INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI

A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600

**“A Class, Gender and Race Analysis of the Nature of North-South Relationships:
A Study of Canadian and Salvadorean Non-Governmental Organizations”**

by

Sara Torres, BSW, (Honours)

**A thesis submitted to
the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research
in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of**

Master of Social Work

The School of Social Work

**Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario**

September, 1997

**(C) copyright
1997, Sara Torres**

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Acquisitions et
services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-27069-6

Canada

THESIS ACCEPTANCE FORM

The undersigned recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies
and Research acceptance of the thesis

**“A Class, Gender and Race Analysis of the Nature of North-South NGO Relationships:
A Study of Canadian and Salvadorean Non-Governmental Organizations”**

submitted by *Sara Torres, BSW, Carleton University*

in partial fulfillment of the requirements for

the degree of Master of Social Work

Thesis Supervisor

Director School of Social Work

Carleton University

Sep 15, 1997
Date

Abstract

This study examines the 'nature' of the relationship between Progressive Salvadorean and Progressive Canadian/Northern international development NGOs, using a class, gender and race perspective. Traditionally North-South NGO relations focus on the transfer of money and or technical expertise from the North to the South while ignoring the implications of the class, gender and race of stakeholders in the process. The interrelation among these three factors, accompanied by Western development theories and financial resources primarily in the hands of the North, has shaped the relationship in its present characteristics of 'positive' and 'negative' inequality. A model of 'class, gender and racial Mutualism' presents a path for creating equal relations between these NGOs. Progressive Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs have accumulated much practical and theoretical knowledge about their countries and with this can create a powerful relationship to strengthen the cause of development and the formation of a more egalitarian international civil society.

For my family

in

Canada

and

Colombia

their love and confidence encouraged me from beginning to end.

Acknowledgments

I am grateful to the Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs who participated in “one more” study about their work for development in El Salvador. Their eagerness to share their thoughts and aspirations were crucial to this study. Especially to Benjamin Alas of Socorro Luterano Salvadoreño, Fermin Garcia Guardado and Elba Perez Gutierrez of Asociación Nacional Indígena Salvadoreña (ANIS), Marthe Lapierre of Development and Peace, Lourdes Palacios of Fundación para la Cooperación y el Desarrollo Comunal de El Salvador (CORDES), Oscar Ríos of Fundación Salvadoreña para la Reconstrucción y el Desarrollo (REDES), Carlos Rodriguez of Oxfam-Québec, Roch Tassé of Inter Pares, Manuel Vanegas of Corporación Intersectorial para el Desarrollo Económico y el Progreso Social (CIDEP) and José Samuel Ventura of Fundación Segundo Montes (FSM). I also thank Carlos Laviedes of CIDA in Canada, and Jorge Garza of SOGEMA in El Salvador for their insightful comments and information about Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs.

I am grateful to the Carleton School of Social Work professors for my learning throughout this program. Especially to Bessa Whitmore (thesis supervisor), Rashmi Luther, Cecilia Taiana, Bernice Moreau, Gillian Walker, Jim Albert, Diana Ralph and Therese Jennissen. Without them for the last couple of years, I would have not learned to see the world as I do now. This thesis is but a reflection of that learning.

In this particular project I also give thanks to professors Laura Macdonald and Steve Hick for their support and insightful comments as part of the thesis committee. They and Bessa gave me the strength to go one step further until I reached this end.

I would also like to thank the staff at the School of Social Work for their liaison role. And to the Graduate Studies Research Fund which provided me with assistance to carry out my fieldwork in El Salvador.

Of course my academic life is only one part of my real life. In this other part, I am grateful to my friends, co-workers and class mates who encouraged me in this process. Ana Osorio, Angela Laird, Kayla Huckerby, Alma Estable, Elizabeth Leiva, Lulu Tobo-Gillespie, Nupur Gogia, Clara Jimeno, Lise Martin, Magrelys Rodriguez, Mercedes and Roberto Guerra, Jaime Chavez and Romulo Osorio, Victor Hugo Carranza and especially to Karen Hamilton of SalvAide who was always there to listen to my ideas, concerns and willing to give me feedback, editing support and mostly encouragement.

In the most determinant part of my life I am grateful to all my family: My Mom, Albalilia Ospina; my sisters, Beatriz, Lucrecia, Matilde, Ana, Oliva, Raquel, Angelica and Lilia Torres, my brother Jose Sibar Torres, my partner David Pubil; my daughters Tamara and Melisa, my nieces and nephews Michel, Sara Eva, Caterina, Fabian, Alexandra, Liliana, and many more family members that I can not name. I would not have been able to finish this project without their moral, spiritual, logistical, political and financial support. My late father's spirit has been with me all along.

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Dedication	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
List of Tables	viii
List of Appendices	ix
Definition of Terms.....	x
Chapter 1: Introduction	1
1.1 Research Questions	9
Chapter 2: An Integrated Marxist Feminist and Anti-Racist	
Framework to the North South NGO relationship	12
Introduction	12
2.1 Personal experience and identity	13
2.2 Anti-Racism	18
2.2.1 Racism in daily practice.....	22
2.3 Feminism	24
2.4 Marxism	28
2.5 Towards an Integration of Marxism, Anti-Racism and Feminism	32
Conclusion	36
Chapter 3: Canadian and Salvadorean NGO relationships: A review of the literature.....	38
Introduction	38
3.1 The origins of the 'aid' process	40
3.2 Aid delivery through NGOs	40
3.3 Canadian Aid to El Salvador	42
3.4 Tripartite Nature of the relationship	43
3.5 Directions in the relationship	45
3.5.1 Naming the relationship	47
3.5.2 Models of North South relations	52
3.5.3 The modernization model	53
3.5.4 The Dependency model	54
3.5.5 Marxism,Dependency, Anti-Racism, Feminism model.....	55
3.6 Race\class and gender in the relationship	56
3.7 A possible influence to the Northern and Southern NGO relationship for the future..	58

Chapter 4: Methodology	63
Introduction	63
4.1 Sample size	63
4.2 Instruments	64
4.2.1 Face-to-face interviews	65
4.2.2 Reflexive Log	66
4.3 Strengths and Limitations	66
4.4. Analysis of the data	67
 Chapter 5: Progressive Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs relationship:	
the interview data	69
Introduction	69
Section I : The political situation in El Salvador	71
5.1. The War years	72
5.2 Peace Accords and Post-War years	73
5.2.1 Summary of the characteristics of the relationship	77
Section II: Vision of the relationship	78
5.3. Perspectives on Equality & Inequality	78
5.3.1 Salvadorean NGO perspectives on Equality & Inequality	79
5.3.2 Canadian NGOs perspectives on equality and Inequality	86
5.4 Perspectives on criteria	91
5.4.1 Salvadorean NGOs perspectives on criteria	91
5.4.2 Canadian NGOs perspectives on criteria	95
5.5 Perspectives on screening	98
5.5.1 Salvadorean NGOs perspectives on screening	98
5.5.2 Finding donors to achieve goals	98
5.5.3 The contract	99
5.6 Canadian NGOs perspectives on screening	100
5.6.1 Finding partners	100
5.6.2. Establishing conditions	101
Section III: Perspectives on Race	102
5.7.1 Salvadorean NGO perspective on Race	102
5.7.2 Canadian NGO perspective on Race	105
5.8 Perspectives on Gender	108
5.8.1 Salvadorean NGO perspective on Gender	108
5.8.2 Canadian NGO perspective on Gender	109
5.9 Perspective on Class	111
5.9.1. Salvadorean NGO perspective on Class	111
5.9.2. Canadian NGO perspective on Class	111
Section IV: Directions in the relationship for the near future	
5.10.1 Salvadorean NGOs directions	112
5.10.2 Canadian NGOs directions	114
Conclusion	115

Chapter 6: The Canadian and Salvadorean NGO Relationship: Discussion	117
Introduction: “Just because” , a poem	117
Section I: What have we learned about the relations between the NGOs?	
6.1 The literature and its influence in the relationship	119
Section II: The Interview data; Progressive Canadian and Progressive Salvadorean Vision on the relationship	121
6.2 Equality vs. inequality in the War and Non-War periods	121
6.3 The influence of Class	125
6.3.1 Table 2: CIDA’s example of results and indicators RBM	129
6.4 The influence of Gender	132
6.5 The influence of Race	134
6.6 Directions in the Canadian and Salvadorean NGO relationship	137
6.7 Class, gender and race; some directions for the relationship	139
Section III: A class, gender and racial Mutualism approach to the relationship	140
6.7 The model	140
6.7.1 The theoretical	142
6.7.2 The conceptual/analytical	143
6.7.3 The practical	145
Conclusion	146
Chapter 7: Conclusions	148
Bibliography	156
Appendix 1	163
Appendix 2	165
Appendix 3	167
Appendix 4	168
Appendix 5	169

List of Tables

Table	Description	Page
1	Models of North-South NGO relationships	52
2	Characteristics in the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs: the war and non-war years	77
3	CIDA's example of results and indicators of Result-Based Management	129
4	The concientization process on anti-racism	144
5	Phases in the concientization process	145
6	Tasks of the concientization process	146

List of Appendices

Appendix	Description	Page
1	Questionnaire for NGOs	163
2	Letter requesting participation to: NGOs	165
3	Consent form	167
4	Guide for Literature review on development theories	168
5	Guide for literature review on trends in the relationship	169

Definition Of Terms

Class\Classisms: Elliot and Fleras (1992) define class as “A group of persons who occupy a similar position with respect to several variables, the most important being wealth, power, status, and ownership” (p.330) I have make this definition more specific by acknowledging that those who control the position of production by owning the means of production, force those who do not, to sell their labour. The latter are therefore subject to exploitation. Classism is the systematic use of middle and upper class social, economic and political privileges, which keep the lower classes in a position of exploitation.

Development: The process of achieving full realization of a country's population in education, health, without economic poverty. The respect on human rights, advocacy, democracy and economic justice.

Equal: 1. Having the same rights. 2. Evenly proportioned; not disproportionate; balanced. 3. Affecting all alike; uniform applications. 4. Shared by all alike: equal rights. (Funk & Wagnalls, 1989, p.447)

Equality: The state or quality of being equal; also, an instance of this. (Funk & Wagnalls, 1989, p.447)

Gender: For Blackburn (1996)“Gender is the [social construction and the] culturally shaped expression of sexual difference: The masculine way in which men should behave and the feminine way in which women should behave”(p.154).

Inequality: According to the Funk & Wagnalls Canadian College Dictionary, inequality can mean the following: 1. The state of quality of being unequal. 2. An instance of this. 3. Lack of evenness of proportion; variableness: inequalities of climate. 4. Disparity of social position, opportunity, justice, etc. Syn: Disparity

Disparity: 1. Lack of equality, as in age or rank. 2. Unlikeness: dissimilarity. 3. An instance of inequality or unlikeness. Syn. *discrepancy*, and *inequality* are applied to difference where we would expect to find likeness or equality. *Disparity* is a difference in some measurable quantity, as weight, strength, power, or importance: the *Disparity* between the armed forces of two nations. *Inequality* is a general term and stresses that equality is the normal or expected condition.(Funk & Wagnalls, 1989, P.838)

Northern NGOs: are defined as "agencies active in international development, peace, human rights, environment, and development education...NGOs support or implement programs for which governments are normally thought to be responsible; and they often do these things in co-operation with governments, relying to a large degree on government funds. Therein lies much of the significance, and the contradictions, of the NGOs" (Murphy, 1991, p.163)

Progressive NGOs (PNGOs): Are those who have demonstrated a commitment to improving the social, political and economic conditions of the people of El Salvador, including the elimination of poverty, injustice, military repression and the building of democracy. Progressive NGOs address the problem of power by trying to promote changes in order to achieve transformation in the relation of social forces, in a manner which favours the majority (Macdonald, 1994).

Race/racism: I use race in the context of a social construction that is used to perpetuate systemic racism. "Systemic racism takes place when structures and practices (whether intentional or not) exclude, exploit and deny people their rights on the basis of race. Systemic racism means that these practice and structures are widespread and have become backed up by institutionalized power." (burke, 1994, p.22-3)

Relationship: the formal or informal process existing between northern and southern NGOs in order to conceptualize, implement and evaluate development or emergency relief projects in southern countries. These projects are financed by northern NGOs. Southern NGOs are the executors of the large majority of projects. Northern NGOs have executed a certain percentage of those.

Sexism: "Sexism is the inability or refusal to recognize the rights, needs, dignity, or value of people, one sex or gender. More widely, the devaluation of various traits of character or intelligence as 'typical' of one or other gender"(Blackburn, 1996, p.349). Sexism has systematically given privileges to men by discriminating against women.

Southern countries: I define as southern countries, those states and their populations that are located geographically to the south of the globe and, whose majority live under conditions of poverty, illiteracy, malnutrition. These countries are also characterized by their subordination to global capitalist market forces which do not allow them to become economically competitive in the world. These countries are generally governed by wealthy elites.

Southern NGOs: as the different non-governmental organizations based in southern countries which develop and execute the projects or activities financed by northern NGOs.

Underdevelopment: The term underdevelopment was commonly used in most of the literature before the mid-1960s. Third World intellectuals, in particular, considered the term to be value-laden and based on the notion that the Western industrialised nations were more qualified for setting the development norms and standards for the rest of the world. Beginning in the 1970s the terms 'developing' or 'Third World nations' have been more widely acceptable (Acosta-Belen, Bose, 1995, p.33). For other academics, underdevelopment is not something that is created, "it is an original state of backwardness, which can be attributed to such factors as scarcity of capital, prevalence of traditional institutions and dominance of rural oligarchies (Randall & Theobald, 1985:104, as cited in King, 1992, p.40-41)

Chapter 1

Introduction

This study is of the relationship between Progressive Salvadorean NGOs (PSNGOs) and Progressive Canadian\Northern international development NGOs (PCNGOs)¹, who had worked together for approximately 10 years (1986-1996). The relationship between these NGOs began when, in the midst of a civil war, PSNGOs requested financial and political support from PCNGOs and PCNGOs agreed to help PSNGOs. I am calling these NGOs “progressive” due to their commitment to improving the social, political and economic conditions of the people of El Salvador, including the elimination of poverty, injustice, military repression and the building of democracy. Progressive NGOs address the problem of power by trying to promote changes in order to achieve transformation in the relation of social forces, in a manner which favours the majority (Macdonald, 1994).² These NGOs have great potential and an accumulated practical and theoretical knowledge about their countries, that together

¹ International NGOs are non-profit organizations based in developed countries. They fund (and sometimes implement) development projects, usually in more than one country (Macdonald, 1996, p.7).

² In the case of El Salvador, especially during the war, PCNGOs supported PSNGOs who openly supported the FMLN's Marxist platform that aimed to build socialism in El Salvador. PCNGOs do not openly reject capitalism, however. The difference between progressive and non progressive Northern NGOs' is that the latter group is oriented at provoking changes in order to avoid modifications in the structure of power (Macdonald, 1994).

can create a powerful relationship to strengthen the cause of development³. In order to advance these relationships, more exploration should be given to the role that Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs play in shaping these relations, with the purpose of making recommendations for change and of creating a model(s) for more equal relations.

This study examines the nature of the 'relationship'⁴, between PCNGOs and PSNGOs through a lens of race⁵, class⁶ and gender⁷. This is an integrated approach that takes into consideration the

³ Development is not only something for Southern Countries. As one PSNGO stated, there is not any more that we can lose in the South, but Northern countries have much more to lose.

⁴ I will use the generic term 'relationship' to refer to Northern and Southern NGOs interaction in the implementing development projects, lobby and advocacy (Torres, 1996). See Chapter 3.

⁵ I use race in the context of a social construction that it is used to perpetuate systemic racism.

"Systemic racism takes place when structures and practices (whether intentional or not) exclude, exploit and deny people their rights on the basis of race. Systemic racism means that these practice and structures are widespread and have become backed up by institutionalized power" (burke, 1994, p.22-3).

⁶ Elliot and Fleras (1992) define class as "A group of persons who occupy a similar position with respect to several variables, the most important being wealth, power, status, and ownership" (p.330) I have make this definition more specific by acknowledging that those who control the production by accessing and owning the means of production, force those who do not, to sell their labour. The latter are therefore subject to exploitation. Classism is therefore the systematic use of middle and upper class social, economic and political privileges, which keep the lower classes in a position of exploitation.

⁷ For Blackburn (1996) "Gender is the [social construction and the] culturally shaped expression of sexual difference: The masculine way in which men should behave and the feminine way in which women should behave" (p.154). "Sexism is the inability or refusal to recognize the rights, needs, dignity, or value of people, one sex or gender. More widely, the devaluation of various traits of character or intelligence as 'typical' of one or other gender" (p.349). Sexism has systematically given privileges to men by discriminating against women.

influence in the relationship of three factors: the class struggle in El Salvador, sexism in the social, political and economic spheres of the Salvadorean and Canadian societies; the racial discrimination against non-white people in both Canada and El Salvador.

To examine this relationship, I conducted face to face interviews with PCNGO and PSNGO representatives who had been working together between 1986 to 1996. I chose El Salvador and Canada as case studies because it allowed me to document the perspective of NGOs with whom I have been involved directly or indirectly (over the last sixteen years) through my solidarity and development efforts in Canada. The 'process' of the relationship interested me as it is often overlooked in descriptions of the purpose of NGO programs.

This Canadian and Salvadorean relationship presents some characteristics of 'positive' and 'negative' inequality, terms used by one of the NGO representatives. According to this representative, 'positive' inequality is based on an acceptance of the differences; unjust inequality is based on having suffered an injustice. (I use the term 'negative' inequality instead.) Negative inequality reflects a lack of participation of Salvadorean NGOs in the decision making related to Canadian NGO policies and programming for El Salvador. Positive inequality addresses the existing division of responsibilities between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs, in which Canadian NGOs finance the projects and Salvadorean NGOs execute them.

Given these characteristics, this study demonstrates the following: 1. efforts are being made by both Progressive Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs to establish a process of equal and just relations, yet complex dynamics of inequality still exist; 2. the influence of class in the relationship has been acknowledged in working together to end the war; 3. the influence of gender in the relationship is being discussed more and more, especially in relation to Salvadorean NGO's efforts to meet project funding criteria; 4. there is little or no recognition of the influence of race and/or racism in the relationships; 5. There is a desire from both NGOs to work together in lobbying and advocacy in the near future.(see Chapter 6).

The results of this study call for a redefinition of Northern and Southern NGO relations. A model of Class-Gender and Racial 'Mutualism' provides a practical lens to move from the status-quo by challenging the assumptions and practices of racism, classism and sexism to a more equal and just relationship. The 'micro' level of North-South relations can take leadership in this model and pressure the governments at the 'macro' levels to do the same.

My perspective in this study is not neutral, as I believe there is no such a thing as complete objectivity. My perspective and ideas, that are grounded in certain historical reality, (Kay, 1989) are based on my own experience in social and development work as a 'Southern woman' (from Colombia) in a Northern

country (Canada). This experience is shaped by class (poor, Marxist perspective), gender (feminist) and race, (Brown, anti-racist perspective) and one that is committed to improving North-South relations from a critically⁸ constructive stand point in which I identify the problem (inequality in the relationship) and also provide solution (to challenge classism, sexism and racism) in building more equal relationships . As a researcher and analyst, I must acknowledge that I struggled to separate my personal experience from that of the interviewees in order to break away from what Wolcott (1994) calls the “temptation to overpower, rather than surrender to, one’s data” (p.28).

My assumptions for this study are: 1. the past and current relationships between Northern NGOs with the Southern NGOs perpetuate neo-colonial (rich/poor, Black/White) power dynamics. Classism and sexism have been addressed to some degree, but racism as a factor is rarely acknowledged and therefore remains unchallenged. 2. The access of Northern NGOs to financial resources, their freedom of organization, and the funds to finance projects in the South, allows them to develop areas of expertise about the recipient country. Although most Southern NGOs are seen as effective executors of projects, they lack financial resources, technical expertise, and often endure state

⁸ My critical perspective is grounded in Critical Theory. In this theory one is always searching out the “contradiction’s in social arrangements in which, for example, certain groups are systematically excluded from power”(Blackburn, 1996, p.89). The term constructive addresses my search for positive outcomes or to set-up an example in the change that I want to occur (ibid. p. 78-79)

See also, McLaren, Peter with Preface by Paulo Freire, Critical Pedagogy and Predatory Culture, 1995, p.229-259.

political repression. This combination hinders the ability of Southern NGOs to gain expertise about the context of development work in Northern countries. This lack of knowledge about Canadian society has been cited by Canadian NGOs as the reason that Southern NGOs cannot directly contribute to the policy, fund-raising and/or advocacy work of Northern NGOs in Canada. 3. there is inequality in the relationship due to the power that Northern NGOs have to influence a development agenda that does not necessarily meet the needs of Southern NGOs. 4. the model of 'accompaniment', advocated by progressive NGOs in Central America, provides a good starting point to establishing equal relationships between Northern and Southern NGOs.

I believe that part of the problem in North-South NGO relations has been the simplistic way of seeing the relationship as the transfer of money or technical expertise from North to South while ignoring the implications of the class, gender and race of stakeholders in both the North and South. It is the interrelation between these three factors, (classism, sexism, racism) accompanied by Western development concepts and money in the hands of the North, that has shaped the relationship as one of 'positive' and 'negative' inequality.

Whatever the term used to name the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs (identified in Chapter 3 as partnership, collaboration, counterparts, associates or alliances), it has generally resulted in an unequal relationship. In a recent CIDA study, (June 1995) African NGOs criticized the

relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs as characterised by donor overt control of the development process and Southern NGO compliance in order to access the funding.

Although Southern NGOs should not be exempt from criticism for the role they have played in this relationship, the donor-receiver characteristics (whether intentional or not) have created the ideal conditions to perpetuate what has been called the new colonial ways of domination "...as the colonial powers who wanted to save the South as part of the 'White Man's Burden'...today donors...believe that their money is the only thing that can 'save' the 'masses of helpless people' of the 'Third World'" ((Muchunguzi & Milne, 1995,p.23).

This study is important because, though considerable in-depth analysis has been done on the lack of democratization, militarization, and the effects of globalization on Southern countries, little work has been done, "from the bottom-up"⁹, from the perspective of the South in regards to the role that NGOs play in the North-South context¹⁰. As well, little has been done in analyzing North-South relationships from a class, gender and race perspective. This type of approach is crucial as it challenges classism,

⁹ I am using the expression "from the bottom-up" to refer to research conducted on donor NGOs in the North, from the perspective of recipient NGOs in the South. I do not know all Southern NGOs perspectives, however, my race, class, gender, language, immigrant status and experience in the development field, allow me to bring this perspective in my research.

¹⁰ See Macdonald, (1996.)

sexism and racism that is "a fundamental tenet which contributes to practices of exclusivity" (burke, 1994 p.22-3) in North-South relations.

This study is also important because relations between states and peoples of the North and South, in the Americas, go back to the harmful encounter of the two cultures: the Yellow races from America, with the White colonizers from Europe. Macdonald (1996) states that NGOs working in the area of development are hardly a new phenomenon. "They trace their origins back to the work of Western missionaries in the colonized world, and adopted their present form in the post-World War II period when they began to provide relief to the peoples of war-torn Europe."(p.3) The state (macro relations) is manifested in the NGO (micro) relationships through the intrinsic financial relationships of Northern NGOs to their governments. The relationship of Southern NGOs to their governments depends on the social and political conditions of their countries.¹¹

¹¹ The polarization of Latin American societies between the so called Right and the Left, has reached its highest point of antagonism. By Progressive NGOs opposing the policies of the states, they become victims of repression and intimidation.

1.1 Research Questions

This study explores the relationship between Northern (Canadian) and Southern (Salvadorean) NGOs from 1986 to 1996, and how, race, class and gender have influenced the relationship. The research questions are: 1. What role do Salvadorean NGOs play in the elaboration of Canadian NGOs' policies, programs and project criteria for El Salvador?, 2. How are issues of class, race, and gender manifested in their relationship?, 3. How do Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs perceive the trends in their relationship for the coming years?

This study is organized as follows: Chapter 2 focuses on the theoretical framework and the influence that the literature has on the Salvadorean and Canadian NGO relationship and why it is important to have a Marxism, Feminist and Anti-Racist integrated approach to the relationship. First, I will explain how my identity as an insider in the field of development -- first in solidarity work and then with SalvAide¹² -- is shaped by having a Marxist, Feminist and Anti-racist analysis.

¹² SalvAide is a Canadian NGO supporting locally initiated projects in El Salvador since 1985. Its current mandate is to support three main programs in El Salvador: Community Economic Development; Democratic Empowerment and Human Rights Advocacy, Information and Education in Canada. My opinions in this paper do not reflect those of SalvAide. I did not invite SalvAide to participate in this study to avoid conflict of interest concerning other NGOs that I have not been a staff member.

Second, I present a summary of what Marxism, Sexism and Anti-Racism theories racism present or do not present to overcome oppressions of classism, sexism and racism in the development discourse and how it influences the relationship. I conclude this chapter by discussing the need to have an integrated approach to the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs.

Chapter 3 examines the trends in the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs, especially as it is played out through the 'aid' process. First I discuss the origins of the process and the aid delivery through NGOs, followed by a discussion of the context of Canadian aid to El Salvador. Then, I address the tripartite nature of the relationship and some of the issues that the literature presents about as the directions in the NGO relationship. At that point, I focus on how issues of race, class and gender, have been addressed in the relationship. This chapter is concluded by presenting social movements as a possible source of influence in the Northern and Southern NGOs relationship.

In Chapter 4, the methodology of the study is explained. In Chapter 5, I present the findings from the interview data. The first parts present the characteristics of the relationship during the war and no-war years. The second part addresses the vision that Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs have of their relationship in regard to the equality and inequality in the relationship, PCNGOs' criteria for funding approval and PSNGOs implementation of the project, screening of PSNGOs by PCNGOs and selection and finding partners between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs. The

third section addresses Canadian and Salvadorean NGO perspectives on race, class and gender. I conclude this chapter by presenting their views for the future of their relationship.

In Chapter 6, I will go back to the literature and the interview data to examine what has been learned about the Canadian and Salvadorean NGO in the relationship. The first learning addresses the links between the literature and the relationships. The second learning focuses on the vision of the Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs of their relationship in terms of equality and inequality, the influence of race, class and gender, and the future of the relationship. I close this chapter by providing a 'class, gender and racial-Mutualism' model that I hope will encourage more learning and the strengthening of the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs over the long term.

In Chapter 7, I conclude this study by highlighting the major results and posing some questions to further strengthen the Canadian (Northern) and Salvadorean (Southern) NGOs.

Chapter 2

An integrated¹³ Marxist Feminist and Anti-Racist Framework to the North South NGO relationship

Introduction

As noted in chapter I, the North-South¹⁴ NGO relationship (both institutional and individual) is characterized by 'positive' and 'negative' inequality. The lack of an integrated class, gender and race analysis of the institutional and individual relationships, is, in my view, an underlying cause of the negative inequality between the NGOs. This lack of an integrated analysis is reflected in the major theories (Marxism\Dependency and Modernization) which have guided Northern and Southern NGO relationships over several decades. Therefore, the incorporation of an integrated Marxist, Feminist and Anti-racist framework in analysing Canadian and Salvadorean NGO relationships is a more complete way to understand this inequality and to move the relationship towards more equality. The basis for this equality is the eradication of classism, sexism and racism in the relationship. In the long-term this contributes to the gradual consolidation of civil society world wide. As mentioned in the introduction, the first stage happens at the 'micro' level, which in turn pushes the 'macro' level to do the same.

¹³ Patricia Collins (1990) in defining Black Feminist Thought, states that to demonstrate the existence and authenticity of Black Feminist Thought, "It needs to be presented as being coherent and basically complete." This according to Collins is in "contrast to [her] actual view that theory is rarely this smoothly constructed"(p.xiv).

¹⁴ For a discussion on the major transformations that North-South relations have gone through over the last four decades, see Rothstein, Robert, L, North-South Relations, in Krieger, 1993, p.653-5.

In this chapter I will discuss the influence that the literature has or (has not) on the Salvadorean and Canadian NGO relationship and why it is important to have a Marxism, Feminist and Anti-Racist integrated approach to the relationship. To achieve this end, I first explain how personal experience and identity in the field of development is shaped by my Marxist, Feminist and Anti-Racist analysis. This personal experience and knowledge is crucial to me as it is what Bannerji (1995) defines as "... more than the raw data of physical reflexes and feelings. It is the originating point of knowledge, and interpretation, a relational sense-making, which incorporates social meaning. This experience creates and transforms" (p.86). Second, I present what Marxism, Feminism and Anti-Racism, present, or do not present, to overcome oppressions of classism, sexism and racism in the development discourse and how it influences the relationship. I conclude this chapter by discussing the need to have an integrated approach to the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs. None of these approaches alone does justice to the relationship.

2.1 Personal experience and identity

As a member of a racial minority, a woman, and as an activist in the solidarity movement for Central America, (specifically as an international development worker for El Salvador) for the last 15 years, I bring considerable experience to this discussion. It has become clear to me that work for development is more complex than to explain it simply as NGOs and governments sending money from Canada to El Salvador to solve the problems of its poorest populations. For a long time, however, I could not identify what made it so complex. In writing this thesis, I have gone

through a process of internal conflict as I uncovered the contradictions embedded in the field of development, anti-racism, social work and feminism.

The internal conflict that I experienced in determining this framework was due to my anger at realizing the existence of two kinds of racism: the 'first racism', the one perpetuated upon myself and other racial minority people living in Canada; the 'second racism' the one I myself perpetuated upon native and black people in my own country of Colombia. In the 'second racism' I came to realize that I was racist in my own society due to internalized racism. I am angry at a country where the superficial colour of skin (light) allows a person to feel part of the so-called 'racial elite' to the point of rejecting their native and black blood. This type of internalized racism can only further the division among the classes to the benefit of the elites, who are for the most part, light skinned. I was able to deconstruct this type of racism in my own life. The challenge for other Southern people and countries is to dismantle both first and second types of racism.

This 'second racism', opened my eyes to the role of racism in development practice, as I undertook to analyze the North-South NGO relationship with an Anti-Racist framework. I knew that in doing so, I took the risk of exposing my own history and of challenging those involved in both the social work and development fields to do the same. I knew that some defensiveness might be experienced by those readers who had not yet moved to this level of dismantling 'first' and 'second' racism in their own lives. However, I could not stay within a class and gender approach alone. I had to incorporate anti-racism with the risk and the hope of creating a new

reaction for the participants of this study and perhaps my readers, to become engaged in anti-racist international development practice.

The first type of racism I experienced in international development was in my role as an activist in solidarity work and somehow feeling 'second class' for being a Southern person doing development work in a Northern country. It seems to be fine for mainstream NGOs and individuals to be doing international development work, but not for Southern individuals. For instance, the fact that I was from Colombia and knew the country and language, did not provide an advantage in applying for a position to work in that area of the Americas because I had an accent and my written English was not as good as the position required. However, one mainstream Canadian was hired to do the job even though that person knew hardly any Spanish and little about the country. In other instances, some of the subtle and even overt comments were related to Canadians "knowing better" how to do their work in Canada. One day for example, there was an argument(at one of the meetings of a solidarity group), about bringing a person from El Salvador to help with the organizing of some work in Canada. One white Canadian stated immediately... "to do what?, to clean the floors?" Such blatantly paternalistic and racist attitudes, go unchallenged in many NGO and solidarity networks.

Experiencing the 'first racism' inspired rage --not at the person who made the above statement, (whom I know and have a relationship of friendship and love), but to the larger discriminatory system in which he/she participates. I believe other people also have the right to be angry with me

for being discriminatory in whatever way I have not yet realized. The real struggle for anti-racism however, must move from the past and present individual practice of discrimination to personal and systemic change in the present and the future.

In regards to feminism, the conflict that I experienced happened when I realized my own oppression as a woman within a patriarchal system of women's subordination and male domination. My political awareness came as a result of my work in support of women in El Salvador. These women were living in the midst of a civil war, and yet they were convinced that their struggles as women had to be addressed in conjunction with their class struggle to build a new society in El Salvador. With these women I learned that my feminism also starts in my home, and that I needed to build a different set of relations with men not only in the public but also the private realm. At the economic level, my first discovery of the inequality of women in a Northern country came 11 years ago when, working at a grocery store, I was told by my coworker that I was paid 50 cents less than my male co-worker for the same job. The devaluing of my work is but a token of the devaluing of women's work worldwide.¹⁵

In regards to classism, the conflict I experienced goes back to my life as a high school student in Colombia. I learned then about Marxism by suffering the consequences of military repression. As

¹⁵ Marilyn Waring in her video Who's Counting? Sex, Lies and Global Economics, (National Film Board), Studio, B. 1995, demonstrates the global system maintains the undervaluation of women's work although men's work was closely related to the starting of wars and the destruction of the environment.

students we were called communist by the army when they arrived to dismantle our rally in support of a teacher's strike for better wages. I also learned through my older sisters' bedtime stories, about the complicity of the local elites with the policies of international funding institutions to borrow for 'development'. This created substantial debt, leading the Southern countries into a relationship of dependence and an imperative for repayment. My conflict came in seeing myself as a development and social worker trying to help Southern NGOs with funds to alleviate some of their problems, when these same funds (received in the form of bilateral aid) were actually taking their countries to further underdevelopment. Although I know that as NGOs we are trying to do good work, and we try to develop relationships of more equality, we have to be allies in a long struggle to deconstruct the racism, sexism and classism embedded in North-South relations. If this is not done, Northern NGOs might fall into what Mukherjee (1988) calls cultural recolonization, "an attempt to go back to the place of one's past crime and recreate the past in a way that the crime is displaced, muffled, washed out"(p.101).¹⁶

In the following section I discuss the degree to which Anti-Racism, Feminist and Marxist theories present or do not address issues of classism, sexism and racism in the development discourse and how that affects the relationship.

¹⁶ Mukherjee (1988) used this term in her critique of the colonizing role of Hollywood movies, such as "A Passage to India," "Out of Africa" and "Gods Must be Crazy." She argues that these movies are a "white man's attempt to exorcize the past and to make it appear as though the bad part--the sin and guilt part--never happened"(p.100-1).

2.2 Anti-Racism

As a student, activist and development worker, I have also been exposed to people believing that Southern countries experience underdevelopment because "YOU PEOPLE ARE NOT AS SMART". This approach is entrenched in Northern countries by equating underdevelopment with the inferior intelligence of Black, Brown and Yellow races. This victim-blaming approach only strengthens the racism in Northern countries towards Southern countries rather than making an effort to understand the real causes of underdevelopment and to challenge white privilege. Northern countries have traditionally benefited from equating development with race, and have used that to oppress people of colour. When a white person believes that a non-white person is less smart, then whiteness becomes the norm and it separates "those who are entitled to have certain privileges from those whose exploitation and vulnerability to violence is justified by their not being white"(Kivel, 1996, p.17).

The main question to ask in this section is, "What does theory have to do with racism and Anti-Racism? The answer is, "Everything." Racism According to Bannerji (1995), "it's not simply a set of attitudes and practices they [European societies] level towards 'us', [Black, Brown, Yellow races], their socially constructed 'other,' but it is the principle of self-definition of European/Western societies... what is otherwise known as European civilization"(p.46). Racism, therefore, describes the dynamic relations between racial prejudice, institutional discrimination,

the economy and culture. These relations have been transformed from "paternalistic to competitive social structures"(Van den Burgh 1969, as cited in Bowser, 1995, p.xxii). However, the malestream¹⁷ development literature, in both the 'right and the left', addresses race/racism in underdevelopment as if relations between North and South were colour blind, and oblivious these dynamics inherent in rich & poor relations. Attention is given to race only in the context of the ethnic conflicts or racial struggles within Southern countries. Kay (1989) recognizes that ethnic and gender divisions have surfaced with renewed force, "and the development literature is bereft of ideas regarding how best to deal with these issues and propose policies for overcoming the exploitation of ethnic groups, women, and what are often called minorities"(p.211). However, he does not develop the issue in the context of North-South relations.

Chew & Denmark (1996) also acknowledge that "At the onset of the cold war, when simplistic racial or climatic explanations of 'backwardness' would no longer suffice, various perspectives on development were created that remained nonetheless consistent with this overall orientation" (p.1). In other words, without addressing the issues of racism and sexism, theorists are perpetuating the sexist, classists and racist approaches carried on since colonization. They have ignored the role played by the more progressive schools in addressing Anti-Racism. Amin (1996), however, characterizes these schools as "many Western left intellectuals retreating from a

¹⁷ Baksh-Sooden (1993) She defines "malestream" ...as mainstream [NGOs] which represent "interests other than women's" (As cited in Johnston, 1995, p.62).

characteristically naive enthusiasm of the Third World [and turning to] a pro-imperialist stance now hardly distinguishable from Third World bashing"(p.78).

Although Frank (1996) recognizes that "enlivened social (and ethnic/nationalist) movements-with variety of similarities and differences among them"(p.49.) are getting organized to respond to economic changes and pressures all over the world, he does not develop this further.

The Anti-Racism literature, does draw the links between Colonialism, development and Anti-Racism. These links are drawn by tracing the beginning of racism to the encounter between the two cultures. The colonizers (Spanish, British, French, Portuguese)adopted a racist attitude of superiority towards the American Natives and later the Black slaves. "Native Americans were immediately seen as not having nations and cultures worth respecting, as an inferior people, and as having only one purpose-- To serve the new European societies as servants, laborers, and slaves"(Bowser, 1995, p.xiv). Blacks in contrast, "were 'naturally evil'"(Palmer, 1976, p.42 as cited in Lewis, 1995, p.61).

These links are also drawn in explaining the white colonizer's strategy to control the Black and/or Indian populations, by creating rivalries amongst them. For instance, to control the Indians and to "extract labor from them, Spaniards used free and enslaved Blacks, as well as mulattos and mestizos, to force compliance. Thus, while those of African descent had fewer rights than Indians, they were also considered stronger and more evil than Indians, and therefore the perfect intermediaries between Spaniards and the conquered Native population"(Lewis, 1995, p.62). According to Said (1993), the

origins of imperialistic expansion which aimed at bringing the world closer together, has created “ a process of separation between Europeans and Natives. [And Blacks as an insidious] and fundamentally unjust one...”(p.xxii).

Little of the development literature addresses the racial context of North-South relations, or traces their roots back to slavery. In doing so, it fails to address the origins of present day racism. The Anti-Racism literature is primarily written by Blacks, and writers of colour. The challenge presented in the Anti-Racism literature is that everyone in this society, “women and men, boys and girls, who want to see end to racism, and an end to white supremacy, must begin to engage in a counter hegemonic "race talk" that is fiercely and passionately calling for change" (hooks, 1995, p.5). Thus, "Racism and the most effective actions that can be taken against it are becoming transnational or global on at least the cultural and institutional levels"(Bowser, 1995, p.xxii.). Part of this Anti-Racism work should be challenging the assumption of superiority of one system (people) over others. Acosta-Belen & Bose (1995) argue that the claim that Western societies represent the ideal form of cultural, socio-economic, and political development for “Third World countries to emulate if they are to achieve progress, prosperity, and democracy, [is part of that assumption of superiority]. The antinomy of civilized Europe vis-à-vis its primitive colonial subjects has left a legacy of unequal power relations and ideological paradigms that still presuppose the natural inferiority of these populations” (p.17).

2.2.1 Racism in the daily practice:

One must begin by critically questioning past beliefs and behaviors that have perpetuated racial discrimination. Several factors are involved here:

1. The belief in a dominant ideology that presents one set of people (white) as superior and others (Brown, Black, Yellow) as inferior.¹⁸ Such beliefs are predominant although "races are not pre-existing natural entities but social groups produced out of unequal power relations and discriminatory practices" (Stepan, 1991, p.136). The internalization of racism occurs when the 'inferior' accepts such an ideology and escapes his/her identity by wanting to be white (Kivel, 1996). This pervasive notion undermines the strength of racial unity by dividing Black, Brown and Yellow races who want the privileges of lighter skin. These "racist premises can be built upon in particular ways to further the interests of specific classes within dominant and aspiring dominant ethnic groups, where ethnic supremacy will involve the privilege, exploitation of, or access to, economic or political resources" (Anthias and Yuval-Davis, 1992, p.94).

¹⁸ The Western defence of the inferiority concept of one race over the other, is traced back to Thomas Malthus (1766-1834), the founder of scientific racism. Such racism justified the extermination of poor people and people from different skin colour and cultures (inferior) under the principle of controlling the populations. Francisco Galton (1822-1911), is the founder of the concept of eugenics and influential in the development of eugenics as a science and religion. Eugenics "is a movement of 'race improvement,' and the relation between eugenics and racism is therefore often taken to be a defining one" (Stepan, 1991, p.135). Adolf Hitler (1889-1945), the mind responsible for the assassination of six million Jews. Paul Ehrlich (since the 1960s) has continued the eugenics movement by advocating the sterilization of women to control what he calls the 'population explosion' in third world countries.

2. The behavior, action and thoughts that perpetuate such ideology for which we are all responsible in our daily lives. This involves our conscious and unconscious experience of 'first' and 'second' racism for which those people who are Black and/or people of colour, are devalued (Kivel, 1996). The strategies of the 'superior' to resist change involve blaming the 'inferior'. Here, the 'second racism' is used by white people to justify maintaining the first racism by pointing out that racism exists in Southern countries and "it is worse". Fanon (1967) also argues that "the feeling of inferiority of the colonized is the correlative to the Europeans 'and Canadians' feeling of superiority" (p.93).
3. The subjugation of the 'inferior' in order for the 'superior' to maintain power. At the macro level, this involves the underdevelopment of Southern countries with the complicity of Southern elites, and Northern consumption of the knowledge, expertise, and the raw and manufactured materials gained at the expense of Southern countries.
4. The commodification of culture (hooks, 1992) further resists recognizing racism by addressing only non-challenging aspects of difference. In the North the "cultural, ethnic, and racial differences will be continually commodified and offered up as new dishes to enhance the white palate" (p.39). A clear example of this is the organizing of multicultural 'fashion shows' within schools, pretending in that way to celebrate anti-racism day.

2.3 Feminism

If the struggles to overcome class and race oppressions are necessary in improving the relationships amongst Northern and Southern NGOs, as important it is the incorporation of a feminist perspective in that relationship. Whereas feminist theory reflects different views of the world as espoused by liberal, socialist, radical feminism and anti-racist\Black Feminist thought, these theories brought women's equality in the North and the South to the front burner. A socialist feminist vision of the North-South relationship questions the prevailing capitalist system and its intersection with a patriarchal system\ or male privilege (Eisenstein, 1993, Bannerji, 1995). Black Feminist Thought\ Anti-Racism empowers Black women and racial minority women towards political activism (Williams, 1989, Collins, 1990). Liberal feminism works within existing institutions while focusing on sex discrimination as the cause for gender inequality (Andersen, 1997). Radical feminism theorizes that male dominance over women is institutionalized by patriarchy.

As none of these theories are monolithic, their inclusion (especially socialist feminism) can potentially insure that both NGOs are committed to fulfilling the inherent right that women have to participation in decision making and to benefit from the social, political, and economic gains of their countries.

A feminist perspective also challenges women's subordination within the 'progressive' field (being Marxist is not equated with being feminist) where women's specific struggles tend to be

overshadowed by the struggle of class. This phenomenon happens in both the North (west) and the South (non-west), the past and the present. In Schneir's (1994) edition of Michell's (1966) work, *Women: The Longest Revolution*,¹⁹ it is clear that "... in the West, the problem [the subordination of women] has become a subsidiary, if not an invisible, element in the preoccupations of socialists. Perhaps no other major issue has been so forgotten..."(p.202). Thirty years later, in the South, a similar situation is found. For instance, in El Salvador, Marxist and Liberals\conservatives have argued against the 'importation' of feminist ideas by women's groups while both have historically appropriated ideas about development from other countries and adapted them in Latin America.²⁰

Malestream development literature does not address the struggle of women (Kay, 1989). Those who do tend to use an add-on approach (Amin, Frank, 1996). Some of the feminist literature identifies Colonialism and neo-colonialism as detrimental to women. Feminists in North-South have harshly criticized the Dependencistas, Marxist and Neo-Conservatives/Liberals for their omission of women's contribution to the world's economy and to the societies.

The feminist critique helped to pressure development agencies, such as CIDA, the World Bank and IMF, to incorporate gender criteria into their policies and programming in the South; these according (Maguire 1984), are a quick fix "to improve the disappointing performance of the past

¹⁹ See Schneir, Miriam, *Feminism In Our Times*, (1994.) p.201-12.

²⁰ I am using the term Latin America for lack of a better word. I recognize that this raises a debate around generalizing to all the Central and Southern American countries as if they were homogenous.

development decades” (p.48). They have achieved minimal changes in the South, but they have shifted the focus away from criticizing the failures of the development industry (Maguire 1984). These policies have become a major influence in the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs. Through these policies, gender in development has become institutionalized.

Much of the literature on women and development focuses around these policies. Yet, the elaboration of policy guidelines by Northern countries to incorporate women into the development process, such the Women in Development (WID) and Gender and Development (GAD) remain band aid solutions. “Because WID does not challenge existing structures, including those of gender relations, it has been accepted by many governments in both the North and the South , and by multilateral organisations such as the World Bank, the United Nations and the International Monetary Fund”(King, 1992, p.53-4).

WID recognises that development cannot occur if the resources of half the world’s population (women) are undervalued (although over exploited in relation to men’s work). However, WID “overlooks causal factors in the system itself. No attempt is made to examine the roles of Colonialism, imperialism, capitalism, racism and sexism in contributing to the subordination of the Third World in general and Third World women in particular (Maguire, 1984, p.24). WID sees the strategy as ‘managing’ the incorporation of women. The practical approach is for all international institutions (such as the United Nations Development Programs (UNDP), and CIDA in Canada) to be trained in gender sensitivity at all levels of management. “One-page country

NOTE TO USERS

Page(s) not included in the original manuscript are unavailable from the author or university. The manuscript was microfilmed as received.

27

UMI

government and NGO aid programs to Southern women, not necessarily the achievement of gender equality for Southern women.

2.4 Marxism

My assumption in making the links between development theories and NGO relationships is that there is an underlying cause-effect relationship. That is, Northern NGOs are not passive recipients of that influence; it is implicit in their programming and policies overseas. However, Palme (1981)²² argues that there is no such a thing as a "single Marxist theory of underdevelopment" and that it might probably be more appropriate "to speak of 'Marxist inspired' theories of underdevelopment..."(p.63). These theories have been very influential in the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs, especially in the case of El Salvador. Marxism provided a revolutionary set of explanations to the understanding of society that became a crucial source of hope for many poor people in Latin American countries. Although these theoretical explanations reflected the mode of production²³ of a developed capitalist country, its teachings, were modified by the Latin American intelligentsia²⁴ (Harris, 1992) to respond to the mode of production of the 'underdeveloped' countries of Latin America and the Caribbean. Therefore, in El Salvador, this

²² in Seers, Duddley,(ed), Dependency Theory, 1981.

²³ According to Marxism, the mode of production is determined by the forces of production (labour) and means of production (financial and industrial/material capital)

²⁴ The same influence has prevailed within conservatism in Latin America. "A notable characteristic of Western conservatism is its flexibility: that is, the ability of conservatives in Europe and the Americas to adapt their thought and program to changing social conditions, all the while striving for the maintenance of social order and stability. (Henderson, 1988, p.166.)

set of explanations, along with devastating poverty, landless peasants and a lack of democracy resulted in an armed revolution which ended, after 12 years, with a politically negotiated solution between the Farabundo Marti Front for National Liberation,(FMLN) and the Salvadorean government. Horazuk(1987) believes that the FMLN (like the ANC of South Africa) has successfully “transitioned from an armed revolutionary movement into an electoral party and won major victories without weakening its political ideals”(p.3).²⁵

The war in El Salvador was seen by the FMLN in the context of a Marxist²⁶ ‘class’ analysis that challenged the “social relations of production” in that particular country (Wright, 1993). As in any capitalist society, according to Marxism, these relations accounted for several factors: 1. A few individuals within the dominant class, ‘the bourgeoisie’²⁷, accumulate the wealth of a particular society. 2. The wealth accumulated by the bourgeoisie is the result of the development of wage labour [working class]. 3. The wage labour is maintained through the competition for jobs amongst the working class (Editorial Progreso, p.43, ND). 4. The working class (once in control of the means of production) in alliance with the peasants is the one indicated to organize and overthrow these elites and to establish the ‘dictatorship of the proletariat’. This implies the “...doctrine of the world-historical mission of the working class as builder of a classless

²⁵ Some critics of the Salvadorean revolution argue that the war brought no change for the people of El Salvador, others believe that Salvadorean civil society has more opportunities now than before the war. The FMLN, for instance, won an unprecedented 45% of Salvadorean support in the March 1997 elections.

²⁶ Of all the dominant paradigms to explain underdevelopment in Latin America such as Conservatism, Liberalism and Marxism, the latter is the one which focuses on a class analysis.

²⁷ For purpose of this study, I will use the term ‘elite’ although Amin (1996) explains how it is a misnomer. The Bourgeoisie is the real Marxist term for this dominant class.

society...”(Progress Publishers, 1984, p.11). 5. A transitional stage of this dictatorship is socialism to the final stage the establishment of communism (Progress Publishers, 1984).

While Marxism has had the most influence in Southern countries (Frank 1984) it has been widely discredited (Nimtz, 1993). A critique of Marxism presented by Frank (1984) argues that the failure of Marxism lies in believing that the proletariat could be the main force to lead to socialism. He concludes that contemporary historical materialism has revealed that “the proletariat has little reason to play the role originally ascribed to it by Marx’s historical materialism”²⁸ (p.284).

Defenders of Marxist historical materialism, such as Shamir Amin (1996), believe that the root conditions underlying this theory still prevail and allege that neo-Marxists do not do justice to Marx’s original thinking. "The neo-Marxist schools of thought are classified on whether their theoretical emphasis is on modes of production, dependency, or the World system"(Amin, 1996, p.77).

Dependency theory challenged the Northern domination over the Southern countries. However, Southern governments which have tried to base their development plans on a dependency or Marxist

²⁸ The Marxist method of historical materialism is grounded in the belief that “it is not the consciousness of men that determines their existence, but on the contrary, it is their social existence which determines their consciousness” (Frank, 1984, p. 280). For Lenin this was the “concrete analysis of a concrete reality”(ibid). Therefore, the exploitation of the workers will raise their consciousness into fighting against their oppressive conditions.

analysis have suffered the political and military intervention of the United States government, and have "seldom been able to see their work through to completion. Examples include, Nicaragua under the Sandinistas, Grenada under the People's Revolutionary Government, Mozambique under the Mozambican Liberation Front (FRELIMO) and Chile under the Unidad Popular" (King, 1992, p.45). Cuba, under Fidel Castro, has been the only socialist country in Latin America, which has survived²⁹ so far the counter-attack of neo-conservatism/liberalism. Most social movements and/or democratic forces have been militarily repressed by anti-democratic governments. Other revolutionary movements, such as the Farabundo Marti Front for National Liberation in El Salvador, (FMLN) and the National Revolutionary Unity of Guatemala (URNG) have eventually reached peace settlements with the state.

Part of the failure of the dependency theory approach in Latin America can be attributed to the attachment of Latin American elites to modernization theory. According to this theory, northern style development is a path for Southern countries to imitate. The principal advocate of modernisation theory is Walt Rostow (1962) in his book *The Stages of Economic Growth: A non-communist Manifesto*. Modernisation theory views development as a linear progression followed by all societies from a "traditional" stage, through a "take-off" period to "the age of mass consumption", currently represented in the industrialised West. Within this vision, Latin American elites have attempted to achieve development through neo-liberal policies of structural adjustments and market control. These

²⁹ I am using the term survived, because in reality Cuba is slowly but surely privatizing and allowing corporations and people to own private businesses. A Cuban representative stated that these changes are made while protecting the interest of the revolution, however (Ottawa, July 1987).

policies are implemented through International Funding Institutions (IFIs) which formulate structural adjustment reforms to ensure "fiscal discipline, changing priorities in public spending, tax reform, financial liberalization, a competitive exchange rate, trade liberalization, foreign investment, privatization, and adequate property rights" (Rosales, 1995, p.5). According to Kay (1989), the key to this approach is the "flexibility in which prices rule and government intervention or dirigisme is spurned" (p.228).

In the context of El Salvador, in which the Marxist led FMLN parties have almost as much popular support as the conservative government, new challenges are arise for both Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs. How will this new conjuncture in El Salvador facilitate or hinder their programming? Will the FMLN support the neo-liberal policies of the government?. How will both NGOs maintain a class analysis in their relationship?

In the following section, I will discuss the role that an integrated approach can play in the North-South NGO relationship.

2.5 Towards an Integration of Marxism, Anti-Racism and Feminism

A Marxist/Feminist/Anti-Racist framework for analyzing the North-South relationship between NGOs must take into account three oppressions (racism, sexism and classism). Anti-racism work, for instance, must take into consideration that "racism divides certain categories of women and

unites them with men" (Anthias and Yuval-Davis, 1992, p.106). Black and other racial minority women struggling to unionize (being paid less than the Black and racial minority men) may subordinate their gender struggle of 'equal pay for work of equal value' to struggle together with men against racism in the work force, although it may not directly address their gender needs. In relation to class, on the other hand, Callari et al, (1995), argue that we must be developing new ways of situating class in the arenas of social struggle and identity. They recognize that 'traditional' class politics are also gendered and racialized politics, and state that "...with the decentering of class, Marxists can continue to highlight the class aspects and consequences of social life, while showing how class affects but does not necessarily predominate in a variety of ostensibly non-class struggles" (p.7).

An anti-racist, class and gender approach to North-South relations must start with a conscientization process, as advocated by Freire (1989). "In order for the oppressed to be able to struggle for their liberation, they must perceive the reality of oppression not as a closed world from which there is no exit, but as a limiting situation which they can transform... it must become the motivating force for liberating action"(p.34). If any task is difficult and challenging, this is the one. Conscientization implies the self- deconstruction of classism, sexism and racism into marxist, feminist and anti-racist practice. With this approach Northern and Southern NGOs develop a relationship that continues to advocate for structural solution to poverty and inequality rather than being content with, or 'resigned' to, band aid solutions.

An Anti-Racist analysis contributes to deconstructing the notion of Southern countries' populations being less intelligent and the belief in the racial superiority of Northern countries, thereby creating a world that recognizes difference as part of equality amongst populations of all races. NGO work is considered supplementary (not a substitute) to the efforts of Salvadoreans. The arrogant notion that the North is the savior of the South becomes a joint struggle in which both NGOs take the same risks (Murphy, 1991) and have the same responsibilities.

Given that the majority of the world's poor populations are from Brown, Yellow and Black races, we must incorporate an anti-racist framework into a class analysis. Class without an anti-racist analysis is inadequate. The main reason for targeting racism in international development is that racism is present in what Bowser (1995) calls "in consequence but not by formal institutions" (p.295). Therefore anti-racist activists face a double struggle to challenging a system(s), which is racist in nature but one which denies the existence of racism. In South Africa for instance, the collapse of state apartheid is supposed to have abolished racism, yet "the new South Africa, continues to perpetuate racism in consequence"(Ibid, p.295). This racism 'in consequence' is also noted by hooks (1995); "Overt racist discrimination is not as fashionable as it once was and that is why everyone can pretend racism does not exist ...we need to talk about the vernacular discourse of neo-colonial white supremacy--similar to racism but not the same thing" (p.5).

An Anti-racist analysis is fundamental in understanding the North-South NGO relationship as it challenges NGOs in both South and North to engage in a process of decolonization towards

racial equality hooks (1995) argues that the unlearning of white supremacy starts by divesting [oneself] of white privilege (if one is white) and vestiges of internalized racism (if one is black). This occurs by “transforming our minds and our habits of being” (p.264).

A feminist analysis ensures that the contribution to the process of development of half the world's population (women) is integrated in achieving the social, political, economic and racial equality within and between Southern and Northern countries. Yet , as Andersen (1997) notes it, there is a need for an inclusive thinking that “reminds us that women’s experiences vary by race, class, age and other social factors” (p.13). Therefore, when Northern and Southern NGOs challenge the sexism within and between the relationship between peoples and their institutions they contribute to this inclusivity.

In this framework I have not presented answers; rather I have tried to generate questions through specific issues. This I hope will generate discussion towards actions by Northern and Southern NGOs as institutions and as peoples to address race, class, and gender in their relationships. Actions will ideally lead to more discussion and eventually result in the conscientization in both the North and the South. A process of conscientization can have a snowball effect on people's organizing.

In the case of El Salvador this process has been left dormant for the last 5 years, due to the lack of vision after the war. Salvadoreans were so focused on fighting to end the war that they did not

develop post-war strategies. At a meeting that I attended with representatives from rural communities and peasant organizations the discussion focused on their movements' need to be revitalized to fight to improve their social and economic conditions. These, they said, have not improved with the end of the war.

In the North this process of conscientization has also been dormant the last 15 to 20 years due to the co-optation of popular movements through government funding.

Conclusion

The mainstream development literature misses an integrated Anti-Racist, Feminist approach to explaining and bringing solutions to Southern underdevelopment. Recently, attempts have been made by Anti-Racist, and Feminist and Marxist writers to incorporate the other, specifically in the areas of Feminism and Anti-Racism, or Feminism and development. The integration of race, class and gender in to progressive literature addresses the social relations in Northern countries such as Canada, the United States and Europe (Bowser, 1995, Essed, 1991).

At the macro and micro levels, the challenge remains for academics, social movements, Anti-Racist and Feminist movements to challenge the present social, political and economic conditions, which will determine the transition in the world for the next 50 years (Wallerstein, 1996). It is the role the intelligentsia and activists to provide an Anti-Racist, feminist and Marxist integrated approach in order to advance the cause of development for Southern countries. The North can only benefit by such an

approach. Such leadership will help Northern and Southern NGOs and states, in establishing improved relationships. The role that the theories reviewed in this literature (development, Anti-Racism and feminism) play in the development work on NGOs in the South will be explored later in this chapter.

In summary, the first part of this chapter (the macro) has demonstrated that the lack of an integrated approach to race, class and gender in the literature, implies that it has “established pattern of domination based on race, gender and colonial status that continue to shape the relations between the North and the South today” (King, 1992, p.39). The development literature does not integrate an analysis of Anti-Racism and Feminism. It does, however, contain an approach that I call the “silent integrated oppression”; the silence is the omission to address racism, sexism and classism in the world. In fact, this contributes to the silence of these oppressions in the North-South relationship. Mainstream development academics are called upon to analyze development from an anti-racist, Marxist and Feminist perspective.

Chapter 3

Canadian and Salvadorean NGO relations: a review of the literature

Introduction

As discussed in chapter two, Northern and Southern NGO relations are influenced by theories in the North and the South. With the creation of the 'aid' programs from the so-called 'developed' (Northern) countries to the so called 'underdeveloped' countries (the South)³⁰ following the Second World War, both Northern and Southern NGOs have been involved in the 'aid' process.

In this chapter, I examine the trends in the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs, especially as it is played out through the 'aid' process. I briefly discuss the origins of this process and the delivery of aid through NGOs, followed by an examination of the context of Canadian aid to El Salvador. Then I refer to the tripartite nature of the relationship and some of the issues that the literature presents around the directions in the NGO relationship. I also discuss how issues of race, class and gender, have been addressed in the Canadian and Salvadorean NGO relationship. I conclude this chapter by exploring the

³⁰ Although the Marshall Plan (the biggest reconstruction programs to Europe) was North-North.

possible influence on the Northern and Southern NGOs of some (academic) writings on the role of social movements in the world and the interest of both Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs in working around issues of lobby and advocacy.

3.1 The origins of the 'aid' process:

Bennett (1991), argues that the modern world is divided between poor and rich nations, and if all states were divided into two classes, developed and developing "the developed one-fourth of the world population enjoys the benefits of possessing about 80 percent of the gross world product, while in the developing world three times as many people must survive on the remaining 20 percent of the world's wealth" (p.297). This inequality is in large part a result of colonisation and industrialisation (the invasion and appropriation of the new continent's resources and institutionalisation of slavery by European explorers). However, it was only after the second World War that industrialised countries, especially the United States, decided to pay closer attention to the increasing poverty in so-called third world countries. International institutions such as the World Bank (WB) and the International Monetary Fund (IMF) were created (through the Bretton Woods agreement), to manage world finances and a process of bilateral (government to government) financial aid from Northern to Southern countries. These institutions provided huge amounts of cash to Southern countries to modernise their local economies and allow local elites in the South to invest in producing export crops for the international market. Hughes (1991) argues that this approach sought to create "a reliance on

foreign capital to build an industrial base to export, to retire foreign debt, and eventually to invest abroad" (p. 357).

This process of 'aid' through 'loans' has proven to be inefficient, as Southern countries acquired huge debts, and debt service payments have exceeded the income from export products. Bennett (1991) cites that "the debt of the developing states doubled between 1965 and 1973 and doubled again in the next five years.³¹ By 1989, their total indebtedness was more than \$1.3 trillion" (p.297). The end result is that industrialised countries continue to benefit from the debt servicing while the majority of the populations in Southern countries experience worsening poverty.

3.2 Aid delivery through NGOs:

For over thirty years they have channelled 'grant' money to Southern countries mainly through Southern non-governmental organisations (NGOs). CIDA created the NGO Program in 1968, the first development agency in the industrialised world to establish a program of co-operation between government and private agencies working in the third world (CIDA, 1984, p.9). In 1989-90 Canadian NGOs received 16% of Canada's Official Development Aid (ODA), however due to government budget cuts, (1993-94) they received only 10% from a budget of \$2.2 billion for foreign aid (Knox and Stackhouse, 1995, p.A8). At present, the role of NGOs

³¹ It is important to note that a large part of this debt is owed to the banks, not to official donors.

as intermediaries is being questioned, as CIDA's aid shifts towards the private sector and Southern governments to implement development projects (Muchunguzi, Milne, 1995).

Korten classifies these NGOs into three generations or types: "Relief and Welfare; small-scale, self-reliant local development (or Community Development); and sustainable systems of development" (Korten, 1987 as cited in Macdonald, 1996, p.8). The first generation (or relief and welfare) focused on providing material relief in the short term, and had an "assistentialist" (meeting survival needs) approach to development. The second generation, provided assistance through technical skills and financial resources while having a developmentalist approach, based on economic growth. The third generation attempts to change Southern (national) policies in favour of the poor, and provides technical and financial assistance. This generation should act more as a catalyst for change, Korten argues, but not necessarily social change (Macdonald, *ibid*). These generations of NGOs do not necessarily have only one characteristic, but may (over time) have had a combination of all three.³² According to Johnston (1995), "the differences among NGOs are based on *choices* they make, grounded in a particular world view and informed by relations and alliances with local groups, about the nature of their role, their activities and their overall political strategy"(p.57). Johnston believes

³² On NGO frameworks see also: -Brodhead, Tim, "NGOs: In One Year, Out the Other?", World Development, Supplement. 15 (Autumn 1987):1-6; Elliot, Charles, "Some aspects of the Relations Between the North and South in the NGO Sector." World Development, Supplement 15 (Autumn 1987): 57-68; Korten, David C, "Third Generation NGO strategies: A Key to People-Centered Development." Supplement 15 (Autumn 1987): 145-59; Therien, Jean-Philippe, "Non-governmental Organization and International Development Assistance." Canadian Journal of Development Studies, 12.2 (1991):263-80.

that "historical origins and motivations, links to international organizations and unequal access to resources have resulted in significant differences between Northern and Southern NGOs"(ibid).

3.3 Canadian Aid to El Salvador:

In 1984, the Canadian government renewed its bilateral aid to El Salvador despite the fact that many Canadian NGOs and Salvadorean organisations had denounced the human rights violations committed by the Salvadorean government. NGOs stated that with the escalation of the civil war in that country, "the renewal of bilateral aid to El Salvador must be understood and interpreted within the broader context of the overall counter-insurgency program of the Salvadorean government" (Hymovitch, 1986, p.25). Bilateral aid basically supported the programs neglected by the Salvadorean government due to its greater priority of financing military operations.³³ The Canadian government sub-contracted with a Canadian for-profit NGO, the Canadian Hunger Foundation, to administer all the funds for these purposes. Many NGOs advocated for aid to be sent through not for-profit NGO channels, not linked to the Salvadorean government. This, they argued, would support the people in most need, rather than supporting a government with a high record of human rights violations.

³³ Unofficial comments by CIDA officers refer to progressive NGOs considering bilateral funds as 'dirty money'.

Bilateral aid was given to El Salvador once again in 1995. This time the funds were to be administered by a Canadian consortium called SOGEMA.³⁴ Canadian NGOs were critical of this and requested that criteria be developed to support local grassroots Salvadorean NGOs, rather than only business oriented NGOs. SOGEMA's Social Reconstruction Program aims to support projects that give both Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs equal opportunity in the application for funding through a 'bidding' system. In 1995, five out of sixty-six proposals submitted by NGOs to SOGEMA received funding³⁵. The five were Salvadorean non-profit or business oriented NGOs. Although bilateral aid still plays a determining role in Canadian-Salvadorean NGO relations, a further analysis of aid policies goes beyond the scope of this study.

3.4 Tripartite nature of the relationship:

The relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs is part of the 'engranage'³⁶ in which both NGOs play the role of donor and recipient. Canadian NGOs are donors to Salvadorean

³⁴ SOGEMA is private firm from Montreal that won the competition to administer the Canadian Aid program.

³⁵ Interview with Jorge Garza, project analyst for SOGEMA in El Salvador, July, 1996.

³⁶ Engranaje is the Spanish word for 'gear'. The meaning that I have chosen for 'gear' is presented in the dictionary as "...assembly of interacting parts that serves to transmit motion or to change the rate or direction of motion." (Funk & Wagnalls, 1989, p.554). In figurative speech it also means 'Enlazar', "Dar enlace o trabazon a unas cosas con otras" (Everest Corona, 1974, p.590). To link or unite something's with others.

NGOs, and recipients of CIDA funding.³⁷ Salvadorean NGOs are donors to Salvadorean communities and organizations,³⁸ and recipients of funds from Canadian NGOs. Their relationship is therefore tripartite in nature. Muchunguzi & Milne (1995)³⁹ describe this relationship in two ways: one, the challenge faced by Northern NGOs in securing funding for their projects in the South in which there is a "...tendency from the donor to give to NGOs more flexibility in programming only after the latter had agreed to implement programming in one of the donor's priority areas" (p.56); two, the challenge faced by Southern NGOs as "...Northern donors exercise too much control over the processes...formulate development agendas and tend to impose these agendas on Southern partners"(IBID, p.13.).

This tripartite relationship greatly influences the directions in the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs. For instance, in a CIDA policy document in 1994, CNGOs wanting to receive CIDA support are mandated to adopt a 'Result-Oriented Management Approach'(RBM). Inasmuch as the document states that Canadian NGOs "are not asked to transform their management systems, but merely ensure that they show evidence of the program results to which they, their partners and CIDA are committed."(p.1), the document is

³⁷ I use the term recipient to refer to the Canadian NGO and CIDA relationship although as discussed later in this chapter, Canadian NGOs have more leverage with the Canadian government than Salvadorean NGOs do with Canadian NGOs

³⁸ The relationship between Salvadorean NGOs and their communities is not studied here. One PCNGO representative stated that this is also an unequal relationship.

³⁹ A 1995 study financed by the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) entitled, Perspectives from the South: a Study on Partnership.

clear in that CIDA expects that the result-based management will replace past approaches to development such as the 'blue-print, or proposal-led' approach.⁴⁰ According to this document, the RBM, is an approach "that anticipates the uniqueness of each situation and rewards innovation" (p.3). This approach is focused on obtaining results; "what is actually achieved within a particular period of time, toward the attainment of goals and objectives"(p.4). Although in this study I do not focus on the relationship between CIDA and the Canadian NGOs, I have raised this issue because the changes in CIDA criteria affect Canadian NGOs' programming which is in turn reflected in the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs. This issue will be discussed further in chapter 6.

3.5 Directions in the relationship:

Relations between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs have involved the following characteristics: Many Canadian NGOs have taken an active role in policy and advocacy in monitoring human rights violations in that country despite, at times, disagreeing with the Canadian government and CIDA policies. Many Salvadorean NGOs supported the FMLN's social, political and economic platform. Due to the critical situation in El Salvador during the war years, (1979 to 1992), Salvadorean NGOs regarded the "single most important factor

⁴⁰ "Under proposal-led or blueprint programming, the inputs and activity details of the project proposal, rather than the results sought, drove the project and was the point of reference for evaluation and monitoring. (ibid, p.2)

affecting their work [as] the war...prolongation of the war means an increased suffering for civilians"(CCIC, 1986, p.1).

The relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs, at the time, was shaped by pressure on Canadian NGOs to "develop a pro-active program to help defend popular organisations and humanitarian assistance programmes in El Salvador"(NICA, 1989, p.9). In response, Canadian NGOs were asking the Canadian government to "provide funding for the creation and maintenance of linkages among like-minded NGOs and popular organisations in Canada and Central America... and support Canadian NGO organised development education programmes on Central America" (CAPA, 1989, p.4).

In the early 90s, due to funding cuts implemented by CIDA, the focus shifted from supporting the emergency situation in El Salvador to addressing the financial vulnerability of Canadian NGOs (CNGOs), and their need to change work strategies in order to survive. Kelleher, D, et al (1996) argued that CNGOs needed to move their organisations towards more professionalization and expertise as "...NGOs are facing uncertain financial futures, and in some cases a crises of relevance" (p.iii). A CCIC⁴¹ document (1993) stated that part of the change in CNGOs involved taking a more pro-active role in lobbying against structural adjustment processes happening in the world. "One answer for

⁴¹ CCIC stands for Canadian Council for International Co-operation. It is an umbrella agency for over 200 Canadian NGOs and is based in Ottawa.

NGOs is to remain relevant by devoting more attention to macro policy issues and advocacy for necessary reforms"(p.12). Canadian NGO shift in this direction is also due to pressure by Southern NGOs who continue to request financial support, while also asking that Northern NGOs play a role at the macro level of policy and advocacy. "What they [Southern NGOs] need from their Northern counterparts is action on policies in industrial-world capitals... 'we can't change the opinion of Canadian or American decision-makers... only Canadians or Americans can do that" (The Globe & Mail, 1995).⁴² Murphy (1991) believes that education and advocacy role over a period of 15 years, may have been the "most significant activity and contribution of the NGOs, with more lasting effect than the millions of dollars the NGOs used in programs in the Third World over the same time"(p.171).

3.5.1 Naming the relationship:

The relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs has been called 'partnership' (CIDA, 1984), especially in the North. This partnership refers both to the relationship between Canadian NGOs and CIDA, and between Canadian NGOs and Southern NGOs. A 1984 CIDA, document summarising the agency's last 15 years of supporting development projects in the South, situates this partnership in the context of money exchange between the North the South. It states that 'partnership', has...

⁴² The Globe & Mail, 'Aid agencies compelled to dance to Ottawa's tune'. International News Section, p. A8, 1995)

channelled resources to regions and sectors in the developing world that tend to be neglected by government. It has actively involved and thus encouraged self-reliance. It has strengthened local institutions and indigenous development efforts and tapped local and other resources that would normally be available for development purposes (CIDA, 1984, p.12).

The same report, however, presents 'partnerships' between CIDA and Canadian NGOs, as a process between two partners. It states,

"... the government was anxious not only to help the NGOs increase and expand their efforts but to do so in a way that respected their independence, integrity and personality... a co-operative endeavour between CIDA and the NGOs to assist the developing countries to better their lot and to become self-reliant" (IBID, p.10).

Canadian NGOs state clearly their desire to have an equal relationship with CIDA, by collaborating, consulting, and participating in the decision making process. A CCIC (1995) document advocates for a relationship with CIDA based on three principles: openness to independent initiatives by voluntary organisations; transparency and reciprocal enrichment in the elaboration of programs, policies and decision-making; and efficient consultation (p.2).

Murphy (1991) states that there remains some give and take in the relationship, but ...

due to conventional illusions of who is giving (the government) and who is taking (the community), there is rarely rigorous debate and struggle in what become a comfortable symbiotic relationship. But the givers and takers are in reality entirely the reverse of conventional premises: the government is in fact taking from the community; and it is the community that is giving; the workers (paid and unpaid and those nominally served by the society in question) are subsidising the government and society as a whole through volunteer activity"(p.197).

As mentioned earlier, it is not be in the scope of this study to analyse this relationship in-depth. However, I believe that Canadian NGOs (especially the larger agencies) are well-equipped to advocate on their own behalf with donor agencies and eventually to improve the relationships with Southern NGOs. CNGOs can argue with CIDA that they have the right to access taxpayers' money which is in turn reinvested in Canada. Salvadorean NGOs (SNGOs) can not use the same argument in their negotiating with CNGOs.

Due to criticisms by Southern NGOs, (addressed in the section below) certain Canadian NGOs have acknowledged, (especially since the late 80s) that the relationship between Canadian and Southern NGOs has been unequal, and some have moved away from relying on the term 'partnership'. "The concept of partnership itself requires careful scrutiny " (Clinton as cited in Wilson & Whitmore, 1995, p.62). Many Northern NGOs prefer the terms 'collaboration' or 'team work' with 'associates' or 'counterparts'" (Muchunguzi & Milne, 1995, p.62).

Some Canadian NGOs working in Central America are adopting an approach called "Accompaniment... this relationship is based upon respect for control by the local agency and an attempt to provide non-monetary forms of support for the struggles of local groups and a deeper form of commitment for the processes of social change in the third world"(Macdonald, 1996, p27). Others support this approach as well because it

“embodies a process of sharing mutual support... a form of development co-operation that goes beyond the financial relationship and is based on mutual knowledge, a common commitment, and solidarity” (Clinton, 1991, as cited in Wilson and Whitmore, 1995, p.62).

In a 1989 CCIC workshop to define Canadian NGOs role in Central America, participants indicated an interest in moving “beyond project to program; to increase co-operation among NGOs in Canada; to redefine our *relationship* (my emphasis) with Central Americans so that they become active participants in defining our work; to change our attitudes to the way we go about our work”(Burke, 1989, p.2).

In Central America, documents indicate that the relationships established between certain Canadian NGOs with certain Salvadorean and Central American NGOs,⁴³ - should have entailed a relationship of more equality. In this type of project, Northern and Southern NGOs would have to show a commitment towards “... a new international division of labour...in which Northern and Southern NGOs both have essential parts to play if common goals are to be attained, in which neither has sole power, and one might add, the risks in working for change are more equally shared” (Murphy, 1991, p.178).

⁴³ to support projects aiming at peace building, democracy, and social justice, -which are not readily measurable in financial terms

The term 'alliances' is used by the authors of the documents published in 1995. This refers to a better way of establishing relationships and ways of working among Canadians, Southern NGOs and other actors in the world. A 1995 Oxfam-Canada document, states that strategic alliances in Canada and internationally, "are creative responses that have both a programmatic dimension...(a consolidation of working relationships with programming partners) and an organisational or structural aspect... (mergers and association with other agencies)" (p.1).

Such alliances are an alternative for future Northern and Southern NGOs relationships.

The North South NGO interaction, whether in El Salvador, Central America or in other areas of the world, implies a multiplicity and range of NGO relationships, "The donor/recipient relationship, the service/client relationship, the bureaucratic relationship. The professional relationship, the political relationship: these are all different, with very different properties and levels of trust, commitment, intimacy" (Murphy, 1991, p.185). All the terms used such as partnerships, collaboration, associates, teamwork or counterparts, or alliances are names given by different Canadian NGOs to their different relationships with Southern NGOs. It is not completely clear in the literature what different practices these relationships, or the names given to them, have entailed (Torres, 1996). None of these approaches present an integrated vision of class, gender and race (Marxism, Anti-racism, feminism).

I have in the following chart attempted to summarize some of these practices.⁴⁴

3.5.2 Table 1. Models of North-South NGO relations.

Development theories	Resulting Relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs.
Modernisation (Neo-liberalism Neo-conservatism) Model I	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Vertical & Paternalistic relationship -Perpetuation of North/South Divide -Like minded NGOs, no obvious conflict amongst Northern donors and Southern recipients. Southern NGO's complete submission to donors' requirements. -Large NGO budgets (millions of dollars) due to access to bilateral funding, or International Funding Institutions (IFIs) -Larger Southern NGOs budgets, due to accessing their own government's funding as well. -No recognition of power dynamics, Gender incorporated as one amongst other project criteria -Racism is completely ignored. -pouring of aid to solve Southern underdevelopment, band aid solutions to a global problem . Name for relationship: partnership.
Dependency (Marxism Social Democracy) Model II	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Combination of Vertical and Horizontal relationship -Recognition of power dynamics in the relationship -Less funding than previous model, due to unwillingness to access bilateral aid -Racism acknowledged as existing within Southern countries only -Gender incorporated as one more criteria, while criticising sexism in the South -Conflict with Southern NGOs at times due to differences in approach to development -Projects implemented are not necessarily different than the previous model (band aid solutions with some short term structural changes through their lobbying and advocacy against undemocratic government policies in both the North and the South and IFIs -name for the relationship: accompaniment, partnership, alliances, collaboration.
Dependency (MarxismAnti-Racist Feminist) Model III = Mutualism (see model on chapter 6).	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Horizontal relationship -Ongoing conflict due to conscientization process. -Less funding from government or other sources of funding -international alliances, lobby, advocacy, civil disobedience towards permanent structural changes -challenging racism, sexism and classism, (within and between North and South) -Long term projects towards long term changes in the world. -Name of relationship: mutualism.

⁴⁴ The resulting relationship of the Neo-liberalism/liberalism approach is based on literature data and does not necessarily reflect Canadian or Salvadorean NGOs.

Model one

3.5.3. The Modernisation (Neo-liberalism and Neo-conservatism)

This model reflects Korten's first and second generation of NGOs. The interventions of these NGOs focus on providing material relief to Southern NGOs to address emergency and short term needs. They measure development in terms of economic growth (Macdonald, 1996). Both Northern and Southern NGOs have large budgets (millions of dollars) due to access to bilateral funding, or International Funding Institutions (IFIs). Southern NGOs harshly criticize this NGOs fund-raising approach because of their tendency to represent Third world countries as helpless victims and Northern countries as the saviours (Muchunguzi & Milne, 1995).

Although in this model the relationship is called a 'partnership,' it is a vertical and paternalistic relationship that does not challenge the North-South Divide. In this model, Southern NGOs tend to be like minded NGOs that comply to the Northern NGOs criteria, thus avoiding conflict and the recognition of the underlying power dynamics. These NGOs incorporate gender issues as one amongst other project criteria, without challenging sexism. This relationship ignores blatant racism, yet some policies such as forced sterilization of Southern women in exchange for project funding entails racist practices (Gillespie, 1994).

Model two

3.5.4 Dependency theory (Marxism, and Social Democracy)

This model reflects (partially) Korten's third generation of NGOs⁴⁵. These NGOs efforts attempt "to change national policies in favour of the poor than towards small scale projects " (Macdonald, 1996, p.11). Part of the policy work involves initiatives for short term structural changes through their lobbying and advocacy. The targets of this lobbying are IFIs and also Southern governments. The small scale projects implemented by these NGOs are not necessarily different from the previous group, however, they tend to receive less funding. Part of this is their unwillingness and or inability to access bilateral and corporate aid.

The name of this model is 'accompaniment' (also partnership, alliances, and collaboration). It presents a relationship that combines vertical and horizontal characteristics called 'positive and negative inequality'(see chapter 5). Northern NGOs acknowledge the power dynamics in the relationship that at times brings conflict due to their differences in development approaches. Both NGOs tend to use more negotiating techniques to express their views. Some Northern and Southern NGOs acknowledge racism in the North-South relations, not however in the NGO to NGO relationship.

⁴⁵ "Third generation NGOs which attempt to promote reform of state policies are therefore not necessarily part of projects of progressive social change" (Macdonald, 1996, p.11).

Northern NGOs identify racism within Southern countries mainly. The projects incorporate gender as one more criteria and there are acknowledgement of sexism in development.

Model three

3.5.5 Marxism, Dependency, Anti-Racism and Feminism

The basis for this model is a relationship based on horizontal elements: meaningful participation of Southern NGOs in the elaboration of policies and programming of Canadian NGOs and vice versa, ongoing communication about projects; systematic communication around strategies to achieve international alliances, lobby, advocacy, civil disobedience towards structural changes such as the building of peace, democracy and social political and economic platforms of popular organizations.

The key for this model, however is the incorporation of an anti-racist perspective to the NGO relationship by entering a process of conscientization towards the dismantling of classism, sexism and racism within and between North and South .

The political aspect of this new relationship risks losing eligibility of sources of funding from government or other sources. The nature of this relationship will be conflictive at the beginning, due to the fact that both NGOs see each other as equals and thus each can challenge the other to do the same.

For a more detailed discussion of a Class, Gender and Racial-Mutualism relationship see chapter 5.

3.6 Race/Class and Gender in the relationship:

In trying to understand the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs in light of the impact of class, gender and race, the literature indicates that there is more understanding of the impact of class on the relationship (Northern NGOs have supported Southern NGOs who have had Marxist influence in their work). Following class, gender has received the most attention. Discussion of the impact of race is almost nonexistent. This is especially true amongst NGOs who work on policy and advocacy towards social equality.

Gender is included in various NGO project policies. CIDA's policy objectives on women and development have openly supported the incorporation of gender equity "to promote policies

and activities among CIDA's partners, in Canada and overseas, that enable them to integrate gender considerations effectively into their development work"(CIDA, 1995, p.2). Other literature call for the role of women to be specifically defined. Beaulink (1989) states, " we often make the mistake of merely viewing women as 'beneficiaries' or as 'target group' while, only later we began to see them as active agents in the development process"(p.90).

In regards to race, the literature indicates some acknowledgement but is mostly silent about racism in international development. For instance, in a CCIC and R&R ⁴⁶ workshop, (with the theme, "Shrouding of Racism"), organized for NGOs working in South Africa, it was stated: "Canadian solidarity workers find it easier to work elsewhere. There is a denial of the need to deal with racism in Canada"(CCIC, 1994, p.6). Canadian NGOs are outspoken about challenging racism in Southern countries. They understood that the changes in South Africa are "not simply the end of apartheid but the beginning of institutional change to reduce racism"(ibid, p.6). However, at this workshop it was stated that anti-racism work needs to be done internally, in all Canadian NGOs, as a pre-requisite action for Canadian NGOs working in this part of the world (Africa).

⁴⁶ R&R is the Re-habilitation and Reconstruction program of CCIC to help in emergency situation such as war and natural disaster in Southern countries. This program was closed due to CIDA budget cuts to CCIC in 1995.

3.7 A possible influence to the Northern and Southern NGO relationship for the future

Seeing a light at the end of the tunnel of underdevelopment and the disillusionment with the present crisis, some progressive intelligentsia see hope in social movements on a world wide scale.

Frank (1996) believes in the opportunities for social change offered by social movements worldwide. He also warns that the previously progressive political content or direction of social movements seem to be turning rightward. "In Latin America, right-wing evangelical fundamentalism is replacing more progressive community organizations around the theology of liberation and other popular currents in the Catholic Church" (1996, p.49).

Amin (1996) believes that social movements have been the most powerful movements in the contemporary scene, such as the contributions of the feminist movement, but criticizes Frank for his naive belief in social movements as the answer. Amin argues that social movements seemed "to be completely manipulable (and are manipulated) by the dominant forces of capital, preoccupied in the short term with the management of the crisis and not with its solution" (p.67). He furthers his argument in that "the task ahead is first and

foremost the reconstruction of the social power of the popular classes that has been eroded by the ongoing crisis" (Amin, 1996, p.85).

Chew & Denmark, (1996) consider the study of social movements important "to facilitate the progressive march of freedom and justice". However they caution us that even if we "think globally and act locally", focusing on the local without addressing a broader framework might actually constrain our understanding of the underpinnings of the issues at hand, while making it easy for pernicious international forces to undermine good works (p.12).

Korten (1995) calls for the dismantling of international funding institutions such as the World bank and the IMF).⁴⁷ "It is an essential step towards assuring that the international debts are eliminated, and that these are not instantly re-created... the intent of these is to interfere with the operations of transnational corporations and financial markets... to create a system that works well for people"(Korten, 1995,p323-4).⁴⁸

⁴⁷ This is a shift from lobbying the IFIs to improve their policies to asking for their closure. This has implications for NGO lobbying that has traditionally focused on the former.

⁴⁸ In this book When Corporations Rule the World , (1995) Korten's proposal outlines the following: the International Monetary Fund (IMF), should be replaced by a United Nations International Finance Organization(UNIFO) responsible for (1) managing the process of repudiating and writing off the international debts of low-income countries; (2)regulating international financial markets; (3)providing a forum within which governments can coordinate policies aimed at keeping their foreign accounts balanced...The World Trade Organization(WTO) should be replaced by a UN Regulatory Agency for Transnational Trade and Investment (UNRATTI)... This is as well how Corporate libertarians will see these measures. ."(p.323-4)

Kay, (1989) calls upon Structuralists and Dependistas to rediscover civil society, to present proposals for strengthening the social participation and the social organisation of the weak, the voiceless, the oppressed, and the poor. "It is also imperative to give greater recognition to the importance of cultural ideological elements in the mobilisation of society for development, the institutionalisation of change and the achievement of social cohesion and integration" (Kay, 1989, p.211).

At the theoretical level, Amin (1996) recognizes the global polarization inherent in capitalism and calls for "long projects of transition that confront the double task, in part contradictory, of developing the forces of production and of constructing alternative social relations of production" (p.75).

Korten (1995) sees the need for a people-centered development theory that would explain and provide guidance in addressing the deeper causes of the crisis. He argues that without a theory, "we were like a pilot without a compass". Therefore what is needed is a theory of sustainable societies that would apply to Northern and Southern countries alike. He believes that this theory must go beyond the sterile formulations of economics to explain why human societies have become so alienated from natural processes. The aim is therefore the creation of life-

centered societies in which the economy is but one of the instruments of good living-not the purpose of human existence(p.6-7).

Vargas (1996) suggests a more adequate concept of "emancipatory processes" ⁴⁹ "It is plural, not singular, because I believe it is essential to overcome the idea of a single unifying process (as claimed with the concept of 'development' in order to open ourselves up to multiple processes and ethnical/political projects reflecting the vast diversity of the continent" (p.353), Vargas argues that although this approach negates a class struggle, an emancipatory process recognizes and acknowledges similarities and differences amongst the struggles in order to achieve a common goal.

Since advocates for social movements lack a Feminist, Marxist and Anti-Racist integrated approach to their strategies on development and underdevelopment, it is unlikely that the networking and relationships these movements propose include such an approach. By having an integrated approach to the relationship these social movements indeed contribute to the eradication of classism, sexism and racism. If this is not done, the social movement advocates perpetuate a model where the North 'accompanies' the

⁴⁹ According to Giddens (1991), we can define *emancipatory politics* as a perspective attempting above all to liberate individuals and groups from constraints adversely affecting their life's possibilities" (as cited in Vargas, 1996, p.353).

South without sharing the risks and responsibilities, the South will again initiate the organizing and the North will again replicate the 'aid regime'.⁵⁰

To review, I have discussed in this section (the micro) the context of the 'aid' process to El Salvador as it played out among the Canadian NGOs and Salvadorean NGOs. I have presented some issues around the role that Northern NGOs have played in this relationship, including their relationship with CIDA. I have also examined the impact that race, class and gender have had in the relationship and I have presented the current models of the relationship, such as partnership and accompaniment and class, gender and racial-mutualism. I concluded this chapter by addressing the possible influence of social movements on the relationship in the future.

⁵⁰ In this model (the North) becomes the policy maker and consultant, and the South, the executor.

Chapter 4

Methodology

Introduction

This is an exploratory study of the relationship between progressive Northern and Southern NGOs in Canada and El Salvador. The data were collected through face-to-face interviews with participant NGOs' staff in Canada and El Salvador. The sample was limited, following Wolcott's argument (1994) that "for the in-depth reporting that is the hallmark of qualitative work...increasing the number of cases serves only to reduce proportionately the attention that can be given to any one of them"(p.182).

4.1 Sample

A total of ten progressive NGOs participated in this study, four Canadian based NGOs with programming in El Salvador and Central America, and six Salvadorean based NGOs receiving funding from Canadian NGOs⁵¹. I also interviewed one CIDA staff person in El Salvador, whose input was crucial to my understanding of the future trends in the relationships.⁵²

Most of the progressive Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs have had a relationship with one another for at least 9 years (between 1986 to 1996). This time corresponds to the

⁵¹ The interview data from two of the Salvadorean NGOs were not incorporated in the descriptive findings of this study (Chapter 5), due to the fact that the NGO staff interviewed had been with the organization a very short time and could not specifically answer the questions asked. Their input, however, is incorporated into my general understanding of how the relationship is at the present time.

⁵² Initially I wanted to interview 'progressive' and 'traditional' Canadian and Salvadoran NGOs who reflected the combination of Korten's tripology of NGOs, (see chapter 3) However, due to the unwillingness the NGOs to participate in the study, combined with my limited time and financial resources, I interviewed progressive NGOs only.

civil war era in El Salvador in the 1980s, and the non-war era, the 1990s. Through my 15 years of experience in solidarity and development work in El Salvador, I am familiar with the work of all the participant NGOs, personally know all the Canadian interviewees, and two of the Salvadorean interviewees.

I contacted all NGOs over the phone to informally request their participation, followed up by faxes with the official letter of request, consent form and interview guide. (See Appendix 2). This was followed up by another phone call to confirm their participation and arrange an interview date. The five NGOs who declined to participate did so following the written request.

The Salvadorean NGOs agreed to have their names published in the final study. Three of the Canadian NGOs asked to see a draft before agreeing to have their names published in the final study.

Of the ten interviewees, only two were women. As presented chapter 6, this phenomenon brought an interesting perspective, one I had not previously anticipated.⁵³

4.2 Instruments

Two instruments⁵⁴ were used in this study: 1. Face-to-face interviews. 2. Reflexive log.

⁵³ I did not interview 'Women only' NGOs because they are newer in the history of El Salvador and therefore had not been working as long with Canadian NGOs, as was the case, I felt of other mixed gender organizations.

⁵⁴ Originally, I had planned to have a third instrument: A content analysis of documents (policies, programs, project criteria) of Canadian NGOs and at CIDA over the last 10 years. However, personal limitations in my time impeded me to developed this part.

4.2.1 Face-to-face interviews

The interviews with the Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs, and the CIDA representatives were conducted using a questionnaire guide (see appendix 1). The questions aimed at determining three factors: (1) the role that Salvadorean NGOs played in the elaboration of policies and programs of Canadian NGOs for El Salvador. (2) The influence that race, class and gender⁵⁵ had in their relationship. (3) Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs' perceived trends in their relationship for the coming years. Some variations occurred in the probes, to correspond to the issues raised by interviewees.

Each interview lasted from forty-five minutes to two hours, depending of the availability of the interviewees. All the interviews were tape recorded. Some interviewees asked that the recording be stopped when certain issues were discussed. All participants said that I could call them back if I had any other questions or needed more clarification.

In El Salvador, I conducted the interviews in Spanish and in Canada in English, French and/or Spanish.⁵⁶ I transcribed all the interviews. There were times in the interviews when participants were not clear about the meaning of some questions, especially around race. When I presented the study of the Perspectives from the South, (CIDA, 1995), in which African NGOs name racism as an influence on the inequality in their relationship with northern NGOs, participants felt able to discuss this issue more clearly.

⁵⁵ I did not send my own definitions of race, class and gender to the participants because I did not want to impose those on them. By so doing, I felt that there was flexibility in understanding their own perceptions of the role that class, race and gender had had in the relationship.

⁵⁶ I felt very comfortable with the responsiveness of all participants. I left each interview with the desire to explore many more issues. One/or to two hours is never enough time to capture the experience that participants have gained over so many years of work.

4.2.2 Reflexive Log

I kept a log of my thoughts in order to record my immediate reaction to the interviews. I wrote the highlights of the interview as soon as I left each interviewee. These notes related to how participants analysed the issues of class, gender and race; the issues they brought up which I had not previously identified; the ones with which I agreed or disagreed; the ones in which we shared a similar analysis, and the commonalities in analysis amongst the NGOs. These notes were very useful in my analysis, especially in understanding the complexity of equality and inequality in the relationship. I also wrote any methodological variations that I used in the process of the interview⁵⁷.

4.3 Strengths and Limitations

The strengths of this research are the analysis of the perspective that Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs have in regards to their relationship and to bring light to the influence of class, gender and race on their work. As well this analysis brings anti-racism and feminist framework to the larger development theories and how it feeds the resulting relationship between northern and southern NGOs. To invest the time and resources to interview the participants in their own countries of work was fundamental to understanding the complexities with which they are confronted. Another strength is my commitment to make this research available in Spanish for Salvadorean NGOs to use, and to build more knowledge about northern NGOs. Both NGOs will ideally enhance their knowledge about the influence of class, gender and race in their relationship.

⁵⁷ At one of the interviews it was not pertinent to have a written questionnaire because the set-up of the room was very informal.(i.e. some roosters were wandering around). Therefore, I asked the questions verbally, having memorized them.

4.4 Analysis of the data:

I used a content analysis to classify the data because it facilitated the search for patterns, themes and categories to explain the Canadian and Salvadorean NGO relationship. This method helped me to analyze the contents of the interviews (see chapter 5) and my observations of the interview process.

I organized the data as follows: First, I did verbatim transcriptions of the interviews. I formatted the transcriptions with enough space to write notes on the sides and to number each paragraph so that if I later needed to go back to the original transcripts I could do so easily. . I made three copies of each interview. One I kept as original, the second I used for writing notes, and the final copy for cutting and pasting.

I began my analysis by reading the entire set of interviews several times in order to get an understanding of the total context of the data, and writing notes on topics as they emerged from the data. In separate pages, I wrote my own analytical notes that appeared as a result of the data and some notions of how I could organize the data.⁵⁸

Then, I took each interview and translated into English every sentence or statement regarding the 'process' in the relationship⁵⁹ and numbered every entry (total 172 entries) given by the respondents. Second, I identified the most common terms and topics used by both NGOs to describe their relationship.⁶⁰ Those terms guided me in clustering the

⁵⁸ One of the notions that emerged out of the data is that of NGOs 'moral authority' in the relationship. (See chapter 6)

⁵⁹ As illustrated in Chapter 5, I present the translation of the original statements as footnotes for those readers who are unfamiliar with Spanish and/or French. Translating verbatim interviews was a challenging process. I noted Patton (1990) affirmations that "The grammar in natural conversations is atrocious. Sentences begin and then are interrupted by new sentences before the first sentences are completed."(p.380)

⁶⁰ The most frequently used terms were: support, imposition, selecting partners, good relationships, monitoring, evaluation, lack of participation, trust, distrust, decrease in support, accompaniment, solidarity, consultation, transparency, screening, criteria, pressure, arrogance and feminism, equality, inequality, power..

themes and in colour-coding them. For instance, to classify the data that addressed my first research question, I used a sorting technique. All the terms that dealt with power in the relationship, inequality, equality, horizontal relationships, lobby and advocacy, political support and accompaniment, were named 'perspectives on equality and inequality' and colour-coded it yellow. I used the same procedure to find the other themes and I named them 'perspectives on criteria' and 'perspectives on screening'. For the data addressing the second research question, I used the 'perspectives on race, class and gender'. For the data addressing the third research question, I used the theme 'perspectives on future directions'. In an iterative process, moving back and forth between the emerging themes and the raw data, I gradually worked to refine the categories until I was satisfied that all opinions were included and fairly represented. (See chapter 5)

A second source of data that I used in my analysis was my own experience in the field of development. I have used such experience as a tool to interpreting the data. For this I use Patton's (1990) definition of interpretation as "attaching significance to what was found, offering explanations, drawing conclusions, extrapolating lessons, making inferences, building linkages, attaching meaning, imposing order..."(p.423). (See chapter 6).

Only at the end of this process did I develop the final text.

Chapter 5

Progressive Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs relationship⁶¹ : The Interview data

Introduction

I conducted the interviews in El Salvador in the Summer (July) of 1996, during a two week visit to that country. The interviews in Canada were conducted in the fall (October-November) of 1996 and winter (January-February) of 1997. The interviews went quite smoothly. All NGO representatives were very warm and seemed eager to participate in the interviews. I appreciated their sentiment very much as I knew that in the NGO field one's time is always measured. After each interview I left with a 'understanding' that seemed to characterize that particular NGO. Based on those feelings I named the ten NGOs as follows: peaceful, fighter, soft, intellectual, practical, thinker, profound, realistic, positive and visionary. These feelings are also a reflection of the themes that evolved during the interviews.

⁶¹ The relationships between Canadian and Salvadoran NGOs do not necessarily reflect a one to one correlation between the Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs participating in this study. Both NGOs have relationships with other Salvadorean and/or Canadian NGOs reflected in the data (but not part of the sample NGOs interviewed), because the participants refer to their relationships as well. In the case of Canada for instance, four NGOs were interviewed, yet during the interviews, Salvadorean NGOs mentioned about twelve Canadian NGOs and other Northern NGOs. Canadian NGOs interviewed also refer to their work in other countries of Central. and\of] South America as other Southern countries.

These themes, 'equality vs. inequality'; screening vs. applying for the projects; and criteria' vs. 'consultation & decision making, were of great importance for both types of NGOs in their process of establishing, maintaining and ending their relationship. These themes will be addressed in section two of this chapter.

In this chapter, ⁶² I will present the perspective that these NGOs bring to their relationship as experienced over the last 10 years (1986 to 1996). Since the interviews were conducted in Spanish, English and French, I will provide the original quotes as footnotes as necessary. As mentioned earlier (Chapter 1), I developed three research questions aimed at determining three issues: 1. The degree of input by progressive Salvadorean NGOs in the policies and programming of Progressive Canadian NGOs for El Salvador; 2. the influence of race, class and gender in the relationship; 3. Future directions in their relationship.

To describe the perspective of both NGOs on the relationship⁶³, I have organized this chapter into three sections corresponding to the times of the Salvadorean context and to the research questions. The first section will present the characteristics of the relationship during the war and non-war years. The war years were marked by a harsh political and military climate and the

⁶² In previous chapters, the theoretical framework (chapter 2); the literature review (chapter 3), I provided the background in which progressive and Canadians and Salvadorean NGO relationships are immersed.

⁶³ Progressive Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs are a heterogeneous group. For simplicity in describing their relationship, I will refer to progressive Canadian/Northern NGOs as (PCNGOs) and PSNGOs. One Salvadorean NGO respondent stated that their relationship with Canadian NGOs was no different from the relationships they had developed with other NGOs from Europe and the United States. (See Chapter 6)

years following the peace accords were characterized by changes in the behavior of international funding institutions and the restructuring of Salvadorean NGOs. The second section will address the vision both Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs have of their relationship as presented in three themes: equality vs. inequality in the relationship, screening vs. applying for the projects; and criteria vs. consultation & decision making. The third section presents the perspectives of both NGOs on the influence of race, class and gender in their work. The fourth section concludes this chapter by providing some of the directions and desires of both NGOs for their future relationship.

Section I

5.1 The Political Situation in El Salvador

The last 10 years in the relationship between PSNGOs and PCNGOs mark two different periods in the history of El Salvador: 1) the war years of the 1980s; 2) the Peace Accords in the 1990s, after the end of the military war.⁶⁴

During the war, the PSNGOs' work focused on the protection of human rights, providing emergency shelter, helping internally displaced refugees and the repatriation of Salvadoreans returning from refugee camps in Honduras and Nicaragua. After the Peace

⁶⁴ I am using the term "military war" to distinguish it from the political economic and social war which continues to cause poverty, human rights violations, and lack of democracy. This latter war continues.

Accords and the end of the war, their work has concentrated more in areas such as land ownership for the peasants, support for the demobilized (ex-combatants), production projects for the agricultural sector, health and education initiatives, women's organizing, sending technical assistance through volunteers, institutional support to NGOs, formation of regional networks, and exchange between countries.

5.1.1. The War Years

Some Canadian and some Salvadoran NGOs believe that, due to the war\emergency situation in El Salvador and the understanding by the funding institutions⁶⁵ of the crisis situation, there was a higher level of funding for Salvadorean NGOs. This situation also facilitated leniency around project criteria and time-frames for project completion, less rigorous accounting mechanisms and thus, funds were given without many conditions. One PSNGO stated that by the end of the 80's and beginning of 90's, PSNGOs were making an effort to plan on a yearly basis. However, there was considerable uncertainty about what was going to happen in the country, (i.e., military operations in the city or the [country side]) and consequently, most of the planning had a high level of 'abstraction.'

On the other hand it was life threatening for PCNGO representatives to visit the field, resulting in less frequent visits to El Salvador and the inability to monitor the projects. The projects

⁶⁵ Most PSNGOs referred to Canadian, and Northern NGOs and government donor agencies as 'la cooperacion' or 'the funding institutions'. This is different from PCNGOs who refer to PSNGOs as 'the partners'

were therefore, short term and emergency oriented. One PSNGO called this type of funding (1.) economic (natural disasters) and emergency (the war) or, (2.) political emergency (military repression and bombings). The latter was felt mostly in the rural areas and the former was felt in both rural and urban areas. In this context, PSNGOs depended fully on funds from international funding institutions. One PSNGO called this "a relationship of dependency."

Some PSNGOs believed that they were seen by the international funding institutions as important actors in the social and political process of the country. According to the PSNGOs the relationship between NGOs was based on emergency, charity, trust, admiration and courage. PSNGOs representatives came frequently to Canada and those who came were highly respected by PCNGOs and solidarity organizations. At the same time, Canadian representatives from solidarity groups also (frequently) visited El Salvador to monitor the human rights situation. PCNGOs organized high level delegations with the same purpose.

During the war, PCNGOs knew of the links between PSNGO and the Farabundo Marti National Liberation Front (FMLN). One PSNGO stated that during this time, many of those involved in popular social movements, such as unions and co-operatives, did not have an independent identity, but had close links to either the FMLN or the Salvadorean government, the principal actors of the war. This NGO representative affirmed that by the end of the 80s, however, there was a need to have an independent expression apart from the FMLN or the government. Civil society started to create avenues of expression through the creation of NGOs and social organizations, particularly in the four years from 1986 to 1990. With the

end of the war, these actors had recuperated their institutional identity. This process was called, by some Salvadorean academics, the 'renaturalization' of civil society.

5.2 Peace Accords and Post-War period

Some Canadian and all Salvadorean NGOs stated that the end of the war and the signing of the peace accords brought a series of rapid radical changes to project criteria and policies. For instance, one PSNGO admits that this period brought a crucial 'quiebre' (rupture) in the situation of El Salvador which forced them to redefine the nature of the PSNGO (*replantea la naturaleza*) of the NGOs, and their links established with the Canadian funding institutions and solidarity organizations.

Two PSNGOs affirmed that the end of the war brought a reduction in the level of funding and a decrease in support and interest. These representatives argued that the funding institutions presumed that everything was fine in El Salvador. They criticized the international funding institutions and solidarity organizations for eliminating El Salvador from their agenda, stating 'El Salvador was on their agenda only when we were being killed.' One PSNGO representative added that the situation in El Salvador 'is far from being democratic'. If there was a war in El Salvador, perhaps there would be an overflow (*desborde*) of solidarity with El Salvador.

After the peace accords there were many other changes in the relationship with international NGOs. For instance, there were more demands in relation to time frames for

the completion of projects, accompanied by demands for rigorous and systematic accounting mechanisms, and more frequent visits of PCNGO officials. Funds were given with more conditions. One PSNGO stated that under the so called vision of 'development', quantitative measurement of results using financially based indicators were now required. Projects supported were of longer term [up to three years] and less emergency or charity oriented. There was a tendency to provide credit rather than grants, and project implementation and completion was to be verified by PCNGOs officials. One PSNGO called this relationship 'funding institutions and exchange' because PSNGOs received more funding and PCNGOs are able to visit the country and communities. One PSNGO stated that the funds received from PCNGOs played more of a complementary role because the majority of funds came from Europe. Two PCNGOs stated that they supported PSNGOs through institutional strengthening of the PSNGOs after the war, helping PSNGOs in the areas where they were weak. One NGO added that this is due to the unwillingness of other Northern NGOs to support core funding for PSNGOs.

According to some PSNGOs, the relationship changed to one based on technical expertise and accountability, pressuring PSNGOs to undergo rapid re-structuring in order to meet the technical demands. As a result of these changes, some PSNGOs achieved a greater level of development, others remained small and others have or will disappear. (More on these changes are developed in the sections below).

Two PSNGOs believe that their movements had more credibility after the war, due to their work with civil society and their efforts to achieve self-sufficiency. One PSNGO felt that they were perceived (by PCNGOs) as less important actors after the end of the war. When there was death and blood there was more solidarity and the relationship from Northern NGOs was 'warmer' (calida). After the war the contrary happened; there was an abrupt 'break'(rompimiento) to the relationship, and there was no continuity to the way the relationship was during the war. One PSNGO believed that the 'leadership' (protagonismo) valued during the war, was not valued after the war. PSNGOs [EL Salvador] do not make the news anymore. The visits from PSNGO representatives to Canada were less frequent and less accepted. As well, the visits of Canadian groups to monitor the human rights situation were less frequent, and some PCNGOs have pulled out of El Salvador altogether.

In summary, the type of relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs for the last 10 years has corresponded to the political situation of El Salvador. The war years focused the relationship on the protection of human rights, emergency projects and ending the war, along with more lenient projects criteria and larger amounts project grants. The post-war years focused the relationship on PCNGOs supporting projects of longer duration [up to three years], more strict accountability of PSNGOs and a reduction in the number and amount of project grants. In table 1 I illustrate the changes in the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs for the last 10 years.

Summary of the characteristics on the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs: the war and post-war years.

Table 1.

War years	Peace accords and post-war years
<p>From Canada to El Salvador:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -higher level of funding -leniency on time-frames for project completion due to understanding of crisis situation -less rigorous accounting mechanism -projects could not be verified because of war -less frequent visits from PCNGOs officials to El Salvador -more frequent visits of groups of Canadians monitoring human rights situation -funds given without many conditions -short term projects and emergency oriented -PSNGOs were seen as important actors in the social and political process of the country -funds given in the form of grants -many PCNGOs involved in EL Salvador 	<p>From Canada To El Salvador:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -reduction in level of funding - more demands on time frames for completion of projects - rigorous and systematic accounting mechanisms -projects could be verified -more frequent visits of PCNGO officials -less frequent visits of Canadian groups to monitor the human rights situation -funds are given with more conditions -longer term projects and less emergency or charity oriented -PSNGOs are perceived as less important actors in the process -tendency to provide credit rather than grants -Some PCNGOs have pulled out of El Salvador
<p>From El Salvador to Canada:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -more frequent visits from and highly respected representatives of PSNGO to Canada -relationship between NGOs based on emergency, charity, trust, admiration and courage - PSNGOs depend fully on funds from international funding institutions and have no long-term strategic planning - El Salvadorean government see PSNGOs as a branch of the guerrillas 	<p>From El Salvador To Canada:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -less frequent and less accepted visits of PSNGO representatives to Canada -relation based technical expertise and accountability -rapid re-structuring of PSNGOs to meet the technical demands.. Some PSNGOs grew; others remained small and others have or will disappear -PSNGOs trying to become self-sufficient. Long term strategic planning -PSNGOs see their movement as having more credibility

Section II.

Vision of the Relationship

This section addresses the view of the eight NGOs about their inter- relationship. This can be seen in three common themes: equality vs. inequality in the relationship, screening vs. approving the projects and consultation vs. decision making. These themes reflect the input of Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs' in the relationship, in their respective roles as donor and/or recipient.⁶⁶ (In each section, I will first present the Salvadorean NGO input, followed by the input of Canadian NGO.)

5.3 Perspectives on Equality and Inequality

PSNGOs perceive that the equality and inequality in their relationship with PCNGOs is inherent in the 'money' and 'political support' received in the 'process' of approving projects, maintaining and ending the relationship. The inequality present in the relationship is framed as a power issue and covers project funding issues, political work and decisions about ending the relationship.

⁶⁶ I am using these terms for simplicity in locating both NGOs within a relationship of 'money exchange.'

5.3.1 Salvadorean NGO perspective on Equality & Inequality

One PSNGO believed that international funding institutions in general ,(in which Canada is not the exception) are characterized by a power relationship between those who have resources and those who do not. It is inherently an unequal relationship. *"... la cooperación al desarrollo es una relación de poder entre los que tienen los recursos y los que no los tenemos. Es una relación, de poder desigual..."*⁶⁷

To recognize such inequality is a step forward and there are some PSNGOs who have not realized that this inequality exists. Inequality is more obvious in the relationships that are developed on the basis of 'arrogance', and less obvious in horizontal, transparent or fraternal relationships. Nevertheless, they remain a power relationship.

*"...en algunas relaciones es mucho más obvio, en algunas relaciones la desigualdad se maneja con mucha soberbia, en otras se maneja en una forma más horizontal, más transparente, más fraterna, pero es una relación de poder..."*⁶⁸

Two PSNGOs called the relationship North-South, (norte-sur) because PSNGOs are the ones who receive the funding and PCNGOs approve them. In this relationship the PSNGOs send continuous reports and information demanded by the PCNGOs yet the PSNGOs know very little about the work of PCNGOs in Canada., and the PCNGOs have very few staff people in

⁶⁷ "...it's that development cooperation is a relationship of power between those who have the resources and those of us who don't have them. It's a relationship of unequal power..."

⁶⁸ "...in some relationships it's much more obvious. In some relationships the inequality is managed with a lot of arrogance, in others it's managed in a more horizontal, transparent and friendly way, but it is a power relationship..."

EL Salvador. One PSNGO stated that this is perhaps why some relationships have ended with the completion of the project and there has not been interest from either of the NGOs to continue it. The PSNGO sent the final report and that was it.

One Salvadorean NGO did not see inequality at the individual level of the relationship or any undervaluing of the relationship of PCNGOs with PSNGO. If there was inequality it had to be based on the fact that the PCNGOs had more resources and sources of funding.

Another PSNGO representative felt that in some cases, it was not possible to establish fraternal relationships, perhaps because communication being done through fax and telephones and not in person. The relationship could not be called bad, just different.

All four PSNGOs recognized that they have had horizontal, transparent and/fraternal relationships with some PCNGOs. *"... la relación que hemos tenido siempre ha sido una relación fraterna...conjuntamente hemos podido discutir, proponer, sugerir e incluso aspectos institucionales. ..."*⁶⁹

In these types of relationships, when the PSNGO presented a project which reflected the context of the country, and their capacities as institutions, the Northern NGOs and the PSNGOs discussed it together, as 'partners'(socios). The Northern NGO questioned the rationale for some of the objectives but both agreed on the strengths and on the areas for

⁶⁹ "...the relationship that we have had has always been a friendly...jointly we've been able to have discussions, make proposals and suggestions even about institutional issues..."

improvement. In these relationships, some PSNGOs were able to give input into some PCNGO policies and programming, due to their more intimate knowledge of Salvadorean society. In a horizontal relationship, although the PCNGO had the power to end the relationship, they informed the PSNGO that they had decided to work with another NGO in another area. In some cases, the PCNGOs found other sources of funding from other Northern NGOs to help this particular PSNGO.

In more arrogant relationships, the Northern NGO did not approve of the project because it did not support its policies, yet these are not discussed. One PSNGO provided an example in the imposition of environmental or gender criteria to projects and to the institutional programs. A PCNGO, however, did not think that all foreign influences are necessarily bad, recognizing also that the environmental conditions are a serious problem in the country, and there is a problem in the relationships between the men and women, but the way to target these are different. However, these are impositions based on a fundamentally unequal relationship. Another PSNGO believed that there is inherent inequality in the North-South relationship "El que paga El mariachi canta la cancion".

This PSNGO representative believed that the PCNGO, criteria respond to cultural and political, or 'trends'(modas), and priorities of the Northern country.

"...ha sido la cooperación internacional la que ha obligado y e introducido estrategias medio ambientalistas en los proyectos y en los programas institucionales; muchas de esas influencias vienen de condiciones culturales de las ongs de Canadá o por exigencias políticas de su país...no quiero decir que la influencia del extranjero es

mala, pero digo que ha sido una relación desigual porque eso del medio ambiente y de género son modas o prioridades de los países del norte."⁷⁰

The power in the relationship is also seen in that it is the PCNGOs who end the relationships because they have changed their policies towards El Salvador. (For instance, a shift from supporting education projects to focusing on credit projects.)

One PSNGO stated that the past relationship, based on friendship and fraternity, has now become an economic relationship, based on projects, on a service sold. This 'economic' relationship set-up the framework for PCNGOs to impose their criteria on PSNGOs. A relationship in which both get to know each other better, develop trust and discuss the issues, without anger, is the ideal relationship.

All PSNGOs stated that they have had more important discussions with PCNGOs than communicating only around funding, referring particularly to the social and economic conditions of the country. In these cases, the PSNGOs and PCNGOs got together to discuss lobbying strategies. One point of convergence with PCNGOs was in the role that civil society can play in changing public policies.

⁷⁰ "...it has been the international funders which have obliged and introduced environmental strategies into the projects and the institutional programs; many of these influences come from the cultural conditions of the Canadian NGOs or from political requirements from their country...I don't want to say that foreign influence is bad, but rather it's been an unequal relationship because the issues of the environment and gender are fashionable or were priorities for countries in the North."

This exchange of information and lobbying strategies has helped PCNGOs and the Canadian government within the WB and the IMF.

*"...A veces jugamos un papel incidente de cabildeo y de loby...en el Banco Mundial y en el Fondo Monetario Internacional, entonces al hacer intercambio de informaciones; ellos pueden influenciar el gobierno de Canadá sobre las políticas hacia la región salvadoreña."*⁷¹

In this type of relationship there is still an institutional relationship that continues after a project has ended. One PSNGO stated that a relationship of solidarity had to be separated from the process of writing and sending reports to PCNGOs.

There is a power relationship in the political work as well, but it is more subtle than in the financial relationship. In one case, the PCNGO wanted to influence the PSNGO to take a particular stand on an issue (globalization). The result of this pressure depended on the PSNGO's capacity to adopt or reject those pressures. The PSNGO did not want to take the same stand and/or to pressure their membership to do it, but the issue was resolved through democratic negotiations between both NGOs.

One PSNGO stated that PCNGOs and Northern NGOs do not like to be seen as financial institutions, but rather as development institutions in which the relations with the partners moves beyond the financial to develop a more profound and close relationship. The Northern NGOs were criticized because at the time of ending their relationship, their practices were no

⁷¹ "...Sometimes we play an important lobby role... in the World Bank and in the International Monetary Fund: by exchanging information, they can influence the Canadian government on policies for the Salvadorean region."

different than those of the financial institutions. In one case, the PCNGO ended the relationship presumably because the PSNGO had not met its part of the project agreement. The PSNGO criticized this practice because the causes for the PSNGO's lack of fulfilment of the agreement was due to problems in the country, such as natural disasters or political instability [which were out of the PSNGO control] the PCNGO ended the relationship in the same way as a financial institution. Indeed, if they had developed a closer relationship, this type of situation could have been discussed, resulting in changes or even an extension of the time frame of the project, rather than an ending to the relationship.

Another PSNGO criticized the PCNGOs because while their support during the war strengthened the PSNGO's role within society, the same PCNGOs [withdrew their support] after the war. It seemed as if they were interested in seeing PSNGOs disappear.

"...jugamos un rol durante la guerra...y llegamos a pensar que así como la cooperación intervino para fortalecernos y para que nosotros jugáramos roles importantes dentro de la sociedad. Ahora, en tiempo de paz, pensamos que su papel, su convicción o su política es de hacernos desaparecer".⁷²

Two PSNGO acknowledged that PCNGOs or Northern NGOs (in many cases) depend on their own governments for funding, and therefore once the PCNGO approves the PSNGO's project, it has to receive the funds from the Canadian government. Funding cuts by the Canadian government to the PCNGOs has limited their ability to support and strengthen the PSNGOs. When PCNGOs were late in transferring the funds to the PSNGOs, their

⁷² "...we played a role during the war... and we thought that international funders intervened to strengthen us so we would have important roles in society. Now that we are in peace time, we think that their role, their conviction or their policy is to make us disappear".

(PSNGOs) own beneficiary communities would pressure them to channel the funds promised.

This created difficulties for one PSNGO which was unable to pressure the PCNGO in the same way.

When PCNGOs are late in transferring funds, it is due to policies of the Canadian government.

*"...Aquí hay un problema serio. Los ongs canadienses no están bien financieramente. Nosotros tenemos un compromiso con la comunidad; las ongs del norte tienen un compromiso con nosotros; la comunidad nos presiona y nosotros no podemos presionar a los ongs porque ellos siempre dicen: "El gobierno tiene esto, está estructurando eso". De nuestro lado, siempre tenemos la presión de la comunidad."*⁷³

Three PSNGOs stated that there was inequality with some PCNGOs and horizontal relationships with others. One PSNGO also believes that this North-South relationship must be transformed into a more horizontal relationship in which there is mutual learning and mutual sharing

*"En el marco de la relación norte/sur debería haber criterios más horizontales en lo que se refiere al aprendizaje, el diálogo y el intercambio; porque aquí, la relación es desigual. Uno define sus programas y ellos por la moda o el interés que tienen hacen otra cosa, pero aquí con nosotros no ha habido consulta; digamos franca y transparente".*⁷⁴

⁷³ "...There is a serious problem here. The Canadian NGOs are not well off financially. We make a commitment to the community; the Northern NGOs make a commitment to us; the community pressures us and we cannot pressure the NGOs because they always say: "The Government has this, it's structuring that." On our end, we still have the community pressure."

⁷⁴ "In the framework of the North/South relationships, there should be more horizontal criteria for apprenticeship, dialogue and exchange; because here the relationship is unequal. We define our programs and then, because of what's fashionable or because of their interest, they do something else, but here with us there's been no ...let's say, frank or transparent consultation."

5.3.2 Canadian NGO's perspectives on equality and Inequality

Most PCNGOs felt that there was some equality in their relationships with PSNGO. One PCNGO defined it as 'true' partnership, another as a 'social pact' and transparent. All believed it to be based on solidarity, commitment, a shared analysis of the society they want to achieve and a long history of supporting the PSNGOs. In this history there is a strong relationship with mutual criticism and funding institutions.⁷⁵

Two PCNGOs stated that they have good relationships but also moments of tension with PSNGOs. One believed the tension arose following the end of the war, *"...los ongs presentaban carencias y nosotros exigiamos más; un poco la misma situación; problemas por las exigencias despues de la guerra"*.⁷⁶ Another believed that the tension arose due that both NGOs represented complex organizations with a variety of people and variety of opinions.

Two PCNGOs suggested that in relationships of solidarity, there is no inequality but a sharing of different responsibilities. One PCNGO believed that PSNGOs had power in the

⁷⁵ One NGO stated that their support was contrary to other PCNGOs who were new at supporting PSNGOs. New money given by the Canadian government brought in a group of NGOs who had not been engaged in the previous process.

⁷⁶ "...the NGOs presented deficiencies and we required more; it's a little of the same situation; problems because of requirements after the war".

relationship as well, because although PCNGOs had the money, PSNGOs had the expertise to implement the projects.

*"...même si on voulait jouer au niveau du rapport de force...les ongs du nord ont les sous, mais les ongs du sud ont des programmes et dans plusieurs coins....ils comptent sur des bons programmes et ils ont besoin de dépenser des sous, puis les ongs du nord cherchent des canaux pour investir leur argent, puisque ils n'ont pas toujours la capacité eux mêmes de programmer, donc qu'ils sont dépendants sur l'identification de bons partenaires qui ont les programmes, donc on pourrait arguer qu'il y a un rapport de force qui s'est établi."*⁷⁷

Another NGO representative insisted that if this is considered inequality, the opposite is also true. PCNGOs must also consider the relationship unequal with PSNGOs because PSNGOs are the ones responsible for the implementation of the project. One PCNGO believes that inequality can only transpire when PSNGOs receive funding from bigger institutions with larger amounts of money, not with the small amount of funds that PCNGOs send.

This same PCNGO stated that the Southern NGOs which claim that there is inequality in the relationship because the North has money and imposes its norms on the South, are unconsciously creating a 'guilt complex' in the North, and thus 'we feel sorry for them'.

"Los ongs del sur, aquellos que consideran que tienen una relación desigual con el norte; porque es el norte que trae la plata; es el norte que impone las normas a partir de su experiencia. En el fondo, lo que se intenta es crear un complejo de culpabilidad en el norte, diciendo: 'Ustedes son responsables de lo que les pasa'; es una mentalidad colonialista; porque vienen con el dinero y dicen que tienen conocimiento, eso es inconsciente; es verdad pobrecitos. Eso en los años 70s era la

⁷⁷ "...even if we wanted to work at a level of a forced relationship...the NGOs in the North have the money, but the NGOs in the South have the programs in many zones...they have some good programs and they need to spend money, and the NGOs in the North are looking for channels to invest their money, since they don't have the capacity themselves to do programming; they are dependent on identifying good partners who have the programs, so you could argue that a forced relationship is established."

*idea de unificar a todo... hoy eso ha desaparecido. Los culpables del mal desarrollo están en el sur ; tanto como en el norte. Los culpables de las injusticias están más en el sur que en el norte ”.*⁷⁸

In this representative's view, this type of inequality is more complex, in that the funders, whether PCNGO or PSNGO has power in the relationship because of the money exchange. This is a mentality of the 70s is not relevant anymore and both the North and the South are guilty of “bad development” (mal desarrollo). This PCNGO representative stated that on the contrary, the most guilty of injustice are found in the South rather than in the North. Southern NGOs are now acknowledging another aspect of this inequality, in that if the North has more money than the South, it implies the same unequal relationship between the Southern NGOs and their local communities to whom they give money. In addition, the issue of class come in here in that the members of the communities tend to be poor, or illiterate and rural, while the NGO personnel tend to be middle class and urban based.

All Canadian NGOs provided political support to PSNGOs during the war.

*“Las relaciones de trabajo con las ongs; si teníamos muy buenas relaciones, muy claras; compartíamos en buena medida... el propósito era de ayudar y pasar por la guerra...ayudar a resistir...connotación de derechos humanos”.*⁷⁹

⁷⁸ “Southern NGOs, those that believe that they have an unequal relationship with the north because it is the north that brings the money; it's the north that imposes the norms from their experience. What they really try to do is to create a guilt complex in the north, by saying: “You are responsible for what happens to us”; it's a colonialist mentality because you come with the money and say that you have the knowledge, [then you say] it's unconscious, but it's true, “poor things”. In the 70's the idea was to unite everything...today that has disappeared. Those guilty of bad development are in the South as well as the North. There are more guilty of injustice in the south than in the north.”

Three expressed pride in supporting the return of the refugees to El Salvador, and to have helped to end the war. Two PCNGOs defined the relationship during this time as 'accompaniment' and after the war, as solidarity and partnership based on giving core funding.

One PCNGO believes that the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs has improved in regards to 'getting together' to discuss international policies and lobbying strategies, in the context of two individuals, 'you and me' (tu a tu) relationship.

"...La relación entre el norte y el sur se ha mejorado, en el sentido que hay las mesas de concertación donde, los del norte y del sur, se discute. Al principio se decía; es que ustedes del norte y del sur, al final de unos cuantos meses se descubre que no es ni del norte ni del sur, pero tú y yo, tu organismo y el mío, tu participas en la decisión cuando hablamos del Canadá o del Salvador. Tú criticas a Canadá, yo critico a Canadá; tu criticas al Salvador, yo critico al Salvador".⁸⁰

All PCNGOs agreed that the political relationship continued after funding ceased to the PSNGOs. However this relationship is informal and sporadic. *"The funding relationship ends. We have letters back and forth, visit them, sit to chat".*

⁷⁹ "We had very good, very clear working relationships with the NGOs; we shared very well, the objective was to help and to get through the war; to help to resist; with a connotation of human rights"

⁸⁰ "...The relationship between the North and the South has improved, in the sense that there are more round tables where things are discussed between those in the North and those in the South. In the beginning we said; you in the North and you in the South, but after a few months we discovered that it's not a question of North or South but rather you and I, your organization and mine, you participate in the decision when we talk about Canada or about El Salvador. You criticize Canada, I criticize Canada; you criticize El Salvador, I criticize El Salvador"

All PCNGOs have had a relationship with PSNGOs for a long-time. One PCNGO has ended two relationships after 10 years. In this case it happened for two reasons: (1.) the PCNGO was moving in a different direction; (2.) because of a difference of opinion and inability to reach a compromise, as well as disagreements based on a lack of financial accountability of the PSNGO. If the relationship ends on good terms, PCNGOs refer PSNGOs to other funding organizations, and let them know a year ahead.

Another PCNGO believed that once a partner is able to receive substantial amounts of money from other sources, such as the European bilateral aid, and they become strong institutionally, they (PCNGO) do not have to support this PSNGO anymore, and their mission has been accomplished.

"...dans la même ligne de partenariat, depuis le début c'est-ce qu' on voulait; si notre but était de les renforcer institutionnellement; on pourrait dire que c'est un exemple de succès; elles sont devenues leur propre porte parole, donc elles n' ont plus besoin de nous..."⁸¹

Since the funds this PCNGO provided were limited compared to those sent by the European community, this PCNGO wanted to give PSNGOs the tools that allowed them to have access to bigger sources of funding in order to become independent from the PCNGO.

⁸¹ "...along the same line of partnership, from the beginning it was what we wanted; if our goal was to reinforce them institutionally speaking; we could say that it was successful. They became their own spokesperson, and so they didn't need us anymore..."

One PCNGO was critical of Northern and Southern NGOs who in order to pay their bills, are engaging in mental 'lucubrations' (elucubraciones mentales) in accepting funds from the World Bank, something that was not done in the past.

5.4 Perspectives on Criteria

5.4.1 Salvadorean NGOs perspectives on Criteria:

According to one NGO, some of the changes in criteria resulting from an end to the war, were both positive and negative. The negative effects involved a different relationship between PCNGOs and PSNGOs. The technical demands of Canadian NGOs increased, which forced rapid changes in PSNGOs in order to meet the new requirements. In some cases, the PSNGOs did not have the technical skills to implement a more effective and modern system of administration. The result was the firing and hiring of personnel, and rethinking the philosophy of the institution. These changes that normally take a long period of time, were done quickly to meet the demands, (and thinking that they were the best). Such changes cannot be measured in the short term. One PSNGO noted that there had been no consultation with them about the changes in the policies of the PCNGO in relation to El Salvador.

One positive effect of the change in criteria was that it helped PSNGOs to do strategic planning. In some cases, the PCNGOs imposed basic requirements but allowed for PSNGOs to meet them gradually. This set of PCNGOs demanded bi-annual or annual plans to show the

progress made in meeting the requirements. In other cases, the PCNGOs allowed very little time for the changes to be made and some PSNGO were not able to meet the demands.

As the country became more stable, the PSNGOs were able to plan on a longer term basis. One PSNGO agreed that longer strategies resulted in the setting up of more effective administrative and accounting mechanisms.

"...A medida que la realidad vino a estabilizarse un poco más; as instituciones pudieron planificar más a largo plazo. Eso era como un proposito interno. Pero también fue una presión de la cooperación canadiense y europea; ya no bastaban planes anuales ni bi- anuales sino a más largo plazo".⁸²

Three Salvadorean NGOs stated that there were differences in how PCNGOs applied their criteria. Some PCNGOs were more open to dialogue and to negotiate certain criteria than others. One PSNGO believed that in recent years, there have been improvements as both NGOs reached compromises. The PCNGOs knew that PSNGO programming and policies reflected their reality. The NGO believed that in the future there would be more openness from the PCNGOs to discussing the criteria but fewer funds to support the PSNGOs as El Salvador becomes less of a priority, and PCNGOs efforts are re-directed to other areas of the world (such as Eastern European or Guatemala).

⁸² "As reality began to stabilize itself a little more, the institutions could make more long term plans. It was like an internal objective, but it was also pressure from the Canadian and European partners; annual or bi-annual plans were now not good enough - they had to be long term plans"

Another example deals with different approaches among the PCNGOs in regards to the numbers of people needed to be 'reached' by a project in order to have an "impact". The PCNGO argued that a small amount of money should have an impact on large numbers of people, while the PSNGO said that the funds would have a greater impact for smaller numbers of people. Sometimes these differences created awkward (engorrosos) moments, and, as one PSNGO representative stated, the only way to avoid this clash of perspectives was to focus on financial reports rather than narrative ones.

"... Ellos lo que quieren es sentir allá que apoyaron a dos mil mujeres; nosotros decimos queremos apoyar a 75 mujeres, que verdaderamente se vea el impacto. Se hace un intercambio de notas y nosotros explicamos los porqués, pero se vuelve muy engorroso... Hemos logrado cambiarlo, mas los problemas que teníamos en los informes narrativos... esas son las características propias de los donantes. Es que yo quiero que mi plata vaya a cubrir a la mayoría de gentes, porque son filantrópicos...esos son sus criterios. Pero venimos nosotros y recibimos un puchito, entonces decimos no lo vamos a distribuir en mil mujeres; vamos a capacitar 75 mujeres; les vamos a asesorar, a dar crédito y vamos a crear impacto en la zona con ese proyecto."⁸³

Another aspect of the criteria had to do with project reporting. Two PSNGOs affirmed that it was necessary to give financial reports, in order to achieve the desired results at different moments. However, there were times when small details threatened to jeopardise the relationship. An example of this was in incurring expenses that were not specified in the

⁸³ "What they want is to feel that they have supported two thousand women; we say that we want to support 75 women and really see the impact. An exchange of notes is done and we explain the whys, but it becomes very cumbersome... We have managed to change it, mostly the problems that we had with the narrative reports... those are the particular characteristics of the donors. It's that I want my money to cover a lot of people, because they are philanthropists... these are their criteria. But we come and we receive a small amount, then we say that we are not going to distribute it to a thousand women; that we are going to train 75 women, we are going to give them advice, give them credit and we are going to have an impact in the area with this project."

project, but were considered necessary by the PSNGO. It took a long process of explaining the rationale for this expense, said one NGO representative, and was more expensive than the item itself. This resulted in a deterioration of the relationship, as the PSNGO was made to feel incapable of making certain decisions.

Criteria were also limiting in that PSNGOs had their own way of presenting the reports, while the PCNGOs wanted them to be written in their specific format. The PSNGOs were expected to follow the PCNGO (or the Northern NGO) format in order to be approved. In other cases, the PCNGO transferred the funds and the PSNGO decided the best way to invest those funds. Other PCNGOs asked for every receipt (in one case, only original receipts) justifying project expenses.⁸⁴

5.4.2 Canadian NGOs perspectives on Criteria:

Decision making / consultation

PCNGOs have two ways of linking to El Salvador or Central America. Some send Canadians because the government has specified that a Canadian must be hired; others hire local people. For some, this second option is to reduce costs, as it is more expensive to send Canadians. In addition to their field representatives, most PCNGOs have

⁸⁴ Not having original receipts goes against the Salvadorean government's auditing regulations and in this same case the NGO had promised to send the original receipts back when the PSNGO was audited by the government

advisory committees in Canada, and/or the region to help in the development of their policy and programming. Once PCNGO stated that their representative in the area knew better about the relationship with PSNGOs than PCNGO staff who was in Canada. This PCNGO representative considered the information received in Canada as 'second hand' information. *"...I am so far here in Ottawa, I hear things; I have been told, but I do not have the relationship. It is second hand"*.

All PCNGOs agreed that their criteria had developed over time. Three PCNGOs acknowledged that PSNGOs did not formally participate in the decision making of their NGOs, but were "consulted" at different times. One PCNGO stated that although PSNGOs do not participate in their planning sessions, they do and are welcome to criticize the criteria sent to them.

Two PCNGOs recognized that project criteria became more strict after the war and they realized that PSNGOs were technically weaker than they thought (PSNGOs weaknesses had gone unnoticed during the war). One PCNGO knew that the aid to El Salvador had to be given in a more structured way, (as it was everywhere else in the world) and that the war in El Salvador had constituted an exception. After the war, the PCNGO had to re-think its program in El Salvador. One PCNGO stated that the changes in criteria raised some problems and tensions with the PSNGOs, due to a lack of methodology in their programming.

"Hemos tenido más problemas con las ongs después de la guerra que durante la guerra; la guerra hacía que se taparan muchos de los problemas que pudieran existir; es muy diferente lo que puedas hacer durante la guerra que después."

Problemas de gestión; aplicar a El Salvador las mismas normas que aplicamos normalmente en todo el mundo...es una relación de excepción durante la guerra".⁸⁵

For one PCNGO, the changes and strictness in project criteria were due to a demand by the public and by private companies and government for better use of taxpayers' money. As well, some PCNGOs were accused of having supported projects for political interest only.

For most PCNGOs, a change in criteria implied a change of partners. For some PCNGOs, the changes in criteria and themes were based on consultation with several actors.

"The ideas for changes in criteria come not only from our current funding partners, but from a whole range of partners and others...We do it based on fundraising needs, donors minds, CIDA and our partners".

For others, the change developed as a result of 'consultation' with different actors, partners, popular groups where they work, their representatives for the region, overseas volunteers and governments of Canada and Southern countries governments.

"Ha habido una consultación con las mujeres que trabajamos y con los grupos populares, en los últimos dos años, en los países con los representantes, con los cooperantes voluntarios y con el gobierno de Canadá o allá. Todo se ha hecho con preguntas que los representantes tienen que responder; lentamente eso va llegando a Canadá, se hace un draft y se discute...,pero la última definitiva es muestra política; el partenaire puede aceptarla o no..."⁸⁶

⁸⁵ We have had more problems with NGOs now that the war has ended than we had during the war: the war meant that many of the problems which could exist were covered up; what you can do during the war is very different from what you can do afterwards. Management problems: apply to El Salvador the same norms that are applied normally around the world...it's an exceptional relationship during a war"

⁸⁶ "There has been a consultation with the women we work with, and with the popular groups, in the last two years, in the countries with representatives, with overseas cooperants, with the government of Canada or there. Everything has been done with

For one NGO, the official policy developed after such consultation was not open for discussion. The 'partner' had the option to accept or reject it. Those who agreed with it would find their input in the policy, those who disagreed would not. For another PCNGO, the PSNGOs were consulted after their plan had been discussed within the PCNGO, with the regional representative and presented to CIDA. Their partners were then informed of the amount of funding allocated to them. Partners were to submit their proposals based on the information provided to them. Another PCNGO did an analysis of the conjuncture of El Salvador in Canada, then discussed it with the PSNGOs.

One PCNGO feels that changes in criteria help the PSNGO learn about specific issues. For example, a PSNGO may find that if they do not meet the criteria on the environment, it is not financed. This helps them learn about criteria related to the environment, while letting the PCNGO know about the PSNGO's strengths and weaknesses in this area.

questions that the representatives have to answer; slowly it arrives to Canada, a draft is done, it's discussed...but the ultimate defining factor is our polity; the partner can accept it or not..."

5.5 Perspectives on Screening

5.5.1 Salvadorean NGOs perspectives on screening:

5.5.2 Finding donors to achieve goals:

All PSNGOs stated the importance of sharing the same beliefs (comulguen) and identifying with the mission and objectives of their institution. One PSNGO said that it is sometimes 'al azar' how they find NGOs who will support them. If they had had a choice, they would (probably) have chosen some NGOs and not others. In some cases the PSNGO knew about a PCNGO because of its work with other PSNGOs.

All PSNGOs affirmed that establishing a relationship with a PCNGO depends on whether a project is approved or not. One PSNGO stated that once they presented a project proposal to a PCNGO, they were usually asked for more information, which the PSNGO provided and the relationship developed from there. However, if the PCNGO did not approve the proposal, there was nothing the PSNGOs could do about it. One PSNGO stated that they were kept outside of the process of project approval, and they only received news about the state that their project when the PCNGO required additional information about the project. They were informed only at the end whether the project had been approved or not.

5.5.3 The contract

Once a project is approved, a contract is signed indicating the mutual responsibilities and the amount of the funds allocated. The project itself becomes an important document of the agreement and the time frames for transferring the funds. In the case of Canada there is a peculiarity (*peculiaridad*), in that the last transfer of funds is sometimes done only after the final report is submitted. The PCNGO wanted to have the final report first and reserved the right to reject any modifications to the initial agreement. The funds were withheld until the PCNGO had agreed with the PSNGOs justifications for the changes. According to a larger NGO, PSNGOs are able to do internal movements (*movimientos internos*) of funds until the reimbursement was received. For one PSNGO, this situation demanded a certain level of institutional development, since smaller NGOs would not have the funds to complete a project and wait for reimbursement (which generally was received two to three months later.) To some PSNGOs, such criteria indicate a level of distrust on the part of PCNGOs.

One PSNGO stated that although the project formats are developed by the PCNGO, these are not always rigid. If there are aspects of it that do not apply to the Salvadorean reality (such as the banking procedures), the PSNGO can renegotiate some of the clauses (*clausulas*) as long as these do not contradict Canadian government policies. The PCNGOs, which are more transparent with the PSNGOs, will tell them that those clauses are stipulated by the Canadian government and cannot be changed.

5.6 Canadian NGOs perspectives on screening

5.6.1 Finding partners

Some relationships with PSNGOs were established in an unpredictable way. One PCNGO called this 'historical accidents'; especially because some years later, when the PCNGO changed priorities, the organizations in those traditional relationships were working in different areas than the PCNGOs.

"The partners we have are made up of historical accidents or previous areas, we worked in previous decisions made. The accidents happen because the particular need in a moment and understanding of development needs at the moment; our perspective might change down the road and we still have partners. Down the road it will seem like historical accidents, but there are good reasons to do so. ie, why do we work in the country? We work in some and not other countries; it has to do with the people, we have on staff and their own initiative and they are doing interesting work and it continues. The partners we work with might themselves evolve or we choose other partners..."

One PCNGO stated that once they find the right PSNGO they want to stay in a relationship for a long time, until the PSNGO is able to speak for itself and does not need the PCNGO anymore. Most PCNGOs expected the PSNGOs to share the same analysis, to be transparent, honest, efficient to have potential, and be able to commit to the relationship. One PCNGO wanted transparency on both sides; another wanted to establish mutual learning relationships with PSNGO's. Another PCNGO stated that they analyzed the PSNGO capacity to achieve the projects results as well as their political & ideological perspective before they approved the funds. Its screening procedure (which

is used in all parts of the world) involves an analysis of the organization presenting the project proposal, an analysis of the project, and congruence with the PCNGOs priorities.

"...los criterios se analizan a tres niveles: 1. Análisis del partenaire...; 2. Análisis, descripción y criterios del proyecto.. .; 3. Con muestras orientaciones determinamos prioridades que pueden ir cambiando de acuerdo a nuestras exigencias."

One PCNGO said that it was not interested in maintaining a relationship with a PSNGO which had kept the same view as in the 1980s and preferred PSNGOs who had the capacity to adapt to the new political 'conjuncture' another wanted to apply the strategies learned in one area to other countries by encouraging relationships amongst NGOs in the region and in other areas of the world.

5.6.2 Establishing conditions

Three PCNGOs stated that they pressured PSNGOs supporting different political parties within the FMLN to work cooperatively by giving funding for joint projects. Though the PSNGOs worked together to get the funding, there was no real sustained coordination.

"...les obligo a una real coordinación porque estaban juntos para el financiamiento, pero no en la práctica. Nos dimos cuenta después de un tiempo que uno de los problemas era que no había verdadera coordinación y sí la necesitábamos..."⁸⁷

One PCNGO believed that PSNGOs should leave their political tendencies to the side in order to have a project approved. The PCNGO did not want the PSNGO to gain 'political

⁸⁷ "...I require from them real coordination; together for financing, but practical. We realized after a while that one of the problems was that there was no real coordination and we needed it..."

advantage' (capital politico) as result of the funds received. These political tendencies, it was believed, affected the project's capacity to achieve the intended results.

Section III.

5.7 Perspectives on Race

5.7.1 Salvadorean NGO perspective on Race

All PSNGOs stated that race was not an issue in the relationship and that they had not detected any obvious racist attitudes from PCNGO representatives. Two PSNGO representatives found a certain 'redeemer' (redentora) attitude from members of solidarity groups in regards to people in the South. This attitude was expressed by their belief that they had the solutions, the best alternatives. Everything done in the South was of poor quality, because it had not come out of a careful analysis.

"Yo nunca he logrado detectar una actitud racista, es decir obvia. Si siento que hay más que todo en personas vinculadas a organismos de solidaridad. Esa actitud redentora con respecto a la gente del sur; en el sentido de que son los que traen las soluciones y las mejores alternativas... Todo lo que se hace aquí; por haber sido hecho en el sur es de mala calidad; no ha sido el producto de un análisis y por lo tanto no es de bueno".⁸⁸

⁸⁸ "I've never managed to detect a racist attitude -an obvious one. If I feel there is one it's more in people linked to solidarity organizations. This redeeming attitude with respect to people in the South; in the sense that they are the ones that bring the solutions and the best alternatives...Anything that is done here is of low quality because it was done in the South; it has not been a product of an analysis and for this reason it's no good".

One PSNGO stated that race had nothing to do with the relationship but, that if PCNGOs reflected Northern NGOs feeling that they knew more than the PSNGOs, it was not because of racism but suggested a Northern arrogance. Salvadoreans were seen as the needy and marginalized poor of the third world waiting for the 'crumbs' from the North and hoping that the wealth from the North would 'trickle-down' to El Salvador. This, according to the PSNGO, was not racist marginalization, but were reflective of Northern arrogance and haughtiness.

One PSNGO noted that there were some groups of Canadians who came to the country to see the projects that they were supporting, who knew little about international development, and who brought racist attitudes. These were shown by their criticism of everything around them. They saw very few positive things in the work being done, and felt uncomfortable even with very simple things such as the noise, the homes, the garbage and the heat.

One PSNGO stated that this attitude [knowing everything] seemed to be more prevalent in technical 'experts' sent by PCNGOs (or Northern NGOs), who came to the country with quite arrogant attitudes, as if they had 'a magic wand [for solving the problems]. This NGO believed that these were individual attitudes, and did not reflect the PCNGO's institutional policies.

"...también el caso de los técnicos que vienen con la vara mágica... con actitudes bastante prepotentes. Si lo pudieran haber demostrado técnicos que los ongs contrataron, (que no se si trabajan permanentemente o eventualmente con estas ongs) si los contratan por tener esas actitudes o son actitudes que se salen de la política o del contrato institucional. Pienso que pueden ser cuestiones de estilo; no creo que

*sean parte de las políticas institucionales, sino se debe a criterios más particulares.*⁸⁹

In the context of our discussion on race, one PSNGO believed that sometimes the representatives of a particular PCNGO did not meet the technical requirements to perform a more efficient job. In this area, this NGO stated that there have been some PCNGOs and Northern NGOs who sent technical support to the PSNGO, but first co-ordinated with the PSNGO to assure that both experts complemented each other.

Two PSNGOs saw no influence of race in the relationship, although one felt that the fact that all decisions were made in the North was symbolic of it. One PSNGO did specifically not see racism in the relationship but believed that those with money intervene and define [programs and policies]. Some do it in more humble way; others come with more openly, still others come with a more horizontal treatment.

Another PSNGO stated that they did not see any racism from NGO representatives, but on the contrary found them quite sensitive. This NGO representative believed that Canadians and people all over the world identify with problems such as poverty and misery.

"...por lo menos con los representantes de los organismos que hemos tenido relación no. Ellos son muy sensibles. Veo también que las gentes que están en Canadá o en

⁸⁹ "Also there's the case of technical people that come with a magic wand...with quite superior attitudes. Yes, the technical people hired by the NGOs could have shown it, I don't know if they work permanently or just temporarily with these NGOs, or if they hire them because they have these attitudes, or if these attitudes come out of the policy or the institutional contract. I think that it can be a question of style; I don't think that it's part of an institutional policy, but rather it's more personal."

cualquier lugar del mundo; son muy sensibles a los problemas de pobreza y miseria".⁹⁰

Even though the PSNGOs says that racism is not an issue, when one link what they did say to the theory (anti-racism literature) in fact racism is an issue.

5.7.2 Canadian NGO perspective on race

While all PCNGOs agreed that race was not an issue in the relationship with El Salvador, all acknowledged that there was racial discrimination in the South against indigenous peoples in Guatemala and Mexico and black peoples in the South. One PCNGO believed that there was racism in Haiti because the population was Black, the misery and lack of intellectual development of Haitian people was more discredited (desprestigiados).

"...raza: no es temática, en Guatemala y en México si; racismo no lo he notado mucho quizás más en el caso de Haití...Haití más dominado por la miseria y la falta de desarrollo intelectual; trato de desprecio y color; ciertamente hay mucho racismo contra los Haitianos, [por parte de la gente del norte] ciertamente un factor, que la población sea negra".⁹¹

One PCNGO felt the North is more sensitive than the South around the issue of indigenous people. Another stated that racism 'doesn't exist but it does', because

⁹⁰ At least with the representatives of organizations that we have had relationships with, no. They are very sensitive. I also see that the people who are in Canada or in other parts of the world are very sensitive to the problems of poverty and destitution"

⁹¹ "...race: it's not a topic; in Guatemala and Mexico it is; I have not noticed much racism...maybe more in the case of Haiti...Haiti is more dominated by poverty and a lack of intellectual development; scornful treatment and colour; certainly there is a great deal of racism against Haitians; certainly a factor is that the population is black"

frequently the Northern NGOs would worry more about the marginalized of the societies in the South (such as the Black and the Indians) than the local NGOs.

"No tiene que ver de ninguna manera, pero puede tener que ver mucho de hecho. ..en el norte se preocupan mucho con aquello que se puede ver como los marginados de la sociedad, por ejemplo en Colombia se dice: los indios, los negros en los puertos o las minorías étnicas. En el norte las organizaciones se preocupan más de esos grupos que los mismos ongs; los organismos del norte son aquellos que están más sensibilizados a la problemática de los grupos minoritarios del sur; sean raciales o económicos".⁹²

One PCNGO believed that currently the North does not claim to be the one that knows, because it has recognized that the South has a strong capacity. Therefore what is used today is the language of 'partnership' and dialogue . The issue was seen by another PCNGO as North and South, not as race.

In the context of racism, one PCNGO stated that this could create an 'unjust inequality', referring to the feeling that the world is superior vis a vis the non-western world. Such a [feeling of superiority] is based on economic and intellectual factors. With this approach, the North seeks to impose its way of thinking and criteria on the South. One NGO stated that the South had to reject this, because it is false, and is not favorable to development. Examples of these impositions were given, such as the expert 'know how' strategies in the 60's, and the ideological exportation of the 70's. Another example was women who were

⁹² "It has nothing to do with it at all, but it can have a lot to do with the facts...in the North they worry a lot about what is seen as those marginalized from society, for example in Colombia they say the Indians, the blacks in the ports and the ethnic minorities. In the North the organizations worry more about these groups than the NGOs themselves; the organizations in the North are those that are more sensitive to the problems of the minority groups in the South, whether they be racial or economic".

not able to accomplish what they wanted to in France in relation to the women's rights, went to Latin America to struggle for the defense of women there

One PCNGO acknowledged that they did not have a policy on race, but were trying to do something about it, by talking to the different partners. This PCNGO representative acknowledged that racism is endemic. *"...We live in a racist world; we live it and breath it; we struggle against it, but it is there; we should not deny it. For instance in the organization there are not many non- white people"*.

This NGO representative recognized that because PCNGOs are wealthier organizations compared to the Southern partners, *"the partnership becomes a power relationship, which manifests itself in racial , class and gender attributes"*.

Another PCNGO stated that PSNGOs resist gender and racial issues as cultural matters of their country. This is a sensitive issue that needs to be treated very respectfully and carefully but you have to challenge those cultural practices. It is not easy but it has to be addressed

*"...je pense qu'un vrai partenariat implique qu'on se "challenge" intellectuellement et mutuellement...; on pense de façon respectueuse qu'on a un devoir intellectuel d'engager un apprentissage dans les deux sens...on poussait la ligne et eux ils la poussaient aussi; on continue il y a un dialogue; on continue à travailler ensemble, on a fait du chemin..."*⁹³

⁹³ "I think that a real partnership implies that there is a mutual and intellectual challenge...we think in a respectful way that we have a two-way intellectual task of apprenticeship...we push the line and they also push it; we continue and we have a dialogue; we continue working together...we've made a path.

5.8 Perspectives on Gender

5.8.1 Salvadorean NGO perspective on Gender

Two PSNGOs stated that gender has had the most influence in the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs. In one case the PCNGO has openly told the PSNGOs that they want to introduce policies and mechanisms prioritizing gender equity.

"Donde si creo que ha habido más influencia de las ongs de Canadá ha sido en la parte de la cuestión de género. Ahí siento que ha sido...incluso con la gente que manejamos un nivel de transparencia mucho más directo; nos dicen: "Nosotros como ongs canadienses, estamos interesados que las ongs que reciben fondos introduzcan en sus políticas mecanismos que den prioridad y privilegien la equidad de género". Eso es claro".⁹⁴

There are other PCNGOs with whom there had not been an opportunity to talk about these issues, but their project guidelines [formularios] ask about benefits to women. It was assumed that this was a sign that some PCNGOs were interested in gender equity. Some PCNGOs have asked for feedback from the PSNGO on this issue and have even had meetings to discuss it.

⁹⁴ "Where I think that there has been the most influence from Canadian NGOs has been in the question of gender. I think that there has been in that area...even with people that we have a quite direct level of transparency with, say to us. "Our interest, as Canadian NGOs, is that the NGOs that receive money introduce mechanisms into their policies which will give priority and privileges to gender equality" This is clear."

Gender has had an influence in that PSNGOs who are not working with a gender perspective are being discriminated against by not being funded. One PSNGO felt that this reflected an “avalanche of feminism” coming from the North. This NGO representative differentiated between gender identity and feminism. For him/her gender meant the inclusion of both men and women, but this was not the same as feminism which upheld only women.

One PSNGO believed that gender had no impact on the relationship because they had dealt with the issue before the PCNGO had included gender in their project criteria.

Another PSNGO saw gender as an issue in the role played by women's groups within the country. There are women's NGOs which are trying to address discrimination against women, but are defined by some PSNGOs as feminists. According to this representative, the creation of various feminist groups has weakened the popular movement.

5.8.2 Canadian NGO perspective on Gender

Three PCNGOs stated that gender had an influence in the project criteria for El Salvador. One PCNGO acknowledged that men (and in some cases women) in the PSNGO's resisted gender criteria, even if, at times, they had identified gender training workshops for men as a priority. One PCNGO regarded gender as an important determinant in choosing partners in El Salvador. Another stated that gender received a greater priority after the war.

Two PCNGOs stated that, at the beginning, it was the PSNGOs who resisted gender change. Both the men and the women saw the pressure as a Northern issue. One PCNGO challenged the male leadership in PSNGOs by supporting gender initiatives. At the beginning some PCNGOs entered into “political complicity” with the women in the PSNGOs in order to support initiatives that favoured the women. Later PSNGOs developed gender inclusive projects as a result of negotiations with PCNGOs (or other agencies). According to one PCNGO, the resulting changes were due to the existence of a true partnership between the NGOs as well as Salvadorean woman’s interest in it.

One PCNGO stated that gender criteria are part of the negotiations related to the project proposals. The PSNGOs are informed that the PCNGOs, as well as other international funders, want to fund women’s projects and are insisting on a gender perspective in their work. Both NGOs want the funds and are smart in meeting the gender criteria.

“...we want to fund the women, they do not want to fund the women. It is always back and forth. As to how are they insuring that the women are getting the support we want them to get and how do we build the strength of the women within the organizations and encourage the leaders to understand the role of the women within the organization. We do not always agree with their perspectives. They and we are smart; they know they will say yes. We want the women to do this and do that because they know it is important to us and to all international funders. All international funders are insisting on a gender perspective and a gender analysis in their work. so, partners are learning to do that. There are individuals within the organization who favour that and individuals who don't.”

5.9 Perspectives on Class

5.9.1 Salvadorean NGO perspective on Class

When asked about the influence of class, PSNGOs had very little to say about it.

Two PSNGOs mentioned that during the war it was very important to have the support of PCNGOs who identified with PSNGOs' political and ideological perspectives. One NGO said that after the war the most important aspect was that the PSNGO met the technical requirements to receive funding.

Two PSNGOs referred to PCNGOs giving preference to some PSNGOs more than others. One PSNGO referred to the influence of class on the relationship in the context of foreigners linked to radical political perspectives who come to El Salvador to fulfil their own political convictions. These people criticize PSNGOs for wanting to receive funds from U.S. AID and have even withdrawn their support when a particular PSNGO wanted to receive such funding.

5.9.2 Canadian NGO perspective on Class:

When asked about the influence of class, one PCNGO saw the analysis not in its classical definition, but in the context of giving power to those who do not have it.

For most PCNGOs, a class analysis meant sharing the model of society [socialism] sought [by Southern NGOs] and because they have traditionally worked with poor people and labour unions.

“Estamos trabajando en solidaridad porque tenemos un visión similar de la cooperación al desarrollo y si no podemos tener una visión similar, entonces no vamos a trabajar juntos”.⁹⁵

One PCNGO criticized both Northern and Southern NGOs because he/she felt, everything is being lost, even ideology does not count any more, but the hybrid (lo híbrido). *“...hoy lo que cuenta es lo híbrido. Ni los sindicatos del norte tienen fuerza ni en el sur...aquí en Canadá no hay ninguno que sea interesante”.⁹⁶*

Section IV

5.10. Directions in the relationships

5.10.1 Salvadorean NGO's directions

One PSNGO representative focused on changing the time frame for development. These time frames tend to be short-sighted, and conjunctural (cortoplacistas coyunturales), rather than focusing on long-term programs that would allow elaboration of new economic, social and political indicators for development funding institutions. The practice so far has been to limit

⁹⁵ “we are working together in solidarity because we share a similar vision of development cooperation, if we can not have a similar vision, then we will not work together”

⁹⁶ “The hybrid is what matters now a days. Neither the Northern or the Southern union movement has strength... there is not one interesting movement in Canada”

a particular initiative to one year because the priorities may change. In other cases, priorities may change because a new executive director may be interested in another area of the world.

"Otro punto que también yo cambiaría fuera: los plazos que se establecen para la cooperación y el desarrollo. Yo hago una crítica a muchas de las ongs (es válida la crítica); es esta de que la famosa cooperación al desarrollo; entendiendo desarrollo integral, que la persona humana mejore sus condiciones de vida no es una cosa que vas a hacer con un proyecto de un año. Que no es con acciones corto placistas conjunturales, espontaneas algunas, que vas a comenzar la solución".⁹⁷

One PSNGO stated that from 1995-96, both local and international NGOs have started to question (plantear) the meaning of funding institutions for development. For instance, the question asked is Does aid really help? (ayuda la ayuda?) International funding institutions must challenge this myth in order to become 'an alternative to development'.

On the other hand, another PSNGO stated that, 'if hypothetically', all Canadian funding institutions withdrew from El Salvador, PSNGOs would almost disappear because none have reached a level of economic self-sufficiency. This is where joint initiatives are important.

"...en el caso de que se acabara la ayuda; quedaríamos completamente marginados; no tendríamos ninguna opción de conocimiento y participación. Por eso son importantes las iniciativas conjuntas que nos permitan tomar experiencias de los ongs canadienses como salvadoreños."

⁹⁷ "Another point that I would change would be: the timeframes that are established for cooperation and development. I criticize many NGOs (it's a valid criticism); and it's that this famous cooperation and development; including integral development, that human beings improve their living conditions is not something that you can do with a one-year project. It is not with conjunctural short term actions, some of them spontaneous, that you can begin finding a solution".

One PSNGO wanted to continue receiving political, financial and moral support in the future, and maintain a relationship based on real solidarity. They also wanted to continue lobbying the Canadian government in relation to policies of the World Bank and IMF.

Another wanted to receive help around institutional strengthening for both Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs in the future. This representative stated that so far, monitoring and evaluation have been imposed by Northern NGOs, but PSNGOs have not done the same. All evaluation and monitoring must be a two way learning process in which the experience of PSNGOs is applied in Canada as well and vice versa.

Most PSNGOs believed that the relationships to be established in the future are not between NGOs, but between movements (i.e. co-operative to co-operative) from civil society to civil society

“estamos buscando una relación mas fraterna, nosotros tenemos mucho que aportar a las sociedades del primer mundo; somos un pueblo de fe; creemos en el triunfo que nos va dando la fortaleza y la esperanza y esa es una característica que tenemos; tenemos sueños que algún día vamos a lograr algo”⁹⁸

5.10.2 Canadian NGOs directions

Only those PSNGOs and PCNGOs which are able to meet the new times and challenges of globalization and neo-liberal policies will be the ones to continue being relevant for the

⁹⁸ “We are searching for a more fraternal relationship because we have lost to contribute to the societies in the first world. We are people of faith, we believe that one day we will triumph, and that is a dream that gives us strength and hope. This is a characteristic that we have, we dream that one day we will be able to achieve that dream”.

future. Most PCNGOs however want to continue relationships based on solidarity, mutual respect, transparency, the influence of women in the policy decisions of PSNGOs, and strengthening civil society. Some vary in emphasis, focusing on exchange of information, systematizing work in other continents and professionalism in interventions.

One PCNGO representative also wants to improve professionalism in the North, and address their dependency on temperamental changes (cambios temperamentales) in government funding. As well, Southern NGOs should be more representative of their civil society. This same person felt that Southern NGOs should be less subordinate to Northern funding sources and more representative of their own communities, and should avoid partisanship (partidismo).

Both NGOs need to increase their understanding of race, class and gender perspectives.

One PNGO representative stated that the organization could play a role in trying to get the PSNGOs to increase their understanding in this area, but it is not their 'role' to change the internal structure [position] of the organizations.

"what we try is that our partners also take a race, class and gender analysis, in developing their programs and we choose partners that are willing to do this sort of analysis... besides the money is the perspectives that the partners have"

Conclusion

In summary, the Canadian and Salvadoran NGOs perspectives their relationships indicate that:

(1) On issues of equality and inequality in the relationship, both NGOs are making efforts to establish an equal relationship, yet there exist complex power dynamics. For instance,

there are no mechanisms established by PCNGOs to allow PSNGOs to participate in the decision making around policy and programming for El Salvador.

(2) Both NGOs had little to say about the influence that class had had in the relationship and referred to class especially when they worked together to end the war, and in helping the poor.

(3) The influence of gender in the relationship is being discussed especially since PCNGOs want PSNGOs to include gender in all their projects, and PSNGOs know that without gender inclusive projects, they will not be eligible to receive funding from PCNGOs.

(4) Both NGOs did not see the influence of race\racism in the individual the relationship between NGO representatives, however (half of the NGOs), mentioned that it existed in the larger context of North\South relations. PCNGOs have recognized the racial discrimination that Indigenous and Black people face in Southern countries and have started to support projects within these populations.

(5) There is a desire from both NGOs to work together in the near future, in lobbying and advocacy around resisting the policies of the WB and IMF, as well as general issues around globalization and the re-definitions of development. There were however, no mechanisms cited to facilitate such a process.

Chapter 6

The Canadian and Salvadorean NGO Relationship: Discussion

"Just because"

I say it exists, does it mean you believe it does;
 You do not talk about it, it means it does not exist;
 You talk or think about it, it means you are doing something about it;
 You live it, it means that you recognize it;
 You do not know how to talk about it, it means you can not do it
 You believe it exists, it means you take responsibility to change it;
 You take responsibility to change it, others like you, will join you;
 Others join you, it means others are not against you;
 Even then, you still can change it. (Sara Torres, July, 1997)

Introduction:

The poem above reflects the commitment to 'walk your talk and talk your walk' in an anti-racist, feminist and Marxist approach to the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs and peoples, but especially between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs.

The Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs that participated in this study are doing important work in support of the communities in El Salvador. The effect of such work is felt in Canada through education and awareness programs sponsored by PCNGOs. To analyze the relationships that both NGOs develop in this process is important as it can help and/or hinder the relationships amongst Northern and Southern NGOs. To analyze this process, I reviewed the literature and interviewed ten NGOs.

Given the assumption that the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs is unequal, I wanted to find out how it applied to the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs. Therefore I asked the following: 1. What role do Salvadorean NGOs play in the elaboration of Canadian NGOs policies, programs and project criteria for El Salvador? 2. How are issues of class, race, and gender manifested in their relationship? 3. How do Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs perceive the directions in their relationship for the coming years?.

To analyze the answers to these questions, I will go back to the literature and the interview data to draw some links to what I have learned about the Canadian and Salvadorean NGO in the relationship. The first learning addresses the links between the literature and the relationships. The second learning focuses on the vision of the Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs of their relationship in terms of equality and inequality, the influence of race, class and gender, and the future of the relationship. I close this chapter by providing a model that I hope will encourage more learning and the strengthening of the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs over the long term.

Section I

What have we learned about the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs ?

6.1 The literature and its influence in the relationship

The influence of the literature on the relationship reveals several aspects.

The modernization concept of development has been influential at both the macro and the micro context of the NGO relationship. At the 'macro' level it has promoted the pouring in of aid to address the problems of third world countries (Bennet, 1991). It has also translated into the present neo-liberal policies and their tools such as structural adjustment (Rosales, 1996). At the 'micro' level it has been adopted by NGOs, especially amongst those belonging to Korten's first and second generation of NGOs (Macdonald, 1996).

The dependency approach has also been influential at both the macro and micro levels. At the 'macro' levels some attempts to build more democratic societies by progressive governments in Latin America, (Nicaragua, Grenada, Chile) were not successful. At the 'micro' levels, it has influenced the NGOs especially amongst the more progressive ones (Johnston, 1995, Macdonald, 1996) that I have classified within Korten's third generation of NGOs. This explains why progressive Northern NGOs have supported progressive Southern NGOs who have openly criticized their governments or even supported armed revolutions, such as the case in El Salvador.

Progressive academics could influence the micro especially in the area of social movements (Chew & Denmark, 1996), as well as the empowerment of people through their ability to gain control over the resources, (Korten, 1995). This is an important contribution, as progressive NGOs (at least rhetorically) have wanted to empower their beneficiaries to have more control over the development process.

The feminist literature is gradually becoming more influential in women centered programs financed by development agencies such as CIDA. Socialist feminist literature, for instance, challenges capitalism and patriarchy in the development agenda.

The anti-racism literature is absent from mainstream literature, and only recently some mainstream feminist literature began to incorporate issues of race and diversity (Anderson, 1997). Because mainstream development literature influences the relationship between the NGO's, this literature must incorporate both a feminist and anti-racism approach. If this is not done, the development literature will continue influencing the social construction of racism, sexism and classism by a phenomenon that I called 'the silent integrated classism, sexist, and racist' approach to development.

In the micro context of Aid, the accompaniment model used by PCNGOs, was relevant only during the war, because then, the vision of ending the war and of building a new society, was the main principle on which the relationship was built. This model becomes less relevant after the war, however, as criteria overpowered the relationships and there does not appear to exist, amongst PSNGOs, a clear vision of the society that they want to achieve.

Section II

The interview data; progressive Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs vision of their relationship.

6.2 Equality vs. inequality in the War and Non-War periods

In understanding the role that Salvadorean NGOs play in the elaboration of Canadian NGOs policies, programs and project criteria for El Salvador, I learned that their relationship presents some characteristics of 'positive' and 'negative' inequality. The 'positive' inequality recognizes the differences and division of responsibilities in which Canadian NGOs finance the projects and the Salvadorean NGOs execute them. In this positive inequality there are some elements of equality such as opportunity to dialogue and solidarity. 'Negative' inequality was seen by PSNGOs in their lack of participation in the decision making of PCNGOs policies and programming for El Salvador. The inequality lies in a relationship that focuses more on the 'money' than in a 'political and ideological' exchange between NGOs. (This will be developed later in addressing the influence of class in the relationship.)

In this chapter I will use the term '*moral authority*' in interpreting the data. This term emerged as a concept during the interviews and the interview data, especially when Salvadorean NGOs felt honoured, and meritorious in receiving Canadian NGO support,

or when both NGOs knew they had an expertise over the work done. As well, this occurred in cases where both NGOs reserved their right to be critical of the others' behaviour. The term appeared also when both NGOs felt that they had the power to influence the other NGO. In some aspects of the relationship, especially in project management, Canadian NGOs expressed some sense of authority over the PSNGOs' lack of experience in this area which coincided with the end of the war. (This will be further developed in the section of the influence of class.)

The term 'moral authority' thus refers to the power that both NGOs had in the relationship. This relationship shifted over time from equality to inequality and vice versa. An important aspect of this power is discussed by Wright (1993) in what he calls *Situational* and *Systemic* power⁹⁹ *Situational* power is the "...ability of the one actor to get another to do something even in the face of resistance, and *Systemic* power is "...the power to realize one's interests by virtue of the overall structure of a social system rather than by virtue of commanding the behavior of others or of controlling the agendas of specific organizations" (p.145).

The weight of the *situational* and the *systemic* power in the PCNGOs and PSNGOs relationship seems to reflect the position that they occupy within the 'aid process'. For instance, both NGOs gave greater importance to the role of 'money exchange' after the war which implied that PCNGOs had *situational* power due to having the financial means to support the projects which met project criteria. On the other hand, both NGOs gave

⁹⁹ In Krieger, Joel, edi. The Oxford Companion to Politics of the World, 1993.

greater importance to the role of the 'political' exchange during the war, which in turn reflected PSNGOs and PCNGOs having *systemic* power in the relationship. When both NGOs hold the systemic power, I call that equal relations. Therefore during the war the relationship was more equal and shifted to inequality in the post-war period. While PSNGOs seemed to believe that there was more equality during the war and inequality after the war, PCNGOs, felt that the relationship had more elements of equality in both time periods.

Based on both NGOs location on the 'aid process' it is understandable that even if PSNGOs agreed with their role in the 'money exchange' they resented the lack of participation in the decision making of the programming and policies of PCNGOs for El Salvador. The same occurred for PCNGOs who agreed in their roles as providers yet resented it when PSNGOs were critical of their practices or did not seem to appreciate their efforts.

In this 'aid' process, both NGOs want to have the 'moral authority' to influence the other to meet their institutional goals. For PSNGOs, the PCNGOs' moral authority [situational power] lies in having the funds to influence the direction of PSNGO programming and policies, especially after the war. For PCNGOs the power of PSNGOs lies in their efficiency at meeting the projects' expected results.

From an insiders perspective, the lack of participation of PSNGOs in the decision making of PCNGOs, is due to what is seen (within the Canadian NGO field) as the PSNGOs'

lack of knowledge about Canadian society. This was confirmed by PSNGOs when all the participants said that they knew very little about the context of the work of PCNGOs. This gives PCNGOs the rationale (or moral authority) to exclude PSNGOs from this process. As one PSNGO stated, “the communication goes here [El Salvador] to there [Canada] and not the opposite” In fact, while the literature advocates that “the old era of donor-recipient relationship (‘we have and give’ ‘they need and accept’) is dead and gone” (CIDA, 1998, p.89), it may be that this same notion continues to exclude PSNGOs in decision making.

While one NGO has the moral authority over the other, the relationship can not be analyzed solely from the specific aspect of the ‘money’ exchange or the conjunctural feature of the ‘political’ exchange. The relationship must be analyzed within the broader framework that brought the two NGOs together in the first place. This broader framework is the poverty and lack of democracy in El Salvador, combined with the wealth and democracy in Northern countries. Although the participants did not refer to this framework when asked about the influence of class in the relationship, the dependency and Marxist theories of development have explained the war in El Salvador as a class struggle.

In my interpretation of the relationship I added two other factors that influence the relationship: these are gender and race. In the sections below I address how class, gender and race has had an influence the relationship by combining three sources of data, (the interview data, the theory and my personal experience in the field of development).

6.3 The influence of Class

As mentioned before, the war in El Salvador (1979-1991) was based on a class struggle between those who had access to wealth, power, status, and ownership of the means of production, the elites, (Elliot & Fleras 1992) and those who do not, the majority of the Salvadorean population. The relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs emerged during the war and therefore reflects the influence of class for two reasons: 1. Both NGOs were committed to that class struggle by supporting the right of the poor (workers, peasants, unemployed) to struggle for a new society and the end of the war. During the war the clear goal for Salvadoreans was to build socialism. The Nicaraguan and Cuban revolution was an inspiration for them. 2. While PCNGOs were committed to supporting PSNGOs, the former has had the *situational* [economic] and *systematic* [a funder NGO from the North] power to influence and to change the direction of the policies and programming of PSNGOs, reflecting a class influence.

In this context, the relationship between Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs reflects two major influences: the war and post-war periods in El Salvador (as supported by the interview data) and CNGOs' need to professionalize their interventions (as supported by the literature and CIDA policies) to avoid financial vulnerability and in some cases crises of relevancy (Kelleher, D, et al, 1996). One PCNGO stated, "after the war we needed to apply the same standards in El Salvador as in any part of the world". Therefore, the

'moral authority' shifted from being shared by both NGOs during the war, to PCNGOs after the war. During the war PSNGOs held moral authority because of their heroism and vision for a new society. They were killed for their efforts to achieve social and economic justice. PCNGOs also had moral authority because they were helping to protect the lives of those Salvadoreans. PSNGOs had the moral authority to request funding and to be given unconditional help because the political goals and the risk to their lives were more important for PCNGOs than meeting CIDA policies or any project criteria. Many PCNGOs found funding on their own to support projects in El Salvador. Many of these projects were not considered "development" at the time, but rather human rights protection, which did not qualify for CIDA matching grants.

Although both NGOs held moral authority during the war, the PCNGOs used two pressure points, the 'political coordination of the Salvadorean NGOs' (as reflected in Canadian NGOs interview data) and 'technical demands' to control their relationship with Salvadorean NGOs (as reflected in the Salvadorean NGOs interview data). The 'political' coordination pressure focused on the criticism made by PCNGOs of the alliance of PSNGOs with the political parties of the FMLN and their inability to work together. Although most PSNGOs did not mention this issue, the literature has shown that partisan politics played an important role in El Salvador because popular organizations and PSNGOs were influenced by the Marxist and dependency theories advocated by the FMLN.¹⁰⁰ Therefore,

¹⁰⁰ The FMLN being a coalition of five political parties, each holding a different political ideological view of the class struggle (some considered truly Marxist-Leninists, while others social democrats) and different military strategies to overthrow the capitalist government of El Salvador. Some argued that the war had to be based on a long strategy

PCNGOs became fully aware of the influence that these political differences had among PSNGOs. As three of the PCNGOs stated, PSNGOs were told to implement projects in coalition rather than separately. PCNGOs were not sympathetic to PSNGOs applying separately to the same PCNGO to finance different projects. PCNGOs did not want to favour one political party of the FMLN over another. The pressure placed by PCNGOs for the coordination of Salvadorean NGOs reflected the moral authority that PCNGOs were able to work in coordination in Canada, while PSNGOs were unable to do the same in El Salvador.

I recall conversations with some PCNGOs representatives at the time, in which they felt frustrated at being dragged into the politics of PSNGOs. However, once PCNGOs understood the politics, they felt knowledgeable enough about the 'culture of Salvadoreans' to dictate that PSNGOs work in coordination. Despite this pressure point, PSNGOs vision of the new society that they wanted to build in El Salvador overpowered the differences between them and the PCNGOs, and they felt genuine 'accompaniment' from the PCNGOs.

Knowing how dependency theory has also influenced PCNGOs (King, 1992, Macdonald, 1994 & 1996), one could ask: was this pressure due to PSNGOs lack of coordination? or due to PCNGOs having a different political view than that of the PSNGOs and the political parties of the FMLN?¹⁰¹ As suggested in chapter 5, one PSNGO did mention that in the final years of

of alliances between the workers and peasants. Others believed in the alliances of the workers with progressive members of the army while others struggled mainly through electoral politics. Each ideological view found its expression in the PSNGOs who were allied to one of the five parties.

¹⁰¹ Interestingly, the PCNGOs seem to consider this pressure tactic as a success judging by their subsequent efforts to employ the same practice with NGOs in Guatemala.

the war, the civil society (including NGOs) wanted to have an independent expression of the FMLN and that some academics had called that a process of 'renaturalization of civil society.' This brings two questions about the relationship that are not answered by this study: (1) will the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs change in some way by PSNGOs having an independent expression from the FMLN? (2) what kind of 'vision' of the new society might Salvadorean NGOs develop as part of having that independent expression?

A shift in the relationship came after the war, when the sense of heroism PCNGOs felt towards PSNGO workers gradually dissipated and PCNGOs found themselves disillusioned that these brave people did not have the skills they thought they had to meet the new requirements. PSNGOs fell behind in reports, project proposals were not clearly written, projects were not developed as quickly as expected and some collapsed. The moral authority that PSNGOs had had (due to their heroism) shifted slowly to the side of the Canadian NGOs, whose disillusionment and a need to professionalize their interventions translated into implementing policies and criteria that met Canadian standards. Based on the interview data, it is fair to say that the pressure point of 'technical demands' became the focus of their relationship. This pressure point focused on the 'technical expertise' of the PSNGO staff and forced the displacement of many PSNGO workers because their lack of education and skills disqualified them from being actively involved in the second phase of the reconstruction of their country. As mentioned in chapter 3, in analyzing the tripartite nature of the relationship, CIDA's¹⁰²

¹⁰² CIDA in turn explains that the pressure to adopt a RBM is due the fact that "Public bodies in North America and Europe are being held increasingly accountable for their use of diminishing public resources... This has important implications for NGOs, whether they contract to implement CIDA programs or receive CIDA funds for their own programs, as

pressure on Canadian NGOs to adopt a 'results-based management approach' (RBM) also explains the criteria oriented behaviour of Canadian NGOs.

In the following table, I present one example of CIDA's policy, referring to 'institutional strengthening of the partner organization', that PCNGOs had to adopt. This in turn corroborates why PSNGOs had to undergo so many rapid changes.

Table 3. CIDA example of results and indicators of the RBM.¹⁰³

Goal/Objective	Activities/Outputs	Anticipated Results	Indicators of Results
Institutional Strengthening of partner organizations.	Skills development of technical and administrative staff: informal training plus courses	Within 1 year, increased organizational self-reliance	Adequate and qualified staff for the needs of the organization
	Hiring of new, qualified staff	Within 3 years, organizational capacity for increased programming	Systems in place for financial control internal and external audits, cash budgets, monthly financial reports and others identified during implementation period
	Introduction of financial control systems: audits, cash budgets, monthly reports	Within 5-7 years, stable sources of finance and recognition by clients and peers as an effective regional agency	Income and expenditure statements
	preparation of a plan for increasing base and achieving region-wide recognition.		Client satisfaction; assessment by other organizations operating in the same field.

Therefore PSNGOs had not only to professionalize their interventions to meet the new standards of PCNGOs, but they had to demonstrate their "competitiveness" in strategic

CIDA will have to assure itself that these investments are achieving positive development results."(CIDA, 1994, p.1)

¹⁰³ This table was taken from the CIDA document Results-Oriented Programming, Sample # 2, NGO Division, Canadian Partnership Branch, September, 1994, p.9

planning, program evaluation, accounting and presentation of comprehensive project proposals. They were expected to acquire, in a very short time frame, the skills that PCNGO workers had developed over the last 15 to 30 years, without a war, with financial support from a welfare state, free of military and political repression, and within a democracy.

The control that the funding gave to PCNGOs allowed them to dictate the directions in PSNGO structures. This is something that PSNGOs could not influence. As these criteria overpowered their relationship, their vision of the new society was not presented any more by the NGOs as the key to having a relationship. Their relationship moved to the narrow focus of short term projects (up to three years). One PCNGO even stated that “everything was clearer during the war.”

The new criteria disqualified many staff of PSNGOs who, during the war, had struggled against repression and developed many lobbying, advocacy and organizational skills. These skills were not relevant to the managerial skills demanded in the post-war era. I recall an informal conversation of one PSNGO staff during my visit in July 1996. This person lamented the emigration of many Salvadoreans political leaders, who were replaced by the new professionals of the NGO field. Therefore, as illustrated in the ‘activities/outputs of Table 2, the changes in criteria translated into exclusion of many of those Salvadoreans who fought during the war and supported the PSNGOs but who did not have the education or technical skills to contribute in the competitive NGO field. Many academics, and activists in the North

were critical of the FMLN leaders for leaving their rank and file without much support after the war. Yet the same withdrawal of support occurred from PCNGOs and PSNGOs.

PSNGOs knew that in order to survive as institutions, they had to change to meet the new requirements. Because PSNGOs were busy learning new skills there was no time to analyze the implications of these rapid changes in the long term. Rapid changes in criteria (without upgrading the skills of the PSNGO staff) thus had negative effects within PSNGOs.

Another aspect of the class influence in the relationship is what two PSNGOs and one PCNGO referred to as PCNGOs bringing radical left views to El Salvador with the interest of influencing the work of PSNGOs. The NGOs who referred to this issue stated that many Northern solidarity and NGO workers wanted to achieve the political and social changes in El Salvador that they were not able to achieve in their own countries. However, it is beyond the scope of this study to analyze that influence. This is an important issue for further study, especially as the need for a relationship based on political exchange takes precedence.

6.4 The Influence of Gender

Although women have been involved all along in the process of development in El Salvador, their contributions were not recognized until the mid-eighties. During the first years of the NGOs, relationship, the gender influence did not play a major role. Its major influence came after the war with the implementation of project criteria. In this way, PCNGOs hold the moral authority over PSNGOs because they have at least begun to address sexism Canada,¹⁰⁴ much earlier than Salvadorean NGOs have done it. A particular characteristic within the Salvadorean NGO field is the openly stated resistance by men¹⁰⁵ to implementing gender criteria. Their main argument is that it privileges women over men, whereas for them, gender implies both men and women. In the case of El Salvador, the backlash is synonymous with the tendency of PSNGO males to link women's struggles to feminism, something they regard as a Northern phenomenon. Therefore they disregard those struggles. Such resistance to 'foreign' influence is contradictory to their acceptance of the FMLN's political platforms, however, which, based on Marxist Leninist and Social Democratic approaches, have also come from the outside.

Having gender criteria in an organization does not necessarily imply that an organization is progressive in their relationship with women or in their relationship with Southern or Northern organizations, nor that they really want to assist women in their efforts to share economic power and benefits (Maguire, 1984).

¹⁰⁴ the degree to which this actually happens is a matter of much discussion.

¹⁰⁵ (men in Canada do too)

We know that the pressure from the women's movement, both inside and outside Canadian NGOs has influenced the incorporation of gender policies in PCNGOs criteria. This gives PCNGOs the moral authority to pressure the PSNGOs to address gender inequality.

According to one PCNGO, a relationship based on feminist solidarity took precedence between PCNGOs and Salvadorean women's NGOs, when the former began to support women's initiatives and a need for their struggles to be recognized within the context of the Salvadorean revolution. Initially, PCNGOs supported projects submitted by women's groups; later they demanded that gender oriented projects be adopted within gender mixed organizations. In this regard PCNGOs had the moral authority to request for gender criteria. The request for gender criteria is an important beginning in addressing women's isolation from the development process. However, as mentioned before, the incorporation of gender criteria within mixed organizations is not necessarily an indication that sexism is being addressed. Therefore, in both Canada and El Salvador, a gender approach to NGO work must ensure that the spaces open up for the real participation of women. As most PCNGO representatives said, "participation of women in decision making and leadership of the organization is essential".

6.5 The Influence of Race:

Only one of the respondents used the word “racism” to refer to the influence of race in the relationship. Do we then conclude that race and its manifestation, racism, does not exist in the relationship? The problem with racism is that it is subtle. In this context of racism, when PSNGOs were asked if they believe race had an influence in the relationship, they did not call it racism, but used other terms such as arrogance, haughtiness, superiority, North-South, and power to decide. When most NGOs say that racism is not an issue in the individual relationship between NGOs, my first reaction was to believe it. Later, in analyzing this, I understand their responses as a manifestation of the ‘first’ racism, the one perpetuated upon myself and ‘second’ racism, the one I perpetuate upon others (see Chapter 2). Racism is therefore such a vicious disease that unless you recognize it, name it, and fight it, it affects one’s life and one’s relationship with others. Historically, racism is perpetuated by the silence around it. It is lived ‘in consequence’ (Bowser, 1995) by those who are institutionally discriminated against through policies that exclude them because of their race. As cited Jones and Carter (1996)¹⁰⁶, institutional racism consists of “those established laws, customs, and practices which systematically reflect and produce racial inequalities in American [Canadian] society...whether or not the individuals maintaining those practices have racist intentions”(p.2). Two examples are worth mentioning (1) the Indian Act in Canada¹⁰⁷ and (2) the Salvadorean

¹⁰⁶ In Bowser, Benjamin, and Hunt, Raymond G, (eds.) The Impacts of racism on white Americans, SAGE, 1996.

¹⁰⁷ The Canadian government, through the Indian Act of 1876 and subsequent legislation and treaties, introduced institutionalized racism in the relationship between Canada and its

constitution which in the past prohibited the entrance of black people into the country. Yet, racism remains unchallenged by both NGOs when they see racism as only happening on the other side of the border.

In one of my site visits to the countryside in El Salvador, I was laughing with the guide about the conditions of the roads and how the car was jumping up and down due to the uneven road. All of a sudden he asked me, “are you laughing at us?” adding, “we tolerate a lot from foreigners.” At that moment I realized that if that person had not had enough confidence to challenge me, I would never have known that my comments were seen as derogatory. PSNGOs experience with foreigners can be considered as part of ‘cultural racism’. This type of racism is “the conscious or subconscious conviction that White Euro-American [Canadian] cultural patterns and practices as reflected in economics, music, art, religious tenets, and so forth, are superior to those of other visible racial/ethnic groups (i.e., Native, Asian, Hispanic, and Black Americans)” (Jones & Carter, in Bowser, 1996, p.3).

Therefore, when one PSNGO stated that it is possible ‘that, racism, exists’ in the practice of sending technical experts who come with their magic wand and presumed technical expertise and a sense of superiority over the PSNGO technical experts¹⁰⁸, one can ask, what homework

Aboriginal peoples by removing political sovereignty from indigenous people through a system of indirect rule and segregation. (Frances et al, 1995; Elliot & Floras, 1992)

¹⁰⁸ At times the divide between race and class is blurred. For instance, if the same case would happen in the relationship between Canadian and Eastern European NGOs, who are both based in white societies. I would call that ‘classism’ because the assumption

did this technical 'expert' do before going to El Salvador.? Did he/she question the Northern assumption that Southern non-white people are said to be in poverty because they are not as smart?. Has this 'expert' read one tourist guide, or cultural profile about El Salvador and therefore knows the country social, political and cultural situation? "The provision of culture-specific information, especially in a superficial way, has led to increased stereotyping, rather than, as had been hoped, to a reduction in stereotyping across cultural groups" (Estable & Meyer, 1997).

The existence of racism in the larger context of the relationships between North-South and their peoples, (as recognized by four of the Canadian and Salvadorean NGO representatives) can be traced back to colonialism. Since then Indigenous and Black populations have been considered inferior because of their race.¹⁰⁹ To recognize the harm that racism has inflicted on the relationships amongst white, brown and Black peoples through colonization is, I believe, the first step in repairing that damage. In this sense, racism and anti-racism needs to be incorporated into the development discourse. Racism, and anti-racism must become a development issue. In the same way that feminism in development evolved as a response to the exclusion of women, anti-racism in development is the response to a exclusion of and discrimination against the majority of the world's population

behind the support is based on a common belief that capitalism is the better option than the socialism that Eastern Europeans had.

¹⁰⁹ See chapter 2 on the social construction of race.

In recent years PCNGOs have started to address the discrimination against Indigenous and Black peoples in Southern countries. As mentioned earlier, (chapter 3), the CCIC workshop on 'Shrouding Racism' addressed how Canadian solidarity workers find it easier to work on racism elsewhere while there is denial that the same must happen in Canada. I would argue that PCNGOs have not yet developed moral authority over PSNGOs because PCNGOs have not fought racism and discrimination against these same peoples in Canada. However, this is a beginning in making a connection between that larger context of racism, and how some decisions in the individual relationship are affected by this context.

If we analyze the relationship from a race, class and gender perspective, it has been unequal all along. The funds PCNGOs give to PSNGOs allows them to influence PSNGO policies and programming, as explained in the case of the changes in criteria, but the opposite is not the case. This corroborates the second assumption of this study, that unless the relationship changes, PSNGOs will never influence the work of NGOs in Canada. In this way, PCNGOs will continue having power over PSNGOs on the basis of knowing more about PSNGOs and their society than the PCNGOs know about Canada.

6.6 Directions in the Canadian and Salvadorean NGO relationship

Keeping with their present roles of funder and executor, all NGOs want some changes at the individual NGO to NGO relationship while others also want changes in the larger

context of aid. Nevertheless, all want to keep the elements of equality that the present relationship has, such as the opening between some NGOs to dialogue. PSNGOs wanted to continue receiving financial, moral and political support from the PCNGOs, and the PCNGOs wanted the PSNGOs to be efficient in implementing the projects and to be transparent and honest in the relationship. All NGOs wanted the other NGOs to change some aspects of their practice that leads to inequality in the relationship. For instance, some PCNGOs wanted more professionalism in the interventions of PSNGOs and some PSNGOs wanted to have more openness for discussion and participation in the decision making of PCNGOs for El Salvador.

Despite the fact that some recognized that there was something wrong with the present system of aid, such as the time frame of development, and/or neo-liberal policies, none of the NGOs presented a mechanism to achieve those changes at the macro level.

The loss of vision of the future for Salvadorean NGOs and the withdrawal from El Salvador of some Canadian NGOs at the end of the war in El Salvador, demonstrated that the relationship was specific to a particular time and a particular conjuncture. If relationships are formed and maintained on these bases, they play no other role than to address the symptom (to enter a country to finance a particular project within a particular time frame) rather than the cause of the problem; the underdevelopment of Southern countries. This is maintained through classism, sexism and racism.

6.7 Class, gender and race; some directions for the relationship

As Canadian NGOs are influenced by mainstream development theories in determining their policies and programming in Southern countries, and the literature reviewed for this study lacks a class gender and race integrated approach, it is likely that Northern NGOs also lack such a approach. Since the Anti-Racism literature is written by Black people and people of colour and these people are by and large excluded from mainstream NGOs (CCIC, 1996), it is unlikely that the Anti-Racism literature will influence the rank and file of Northern NGOs unless they purposely reach out to that body of work.

Although a Marxist analysis has influenced Salvadorean NGOs to strive for more just social, political and economic conditions in Latin America, an orthodox Marxist's "conceptual categories of class and mode of production" are fundamentally sex and racially blind. (Hartmann 1979, as cited in Anthias and Yuval-Davis, 1992; p.109). Therefore, Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs must reach out to other theories to incorporate a broader analysis of feminism and anti-racism. Anthias and Yuval-Davis(1992) state that social classes can be seen as the product of struggle within concrete historical processes which will include relations of gender and ethnicity and race, as well as economic, political & ideological relations"(p.93) .

The commitment that both NGOs expressed about the relationship must help them now to step back and analyze how their interventions can really address the problems at their roots. This study inspired me to propose a model that ideally can help the relationship in exploring some of the underlying causes of the North and South divide. In this case I refer to the racism in the relationship. As mentioned earlier, my proposal is for Anti-racism to become a development issue. In this model Northern and Southern NGOs are called upon to re-direct their work with an anti-racism focus at both the individual, institutional and societal level. In the section below I present such model.

Section IV

The model :

6.8 “A class, gender and racial Mutualism”¹¹⁰ approach to the relationship

I suggest a model that draws from previous ones such as ‘accompaniment,’ to incorporate a concientization (Freire, 1989) process. This process is important because it forces individuals to acknowledge their role as oppressor and/or oppressed and therefore empowers the oppressed to change their situation. It also calls on the oppressors to actively participate in deconstructing the roles they play in the relationship.

This process refers to “learning to perceive social, political, and economic contradictions, and to take action against the oppressive elements of reality” (ibid, p.19). The new

¹¹⁰ risking, as the other approaches, to be a Northern named relationship, which might not have any connection to the reality of Southern NGOs.

element that I incorporate is racism within and between North and South relationships. This model contributes to the relationship because it suggests a process in which its learning can move beyond the financial and political exchange in the relationship to deconstructing the classism, sexism and racism. Such a process of political and ideological exchange includes three components, the theoretical, the analytical and the practical. The main feature in this model is the incorporation of Anti-Racism as a development issue.

The theoretical base for this model is an Anti-racist, feminist and Marxist approach, (with or without the implementation of projects) to advance the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs to a level of greater equality. I have added the term 'mutualismo'¹¹¹ because according to the Spanish dictionary, such a relationship is based on an equilibrium [equality] of the 'services rendered and received.' In the PCNGO and PSNGO relationship the services rendered (implementation of projects by PSNGOs) and the services received (funding of projects by PCNGOs) are not in equilibrium. This lack of equilibrium in the relationship addresses what I earlier discussed as positive and negative inequality.¹¹²

Let me explore its three components:

¹¹¹ "conjunto de acciones fundadas en la mutualidad.// Doctrina que considera a toda la humanidad como una asociacion en la que los servicios prestados y recibidos deben equilibrarse. (Everest, 1974, p.975)

¹¹² This model is a path towards strengthening the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs and an attempt to bring an insider's perspective to the North South NGO relationship. It is not complete, of course, and it will be difficult to implement, but it is presented here as a beginning.

6.8.1 The theoretical: This component incorporates an integrated approach to Marxism, Feminism, and Anti-Racism. Marxism validates the class struggle of the people. Nimtz Jr. (1993) cites, "As long as there is class struggle there will be those who seek to explain and apply the lesson of that struggle in the interests of the oppressed." (p.575)¹¹³ In the case of El Salvador, the root causes of the war are still prominent. In Canada the poor are getting poorer and globally, Multinationals Corporations are becoming even more powerful. A class approach goes back to empowering the poor in alliance with the middle class to fight for their social, political and economic rights.

In Canada and in El Salvador, women are being discriminated against in the social political and economic spheres. A feminist approach goes back to the right of women to fully contribute in society, and therefore to challenge capitalism and patriarchy (Andersen, 1997). Feminism empowers women and seeks to negotiate with men to achieve equality.

Anti-Racism challenges the racist assumption of the superiority of 'Whiteness' over the non/or less white races or, the assumption of superiority of any racial group over another.¹¹⁴

Fernandez (1996) affirms that "growing numbers of people have come to oppose overt racism, not by eliminating the feelings so much as to modifying them to be more palatable

¹¹³ Nimtz, Jr. says that whether they called themselves Marxists would probably matter little to Marx or Engels themselves (p.575).

¹¹⁴ Southern countries' elites "are not thereby absolved of responsibility for oppressing certain ethnic/cultural/religious groups, classes, or women within their populations. Race essentialists positions that hold only whites accountable for racial oppression are overly simplistiv, miss the complexity of the issues involved, and encourage a focus on only one set of villains" (Jhappan, Radha, 1996, p.15).

to others—and to themselves”, he argues that such modified forms of racism are “n most cases subtler and more sophisticated than their predecessors, but they are just as harmful, not only to the oppressed but to the oppressors.” (p.161)¹¹⁵ Bowser (1996) calls this modified racism *neo-racism*.

6.8.2 The Analytical: In this component the model moves from the whole (classism, sexism, racism) to the parts (Salvadorean and Canadian NGOs). These NGOs must transform on a continuum of progressive change that addresses the principles of equality, co-operation, mutuality, respect, dialogue, and openness. Such principles become the elements that guide the concientization process in which both NGOs engage. These elements are crucial in the political and ideological discussions surrounding the combination of oppressions within classism, racism and sexism. Under these principles, for instance, women in mixed NGO staff groups and/or board of directors are empowered to challenge gender inequality, while men are freer to outline their resistance to such change. A racial minority staff can identify the discrimination against racial minorities while both men and women engage in the discussion to eliminate it. A poor person is hired on the basis of his/her field experience as opposed to his/her academic credentials only.

Race and/or racism is the variable the least addressed by the data and one that influences as much the relationship. Therefore, this analytical aspect of the model focuses on how this variable (anti-racism) can be incorporated into the relationship. Its incorporation,

¹¹⁵ In Bowser & Hunt, (eds) Impacts of racism on White Americans. (ibid)

this variable (anti-racism) can be incorporated into the relationship. Its incorporation, (assuming that Marxism and Feminism are addressed) must be part of that conscientization process in which we (NGOs) take action against racism as an 'oppressive element of reality' .

Before moving to describe the practical component of this model I attempt, in the table below, to describe some of the issues arising as a result of the incorporation of an anti-racism approach to the NGO relationship. I have put these issues in opposition, that is, pros and cons, because they reflect the commitment but also the conflicts involved in deconstructing racism.

Table 4. The conscientization process on anti-racism

PROS of using an anti-racism framework	CONS of using and anti-racism framework
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. By naming race/racism, society takes responsibility. 2. Racism is challenged and demystified 3. NGOs are encouraged to explore their own racism in their daily work. 4. Creates knowledge about Northern NGOs anti-racism practice and/or racist practices. It encourages Southern NGOs to explore their racism towards Black and Native populations, or any person deviating from some degree of whiteness. 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. NGOs might not like to affirm that there is racism in the relationship between northern and southern NGOs. 2. It creates conflict as white society prefers to ignore racism and maintain white privilege, and Black and Brown and Yellow populations have to dismantled internalized racism. The process of demystifying racism will often create conflict and resistance. 3. NGOs are criticized for perpetuating racism. NGOs do not want or like to be called racists. 4. Northern NGOs might not be interested in southern NGOs doing anti-racism work because it could backfire. Southern NGOs may criticize Northern NGOs even more.

6.8.3 The practical: In this component people in institutions begin the incorporation of an integrated approach into their policies and programming, followed by an action plan. Such a plan replaces the 'money and political exchange' between and within Northern and Southern NGOs with a 'class, gender and racial-Mutualism' approach.

This plan involves three phases: Phase One, in which NGOs continue to be attached to the status-quo; Phase two (procedural integration), in which NGOs engage in a conscientization process; Phase three (full integration) in which anti-racism, feminism and Marxism becomes the practice of the NGOs.

Table 5. Phases in the conscientization process

<p>Phase One Status-quo: -Northern NGOs puts no race and class criteria demands to Southern NGOs proposals. -Southern NGO have no mechanism to put demands on Northern NGOs for race, class and gender criteria either. -Northern and Southern NGOs adapt to some demands of the relationship, that is, gender criteria in projects, but do not adopt feminism within their institutional changes.</p>
<p>Phase Two: Procedural Integration: The political and ideological discussions began. -Northern and Southern NGOs are equal in the relationship, therefore they ask each other for their vision and strategies on race, gender and class approach. -Both NGOs incorporate a time frame to engage in a process of conscientization within staff, boards and membership. These are shared amongst NGOs. -Both NGOs push for a conscientization process at the macro level such as at CIDA, the Canadian government and southern governments and institutions..</p>
<p>Phase three. Full integration -An anti-racism, feminist and class analysis is incorporated into all aspects of the NGOs work -Both NGOs engage their civil societies to do the same. -The process is continued with or without institutional (core/project) funding: institutions and individual people contribute to the elimination of racism, sexism and classism.</p>

The **procedural integration** phase starts with the engagement of Northern and Southern NGOs in the following activities:

Table 6. Tasks of the conscientization process

Identification of pros in the conscientization phase:	Identification of obstacles conscientization process:
-naming the benefits that both NGOs gain from the relationship	-naming the obstacles to recognizing the benefits
-naming the tasks within race, class and gender that needs improvement	-naming the obstacles to achieve the improvements: i.e.-first and second racism,
prioritizing the task to work	selecting and identifying the obstacles.
Allocating the human and financial resources for the different areas.	finding the human and financial resources to continue implementation of process that has brought the NGO to the present phase.

Conclusion:

Progressive NGOs in the North and the South are called upon to set up such a system of organized mutual aid, based on the deconstruction of present patterns. If unchanged, these patterns will continue to perpetuate classism, sexism and racism not only in the relationship between Northern and Southern NGOs, but in the relationship between NGOs and their respective civil societies. Class-Gender and Racial Mutualism acknowledges that the North and the South need and benefit from each other. Thus, some form of negotiation and fora for discussion must be established by both NGOs in such a relationship. When NGOs in the North and the South develop a relationship based on these characteristics, "international NGOs can help create a model for more egalitarian relations between North and South by avoiding paternalism [sexism and racism] and contributing to the gradual consolidation of international civil society" (Macdonald, 1996, p.12). A Class-Gender and Racial Mutualism model

challenges the present relationship to enter new dimensions of discussion and analyses never undertaken before.

Chapter 7

Conclusion

I said in the introduction to this study that I struggled to surrender rather than to overpower my data. I also said that I did not have a neutral position to analyzing the relationship. This is due to my race, class and gender and experience in the NGO field. I also stated my commitment to strengthening the Northern and Southern NGO relationships in building a better world for all. It is for this latter reason that I conducted this study.

The relationships amongst NGOs interested me because for a long time I have admired the work of the NGOs. I saw in that work the hopes that a child deserves to improve her life and overcome poverty and injustice; I saw my own childhood. I also saw the discrimination of that black and indigenous child because nature has given him the beauty of a colour other than white; I felt my internalized racism. I saw that girl who had to help with the household chores because the boy went to school instead. As I learned about international development work, I saw that child's need to go to school, but especially to eradicate the structures that keep her/him in poverty and illiteracy. In examining the 'nature' of the relationship between PCNGOs and PSNGOs, through a race, class and gender lens, I learned that it is necessary to deconstruct classism, sexism and racism.

When I started this study, there was ample documentation about inequality in the relationship, a result of the Northern NGOs having control of development agenda. However, there was no documentation of the role that class, race and gender had in the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs or the role that Salvadorean NGOs played in the elaboration of programs and policies of Canadian NGOs (in relation to El Salvador).

This, study has found the following about the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs:

7.1. Efforts are being made from both Progressive Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs to establish a process of equality in their relationship, yet complex dynamics of inequality exist . The establishment of equality in the relationship is based on the opportunity that some PSNGO have to engage in dialogue about their project proposals with some PCNGOs, and as well, in some joint lobby initiatives to the World Bank or the IMF. The inequality is based on the lack of participation that PSNGOs have in the elaboration of programs and policies of PCNGOs for El Salvador.

7.2. The influence of class in the relationship was present in working together to end the war and to what some PCNGOs called 'giving power to the poor.' The dynamics of the class influence were also present in the situational and systemic power that PCNGOs had to influence the programs and policies of PSNGOs. An example is the need for PSNGOs to move a Result Based Management approach to development. In regard to PSNGOs, they had systemic power during the war because they had the right to request and receive funds from PCNGOs that were not eligible for CIDA funding.

7.3. The influence of gender seemed to have had the most influence in the relationship and continues being discussed more and more, particularly in regard to Salvadorean NGOs' meeting gender inclusive project funding criteria.

7.4. The influence of race and/or racism in the relationships is from the outset, considered to be a non-issue, but it becomes one as NGOs discuss the larger dynamics of North-South relations. In this context racism is acknowledged as Northern/Western countries believe superiority over the inferiority of Southern countries inferiority. Racism was also acknowledged by PCNGOs in the discrimination that Indigenous and Black peoples face in Southern countries.

7.5. Both NGOs seemed to have a desire to work together in lobbying and advocacy strategies although no mechanisms were discussed to facilitate such a process.

7.6. The war and post-war contexts were major influences in the relationship. This influence was reflected in an 'accompaniment' model during the war, and a 'criteria based approach after the war.

7.7. Marxist and dependency theories had a tremendous influence in the relationship. Both NGOs followed development models based on such approaches. For instance, PSNGOs wanted to end the war and to build socialism in El Salvador. PCNGOs supported PSNGOs in those goals. Since these theories lacked an integrated class, gender and race approach, so did the relationship between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs.

The results of this study encouraged me to pose some questions about further issues to be investigated in a dialogue between these two groups of peoples, in different parts of the world, who share a common goal. These questions involve various areas:

7.8. Power in the relationship. The Salvadorean and Canadian NGO relationship involves both positive and negative inequalities. The relationships involving coalition work for lobbying, advocacy, and national, regional, and international networking seem to provide equal relations. However, mechanisms must be established to include the participation of Southern in the decision making process (Rousseau & Sisson, 1992). At the same time this raises the question, to what extent and for what purposes would Northern NGOs be willing to put themselves in a position of NGOs sharing equal power with Southern NGOs?

My own experience (working in a second or third language) and investing time and resources, makes me realize that only by investing these resources will Southern peoples be able to study the North and not only the opposite. The South must study the North in order to deconstruct the classism and racism of Northern knowledge as the norm in development.

In the case of El Salvador, there was a marked decrease after the war in the information sent to Canadian NGOs by Salvadorean NGOs and other actors in El Salvador regarding their political needs and strategies. In this sense, the Salvadorean NGOs have abdicated some of the responsibility for cultivating this part of the relationship. It may appear to some Canadian NGOs that their Salvadorean counterparts are consciously choosing to

focus more on the economic aspect of the relationship. A PSNGO representative asked the following question during a CAMG focus group discussion in the summer of 1996,¹¹⁶ “What lobby work and communication are we doing for others to support us?”

7.9. *Professionalization of Northern and Southern NGOs interventions:* the financial vulnerability of Canadian NGOs and, in some cases, crisis of relevancy (Kelleher, D, et al, 1996) has implications for their policy and programming in Southern countries. This need for professionalism, along with the ending of the war in El Salvador, might explain the rapid change in criteria for their programming in El Salvador. How can rapid changes in criteria ensure that they respond to the needs of beneficiaries, rather than to the criteria themselves? Should the practices in El Salvador be any different from any others, in other parts of the world?

7.10. *The tripartite nature of the relationship:* The relationship between CIDA, the Canadian NGOs and Salvadorean NGOs raises fundamental questions about the mixed blessing of government funding. On the one hand, funding helps Canadian and Southern NGOs meet their needs; on the other, it forges relationships of recipient-donor compliance. The inequality between Canadian NGOs and the Canadian government differs from the existing inequality between Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs. Canadian and Salvadorean NGOs must learn from each other about negotiating with CIDA and other international funding institutions.

¹¹⁶ The Central America Monitoring Group (CAMG), organized this focus group in El Salvador to evaluate Canadian development assistance to El Salvador.

7.11. *Relationship as an engranaje*: In a previous paper, (Torres, 1996) I saw the North south relationship as an 'engranaje' (gears) in the world system. In this study I continued with such notion. In an Engranaje, both parts are necessary. I do not want to see the relationship in mechanical terms, but rather, the notion of 'gears' seems to bring a dynamic image of a relationship that is in motion. In this motion, Northern and Southern NGOs are institutions and as such, they transform themselves and the environment in which they intervene. However, in a financial exchange, both NGOs are part of an engranaje but their relationship did not transform beyond the superficial nature of that exchange. Therefore, it is unlikely that this relationship could have made a profound transformation to the environment in which they operated (Canadian and Salvadorean societies).

7.12. *Who outdates what?* The shift taking place in El Salvador between Canadian 'solidarity' NGOs withdrawing and 'business' NGOs entering (Garza, 1996) brings an interesting phenomenon to the nature of the relationship and its duration. When I first learned about progressive Canadian NGOs losing interest in the situation in El Salvador, at the end of the war, I was disappointed at their lack of vision. However, Garza's argument that the mandate of progressive Canadian NGOs did not correspond to the new reality in El Salvador, raised an issue that I had not envisioned. He stated...

"A raíz que entramos en un mundo donde la causa de vida o muerte ya no es el principal motivo de la relación entre las ongs, sino que lo que importa es la

*parte técnica;...empiezan a entrar al país, toda una gama de instancias canadienses: ongs, universidades y la empresa privada".*¹¹⁷

Therefore, the social and economic demands could be seen as the real conditions which outdated PCNGOs role in El Salvador rather than a lack of interest. If progressive Canadian NGOs left El Salvador because their mission did not fit their mandate, are they nomads within the international development field.? If so, what kind of relations could they establish and maintain in their interventions? What kind of learning remains or is taken out within and between each country? In these circumstances can Canadian and Southern NGOs develop relationships that carry on systematically, even if a financial arrangement is not present in the relationship. ?

7.13. *Are funds a mechanism to facilitate a race, class and gender approach?* The data demonstrate that class and gender issues have had an influence in the relationship, yet there is also a close correlation between addressing these issues and having access to project funding to support them. Some questions arise about incorporating anti-racism as a development issue. Would Northern NGOs address anti- racism if there are no funds to support that work? Have they started to address racial discrimination in the South because there are funds to do so? Would Southern NGO soon equate anti-racism work with more funding? I agree that funds must be allocated to provide for some core

¹¹⁷ "Now that we are entering into a world where the cause of life or death is no longer the main reason for a relationship between NGOs, what is important is the technical part...a whole range of Canadian institutions are beginning to come into the country: NGOs, universities and private business."

expenses. I am afraid though that the desire to access those funds may overpower the real issue, that is the deconstruction of racism, sexism and classism.

It is my hope that the questions above and the overall findings of this study encourages the readers to explore the mechanisms of the relationship further. In interviewing NGOs and listening to their passion and commitment to their work, I asked myself, how is it possible for such committed people to strengthen the relationship.?

A process of conscientization within and between Northern and Southern NGOs is a necessity to deconstruct classism, sexism and racism. A 'class, gender and racial Mutualism' model is a beginning in the process of the deconstruction of such oppressions.

By addressing equality and inequality NGOs play a fundamental role in an international movement for the protection, strengthening and development of an international civil society.

Bibliography

Acosta-Belen, Edna, Bose, Christine E., Colonialism, Structural Subordination, and Empowerment, Women in the Development Process in Latin America and the Caribbean, Women in the Latin American Process, Temple University Press, Philadelphia, 1995.

Amin, Samir, On Development: For Gunder Frank, Locke Anderson, W.H., translator, in Chew, Sing, C, Denmark Robert, A.(Ed), The Underdevelopment of Development, Essays in Honor of Andre Gunder Frank, SAGE Publications, Inc., Thousand Oaks, California, 1996.

Andersen, Margaret L. Thinking About Women Sociological perspectives on sex and gender, Allyn & Bacon A Viacom Company, Needham Heights, MA, 1997.

Anthias, Floya, Yuval-Davis, Nira, Racialized Boundaries Race, Nation, Gender, Colour and Class and the Anti-racist struggle, Routhledge, New York, 1992, p.92-109.

Bannerji, Himani, Thinking through, Essays on feminism, Marxism, and Anti-Racism, Women's Press, Toronto, 1995.

Barret, Michele, Women's Oppression Today: Problems in Marxist Feminist Analysis, in Humm, Maggie, (Ed)., Modern Feminisms, Political Literary Cultural, Columbia University Press, New York, 1992.

Baksh-Sooden, Rawwida. "Gender Planning or Feminist Development Theory/Practice: A conceptual Framework for Analyzing the Male Bias in the Programmes and Structures of 6 Caribbean NGOs", Master's research paper. The Institute of Social Studies, 1993.

Beaulink, Anne Marie, Women and the Debt Crises, Development 1- Journal of SID, 1989.

Bennett, LeRoy, A. International Principles & Issues (fifth edition), Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey, 1991.

Bowser, Benjamin, P., Racism and Anti-Racism in World Perspective, Sage Series on Race and Ethnic Relations, Volume 13, 1995, p.xiv- xxii.

Broadhead, Tim, "NGOs: In one Year, Out the Other?", World Development Supplement, No 15, Autumn, 1987, p.1-6.

burke, eloise, e, Hold the Ridim, Survey Report: on Racial Representation OCIC Members and Associates, ODP Participating NGOs Ontario Council for International Cooperation, February, 1994.

Burke, Beverly, Canadian NGOs Options in the Context of the Central American Peace Process: Workshop report, Canadian Council for International Cooperation (CCIC), Ottawa, 1989.

Callari, Antonio, Cullenberg, Stephen, Biewener, Carole, (Ed.s), Marxism in the New World Order: Crises and Possibilities in Marxism in the Postmodern Age Confronting the New World Order, The Guilford Press, New York, 1995.

Canada-Caribbean-Central America Policy Alternatives, (CAPA), Briefing for Roundtable on "Peace and Reconstruction in Central America: Choices for Canada", Ottawa, May 5-6, 1989.

Canadian Council for International Cooperation (CCIC), Reconstruction and Rehabilitation Fund. Disaster Assessment of El Salvador, Ottawa, December 1-17, 1986.

CCIC, Putting People First: Towards a Canadian Foreign Policy for the 21st Century, Ottawa, 1993.

CCIC, The Reconstruction and Rehabilitation Fund, Indicative Planning Session, An organizational focus for Canadian NGOs working in South Africa, Neighbours Consulting: Consultation entre voisines, voisin, Ottawa, May 26-27, 1994.

CCIC, Rousseau, Michel, et Sisson Caron, Une Etude Des Coalitions Canadiennes d'Organisations Non-Governmental, ACIDI et CCCI, Ottawa, Mars, 1992.

Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA), Partners in Tomorrow: fifteen years of CIDA's Non-governmental Organizations Program 1968-1983, Ottawa, 1984.

CIDA, Results Oriented Programming, NGO Division, Canadian Partnership Branch, Ottawa, September, 1994.

Cardinal, Linda, Costigan, Annette, Heffernan, Tracy, "From Women and Development to Feminism and Development: MATCH's New Directions", MATCH International Centre, Mimeo. Ottawa, 1989.

Cardoso, Fernando, Henrique, Dependencia y Desarrollo en America Latina, ensayo de interpretacion sociologica, siglo veintiuno editores sa, Mexico, 1971.

Central America Monitoring Group (CAMG), Salvadorean NGO Perspectives on Canadian Canadian Cooperation: A synthesis of Focus Group Discussions held in El Salvador, July, 1996, written by Kowalchuk, Lisa, Ottawa, October, 1996.

Chew, Sing, C, Denemark Robert, A, The Underdevelopment of Development, Essays in Honor of Andre Gunder Frank, SAGE Publications, Inc., Thousand Oaks, California, 1996

Collins, Hill, Patricia, Black Feminist Thought: Knowledge, Consciousness, and the Politics of Empowerment, Unwin Hyman, Inc. Cambridge, MA, 1990.

Editorial Progreso, Carl Marx, F. Engels: Obras Escogidas, Moscú, ND.

Elliot, Charles, "Some aspects of the Relations Between the North and South in the NGO Sector", World Development, Supplement No 15, Autumn, 1987, p.57-68.

Elliot, Jean Leonard and Augie Fleras, Unequal Relations - An Introduction to Race and Ethnic Dynamics in Canada, Prentice-Hall, Scarborough, 1992.

Essed, Philomena, Undertanding everyday racism: an interdisciplinary theory, Sage Publications Inc, California, 1991.

Estable, Alma, Mechthild Meyer, Pon Gordon, Teach Me To Thunder, A Training Manual for Anti-racism Trainers, produced by the Canadian Labour Congress, published by From the Margin, Ottawa, 1997.

Fanon, Frantz, Black Skin White Masks, Trans lated by Charles Lam Markmann, Grove Press, Inc. New York, 1997.

Henry, Frances, Tator Carol, Mattis, Winston, Rees, Tim, The Colour of Democracy-Racism in Canadian Society, Harcourt Brace & Company, Toronto, 1995.

Frank, Gunder, Andre, Critique and Anti-Critique: Essays on Dependence and Reformism, Praeger Publishers, New York, 1984.

Frank, Gunder, Andre, The Underdevelopment of Development, in Chew, Sing, C, Denmark Robert, A, (ed.s) The Underdevelopment of Development, Essays in Honor of Andre Gunder Frank, SAGE Publications, Inc., Thousand Oaks, California, 1996.

Freire, Paulo, Pedagogy of the Oppressed, The Continuum Publishing Company, New York, 1989.

Gillespie, Peter, D, Policing Population, in Canadian Forum, Volume LXXIII, No 832, Canadian Forum Limited, Halifax, September 1994, p.16-22.

Harris, Richard, L, Marxism, Socialism and Democracy in Latin America, Latin American Perspectives Series, No.8, Westview Press, 1992 .

Henderson, James, Conservative Thought in Twentieth Century Latin America, The Ideas of Laureano Gomez, Ohio University, Monographs in International Studies, Latin America Series, No 13. 1988.

hooks, bell, Killing Rage, Ending Racism, Henry Holt and Company, New York, 1995.

hooks, bell, Black Looks race and representation, South End Press, Boston, 1992.

Horazuk, Cherrene, The FMLN Make History: what it means for all of us? "El Salvador Watch", produced by the Committee in Solidarity with the people of El Salvador, (CISPES), No 58, April, 1997.

Hughes, Barry, B., Continuity and Change in World Politics The Clash of Perspectives, Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey, 1991.

Hymovitch, Rhena, Counterinsurgency and Peasant Resistance in El Salvador, A report featuring documentation from a SalvAide fact-finding mission to El Salvador, published by SalvAide, Toronto, 1986.

Jhappan, Radha, Post-Modern Race and Gender Essentialism or a Post-Mortem of Scholarship, Studies in Political Economy, (51), Fall, 1996, p.15-59.

Johnston, Pari, J. The problematic Practice of Participation and Solidarity: An Analysis of Partnership between Progressive Canadian and Jamaican Non-Governmental Organizations, A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts, The Norman Paterson School of International Affairs, Carleton University, Ottawa, 1995.

Jones, James, M, Carter, Robert, T, Racism and White Racial Identity: Mergin Realities, in Bowser, Benjamin, P, Hunt, Raymond, G, (Eds) Impacts of Racism on White Americans, (second edition), SAGE publications, Thousand Oaks, California, 1996.

Kay, Cristobal, Latin American Theories of Development and Underdevelopment, Routledge, New York, 1989

Kelleher, David, McLaren, Kate with Bisson Ronald, Grabbing the Tiger by the Tail, NGOs learning for organizational change, CCIC, Ottawa, 1996.

King, Cynthia, Contributions of Third World Women to a Feminist Vision of Development, A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research, in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts, Department of Sociology and Anthropology, Carleton University, Ottawa, April 13, 1992.

Kivel, Paul, Uprooting Racism: How white people can work for racial justice, New Society Publishers, Philadelphia, 1995.

Korten, David, C, When corporations Rule the World, A Copublication of Kumarian Press, Inc., and Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc. West Hartford, Connecticut, 1995.

Korten, David, C, "Third Generation NGO strategies: A Key to People-Centered Development", World Development, Supplement No15, 1987, p.145-59.

Landau, Saul, The Guerrilla Wars of Central America, Nicaragua, El Salvador and Guatemala, St. Martin's Press, New York, 1993.

Lewis, Laura, A, Spanish Ideology and the Practice of Inequality in the New World, in Bowser, Benjamin, P., Racism and Anti-Racism in World Perspective, Sage Series on Race and Ethnic Relations, Volume 13, 1995.

Macdonald, Laura, Supporting Civil Society: the political role of NGOs in Central America, Macmillan, England, 1996.

Macdonald, Laura, Globalising Civil Society: Interpreting International NGOs in Central America, International Studies Quarterly, Blackwell Publishers, Cambridge, MA, Volume 38, 1994.

Maguire, Patricia, Women in Development: An Alternative Analysis, Centre for International Education, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA, 1984.

McLaren, Peter, with Preface by Paulo Freire, Critical pedagogy and the pragmatics of justice, Critical Pedagogy and Predatory Culture, Routledge, 1995, p.229-259.

Mitchell, Juliet, Women: The Longest Revolution, in Schneir, Miriam, (Ed), Feminism in Our Time, Random House, Toronto, 1994, p.201-12.

Muchunguzi, Dennis, A.K., Milne, Scott, D., Perspectives From The South: A Study On Partnership, AFREDA, Tanzania, CIDA, Ottawa, June, 1995.

Mukherjee, Arun, Towards an Aesthetic of Opposition, Essays on Literature Criticism & Cultural Imperialism, Williams-Wallace Publishers Inc., Stratford, Ontario, Canada, 1988.

Murphy, Brian, Canadian NGOs and the Politics of Participation, Ed. by Swift, Jamie, Tomlinson, Brian, Conflict of Interest Canada and the Third World, Between the Lines, 1991.

Non-Intervention in Central America (NICA), Mission for Peace, El Salvador, A Decade of War, The Promise of Peace, Toronto, March, 1989.

OXFAM, Background paper, workshop on New Organizational Roles and Structures, Notes on Oxfam-Canada's Experience. by John Saxby, Ottawa, Nov. 7-9, 1995.

Patton, M, Q, Qualitative analysis and interpretation, Qualitative evaluation and research methods, (second edition), SAGE publications, Newbury Park, CA, 1990, p.371-436.

Palme, Gabriel, Dependency and Development: A Critical Overview, in Seers, Dudley, (Ed), The Dependency Theory a Critical Reassessment, Frances Printer (publishers) Limited, London, 1981, p.20-78.

Progress Publishers, On the Dictatorship of the Proletariat, Moscou, 1984.

Randall, Vicky, Theobald, Robin, Political Change and Underdevelopment: A critical Introduction to Third World Politics. Basingstoke and London: Macmillan, 1985.

Ralston, John Saul, Voltaire's Bastards The Dictatorship of Reason in the West, Penguin Books, Toronto, 1993.

Rosales, Carlos Antonio, The Eclipse of the Oligarchy: The Emergence and Political Activation of the New Right in El Salvador, A research Essay submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research, Department of Political Science, Carleton University, April 1995.

Rueschemeyer, Dietrich, Stephens Evelyn Huber, Stephens, John D., Capitalist Development & Democracy, University of Chicago Press, Chicago, 1992.

Said, Edward, Cultural Imperialism, Alfred A. Knopf, Inc, New York, 1993.

Seers, Dudley, (Ed), The Dependency Theory a Critical Reassessment, Frances Printer (publishers) Limited, London, 1981.

Stepan, Nancy Leys, The Hour of Eugenics: Race, Gender and Nation in Latin America, Cornell University Press, 1991.

Therien, Jean-Philippe, "Non-governmental Organizations and International Development Assistance", Canadian Journal of Development Studies, 12.2, 1991, p.263-80.

Torres, Sara, A Review of International Development Literature in Canada in the area of Northern NGO relationships with Southern NGOs, An independent research project, Carleton School of Social Work, Ottawa, January 10, 1996

Vargas, Virginia, Women's Interests and Emancipatory Processes, (Harris, Cristian, Translator,) in Chew, Sing, C, Denemark Robert, A, (Eds). The Underdevelopment of Development, Essays in Honor of Andre Gunder Frank, SAGE Publications, Inc., Thousand Oaks, California, 1996.

Vickers, Jeanne, Women in the World Economic Crisis, Zed Books Ltd, London, 1991.

Waring Marilyn, Who's Counting. Sex, Lies and Global Economics, National Film Board, Studio, B, Ottawa, 1995.

Williams, Fiona. Social Policy - A Critical introduction. Cambridge: Polity Press, 1989.

Wilson, Maureen G, and Whitmore, Elizabeth, Accompanying the Process: Principles for International Development Practice, Canadian Journal of Development Studies, Special Issue, 1995 p.61-77.

Wolcott, Harry, F, Transforming Qualitative Data: Description, Analysis and Interpretation, Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, 1994, p.28

Reference books:

Blackburn, Simon, Critical Theory, Oxford Dictionary of Philosophy, Oxford University Press, New York, 1996.

Everest, Corona, Diccionario Corona, Lengua Espanola, (sexta edicion) Editorial Everest, Leon Espana, 1974.

Eisenstein, Zillah, "Feminist Theory" p.299-300; Nimtz, Jr, August H, Marxism, p.569; Rothstein, Robert, L, North-South Relations, p-653-5; Wright, Erik, Olin, Class And Politics "How Class Shapes Politics", p.143-145, in Joel,Krieger,(Ed). The Oxford Companion to Politics of the World, Oxford University Press, Inc. New York, New York. 1993.

Funk & Wagnalls, Canadian College Dictionary, Harper & Row Publishers, Inc., Markham, 1989

Article:

Knox and Stackhouse, The Globe & Mail, 'Aid agencies compelled to dance to Ottawa's tune'. International News Section, p. A8, 1995.

Appendix 1

Questionnaire for NGOs

1. How long have you been working in El Salvador?
2. In what areas?
3. How do you characterize the relationship that you have established with Central American NGOs especially in El Salvador, over the last 10 years?

Probes:

- has it changed at any time?
- what prompted the change?
- how are partners selected?
- what are the criteria?

4. Has your organization established any mechanism to allow southern partners access to the process of developing policies and programs for their particular geographical or thematic areas?

Probes:

- could you give some examples?
- if yes, describe the mechanism?
- How have are they being operationalized?
- if not, is there reason for not having been established?

5. What influence have had the following issues in the relationship:
 - class issues?
 - gender issues?
 - racial issues?

6. Have these issues been discussed with your partners?

Probes:

- Who identified these issues?
- Which issue has received the most emphasis?/ the least emphasis?
- in the programming/policies?
- in project criteria?

If yes, what areas have been affected by these issues ?

- decision-making?
- conceptualization and implementation of programs, policies?

4. How would you describe the process of establishing, continuing and dissolving a particular relationship with your southern partner?

Probes:

- what makes you decide on continuing a relationship with a particular NGO?
- in ending a relationship with an NGO?
- do issues of class have had an influence in establishing or dissolving a relationship?
- do issues of gender have an influence on establishing or ending a relationship?
- do issues of race have an influence on establishing or ending a relationship?

(This questionnaire was translated into Spanish for Salvadorean NGOs)

Appendix 2.

Letter requesting participation to: NGOs

Dear _____

I am currently enrolled in the Master of Social Work program at the Carleton University School of social work. As part of the requirements for graduating, I have chosen a Thesis.

My choice of subject for this project is to explore the nature of the relationship between northern and southern NGOs, especially in the case of Canada and El Salvador from 1985 to 1995. Besides my academic interest in completing this study, I am also a southern woman (from Colombia) who have had experience in working in support of Salvadorean NGOs since 1982.

I believe that such study is important because though analysis has been achieved regarding the democratization, militarization, and the effects of globalization on southern countries, little has been done, from the perspective of the south, in regards to the role that NGOs play in the north-south context. As well, little has been done in analyzing north-south relations from a class, gender and race perspective. This will be my framework of analysis for this study.

I am seeking the participation of four Canadian NGOs and four NGOs in El Salvador in this study. I am asking _____ to be one of them. I will be providing a copy of the final study to your organization. The results will also be translated into Spanish and distributed in El Salvador. I appreciate you taking the time to allow me to hear about your experiences, and to document the issues raised, and postulate areas for further study and action. I am working under the supervision of my thesis committee made up of three Carleton University faculty members.

If you agree, your participation would involve two components:

1. one interview that would last about one and half hours and will be held at a location of your choice. I will ask that you allow me to tape this discussion to facilitate accuracy in my analysis. (If you rather I did not tape, the choice of my taking handwritten notes will be offered). All tapes or notes from the interview will be destroyed or returned to you after the study is written. I will send you a copy of the interview guide prior to the interview.

While I will be using your words and thoughts in my study, I will not use your name unless you allow me to quote it. If you do not agree to your name being published, I will not report and link or in anyway make any correlations on who reported what information. However, given the small number of NGOs that will be interviewed, there is a possibility that your colleagues from other NGOs might identify you and/or your organization. Thus, I can not guarantee anonymity. Therefore, if you request, I will agree to show you a copy of the transcript and I will delete any quote that you wish. Interviewees will have the choice not to respond to certain questions or probes, or withdraw from the study at any time.

I will give you the choice of having the name of your organization appearing in the acknowledgment section of the report if you wish to do so. Finally I would ask you to sign a letter of consent that outlines more fully the process of the interview.

2. access to documents (specifically policies, programs, and project criteria for El Salvador and/or Central America) for the last 10 years. I will ask that you allow me to work at your office for referral, or allow me to copy the relevant information, which ever is more convenient for you. I will cover the cost of the photocopies, and will make them at your office or the closest photocopy place to your agency in order to guarantee immediate return of the data.

I understand the time constraints that this might imply to you. I appreciate your consideration in taking part in this study.

If you have any questions, please do not hesitate to contact me or my supervisor at any time.

Sincerely,

Sara Torres, MSW student,
School of Social Work, Carleton University.
(613) 520-5601

Thesis Supervisor:
Bessa Whitmore,
School of Social Work, Carleton University
(613) 520-2600, Extension: 6692

(This letter was translated into Spanish for Salvadorean NGOs)

Consent Form**Carleton University School of Social Work**

I, _____ for the organization _____, agree to participate in the study being conducted by Sara Torres of Carleton University School of Social Work. I am aware that this study will examine the nature of the relationship between northern and southern NGOs (Canadian and Salvadorean) from 1985 to 1995.

I understand that participation in this study will involve:

1) one interview of approximately one and a half hours. The interview will be audio-taped, (upon my approval) and these tapes will either be returned to the organization, or destroyed.

2) access to documents (policies, programs, and project criteria) of the organization for El Salvador (or the region if that is the case). The organization will determine the conditions in which these materials can be accessed.

While there are no anticipated risks involved in this study, participation is voluntary, and the organization may withdraw at any time.

I understand that the results of the study may be published, and will be deposited in the Carleton University library. One copy will be given to the organization.

While the study will reflect and utilize my response to the interview, it will not use my name unless I agree to be quoted. If I do not agree to be quoted the report will not link me or in any way make any correlation to the information I provide. However, I understand that given the small number of NGOs that will be interviewed, and the general knowledge of one another that exists amongst the NGO community, my name, and/or the name of the organization may be recognized by others. Thus, the study cannot guarantee anonymity. Therefore:

I _____ agree that my name be published in the study.

I _____ do not agree that my name be published in the study.

My organization _____ agrees to have its name published in the study.

My organization _____ does not agree that its name be published in the study.

Signed: _____

Dated: _____

(This form was translated into Spanish for Salvadorean NGOs)

Appendix 4

**Guide for Literature review on:
Development Theories**

1. To what extent do development theories reflect an understanding of the underlying divide between north and south in regards to:
 - a. class?
i.e. the degree of understanding of the origins of development and solutions to underdevelopment.
 - b. gender?
i.e. the role that women have played in development and underdevelopment.
 - c. race?
i.e. the acknowledgment of racial/racism issues in development and underdevelopment.

2. What are the similarities and differences that the different paradigms present in north-south relations as it regards to:
 - a. the role of the northern and southern actors?
 - b. the future of the relationship?
 - c. empowerment of which actor?

3. What do feminist theories for development advocate in relation to:
 - a. class?
i.e. the degree of understanding of the origins of development and solutions to underdevelopment.
 - b. gender?
i.e. the role that women have played in development and underdevelopment.
 - c. race?
i.e. the acknowledgment of racial/racism issues in development and underdevelopment.
 - d. the role of northern and southern partners in a relationship?

4. What do anti-racism theories for development advocate in regards to:
 - a. class?
i.e. the degree of understanding of the origins of development and solutions to underdevelopment.
 - b. gender?
i.e. the role that women have played in development and underdevelopment.
 - c. race?
i.e. the acknowledgment of racial/racism issues in development and underdevelopment.
 - d. the role of northern and southern partners in a relationship?

Appendix 5

**Guide for literature review on:
Trends in the relationship amongst NGOs**

1. What is written in primary and secondary sources such as Canadian NGOs and CIDA development education documents, and the work of academics about the relationship between northern and southern NGOs? ie
 - a. how are they defined?
 - b. shifts in the relationships and why?
 - c. implicit or explicit practices of the relationship?
 - d. mechanism for starting, maintaining or advancing the relationship?
 - e. decision making?
 - f. who should make the initiative to start a relationship?
 - g. what are the principles guided the relationship?

2. Do these NGO documents acknowledge or provide an understanding of northern and southern NGO relationships in regards to stakeholder:
 - a. class?
i.e. the degree of understanding of the origins of development and solutions to underdevelopment.
 - b. gender?
i.e. the role that women have played in development and underdevelopment.
 - c. race?
i.e. the acknowledgment of racial/racism issues in development and underdevelopment.

3. What is written in primary and secondary sources about northern and southern NGOs in regards to:
 - a. who they are?
 - b. what learnings have each of them contributed to the relationship?

4. What difference can be found in the relationship that northern NGOs have with southern NGOs and the one they would like to establish with CIDA themselves?

IMAGE EVALUATION TEST TARGET (QA-3)

APPLIED IMAGE, Inc.
1653 East Main Street
Rochester, NY 14609 USA
Phone: 716/482-0300
Fax: 716/288-5989

© 1993, Applied Image, Inc., All Rights Reserved