1

MICROCOPY RESOLUTION TEST CHART
NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS
STANDARD REFERENCE MATERIAL 1010a
(ANSI and ISO TEST CHART No. 2)

National Library
of Canada

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Canadian Theses Service

Service des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada
K1A 0N4

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

Daughters in Exile
Negotiating the spaces of the avant-garde
Christiane Pflug and Joyce Wieland

by

Christine Louise Conley B.A.

**A thesis submitted to the Faculty of
Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfillment
of the requirement for the degree of
Masters of Arts
in Canadian Studies**

Carleton University

OTTAWA, Ontario

(December 3, 1990)

© 1990, Christine Louise Conley

National Library
of Canada

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Canadian Theses Service Service des thèses canadiennes

Ottawa, Canada
K1A 0N4

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-68819-X

Carleton University

Ottawa, Canada K1S 5B6

Thesis contains black & white
photographs &/or explanatory tables
which when microfilmed may lose their
significance. The hardcopy of the
thesis is available upon request from
Carleton University Library.

The undersigned recommend to the Faculty
of Graduate Studies and Research acceptance of the thesis

"Daughters in Exile
Negotiating the spaces of the avant-garde
Christiane Pflug and Joyce Wieland"

submitted by Christine Conley, B.A.
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of Master of Arts

.....*Nathalie Luckey*.....
Thesis Supervisor

.....*John C. ...*.....
Director
Institute of Canadian Studies

Carleton University

Ottawa, Ontario

January 1991

Abstract

This thesis examines the position of women artists working in Toronto during the 1960s. Through an interrogation of the critical and institutional discourses that shaped local art production and dissemination - the status of women in relation to commercial galleries, museum collections, art publications, art education and government funding agencies - it maps the patterns of women's containment and displacement from the regenerative practices of the avant-garde. The works of Christiane Pflug and Joyce Wieland are examined for the ways in which they negotiated their position relative to their male contemporaries. The spatial organization of Pflug's paintings and Wieland's experimental films are analysed for the correspondence between social space and represented space, in order to delineate the possibilities and limitations of the formalist transgressions of the radical avant-garde towards the representation of female subjectivity. The inscription/absence of the "feminine" body and extra-textuality are found to be the strategic determinants of their aesthetics.

Acknowledgements

I would like to acknowledge the invaluable assistance of Dr. Ann Davis who generously shared her research and her insights into the work of Christiane Pflug. I am also grateful to Dr. Michael Pflug for making his private collection of works available to me. I would like to thank Natalie Luckyj for directing me to the work of Christiane Pflug and to Ann Davis. I also appreciate Pat Smart's guidance during the early stages of thesis development. All those who submitted to interviews, a heartfelt thankyou, especially Joyce Wieland.

As this thesis addresses at least one artist who juggled creative work with childrearing, I think it only appropriate to acknowledge those women who cared for my children while I pursued this degree: Glory Bent, Christine Hastie, Adeline Joseph, Tibiki Cappuccino, Elfi Bemis, Heather Blakley and the staff of the Children's Centre.

Finally I would like to thank Karen Westwood who ensured that this thesis became hard copy, and Alex Wood for his patience and support throughout.

Table of Contents

	List of Illustrations	vii
	List of Appendices	xi
	Photograph of Christiane Pflug	xii
	Photograph of Joyce Wieland	xiii
Chapter 1	Introduction	1
1.1	Modernity and the spaces of femininity	3
1.2	Feminism and the avant-garde	7
1.3	The Maternal Metaphor and L'écriture féminine	9
1.4	Summary	11
Chapter 2	Women Artists and the Toronto Avant-garde	13
2.1	Exhibitions, art journalism and the Toronto avant-garde	16
2.2	Collections	35
2.3	Canada Council Grants	47
2.4	Art Education	50
2.5	Conclusions	58

Chapter 3	Christiane Pflug	62
3.1	Childhood, Michael Pflug and the early work in Paris	67
3.2	Tunis	75
3.3	Toronto	83
3.4	Conclusion	97
Chapter 4	Joyce Wieland	100
4.1	Childhood, art school and early stages	102
4.2	Spatial permutations and the grid	106
4.3	Filmmaking and the avant-garde in Toronto and New York	108
4.4	<i>Water Sark</i>	113
4.5	<i>Hand Tinting</i>	118
4.6	<i>Reason over Passion</i>	124
4.7	<i>Pierre Vallières</i>	129
4.8	<i>Solidarity</i>	130
4.9	Conclusions	131
Chapter 5	Conclusions	133
	Illustrations	137
	Appendices	185
	Bibliography	194

List of Illustrations

Figure 1	Advertisement for Seagram's V.O. Whiskey Reproduced in <i>artscanada</i> late 1960s.	137
Figure 2	Suzanne Guite <i>Christ Noir</i> 1962 Black walnut 5' x 4' x 12"	138
Figure 3	Catharine Boudreau <i>Canal Form No. 1</i> 1966 Ciment fondu 2' x 30" diameter	139
Figure 4	Anne Kahane <i>Runners</i> 1967 Cedar 52.5" x 41" x 16"	140
Figure 5	Patricia Fulford <i>Totemic Structure #1</i> 1967 Laminated redwood, painted 8'6" x 35" x 29"	141
Figure 6	Francoise Sullivan <i>Aeris Ludus</i> 1967 Painted steel and plastic 10' x 18' x 5'	142
	<i>Fata Morgana</i> 1966 Painted steel 7' x 6' x 6'	142
Figure 7	Lise Gervais <i>Confederation</i> 1967 Fibreglass (metal structure) 7' x 12' x 3'6"	143
	<i>Luna Park</i> 1967 Fibreglass (metal structure) 7' x 6'6" x 5'6"	143
Figure 8	Christiane Pflug <i>Justice Building, Paris</i> 1954 Oil on paper 50.2 x 32.2 cm.	144
Figure 9	C. Pflug <i>Pont D'Austerlitz</i> 1954 Oil on canvas 29" x 36"	145
Figure 10	C. Pflug <i>Canal St. Martin</i> 1955 Oil on canvas	146
Figure 11	C. Pflug <i>Still Life with Clock Face and Tiles</i> 1957 Tempera 28 5/8" x 36"	147

Figure 12	C. Pflug <i>Still Life with Black Cloth and Rose</i> 1956 Oil on canvas 19 3/4" x 14 1/4"	148
Figure 13	C. Pflug <i>Bird Cage with Pears</i> 1958 Tempera 18 1/4" x 24 1/4"	149
Figure 14	C. Pflug <i>Railway Yards in the Rain</i> 1962 Oil on canvas 49.5 x 55.9 cm.	150
Figure 15	C. Pflug <i>Window on Yonge Street</i> 1961 Oil on canvas 22 1/2" x 19 1/4"	151
Figure 16	C. Pflug <i>On the Balcony No. 2</i> 1963 Oil on canvas 52 1/2" x 39 1/2"	152
Figure 17	C. Pflug <i>The Kitchen Door in Winter II</i> 1964 Oil on canvas 119.9 x 100 cm.	153
Figure 18	C. Pflug <i>On the Black Chair No. 2</i> 1963 Oil on canvas 33" x 30"	154
Figure 19	C. Pflug <i>On the Black Chair I</i> 1963 Oil on canvas 21 1/2" x 18"	155
Figure 20	C. Pflug <i>Avrom Isaacs</i> 1964 Oil on canvas 86 1/8" x 76"	156
Figure 21	C. Pflug <i>Incomplete Landscape</i> 1970 Graphite on paper 24.6 x 31.8 cm	157
Figure 22	C. Pflug <i>Kitchen Door with Esther</i> 1965 Oil on canvas 64" x 76"	158
Figure 23	C. Pflug <i>The Squirrel</i> 1967 Graphite on paper 32.3 x 25.7 cm	159
Figure 24	C. Pflug <i>On McDermott's Farm: The Forest</i> 1971 Graphite on paper 5" x 6 3/4"	160
Figure 25	C. Pflug <i>Kitchen Door with Ursula</i> 1966 Oil on canvas 65 1/8" x 76 1/8"	161
Figure 26	C. Pflug <i>Ursula on Ward's Island</i> 1966 Graphite on paper 17.1 x 12.7 cm	162
Figure 27	C. Pflug <i>Lake Simcoe</i> 1964 Graphite on paper 16.5 x 11.8 cm	163

Figure 28	C. Pflug <i>The Loon</i> 1967 Graphite on paper 14 5/8" x 12 1/2"	164
Figure 29	C. Pflug <i>Toronto from Centre Island I</i> 1967 Graphite on paper 32.3 x 25.5 cm	165
Figure 30	C. Pflug <i>Boxcars, Marlborough Avenue</i> 1968 Graphite on paper 12 1/2" x 9 5/8"	166
Figure 31	C. Pflug <i>Railway Dam and Truck</i> 1967 Graphite on paper 37.2 x 31.8 cm	167
Figure 32	C. Pflug <i>McDermott's Truck</i> 1971 Graphite on paper 5" x 6 3/4"	168
Figure 33	C. Pflug <i>Cottingham School in Winter I</i> 1968 Oil on canvas 43 7/16" x 39 1/2"	169
Figure 34	C. Pflug <i>Over the Kitchen Sink</i> 1967 Graphite on paper 25.5 x 32.1 cm	170
Figure 35	C. Pflug <i>With the Black Flag</i> 1971 Oil on canvas 54" x 56"	171
Figure 36	C. Pflug <i>Pigeon and City Skyline</i> 1972 Graphite on paper 4" x 6" Last drawing: New York City March 1972	172
Figure 37	Joyce Wieland <i>Untitled</i> 1955 Collage 9.0 x 15.0 cm	173
Figure 38	J. Wieland <i>Heart On</i> 1961 Collage on cloth 177.8 x 251.5 cm	174
Figure 39	J. Wieland <i>Balling</i> 1961 Oil on canvas 182.8 x 234.3 cm	175
Figure 40	J. Wieland <i>Sailboat Sinking</i> 1965 Oil on canvas 76.5 x 81.5 cm	176
Figure 41	J. Wieland <i>Cooling Room II</i> 1964 Mixed media construction 114.3 x 94.2 x 18.1 cm	177
Figure 42	J. Wieland <i>Tragedy in the Air or Plane Crash</i> 1963 Oil on canvas 128.6 x 157.2 cm	178
Figure 43	J. Wieland <i>Young Woman's Blues</i> 1964 Mixed media construction 44.5 x 33 x 22.9 cm	179

Figure 44	J. Wieland <i>The New Power</i> 1963 Oil on canvas 106.4 x 40.6 cm	180
Figure 45	J. Wieland <i>Flicks Pics #4</i> 1963 Oil on canvas 106.7 x 40.6 cm	181
Figure 46	J. Wieland <i>Sanctu Spiritus</i> 1964 Mixed media construction 59.2 x 22.5 x 22 cm	182
Figure 47	J. Wieland <i>Cooling Room I</i> 1964 Mixed media construction 73.7 x 58.9 x 27.9 cm	183
Figure 48	J. Wieland <i>Man Has Reached Out and Touched The Tranquil Moon</i> 1970 Mixed media 298.5 x 163.2 cm	184

List of Appendices

Appendix 1	The Art Gallery of Ontario Permanent Collection	185
Appendix 2	Women in the Hart House Art Collection 1969	186
Appendix 3	Art Bank Collection: Expenditure on works by male and female artists 1971/72 - 1979/80. Compiled by Sasha McInnes-Hayman	187
Appendix 4	Art Bank Collection: Fourteen highest paid artists. Compiled by Sasha McInnes-Hayman	188
Appendix 5	Canada Council Arts Bursaries Statistics 1965/66 - 1969/70	189
Appendix 6	Ontario College of Art 1959-1970 Percentage of Women Instructors	190
Appendix 7	Ontario College of Art 1959-1970 Number of Women Instructors in Each Subject Area	191
Appendix 8	Ontario College of Art 1961-1970, Female Students as a Percentage of Total Enrolment	192
Appendix 9	Ontario College of Art 1961-1970, Student Enrolment	193

Christiane Pilug in her home
Ontario Homes and Living, September 1964

Joyce Wieland at the Maison Dore, Conference on The Conference of the Arts, 1961
Evidence, Number 3, Fall 1961

1. Introduction

And that their history, their stories, constitute the locus of our displacement. It's not that we have a territory of our own; but their fatherland, family, home, discourse, imprison us in enclosed spaces where we cannot keep on moving, living, as ourselves. Their properties are our exile. Their enclosure, the death of our love. Their words, the gag upon our lips...How can we speak so as to escape from their compartments, their schemas, their distinctions and oppositions: virginal/deflowered, pure/ impure, innocent/ experienced...¹

There is no doubt that femininity is an oppressive condition yet women live it to different purposes and feminist analyses are currently concerned to explore not only its limits but the concrete ways women negotiate and refashion that position to alter its meanings.²

Virginia Woolf preempted consideration of "the great problem of the true nature of woman and the true nature of fiction" by maintaining that "a woman must have money and a room of her own if she is to write fiction."³ Where Woolf's "room" has come to represent the prerequisite material conditions for artistic endeavour, the question posed by Linda Nochlin in 1971 - "Why have there been no great women artists?"⁴ - initiated an examination within the visual arts of the ideological and discursive grounds of women's exclusion from artistic canons.

-
1. Luce Irigaray, "When Our Lips Speak Together," in *This Sex Which is Not One*, trans. Catherine Porter (New York: Cornell U P, 1985), 212.
 2. Griselda Pollock, "Modernity and the spaces of femininity," in *Vision and Difference*, (London: Routledge, 1988), 84.
 3. Virginia Woolf, *A Room of One's Own*, (London: Grafton Books, 1977), 6.
 4. Linda Nochlin, "Why have there been no great women artists?" *Art News* 69.9 (January 1971), 22-39, reprinted in E. Baker and T. Hess, *Art and Sexual Politics*, (London: Collier Macmillan, 1973).

Subsequent critique by two generations of feminist art historians and critics⁵ has seriously undermined the authority of male defined notions of artistic accomplishment - greatness, mastery, and the myth of genius - criteria which had rendered the categories "woman" and "artist" a contradiction in terms. Griselda Pollock summarizes the problem thus:

Creativity has been appropriated as an ideological component of masculinity while femininity has been constructed as man's and, therefore, the artist's negative. As the late nineteenth-century writer clearly put it: "As long as a woman refrains from unsexing herself let her dabble in anything. The woman of genius does not exist; when she does she is a man." ⁶

Negotiating this contradiction in the artistic climate of the 1960s in Toronto is the subject of this thesis. The artists to be considered are Christiane Pflug (1936-1972) and Joyce Wieland (1931-). Both of these women successfully took on the project of inventing themselves as artists within the theoretical framework of modernist art practice and the cultural heroics of the post war avant-garde. And they did so in relative isolation, certainly from one another, but more specifically from any public discourse that could re-articulate their personal struggles in collective terms. They both established themselves prior to the second wave of feminism and its concomitant validation of women's perspectives and concerns, that is, before the late sixties, when an activist grass-roots women's movement emerged in Canada under the banner "the personal is political."⁷

-
5. For an outline of feminist art and art history see Thalia Gouma-Peterson and Patricia Mathews, "The Feminist Critique of Art History," *The Art Bulletin* LXIX 3 (September 1987), 326-357.
 6. Griselda Pollock, *Vision and Difference*, (London: Routledge, 1988), 21.
 7. For a history of the emergence of the women's movement in Canada see Nancy Adamson et.al., *Feminist Organizing for Change: The Contemporary Women's Movement in Canada*, (Toronto: Oxford UP, 1988).

1.1 Modernity and the spaces of femininity

Griselda Pollock's essay "Modernity and the spaces of femininity"⁸ provides an important model for this thesis, which is concerned with how sexual difference is inscribed within the work, not as a product of any biological essence, but as a process of cultural mediation which is historically and socially gendered. Pollock does not consider women's art works as documents reflecting or expressing their oppressive condition, but rather stresses that,

the practice of painting is itself a site for the inscription of sexual difference. Social positionality in terms of both class and gender determine - that is, set the pressure and prescribe the limits of - the work produced. ⁹

Pollock's critique of art history has been elucidated in a number of publications, commencing with *Old Mistresses: Women Art and Ideology*,¹⁰ co-authored with Rozsika Parker in 1981, and further developed in "Women, Art and Ideology: Questions for Feminist Art Historians." Her methodology is a synthesis of Marxism with psychoanalytic and deconstructive theory. Rejecting evaluative criticism she conceptualizes history as "a complex of processes and relationships" rather than a series of additive formulations such as "art and society" or "art and its social context".

We instead have to deal with the interplay of multiple histories of the codes of art, the ideologies of the art world, the forms of production, the social classes, the family and sexual practices whose mutual determinations and interdependences have to be mapped together in precise but heterogeneous configurations.

8. Pollock, "Modernity and the spaces of femininity," 50-90.

9. *Ibid.*, 81-2.

10. Rozsika Parker and Griselda Pollock, *Old Mistresses: Women, Art and Ideology*, (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1981).

...Furthermore, art is constitutive of ideology, it does not merely illustrate it.¹¹

In "Modernity and the spaces of femininity" Pollock applies her methodology to the examination of specific works by Berthe Morisot and Mary Cassatt - artists engaged with the Impressionist circle in nineteenth century Paris - in a process which "necessitates a deconstruction of the masculinist myths of modernism."¹² While Pollock is not alone in this project of dismantling modernist myths - Rosalind Krauss' *The originality of the avant-garde and other modernist myths*¹³ is only one example from the field of art criticism - hers is certainly a singular attempt to work out a feminist methodology that does not merely map "women on to existing schemata" or consider them as a separate category, but aims at a "theorization and historical analysis of sexual difference." For Pollock the historical recovery of women artists, while necessary in order to refute the lie of women's absence from artistic practice, is in itself insufficient.

To avoid the embrace of the feminine stereotype which homogenizes women's work as determined by natural gender, we must stress the heterogeneity of women's art work, the specificity of individual producers and products. Yet we have to recognize what women share - as a result of nurture not nature, i.e. the historically variable social systems which produce sexual differentiation.¹⁴

The matrix for Pollock's consideration of Morisot and Cassatt is space. Pollock examines how "the socially contrived orders of sexual difference" structured the lives of these women and the work they produced. In the process she builds a case for relating space and femininity which is relevant to my examination of Pflug

11. Griselda Pollock, "Women, Art and Ideology: Questions for Feminist Art Historians," *Woman's Art Journal* IV (Spring/Summer 1983), 39-47.
12. Pollock, "Modernity and the spaces of femininity," 50.
13. Rosalind E. Krauss, *The originality of the avant-garde and other modernist myths*, (Cambridge: MIT Press, 1985).
14. Pollock, "Modernity and the spaces of femininity," 55.

and Wieland. First of all she notes Cassatt's departure from the conventions of geometric perspective, a representational system which "establishes the viewer as both absent from and indeed independent of the scene while being its mastering eye/I." She then introduces the notion of phenomenological space to a discussion of Cassatt's spatial deviations.

Instead of pictorial space functioning as a notional box into which objects are placed in a rational and abstract relationship, space is represented according to the way it is experienced by a combination of touch, texture, as well as sight. Thus objects are patterned according to subjective hierarchies of value for the producer. Phenomenological space is not orchestrated for sight alone but by means of visual cues refers to other sensations and relations of bodies and objects in a lived world. 15

Deviation from the conventions of geometric perspective offers the possibility of constructing a relationship between viewer and viewed that is not based on appropriation and control - the subject/object dichotomy that Suzanne Kappeler, for instance, examines in her work on pornography.¹⁶ This possibility is of particular significance to our consideration of women artists because of the problematic position of women within the construction of the gaze, what Laura Mulvey has succinctly termed "Woman as Image, Man as Bearer of the Look"¹⁷ in relation to cinematic practice, and has been variously articulated by writers such as Luce Irigaray, Annette Kuhn, and E. Ann Kaplan.¹⁸ This asymmetry is a central factor in

15. *Ibid.*, 64.

16. Suzanne Kappeler, *The Pornography of Representation*, (Minneapolis: U of Minnesota P, 1983). Kappeler's various configurations of culture are useful in their challenge to the paradigms of modernist practice - mastery, subjective universality and disinterestedness - and in her assertion that in a culture which privileges the male gaze "the role of subject constitutes a site for a power struggle." (7).

17. Laura Mulvey, "Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema," in Brian Wallis (ed.), *Art After Modernism*, (New York: The New Museum, 1984), 366. [Reprinted from *Screen* 16.3 (Autumn 1975).]

18. Luce Irigaray, "This sex which is not one," translated by Catherine Porter in *This Sex Which is Not One* (New York: Cornell U P, 1985); Annette Kuhn, *Women's Pictures: Feminism and Cinema* (London: Routledge & Kegan Paul, 1982), 601-5; E. Ann Kaplan, "Is the Gaze male?" in

shaping what Pollock calls the spaces of femininity.

The spaces of femininity are those from which femininity is lived as a positionality in discourse and social practice. They are the product of a lived sense of social locatedness, mobility and visibility, in the social relations of seeing and being seen. Shaped within the sexual politics of looking they demarcate a particular social organization of the gaze which itself works back to secure a particular social ordering of sexual difference.

19

A second critical factor in Pollock's scheme is the division of public and private spheres, a separation which "problematized women's relation to the very activities and experiences we typically accept as defining modernity."²⁰ Pollock cites Baudelaire's model of the ideal modern artist - the flâneur, "who is a passionate lover of crowds, and incognito, a man of the world" - as a quintessentially masculine figure for which there is no female equivalent, for women "did not enjoy the freedom of incognito in the crowd. They were never positioned as the normal occupants of the public realm."

The flâneur/artist is articulated across the twin ideological formations of modern bourgeois society - the splitting of private and public with its double freedom for men in the public space, and the pre-eminence of a detached observing gaze, whose possession and power is never questioned as its basis in the hierarchy of the sexes is never acknowledged. 21

My thesis draws upon Pollock's essay, then, to determine the ways in which both Pflug and Wieland negotiated the spaces of modernity and femininity as they were constituted in the years immediately preceding the second wave, through the imperatives and assumptions of the avant-garde. And like Pollock's study the formal matrix for my consideration of their work is space, specifically, the ways in

Powers of Desire: The Politics of Sexuality, ed. Ann Snitow et. al. (New York: Monthly Review Press, 1983).

19. Pollock, "Modernity and the spaces of femininity," 66.

20. *Ibid.*, 70.

21. *Ibid.*, 71.

which the spatial permutations of modernist art allowed for an alternative positioning of the female subject.

1.2 Feminism and the avant-garde

The relationship of women to the paradigms of modernism, particularly avant-gardism, can be seen to be paradoxical. Feminist critics such as Angela Partington reject an avant-garde practice defined by "the constant imperative to break with the conventions of 'readability', in favour of strategies which are intended to demonstrate the 'facility', 'opacity' or 'productivity' of the text."²² This tradition has been critiqued for substituting formal innovation for political engagement, reducing "the meaning of all art to its place within the history of form/style"²³ and allowing high culture to defend its claim to disinterestedness, that is, art for art's sake. Rather than accept this constant imperative to break with established stylistic conventions as the dynamics of a progressive tradition, feminists like Partington re-view this particular modernist myth as a circulation of power between generations of males, whereby rebellious sons ritually usurp the power of the fathers. This struggle does nothing to negotiate the problematic position of women in relation to patriarchal culture - our silence, our absence - but rather acts much like a red herring to distract from and obscure the asymmetry of gender power relations. As Joyce Nelson writes in *The Perfect Machine*:

Patriarchal societies are founded upon a crime. This crime is not the murder of the father, as Freud would have us believe. It is the rape and scorn of the mother. 24

22. Angela Partington, "Feminist Art and Avant-Gardism," in Hilary Robinson (ed.), *Visibly Female*, (London: Camden Press, 1987), 231.

23. *Ibid.*

24. Joyce Nelson, *The Perfect Machine: TV in the Nuclear Age*, (Toronto: Between the Lines, 1987), 169.

On the other hand, Laura Mulvey argues for a congruence of strategical interests between the arguments developed by the modernist avant-garde and the struggle of feminists to develop a radical aesthetic.

...consciously confronting traditional practice, often with a political motivation, working on ways in which aesthetic challenges alter relations both with modes of representation and with expectations in consumption - all these questions arise similarly for women. 25

Mary Jacobus reaches similar conclusions:

The dream of a language freed from the Freudian notion of castration, by which female difference is defined as lack rather than otherness, is at first sight essentially theoretical, millennial and Utopian. Its usefulness lies in allying feminism and the avant-garde in a common political challenge to the very discourse which makes them possible; the terms of language itself, as well as the terms of psychoanalysis and literary criticism, are called into question. 26

There is some disagreement, then, as to the revolutionary potential of the avant-garde text, and certainly gender has positioned artists differently within this project as it has been carried out across a number of disciplines, literary and visual. Jo Anna Isaak maintains that the subversive strategies adopted by Gertrude Stein to "unseat the patriarchy" has meant that her writing has never been claimed for the canon - "Its inappropriateness has prevented it from being appropriated."²⁷ As I will discuss in Chapter 4, similar contradictions were encountered by Joyce Wieland when her work was excluded from the Anthology Film Archives in New York.²⁸

25. Laura Mulvey, "Feminism, Film and the Avant-garde," in Mary Jacobus (ed.) *Women Writing and Writing About Women* (London: Croom Helm, 1979)

26. Mary Jacobus, "The Difference of View," in *Reading Woman*, (New York: Columbia UP, 1986), 30.

27. Gertrude Stein quoted in Jo Anna Isaak, *The Ruin of Representation in Modernist Art and Texts*, (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1986), 12.

28. J. Hoberman, "After Avant-Garde Film," in Brian Wallis (ed.), *Art After Modernism* (New York: The New Museum, 1984), 65.

The relationship of women to modernity's crisis of legitimation is problematic. Pollock points to the danger of total relativism and cautions against conflating the death of the mythic figure of the creator/author with the negation of the historical producer. In her book *Gynesis*, Alice Jardine raises similar concerns about the existence of women as historical subjects within theoretical developments in France, which have involved "a relinquishing of mastery, indeed a valorization of nonmastery..."²⁹ This rethinking of the subject/object relation has involved the putting into discourse of "woman," a process which Jardine terms *gynesis*.

a reconceptualization of...the master narrative's own "nonknowledge," what has eluded them, what has engulfed them. This other-than-themselves is almost always a "space" of some kind (over which the narrative has lost control), and this space has been coded as *feminine*, as *woman*...³⁰

What Jardine makes clear about this process, however, is that "woman" and the "feminine" have been transformed into verbs within a discourse that is not about women as thinking, speaking, writing subjects. Despite this new conceptualization of "alterity," "woman" persists as the subject matter of culture, the medium which allows for male contemplation, while "women" remain absent - silent.

1.3 The Maternal Metaphor and L'écriture féminine

At the same time there are women working in this decidedly male French tradition - women such as Hélène Cixous, Luce Irigaray and Julia Kristeva - whose writings negotiate the terrain of modernity, *gynesis* and feminism towards breaking the equation of femininity with passivity and silence. Though working in distinctly different ways from one another, Jardine believes that:

29. Alice Jardine, *Gynesis*, (New York: Cornell U P, 1985), 154.

30. *Ibid.*, 25.

They all direct attention to the ways in which the mother and the maternal have been silenced and indeed mutilated in order for Western culture to thrive, and to the need for the maternal to be henceforth signified in new ways. 31

Within the writings of these three women the maternal feminine has become synonymous with that which is absent, desired, elsewhere. In *Revolution in Poetic Language*, Julia Kristeva argues that "what is repressed in the individual during the acquisition of symbolic language are the pre-Oedipal functions that connect the infant...to the mother's body."³² Kristeva calls this the semiotic. Because it is bound up with the body of the mother, the semiotic is associated with the feminine. "Kristeva looks to the semiotic as it appears in the avant-garde text as a means of undermining the symbolic order."

Indifferent to language, enigmatic and feminine, this space underlying the written is rhythmic, unfettered, irreducible to its intelligible verbal translation, it is musical, anterior to judgement;" it is that "air or song beneath the text" which is allied with woman. 33

In a corpus of texts that is generally referred to as *l'écriture féminine*, Hélène Cixous and Luce Irigaray articulate the female body as the site of discovery of woman's own sexual difference.

she has been kept at a distance from herself, she has been allowed to see (not-to-see) woman from the perspective of what man wants to see of her, i.e. almost nothing...Her "own" house, her body itself, she has not been able to inhabit..She has had no eyes for herself. She has never explored her house...She has not dared to take pleasure in her body, which has been colonized. 34

31. *Ibid.*, 263.

32. Summarized here by Jo Anna Isaak, *The Ruin of Representation in Modernist Art and Texts*, (Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1986), 16.

33. Quoting Julia Kristeva, *Ibid.*

34. Helene Cixous, "La Jeune Née: An Excerpt," *Diacritics*, 7, 2 (Summer 1977), 68, quoted in Kay Armatage, "The Feminine Body," *Canadian Woman Studies* (Spring 1987), 84.

They develop the topos of the breast (Cixous) and the vulval lips (Irigaray) as models for the realization of female difference, tracing the female body in a textual activity that moves to displace the unicity of phallic representation with the indeterminate morphology of female corporeality, its multiplicity, diversity, infinitude - heterogeneity. This in turn is seen to formally parallel the transgressions of the avant-garde, "the constant exceeding of the limits of conventional signifying systems in the search for new and heterogeneous languages."³⁵

These textual strategies and their privileging of the maternal metaphor are relevant to my consideration of Pflug and Wieland, both of whom generate an "extratextual elsewhere" through the spatial ordering of their work. In Pflug's case, the connection lies in her affinity to a mystical tradition which links the Mother, Death and the Unknown,³⁶ whereas with Wieland it is her affirmation of the maternal-feminine body as a source of creative power.

1.4 Summary

This thesis is organized around two questions. First, what was it like to be a woman artist in Toronto in the 1960s? And second, what artistic strategies did Christiane Pflug and Joyce Wieland evolve in negotiating their respective positions within the Toronto community?

In Chapter 2 of this thesis, I attempt to map out the territory available to women artists working in Toronto during the 1960s. I draw upon a number of theoretical sources in interpreting the evidence - statistical, documentary and anecdotal - of the shifting parameters of women's practice in relation to the

35. *Ibid.*, 86.

36. Jardine, *Gynesis*, 142.

dominant discourses that shaped art production and dissemination. In examining mainstream institutions alongside those associated with the avant-garde, I look for the ways in which modernist myths and the specific practices of the Toronto avant-garde intersected to limit, contain or dismiss women's work.

I proceed in Chapters 3 and 4 to a textual analysis of the works of Christiane Pflug and Joyce Wieland. In both cases I examine the ways in which traditional space is re-articulated "so that it ceases to function primarily as the space of sight for a mastering gaze, but becomes the locus of relationships."³⁷ I consider the persistent lack of closure and the references to an extra-textual space, common to both artists, as spaces for the inscription of sexual difference and social positionality. My textual reading accesses available biographical evidence in tandem with the theoretical premises discussed above to chart the specific and different artistic strategies evolved by each of these artists, within the confines of the modernist project.

37. Pollock, "Modernity and the spaces of femininity," 87.

2. Women Artists and the Toronto Avant-garde

The democracy of the canvas has not attracted the best talents of women. On the few occasions when they have sought self-expression in the plastic arts, a goodly portion of even these few have shared the expenditure of their abilities with the requirements of marriage and household duties.

The history of art, as a result, is a history of men. Women have not made any significant contributions because they have not applied their unrelenting attention, their serious desire to take advantage of this democracy, the equality that the canvas offers.¹

The passage above was written in 1960 by critic Lawrence Sabbath to introduce the work of Toronto artist Paraskeva Clark. To claim that it is sexist is rather like saying the earth is round; without further surveying the terrain we can neither locate its coordinates nor traverse its paths. This chapter then is intended as a mapping out of the position of women artists working in the 1960s in Toronto. Its purpose is not simply to add local colour to the feminist culture theory discussed thus far (ie. Toronto was just as misogynist as everywhere else, truly a world class city) but to determine the shifting parameters of women's practice at a specific time and place, parameters which intersected with the personal biographical circumstances of both Christiane Pflug and Joyce Wieland to shape their respective artistic practices. This analysis provides the necessary groundwork for my

1. Lawrence Sabbath, "Paraskeva Clark," *Canadian Art* 70 (Sept 1960), 291.

subsequent textual readings in Chapters 3 and 4, where, rather than isolating Pflug and Wieland as special psychological cases - as exceptional ahistorical subjects - I attempt to situate them historically as artists shaped by specific factors of gender, social position and nationality.

This chapter involves a reading of statistics - on women in museum collections, women and Canada Council funding and women in the art education system - combined with a reading of the contemporary critical discourse: *Canadian Art/artscanada* (1960-1970) and *Evidence* (1961-1967),² selected relevant texts, archival interviews with Toronto women artists³ and some anecdotal evidence from personal interviews. Given the nature of the sources available I have in some cases needed to extrapolate from statistical and critical analyses which are not localized but address a more general Canadian or provincial context. I have also made use of studies which extend chronologically beyond the period of inquiry into the 1970s where I feel that these assist in pinpointing changes or illuminating trends. In attempting to delineate the shifting circumstances around women's production I begin with a general analysis of women's visibility in contemporary exhibitions and critical writing. I then discuss the representation of women in public gallery collections, as Arts Council grant recipients, and within the art education system. In each area I examine mainstream institutions alongside those formations more clearly aligned with the local avant-garde. What I hope to illuminate are the specific ways in which the organization and practices of the '60s avant-garde perpetuated the

2. Considered a forum for the Toronto artistic and literary avant-garde. The artists associated with the Isaacs gallery were prominent contributors.

3. Janice Cameron, Frances Ferdinands, Sharon Snitman, Madli Tamme and Annetta Werick. *Eclectic Eve*, (Toronto: Women's Educational Press, 1972). Interviews with 59 women active in Toronto transcribed from tapes in the collection of the Ontario College of Art.

dissociation of femininity from serious art, producing a maze of contradictions for those women who nevertheless persisted in making it.

The Sabbath passage above reveals a number of assumptions about art which are characteristic of late modernism and the period under consideration here. First, he equates art and the history of art exclusively with the practice of painting on canvas. Second, his unsubstantiated attribution of democracy and equality to this practice presumes artistic creation to be an insular activity, separate from and immune to the social and political inequities of the world, and centered on the expression of a politically neutral and ungendered "self." According to Sabbath, our only differences before the canvas are talent and commitment. He presents the "requirements of marriage and household duties" which so limited Paraskeva Clark's production simply as obstacles which women have failed to overcome. Not only does Sabbath underestimate the enormous drain that such impediments have upon women's time and creative energies, but he misinterprets their nature and significance, the way in which the sexual division of labour reproduces the division of public and private to secure male hegemony.⁴ As Rozsika Parker has pointed out in a review of Germaine Greer's *The Obstacle Race* (1979): "It is not the obstacles that Germaine Greer cites that really count, but the rules of the game that demand scrutiny."⁵ And it is these rules that I will consider now.

4. Sheila Rowbotham's book *Woman's Consciousness, Man's World* (1973) gives a clear account of this process from a analysis developed amid the political upheavals of the '60s.

5. Griselda Pollock, "Women, Art and Ideology: Questions for Feminist Art Historians," reprinted from *Womans Art Journal* in Hilary Robinson (ed.), *Visibly Female*, (London: Camden Press, 1987), 206.

2.1 Exhibitions, art journalism and the Toronto avant-garde

In the Toronto of the 1950s, the revolving doors of the art scene were gaining momentum. At the beginning of the decade, Toronto painting existed in the twilight of the Group of Seven. True to the pattern of modernist movements since the mid 19th century, the formation of Painters Eleven (1953-1960)⁶ brought together a disparate collection of artists in revolt against the landscape tradition of the Canadian "Old Masters" and their followers. The efforts of Painters Eleven to establish non-objective painting in Toronto coincided with the opening of several adventurous commercial galleries in the city, creating a favourable climate for a burgeoning experimental art scene.⁷ Throughout the '60s these commercial galleries would represent the views of the new generation of artists, who succeeded Painters Eleven in challenging the hegemony of the established art museums (especially the Art Gallery of Ontario) and the complacency of the old art societies.⁸ This new generation was not constituted through any formal membership or explicit manifesto, but rather came to be collectively identified through their association with the gallery opened by Avrom Isaacs in 1955.⁹

-
6. The eleven artists were: Hortense Gordon, William Ronald, Alexandra Luke, Kazuo Nakamura, Walter Yarwood, Oscar Cahen, Jock Macdonald, Jack Bush, Harold Town, Ray Mead and Tom Hodgson.
 7. Among them was Barry Kerneman's Gallery of Contemporary Art (1956-59), subsequently taken over by Dorothy Cameron. During the late '50s the Park Gallery, Roberts Gallery and Laing Gallery all showed the work of younger Canadian artists.
 8. Commercial galleries were the most receptive to artists' initiatives: Av Isaacs acted upon the advice of artists (Snow and Coughtry) in transforming his framing business into a gallery (Barrie Male p. 52) while Carmen Lamanna, in effecting the same transformation in 1967, was advised by David Bolduc in selecting his artists. (Carole Conde, interview July 26, 1988).
 9. David Burnett and Marilyn Schiff, *Contemporary Canadian Art* (Edmonton: Hurtig, 1983), 82.

The Greenwich Gallery, renamed Isaacs in 1959, was considered pivotal to the project of evolving a distinctly Toronto idiom in painting,¹⁰ though the foremost orientation of its proponents was New York.¹¹ In 1960 Elizabeth Kilbourn wrote:

The most uncompromising of all is the Isaacs Gallery. By a remarkable combination of hard-headed intelligence and sensitivity, Av Isaacs has collected almost all the good young experimental artists that Toronto has produced.¹²

One year later Isaacs' response to the challenge of new ideas was described in the art publication *Evidence* as no less than "an act of faith...a recognition that the experimental, questing artist is the man who makes tomorrow's history..."¹³ In his history of Toronto modernist painting *Out of the Park*,¹⁴ Barrie Hale refers repeatedly to the artists represented by Isaacs as "culture heroes" and claims that "The Isaacs artists came to embody a conglomerate Toronto Artist."¹⁵

The title of Hale's litany to masculine artistic genius, albeit local grown, is derived from Kenneth Noland's metaphor for artistic endeavour: "He said the purpose of the whole thing was to knock the ball out of the park."¹⁶ However if we examine the list of artists associated with Isaacs from 1955 to 1970, names which are synonymous with the artistic achievements of the period, it would appear that when the home team was recruited, women were out of the game. To the enclave of local

-
10. For a history of this project see Dennis Reid "Notes on the Toronto Painting Scene: 1959-1969," in William Townsend (ed.), *Canadian Art Today*, (London: *Studio International*, 1970), 33-35; Dennis Reid and Barrie Hale, *Toronto Painting: 1953-65*, (Ottawa: National Gallery of Canada, 1972); Barrie Hale, *Out of the Park: Modernist Painting in Toronto 1950-1980*, (Toronto: Coach House P, 1985).
 11. See Elizabeth Kilbourn's introduction to the catalogue *19 Canadian Painters '62*, (Louisville: J. B. Speed Art Museum, 1962) where she also states "Isaacs became a synonym for avant-garde in Toronto."
 12. Elizabeth Kilbourn, "The Toronto-Hamilton Scene," *Canadian Art* 69 (July 1960), 238.
 13. Hugo McPherson, "The Isaacs Gallery," *Evidence* 3 (Fall 1961), 22.
 14. Barrie Hale, *Out of the Park: Modernist Painting in Toronto 1950-1980*, vol. 2 of *Provincial Essays* (Toronto: Coach House Press, 1985).
 15. Hale, *Out of the Park*, 51.
 16. Jack Bush quoted in Hale, *Out of the Park*, 6.

artists Michael Snow, William Ronald, Gordon Rayner, Dennis Burton, Robert Markle, Robert Hedrick, Graham Coughtry, Richard Gorman, John Meredith and others, we can include only two women then living in Toronto: Joyce Wieland and Christiane Pflug.¹⁷

Toronto born Joyce Wieland, both through her artistic practice and her marriage to Michael Snow, was very much a part of the Isaacs crowd, though she did not actually join Isaacs from Dorothy Cameron's Here & Now Gallery until 1960.¹⁸ Throughout the decade her work was exhibited in group shows with other male members of Av's constellation both inside and outside the Isaac's gallery though never, according to her exhibition record, alongside the work of Christiane Pflug.¹⁹ In his "Notes on the Toronto Painting Scene: 1959-1969" Dennis Reid includes Wieland as the only female member of the new generation of painters which succeeded Painters Eleven in the first half of the '60s.²⁰ Wieland was also involved in other group ventures such as the satirical Conference on the Conference of the Arts²¹ and contributed articles to the first issue of *Evidence*. Her childlessness, though not by choice, allowed her the freedom to pursue her career in Toronto as well as New York, where she resided with Michael Snow during much of the decade.

-
17. Confirmed in telephone conversation with Av Isaacs April 22, 1989. The only other women artists he represented were Anne Kahane of Montreal and later Cathie Falk of Vancouver.
 18. Wieland had a two-person show at Isaacs with Gordon Rayner in 1959. Av was persuaded by Michael Snow and Robert Hedrick to take her on in 1960. Telephone interview with Avrom Isaacs, Toronto, 22 April 1989.
 19. For an exhibition chronology see Art Gallery of Ontario, *Joyce Wieland*, (Toronto: AGO, 1987), 205 (catalogue).
 20. Of the male members the majority are from Isaacs. Reid, "Notes on the Toronto Painting Scene: 1959-1969," Only three women were featured in the exhibition *Toronto Painting: 1953-65* which Reid and Hale curated for the National Gallery: Hortense Gordon, Alexandra Luke and Joyce Wieland.
 21. This rowdy gathering at the brewers room of the Maison Dore was an irreverent critical response to the Conference of the Arts held at the O'Keefe Centre in 1961. See *Evidence* No. 3 (Fall 1961), 42.

The significance of freedom from family responsibilities should not be underestimated. The limitations imposed upon Paraskeva Clark, for example, have already been mentioned. Yet while the physical, material and logistical demands of childrearing can definitely be seen to hinder mothers as practising artists, there is also another less tangible factor. For the inclusion of women in male-dominated institutions has long been associated with the renunciation of female sexuality, and by extension, maternity. In her study of the myth and cult of the Virgin Mary, Marina Warner quotes St. Jerome,

As long as a woman is for birth and children, she is different from man as body is from soul. But when she wishes to serve Christ more than the world, then she will cease to be a woman, and will be called man.²²

While Jerome's writing dates from the fourth and fifth centuries, there is a sobering consistency between his description of the vocation to the cloister, the nineteenth century concept of artistic genius cited in the introduction to this thesis and, I would argue, the terms of women's membership in avant-garde art movements. What it amounts to is this: honorary men are not mothers.

From the writing of both Dennis Reid and Barrie Hale, we can ascertain that the tendency to identify Isaac's artists as a coherent group was based as much or more upon their shared interest in contemporary music and their common approach to life, art and socializing than upon any demonstrated stylistic resemblances amongst their works. They were bound together by their outlook on art rather than the look of the art they produced.

The one characteristic which unites the better painters of the first half of this decade is a concerted attempt to force further

²² Marina Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex*, (London: Picador, 1985), 73.

the boundaries of propriety; as much in terms of the life-style of the painters and content of their work as of its style.²³

But this outlook could be problematic in the way it positioned women artists. In accounting for the dismissive attitude of some of Alexandra Luke's contemporaries towards her work - Luke and Hortense Gordon were the only women in *Painters Eleven* - Joan Murray cites then current assumptions about what constitutes a "painterly" lifestyle .

We expect them [painters] to be young; rather dissolute; preferably male; certainly poor; untidy, disorganized and highly impractical... Middle-aged when she [Luke] began painting in earnest, she was a wealthy homemaker and do-gooder and, according to all observers, the best organized, most energetic and practical woman who ever wore shoes. By assumption, surely such a creature can't paint. ²⁴

In particular, the artists associated with Isaacs were passionate advocates of jazz, traditionally a male preserve for both black and white instrumentalists. The shifting personnel of the Artists' Jazz Band (formed in 1962) included Michael Snow, Graham Coughtry, Gordon Rayner, Nabuo Kubota and Robert Markle.²⁵ Further, Barry Hale writes that partying and the use of amphetamines (social and inspirational) were at the core of the Toronto revolution.²⁶ Outside artists' studios then, jazz clubs, strip joints (Robert Markle's preferred subject matter) and taverns were the public social spaces where these artists convened. While women of the period would certainly not have been subject to the strict prohibitions that Griselda Pollock describes regarding nineteenth century Paris - where the female counterpart to the flâneur was a prostitute - still the bohemian lifestyle associated with these traditional male social spaces remained asymmetrical in its moral implications.

23. Reid, "Notes on the Toronto Painting Scene: 1959-1969," 34.

24. Joan Murray, *Alexandra Luke: Continued Searching*, (Oshawa: Robert McLaughlin Gallery, Oshawa, 1988), 1.

25. Burnett and Schiff, 83.

26. Hale, *Out of the Park*, 50.

During the 1960s, public drinking establishments in Ontario were still segregated into areas designated as "Men Only" and "Ladies and Escorts."²⁷ In *Cat's Eye*, Margaret Atwood (whose early short stories were published in *Evidence*) reveals the sexual politics of such establishments through her character Elaine:

The Life Drawing students prefer Ladies and Escorts, but they need a woman to get in. This is why they invite me: they even buy me free beers. I am their passport. Sometimes I'm the only one available after class, because Susie, the girl my age, frequently begs off, and Marjorie and Babs go home. They have husbands, and are not taken seriously. The boys call them "lady painters."

"If they're lady painters, what does that make me?" I say.

"A girl painter," Jon says, joking.

Colin, who has manners of a sort, explains: "If you're bad, you're a lady painter. Otherwise you're just a painter." ²⁸

In contrast to Wieland, Christiane Pflug was a German immigrant (she arrived in 1959) whose nationality made her especially self-conscious in post-war Toronto, where the vitality of the art scene owed much to members of the Jewish community.²⁹ Also unlike Wieland, her artistic concerns were not seen to parallel the Neo-Dadaist interests of Isaac's other artists. Art historian Hugo McPherson, for example, links her to Ken Danby, assigning her work the label "magic realism."³⁰ Working in the isolation of her home, Christiane's painting was circumscribed by her domestic responsibilities as a wife and mother of two daughters, responsibilities

27. This practice was discontinued after an amendment to the Human Rights Code in 1972 outlawed the denial of services in public places based on sex, marital status, race, creed etc. Ontario Statute 1972 Chapter 119.

28. Margaret Atwood, *Cat's Eye* (Toronto: Seal Books, McClelland-Bantam, 1988), 297.

29. In an interview with Ann Davis (New York 16 Nov 1986) artist Anton Van Dalen states that the Pflugs were apologetic about being German and that this placed them somewhat on the defensive in relation to the art world. Collection of Ann Davis.

30. Hugo McPherson, "Toronto's New Art Scene," *Canadian Art* 95 (Jan/Feb 1965), 9.

which set her apart from other artists. In her personal correspondence she expresses her desire to live on Toronto Island and describes the artists there as,

the sort who write and make movies and read alot of colour theory...in their own lives they are very independent and so they have little sense of responsibility.³¹

Further, her plans to reside temporarily in New York - as Wieland and Snow did - never materialized.³²

Despite these differences of circumstance, Wieland as insider/Pflug as outsider so to speak, both women perceived their relationship to the agenda of the avant-garde in terms which suggest a shared sense of difference. Joyce Wieland recalls:

I started to invent myself as an artist. I saw only gradually that my husband's artistic concerns were not mine, although I loved Cezanne, Vermeer, etcetera...Eventually women's concerns and my own femininity became my artist's territory.³³

Similarly, Pflug responds to Av Isaacs' inquiry:

Living in Toronto I do not know it [the avant-garde] well. In some of the recent movements thought and attitude become more important than vision. I have to develop my own vision independently of these movements.³⁴

In light of the differences in artistic strategies that each of these women developed, it is significant that Wieland explicitly links her own sense of displacement to gender, in a way that anticipates feminist debates in the 1970s, while Pflug's concern with the integrity of her work as a personal statement is more akin to the existentialist theories of authenticity and self-knowledge that dominated

31. Christiane Pflug, Letter to her mother-in-law, 22 June 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

32. In the same interview (fn. 28) Van Dalen implies that Michael Pflug's lack of support for the venture led Christiane to abandon her plans to live in New York.

33. Joyce Wieland quoted in Kay Armatage, "Interview with Joyce Wieland," in Karyn Kay et. al. (eds.), *Women and the Cinema* (New York: E.P. Dutton, 1977), 248-9.

34. Christiane Pflug speaking with Av Isaacs in "Questions and answers," Typescript c. 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

philosophical circles in the 1940s and 1950s. Nonetheless both artists express a degree of alienation from the "malestream" which surfaces frequently in statements by their female contemporaries, a point which I will take up further in discussing the representation of women in museum collections.

Such alienation was certainly well founded given the polarization of male/female practices evident in contemporary art journalism. The following notice in *The Globe and Mail* heralded Christiane Pflug's first exhibition at the Isaacs gallery in 1962:

Christainne [sic] Pflug, in the back room at the Isaacs, shows what can be achieved by discipline, the view from a back window, a few dolls, pencil, paper and an intense and lovely talent. Also feminine sensitivity. Denis [sic] Burton in the front room shows what can be done with a little discipline, the scene, man; canvas, oils, and a diffused but expanding talent. Also masculine bravado.³⁵

A persistent dissociation of art from femininity is characteristic of the vintage macho of modernist art chronicles. Journalist Barrie Hale's *Out of the Park*, though published in 1985, is stylistically consistent with his writing of the '60s and adopts the characteristic hype and "buzzwords" of the period. Punctuated by war and sports imagery, it celebrates rebellious, independent artists who take "risks," "incredible liberties" and though sensitive to nuance are always "tough." Hale's rhetoric, though engaged with Toronto artists, is symptomatic of a formalist criticism indigenous to the New York art scene. Nicole Dubreuil-Blondin notes:

An analysis of the terms used in Greenberg's criticism to talk about Pollock and his work shows a constant recourse to manifest male power. There the artist, full of energy, is defined by his forcefulness, his frustration, his innate violence - a rugged and brutal character reminiscent of *the myth of the all-conquering American hero*. The work itself is situated in the

35. "Around Town" *The Globe and Mail*, 10 November 1962, author unspecified.

same terms: monumental, brave, intense, extravagant, and powerful.³⁶ [my emphasis]

Not surprisingly, attempts to endorse the work of women within this asymmetrical discourse ran the risk of disintegrating into jargonistic confusion. Art historian Dennis Reid (at the time a curator at the National Gallery of Canada) wrote in 1970:

Joyce Wieland's work suffers not in the least beside Snow's. But whereas with Snow one never confronts him within himself, but at a point where you both meet in some phenomenal construction out of his imagination, Wieland takes you into her. This is toughened by an obvious awareness on her part of this role, and the resulting implications are profound.³⁷

The insertion of token women into the existing discourse of the avant-garde presented a "no win" situation that was not lost on women artists. Vera Frenkel, for example, has summarized the complex of contradictory labels that both confined and dismissed women as artists:

too strong (therefore not womanly), too weak (therefore not an artist), too pretty (either stupid or promiscuous), too ugly (deprived or depraved), too young (derivative but available), too old (tough, doesn't fuck but is probably dying to)..and so on.³⁸

The rhetoric of the 1960s was coloured by a fierce insistence upon individual artistic freedom and independence from established institutions.³⁹ The role of women artists in this struggle might be seen to parallel that of women in other revolutionary social movements of the decade:

From 1968-70 I was involved in the McGill student movement. Looking back, however, I can see that I was on the periphery. Women were not really 'let in'; almost all of the women who were involved, myself included, were connected to political

-
- 36. Nicole Dubreuil-Blondin, "Feminism and Modernism: Paradoxes," in Benjamin Buchloh (ed.), *Modernism and Modernity* (Halifax: NSCAD P, 1983), 196.
 - 37. Reid, "Notes on the Toronto Painting Scene: 1959-1969," 35.
 - 38. Vera Frenkel in Janice Cameron et.al., *Eclectic Eve*.
 - 39. See the protest lodged by dissenting artists at "The Conference on the Conference of the Arts," in Hale, *Out of the Park*, 47.

men. It was clearly our ticket in. I can remember meetings where nothing that a woman said was taken seriously.⁴⁰

In the art world women reflected the light of men as models, groupies, girlfriends and wives. Frequently they supported them financially. For women artists, the artist's wife syndrome presented a particular challenge. Joyce Wieland recalls her early years in New York:

I didn't want people to say..."She's pretty good for a woman. She's not a bad painter herself - in relation to her husband." So I didn't want to hear that. I was adamant. I've seen that painters' wives were considered second-class, and that many failed and dropped out. Everybody dropped out in my generation except for two or three people. They just disappeared. And I thought, "Fuck that, boy. They're not going to deny me."⁴¹

Toronto artist Carole Conde recalls curators visiting the studio and not knowing whose work they were really interested in seeing, hers or that of her husband Karl Beveridge.⁴²

A perusal of the only major art periodical in English Canada at the time, *Canadian Art*, confirms that women were more easily conceived of as the object of artistic endeavour - the material of male inspiration - than as creative agents. Figure 1 is an advertisement for Seagram's V.O. Whiskey that was run repeatedly in *artscanada* and *Saturday Night*. Both women and art are reduced to issues of lifestyle in a reaffirmation of the "eternal feminine," and of art as one more formal innovation (fad) after the next. When *Canadian Art* changed its name to *artscanada* in 1967 under the temporary editorship of Barry Lord, it introduced, along with other

40. Nancy Adamson, et. al (eds.), *Feminist Organizing for Change*, 41.

41. Interview with Joyce Wieland, Toronto, 8 October 1986, in Barbara K. Stevenson, "The Political and Social Subject Matter in the Art of Joyce Wieland and Greg Curnoe," Unpublished M.A. thesis, (Ottawa: Carleton U, 1987), 176-77.

42. Personal interview with Carole Conde, Toronto, 26 July 1988. The catalogue by Conde and Beveridge *It's Still Privileged Art* (AGO: 1976) addresses the conundrum of being an artist/wife/mother.

changes to the format, a colour centrefold available separately as a poster. The offerings: Gino Severini's *Abstract Rhythm of Madame S.*, Picasso's *Seated Woman* (1927), Edward Muybridge's sequential photographs of a woman stripping. The so-called "radical" publication *Evidence* followed suit; the 1967 edition features a photo spread entitled "Ukrainian Girls,"⁴³ an assortment of blondes and brunettes modelling fur coats.

The scale of modern art was another decisive factor in dissociating women's production from the center-stage of the avant-garde. Kay Kritzwise writes:

There's no doubt about it, the Nineteen Sixties spell size to artists...It's a natural evolution of something which has been happening to size ever since the abstract expressionists knocked the frames off paintings.⁴⁴

Carole Conde recalls the spectacle of Jerry Santbergen's painting stretched across the Gardiner Expressway,⁴⁵ as an example of just how far the departure from easel painting could go. Few women artists, then as now, could afford a studio space outside of their homes. Artistic production was often carried out in tandem with housework and childrearing within the confines of a kitchen or living room. In this Christiane Pflug was not atypical. Given the limitations of a domestic work space it is not surprising that the expansive scale of much of '60s painting and sculpture was primarily associated with male artists. And while, much like modernist criticism, the scale of '60s painting was a measure not only of local concerns but of a yardstick imported from New York, Lucy Lippard confirms that women's work in the "big apple" also ran contrary to prevailing notions of what constituted serious art:

I thought serious artists had to have big, professional-looking spaces. I found women in corners of men's studios, in

43. "Ukrainian Girls," *Evidence*, vol. 10, 1967, 60.

44. Kay Kritzwise, "Art on the Up and Up," *The Globe and Mail*, Toronto, 11 May 1968.

45. Personal interview with Carole Conde, Toronto, July 26, 1988.

bedrooms and children's rooms, even in kitchens, working away. I thought important American art was large. I found women working small both out of inclination and necessity.⁴⁶

Some women were working big; Milly Ristvedt's large abstract paintings were produced in a studio space during the late '60s and were well received.⁴⁷ However, women's participation in large scale projects could easily be interpreted as a transgression of male territory when the stakes were high. Such was the case for Joyce Wieland, who recalls the reaction to her first feature length film *Reason Over Passion* (1968):

I was made to feel in no uncertain terms by a few male filmmakers that I had overstepped my place, that in New York my place was making little films.⁴⁸

The scope of this chapter does not allow for any in depth analysis of the critical reception of Toronto women during the 1960s in newspaper reviews. However, my examination of *Canadian Art/artscanada* readily reveals that critical articles on individual women artists were few. Equally significant is the treatment of women's work within the many survey and theme articles that were characteristic of the period.

In Robert Fulford's "A Survey of the Work of 24 Young Canadian Artists" (Jan/Feb 1961), four of the twenty four artists are women: Suzanne Bergeron, Molly Bobak, Ghitta Caiserman and Anne Kahane. The fact that three of these women are from Montreal and none from Toronto perhaps testifies to the pre-eminence of Montreal as an artistic centre at the time.⁴⁹ Jonathan Holstein's "New York's Vitality tonic for Canadian Artists" (Sept/Oct 1964) treats Joyce Wieland and Michael

46. Lucy Lippard, *From the Center* (New York: Dutton, 1976), 4.

47. See Barry Lord "Milly Ristvedt: Carmen Lamanna Gallery," *artscanada* 130/131 (April 1969), 40.

48. Kay Armatage, "Interview with Joyce Wieland," in Karyn Kay and Gerald Peary (eds.), *Women and the Cinema: A Critical Anthology*. (New York: E. P. Dutton, 1977), 252.

49. See Elizabeth Kilbourn, "The Toronto-Hamilton Scene," 238 and the Editorial to *Canadian Art*, 95 (Jan/Feb 1965).

Snow together as a married couple rather than as individual artists. Other theme articles such as "Five Artists in their Environments" (April 1969) and "The Education of 12 Practising Artists" (Nov/Dec 1965) typically include no women at all.

Much of the critical writing of the 1960s demonstrates a concern with cultural identity which was both national and localized. In a number of major articles, academics and critics attempted to define the Toronto art scene vis-à-vis other art centres, both within Canada (Montreal) and without (New York). Here too women are scarcely mentioned. In his 1965 article "Toronto's New Art Scene" (Jan/Feb 1965) Hugo McPherson allots one paragraph to Wieland as a exponent of Pop Art while Christiane Pflug warrants half a sentence. David Silcox's article "Canadian Art in the '60s" (Feb 1967) makes only brief reference to Wieland, and while he acknowledges the importance of Anne Kahane and Elza Mayhew to the emergence of sculpture in Canada, he does not support this assertion with any analysis of their work.

Mayhew does gain more attention in Barry Lord's review "Canadian Sculptors at Expo" (May 1967) with the following rather qualified praise:

In addition to her *Meditation Piece* for the Canadian pavillon's sanctuary (a work which is marred by her over-prominent signature and date), Elza Mayhew has distinguished herself in *Concordia*, an 8' high cast bronze totem which is one of her best to date. The surface has been intelligently organized and expressively incised, without becoming too busy as it often does in her weaker pieces. 50

Granted, more comparative analysis would need to be done before concluding that such a critique is gender biased. Nonetheless, accusations of "over-prominent signature" and being "too busy" are not ones that I have encountered in

50. Barry Lord, "Canadian Sculptors at Expo," *artscanada* 108 (May 1967), 14.

contemporary critiques of male artists. They may well reflect the imposition of male-centered standards which cannot account for the different perspective women bring to their work.⁵¹

In 1968 the Art Gallery of Ontario held a major exhibition entitled *Canadian Artists '68*. *artscanada* published three reviews of the show. American critic Lucy Lippard (it was a common practice for *artscanada* to invite Americans to write about Canadian regional or national exhibitions) distinguishes herself by voicing her appreciation for Wieland's work, without introducing her as Michael Snow's wife or as simply one of the Isaacs crowd. Barry Lord, on the other hand, makes no reference to Wieland or any other women in the show. In reviewing the film component, Manny Farber (another American critic) offers a summary treatment of Wieland's three films without according them any significance within experimental film practice. By contrast several paragraphs are lavished upon Michael Snow's *Wavelength*, which Farber heralds as possibly "the sternest reproof to the commercial film as we know it."⁵²

Not surprisingly, the calendar listings for the decade include few exhibitions by women at galleries.⁵³ Anne Kahane of Montreal, and later in the decade Cathie Falk of Vancouver, were the only women besides Joyce Wieland and Christiane Pflug to be represented by Av Isaacs.

Jack Pollock is remembered by Carole Conde as being the only dealer to really give young women a chance, even when their work did not correspond to his

51. Works which were busy with detail were of course anathema to the modernist emphasis on pure colour and abstract form. Evidently Clement Greenberg voiced this criticism of Alexandra Luke's work in the 1950s. See Jennifer C. Watson, *Alexandra Luke: A Tribute*. Exhibition Catalogue (Oshawa: Robert McLaughlin Gallery, 1977), 10.

52. Manny Farber "Films at Canadian Artists '68," *artscanada* 128/129 (Feb 1969), 29.

53. By the early sixties there were several new galleries on the scene. Gallery Moos, Jerrold Morris, Mazelow, Pollock, Galerie Dresdnere and Gallery Pascal exhibited Canadian artists while David Mirvish was known for his exhibitions of American avant-garde art. Burnett and Schiff, 82.

personal preferences.⁵⁴ Conde had her first show at Pollock's Phase II in 1968. Calendar listings would tend to support her statement: it was Pollock who held two retrospective exhibitions of "the girls," Frances Loring and Florence Wyle, one in 1965 and another after their deaths in 1968. He also showed a number of other women: Alice MacKenzie, Thelma Van Alstyne, Mary Schneider, Alison Knowles, Sally Wildman, and Ruth Weisberg.⁵⁵ But Pollock was not in the habit of exhibiting the same group of artists repeatedly in the way that other prominent galleries such as Isaacs, Walter Moos, Jerrold Morris and Carmen Lamanna (who opened in 1967) did. Hence Milly Ristvedt, the only woman then represented by Carmen Lamanna, achieved a higher profile than any of the women mentioned in relation to Pollock, in part because of her dealer's consistent promotion of her work.

Similarly Doris Pascal, who operated the only gallery devoted exclusively to printmaking, regularly exhibited Vera Frenkel from 1965 on. But from the evidence at hand Pascal did not appear to promote any other women, though she may well have carried their work. There is one exhibition notice in November 1967 for Rita Letendre, who had moved from Montreal to Toronto.

While residing in Montreal, Letendre had exhibited regularly in Toronto with Dorothy Cameron up until the closure of the latter's gallery in 1965. Cameron was definitely a key player in the Toronto commercial art scene. When Barry Kerneman closed his Gallery of Contemporary Art in 1959, his former assistant Dorothy Cameron took it over changing the name to the Here & Now Gallery. The Here & Now was lauded by Elizabeth Kilbourn in 1960 for having "proved its vitality with several important, a few remarkable and occasional off-beat exhibitions."⁵⁶ In

54. Personal interview with Carole Conde, Toronto, 26 July 1988.

55. To my knowledge these women were all from the Toronto area.

56. Elizabeth Kilbourn, "The Toronto-Hamilton Scene", 238.

September 1962 the name changed to the Dorothy Cameron Gallery with a focus on exhibiting sculpture and prints. After its closure Cameron was credited with having done more than anybody to promote the medium of printmaking.⁵⁷ Edythe Goodridge of the Canada Council commends Cameron's contribution to "a changed understanding of the arts"⁵⁸ while Gail Hutchinson of the AGO, who worked for Cameron in the '60s, asserts that she was the only one with a vision of the curatorial role that a commercial gallery owner could play, though the men (dealers) did cooperate with her initiatives.⁵⁹ Confirming Cameron's reputation for encouraging young artists - M. J. Tyrwhitt calls her "both den mother and psychiatrist"⁶⁰ - Vera Frenkel recalls being offered an exhibition by her while still a student at the Ecole des Beaux-Arts in Montreal, though she deferred out of shyness.⁶¹ And of course Cameron's hosting of the Eros 65 exhibition at her gallery and her refusal to remove Robert Markle's works from the show - an offense that landed her with a highly publicized conviction on obscenity charges - cast her in the role of the embattled defender of the right to free artistic expression.⁶²

Nonetheless, the extent to which Cameron promoted women artists is unclear from the sources consulted.⁶³ Cameron did take on Alexandra Luke in 1957 upon seeing her work at the Park Gallery along with other members of Painters Eleven. However Joan Murray's catalogue *Alexandra Luke: Continued Searching* only lists one exhibition at Cameron's gallery between that time and Luke's death in

-
57. Harry Malcolmson, "Print-making in Ontario," *Canadian Art*, 95 (Sept/Oct 1965), 13.
 58. Personal interview with Edythe Goodridge, Ottawa, 5 August 1988.
 59. Telephone conversation with Gail Hutchinson, Toronto, 28 July 1988.
 60. M.J. Tyrwhitt, "Dorothy Cameron and the elegant sell," *Macleans Magazine*, 75 (22 Sept 1962), 71.
 61. Telephone conversation with Vera Frenkel, August 13, 1988.
 62. See Kildare Dobbs, "Eros on Yonge Street," *Saturday Night* 81 (Feb 1966), 18-21 and Kenneth Smookum, "Argument," *Macleans Magazine*, 79 (2 April 1966), 48.
 63. My own investigation here has been limited by Cameron's refusal to be interviewed about the past.

1966 - a solo show in 1961. An invitation to Joyce Wieland's solo show at the Here & Now indicates that in 1960 Cameron represented three other women besides Luke and Wieland: Micheline Beauchemin, Sarah Jackson and Florence Vale.⁶⁴ Joyce Wieland departed for Isaacs later in 1960, and aside from Rita Letendre I found no evidence in *artscanada* of the women above or others being consistently associated with Cameron's gallery. I did find a single listing for Helen Piddington in 1965.

In addition to these more prominent galleries there were exhibition listings for women at lesser known venues: May Marx and Niiko Nishimura at 123 (Nov. 1967), Cathy Arthur at Shaw Rimmington (April 1969), Marion Greenstone at Albert White (April 1968), Grace McKenzie at W and W (April 1967), and Jane Mitchell and Sara Gill at the Towne Cinema (Dec. 1968), while sculptor Patricia Fulford was represented by Helen Mazelow. Likewise, University based galleries such as Hart House (University of Toronto) and the gallery at York University included some local women; Christiane Pflug had a retrospective at Hart House in 1969. However, despite the sense of place that supposedly informed the Toronto avant-garde - the paid advertising in *Canadian Art/artscanada* alone testifies to the commitment of Toronto dealers to marketing local *male* artists, while names such as Snow, Town and Coughtry are the staple of every critical article on the '60s "scene" - there is very little in the way of consistent representation and promotion of women artists from Toronto in Toronto. Wieland, Pflug, Fulford and Frenkel along with Conde and Ristvedt (after 1968) are the only names which recur with any frequency. Within the Toronto listings, they are easily outnumbered by women artists from elsewhere: Anne Kahane, Rita Letendre, Betty Goodwin, Ghitta Caiserman-Roth, Lise Gervais,

64. Wieland file in the library collection of the Art Gallery of Ontario, Toronto.

and Suzanne Bergeron (Montreal), Helen Frankenthaler and Louise Nevelson (New York), Molly Bobak (Fredericton), Gathie Falk, Sherry Grauer and Audrey Capel Doray (Vancouver), and Pat Martin Bates (Victoria), though these women too do not comprise a very long list.

To summarize briefly, then, a select few Toronto women were promoted in isolation from one another by the key galleries, while a small number (in proportion to male artists) of other women were given sporadic attention by lesser known galleries. The existence of commercial venues owned by women (Cameron, Pascal and Mazelow) may have increased the number of women given recognition - Frenkel and Fulford for example - but does not seem to have appreciably altered this overall pattern.

While few women gained visibility as artists, women were prominent in the supportive roles of curator, critic, or gallery administrator. Dorothy Cameron's contribution has already been discussed. Jean Sutherland Boggs' article "In Canada, a place for women",⁶⁵ beginning with the statement "Canada might seem a haven for women in the arts" goes on to list women in influential positions in art publishing, galleries, museums, and councils. However, through the course of the article only two artists are mentioned: Emily Carr and Joyce Wieland. Some haven.

Sandra Gwyn's report *Women in the Arts in Canada*, confirms Boggs' essay and also introduces another element, the formation of Women's Committees in art galleries. According to Elizabeth Kilbourn,

It was these women, perhaps more than any other group, who consciously pioneered the public acceptance of contemporary

65. Jean Sutherland Boggs, "In Canada, a place for women," *Artnews*, 73.7 (Sept 1974), 30-32.

Canadian art...Women's committees pioneered the device of picture loan for collectors with small budgets...⁶⁶

The degree to which women artists' careers were furthered by these volunteered efforts to promote contemporary Canadian art, or by the influence of women curators, dealers, critics, and administrators remains an area for further enquiry. However, one can reasonably conclude that male artists, at least, were the beneficiaries of an enormous amount of female ingenuity and energy in these supportive roles.

By the end of the decade, critical writing was no longer holding women artists up as exceptions. Rather the tendency was more towards negating the significance of gender altogether, effectively recycling the modernist concept of art as a value-free practice separate from social and political considerations, while subsuming any specifically female perspective into a male defined universality. Gail Dexter's article "These three women want you to accept them as artists, not 'women artists'"⁶⁷ celebrates the arrival of "three artists who happen to be women" and "are making it in Toronto now": Eleanor Mackey, Milly Ristvedt and Carole Conde. The comments of these women (a generation younger than Wieland and Pflug) are a good measure of the contradictory messages that women were receiving during the decade.

An artist friend once told me that I was the greatest woman artist in Canada. That was a terrific compliment. But then I began to realize that I'd never thought of him - or anyone - as a great *male* artist. - Milly Ristvedt

People look at the pastel colours in my paintings and call them "feminine." But when a man - like Jules Olitski, say - uses pastels, it's not feminine. It's his *art*! - Eleanor Mackey

66. Sandra Gwyn, *Women in the Arts in Canada*, Study prepared for the Royal Commission on the Status of Women in Canada, Ottawa, 1971.

67. Gail Dexter, *Toronto Daily Star*, 1 Feb 1969, 53.

Being a woman artist is awful. It's a degrading unnecessary label. And it means you have to work twice as hard just to be accepted as an artist. - Carole Conde

Finally, what is excluded from the historical record is often as illuminating as that which is considered "newsworthy." In the April 1967 issue of *artscanada*, there is an "obituary" for the CBC radio program *Umbrella*, flamboyantly hosted by William Ronald, who established his career as a member of Painters Eleven. However in that same year there is no article in tribute to Alexandra Luke, an equally vital member of Painters Eleven, who died of cancer at age sixty-six. One possible explanation for this absence is the antipathy of editor Barry Lord, an avowed socialist, for Luke's husband, a member of the "General Motors sell-out family of McLaughlins in Oshawa."⁶⁸ If so, then this dismissal of Luke is truly ironic, for her husband did not take her work seriously either. During her trips to study with Hans Hofmann, Robert McLaughlin would "take down her work and put up the Victorian pictures with which he felt more comfortable."⁶⁹ A "no win" situation indeed.

2.2 Collections

Avis Lang Rosenberg's *Women Artists and the Canadian Art World: A Survey* is one of a number of studies performed since the Royal Commission on the Status of Women in 1971, motivated by the need for some "hard facts about the inclusion and representation of work by woman artists in Canadian artworld artspaces."⁷⁰ Though most of her data reflects women's status in the 1970s, Rosenberg's examination of the collection of the Art Gallery of Ontario includes

68. See Barry Lord, *The History of Painting in Canada*, (Toronto: NC Press, 1974), 204.

69. Murray, *Alexandra Luke*, 1.

70. Avis Lang Rosenberg. "Women Artists and the Canadian Art World: A Survey." *Atlantis*, 5.1 (Fall 1979), 107.

figures for the years 1960, 1970 and 1976, with a breakdown according to medium, nationality (Canadian or Non-Canadian) and sex (Appendix 1).⁷¹ Rosenberg summarizes her findings:

Large beasts move slowly and sometimes backwards. The percentage of works by women was 5.5% in 1960, up somewhat to 7.4% in 1970, and back down in 1976 to 7.2%, the slippage probably due in part to all those recent new Henry Moores.⁷²

I have derived the tables below from the data provided by Rosenberg. Table 1 locates the shifts in women's representation in the Canadian collection while Table 2 reveals acquisition patterns.

<i>Percentage of Works by Women in the AGO's Canadian Collection</i>				
	Painting %	Drawing %	Sculpture %	Prints %
1960	11	3	27.5	3.5
1970	11.5	8	20.6	12.6
1976	11.1	8.1	18.8	13.3

Table 1

<i>Acquisitions to the AGO Canadian Collection 1960-1976</i>				
	Painting	Drawing	Sculpture	Prints
# Women/ Total Acq.	65/574	30/249	17/109	66/330
% Women	11.3%	12%	15.6%	20%

Table 2

71. The actual number of women artists in the collection is not recorded by Rosenberg as the AGO's cataloguing procedures at the time of her study made such a calculation prohibitive.

72. *Ibid.*, 2.

The bulk of the Canadian collection is comprised of paintings: 55.5% in 1976. Between 1960 and 1976 the painting collection expanded by 67% with 574 acquisitions. In this central area the status quo of 11% was maintained in relation to women's representation.

In the drawings collection women are better represented in 1976 than they were in 1960, but Table 2 indicates that as a percentage of purchases this area was only marginally better than painting. Only in the area of prints do we see any substantial increase in women's representation, a point I shall return to.

Sculpture was the area of greatest expansion during this sixteen year period: 272% compared to 67% (painting) 127% (drawing) and 147% (prints). Though the percentage of women in the sculpture collection exceeds those in other categories, it is here where women in fact lose ground; falling from 27.5% of the collection to 18.8%. This being Canadian sculpture, the Henry Moore bequest can hardly account for the decline.

It is possible that the reason proportionately fewer sculptural works by women were being collected had to do with the growing importance of sculpture at the time and the issues thus engaged. Literature on the period indicates that where the culture heroes of Toronto in the early 1960s were celebrated for their painting - Barrie Hale and Dennis Reid's "Toronto Painting: 1953-65," for instance - the latter part of the decade heralded the ascendancy of sculpture. Much of the credit for this new emergence is attributed to Dorothy Cameron, whose gallery closed in late 1965 because the medium was not financially viable. Two years later the situation was more optimistic. The Department of Public Works Program - created in policy in

1964 - got underway in 1968 when a Fine Art Advisory Committee was established.⁷³ The May 1967 issue of *artscanada* was largely devoted to sculpture at Expo.⁷⁴ Among the flurry of commissions and programs set up for Canada's Centennial, the ambitious "Sculpture '67" exhibition organized by Dorothy Cameron for the National Gallery was enthusiastically received by critics and public alike and marked a new visibility for Canadian sculpture. In their writing of 1967, both Robert Fulford⁷⁵ and David Silcox⁷⁶ acknowledge and welcome the new place of sculpture on the Canadian art scene.

In her preface to the catalogue *Sculpture '67*, Cameron makes the following observation about what's happening in Canadian sculpture:

...far fewer sculptors (a handful only) were bringing fresh insight to the human form or concern to the humanist tradition; the majority...were involved with the exploration of new forms, new spatial concepts and new materials, with the technological transformations of a world-wide plastic-coated electric revolution.⁷⁷

What Cameron is describing here is a major shift in sculptural concerns, what Robert Fulford refers to as "the conflict between old and new versions of sculptural reality," which *Sculpture '67* "acted out in public."⁷⁸ The fascination of contemporary artists' with computers and technological wizardry is evident in the pages of *artscanada*. The theme of the February 1967 issue was "technology;" Marshall McLuhan authored the feature article. The August 1968 issue was devoted to the use of plastics, then entering the domestic market having been originally

73. Bodolai, "Sculpture: A Rebirth of Humanism", 43.

74. See Barry Lord, "Canadian Sculptors at Expo," *artscanada*, 108 (May 1967), 12.

75. Robert Fulford, "Sculpture '67," *artscanada* 111/112 (Aug/Sept 1967).

76. David P. Silcox, "Canadian Art in the Sixties," *artscanada* 105 (February 1967).

77. Dorothy Cameron, *Sculpture '67*, National Gallery of Canada, 1967.

78. Fulford, "Sculpture '67."

developed for the NASA space program. In writing about the work of Gerald Gladstone, William Withrow concurs:

His work is an expression of the 1960's in two effective ways: its forms are directly inspired by our pre-occupation with the exploration of outer space and he uses the technical methods of industry.⁷⁹

As only six out of the fifty-one sculptors in Cameron's landmark exhibition were women, it would appear that few women sculptors were producing work consistent with these emerging sculptural concerns and the critical discourse that supported them. Of the six who were included: Suzanne Guite, Catharine Boudreau, Anne Kahane, Patricia Fulford, Francoise Sullivan and Lise Gervais, only the work of the latter two would seem to correspond to Cameron's analysis in conception or choice of materials. (See Figures 2 - 7). The comments of the artists are illuminating, echoing the alienation of Wieland and Pflug.⁸⁰

My artist's compulsion to work with forms comes from this need we all share, this human need to be part of a whole...To hear the voice of the universe, I must first be still and listen to my own. - Suzanne Guite

The first time I was really "on" with my work, I became aware that it had nothing at all to do with my ego...I was only the *vehicle* for creativity...I do not want to play the game of "being a sculptor." I just want to function as a complete person, part of whose day to day life is to work at sculpture. - Catharine Boudreau

Yet because of the way I choose to work, I feel "out of things" today. On the other hand, since the "things" I am "out of" are not *my* things, I am both lonely and quite unconcerned about it. - Anne Kahane

If the heroic posturing of avant-garde painting alienated women, the engagement of sculpture with the paradigm shifts of a space age society could be seen

79. William Withrow, "Canadian Sculpture Today," in *Fifteen Canadian Artists*, Exhibition Catalogue (New York: MOMA, n.d.), unpaginated.

80. Quoted in Dorothy Cameron, *Sculpture '67*, 22, 38, 44.

as similarly exclusive. In fact one senses a certain resistance on the part of these three women to the preoccupations of a technological age. Certainly Wieland's work of the '60s, in particular her film *Reason over Passion* (1968), can be seen in this light, as can Christiane Pflug's depictions of Toronto, where high-rise buildings and high tension towers signal the dehumanizing effect of technology on the urban environment.

For purposes of comparison, at 11.8% "Sculpture '67" has an even lower percentage of women than the AGO's acquisition pattern (see Tables 1 and 2). But if we take this 11.8% figure as an indicator of the gap between women artists' concerns and those of the new sculptural vanguard, the decline of women in the area of sculpture at the AGO may be seen as a measure of women's position to the dominant discourse of art production, rather than as evidence of discrimination on the part of individual curators.

Returning to the print collection, the AGO statistics would appear to bear out what a number of feminists have observed, that within the hierarchies of the art world the participation of women is more acceptable in less prestigious mediums or new experimental areas which have yet to be sanctified by feats of male artistic genius. Some women of course have found this appealing. Lisa Steele points out that part of video's initial attraction for women was that, much like performance art, it lay outside the burden of 'official' histories.⁸¹ At the same time the exclusion of women from certain areas of cultural production - whether by fiat or persuasion - has been used as an instrument of power. Perhaps the most frequently cited example

81. Lisa Steele, "Committed to Memory," in Rhea Tregebov (ed.), *Work in Progress: Building Feminist Culture*, (Toronto: The Women's Press, 1987), 40.

is the exclusion of women from history painting in the heyday of the academies, and their consignment to,

the genres of still life, portraiture, and landscape, genres considered less prestigious and thought to demand less skill or intellect...their concentration in these areas signified their inferiority.⁸²

Women are caught in a circular logic that not only concentrates them in areas considered secondary within the existing hierarchies but then reinforces the notion that they themselves are inferior because of their location and practice. This self-fulfilling prophecy serves to maintain women's exclusion, not simply from the making of particular kinds of artifacts, but from agency within the larger symbolic order. As Dorothy Smith has described it, women are excluded,

from the work of producing the forms of thought and the images and symbols in which thought is expressed and ordered.
83

Griselda Pollock points out how specific restrictions act to maintain this status quo,

Control over access to the nude was instrumental in the exercise of power over what meanings were constructed by an art based upon an ideal of the human body. Official exclusion from life classes ensured that women had no means to determine the language of high art or to make their own representations of the world, and thus resist and contest the hegemony of the dominant class or gender.⁸⁴

It is not unexpected to find then that women fared best in the AGO's collection in printmaking, an artisanal mode of production whose processes made it the antithesis of the heroic painterly gesture. The production of editions did make

82. Pollock, "Women, Art and Ideology," 216.

83. Dorothy E. Smith, "An Analysis of ideological structures and how women are excluded: considerations for academic women," *Canadian Review of Sociology & Anthropology*, 12/(4) Part 1, 1975, 354.

84. Pollock, "Women, Art and Ideology," 217.

the work more accessible, but such democratic notions, though compatible with the political sentiments of the 1960s, would have been at odds with the celebrity that attends the making of precious, unique objects.

At the same time, a lesser degree of competitiveness was associated with graphic work vis-à-vis painting, as Elizabeth Kilbourn comments in 1960:

No overnight reputation is made, no fortune amassed on the strength of a graphics show. But the political manoeuvring - the toes that musn't be stepped on and the wrists that must be slapped - all this is too apparent for a comfortable perusal of paintings in an OSA or CGP show.⁸⁵

This lesser status also held a certain strategic appeal. Recalling the circumstances of her involvement teaching printmaking at the Artists Workshop⁸⁶ in the mid '60s, Diane Pugen felt that to secure a teaching position it was necessary to have a skill to offer that was different from those of the male instructors. In this way any direct competition was avoided.⁸⁷

Though a much smaller 'beast' than the AGO, the Hart House Collection at the University of Toronto is nonetheless an important collection that bears examination. The gallery at Hart House has a history of early receptivity to modernist painting with a Painters Eleven exhibition held in 1956⁸⁸ and a controversial exhibition of figurative work by Michael Snow and Graham Coughtry in 1955.⁸⁹ In his introduction to the catalogue of the collection published in 1969, Hugo McPherson lays a claim for the Hart House Art Committee as a "sponsor of

85. Kilbourn, "The Toronto-Hamilton Scene," 237.

86. The New School (professional visual art training), founded in the fall of 1965, joined with the Hockley Valley School (summer school) and the Artists Workshop (visual & performing arts) under the directorship of John Sime. By 1969 they were known collectively as Three Schools. See advertisement, *artscanada* 130/131 (April 1969), 51.

87. Personal interview with Diane Pugen, Toronto, July 29, 1988.

88. Hale, *Out of the Park*, 30.

89. *Ibid.*, 52.

new forces in Canadian art,"⁹⁰ recalling the electronic jazz combo at the opening of Les Levine's one-man show in 1964 and the installation of a corner of Dennis Burton's studio in the latter's exhibition of 1966. According to McPherson, the "critical *gestalt* in the committee's growth...was the decision in 1961 to buy a major canvas by Harold Town."⁹¹ In his text for the catalogue Jeremy Adamson concurs:

Since the early 1960s the Hart House collection has expanded rapidly, and paintings truly representative of contemporary art in Canada have appeared on the common room walls. The purchase in 1961 of Harold Town's *Homage to Turner* and Jock Macdonald's *Airy Journey* provided the necessary breakthrough.⁹²

While this victory for the avant-garde was characteristic of the decade's "energetic and often controversial exhibitions"⁹³ it did not stimulate a favourable climate for the purchase of works by women. My examination of this collection as catalogued in 1969 indicates that indeed it was a period of expansion, with 30 works *purchased* (rather than donated) during that decade. However, only 3 of these or 10% were by women.

Appendix 2 provides a list of all of the women included within the *Hart House Collection of Canadian Paintings* in 1969. Though sculpture is not included in this catalogue, works on paper are. It is important to note that like all museum collections a substantial number of acquisitions are gifts rather than purchases; however as this would appear to apply equally to male and female artists I will only make the distinction (as above) where it appears significant. My examination of this data indicates that of the 100 artists represented in the collection, 20 or 20% were

90. Jeremy Adamson, *The Hart House Collection of Canadian Paintings*, (Toronto: U of T P, 1969), 7.

91. *Ibid.*

92. *Ibid.*, 16.

93. *Ibid.*

women. The total number of art works in the collection was 162⁹⁴ with 24 or 14.8% of these by women. Hence the purchase record of 10% for the 1960s was well below average.

Women artists are rarely represented by more than one work in the collection. The only exceptions to this rule are Lilius Torrance Newton and Dorothy Stevens. Two of the three portraits by Newton are of Vincent Massey (principal founder of Hart House) and his wife Alice and were presented as gifts by the Masseys in 1934, while the three small etchings by Dorothy Stevens constitute a single purchase by the Sketch Club in that same year.

This raises two issues, for not only are women under-represented as a group but as individuals. Where there are five Lisners and eight Milnes there is only one Carr. Hence developments in the oeuvre of any given female artist cannot be traced, much less the relationship of her work to her contemporaries. Such tokenism situates women's art works as poetic moments outside the narrative of history. Hence any legitimation of women's work through acquisition or exhibition is tempered by their exclusion from critical or art historical discourse. In a review of Christiane Pflug's posthumous exhibition at the Art Gallery of Ontario in 1975, Roald Nasgaard, the AGO's new curator of contemporary art, comments that "while the pictures `did not add anything essential to the history of art, it was their strength that made them so valuable.'"95

The institution of the Canada Council Art Bank in 1972 was consistent with a general increase in public patronage of the arts. For artists, dependence upon the competitive market forces that drive the commercial art scene shifted to increasing

94. While 163 works are listed, one is acknowledged as a loan from the U. of T. collection.

95. Gary Michael Dault [Review] "A Delicate and Stirring Show," *Toronto Star* July 18, 1975.

expectations and demands upon the largesse of government funded arts councils. Founded in 1957 with a modest public endowment, the budget of the Canada Council continued to rise during the 1960s, with the first big increase coming in 1965 when an annual Parliamentary grant was introduced.⁹⁶ The Ontario Arts Council was founded in 1963⁹⁷ based on the federal model with a budget of \$300,000 growing to \$1,750,00 by the end of the decade.⁹⁸ This opening up of government funds led to the organization of a number of lobby groups: the Professional Art Dealers Association of Canada (PADAC) in 1965,⁹⁹ Canadian Artists Representation (CARFAC) in 1968¹⁰⁰ and the Association of National Non-profit Artists' Centres (ANNPAC) in 1976. The evolution of the latter two groups marked a departure from the paternalism of the dealer/artist relationship to greater autonomy and self-determination on the part of artists in controlling the production, exhibition, distribution and documentation of their work. Though shifting economic dependence from the market to the government may seem to be an exchange of one master for the next, the structures of art councils (jurying by peers) and their responsiveness to new directions in art-making do allow for greater artists' control over the distribution of existing funds, however inadequate these may be.

The figures provided by Avis Lang Rosenberg's study indicate that women artists have benefitted from this economic shift,¹⁰¹ something the author attributes to differing "notions about saleability."

96. The Canada Council, *Twenty plus five*, (Ottawa: The Canada Council, 1977), 6.

97. Roy MacSkimming, *For Arts' Sake: A History of the Ontario Arts Council 1963-1983*, (Toronto: Ontario Arts Council, 1983), 11.

98. *Ibid.*, Appendix B, 72.

99. Kay Kritzwiser, "PADAC," *Art News*, 73.7 (Sept 1974), 30.

100. Barry Lord, "Artist Power or Reviews Don't Pay the Rent," *artscanada*, 120/121 (August 1968), 41.

101. Rosenberg, 109-111.

<i>Comparative Representation of Women in 1976</i>	
	% Women
Canada Council Art Bank Collection*	22.4
AGO Collection	7.2
AGO Canadian Collection	13.0
Commercial gallery rosters	15.1
* Art Bank figures are for 1975	

Table 3

In contrast to Rosenberg's findings, Sasha McInnes-Hayman's study, performed for Status of Women Canada in 1981, is more critical of the Art Bank's track record. Her data points to "an obvious inequity perpetuated from the programme's inception to the present."¹⁰² What is particularly interesting about her data (see Appendix 3) is the large disparity it reveals in the amounts of money allotted to the purchase of works by women in comparison to their male counterparts. On a per capita basis the proportion is \$1,434 (females) to \$2,958 (males) or 1:2. McInnes-Hayman also provides an appendix listing fourteen artists who were the highest paid over the eight year period of her study, receiving a total of \$1,098,636. Though the inclusion of these 'stars' - all males - does skew the overall statistics somewhat, when excluded from the calculations the average for male artists still remains high at \$2,322. The proportion of women to men is then 1:1.6.

Rosenberg's data provides a useful cross reference.¹⁰³

102. Sasha McInnes-Hayman, *Art Bank Collection: Expenditure on works by male and female artists for years 1971/72 through 1979/80, 1981, 1.*

103. Rosenberg, 109.

<i>Works by Women Artists in the Art Bank - March 1975</i>			
Category	Total # Works	# Works by Women	% Works by Women
Painting	767	130	16.9%
Sculpture	279	53	19.0%
Works on Paper	2205	544	24.7%
Total Works	3251	727	22.4%

Table 4

What can be determined from these figures is that works on paper comprise 74% of all purchases of women's works. As works on paper tend to fetch lower prices than either paintings or sculptures this offers a possible explanation for the gender gap. However, works on paper also comprise a major portion of the works purchased from men: 67%. Clearly then differences in the amounts of money allotted to male and female artists can be attributed to the sex of the worker rather than the medium of the work. On average, women's work is cheaper. Moreover, the ratio of 1:1.6 that we find in the Art Bank statistics is consistent with the value of women's work elsewhere in the Canadian labour force, where women earn 62 cents for every dollar a man earns.¹⁰⁴

2.3 Canada Council Grants

In the area of direct federal funding of individual artists, there is no published material that addresses the 1960s. Table 5 below is based on unpublished statistics secured from the Research and Analysis Section of the Canada Council (Appendix 4).

104. *The Facts*, vol. 7 no. 3 (May/June 1985), 10. Similar figures were published by Labour Canada in 1987. See Nancy Adamson et. al., 6.

The Council's breakdown according to sex encompasses bursaries in all disciplines, not just the visual arts, so it can only be taken as an indicator of women's status in the arts generally. As Sasha-McInnes Hayman points out in her study of the Council,¹⁰⁵ women tend to be on a par or even exceed men receiving grants in the area of dance, hence the picture for women in the visual and other arts is actually more bleak than appears here.

Canada Council Arts Bursaries: All Disciplines 1965/66 to 1969/70				
	APPLICATIONS		AWARDS	
	Women/Total	% Women	Women/Total	%Women
1965-66	111/255	43.5	39/89	43.8
1966-67	150/361	41.5	51/129	39.5
1967-68	144/428	33.6	47/158	29.7
1968-69	217/649	33.4	67/249	26.9
1969-70 I*	260/838	31	61/227	26.8
1969-70 II*	258/869	29.6	56/225	24.8
* statistics for the period 1969-70 include a breakdown for two categories of bursaries				

Table 5

What is evident from Table 5 is that the number of both applications and awards increased dramatically in the second half of the '60s. However the representation of women in both categories decreased and the gap between the percentage of women applying (expectations) and the percentage of women receiving awards (realizations) widened.

105. Sasha McInnes-Hayman and Margaret Wilkinson. *The Canada Council: A Study*. 1982.

Sasha McInnes-Hayman and Margaret Wilkinson have compiled statistics on the Canada Council from 1970/71 to 1980/81. Table 6 is derived from their publication and gives figures for the visual arts and photography for B grants which replaced bursaries in the 1970s. Unfortunately no statistics are available on the actual sums received by individual artists.

<i>Canada Council B Grants: Visual Arts and Photography 1971/72 to 1980/81</i>				
	APPLICATIONS		AWARDS	
	Women/Total	% Women	Women/Total	%Women
1971-72	N/A	N/A	N/A	N/A
1972-73	105/416	25.2	24/94	25.5
1973-74	93/293	31.7	10/44	22.7
1974-75	136/432	31.5	25/82	30.5
1975-76	151/483	31.3	21/75	28
1976-77	154/443	34.8	13/78	16.7
1977-78	127/408	31.1	17/72	23.6
1978-79	149/461	32.3	19/82	23.2
1979-80	176/493	35.7	34/89	38.2
1980-81	155/431	36	30/74	40.5

Table 6

The 1970s was a period of relative stabilization in terms of the number of applications and awards. During that decade women's presence vacillated without reaching the 40% mark (comparable to their position in 1965, Table 5) until 1981. The figures for 1976 are especially intriguing coming one year after International Women's Year: a rise in the number of applications with a dramatic and unprecedented fall in the number of awards. Though more data from the first half of the '60s is needed for verification, it would appear that as more artists applied for grants and the system became more established, women artists both applied less and received less.

2.4 Art Education

It is generally acknowledged that women instructors do not figure largely in Canadian post-secondary art schools. Given this, my findings on the status of women instructors at the Ontario College of Art are not surprising. Using the brochures published by the College I have assembled statistics on the number and percentage of women teaching (Appendix 5) and the subjects they were assigned to teach (Appendix 6).

Appendix 5 conveys that with some variation the percentage of women instructors was never more than 28% and rarely more than 20%. In actual numbers they range from 6 to 17. At 19% the complement of female instructors in 1969/70 was exactly the same as it had been in 1959/60 though in the interim the number of faculty *tripled*. The extent of these women's course loads could not be determined (ie. whether part-time or full-time) from the information available. Positions as technical assistants became available in 1963 but the number of women decreased as more positions opened up.

Women were in charge of departments (with titles that varied from Director to Chairman to Head) in only two areas: Lily C. Maley (1959-68) and Helen F. Gregor (1968-) in Material Arts/Textiles, and Ruth Home (1959-66) and Dorothy Hoover (1967-) in Museum Research/Dept. of History of Art. These appointments reflect the general consignment of women to teaching in areas which are ancillary to art-making: English, Art History, Museum Research; or considered the preserve of women: textiles, fashion illustration (See Appendix 6). Women rarely taught painting or sculpture though a few taught lettering and design. It should be noted

that Appendix 6 does not indicate the course load of women instructors, nor does it differentiate between day or evening courses. It simply means, for example, that 2 women were teaching painting in 1966/67. One of them was Christiane Pflug, who, though she enjoyed teaching and was reputedly popular with her students, left for reasons of internal politics.¹⁰⁶

Gail Geltner, a student of Christiane's at OCA, confirms her popularity but also that her method of teaching painting - encouraging the students to paint things as they really look - was at odds with the methods of other instructors who "didn't say look but paint your guts."¹⁰⁷ Geltner also recalls that Christiane extended herself outside the class, inviting students to her house and providing "the only chance for women students to have these sorts of discussions. The boys hung out together." Christiane's husband Michael Pflug claims that Christiane was fired by Carl Schaefer, then Chairman of the Department of Painting, because of artistic differences; in the face of the college's strong disapproval of the Dine/Oldenburg/Segal exhibition at the Art Gallery of Ontario (Jan 14-Feb 12 1967), Christiane nonetheless encouraged her students to attend.¹⁰⁸ While the precise circumstances of Christiane's termination of employment at OCA remain uncertain, clearly her divergence from the established norms of painting at the college (ie. the practice of her male colleagues) isolated her politically in ways which precipitated her departure. What is also evident from Geltner's recollections is that female students were equally isolated from discussions relevant to their artistic concerns, and that the absence of sympathetic female instructors, such as Pflug, reinforced this exclusion.

106. From a personal interview with Carole McIntyre, close friend of the Pflug family, Toronto, July 28, 1988.

107. Telephone interview with Gail Geltner, Toronto, November 19, 1988.

108. Conversation with Michael Pflug, Toronto, November 18, 1988.

In order to examine the situation for female students at the Ontario College of Art, I have calculated statistics (see Appendices 7 and 8) based on the student yearbooks published by the College. These provide an unofficial record of the students enrolled in each year and area. I identified female students by their names alone. Where names were unfamiliar to me, due to ethnic origin, or ambiguity (eg. Terry), such students were counted as male. Hence the number of female students may actually be higher than indicated, though there were never more than 15 such names in any given year. For more precise statistics, the official records of the college would need to be consulted. Also, yearbooks for the years 1967/68 and 1968/69 could not be located by the OCA library at the time of this research, hence there are no figures for those years. Still, patterns of enrolment over the decade are sufficiently apparent from the material at hand.

As far as women's shifting enrolment in specific areas is concerned, these statistics are not precise enough to provide conclusive evidence, though the virtual absence of women in Industrial Design, for example, is readily apparent. In the area of sculpture, the numbers are so small that a difference of one or two women would totally skew the percentage. But interesting observations may be made about the area of Material Arts where enrolment expanded nine times between 1961 and 1970. Material Arts included textiles, ceramics and other craft related art forms as well as some steel-welded sculpture. As mentioned above, it was one of two areas consistently headed by a woman and included areas (textiles and ceramics) where female instructors were hired with greatest regularity (See Appendix 6). According to Angelo Rao who maintains the slide collection at the OCA library, the slides for

Material Arts (now defunct as a department) are still kept as a separate category from the Fine Art slides.¹⁰⁹

In the early '60s, *all* of the students in this area were women, but by the end of the decade, female students accounted for only 60% to 70%. One could surmise that increasing interest in Material Arts reflected the re-evaluation of artisanal modes of production that was the legacy of the dadaist debunking of high art culture. The celebrated exhibition Dine/Oldenburg/Segal at the ACO and the installation at the Isaacs Gallery of Joyce Wieland's cloth hangings (April 1967) are only two examples of the local currency of Pop Art and neo-dadaist ideas, which integrated art with daily life.¹¹⁰ The pattern here could reasonably be interpreted as a displacement of women resulting from the adoption of art forms, previously considered feminine mediums, into the high art lexicon. Roszika Parker's discussion of the division of labour between men and women in the English Arts and Crafts movement, specifically William Morris' treatment of embroidery, is a parallel historical example.¹¹¹

A comparison of Appendices 7 and 8 indicates that where overall enrolment during the decade increased by 62%, women students as a percentage of the total student body remained stable at around 40%. Where we see a change in the pattern for women is in the third and fourth years, where their presence steadily increases. Specifically, we can calculate that fourth year students of both sexes represented

109. Telephone conversation with Angelo Rao, August 3, 1988.

110. Toronto artists' interest in neo-dada is discussed in Marie Fleming, "Joyce Wieland: A Perspective," in *Joyce Wieland*, 25.

111. While Morris is credited with transforming Victorian embroidery altogether - promoting the breakdown between high art and craft - he did little to break down the sexual division of labour. His patterns were embroidered by women in his shop according to his instructions. Roszika Parker, *The Subversive Stitch: Embroidery and the Making of the Feminine*, (London: The Women's Press, 1984), 180-183.

13.9% of the student body in 1961/62 and 17.86% of the student body in 1969/70: an increase of 28%. If we look at the figures for women for those same years, we can calculate that female students in fourth year jumped from 4.6% to 7.1% of the student body: a 54% increase. The corresponding figures for males are 9.27% to 10.7%: a 15.3% increase. Hence, though the percentage of women students enrolling in the college changed very little, there was a definite trend for more of the female students who did enroll to complete their studies and graduate. And though this trend may well have been common to female students at post-secondary institutions generally during the same period, what is of interest here is how this development connects with other trends in the art world.

During the 1960s the Ontario College of Art was under considerable attack from those who considered themselves part of the mainstream of modern art. May Ebbitt Cutler's article "Crisis in Canada's Art Schools" levels the following broadside:

...Since the death of the great painter-teacher, Jock Macdonald, in 1960, the Ontario College of Art has contributed almost nothing by way of serious artists to the country.¹¹²

The article quotes former students denigrating the college. Bill Ronald remembers his own battle against its staid academicism in the 1950s. Painter Richard Gorman claims "there are two things wrong with OCA: 1) the teachers are no good, and 2) the students are no good." He concludes his critique with, "The good student has no choice but to rebel."¹¹³ Cutler comments, "There is certainly a considerable history of rebellion among those former students who are today achieving anything as painters" and then goes on to discuss the high drop-out rate at OCA, where "no one

112. May Ebbitt Cutler, "Crisis in Canada's Art Schools," *Canadian Art* 99 (Dec 1965), 14.

113. Cutler, 20.

is expelled except for insubordination." The fact that so many students leave voluntarily is used to substantiate the general opinion of the article that potentially great artists do not graduate from the Ontario College of Art.

Given my reading above of OCA's enrolment patterns, it would seem that the number and proportion of women graduates *increased* at the very time that the reputation of the college was in *decline*. Women were staying on in larger numbers precisely when artistic integrity was being publicly equated with dropping out of OCA. Meanwhile, some of their rebellious male counterparts (Karl Beveridge for one) and at least one female student (Nancy Hazelgrove) were leaving OCA to attend the New School of Art, founded in 1965 by John Sime, Robert Hedrick and Dennis Burton.

The three of us decided to start an art school. We wanted to start something that would produce the kind of natural heirs to the kind of history we had made...to produce guys versatile enough to adjust to whatever changes were happening on the art scene, plus the benefits of our experience and technical know-how.¹¹⁴

Burton's account of the origins of the school would suggest that these "natural heirs" were not likely to be female, for the data discussed thus far suggests that women occupied a place outside the history created by these men. Karl Beveridge's recollections confirm that the intense master-disciple relationship which formed the basis for art training at the New School was primarily a kind of male bonding.¹¹⁵ In the absence of female instructors, the learning process worked quite differently for female students, who often worked part-time as models for the life-drawing classes and were rarely taken seriously as artists. According to Beveridge, Eleanor Mackey

114. Dennis Burton quoted in Vera Frenkel, "The New School of Art: insight-explosions," *artscanada* 122/123 (Oct/Nov 1968), 13.

115. Personal interview with Karl Beveridge and Carole Conde, Toronto, July 26, 1988.

was one of the few who was, in part because as a mature married woman and mother she was less impressionable, less intimidated and better able to parley her way with the instructors.¹¹⁶ Another artist who negotiated her education at the New School adequately to survive in the art world is Nancy Hazelgrove, who arrived after two years at OCA rather than straight out of the protective custody of high school.

To summarize thus far, the Ontario College of Art was being discredited as a training ground for artists precisely when women students were gaining a greater presence there, while the New School, considered a more authentic alternative, continued the male-centered objectives and practices of the avant-garde. This pattern is not without historical precedent. According to Lisa Tickner's account of the suffrage campaign of 1907-14, British women artists faced much the same situation:

And it was a cruel and not insignificant irony that women gained entry to the academic curriculum only at the point at which the power of academic institutions was being challenged by avant-garde developments elsewhere, and that women were often no better placed in these alternatives to the Academy than in the Academy itself.¹¹⁷

What is at issue here then is not whether the attacks upon OCA were fair or accurate, but rather the way in which women are positioned within these debates about the nature of art, the purpose of art education, and the cause of the avant-garde.

The concept of the artist which permeates Cutler's article is consistent with that of the 'culture hero,' a "brave individualist...committing himself to the lonely, self-exposing and frighteningly-uncertain path of creating though the heavens

116. According to Beveridge and Conde, Mackey forfeited her art career at the end of the '60s, including a show with Isaacs, to become a political activist.
 117. Lisa Tickner, *The Spectacle of Women*, (London: Chatto & Windus, 1987), 1.

fall..."¹¹⁸ The single-minded devotion to art that is expected here completely downplays the economic concerns of artists. Rather than questioning why it should be so difficult for an artist to make a living making art, it is the educational institutions who are blamed, for failing to produce artists sufficiently indifferent to gross material concerns.

The curse of Canadian art is the part-time painter and his naive assumption that art does not require the whole of a man, that it can be picked up and dropped according to the dictates of economics, time and inspiration...if he has at hand so easy a means of placating his conscience as "the necessity of earning a living," he postpones the struggle through frustrations and failure that an artist must handle if he would cut his own path to greatness.¹¹⁹

This concept of the artist excludes many women's experiences both on the economic front and in terms of the quantity and quality of time available to women with family responsibilities. This is demonstrated through the words of the women themselves, speaking in 1973:¹²⁰

The years 1961-65 were spent at the Ontario College of Art. It was hard, I had the dual responsibility to family and to school...You can't isolate yourself, that part of you being an artist, is having experiences, is living and living in the ordinary sense, not going out and having wild parties... - June Drutz

I have difficulty in surviving financially: fortunately, I am content with little. However materials cost a lot, and it is hard to support ones work on sales. I teach a minimum of hours to keep me in bread...When my four children were small, I worked shorter hours at art, but probably grew more, intellectually, than if I had gone into production right after art school. - Jo Manning

Both of these women assert their divergence from the formation of the artist as "culture hero" not only in recognizing the limitations imposed by material

118. Cutler, 14.

119. Cutler, 15.

120. Cameron et.al. *Eclectic Eve*.

circumstances but in suggesting an alternative vision of the role of art in their lives. June Drutz denies the importance of "wild parties" which Barrie Hale maintains to be the crux of the 1960s experimental art scene,¹²¹ while Jo Manning, whom Vera Frenkel recalls as being instrumental in securing access to printmaking facilities for herself and other young women printmakers in the '60s,¹²² has the temerity to attribute intellectual growth to her years of limited art production as the mother of four young children.

2.5 Conclusion

In this chapter I have attempted to map out the position of women in relation to the dominant discourses that shaped art production, exhibition, critical writing, collecting, funding and education in the 1960s. In each category I have examined what might be considered mainstream institutions alongside those which more closely identified themselves with the mythologies and practices of the Toronto avant-garde. Thus I have considered collecting patterns at the AGO and at Hart House; representations of women in *Canadian Art/artscanada* and *Evidence*; art education at OCA and the New School; and, finally, the shift in systems of financial support (and legitimation) from the commercial scene to arts council funding. I have attempted to locate relevant points of intersection between these categories, for example between commercial representation/promotion and the critical apparatus that supports it, so as to determine the territory available to women through traditional institutions (the legacy of art history) and the avant-garde (the contemporary interpretation/revision of modernism).

121. Hale, *Out of the Park*, 50.

122. Telephone conversation with Vera Frenkel, August 13, 1988.

To begin, the sources consulted here confirm that Wieland and Pflug were exceptional women in the number of exhibitions and degree of critical attention they received. Wieland in particular was frequently the only woman to even be mentioned in publications featuring the Toronto art scene, and while such articles often omit any serious analysis of her work or demonstrate ambivalence as to its value or significance, they nonetheless acknowledge her membership in the new generation of experimental artists. The scarcity of other women artists in both the exhibition listings and advertisements of *Canadian Art/artscanada* or in that magazine's coverage of the visual arts confirms Wieland's own assertion that "Everybody [women painters] dropped out in my generation except for two or three people."¹²³

While the scarcity of women artists in *Canadian Art/artscanada* might be attributed to its position as a mainstream establishment publication, the visibility of women was in no way enhanced by the appointment of a socialist editor, Barry Lord. Nor did women fare better in the pages of *Evidence*, an alternative tabloid publication generated by the artists associated with Isaacs. Women in the Toronto art world were better tolerated in the supportive roles of curator, gallery owner or critic - Dorothy Cameron, Elizabeth Kilbourn, Kay Kritzwiser (*The Globe & Mail*) and Gail Dexter (*Toronto Star*) - positions one step removed from the creative mystique that surrounded notions of the artist.

Avant-gardism in Toronto was lived out through an intersection of social life and art practice that problematized women's participation in particular ways. The bohemian rejection of conventional sexual mores and by extension the family, the

123. Interview with Joyce Wieland in Stevenson.

convening of artists in public locations traditionally reserved for male camaraderie (taverns) or explicitly sexual voyeurism (strip joints), the expansive scale of painting and sculpture that presumed the availability of large studio spaces, the move away from figurative and humanist concerns to embrace the concepts and materials of space-age technology, the male bonding model of art education, the very language of art criticism, all dovetailed in dissociating femininity from serious art.

My examination of the collections of the AGO and Hart House would indicate that while the representation of women never seems to exceed the 20% mark in either institution, women still fared better at the more traditional AGO than at Hart House, where identification with the artistic ideals of the avant-garde coincided with a decrease in purchases of women's work. Similarly, in art education women seemed to make headway at the more conservative OCA precisely when the torch of the avant-garde was being passed on to the next generation (of males) at the New School. While women were not well served by the commercial art scene, government sponsored channels of validation and financial support (Canada Council grants) became less responsive to women as more artists applied and competition for resources increased. The Art Bank statistics confirm that in the art world, the monetary measure of women's work in relation to their male peers was consistent with other sectors of the economy - undervalued and underpaid.

The pattern that emerges across these practices and institutions is one of containment and displacement. Women artists consistently occupied a tenuous position on the periphery of the art world, left behind in the wake of the avant-garde's own regeneration. At the same time women were isolated from one another, both numerically (representation within collections and commercial

galleries) and figuratively (the rejection of the label "woman artist" by those "making it"). Some of those women who nonetheless persisted in making art, often in relative obscurity as in the case of those documented in *Eclectic Eve*, expressed a sense of alienation from avant-garde notions of art and the artist - mastery, disinterestedness, art as a discreet category divorced from daily life. Their words suggest a certain resistance to the hegemony of contemporary male-dominated movements, asserting the validity of their own alternative visions of art and art practice. However, without a public discourse to validate their perspective and to articulate their struggle in collective terms, such resistance remained isolated within the domain of the personal.

3. Christiane Pflug

And so everything passes, the sadness about what was lost, and what one never had, is sometimes so violent and unreasonable. I mean against all reason and what one could possibly expect. Always one wants to lift the day beyond itself into something marvellously festive, dream-like and beautiful. Stella and Morris Louis succeeded. Compared to that, what one does oneself looks cramped and detailed, but I can't do anything else. The sun shines on the small houses, through the twigs of the trees one sees cars standing in front of each other. Covered with snow, the car roofs are set off from each other, here and there a red or blue one, which I am just painting. I love to paint again. I'm not so impatient any more. Sometimes it seems to me as if the mass of different elements produces an effect which puts it into relation to the complexity and confusion of life. Then again, one would like to take a broom and create space for clear pure forms and colours. And so it goes on, with the restlessness that eats one and hollows one out, a kind of constant battle. One doesn't want to imagine that one could fail.

Christiane Pflug, Toronto, 1968 ¹

I claim that every woman in this century and in our cultural sphere who has ventured into male-dominated institutions - 'literature' and 'aesthetics' are such institutions - must have experienced the desire for self-destruction. In her novel *Malina*, Ingeborg Bachmann has the woman disappear inside the wall at the end, and the man Malina, who is a part of her, serenely states the case: "There is no woman here."

The last sentence reads: "It was murder."

It was also suicide.

Christa Wolf ²

1 Dedication in *Brick* (Winter 1987), 5.

2 Christa Wolf, "A Letter about Unequivocal and Ambiguous Meaning, Definiteness and Indefiniteness; about Ancient Conditions and New View-Scopes; about Objectivity" in Gisela Ecker (ed.), *Feminist Aesthetics*, (London: The Women's Press, 1985), 105.

This chapter will address the painting and drawing of Christiane Pflug, who lived in Toronto from 1959 until her suicide in 1972. Even before her untimely death at age 35, Christiane received considerable attention from galleries, collectors and critics with retrospectives at the Winnipeg Art Gallery (1966), Hart House (1969) and the Sarnia Art Gallery (1971); two major exhibitions, curated by art historian Ann Davis³ were launched posthumously by the Winnipeg Art Gallery in 1974 and 1979. She was one of only four women to teach painting at the Ontario College of Art during the 1960s, and received two grants from the Canada Council which enabled her to spend the summers of 1967 and 1968 painting and drawing on the Toronto Islands.⁴ As I have already indicated in Chapter 2, Pflug was represented by Av Isaacs, whose gallery was at the center of a nascent Toronto based avant-garde, while at the time of her death, *artscanada* was about to publish a feature article on her work written by Mary Allodi.⁵

Despite this recognition, Pflug herself harboured a persistent sense of professional failure. Granted, there were disappointments: her departure after one year from OCA, her eventual break with the Isaacs Gallery,⁶ and the lack of sales from her Hart House retrospective. Yet such setbacks are not uncommon among artists and, in comparison to her female contemporaries at least, Christiane had done

-
3. Davis is presently writing a biography of Christiane Pflug scheduled for publication in 1990 (Oxford UP) and, along with Michael Pflug, has been the source for the unpublished documents referred to in this thesis.
 4. Valerie Elliot, "Intensity is the Essence," *The Globe & Mail* [supplement] June 8, 1968, 12. Pflug is listed as an arts bursary recipient (unspecified amount) in the *10th Annual Report: The Canada Council 1966-1967*, 64, and again for a bursary of \$3,500 in *11th Annual Report: The Canada Council 1967-1968*, 36.
 5. Mary Allodi, "Christiane Pflug," *artscanada* 174/175 (Dec 1972/Jan 1973).
 6. By 1969 Christiane was no longer with the Isaacs Gallery. However, the break did not result from any rejection of her work but rather of her husband, whose domineering attitude Av Isaacs eventually found intolerable. Telephone conversation with Av Isaacs, April 22, 1989.

well. Mary Allodi, a personal acquaintance, attributes the artist's sense of failure to her isolation from a supportive community:

It is too bad that she did not have someone outside the family to point that [her success] out to her. Other artists certainly did. But if you are a woman at home painting that is all you have. You have no other contacts. She did not move in the general artists' circle.⁷

Virtually all of the paintings completed since Christiane's marriage depict interior scenes or views from the window/door of her home. Interior domestic space was both site and subject for her artistic practice, affecting a continuity between social space and represented space. In mapping out the relationship between these two spaces, I am concerned with the correspondence of her life experience to the larger pattern of women's relationship to artistic production. My analysis of the spatial tensions that prevail in Christiane's work relates her history of personal and cultural dislocation to her contradictory position as a woman artist, given the material and historical circumstances outlined in Chapter 2, and a symbolic order predicated upon the repression of the feminine which privileges the paternal function over the maternal, the Law of the Father over the Maternal Other. I argue that the tensions between external and internal spaces that we find in her work speak of her contradictory relationship to the domestic sphere - home as both shelter and prison - a contradiction arising not only from her conflicting responsibilities as wife/mother/artist but also from a personal sense of homelessness engendered by her wartime experiences. I argue further that the unresolved nature of this contradiction is articulated through her departure from the aesthetic prescriptions of a modernist tradition based upon technical and intellectual mastery. For what is pre-

7. Interview with Mary Allodi by Ann Davis. Unpublished typescript. Collection of Ann Davis.

river Seine is a precursor of the myriad boats and other vehicles which will populate her Canadian works, traversing spaces which extend beyond the frame. In *Canal St. Martin*, 1955 (Fig. 10) the dark trees that form an impenetrable screen behind the bridge—a strangely articulated structure - will also reappear in Pflug's paintings of the railway yard outside her Yonge Street apartment.

Christiane's awkward handling of perspective creates certain disjunctions and ruptures in our reading of the pictorial space that prevent smooth transition. This uneasy distancing which persists throughout her oeuvre indicates that, from the outset of her career, the elements which Christiane was at such pains to arrange held a meaning beyond their surface identity. Certainly we know this to be the case in her later work. In response to a Toronto art critic's observation that

[t]here is an almost frightening air of unreality in the midst of her intransigent and tightly controlled naturalism...to pose certain abrupt questions about the real and the artificial, the seen and the not seen...

Christiane stated:

I can understand that feeling but it is not derived from the subject matter...It must come from my increasing awareness of the unsolved things in life, that are answered by neither religion nor philosophy.²⁴

Christiane's progress was encouraged by Michael and by the Portuguese artists Vieira de Silva and Arpad Szenes. Michael Pflug recalls,

Very quickly in my mind, there was no doubt that she was a painter...For Christiane to paint was a revelation, it opened a door to her childhood...²⁵

Christiane and Michael's shared interest in art was mutually satisfying. However, he did not approve of the fashion aspect of her background and was very critical of

24. Constance Mungall, "Christiane [sic] Pflug," *Ontario Homes and Living* 8 (Sept. 1964), 17.

25. Ann Davis, *Christiane Pflug 1936-1972*, Exhibition Catalogue (Winnipeg: WAC, 1974), introduction.

The careful framing and arrangement of compositional elements, the interplay of geometric shapes and the balance of colour suggest a distillation of the environment, even a certain degree of contrivance, for the artist's need to aestheticize her surroundings, a desire rooted in a childhood of disruption and exile, exceeded any purely descriptive intention.

I had to learn here [Toronto] that I would never find the same landscape, the same quality of life which we had left behind in Europe and North Africa. What I saw around me at first seemed banal and often ugly. Only slowly I saw it differently, the very sharp light here, which has something of the light in Tunis, the landscape much larger and more chaotic. In pursuing it one can bring a different tension into one's painting.¹²

Further, where Pflug achieved verisimilitude, there is always something "not quite right" about her perspective, something awkward and oblique about the overall recession into pictorial space, though the spaces between the objects themselves are convincing enough. In this respect her work has been likened to the pre-Renaissance painters whom she admired, Giotto in particular.¹³ But her intent was not to archaicize. The collapsing and fragmentation of pictorial space was a primary characteristic of modernist practice. And though her representational mode of painting placed her outside contemporary concerns with abstraction, Pflug was in no way ignorant of developments in the theory and practice of art.¹⁴

Nor did her divergence from the conventions of one point perspective indicate a lack of painterly expertise, for the phenomenon persists in her most

12. Christiane Pflug with Av Isaacs, "An autobiographical statement" Unpublished typescript, c. 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

13. The Pflugs displayed a collection of postcards in their home which featured reproductions of artists whom they admired. Giotto was included and is also mentioned as an influence by artist Anton Van Dalem. Interview with Ann Davis (New York, Nov. 16, 1986).

14. Marv Allodi makes this point in her article "Christiane Pflug," 42. Christiane's correspondence provides ample evidence to support it.

technically accomplished works, leading one to suspect that spatial organization is as critical to the meaning of these paintings as the subjects portrayed. And there is little doubt that the recurrence of motifs - the view from the window or across the water, the dolls, the dying flowers, the cabinets, cages and other enclosures, the birds and planes, boats and trains - and above all the tension between interior and exterior spaces, speaks of a personal iconography that begs elucidation.

3.1 Childhood, Michael Pflug and the early work in Paris

Christiane Schuett was born in Berlin in 1936. There she spent her early childhood. Though her parents were not married, Christiane's arrival in the world was neither unplanned nor unwelcome. Her mother Regine, daughter of a well-to-do bourgeois family, simply fulfilled her own desire to have a child, albeit one who would not carry the name of the father.¹⁵ Predictably, given the social norms of the time, her transgressive behaviour caused family tension and estrangement.¹⁶ A proud and independent woman, Regine subsequently supported herself and her small daughter by establishing her own business as a fashion designer. Christiane's father did not live with them and died of tuberculosis when she was four.

The first five years of Christiane's life were relatively stable and happy. In her mother's studio Christiane was allowed to play with the wools used for knitting, an early exposure to creative design and the subtleties of colour acquired within the

15. Conversation with Ann Davis, London, Nov. 17, 1988.

16. These tensions were as much class-based as moral. Christiane's paternal grandmother, a bourgeoisie, had married into Prussian nobility and wished a woman of the nobility for her son. She and her husband opposed their son's marriage to Regine. Angered by this, Christiane later rejected the name and title of her father (von Willesen) when it was eventually offered to her. Correspondence from Michael Pflug May 3, 1989.

context of women's everyday work. At the same time her memoirs¹⁷ suggest a deep-seated anxiety around even the most routine departures of her mother. There are recurring accounts of waiting impatiently for Regine to return home from work (once the war started Regine was recruited as a nurse) and the joy of Sundays and holidays when they could be together - "It was marveious to be the whole day with her, no kindergarten, no hospital, no people I did not know."¹⁸ The early years were marked by frequent journeys, often alone, to stay with relatives and friends of Regine. These sojourns were not always happy. A sensitive and introverted child, Christiane's recollections recount various mishaps or accidents in an uncertain, unpredictable world of stern and disapproving adults. Drawing with her crayons and painting with her first box of watercolours - instructed by her mother and grandmother - stand out as pleasurable pastimes. Characteristically, she tackled watercolour technique with a seriousness and determination unusual in one so young.¹⁹

In her memoirs Christiane recalls a Christmas spent at her grandparents' home. A doll's house made by soldiers at the hospital left a vivid impression. This fascination with contained domestic space (the reproduction/re-presentation of the home) and strong identification with dolls continued into adulthood, re-emerging as a central element in her paintings. In a letter to her in-laws in 1966 about another Christmas present, a facsimile edition of *Alice's Adventures Underground*, she

17. Christiane Schuett, "Childhood," unpublished memoir written in Wuppertal, 1955. Collection of Ann Davis.

18. "Childhood", 5.

19. *Ibid.*, 23-24.

writes:

...we [Christiane and her children] always especially enjoy the sudden growing and shrinking, the imprisonment in the small house into which she does not fit anymore at all...²⁰

From 1941 to 1949 Christiane was separated from her mother. As bombing intensified children were evacuated from Berlin and Christiane was sent to live in the Austrian Tyrol town of Kitzbuehl with the widow Petzold. In the household of Mrs. Petzold, a devout Roman Catholic whose demeanor was by all accounts rather severe, Christiane retreated to an inner world of reading, drawing and painting, while waiting anxiously for infrequent visits from her mother.

I grew up in a world of adults. I had to be quiet, in a large house, and this restricted most other activities. With books, paper and crayon one could always create one's own world, which also defied intrusion by any unwanted people.²¹

During the confusion of the final months of the war Regine was a prisoner of the Allies, her whereabouts uncertain. Regine had instructed her mother to send her bankbook to Mrs. Petzold to provide for Christiane, but this information was withheld from the child. Instead Mrs. Petzold impressed upon Christiane the burden of her financial dependence, calling her "my little pauper."²² Once the war was over, reunion of mother and daughter was further delayed by financial difficulties, disrupted transportation systems that made travel prohibitive, and paperwork now complicated by Austria's separation from Germany. Though Mrs. Petzold wished to adopt Christiane, Regine would not agree and Christiane rejoined her mother at the age of twelve in Frankfurt.

20. Unpublished letter to Aunt Sibylle, Jan. 22, 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

21. Christiane Pflug, "An autobiographical statement."

22. Interview with Regine Faust nee Schuett by Elizabeth Schwaiger, Dec. 18, 1984 and Ann Davis on Nov. 15 & 21, 1985. Collection of Ann Davis.

In 1953 she went to Paris to study fashion design. It was there in 1954 that she met her future husband Michael Pflug, a medical student whose true passion was painting. Somewhat disenchanted with her drawing instruction - "I did not have the light elegance of line, or the ability to change according to each new development in fashion"²³ - Christiane decided to experiment with colour and began painting scenes of Paris in gouache. Under Michael's tutelage (he had received some art school training) Christiane's painting developed quickly from the dark heaviness of her first gouache executed on Easter Sunday 1954, to the greater freedom and light found in her tempera painting *The Artist's Room in Passy*, 1955, both works now in the collection of Dr. Pflug.

In the stillness and sombre tones of these earliest paintings we can already discern some of the emotional tenor that will distinguish her later production, a sense of displacement in an indifferent world, outside the mainstream of a life passing her by. It is a solemn vision which belies her years: a young woman of eighteen. Likewise, certain recurring motifs are established. Her *Justice Building, Paris*, 1954 (Fig. 8) appears both imposing and somehow haunted, looming high above our viewpoint with its yawning dark windows. Its awkward rendering confuses our reading of scale and location; it appears both near and far. The window motif which first emerged in *The Artists's Room in Passy* is paralleled in the cityscapes by the arches of the bridges that cross the river Seine, controlling our passage, as in *Pont D'Austerlitz*, 1954 (Fig. 9). This interest in bodies of water as an organizing and probably symbolic element will re-surface in her depictions of Toronto from the islands. Similarly the steamboat that she depicts navigating the

23. Christiane Pflug, "An autobiographical statement."

river Seine is a precursor of the myriad boats and other vehicles which will populate her Canadian works, traversing spaces which extend beyond the frame. In *Canal St. Martin*, 1955 (Fig. 10) the dark trees that form an impenetrable screen behind the bridge—a strangely articulated structure - will also reappear in Pflug's paintings of the railway yard outside her Yonge Street apartment.

Christiane's awkward handling of perspective creates certain disjunctions and ruptures in our reading of the pictorial space that prevent smooth transition. This uneasy distancing which persists throughout her oeuvre indicates that, from the outset of her career, the elements which Christiane was at such pains to arrange held a meaning beyond their surface identity. Certainly we know this to be the case in her later work. In response to a Toronto art critic's observation that

[t]here is an almost frightening air of unreality in the midst of her intransigent and tightly controlled naturalism...to pose certain abrupt questions about the real and the artificial, the seen and the not seen...

Christiane stated:

I can understand that feeling but it is not derived from the subject matter...It must come from my increasing awareness of the unsolved things in life, that are answered by neither religion nor philosophy.²⁴

Christiane's progress was encouraged by Michael and by the Portuguese artists Vieira de Silva and Arpad Szenes. Michael Pflug recalls,

Very quickly in my mind, there was no doubt that she was a painter...For Christiane to paint was a revelation, it opened a door to her childhood...²⁵

Christiane and Michael's shared interest in art was mutually satisfying. However, he did not approve of the fashion aspect of her background and was very critical of

-
24. Constance Mungall, "Christiane [sic] Pflug," *Ontario Homes and Living* 8 (Sept. 1964), 17.
 25. Ann Davis, *Christiane Pflug 1936-1972*, Exhibition Catalogue (Winnipeg: WAG, 1974), introduction.

her personal appearance. In a letter to her mother shortly after meeting Michael, Christiane wrote that amongst other adjustments she had stopped wearing makeup to placate him.²⁶ Christiane's domestic untidiness was another source for his displeasure. This intensely emotional "jeu de tennis. Back and forth", as Christiane describes their relationship, became the template for their life together.

Their relationship was characterized by two elements: first, the rejection of the maternal influence (fashion) associated with an autonomous and unreserved sexuality (Christiane's illegitimacy and her numerous affairs prior to marrying Michael²⁷) in what may be read as a retroactive appropriation under the Name-of-the-Father. In later years Michael would reinforce Christiane's sense of inadequacy and financial dependence²⁸ (she was haunted by the spectre of destitution and homelessness) much as had Mrs. Petzold, the foster mother whose plans for appropriation were foiled. Second, one can discern in these corrective measures the imposition of an aesthetic standard that spills over and beyond the pictorial frame to include every aspect of lifestyle and environment, including Christiane herself.

Christiane's artistic practice was inextricably intertwined with the authority, aspirations and aesthetic standards of her husband, who promoted her work, provided most of her technical instruction and rigorously supervised the execution of each painting.²⁹ Her acknowledgement of her husband's support confirms the

26. Christiane Schuett, Letter to Regine Faust, June 2, 1954. Collection of Ann Davis.

27. Michael Pflug's bitterness and reproach made Christiane regret having disclosed her previous sexual relationships. Correspondence from Dr. Pflug, May 1, 1989.

28. Interview with Ursula Pflug by Ann Davis, Jan 17, 1965. Collection of Ann Davis.

29. A number of friends and relatives collaborate this. See interview with Anton Van Dalem (cited above); interview with Ursula Pflug (Jan 17, 1985) by Ann Davis; and interview with Karen du Toit by Elizabeth Schwaiger. Collection of Ann Davis.

centrality of painting in both their lives:

Michael is a good critic. His love and enthusiasm for painting is helpful. For him it is the only way to live. *My painting is the projection of the life we lead together.*[my emphasis]³⁰

Though a painter himself, Michael Pflug's medical studies demanded most of his time and energy. He felt that he gave up his vocation as a painter for the security of his family.³¹ In speaking of his youth after the war, he wrote "I desired to become a "great man" an obsession later transferred to Christiane."³² In his unpublished autobiography he states:

It was my own obsession with painting, in face of my old hopes, that it would somehow liberate us from a trivial life, that made me constrict Christiane's life more and more around a narrow and enclosed world, out of which the window through which she painted was the only outlook. ³³

I had learned to...develop and choose her subjects, and develop the theme of her painting. ³⁴

Some observers of the Pflugs have questioned the degree to which Christiane's paintings were wholly her own.³⁵ However, I would maintain that her particular vision was not compromised by Michael's attempts to regulate her production. Aside from the fact that Christiane's iconography clearly derives from her childhood experiences (as I will demonstrate), not to mention the visible differences between her work and that of her husband³⁶ (a matter that space

30. Elliot, 12.

31. Record of conversation between Michael Pflug and Ann Davis, Sept. 3, 1984. Collection of Ann Davis.

32. Letter from Michael Pflug to Ann Davis, Dec. 2, 1986. Collection of Ann Davis.

33. Michael Pflug, "Autobiography," unpublished manuscript, 1972-73, 188. Quoted in Davis, *Christiane Pflug 1936--1972*, introduction.

34. *Ibid.*

35. Anton Van Dalem specifically raises this question (Interview by Ann Davis, NYC 1986) though the rigour of Michael's supervision is also confirmed by daughter Ursula (interview by Ann Davis, Jan 17, 1985) and friend Karen du Toit (interview by Elizabeth Schwaiger). Collection of Ann Davis.

36. Michael painted both representationally and abstractly. He had an exhibition at Gallery Moos in Toronto in 1963.

limitations do not allow me to pursue), most of Michael's advice appears to have been technical³⁷ and even then it was not always heeded.

Dr. Pflug has described how he would set up the children's blocks so that Christiane could practice drawing in perspective. In his estimation she never succeeded, she never got it right.³⁸ These sessions, which he closely supervised, always frustrated her and, as in other cases where he would critique her work, there were often scenes. However, what her husband interpreted as her failure or inability to master the skills of rendering "correctly in perspective" might also be read as an act of resistance, for the essential spatial tensions in Christiane's work stem from her deviation from such conventions, her use of phenomenological space.

As I have discussed in my introduction to this thesis, Griselda Pollock's description of such an experiential space suggests an aspect of modernity that allows for the inscription of subjectivity:

...objects are patterned according to subjective hierarchies of value for the producer. Phenomenological space is not orchestrated for sight alone but by means of visual cues refers to other sensations and relations of bodies and objects in a lived world.³⁹

Christiane's very articulation of space speaks for the work as a product of her own position, her own vision. Further, Joanna Isaak's discussion of the work of Cezanne in relation to phenomenology links this subject position to the intense observation that was essential to Pflug's process:

The subtle distortions of perspective that were the result of Cezanne's *painstaking observation* impressed the phenomenologist Maurice Merleau-Ponty as an almost

37. For example, during the painting of Avrom Isaac's portrait Michael was away. He and Christiane wrote back and forth regarding the execution of Av's shoes, with M sending drawings of his own shoes. Interview with Mary Allodi by Ann Davis. Collection Ann Davis.

38. Interview with Dr. Michael Pflug, Nov. 18, 1988.

39. Pollock, "Modernity and the spaces of femininity", 65.

scientific investigation of the relation between *perception, time and memory*. It is apparent that modernism is the art of modernization, of technology, of the new physics, of industrial acceleration - a response of the imagination to urbanization. It is the art consequent on a world *reinterpreting, reinventing itself*. [my emphasis] 40

Similarly, Christiane's art constituted a reinterpreting and reinventing of herself and her own (dis)placement in the world, an aestheticizing of experience in which the meticulous observation and re-presentation of each new environment, the passage of time, and the recycling of vividly recalled childhood memories coalesce. As a stabilizing element her art countered a crisis of identity that remained unresolved throughout her lifetime, and was intimately connected to the patterns of dislocation that shaped her formative years and continued into adulthood. For Paris too would not be her home for long.

3.2 Tunis

In 1956 Christiane became pregnant, though she was not to repeat her mother's transgression. Her marriage to Michael Pflug in Munich allowed her to traverse the boundary of the whore/madonna dichotomy and by the end of the year she had joined Michael in Tunis where he was completing his medical internship. The new light and lifestyle which the Pflugs encountered in Tunis was much to their liking. They enjoyed the simple, solid Islamic architecture and daily ambience of an ancient culture, though Michael's salary was small and there were difficulties. Both of their daughters, Esther and Ursula, were born during these two years living in the Kasbah.

40. Jo Anna Isaak, *The Ruin of Representation in Modernist Art and Texts* (Ann Arbor: VMI Research Press, 1986), 5.

Working in tempera, Christiane turned to her immediate environment and produced a number of beautiful interiors and still-lives, a radical change from the cityscapes of Paris. In *Still-Life with Clock Face and Tiles*, 1957 (Fig. 11) a few household objects are isolated in a corner on the tile floor. Each object is carefully articulated in a composition where the overall patterning of colour takes precedence over any desire to convey sensuous texture. It is the displacement of space that is of concern, not the surface character unique to each: teapot, vase/flower, bottle, cup, clock. Yet there is also, to contradict this, a certain flatness to the teapot, while the location of the vase and bottle in relation to the tiles and wall is incongruent, seeming to be pushed up against the wall in a manner that emphasizes the large empty foreground. There again, the wall itself is not solid; the corner seems to dissolve into space, while the handleless clock speaks of lost time.

This still life evokes the hermetic space of Surrealist invention. The work of René Magritte comes readily to mind. Magritte too places objects in rooms whose walls dissolve, literally into sky. But with Magritte there is an obvious shock value to his juxtapositions that is not the case with Pflug, whose work, despite its dreamlike qualities, is still rooted in actual experience and observation of the material world. She was after all living in an ancient land where change is experienced very slowly and where the intensity of light on white walls would effect dissolution.

This work is characteristic of the Tunisian interiors. The same objects reappear in different arrangements on tables or within opened cupboards. What seems to be common to them is their spatial organization, the isolation of objects, both from each other (the distance between) and from the viewer (the distance to).

One might say that their difference is articulated through spatial separation/location rather than their individual identities, for they are all of a kind. They are all vessels.

There are two aspects of these vessels which I would point out here. First, within both Freudian theory and certain non-Western cultures, vessels are interpreted as female elements.⁴¹ Second, within the Roman Catholic Church, vessels are associated with the mystery of the Eucharist, what Catholics hold to be the actual transubstantiation of the body of Christ, the spirit made flesh. Though Pflug rejected the doctrines of the Catholic Church, recollections of its colours and rituals informed her art.⁴² Given that Christiane's retreat into a world of representation coincided with her exposure to the visual richness of Catholic ritual, I would suggest that the vessels that dwell within the stillness and silence of Christiane's interiors, take on a significance analogous to their liturgical function; they embody the need to make visible that which is invisible/absent. They evoke the desire to witness a transformation of the material world that would allow transcendence of the barriers that divide, closure of the space that separates. However, this yearning which remains unconsummated does not circulate around God the Father, but rather the irrecoverable site of childhood. And this in turn is intimately bound up with the absent mother.

Christiane's memories of the Tyrol connect the sadness of separation from her mother with the solace of art and religion:

...[A]s a child of six or seven, I was deeply impressed by the paintings in churches and chapels, the carved and painted wooden Madonnas on the crossroads in the woods in Tyrol.

41. The analogy of the calabash to the womb, for example, is repeatedly suggested in Trinh T. Minh-ha's film of West African villages *Naked Spaces: Living is Round*.

42. Davis, *Christiane Pflug 1936-1972*, introduction.

The many paintings in the peasant homes and small chapels
and the changing of ritual colours during the church year gave
life a beauty and depth which it would otherwise not have had.
43

I am suggesting that this separation was a pivotal factor within the nexus of circumstances that contributed to Christiane's dislocation, her lack of a sense of place, her "homelessness." While it is not my intention here to second-guess Pflug's psychological profile, psychoanalytic theory has been usefully appropriated within feminist textual analysis in ways which privilege sexual difference as an organizing principle of cultural production, while asserting female subjectivity as an element disruptive to the established order. Within this corpus of writing, Julia Kristeva's essay "Motherhood according to Giovanni Bellini"⁴⁴ is useful in specifically addressing subjectivity and visual representation. The topology of the missing mother which Kristeva evolves provides an interesting point of entry for a consideration of Pflug's practice.

In "Motherhood According to Giovanni Bellini," Kristeva applies her theory of the semiotic to the practice of painting, creating a topology in which biography and artistic practice intersect and circulate around the absence/presence of the mother. Using depictions of the Madonna and Child, Kristeva contrasts the urge to abstraction in the painting of Giovanni Bellini (motherless child) with the masterful representation of the same theme by Leonardo (whose precocious seduction by his mother, she suggests, accounts for his homosexuality). Against an economy of representation which reproduces "bodies and spaces as graspable, masterable objects,"⁴⁵ resulting in images of "the untouchable mother and her baby-object"

43. Christiane Pflug "An Autobiographical Statement."

44. Julia Kristeva, "Motherhood According to Bellini," in *Desire in Language* (New York: Columbia UP, 1980).

45. Kristeva, "Motherhood According to Bellini," 246.

Bellini's work is examined for the space that lies between and separates the mother and infant.

Maternal space is there, nevertheless--fascinating, attracting, and puzzling. But we have no direct access to it. As if there were a maternal *function* that, unlike the mother's solicitude in Leonardo's paintings toward the baby-object of all desire, was merely ineffable *jouissance*, beyond discourse, beyond narrative, beyond psychology, beyond lived experience and biography--in short, beyond figuration.

And the painter as baby can never reach this elsewhere, this inaccessible peace colored with melancholy, neither through the portrayed corporeal contact, nor by the distribution of colored blocks outlining corporeal volumes. It rather seems as though he sensed a shattering, a loss of identity, a sweet jubilation where *she* is not; but without "her" - without eyes or vision - an *infinitesimal division* of color and space rhythmically produce a peculiar, serene joy. To touch the mother would be to possess this presumed *jouissance* and to make it visible...But the search appears wherever color, constructed volume, and light break away from the theme...implying that they are the real, objectless goal of the painting. 46

The final component of Kristeva's essay that concerns us here is the hostility which she detects between mother and child in Bellini's images. Mary Jacobus offers a reading of this drama in light of "abjection," Kristeva's term "for the precarious casting out or primal repression which marks the emergence of the signifying subject..."⁴⁷

The precarious emergence of subjectivity takes place in a "close combat" between a sort of subject that is not yet a subject and a mother who is not yet an object - "a reluctant struggle against what, having been the mother, will turn into an abject. Repelling, rejecting; repelling itself, rejecting itself. Ab-jecting."

46. *Ibid.*, 247-48.

47. Mary Jacobus, "Dora and the Pregnant Madonna," in *Reading Woman* (NYC: Columbia UP, 1986), 159.

Only by this self-differentiating movement which installs boundaries, difference, and at the same time narcissism, can instinctual chaos be confined and kept at bay. 48

As Elizabeth Grosz writes, Kristeva's notion of abjection "sketches the peculiar space and time...marking the threshold of language and a stable enunciative position." 49

Understanding abjection involves examining the ways in which the inside and the outside of the body are constituted, the spaces between the self and the other, and the means by which the child's body becomes a bounded, unified whole - the conditions under which the child is able to claim the body as its own and, through its 'clean and proper' body, gain access to symbolisation.

Abjection involves the paradoxically necessary but impossible desire to transcend corporeality. It is a refusal of the defiling, impure, uncontrollable materiality of a subject's embodied existence. 50

Within Kristeva's topology, pictorial tension is established between this search for jouissance/maternal space/union with the absent mother/the unrepresentable ("the real, objectless goal of the painting") and the ab-jecting force which Kristeva locates in Bellini's painting--"a violent, clumsy breaking away, with the constant risk of falling back under the sway of a power as securing as it is stifling."⁵¹

Though I do not agree with Kristeva's specific observations of Bellini's painting, the relevance of her topology for a reading of the spatial dynamics in Pflug's work is twofold. First, it offers a means of conceptualizing the urge to representation, the urge to exceed boundaries (in Pflug's case the move towards a desired object/vessel, towards the horizon or beyond the frame) and the urge towards abstraction (Pflug's desire to "create space for clear pure forms and colours") that does not revolve around phallogocentric constructions of God or Truth, but rather

48. *Ibid.*

49. Elizabeth Grosz, *Sexual Subversions* (Sydney: Unwin & Irwin, 1989), 71.

50. *Ibid.*, 71-72.

51. Jacobus.

the desire to signify the maternal in new ways. And without reducing Pflug's entire oeuvre to a literal search for *her* mother, my reading of her work reveals a strong urge for unity with some unidentified presence (or state of harmony) distant in time and space, coupled with a personal iconography that reconstructs memories of childhood. Second, Kristeva's theory of "abjecting" relates to the tensions between external and internal spaces that counter or stymie the transcendent tendencies in Christiane's work, tensions which prevent closure and evoke a sense of melancholy, anxiety, and in some of her later production, where she attempts to move beyond the domestic frame, barely contained dread.

Still Life with Black Cloth and Rose, 1956 (Fig. 12) introduces the theme of the wilting flower with another arrangement of vessels. The limp, dying rose is presented alongside Christiane's paint brushes, which stand erect. Their juxtaposition suggests the primacy of art over life, or at the very least, the centrality of art as a stabilizing element in Christiane's life.

Life is basically absurd, but still there are rules to stay within. It is better to paint, for instance, than to worry about life. Painting helps when I get depressed. 52

This tableau of the fading flower conveys both melancholy and a certain detachment, a combination common to many of Christiane's paintings.

Bird Cage with Pears, 1958 (Fig. 13) introduces still another mainstay of Christiane's iconography - the bird cage. Though again, the apparent naturalism of this presentation of objects does not alert us to any symbolic intent, certain devices serve to hold our attention. Within the shallow shape the extension of the table surface horizontally out of the frame pulls the viewer into the center of the

2

MICROCOPY RESOLUTION TEST CHART
NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS
STANDARD REFERENCE MATERIAL 1010a
(ANSI and ISO TEST CHART No. 2)

composition and to the bird cage, a rather odd contraption which is only rendered in depth on one side. The bird is presented in profile, as if more to signify "bird" than to tell us anything about "birdness" while its framing by the bars of the cage reinforces the sense of enclosure. The placement of the pear in front of the cage obscures the corner, causing some ambiguity in our perception of the cage's shape, much like the reversible cube that Paul Klee amongst others experimented with. The visual tension in this work is established through an interplay of spatial configurations, the enclosed space of the cage which only the sight can penetrate and the open vessel which is opaque but offers its contents up.

The writings of Paul Klee are useful in connecting Pflug's painting to theories of modern art. The following is excerpted from his "Creative Credo" of 1920:

Art does not reproduce the visible; rather, it makes visible.

Formerly we used to represent things visible on earth, things we either like to look at or would have liked to see. Today we reveal the reality that is behind visible things, thus expressing the belief that the visible world is merely an isolated case in relation to the universe and that there are many more other, latent realities. 53

Unlike Klee, Christiane never experimented with abstraction, though she identified with the aspirations of artists such as Stella and Morris Louis who did.⁵⁴ Her paintings were always grounded in the visual specificity of her immediate surroundings, the appearance of things - "There has to be a certain degree of truthfulness...one has to paint what is a natural and integral part of one's surroundings."⁵⁵ At the same time they evoke a sense of mystery, "the feeling that

53. Reprinted in Herschel B. Chipp, *Theories of Modern Art* (Berkeley: U of California P, 1968), 182-186.

54. See statement by the artist from *Brick*, footnote 1.

55. Elliot, 10.

the world on the canvas conceal[s] another more illusive world,"⁵⁶ that echoes Klee's metaphysical approach to representation though, significantly, never with the degree of confidence and certainty that informs the Swiss artist's writings. This orientation can also be found in statements Pflug made about her aim in painting:

I would like to reach a certain clarity, which does not exist in life. But nature is complicated and changes all the time. ⁵⁷

Change was a disturbing factor in Christiane's life, not only frequent changes in residence but the accelerated pace of modern life.

In Paris and Tunis at that time, the changes of modernisation were much less apparent. One did not really have to face them - one lived with an attachment to the past - old buildings, landscapes slowly formed over centuries. ⁵⁸

After the peace and tranquillity of Tunis, Christiane's move to the New World would force an encounter with the transience of a modern urban environment and introduce a new set of problems for her life and art.

3.3 Toronto

In 1959 Christiane moved with the children to Canada where her mother, now married and with another daughter, was living in suburban Toronto. Michael returned to Paris for medical exams. The year and a half before he joined them in 1960 marked a hiatus in Christiane's painting, due to the considerable demands of childcare as well as a distressing culture-shock.

I would like to know what a woman on her own with two small children could be able to create, while I can hardly get

-
- 56. Gail Geltner, *The Christiane Pflug Retrospective Exhibition*, (Sarnia Public Library and Art Gallery, 1971), introduction.
 - 57. Christiane Pflug with Av Isaacs, "Questions and Answers" Unpublished typescript c. 1966. Collection of Ann Davis
 - 58. Christiane Pflug, "Questions and Answers."

through with the necessary work. Nobody and absolutely nobody is able to understand that, outside of my mother. 59

Once installed in their own apartment on Yonge Street, however, Christiane once again took up solving the particular set of painting problems posed by her new environment.

Railway Yards in the Rain, 1962 (Fig. 14) is part of a series of works that depict the view from their apartment. The trees in the distance are in David Balfour Park and the ravine at Summerhill. The nostalgic mood of this particular rendition, as the early morning mist rises, is consistent with what we know of Christiane's sense of displacement. But in addition there is also a kind of foreboding evident in the still, dark railway cars and the empty, cavernous buildings. What does the mist hide? What will it reveal? The fences and open space to the left direct us to the train while two abandoned cars sit darkly discouraging our passage. From her childhood memoirs we can ascertain that trains in particular were associated by Christiane with departures from her mother, as in this recollection of a trip to Bavaria to visit a friend of Regine:

We were standing on the platform...Then the train arrived and we entered it. Somebody opened the window and I could hold my mother's hand. I did not want to release it. I will not let go, I will hold it as fast as I can. The train started to roll and I held onto her hand. For a while it went all right. Then the train moved faster and we had to let go. I cried for so long...60

One can speculate on a parallel significance for the other vehicles that populate her later landscapes - the trajectories of the boats and planes implying destinations beyond the visible, beyond the pictorial space.

Window on Yonge Street, 1961 (Fig. 15) combines this view with a doll who assumes the position of the artist sitting in a black wicker chair looking out. The

59. Christiane Pflug, Letter to Michael, Downsview, February 26, 1960. Collection of Ann Davis.

60. "Childhood," 7. Reprinted in *Provincial Essays* vol. 5 (Toronto: Coach House Press, 1987), 31.

structure of the chair is similar to the bird cage. It acts in conjunction with the barrier of the window sill to prevent movement into the open space beyond. Like *Railway Yards in the Rain*, this atmospheric space is painted with a subtlety and variation of tone that gives it strong visual appeal, while conveying a poignant blend of memory, desire and foreboding.

In 1962 the Pflugs moved to a house on Woodlawn Avenue West. Surrounded by a dense growth of trees that screened the view, Christiane turned more to interior scenes in which her dolls dominate. Once again a birdcage figures in *On the Balcony No. 2*, 1963 (Fig. 16), placed before the grid of the balcony fence. By analogy the cage which both shelters and contains the pigeons is likened to this fence which marks the boundary of Christiane's domestic space. The black doll and the cage are draped in Tunisian cloth, perhaps to recall the colour and tranquillity of the Tunisian interiors, perhaps also to connect the doll to Christiane. Her mother Regine recalls that when Christiane was on holidays in Bavaria, she was treated like a gypsy, for all of the children there were blonde and blue eyed. Regine even made her a little children's book with a gypsy wagon. "She had always this feeling of the gypsy girl."⁶¹ In the Tyrol there was not the same problem with her colouring, but there her Prussian accent set her apart.

The black doll appears in a number of works which repeat this sense of estrangement, as in *The Kitchen Door in Winter II*, 1964 (Fig. 17). Though it is simple enough to equate blackness with otherness and see this as a very personal projection of alienation, our reading is further helped here by comments that Christiane made in a letter to her in-laws while enroute to her exhibition at the

61. Transcript of interview with Regine Faust by Ann Davis and Elizabeth Schwaiger. Collection Ann Davis.

Winnipeg Art Gallery. She observes that many of the dining car waiters on the train are black and expresses sympathy for them because they have had to leave the nice parts of the world in order to find work.⁶² Similar circumstances caused the Pflugs to leave Tunis, though both Christiane and Michael missed the beauty of North Africa deeply. Hence the black doll standing outside in winter without a coat not only recalls Christiane's fear of destitution and homelessness, but also reflects her own position as a reluctant immigrant.

In tandem with the alienated black doll is the abandoned Shirley Temple doll. In *On the Black Chair No. 2*, 1963 (Fig. 18) the doll sits up in a black wicker chair which surrounds and separates her from the objects beyond. This Shirley Temple doll was popular during the 1930s and 1940's, the years of Christiane's childhood. Through her equally popular films of that time, Shirley Temple had come to be associated with the role of an orphan. Moreover she is wearing beads which Ann Davis suggests refer to the Bedouin necklaces which Christiane wore.⁶³ Again the black chair acts as a barrier. Structurally similar to the bird cage, it separates the doll from the vase of flowers and the enigmatic basket and bowl (again all vessels or containers) that lie empty on the floor.

A similar pattern emerges in *On the Black Chair I*, 1963 (Fig. 19) where the Shirley Temple doll lies down with her eyes closed. The chair pushed up close to the picture plane looms large. Its wicker back is painted in white where it overlaps the vase on the table beyond, thus reinforcing the perception of the chair as a visual barrier. Though largely obscured by this wicker screen, the vase of flowers is placed at the focal point of the composition, an elusive object of desire.

62. Unpublished letter to Michael's mother Jan. 6, 1966.

63. Conversation with Ann Davis, Jan 7, 1989. Davis also has a collection of photographs of Christiane modelling necklaces for a fashion photographer before she met Michael.

There is evidence that dolls were associated with strategies developed in childhood to deal with trauma. In her memoir "Childhood" Christiane reconstructs a visit to Bavaria where her precious doll was broken through the malicious play of an older girl. She recalls intermittently taking the doll out of her box and looking at her for a long time hoping that the damage would be reversed.

...I put her back carefully...waited that perhaps everything would grow on. From time to time I looked carefully but it did not happen. 64

What is striking about this account is the expressed hope that everything will be all right again simply through the power of looking; if she only looked hard enough reality would be somehow transformed. This harkens back to my comments on Pflug's use of vessels and her desire to transcend the present, while introducing another element: her sense of personal powerlessness. She herself could not affect desired changes in the world. She could only look and re-present, suggesting once again an inverse relationship to the aestheticizing gaze of modernity.

In a reversal of her animation of the dolls, Christiane's portrait of *Avrom Isaacs*, 1964 (Fig. 20) seems to make him into a still-life object. This painting took six months to complete with Isaacs coming two days every week to pose, for as Pflug's paintings became larger they consumed months of sustained effort. She assigned herself a rigorous schedule, painting before the children were up, preparing them for school and then painting until they returned. When doing her night scenes, she reversed this, sleeping during the day and painting at night. She did not do an all over sketch and then build up her surfaces. Her method of painting and of drawing was to begin at one corner and complete the composition inch by inch. Her

64. "Childhood", 35.

Incomplete Landscape, 1970 (Fig. 21) demonstrates this process, in which the image emerges in a manner more akin to needlework (which she was introduced to as a child and loved⁶⁵) than traditional painting techniques. This method of completing each segment before going on to the next mirrors somewhat the story of the doll.

I paint a little section daily and hope each day will bring something new. If I reasoned it out, there would be no reason to paint. ⁶⁶

At the same time this mode of working was physically and emotionally exhausting and not without anxiety and fear of failure.

I work slowly. It is hard to paint day after day for two months on one painting and keep the same strength of vision. There is a danger that I will get tired, lapse into reproducing instead of really painting, putting dead paste on dead canvas instead of something that's really alive. ⁶⁷

Given the time required to complete the painting of Isaacs, it is perhaps no accident that the door leading to the balcony (and escape) has no doorknob. What is also missing in this and all of the kitchen interiors is the dirty dishes, or for that matter, any evidence of living. It is an idealized kitchen space where domestic work is only inferred by its absence.

Letters by Christiane to her mother-in-law in Germany (written during a very tense time, 1965-66, when Michael was constantly studying for exams) are replete with details of domestic life and the burden of juggling meagre financial resources. Christiane seemed to operate under the same exacting standards for domestic

65. "My aunt gave me some handiwork: a piece of linen and blue yarn. I was supposed to cross-stitch. I loved to do it." from "Childhood", 15.

66. Elliot, 11.

67. Mungall, 17.

responsibilities as for her art. And she found it overwhelming and irritating.

...sometimes the pressure seems too much to cope with daily life, I don't manage it very well...I can't manage to gain distance, oh well lets' forget it..⁶⁸

It's a drag how women are always concerned about small sums (a pair of children's socks, ridiculous...)⁶⁹

If only the housework and the clothes for the children were not such a burden then we'd be doing quite well.⁷⁰

And regarding a dinner party,

...in the end it always turns out well, but all the headaches before...Of course the dishes are horrendous afterwards, only today everything is in order again.⁷¹

What emerges from a reading of Christiane's concerns with her domestic duties is a strong need for completion; however as the adage goes: housework is never done. The material world keeps changing, meals are consumed, dirt collects and children grow. Christiane was engaged in a constant battle to fend off these aspects of the material world, to stop their constant changing, *to freeze time to create space to practice art*. These foiled attempts at completion on the domestic front parallel the spatial tension in her art where the desire for closure or unity remains unsatisfied.

When Christiane's work does start to break away from the strict confines of her home it is a gradual process and it happens through the kitchen door. *Kitchen Door with Esther*, 1965 (Fig. 22) places the young Esther literally on the threshold of the house. The melancholy that pervaded earlier works has been left behind. Beyond Esther the trees, in full foliage, seem to open up and circulate around a patch of open sky. The trees are no longer an impenetrable barrier. This spiral of lush

⁶⁸ Letter to Michael's mother June 11, 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

⁶⁹ Letter to Michael's mother, August 19, 1965. Collection of Ann Davis.

⁷⁰ Letter to Michael's mother, Feb. 6, 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

⁷¹ Letter to Michael's Mother, Feb. 15, 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

green seems to offer a possibility of movement denied elsewhere by the bird cage, the wicker chair or the maze of bare branches of *The Squirrel*, 1967 (Fig. 23) for example. Yet even while it beckons it also inspires dread, much like the trees in *On McDermott's Farm: The Forest*, 1971 (Fig. 24). As one critic has observed:

Pflug's art is a device to keep the threatening world at bay...The porch door has great symbolic power, when closed it shields and protects, when open the unknowable outside again threatens. 72

Gaile McGregor relates Christiane's work to the Wacousta syndrome, a term coined for what she identifies as the quintessential Canadian cultural syndrome - a characteristic retreat from nature which constitutes,

the prototype for our relation not merely with nature but with the world at large. Both the structure and the focus of our vision have, in other words, been not merely influenced but in a sense determined by our idiosyncratic experience of the self/other interface. 73

McGregor holds up Pflug's complex use of the framing/containment theme as an exemplary response to the symbolic treatment of the house in Canadian art.⁷⁴ In particular she points to the ambivalence in Pflug's paintings between the relative desirability or safety of the inside vis-à-vis what is "out there," a simultaneous reaching out and repulsion expressed through the window motif. She quotes Ann Davis:

The window symbol, sometimes represented by a door...or by a mirror...has the advantage of a dual nature: it can point inward or outward, or even, on occasion, in both directions... This very identification of a window or door frame suggests a distinction between here and there, between mine and theirs...The window symbol can thus represent a reaching out, a creative extension, or a fear of the exterior.⁷⁵

72. Harry Malcolmson, Untitled column in *The Telegram*, May 23, 1964, 21.

73. Gaile McGregor, *The Wacousta Syndrome* (Toronto: U of T P, 1985), 76.

74. *Ibid.*, 102.

75. *Ibid.*

McGregor's observations are supported by the fact that it was in Canada that the window motif emerged as a means of expressing interior/exterior ambiguity in Christiane's work. In the Paris outdoor scenes and in the Tunisian interiors, spatial tensions - here/there or inside/outside - are worked out through the strategic placement of bridges, trees, cages, and vessels. Moreover there is some evidence that Christiane found the Canadian landscape rather daunting if not downright distasteful. During her train trip to Winnipeg, she seemed vividly aware of how large and thinly populated Canada was. She remarked upon the dangers of living in the bush and the fact that she herself was ill-equipped to survive there.⁷⁶ Describing a drive into the Ontario countryside in a letter to his mother, Michael Pflug wrote "but Christiane was really depressed by this excursion into emptiness today. Even the sparseness doesn't have anything to offer here."⁷⁷ Christiane herself seemed most comfortable with the landscape when it was cultivated within an urban setting and viewed from the safety of a small space with clearly defined boundaries. She writes about a trip to the Canadian National Exhibition:

...and I still like the rides, especially on the big ferris wheel, one sits so nicely in the small compartments and sees the landscape, here it was the lake with the islands and the tiny sailboats, emerge and submerge.⁷⁸

At the same time, I must contest McGregor's thesis in relation to Pflug. To begin, *The Wacousta Syndrome* is a gender blind study. Particularly in addressing the symbolic use of the home, the author does not account for the specificity of women's relationship to the domestic realm. Given the centrality of the boundaries of public and private in the shaping of women's identities, the dual nature of the

76. Letter to Aunt Sibylle, January 22, 1966. Collection of Ann Davis.

77. Letter to his mother, June 1965. Collection of Ann Davis.

78. Letter to Michael's mother, August 19, 1965. Collection of Ann Davis.

window symbol which Ann Davis elucidates is, I think, more appropriately linked to the consequences of women's restricted agency in the public sphere and the differential power exercised by men and women in both public and private realms.

Similarly, gender difference is absent as a determining factor in McGregor's analysis of the Canadian antipathy for nature and our indiosyncratic experience of the "self/other interface." Since Simone de Beauvoir's *The Second Sex*, the association between "woman" and "otherness" has been a preoccupation of modernist theory. The Cartesian constructions of "Self" and "Other" evoked by Sartrean phenomenology (the opposition of Mother-Nature and Man-made-History for instance⁷⁹) have, as Alice Jardine discusses in *Gynesis*, been refuted by the redefinition of alterity associated with structuralist theory. However, despite attempts to conceptualize "otherness" outside the obligatory female connotations of the "maternal abyss" or "the void which is a source of anguish",⁸⁰ the abstract spaces of alterity in contemporary thought have still been gendered female. Summarizing Julia Kristeva, Jardine writes:

The space "outside of" the conscious subject has always connoted the feminine in the history of Western thought - and any movement into alterity is a movement into that female space...⁸¹

This cultural asymmetry has profound implications for any consideration of a female conscious subject. Hence, the omission of sexual difference in McGregor's discussion of alienation and depictions of nature forms a significant blind spot that argues against any reduction of Pflug's treatment of exterior/interior spaces, or her response to landscape, to her identity simply as "Canadian." Rather I would attribute

79. Jardine, *Gynesis*, 86-87.

80. *Ibid.*

81. *Ibid.*, 114-115.

the concurrence between observable aspects of Pflug's work and the patterns developed by McGregor to a position of marginality determined primarily, though not exclusively, by gender. In this respect Kristeva's topology of the missing mother, which foregrounds the problematics of a female conscious subject within patriarchal culture, remains a more useful model for conceptualizing the crisis of identity that Davis locates in Pflug's use of the window symbol.

Further to these reservations on the theoretical front, much of what might be discerned as fear of nature in Christiane's work can be traced to influences that preceded her arrival in Canada. Within German folklore for instance, forests are frequently depicted as perilous sites for children. In her memoirs Christiane recounts the story of the Nightkrepp who would steal children found out of doors at dusk and carry them off to the dark forest.⁸²

As soon as it became dark we went home quickly. In the dark the hedges looked like walls. The houses stood quiet and dark... We thought of the Nightkrepp who might catch us and leave us the next day in the thick underbrush in the forest. ⁸³

The dense walls of trees which populate her Canadian landscapes, first evident in her depictions of Paris, recall this childhood perspective.

A more bleak atmosphere pervades *Kitchen Door with Ursula*, 1966 (Fig. 25) than *Kitchen Door with Esther*. Here the child sitting outside is seen reflected in the glass of the door. Due to the amount of time required for completion the painting encompasses two seasons; Ursula is seen on a spring day whereas the scene through the door is of winter. The passage of time is inscribed within the work as a function of the artist's practice. However this visual reference to the changing of the seasons is also paralleled in Christiane's writing. During a skiing holiday in Austria,

82. "Childhood", 2.

83. *Ibid.*, 4.

Christiane and her mother had great difficulty negotiating a steep slippery path on their return to the guesthouse. Dusk had fallen and "the forest was dark and terrifying." They arrived at last, both exhausted and miserable. Christiane writes,

It was a terrible evening and I fell asleep exhausted and crying. I did not like snow and winter as much as the summer and grass and flowers. When one looked out onto the hills and barren trees one could not imagine that it would ever be summer again. 84

In this passage we once again find Christiane searching for visual confirmation that the longed for event will happen (the return of summer or of her mother or of the wholeness of her doll). The apprehension and anxiety characteristic of these accounts is evident too in *Kitchen Door with Ursula*. The immateriality of Ursula's reflection suggests a tenuous, uncertain presence, while the split/distance between mother/artist and child is reinforced by the winter/spring dichotomy that defines their respective spaces.

Christiane's outdoor scenes became more frequent as her daughters grew older. They all enjoyed excursions to the Toronto islands. Once again water surfaces as an organizing principle, while manipulations of scale create spaces that overwhelm and cannot be traversed. *Ursula on Ward's Island*, 1966 (Fig. 26) repeats the position of Esther above; she walks away from her mother into the water and towards the distant horizon. Her small back speaks of her youth and vulnerability. In drawings such as *Lake Simcoe*, 1964 (Fig. 27) the scale of the small boats emphasizes the emptiness of the foreground. They seem precarious. In *The Loon*, 1967 (Fig. 28) neither isolation nor union with the far shore seems desirable.

84. *Ibid.*, 36-7.

Toronto from Centre Island I, 1967 (Fig. 29) conveys the sense of alienation that Christiane expressed in recording these trips to the islands:

...although one can see the silhouette of the city with all of its box-like houses and the many windows, there is a sense of retreat here, of being left behind, which feels very strange. ⁸⁵

Much like Alice in her adventures underground, space for Christiane is either too big or too little, too vast or too constricting. There doesn't seem to be any balance. As Christiane's technique improved the strangeness of her drawings was less from perspectival ambiguity as simple reference to lack or absence. *Boxcars, Marlborough Avenue*, 1968 (Fig. 30), *Railway Dam and Truck*, 1967 (Fig. 31) and *McDermott's Truck*, 1971 (Fig. 32) are three drawings which reintroduce the motif of an ominous empty vehicle. In figs. 30 and 32, the open door of the box car and the open window of the car frame and control entry into the landscape, much like the windows, doors and cages in previous work.

In 1967 the Pflugs purchased a house and moved once again. The Cottingham School series depicts the view across the street from their new home on Birch Avenue. The colour of the Canadian flag flying above the school in this series varies according to the passing seasons, a reference to the changing colours of the Catholic Church which Christiane recalled from her years in the Tyrol.⁸⁶ This cyclical change grounded in traditional religious ritual is played off against the technological changes evident in a cityscape transformed by post-war development. In *Cottingham School in Winter 1*, 1968 (Fig. 33), for instance, Christiane has gone beyond the window frame to depict a modern city where power lines, high-tension towers and high-rise buildings encrouch upon pre-war residential buildings. The

85. Letter to Michael's Mother, Feb. 27, 1966. Collection of Ann D . . .

86. Davis, *Christiane Pflug 1936-1972*, introduction.

interplay of pink and white in the houses gives this painting a more cheerful impression than we have come to expect. There are still some distortions of perspective, in particular the shifting dimensions of the white house which stands behind the school and refuses to remain fixed in space. But the blue sky pales into infinity - recalling the serenity of the Tunisian interiors - while the windows of these houses are not as mysterious or forbidding as in other depictions of the same theme. Christiane would appear to have reached some kind of plateau in her struggle, especially if we compare it with *Over the Kitchen Sink*, 1967 (Fig. 34) a drawing from the previous year, where the angle and intimidating scale of the water taps suggest the point of view of a small child.

But this peace was short-lived. *Cottingham School With the Black Flag*, 1971 (Fig. 35) was the last of this series to be completed. Here the high tension towers and high-rises loom large and close, blocking access to the sky and horizon. Moreover, some alien force seems to be unleashed in the trees which threaten to push us back against the picture plane. These trees are not just forbidding, they roar, breaking through the silence that has to this point pervaded Christiane's vision. Much like the man-made frames and enclosures of the earlier works, these trees halt our movement towards the open space at the horizon.

Eventually the combined stress of confrontations with Michael, the growing independence of her now adolescent daughters, a sense of professional failure and other domestic tensions was too much. Christiane made a final trip to Ward's Island with her dog Nemo and died of an overdose of barbituates on April 4, 1972. Her last drawing, done in New York City, is almost serene (Fig. 36). It lacks the spatial tensions of previous work, achieving an unprecedented degree of visual closure.

For the bird that looks out from above the rooftops has broken free of any restraint and seems aligned with the plane that flies off to the right to the space beyond the frame.

3.4 Conclusion

Given the iconographical sources of Christiane Pflug's work, her engagement with representation may be conceived as a process of mediating the disruption and dislocation of her childhood. What is of interest here is how that mediation is articulated through the spatial organization of her work, the shape of the middle ground that eludes rational definition and closure. In my examination of Pflug's work I have attempted an analysis that considers represented space not simply as descriptive but as a "locus for relationships," as that site where the paradoxical relationship of the artist to the paradigms of modernist art mesh with the unresolved conflicts specific to her personal history.

These conflicts have been played out across a largely domestic terrain bounded by the spatial/temporal dichotomies of inside/outside, here/there, now/then. In the cityscapes of Paris and in her Toronto landscapes, bodies of water separate the viewer from a distant horizon while myriad vehicles (planes, boats, trains - vessels) traverse the pictorial space to destinations beyond the frame. In the womblike interiors of Tunis, painted during the two years that framed her pregnancies and the births of her daughters (in the parlance of an earlier age - her confinement), household vessels, cupboards and bird cages feature in a play of interior and exterior spaces that suggest the mystery of life (birth) and death. In the

three Toronto residences the window symbol marks the threshold for the artist's movement into that which is desired/feared yet remains beyond figuration.

I have suggested Kristeva's topology of the missing mother as a point of entry into Pflug's practice. To explore this maternal metaphor further, in *Gynesis*, Alice Jardine points to "the Mother, Death, and the Unknown"⁸⁷ as the precise coordinates of mystical discourse. Mysticism has been a strong element in the German philosophical tradition; Jardine cites Goethe, Hegel, Nietzsche as well as those psychoanalysts whom Freud rejected as "mystics of the maternal." A number of the ideas which she identifies as common to lay religious and mystical currents are characteristic of Christiane's work, in particular "where an unresolved paradox leads to confusion between the inside and outside" and "where there reigns a profound pessimism about changing anything: i.e., 'there is *no future*.'" Further, there is a certain sense of mystery and nostalgia evoked in Christiane's work by those spaces which are unrepresented but inferred to exist beyond the frame, beyond the horizon, beyond the visible, a sense of suspended time and confused boundaries which is consistent with this mystical tradition. (I have already discussed Christiane's affinity to Paul Klee, for example.) These "extratextual" spaces, which are a persistent element in her work, suggest more than one "utopian" site corresponding to the coordinates cited by Jardine: the mother as metaphor for the irrecoverable state of childhood, for the attainment of knowledge and understanding ("I would like to reach a certain clarity that does not exist in life"), and finally, for the release of death.

87. *Ibid.*, 142.

The interface between art and domestic space in Christiane's work points to the congruence between the constraints upon the artist as a woman accessing male culture and the pressures and restrictions of her daily life as wife and mother. For while her urge to represent can be seen in terms of the recovery of some utopian site coded feminine and maternal, the language and the tools available to her were the inheritance of the Father, administered through a husband who sought Christiane's (and arguably his own) redemption through art, her transformation from madonna/whore to "great artist." Within this scheme there was no pre-existing space for "the difference of view, the difference of standard" that Woolf equates with the inheritance of womanhood.⁸⁸ That space could only be created through resistance, not only to the closure of rational geometric space, but to the mastering gaze that "fixes" the terms of artistic mediation - the shape of the middle ground, the spaces between - and secures the borders of private and public, woman and artist.

⁸⁸ Mary Jacobus, "The Difference of View," in *Reading Woman: Essays in Feminist Criticism*, (New York: Columbia UP, 1986).

4. Joyce Wieland

The art of Joyce Wieland has a consistency of power, joy and beauty which will secure her place with the great artists of this century...an art created in gentleness and that warm light which is uniquely and eternally female. ¹

The tribute above was written in 1968 by New York filmmaker Shirley Clarke on the occasion of Wieland's first retrospective exhibition at the Vancouver Art Gallery. Joyce Wieland is frequently heralded as Canada's greatest *woman* artist, her success qualified by the very terms glowingly invoked by Clarke to legitimize the artist's inclusion within the canon. This double-edged aspect of the feminine persists in much of the writing about Wieland and her work, so that almost twenty years later, in response to Wieland's 1987 retrospective at the Art Gallery of Ontario, Kass Banning could still raise the question of the "paradox engendered by the authorization of our women artists."²

In her critique of the AGO's exhibition catalogue, Banning maintains that the valorizing that builds a case for greatness presents Wieland as delightfully eccentric, rather than doubly marginalized, and furthermore, that the homogenizing tendency of American feminism (she refers here to the essays by Lucy Lippard and Lauren Rabinovitz) has privileged gender to the exclusion of other local differences. In

1 Shirley Clarke, New York filmmaker, quoted in *Wieland* 57-67, Retrospective exhibition catalogue (Vancouver: VAG, 1968).

2 Kass Banning, "The Mummification of Mommy," *C Magazine* 13 (March 1987), 38.

response to what she sees as the mythologizing of Wieland under the guise of the "Eternal Feminine," Banning calls for an articulation of Wieland's specificity, as a woman, an artist and a Canadian.

Arguably, Wieland's work can be seen as a process of negotiating the very contradictions that these identities - artist, woman, Canadian - pose. And I will argue in this chapter that her awakening to the terms of sexual difference, as they are inscribed within culture, informs her consideration of other differences of race, class and nationality. For the artistic strategies developed by Wieland during the 1960s to articulate female subjectivity were also used to address her sense of displacement as a Canadian living between Toronto and New York.

I was on my way in a sense to becoming an artist's-wife-type artist until I got into looking around in history for female lines of influence. I read the lives and works of many many women...I started to invent myself as an artist. I saw only gradually that my husband's artistic concerns were not mine, although I loved Cezanne, Vermeer, et cetera...Eventually women's concerns and my own femininity became my artist's territory.

I think of Canada as female. All the art I've been doing or will be doing is about Canada. I may tend to overly identify with Canada. 3

The decade of the 1960s was a critical period in the artist's evolution of a strategic practice based on the valorization of the feminine and a commitment to art as a political discourse. In this chapter I will examine the ways in which the practices of the modernist avant-garde that Wieland encountered in both Toronto and New York offered opportunities for the rupture of closed homogeneous forms of representation that Wieland adapted in developing her own feminist aesthetic. Central to my discussion is Wieland's manipulation of spatial and temporal

3. Joyce Wieland quoted in Kay Armatage, "Interview with Joyce Wieland," in Karyn Kay et.al. (eds.), *Women and the Cinema* (New York: E.P. Dutton, 1977), 248-9

elements to pose an alternative subject position and textual authority, a textual excess, coded feminine, that exceeded the parameters of the experimental terrain staked out by her male contemporaries. I will examine the development of two formal strategies that formed the basis for her critique of sex and power: the collapsing of representational space and the use of sequential imagery. And though there is ample evidence of Wieland's fascination with visual mutability in her paintings, collages, and assemblages, it is her experimental film work that will be the focus of my investigation here: *Water Sark* (1964-5), *Hand Tinting* (1967-68), *Reason over Passion* (1967-69), *Pierre Vallières* (1972), and *Solidarity* (1973).

4.1 Childhood, art school and early strategies

Though Wieland's work in film has tended to be treated separately from her work in visual art media, these two areas are closely interconnected both aesthetically and thematically. Love, sexuality, domesticity, spirituality, imperialism, nationalism, economics and ecology interweave a practice which encompasses collage, drawing, painting, printmaking, assemblage, soft sculpture, quilts, and a book-work composed as a catalogue for her second retrospective *True Patriot Love* at the National Gallery of Canada in 1971. My focus on the film work in this chapter arises from a consideration of two aspects of the medium's significance to her career: its formative influence upon her artistic development, and the ways in which experimental filmmaking positioned her as a female artist within the avant-garde communities of Toronto and New York.

A very early cross-reference to film in Wieland's art work is an untitled collage of 1955 (fig. 37) which combines pressed flowers, part of a calendar for the

month "janvier" a fragment of film-strip animated with painted eyes, and text from a movie ad layout (part of her free-lance work reassembling layouts of American movie advertisements) which reads "The product of an unhappy family life, Marina was fated to be what she became - a sinner." This collage is framed alongside a companion piece for the month of "decembre" where the text reads "She decided to reform Lexi, and found herself in love." While one can only speculate as to the specific autobiographical significance of this duo - Wieland met the rebellious young Michael Snow in 1955 - what is of interest here is the linking of animation and references to the cyclical passage of time/life (the calendars and pressed flowers) to texts which associate love and sex with social transgression and domestic upheaval. These themes not only resonate throughout her work, in ways which I will take up further below, but inform the following account of the artist's childhood by Robert Everett-Green:

She was born during a summer storm in 1931, the last of three children in a Toronto family of recent British immigrants. The Wielands had traditionally been entertainers, specializing in circus acts and low-theatre turns like Ballerina Burlesque. Joyce's great-grandfather George was a famous London clown who had been praised in a review by Charles Dickens for a "grotesque humour of no ordinary kind." Her father, Sydney, had been a minor vaudevillian who had abandoned a wife and children for a bigamous liaison with Joyce's mother, a young runaway who liked to be called Billy. They fled one step ahead of the law to New York, then Toronto, where they lived always one step behind in the rent.

In Canada, Sydney Wieland retired from the stage to a film projectionist's booth. He submerged his theatrical ambitions in his youngest daughter, pushing her through weekly tap-dancing lessons. Outside the dance studio, he and Billy were fitfully attentive parents, too needy of each other to have much time for their children. "We were like wallpaper," says Wieland. In the evenings when her parents went out to play cards with friends, they gave her scraps of paper on which to draw. Early photos show an anxious child, invariably gnawing

her fingernails. Wieland's father died of heart disease when she was seven, and two years later her mother lost an agonizing struggle with cancer. Her brother went into the army soon after, and Joyce and her sister were on their own. The disintegration of the family, and the hardships that followed, left Wieland with a permanent sense of dread and an anxious desire to please. "I had to be a good girl, to keep these terrible things from happening again," she says, "which meant I must have been a bad girl before." Balanced against this was an instinct for rebellion inherited from Billy, who had prefaced her flight from her father's house by pushing her corset up the chimney.

Like Christiane Pflug, Wieland was born of a union that existed outside the accepted moral standards of the time, not to mention the law. And like Pflug, her childhood was shaped by financial insecurity and the disintegration of her family. For both women, art (particularly drawing) and books played a consoling and mediating role in coming to terms with a premature loss of innocence, which was for Wieland, at least, nothing less than catastrophic. Everett-Green continues: "Making pictures had become a refuge. By the time she enrolled at Central Technical School, Wieland was certain that survival, for her, meant becoming an artist."⁴

What I am suggesting here then is a correspondence between biographical circumstances and artistic strategy that circulates around the interface of love/sex and death, combining erotic playfulness with intimations of disaster. In *Heart On*, 1961 (fig. 38), with its sexual punning, cloth is used to create spaces of concealment (flaps and pockets) and exposure, as the curtain rises on a cast of hearts performing against a blushing red ground, the blood stained sheets of her mother's deathbed.⁵ Such references to blood and the colours red and white will recur throughout her work.⁶

4. Robert Everett-Green, "Bold Strokes," *Saturday Night* (May 1987), 60.

5. Artist's talk at the National Gallery of Canada, May 11, 1989.

6. In discussing her film *Pierre Vallieres*, Wieland cites the lab error that caused his mouth to be so bloody red. "I am very interested in red and white - it has been a theme in all my films." Interview with Debbie Magidson and Judy Wright, *The Canadian Forum* (May/June: 1974), 62.

Wieland attended Central Technical School from 1944 to 1948 where she studied with Doris McCarthy, Elizabeth Wynn Wood, Virginia Luz and Robert Ross. She was excited by the unorthodox approach of her teachers who "would dare to play music in class and were acknowledged as being better than those at O.C.A."⁷ McCarthy in particular provided an important role model of a woman artist which, as Marie Fleming notes, complemented the strong influences of Wieland's mother - "the dignity she conferred on domestic objects and work" - and older sister Joan, who worked to support them.⁸

The interest that Wieland developed in drawing during her early childhood - she sold "racy" pictures to fellow students in elementary school to finance her drawings - was related both to movies and to comic strips, interests which "manifested themselves in a fascination for her toy movie camera-projector and in her own comic strip creation, female superhero *Agent X9*."⁹ Wieland's professional interest in film dates back to at least the early 1950s ("I had this great desire to work with film"¹⁰) and it was through her employment at Graphic Associates, a film animation studio run by Jim McKay and George Dunning, that she was introduced to the other members of the then burgeoning experimental art scene, in particular Michael Snow, whom she married in 1956.¹¹ Dunning, who was looking to train local artists in animation and had already hired Snow and Graham Coughtry, took on Wieland in 1955 because of the film-like nature of her sequential paintings, a relationship which the artist was conscious of and would develop further.

-
- 7. John Porter, "Artists Discovering Film Post-War Toronto," *Vanguard* (Summer 1984), 24.
 - 8. Marie Fleming, "Joyce Wieland: A Perspective," in *Joyce Wieland* (Toronto: AGO, 1987), 22.
 - 9. Porter, 24.
 - 10. Fleming, 23.
 - 11. Porter, 24-26.

4.2 Spatial permutations and the grid

The use of sequential imagery and the collapsing of representational space, formal considerations which also informed the practices of her male contemporaries,¹² were employed early on as a means of critiquing sex and power. Lauren Rabinovitz maintains that Wieland's painting *Balling*, 1961 (fig. 39) exemplifies her "early integration of women's experiences, eroticism, and sardonic humor."¹³ While colour and delineation portray the penis in erotic terms more often associated with female sexuality, it is the flatness of the pictorial space that gives the piece its critical edge.

Because the point of view lacks any sense of depth, it portrays a phallus without representing or alluding to phallic proportions. Slyly mocking the traditional pornographic and commercial representation of the penis as a powerful weapon, the flat central emphasis allows from a woman's point-of-view the erotic celebration of heterosexual intercourse. ¹⁴

Wieland's use of sequential imagery is similarly deployed in commentaries on the pursuit of power in contemporary society. Like many Pop artists, Wieland used items of everyday use in her assemblages and paintings of the 1960s. Rabinovitz notes that, typically, her child-like renderings reduced the penis to just another banal object, much like the hard-edge soup cans and flags of Warhol and contemporaries.¹⁵ But Wieland did not create icons of consumer society. She placed objects or their representations within grid-like structures - assemblages of boxes or

12. Michael Snow's *Walking Woman* series of the 1960s which involved several incarnations in painting, sculpture and film is perhaps the most relevant example.

13. Lauren Rabinovitz, "The Development of Feminist Strategies in the Experimental Films of Joyce Wieland," *The Film Reader* No. 5 (Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University, 1982), 133.

14. *Ibid.*

15. *Ibid.*

canvases that mimic a storyboard/comic strip format - to introduce temporal elements of flux and transience.

Wieland's depictions of vessels such as airplanes, ocean liners and sailboats almost always signal disaster, as in *Sailboat Sinking*, 1965 (fig. 40), *Cooling Room II*, 1964 (fig. 41), and *Tragedy in the Air or Plane Crash*, 1963 (fig. 42). These vessels figure too in works with explicitly sexual overtones such as *Young Woman's Blues*, 1964 (fig. 43), *The New Power*, 1963 (fig. 44) and *Flicks Pics #4*, 1963 (fig. 45), works that not only link sexual politics to the machinations of commerce and the larger political arena, but do so in a way that invites comparison with Pflug's response to a modern technologically changing world, in that they suggest the detachment of the spectator from any sense of agency. Life is like a movie; it happens to you. As Rabinovitz observes:

By dividing her canvases into series of squares in which action occurs sequentially, Wieland asserted a visual mutability *fatalistically connecting constant change with the inability to control or freeze power.* [my emphasis] ¹⁶

Wieland's organization of space laterally through the frames of a popular culture format may be seen to achieve a similar emotive effect, then, to Pflug's use of a yawning middleground in her landscapes. Her fascination with the sinking sailboat motif recalls Pflug's childlike pleasure at the view from the CNE ferris wheel, watching "the tiny sailboats, emerge and submerge." ¹⁷

I have discussed the lack of closure in the spatial organization of Pflug's work as a function of her attempts to fend off the forces of change, both in terms of the technological encroachments of modernity and the more mundane, cyclical changes of the material world. And I have indicated here in my discussion of Wieland's

16. *Ibid.*

17. Letter from Christiane Pflug to Michael's mother, August 19, 1965. Collection of Ann Davis.

work what I perceive to be a corresponding lack of mastery over narrative. The specific nature of this relationship of author to text, however, constitutes a crucial point of divergence between the two artists' practices. First, because Wieland's satiric humour and commitment to art as a political discourse places her in a different relation to issues of enunciation and subjectivity than does the phenomenological expressivity of Pflug. And second, because during the 1960s, Wieland's fatalistic perspective is put into process with her exploration and affirmation of a specifically female corporeality that replaces the logic of the master narrative with something else, an elsewhere, an excess, that shapes her engagement with the filmic representation of woman as no "other."

4.3 Filmmaking and the avant-garde in Toronto and New York

In his article on the relationship of artists to filmmaking in post-war Toronto, John Porter places Wieland firmly within the nexus of experimental film activities which emanated from the overlapping personnel of Graphic and the small loose community developing around the O.C.A. and Greenwich (Gerard Street) Village - Toronto's provincial miniature bohemia."¹⁸ It was the artists associated with this community that Avrom Isaacs came to know when he opened his Greenwich Art Shop in 1951 and these same artists who encouraged him to open his Greenwich Gallery in 1955. Warren Collins, a camera-operator at Graphic who had been making his own 16mm films since 1951, was an important contact for Wieland, introducing her and his co-workers to personal filmmaking. Wieland starred in at least three of his films along with Snow, Coughtry, Dennis Burton and Bob Cowan.¹⁹ Gordon

18. Porter, 24.

19. *Salada Tea Commercials* (1955/56), *A Salt in the Park* (1956) and *OSA Opening Ceremonies* (1956), as well as Wieland's opening at the Here & Now Gallery in 1960. Porter, 25.

Rayner and William Ronald were also involved in this fledgling community of local artist/filmmakers that would develop in the '60s into a national network for independent production and distribution. Wieland made her first film in 1959²⁰ and in 1960, in conjunction with her solo show at Dorothy Cameron's Here and Now Gallery, she organized "what may be Toronto's first public screening of personal films by local artists."²¹ In late 1962, Wieland and Snow arrived in New York to the hum of an energetic alternative filmmaking scene that was exploding with activity.

Historically, film critics have discussed Wieland's work in relation to the formal preoccupations of "structural film," a term coined by F. Adams Sitney in 1969 to describe the films of Wieland and other New York artists.

Theirs is a cinema of structure wherein the shape of the whole film is pre-determined and simplified, and it is that shape that is the primal impression of the film...what content it has is minimal and subsidiary to the outline. ²²

This is in some ways an apt description of Wieland's experimental films. They do seem to have a predetermined shape and they do variously employ the four techniques that Sitney further cites as characteristic of structural film - fixed camera position/fixed frame; the flicker effect; rephotography off of the screen; and loop printing. More recently, structural film has been understood to encompass those films which "investigate the physical properties of film" and "emphasize the tensions amongst the physical materials, perceptual processes, and the pictorial realities film has traditionally represented."²³ Here again, the term is applicable.

20. *Dog Story*, shot with Graphics co-worker Warren Collins, remains unedited.

21. Porter, 26.

22. F. Adams Sitney, "Structural Film," in P. A. Sitney (ed.), *Film Culture Reader* (New York: Praeger, 1970), 327.

23. Rabinovitz, *The Film Reader*, 132.

However Wieland never subordinates subject matter to formal innovation. Even a 'minimalist' film like *Sailboat* (1967-68) can be traced to a preoccupation with personal loss through disaster - "here one minute and gone the next."²⁴ In fact the artist has identified her subject matter as the primary motivation for her return to Canada in 1971.²⁵

The pervasive erotic play in Wieland's work, her conjoining of art practice with political activism,²⁶ her penchant for puns, and her love of irony have more to do with the anti-high art rituals of Dada, from which the counter-culture of the 1960's drew its inspiration, than a self-reflexive film practice turned in upon itself. During the late 1950s, the group of Toronto painters that included Wieland were very concerned with the work of Marcel Duchamp, Kurt Schwitters and the neo-Dada painting of the Americans Jasper Johns, Robert Rauschenberg and Jim Dine.²⁷ Wieland's admiration for the subversive wit of the Dadaists is on record - "They're artistic in a 'general' way...They see things whole. Their jokes are about life."²⁸

Similarly the legacy of Dada and French Surrealism could be found in the New York film community that Wieland found so stimulating and supportive upon her arrival in 1962. This autonomous avant-garde movement identified "exploitation, alienation, sexual repression and homogeneity as the prevailing characteristics of the dominant cinema which it sought to counter."²⁹ It included

-
24. "...because I was orphaned very young, I think there was always this kind of strain in my work..." Interview with Joyce Wieland in Barbara Stevenson, "The Political and Social Subject Matter in the Art of Joyce Wieland and Greg Curnoe," Unpublished M.A. thesis (Ottawa: Carleton U, 1987), 156.
 25. Armatage, "Interview with Joyce Wieland," 253.
 26. Wieland was active with CAR in its coalitions with the farm workers of Ontario and native peoples' resistance to the James Bay hydroelectric project, amongst other struggles. See Stevenson, 168-9.
 27. Fleming, 25.
 28. *Ibid.*
 29. J. Hoberman, "After Avant-Garde Film," in Brian Wallis (ed.), *Art After Modernism* (New York: The New Museum, 1984), 63.

tendencies to obscure the boundaries between high art and popular culture, a strategy held in common with Pop Art and taken up by Wieland in her use of found objects and her incorporation of women's quilting and needlework skills. Founded on diversity and with a popular base of support, this oppositional film practice not only countered the aesthetic conventions of commercial cinema, but devised alternative modes of production and distribution. The democratic screening of all submissions by Jonas Mekas at the Grammercy Arts Theater,³⁰ the artisanal modes of production that required little money or previous technical expertise, and the receptivity to highly personalized statements, made this independent filmmaking community attractive to a number of women, including Wieland.

It is this "unruly underground" that was superseded by what J. Hoberman names as "the key structural event of the early 1970s, namely the institutionalization of the avant-garde."³¹ Hoberman relates this to "the process of legitimating cinematic modernism," as the ontological investigations of structural film brought cinematic practice in line with the formalist concerns of the New York art world, the "modernism of Clement Greenberg." This movement towards institutionalization was consolidated in 1970 with the establishment of the Anthology Film Archives. The restrictive selections of this institution created "a fixed pantheon of filmmakers and a certified canon of masterpieces."³² But it did not include Wieland.

This omission may be attributed to the bias of a male dominated art world. Wieland herself admits that her choice of subject matter - animals and domestic

30. Lauren Rabinovitz, "The Films of Joyce Wieland," Catalogue essay in *Joyce Wieland*, (Toronto: AGO, 1987), 118.

31. Hoberman, 65.

32. *Ibid.*

objects considered unworthy by men - placed her outside the movement she was a part of.

The men in that movement, excluding my husband, were no more enlightened than any other men at that time. They failed to treat me as their equal as an artist. It was simply this, that even very civilized men compete, and they only cared to compete with each other. 33

But there is something more here. For there is an element to Wieland's work which eludes the labelling strategies of official certification, that spills over the boundaries of distinct categories and in fact throws the very practice of naming into relief.³⁴ This element is particularly strong in *Reason over Passion* where Trudeau's maxim is superimposed upon the expansive reality of the land and rendered impotent. And it is present elsewhere, as an "otherness," an "excess," a "something else" that formalist criticism has proven inadequate to describe (beyond the reductive terms of personal uniqueness and eccentricity) but nonetheless surfaces repeatedly in feminist readings of her work. Kass Banning refers to Sitney's omission of Wieland in the second edition of *Visionary Film*:

If structural film is a foundation garment fashioned by men, "Joyce" (as Sitney would have it) is the film artist who exceeds its strictures. 35

Both Banning and Kay Armatage introduce this notion of textual excess in their readings of Wieland's films *Water Sark* and *Hand Tinting*.

33. Joyce Wieland, interviewed by Debbie Magidson and Judy Wright, *The Canadian Forum* (May/June 1974), 62.

34. Banning, "The Mummification of Mommy," 38.

35. Kass Banning, "Textual Excess in Joyce Wieland's *Handtinting*," *CineAction!* 5 (May 1986), 12.

4.4 Water Sark

Kay Armatage reads *Water Sark* as an opportunity to see in process Wieland's discovery of the "feminine body" which "is traced upon the female body in much of her work." This tracing "also becomes a practice of image construction through which she is able to operate the feminine over the male body in a very literal displacement of the phallic."³⁶ Armatage enters into debate here with Kass Banning's analysis of *Hand Tinting* where the latter emphasizes her interest in the textual over the sexual:

My attempt here is however to trace a textual activity, a movement, rather than to search for feminine motifs in the form of radical content; this is the attempt to explain the text and its activities as a practice of difference, of difference inscribed... where difference is conceived as an act of subversion operating through, and against, conventional syntax, grammar.³⁷

Armatage resists such sharp distinctions:

Wieland has consistently and consciously sought out the feminine precisely as a site of potential images which have remained unexplored by her male counterparts, and in which she could construct an aesthetic based upon a tradition which she saw as belonging to women. The trace of the feminine in her work is not simply a textual practice, but the insistence on the feminine body as the subject of playful dilation constitutes yet another excess.³⁸

While these positions are not mutually exclusive, I concur with Armatage's affirmation of the centrality of the feminine body to Wieland's work. And what I think an examination of her films demonstrates is that Wieland's evocations of the "feminine," whether as topology or as cultural tradition (a genealogy of women),

36. Kay Armatage, "The Feminine Body,: Joyce Wieland's *Water Sark*," *Canadian Woman Studies* 81 (Spring 1987), 84.

37. Banning, "Textual Excess," 14.

38. Armatage, "The Feminine Body," 84.

intersect with the specificity of race and class in ways that circumvent any reduction of "woman" to a biological essence.

Water Sark can be seen as a filmic transformation of Wieland's mixed media assemblage *Sanctu Spiritus*, 1964 (fig. 46) which points to the idealization and containment of the feminine within the domestic sphere, symbolized by plastic flowers, a crocheted doily and a miniature double bed. Two framed photos of a bride rest like icons within this domestic sanctuary, housed within a rectangular box, its door left half-way ajar. This tableau is illuminated by a single light bulb. As a commentary on consumerism, *Sanctu Spiritus* shares an agenda with Pop Art; however as Rabinovitz points out this is not simply a critique of commodity consumption.

It calls attention to how the socialization process trains women to be consumers while it also celebrates the creative energies that women direct toward selecting, arranging, and maintaining the objects they purchase.³⁹

Wieland's use of the box relates both to Louise Nevelson's work and to what she has identified as a specifically female fascination with making little boxes.⁴⁰ The domestic theme of *Sanctu Spiritus* also coincides with Betty Friedan's writing on the oppression of housewives in their suburban boxes; *The Feminine Mystique* was published in 1963. The artist recalls her interest in the domestic site as an appropriate subject for art-making in terms which invite comparison with Christiane Pflug's circumstances.

In my work in particular, from the time I made *Watersark* (1965) I was interested in the idea of the shut-in housewife. In that film I worked from the premise that a person could not go outside, and had a very restricted area and amount of money.

39. *Ibid.*

40. Stevenson, 172.

Like the Proustian thing in the room - what can come out of here? 41

But Wieland's treatment of the domestic realm in *Water Sark* does not circulate around the notion of shelter/prison but rather transforms it into a site of pleasure and empowerment.

Water Sark begins with its mysterious title superimposed over a Japanese lampshade. With no pre-conceived notions as to what the film is "about," we are open to its process of self-discovery. The mise-en-scène echos that of *Sanctu Spiritus*. The light overhead illuminates a number of domestic objects arranged as a still-life: pink plastic roses, a fern, a teapot, a bowl and a glass of water: however, the photographs of idealized feminine beauty that graced *Sanctu Spiritus* are absent. Instead it is the artist whom we see, for the woman-of-the-house in this case is Wieland, poised for an altogether different role, in a film shaped by her epiphany as an artist.

The camera is visibly wielded in ways which are self-reflexive - pointing to Wieland as author - but also act to trace her bodily gestures. Though the camera moves in and out and around the objects set out before us it is always in closeup so that the space is shallow and enclosed. Which is not to say it is claustrophobic. This is not the hermetic dream space of Surrealist invention, but a confined domestic space which is transformed into a site of limitless possibility.

By shooting through various media such as water, a prism, and a thick lens, and through complex manipulations with a broken mirror, Wieland distorts and confuses spatial relations. Co-ordinates are indeterminate. The space between viewer and viewed is at times collapsed as boundaries dissolve and inside becomes

41. Joyce Wieland, interviewed by Debbie Magidson and Judy Wright, 62.

outside. This latter confusion, which is physiologically associated with sexual arousal, suggests here both an altered state of consciousness and a kind of auto-eroticism. The whole is presided over by the artist herself, whose body is amongst the objects to be examined.

Where the layers of water and lens serve to soften and blur colour and contour, the flashing shard of mirror reflects a fragmented body image, a multiplicity of surfaces which defies the visual logic of any single point of view. Armatage suggests that the artist's wielding of the mirror in "transgressive, joyful play," achieves the same metaphorical ends as the speculum of Luce Irigaray, in which man "discovers that woman has substituted her own image in a text which speaks of and from her body." The significance of the mirror is outlined by Armatage.

...feminist avant-garde filmmakers in France have devised an aesthetic hinging on the film portrait as the fantasy of a mirror that conserves the feminine image rather than forgetting it, a human mirror that may become the revealer of the unconscious or stolen double ...which brings women as subjects of their own representation...

Once the terms of bodily representation have been "broken down," Wieland introduces her naked shoulder and breast. The point at which the breast is seen in clear focus is constructed within the film as its point of revelation, coinciding as it does with the surfacing of the camera from a maze of aqueous filters. It becomes a central image, which, according to Armatage, is pursued by the camera as an "object of fascination and desire" displacing the phallus as "primary signifier."⁴² This displacement contributes, as much as the nakedness of the breast itself, to the transgressive quality of the film.

42. Armatage, "The Feminine Body," 87.

Wieland's text may be read as an affirmation of the female body as site of erotic pleasure and creative power. Such a reading is well served by Armatage's alignment of *Water Sark's* permutations with the topology of "l'écriture féminine," especially with respect to the breast.

For Irigaray and for Cixous, it is in the woman's own body that she will find the models capable of realizing her difference...the woman's body as a model which counters the phallic hegemony... Irigaray finds her model in the female genitals... the breast in Cixous' topology is the analogue to Irigaray's vulval lips. 43

In the circumstances around Wieland's production, there is evidence to support a reading of the breast as an identification with the maternal as source of creativity. Though herself childless, Wieland's expressed desire to see herself as part of a female line (represented by her incorporation of sewing into the high-art lexicon) and her personal coming to terms with the death of her mother were intimately linked in the struggle to create herself as an artist.⁴⁴ Wieland has explicitly connected her mother's ingenuity, her ability to "make something out of nothing" to her own definition of what art is.⁴⁵ Also, this affirmation of the maternal feminine is located in the kitchen - not the boudoir - further strengthening the association of female creativity with domestic/art-work.

Near the end of the film Wieland dons that household standby, the rubber glove ("Playtex" comes immediately to mind here) and commences to play with a toy boat which bobs up and down in the water with a buoyancy analogous to the earlier shots of the breast. Armatage links this and other instances of joyful play in the film to what Irigaray terms "detours" or "evasions" which fragment the text and

43. *Ibid.*, 86.

44. Stevenson, 172.

45. Artist's talk at the National Gallery of Canada, May 11, 1989.

through this subversion of its logical coherence open up spaces for self discovery. Identical toy boats are featured in Wieland's mixed media construction *Cooling Room I* (fig. 47) of the same year. Like *Sanctu Spiritus* this work is part of a series of boxes which house Wieland's growing personal iconography. It involves a disaster scenario, the significance of which has been discussed above. Given the sense of loss that is usually signified by these passing ships, Wieland's relaxed and joyful play here may be read as a moment of wholeness, arrived at through reconnecting with the maternal source of her own creative power.

The last shot of the film is again of the nonsensical title. While water is used throughout Wieland's work as a medium of transformation, "the source of creativity and a metaphor for the unconscious," Armatage tells us that "sark" was simply a word that appealed to Wieland at the time and which she used playfully. Armatage gives us another Old Teutonic meaning as "a chemise or surplice worn next to the skin." Given the role of water and other analogous media as visual interface between the viewer and Wieland's body, this meaning gives further resonance to a reading of *Water Sark* in relation to "l'écriture féminine," the title then suggesting "the relation of the unconscious and the body, the interface between feminine identity and image." ⁴⁶

4.5 Hand Tinting

In 1967 Wieland was involved in producing a documentary commissioned by Xerox of their retraining center in West Virginia. Eighty percent of the teenage girls involved in this programme were black and all of them were hopelessly poor.⁴⁷

46. Armatage, "The Feminine Body," 88.

47. Blacks account for eleven percent of the American population. See "Blacks want own statistics on AIDS," *The Ottawa Citizen*, May 2, 1988, A3.

Wieland describes their education - learning to type - as "humiliating...a corporate pacification program." She was sorry to see "all their swearing and astounding wit cut out of the final version" and wanted to make her own film about them.⁴⁸ Wieland took some of her own cuts from the film and made *Hand Tinting*, loop printing and reversing scenes of the girls dancing, swimming and generally socializing.

Wieland's use of documentary footage to subvert the authorized text is not unprecedented; as early as 1927 Esther Shub created the first compilation film using ready developed film shot by men.⁴⁹ And though the use of found objects has many antecedents, Wieland's appropriation of a dadaist inspired practice - reconstituting the refuse of a throw-away society into art - takes on a specifically feminist slant, being also analogous to the recycling of materials in quiltmaking. This latter metaphor of women's needlework is extended throughout *Hand Tinting* where the celluloid is tinted with cloth dyes, hence the title, and perforated with sewing needles. These typically domestic procedures allude to the plastic nature of the film material while contributing to the rhythmical quality which is central to the film's meaning.

The rhythmical element of *Hand Tinting* results from the recurrence of actions which remain incomplete. The gestural movements of women dancing, immersing their heads in the swimming pool, and exiting the locker room are arrested - cut-off prematurely. Reverse printing creates a horizontally symmetrical oscillation of this movement from frame to frame. The containment of movement

48. Armatage, "Interview with Joyce Wieland," 247.

49. Kay Armatage and Linda Beath, "Women in Film," Catalogue essay in *Women and Film 1896-1973: International Festival*, (Toronto: 1973), 4.

within a shallowly defined space "so destroy[s] formal, illusionistic conventions that all that remains are facial and bodily signs for women of colour."⁵⁰

White women are also shown in the film but they do not dance; they sit and watch, spectators whose stillness punctuates the repetitive, hypnotic movements of the women who are black. Though this is a silent film, the pulsating rhythm that is produced by these bodily images is almost audible as the Motown tunes of the period. In Banning's words,

Rhythm is the film's music, its speech beyond the silence, the rhythmic cadence of the woman's body and the body of the text.
51

Banning reads this rhythm in terms of Kristeva's theory of the semiotic,

a prelinguistic, atavistic core of energy grounded in the acoustic, perceptual, and tactile experience which precedes representation, individuation and language. 52

The 'prelinguistic' is associated with that space which is outside the patriarchal structures of language and representation, a space which has been coded as 'feminine' and associated with the maternal body. In *Water Sark*, silence or speechlessness is associated with the artist's discovery of her female/maternal body as site of creativity and pleasure. Wieland's silent mouthing and lip play through the distorting lens of a magnifying glass assert once again her heterogeneity.

Banning further suggests that a different form of pleasure is invoked by,

the loss of the imaginary closeness to the mother's body...
replayed by the loss/ disappearance, and reappearance of the
images of women in the film as they vanish around corners or
move out of frame. 53

50. Rabinovitz in *Joyce Wieland*, 161.

51. Banning, "Textual Excess," 13.

52. *Ibid.*

53. *Ibid.*, 14.

Banning uses Kristeva's semiotic model to argue that *Hand Tinting* moves towards representing "that which remains invisible and absent - female pleasure and specificity."⁵⁴ While agreeing with Banning, I would suggest further that the specificity represented here is not only female but Black and American. To begin I will consider another film concerned with representing pleasure which is absent, repressed, unspeakable.

Jean Genet's *Chant d'Amour* (1950) is a silent film which uses rhythm as a means of establishing a sense of sexual longing between male prison inmates. The rhythm is established through repeated intercutting of body movements with a central image - a bouquet of flowers that swings back and forth, like a pendulum, between the windows of two inmates. Within the prison, racial difference and power differences (between guards and prisoners) replace sexual difference in establishing erotic tension. Attempts at sexual union are symbolized by prisoners blowing cigarette smoke through holes in their cell walls, the same holes which they use to derive voyeuristic pleasure. The film ends with a sense of consummation as the flowers finally reach their destination and enter the window.

Of course, there is no sense of consummation at the end of *Hand Tinting*; unending repetition signifies the cycle of poverty secured for these young women by Xerox's corporate agenda. But the similarities between these two films: institutionalized female/male subjects, silence and rhythm, frustrated desire, tension between contained spaces and imaginary spaces outside the depiction itself, demonstrate shared strategies for representing difference. Banning suggests the construction in *Hand Tinting* "of an indeterminate space enclosed within a

54. *Ibid.*

symmetrical border," an "extratextual" space structured through the sight lines of the women as a "utopian terrain."⁵⁵ In *Chant d'Amour* the central dream/fantasy sequence places sexual consummation outside the walls of the prison (representing normative heterosexual values) in an indeterminate 'natural' environment. It is worth noting that in describing her concept of "this 'other bisexuality' [which] doesn't annul differences," Hélène Cixous cites Jean Genet as a feminine (or bisexual) writer.⁵⁶

What I am concerned with here then is not the delineation of a feminine aesthetic rooted in biological essentialism, but rather a textual position which allows for the articulation of difference, creating a conceptual space from which "other" voices may speak. This space which eludes the homologous point of view and encoded meanings of conventional cinematic practice ruptures the subject/object power relations that structure representation, so that "looking" and the construction of "the look" need no longer be based on the exercise of power over, that is, mastery. This relinquishing of textual authority on the part of the artist is what Banning sees as the basis for a new kind of authorship, "one conditioned by a principle which is decidedly not phallic."⁵⁷

In *Hand Tinting*, it is the voices of these young women, "their swearing and astounding wit," which Wieland seeks to restore. The film is a visual poem that seeks to redress the erasure of specificity, of cultural identity, in the official made-for-T.V. version. And it is the tracing and movement of the female body that is crucial to this project. For within its silence, it is dancing that comes to signify the vernacular specific to Black culture, which is above all a culture born of oppression

55. *Ibid.*

56. Toril Moi, *Sexual/Textual Politics*, (London: Methuen, 1985), 109-10.

57. Banning, "Textual Excess," 14.

and resistance. Black American dancing has specific associations with spiritual enlightenment. The Hallelujah arm-flailing that we see in this film stems from the fact that Black slaves in the U.S. were forbidden to dance. They disguised this activity by calling it something else acceptable to protestant ethics: "feeling the Lord."⁵⁸ The visual power of the dancing in *Hand Tinting* stems more from its history as a vehicle for spiritual expression within Black culture, than to any conjuring of an atavistic state.

It is worth noting that *Hand Tinting* is contemporary with the Black civil rights movement in the U.S. and was completed in the year of Martin Luther King's assassination. It may easily be read in terms of racial tension. As I have already mentioned, the white women who sit and observe act as a visual counterpoint to the black women who dance. Similarly a white woman immersing her head in the swimming pool is coupled with the image of a black woman moving towards the locker room door. This playing off of images black and white contributes to the visual tension of the film, its rhythmical pattern. Given Wieland's penchant for puns, *Hand Tinting* may well be read as a black and white film about colour, a hand-coloured film about blacks and whites.

Wieland's close identification with the subject matter of her films is formally expressed through close camera work and a shallow filmic space which cause a reduction, one might even say collapsing, of the psychic distance between viewer and image. Though an essential ingredient to both *Water Sark* and *Hand Tinting*, it is in the epic proportions of *Reason over Passion* that this intimacy emerges as a powerful visual metaphor for the artist's identification with Canada as female.

58. See Judith Lynne Hanna, *To Dance is Human*, (Austin: U of Texas P, 1979), 19.

4.6 Reason over Passion

Wieland's first feature length film takes its title from a statement by Pierre Elliot Trudeau: "Reason over passion - that is the theme of all my writings." He was responding to the quilting bee organized by Wieland in New York to produce two quilted wall hangings with the words "Reason over Passion" in both official languages. The "quilt-in" was the culmination of a number of actions in response to the election of Trudeau as leader of the Liberal Party in 1968, including an occupation of the Canadian Consulate in New York by ex-patriate artists. In an ironic gesture, Wieland gave Trudeau the French version as a gift. She then decided to use the phrase as the text for her film because it elicited a response.⁵⁹

Wieland has stated that in making *Reason over Passion* she "felt like Leni Riefenstahl...a government propagandist."⁶⁰ Yet unlike Riefenstahl, Wieland was taking Trudeau on for his words, which are the antithesis of her commitment to "seeing life whole." In the film version Wieland was "treating them as a propaganda slogan, and through permutation, turning them into visual poetry, into a new language."⁶¹ The substance of this new language consists of 537 computer generated permutations of the words reason over passion, which are superimposed over images of the Canadian landscape.

The landscape footage was taken by Wieland during a trip across Canada using a hand held camera and shooting from a car or train. She keeps the camera in a fixed position perpendicular to the direction of the moving vehicle and uses a

59. Fleming, 185, footnote 52.

60. Lucy Lippard, "Watershed," essay in *Joyce Wieland*, (Toronto: AGO, 1987), 3. Wieland has also compared the title of Riefenstahl's film on Hitler *Triumph of the Will* to *Reason over Passion*. Artist's talk at the National Gallery of Canada, May 11, 1989.

61. Armatage, "Interview with Joyce Wieland," 251.

shallow depth of field so that the landscape seems to rush past the frame, sometimes blurred, at other times clearer, depending upon speed and focal point. In landscape painting, the placement of the horizon determines the overall shape of the image; it is the spatial reference that indicates the viewpoint of the spectator. In *Reason over Passion* the horizon changes in the transition of the terrain from sea to sea - from forests to farmland to open fields and prairie to forest to mountains. The horizon moves in and out; the space within the visual field opens and closes. We experience the land as a continuous undulating surface. The movement traced by the photographic record is like a loving caress. Wieland's portrait of the land is intimate and yet impresses us with its overwhelming proportions, its vastness and diversity, again, a site of limitless possibility which defies any single naming. Wieland treats the land in a way similar to the filming of her own body in *Water Sark*: fragments that suggest the whole - blurred, textured, sensuous, a site of pleasure. The water that was so visible in the latter film is transformed here into snow, lying like a thick quilt upon the land.

It requires little in the way of contrivance to see Canada in terms of the topology of the female body and as the site of the maternal "Mother Earth." As Banning has noted "It is a cultural commonplace that "physis" or nature is female, whereas "techne" or technology...is actively considered male."⁶² Just as the male structures of representation are transgressed by Wieland's textual excess in *Water Sark* and *Hand Tinting*, so the multiplicity and scale of Canada resists and disrupts the naming strategies of photographic technology and the male-stream logic that

62. Kass Banning, "From Didactics to Desire," *Work in Progress*, (Toronto: The Women's Press, 1987), 159.

authorizes Trudeau's claim to reason. When superimposed upon Wieland's images, Trudeau's maxim is reduced to non-sense.

Trudeau's portrait is at the center of the film, replacing Ontario. His placement between Quebec and the West is appropriate given his commitment to holding the country together. However what Wieland is also implying here is that Trudeau's centrist vision of federalism, conceived from the point of view and economic interests of Ontario, cannot speak to the diverse regional interests of the rest of the country. The freeze frame images of Trudeau are, like Wieland's own evaluation of him at the time, somewhat ambiguous, oscillating between a fascination with the "odalisque"⁶³ and an ironic de-construction of the man as national icon. The context would suggest that Wieland seeks to demystify the "leader" as much as she does other symbols of the nation: the flag and the anthem.

The male/female opposition implicit in *Reason over Passion* was not new to her film work. *Rat Life and Diet in North America* (1968) unequivocally links sexual power to political power, didactically presenting the U.S. as a male imperialist power raping a female Canada. This awareness of being doubly colonized and Wieland's sense of alarm around the American takeover of Canada are the motivating forces behind the film. Influenced by her readings of Canadian history, especially George Grant's *Lament for a Nation* and James Laxer's *The Energy Poker Game*,⁶⁴ the artist recalls that she was thrown into a panic "an ecological, spiritual panic about this country."⁶⁵ She describes her silent mouthing of the national anthem at the beginning of the film - a sequence that recalls her lip play in *Water Sark* - as "Almost announcing the death of the country, which is what this film is partly about - a last

63. Armatage, "Interview with Joyce Wieland," 251.

64. Stevenson, 167.

65. "Debbie Magidson and Judy Wright interview Joyce Wieland," 63.

look at Canada."⁶⁶ The graininess of the film, which was rephotographed from a moviola, not only counters the up-to-the-minute slickness of conventional travelogues with a sense of nostalgia, but suggests the cinematic technology of the silent film era, which coincided historically with the emergence of a nationalist landscape tradition in Canada.⁶⁷ Reviewing the film in 1970, P. Adams Sitney concludes: "At the end, we have seen an ecological dirge, not a poem of becoming so much as of what might have been."⁶⁸

Lauren Rabinovitz suggests that the electronic beep that sounds at regular intervals acts as a measure of the length of time it takes to watch the film, emphasizing its slow progression.⁶⁹ I would suggest another function which adds an important dimension to the reading of the film. While Wieland's lament for the land we see refers to the imperialist intentions of the U.S., the auditory space referenced by the electronic beep - a synthesized version of the artist's own voice⁷⁰ - suggests still another uncharted space for colonization. The passage of time marked by our anticipation of the inevitable beep is analogous to the countdown that precedes that penultimate phallic spectacle, a rocket launching into outer space.

The escalation of the NASA space program during the 1960s reached its apex in 1969 (during the production of *Reason Over Passion*) with the Apollo flight to the moon. The significance of this technological feat in extending the American frontier to the moon, a heavenly body associated since ancient times with the female principle, could not have been lost on Wieland, whose strong feelings and active

66. Armatage "Interview with Joyce Wieland," 251.

67. In *The Far Shore*, produced for commercial release in 1976, Wieland combined these themes with an artist based on Tom Thomson as the gentle lover of both the heroine and the land, which he defends against the rapacious incursions of capitalist developers.

68. P. Adams Sitney, "there is only one Joyce," *Artscan* 27 April 1970, 45.

69. Rabinovitz, *The Film Reader*, 135.

70. Conversation with the artist, May 11, 1989.

protest against the presence of U.S. technological enterprises in Canada are well known. A newspaper article marking the twentieth anniversary of the moon landing recalls that in Toronto's Yorkville district, then a hippie haven, a "howl-in" was held where participants were told "to bay at the moon to mark the end of the moon's virginity."⁷¹ On the level of representation, the human presence in outer space opened a new chapter in the science of surveying and mapping. Landsat imagery now provides the "true" picture. From the vantage point of the moon or any other man-made satellite, the colonizing (electronic) eye can capture not only Canada, but half of the globe, within a single frame.

This correlation of metaphors is supported by the fact that *Reason over Passion* is not the only statement of Trudeau's that Wieland appropriated, for his words have also been enshrined in her mixed media piece entitled *Man Has Reached Out and Touched the Tranquil Moon* (fig. 48), where "Each letter, contained in the sealed silence of its small space, intimates a vast otherness."⁷² These are the only two phrases by the prime minister thus preserved. As I have discussed in Chapter 2 of this thesis, the 1960's imagination was animated by a pre-occupation with space-age technologies and exploration that informed artistic practice. A 1969 review of *Reason over Passion* in *Artscanada* was printed alongside an item announcing a "Put Your Name in Space" contest, to name Canada's planned communication satellite.⁷³ But while Wieland's film may be seen as similarly engaged with these contemporary issues, it also disturbs the supporting logic that allows the space program, and the sell-out of Canadian resources, to be carried out in the name of progress. In Wieland's lament for Canada, the electronic beep marks

71. "Remember how we all reacted?," *The Globe and Mail*, Saturday July 15, 1989.

72. Fleming, 77.

73. *Artscanada*, 134/135 (August, 1969).

the countdown for the next American offensive, aided and abetted by the allies of patriarchy within.

4.7 Pierre Vallières

Wieland's concern with the politics of the moment and her connecting of sexual politics with national issues is also evident in *Pierre Vallières*, wherein the author of *The White Niggers of America*, equates the oppression of women with the oppression of the working class and the struggle for self-determination in Quebec. A part of the anatomy symbolizes the whole as the entire thirty-three minute documentary features an extreme closeup of Pierre Vallières' mouth. Given Vallières' status as an orator this zeroing in on the mouth is appropriate. Likewise, the claustrophobic space, for this is the mouth of a man who spent three years in prison without a trial.⁷⁴

The structure of the film comments on bilingualism as another asymmetrical opposition analogous to the male/female dichotomy, suggesting that "equal representation" is not the solution. Our attention to Vallières' voice speaking in French is disrupted by the textual authority of the English supertitles. There is a tension between the visual presence of the English text (which one could argue is to some extent privileged in a visual/literate culture) and the auditory space created by the spoken French. Though the superimposition of text in the form of subtitles is a recognized film convention, Wieland's incorporation of text in her films consistently points to the limitations of language as a system for representing experience and to naming as the privilege of the powerful. Within the film

74. Stevenson, 168.

language which Wieland develops, Vallières is coded as feminine, his red lips, with the added bonus of the moustache, being visually analogous to female genitalia. Moreover, officially censured, he speaks from a position of silence.

Visual relief is offered by the closing shots, where the camera pans out the window to show us the snowy Québec countryside. Rather than moving from the close-up shot of Vallières' mouth to show us the whole man, Wieland chooses to maintain the disconnection of this voice, which speaks of oppression and revolution, from Vallières as an individual male. Instead she locates the disruptive voice, which has been coded 'feminine,' within the land.

4.8 Solidarity

The disconnection of voice and image in *Solidarity* ironically juxtaposes the rhetoric of the labour movement with the experience of those who walk the picket lines. In typical documentary fashion, the opening credits situate the action:

May 26, 1973 5,000 People Demonstrate in Kitchener, Ontario to
Support the Striking Workers of the Dare Cookie Factory.

What we see of these 5,000 demonstrators, however, is their feet. Using a high angle and fixed frame, Wieland films the feet of those walking the picket line in order to convey the experience from their point of view. The camera angle also places the spectator in a position analogous to the strikers. Wieland's strategy here is an inverse of the "talking heads" format common to documentary practice. These women remain anonymous and silent. Despite the energetic speeches of various female union representatives, whose voices outside the frame rally the workers to struggle against women's economic exploitation, the women who are doing the walking rather than the talking do not seem empowered. At the same time,

Wieland's use of part of the anatomy to represent the whole, in this case feet, and her creation of a visually indeterminate space, succeeds in making a more general statement about the "pedestrian" reality of working-class solidarity, that belies the heroic idealizations of middle-class Marxists.

4.9 Conclusion

Joyce Wieland evolved an art-practice based upon the female body as matrix of representation that ruptured the terms of conventional representations, while exceeding as well the borders of the artistic front defined by the contemporary avant-garde. Without reiterating the development of feminist strategies in Wieland's work that anticipate the debates of the 1970s and even the 1980s, I would like to consider the implications of her involvement with avant-garde communities. Though most of the formal considerations and thematic concerns of Wieland's art of the 1960s were in evidence early on, it is in New York City that they came together strategically, most remarkably in her films. And while the attitudes of her male contemporaries in the underground film community were ultimately dismissive, there was more happening for women in the alternative scene in New York, albeit marginalized, than Toronto. Particularly in the area of experimental dance, there were a number of women of Wieland's generation who were performing in ways that pre-figured feminist performance art of the early 1970s. Eleanor Antin (b. 1935), Simone Forti (b. 1935), Joan Jonas (b. 1936), Yoko Ono, Alison Knowles (b. 1933) and Yvonne Rainer (b. 1934), who would also become a noteworthy filmmaker, were all active in this community. Granted, the women's movement was active in the U.S. long before Canadian women were organizing around feminist issues, and this

alone might have been a stimulating force,⁷⁵ for certainly, the valence of the "feminine" body in Wieland's work resonates with the contemporaneous politics of the female body. But what this suggests for further investigation is the precise relationship of women working in areas such as dance, where they have traditionally been accorded greater artistic freedom and acknowledgement, and their movement into other areas such as filmmaking, video and performance, areas which remain marginalized but situate women closer to the discursive spaces occupied by men.

75. In the U.S. the President's Commission on the Status of Women published a report of their recommendations in 1963, much earlier than the Canadian Royal Commission on the Status of Women which was appointed in 1967 and reported in 1970.

5. Conclusion

As an introduction to this thesis I quoted two writers who have interrogated the problem of female subjectivity within patriarchal culture. Luce Irigaray names patriarchal culture as the locus of women's displacement and speaks to the (im)possibilities of our enunciation beyond the terms of "their" binary oppositions. Griselda Pollock acknowledges this problematic as constitutive of female oppression, while reframing the feminist project as a socially and historically constructed process of negotiation, across women's contradictory positions, and through particular political/textual strategies. Though articulating the problem of female agency differently, both Irigaray and Pollock evince a configuration of culture based on women's displacement - the daughter's exile.

In "Modernity and the spaces of femininity," Pollock includes the following note:

In earlier drafts of this chapter I explore the possibilities of coordinating the historical perspectives on the spaces of modernity and femininity with those of feminist psychoanalytical writing on femininity...between which there was tantalizing coincidence on the issues of the look, the body and the tropes of distance and proximity in the construction and feminine negotiation of sexual difference under a patriarchal system.¹

1. Pollock, 87.

While not setting out specifically to accomplish such a co-ordination, the critical strategy that I have evolved in this thesis derives from the interplay of these same historical and theoretical models, mapping the particulars of biography, social and artistic context onto the patterns of sexual difference that feminist interpretations of psychoanalytical theory have illuminated, specifically, the privileging of the Paternal over the Maternal in culture and the precarious process of individuation that occurs across this asymmetry. And it is especially in the issues of the body and "the tropes of distance and proximity" that the artistic practices of Pflug and Wieland intersect in meaningful ways, not only with each other, but with the contemporaneous concerns of modernity.

While one could comment at length upon the confluence of images and motifs in the art of these two women - the domestic site, bodies of water, vessels (boats, planes, trains) - the strategic determinants of their works are the inscription/absence of the "feminine" body and the organization of representational space. In Chapter 4, I have discussed the lack of mastery over narrative that informs both Pflug and Wieland's work and have suggested their respective relationships to textual authority and subjectivity as a point of divergence. For Pflug, subjectivity remains a site of disunity and conflict, a movement towards but never past the threshold of enunciation, a vision pervaded by stillness, silence, mysterious absence - a *mise-en-scène* that awaits animation. For Wieland, subjectivity is simultaneously heterogeneous and unified, a configuration expressed visually through fragmentations of the body that represent a "whole" reconstituted elsewhere, beyond the frame, animated to speak to differences of social positionality - of sex and race and class.

The spatial tensions in Pflug and Wieland's works can be conceptualized in terms of their orientation to spectacle and to the body. For Pflug, the celebration of the Roman Catholic mass was a formative influence. The Christian Church is a theatrical arena for the transcendence of corporeal reality - a denial, even a repudiation, of bodily functions and pleasures - where rituals of sacrifice and redemption are acted out in spaces coded sacred or profane by the boundary of the communion rail, and where the feminine body is subsumed within the paradoxical maternity of the Virgin Mary.² For Wieland, the primary site was a secular one; the elaborate costume dramas, Disney animated features and musicals that played at the King's Playhouse cinema at Queen and Dovercourt, were a source of fascination and pleasure that meshed with the theatrical tradition of her own family.³ It was such products of popular culture that inspired her female superhero, Agent X9, whose adventures exceeded not only the physical limits of human possibility - frailty and mortality - but more importantly the restrictive definitions of female agency.

While this raises interesting questions around the inculcation of femininity in religious versus non-religious spheres, it is not an argument for the secular over the sacred as a site for feminist intervention - with Wieland tap dancing into the extra-textual - though it does suggest intriguing possibilities within popular culture and the art of animation for appropriation and transformation. Rather it is the ways in which these issues of the body interface with the technological face of modernity and the pre-occupations of an avant-garde whose regeneration (changing styles and "isms") has escalated with the pace of technological change. For the move away

2 See Marina Warner, *Alone of All Her Sex* (London: Pan Books, 1985) and Julia Kristeva, "Stabat Mater," in Susan Rubin Suleiman ed., *The Female Body in Western Culture* (Cambridge: Harvard, 1986), for thorough and insightful discussions of the Virgin mother.

3 Porter, 24.

from figurative concerns in post-war art, the embrace of the "technological transformations of a world-wide plastic-coated electric revolution,"⁴ and the corresponding displacement of women's artistic concerns (as I have discussed in Chapter 2 with respect to sculpture) mark out the terrain of debates around technology and the (feminine) body - issues of representation and reproduction - that have engaged the energies of second wave feminists, and transformed the practices of contemporary Canadian artists, those communities formed by the politics of the avant-garde and reconstituted during the 1980s around the politics of difference.

4. Dorothy Cameron, *Sculpture '67*, National Gallery of Canada, 1967. See my Chapter 2, footnote 77.

Illustrations

pop art

op art

Seagram's
V.O.
CANADIAN WHISKY

A RARE OLD DELICATE CANADIAN WHISKY
SPECIALLY MATURED IN OAK CASKS
57.1% ALC/VOL (114.2 PROOF) UNDER THE
SUPERVISED SIGN OF THE CANADIAN GOVERNMENT
SEAGRAM'S SEAGRAM LIMITED
TORONTO, ONTARIO, CANADA
BOTTLED BY SEAGRAM

top art

In the art world, today's craze may be forgotten tomorrow.
Not so with whisky. Year after year,
that great V.O. taste, smoothness, and softness, all the rest
in fact, more people on this planet, relax, satisfied
with Seagram's V.O. than with any other Canadian Whisky.
Next time, ask for V.O. Relax, satisfied.

Figure 1

Advertisement for Seagram's V.O. Whiskey
Reproduced in *artscanada* late 1960s.

Figure 2

Suzanne Guite *Christ Noir* 1962
Black walnut 5' x 4' x 12"

Figure 3

Catharine Boudreau *Canal Form No. 1* 1966
Ciment fondu 2' x 30" diameter

Figure 4 Anne Kahane *Runners* 1967
Cedar 52.5" x 41" x 16"

Figure 5

Patricia Fulford *Totemic Structure #1* 1967
Laminated redwood, painted 8'6" x 35" x 29"

Figure 6 Françoise Sullivan *Aeris Ludus* 1967
Painted steel and plastic 10' x 18' x 5'

Fata Morgana 1966
Painted steel 7' x 6' x 6'

Figure 7 *Luna Park* 1967
Fibreglass (metal structure) 7' x 6'6" x 5'6"

Lise Gervais *Confederation* 1967
Fibreglass (metal structure) 7' x 12' x 3'6"

Figure 8

Christiane Pflug *Justice Building, Paris* 1954
Oil on paper 50.2 x 32.2 cm.

Figure 9

C. Pflug *Pont D'Austerlitz* 1954
Oil on canvas 29" x 36"

Figure 10

C. Pflug *Canal St. Martin* 1955
Oil on canvas

Figure 11

C. Pflug *Still Life with Clock Face and Tiles*
1957 Tempera 28 5/8" x 36"

Figure 12

C. Pflug *Still Life with Black Cloth and Rose*
1956 Oil on canvas 19 3/4" x 14 1/4"

Figure 13

C. Pflug *Bird Cage with Pears* 1958
Tempera 18 1/4" x 24 1/4"

Figure 14 C. Pflug *Railway Yards in the Rain* 1962
Oil on canvas 49.5 x 55.9 cm.

Figure 15

C. Pflug *Window on Yonge Street* 1961
Oil on canvas 22 1/2" x 19 1/4"

Figure 16

C. Pflug *On the Balcony No. 2* 1963
Oil on canvas 52 1/2" x 39 1/2"

Figure 17

C. Pflug *The Kitchen Door in Winter II* 1964
Oil on canvas 119.9 x 100 cm.

Figure 18

C. Pflug *On the Black Chair No. 2* 1963
Oil on canvas 33" x 30"

Figure 19

C. Pflug *On the Black Chair I* 1963
Oil on canvas 21 1/2" x 18"

Figure 20

C. Pflug *Avrom Isaacs* 1964
Oil on canvas 86 1/8" x 76"

Figure 21

C. Pflug *Incomplete Landscape* 1970
Graphite on paper 24.6 x 31.8 cm

Figure 22 C. Pflug *Kitchen Door with Esther* 1965
Oil on canvas 64" x 76"

Figure 23

C. Pflug *The Squirrel* 1967
Graphite on paper 32.3 x 25.7 cm

Figure 24

C. Pflug *On McDermott's Farm: The Forest* 1971
Graphite on paper 5" x 6 3/4"

Figure 25

C. Pflüg *Kitchen Door with Ursula* 1960
Oil on canvas 65 1/8" x 76 1/8"

Figure 26

C. Pflug *Ursula on Ward's Island 1966*
Graphite on paper 17.1 x 12.7 cm

Figure 27

C. Pflug *Lake Simcoe* 1964
Graphite on paper 16.5 x 11.8 cm

Figure 28

C. Pflug *The Loon* 1967
Graphite on paper 14 5/8" x 12 1/2"

Figure 29

C. Pflug, *Toronto from Centre Island I* 1967
Graphute on paper 32.3 x 25.5 cm

Figure 30

C. Pilug *Boxcars, Marlborough Avenue* 1968
Graphite on paper 12 1/2" x 9 5/8"

Figure 31

C. Pflug *Railway Dam and Truck* 1967
Graphite on paper 37.2 x 31.8 cm

Figure 32

C. Pflug *McDermott's Truck* 1971
Graphite on paper 5" x 6 3/4"

Figure 33

C. Pflug, *Cottingham School in Winter I* 1968
Oil on canvas 43 7/16" x 39 1/2"

Figure 34 C. Pflug *Over the Kitchen Sink* 1967
Graphite on paper 25.5 x 32.1 cm

Figure 35 C. Pflug *With the Black Flag* 1971
Oil on canvas 54" x 56"

Figure 36

C Pflug *Pigeon and City Skyline* 1972 Graphite on paper 4" x 6"
Last drawing: New York City March 1972

Figure 37

Joyce Wieland *Untitled* 1955
Collage 9.0 x 15.0 cm

Figure 38

J. Wieland *Heart On* 1961
Collage on cloth 177.8 x 251.5 cm

Figure 39

J. Wieland *Balling* 1961
Oil on canvas 182.8 x 234.3 cm

Figure 40

J. Wieland *Sailboat Sinking* 1965
Oil on canvas 76.5 x 81.5 cm

Figure 41 J. Wieland *Cooling Room II* 1964
Mixed media construction 114.3 x 94.2 x 18.1 cm

3 of/de 3

MICROCOPY RESOLUTION TEST CHART
NATIONAL BUREAU OF STANDARDS
STANDARD REFERENCE MATERIAL 1010a
(ANSI and ISO TEST CHART No. 2)

Figure 42 J. Wieland *Tragedy in the Air or Plane Crash* 1963
Oil on canvas 128.6 x 157.2 cm

Figure 43 J. Wieland *Young Woman's Blues* 1964
Mixed media construction 44.5 x 33 x 22.9 cm

Figure 44

J. Wieland *The New Power* 1963
Oil on canvas 106.4 x 40.6 cm

Figure 45

J. Wieland *Flicks Pics #4* 1963
Oil on canvas 106.7 x 40.6 cm

APPENDIX 3. Art Bank Collection: Expenditure on works by male and female artists 1971/72 - 1979/80.

Compiled by Sasha McInnes-Hayman

	1972/73	1973/74	1974/75	1975/76	1976/77	1977/78	1978/79	1979/80	Total
Budget (\$)									
Male	847317	795230	470886	595893	653410	498683	596095	519068	\$ 4,976,582
Female	103209	112094	92930	62620	93245	69645	107817	61810	\$ 703,370
Budget (%)									
Male	89.0	87.7	83.5	90.5	87.5	87.7	84.7	89.4	Avg 87.5%
Female	11.0	12.3	16.5	9.5	12.5	12.3	15.3	10.6	Avg 12.5%
Number									
Male	261	259	153	238	214	169	182	208	1,684
Female	63	79	60	58	60	49	63	57	489
Number (%)									
Male	80.5	76.9	71.8	80.4	78.0	77.5	74.3	78.5	Avg 77.2%
Female	19.5	23.1	28.2	19.6	22.0	22.5	25.7	21.5	Avg 22.8%
Average (\$)									
Male	3246	3058	3078	2504	3053	2951	3275	2496	Avg 2958
Female	1638	1435	1549	1080	1554	1421	1711	1084	Avg 1434

Figure 47 J. Wieland *Cooling Room I* 1964
Mixed media construction 73.7 x 58.9 x 27.9 cm

Figure 48

J. Wieland *Man Has Reached Out and Touched
The Tranquil Moon* 1970
Mixed media 298.5 x 163.2 cm

Appendices

**APPENDIX 4. Art Bank Collection: Fourteen highest paid artists.
Compiled by Sasha McInnes-Hayman.**

Fourteen men were found to be the highest paid artists over the 8 year period studies. They are:

Baxter, Iain	\$ 53,082
Ewen, Paterson	60,075
Gagnon, Charles	73,310
Gaucher, Yves	92,250
Hurtubise, Jacques	139,240
Iskowitz, Gershon	87,320
Molinari, Guido	93,875
McEwen, Jean	74,815
Rabinowitch, Royden	63,600
Redinger, Walter	93,500
Smith, Gordon	42,258
Snow, Michael	78,541
Tousignant, Claude	122,767
Town, Harold	77,085

The average annual amount received by each of these artists from the Art Bank was \$10,283.

The average annual amount received by all male artists was \$2,958. In contrast, the average annual amount received by women artists was \$1,434.

APPENDIX 2. Women in the Hart House Art Collection 1969

Artist	Dates	# works	Acq. date
Simone Mary Bouchard	1912-45	1	1942
Ghitta Caiserman-Roth	1923-	1	1951-2
Emily Carr	1871-1945	1	1929
Paraskeva Clark	1898-	1	1939
Grace Coombs	1890-	1	1922-23
Ruth M. Eliot	1913-	1	1934
Lise Gervais	1933-	1	1965-66
Jacqueline Gilson	1912-	1	1951-52
Bess (Larkin) Housser Harris	1890-	1	1930-31
Prudence Heward	1896-1965	1	1936
Yvonne McKague Housser	1898-	1	1934
Lucy Jarvis	1896-	1	1949-50
Kathleen Moir Morris	1894-	1	1934-35
Lilias Torrance Newton	1896-	3	1934
Christiane Pflug	1936-	1	1962-63
Marthe Rakine	n.d.	1	1950-51
Benita Sanders	1935-	1	1966-67
Anne D. Savage	1897-	1	1930
Claire Shoniker	n.d.	1	1956-57
Dorothy Stevens	1890-	3	1934

APPENDIX 3. Art Bank Collection: Expenditure on works by male and female artists 1971/72 - 1979/80.

Compiled by Sasha McInnes-Hayman

	1972/73	1973/74	1974/75	1975/76	1976/77	1977/78	1978/79	1979/80	Total
Budget (\$)									
Male	847317	795230	470886	595893	653410	498683	596095	519068	\$ 4,976,582
Female	103209	112094	92930	62620	93245	69645	107817	61810	\$ 703,370
Budget (%)									
Male	89.0	87.7	83.5	90.5	87.5	87.7	84.7	89.4	Avg 87.5%
Female	11.0	12.3	16.5	9.5	12.5	12.3	15.3	10.6	Avg 12.5%
Number									
Male	261	259	153	238	214	169	182	208	1,684
Female	63	79	60	58	60	49	63	57	489
Number (%)									
Male	80.5	76.9	71.8	80.4	78.0	77.5	74.3	78.5	Avg 77.2%
Female	19.5	23.1	28.2	19.6	22.0	22.5	25.7	21.5	Avg 22.8%
Average (\$)									
Male	3246	3058	3078	2504	3053	2951	3275	2496	Avg 2958
Female	1638	1435	1549	1080	1554	1421	1711	1084	Avg 1434

**APPENDIX 4. Art Bank Collection: Fourteen highest paid artists.
Compiled by Sasha McInnes-Hayman.**

Fourteen men were found to be the highest paid artists over the 8 year period studies. They are:

Baxter, Iain	\$ 53,083
Ewen, Paterson	60,075
Gagnon, Charles	73,310
Gaucher, Yves	92,250
Hurtubise, Jacques	139,240
Iskowitz, Gershon	87,320
Molinari, Guido	93,875
McEwen, Jean	74,815
Rabinowitch, Royden	63,600
Redinger, Walter	93,500
Smith, Gordon	42,258
Snow, Michael	78,541
Tousignant, Claude	122,767
Town, Harold	77,085

The average annual amount received by each of these artists from the Art Bank was \$10,283.

The average annual amount received by all male artists was \$2,958. In contrast, the average annual amount received by women artists was \$1,434.

APPENDIX 5. Canada Council Arts Bursaries Statistics
1965/66 - 1969/70

		Applications		Awards	
		No.	No.	\$,000	
1965-66	Men	144	50	110	
	Women	111	39	86	
	Total	255	89	196	
1966-67	Men	211	78	172	
	Women	150	51	112	
	Total	361	129	284	
1967-68	Men	284	111	270	
	Women	144	47	114	
	Total	428	158	384	
1968-69	Men	432	182	616	
	Women	217	67	227	
	Total	649	49	843	
1969-70 I	Men	578	166	580	
	Women	260	61	212	
	Total	838	227	792	
1969-70 II	Men	611	169	591	
	Women	258	56	196	
	Total	869	225	787	

APPENDIX 6. Ontario College of Art 1959-1970
Percentage of Women Instructors

	Instructors		Technical Assistants	
	Women/ Total No.	% Women	Women/ Total No.	% Women
1959/60	6/31	19	--	--
1960/61	6/36	17	--	--
1961/62	8/39	21	--	--
1962/63	9/45	20	--	--
1963/64	9/47	19	2/2	100
1964/65	7/49	14	2/4	50
1965/66	7/53	13	0/2	0
1966/67	19/67	28	1/6	16
1967/68	12/64	19	0/2	0
1968/69	18/75	23	1/5	20
1969/70	17/90	19	0/7	0

APPENDIX 7. Ontario College of Art 1959-1970

Number Women Instructors in Each Subject Area

	1959 to 1960	1960 to 1961	1961 to 1962	1962 to 1963	1963 to 1964	1964 to 1965	1965 to 1966	1966 to 1967	1967 to 1968	1968 to 1969	1969 to 1970
Lettering	1	1	2	1	1	1	-	1	1	2	-
Design	3	3	3	2	2	2	2	2	2	2	1
Museum/Hist Research	2	2	3	4	3	3	2	3	2	1	2
Textiles	1	1	1	1	1	1	2	2	2	3	3
English	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1	1
Ceramics	1	1	-	-	-	-	1	2	3	3	3
Sculpture	-	-	1	1	1	-	-	-	-	-	-
Media	-	-	-	1	1	1	1	1	1	-	-
Metal	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	1	-	-
Tech/Arch Dwg	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1
Art History	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	2	2
Illustration	-	-	-	1	1	-	-	-	-	1	1
Fashion Illus	-	-	-	1	1	-	-	-	-	1	1
Painting	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	-	2
Interior Rendering	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1
Interior Design	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	-	-
Drawing	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	3	1
Drawing Techniques	-	-	-	-	-	-	-	1	1	-	-

APPENDIX 8. Ontario College of Art 1961-1970, Female Students as a Percentage of Total Enrolment

	1961 to 1962	1962 to 1963	1963 to 1964	1964 to 1965	1965 to 1966	1966 to 1967	1969 to 1970
	%	%	%	%	%	%	%
Foundation Year	43	49	42	43	46	46	46
Second Year:							
Ad Design	17	48	35	39	34	50	32
Ad Illus	39	29	45	-	-	-	-
Dwg & Ptg	56	59	58	49	60	57	37
Ind Design	17	0	3	5	3	6	3
Int Design	56	53	66	54	54	53	59
Mtrl Arts	100	44	69	74	78	80	60
Sculpture	33	33	38	46	27	27	31
Spec Students	100	100	-	-	-	-	-
Total % 2nd yr.	40	41	42	41	40	46	36
Third Year:							
Ad Design	19	16	24	36	38	24	32
Ad Illus	35	42	32	-	-	-	-
Dwg & Ptg	18	53	55	56	48	58	62
Ind Design	7	13	0	0	4	4	5
Int Design	61	56	46	63	46	49	47
Mtrl Arts	100	100	34	75	69	71	66
Sculpture	50	40	34	36	43	17	22
Spec Students	83	100	-	-	-	-	-
Total % 3rd yr.	35	38	32	40	39	34	41
Fourth Year:							
Ad Design	47	22	15	23	35	41	34
Ad Illus	27	30	42	27	-	-	-
Dwg & Ptg	38	30	59	55	47	38	57
Ind Design	0	8	11	0	0	5	0
Int Design	46	62	61	28	61	26	33
Mtrl Arts	67	100	83	33	82	75	70
Sculpture	0	67	34	40	50	43	29
Spec Students	63	25	-	-	-	-	-
Total % 4th yr.	34	37	37	29	39	42	40
Post Graduates	75	-	34	-	-	-	-
% of Total Enrolment	40	43	40	40	42	40	38

APPENDIX 9. Ontario College of Art 1961-1970

Student Enrolment

	1961 to 1962	1962 to 1963	1963 to 1964	1964 to 1965	1965 to 1966	1966 to 1967	1969 to 1970
	#	#	#	#	#	#	#
Foundation Year	234	263	320	320	321	323	311
Second Year:							
Ad Design	41	33	108	99	121	106	115
Ad Illus	52	38	-	-	-	-	-
Dwg & Ptg	32	32	36	43	35	37	59
Ind Design	23	22	39	37	35	49	36
Int Design	27	32	41	48	47	38	27
Mtrl Arts	6	9	16	19	18	30	47
Sculpture	6	6	13	13	11	15	13
Spec students	7	2	-	-	-	-	-
Total 2nd yr.	194	174	256	259	253	275	297
Third Year:							
Ad Design	26	44	3	83	76	92	87
Ad Illus	6	24	28	-	-	-	-
Dwg & Ptg	38	30	22	25	21	26	34
Ind Design	14	23	19	28	25	26	21
Int Design	23	18	24	30	41	37	19
Mtrl Arts	7	7	6	12	16	14	35
Sculpture	4	5	6	11	7	6	9
Spec students	6	2	-	-	-	-	-
Total 3rd yr.	144	153	139	189	186	201	204
Fourth Year:							
Ad Design	15	23	41	30	71	63	77
Ad Illus	22	23	24	22	-	-	-
Dwg & Ptg	16	23	27	20	19	13	35
Ind Design	14	12	19	14	24	20	18
Int Design	13	21	18	18	23	35	30
Mtrl Arts	3	6	6	6	11	12	27
Sculpture	2	3	3	5	8	7	7
Special students	8	4	-	-	-	-	-
Total 4th yr.	93	115	138	115	156	151	194
Post Graduates	4	-	3	-	-	-	-
Total enrolment	669	705	856	883	916	1018	1086

Bibliography

Bibliography

Books and Exhibition Catalogues

- Adamson, Jeremy. *The Hart House Collection of Canadian Paintings*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1969.
- Adamson, Nancy, Linda Briskin and Margaret McPhail. *Feminist Organizing for Change: The Contemporary Women's Movement in Canada*. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Ardener, Shirley (ed.). *Women and Space: Ground Rules and Social Maps*. London: Croom Helm, 1981.
- Armatage, Kay and Linda Beath. *Women and Film/La femme et le film 1896-1973: International Festival*. Toronto: 1973 (catalogue).
- Armatage, Kay. "Interview with Joyce Wieland." Karyn Kay and Gerald Peary (eds.). *Women and the Cinema: A Critical Anthology*. New York: E. P. Dutton, 1977.
- Art Gallery of Ontario. *Joyce Wieland*. Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario and Key Porter Books, 1987 (catalogue).
- Banning, Kass. "From Didactics to Desire: Building Women's Film Culture." In Rhea Tregebov (ed.). *Work in Progress*. Toronto: The Women's Press, 1987.
- Burnett, David and Marilyn Schiff. *Contemporary Canadian Art*. Edmonton: Hurtig, 1983.
- Burnett, David. *Toronto Painting 1984*. Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario, 1984 (catalogue).
- Cameron, Dorothy. *Sculpture '67*. Ottawa: National Gallery of Canada, 1967 (catalogue).
- Cameron, Janice, Frances Ferdinands, Sharon Snitman, Madli Tamme and Annetta Werick. *Eclectic Eve*. Toronto: Women's Educational Press, 1972. Transcribed from audio tapes in collection of the Ontario College of Art. Unpaginated.

- Conde, Carole and Karl Beveridge. *It's Still Privileged Art*. Toronto: Art Gallery of Ontario, 1976 (catalogue).
- Cornwell, Regina. "True Patriot Love: The Films of Joyce Wieland." In Seth Feldman and Joyce Nelson (eds.). *Canadian Film Reader*. Toronto: Peter Martin Associates Ltd., 1977.
- Davis, Ann. *Christiane Pflug 1936-1972*. Winnipeg: Winnipeg Art Gallery, 1974 (catalogue).
- Davis, Ann. *The Drawings of Christiane Pflug*. Winnipeg: Winnipeg Art Gallery, 1979 (catalogue).
- Dubreuil-Blondin, Nicole. "Feminism and Modernism: Paradoxes." in Benjamin Buchloh (ed.). *Modernism and Modernity*. Halifax: Nova Scotia College of Art and Design Press, 1983.
- Duval, Paul. *High Realism in Canada*. Toronto: 1974.
- Ecker, Gisela (ed.). *Feminist Aesthetics*. London: The Women's Press, 1985.
- Farr, Dorothy and Natalie Luckyj. *From Women's Eyes: Women Painters in Canada*. Kingston: Agnes Etherington Art Centre, 1975 (catalogue).
- Fleming, Marie. *100 Years Evolution at OCA*. Toronto: Ontario College of Art/Art Gallery of Ontario, 1977.
- Geltner, Gail. *Christiane Pflug Retrospective Exhibition, 1971*. Sarnia: Sarnia Public Library and Art Gallery, 1971 (catalogue).
- Grosz, Elizabeth. *Sexual Subversions: Three French Feminists*. Sydney: Allen & Unwin, 1989.
- Hale, Barrie and Dennis Reid. *Toronto Painting: 1953-65*. Ottawa: The National Gallery of Canada, 1972 (catalogue).
- Hale, Barrie. *Out of the Park: Modernist Painting in Toronto 1950-1980*. Vol. 2 of *Provincial Essays*. Toronto: Coach House Press, 1985.
- Hirschon, Renee. "Open Body/Closed Space: The Transformation of Female Sexuality." in Shirley Ardener (ed.). *Defining Females: The Nature of Women in Society*. New York: John Wiley & Sons, 1978.
- Hoberman, J. "After Avant-Garde Film." in Brian Wallis (ed.). *Art After Modernism: Rethinking Representation*. New York: The New Museum of Contemporary Art, 1984.
- Irigaray, Luce. "When Our Lips Speak Together." *This Sex Which is Not One*. trans. Catherine Porter, New York: Cornell University Press, 1985.

- Irigaray, Luce. "This Sex Which is Not One." *This Sex Which is Not One*. trans. Catherine Porter, New York: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- Isaak, Jo Anna. *The Ruin of Representation in Modernist Art and Texts*. Ann Arbor: UMI Research Press, 1986.
- Isaak, Jo Anna. "Mapping the Imaginary." in Lorne Falk and Barbara Fischer. *The Event Horizon: Essays on Hope, Sexuality, Social Space and Mediation in Art*. Toronto: Coach House Press, 1987.
- J. B. Speed Art Museum. *19 Canadian Painters '62*. Louisville: J. B. Speed Art Museum, 1962 (catalogue).
- Jacobus, Mary. "The Difference of View." in *Reading Woman*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1986.
- Jardine, Alice A. *Gynesis: Configurations of Woman and Modernity*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- Kappeler, Susanne. *The Pornography of Representation*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1986.
- Kestash, Myrna. *Long Way from Home*. Toronto: James Lorimer & Company, 1980.
- Kraus, Rosalind E. *The originality of the avant-garde and other modernist myths*. Cambridge: MIT Press, 1985.
- Kristeva, Julia. "Motherhood According to Bellini." in *Desire in Language*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1980.
- Kristeva, Julia. "Stabat Mater." in Susan Rubin Suleiman (ed.). *The Female Body in Western Culture*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1986.
- Lippard, Lucy. *From the Center*. New York: Dutton, 1976.
- Lord, Barry. *The History of Painting in Canada*. Toronto: NC Press, 1974.
- McGregor, Gaile. *The Wacousta Syndrome*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1985.
- Moi, Toril. *Sexual/Textual Politics*. London: Methuen, 1985.
- Mulvey, Laura. "Visual Pleasure and Narrative Cinema." in Brian Wallis (ed.). *Art After Modernism*. New York: The New Museum, 1984.
- Mulvey, Laura. "Feminism, Film and the Avant-garde," in Mary Jacobus (ed.). *Women Writing and Writing About Women*. London: Croom Helm, 1979.
- Murray, Joan. *Alexandra Luke: Continued Searching*. Oshawa: The Robert McLaughlin Gallery, 1987 (catalogue).
- Murray, Joan. *Painters Eleven in Retrospect*. Oshawa: Robert McLaughlin Gallery, 1979 (catalogue).

- Museum of Modern Art. *Fifteen Canadian Artists*. New York: MOMA, n.d., unpaginated (catalogue).
- Nelson, Joyce. *The Perfect Machine: TV in the Nuclear Age*. Toronto: Between the Lines, 1987.
- Nochlin, Linda. "Why have there been no great women artists?" *Art News* 69.9 (January 1971), 22-39. Reprinted in E. Baker and Thomas B. Hess (eds.). *Art and Sexual Politics*. London: Collier Macmillan, 1973.
- Parker, Rozsika and Griselda Pollock. *Framing Feminism: Art and the Women's Movement 1970-85*. London: Pandora, 1987.
- Parker, Rozsika and Griselda Pollock. *Old Mistresses: Women, Art and Ideology*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1981.
- Parker, Rozsika. *The Subversive Stitch: Embroidery and the Making of the Feminine*. London: The Women's Press, 1984.
- Partington, Angela. "Feminist Art and Avant-Gardism." in Hilary Robinson (ed.). *Visibly Female: Feminism and Art: An Anthology*. London: Camden Press, 1987.
- Pollock, Griselda. *Vision and Difference: Femininity, Feminism and the Histories of Art*. London: Routledge, 1988.
- Pollock, Griselda. "Women Art and Ideology: Questions for Feminist Art Historians." in *Woman's Art Journal* IV (Spring/Summer 1983), 39-47. Reprinted in Hilary Robinson (ed.). *Visibly Female: Feminism and Art Today*. London: Camden Press, 1987.
- Rabinovitz, Lauren. "The Development of Feminist Strategies in the Experimental Films of Joyce Wieland." *The Film Reader*. 5 Evanston, Ill.: Northwestern University, 1982.
- Reid, Dennis. "Notes on the Toronto Painting Scene: 1959-1969." in William Townsend (ed.). *Canadian Art Today*. London: Studio International, 1970.
- Rowbothom, Sheila. *Woman's Consciousness, Man's World*. London: Pelican, 1973; Penguin, 1974.
- Sitney, P. Adams. "Structural Film." in *Film Culture Reader*. New York: Praeger Publishers, 1970.
- Stanton, Domna C. "Difference on Trial." in Nancy K. Miller (ed.). *The Poetics of Gender*. New York: Columbia University Press, 1986.
- Steele, Lisa. "Committed to Memory." in Rhea Tregebov (ed.). *Work in Progress: Building Feminist Culture*. Toronto: The Women's Press, 1987.
- Theberge, Pierre and Alison Reid. *Joyce Wieland: Drawings for "The Far Shore."* Ottawa: The National Gallery of Canada, 1978.
- Townsend, William (ed.). *Canadian Art Today*. London: Studio International, 1970.

- Vancouver Art Gallery. *Wieland 57-67*. Vancouver: Vancouver Art Gallery, 1968 (catalogue).
- Warner, Marina. *Alone of All Her Sex: The Myth and the Cult of the Virgin Mary*. London: Pan Books, 1985.
- Watson, Jennifer. *Alexandra Luke: A Tribute*. Oshawa: Robert McLaughlin Gallery, 1977 (catalogue).
- Winnipeg Art Gallery. *Christiane Pflug*. Winnipeg: Winnipeg Art Gallery, 1966 (catalogue).
- Wolf, Christa. "A Letter about Unequivocal and Ambiguous Meaning, Definiteness and Indefiniteness; about Ancient Conditions and New View-Scopes; about Objectivity." in Gisela Ecker (ed.). *Feminist Aesthetics*. London: The Women's Press, 1985.
- Woolf, Virginia. *A Room of One's Own*. London: Grafton Books, 1977.

Government Documents, Unpublished Research Studies and Institutional Publications

- Canada Council. *10th Annual Report: The Canada Council 1966-1967*. Ottawa: The Canada Council, 1967.
- Canada Council. *11th Annual Report: The Canada Council 1967-1968*. Ottawa: The Canada Council, 1968.
- Canada Council. *Twenty plus five: A discussion paper on the role of the Canada Council in the arts after the first twenty years (1957-77) and over the next five*. Based on a report by a committee of the Council: Nini Baird (chairman), Marjorie Johnston, Eric McLean, Paul Park. Ottawa: The Canada Council, 1977.
- Gwyn, Sandra. *Women in the Arts in Canada*. Study prepared for the Royal Commission on the Status of Women in Canada, 1971. (Carleton Library: Gov't Doc.).
- MacSkimming, Roy. *For Arts' Sake: A History of the Ontario Arts Council 1963-1983*. Toronto: Ontario Arts Council, 1983.
- McInnes-Hayman, Sasha and Margaret Wilkinson. *The Canada Council: A Study*. [1971/72 to 1981/82] 1982. [Ottawa: Canadian Advisory Council on the Status of Women Documentation Centre]
- McInnes-Hayman, Sasha. *Art Bank Collection: Expenditure on works by male and female artists for years 1971/72 through 1979/80*. 1981. [Ottawa: National Gallery of Canada Library].
- Ontario College of Art, Toronto. *Calendars from 1959 to 1970*.

Ontario College of Art, Toronto. Student Yearbooks from 1961/62 to 1966/67 and 1969/79.

Articles in Periodicals and Newspapers

- "Milly Ristvedt." *artscanada* 142/143 (April 1970), 68.
- Allodi, Mary. "Christiane Pflug." *artscanada* 174/175 (Dec 1972/Jan 1973), 42-47.
- Armatage, Kay. "The Feminine Body: Joyce Wieland's *WaterSark*." *Canadian Woman Studies* 8.1 (Spring 1987), 84-8.
- Banning, Kass. "Textual Excess in Joyce Wieland's *Handtinting*." *CineAction!* 5 (May 1986), 12-14.
- Banning, Kass. "The Mummification of Mommy: Joyce Wieland as the AGO's First Living Other." *C Magazine* 13 (March 1987), 32-38.
- Bayefsky, Aba. "Renewal at the Ontario College of Art." *artscanada* 122/123 (Oct/Nov 1968), 25-27.
- Bodolai, Joe (Moderator: Symposium). "Sculpture: a rebirth of humanism." *artscanada* 190/191 (Autumn 1974), 40-48.
- Boggs, Jean Sutherland. "In Canada, a place for women." *Artnews* 73.7 (Sept 1974), 30-32.
- Burnett, D. "Toronto: Christiane Pflug." *artscanada* 38 (March/April 1981), 55-6.
- Cutler, May Ebbitt. "Crisis in Canada's Art Schools." *Canadian Art* 99 (Dec 1965), 14-26.
- Dault, Gary Michael. "A Delicate and Stirring Show." *Toronto Star* July 18, 1975.
- Dault, Gary Michael. "Carole Conde at Pollock Gallery, Phase II." *artscanada* 130/131 (April 1969), 41.
- Dexter, Gail. "These three women want you to accept them as artists, not `women artists.'" *Toronto Daily Star* February 1, 1969, 53.
- Dobbs, Kildare. "Eros on Yonge Street: Impressions of the Dorothy Cameron Trial." *Saturday Night* 81 (Feb 1966), 18-21.
- Elliot, Valerie. "Intensity is the Essence." *Globe and Mail* June 8, 1968, Supplement p. 12.
- Enright, R. "Human Landscape: Christiane Pflug." *Arts West* 8 (May 1983), 29-2.
- Everett-Green, Robert. "Bold Strokes." *Saturday Night* (May 1987), 59-63.

- Evidence*. A Toronto periodical published between 1961 and 1967 as a forum for new literature and experimental art.
- Farber, Manny. "Films at Canadian Artists '68." *artscanada* 128/129 (February 1969), 28.
- Frenkel, Vera. "The New School of Art: insight-explosions." *artscanada* 122/123 (Oct/Nov 1968), 13-16.
- Fulford, Robert. "Sculpture 67" *artscanada* 111/112 (Aug/Sept 1967).
- Gouma-Peterson, Thalia and Patricia Mathews. "The Feminist Critique of Art History." *The Art Bulletin* LXIX.3 (September 1987), 326-357.
- Hale, Barrie. "Son of Toronto Painting 1953-65." *artscanada* (Feb/Mar, 1973), 56-64.
- Hudson, Andrew. "A Critic from Saskatchewan Looks at Toronto Painting." *Canadian Art* 88 (Nov/Dec 1963).
- Irigaray, Luce. "And the One Doesn't Stir without the Other." *Signs* vol. 7, no. 1, 1981.
- Kilbourn, Elizabeth. "The Toronto-Hamilton Scene." *Canadian Art* 69 (July 1960), 237-8.
- Kritzwiser, Kay. "Art on the Up and Up." *The Globe and Mail* May 11, 1968.
- Kritzwiser, Kay. "PADAC." *Art News* 73.7 (Sept 1974), 30-32.
- Kritzwiser, Kay. "Some fizzy moments enlivened the passing year." *The Globe and Mail* December 28, 1968.
- Lippard, Lucy. "Notes in review of Canadian Artists '68." *artscanada* 128/129 (February 1969), 25.
- Lord, Barry. "Artist Power or Reviews Don't Pay the Rent." *artscanada* 120/121 (August 1968), 41.
- Lord, Barry. "Canadian Artists '68." *artscanada* 128/129 (February 1969), 27.
- Lord, Barry. "Canadian Sculptors at Expo." *artscanada* 108 (May 1967), 14.
- Lord, Barry. "Milly Ristvedt: Carmen Lamanna Gallery, February 1969." *artscanada* 130/131 (April 1969), 40.
- Magidson, Debbie and Judy Wright. "Debbie Magidson and Judy Wright interview Joyce Wieland." *The Canadian Forum* (May/June 1974), 61-63.
- Magidson, Debbie. "Joyce Wieland's Vision." *The Canadian Forum* (September 1975), 70-71.
- Malcolmson, Harry. "Print-making in Ontario." *Canadian Art* 95 (Sept/Oct 1965), 13-14.

- Martin, Jane. "A study of some Male/Female Percentages in the Art world." *Atlantis* 5.1 (Fall 1979), 127-129.
- McCarty, Lianne M. "The Experimental Films of Joyce Wieland." *Cine-Tracts* 5.1 (Summer/ Fall 1982), 51-63.
- McPherson, Hugo. "The Toronto Scene." *Canadian Art* 95 (Jan/Feb 1965), 17-19.
- McPherson, Hugo. "Toronto's New Art Scene." *Canadian Art* 95 (Jan/Feb 1965), 8-10.
- McPherson, Hugo. "What Toronto Sees." *Canadian Art* 95 (Jan/Feb 1965), 13-16.
- Mungall, Constance. "Christianne [sic] Pflug." *Ontario Homes and Living* 8 (Sept. 1964), 16-17.
- Nasgaard, Roald. "Toronto." *artscanada* 184/185/186/187 (Dec 1973/Jan 1974), 193-197.
- Pflug, Christiane. Quoted in *Brick* (Winter 1987), 5.
- Porter, John. "Artists Discovering Film Post-War Toronto." *Vanguard* (Summer 1984), 24-26.
- Rabinovitz, Lauren. "Issues of Feminist Aesthetics: Judy Chicago and Joyce Wieland." *Women's Art Journal* (San Francisco: Fall/Winter 1981), 38-41.
- Rosenberg, Avis Lang. "Women Artists and the Canadian Art World: A Survey." *Atlantis* 5.1 (Fall 1979), 107-126.
- Ruddick, Sara. "Maternal Thinking." in *Feminist Studies* 6.2 (Summer 1980), 342-67.
- Sabbath, Lawrence. "Paraskeva Clark." *Canadian Art* 70 (Sept 1960), 291-3.
- Salsberg, Lanny. "Artists Succumb to U.S. Lure." *Toronto Daily Star* August 16, 1969.
- Silcox, David P. "Canadian Art in the Sixties." *artscanada* 105 (February 1967), 55-60.
- Smith, Dorothy E. "An Analysis of ideological structures and how women are excluded: considerations for academic women." *Canadian Review of Sociology & Anthropology* 12/(4) Part 1, 1975.
- Smookum, Kenneth. "Argument." *Macleans Magazine* 79 (April 2, 1966), 48.
- Tyrwitt, M. J. "Dorothy Cameron and the elegant sell." *Macleans Magazine* 75 (Sept 22, 1962), 71.

Unpublished Documents

Collection of Ann Davis, London, Ontario:

Pflug, Christiane. "An autobiographical statement." Typescript c. 1966.

Pflug, Christiane. "Questions and Answers." with Avrom Isaacs. Typescript c. 1966.

Pflug, Christiane. Correspondence 1954-1972. Typescript translated from German.

Pflug, Michael. Correspondence with Ann Davis and others.

Schuett, Christiane. "Childhood." Typescript, Wuppertal 1955.

Transcripts of interviews by Ann Davis with various relatives and friends of the Pflugs.

Stevenson, Barbara K. "The Political and Social Subject Matter in the Art of Joyce Wieland and Greg Curnoe." Unpublished M.A. thesis. Ottawa: Carleton University, 1987.

Personal Interviews

Conde, Carole and Karl Beveridge Toronto July 26, 1988

Davis, Ann London January 7, 1989 (Telephone)

Davis, Ann London November 17, 1988

Frenkel, Vera Toronto August 13, 1988 (Telephone)

Geltner, Gail Toronto November 19, 1988 (Telephone)

Goodridge, Edythe Ottawa August 5, 1988

Hutchinson, Gail Toronto July 28, 1988 (Telephone)

Isaacs, Avrom Toronto April 22, 1989 (Telephone)

McIntyre, Carole Toronto July 28, 1988

Pflug, Michael Toronto November 18, 1988

Pugen, Diane Toronto July 29, 1988

Wieland, Joyce Toronto November 19, 1988

END

0|2|03|9|2

FIN