1

PM-1 3 1/2 x 4 PHOTOGRAPHIC MICROCOPY TARGET
NBS 1010a ANSI/ISO #2 EQUIVALENT

PRECISION^{SM} RESOLUTION TARGETS

**Searching for "Miss Civil Service" and "Mr. Civil Service":
Gender Anxiety, Beauty Contests and Fruit Machines
in the Canadian Civil Service, 1950-1973**

by

Patrizia Gentile, B A

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of
Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts
School of Canadian Studies

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario
August 2, 1996
©copyright 1996

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395, Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

0-612-19429-9

0-612-19429-9

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-612-19429-9

Canada

Name MIRZIA GENTILE

Dissertation Abstracts International is arranged by broad, general subject categories. Please select the one subject which most nearly describes the content of your dissertation. Enter the corresponding four-digit code in the spaces provided

Canadian History

SUBJECT TERM

0334

U·M·I

SUBJECT CODE

Subject Categories

THE HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

COMMUNICATIONS AND THE ARTS

Architecture 0729
Art History 0377
Cinema 0900
Dance 0378
Fine Arts 0357
Information Science 0723
Journalism 0391
Library Science 0399
Mass Communications 0708
Music 0413
Speech Communication 0459
Theater 0465

EDUCATION

General 0515
Administration 0514
Adult and Continuing 0516
Agricultural 0517
Art 0273
Bilingual and Multicultural 0282
Business 0688
Community College 0275
Curriculum and Instruction 0727
Early Childhood 0518
Elementary 0524
Finance 0277
Guidance and Counseling 0519
Health 0680
Higher 0745
History of 0520
Home Economics 0278
Industrial 0521
Language and Literature 0279
Mathematics 0280
Music 0522
Philosophy of 0998
Physical 0523

Psychology 0525
Reading 0535
Religious 0527
Sciences 0714
Secondary 0533
Social Sciences 0534
Sociology of 0340
Special 0529
Teacher Training 0530
Technology 0710
Tests and Measurements 0288
Vocational 0747

LANGUAGE, LITERATURE AND LINGUISTICS

Language 0679
General 0289
Ancient 0290
Linguistics 0291
Modern
Literature 0401
General 0294
Classical 0295
Comparative 0297
Medieval 0298
Modern 0316
African 0591
American 0305
Asian 0352
Canadian (English) 0355
Canadian (French) 0593
English 0311
Germanic 0312
Latin American 0315
Middle Eastern 0313
Romance 0314
Slavic and East European

PHILOSOPHY, RELIGION AND THEOLOGY

Philosophy 0422
Religion 0318
General 0321
Biblical Studies 0319
Clergy 0320
History of 0322
Philosophy of 0469
Theology

SOCIAL SCIENCES

American Studies 0323
Anthropology 0324
Archaeology 0326
Cultural 0327
Physical
Business Administration 0310
General 0272
Accounting 0770
Banking 0454
Management 0338
Marketing 0385
Canadian Studies
Economics 0501
General 0503
Agricultural 0505
Commerce-Business 0508
Finance 0509
History 0510
Labor 0511
Theory 0358
Folklore 0366
Geography 0351
Gerontology
History 0578
General

Ancient 0579
Medieval 0581
Modern 0582
Black 0328
African 0331
Asia, Australia and Oceania 0332
Canadian 0334
European 0335
Latin American 0336
Middle Eastern 0337
United States 0337
History of Science 0585
Low 0398
Political Science 0615
General
International Law and Relations 0616
Public Administration 0617
Recreation 0814
Social Work 0452
Sociology 0626
General
Criminology and Penology 0627
Demography 0938
Ethnic and Racial Studies 0631
Individual and Family Studies 0628
Industrial and Labor Relations 0629
Public and Social Welfare 0630
Social Structure and Development 0700
Theory and Methods 0344
Transportation 0709
Urban and Regional Planning 0996
Women's Studies 0453

THE SCIENCES AND ENGINEERING

BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES

Agriculture 0473
General 0285
Agronomy
Animal Culture and Nutrition 0475
Animal Pathology 0476
Food Science and Technology 0359
Forestry and Wildlife 0478
Plant Culture 0479
Plant Pathology 0480
Plant Physiology 0817
Range Management 0777
Wood Technology 0746
Biology 0306
General 0287
Anatomy 0308
Biostatistics 0309
Botany 0379
Cell 0329
Ecology 0353
Entomology 0369
Genetics 0793
Limnology 0410
Microbiology 0307
Molecular 0317
Neuroscience 0416
Oceanography 0433
Physiology 0821
Radiation 0778
Veterinary Science 0472
Zoology
Biophysics 0786
General 0760
Medical

EARTH SCIENCES

Biogeochemistry 0425
Geochemistry 0996

Geodesy 0370
Geology 0372
Geophysics 0373
Hydrology 0388
Mineralogy 0411
Paleobotany 0345
Paleoecology 0426
Paleontology 0418
Paleozoology 0985
Palynology 0427
Physical Geography 0368
Physical Oceanography 0415

HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES

Environmental Sciences 0768
Health Sciences
General 0566
Audiology 0300
Chemotherapy 0992
Dentistry 0567
Education 0350
Hospital Management 0769
Human Development 0758
Immunology 0982
Medicine and Surgery 0564
Mental Health 0347
Nursing 0569
Nutrition 0570
Obstetrics and Gynecology 0380
Occupational Health and Therapy 0354
Ophthalmology 0381
Pathology 0571
Pharmacology 0419
Pharmacy 0572
Physical Therapy 0382
Public Health 0573
Radiology 0574
Recreation 0575

Speech Pathology 0460
Toxicology 0383
Home Economics 0386

PHYSICAL SCIENCES

Pure Sciences
Chemistry 0485
General 0749
Agricultural 0486
Analytical 0487
Biochemistry 0488
Inorganic 0738
Nuclear 0490
Organic 0491
Pharmaceutical 0494
Physical 0495
Polymer 0754
Radiation 0405
Mathematics
Physics 0605
General 0986
Acoustics
Astronomy and Astrophysics 0606
Atmospheric Science 0608
Atomic 0748
Electronics and Electricity 0607
Elementary Particles and High Energy 0798
Fluid and Plasma 0759
Molecular 0609
Nuclear 0610
Optics 0752
Radiation 0756
Solid State 0611
Statistics 0463
Applied Sciences
Applied Mechanics 0346
Computer Science 0984

Engineering 0547
General
Aerospace 0538
Agricultural 0539
Automotive 0540
Biomedical 0541
Chemical 0542
Civil 0543
Electronics and Electrical 0544
Heat and Thermodynamics 0545
Hydraulic 0546
Industrial 0547
Marine 0794
Materials Science 0548
Mechanical 0743
Metallurgy 0551
Mining 0552
Nuclear 0549
Packaging 0765
Petroleum 0554
Sanitary and Municipal System Science 0790
Geotechnology 0428
Operations Research 0796
Plastics Technology 0795
Textile Technology 0994

PSYCHOLOGY

General 0621
Behavioral 0384
Clinical 0622
Developmental 0620
Experimental 0623
Industrial 0624
Personality 0625
Physiological 0989
Psychobiology 0349
Psychometrics 0632
Social 0451

The undersigned recommend to the Faculty
of Graduate Studies and Research acceptance of the thesis

Searching for "Miss Civil Service" and "Mr. Civil Service":
Gender Anxiety, Beauty Contests and Fruit Machines
in the Canadian Civil Service, 1950-1973

submitted by Patrizia Gentile, B.A.
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of Master of Arts

.....
Thesis Supervisor

.....
Director
School of Canadian Studies

Carleton University

Ottawa, Ontario

August 1996

For the children in my life

***Amanda Carolina DeVito
Christopher Joseph DeVito
John Stuart Atkin Ryan
Jonathan Emilio Palmieri
Julia Pauline Lévesque
Philip Alexander Atkin Ryan***

***in the hopes that you will always
find the strength and courage to
resist; and that you will always
know how much I love you***

Abstract

Between 1950 and 1973 the Recreational Association (RA) organized the "Night of Stars" where "Miss Civil Service" was crowned. Meanwhile the Security Panel, a intergovernmental committee established to investigate possible espionage activities and maintain national security in Canada, established in conjunction with the RCMP, a surveillance net in the civil service aimed at detecting and interrogating homosexuals. This thesis argues that although the anti-homosexual security campaigns (1959-1969) and the civil service beauty contests were organized and "managed" by two distinct governmental institutions, placed in the context of the gender anxieties of the Cold War Ottawa period, these two seemingly unrelated events in the history of the federal civil service serve to illustrate how notions of proper gender and sexual codes were defined, defended and maintained.

The civil service beauty contests and the ideals of beauty, femininity and female (hetero)sexuality that it perpetuated, legitimized the segregation of female government workers in the lower levels of the job hierarchy. Yet, the "Miss Civil Service" title was hotly contested not only for the obvious reason of being perceived as the "ideal government girl" but also for the material advantages that it brought. The anti-gay/lesbian security regime and the detection "machine" that was created by prominent local psychologists, on the other hand, were attempts to purge from the civil service ranks government workers who did not conform to traditional gender and sexual codes on the premise that they posed a threat to national security. This thesis explores these two methods of constructing gender and sexuality in historical context.

Acknowledgements

A thesis is never a particularly joyful and easy undertaking. Luckily there were many people who helped me through the academic and personal growing pains that are associated with writing a project of this sort. I would like to thank my parents, Giuseppe and Giovanna, for their financial support and their patience. Although they don't quite understand why I insist on going to school for more than I have to, my sisters Josie, Rae and Nadia and my brother Charlie have given me the love and support that only siblings can give. Knowing that they are proud of me gives me the energy to continue.

A good historical topic is much like a great love affair: the best lovers are the ones that creep up on you when you least expect it. I stumbled on the topic for this thesis in very much the same way while doing research for Gary Kinsman. Gary Kinsman has been one of my greatest sources of inspiration. He has taught me to be critical of the mainstream and showed me the beauty of working from the margins. Thank you for your academic and personal support. I would also like to thank Heidi Ho for demystifying the National Archives--Heidi always showed them who was in control.

I have had the privilege to work with Deborah Gorham for the past two years both as my professor and my thesis supervisor. I can only hope that my passion for writing women's history will always be as deep and as boundless as her passion and love for writing women's history. Thank you, Debby, for providing me with a safe space to learn, for your kindness, your patience and your academic expertise.

I am grateful to my friends who have supported me at times when I thought that the strain of writing a thesis was too much for me to handle. I would like to thank Karen Dubinsky for her interest in my work and for her faith in me. Fraser Valentine has been one of those friends who has witnessed the good and bad in the past three years. I'm grateful that he was there: it made all the difference. Gaby Lévesque and Pauline Rankin have given me two essential ingredients to write a thesis: a kick in the you-know-what to get me started and lots of love. In the three years that I have lived in Ottawa they have been my family and have opened up their home and hearts to me. Thank you for your patience and for looking out for me--it saw me through some tough times. Dino Zuccherini has taught me that if you live your life questioning the authority of the dominant ideas of our time, you will never lose sight of your soul.

There have been times in this process when I have felt like I couldn't finish. Wendy Atkin was always there at those times to help me up and back to my computer. Wendy's love, complete faith in me and editorial assistance has made the thesis you now hold in your hands possible.

Table of Contents

Introduction	page 1
Chapter One	
Conceptualization and Contextualization	
The Civil Service Beauty Contest and the	
Anti-Homosexual Purge	page 13
Chapter Two	
"Mirror, Mirror on the Wall"	
Who's the fairest "Government Girl" of All?	page 44
Chapter Three	
"Mr. Civil Service" and the Cold War: Defining	
Masculinity and Sexuality in the Canadian	
Bureaucracy.	page 86
Conclusion	page 128
Illustrations	page 135
Appendix.	page 149
Bibliography.	page 156

Introduction

---

beauty contests are everywhere they take place around the world draw local international audiences span every conceivable group interest and topic and involve competitors ranging in age from infants to centenarians. Second, as universal and diverse as beauty contests are and as varied as their cultural and historical context tend to be what they do is remarkably similar¹

-C Ballerine-Cohen et al Beauty Queens on the Global Stage-

Pageants are held for different purposes. Pageants have been held as part of town festivals to promote products to celebrate ethnic pride or a special cause to recognize those who have lost a certain amount of weight or merely to create a television special that cashes in on the popularity of pageants.

Some pageants merely exist without ever gaining any significant publicity. Among these lesser-known pageants are the "Miss Man Made" pageant for transsexuals and Mr. Gay America.²

-B Peterson Burwell and Polly Peterson Bowles Becoming A Beauty Queen. The Complete Guide -

In the 1970s when J.E. Hodgetts wrote his books on the history of the Canadian public service he did not include a section on women in the civil service and certainly never even considered the impact that the Miss Civil Service beauty contests had on the lives of the thousands of stenographers and secretaries who

---

¹C. Ballerine-Cohen, R. Wilk, B. Stoeljc, eds. Beauty Queens on the Global Stage: Gender, Contests and Power (New York: Routledge, 1996), p. 1.

²These two quotations are taken from a beauty contest manual prepared and written by two sisters who participated in the Miss America title. It is a remarkable work in that it offers step-by-step advice on how to apply make-up, who to date while in competition, how to sit, stand and smile, how to pack for the competition and so on. I would like to thank Mary Louise Adams for lending the book to me. For more see B. Peterson Burwell and Polly Peterson Bowles, Becoming a Beauty Queen. The Complete Guide (New York: Prentice Hall Press, 1987).

worked as support staff.³ Indeed, his book on the Canadian public service is concerned with the physiology of the public service and as such is a historical survey of the design and structure of the government. J.R. Mallory, a political scientist, also wrote an important book on the topic of the structure of the government.⁴ A theme of his book was to explore 'who controls the controllers' or how do the senior public servants influence the legislators.⁵ Mallory mentions the Security Panel but not the post-war anti-homosexual security purge and its impact on the lives of gay and lesbian civil servants. Like Hodgetts, Mallory was concerned with the physical structure of the government and how it worked politically. A social history of the public service has yet to be written.

Between 1950 and 1973, women working for the Canadian federal bureaucracy in Ottawa competed in beauty pageants for the crown and title of "Miss Civil Service" (1950-1960) or "Miss RA Queen" (1960-1973) [see illustration 1]. The Recreational Association (RA) organized an annual event known as the "Night of Stars" where "the ideal government girl" was crowned the civil service beauty.

---

³Hodgetts has written many books and articles on the history of the public service but his two major works on the history of the civil service are The Canadian Public Service: A Physiology of Government, 1867-1970 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973) and J.E. Hodgetts et al. The Biography of an Institution: The Civil Service Commission of Canada, 1908-1967 (Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1972).

⁴J.R. Mallory, The Structure of Canadian Government (Toronto: Macmillan of Canada, 1971). For more on the structure of the government and especially the public service (ch. 12) from a political science approach see N. Ward, Dawson's The Government of Canada, 6th ed. (Toronto: University of Toronto, 1990).

⁵J. Mallory, p. 1.

queen. According to the RA NEWS, the RA's monthly newspaper, the beauty contest was almost always a well-attended social event. Meanwhile, the Security Panel, a group of powerful and influential deputy ministers and high-ranking civil servants, were sending directives to a special force of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) to investigate and interrogate any homosexuals working in the civil service or living in the greater Ottawa area. Documents acquired through the Access to Information Act show that the security campaign against gay and lesbian public servants intensified by 1959 and continued well into the 1970s.¹ For the purposes of this thesis, the time frame I am concerned with in relation to the anti-homosexual security purge is 1959 to 1969. It was in the course of this decade that the RCMP collected and amassed nine thousand names and files of so-called 'suspected, alleged and confirmed' homosexuals.

The Security Panel and the Department of National Health and Welfare commissioned a machine to detect homosexuals in 1962. The 'fruit machine', a term given to the detection mechanism developed by the late Carleton University psychology professor Dr. F. R. Wake, was to be used as part of the surveillance system established to ferret out gay people working in the government. Although

---

¹ I have been fortunate to be working for Dr. Gary Kinsman on the anti-homosexual security campaigns. My participation in this research venture has given me access to the documents I mention in the text. Dr. Kinsman's project is funded by the Social Sciences and Humanities Research Council.

² Annual Reports, Directorate of Security and Intelligence, 1967-68.

it was never officially used except on known homosexuals for testing. It played an important part in the construction of gay people as potential threats to national security based on their so-called deviant personality traits. These traits made them unreliable for service in the federal government as well as the military and the RCMP. What is of particular importance here is that Wake and his band of associates constructed these 'character weaknesses' which gays and lesbian supposedly possessed in gendered language. In other words, the stereotypes that were at the core of the 'character weakness' conceptualization can play a crucial role in illuminating what was considered proper and acceptable gender and sexual behaviour during this time period.

A central theme of this thesis will be to examine how both the civil service beauty contests and the anti-gay security campaigns functioned to reinforce a culturally and socially constructed sex/gender system. I am particularly interested in exploring the codes of femininity, masculinity and sexuality that are part of this sex/gender system and how these codes organized the occupational and social realities of heterosexuals, gays and lesbians in the civil service during this period. While the federal service beauty contests facilitated the systemic sex discrimination and objectification that was institutionalized in the bureaucratic hierarchical structure, the 'secret' anti-homosexual security campaign functioned as a gender subtext that sent a message defining acceptable gender and sexual behaviour within the marginalized sections of the government employee work culture.

Although the anti-homosexual security campaigns (Dr. Wake's "fruit machine" and the civil service beauty contest) were not organized by the same people or the same organization and ostensibly were established in isolation from each other, I will argue in this thesis that the fact that they happened at the same time is not coincidental. One of the major threads of this thesis is that both the security campaigns against homosexuals and the beauty contests were effective examples of how the internal government organizations dealt with a rising atmosphere of gender anxiety that resulted from the Cold War era and the re-integration of traditional gender values in the 1950s and 1960s. The anti-gay/anti-lesbian security regime of the 1960s and the civil service beauty contests were also major organizational apparatuses that took place within the context of the modernization of the Canadian bureaucracy.

Locating secondary sources to write a history of beauty contests in the Canadian federal service or the anti-homosexual security regime has been a difficult task. Research on security campaigns in this country has concentrated mostly on anti-communist campaigns at both the civilian and state levels.¹ Material

---

¹A good starting point for this area of the security campaigns is R. Whitaker, "Origins of the Canadian Government's Internal Security System, 1946-1952," Canadian Historical Review LXV, 2 (1984), p.154-183 and his new book, Cold War Canada: The Making of a National Insecurity State, 1945-1957 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994). There is a plethora of information and research done on this topic by both R. Whitaker and G. Kealey especially in connection with labour and immigration history. See for example, G. Kealey, "State Repression of Labour and the Left in Canada, 1914-20: The Impact of the First World War," Canadian Historical Review LXXIII (3) 1992:281-314 and G. Kealey and R. Whitaker, eds. The R.C.M.P. Security Bulletins: The War Series, Part II, 1942-45 (St. Johns: Canadian Committee on Labour History, 1993).

on major anti-gay/anti-lesbian campaigns in Canada has not garnered the same level of attention as the anti-communist campaigns have. However, intensive investigation of the security campaign against gays and lesbians in the 1950s and 1960s has been undertaken by Gary Kinsman.⁹ From this new interest and research two articles on the anti-gay campaign have been published by David Kimmel and Daniel Robinson, "The Queer Career of Homosexual Security Vetting in Cold War Canada" (1994) and by Gary Kinsman, "'Character Weaknesses' and 'Fruit Machines': Towards an Analysis of the Anti-Homosexual Security Campaign in the Canadian Civil Service" (1995).

The research on the anti-homosexual security campaigns is complex and fascinating but for the purposes of my thesis, I have placed the security campaigns against homosexuals within the larger context of the civil service beauty contests as a gendered subtext and as an example of gender anxiety. I demonstrate in Chapter Three especially that the anti-gay/anti-lesbian purges were a central part of the Cold War hysteria in North America. In the post-war years, dominant groups sought to alleviate that anxiety in part by a revived emphasis on the imposition of traditional gender roles. Both the civil service beauty contests and the anti-

---

⁹G. Kinsman's most recent book, The Regulation of Desire: Homo and Hetero Sexualities (Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1996) is essential reading because of its comprehensive approach to the history of sexuality. Chapters six and seven are especially useful for their treatment of the construction of heterosexuality in Canada and the construction of the homosexual as 'danger' within the specific context of the security campaigns. Other works include J. Sawatsky, Men In the Shadows. (Toronto, Doubleday Canada, 1980), 111-40 and his For Services Rendered. (Toronto: Doubleday Canada, 1982); P. Girard, "From Subversion to Liberation: Homosexuals and the Immigration Act, 1952-1977", Canadian Journal of Law and Society, 2 (1987), 1-27.

homosexual security campaigns functioned as 'behind the scenes' mechanisms for ensuring that conventional codes of masculinity, femininity and heterosexuality remained intact.

Literature (and indeed, archival material) on the history of beauty contests in Canada is scarce. Except for a chapter on Miss Teen Canada in Betty Steele's The Feminist Take Over (1987) and a brief reference to Miss Nova Scotia in Suzanne Morton's recent book Ideal Surroundings: Domestic Life in a Working-Class Suburb in the 1920s (1995), a historical analysis of Canadian beauty contests does not exist.¹⁰ My thesis, then, is the first of its kind in that it offers a historical exploration of the civil service beauty contests in the Canadian federal government during the 1950s and 1960s. The limited time and scope of writing a thesis, however, meant that many angles of this 'story' are still missing. In Chapter Two, I integrate some interviews that I have conducted with women who participated in the beauty contests and some of the women who helped organize the pageants. This thesis, however, is not an extensive oral history of the

---

¹⁰B. Steele's chapter on Miss Teen Canada is not a history in the traditional sense but does offer an analysis of the impact or lack thereof of feminism on young women using the popularity of the Miss Teen Canada pageant as an example of the women's movement 'failure' to convince young women of the advantages of feminism. See especially pages 143 to 164 in her book, The Feminist Takeover. (Richmond, Ont: Tercet, 1980). Suzanne Morton, on the other hand, offers a brief historical glance at the Miss Nova Scotia pageant and particularly in reference to the Labour Day celebrations in Nova Scotia and the labour party more generally. She attributes the Miss Nova Scotia Beauty Contest, the autoshow and the baseball game as part of mass culture that working-class men had as a source of social bonding on the one hand and yet remained as another source of struggle. See pages 123 and 130 in her book, Ideal Surroundings. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995).

experiences of the women who participated as contestants in the beauty contests. It is a historical analysis of the discourse around the construction of beauty, femininity, masculinity and sexuality and how the civil service beauty contests and the anti-homosexual security purge organized the gender and sexual behaviour of government employees.

Given the scant literature on the history of beauty contests in Canada, this thesis makes an important contribution to what I hope will be the beginning of a new field and topic for historical analysis. The most recent contribution to secondary sources on beauty contests is a collection of articles entitled Beauty Queens on the Global Stage: Gender, Contests and Power (1996).¹¹ According to the editors, a comprehensive history of beauty contests and the history of the international spread of pageantry remains to be conceptualized and written. Once beauty contests begin to be characterized as a legitimate field of historical analysis within a feminist framework, we can begin to unravel the connections between beauty, sexuality and gender and its impact on the political arena.

This thesis crosses the boundaries of various areas of historical inquiry. It inquires into issues that speak to the fields of women's history, labour history, ethnic history, local history, gay and lesbian history and history of national security.

---

¹¹C. Ballerine-Cohen, R. Wilk and B. Stoeljc, eds. Beauty Queens on the Global Stage: Gender, Contests and Power. (New York: Routledge, 1996). This book is a compilation of eleven articles that deal with beauty contests in the United States, the Third World and transsexuals. The editors describe beauty contests as institutions that "put gender norm-conventionally, idealized versions of femininity-on stage in a competition awarding the winner a "royal" title and crown" (see p.2).

Canadian women's historians such as Ruth Roach Pierson, Veronica Strong-Boag and Annalee Götz have tackled the history of 1950s and 1960s in articles on the restoring of traditional gender and sexuality roles within the context of the family ¹² This thesis is informed by this work and by the feminist interpretation of American historians Judith Gerson and Kathy Peiss of the reconceptualization and renegotiation of gender boundaries. The new questions that are being asked by gay and lesbian historians and historians of sexuality have also played a critical role in this thesis. This body of interpretive literature has provided the basis of the approach I use as the framework for this thesis.

Chapter One begins with a brief overview of the history of women in the civil service from the late nineteenth century to the early 1970s. It also offers an examination of the Recreational Association (RA) and its role as organizer of the Miss Civil Service contests and its role as the leisure organization for the government community. Chapter One also includes an in-depth exploration of the anti-homosexual detection machines and how the cultural stereotypes on which it was based cemented the construction of gays and lesbians as possessing "character weaknesses" and thus a 'danger' to the nation's security. The last section of this chapter offers the conceptual framework on which I will draw to help

---

¹²See in particular, A. Götz, "Family Matters: The Canadian Family and the State in the Postwar Period," *left history*, 1(2), Fall 1993:9-49; R. Roach Pierson, "Home Aide: A Solution to Women's Unemployment after World War II," *Atlantis*, 2 (2), spring 1977:85-97; and V. Strong-Boag, "Home Dreams: Women and the Suburban Experiment in Canada, 1945-1960," *Canadian Historical Review*, 72(4), Dec. 1991:471-504.

explain how the beauty contests and the anti-homosexual security campaigns organized the lives of heterosexual women, gays and lesbians.

Chapter Two begins with a brief historical overview of beauty contests in North America. I then offer a historical analysis of the civil service beauty contests and how they enforced ideals of femininity, beauty and female sexuality in the government community during this period. One of the major issues I will address in Chapter Two is how the beauty contest legitimized the occupational sex segregation of the civil service throughout the 1950s and 1960s. I argue that the civil service beauty contest constructed women as sexual and beauty objects and that this construction served to reinforce society's preoccupation during this period over proper feminine and masculine roles. Although they were not explicitly designed to do so, beauty contests justified the gender segregation of women at the lowest levels of the occupational hierarchy in the government community.

Part of uncovering the history of civil service beauty contests involves understanding the ways in which issues of class and race/ethnicity affected those women working as secretaries, stenographers and clerks in the civil service and who participated in the beauty pageants. Participating in the civil service beauty contests meant an opportunity to stand in the lime-light and gain celebrity status for a brief moment--an opportunity that many of these young women would not have had in any other context except for those who would eventually get married and have a ceremonial wedding. It also was an opportunity for government employees

to enact entrenched gender and sexual codes that were not acceptable or tolerated in the office setting but encouraged at the "Night of Stars", the event where Miss Civil Service was crowned. Issues around race and ethnicity are also addressed particularly in relation to the construction of beauty and sexuality

Chapter Three is principally concerned with examining the construction and regulation of sexuality through the civil service beauty contests and the anti-homosexual security campaigns within the government community. One of the important connections between these seemingly incongruent historical events is that both functioned as a form of institutionalized compulsory heterosexuality. Although different messages were being conveyed by the beauty contests and the security purges against gays and lesbians, there was a concentrated effort to market (via the beauty contest) the institution of marriage and heterosexuality as an end in itself for both men and especially women. Another major thread in this chapter is the construction of masculinity and heterosexual male sexuality especially in reference to the way it helped to define gender and sexual roles in Cold War Ottawa. Non-conformity to active participation in these institutions was unacceptable. In this chapter I am particularly interested in showing that gender and sexuality are inextricably connected. For this reason, a historical exploration of both the beauty contests and the ways in which they organized gender codes and female sexuality and the security purges as an institutionalized form of maintaining and enforcing compulsory heterosexuality and ideals of masculine

behaviour help illuminate the climate in which people worked in Cold War Ottawa

Chapter One

Conceptualization and Contextualization: The Civil Service Beauty Contest and the Anti-Homosexual Purge

The civil service beauty contests and the anti-homosexual security purge are two seemingly unrelated events in the history of the federal civil service in Canada. These episodes in the historical construction of gender and sexuality took place in the Cold War era. Most North Americans who lived in the 1950s experienced intense fear of imminent communist invasion. The American and Canadian governments undertook institutionalized attacks on the left-wing or non-white immigrants and on other 'undesirables'. Police forces were marshalled to enforce the so-called 'security state'. At the same time, traditional gender and family values assumed a great deal of importance.

This chapter will explore the gender and sexual subtexts of the security state by examining the beauty contest and the anti-homosexual purge from various angles. First, I offer a brief history of women in the civil service from the late nineteenth century to the early 1970s. The aim of this section is to contextualize the working history of the hundreds of women who worked as stenographers, typists and clerks and demonstrate the origins of the system of occupational sex segregation which characterized the federal civil service. The second section deals with the Recreational Association (RA) and its role as the creator of the civil service

contests. I am mainly interested here in establishing the function the RA played in the lives of the single women and men who worked for the federal government. The third section is an introduction to the 'fruit machine' and the ways in which it used gendered stereotypes to represent gays and lesbians as 'deviant' possessing 'character weaknesses' and thus being a 'danger' to the nation. Finally, I explore the theoretical formulations that establish a more nuanced understanding of how the system of gender and sexual relations could be conceptualized as a relationship between what Judith Gerson and Kathy Peiss call "boundaries and negotiations" ¹. In addition, this section will examine the underpinnings of the beauty system and femininity.

I. WOMEN IN THE CIVIL SERVICE: A BRIEF HISTORY

The first female public servants were appointed matron and deputy matron at the Kingston Penitentiary in 1870. In 1871, a woman was appointed "lock-labourer" on the Williamsburg Canal. Of the 4,280 civil servants employed by the government in 1885 only 23 were women ². By the turn of the century, women slowly permeated the lower ranks of the civil service in spite of the fact that the Civil Service Commission placed limitations on the hiring and promotion of women. Kathleen Archibald suggested in her 1970 report to the Canadian government that

---

¹See J. Gerson and K. Peiss, "Boundaries, Negotiation, Consciousness: Reconceptualizing Gender Relations", Social Problems, 32(4), April 1985: 317-331.

²Kathleen Archibald, Sex and the Public Service, (Ottawa: The Queen's Printer, 1970), p.14.

the reason for this was that "women were not considered suitable for, or capable of, work at more responsible levels"³ Furthermore, Archibald maintained that the Civil Service Commission was not concerned with keeping women in the lower ranked jobs, for this was taken for granted, but was instead interested in "keeping down the number of women in the civil service"⁴

The Royal Commission on the Civil Service in 1908 and the Civil Service Act of 1918 officially restricted women to the lowest level of the service. From the beginning, the Civil Service Commission maintained a system of occupational sex segregation which determined the nature of women's work in the civil service for many decades. Married women were denied access to the civil service except during the two World Wars. Restrictions were reinstated once the men returned from war. It was only in 1955 that these restrictions on married women were revoked but until then a woman civil servant who married was obliged to resign.⁵ Significantly, once restrictions on married women were revoked the numbers of women working for the government increased from 40% in 1954 to 45.5% in 1955 and to 47% in 1956.⁶ The increase in numbers may have been a direct result of more married women applying for jobs, although we have no way of knowing this

---

³Ibid., p 14

⁴Ibid., p.14

⁵Office of Equal Opportunities for Women The Employment of Women in the Public Service of Canada. Mandate for Change 1st ed (Ottawa: The Queen's Printer, 1973) p 1

⁶K. Archibald, p 17

with certainty because numbers published at the time did not mention marital status. Alternatively, women may have perceived government jobs as more attractive simply because now there was more job security in the event of marriage.

By the 1950s more than 80% of women employed by the civil service were concentrated in administrative support staff positions working as secretaries, typists, clerks and stenographers. In 1961 the renewed Civil Service Act did not forbid discrimination on the basis of sex. It was only with the 1962 report of the Royal Commission on Government Organization and Management of the Public Service (Glassco Report) that there was some recognition of women's status in the service. The Glassco Report mentioned that, although there were no explicit policies for occupational segregation by sex, discrimination against women was rampant. It was with the Public Service Employment Act of 1967 that sex was added to race, national origin, colour and religion as a basis on which it was forbidden to discriminate.⁷ This significant victory for women was a result of the realization that Canada was "trailing behind" both the United States and the United Kingdom as well as a result of the ratification of the 1956 Discrimination (Employment and Occupational) Convention of the International Labour Organization which committed Canada to eliminate discriminatory hiring practices.

---

⁷ *Ibid.* p 18

on the basis of sex ⁸

The Archibald Report and the 1973 report issued by the Office of Equal Opportunity for Women did not mention the beauty contests as an example of enforcing sex stereotyping. Indeed, it is only recently that our analysis of gender discrimination has moved beyond structural issues such as equal pay for equal work or paid maternity leave. Yet both the Archibald Report and the 1973 report issued by the Office of Equal Opportunity for Women were bureaucratic responses to the women's issues reported on by the Royal Commission on the Status of Women ⁹. Unfortunately, there is no data indicating a change in attitudes that would suggest whether or not these important dates and policies made a substantial difference in the *daily lives* of women working in the government bureaucracy. As part of what Adamson, Briskin and McPhail call "institutionalized feminism", the Archibald Report and reports compiled by the Office for Equal Opportunity for Women "made the government the target of its campaign to end women's inequality" ¹⁰. By changing the legal, political and economic structures that

---

⁸Ibid., p.18. Not only did the Glassco Commission suggest that the Canadian government was trailing behind other major Western countries in the employment of women to senior levels it also suggested that the government provide a "creative leadership" for the rest of the country in this matter.

⁹See especially chapters one and two of the Report of the Royal Commission on the Status of Women, (Ottawa:Information Canada, 1970). The Report also has a section on women working in the federal civil service (see pages 105 to 140).

¹⁰N. Adamson, L. Briskin and M. McPhail Feminist Organizing for Change: The Contemporary Women's Movement in Canada, (Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1988), p. 51. For more on the history of the second wave women's movement in Canada see chapter two. For a more in-depth study on the underlying causes of women's occupational segregation in Canada see

formed the obstacles that oppressed women the institutional feminist movement helped pave the way for changing attitudes towards women

It was at the recommendation of the Archibald Report that the Office of Equal Opportunity for Women was established in 1971 its primary function being similar to the "watchdog role" played by the now defunct Advisory Council on the Status of Women. In 1974, the Office of Equal Opportunity for Women held a conference in Ottawa on "The Role of Women in the Public Service". The main objective of the conference was

to heighten and expand awareness of the Federal Government's efforts to improve opportunities for women in the Public Service of Canada to obtain wider involvement in these programs by sharing information as to their scope and possibilities on an intensive basis, and to obtain a broader understanding of the problems women encounter in advancing in the services ¹¹

Conferences of this nature and the information and forum for debate that they provided did result in some structural changes (as opposed to attitudinal changes toward women and gender roles). Some examples of attempts to make structural change include a Cabinet directive in 1973 to all deputy ministers to increase the number of women in middle and senior management positions, elimination of rules

---

P. Armstrong and H. Armstrong, The Double Ghetto, Canadian Women and Their Segregated Work, 2nd ed (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1978).

¹¹Office of Equal Opportunity for Women, Summary of the Ottawa Conference on "The Role of Women in the Public Service", Jan 24-45, 1974:p.4. This 'surge' in the producing documentation that would hold the government accountable for its dismal record of dealing with issues of sexism in civil service was generated by the Report on the Royal Commission on the Status of Women which appeared in 1970.

which treat women differently from men (such as moving expenses) and establishment of liaison and equal opportunities programs in most government departments ¹² Unfortunately these attempts to make structural change were not very successful. Approximately ten years after these recommendations were made of the 55 000 women in the federal service 80% continued to hold positions in the low levels of the administrative support categories ¹³

In an article she wrote for Canadian Public Administration in 1973 Archibald maintained that discrimination against women was due to institutional factors that shaped the system and that "[t]he problem is that the public service was designed as a system of manpower utilization and it has adjusted only in a very creaky fashion to being a system of woman power utilization" ¹⁴ In the post-WWII period the women were hired as "stenographers" and "typewriters" while the men became "general clerks" who, not incidentally, climbed the administrative ladder while "typewriters" could not ¹⁵ The discrimination against women embedded in the hiring practices as well as the institutional attitudes that prevailed in the period I am concerned with here ensured a system of occupational sex segregation with women at the bottom of the federal service hierarchy

---

¹² J. Smith "Equal Opportunity in the public service" Canadian Labour 20 (June 75) p 15

¹³ "Women must change attitudes to get equal breaks" University Affairs 16 (April 1982) p 12

¹⁴ K. Archibald "Men, women, and persons", Canadian Public Administration 16 (Spring 73) p 15

¹⁵ Ibid. p 16

Like the rest of the work world, the public service had a system of social and occupational norms governing personal interactions established for men by men. The 'intrusion' into this male-dominated space by women forced new social and sexual boundaries. In light of these institutional forces against female employees in the civil service, the beauty contests served to reinforce those boundaries. As we will see in Chapter Two, beauty contests were (and are) ways in which a sex\gender system legitimizes and perpetuates the primary role of women as "feminine" and sex objects.

In the next section, I will examine the role of the Recreational Association in establishing a leisure space for the stenographers, typists and clerks mentioned above. Most women who worked for the Ottawa civil service in this period were in their early twenties to late thirties.¹⁶ Young and away from family and home (which in some cases meant rural Saskatchewan or rural New Brunswick) these women wanted to have fun after work was over. The Recreational Association, an organization designed for the express purpose of offering recreational activities to civil servants came to the rescue. Although I will make more detailed references to the RA in Chapter Two, in the next section I will show how the Recreational Association can be perceived as the unofficial arm of the Civil Service Commission.

---

¹⁶ See table showing the figures for 1967 titled "Turnover Rates of Full-Time Employees in the Federal Public Service by Sex and Age, 1967" in The Report on the Royal Commission on the Status of Women. (Ottawa: Information Canada, 1970), p.116.

II. The Recreation Association: The Creator of the RA Queen

The civil service beauty contests were organized by the Recreational Association. The RA, established in 1941, for many years catered solely to federal employees and offered a wide variety of recreational services, including sports, arts and crafts, language courses, cultural and educational courses, chess and bridge clubs, excursions and entertainments.¹⁷ The RA also published news bulletins that appeared weekly on notice boards in departments as well as a monthly called the RA NEWS. The RA NEWS was a community newspaper that kept its members abreast of what was happening in the federal government community. In 1959, its estimated circulation was 16, 000 copies and it could be found at various venues around Ottawa.¹⁸ The RA NEWS, however, was also inadvertently an avenue through which proper feminine and masculine behaviour was enforced. It was through this medium that beauty contest dates, deadlines, the rules and regulations, names of judges, and the winners were announced. Gender stereotypes pervaded the sport pages, the advice columns, the women's page ("Feminine Fancies"), the cartoons, and the many jokes, poems, songs and limericks that were published.[see illustrations 2 and 3]

The impact of the RA on the social life of civil servants is difficult to discern. According to an article appearing in the RA NEWS, the idea of the RA came about

---

¹⁷Arthur Sykes, "The RA Story", RA NEWS, October, 1959:pp.5-8.

¹⁸ibid., p.4.

in the early years of the Second World War.¹⁹ During this period, a large number of civil servants, mostly women, worked in Ottawa on what was believed to be a temporary basis. They replaced men who left for combat and women's work was expected to cease on marriage. Most of these women moved to Ottawa from across Canada and had very little opportunity to socialize outside of work hours. The majority of entertainment establishments such as bars and restaurants were considered inappropriate spots for single women living alone and unescorted. Except for the YWCA and volunteering for church activities many federal employees had nowhere to go for fun.

The Government was much too busy with the War efforts to do more than build a hostel for single girls, and even the latter, not being cloistered nuns, might be expected to want some outside evening recreation. The "Y" was preoccupied with its Red Triangle work for the uniformed services, the churches had few facilities and those cramped, and the municipalities could not be expected to spend their taxpayers' money to alleviate what was then thought to be only a temporary situation.²⁰

It was the expansion of the then small Athletic Association which grew into the RA today that enabled these "single girls" who were not "cloistered nuns" to socialize.²¹

Although the RA did not promote itself as a place where one could meet potential dates or spouses, it quickly became a legitimate space to meet people for that express purpose.

---

¹⁹ibid., p.7.

²⁰ibid., p.7.

²¹ibid., p.7. The Recreational Association still exists today.

We have never operated a "Lonely Hearts" club, but we have noted quite a number of marriages of RA members in the yacht club and the operatic society, and we had two honeymoon couples on our European Tour last Spring.²²

Indeed, single heterosexual civil servants could expect that the RA Centre's numerous dances held opportunities and a legitimate space for potential romantic ventures.

The RA played an important function in Ottawa from its inception to the present. It provided many and varied activities, clubs and entertainment for its membership. It also provided a social space where young and single civil servants could congregate and meet each other. But the RA also established courses for women on how to wear make-up, how to improve posture and how to maintain a diet. All of this 'advice' was part of establishing a proper public image for women working in the public service. After all, the logic went, these women indirectly 'represented' the federal government. Yet, ultimately the main focus of female civil servants was supposedly to find a husband and what better place to match these single women with men than Ottawa which was swarming with bachelors?

Neither 'bachelors' nor single women were exclusively heterosexual. Gay men and lesbians worked for the federal government. There is no documented history of how gay and lesbian civil servants carved out their social space in the government community in this period. There are no statistics that I can analyze or

---

²²ibid., p.7

cite related to their existence because sexuality was classified under one dominant framework: heterosexual. Recent research on the anti-homosexual purge in the Canadian civil service points to the existence of gays and lesbians in the civil service.²³ The question remains as to how these men and women resisted and conformed to the prescribed gender and sexual codes that permeated the government community. The following section investigates how gender stereotypes around proper feminine and masculine behaviour were used by Dr. F.R. Wake and his homosexual detection machine. An important theme that will be discussed briefly here and examined in more detail in Chapter Three, is the manner in which these gender stereotypes were used to construct gays and lesbians as 'dangerous' to national security.

III. *The Anti-Homosexual security campaign in the Canadian Civil Service, 1959-1969: Heterosexual Hegemony²⁴ and the 'Fruit Machine'*

During the Cold War era in Canada, hundreds of gay men and lesbians were

---

²³ See G. Kinsman, "Character Weaknesses' and 'Fruit Machines': Towards an Analysis of The Anti-Homosexual Security Campaign in the Canadian Civil Service", *Labour/Le Travail*, 35 (Spring 1995): 133-161; Chapter Seven in *Regulation of Desire: Homo and Hetero Sexualities*, 2nd edition. (Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1996); D.J. Robinson and D. Kimmel, "The Queer Career of Homosexual Vetting in Cold War Canada", *Canadian Historical Review*, v. LXXV(3), September 1994:319-345; and p.184-5 in R. Whitaker, *Cold War Canada: The Making of a National Insecurity State, 1945-1957*. (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994)

²⁴ The term "heterosexual hegemony" is used by both Jonathan Ned Katz in his article, "The Invention of Heterosexuality" *Socialist Review*, 20(1), Jan-Mar. 1990:7-34 (see esp. pp. 20-3) and Gary Kinsman in his book, *Regulation of Desire: Sexuality in Canada*, 1st edition. (Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1989), pp.105-107. The term is used to describe the "predominance of the hetero norm" in the 1950s and the beginning of the modern welfare state. The term "fruit machine" was coined by the RCMP officers in reference to Dr. F.R. Wake's "Special Project". The "Special Project" was a battery of tests and devices designed to "detect" homosexuals.

subjected to state surveillance conducted by the Royal Canadian Mounted Police (RCMP) as sanctioned and under the directives of the Security Panel. The Security Panel was created in 1946 on the recommendation of the Royal Commission to Investigate the Facts Relating to and the Circumstances Surrounding the Communication, by Public Officials and Other Persons in Positions of Trust, of Secret and Confidential Information to Agents of a Foreign Power (1946) to be housed under the Privy Council Office (PCO), chaired by the PCO representative, with permanent representation from the Department of National Defence, the RCMP, and External Affairs.²⁵ The Panel's role was "to advise on the co-ordination of the planning, organization and execution of security measures which affect government departments, and to advise on other such security measures as may be referred to it".²⁶ The Security Panel was a response to the spy scandal discovered with the defection of Soviet cipher clerk Igor Gouzenko. In light of the evidence that public servants were betraying the Canadian government and thus compromising internal (national) security, the Royal Commission was determined to re-establish control of the Canadian bureaucracy and the Security Panel was part of that plan.

The climate of the Cold War was thus ripe for an anti-communist purge. The

---

²⁵R. Whitaker, "Origins of the Canadian Government's Internal Security System, 1946-1952, Canadian Historical Review, LXV (2), 1984:p.157.

²⁶Ibid., p.157-8.

rise of the security state has been extensively documented by historians such as Jack Granatstein, Reginald Whitaker and Gregory Kealey. Whitaker contends that in the Cold War period, the notion of 'disloyalty' was identified with ideological beliefs that differed from those of liberal democracies in capitalist countries. Communism was then seen as a threat that had to be stopped by purging and suppressing the civil liberties of Canadians who challenged the dominant discourse or belief system. It was a time when 'social cohesion' for the people who held power meant that 'difference' in any form or shape was intolerable. The "Other" was seen as not only a threat to that social cohesion but also a danger to 'national security'. As Whitaker put it: "one of the characteristics of the security programs set in motion in this period [1946-52] is a conflation of espionage (passing secrets to a foreign power) and subversion (an internal threat to order)".²⁷

In the case of the anti-homosexual regime, the Security Panel was concerned with detecting homosexuals before they were even given jobs in the civil service, demonstrating that it was more important to keep what was perceived as a 'subversive' element out before any opportunity for espionage existed.²⁸ Homosexuals transgressed the 'ideals' and 'values' at the core of the 1950s and

---

²⁷ *Ibid.*, p.155.

²⁸ I will discuss this issue in more detail in Chapter Three where I will establish the systemic discrimination of gays and lesbians by the federal public bureaucracy in this period because of its fear over the threat that such people posed due to their supposedly easily exploitable "character weaknesses".

1960s, where the family and traditional gender roles were perceived as the adhesive that kept the dominant culture together. The ideology behind the security state was not just about the supposed 'protection' of Canadian borders, it involved the active practice of constructing and sustaining an image of the Canadian state as a rational (read 'masculine'), effective (read 'heterosexual') system.

The security regime against gays and lesbians²⁹ in Ottawa involved a vast surveillance system involving the RCMP and the Ottawa Police which included interrogations, park sweeps, taking pictures of gay men in bars as well as following, opening mail and listening to phone conversations of 'suspected' homosexuals. By 1969, the RCMP had collected nine thousand names of "suspected, alleged and confirmed" homosexuals within the greater Ottawa area.³⁰ In 1963, the RCMP used a map of Ottawa with red dots to designate homosexual activity in order to keep abreast of their findings. The map was covered with so many red dots that it was practically useless. In light of this, the detection tests were seen as more 'reliable' and thus well received by the Security Panel. A 1962 report by psychology

---

²⁹In the documents accessed for the research on the anti-homosexual security purge the language predominantly associates the word "homosexual" with gay men. This is chiefly due to the fact that in this period men still held the jobs in the civil service where "secret" and "top secret" security clearance were necessary. However, lesbians were considered as much a 'threat' to national security especially in terms of their non-conformity to prescribed gender behaviour. For example, lesbians in the military were systematically discharged on the basis of their sexual orientation. See A. Berubé's, Coming Out Under Fire. (New York: Plume Books, 1990) for more on lesbians in the military.

³⁰Of the nine thousand names collected one third were people who worked for the government, the rest were names of Ottawa citizens who got caught in the surveillance net.

professor Dr. F.R. Wake of Carleton University who researched and designed the "fruit machine", suggested that the most "productive line of research which might be undertaken" consisted of three tests: the Hess-Polt pupillary test, combined with a measure of skin perspiration (McCleary Palmar Sweat Test) and the plethysmograph with a modification to measure pulse rate.³¹

The infamous 'fruit machine' was based on a stereotypical understanding of gay lifestyle and culture. Under "methods for detecting homosexuality", Dr. Wake included a word association list with 147 terms in which he designated words such as queen, circus, whole (hole), mother, punk, camp, coo, sew, swing, velvet, wolf, prowl, house, club, restaurant, tea room and top men to be "homosexual".³² According to Wake, these words would elicit some kind of latent or closeted homosexual identification.

Another example of Wake's dependence on socially constructed stereotypes was the use of masculinity-femininity scales. Certain assumptions about gender roles and differences were implicit in the questionnaire where the respondents had

---

³¹The Hess-Polt device was a machine that flashed visual image at subjects while photographing the movement of their pupils and the length of time spent looking at a picture taken from physical culture magazines. The McCleary Palmar Sweat Test was a device where subjects held a bag of crystals that measured changes in emotional levels based on palm sweat. This device was used in conjunction with the word association list developed specifically for homosexuals (see text for more on list). The plesymograph was a glorified lie-detector where an electronic device was attached to the finger (or forehead) and was also used to measure emotional change. For a more in depth analysis of these devices and an overview of the medicalization of homosexuality see chapter three. For American examples of 'employment tests' see R.S. Brown, Loyalty and Security: Employment tests in the United States. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1958). See especially pages 256 to 260 for employment tests created to identify homosexuals.

³²F.R. Wake, "Report on Special Project", December 19, 1962: Appendix A.

to answer "true" or "false" to statements such as,

If I was a reporter I would like very much to report news of the theatre
I would like to be a nurse.
I very much like hunting.
I think I would like the work of a dress designer.
I think I would like the work of a garage mechanic.
I like adventure stories better than romantic stories
I would like to be a florist.
There was never a time in my life when I liked to play with dolls.³³

These stereotypes were based on a specific understanding of gender role behaviour and differences and suggested that homosexual men apparently displayed feminine or effeminate traits, their 'personalities' were 'defective' and they were thus 'unsuitable' for employment, especially in areas where they had access to Secret and Top Secret information.

Although Wake admitted in his report that psychologists dismissed the notion that homosexuals had a specific masculine-feminine 'dimension', he felt the questionnaire was still useful for detecting homosexuals. Whether it was the 'neutral' pictures used to detect object sex desire in the Hess-Polt device or the MF scales, the purpose of the 'fruit machine' was to separate the 'normal' people from the people who, they argued, 'deviated' from the norm.

The drive to develop techniques that would detect homosexuals who possessed 'character weaknesses' and therefore were 'unsuitable' and 'unreliable'

---

³³The questionnaire included 60 statements similar to those that you find in this section. I will discuss this questionnaire in more detail in Chapter Three. See F.R. Wake, "Report on the Special Project", December 19, 1962: Appendix A.

for work in the civil service, was motivated by the state's desire to establish a systemic manner through which to enforce ideals of heterosexual and gender roles. Homosexuals were unreliable because they did not conform to the sex\gender system that adheres to strict rules of what constitutes 'femininity' and 'masculinity' and by extension the cultural codes in the 1950s and 1960s of what was meant by 'normal behaviour'. Wake's project never fulfilled its objective with any definite results and was eventually abandoned by 1967. However, it demonstrates the security state's need to establish that government employees were 'authentic' heterosexuals and at the very least, harbored no latent homosexual tendencies.

Purging the 'unwanted' and 'undesirable' element from the federal service ranks was one step in attempting to 'purify' the nation. By the mid-1950s the RCMP 'counter subversive' efforts shifted towards homosexuals as another enemy and danger to national security. Now, the 'evil' communist and the gay public servant who lurked around the corner ready to pounce on any unsuspecting victim were both under the careful gaze of the police.³⁴ Indeed, the Cold War was more a battle with the internal and rising gender and sexual anxiety that vexed society than a 'peaceful' war against the Soviet Union. The focus of the next section is to

---

³⁴Another threat or danger to national security that was identified in this period was the woman who did not conform to proper gender codes. For more on this see E.T. May, Homeward Bound: American Families in the Cold War Era. (New York: Basic Books, 1988); Ruth Roach Pierson, They're Still Women After All: The Second World War and Canadian Womanhood. (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1986) ; and Geoffrey Smith, "Security, Gender and the Historical Process", Diplomatic History 18 (Winter 1994):79-90.

establish the theoretical framework or map that I will refer to throughout this thesis as a conceptual framework for the beauty contests and the anti-homosexual purges

IV. *Gender Anxiety, Beauty Contests and the Security Campaigns*

The purpose of this section is to situate the beauty contest model and the anti-gay purges within a theoretical framework or conceptualization that explains how both the beauty contests and the anti-homosexual purges functioned in organizing social and gender relations in the Canadian civil service in the 1950s and 1960s. In order to explain the system of gender anxiety that characterized the government community in the mid-twentieth century, I draw upon the work of Judith Gerson and Kathy Peiss who have offered a reconceptualization of gender relations. Much feminist history has used a framework that is based on the dichotomy of separate spheres. Gerson and Peiss move beyond this by introducing a system of boundaries and negotiation/domination as the sites where the process of defining gender relations takes place. In the areas of stability/instability that govern everyday social interactions between men and women lies the notion of gender anxiety. In this section, I discuss the concept of gender anxiety, the development of an ideology of beauty and femininity, and its implications for women's lives.

In her article, "Remaking the She-Devil: A Critical look at Feminist Approaches to Beauty", Kathy Davis describes *beauty* as,

an ideological battlefield where women grapple actively and knowledgeably

with opposing cultural construction of femininity, beauty, and what should or should not be done about the female body³⁵

Davis critiques feminist notions of the ideology of beauty or what she calls the "fashion-beauty complex" as an oppressive system that women do not control. Her main concern is that women do have agency in influencing and shaping the "fashion-beauty system" as well as negotiating the various prescriptions of beauty and femininity. Beauty contests exist because of the existence of the ideology of beauty/femininity which reinforces the cosmetic, fashion and media industries but they *continue* to prosper because women are primary agents in that they engage with these beauty industries. Davis does not dismiss the reality that the fashion-beauty complex is a "major articulation of capitalist-patriarchy", rather, she suggests that this analysis does not give us a clear picture of women's role in perpetuating the beauty system³⁶. Ideals of beauty and femininity, then, are important not only in creating and teaching women how to behave in "proper" ways according to gender roles³⁷, they are also roles that women often seek out.

The beauty system as such works to maintain a sex\gender system ordered

---

³⁵K. Davis, "Remaking the She-Devil: A Critical Look at Feminist Approaches to Beauty", Hypathia 6(2), Summer 1991 p.23

³⁶Ibid, p 25. The term "beauty system" is used in an article by D. MacCannell and J.F. MacCannell, "The Beauty System", in N. Armstrong and L. Tennenhouse, eds. The Ideology of Conduct (New York: Methuen, 1987), pp.206-238. See especially p. 208 for a definition of this term.

³⁷U. Stannard, "The Mask of Beauty", in V. Gornick and B. Moran, eds. Women in Sexist Society, (New York: Basic Books, 1971), p. 123.

by a certain set of social boundaries. The sex\gender system I am referring to here is understood as "the institutionalized system which allots resources, property, and privileges to persons according to culturally defined gender roles."³⁸ The function of the beauty system and for my purposes here, the beauty contest, as an integral part of the sex/gender system is to crystallize the gender division between the sexes within an established structure.

Institutionalized, the separation and segregation of the sexes is not the cause of gender disorders but only a part of the system, its maintenance equipment. In short, the contradiction at the base of the beauty system is that the prescribed feminine beauty practices are believed to attract males, or bring the sexes closer together, while their real effect is to keep the sexes separate and unequal, even, or especially, as they seem to be coming together.³⁹

The beauty system and the ideals of femininity and beauty that it enforces are intertwined with gender and sexuality as a system of social relations.

Gender is a "fluid [category] whose meaning in a specific social context as it is created and recreated through human actions."⁴⁰ Gender instability increased in the World War II period as more women worked in non-traditional jobs as a result

---

³⁸G. Lerner, The Creation of Patriarchy, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1986), p. 238. This definition has been taken from the appendix of Gerda Lerner's book. According to the author, the term "sex/gender system" was introduced by anthropologist, Gayle Rubin.

³⁹MacCannell and MacCannell, p. 208.

⁴⁰J.M. Gerson and K. Peiss, "Boundaries, Negotiations, Consciousness: Reconceptualizing Gender Relations", Social Problems 32(4), April 1985: p. 317.

of war mobilization.⁴¹ It was the rise of what Janice Irvine calls "gender insecurity" or "gender anxiety" that led to the idealization of women and the family which permeated the cultural consciousness in the post-war era.⁴² Yet, even at the apex of the seemingly "natural" reintegration of traditional family values and reinforcement of heterosexuality, the "witch hunts of the early '50s directed against communists and homosexuals spoke to a pervasive fear of Otherness".⁴³ The influx of women in the labour force and the challenges to traditional roles articulated by the feminist movement in the mid to late sixties, further contributed to gender anxiety and the need to re-order society along conservative, traditional gender polarities and heterosexual norms.

The notion of gender anxiety is particularly useful for this project because it will help explain and describe why the beauty contest model was appropriated by the federal government community. Women were hired as stenographers, typists and secretaries in large numbers by the late 1940s and 1950s mostly due to the labour shortage that the federal government experienced because of the war and the growing bureaucratic machine. The federal public service was designed for

---

⁴¹J.M. Irvine, "From Difference to Sameness: Gender Ideology in Sexual Science", The Journal of Sex Research 27(1), February, 1990:p.13. For a Canadian example, please see R. Roach Pierson's book, "They're Still Women After All": The Second World War and Canadian Womanhood. (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1986).

⁴²See E.T. May. Homeward Bound: American Families in the Cold War Era. (New York: Basic Books, 1988) for more on the idealization of women and the family in the 1950s and the integration and consumption of those ideals in American mass culture.

⁴³J.M. Irvine., p.14.

men by men. The paramilitary subculture that was a result of that male-dominated organization meant that the presence of women in the federal government by the mid-twentieth century unbalanced or destabilized the system. No longer a male bastion, the federal civil service culture had to find a method that would assist in defining what a "typical government girl" meant. I suggest that the civil service beauty contests became one of the obvious or 'external' methods to help 'solve' the problem of 'gender anxiety' that women working within the male paramilitary subculture introduced. A central theme of this thesis is that the beauty contests are as much about the definition of masculinity in the civil service as they are a reflection of femininity and gender roles.

The 'internal' method used to define gender roles and boundaries was to institute a system of occupational sex segregation. The sexual division of labour which evolved from the early twentieth century especially in the administrative support level remains largely intact to this day in the civil service. The federal government is notorious for the way it used "sophisticated bureaucratic measures to corral women into the lowest occupational grades".⁴⁴ As I mentioned earlier in

---

⁴⁴G.Lowe, Women in the Administrative Revolution: The Feminization of Clerical Work. (Oxford: Polity Press, 1987), p.71 (and chapter four). For more on the creation of the female ghetto in clerical work and more specifically, the administrative revolution, in Canada see the above cited book and G. Lowe's, "Women, Work and the Office: The Feminization of Clerical Occupations in Canada, 1901-1931", Canadian Journal of Sociology, 5(4), 1980:361-81 and his "Class, Job and Gender in the Canadian Office", Labour/Le Travail, 10 (Autumn 1982):11-37. For a discussion of women in the federal civil service during the Second World War see J. Doherty, "Changing Ghettos: Women Clerical Workers in Ottawa During The Second World War", MA Thesis, Carleton University, Ottawa, 1985. For a general overview and study of the concept of occupational sex segregation from a sociological approach see B. Fox and J. Fox, "Occupational Gender

in section one, by 1955 female employees made up 80 percent of the administrative support staff. Graham Lowe suggests that the main reasons that have contributed to the entrenchment of women in clerical work were "the growing supply of educated, middle-class young women and ideas of femininity which lent themselves to the task of typing".⁴⁵ One of the chief themes in this thesis will be to demonstrate how the civil service beauty contests legitimized the presence of women in low-status jobs by constructing them as sex objects.

It is more difficult, however, to prove that the beauty contests added to the system of sexual harassment and violence that is often associated with the sexual objectification of women. Some sociologists who have studied the impact of gender on bureaucratic organizations suggest that the presence of women can lead to a set of power relations between 'boss' and 'secretary' based on sexual power.⁴⁶ Rosemary Pringle, author of a book entitled Secretaries Talk, refers to the power

---

Segregation in the Canadian Labour Force, 1931-1981", Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology, 24(3), August 1987:374-397. For a historical approach to this topic see H. Hartmann, "Capitalism, Patriarchy and Job Segregation by Sex", Sign, 1(1976):137-169.

⁴⁵G.Lowe (1987), p.75.

⁴⁶Suzanne Perry, Miss Civil Service 1963, mentioned one incident in her interview that helps illustrate this point. In 1963, after she was crowned Miss Civil Service, Suzanne was approached by CJOH (a local news station) and asked if she would be interested in representing Ottawa for the first time in the Miss Canada pageant. She decided to participate in the venture that was being sponsored by both CJOH and a local lady's wear store that would supply her entire wardrobe. When she went to be fitted, the manager of the store began to make sexual advances toward her. She described the manager as a "...a very unpleasant, groping kind of male. I just—it was made rather plain to me what was the expectation of me and I said, "Thanks, No, Thanks", I don't want to be part of this". Luckily, she was able to avoid any further danger and refused to be part of the venture from that point.

and control issues that are part of the boss-secretary relationship as "erotic bureaucracies",

which suggest that the demise of 'erotic man' and the rise of 'rational man' described by [Roslyn] Bologh has involved the sublimation of eroticism, but not its erasure from the modern bureaucratic organization.⁴⁷

The concept of erotic bureaucracies is a useful way of establishing a framework of analysis for exploring issues around the construction of (hetero)sexuality in bureaucratic organizations as well as examining potential sites of sexual danger. Although the bureaucratic ideal is based on the notion of rationality or more specifically, the idea that like the Catholic priesthood, civil servants are devoted to the higher good of organizing principles, Pringle and others insist that understanding gender divisions in the bureaucracy must be accompanied by an analysis based on sexual rule and power. The Miss Civil Service contests, then, may be one example of why "(t)he desexualization of the male bureaucrat is paralleled by the sexualization of women subordinates".⁴⁸

Finally, the concept of gender anxiety will be useful in theorizing the anti-homosexual security campaigns as the gender and sexual subtext within the federal government community. Although the security regime against gays and lesbians was couched in secrecy, knowledge of the RCMP surveillance net became part of

---

⁴⁷A. Witz and M. Savage, "The Gender of Organizations", in M. Savage and A. Witz, eds. Gender and Bureaucracy. (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1992), p.27.

⁴⁸Ibid., p.52.

the collective consciousness of the gay and lesbian subculture in the government community by the mid-1960s.⁴⁹ An examination of the anti-gay purges also allows us to look at the issue of conforming to the prescribed gender and sexual roles from the vantage point of people who did not 'belong'. Another important theme in this thesis will be an analysis of how civil servants of both sexes who could not or did not conform to the gender and heterosexual norms negotiated and survived the boundaries that those norms established. Placing the anti-gay purges within the larger context of the beauty contests allows me to examine the gendered subtext offering yet another example of compulsory heterosexuality and gender anxieties that plagued the federal service community and society in this period.

In the 1950s and 1960s, the re-ordering of society was based on the need to redefine notions of femininity and masculinity at all levels of society and especially in the work force. Using concepts such as boundaries and negotiation, Judith Gerson and Kathy Peiss establish a dynamic way of conceptualizing gender relations in a dialectical relationship and not simply a function of separate spheres. The reconceptualization of gender relations allows us to take into account women's agency in determining and influencing the everyday interaction with men. It also goes beyond traditional understanding of power as exclusively in the hands of men

---

⁴⁹According to the Directorate of Security and Intelligence Annual Report of 1963-64, the RCMP were unable to rely on informants for information leading to more names of gays and lesbians living in the greater Ottawa area. If we read the documents "against the grain" we can conclude that "cooperation" decreased as knowledge of the extensive surveillance system became part of the gay and lesbian collective consciousness.

(as practised in the public sphere) by demonstrating the tenuous hold over ideals of masculinity and femininity that both men and women experience and confront every day of their lives.

The concept of boundaries allows for more flexibility with which to analyse gender relations because it acknowledges the interconnections that mark people's lives between the so-called private and public spheres. Moreover, in marking those sites the notion of boundaries effectively permits us to see the

...social territories of gender relations, signalling who ought to be admitted and excluded ...[a]s a consequence...these intersections reveal the normal, acceptable behaviours and attitudes as well as deviant, inappropriate ones.⁵⁰

In this sense, the concept of boundaries is particularly useful for the assessment of stability, change and diversity in a system of gender and sexual relations. Every time women or gays and lesbians pushed at these boundaries, a shift took place. Although the previous system of gender and sexual relations was altered, the actual paradigm or matrix of power may have remained the same. For example, women were 'permitted' to start working for the federal civil service when a labour shortage made it necessary to accept women in a male-dominated space. The 'boundary' that was crossed meant that women gained access to jobs as secretaries and stenographers which had been the preserve of men. However, the new boundary that was established did not necessarily change or improve their

---

⁵⁰Gerson and Peiss., p.319.

status. Once an occupation became dominated by women, it tended to lose status. Thus, the sexual division of labour was recreated and in turn enforced the boundaries between prescriptions of femininity and masculinity as well as the enforcement of compulsory heterosexuality.

The notion of negotiation is important in that it suggests human agency.⁵¹ It reaches beyond theories of domination for understanding gender relations. Negotiation allows us to avoid the assumption that women are passive victims of a system of power controlled by men as described by domination theory. The concept of negotiation explains "the ways women and men bargain for privileges and resources" which usually maintain or change the structural, spatial, and social boundaries that exist.⁵² By using this theory of how men and women struggle for new sites of power and existence, the image of 'crossing' a boundary such as the proverbial 'glass-ceiling', suggests a new set of codes and rules around the issue of gender and sexual relations. In turn, those new codes and rules can then form a challenge or reinstitute under a different guise notions of femininity, masculinity, race, class and sexuality.

Central to the concepts of boundaries and negotiation is the notion of "consciousness". Gerson and Peiss suggest that "viewing forms of gender consciousness along a continuum produces a more useful conception of

---

⁵¹*Ibid.*, p 321.

⁵²*Ibid.*, p.321.

consciousness, while examining gender based interactions allows us to explain how these forms of consciousness develop and change" ⁵³ 'Consciousness' is key, then, in discerning the way in which structural change may take place (for example, legal change) while attributes around what constitutes 'proper' behaviour along gender and sexual lines remain the same. The continuum to which Gerson and Peiss are referring has three points of reference: gender awareness, female/male consciousness and female/anti-feminist consciousness. Gender awareness is described by the authors as "a non-critical description of the existing system of gender relations" where traditional gender differences are taken as "natural and inevitable". ⁵⁴ The features of female consciousness are two-fold; it is the "*outcome* of the processes of negotiation and domination and their reciprocal interaction" and it also "*influences* processes of negotiation and domination, and ultimately, the boundaries shaping gender relations" ⁵⁵ Feminist/anti-feminist consciousness, which on a continuum would be placed opposite gender awareness, "involves a highly articulated challenge to or defence of the system of gender relations in the form of ideology". ⁵⁶

---

⁵³ *Ibid.*, p. 324.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 324.

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, p. 326. Words in italics are my emphasis. 'Gender awareness' is considered the extreme opposite of 'feminist/anti-feminist consciousness' because the former is the non-critical and general acceptance of existing gender roles as "natural and inevitable" (p. 324) whereas the latter is a direct challenge to the very same gender roles.

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 325.

The reconceptualization of gender relations using the concepts of boundaries, negotiation and consciousness developed by Gerson and Peiss is one way in which we can begin to understand how changes in the ideals of proper feminine, masculine, and sexual roles within the federal government community shifted in the 1950s and 1960s. By using concepts that speak to the various resources and limitations women and men have at their disposal to 'stake their claim' in regards to gender relations in bureaucratic organizations, the idea of 'gender anxiety' becomes more meaningful as a way to describe the social and relational conditions of the 1950s and 1960s described above. The notion of 'gender anxiety' only becomes a viable means of explaining the civil service beauty contests and the anti-gay security campaigns if we have a theory of how the influx of women into the civil service community in the early 1950s and the realization that not everyone was (is) heterosexual could turn the work culture of the Canadian bureaucracy on its head. Indeed, the challenge to or reinforcement of "boundaries" through the processes of negotiation, which in turn causes shifts in consciousness, can lead us to examining sites of conformity and resistance.

The organizational and structural changes that the Canadian bureaucracy experienced in the post- World War II era took place within the context of the societal changes that were characteristic of the Cold War era. Questions and issues concerning gender and sexual behaviour had an influence on the growing modern bureaucracy and caused new anxieties over gender to emerge. The beauty

contests and the anti-homosexual security purge were two examples of the manifestation of that anxiety. The need to develop a universal and ideal image of the 'government girl' and 'government man' became one of the driving forces behind the dominant understanding of how civil servants were socially organized in the government community.

Chapter Two

"Mirror, Mirror on the Wall": Who's the fairest "Government Girl" of all?

"Civil Service Girls"
(Ottawa Girls)
Scampering nylons
Heading for cover
Business Girls
Svelte and glossy
Are your dream-men
Boys or bossy?
Love your lovers
Chic to chic
Bachelor girls
Sometimes baby-sisters
Know all is not
Gold that glitters
They adjure the wedding ring
For the best of everything.
-L.M. with apologies [sic]-¹

The "government girl" or the "civil service girl" or the "Ottawa girl" or the "business girl", one of the four, were all terms used in the 1950s and 1960s to refer to women who worked in the federal civil service. This poem was dedicated to the "government girl" and was published by the RA NEWS.² In the 1950s and 1960s,

---

¹"Civil Service Girls", RA NEWS, April 1959:p.13.

²The RA NEWS published two other poems written on the subject of women in the civil service. The poem "Song of a Successful Secretary" (August 1962:p.20) was written in the first person but the author remains unknown. The main theme of the poem was the job security a secretary in the government had due to the intricate and complex filing system secretaries establish which make them, as a result, indispensable. The other poem is of particular value here because it points to the ideology of beauty and femininity that pestered women government workers. "Should Women

when women in the administrative support ranks became a permanent feature of the burgeoning Canadian bureaucracy, the image and symbol of the "government girl" was a topic that inspired 'literary types' within the civil service. The "government girl", in fact, symbolized a female civil servant working for low wages in dead-end jobs. Yet, the "ideal government girl" represented in the "Miss Civil Service" title was a status sought after by contestants in the civil service beauty contests.

The following chapter consists of three sections. The first section is a brief historical overview of beauty contests in North America. This section deals with the contextualization of the beauty contests in the US and Canada, paying particular attention to the origins of the modern beauty contest and the historical impact that beauty contests have had on ideals of beauty and womanhood. The second section is an examination of the 'ideal government girl' and how that ideal enforced codes of femininity, beauty and female sexuality through the civil service beauty contests. The last section in this chapter offers the few examples and stories of 'resistance' to the civil service contests.

Wear Make-up or Not? by R.E. Sturgeon (June 1953:p.16), was a lengthy and bad poem about the pros and cons of make-up and the impact that "ugly" and "pretty" women have on men. Its message was ultimately that make-up and beauty are a central part of women's sexuality

1. Historical Overview of Beauty Contests in North America³

Since the seventeenth century, women have been selected as "queens" associated with rural carnivals or festivals in Europe. According to Lois Banner, one of the more important functions of carnivals and festivals in the seventeenth century and later on into the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries was to celebrate the community especially the values and traditions that it upheld. The 'queen' of the carnival/festival was a symbol of "enduring community values and future utopian expectations" ⁴ Presiding over these community events gave winners an opportunity to elevate their "meagre" status, thereby fostering an illusion of social mobility.

The modern concept of what we now understand as the "beauty queen" originated in the United States in 1854 with Phineas T. Barnum. Barnum was the first to organize an event where women would display their faces and bodies before judges ⁵ The contests originally established by Barnum differentiated on the basis of marital status. If a married woman won, she would be the proud recipient of a

---

³Although my focus is North America a recent study that examines the global impact of beauty contests from a cultural studies/anthropology approach had been published. See C. Ballerino Cohen, R. Wilk and B. Stoeltje, eds. Beauty Queens on the Global Stage: Gender, Contests, and Power. (New York: Routledge, 1996).

⁴L. Banner, American Beauty. (New York: Alfred A. Knopf Inc., 1983), p.254.

⁵Ibid., p 255

diamond tiara, if a single woman won, she would receive a dowry⁶ The contests failed because women who wished to participate were considered to be of 'questionable reputation', sometimes being referred to as prostitutes Although the beauty contest in 1854 did not include competing in bathing suits (the first time bathing suits were introduced was in Atlantic City, 1921), it was still considered unthinkable for women to display their bodies (much less *parts* of their body) for the express purpose of competing for a prize Indeed it would have been disgraceful for both the participant and her family even if it meant the possibility of a dowry for single daughters of poor families

The beauty contest as originally conceived by Barnum had to be replaced with a combination of

the features of lower-class carnivals with upper-class festivals and thereby fused energy with refinement in a natural and national setting that celebrated the young American woman as a symbol of national pride, power, and modernity⁷

As a result, Barnum solicited newspapers in the United States to organize a "photographic beauty contest" where women would send their pictures to newspapers.⁸ This particular beauty contest was popular well into the early twentieth century In part, its popularity was based on its accessibility to both the

---

⁶Ibid., p.255. See also A.R. Rivora, Live from Atlantic City. A History of the Miss America Pageant (Bowling Green, Ohio: Bowling GreenState University Popular Press), pp 7-9

⁷Ibid., p.260.

⁸L. Banner, p.256

literate and illiterate masses and, in turn, the ability for the masses to influence the ideals and notions of what constituted a "beautiful" woman. It became a 'legitimate' contest because the winner was selected from a larger pool of "judges". By 'voting' *en masse* for the upper classes, the 'respectable' women in society could then enter the contest without compromising class boundaries and Victorian values concerning the proper display of the female body.

By the turn of the twentieth century, modelling was considered a legitimate career for women. The rise of the fashion industry and its subsidiary, modelling, brought a shift in the ability of women to display themselves (in person) in a public manner. Models were constructed as hard-working women from working to middle-class families struggling to make a better living for themselves and their loved ones.⁹ As modelling became an acceptable and respectable career venture for young women it helped legitimize the spread of beauty contests (as we know them today) simply because it made the display of the female body in public less scandalous for women and their families. Most of the actual winners of these contests were from the working classes or had low status jobs; consequently, beauty contests were seen as an avenue to social mobility and access to careers

---

⁹*Ibid.*, p.261. According to Banner, prizes for the winner of certain beauty contests in the 1890s included the opportunity for a career in modelling or in the theatre (see p.263).

in modelling and the theatre.¹⁰

The first Miss America contest was held in Atlantic City in 1921. The evolution of the Miss America pageant is traced in A.R. Riverol's book, Live from Atlantic City: A History of the Miss America Pageant. Although the author traces the historical development of the Miss America pageant over seven decades (1920s to 1980s), he does not offer an analysis or any sufficient contextualization for a better understanding of the beauty contests as a method for maintaining social order. One very important aspect of his book, however, is that he demonstrates the role of corporations and how they use the beauty contests as a tool for garnering publicity and profit.¹¹ Corporations, especially within the tourism industry, gradually came to depend upon the crowds and spectators that the Miss America pageant drew. Indeed, the connections between the fashion industry, the cosmetic industry, the television industry and the beauty contest business are irrefutable. All these components depend on and reinforce each other and ensure that every year the

---

¹⁰Ibid., p.263. Banner suggests that although the beauty contests did allow for the opportunity to climb the social ladder, she insists that beauty contests and modelling careers ultimately served as a vehicle for social discipline (see p.264). This is an important point because it demonstrates that as part of the ideology of beauty, beauty contests and modelling careers were meant to enforce and construct a specific set of gender and sexual codes for women. I should mention that beauty contests are still considered ways in which one can gain fame and fortune, especially in the USA. The scholarships and fringe benefits that are associated with the Miss USA contest are considered the biggest pull and one of the reasons for the continued success of this institution. For an example of a beauty queen (Miss Canada 1952) who had high hopes of a career in acting had her dreams crushed after her reign was over, see M. Reddick, "My, uh, Dazzling Career as Miss Canada", Maclean's Magazine, September 15, 1954:18-19 and 104-106.

¹¹A.R. Riverol, Live from Atlantic City..., p.12. He demonstrates this point throughout the book but makes some salient comments on this topic in the Introduction.

Miss America pageant is televised around the world.¹²

Between 1946 and 1961, Miss Canada participated as a contestant in the Miss America pageant. Except for the Macleans Magazine article (1954) written by a former Miss Canada describing her experience, nothing had been written to explain why Miss Canada participated in the Miss America pageant. Because a general history of Canadian beauty contests has never been written, the description I will offer in the following pages is a superficial one. My intent here is to establish the larger context and network of beauty contests within which the civil service beauty contests were taking place.

The Miss Canada pageant started in 1946 and ended in 1992. The corporation that ran the Miss Canada pageant was Cleo Productions, which was owned by CFTO Television.¹³ The author of an article based on a behind-the-scenes look at the Miss Canada pageant which appeared in Saturday Night described the contests as a "commercial grotesquerie".¹⁴ The Miss Dominion of Canada pageant, the other, lesser known national beauty contests organized by a non-profit organization in Niagara Falls was orchestrated by John C. Bruno, the

---

¹² Ibid., p49-50. According to Riverol, the Miss America pageant was first televised in July of 1954 marking an important shift in the pageant as an exclusive event. By the early 1960s, the Miss America corporation decided to exclude "any participation by contestants not holding a state title...[such as] ...Miss Atlantic City, Miss Puerto Rico(1962), Miss Canada, and Miss New York City(1963)" (see p.83).

¹³ V. Miner Johnson, "Meeting Miss Canada; or, the rape of Cinderella", Saturday Night, (February, 1973):p.15.

¹⁴ Ibid., p 15

owner of Canadian Beauty Spectaculars Limited¹⁵ His profits came from the makeup and accessories used by the contestants, which his company manufactured.

The competition between these contests was an interesting one in that it offers an insight into the manner in which beauty contests were constructed in industry. The owners of the Miss Canada pageant maintained that its queen was the only legitimate representative of the "ideal Canadian girl", especially since it claimed that it was a *national* contest. Moreover, the winner of the Miss Canada pageant was sent to Atlantic City to participate in the Miss America pageant, making "their title" a more prestigious one. The owners of the Miss Canada pageant insisted that "Miss Canada isn't really a beauty queen at all, since she gets more marks for poise and talent than she does for appearance... 'We don't want a Liz Taylor- we want a Jackie Kennedy type of girl'"¹⁶ The construction of Miss Canada as a wholesome and legitimate contest which upheld good, clean values was done for two reasons. First, Miss Canada was seen as a symbol of Canadian nationalism and pride. Second, as a participant in the Miss America pageant it had to appeal to its ideal images of beauty and patriotism.[see illustration 4]

The owner of the Miss Dominion of Canada, however, was more forthright

---

¹⁵A. Ross, "Next chore for our courts: judging beauty contests", Macleans Magazine, 77(24), December 14, 1964:p.1.

¹⁶Ibid., p.2.

about the purpose of his contest. He was less concerned with the talents of the contestants and was interested in seeing how good they "looked in a Mountie costume" ¹⁷ Although the Miss Dominion of Canada pageant was, in the words of Mr. Bruno, a "straight" (meaning 'authentic') beauty contest and thus looked down upon by the Miss Canada pageant, the 'advantage' it had was that the winner represented Canada at the Miss World, Miss Universe and Miss International pageants. Bruno likened the competition between the contests to the Olympics, suggesting that the important thing to remember was not the ideals of what was Canadian, but to have the more "beautiful" women win so that more money could be made for the owners of the beauty contests. Clearly, the women themselves were seen as pawns in a larger corporate game.

An important aspect of beauty contests is the multi-layered nature of the competition in terms of the network it creates between the well-known pageants such as Miss Canada, Miss America or Miss Universe and the smaller pageants such as Miss East Ontario, Mademoiselle Québec or even Miss Civil Service. In the serious world of beauty contests, a young woman could not aspire to be crowned Miss Canada unless she could build a list of titles she had won at local levels. It is not surprising then that in 1969, Miss Canada was one of the judges for the Miss Civil Service contest. Indeed, some of the winners of the Miss Rough

---

¹⁷ Ibid , p.2.

Rider contest were female federal servants and Miss Civil Service would also wear the Miss Tulip Festival crown. As part of this larger network of beauty contests, Miss Civil Service was seen as a stepping stone to bigger and brighter futures as Miss Canada, Miss Dominion of Canada or even Miss America. In all these cases, the role of the beauty contest was to entertain, affirm women as sex objects, enforce certain ideals of beauty and femininity and to make a profit by both the organizers and the participants via prize money.

In 1954, Miss Civil Service, Betty Burton, met Miss Canada, Barbara Markham at "Cornwall Night", an event hosted by the manager of the Connaught Park Raceway, T.P. Gorman. The guest list was an impressive one and included, Ray Kinsella, the President of the Ottawa Recreational Association, RA Directors, Len Hill (House of Commons staff), Jack Vinokur (of the Civil Service Commission) and Charlie Anderson (of the Dominion Bureau of Statistics) ¹⁸ It was a big night for Cornwall but especially for Miss Civil Service. A photograph of Miss Canada shaking hands with Miss Civil Service allows for a rare glimpse into the different purposes that the Miss Civil Service Contest and the Miss Canada Pageant served as advertising gimmick. [see illustration 5]

II. The "Ideal Government Girl": Enforcing codes of femininity, beauty and female sexuality

The crowning of the first 'queen' of the civil service was actually an event

---

¹⁸"Miss Civil Service Meets Miss Canada", RA NEWS, September 1954 p 20

that was part of the RA snow carnival in 1950 Theresa Nugent won the title "Miss RA" that year and was crowned the first official "Miss Civil Service" in 1951 The civil service beauty contests allow for a more nuanced understanding of what sort of 'climate' existed in the federal community surrounding issues of proper gender and sexual behaviour In this section I will show how beauty contests helped to manufacture two important types of culture--a social class mobility and workplace discipline In effect, the beauty contests created messages that defined the 'proper' gender and sexual roles for those employed in the federal civil service

Beauty contests and the selection of 'queens' at events such as prom night, homecoming or winter carnival are considered cultural institutions in North American culture In the course of my research I have come across 'titles' such as Miss Picnic, Miss Tulip Festival, Miss Rough Rider, Miss 'Save a Life', Miss Secretary of Canada, Miss Japan-Canada Friendship or Miss RA Ski Club.¹⁹ The

---

¹⁹"Miss Picnic" was the title of the winner of the RA Picnic Day. "Miss Civil Service" had a dual role to play as "Miss Tulip". Miss Tulip continued to reign well after the civil service contests ended. In 1973, Ottawa held its first Miss Tulip Contest where the winner was selected by public vote, reminiscent of the photographic newspaper beauty contests that were held in the United States at the turn of the century. For more on this see picture and announcement in the Ottawa Journal, May 11, 1973, p. 3. See also the article announcing the winner by Wendy Warburton, "English Scholar selected as Tulip Festival Queen", Ottawa Journal, May 18, 1973:p.21. "Miss Rough Rider" was another Ottawa local contest that lured women from the civil service. Unfortunately, I do not have the dates for this contest. "Miss Save a Life" was a contest sponsored by the St. John's Ambulance Association as part of the National Research Council's 'Save a Life Week'. Miss NRC of 1968 was crowned "Miss Save a Life". "Miss Secretary of Canada" was created and sponsored by Remington-Rand Inc., "in recognition of the services rendered by secretaries in Government, Industry and Commerce" in 1960. The organizers of the Miss Secretary of Canada pageant claimed that "this was not a beauty contest, although appearance is one of the several factors on which she will be judged". Other criteria that the "ideal secretary" had to possess were proficiency in typing, shorthand, skills and poise as well as having to submit a 300 word essay giving advice on what it takes to be a successful secretary. The above quotes were taken from an article entitled

obsession, then and now, with somehow being able to choose from a crowd of women, one exceptionally 'beautiful' and 'feminine' woman has always been a central element for creating examples of what a 'real, perfect female' should be. Our culture's preoccupations with what is 'beautiful' and 'feminine' as well as what is 'masculine' is manifested through rituals such as beauty contests which institutionalize an ideology of beauty that women and men are constantly negotiating.

One of the central themes of this thesis is to demonstrate the uniqueness of the civil service beauty contest as arbiter of proper gender behaviour. In a 1965 edition of the RA NEWS, the editor made specific references to the important role the RA Queen played as the representative of the "Ideal Government Girl"

The RA Queen of the year contest differs from the ordinary beauty contest in that the girl who is selected reflects credit not only on herself but also on all of the thousands of girls who work for the Federal Government. The honour and esteem which the RA Queen receives are meant both for herself and for all of her colleagues without whose dedicated efforts the machinery of government would quickly grind to a halt. Having chosen its Queen for the year, the RA proudly requests that she represents them at many public appearances so that as many as possible can see the person whom you

---

"G' Girls...You Can Become Miss Secretary of 1960", RA NEWS, May 1960 p 13 and 20. For a list of prizes (that included a portable typewriter) see RA NEWS, June 1960 p 20 and for the announcement of the winner see RA NEWS, October, 1960 p.1. The "Miss Japan-Canada Friendship" contest established by the Trade Department, perhaps one of the more overtly political contests that I came across, was held in 1965. I believe that this was the only year that it was held. The winner had to be of Japanese heritage and the budget for the contest was apparently \$40,000, a considerable amount for 1965. See "Trade Department Seeks Japanese Beauty", Ottawa Journal, February 5, 1965 p.10. Finally, "Miss RA Ski Club" was basically the title given to the lucky winner after the annual ski outing.

might meet any day in any office--the Ideal Government Girl.²⁰

As the official ambassador of the "Ideal Government Girl", the civil service beauty queen was a symbol of pride for the RA and for the federal government.[see illustrations 6, 7 and 8] As a result, being chosen "Miss Civil Service" or after 1960, "RA Queen of the Year" was considered a great honour. As I will discuss in more detail later in this chapter, for many of these women who came from rural areas or working-class backgrounds, serving as Miss Civil Service meant instant fame, popularity and appreciation

But by the 1950s, for some, the image of the 'government girl' was considered to be a dangerous vision. Alan Philips, a writer for Maclean's Magazine certainly felt that way. In an article entitled "The Government Girl" written in 1953, Philips described a dismal picture of what happens to 'girls' who left their warm and protective homes and families to live alone in the big city as a government worker.

As a national figure, the Government Girl, Glee[the woman being interviewed] was a shadowy presence, sensed but seldom seen, behind regulations and services that touch us all. Federal officials are a helpless crew until 'their girls' - Glee and about twenty-thousand others--hastily sign in at 9 a.m., relax, powder their noses, open the files and start the typewriters, calculators, dictaphones and duplicators piling up the paper in quadruplicate".²¹

The picture that Philips did create of the 'Government Girl' was that these women

---

²⁰T. Coughlin, "Editorial", RA NEWS, May 1965:p.2.

²¹A Philips, "The Government Girl", Maclean's Magazine, January 15, 1953:p.25.

were looking out for "adventure" and "independence" leaving behind their proper life back at home as dutiful daughters. There was an assumption on the part of the author that these women were white middle-class, single and heterosexual with no *legitimate* reason for wanting to leave their homes and families to work in Ottawa. There was also the assumption that these young women were becoming socially mobile, acculturating themselves to big city life and its endless possibilities for social and sexual choice and danger as well as the knowledge that comes with learning the boundaries around the social and sexual. For the article, Philips traces the life of Glee Jesse "of Calgary, a tall good-looking brunette" who "turned her back on her steady boyfriend, her parents and the well-paid job as a secretary to an oil-company executive" ²² Indeed, the story constructed by Philips is one where a perfectly 'good' girl was taking a big risk by moving to Ottawa because stenographers and typists had dead-end jobs, the women outnumber the men and the 'freedom' that came with living away from home could lead many of 'these girls' to inappropriate social behaviour such as drinking, buying on credit and having sex. When asked how her parents felt about her leaving home to move to Ottawa, Glee said that her father did not approve but her mother did not seem to mind and in fact, encouraged her daughter because "[a]fter all, Glee was going to Ottawa, where respectability is almost as rampant as vice is believed to be in Montreal" ²³

---

²²*Ibid.*, p.25.

²³*Ibid.*, p.25.

The growing Canadian bureaucracy resulted in a labour shortage. Consequently, thousands of women were 'signed-up' to work as stenographers and typists. According to Philips, the office help shortage was especially bleak in 1952, when for the first time since the war, "untrained girls were taken fresh from high school and paid fifteen dollars a week to learn enough to pass civil service exams".²⁴ The government also tried to bring in female stenographers and typists from Britain under a federal-provincial immigration scheme. According to Philips, a federal recruiting officer went to Montreal in 1953 and tried to "entice" these women into joining the office ranks of the Canadian federal service but only two accepted while the rest responded that they have "heard that men outnumbered girls eight to one in Ottawa".²⁵ In fact, in 1953, there were 95 000 males and 107 000 females. Ottawa was thus described as "a bachelor's paradise, spinster's despair".²⁶

Philips went to great lengths to emphasize the potential ruin of these "Government Girls" due to the man shortage in Ottawa. For young women, socialization meant not simply learning the ways of modern urban life but also

---

²⁴ *ibid.*, p. 25.

²⁵ *ibid.*, p. 25.

²⁶ *ibid.*, p. 25.

meeting men. Laurentian Terrace ²⁷, a residence built by the Government for young women flooding into the city during the Second World War, was a "target" for the 'lust-crazed' bachelors roaming aimlessly through the Ottawa streets

Inevitably, it is a target for men. They call up almost every night for dates. "Even the hotels give them our number," complains Winifred Moyle. "It's extremely annoying, and we certainly don't encourage it" ²⁸

The image that this statement conjured up for the reader and the implicit message that it delivered left the impression that the young women who worked in Ottawa were easy prey for the oversexed and lonely bachelors who were looking for 'dates'. The concentration of single women at the Laurentian Terrace and the YWCA allegedly made it easier to locate these innocent and unsuspecting 'girls'. The implicit message was that if you send your 'virginal' daughter to Ottawa you were sending her to her demise. Philips makes several attempts in his article to somehow debunk the notion that Ottawa was a 'respectable' city although not as dangerous as Montreal where single women were sure to lose their 'innocence' as soon as they got off the train.

If a government girl could not or did not find a bridegroom and a happy home what would be her fate? According to Philips, she would,

---

²⁷ Ibid., p.38. In 1953, the superintendent of the Terrace was Winifred Moyle, a dietician. Laurentian Terrace was established as affordable housing for female federal employees. According to Winifred Moyle, "We think of it more as a hotel than a home. If the girls have a problem we're happy to discuss it, but we don't try to regulate their lives or morals". Glee was a resident of the Laurentian Terrace when she first came to Ottawa but eventually moved out and into an apartment with three other female civil servants.

²⁸ Ibid., p.38.

in her middle-age be reasonably well-off, well-travelled, busy and useful, as set in her ways as a man her age, but no less well-adjusted. Only when considered as a group does the spectre of the spinster stalk the federal corridors ²⁹

Although a job in the civil service could have led to an exciting and lucrative career for men (even if they started at the very bottom of the ladder), government girls were expected to get married. To put any parents who might be reading his article at ease, Philips hastens to add that the single government girl's chances are quite favourable

What are their home-making chances?.. The Ottawa census figure, released last fall, show 51, 919 unmarried females to 46, 225 unmarried males-about eight single women to seven single men ³⁰

Leaving aside for a moment the assumption that these "unmarried females" and "unmarried males" were all heterosexual, this was a particularly desperate attempt to ensure the reader that *all* government girls were essentially home and wife material ready to be snatched up. Philips even goes as far as saying that the "5, 694 leftover females . don't necessarily become old maids" because most of them met their future husbands on holidays or have boyfriends waiting for them at home (where they came from)

Buying on credit and the danger of going into debt was considered to be a potential problem for some of these government girls. Part of being a female civil

---

²⁹ *ibid.* p 42

³⁰ *ibid.* p 42

servant involved dressing appropriately, which did indeed mean that a woman would have to go into debt. Stores all over the city advertised specials and credit lines specifically geared toward these women in an attempt to lure them into their stores.

Credit comes so easy for girls in the government that lots of the younger ones are up to their ears in debt before they know it. Stores besiege them with tempting low-payment plans.³¹

How you *looked* was considered extremely important and that meant buying clothes and make-up and accessories that would supposedly enhance your looks. The beauty contestants paraded in their 'office wear' (no gowns or bathing suits) and the fashion shows organized by the RA attest to the importance placed on the prescribed but unwritten dress code that the women of the civil service had to follow.

In January 1952, Glee, the woman that Philips considered to be a typical government girl was chosen Miss Indian Affairs by her department but,

[t]he role didn't come easy. On the gala night, as the judges watched the parade of contestants, Glee's smile suddenly froze and she went by 'dead pan'.³²

Philips ends his profile of Glee by noting that she was in the same position she was when she first came to Ottawa; with a boyfriend she does not plan to marry and a job that became a boring routine. The article ends with admission that although

---

³¹Ibid., p.38.

³²Ibid., p.40.

she feels like she was in a "rut" it was a "rut with a lot more room than the one I was in at home"

But until Glee and the thousands of other secretaries and typists found a home and a husband they continued to work at their low-paying, dead-end jobs. In an article aimed at poking fun at secretaries, I found some interesting examples of the different stereotypes that existed and what they reveal about the manner in which women in low-status jobs were constructed. Although stereotypes as a measure of reality are not reliable, they can direct us to some of the assumptions people held about secretaries and what they expected from these women. This can also be true when looking at the various ways in which gay men and lesbians are depicted through stereotypes and the impact that those stereotypes wield when considering questions concerning 'trust', 'reliability', and 'loyalty'. The myths people held about women in low-paying jobs or gays and lesbians can be considered an indication of the way perception can have a greater influence on representation than the actual 'reality' or 'truth'. In the case of the article in question entitled "The Boss's Hired Girl", the stereotypes described point to some of the perceptions that were held concerning women's expected passivity, cheeriness and sexual prowess.

There were seven 'types' of secretaries described by the author as "the most glamourized piece of dressed goods around the office".³³ There was "Pam-The

---

³³"The Boss's Hired Girl". RA NEWS, December 1961:p.15.

Party Girl", "Olive-The Octopus", "Prudence-The Protective", "Dotty-The Dotter", "Carry-The Country Kid", "Sylvia-The Sex Bomb", and "Martha-The Magnificent". The last type, "Martha-The-Magnificent", was, of course, the ideal secretary because,

she gets you off to conferences with your briefcase and out in the rain with your umbrella. She impresses your wife, your bill collectors and the top brass. Any boss would envy you. So what do you want with a sex bomb?³⁴

"Martha-The Magnificent" was a sexless, motherly but efficient secretary who was not considered a source of jealousy for the boss's wife and who was always ready to get you out of a jam.[see illustration 9] Unlike "Sylvia-The Sex Bomb", whose 'beauty' and erotic sensibilities spelled trouble for the "boss"

A pretty girl is like a melody but this secretary is dynamite with a short fuse "Blondie" or the "Body" or whatever exotic name your friends call her may even hate men but your friends will never believe that your dictation periods are not comparable with the more spectacular of the Roman orgies. Your wife will hate her. Her gal friends will distrust you. Still she'll probably look good come next R. A. picnic in her bikini.³⁵

Although "Sylvia-The Sex Bomb" was the extreme opposite of the "Martha-The Magnificent", and possibly a 'man-hater', both stereotypes point to the importance that was placed on the image that these phantom 'secretaries' produced as well as the effect it had on the work they performed.[see illustration 10] Underlying all the stereotypes was the erotic and sexual potential that secretaries allegedly exhibited

---

³⁴ibid., p.15. "Martha-The Magnificent" was so magnificent that, according to the author, "there ought to be a statue right in that corner to Martha"

³⁵ibid., p.15.

and the potential sexual relationship that could transpire between a secretary and the employer

"Prudence-The Protective" was undesirable in that she thwarted any potential sexual interlude an employer would be entertaining through censorship by refusing "to make dinner dates over the phone with single gals before making sure that it is your kid sister or your maiden aunts". According to the author, wives love this type of secretary. On the other hand, wives had a hard time with secretaries such as "Dotty-The Dotter" because this 'girl' "can hardly break away from you at 5 o'clock". Apparently, Dotty was so taken by her 'magnificent' employer that "she may even say she wished she were the mother of your children". The author warned that this was not a serious invitation to have sex and live together in wedded bliss but a shout for attention and thus relatively harmless to married men. "Olive-The Octopus" and "Pam-The Party Girl" were considered less than ideal mainly around the issue of efficiency. Olive represented the stereotype of the efficient secretary. she was a nosy busy-body. Pam, on the other hand, was always cheerful and a blast to have around at office parties but not very efficient because she would be a "little wilted in the early morning" because she had been up late the previous night partying.

With the influx of women into the federal service by the mid-1950s, there seemed to be a need to define and create an image of the "typical government

girl".³⁶ Each government department would organize an internal competition to select the 'girl' who would represent the department at the "Night of Stars", the event where the actual judging for Miss Civil Service took place. Judging from the profiles provided of the winners by the RA NEWS, the "typical government girl" was a woman who worked in an administrative support position and had charm, poise, and a good personality. She was preferably single with no children, heterosexual, well-groomed, tall, thin and 'beautiful' with shiny hair. Indeed, to emphasize this ideal, the articles announcing the winner for a particular year would publish the beauty queen's height, weight and measurements along with her address.

To help women in the civil service achieve this ideal, the RA published numerous advice columns specifically addressing women in the government. Articles entitled, "The Well Dressed Government Girl" or "Pretty Girls are Nicer" were published for advice on how to dress and why being "pretty" meant that one would be more popular. Fashion shows catering to the fashion needs of male and female federal employees (for two years in the 1960s the beauty contests were held in conjunction with fashion shows), charm and modelling courses, diet classes, advice columns and articles offering 'hints' on how to "hunt" for men or how men can

---

³⁶ The first time I spotted the term "typical government girl" was in an article titled, "Do You Know 'Miss Civil Service'?" RA NEWS, February, 1952.p 2. I can only assume that this term was actually used earlier but earlier issues of the RA NEWS were not available to me.

"play upon your victim's sympathies"³⁷ contributed to defining the 'typical government girl' and by extension the new 'typical government man'.

The concern over establishing the ideal government girl was motivated by the need to create a specific and unique image of the *government* worker. Clothes, therefore, played an important role in producing that image and the behaviour that must accompany it. Proper office wear and fashion tips were by far the most discussed and written about topic found in the pages of the RA's monthly newspaper. Miss Civil Service became the unofficial arbiter of proper and acceptable office wear for government girls. Fran Jones, the main writer for the "Feminine Fancies" column, commented on the fashions that the Miss Civil Service winner, runner-ups (crowned as the official "Princesses") and contestants wore at the "Night of Stars". She pointed out the styles that were considered appropriate and those that were not suggesting that "[t]he contest could be used as a yard stick". By doing this, Jones was able to send a clear message to the young government girl of what image she was supposed to produce as a 'government girl'.

The "well-dressed government girl", according to Beth Bertram, who wrote an article on the topic for the RA NEWS in 1952, always planned her wardrobe ahead of time so that she would never find herself in the predicament of having to buy in haste for a social event or have to make a choice from a dwindling selection

---

³⁷ P. McMullen, "The Zublinsky Report", RA NEWS, May 1952: p.10. 'The Zublinsky Report' was an article written for male readers offering advice on how to find a girlfriend. It gave advice on what 'persona' a man should take on depending on the 'type' of 'girl' he wanted to date.

of clothes   The main message seemed to be that a woman should buy good quality clothing which could be easily transformed from daywear to evening wear

The well-dressed girl can often make her dollar go further by buying things which serve several purposes like the basic black dress of fine wool which may be adorned, for business, with a simple scarf at the neck or dressed up, for later in the day, with a bit of glitter. Then there are the separates, the basic skirts in black, brown or dark grey and the variety of sweaters, jerseys and blouses which may be worn with them. Reversible jackets or coats also offer the possibility of greater variety ³⁸

This rather conservative and 'unglamorous' wardrobe would probably not be considered very flattering or enable women to construct themselves into 'sex bombs', yet the erotizing of women was a persistent feature of life in the government community.[see illustration 11] When a Miss Civil Service contestant did overstep the boundaries of what was considered proper clothes befitting a "G" girl she was openly chastised for her inappropriateness in Fran Jones's column Jones made a point of mentioning those few women who competed in "date" dresses³⁹ which were not acceptable for the office due to the unprofessional atmosphere that such dresses inevitably were thought to create. The underlying issue here was the overt eroticizing that such dresses produced as opposed to the more conservative customs that made the 'cut' in the opinion of Fran Jones. Ultimately, "the well-dressed girl never over dresses [s]he knows that there is

---

³⁸B. Bertram, "The Well-Dressed Government Girl", RA NEWS, September 1952 p 8

³⁹F. Jones, "Fashion Notes..", RA NEWS, June 1959 p 12. Fran Jones did not actually mention names but did say things like "only one wore a dress that was out of keeping with the idea" making it easy to identify the transgressor.

plenty of sense in the well worn phrase 'plain but good'" ⁴⁰

'Beauty' and "plain but good" clothes, however, were not the only qualities that the ideal government girl had to possess in order to win the Miss Civil Service title. A "good" personality, charm, grooming and poise were also important criteria. To help those women and 'girls' in the civil service who needed some guidance in creating that charming personality, the RA established the RA Charm School which was open to women only. In order to advertise the new RA Charm School the RA NEWS asked six students, all women government workers, "What Constitutes Charm". Charm, according to Christine Hope of the Service Division, Civil Service Commission, was "a combination of beauty, manners, actions, personality and grooming" ⁴¹ All six women believed that 'charm' was a central part of beauty and it could be learned: a woman could be taught to dress appropriately, to properly style their hair and apply make-up correctly. Giselle Simard of the Administrative Branch, Department of Mines and Technical Surveys suggested that charm constituted "gracious gestures (postures, movement)" and "a properly modulated voice" ⁴² The prerequisite of "charm" was one of the cornerstones of femininity and sophistication. Emulating characteristics associated with middle and upper class people was as important as smiling sweetly. Erasing any remnants of working-class

---

⁴⁰Ibid., p 12

⁴¹"RA ASKS ..What Constitutes Charm?", RA NEWS, September 1957:p.16.

⁴²Ibid. , p 16

or rural traits such as attempting to obtain a "properly modulated voice" was a critical feature of the "professional girl" It also became the last opportunity for the "not so pretty girls" to be popular with the opposite sex

Charm is being attractive but not necessarily beautiful The emphasis is on mannerism, poise, conduct and speech.. To be popular with the opposite sex, it is far more important to have charm than anything else ⁴³

Another theory of charm put forward was that charm was a necessary result of beauty In an article published in the RA NEWS, Shirely M Plowman insisted that "[b]eauty and charm go hand in hand [w]hen a girl is pleasant to look at she is pleasant to be with and men flock around her like moths around a light bulb" Plowman suggested that "plainness is not necessarily a fool-proof test that something is good...[usually] plainness is only dullness" ⁴⁴ According to Plowman, it takes self-respect and patience to be "flawlessly groomed, to have clean shining hair, well-dressed clothes and a neat, whistle-bait figure" Although the debate over which came first, beauty or charm, was never resolved, the importance of achieving both, whatever the personal and financial cost, was part of the push toward the realization of an ideal image of beauty and femininity

Poise was also an important skill that could be learned and a crucial qualification that the "ideal government girl" had to possess In January 1960, the "Feminine Fancies" corner of the RA NEWS suggested some "beauty hints" for

---

⁴³ibid., p.16

⁴⁴S. M. Plowman, "Pretty Girls Are Nicer", RA NEWS, August 1954 p 6

female civil servants on how to sit and stand. According to the advice column, women government workers should make a letter "S" silhouette when sitting down. Posture and poise was also important when standing, one was to "[s]tand with ankles not too far apart, weight on one foot, the forward one, and the other turned at a 45 degree angle, knees slightly bent".⁴⁵ Again, like the need to learn how to 'properly modulate your voice', learning how to sit like a 'lady' pointed to middle-class sensibilities concerning of proper display of the body; feminine women from 'good' upbringing do not slouch. This standing position was essentially the 'correct' way to stand if posing for a picture, or the way models would stand when modelling clothes. It was also the way all civil service beauty queens stood when posing for their picture to be taken. According to Fran Jones, the writer for the "Feminine Fancies" corner, "we will feel better, because we look better". [see illustration 12]

Although 'advice' on how to dress, sit, and where to look for a "man" could be found scattered throughout the RA newspaper, the woman's page, better known as "Feminine Fancies" (a feature in the 1950s), was where most of the crucial information on proper feminine behaviour was found. This page included recipes, fashion advice, etiquette, advice on how to organize a wedding, articles featuring "beauty hints" and the latest news on who was engaged to whom. The woman's page not only emphasized the obligation of female civil servants to look and behave

---

⁴⁵F. Jones, "Beauty Hints", RA NEWS, January 1960: p.7

a certain way, it also enforced compulsory heterosexuality. A 1959 article in "Feminine Fancies" entitled "How to Meet a 'Man'" offered advice on where women should go to meet their future boyfriends and husbands, suggesting that "if you have not found the RA a happy hunting ground, try the YWCA or better still the YMCA dances and co-ed clubs, or your church's young people's groups" ⁴⁶ The same article even suggests as a last resort that if Ottawa had been unsuccessful as a "hunting ground", then a trip to Montreal was the next best option.

In addition to giving advice on how to find a man, "Feminine Fancies" featured articles with suggestions on what to do on a date. Following the cliché that "the way to man's heart is through his stomach", the article suggested that "Ottawa bachelors are famished for a good home cooked meal" ⁴⁷ Since marriage was supposed to be the primary goal of every "government girl", a first date was suggested as a good start to show a future prospect what a "good wife" one could be by cooking him a "good" hot meal, but "if you can't feed him, you can make him happy by suggesting picnics" ⁴⁸ Counsel on what was acceptable sexual behaviour for the first date was also included in the article.

I hope I don't have to warn you about dining alone at his apartment
Wait till you get engaged to do that. Avoid the situations where any
unpleasantness might develop. This would be the end of what might have

---

⁴⁶F. Jones, "How to Meet a Man", RA NEWS, July, 1959 p 12

⁴⁷Ibid., p.12.

⁴⁸Ibid , p.12

been a good friendship. Carry a hatpin in case you get fooled ⁴⁹

The need to enforce a sex/gender system while maintaining some control over the sexual possibilities and sexual danger that it inevitably entailed was the reasoning behind this article. Although women were needed in the administrative support positions, their work pattern was seen as temporary, marriage and having children being their true destiny. To reinforce the link between beauty, popularity and marriage, civil service beauty queens who had boyfriends, got engaged or once married had babies, were featured in the RA NEWS. In a letter written by Marie Rochon, Miss Civil Service 1956, published by the RA NEWS, we find a prime example of this notion that even the most beautiful government girl of 1956 saw the advantages of finally getting married and becoming a housewife

Everyone has dreams of beautiful events, and I especially want to thank you for making so many of mine come true. And now I abdicate my throne in favour of a smaller kingdom--a home" ⁵⁰

Married woman and indeed, the institution of marriage, have always been a point of contention for the civil service. In 1959, the RA NEWS announced that married women would be excluded from the contest. The reasoning behind this restriction was that married women have their "prize", namely, their husbands ⁵¹. Although this

---

⁴⁹Ibid., p 12

⁵⁰"Time Now to Think about Miss Civil Service of 1957", RA NEWS, January, 1957, p.3. The article also mentioned that when Marie Rochon won in 1956, she chose the New York trip (her prize) as her honeymoon.

⁵¹"Selection of Miss Civil Service Begins", RA NEWS, April 1959: p 1.

actually did not stop married woman from being selected during the departmental contests, only two of the twenty-two winners of the civil service beauty contests title were married women. Betty Burton was Miss Civil Service for two full terms, 1954 and 1955. The night she won in 1954, the Ottawa Journal reported that the six judges on duty that evening took two hours of deliberation before coming to a decision on the winner.⁵² It was a difficult decision. Perhaps the selection of Mrs Burton was a subtle political commentary on the fact that in the same year, the Civil Service Commission was under tremendous pressure to eliminate the restriction of hiring married women in the civil service.

The controversy over selecting a married woman, however, was not only a matter of political commentary on the part of the judges in the crucial years of 1954 and 1955. Indeed, it was one thing to sit and gaze at available and single young women but an entirely different thing to gaze at another man's wife. The patriarchal values at the core of this perception of women as ultimately the property of men in this period reverberated in this particular debate. Moreover, because women's sense of value was supposed to be associated with having a husband and eventually being a mother, having a husband was perceived as the ultimate "prize". And yet if the civil service beauty contest were supposed to capture the 'essence' or 'ideal' of what it meant to be a "government girl", numerous married women

---

⁵²"Miss Civil Service of 1954 a 'Mrs'". Ottawa Journal, March 20 1954 p 3

considered themselves part of that essence. According to the "chairman" of the RA beauty contest committee, Betty Shelton, "[w]e barred married women from the contest three years ago. But there was such a whoop and holler- about half the girls in the service are married- that we had to reinstate them".⁵³

In 1962, the year that the organizers of the beauty contest decided to "reinstate" married women, Mrs. Betty Gittens won the title. Betty Gittens, the only black woman to win the RA Queen crown, emigrated to Canada in 1959 from Barbados and got a job working for the government to help support two small sons and put her husband through medical school.⁵⁴ Giselle Brown, "Princess" (runner-up) of 1967, was the only other married woman of colour who made it to the finalist level. According to Miss Civil Service of 1963, Betty Gittens "was a very striking human being and a very professional, very charming woman. I would imagine that she was probably one of the better ambassadors that they had".⁵⁵

In fact, Gittens' popularity and demeanor made her a perfect candidate as a representative of the "ideal government girl". When asked to describe the reaction of people after Gittens was selected, Suzanne Perry suggested that the

---

⁵³"Tomorrow Miss Civil Service will open the National Tulip Festival", Ottawa Journal, May 17, 1962 p.3

⁵⁴Ibid, p.1. The RA NEWS story published after Betty Gittens won did not mention her race. It was only with the picture that accompanied the article that I was able to determine that she was a woman of colour. See "D O T Belle is RA Queen", RA NEWS, June 1962:p.1

⁵⁵Interview with Suzanne Perry, interviewed by author, Tape recording, Ottawa, Ontario, June 20, 1996

fact that she was married and black may have "offended" some people. According to Perry, "Betty Gittens was not very black". The concept of beauty that prevailed was associated with notions of 'whiteness', but Betty Gittens was "acceptable" because her 'blackness' did not wander too far from that concept. Her professionalism, her charm and the 'lightness' of her skin did not challenge the Anglo perception of beauty and femininity.

But if one did not have a husband (or wife) or "beauty" on one's side, there was always the Marriage Bureau, a "dating service" catering to the single and lonely in Ottawa. The RA NEWS featured an article on the Marriage Bureau written by Mrs. A. Clarke, the manager of the Bureau. Mrs. A. Clarke claimed that,

[w]e work no miracles but we do make a serious attempt to find the right potential marriage partner in every case. We deal only with people seriously interested in marriage.⁵⁶

Clarke commented on the need for such an institution in Ottawa. She wrote about her time in the Civil Service before managing the Marriage Bureau where she recalled listening with "sympathy to the many tales of my fellow workers, men and women, complaining of the dullness and futility of bed sitting room evenings spent watching television"⁵⁷. She noted that although most of the people who confided in her when she worked in the Civil Service had successful professional careers they all felt the "same frustration and emptiness". The role of the Marriage Bureau

---

⁵⁶A. Clarke, "A Little-Known Ottawa Service", RA NEWS, December 1958 p. 26

⁵⁷Ibid., p. 26.

was to 'assist' these otherwise successful but basically shy people to meet each other and eventually get married.

Despite these persistent and incessant pressures to embrace and conform to the ideals of marriage and beauty, the beauty queen title and crown was actively sought by the women in the federal service. Being selected a beauty queen was a very important honour for young women who participated in the contests. In May of 1958, the RA NEWS asked the winners of six departments "How does it feel to be a Queen?". The answers given convey the excitement that came with being selected to represent your department at the "Night of Stars". Anne Therien, Queen of Indian Affairs 1958, said that she was "extremely thrilled and delighted" while Carmen Desloges, Miss National Health and Welfare, offered that "it is a thrill of a lifetime to be selected as queen of a whole Government department".⁵⁸ In fact, all six departmental winners said that being selected was a "thrill". In a sense, the civil service beauty contest was a way to increase morale. It was constructed as an event conducted in the spirit of fun (as well as giving the department an excuse to have a party) downplaying the competitive and oppressive dimension that could be associated with beauty contests in general.

In an interview with Miss RA Queen 1963, Suzanne Perry (formally Murton), refers to the underlying and unavoidable spirit of competitiveness that did surface.

---

⁵⁸"RA ASKS How does it feel to be a Queen?", column in the RA NEWS, May, 1958:p.24.

When asked how she felt the night that she was crowned, Perry replied

Oh, on top of the world! It was a wonderful feeling I was thrilled to bits. Absolutely thrilled to bits because I didn't expect it at all. And this 'wonderful' male who I later married who you now know I am no longer married to said, "oh, you won't win, so and so is going to win" And so and so, was a little too glamorous for them I think... She was very sophisticated I was not very sophisticated. It was just part of her personality. She was a very mature—I still know this woman and she's, I mean, I think she was born sophisticated. Yeah, so I was very surprised because I had not been expecting this at all. I was very excited.⁵⁹

Her sense of competitiveness, however, was only partly in response to the "sophisticated woman" and somewhat directed to her ex-husband. Nevertheless, she reveals in this statement that she knew instinctively that the ideal government girl in the minds of the organizers and the judges was not a glamorous, sophisticated young woman, but a pretty yet sensible young girl. Indeed, the message here is that it is not maturity and worldly women that get rewarded, although Perry's ex-husband and others like him may have felt differently, but 'good', 'wholesome' and 'innocent' looking and acting girls who could rightfully represent the women of the federal civil service.

Being chosen queen of a department or Queen of the Civil Service also gave the winners instant celebrity status. Their pictures and stories made headline news in the Ottawa Journal, the Citizen, and Le Droit. This public display of their 'victory' functioned as a way to affirm and reward their beauty and femininity. They became

---

⁵⁹Interview with Suzanne Perry, interviewed by author, Tape recording, Ottawa, Ontario, June 20, 1996.

'ambassadors' of the Canadian civil service and were asked to numerous social and political functions where they met high-ranking government officials. For example, Miss RA Queen 1966, Carole Fox, met and posed with Prime Minister Diefenbaker for the opening of the RA Stamp Exhibition ⁶⁰ Carole Fox was described as one of the "busiest" of the civil service beauty queens because she travelled to seven Canadian cities in five days prior to the Tulip Festival as part of publicity for the event ⁶¹ Miss RA Queen 1963, Suzanne Perry shared the limelight with Premier E C Manning of Alberta at the opening of the 1963 Tulip Festival.⁶² In a 1968 edition of the RA NEWS, an article listing the different functions that the Queen would have to attend such as major RA events ended with a warning that being a civil service queen, "calls for lots of energy and a good sense of public relations".⁶³

The judges and the prizes were also important incentives that drew women to the beauty contests and spectators to the beauty contest event as well as providing legitimacy. The roster of judges included fashion editors from the major dailies in Ottawa, the Dean of Women at Ottawa University, high-profile women journalists, the Rough Riders head coach, a Rough Rider flanker, renowned local

---

⁶⁰See RA NEWS, January 1966.p.16

⁶¹D Burton, "RA Queen's Past and Present Get Together", RA NEWS, August 1966.p.10.

⁶²Picture accompanying article "A Million dazzling tulips Kick Off tourist season", The Citizen, May 18, 1963 p 5 The Ottawa Journal had a picture of Miss RA Queen 1963 flanked by Premier Manning and the National Leader of the Social Credit Party, Robert Thompson.

⁶³"Between the Lines-Behind the Scenes", RA NEWS, October, 1968.p.4.

businessmen, a former 'Miss Canada', a former 'Mr Canada', Judy LaMarsh (M P for Niagara Falls at the time), Senator Josie Dinan Quart, a Toronto impresario and many other personalities. The judges had score sheets that included categories such as 'posture', 'appearance', 'personality', 'hair', 'sitting' and 'dress' ⁶⁴ Some of the prizes they received included free trips to the West Indies, Europe, New York City (including entertainment) as well as money (up to \$250), diamond rings, pearl necklaces, free modelling lessons and free hair styling sessions. All of this attention and the material advantages that accompanied it meant that these stenographers, typists and secretaries who held low status and low paying jobs were being offered the opportunities of a lifetime.

Although the actual functions that the civil service beauty queen attended were numerous, the one function that was considered the most important and deserved serious attention was to epitomize the 'feminine' image to which all women in the civil service were to aspire. The civil service beauty contests were unique in that they were used to justify women working in a traditionally masculine domain without compromising strict codes of gender difference. Before the influx of women into the service, the definitions of the ideal civil servant were easily captured: you had to be a white male, preferably Protestant, educated, English-speaking (French was an asset) and presumably heterosexual. The presence of

---

⁶⁴Interview with "Anne", Conveyor of the Beauty Contest Committee, 1962 to 1973, interviewed by author, notes, Ottawa, Ontario, June 19, 1996

women challenged this carefully scripted ideal so that male civil servants had to re-negotiate their status as 'masculine' men. With these new definitions of 'proper' masculine and feminine behaviour came new boundaries of gender relations and roles

III.Feminists, "Raquel Burnett" and "Phyllis Diller": Parody and Protest of the Miss Civil Service Beauty Contest

On May 22, 1970, the night Margaret Kennedy of the National Research Council won the "Miss RA Queen" title, a group of women protested in front of the Recreational Association's main entrance. It was only two years earlier that American feminists staged the now famous 'bra-burning' protest (no actual bras were burnt) in Atlantic City against the Miss America Pageant.⁶⁵ The first protest against the Miss Canada Pageant where 10 women from the Toronto's Women's Anarchist Group and the Radical Lesbian-Feminist group ambushed the pageant, was staged five years after the Miss RA protest.⁶⁶ Except for this "small group of female picketers", however, the RA Night of Stars progressed smoothly.⁶⁷

---

⁶⁵For a more on the Miss America Protest see A. Echols. Daring to be Bad: Radical Feminism in America, 1967-1975. (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989), especially pages 92-101 and A. Rivora. Live From Atlantic City. (Bowling Green, Ohio: Bowling green State University Popular Press, 1992). For the 'manifesto' prepared by the American feminists who organized the protest entitled "No More Miss America!" see R. Morgan, ed. Sisterhood is Powerful: An Anthology of Writings from the Women's Liberation Movement. (New York: Vintage Books, 1970), pp.521-524.

⁶⁶I got this information from tapes made by the 10 women protesters about the demonstration after the fact. See Canadian Women's Movement Archives, SR 11/13, 11/14, Miss Canada Pageant Protestors, November 12, 1975. To my knowledge this is the only public record of this protest.

⁶⁷The "National Research Miss Tops 27 Girls for RA Crown" Ottawa Journal, May 23, 1970:p.3.

According to an article in the Ottawa Journal, the protesters were demonstrating against the "degrading" civil service beauty contest. I highlight this particular incident because in the 22 year span of the contests, this is the only evidence of resistance to the civil service beauty contests that I have been able to find.

A less overt critique of the beauty contest was an article that appeared in the RA NEWS on March 1958. According to the article women were "[s]o intent on remaining attractive that many of our national customs are but beauty shows in one form or another". This was an astute and 'subversive' comment for this period because it made an explicit point about the very crux of beauty contests and how woman and the ideal of beauty are used. By the post war period, beauty contests and the various institutions and companies that appropriated the beauty contest model were numerous. This method was so popular because of the strong images that beauty contests constructed around women, ideals of beauty and the myth of female perfection.

The beauty contests that took place in the Canadian federal bureaucracy in the 1950s and 1960s were not dissimilar from their counterparts in various institutions and corporations that appropriated the beauty contest model in the post war period. Selling a product by associating it with a beauty queen or 'beautiful' woman meant big business for the private sector and business interests.

Nowadays commercial firms, football teams and Chambers of Commerce find that beauty contests can be valuable advertising gimmicks, which sell products, boost morale and attract tourists. Miss X's beer of 1958 can

increase the sale of the brew beyond normal comprehension and of course our Miss Grey Cup helps to enliven the game. Apparently any commodity can be made appealing if a beauty contest is used to promote it ⁶⁸

Indeed this association was an accurate one because beauty and beauty contests translate into profit and powerful messages. In particular, plugging a product with a model or a beauty queen was and continues to be associated with the notion that "beauty is good". More importantly, however, there is a presumption that if a beautiful woman thinks something is good then it *must* be good. If associating physical manifestations of beauty with a product was an ingenious advertising gimmick, according to the RA NEWS article mentioned above, the Civil Service Commission should get in on the act.

Departments are busy now selecting their entries among the fascinating pulchritude on their staffs. Perhaps the Civil Service Commission should take over to advertise the benefits of employment in government employment ⁶⁹

Had the Civil Service Commission acted on the suggestion, few would have questioned the appropriateness of the Commission's decision. The reality was that the civil service beauty contests were an effective way to 'market' the government or more accurately, the burgeoning bureaucracy, in the same way that Miss X's beer made a brewing company richer.

Parodies of the beauty contest by fellow civil servants challenged the

---

⁶⁸"Queens From Many Departments To Enter Miss Civil Service Contests" RA NEWS, March, 1958, p 12.

⁶⁹ibid . p 12

messages promoted by the beauty contests. In 1969, Walford Reeves was the only 'man' to participate in the civil service beauty contest. Donned with a sash that read "Misguided Missile", Reeves was the only known drag performer to entertain the audience at the RA Queen Contest ⁷⁰ [see illustration 13]. Reeves' performance that night consisted of an impersonation of Phyllis Diller, the famous American comedian who herself deliberately poked fun at traditional gender codes. Her performances were radical in that they consisted of social satire of prevailing ideals of beauty and feminine behavior in the 1950s and 1960s ⁷¹. Indeed, her performances were so outrageous and subversive that she could be considered the anti-beauty queen. It was her "bitchiness", her "ugliness" and her genderbending that won over gay men, her first group of supporters ⁷².

In 1973, an organizer of the Miss National Archives departmental contest also graced the event with her version of femininity. According to Ginette Bonneau, a runner-up of the Miss National Archives contest, the organizer was introduced as part of the list of contestants as "Raquel Burnett". Raquel Burnett came down the

---

⁷⁰Unfortunately, the only information I have about this particular story is a picture I found on page nine in the June issue of the RA NEWS, 1969.

⁷¹Phyllis Diller started her career as the first stand-up comedienne in 1955. Her stage persona, which had become part of North American popular culture was developed some years later. For a commentary on her career given in an interview, see D Collier and K Bekett, Spare Ribs: Women In Show Biz. (New York: St. Martins Press, 1980), pp 2-6.

⁷²Ibid., p.4. In her interview with one of the authors, Phyllis suggested that "(m)y first group of supporters were homosexuals, the second group and my most avid fans were women". She goes on to say that "there are probably one thousand homosexuals who regularly impersonate me at parties or in small clubs" (see p.5).

aisle "dressed as Carol Burnett when she does the cleaning lady, with her bucket and mop. And then she stopped in the middle of the aisle, and she blew her nose with a lot of noise and then she went on the stage."⁷³ The audience broke out in laughter at the display. Although the organizers' intention was to poke fun for the purposes of entertainment, the message she offered from her impersonation of Carol Burnett's 'cleaning lady' character was the flip side of proper feminine behavior expected of a government girl. In effect, both Walford Reeves and "Raquel Burnett" were able to demonstrate what the ideal notions of beauty and femininity were by using extreme examples of what they were not [see illustration 14]

Except for these instances of 'resistance' towards the civil service beauty contests, the 1950s and 1960s continued to be a period where the majority of women conformed to the traditional prescriptions of femininity, beauty and sexuality. The civil service beauty contests were just one more example of the complex political, social, economic, medical and legal system which together worked to 'reinstate' traditional ideals of gender and sexual codes in the Cold War era. The Recreational Association's beauty contests established boundaries for acceptable social and political behaviour within the civil service. The influx of greater numbers of women was considered a threat to the carefully balanced image of the civil

---

⁷³ Interview with Ginette Bonneau, interviewed by author, Tape recording, Ottawa, Ontario, May 30, 1996

service as a male-dominated space. The beauty contests succeeded in maintaining and reinforcing sexual and gender relations that sustained some semblance of the earlier glory of the Canadian civil service. In other words, the civil service beauty contest was a tool used to maintain and perpetuate the masculine 'male' as the ideal public servant, rational, heterosexual, 'strong' (intellectually and physically), loyal and responsible. Negotiating the parameters set by the notion and image of the 'ideal government girl' became a daily routine for women working for the federal government. Lesbians and women 'careerists' in the civil service who chose to challenge the ideologies of beauty, femininity and domesticity set new boundaries and areas of resistance.

Chapter Three

'Mister Civil Service'?: Defining Masculinity and Sexuality in the Canadian Bureaucracy

How are you going to maintain security while at the same time preserving and maintaining the fundamental rights of the individual? It is a difficult problem. It is so easy to criticize, but it is so much more difficult, having that responsibility, being desirous of maintaining those freedoms, to be able to carry out one's wishes. Loyalty is expected of all Canadians. It is imperative as a quality of public service. There are many cases in which the loyalty of the individual is not in question. But that individual may still not be reliable as a security risk, as was stated a moment ago, because of defects of character which subject him to the danger of blackmail. It is a fertile field for recruiting by the U S S R, where public servants are known to be the companions of homosexuals. Those are the people that are generally chosen by the U S S R in recruiting spies who are otherwise loyal people within their countries.¹

-John Diefenbaker, 1963-

When Diefenbaker made these statements in the House of Commons he was the Leader of the Opposition. Three years had passed since he established the Bill of Rights, Canada's first piece of legislation that formally protected people's fundamental rights. He considered this the "greatest achievement of his political career".² Unfortunately, because they had "defects of character", gays and lesbians were not subject to the same ideals of individual rights to which other Canadians had a legal right. In 1958, Diefenbaker asked the Security Panel "to

---

¹House of Commons, Debates, October 25, 1963, 4049

²J.L. Granatstein et al. Nation Canada Since Confederation 3rd ed (Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Limited, 1990), p. 467

determine whether it was possible to modify existing policy in order to draw a clearer distinction between cases involving character weaknesses, particularly homosexuality, and those involving ideological beliefs" ³ The Security Panel promptly responded to his request and in 1959 embarked on a "lengthy study" of homosexuality as a security risk ⁴

By the mid-1950s, Australian and British intelligence authorities reported that the Soviet strategy for blackmail and recruitment was moving away from using communist sympathizers to gather secret information in order to exploit "human weaknesses" with special attention to the "practice of homosexuality" ⁵ The exploitation of what was considered "socially reprehensible" behaviour supposedly made homosexuality the prime target for Russian hidden cameras and spy traps But the security screening of civil servants is not a Cold War phenomenon According to Larry Hannant, security screening of civil servants in Canada started as early as 1931 and increased during the Second World War This suggests the Gouzenko affair of 1946 was not the beginning of the intensive security screening

---

³R B Bryce Memorandum for the Prime Minister and the Minister of Justice "Security Cases Involving Homosexuality" January 26, 1961 p 2

⁴The document I am referring to here was compiled by D F Wall entitled, "Security Cases Involving Character Weaknesses, with Special Reference to the Problem of Homosexuality" May 12 1959

⁵This information was taken from a document accessed by journalist Terry Penner The document has no page numbers and is a chapter of a larger piece of work which is not in my possession The title of the chapter is "From Royal Commission on Espionage to the Royal Commission on Security 1946-1966"

process in Canada⁶

The Canadian security campaigns against homosexuals inside and outside the government is part of an international context in which other Western countries held their respective purges. Although Canada's purge was relatively late compared to the US, Britain and Australia, the construction of homosexuality as a risk and danger to national security was essentially the same.⁷ The pull towards re-establishing traditional gender codes and the push toward heterosexual hegemony initiated a state-conducted witch hunt against gays and lesbians in the civil service and other institutions such as the military.

This chapter begins with an exploration of the debate over the Mr Civil Service Contest. The debate over whether to have a beauty contest for male civil servants is an illuminating one because it allows for a rare glimpse into what some people believed to be the characteristics that the 'ideal' government man should possess. The purpose of the second section of this chapter is to establish how the notion of national security was entwined with issues concerning gender (hetero)

---

⁶For more on pre-Cold War security screening see Larry Hannant's important book, The Infernal Machine: Investigating the Loyalty of Canada's Citizens (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995). See especially chapter three.

⁷There are many books and articles on the topic of Cold War America and security vetting procedures but for a recent article see D. Johnson, "'Homosexual Citizen': Washington's Gay Community Confronts the Civil Service", Washington History (Fall/Winter 1994-5) 45-63. For an article that deals with this topic in great detail in the British context see L. J. Moran, "The Uses of Homosexuality: Homosexuality for National Security", International Journal of the Sociology of Law, 19 (1991) 149-170. For Canada's purge see the article written by Gary Kinsman, "'Character Weaknesses' and 'Fruit Machines': Towards an Analysis of the Anti-Homosexual Security Campaign in the Canadian Civil Service", Labour/Le Travail 35 (Spring 1995) 133-161.

sexuality and family. The third section contextualizes the Security Panel and the purges it conducted against communists and homosexuals during the Cold War era. An important theme in this section is an explanation of the way in which communism became associated with homosexuality. Section four examines gay and lesbian communities in the 1950s and 1960s. I describe how their emergence and resistance during this period impacted on the security campaigns against them. The fifth section deals with the role of professional psychologists in the formation of the security state during this era. I will focus on determining the context in which the 'fruit machine' took place. Finally, the last section examines Dr Wake's 'fruit machine' and the gender stereotypes on which it was based. Here, the discussion will explore the way in which ideals of masculinity were used to construct notions of loyalty, reliability and sexuality.

1. "Mister Civil Service": Renegotiating the Masculine Men of the Civil Service

In March and April of 1957, the RA NEWS published editorials and the opinions of twelve men and women on setting up 'Mister Civil Service' contests. The debate over having a Mister Civil Service contest centred on what criteria the judges would use in selecting Mister Civil Service. Based on the discussion and editorial in the RA's newspaper, the notion of a beauty contest for male civil servants enjoyed support; of the twelve surveyed only two people and the editor thought that it was a bad idea.

The dissenters rejected this particular variation of the beauty contest.

2 OF 2

PM-1 3 1/2 x 4 PHOTOGRAPHIC MICROCOPY TARGET
NBS 1010a ANSI/ISO #2 EQUIVALENT

PRECISION^{SM} RESOLUTION TARGETS

because they insisted that it would be impossible to judge qualities such as "personality appearance and intelligence". One woman could not fathom the notion of men being 'gazed' at by judges in a room full of women since 'they [the male contestants] would probably blush for shame'.⁸ The double standard concerning the criterion under which men and women should be judged went unnoticed by the people being surveyed. Indeed, it was assumed that 'gawking' at men was inappropriate and embarrassing (the question is for whom?) whereas women were somehow immune from suffering the same 'indignities'. Women, moreover, were not expected to be intelligent⁹, but this was not the case for Mr Civil Service. The point was that a 'true' indication of the 'masculine' man was primarily his intelligence, charm, poise, grooming and his 'looks'. It seems, were considered secondary.

The advocates of the Mister Civil Service contest maintained that physique, mental alertness, cleanliness, neatness and popularity are the features that the "typical government man" must possess.¹⁰ At the suggestion of one man who said that Mister Civil Service should be picked the same way as "the best looking female

---

⁸A comment made by Pat Bradley, in the "RA ASKS Should There Be a Mister Civil Service Contest" column, RA NEWS, April 1957, p.20

⁹Ginnette Bonneau, a runner-up in the Miss National Archives contest, 1973, said in her interview that asking the finalist questions was a mainstay in the civil service beauty contests. However, the questions were not considered 'difficult'. The question she was asked was "do you prefer boys with long hair or short hair?" Her response was that it didn't matter since it had nothing to do with his personality.

¹⁰Characteristics were outlined in an editorial on May, 1957, p.2

is picked in any beauty contest the editor reacted with disapproval¹¹ Another man suggested that the lucky man should be chosen from the fellows with the splendid physiques¹² The best way to proceed then was to have Mister Civil Service compete in swimming trunks thus displaying the body beautiful unlike the women who competed in their office clothes¹³ Revealing the need to maintain some semblance of traditional masculine gender codes, one man insisted that the male contestants cannot just walk on stage like the women because it wouldn't be masculine enough¹⁴ suggesting that some demonstration of strength and athletic ability was in order

The Mister Civil Service Contest never materialized but it reveals the interrelationship between the ideals of masculinity and femininity Male civil servants had to *prove* that they were 'real' men by being able to display physical strength or body mass Political savvy or intelligence were no longer the only skills and traits that the male civil servant had to possess The presence of women meant that as men they had to distinguish themselves from feminine stereotypes such as passivity and idleness This was a difficult thing to do since a job in the civil service was not considered to be physically demanding It is not surprising

---

¹¹ Editorial, RA NEWS, May, 1957 p 2

¹² Comment made by Raymond Gorman, in "RA ASKS How Would You Select A Mister Civil Service?" column, RA NEWS, May, 1957 p 20.

¹³ Ibid , p 20

¹⁴ Comment made by David Lanceman, RA NEWS, May, 1957 p.20

then that one of the greatest concerns around the judging of Mr Civil Service was not just the *display* of the body but a demonstration of strength and thus proof of masculinity. Displaying *only* the body was perceived as insufficient because men were not thought to be 'beautiful' like women: men were supposed to be 'handsome' or 'manly'.

Macleans Magazine was also preoccupied with the idea and image of the ideal male bureaucrat. Like the article 'The Government Girl' by Alan Philips discussed in Chapter Two, the image of the 'Ottawa Man' was the topic of a short article written by Christina McCall Newman in 1962. According to the article entitled 'How to spot the Ottawa Man: a concise guide' male civil servants 'of ambition in the nation's capital relentlessly pursue a single goal: to turn themselves into Ottawa Men'.¹⁵ The article was written based on exaggerated stereotypes of ambitious and well-educated male civil servants. Its intent was to poke fun at the notion of the 'Ottawa Man'. But like the 'Mister Civil Service' contest, the aim of the article is to capture the image most people had of the most powerful of male civil servants. More importantly, however, the article points to issues around masculinity, sexuality and class that were central to the image of the 'successful' Ottawa Man:

In the article, Newman described the Ottawa Man in terms of how he

---

¹⁵C. McCall Newman, "How to spot the Ottawa Man: a concise guide", Macleans Magazine, October, 1962 p 3

dresses his conversations his women [sic] his tastes (food drinks interior decorating) what he does in his leisure time and how and whom he entertains By definition

the Ottawa Man is inconspicuous. He's also highly educated (very often in England as well as Canada) formal in manner, meticulous in speech. He's a snob but a nice snob, a gentle man who nothing common does or mean (he never gossips). He is most like himself when he unavoidably fetches up--at an airport perhaps--next to a Toronto Man, whom he regards as crass vulgar and probably in advertising.¹⁶

This ultimate Ottawa Man would work for External Affairs or Finance, the elite departments in the federal government. Indeed Newman insisted that not *all* male civil servants can be Ottawa Men. In fact, the majority of male civil servants could never work as the top brass in these particular departments because education and middle-class characteristics were considered important requirements to even be considered for these positions. General clerks, technicians or printers could never aspire to be an "Ottawa Man" because most of them did not come to the civil service with university degrees or from the middle to upper classes. At the least, these positions required high school diplomas.

For male civil servants who wanted to emulate the "Ottawa Man", McCall-Newman offered the following instructions on speech, dress, drinking, and dating. According to the article, a well-dressed Ottawa Man always wore a navy suit (even

---

¹⁶Ibid. p 3

in the summer) gold-rimmed glasses and carries an umbrella.¹⁷ He drank sherry wine, ale or Scotch and never daiquiris. His house is decorated with a faded lithograph of the skating pond at Rideau Hall in 1872,¹⁸ a frayed Oriental rug and 'comfortable chairs'.¹⁹ When he entertains, he invites 'important' people from 'abroad' or other Ottawa Men. His parties are professionally catered by caterers who only work for Ottawa Men. He only associates with people of colour, according to Newman, when he invites them over for small dinner parties which 'often feature one black, brown or yellow guest from Abroad' who comes with his Oxford accent and his wife 'in a sari'.²⁰ The Ottawa Man was never a person of colour himself. Indeed, very few of men from visible minority communities made it to the upper echelons of the civil service.

The Ottawa Man was heterosexual and virile but not flamboyant. Like the rest of his life, his wife and by extension, his sexuality, had to be 'tastefully understated'.

He never appears with the big, built blondes in bouffants who are popular elsewhere; he doesn't even dream about them. His wife tries for the little-brown-hen look, shiny clean undyed hair, cashmere sweater, string of pearls, black silk dress, white kid gloves, old beaver coat - maybe a small tatty mink stole. She knows what to do at a formal dinner, she belongs to the National Gallery Association, sits on the Toy Testing Committee, and ushers

---

¹⁷ Ibid., p 3

¹⁸ Ibid., p 3

¹⁹ Ibid., p 3

at the Ottawa Choral Society.²⁶

The ideal wife of the Ottawa Man was a high class version of the typical government girl. She was well-groomed, college or university educated and from the middle to upper classes. Indeed, unlike most stenographers and secretaries working in the civil service, the Ottawa Man's wife did not have to be coached on how to modulate her voice or how to sit. Indeed, it was the Ottawa Man's wife whom these women working in the steno pools tried to imitate. Marrying a more sophisticated rendition of the typical government girl was as much a political move as it was socially sanctioned behaviour for the Ottawa Man. Indeed, the ideal wife described here was not sought out for her intelligence or her sex appeal; rather, she was sought out for her ability to understate her sexuality and boost his masculinity.

The 'typical government girl' then was not a lone figure in the collective imagination. The 'Ottawa Man' was as much a *symbol* of the ideal male bureaucrat as 'Miss Civil Service' was a *symbol* of the model government secretary or stenographer. The former was an image of a career man and the latter an image of a 'respectable' but temporary profession for women. Indeed, the occupational divisions that were at the core of these very different notions of the male and female government worker demonstrate that the divisions were critical not only to the actual operation of the government machinery but also crucial to the

---

²⁶*Ibid.*, p. 3

social and gender organization of the Canadian bureaucracy. It was only in the context of the impending Cold War and the gender anxiety that it generated that these stereotypes become not just examples but clear messages of what were considered appropriate goals and aspirations for male and female civil servants.

II. National Insecurity and Heterosexual Hegemony: Gender, Sexuality and Family

In the Cold War era, domestic safety or national (internal) security became synonymous with international security. As a result, the state, media and medical experts made connections between national security, gender, sexuality and family in a systemic and institutionalized effort to re-establish polarized and traditional gender, class and race divisions blurred by the war. North America during the war years was a time when moral restraints were loosened, encouraging women, gays and lesbians, and radical racial groups to establish a collective sense of legitimacy.²¹ But during the age of McCarthyism, various committees were established to ferret out the subversive and evil elements. These committees mobilized to tighten orthodox and conventional ideals of masculine men.

---

²¹The idea that the Second World War was a "force that loosened moral restraint" comes from G. Smith, "Commentary: Security, Gender, and Historical Process," *Diplomatic History* 18 (Winter 1994) p. 81. See also G. Smith, "National Security and Personal Isolation: Sex, Gender, and Disease in the Cold-War States," *The International History Review* 2 (May 1992) 221-440 for an insightful and important look at a gendered and sex analysis of the history of the Cold War in the United States and the use of 'disease' analogies.

domesticity and the family". Indeed, Johnson argues that the anti-homosexual purge of the McCarthy era in the US had very little to do with national security. [i]nstead, it reflected an underlying anxiety over the bureaucratization and urbanization of Washington, changes largely precipitated by the New Deal and World War II.²³

The growing atmosphere of national insecurity led to a rallying cry for the family and heterosexual hegemony. Family stability was considered the only antidote to moral fallout.²⁴ The result of this conceptualization of the family made the lives of people who did not conform a living nightmare.

According to the common wisdom of the time, normal heterosexual behaviour, culminating in marriage, represented maturity and responsibility; therefore, those who were deviant were by definition, irresponsible, immature and weak. It followed that men who were slaves to their passions could easily be duped by seductive women who worked for the communists. Even worse were the 'perverts' who presumably had no masculine backbone.²⁵

One of the greatest anxieties that prevailed during this period was the fear that women would refuse to go back into the home and that women would achieve

---

²³For more on the House Committee on Un-American Activities see W. Goodman, The Committee: The Extraordinary career of the House Committee on Un-American Activities (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux Inc., 1968).

²⁴See D. Johnson, "Homosexual Citizens: Washington's Gay Community Confronts the Civil Service", Washington History, Fall/Winter 1994-95 p. 46.

²⁵E. T. May, Homeward Bound: American Families in the Cold War Era (New York: Basic Books, 1985) p. 94. For a discussion of the Canadian conceptualization of 'family stability' and the reintegration of family values see Annelee Götz, "Family Matters: The Canadian Family and the State in the Postwar Period", left history, 1(2) Fall, 1993 pp. 10-13.

²⁶E. T. May p. 94.

sexual independence outside the parameters of marital/familial relations.²⁷ The notion of deviance then was not only a way to identify gays and lesbians but also women who resisted or challenged the gender norms and social order prescribed by political and medical experts.

In North America women were called upon to embrace domesticity in service to the nation.²⁸ The rise of suburbia and the accompanying barrage of popular articles in the 1950s which pushed women to the periphery was characterized as the ultimate duty to your country in two important ways. First, women were told that if they did not embrace domesticity and dedicate their lives to becoming good wives (i.e. serving their husbands' emotional and sexual needs) and mothers they were to blame for "a host of society's problems [such as] homosexual sons, juvenile delinquents, mental cripples, wandering and alcoholic husbands, and school truants."²⁹ Second, because the notion of national security was linked to the idea that a strong nation is a nation that is based on family where young men grow up to be responsible, virile citizens and young women to become dutiful and submissive wives, the maintenance of the happy united family was constructed as the sole most important goal women should

---

²⁷A. Golz, p. 28

²⁸E. T. May, p. 102

²⁹For a lengthy and provocative discussion on women and suburbia in Cold War Canada see V. Strong-Boag, "Home Dreams: Women and the Suburban Experiment in Canada, 1945-60" Canadian Historical Review LXXII (4), 1991 p. 481

have²⁹

It is no coincidence then that it was in this period and under these conceptualizations of the family and by extension the advantages of heterosexuality that the notion of momism captured the collective imagination. Momism was first coined and popularized by columnist and novelist Philip Wylie, author of Generation of Vipers in 1942 and later medicalized by Edward Streker and his studies on its effects on sons and daughters³⁰. In the loyalty-security discourse of the period, sex pervert and homosexual ostensibly referred to homosexual men. As such, lesbians were largely invisible in the context of this discourse although still perceived perhaps as a more subversive danger because of their ability to remain undetected, except if you were a masculine woman. Masculine women were subversive because of their refusal to engage with the ideology of marriage, heterosexuality and domesticity. Momism, however, was one way in which treasonous moms³¹ could ruin their daughters and thus endanger the nation by pushing them into the evil vortex of lesbianism.

Lesbianism represented a pathological interruption in the normal development process toward motherhood. Treasonous moms could poison their daughters against heterosexuality by describing it as

---

²⁹This term is taken from A. Götz's article, p. 10.

³⁰J. Terry, "Momism and the Making of the Treasonous Lesbian," paper presented at the Canadian Historical Association, Montreal, Québec, August 26, 1995, p. 5-6. A brief discussion on momism can also be found in E. T. May, Homeward Bound (1988), pp. 96-97.

³¹J. Terry, p. 10.

repulsive. In addition, a mother's lack of affection or her own masculinity could induce lesbianism in a daughter. In fact, many descriptions of demonic moms implied that their bitterness and frustration was a form of latent lesbianism.⁴²

It is not entirely clear whether or not Wylie would have characterized his mom as masculine. Perhaps more accurately, the mom of momism was a hyper-feminine woman whose evilness manifested itself in her aggressiveness and manipulative power. It was aggressiveness and manipulation that made her an unfit and dangerous mother (or monster?). She could no longer be considered a good example of what a nurturing mother and wife was supposed to be and in that sense her behaviour and sociopathic actions could easily push her daughter into the black hole of lesbianism. Indeed, lesbianism was the antithesis of motherhood and patriarchal constructions of femininity.

As we shall see later, the language used to describe gays and lesbians is pervaded with the idea that their psychological development has been thwarted. This thwarted development meant that gays and lesbians are immature and thus unreliable and irresponsible. By constructing us in this fashion, Strecker and for a Canadian example, Wake, created the illusion that the undeveloped gender consciousness (also described as gender inversion) associated with homosexuality can interrupt the smooth transition through heterosexual life stages and therefore create a society where 'perverts' and 'chaos' run rampant.

---

⁴² Ibid., p 10

Masculine lesbians or butch lesbians because their appearance and mannerisms openly challenged feminine behaviour became the target of an army of psychologists.³³ Indeed lesbians who were considered 'femmes' were not considered to be 'true homosexuals'.³⁴ Femmes were not perceived by medical experts as 'true homosexuals' because they did not exhibit or suffer from gender inversion and thus their behaviour could be easily altered with psychotherapy. The masculine lesbian on the other hand, was not so easily transformed to normalcy because her homosexuality was based on her refusal to comply with appropriate feminine behaviour and some argued her belief in the 'emancipation of women'.

[L]esbians were labelled deviant to the degree that they symbolized, represented and actualized lives that defied strict gender distinctions during a period of profound anxiety regarding gender roles and the post-war restoration and maintenance of 'normal' family life. Thus, increasingly, masculine appearance became the yardstick against which lesbianism was measured.³⁵

Not surprisingly, when Wake instructed the RCMP to find fifteen lesbians for a pilot test for his 'fruit machine', the assistant Commissioner responded that it was 'difficult' for the Force to locate lesbians in the civil service. The RCMP's 'failure' to connect with the Ottawa lesbian networks and their apprehension to approach

---

³³A history of lesbians in the Canadian military remains to be written. For an American example see, Allan Berubé, Coming Out Under Fire: The History of Gay Men and Women in World War Two (New York: Plume Books, 1990). See also A. Berubé and John D'Emilio, "The Military and Lesbians during the McCarthy Years", Signs, 9(4), 1984: 759-775.

³⁴D. Penn, "The Meaning of Lesbianism in Post-War America", Gender & History, 3(2), Summer 1991 p 196.

³⁵Ibid. p 197.

normal women because the subject they purported would offend them demonstrates the RCMP's construction of female sexuality as invisible.³⁰ Perhaps the civil service beauty contests were very successful in maintaining the status quo or what was more likely lesbians were able to cloak themselves by acting out the stereotypes on the surface while being careful to live their lives as lesbians in more private spaces.

It was the overt challenge to gender roles and heterosexual hegemony that caused the state and the medical experts to organize against homosexuals and for the sanctity of the family. The fear of the Other that was at the crux of gender anxiety in the Cold War period led to attacks on people who did not conform. By constructing homosexuals as immature and therefore unreliable, the loyalty security discourse established gays and lesbians as easy prey and pawns of the Soviet invasion.

III. The Security Panel, Communism and Homosexuality

The issue of defining 'loyalty' and its corollary 'security risks' proved to be a taxing effort for the members of the Security Panel working within the context of the Cold War era. Under the category of 'policy', a 1952 cabinet directive declared that "loyalty to our system of government is an essential qualification for

---

³⁰A memo to D.F. Wall, Secretary of the Security Panel, 25 January 1963, from J.R.M. Bordeleau, Assistant Commissioner, Director, Security and Intelligence, RCMP, p. 1.

employment in the public service of Canada ³⁷ Indeed, one of the most fascinating features of the security campaigns in the Cold War period is the inability by the perpetrators of the campaigns to offer a concrete definition of loyalty. Loyalty meant having an uncritical position or opinion of the prevailing political and moral stances of the government. Anyone who challenged this system by, for example, reading a pamphlet on Marxism or cruising at Major's Hill park (a gay male cruising ground in Ottawa), was being subversive and thus a "security risk" to his/her country.

The construction of the former Soviet Union by the US government and McCarthyism in the 1950s and 1960s as the great enemy from which the US must protect the world created a state of intense fear at all levels in the West. The 'Red Scare' in both the US and Canada led to security checks on 'suspected Commies' and later, homosexuals. The Canadian Security Panel played a crucial role from 1959 to 1969 in the regulation of homosexuality and the enforcement of heterosexuality. Security experts soon turned their attention towards the "risks posed by character and moral weakness".³⁸ The perception was that these individuals were 'subversive' elements because they suffered from "character weaknesses" which increased their chances of being blackmailed. Consequently,

---

³⁷ R. Whitaker Cold War Canada: The Making of the National Insecurity State, 1945-1957 (Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994), p.183. This directive remained in effect with minor modifications to be in effect until 1963.

³⁸ Ibid., p 184.

they constituted 'security risks' based on their vulnerability as targets for Soviet spy agents. Homosexuals were constructed as a "national, social and sexual danger in Canada" ³⁹ National security involved more than just protecting physical territory from the 'evil' Russians; it also meant protecting certain entrenched value-systems and institutions such as heterosexuality and capitalism

The notion that 'national security' was threatened by the existence of communists and homosexuals enjoyed public acceptance in both countries ⁴⁰ The connection between communists and homosexuals was made so the homosexuals were "seen primarily as either directly associated with communism and spying for the USSR or being blackmailed and thus a risk to 'national security'" ⁴¹ One reason for this connection was spurred by the sensationalized cases of gay security officials Guy Burgess and Donald MacLean in Britain during this period. Although these men revealed secrets to the Russians, they did so on the basis of their ideological affiliation and not their respective sexual orientations. In his report to the Security Panel entitled, "Security Cases involving Character Weaknesses with Special Reference to the Problems of Homosexuality", D F. Wall mentioned these cases as examples of civil servants who posed real threats based on their

---

³⁹G.Kinsman "'Character Weaknesses' and 'Fruit Machines': Towards an Analysis of the Anti-Homosexual Security Campaign in the Canadian Civil Service", Labour/Le Travail, 35(Spring 1995):p.137.

⁴⁰G. Kinsman, Regulation of Desire: Sexuality in Canada. (Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1987), p.120

⁴¹Ibid., p.120.

'disloyalty' (he also mentioned a Canadian case but the name was blackened by CSIS) Yet, he points out that "though none had character weaknesses, [they] were apparently motivated by ideological factors rather than by fear of blackmail". In addition, the document makes references to the notion that homosexuals have "a defiant attitude toward the rest of society" and it is that 'defiant attitude' that supposedly leads homosexuals to be easily exploited by Soviet intelligence services. This rebellious attitude coupled with evidence of 'character weakness' made homosexuals easy recruits for the communist trap.

The association between homosexuality and communism made by governments in advanced capitalist societies can be illustrated by an excerpt from R G Waldeck's, "The International Homosexual Conspiracy" that appeared in Human Events, September 29, 1960

homosexual officials are a peril for us in the present struggle between West and East: members of one conspiracy are prone to join another ...many homosexuals from being enemies of society in general become enemies of capitalism in particular...Another reason for the homosexual-Communist alliance is the instability and passion for intrigue for intrigue's sake, which is inherent in the homosexual personality...⁴²

As the "general enemies of society" and based on their "personality" tendencies to search out "intrigue for intrigue's sake", homosexuals were perceived as willingly embracing communism in order to undermine capitalism. Although not explicitly referred to, homosexuals and their "character weaknesses" are also linked to the

---

⁴²As quoted in G. Kinsman's book, Regulation of Desire (1987):p.121. The excerpt was taken from Human Events and reprinted in the New York Native, Sept.21/Oct.4, 1981:p.13.

notion that gay people threaten the social order of gender relations by challenging patriarchal gender roles and differences. The notions of same-gender sex as a 'non-productive' act and the construction of communism as the potential nemesis of market economies were often linked. Indeed, if by virtue of their "deviant personalities", homosexuals can transgress and challenge the sexual 'norm' of heterosexual 'procreative' sex, then they can be employed by communist states to threaten the 'stability' of capitalist hegemony in the West.

The number of people who were subjected to the notorious field investigations and surveillance of the RCMP during the witch hunts is extraordinary. According to Whitaker, 37 000 cases of alleged "communist sympathizers" were filed by the RCMP by 1950, the RCMP constantly complained to backlog.⁴³ In the case of the specific homosexual investigations, the Directorate of Security and Intelligence's (DSI) 'index' system contained 8 200 names by 1967.⁴⁴ According to the annual reports starting in 1959, the number of names that were added to the 'index' increased approximately 1 000 every year. This number included people employed with the federal government *and* citizens in the Ottawa area.

Heated debate with the Security Panel occurred over these 'field investigations' conducted by the RCMP. During a "special meeting" of the Security

---

⁴³R. Whitaker, "Origins of the Canadian Government's Internal Security System, 1946-1952", Canadian Historical Review, LXV(2), 1984:p.169.

⁴⁴Annual Reports of the Directorate of Security and Intelligence, 1966-1967. The numbers increased with each report from 1959 to 1967.

Panel on June 24th 1960 Norman Robertson, Under-Secretary of State for External Affairs

expressed some concern at the statistical approach to the problem which the R C M Police appeared to be making. He pointed out the danger of this kind of investigation developing into a sociological survey in which the security aspects were lost sight of, and suggesting [sic] that it did not serve our present purpose to make a determination of the probable proportion of homosexuals in our populations ⁴⁵

In the same document, these views were shared by R.B. Bryce, Secretary to the Cabinet and Chairman of the Security Panel, the Honourable S.H.S. Hughes, Chairman of the Civil Service Commission, and D.F. Wall from the Privy Council Office. The Commissioner of the RCMP, on the other hand, felt that the spilling over of investigations was necessary to eradicate the 'problem' that presented itself in Ottawa in this period. The debate over how narrow or wide the investigation should be illustrates that at times the different interests of the various State institutions clashed. It also allows for a glimpse at how 'security' and 'protection' of 'secrets' were defined by the Security Panel. More important, however, the debate demonstrates that the anti-homosexual purge was not just concerned with questions of espionage and blackmail but with how to eradicate the presence of homosexuals not just in the civil service (that was taken as a given) but in the entire city of Ottawa.

The report that D.F. Wall compiled and submitted to the Security Panel in

---

⁴⁵D.F. Wall, Secretary to the Security Panel, "A special meeting of a quorum of the Security Panel" Minutes June 24, 1960:p 2

1959 included information on the royal commissions and general precautions from Australia, the United States and the United Kingdom regarding espionage and homosexuality. He specifically concentrated on how these countries dealt with homosexuality and socialism as security risks. According to this document, the Canadian state would have been following the lead of other countries' anti-homosexual security regimes. Wall pointed out that as early as the mid-1940s Australia was concerned with the issue of 'character weakness' as well as communist sympathizers and the exploitation of these individuals by the Soviet security service for confidential information.⁴⁶

In his section, "United States and United Kingdom Views on the Security Problem Constituted by Homosexuality", Wall quotes Admiral Roscoe H. Hillenkoetter, Director of the United States Central Intelligence (early 1950s) extensively. Admiral Hillenkoetter referred to homosexuals as "moral perverts". He also believed that "the consistent symptoms of weakness and instability which accompany homosexuality almost always represent danger points of susceptibility from the standpoint of security".⁴⁷ The Admiral insisted that 'one pervert brings other perverts. They belong to "the lodge, the fraternity" and that

---

⁴⁶D.F. Wall, "Memorandum to the Security Panel: "Security Cases Involving Character Weaknesses, with Special Reference to the Problem of Homosexuality" May 12, 1959 p.6. Wall consulted the Australian government's "Royal Commission on Espionage" for his section on Australia's security regime against gays and lesbians.

⁴⁷Ibid , p.7.

[i]n addition, homosexuality frequently is accompanied by other exploitable weaknesses, such as psychopathic tendencies which affect the soundness of their judgement, physical cowardice, susceptibility to pressure, and general instability. So, in addition to his homosexuality, a pervert is vulnerable in many other ways ⁴⁸

The quotations by Hillenkoetter go on in this vein throughout the section in Wall's document. In terms of their influence on Wall and the Security Panel who read them in Wall's report, it would have been clear that to some, homosexuals were regarded as dangerous human beings who were to be barred at all costs from access to secret information. From the perspective of those who accepted this view, Canada was late in instituting its purge against homosexuals in its civil service. In fact, Canada was considered 'behind the times' in comparison to other major Western countries who had initiated their respective campaigns as early as the late 1940s.

It was within this context that the modern bureaucratic organization emerged. Weber characterized the modern bureaucratic organization in terms of "universalism, legalistic standards, specialization, and routinization of task".⁴⁹ The bureaucratic organization inevitably moulded what is known as the "'bureaucratic personality'-methodical, rational, prudent, disciplined, unemotional and

---

⁴⁸ibid, p.8.

⁴⁹M.Savage and A. Witz, "The gender of organization" in M. Savage and A. Witz, eds. Gender and Bureaucracy (Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1992), p.16.

preoccupied with conformity to expectations"⁵⁰ Essentially, the bureaucratic personality came to be understood as characterized by 'masculine', 'professional' traits. The presumption before women were introduced into the bureaucratic organization was that by virtue of his heightened "rational, disciplined, unemotional state", the public servant was also asexual. But the presence of women meant that a heterosexual erotic subtext had to take precedence over the homoerotic one that the old male-dominated bureaucracy enjoyed. With new definitions of proper masculine and feminine erotic behaviour came new boundaries of gender relations and roles.

IV. Gay and Lesbian Communities in the 1950s and 1960s: Pockets of Resistance

It was not accidental that the widespread witch hunts on gay people coincided with the emergence of organizations such as the Mattachine Society and the Daughters of Bilitis especially in the United States⁵¹. The gay and lesbian organizing that emerged in this period was possible due to the new subcultures that were being established in large city centres during the Second World War. Most of the 'subculture' activity was created through gay bars that began to dot the US

---

⁵⁰D. Greenberg. The Construction of Homosexuality. (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988), p 446.

⁵¹The Mattachine Society was established in Los Angeles in 1951. Its founders were gay men with left leanings. The Daughters of Bilitis was established out of the desire to socialize with other lesbians. It was founded by lesbians in San Francisco in 1955. For more on the history of the Mattachine Society and the Daughter of Bilitis see J. D'Emilio Sexual Politics, Sexual Communities, The Making of a Homosexual Minority in the United States, 1940-1970 (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983).

and, to a lesser extent, Canada⁵² Political and social groups like the Mattachine Society and the Daughters of Bilitis were established thanks to the networks and subcultures that developed in Second World War and as a result of urbanization These gay and lesbian organizations and the communities that were established around them made homosexual *identity* part of public discourse and thus visible The existence of these gay organizations and communities and the 'alternative' lifestyle that was associated with them threatened the heterosexual, patriarchal based family unit Some psychoanalysts complained about how these 'new' communities made it easier for their gay male patients to find sexual partners⁵³

John D'Emilio puts forward an interesting thesis in his essay "Capitalism and Gay Identity" concerning the oppression of lesbians and gays and the existence of gay communities as preconditions for "propelling" the mass movement of the late 1960s (in particular the Stonewall Riots, 1969) and the early 1970s⁵⁴ The increased visibility that the gay subculture afforded and the oppressive actions of the State to repress them via the witch hunts is an important connection

As the subculture expanded and grew more visible in the post-World War II era, oppression by the State intensified, becoming more systematic and inclusive The Right scapegoated "sexual perverts" during the McCarthy

---

⁵²For more on the development and evolution of gay subcultures in the US and Canada see John D'Emilio's essay, "Capitalism and Gay Identity" in H. Abelove et al., eds. The Lesbian and Gay Studies Reader, edited by (New York: Routledge, 1993), pp.467-476 and for Canada, see Gary Kinsman's book, The Regulation of Desire (1987), especially chapter eight.

⁵³J. D'Emilio (1993), p.472.

⁵⁴Ibid. p.472

era Eisenhower imposed a total ban on the employment of gay women and men by the government and government contractors. Purges of lesbians and homosexuals from the military rose sharply. The FBI instituted widespread surveillance of gay meeting places and of lesbian and gay organizations, such as the Daughters of Bilitis and the Mattachine Society.⁵⁵

There are many more examples of the repressive and oppressive efforts of the conservative heterosexual State. However, the above serves to illustrate that the anti-homosexual purges in the civil service were initiated partially in response to the emergence of gay and lesbian communities and organizations. The cyclical relationship between the explosion of gay liberation movements in the early 1970s and the oppressive tactics of the State to subvert homosexual identity demonstrates the dialectical relationship between the forces of repression and resistance.

V. The Medicalization of Homosexuality: The Psychologist's Role in the Security State

Studies conducted in 1948 and 1953 by US sexologist Alfred Kinsey, also contributed to the public knowledge that homosexuality was more widespread than previously thought. Kinsey's studies challenged heterosexual notions that homosexual acts were exclusive to the 'sick' and 'perverted' in society but more importantly, the Kinsey "perspective on homosexuality served to inform Canadian medical, psychological and popular literature in the 1950s and 1960s"⁵⁶. Although relatively 'positive' studies like those conducted by Kinsey were consulted, the

---

⁵⁵*Ibid.*, p 472.

⁵⁶G. Kinsman (1987), p 115

prevalent moralistic attitudes of doctors and the stereotypes they reinforced meant that studies like those established by Kinsey and Evelyn Hooker were considered 'exceptions'

Literature reviews by contemporary medical historians of psychological and public health/hygiene medical journals (among others) demonstrate the prolific writings on the topic of 'sexual inversion' in the 1950s and 1960s. The essays that were published on the topic of homosexuality assisted in constructing definitions of homosexuality and gender relations. Canadian psychologists in this period would have been well-versed in works written by Sigmund Freud (1943) Havelock Ellis (Studies in the Psychology of Sex, 1936), R von Kraft-Ebing (Psychopathia Sexualis, 1922), Wilhelm Stekel (Bi-sexual Love-The Homosexual Neurosis, 1922), and G W Henry (Sex Variants A study of Homosexual Practice, 1948). These texts and the 'scientific' studies, and articles that they inspired were instrumental in constructing homosexuality as 'deviant' sexuality.

Although articles on male and female homosexuality date as far back as the eighteenth century, we can describe the medical writing that flourished in the twentieth century in two waves⁵⁷. The years 1903 to 1925 mark the first wave

---

⁵⁷ The first and second waves are described in detail in Karen A. Martin's, "Gender and Sexuality: Medical Opinion on Homosexuality, 1900-1950", Gender and Society, 7 (2), June 1993:249-254. The third wave of writings is a period I have designated for my purposes here. The period, 1950-1973 heralds in new studies on homosexuality that challenge notions of homosexuality as "pathological". New statistics and theories as well as new debates on excluding homosexuality from the DSM-III introduced a plethora of material in 'defence' of homosexuality.

where medical writings concentrated on making connections between lesbianism, masturbation, nymphomania, and being a suffragist ⁵⁸ Doctors postulated that lesbianism was the reason for the suffrage movement in the early 1900s the root behind "androphobia" or fear of men and that masturbation was the first sign of homosexuality in women As resistance and response to the challenges to gender and sexual roles that the rise of feminism posed, medical doctors had to construct feminism as a "lesbian" plot so that participation even voting, meant that women were somehow "pathological" and "deviant" Medical doctors, then, "were more interested in deviant gender behaviour than sexual behaviour" ⁵⁹ The issue of homosexuality as a perverse sexual act was not necessarily the site of contention for the medical profession It was the challenge to patriarchal definitions imposed on women instigated by women's suffrage (along with the power shift that it would precipitate) which concerned the doctors

In the second wave, 1934 to 1942, medical articles were primarily concerned with "constitutional factors" or physiological factors and the presence of so-called 'masculine' and 'feminine' traits in homosexuals (male and female) In this wave, doctors advocated the use of "tests", scales, measuring or generally physiological characteristics as determining homosexuality Also, there was a tendency to attribute supposedly homosexual 'personality characteristics' that would form the

---

⁵⁸ *ibid.*, p.248

⁵⁹ *ibid.*, p.249

basis of most stereotypes of what constitutes homosexual behaviour. The medical writings would discuss, for example, body proportions, pitch of voice, size of penis and clitoris or "abnormal" distribution of body hair to distinguish homosexuals from 'normal' heterosexuals⁶⁰

Other examples of "personality characteristics" such as musical talent or the ability to cook and sew were seen as sure signs of homosexuality in men. Resistance or inability to sew and cook were seen as masculine tendencies inherent in lesbians. Sexuality and gender were strongly linked in the medical writings of this wave with the added element of the "constitutional factors" that could be quantified with "scientific" tests and instruments.

After the Second World War, medical writings were influenced by two schools: psychoanalysis (1950s and 1960s) and behaviourism (1970s) which concentrated on explaining the 'treatment' of homosexuality⁶¹. Psychoanalytic theories insisted that homosexuals were responsible for "the rise in crime, murder, racism, societal chaos" and the weakening of the family because gay people were "aggressive, masochistic, destructive, deceitful, neurotic, obsessive, narcissistic,

---

⁶⁰*Ibid.*, p. 252-3

⁶¹D. Greenberg, *The Construction of Homosexuality*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988), p. 421. See especially chapter nine, "The Medicalization of Homosexuality". It is important to note that 'homosexuality' as a classification was removed as a psychiatric disorder from the DSM in 1973.

paranoid, and psychotic" ⁶² These 'medical' theories contributed to the irrational hatred of homosexuality and its construction as a personality disorder. Governments in the 1950s and 1960s used these psychological theories to justify surveillance, blacklisting, and legal prosecution. It was primarily in this sense that the State and the medical experts used each other to legitimate and justify their oppressive policies.

"Reversing" or 'curing' homosexuality was a chief objective for psychologists or medical experts since they believed that 'deviance' was mainly caused by

an immature level of sexual adjustment because of (a) constitutional deficiencies (b) the influence of family patterns of sexual adjustment or (c) lack of opportunities for psychosexual development ⁶³

By the 1950s doctors were basing themselves on Freudian psychoanalysis and the rise of the psychosomatic approach to 'understanding' sexual behaviour ⁶⁴. The medical profession continued from the nineteenth century to create definitions and classifications of 'types' of sexual behaviour. The psychiatric 'experts' began to scrutinize sexualities that did not conform to procreative results. The medical and legal institutions of society defined heterosexuality, matrimony and the nuclear family as the model. Heterosexuality and family became the norm on which the

---

⁶²P. Stevens and J. Hall, "A Critical Historical Analysis of the Medical Construction of Lesbianism" International Journal of Health Services, 21(2), 1991 p 296

⁶³J.K. McCreary, "Psychopathia Homosexualis", Canadian Journal of Psychology, vol 4 (June, 1950):p.69

⁶⁴G. Kinsman (1987), p 115.

Cold War state was based.

The medical experts were able to control and regulate homosexuality with the support of 'scientific' method. By identifying the 'causes' of homosexuality as either genetic deficiency (physiological) or growing up in an 'unhealthy' (read psychologically unstable) environment (usually the blame was put on the mother, whether it be for male or female homosexuality), treatment ranged from surgical removal of a "tumour" in the brain to institutionalization, where "sex psychopaths may be segregated for as long as necessary from society while they are being treated. ".⁶⁵ The conclusions that were drawn from these studies on homosexuality were widely accepted because they did not go against the "grain of contemporary norms", rather medical experts were able to translate into sophisticated scientific language what was increasingly perceived as a real and concrete social problem.⁶⁶ The national hysteria associated with the eugenics movement and the need in that period to identify and eliminate the 'undesirables' from Canadian society meant that connections were being made between the decline of social norms and values and the presence of these so-called 'undesirables'. Physicians who saw 'psychologically' deficient people as 'pathological' not only defined and prescribed 'proper' sexual behaviour, their 'diagnosis' and their suggestions for treatment reflected the social mores of the period.

---

⁶⁵---"Sex Deviations", McGill Medical Journal, vol. XIX, January, 1950:p.59-61.

⁶⁶K. Martin., p.247.

By bringing the subject of homosexuality within the respected and scientific realm of knowledge, the dominant heterocentric discourse was able to define what was normal and what was deviant. The minute classification of individual behaviour was characteristic of the State through its legal, medical, and social welfare apparatuses. What takes place as early as the late nineteenth century is a proliferation of categories or subjectivities of sexual deviance within official discourse.⁶⁷ Ideologies of the 'nuclear' family were set up as the reference point or 'normal' site for healthy sexual and familial relations. Thus, the State instituted the criminalization of homosexuality in order to control it. We see the manifestation of this criminalization of 'deviant' sexual behaviour with the British Wolfenden Report (1957) and Canada's McRuer Commission.⁶⁸

The Wolfenden Report and the McRuer Commission (also known as the Royal Commission on the Criminal Law Relating to Criminal Sexual Psychopaths)

---

⁶⁷R. Harrison and F. Mort, "Patriarchal Aspects of Nineteenth Century State Formation" in P. Corrigan, ed. Capitalism, State Formation and Marxist Theory. (London: Quartet, 1980), p.105.

⁶⁸In terms of describing and identifying the historical context within which the anti-gay purge took place, the McRuer Commission was influential in making issues of sexual deviancy part of public discourse at both the political and social levels of society. The Commission travelled to 13 cities and received submissions from approximately 100 organizations, heard evidence from over 100 individuals, filed over 120 exhibits and produced 1860 pages of transcripts of public hearing proceedings, 159 pages of transcripts of private hearing proceedings and a 200 page Final Report. For more on the McRuer Commission see R. Champagne, "Psychopaths and Perverts: The Canadian Royal Commission on the Criminal Law Relating to Criminal Sexual Psychopaths, 1954-1958", Canadian Lesbian and Gay History Newsletter, #2, September, 1986:p.7-9. The Commission relied heavily on medical, legal, police and psychiatric attitudes towards homosexuality and established as a recommendation that the term 'criminal sexual psychopath' be replaced with 'dangerous sexual offender'. Homosexuality was constructed as a serious social danger that must be subverted and regulated by the justice system and by trained medical authorities. Ultimately, the Commission was an example of how heterosexual and patriarchal hegemony manifested itself through legal and medical official discourse.

were both established in 1954. The British study is important for my purposes here because it specifically investigated the subject of homosexuality and prostitution and it was referred to extensively in the Final Report of the Canadian Royal Commission published one year later. Dr. Wake was one of the medical researchers who worked on the McRuer Commission. It was probably through his association and participation with the McRuer Commission that Dr. Wake came into contact with Dr. G.D.W. Cameron, Deputy Minister of National Health and Welfare. Dr. Cameron was the government official who recommended Dr. Wake and other 'psychiatric advisers...who might assist us [the Security Panel] in research and the development of testing technique [regarding homosexuality]'.⁶⁹ Dr. Wake's interest in homosexuality was piqued by his work with the Commission since he submitted his "Report on the Special Project" in 1962, four years after the Final Report of the McRuer Commission was published.

The medicalization of homosexuality enabled the state to use 'expert' discourse on the 'deviant' personalities of gays and lesbians to launch its surveillance system. Although by the late 1950s, studies conducted by experts such as Evelyn Hooker were challenging the general descriptions and

---

⁶⁹R.B. Bryce, "Letter to Commissioner C.W. Harvison", December 20, 1960. In addition to Wake, Cameron recommended other local medical experts whose names were blacked out by CSIS. One of these medical experts was a psychiatric advisor to the Department of Veterans Affairs and the other was a psychiatrist who had a private practice in Ottawa. He also recommended Dr. Ratz, Director of the Medical Advisory Services in the Department of National Health and Welfare, for a "public service point of view". As far as the present research on this area is concerned, Gary Kinsman and I have not been able to ascertain whether or not these doctors participated in any way with the "Special Project" that Wake and his team compiled in 1962 for the Security Panel.

classifications of homosexuals as 'immature' and 'defective', the momentum of the Cold War crushed these tiny victories for gays and lesbians. In the following section, I will discuss in detail the gender stereotypes that stood at the core of the 'fruit machine'. The aim here is to use the example of Wake's detection machine to demonstrate how gender anxiety infiltrated the theories and frameworks which informed the plethora of 'scientific' studies and tests which flourished in the Cold War era.

VI. Gender Codes and "Character Weaknesses": The Fruit Machine and the Construction of National Danger

The question of homosexuality is a contentious area, especially as social mores change. It is in fact, demonstrated by a large number of case histories, that homosexuals are special targets for attention from foreign intelligence services. What is more, there seems to us clear evidence that certain types of homosexuals are more readily compromised than non-deviate persons. However, we feel that each case must be judged in the light of all its circumstances, including such factors as the stability of the relationships, the recency of the incidents, the public or private character of the acts, the incidence of arrests or convictions, and the effect of any rehabilitative efforts. In general, we do not think that past homosexual acts or even current stable homosexual relationships should be a bar to employment with the public service or even to low levels of clearance. We do feel however that, in the interests of the individuals themselves as well as in the interests of the state, homosexuals should not be granted clearance to higher levels, should not be recruited if there is a possibility that they may require such clearance in the course of their careers and should certainly not be posted to sensitive positions overseas.⁷⁰

-Report of the Royal Commission on Security(1969)-

---

⁷⁰Report of the Royal Commission on Security. (Ottawa: Queen's Printer, 1969), p.36

This seemingly 'tolerant' and 'logical' stance taken by the commissioners of the Royal Commission on Security of 1969 was certainly a far cry from the position the Security Panel and the RCMP were taking only a decade earlier. And yet gays and lesbians were still being characterized as security risks in the late 1960s and historians of this period have very little reason to believe that this construction of gays and lesbians did not continue well into the 1970s and 1980s.⁷¹

An article in Maclean's Magazine published in 1954 asked the question, "Can McCarthy Happen Here?" and according to the author the answer was "yes...Canadians have no cast-iron guarantees against judgement without fair trial".⁷² Other articles published throughout the 1950s and 1960s engaged in the debate on whether or not a democratic country should allow the RCMP to impinge on people's right to privacy,⁷³ demonstrating that there certainly existed public knowledge of the vast surveillance system or at least, the possibility of its existence. Not surprisingly, articles of this sort fueled the fear people already had of the 'evil Russians' as well as feeding the anxiety over the existence of the 'Other'

---

⁷¹Gary Kinsman is especially interested in showing that well into the 1970s and 1980s, gays and lesbians were still barred from the civil service by procedural security checks.

⁷²B. Fraser, "Can McCarthy Happen Here?", Maclean's Magazine, March 15, 1954:14.

⁷³See for example, S. Katz, "RCMP: Inside Canada's Secret Police", Maclean's Magazine, April 20, 1963:13; K. Lefolli, "Editorial: What the new parliament can do about the political police: stop trial by dossier", Maclean's Magazine, April 20, 1963:4; B. Fraser, "The New, Slick, Quiet Soviet Spies In Our Midst", Maclean's Magazine, July 25, 1964:16; A. Lower, "Is The RCMP a threat to our liberty?", Maclean's Magazine, July 6, 1957:p.?. All of the articles with the exception of the columns and editorials mentioned the homosexuals as one of the many groups under surveillance by the RCMP. The local daily, the Ottawa Citizen, had one editorial on the debate as early as the 1950s. See "Security and Individual Freedom", Ottawa Citizen, March 20, 1950:p.13.

(especially the 'deviant' and 'perverted' homosexual). Ironically, these articles also made people afraid of the RCMP: the organization that was supposed to 'protect' them from the subversive 'spies' in their 'midst'. They exposed the possibility of a 'police state' very much like the 'coercive' police and state officials of the Soviet Union. This fear, in turn, encouraged a system of self-surveillance and isolation. Although some of these articles actually contested or questioned the RCMP's 'right' to invade people's privacy, the articles supplied the knowledge that like it or not, the RCMP was watching. And almost as if to warn its readers, the Civil Service News reprinted extracts of an article published in the U.S. News and World Report (a right-wing Washington-based new magazine) entitled, "How Canada Fights Spies. Security of State is put Before that of Individual".⁷⁴

The need to establish a machine or a psychological test that could undeniably identify the 'homosexuals' was part of that growing fear of the 'Other', not somewhere in the Soviet Union, but right next door or at the next desk. The notion that homosexuals were 'infiltrating' the civil service in record numbers was perceived as destroying the 'rational' nature of the civil service because,

sex within bureaucratic (and largely male) organizations is constructed as complicating relationships between subordinates and superiors destabilizing the 'impartiality', 'objectivity' and 'rationality' of the new bureaucratic order. This is related to the social construction of middle class and professional masculinities in capitalism as 'rational' and 'objective' in character. We can also see this in a rather different way in relation to the

---

⁷⁴"How Canada Fights Spies: Security of State is put Before that of Individual", Civil Service News, April 1956: 3-4.

military, where extreme prohibitions were implemented against sex between men which was viewed as 'disruptive' of military order.⁷⁵

The 'destabilization' of the bureaucratic order caused by homosexuals was a result of "heterosexuals [who] have some sort of negative emotional feelings when homosexuality seeps into the atmosphere around them".⁷⁶ It is important to note the language used because . . . illustrates that like most medical experts in this period, Wake believed that homosexuality was fashioned into a 'disease' that once air-born could potentially contaminate others

Detecting homosexuals was supposedly a very difficult task because most of the time homosexuals could not be easily distinguished from heterosexuals or were able to conceal their 'secret' even from the discriminating eye of the medical expert but this was not always the case. According to Wake, some homosexuals,

do not care that their proclivities are known- rather they appear to insist that they be noticed. "Visibility" is high because of mannerisms, dress and places frequented.⁷⁷

Indeed, it was these 'overt' homosexuals with their 'mannerisms' (read 'effeminate' gestures) who were considered the most 'unsuitable' for work in the civil service. Highly 'visible' homosexuals directly challenged the notion of masculine men by

---

⁷⁵G. Kinsman, "Inverts, 'Psychopaths' and 'Normal' Men: Historical Sociological Perspectives on Gay and Heterosexual Masculinities" in T. Haddad (ed) Men and Masculinities: A Critical Anthology. (Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press, 1993), p.10

⁷⁶F.R. Wake, "Report on Special Report", December 19, 1962:p.2.

⁷⁷Ibid., p.4.

playing with sex-appropriate behaviour. They were inherently unreliable for the same reasons that women were considered 'unsuitable' for work in the upper echelons of management: 'effeminate' men, like women, were 'weak' and 'soft' both physically and intellectually.

The homosexuals who successfully 'concealed' their 'dark' secret, on the other hand, were equally dangerous but for different reasons. Men and women who on the surface could 'pass' as heterosexual were considered 'subversive' and 'vulnerable'. Their 'vulnerability' stemmed from the fact that they had a 'secret'. But although the 'secret' did not necessarily make them 'disloyal', they were ultimately construed as 'unreliable'. Heterosexual men, for example, were 'normal' or devoid of 'character weaknesses' because as heterosexual men, they have internalized socially acceptable gender behaviour. The assumption here is that *all* heterosexual men were emotionally 'stable', physically strong, and virile and therefore would not contribute to the climate of gender anxiety. Like the notion of 'gender inversion', 'character weakness' was constructed as warped gender identification.

In Chapter One, I mentioned that in his word association list, Wake had designated certain words as having "homosexual meaning". It is important to analyze these 'homosexual' words for the stereotypical meaning they reflected in the minds of the medical experts. But analysing the so-called "neutral words"⁷⁸ can

---

⁷⁸Ibid , p.11. This phrase was used by Wake

also be a critical exercise in decoding what Wake and his band of experts believed to be "normal", heterosexual words and meaning. Words like breast, farm, hammer, blonde, stiff, radiator, erect, politician, stroke, cigar, child, newspaper, fight, and asphalt were all considered "neutral words". In fact, they actually did not mean anything in themselves but they are significant in the context and next to the words designated as homosexual which were considered to heighten the underdeveloped gender consciousness of gay and lesbian subjects. In fact, words like 'breast', 'child', 'cigar' and 'radiator' were not 'neutral' because language itself is invented. The assumption being made here by Wake was that the so-called 'homosexual words' were part of a homosexual 'lexicon' that would generate some reaction by people who were familiar with their hidden meaning.

Wake included in his Report a section on "treatment". The crux of his argument here was that the optimal situation would be to find a method to change the 'unwanted' behaviour or personality trait that was at the base of homosexual identification and tendency. Wake posited that it would be "advantageous to have a method of treatment which would alter only the unwanted behaviour in the individual, thus rendering him safe to employ".⁷⁹ The precondition, however, for modification of behaviour is conveniently located in the homosexual. Wake reiterates in this section that "mental health personnel these days prefer not to

---

⁷⁹Ibid , p.15.

... speak of a cure but rather of a change to controlled sexual behaviour, which would be more comfortable for the subject. " 80

Wake cited works by Caprio and Brenner who found that the 'problem' of homosexuality magically disappears as "general character problems are solved". Despite the fact that Hooker's study in 1957 demonstrated that the 'majority' of homosexuals were 'average to superior in adjustment', Wake continued to insist that there existed trends that contradicted Hooker's findings. He quoted works that emphasize the use of drugs (notably anti-depressants) and aversion therapy as viable options for 'treatment'. Wake was particularly impressed with aversion therapy because of the aspect of "deconditioning-reconditioning". This was consistent with his view that a method of control and regulation of homosexuality would have had favourable 'results'.

Establishing what was considered acceptable masculine and male sexual behaviour in the civil service was as much the topic of debate as defining ideals of beauty and femininity. Wake's 'fruit machine' and the figure of the Ottawa Man ensured that male civil servants were as susceptible to a system of control and regulation as women were to the advice columns on how to sit, stand and speak. Men and women together had to *play their part* in the gender game in order to secure the safety and future of the nation. Indeed, masculine men had to 'protect'

---

⁸⁰*Ibid.*, p.15.

the nation from *outside* and *inside* 'intruders' whose aim was to destroy the patriarchal and capitalist social order. The systemic attack on gays and lesbians who were constructed as 'deviants' because they did not conform to prescribed gender and sexual roles was 'necessary' in the name of national security.

Conclusion

In 1993, Michael Fortier sent his application and picture to the Miss Ottawa Rough Rider contest. For the first time in its history, the Miss Ottawa Rough Rider contest was allowing men to run as contestants. According to an article in Capital XTRA!, an Ottawa gay and lesbian bi-monthly, Fortier believed he had as good a chance at winning the title because of his knowledge of football. Unfortunately, when it was discovered that Michael Fortier, a.k.a, Michelle Ross, was a local "female impersonator", he was disqualified. According to Gisele Gibbs, the contest coordinator, "I'm sure he is a talented individual and he seems to be a wonderful person, but this is not the place for that sort of thing" ¹ The only other male candidate, KOOL-FM DJ Chris "Hollywood" Michaels", felt that although "[d]rag can be fun to watch...I don't think that it would be socially acceptable for a female impersonator to enter the contest" ²

Fully aware that his 'night' job would not be considered appropriate for the contest organizers and sponsors, not to mention Rough Rider fans, Fortier did not send in a photograph of himself as 'Miss Ross' and even offered to sign a waiver stating that he would not show up at Rough Rider games in drag. This, however,

---

¹A. Biggs, "Drag Queens need not apply Pageant a rough ride for Ottawa man", Capital XTRA!, October, 1993:p.8

²Ibid., p.8.

was still not enough for Gibbs. Indeed, his 'night' job not only put his masculinity in question but also cast doubt on his sexuality. Chris Michaels, perhaps in an attempt to erase any doubts that *his* masculinity was 'unclear', said that he would not wear high heels and a skirt to the contest since he was "representing a male sexuality". According to Michaels, drag "doesn't represent the true meaning of football, and it makes a mockery of both men and women".

This one contemporary example of how issues of femininity, masculinity and sexuality are central to the notion of beauty contests helps illustrate the significance of writing and exploring their history. Michael Fortier made a lot of people nervous, he was gay, a drag queen and proud of it. Perhaps the fact that he had a good knowledge of football, a male-centered and homoerotic game, increased the anxiety levels that much more. What is important here, however, is that this episode in the history of the Miss Ottawa Rough Rider contest resonates with many of the issues that this thesis has analyzed.

This thesis has attempted to show how the civil service beauty contests and the anti-homosexual security purges, although two seemingly unrelated events in the history of the Canadian bureaucracy, exemplified how the various governmental institutions dealt with gender anxiety in Cold War Ottawa. Whereas the Miss Civil Service contests were a 'public' display of the gender and sexual codes of this period, the supposedly 'secret' anti-gay /anti-lesbian security regime also defined acceptable gender behavior by purging those government workers who did not

conform

Clearly, the beauty contests and the security purge can be seen to be related only when they are examined as part of the wider context of social anxiety in the 1950s and 1960s. During this period, state authorities and medical experts, for example, created a discourse designed to force women back into the home and 'reclaim' men's proper place in society after the social disruptions of the Second World War. Women were told that like their efforts on the home front during the war, their duty in the 1950s and 1960s was to return to their kitchens and play the role of the dutiful mothers and wives that nature 'intended' them to be³. They were told the 'nation' needed them to bear and rear future generations with good, strong moral values. It was only in a country full of children brought up with traditional ideals of feminine and masculine gender codes that the nation would be strong enough to fight the 'forces of evil', namely communism and its sinister sister, homosexuality.

Being under the 'gaze' of the people who packed the RA Centre's auditorium or the psychological 'gaze' of Dr. Wake and his associates did not make life in Cold War Ottawa easy or simple. The models that the "ideal government girl" and the "Ottawa Man" set for female and male civil servants who worked in the lowest grades of the bureaucratic hierarchy could be constraining and damaging. Gays

---

³E. T. May, *Homeward Bound*, (New York: Basic Books, 1988), p. 102. Elaine Tyler May argues that experts tried to convince women to "embrace domesticity" by "infusing" women's domestic roles "with a sense of national purpose".

and lesbians were considered 'abnormal' and 'deviant' because they transgressed gender and sexual norms by producing the 'homosexual' as

the emotional, effeminate, weak, subversive, conspiratorial, rebellious, revolutionary, corrosive, dark, dangerous, sensuous, irrational, unstable, and corrupt. It is through the production and deployment of this specific regime of representation that the homosexual is produced as a threat to the state, the nation, and national security.⁴

This thesis has attempted to show that although the loyalty-security discourse claimed that gay men and lesbians were dangerous because they could be blackmailed, the underlying fear was that their existence posed a 'threat' to the heterosexual hegemony that was critical for defending conservative gender roles.

By the 1950s and 1960s issues of masculinity, femininity, beauty and (hetero)sexuality became effectively the property of certain arms of the state and medical experts. The sexual and gender division of the sexes was used as the defining principle around which both public and private spaces were organized. The ghettoization of women in stenographic pools and the administrative support staff ensured that the federal government, according to the Glassco Commission cited in Chapter One, had one of the worst records of institutionalized occupational sex segregation among other capitalist countries. I have argued in this thesis that the civil service beauty contests served to legitimize the subordination of female government workers by constructing them as sex objects. Although I have only

---

⁴L. J. Moran, "The Uses of Homosexuality: Homosexuality for National Security", International Journal of the Sociology of Law, 19(1991):p.161.

alluded to the potential sexual opportunities and danger that the government community afforded, a historical analysis of this particular aspect would allow for a more nuanced understanding of how the notion of occupational sex segregation may have impacted on the lives of working women

But to be selected Miss Civil Service was considered an honor and a privilege. The publicity, popularity and material advantages that came with acquiring this title translated into instant celebrity status. For many of the women who worked in overcrowded working conditions with no hope of promotion past Grade 1, the notion that as Miss Civil Service you were considered an ambassador of the Recreational Association and by extension the civil service was a very exciting prospect. Not surprisingly, then, the beauty contests in the civil service remained popular events until the very end.

The 'fruit machine', on the other hand, was a device that even 'straight' RCMP officers who were asked to 'participate' in the pilot tests refused. Ironically, their refusals to participate was based on the fears and doubts that it was 'unreliable' and might 'unjustly' label them as a "fruit", thus its name⁵. Indeed, researchers of the anti-homosexual security campaigns know that gays and lesbians were tested for Wake's 'special project', but the 'results' were inconclusive. The main purpose of the 'fruit machine' for this thesis had been to

---

⁵See J. Sawatsky. Men in the Shadows. (Toronto: Doubleday Canada, 1980), p 133

demonstrate the gender stereotypes that were at the core of the 'scientific' research on which the fruit machine was based.

Gay men experienced many more injustices at the hands of the security regime than lesbians because, (1) men had access to the jobs that required 'secret' or 'top secret' security clearances and (2) gay men *publicly* transgressed the moral order. In other words, gay male sexuality was public in the sense that it took place in parks and had a more organized social network. The networks of underground bars, hotels, and restaurants frequented by gay men in Ottawa in the 1950s meant that the RCMP could locate and raid them. In fact, raiding bars or parks and rounding up gay men was one of the ways that the RCMP and the Ottawa police were able to make 'deals' with informants for names that they could add to their cardex and files. The physical spaces that gay men carved out made it easier for the police to construct them as a 'public danger' or more accurately, a threat to the public morality.

It is important, however, to mention that the security purge was not just directed at civil servants at the upper level of management but spilled over to gay men who did not work for the government but lived in the greater Ottawa area. The evidence of actual experiences⁶ and the number of names collected in this period

---

⁶Gary Kinsman is primarily concerned with writing the history of the anti-homosexual security campaigns from a bottom-up approach. Consequently, his research is chiefly based on the actual experiences of gay men and lesbians who were directly affected by the purge. From the interviews that he has conducted, we know that gays were fired or transferred to less-sensitive positions and that gays in the Ottawa community who did not work for the government were also caught in the

in gay and lesbian history are disturbing. The idea that given the opportunity the members of the Security Panel, the RCMP and local psychologists set up surveillance nets to ferret out gays and lesbians and constructed us as "sexual perverts" who possessed "character weaknesses" is perhaps just as frightening. Yet by plunging into these uncharted waters we expose the structures of prejudice and surveillance that made it possible and gain knowledge that may help to prevent a gay purge from recurring.

When Chris "Hollywood" Michaels asked the rhetorical question, "[c]an you imagine going to a 5th grade class to promote the Ottawa Rough Riders in drag?", he underestimated the significance of his question. Michaels intended to point out how ridiculous it would be for a drag queen to compete in a beauty contest, but instead he voiced his outrage towards men who play with images and ideals of femininity, masculinity and sexuality. He also pointed to the beauty contest as a tool for advertizers and a conveyor of proper gender and sexual behaviour. He also showed us the importance placed on the beauty contest and by extension the 'beauty queen' as role model and ambassador of good, clean fun supposedly associated, in this case, with the Ottawa Rough Riders. This small incident in the history of beauty contests is one example of how beauty contests are arenas for contesting ideals of gender and sexuality, as well as mirrors of the times we live in

---

surveillance net. For more on this please see Kinsman's article "'Character Weaknesses and 'Fruit Machines'"..... Labour/Le Travail, 35 (Spring 1995):133-161.

Illustrations

Illustration 1

Who Will Be Miss Civil Service Of 1952?

Miss Civil Service of 1952 will be chosen at the RA Night of Stars on March 28.

In 1950 it was D.V.A.; in 1951 Trade and Commerce. Which Department will win in 1952! It may be yours.

Your Department has as much chance as the next one. All you need is a good-looking girl. From what we can see (and we can see well) there are a lot of good-looking girls in the Civil Service. And your Department has its quota.

So get busy and have your Department make an entry. It is not too soon to choose now. Then climb aboard the band-wagon and voice voriferous approval of your choice at the RA Night of Stars.

A word to the above-mentioned good-looking girls — Miss Civil Service is not an empty title. Tangible rewards await the winner. And all for beng chosen from a feld of 17,000 to be Miss Civil Service of 1952. What a way to make change!

This is an example of an announcement for the Miss Civil Service contest. It is important to note the language used. It is not clear what exactly was meant by 'change', but one can only assume that the meaning is related to the influx of women the 1950s.

[RA NEWS, January, 1952:p.1]

Illustration 2

The Limerick Corner

If you have a favourite limerick, why not send it in and be eligible for the monthly prize which is a Famous Players theatre ticket?

The selection of the winner is made on the 15th of each month. All limericks become the property of the RA. Address your entries to the Limerick Editor, c/o RA Office, 243 Lisgar Street, Ottawa.

**THE
WINNING
LIMERICK**

DRB has a Steno named Shay,
Who works for a Mr. MacRae;
Her first name is Polly —
She sure is a Dolly,
And, of course, she belongs to
RA!

The winning limerick - this month was submitted by Orville Patterson who is a Security Guard at the Defence Research Board.

One of many limericks and cartoons that cluttered the pages of the RA NEWS in this period. Like this example, most of these limericks and cartoons objectified women and show the sexism female government workers were exposed to on a daily basis.
[RA NEWS, February, 1958 p.4]

Illustration 3

This is the only cartoon that 'poked fun' at the beauty contest. Indeed, it suggests that at least one person may have perceived the event for what it was: an exercise in objectification and the eroticizing of female civil servants [RA NEWS, March 1954 p 14]

Illustration 4

Although we can only assume that Reddick wanted to 'enjoy' the glamour and 'beauty' that made Marilyn Monroe a superstar, this picture reveals that Reddick was more like a the lady you invite for tea with her veiled eyes than a 'sex-bomb'.
[Maclean's, September 1954:p 19].

Illustration 5

TWO QUEENS — Shown above is Alderman Archle Lavigne of Cornwall (representing the Mayor of that town) introducing Miss Canada of 1954 (left) to Miss Civil Service of 1954 (right). See full story on this page.

(Photo by Newton)

Miss Canada 1954 was the glamorous, sexy beauty queen, this time winning 'appreciative' glances from both Mr. Lavigne and Miss Civil Service 1954 Betty Burton, in this instance, seems to represent the 'girl-next-door' [RA NEWS, September, 1954 p.20]

Illustration 6

After the "Night of Stars", the civil service beauty queen and the Princesses had their portraits taken. This picture is an example of what the 'ideal government girl' was supposed to look like: wholesome, innocent, gracious and the opposite of sophistication. [RA NEWS, April 1953: p.10]

Illustration 7

THE WINNERS — Shown here are the choices of the Judges to "reign" at RA during 1968. The Queen, Miss Vicki South, is flanked by Princesses Miss Barbara Warr (left), and Miss Debbie Cuning.

By 1968, the crown worn by Miss Civil Service 1952 had changed to a tiara. Although by this period, fashion required 'shorter' skirts and dresses, the ideal government girl still conformed to traditional gender codes. The idea was to exemplify professionalism and femininity. [RA NEWS, June 1968 p.4]

Illustration 8

It really isn't necessary to explain the above picture. This is the display of beauty you would have seen at the 1968 RA Queen selection on May 10. Thirty-one beautiful girls competed for the coveted crown.

The purpose of this picture is to show what the 'Night of Stars' might have looked like in 1968. Even by the late 1960s, the number of contestants participating in the civil service beauty contests was still very high. [RA NEWS, June 1968, p.4]

Illustration 9

This picture did not accompany the article that outlined the stereotypes in the article discussed in Chapter Two. This picture is an example of what Martha-the-Magnificent may have looked like. Like the stereotype in the article, this picture shows a motherly and efficient secretary [Industrial Canada, September 1965 p.29]

Illustration 10

If 'Sylvia-the-Sex Bomb' was supposedly a 'dangerous' secretary because she presented sexual temptation, this picture is an example of what the 'seductress' may have looked like. Note that unlike the previous picture of 'Martha-the-Magnificent', this secretary is not working and smiling, instead, she is leaning confidently against an inactive typewriter, staring suggestively. [Industrial Canada, September 1965: p.29]

Illustration 11

MISS CIVIL SERVICE OF 1958 TO BE SELECTED ON MAY 12

THE FIRST DEPARTMENTAL CONTEST—The Dominion Bureau of Statistics, for the first time this year, to select a queen to be entered in the Miss Civil Service contest at the Coliseum on May 12, 1958. The queen, standing in the center, and holding the trophy for winning the title of Miss DBS, is Martha

Lemire. The other contestants are, left to right, Diane McRae, Marie Claire Brûlée, Claire LaFrance, Donna McKay, Donna Guibault, Heather Giles, Isabel Brown, Naureen Stead, Raymonde Hégin, Claudette Laurin and Donna Mutter. Absent when the photo was taken was Merg McNulty.

This is an example of what a typical departmental contest may have looked like. Notice here the participants and winner wore clothing considered appropriate for 'the well-dressed government girl' described in the 'Feminine Fancies' column of the RA NEWS. [RA NEWS, March 1958: p 1]

Illustration 12

Tips on Beauty Culture For RA Queen Hopefuls

Before the beauty contest, all contestants were 'coached' on what to wear, how to walk on stage and how the event would progress by the coordinator. In 1963, Nancy Palmer organized a 'course' opened to all contestants and female civil servants called 'Tips on Beauty Culture'. This 'course' was part of a series of 'courses' on beauty and dieting. [Ottawa Journal, May 11, 1963: Saturday section, p.38]

Illustration 13

"Misguided" Missile — Bill Lee of CKOY, the emcee at the RA Queen Contest May 23rd, helps "Phyllis Diller" with her mike prior to "her" performance. Walford Reeves did an excellent job of entertaining those present.

Although his intention was to entertain the audience, Walford Reeves, in fact spoofed the civil service beauty contests, not only by coming in drag but also by choosing to impersonate Phyllis Diller. With his 'performance', he was able to demonstrate the problematic images of femininity and beauty that were at the core of the beauty contest. [RA NEWS, June 1969: p.9]

Illustration 14

OPENING OF THE 1961 LADIES' SOFTBALL SEASON — The 1961 Ladies' softball season opened with Mrs. Betty Spohn, Ladies' Softball Convenor, presenting crests to the teams. Pictured here are left to right Dorothea Ferguson, RA Queen of the Year, Mrs. Noella Rayer, Captain of the CMHC team,

Miss Dot Forrier, Captain of the Custom team, and Mrs. Betty Spohn, Ladies' Sports Programmes. It is hoped that the Ladies' Softball teams will this year report their results into the RA News, reports on their activities were missing year.

(Photo: Andrew M.)

The two softball captains shown here between Miss RA 1961 and the older, conservative Betty Spohn, are examples of how some women who did not want to conform turned to non-traditional sports as a safe haven. [RA NEWS, July, 1961: p. 10]

Appendix

Interview Schedule

Preliminary Questions

- (1) Where were you born? When you first moved to Ottawa, how would you describe your social status?
- (2) How much money did you make per month working for the government when you first started working?
- (3) How long did you work in the civil service?
- (4) Which department did you work for?
- (5) What was your position? What "grade" were you?
- (6) Was your supervisor male or female? If female, what was she like?
- (7) How old were you when you first worked for the federal government?
- (8) What was your living arrangement when you first came to live in Ottawa?
- (9) When you moved to Ottawa after being offered a job did the government offer you a room at the Laurentian Terrace?
- (10) What were some of the attitudes people had towards single women living alone or with in other living arrangements while working in Ottawa during the 1950s and 1960s?
- (11) Did you join the Recreational Association? If yes, why? What activities did you join?
- (12) Do you remember which activities or sports or courses were the most popular or most attended by women in the years that you were a member of the Recreational Association?
- (13) How important a role did the Recreational Association play in the government community other than offering athletic facilities?

Beauty Contest Questions

Ask if the respondent has any paraphernalia from participating in the beauty contests, such as sashes, crowns, trophy, jewellery, rules and regulations, pictures

(14)How did you hear about Miss Civil Service?

(15)What role did your RA departmental representative play in organizing the beauty contests?

(16)What year were you crowned Miss Civil Service or after 1960, RA Queen of the Year?Did you participate in other beauty contests? Do you remember if any previous or subsequent beauty queens participated in other beauty contests?

(17)Who were the judges the year that you won the title?

(18)Where did the pageant take place the year that you were crowned?

(19)What were some of the functions/public events that you attended as Miss Civil Service?

(20)How would you describe your experience regarding your public appearances as Miss Civil Service Queen?

(21)How did men react to your victory? How did women react to your victory? Did your social life change as a result?

(22)How did you feel when you were crowned Miss Civil Service? Did you have a chaperon?

(23)The *RA NEWS* mentioned that the Night of Stars and the Miss Civil Service contest was the "highlight" of the year How important was this event to you? Your friends? The community? Why do you think it was considered a highlight?

(24)As Miss Civil Service or RA Queen, what did you consider your role to be? What do you think the organizers felt your role should be?

(25)Did you have a practice night before the actual "Night of Stars"? If yes, can you remember some of the things they had you do in preparation?

(26) Was there a manual or rule book of some sort that the RA gave you to prepare for the beauty pageant?

(27) Were you told what the historical origins were of the civil service beauty contests?

(28) What was the attitude towards married women competing in the beauty contests?

(29) Do you have a sense of what the average age was of the women who competed in the beauty contests?

(30) Can you remember what the atmosphere was like the night that Miss Civil Service was selected?

(31) What role did the "Princesses" (the two runner-ups) play during the year of their reign?

(32) Do you know of any connections between Miss Civil Service or later, RA Queen of the Year and Miss Tulip?

(33) Can you remember any other titles other than the departmental titles that were associated with the government and were considered important as the Miss Civil Service title?

(34) How were the departmental queens chosen? Were women nominated by their department or were there beauty pageants at the departmental level where contestants were selected by judges? If there were beauty contests at the departmental level, who were the judges? If the winner was nominated, who nominated them?

(35) What do you think made the Miss Civil Service crown so popular among the women who worked for the government? Do you remember if there were people who did not think that the beauty contests were a good idea?

(36) When announcing the upcoming Miss Civil Service contest, the *RA NEWS* suggested that whoever was chosen Miss Civil Service was considered the "ideal government girl"? Can you remember to what extent the women knew and worked with on a daily basis "fit" this "ideal" or attempted to emulate it?

(37) Why were contestants only allowed to compete in office clothing? Did the

contestants have to answer questions, participate in a talent section or demonstrate any specific skills to help the judges select the winner?

(38)I have not been able to determine the how many people from visible minority communities worked for the civil service in the 1950s and 1960s? Do you recall how many women from visible minority communities worked with you?

(39)Were the civil service beauty contests advertised all over the city or were they really only a source of entertainment for the people who worked for the civil service?

(40)According to my research, local business donated their products as prizes for the beauty queen and her princesses. Did you at any point in your reign advertise for their store at public events? If yes, can you remember the conditions of your arrangement?

Security purges questions

(41)Part of my research also involves the activities of the security state regarding "subversive elements" in the civil service. Did you have any knowledge about fellow workers who were fired or transferred to less "sensitive" positions because they could not live up to the conditions of their security clearances?

(42)[If can't answer this question follow up with the following question/statement]-In my research I found an article in the *Civil Service News* entitled "How Canada Fights Spies". The article was a US document about the Canadian security state that was reprinted. It made references to the active investigation of civil servants. I was wondering how prevalent the surveillance of civil servants was and how conscious people working for the government were that they were being watched?

(43)Is there anything else you would like to add about your experience as Miss Civil Service?

Questions for organizers of the civil service beauty contests:

(44)When did you start working for the civil service?

(45)What was you position when you first started your job?

- (46)How many years did you work for the civil service?
- (47)When did you decide to work for the Recreational Association?
- (48)What was your role in the organization?
- (49)When did you become involved in the beauty contests?
- (50)Can you recall what the historical origins were of the civil service beauty contests?
- (51)Why do you think the beauty contests were so popular?
- (52)Did the RA actively solicit local businesses for their donations or did local businesses volunteer to contribute to the beauty contests?
- (53)How popular were the beauty contests in the local Ottawa community?
- (54)To what extent did the Civil Service Commission participate in the Miss Civil Service contest?
- (55)Why did the title change from "Miss Civil Service" to "RA Queen of the Year" in the 1960?
- (56)What expectations do you think the RA had in terms of the role that Miss Civil Service/RA Queen played as a representative of the federal government and women in the civil service?
- (57)How would you describe the "ideal government girl" of the 1950s and 1960s?
- (58)Did Miss Civil Service have a chaperon? If yes, how was the chaperon chosen?
- (59)What were the rules and regulations for the contest? What qualifications or traits were the judges looking for?
- (60)Who recruited the judges? Can you remember what their qualifications were?
- (61)Why did the civil service beauty contests end in 1972? Who decided to end

the contests?

(62)What affect to you think the civil service beauty contests had on the morale of government employees? On women in the civil service?

(63)Is there anything else you would like to add about your experience as an organizer of the Miss Civil Service Contest/RA Queen of the Year Contest?

Sample

Consent to Participate

I have read the information letter describing the purposes and the tasks involved in participation in a study on the civil service beauty contests, 1950 to 1973, which is being conducted by Patrizia Gentile of the School of Canadian Studies at Carleton University. I further understand that should the information I provide be used in her thesis, publications or for teaching purposes, my identity will/will not remain confidential. I acknowledge that I may withdraw my consent to participate at any time.

This study has been reviewed by, and has received ethics clearance, through the School of Canadian Studies. This Office will receive any complaints or concerns with regard to your involvement in this study.

Participant's Name (please print) _____

Participant's Signature _____

Witness's Signature _____

Date ____/____/ 1996
Day Month Year

Supervisor's Name: Dr. Deborah Gorham (613) 520-2600 ext 6645
Graduate Supervisor's Name: Dr. Katherine Arnup (613) 520-2600 ext 4031

Bibliography

Primary Sources

"A Million dazzling tulips Kick Off tourist season". The Ottawa Citizen. May 18, 1963:5

Archibald, K. Sex and the Public Service. Ottawa: The Queen's Printer, 1970

-----, "Men, women, and persons". Canadian Public Administration 16(Spring 73) 14-24

Biggs, A., "Drag queens need not apply Pageant a rough ride for Ottawa man". Capital XTRA!, October 22, 1993:8

Bryce, R B. Letter to Commissioner C W. Harvison. December 20, 1960

Bryce, R B. Memorandum for the Prime Minister and the Minister of Justice "Security Cases Involving Homosexuality". January 26, 1961

Annual Reports of the Directorate of Security and Intelligence, 1959-69

Fraser, B., "Can McCarthy Happen Here?", Maclean's Magazine, March 15, 1964:14.

-----, "The New, Slick, Quiet Soviet Spies in Our Midst", Maclean's Magazine, July 25, 1964:16

"From Royal Commission on Espionage to the Royal Commission on Security, 1946-1966", n.d. (declassified document accessed by journalist Terry Penner)

House of Commons Debates. October 25, 1963:4049

Katz, S., "RCMP: Inside Canada's Secret Police", Maclean's Magazine, April 20, 1963:13

- Lefolli, K., "Editorial: What the new parliament can do about the political police stop trial by dossier", Maclean's Magazine, April 20, 1963 4
- Lower, A., "Is the RCMP a threat to our liberty?", Maclean's Magazine, July 6, 1957.8
- McCall Newman, C., "How to Spot the Ottawa Man: a concise guide" Maclean's Magazine, October 6, 1962:p.3
- McCreary, J K, "Psychopathia Homosexualis", Canadian Journal of Psychology 4(June 1950) 63-74.
- Miner Johnson, V, "Meet Miss Canada: or, the rape of Cinderella", Saturday Night, February, 1973:15-20
- "Miss Civil Service of 1954 a 'Mrs'", Ottawa Journal, March 20, 1954:3.
- "National Research Miss Tops 27 Girls for RA Crown". Ottawa Journal, May 23, 1970.3.
- Office of Equal Opportunities for Women. The Employment of Women in the Public Service of Canada: A Mandate for Change. 1st.ed Ottawa: Queen's Printer, 1973
- Ottawa Conference. "The Role of Women in the Public Service", Jan.24-25, 1974.
- Phillips, A "The Government Girl". Maclean's Magazine, January 15, 1953.p.25.
- RA NEWS (monthly). 1952-1970 (1950-51 and 1971-73 were not available)
- Reddick, M, "My, uh, Dazzling Career as Miss Canada", MacLean's Magazine, September 15, 1954:18.
- Report of the Royal Commission on the Status of Women. Ottawa: Information Canada, 1970.
- Ross, A, "Next chore for our courts: judging beauty contests", Maclean's Magazine, 77(24), Dec 14, 1964:1-2.
- "Security and Individual Freedom", Ottawa Citizen, March 20, 1950:13

- "Sex Deviations", McGill Medical Journal XIX (January 1950) 49-178
- "Tomorrow Miss Civil Service will open the National Tulip Festival", Ottawa Journal, May 17, 1962:3
- "Trade Department Seeks Japanese Beauty", Ottawa Journal, February 5, 1995:10.
- Wake, F.R. "Report on Special Project", 19 Dec , 1962
- Wall, D.F. "Security Cases involving Character Weaknesses with Special Reference to the Problem of Homosexuality" May 12, 1959
- , "A special meeting of a quorum of the Security Panel", Minutes, June 24, 1960.
- Warburton, W , "English scholar selected as Tulip Festival Queen", Ottawa Journal, May 18, 1973:21.

(i) Unpublished Works

- Canadian Women's Movement Archives SR 11/13, 11/14, "Miss Canada Pageant Protesters", November 12, 1975
- Doherty, J., "Changing Ghettos: Women Clerical Workers in Ottawa During the Second World War", MA thesis, School of Canadian Studies, Carleton University, 1985
- Terry, J, "Momism and the Making of the Treasonous Lesbian", paper presented at the Canadian Historical Association, Montreal, Québec, August 26, 1995:1-15.

(ii) Interviews

- Interview with Ginette Bonneau, interviewed by author, Tape recording, Ottawa, Ontario, May 30, 1996.
- Interview with "Anne", Conveyor of the Beauty Contest Committee, 1962- 1973, interviewed by author, notes, Ottawa, Ontario, June 19, 1996

Interview with Suzanne Perry, interviewed by author, Tape recording, Ottawa, Ontario, June 20, 1996.

Interview with Alma Said, interviewed by author, Tape recording, Constance Bay, Ontario, June 19, 1996.

Secondary Sources

Adamson, N., L. Briskin, and M. McPhail. Feminist Organizing for Change: The Contemporary Women's Movement in Canada. Toronto: Oxford University Press, 1988.

Archibald, K. "Men, women, and persons", Canadian Public Administration 16 (Spring'73):14-24.

Armstrong, P and H. Armstrong. The Double Ghetto: Canadian Women and Their Segregated Work 2nd ed. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1978.

Ballerine-Cohen, C., R. Wilk, and B. Stoeljc, eds. Beauty Queens on the Global Stage: Gender, Contests, and Power. New York: Routledge, 1996.

Banner, L. American Beauty. New York: Alfred A. Knopf Inc., 1983.

Bérubé, A. Coming Out Under Fire: The History of Gay Men and Women in World War Two. New York, Plume Books, 1990.

Bérubé, A. and J. D'Emilio "The Military and Lesbians during the McCarthy Years". Signs 9 (4), 1984:759-775

Brown, R.S. Loyalty and Security: Employment Tests In the United States. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1958.

Champagne, R., "Psychopaths and Perverts: The Canadian Royal Commission on the Criminal Law Relating to Criminal Sexual Psychopaths, 1954-1958", Canadian Lesbian and Gay History Newsletter, 2(September 1986):7-9.

Collier, D. and K. Bekett. Spare Ribs: Women in Show Biz. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1980.

- Davis, K. "Remaking the She-Devil: A Critical Look at Feminist Approaches to Beauty", Hypatia 6(2) 1991:21-43.
- D'Emilio, J. Sexual Politics, Sexual Communities: The Making of a Homosexual Minority in the United States, 1940-1970. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1983.
- , "Capitalism and Gay Identity" in H. Abelove et al., eds, The Lesbian and Gay Studies Reader New York: Routledge, 1993 467-476
- Echols, A. Daring to Be Bad: Radical Feminism in America, 1967-1975 Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1989
- Fox, B.J. et al. "Occupational Gender Segregation in the Canadian Labour Force, 1931-1981," Canadian Review of Sociology and Anthropology 24 (3) August 1987:374-397.
- Gerson, J. and K. Peiss, "Boundaries, Negotiation, Consciousness. Reconceptualizing Gender Relations", Social Problems 32(4), 1985:317-331.
- Girard, J., "From Subversion to Liberation: Homosexuals and the Immigration Act, 1952-1977", Canadian Journal of Law and Society 2(1987) 1-27
- Goodman, W. The Committee: The Extraordinary career of the House Committee on Un-American Activities. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux Inc., 1968.
- Gölz, A., "Family Matters. The Canadian Family and the State in the Postwar Period", left history 1(2), Fall 1993:9-49
- Granatstein, J.L. et al. Nation: Canada Since Confederation 3rd ed Toronto: McGraw-Hill Ryerson Limited, 1990
- Greenberg, D. The Construction of Homosexuality. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1988.
- Hannant, L. The Infernal Machine: Investigating the Loyalty of Canada's Citizens. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995

- Harrison, R and F Mort, "Patriarchal Aspects of Nineteenth Century State Formation: Property Relations, Marriage and Divorce, and Sexuality", in P Corrigan, ed, Capitalism, State Formation and Marxist Theory London: Quartet, 1980:79-109
- Hartmann, H, "Capitalism, Patriarchy, and Job Segregation by Sex", Signs 1 (1976) 137-169.
- Hodgetts, J E et al The Biography of an Institution: The Civil Service Commission of Canada, 1908-1967. Montreal: McGill-Queen's University Press, 1972.
- Hodgetts, J E The Canadian Public Service: A Physiology of Government, 1867-1970 Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1973.
- Irvine, J M, "From Difference to Sameness: Gender Ideology in Sexual Science", The Journal of Sex Research 27(1), Feb. 1990:7-24.
- Johnson, David K., "'Homosexual Citizens': Washington's Gay Community Confronts the Civil Service", Washington History (Fall/Winter 1994-95): 45-96
- Katz, J N. "The Invention of Heterosexuality", Socialist Review 20, no 1 (March 1990) 7-33
- Kealey, G, "State Repression of Labour and the Left in Canada, 1914-20: The Impact of the First World War", Canadian Historical Review LXXIII(3), 1992:281-314
- Kealey, G. and R. Whitaker R.C.M.P. Security Bulletins: The War Series, Part II, 1942-1945 St. John's: Canadian Committee on Labour History, 1993.
- Kinsman, G The Regulation of Desire: Sexuality in Canada. Montreal: Black Rose Books. 1987
- "'Inverts,' 'Psychopaths' and 'Normal' Men: Historical Sociological Perspectives on gay and Heterosexual Masculinities" in T. Haddad, ed., Men and Masculinities: A Critical Anthology Canadian Scholars' Press, 1993. 3-35.

- "'Character Weaknesses' and 'Fruit Machines' Towards and Analysis of the Anti-Homosexual Security Campaign in the Canadian Civil Service." Labour/Le Travail 35 (Spring 1995) 1-28
- The Regulation of Desire Homo and Heterosexualities 2nd ed Montreal. Black Rose Books, 1996
- Labonne, N Mademoiselle Québec Ottawa Éditions Populaires, 1972
- Lerner, G. The Creation of Patriarchy. New York. Oxford University Press, 1988
- Lowe, G., "Women, Work and the Office The Feminization of Clerical Occupations in Canada, 1901-1931", Canadian Journal of Sociology 5(4), 1980 361-81
- , "Class, Job and Gender in the Canadian Office," Labour/Le Travail 10 (Autumn 1982) 11-37
- Women in the Administrative Revolution The Feminization of Clerical Work. Toronto and Buffalo: University of Toronto Press, 1987
- MacCannell, D. and J.F. MacCannell, "The beauty system" in N. Armstrong and L. Tennenhouse (eds), The Ideology of Conduct New York. Methuen, 1987 206-238
- Mallory, J.R. The Structure of the Canadian Government Toronto: Macmillan of Canada, 1971.
- Martin, K.A., "Gender and Sexuality Medical Opinion on Homosexuality, 1900-1950". Gender & Society 7(2), June 1993 249-254
- May, E.T. Homeward Bound. American Families in the Cold War Era New York. Basic Books, 1988
- Moran, L.J. "The Uses of Homosexuality. Homosexuality for National Security". International Journal of Sociology of Law 19 (1991) 149-170
- Morton, S. Ideal Surrounding: Domestic Life in a Working-Class Suburb in the 1920s. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1995

- "No More Miss America" (manifesto), in Morgan, R., ed Sisterhood is Powerful. An Anthology of Writing From the Women's Liberation Movement New York: Vintage Books, 1970.521-524
- Penn, D., "The Meaning of Lesbianism in Post-War America", Gender & History 3(2), Summer 1991:190-203
- Peterson Burwell, B. and P. Peterson Bowles Becoming a Beauty Queen. The Complete Guide New York: Prentice Hall Press, 1987.
- Pierson, R. Roach "They're Still Women After All" The Second World War and Canadian Womanhood. Toronto: McClelland and Stewart, 1986
- , "Home Aide: A Solution to Women's Unemployment after World War II", Atlantis 2(2), spring 1977 85-97.
- Riverol, A. R. Live from Atlantic City: A History of the Miss America Pageant Bowling Green, Ohio: Bowling Green State University Popular Press, 1992.
- Robinson, D. J. and D. Kimmel, "The Queer Career of Homosexual Vetting in Cold War Canada", Canadian Historical Review LXXV(3), September 1994.319-345
- Savage, M. and A. Witz, "The gender of organization", in M. Savage and A. Witz, eds. Gender and Bureaucracy Oxford: Blackwell Publishers, 1992:3-64
- Sawatsky, J. Men in the Shadows The RCMP Security Service Toronto: Doubleday Canada, 1980
- For Services Rendered: Leslie James Bennett and the RCMP Security Service Toronto: Doubleday Canada, 1982
- Smith, G. "Security, Gender and the Historical Process," Diplomatic History 18 (Winter, 1994):79-90.
- "National Security and Personal Isolation. Sex, Gender and Disease in the Cold War United States", International History Review 14 (May 1992): 307-337

Smith, J. "Equal Opportunity in the public service". Canadian Labour 20 (June'75). 13-15

Stannard, U. "The Mask of Beauty", in V. Gornick and B. Moran (eds). Women in Sexist Society. New York: Basic Books, 1971. 118-131

Steele, B. The Feminist Take Over: Patriarchy to Matriarchy in Two Decades. Richmond, Ont.: Tercet, 1989

Stevens, P. and J. Hall, "A Critical Historical Analysis of the Medical Construction of Lesbianism", International Journal of Health Services 21(2), 1991. 291-307

Strong-Boag, V., "Home Dreams: Women and the Suburban Experiment in Canada, 1945-1960", Canadian Historical Review 72(4), Dec. 1991. 471-504.

Ward, N. Dawson's The Government of Canada. 6th ed. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1990

Whitaker, R., "Origins of the Canadian Government's Internal Security System, 1946-1952", Canadian Historical Review LXV, 2, 1984. 154-183

----- Cold War Canada: The Making of a National Insecurity State, 1945-1957. Toronto: University of Toronto Press, 1994

"Women must change attitudes to get equal breaks", University Affairs, 16 (April 1982): 12

END

1 7 - 0 6 - 9 7

FIN