Architecture & National Identity
The Judicial Precinct a Century in the Making

by

Diana Velásquez Lozano

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Architecture

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario

©2016
Diana Velásquez Lozano

Architecture & National Identity
The Judicial Precinct a Century in the Making

Diana Velásquez L.

Abstract:

Architecture & National Identity | The Judicial Precinct a Century in the Making examines the relationship between Canadian national identity and its association to architecture and place. Focusing on the architecture of the Capital Plateau, this thesis aims to understand Canadian identity in its 'elusiveness' and the significant role that architecture and its particular location play in establishing and evoking a sense of identity.

By understanding architecture's ability to become a symbol of identity, this research becomes the foundation for the design of the future Federal Courts of Canada. Currently missing an association to place, the courts and judicial system play a strong role in Canadian democratic identity.

Respecting the heritage of urban planning as far back as 1912, this thesis provides a permanent home in the currently vacant west block of the Judicial Precinct. The design proposal deals with challenges such as location, context, function, security and identity while aiming to provide a project representative of its time, its history and a continuation of the 'Spirit of Place' of its location in the 'Heart of the Nation'.

The design proposal focuses on the public image of the Federal Courts and attempts to reinforce a sense of identity through its location, by educating on the judicial system and by providing access- not currently available- to the public at large. It is an idealistic, almost utopian, proposal which aims to manifest our national values regarding how our judicial system should function (transparency, security, justice) as architecture.

Acknowledgements:

To the many individuals along the way who listened, offered advice and words of encouragement.

To my advisor, Mariana Esponda, for your guidance, support and patience throughout this entire process.

A mis padres, que han sido mis ejemplos, sin cuyo apoyo incondicional, amor y sabiduría, esta tesis no habría sido posible. To my sister, my constant source of support, laughter and encouragement. Los amo.

Thank you!

Prologue:

I began my thesis year with an interest in the relationship between cultural identity and architecture. After having the opportunity to spend Winter 2015 semester abroad, the cultural differences and their representations in architecture became more apparent. Upon returning to Ottawa, I began looking for examples of its cultural identity and instead stumbled into a greater interest of architecture's role in one's sense of national identity. After all, national identity to me symbolized a cultural representation on a greater scale. I started to look at the historic buildings I had seen many times before, attempting to understand them further and the role they played in my understanding of the relationship between architecture and identity.

In the search of heritage gems in the city, I was shocked by the void in the judicial precinct. How could such prime real estate in Canada's Capital be vacant in a city dominated by federal presence? I quickly became interested in the opportunities the site could provide and the impact such a prominent site would have in the architectural representation of Canadian identity.

Through research into its history I became aware that the site had been subject to urban plans spanning just over a century to 1912/1913. Investigations into the history of these plans and respecting the intangible heritage of their content, it became apparent that the most appropriate program for the site would be the headquarters of the Federal Courts of Canada.

With a program in mind, the research portion of this thesis expanded to understand its function, its role in Canadian identity and its needs.

Starting with no knowledge, and only an interest in a site and a concept, this thesis, as the culmination of my architectural studies, has taught me that the needs of architecture require an understanding much greater than just a program. They require an understanding of its culture, its function, its place, its context and its history.

Table *of* Contents:

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Prologue	v
Table of Contents/Appendices	viii
Objectives	xi
Introduction	1
Part One: National Identity	3
1.1 National Identity	5
1.2 Who are we? - In Search of a Canadian National Identity	7
1.3 The Architecture of National Identity	11
Part Two: The Capital Plateau: Parliamentary and Judicial Precincts	15
2.1 the Site	17
2.2 The Capital Plateau and Ottawa	22
2.3 A Century of Urban Planning	29
2.4 Planning and Design Principles	35
2.5 Focus on the Judicial Precinct	37

Part Three: The Federal Courts of Canada:	41
3.1 Understanding the Federal Courts (Canadian Judicial System) ...	45
3.2 Symbols of Justice and of the Courts.	50
3.3 Program.....	52
Part Four: Design Proposal	59
4.1 Precedent Studies	61
4.2 Design Considerations	69
4.3 Design Overview	85
4.4 the Public and the Courts: looking at the details.	97
4.5 Floorplans: Understanding Program	111
4.6 Architectural Interventions on Heritage Sites	119
Conclusion	122
Appendices	127
Bibliography	133

List *of* Appendices:

Appendix A: A Note on the Most Recent Site Proposals	127
Appendix B: Judicial Fit Up Standards	131

THESIS

Objectives:

1. *This thesis seeks to understand Canadian Identity and its association to place (in the Capital Plateau).*
2. *This thesis investigates the role and significance of the Judicial system as part of our democratic and national identity.*
3. *This thesis explores architecture's ability to become a symbol of identity and uses these explorations to create the, currently missing, physical association to place for the Federal Courts of Canada.*

Thesis Question:

How can architecture's ability to become a symbol of identity be utilized to evoke and strengthen the relationship between the Federal Courts of Canada and their association to Canadian identity and place?

1 Proposed Site	2 Supreme Court of Canada
3 Justice Building	4 St. Laurent Square
5 Library and Archives	6 Wellington Street
7 Ottawa River	8 Cliff Street Plant

Introduction:

Through a series of investigations on national identity, more specifically, **Canadian national identity**, and its relationship to architecture and place, this thesis seeks to develop a design proposal for the Federal Courts of Canada Building on the last major independent, vacant site on the Capital Plateau.

The Capital Plateau, located in downtown Ottawa, ON, is denoted by the boundaries of Wellington Street to the south, the Ottawa River to the north, the Rideau Canal to east and the Portage Bridge to the west. Divided between the Parliamentary and Judicial Precincts, the Capital Plateau houses some of the most significant functions to the federal government. These functions in combination to its architectural magnificence have, through the years, created an irrefutable relationship between Canadian identity and its association to place. Currently however, this association is fairly limited to the Parliamentary Precinct, leaving the Judicial Precinct a slightly neglected portion of the Plateau.

Made up of the federal court, the federal court of appeal and the tax court of Canada, **the Federal Courts of Canada** are currently housed in multiple ordinary buildings, seemingly inaccessible to the public at large. By providing a notable home for the Federal Courts in the west block of the Judicial

Precinct, the completion of the Judicial Triad pays homage to just over a century of urban planning, revitalizes the Judicial Precinct and serves to strengthen the national identity and its association to place within the Capital Plateau as a whole.

The complexity of the program only becomes more challenging when combined with the restrictions and expectations placed by a prominent site in the city. This thesis seeks to find the fundamentals upon which to base the design through the concurrent investigations into the 'elusiveness' that is Canadian identity, the ability architecture has to evoke emotion, memory and identity, the needs and values of the Federal Courts, its public image, and lastly the immediate and surrounding sites' history, character and precedents. These investigations have also revealed the significance of the Judicial system which plays an integral role in our understanding of Canadian democratic identity.

With a strong basis on investigating the relationship between architecture and identity, the design portion focuses on providing a functional building which speaks of its **time**, its **place** and its **history**. Through the incorporation of architectural intervention at varying scales the aim of this thesis deals with the experiential quality of its public spaces.

Part one: National Identity

“We argue for the critical place that architecture must occupy in any serious discussion of nation and national values; that Canadian architecture can be characterized and this is worthwhile;”¹ Wilson, Scott (2005) p.5

Velasquez, Diana (2015) Parliamentary Precinct overlooking the Ottawa River

¹ Wilson, Scott (2005) *Substance over Spectacle*. 'Foreword'. 1st Ed. P.5 (Gruft, Andrew) Arsenal Pulp Press

Part one of this thesis will focus in understanding the concept of **national identity**, interpreting an individual understanding of the complexity that is **Canadian identity** and finally, **understanding the relationship between architecture and national identity**. All of these concepts come together to generate a platform for a better understanding of the active role happening in Ottawa, as capital city, between Canadian identity and the national image embedded in its key federal architecture. With a prominent location overlooking the Ottawa River north of Wellington Street, the Capital Plateau is the epitome of architecture in the national image; this part will examine and determine the considerations, limitations and expectations that must be present for both the conservation of present and design of future architecture on the plateau and the significant role this complex plays in our national identity as Canadians.

*Understanding in the sense of the Standards and Guidelines process of understanding, planning and intervening. Part one deals with an understanding of the concept.

1.1 National Identity:

National identity aims to encompass within it the shared characteristics of many diverse individuals represented by distinctive traditions, culture and language in order to express the sense of a nation as a cohesive whole. Not always easily definable, national identity is not a natural attribute but rather a process that must be cultivated through time.¹

Often, wrongfully, perceived as a timeless notion, the idea of nation and nationalism has its roots in the French Revolution at the end of the 18th century. With ideologies from the Enlightenment movement the French and American Revolutions provided the notions of nationalism and patriotism respectively, as the devotion to the interests and the culture of a particular nation. Furthermore, nationalism can be approached, politically, psychologically or culturally.² For the purpose of these thesis explorations, the concepts relating to nationalism and national identity will be approached from a cultural perspective, although it must be kept in mind that the three approaches are closely interconnected.

Recognizing their common beliefs and ideals, civic nationalism, had and continues to have the ability to bind a nation together. How we define these common beliefs and ideals, however, is often left to the elected leadership as a representative of

¹ Vale, Lawrence. (2008) *Architecture Power and National Identity*. 2nd Ed. Yale University Press

² Bonikowski, Bart (2008) *Research on American Nationalism*, Princeton University Dissertation

the populace. The role of politics in establishing and continuing the sense of nationalism is then a significant one leaving some, such as Ernest Gellner (author of *Nations and Nationalism*), to argue that the ideals of nationalism can be seen as a “theory of political legitimacy.”³ The conception, formation, and longevity of a national identity then, is interwoven and inseparable from politics as it holds at its core, the values of its collective memories and goals of a given culture at a given time.

National Identity is spread in a way much like propaganda. Its icons are decided by selected individuals or contests and thoughtfully distributed, showcased and marketed to its target demographic. Everyday objects, such as currency, contain the symbols of its identity; national heroes, historical significance-collective memory-, achievements-pride-, the flag and national identifiers, and lastly works of architecture embedded with identity.

The capacity of built environments to act as symbols and to transform one’s mental picture of place has been implicitly understood and utilized for centuries in city building by designers and rulers alike.⁴ Following Gellner’s “theory of political legitimacy”, one can see how the leadership has used the careful manipulation of the built environment to further evoke, define or strengthen a sense of national identity.⁵ Architecture is then, arguably, one of the most effective vessels in the representation of a national image serving as a physical manifestation of embodied national values and ideologies found within a unified national identity.

³ Gellner, Ernest. (1983) *Nations and Nationalism*. 1st Ed. Cornell University Press

⁴ NCC (1984) *A Study of National Capital Symbols*. National Capital Commission.

⁵ Vale, Lawrence. (2008) *Architecture Power and National Identity*. 2nd Ed. Yale University Press

1.2 Who Are We?

In Search of a Canadian National Identity

“Canada resists definition.”¹

As Canadians we are constantly confronted with questions of identity. Due to a short history as a sovereign nation (the Statute of Westminster, which granted Canada the ability to self-govern and establish an independent legislative government, was passed on December 11th, 1931²), Canadians continue to undergo the existential question: what makes ‘you’ Canadian? We are frequently confronted with affirmations of identity, often times born from marketing strategies, but more often than not these aspects that we are susceptible to believe make up our Canadian identity are cast in the form of “we are not”; commonly as a way of establishing our distancing traits from our neighbors to the south: “we are not American”. The challenge in understanding and representing a truly Canadian identity herein lies in understanding that it is a complex mechanism made up of ever changing influences and individual identities. Much of its complexity can be traced to its roots and founding cultures but is ever more complexified by growing multiculturalism, geography, and beliefs along with many other influences. Due to its complexity, any attempt at definition of National Identity in Canada will be ambiguous and arguably elusive in nature. This thesis attempts to understand Canadian Identity through the differences that exist in fragmentation and derive from the many sub-cultures present, national values that tie them all together.

¹Cohen, Andrew (2007) *The Unfinished Canadian: The People We Are*. 1st Ed. McClelland and Stewart p. 245

²Cohen, Andrew (2007) *The Unfinished Canadian: The People We Are*. 1st Ed. McClelland and Stewart

ABORIGINAL
First Nations History Traditions
Collective Memory Inuit
Metis

ANGLOPHONE
Beliefs English Law Political Ideology
English Common Law Traditions
Military

FRANCOPHONE
Beliefs Political Ideology Traditions
French and Roman Civil Law Law
Diffusion History French

DERIVING CANADIAN NATIONAL VALUES FROM 'SUBCULTURES' (2015)³

The diagram above proposes a simple analysis of the roots of some Canadian National Values as derived from a variety of 'subcultures'. Please keep in mind that this diagram is not comprehensive as it deals with a complex organism.

What we are looking for in establishing or reinforcing our identity are not only the similarities in the complexity which seem elusive on their own but traits particular to Canadians alone, distinguishing traits and sources of pride. "Almost everywhere, people have questioned, reconsidered, and redefined what they have in common and what distinguishes them from other people."⁴ Therefore, the national values which we will look at must not only be shared similarities in Canadians, but also come together in a way unique enough to be solely Canadian.

³ Velasquez, Diana (2015) *Identifying National Values derived from Canadian 'Subcultures'*

⁴ Cohen, Andrew (2007) *The Unfinished Canadian: The People We Are*. 1st Ed. McClelland and Stewart

Understanding the whole through fragmentation:

In 1971 Northrop Frye⁵ stated that defining a national identity in Canada is difficult because it presumes a unity. While we continue to consider national identity in Canada to be a unified notion, it will continue to be elusive. It is only when we accept the reality of the fragmentation that occurs and the similarities from these subcultures that come together to form our national values that we begin to better understand a broader image of Canadian identity.

To better understand this fragmentation we begin by looking at the three founding cultures which play key roles in our current identity: the Aboriginal, Anglo, and Franco cultures. Each founding culture has provided a foundation for the development of the nation. For example, Canada's national legal system reflects legal traditions derived from a combination of English common law and French and Roman civil law.⁶ The uniqueness in this becomes a judicial system which combines considers both common and civil law as one entity.

The dynamic of these cultures is further fragmented by multiculturalism and the effect of having a small population spread across vast areas ranging between diverse geographies, therefore various regions are created each with a distinct culture.⁷ The compilation of these factors becomes the cause for multiple subcultures developing across the country.

Though we can account many components to our national values, they are not fully developed and their development is not without its challenges. The first challenge is encountered when we speak of history. Canada does not share one collective memory as from the beginning we established distinct cultures each with different recollections, backgrounds and histories of their own. An example of a fragmented notion of history lies in the settlers. The history often told and taught is approached with a westernized viewpoint from cultures whose nature it was to conquer. In their history, the settlers conquered the lands, brought civilization and technology

⁵ Frye, Northrop (1971) *The Bush Garden: Essays on the Canadian Imagination*. Toronto: Anansi.

⁶ Court Administration Services (2015) *The Role of the Federal Courts*, Online fca-caf.gc.ca

⁷ Ibbitson, John (2005) *The Polite Revolution: Perfecting the Canadian Dream*. McClelland & Stewart. 240

and established permanent roots. However, this same event is looked upon with a negative connotation in aboriginal oral history; the settlers that stole first nations land, enforced their religious beliefs and oppressed their people. As we search for a collective memory in these contradictory histories we must recognize and establish that these distinct cultures are both key roles in a collective national identity. At recognizing this fact and attempting reconciliation we come closer to uniting the people of Canada and achieving a cohesive Canadian identity than we have ever been in the past.

Democratic Identity:

One of the unifying national values that Canadians hold as a cornerstone to their identity is the notion of a fair and just government, a democracy for the people and by the people. Unlike our southern neighbors, what makes this notion uniquely Canadian is the maintained symbolic role of the monarchy alongside democracy. So what is our democratic identity? It divides our government into three interdependent branches: the legislative, the executive and the judicial. Although each of these branches works independently, they must all be present and equally significant for a just government. The legislative branch speaks of the law makers, it refers to our Parliament and its members. It finds its home in the Parliamentary Precinct on the Capital Plateau. The executive branch is related to the governing political party of the time. It is the only one of the three branches whose home is outside of the Capital Plateau in Langevin Block. The judicial branch deals with our judicial system, the interpretation and administrations of our law and justice. The Supreme court is the main representative of this system, but the Judicial Precinct sits incomplete in the Capital Plateau.

1.3 *The Architecture of National Identity:*

“For centuries, leaders have attempted to define a sense of national identity by the careful manipulation of the built environment.”¹

National Identity is intangible in nature. As such a significant and influential idea, it is strengthened by tangible symbols and signifiers. These often include, our association with geography, color, style, form and architecture amongst many others. Narrowing our focus on architecture, we inquire in this search: what gives architecture its ability to significantly strengthen and evoke a sense of national identity?

In order to answer the overall question there are a series of topics that must be addressed. The first of these is looking at the reason behind ‘Why governments build’ and what do they build. Secondly we look at what aspects of architecture contribute to the making and strengthening of national identity through the creation and maintenance of a national image. Some of these include, the architectural style that is chosen and later maintained, the materiality, the security and accessibility of these buildings, and lastly what we are told they signify.

¹Vale, Lawrence. (2008) *Architecture Power and National Identity*. 2nd Ed. Yale University Press

Why do Governments Build:

The buildings that dominate our capital cities and strengthen the sense of national identity are not there by coincidence. Their locations have been meticulously chosen, the buildings have been carefully designed, and their meaning calculated. Although, admittedly, the outcome and criticism is not always what has been foreshadowed, for a large part, the effect that major works of architecture have in relation to national identity provides a sense of power or pride in the national values they have chosen to highlight. Giving way to political interests, Vale states that “Since the design of capital cities and parliament buildings are chosen by the leadership rather than by the populace, the resultant place hardly resembles a truly national identity.”² This is what Clifford Geertz coined as the cultural balance of power within a pluralist society.³ It speaks of the instance that one group has been selected to represent the populace, the idea being that their demonstration of national identity through the built environment will represent the values held by the populace at large. So governments build to embody national values. Governments build to excerpt or demonstrate power (to house government, justice and legislation). Governments build to commemorate events of national significance (often victories at war, patriots fallen in heroic action, and most recently also the quiet ‘heros’ that have helped change the nation to the place it is today). Governments build to create a lasting legacy of their regimes, their accomplishments, and the greatness of their nation. Governments build to rally the emotions of the nation.

What do Governments Build:

The first buildings built to showcase Ottawa as the National Capital were the Parliament Buildings. The largest construction undertaken in North America to date, the complex brought with it a sense of pride to the soon to be nation. Historically, when a new regime takes power, when a new capital city is designated, when governments are looking to start a new they begin with the heart of their values. In Canada our national values hold at their heart our democratic identity; the Parliament buildings are the central location to this notion. Similarly governments aim to

²Vale, Lawrence. (2008) *Architecture Power and National Identity*. 2nd Ed. Yale University Press p.22

³Geertz, Clifford (LOOK UP FOOTNOTE. VALE PAGE 3

construct first the buildings that will represent their state. Parliamentary complexes are amongst the first constructions. Governments build the structures which are primarily, necessary for the function of the government, and secondarily symbols of state. After the governmental basis has been built (parliamentary complexes, houses of legislation, judicial buildings and senates) emphasis is placed on the national images that will commemorate, that will educate and which give character and portray history. These are museums, memorials etc.

Security and Accessibility: How do these change the image of the symbol?

Federal buildings must be secure. We have heard this and the logic behind it from every source there is. They must be protected for both what they house and what they represent. Security is a primary concern in the program, the function and the design of federal buildings. However, should federal buildings be accessible? If so, how accessible can they be while still maintaining their security. The accessibility the populace and public have to a federal building highly alters the image and significance the building has. For example, most of the pictures onlookers have with the White House in Washington D.C includes the black gate that prevents the public from accessing the premises, therefore limiting their experience. The Parliament Buildings and Langevin Block in Ottawa, in contrast are controlled and secured, but the gate that denotes the premises is permeable. By controlling the experience of the public, the buildings are allowed to become an icon, to only be seen from a certain perspective, one which hopefully denotes them as the physical portrayal of national identity. By allowing the public to experience them however, the government is making a political statement about the inclusion and acceptance of the populace. The ability to freely approach Parliament, Langevin Block, the Supreme court and many significant buildings to our national image is a freedom we value as Canadians. We believe not only the building, but the relationship we are allowed to have with it speaks of our national identity. Therefore, moving forward in any design, or function, accessibility should be maintained wherever security allows it to. The intricate relationship between security and accessibility frames our national image.

Architectural Style and National Image:

The national image refers to characteristics commonly found in many federal/ state buildings, normally defining characteristics of architectural style. As, arguably, government buildings attempt to build and/or support specific regimes the architecture of their buildings becomes a symbol of state serving much more than its practical functionality. With this in mind, leaders have consciously chosen and followed architectural styles which in their national values have come to represent power, justice and identity.⁴ As a comparative exercise, let's look at the architecture of Washington, D.C. and that of Ottawa. The U.S. Capital is dominated by neo classical architecture initially chosen to distance themselves as much as possible from the British monarchy and align themselves with ideals similar to those of the Greek Republic. This is visible in their architecture. In contrast, as a commonwealth nation, Canada's national architecture follows the neo gothic image similar to the U.K.'s Parliamentary complex.

Velasquez, Diana (2015) Architectural Style Sketches

⁴Vale, Lawrence. (2008) *Architecture Power and National Identity*. 2nd Ed. Yale University Press

⁵Velasquez, Diana (2015) *Outlines and Sketches- Capital Architecture*

Part two: The Capital Plateau

Parliamentary and Judicial Precincts

Velasquez, Diana (2015) Parliamentary and Judicial Precincts

“Ottawa’s appeal lies largely in Parliament, perched on the heartland above the river. At its feet are the temples of Wellington Street...Here is the soul of the Capital, representing knowledge, law, justice and government. It gives Ottawa its mandate and its memory. It confers elegance, age and history... The scene is the modest country itself.”¹

Cohen, Andrew (2007) p.178

Part two of this thesis will focus on exploring not only the immediate chosen site, but the entire Capital Plateau² (term coined by du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier, 2006), as an extended site, comprised of the Parliamentary Precinct, the Bank Street Valley, The Judicial Precinct and Library and Archives Canada. This is done through a brief history of Ottawa, an analysis of the extended site, history of urban planning and the existing crown and town dichotomy, all investigated through the effect they have on the significance of place and the effect the presence of the federal government plays. These investigations come together as a foundation for an analysis of the existing and potential Judicial Precinct, contemporary proposals on site, and strong considerations moving onto the design phase.

¹ Cohen, Andrew (2007) *The Unfinished Canadian: The People We Are*. 1st Ed.

² du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*.

2.1 The Site:

Locating the proposed Site:

The proposed site for the new Federal Courts of Canada Building is located in the currently vacant west block of the Judicial Precinct. The building comes together with the Supreme Court of Canada and the Justice building to complete the second building triad of the Capital Plateau, in the making since 1912.

As Part two involves uncommon terminology, a few of the following figures and diagrams may be useful in visualizing the Capital Plateau and its surroundings.

City of Ottawa identified in Ontario ①

The City of Ottawa ②

The City of Ottawa- Centre town core ③

The City of Ottawa- Downtown Core¹ ④

¹ City of Ottawa (2011) *Transforming Ottawa's Streets*. Appendix B Ottawa. Base Map, Edited

Surrounding Context: The Capital Plateau & Wellington

Although there is no established, formal name for the study area, the 2006 Site Capacity and Long Term Development Plan (Parliamentary and Judicial Precinct Area) coined the term “Capital Plateau” which has been adopted by this thesis. The Capital Plateau encompasses the larger area with two promontories (where Centre Block and the Supreme Court are located) an Upper and Lower Plateau, the Bank St Valley, Parliamentary, Judicial (and sometimes Cultural) Precincts, Parliamentary and Judicial Triads. All of these come together in the Capital Plateau to house some of the most significant buildings in the nation.

Building Triads and Precincts

- Buildings composing Parliamentary Triad
Parliamentary Precinct & Upper Plateau
- Buildings composing Judicial Triad
Judicial Precinct & Lower Plateau

Plateaus Defined

- Upper Plateau Landscape
Parliamentary Precinct
- Lower Plateau Landscape
Judicial Precinct (& Cultural Precinct to a lesser extent)

The Capital Plateau; Boundaries and Buildings¹

1 Portage Bridge	7 Cliff Street Plant	13 East Block of Parliament
2 Wellington Street	8 Supreme Court of Canada	14 Langevin Block
3 Ottawa River	9 Justice Building	15 Bank of Canada Building
4 Rideau Canal	10 Confederation Building	16 East Memorial Building
5 Library and Archives	11 West Block of Parliament	17 West Memorial Building
6 Proposed Site	12 Centre Block of Parliament	18 St. Laurent Square

¹ City of Ottawa (2011) *Transforming Ottawa's Streets*. Appendix B Ottawa. Base Map, Edited

² Velasquez, Diana (2015) *Aerial View of the Capital Plateau*

Immediate Context: The Judicial Precinct

The Judicial Precinct and its Surroundings¹

1 Confederation Building	7 Library and Archives
2 Justice Building	8 West Memorial Building
3 Supreme Court of Canada	9 East Memorial Building
4 St. Laurent Square	10 Wellington Street
5 Proposed Site	11 Ottawa River
6 Cliff Street Plant	

¹ Velasquez, Diana (2016) *The Judicial Precinct from the River*. Sketch

Immediate Context: The Judicial Precinct

Pictures of the Site and the Precinct

² Velasquez, Diana (2016) *The Judicial Precinct along Wellington St.* Photograph

³ Velasquez, Diana (2015) *The Proposed Site looking West.* Photograph

2.2 *The Capital Plateau & Ottawa:*

A Selective History:

The development of Ottawa as a city has been highly marked by the fact that it is Canada's National Capital. As it has grown, the presence of the federal government has created a town and crown dichotomy which defines the city.

The first known inhabitants of the Ottawa area are the first nations, aboriginal population, particularly the Algonquin. Although not always visible in the capital metropolis, the Algonquin endured a 5,000 year long presence of continuous inhabitation in and around the area.¹ The Algonquin were a nomadic people so no permanent settlements were ever established in the Ottawa area. This also contributes to the lack of disturbance to the land which they maintained natural and picturesque as they travelled through using the Ottawa River as a major trade route and means of transportation. With the settlement of the two dominant external cultures, the Anglophone and the Francophone, the Algonquin presence began to slowly diminish. Some acknowledgements of their presence are still visible, the clearest of which is the city's name. Previously known as Bytown, the town was renamed Ottawa, which is derived from the Algonquin word Odawa meaning "to trade", named after the river that runs along the city.

¹ Fortin, Lyette and Robert Allsopp (2015) *Heart of the Nation: Long Term Vision Plan Presentation*. Ottawa

2

This change became official, marking the birth from town to city on January 1st, 1855. In commemoration and acknowledgement of their past inhabitation there have been efforts to restore and replenish the wild escarpment flowing north of the Capital Plateau into the Ottawa River.

3

Canada as the British Dominion of North America; the need for a central capital city arose. Many cities were considered strong contenders in the 17 year long search for the seat of government, amongst which were Toronto, Kingston, Montreal and Quebec. In the search, Bytown provided the unique experience of being central between the prominent Quebec City and Toronto locations, a border between Upper (Ontario) and Lower (Quebec) Canada and a strategic distance away from the young United States. It came as a strategic decision when Queen Victoria announced in 1858 that Ottawa (by now renamed from Bytown) would be the new seat of government. The decision maintained a careful balance between the complex Anglophone and Francophone relations and would be located in land with aboriginal history, an integral part of the city's

4

² Greber; (1950) *Plan for the National Capital General Report (The Greber Report)* Ottawa 1860 d.10;

³ Greber; (1950) *Plan for the National Capital General Report (The Greber Report)* Ottawa 1876 d.17

⁴ du Toit Allsopp Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Long Term Development Plan: Parliamentary and Judicial Precincts Area*; Public Works Canada

cultural identity. Along with the decision, the sum of two hundred and twenty five thousand pounds (at the time) would be appropriated for the purpose of providing the necessary buildings and accommodation for the Government and Legislature at that certain place.⁵ 1859 saw the design competition for the Parliament Buildings on the site then known as Barrack's Hill, a military site due to its advantageous location on a promontory.

With a growing presence, the small Bytown, became Ottawa, the National Capital and the need for services and developments grew. 1909 brought the rail lines to the centre of the city following the path of the Rideau Canal. Arriving in the capital one stepped out of Union Station onto the south east end of Wellington Street, the heart of the nation.

Through the years, Wellington Street would grow to become the jewel of Canada's Confederation Boulevard Ceremonial Avenue which approaches through Metcalf and makes a loop uniting the municipalities of Ottawa and Gatineau.⁶

The Wellington Street Divide:

One of the anomalies of Ottawa occurs at Wellington Street between the Rideau Canal and the Portage Bridge, commonly referred to as the 'Town and Crown Dichotomy'. This dichotomy is an architectural and spacial boundary which theoretically separates head governmental/ federal functions from municipal/local functions. It is visually articulated through its architecture. Following urban planning strategies and the language of the avenue, the area north of Wellington Street (the Capital Plateau & Chateau Laurier) are pavilions in the landscape, for the most part set back from the street and creating a series of public squares and spaces. This area comprises what we refer to as architecture in the national image, where the rooflines reach vertically creating a dialogue with the skyline through a series of towers, dormers, chateau roofs etc. The Capital Plateau is then the Crown in this dichotomy.

⁵ City of Ottawa, History

⁶ Gordon, David (2015) *A Retrospective on Capital Planning*. Lecture

If the Capital Plateau is the crown, which follows its own architectural principles, the area south of Wellington Street defines the Town boundary. Here we find what Jaques Greber, along with others, refer to as the 'Wellington Street Wall', which means that the architecture of the buildings directly south of Wellington should in some sense form a uniform surface which opposes the crown. The buildings vary greatly in architectural style, materiality and function, but follow height restrictions, rhythmic language and setbacks to achieve this unity. The result is a visual divide down the length of Wellington Street which although originally designed as the divide between town and crown, serves now only as an arbitrary visual boundary due to the amount of federal functions directly south of Wellington Street.

Bennett (1915) Holt Report- Town & Crown⁴

⁴ Bennett, Edward H. (1915) *Report of the Federal Plan Commission (Holt Report)*. Chicago. Dwg 18

² Google (2015) *Wellington Street Divide. Crown, Wellington, Town respectively*. Accessed March 2016

Considering Heritage Recognition on and around the Site:

As established through its history and location, (and also considered further in Urban Planning) the Capital Plateau in its entirety has its own heritage value. This is due to its prominence as the seat of Canadian law and government, often referred to as the 'Heart of the Nation'⁴⁴ (both physically and metaphorically). It is then of no surprise that most permanent buildings in the Capital Plateau are also heritage structures, many for the character defining elements which dominate the national image architecturally. Along with their architectural characteristics many of these buildings attain heritage status due to their function and its significance with intangible Canadian heritage and national identity.

By looking at the heritage values of other buildings on the Capital Plateau, this thesis will search for the similarities in significance in buildings built in varying styles, and different centuries but all who fit within our idea of the national image. Character defining elements can be a good indicator of what makes a strong statement particularly if they overlap through different architectural styles.

For now, the two most significant studies have been the Parliamentary complex and the Supreme Court of Canada. They are significant in this thesis as both the Centre Block and Supreme Court are essentially the 'jewels' in the Parliamentary and Judicial Triads respectively. By looking at them both on their own and how they can help to give form to the public spaces, public experience and the Triad, information can be gathered to help determine how the Design Proposal for the Federal Courts could help enhance the character defining elements of the site.

*Please note that the character defining elements and heritage value represent the research from the Canadian Register of Historic Places. Further development of the Character Defining Elements of the Capital Plateau can be found in Chapter 2.5.

⁴⁴Fortin, Lyette (2015) Heart of the Nation: Long Term Vision Plan Presentation Lecture. Ottawa

	Parliament of Canada:	Supreme Court of Canada:
Landmark:
Character Defining Elements:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Picturesque complex matching yet different gothic revival design 2. Copper roofs, towers pinnacles and iron cresting against the skyline 3. Relationship between buildings and distinctive outdoor spaces around them (tension between the formal, almost austere, centre and 'wild' periphery) 4. Wellington Street fence- original and defining iteration of the Town/Crown dichotomy 5. Parliamentary Lawns – formal centre – retaining wall and podium as the basic form giving element to the space 6. "Wild" state of the cliff- necessary to splendid image of the hill from the North side 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Careful design/ formal progression from the large landscaped forecourt through the grand entrance and into the interior 2. Proportioned and symmetrical design (inside and out) which is enhanced by materials – elegant materials create the sense of occasion and presence. 3. Landscape setting in the Beaux Arts scheme (which was proposed for entire western precinct) 4. Exterior of the building- two distinct elements: Classical base (art deco) with Chateau roof.
Heritage Value:	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Complex in its entirety is a symbol of Parliament and Canadian Government 2. Better Canadian example of design at a large scale 3. Site of numerous nationally significant events and ceremonies 4. High Victorian picturesque composition of international significance (North) vs. formal southern aspect 5. Site of Legislative branch which signifies Canada's nationhood 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Strong historical associations 2. Architectural design and detailing 3. Status as national landmark 4. Symbolic prominence has increased over the years with the supreme court's growing influence and power 5. Familiar symbol of the justice system in Canada at its highest level

EXAMPLES of HERITAGE CONSIDERATIONS ON SITE(2015) Velasquez⁵

⁵ Velasquez, Diana (2015) Chart with information from Parks Canada. (2015) The Canadian Register of Historic Places.

Timeline of Construction on the Capital Plateau:

¹ Velasquez, Diana (2015) *Time line of Construction, Capital Plateau and Surroundings*

² Greber; (1950) *Plan for the National Capital General Report (The Greber Report)* Designed skyline d.211

2.3 A Century of Urban Planning:

Why look at past urban plans for a new design proposal?

Although the proposed urban plans (concentrating on the Capital Plateau) have varied greatly in style, designer, goal and approach, they all maintain similar values to the land, the relationships between landscape and buildings and a formal public realm. What becomes important in this section is then understanding the significant values and heritage of ideas that have been respected and kept throughout the past century in order to consider an appropriate approach which respects the heritage of the prominent site, the needs (both past and present) of both the site and the government and adds value to the judicial precinct.

The plans will appear in chronological order focusing on selected interventions.

The city of Ottawa commissioned the first designed masterplan for Canada's capital, 'The Preliminary Report for the Ottawa Improvement Commission' in 1903 by landscape architect Frederick Todd. At the time of the Preliminary Report for the Ottawa Improvement Commission plan the federal government planned its growth North of Wellington Street west and with projections to expand on the other side of the Rideau Canal to the what we know today to be Major's Hill Park.

¹Cohen, Andrew (2007) *The Unfinished Canadian: The People We Are*. 1st Ed. McClelland and Stewart p. 245

¹⁻⁵du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*.

⁶⁻¹⁰Urbisite- Midcentury Modernist (2015) *The Judicial Triad, Be Careful What You Wish For*. Online 2015-12-17

In 1912 the federal government began the process of expropriating the residential land North of Wellington between what we now know as Bank Street and the Portage Bridge creating a major shift of the cultural landscape of the city. With the 1912 expropriations, the federal landscape would expand to Portage Bridge. The pressure for change would result in increasing the federal presence on the Ottawa River.

The years following the **1912** expropriations saw various urban planning proposals. Following the expropriations, **Frederick Todd** presented the first proposal which hinted at the buildings and services that would be provided. With an Exchequer court established in 1875, but one which lacked a permanent home, in Todd's plan we see the first intention to create a Judicial Precinct adjacent to the current Parliamentary Precinct to house what is now the Supreme Court of Canada. That same year, plans made in collaboration by Edward White and Aston Webb were received but after thorough analysis dismissed as they were considered too similar to Washington, D.C.- the capital city of our southern neighbours. What Sir Wilfrid Laurier once quoted as a desire to create a "Washington of the North" was after the White-Webb plan never pursued again with the understanding that there needed to be many differences in the Canadian capital of the future.

The Holt commission in **1915** hired architect and urban planner **Edward Bennett** to create a new proposal. Bennett, based in Chicago, created a City Beautiful plan and proposed monumental buildings along widened boulevards (including a triad courtyard design for the judicial precinct which included a mall of buildings highlighting the formal public space provided) in 'Report of the Federal Plan Commission on a General Plan for the Cities of Ottawa and Hull'. Under Bennett's plan, Wellington Street would be approximately twice the width we see today. Still a favourite contender amongst the outspoken individuals who have studied and work with Ottawa urban plans, Bennett's proposal was unfortunately not carried out with the changes brought on by the start of the First World War. By the time the economy was recuperating and stable enough to follow the plans, a modernist perspective dominated and the City Beautiful proposals were considered outdated.

¹du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*. PWC

²du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*. PWC

DESIGNED VIEW ALONG WELLINGTON (1916) Benett³

Prime minister William Lyon Mackenzie King was an enthusiast of planning and architecture, as it is said that his favourite hobby was fundraising and planning the Canadian capital of the future. It was under his direct supervision that French planner **Jacques Greber** was commissioned in what would be the longest and most expansive plan of Ottawa to date. The Greber plan came in two phases, a **1938** partial version and a 1950 adaptation after the war, General Report and Plan for the National Capital. Placed on halt during war times, Greber's first plan reimaged the Judicial precinct/triad, as its centre feature stood a beaux arts inspired building which in plan opens up in a circular motion speaking to Veaux's landscape plans of Parliament. This is later revised as Cormier's design for the Supreme Court were completed between 1939-1946. The war had a secondary effect on the site holding four of Ottawa's 17 Temporary Buildings west of the Supreme Court.

The comprehensive **1950** General Report and Plan showed a change in values and style for many aspects including the design for the Judicial Precinct and denotes a clear architectural distinction from north to south along Wellington Street. **Jaques Greber** is accredited with trademarks in Ottawa such as the Greenbelt, to a large extent Gatineau Park, the 417, and the removal of street cars, neon signs and the trains/ train station from the city's centre. A modernist in ideals, Greber exploited the automobile as the great invention of the 20th Century creating for it a series of scenic driveways. A shift occurs, particularly in comparison to Bennett's Beaux Arts approach of the wide city boulevard for Greber's picturesque driveways.

³ Bennett, Edward H. (1915) *Report of the Federal Plan Commission (Holt Report)*. Chicago. Dwg 18

The significance of the vertical reaching roof (chateau roof) in Greber's Plan:

Through the personal intervention of Prime Minister Mackenzie King and Jaques Greber's wish to continue the spirit of place, the picturesque Neo Gothic architectural style was selected to represent the national image in all buildings north of the Wellington Street Divide emphasized vertically by their towers and chateau style roofs. This decision gave shape to the unique architectural style of the Supreme Court in order to follow the Spirit of Place with its neighbouring Justice Building. Designed in an Art Deco architectural style, the supreme court was to have a flat roof and to many resembled more the national image of the United States than Canada. It was then by Prime Minister Mackenzie King's decision that a Chateau style roof was added to the building giving it its unique character and positively enhancing the Ottawa skyline in the national image from the river.

JUSTICE BUILDING (1927) Interior Courtyard Elevation⁵

⁵ Federal Heritage Building Review Office (1982) *Building Reports Volume 28* 87-34 to 87-41. p.101

By the **1970's** the **National Capital Commission (NCC)** dedicated more attention and emphasis on the development of the federal assets in the national image along Wellington Street and devised a 'Core Area Plan'. This plan spoke to the growing needs of the government and the visual role Wellington Street plays as a metaphorical divide between government and town. More recent adaptations of the plan have come with the **1987** Development Plan and the **2006** Site Capacity and Long Term Development Plan for the Parliamentary and Judicial Precincts (duToitt, Allsopp, Hillier). These plans play particular attention to the roles of crown and town divisions in a time where the federal government continues to grow south of the Wellington Street Divide and occupying the 'town'. The key to maintaining this clear distinction visually and physically present is in maintaining key players to Parliamentary and Judicial functions north of the divide on the Capital Plateau and supporting systems/services south into the town.

As this thesis continues to explore and draw parallels from various plans, learning from its history and significance, it will address the main principles not only theoretically but also in its design. A design that adds contemporary value to National image will reflect not only its place in the capital region but the heritage the site holds and will create a conversation as to how it has developed through the years.

⁶du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*. PWC

2.4 Planning and Design Principles:

The 2006 revision for the Site Capacity and Long Term Development Plan for the Parliamentary and Judicial Precinct Area is organized with their planning and design principles as their foundation upon which they will extend and expand the characteristic qualities present. The main principles to consider would maintain two building triads focused on central lawns (the Parliamentary and Judicial Triads- Judicial is to be completed) with two dominant symbols- Centre Block and the Supreme Court- on the two riverside promontories. The main goal of the Long Term Vision Plan, which this thesis seeks to uphold, is the combination of the celebration of capital symbols along with the accommodation of practical functions.¹

¹du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*. PWC

²Velasquez, Diana (2015) *Parliamentary and Judicial Triads*.

What are the Planning and Design Principles:³

1. **Urban Morphology**
2. Land Form
3. Landscape Types
4. **A Confederation Boulevard Address**
5. **Strong Connections to the River**
6. **Pavilions in a Landscape**
7. Primary Symbols and Promontories
8. **Two Building Triads**
9. Additional Accommodation
10. A Connecting Concourse Spine
11. **Balances Asymmetry**
12. **Architectural Composition**
13. A Pedestrian Promenade; A Concave Valley Head
14. Driveways
15. Paths and Trails
16. Visitor Reception and Screening
17. A Secure Parliamentary Precinct
18. Vehicle Screening
19. Parking
20. Materiel Handling
21. Precinct Transit
22. Tour Buses
23. **Environmental Sustainability**

The Planning and Design Principles are an important consideration because they show today's values and approaches to a heritage site. For the design proposal, the principles which directly relate are 1, 4, 5, 6, 8, 11, 12 & 23.

³du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*. PWC

2.5 *The Judicial Precinct:*

What is the Judicial Precinct vs. what it can become:

There is a common misconception regarding heritage architecture which maintains it should pertain to a neglected building. In fact, heritage spans much further than the building footprint. It encompasses heritage sites and intangible heritage. How architecture reacts and adds value to these places is just as important as its contribution to heritage buildings. In Part one of this thesis you have been introduced to the Capital Plateau as housing symbols of identity and in Part two you have been introduced to its components, its history of urban planning and the considerations for its future. Due to its long history and significance the entirety of the Capital Plateau holds value and a unique ability to emphasize the significance of its architecture. This is the power of the Capital Plateau. This is the Power of the Judicial precinct.

The Capital Plateau is made up of an upper plateau (Parliament Hill) and a lower plateau upon which the Judicial Precinct is located.¹ Currently the Judicial Precinct houses some important buildings but the landscape is not inviting to the public. Containing various green spaces, amongst which is the proposed site, it has

¹du Toit, Allsopp, Hillier (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan, Parliamentary and Judicial*. PWC

no paths and lacks the character and feeling of exploration encouraged in the Parliamentary Precinct. Left unfinished, as per the aforementioned urban plans, the Judicial Precinct, mostly in comparison to the Parliamentary precinct, is neglected. Do not mistake this for derelict. The site is prosperous and well maintained, however the lack of the completion of the judicial triad is felt as it breaks the composition of the Capital Plateau and disrupts its 'Spirit of Place'.

The completion of the judicial triad would spark a conversation about the Capital Plateau as a whole, adding value to the entirety of the site, not just the Parliamentary Precinct, and solidify its place within Canadian identity. The reflection of the Parliamentary Triad in the Judicial Triad would speak about Canada's democratic identity and how it functions. Furthermore, the completion of the judicial triad has the ability to create a destination, expand the area and strengthen the identity of each one of its buildings' programs through proximity and accessibility. Marking the longest span of time since a building has been constructed on the Capital Plateau (the last project being Library and Archives Canada 1963-1967) the completion of the Judicial triad provides an opportunity to leave a mark on the evolution of the Capital Plateau in reflection of the values of our time marking Canada's sesquicentennial.

²Velasquez, Diana (2015) *Aerial View of the Capital Plateau*. Photograph

The Proposed Site:

The immediate site contains an area of about 5,500 m² in the west block of the Judicial triad. It is denoted between the boundaries of Wellington Street to the south and a series of interior service roads at the remaining three sides. Although relatively flat, it does have a slope that could have an impact on the design. The site is lined with trees.

Character Defining Elements: the Capital Plateau

The project can be viewed at two scales. The larger scale of the identity and integrity of the Capital Plateau as a whole and the more intimate scale of the judicial triad and the effect that placing a building on its vacant west block can have. As a cohesive entity, the character defining elements will be examined as they are carried through the entirety of the plateau and with notable exceptions as the architectural style has evolved.

¹ Velasquez, Diana (2015) *The Proposed Site looking West*. Photograph

1 Relationship with nature and the River, Verticality & Towers

The composition of the buildings have a picturesque quality with nature. This is accentuated in their verticality rising above it. As pavilion buildings they have facades towards the river as well as along Wellington St.

2 Steep Roofs, Accentuation of its Verticality, Materiality

The high slope of the roofs is unique to Plateau architecture (with the exception of Library and Archives). The materiality (copper) and use of dormers is also significant. This and towers add to the effect of verticality across the plateau.

3 Rhythm of Fenestration, Monolith materiality (some)

Fenestration on the plateau follows neo-gothic and art deco principles and all contain a rhythm rather than randomness in placement. The functions work around the fenestrations rather than dictating them. This is accentuated in the more modern buildings by a smoother materiality and monolith appearance.

4 the Town & Crown Dichotomy

Wellington as the divide, serves to separate the character of the architecture north and south of the plateau. It provides a wall, a backdrop of sorts for the architecture in the national image along the city. Its unique condition and cultural landscape has the ability to dictate identity and must be considered in design.

¹ Vaz, Karishma (2012) *Making an Impact in Ottawa*. Carleton University Website, accessed 2015

¹ Public Works and Government Services Canada (2015) Newly Replaces Copper Roof. accessed 2015

¹ Register of Historic Places Canada (2004) *View of Main Facade, Library and Archives Canada*. accessed 2015

⁴ Past Ottawa (1940/2013) *Wellington St in front of Bank of Canada*. accessed 2015

Part three: The Federal Courts

Allward, Walter S. (1920) IUSTITIA, Judicial Symbol, Supreme Court of Canada

¹ Hennesy, Edward (1984) *Courthouses of the Commonwealth*, 'Foreword'. 1st Ed.

² Alberta Laws in English (2015) *Iustitia, Judicial Symbol in Canada*, Website

“Our courthouses are monuments to our legal tradition, its noble purposes and occasional tragic miscarriages. They evoke the memory of historical events and of the aspirations, frustrations and fears of the many people...They are theatres for high drama and objective symbols of our guaranteed freedoms.”¹

Hennesy, Edward (1984) p.4

Part three of this thesis explores the role of the Federal Courts branch of the Canadian Judicial System. Currently dispersed throughout central Ottawa, the Federal Courts seeks to find a permanent home for its headquarters in the Capital Plateau. In order to accommodate the many necessities of the courts, one must first understand their role, their requirements to function and their character defining elements. Part Three learns from site visits to the current federal facilities, research and conversations. Through critical analysis of what they are provided with currently, case studies and an investigation of their needs, this thesis can provide a more thorough and appropriate design proposal in the coming parts.

¹ Velasquez, Diana (2015) *The Proposed Site looking West*. Photograph

Canada’s Judicial System:

¹Velasquez, Diana (2015) *Canadian Judicial System* based on information from Department of Justice Canada

Canada's Judicial System:

Canada's Judicial System plays a key role in the functional and celebratory aspects of the federal government and its development. As established in part 1.2, the judicial system is one of the three branches that come together to form Canada's democratic identity-along with legislative and executive- to uphold its national values and therefore are an integral part of what we understand to be Canadian National Identity.

As seen in the diagram titled 'Canada's Judicial System', it is broken down into three fully independent branches, connected only by the power of the Supreme Court as the ultimate authority of appeal. Although to thoroughly understand Canadian identity one may need to properly understand the intricate role of each, this thesis will focus only on the information relevant to the Federal Courts of Canada branch of the Judicial system. The significance of this chapter then, lies not in comprehensively understanding the courts, but grasping enough information to interpret their significance as part of the whole, and further explore their functions and programs in order to provide adequate facilities in the design proposal found in part four. The goal of these explorations is to begin to understand how our sense of identity is strengthened as we become more educated and the role of architecture as a symbol of identity in provoking a conversation for this dissemination to commence.

3.1 Understanding the Federal Courts:

Our Judicial System, and in turn the Federal Courts Branch, makes reference to our multi-nationalistic background by establishing a strong sense of identity by unifying and respecting diversity.

“Canada’s national legal system reflects two long-standing and important legal traditions, that of the English common law and that of the French and Roman civil law. The Federal [Courts] are structured so as to ensure that both legal traditions are taken into account and respected in the interpretation and administration of federal laws.”¹

How do the Federal Courts fit into the Canadian Judicial System?

Made up of the Federal Court of Appeal, the Tax Court of Canada, the Federal Court and lastly, Federal Administration Tribunals, the Federal Courts of Canada comprise one of three branches in the Canadian Judicial System. In a summary, the Federal Courts branch deals with the relationship of the individual to the federal government -ie. Tax Court or immigration cases- and is also the court of law with the authority to hold federal departments of the government accountable for their actions.

¹Court Administration Services, Canada (2015) *The Role of the Federal Court of Appeal* (2015-09-09)

What is the role of the Federal Courts of Canada?

Their role is to ensure that the federal government and all its agents act within the bounds of the law when making decisions affecting individual Canadians. As it is a statutory court, its jurisdiction is derived from and protected by legislation. It is a court of law, of equity and of admiralty, and it is a superior court of record having both civil and criminal jurisdiction.¹

As it holds sole jurisdiction, all cases are overseen by judges appointed to the federal courts. The court's headquarters and therefore all judges are relocated to Ottawa as a home base from which they can travel to hear cases in 18 cities across Canada.²

Why is a Federal Courts Building an ideal proposal for the proposed Site?

Given the significance of the Federal Courts within the Canadian Judicial System, and consequently the significance of the Judicial System in our understanding of National and Democratic Identity, it is surprising that the Federal Courts do not currently have a central location. The current functions are spread out over a few buildings (which are shared with non-governmental functions) in downtown Ottawa, their addresses seldom disclosed. Due to their locations and restrictions by the use and buildings themselves, there are many present concerns with their current state. With over a century of urban planning proposing the Federal/ Exchequer Court Building to complete the judicial triad it is a program worthy of the location whose role ties closely with the site. The Program will further analyze and attempt to meet needs that are currently lacking.

¹Court Administration Services, Canada (2015) *The Role of the Federal Court of Appeal* (2015-09-09)

²Court Administration Services, Canada (2015) *The Registry Offices* (2016-03-18)

Character Defining Elements of the Courts:

As a celebrated courthouse, the Supreme Court of Canada is used as the best example for its C.D.E.

Entrance Condition:

The entrance condition is a celebrated space for the public. Sitting on a podium, the court continues to rise as the entrance condition guides you to a central staircase. The materiality is rich and although it is in an Art Deco architectural style, neo-gothic principles of light and shadow are strongly seen.

Materiality:

The Materiality of the courts is luxurious, simple yet full of texture. It changes drastically from the entrance condition to the interior of the courtrooms but each portray the character and authority of the courts.

the Courtroom:

Its materials and colours play a big role in its character as does the unique bench accommodating all of its judges. It is naturally lit through the courtyards of the building.

The Library:

Simple, yet following materiality previously seen, the Supreme Court's library is located within its dormers. It is flooded with natural light and light neutrals against the dark wood, leather bound books and lighting elements.

¹⁻⁴Court Administration Services, Canada (2015) *Supreme Court of Canada Pictures* (2016-02-12)

The People and the Courts: Judicial Values

“The concept of justice I take to be defined, then, by the role of its principles in assigning rights and duties and in defining the appropriate division of social advantages.”¹

The judicial system has a key role within our democratic identity in big part due to our national values. For this thesis then, one of the central investigations became identifying the values we as a society hold our judicial system to. Within a democratic society, we believe the system should be secure, yet hold objectivity and most importantly transparency towards the society. These two values then come together as the shell within which the public is allowed Justice-another national value in a fair society.

In contrast, the Federal Court has narrowed down three virtues, not of what it should be as with the national values we have embedded it with, but to which it holds itself. These are ‘Droit’ french for Law, equity (fairness) and admiralty. These virtues and values are central in our understanding and willingness as a society to participate and give authority and accept consequences from courts of justice. These values should then be carried into architectural concepts in the design proposal stage.

JUDICIAL VALUES

¹Rawls, John (1971) *A theory of Justice*. Harvard University Press. Revised 1999

² Court Administration Services (2007) *Coat of Arms for the Federal Courts of Canada*. Eva Pilar- Cas

Conceptual Architectural Standards in the Courts:

Can you picture a courthouse? What are the elements that make it stand out from the rest of the built fabric? From 'Courthouses of the Commonwealth', by John McConnel, below are certain standards that courthouses maintain as part of their identity. These are ideologies rather than specific architectural elements.

Find evidence of a certain standard that make our courthouses like each other and unlike other building types:¹

1. They must speak to society about and the law. "we are a **just** society"
2. Public governmental buildings in a democratic state and should evidence the democratic notion of access for all. "we are a **democratic** people."
3. Make the process of justice seem to be one of the highest purposes of society, by being presented as monuments-as buildings of great social stature. "I am a **monument to justice**."
4. Focus on a special theatrical space, the courtroom, as the unequivocal center of the drama of deciding what is just.
5. Share with all other buildings of whatever function the recognition of the individual human being, respecting both physical size and spiritual uniqueness. "We are a **humane culture**."

¹McConnell, John C. (1984) *Courthouses of the Commonwealth*. "The Houses of the Law" Massachusetts.

3.2 Symbols of Justice: Symbols of the Courts

To establish and maintain authority and significance, the judicial system must function upholding a set of values. These values are often interpreted to society as iconic images or symbols of the courts. They become the allegorical personifications of the moral forces to which we hold our judicial system.

What is a Symbol?

In this chapter, symbols will be both (a) a physical representations of events, experiences, concepts and values as well as (b) iconic images associated with the courts or the justice system.

What are the Universal Symbols associated with Judicial Systems?

The most famous of the symbols of justice is perhaps ‘Justitia’¹, also referred to as Lady Justice. She is the personification of the morals of justice. Often time, she is with ‘Prudentia’ or Prudence. Prudentia simply refers to the ability to govern and discipline oneself by the use of reason. Prudentia is then an extension of the moral forces of justice.

¹

Symbols of Justice represented in Canadian Identity:

“Justice is the first virtue of social institutions, as truth is of systems of thought.”¹

The following symbols are present almost as the cornerstones of the Supreme Court of Canada both sculpted by Walter S Allward, also sculptor of the Vimy Ridge Memorial.

²

Justitia (Iustitia):

Right Side of the Supreme Court of Canada. Typically pictured with a blindfold to show the objectivity of the law, a balance to represent evidence provided by both sides and a double edge sword to represent the active actions of the law for or against a party. (The statue found outside of Canada's Supreme Court is a unique representation missing the blindfold and the balance but is cloaked and hooded)

³

Veritas:

Left Side of the Supreme Court of Canada. Allegorical personification of the act of the search for the truth, as a foundation to the role and objectivity which should be present in the courts.

Prudentia:

Is not represented at the Supreme Court of Canada.

¹Rawls, John (1971) *A theory of Justice*. Harvard University Press. Revised 1999

²⁻³Ottawa Snapshots (2008) *Iustitia and Veritas*. Accessed 2016-03-23

3.3 Program: Learning from the current Courts

Program:

The Federal Court of Appeal, The Federal Court, & The Tax Court of Canada

Area Proposed:¹

47,982 m²

Due to the area required and the restrictions placed both by the size of the site and the continuity required to maintain a spirit of place in the National Image such as height, the area required may not be fully accommodated within one building, particularly when considering future expansion. A series of multiple scenarios as to the location of program and services were considered in order allow freedom in design decisions. In consultation with professionals familiar with the site and Parliamentary projects, it was decided that the best solution, for this thesis, would be to provide core program, services and judicial chambers in the Capital Plateau north of Wellington St. Secondary program will then be able to be placed in the currently vacant East Memorial Building directly south of the proposed site across Wellington St. In order to facilitate secure circulation, the current underground Parliamentary passageways which already include the site will be expanded to include the Memorial Buildings.

¹ARCHIAL | NORR , Government Experience Profile

Velasquez, Diana (2015) Program required from the future Federal Court

Visiting the current facilities:

The program presented in this section has been personally compiled through a series of tours of the facilities in fall 2015, located at 200 Kent St (Tax Court of Canada) and 90 Sparks St (Federal Courts and Courts of the Court Marshall) as well as multiple conversations with representatives of each.

Although it would have been ideal, the program for the past proposal for the Pierre Elliott Trudeau Judicial Building is not publicly available, and due to the time period elapsed, the growth of the courts has made it outdated.

A secondary decision has also been made of readapting the public and the currently private elements of the courts in order to establish a strong relationship between society and the federal courts and in turn strengthen the sense of identity in both the courts and by extension democratic and national identity.

¹Velasquez, Diana(2015) Program Diagram

Core Program: *North of Wellington (Crown)*

Although the entirety of the program is fundamental to the proper functionality of the courts, it has to be prioritized. In fitting with the research component of this thesis, the program which will be most developed would be that which centers around the public experience. In functionality the program will variate vertically through the buildings with public spaces, court rooms, public services etc all occurring in the lower levels and as services and functions become smaller and more private they will ascend to higher floors. In keeping with the current judicial fit up standards, judicial chambers should be located on the periphery of the building with access to their assistants and services very much in symmetry with the layout of the Justice Building adding dialogue to the triad. The **Courtrooms, Court Support, Libraries, Administration, Judicial Functions and character defining spaces** compose the headquarters and are detailed below.

The Courtrooms: *Symbolic Significance of the Project (heart)*

The courtrooms are the most symbolic of all the functions and facilities within the program. They are themselves symbols of justice and the acts of resolution and equity. There are set standards that set these rooms as unique and powerful. The key players in a hearing dominate the space with roughly 60% or more of the courtroom's area being designated as the litigation area. Facing the judge's bench, the crown and defendant's lawyers are separated from the spectators by a physical barrier. (Changes in design often add to this by arbitrarily defining a boundary).

The Courtrooms themselves are composed of litigation areas, (Judges, court administration, spectator section doors with small windows.¹ Support services however are required.

¹Supreme Court of Illinois (2011) *Minimum Courtroom Standards in the State of Illinois*.

The Courtrooms: Extended Services

The courtroom, although all the public sees, may not be a stand alone facility. A certain amount of support services are required for the dynamic of the courtroom to function properly. The first is the requirement for two completely independent circulation spaces to arrive at the courtroom. The first is the public circulation and the second is judge circulation. (As an objective power, the judge may have no contact with the public-- this becomes a major consideration in the circulation and design of the entire building.) The judge then requires a chamber attached to the courtroom. The judicial chamber is not personal and will be used by any judge presiding over a hearing. Access to both of this occurs next to the bench at the front of the courtroom while the public entrance is at the back.

Further, courtrooms require for the public, defendants and crown, a series of break up rooms, waiting areas, information desks, translation booths, press rooms and security. (the hearings at the Federal Courts are rarely televised so a press room becomes an additional rather than a requirement.)

Court Support Services: the Public

A series of services are available to the public which relate to court functions. These include:

1. Registry Services
2. Corporate Services
3. Archives
4. Document drop off
5. Public Viewing Areas for court related documents
6. Court Administration Services

In my design proposal, the location of these services is contained in its lower levels in combination with a proposal to increase and improve public spaces in the courts.

Court Support Services: the Federal Courts

All of the court support services previously stated require public desks and services but also work for the functionality of the courts and its employees. These additional services must be connected to the public ones but also have the ability to function securely. These services include:

1. Registry Services
2. Corporate Services
3. Archives
 - Ongoing court archives
 - Archives of cases in the past year (for appeal purposed)
 - Archives for cases in appeal
 - Secured archives
 - Archives administration and offices
4. Court Administration Services

the Libraries: Inviting selected society

Through my visits I found that some of the spaces that best represented and contained the character of the courts were their libraries and their extensive collections. -For example, did you know the Tax Court of Canada contains the largest and most rare collection of tax books in Canada?-

These spaces are currently in the secured, private realm of the courts unable to be seen or accessed by any member of the public.

A consideration in strengthening the relationship between the courts and the public would be to **(a) Bring the libraries to a public centre, and allow visual connections to the character these bring to the courts** and **(b) to allow select individuals into these spaces**. For example, open up the space to law students or law societies who could make use of its resources.

Judges:

Once appointed, judges are required to relocate to the city of Ottawa. They are also to be provided with a judicial chamber, judicial assistants and a personal law clerk (although due to financial proceedings this often takes months). There are currently nearly 100 sitting judges in the Federal Courts. These include:

- a. 22 Sitting judges- Tax Court of Canada
- b. Chief Justice - Tax Court of Canada
- c. Vice Chief Justice- Tax Court of Canada (Only division with this position)
- d. 87 sitting judges- Federal Courts/ Federal Courts of Appeal
- e. Chief Justice for the Federal Court of Canada
- f. Chief Justice for the Federal Court of Appeal

Judge's requirements for the program then include:

- 1. Judicial Chamber
 - Minimum 400 ft²
 - Must include: W/c and exterior views
 - 2. Secured Circulation
 - To courtrooms
 - Judge's only elevator
 - Judge's only parking level/zone
 - 3. Personnel who require accommodation
 - Law Clerks (All work together on a separate level.)
 - Judicial Assistants
 - Security/driver (Require a space in the building)
 - 4. Additional
 - Meeting Spaces/Committee rooms
 - Judge's Lounge
 - Additional offices for ongoing cases on site to review documents
 - Reading rooms
-

Additional Services to be considered:

1. Security
 - Separate security into courtrooms
 - Some security on each floor
 - Main security offices
2. Boardrooms/ Conference rooms
 - Meeting rooms
 - Committee rooms
 - Project rooms
 - Motions room
3. Support
 - Mail Services
 - Distribution/ Circulation
 - Emergency exits/services
 - Underground connections to Judicial Precinct +
 - Parking (Underground - to include security screening)
4. Lounges, reading rooms/ break spaces

Character Defining Spaces: to be maintained

1. Halls of Honour
 - Paintings (4'x3') of past and sitting Chief Justices of each Court
 - Colour- Tax Court Purple, Federal Courts Black and Gold
 - Portraits of past and sitting judges
2. Lucien Cardin Conference Room (Tax Court of Canada)
3. Libraries and Books

Part four: Design Proposal

Velasquez, Diana (2015) Judicial Triad- Bird's eye view

“...The best way to make real architecture is by letting a building evolve out of the culture and place.”¹

Mockbee, Samuel(2001)

¹ Mockbee, Samuel(2001) *Ethics or Moral Philosophy*. Vol. 11 Springer. pg 188

Part four of this thesis will use the information learned in parts one, two and three as the foundations for the completion of the Judicial Triad with the design of the Federal Courts of Canada building. The goal of the design is to provide a building that speaks of its **time, place** and **significance in Canadian Identity**. That **adds value to the National Image** north of Wellington Street, and provides a much needed home for the now dispersed branch of the judicial system. The program presented has been researched through site visits and interviews with different branches of these courts and will aim to uphold current character defining elements of each. The design, although comprehensive, will be specifically oriented at enriching the public experience in the landscape, its public spaces, its courtrooms and therefore its public image.

4.1 Precedent Studies:

As the program and site are unique, not many precedent studies are entirely relevant. In order to arrive at a solid understanding, precedent studies were done in multiple categories. The main categories were: Precedent studies on site (proposed Judicial Precinct site), Precedent Studies in the national Image (extending to other buildings on the Capital Plateau), Precedent studies of courthouses and courthouse complexes, and lastly precedent studies of a modern approach to neo gothic style and ideals. The precedent studies presented are only a few key examples of the research and the most useful/ significant demonstration of findings.

Moving forward in the design stage, precedent studies such as the West Block Courtyard which overlaps categories (precedent study on site, and modern interpretation of neo gothic) would be ideal.

¹ Arch Daily(2012) *United States Courthouse*, Accessed 2015 (Adjacent page)

Courthouses:

1. United States Federal Courthouse

Architecture

H3 Hardy Collaboration

2011

Jackson, Mississippi, U.S.A

\$121,000,000

400,000 ft² (37,100 m²)

What Works:

Good Public language
Indirect light and design of the courtroom
Separation of Offices and Courtrooms
Welcoming grand entrance
little to no surrounding context to comment on
good division between public and secured spaces.

What Doesn't Work:

Exterior language doesn't inform where the courts are
Assume the distinction is the glazing.

Shapes. Building is rectilinear with a round courtyard. courts are rounded

circulation to the "exterior" - courtyard

Courtroom

Experience

- 1 COURTROOM
- 2 CHAMBERS AND SUPPORT
- 3 OFFICES
- 4 RECEPTION PLAZA
- 5 CIRCULATION CORRIDORS
- 6 PARKING

2. High Court of Canberra

Edwards Madigan Torzillo and Briggs

1975-1980

Canberra, Australia

\$46,500,000

200,000 ft² (18,500 m²)

What Works:

Centered around public experience

Isolated site

Park outside of site refers to Australia's
Aboriginal past/ relations- constantly
used as a centre of protest

Used locally sourced materials for most
of the project.

Proximity to Parliament- Strong symbol-
ic significance

Visitor is made to feel aware of the Aus-
tralian Judicial System¹

What Doesn't Work:

Architectural Style does not speak to
other courts or national significance

¹High Court of Australia (2010) *The Building*. accessed 2016

3. Law Courts & Robson Square Complex

Arthur Erickson

1979

Vancouver, BC, Canada

\$139,000,000

1,300,000 ft² (120,700 m²)

What Works:

“Horizontal Highrise”

35 Courtrooms

Public Aspect - Square and Courts Complex

Character Defining colours and materials in courtroom

natural lighting in courtroom

multi use of the site and incorporation of sustainability, public context and future expansion.

What Doesn't Work:

Hard to decipher language of courthouse from the exterior

entrances seem a little hidden

Differentiation between public and secured circulation

¹Arthur Erickson (2016) *Portfolio*. online resource accessed 2016

4. Sandra Day O'Connor US Courthouse

Richard Meier & Associates

2000

Phoenix, Az, USA

\$123,000,000

550,000 ft² (51,000 m²)

What Works:

The Court itself is very interesting
Court becomes the heart of the building
Good public area
Good circulation between public and secured
for judges
Unique architecture works with the little con-
text that surrounds it

What Doesn't Work:

Architectural Language is unique but doesn't
speak to the typical character of the court
Unsure about how security works
Offices on the first level below the court

¹Sveivan, Megan (2011) *United States Courthouse, Meier*. Arch Daily

5. Thunder Bay Consolidated Courts

Adamson Associates
2013

Thunder Bay, ON, Canada
\$247,700,000
250,000 ft² (23,200 m²)

What Works:

Grand entrance
creates its own character
welcoming to the public

What Doesn't Work:

Went away from formal character of the court
Courtroom setting is not overly clear
exterior language doesn't comment on function

¹Adamson Associates Architects (2013) Online Portfolio. accessed 2016

6. John M. Roll US Courthouse

Ehrlich Architects

2013

Yuma, Az, USA

\$27,600,000

60,000 ft² (5,600 m²)

What Works:

Attempts to make a connection with the US Supreme Court. Considers context

Does so using local materials and building techniques which makes sense for its climate
grand entrance

good distribution to the court spaces

indirect lighting in the court rooms

Good Public and secured circulation

What Doesn't Work:

Courtrooms are on second level

Don't understand security on lower levels

¹Anderson, Lawrence (2014) John M. Roll US Courthouse, Ehrlich. Arch Daily. accessed 2016

7. Wayne L. Morse US Courthouse

Morphosis/ Thom Mayne
2006

Eugene, Oregon, USA

\$79,000,000

266,700 ft² (24,800 m²)

What Works:

Unique court rooms that integrate natural light and character defining materials.

highly secure building

The courtrooms are integrated into the overall shape of the building

Public interior and exterior spaces that welcome art exhibits

What Doesn't Work:

Architectural Language is unique but doesn't speak to the typical character of the court

¹Morphopedia (2009) *Morphosis Architects Online Portfolio*. Accessed 2015

4.2 Design Considerations:

Learning from Context

Methodology:

The design process has been approached in response to various factors and as a compilation of the information gathered in the research from national identity, the capital plateau and the federal courts. One of the common themes in historical references to the building to be built on the proposed site speaks of the dialogue between the proposed building and the Justice Building. Many of the considered proposals are based on this fact. The proposed building should be of similar mass and character. Part of the character of the national identity is the seemingly symmetrical design, which at a closer look is asymmetrical. For example, towers which appear to be in symmetry are of different proportions and dimensions.

The methodology will then be to begin design process based on a strong dialogue with not only the Justice building but all of the proposal's surrounding context. A variety of methods and proposals will be considered and investigated. As a representation of its time and values, the design proposal needs to add value to a significant heritage site and adapt to respect its character defining elements in a contemporary way.

Design Considerations and Challenges in the Design

The building stands as a monument to the Canadian Judicial System and the headquarters for the Federal Courts of Canada. As such, it is important to differentiate the Federal Courts of Canada Building as a headquarters to that specific branch of the judicial system rather than just a courthouse within it. This means that the majority of its users will work and function outside of the courtrooms rather than within them. The courtroom then becomes more than a destination; it becomes the signifier of the activeness of justice and the values both held by and perceived of, the judicial system.

Identity in Architecture:

This thesis holds that in order to achieve identity in architecture, a building needs to successfully hold three important requirements. It should be in a **location** of significance to the history or sense of identity. It should house a **function** that plays an important role to the meaning, history, or values of that society/ identity. Lastly, it should pay homage to its **context**, meaning its time, its location, its surroundings, its history its values and its goals.

The real success comes in being able to accomplish this architecturally. How can a building represent the significance of its function, in a location already central to the sense of national identity? Furthermore, how does this condition create an opportunity for the function's identity itself to be strengthened?

the Site:

1. Heritage:

As previously stated in part two, the architecture of the Capital Plateau is the epitome of architecture in the national image. Due to the prominence of the location, it would be believed that anything built on the site will play a role in its evolution and history, therefore the design proposal shall **add value** to the site and the **‘Spirit of Place’** present.

In consideration of its intangible heritage of urban planning throughout the century, the selected location is in keeping with program and massing/footprint of its proposals. The creation of the Federal Courts of Canada Building will add value to the heritage and future of the Capital Plateau through the completion of the Judicial triad. As a reflection of the Parliamentary triad, the composition has been studied. Differing from the Parliamentary triad however, the Judicial triad has been constructed over three different time periods, of different materials and architectural style. The building then reflects its time in the evolution of the site’s heritage.

¹ Ledent, Christopher (2013) *Parliament [Capital Plateau] at Sunrise*. Ottawa Photography 365. accessed 2015

2. Context:

A major consideration due to its prominent location and heritage surroundings is its context. To add value to the site, the design proposal should present a design indicative of the values of its time, but should maintain certain restrictions that speak to its surroundings and respects their values.

The first is building heights and compositions. The building should be built in pavilion style architecture with each side creating a main facade, in a composition in keeping with that already found on the capital plateau. Following this composition also means reaching certain building heights, respecting the extent of boundaries (for example, it should be as equidistant from wellington as the justice building) and protecting certain views.

The building should be of similar massing to the Justice building as it becomes a triad reflecting some of the values found in the parliamentary triad. This relationship is examined in the images below in plan, foot print and elevation.

“Ethic standards and a demand for high-quality design and execution, sensitive to the cultural-historic context, are prerequisites for the planning process. Architecture of quality in historic areas should give proper consideration to the given scales, particularly with reference to building volumes and heights. It is important for new development to minimize direct impacts on important historic elements, such as significant structures...”¹

–Unesco , Vienna Memorandum “World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture”

¹UNESCO (2005) *Vienna Memorandum ‘World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture: Managing the Historic Landscape’*. Item 22

Part Four: Design Proposal

Building Heights and Materiality along Wellington St.

Massing: Composition through context

Progressive approach to Footprint

3. Architectural Style:

As investigated in Part one, the relationship between architectural style and architecture as a symbol of national identity is closely interconnected. In Canada, our Parliamentary buildings, the buildings most closely connected to our national identity, are in the neo-gothic style. In response, much of the Capital Plateau attempts to follow its principles or aesthetic. However, **does this mean that any building north of Wellington st on the Plateau is required to be neo-gothic in style?** Although many heritage professionals and architects argue that it does, this thesis holds that it must be of a style which reflects its time, but holds at its core a set of principles that reflect modern interpretations of neo-gothic principles. As time went on, the newer buildings on the plateau began to depart from its neo-gothic roots. The Supreme Court of Canada is an Art Deco building with a Chateau inspired roof to assimilate the style into a neo-gothic approximation. The most criticized building of the complex is Library and Archives Canada, anchoring the plateau to the west in a modern, decidedly anti-historic style.

As the investigations for this thesis have progressed, it has become apparent that although it does not fit the national image, Library and Archives represents the values of its time and shows the evolution of values across the Capital Plateau.

“... contemporary architecture and preservation of the historic urban landscape should avoid all forms of pseudo-historical design, as they constitute a denial of both the historical and the contemporary alike. One historical view should not supplant others, as history must remain readable, while continuity of culture through quality interventions is the ultimate goal.”¹

-Unesco , Vienna Memorandum “World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture”

Art Deco principles:

1. Symmetry
2. Verticality/ Geometry
3. Monolithic Masses

Neo-gothic principles:

1. Assymetry (subtle)
2. Light and Shadow
3. Light and intricate structure
4. Steep Sloping Roofs
5. Accentuating Verticality

¹UNESCO (2005) Vienna Memorandum ‘World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture: Managing the Historic Landscape’. Item 21

Function and National Values embedded in its function:

Through investigation into Canadian national values and the role of the Federal Courts, part three defines three values society perceives the courts should function with in order strengthen the relationship between the public and the courts. These are: Transparency, Security and Justice.

These values are translated into architectural concepts at the design stage and play a big role in the understanding of the building.

Furthermore, a major consideration is the program and the function of the building distinguishing symbolic spaces and program of significance along with public and private functions. The organization of the building relies heavily on the interpretation of the significance and requirements of the functions of the courts.

The Values of our time:

Sustainability:

A growing value in architecture, the concept of sustainability has become a priority in most public projects. The changes that make a project sustainable can be small or consume the design. With its prominent location, this project needs to consider sustainability as a significant value of its time and use materials with low carbon footprints, techniques that are sustainable and even provide accommodation for building systems such as rain water collection to occur.

With a footprint similar in mass to its surrounding context, this design proposes the removal of on grade parking on and around the site by providing underground facilities and restoring its surroundings into the wild escarpment present on the Capital Plateau. This move mirrors that made by the Supreme Court as the first building to provide underground parking and adds value believed to have been lost by the conversion from green onto on grade parking in the past.

Security in Accessibility:

An aspect of this proposal is the restrengthening of the Federal Courts identity in the public image. This thesis proposes that this happens through accessibility and opening up program and facilities in part to the public. However, federal functions have faced growing concerns in security. The design proposal then, integrates security as a major consideration in design by facilitating its enforcement without the need of typical security barriers, or barriers which would deter accessibility or harm the concept of strengthening the court's identity.

process sketches: Facades

process sketches: Facades

The context and architectural language considered is further explained and explored in Chapter 4.2 Design Considerations. The building is considered as part of a federal complex and therefore acts with its context to add value to the national image. Another important relationship explored in these sketches is that between a heavy materiality and glazing.

process sketches: Plan, Section, Experiential

Part Four: Design Proposal

sketch models/ site model

site model

site model

4.3 Design Overview:

The Federal Courts of Canada: *Headquarters*

This chapter utilizes the research learned in parts one, two and three through the design considerations found in part 4.2 for the following design proposal.

As the headquarters for the Federal Courts, the building's spaces contain a lot of private and functional program. The main focus on the design then, becomes the public image of the courts as its symbolic program. What this emphasizes, are the exterior spaces and its experiences, the central celebratory space (heart of the building-containing the courts and public realm) its entrance condition and relationship to the public and its context.

Some of the concepts explored become anthropomorphisms of the national values attributed to the courts in part three. The three strongest concepts are: Security, Transparency and Justice. These become tangible architectural components.

PERSPECTIVE
Looking West Along Wellington St.

How Context was Considered in the Design:

- 1 Site Plan- Judicial Precinct
- 2 Judicial Precinct Context Sketch

Due to the significance of the site, the way its context is understood and considered in its design becomes an integral part of the project. Dealing with heritage principles, in order to add value to the site, the design proposal seeks to speak to and respect all of its context. As seen in drawing 1 (Site Plan), the design proposal situates the building in like and in symmetry with the Justice building -following Art Deco principles-but presents a slightly larger foot print and asymmetry-following neo-gothic principles. The building's footprint is almost square but pays homage to both the Justice Building and Library and Archives by differentiating the central piece as an 'atrium' with a surrounding c-shape (Justice Building), the atrium space becoming a negative concept in the same proportions as the archives block that rises out of Library and Archives (the more solid taller space becomes the shelters clear space).

As the building rises, the heights of its main elements are designed to align with the heights of its neighbours. The solid slopes down from both Library and Archives, and the Supreme Court to a more human scale, as the glazing rises from this same level to match the height of the tower at the Justice Building completing the composition principles found throughout the Plateau.

The steep slopes on the roofs are treated in a more modern way. As the building's roof does not contain a slope, but rather the entire building is sloped. The verticality is accentuated in its axes and through the use of thicker mullions vertically.

The Central Space is differentiated from the exterior glazing by the use of clear glazing where the rest of the building is slightly more reflective. The central space is held by spider glass giving it a sense of lightness where the mullions on the exterior glazing and its reflected surroundings anchor the building to its site.

The Central Concepts behind the Architectural Strategy:

1 Heart of the Building

The building's central area becomes a celebrated space containing the public and courts floating above. This program speaks to the most symbolically significant function of the building, its center of justice sheltered by its outer shell (security) but open for all to see (transparency).

2 Axes of Transparency

Opening the building to the public these axes become central organizational tools throughout the design.

3 Framing Protected Views

The building's orthogonal organization is broken up by 45 degree corners, each of which are oriented to frame a view of tangible or intangible heritage. These include: The Supreme Court as its superior, Wellington Street as the connection between crown and town, the River and the character of the site and lastly West Memorial Building (if the program expands onto this site it would create a visual connection)

4 Public to Private Functions

Both in plan and in section the building distinguishes the accessibility/security to its functions. The higher you are the more private its functions, the further from the entrance in plan the more private.

5 Considering a Human Scale

As such a large scale building, the materiality slopes to a more human scale as it comes to its entrance condition, coming down from the heights of the Supreme Court and of Library and Archives Canada, conceptually allowing more accessibility to the program.

Part Four: Design Proposal

- Library & Archives Canada 1
- Design Proposal 2
- St Laurent Square 3
- Justice Building 4
- Confederation Building 5
- Supreme Court of Canada 6
- Cliff Street Plant 7
- Ottawa River 8
- Victoria Island 9

- Ottawa River 1
- Supreme Court of Canada 2
- Cliff Street Plant 3
- Confederation Building 4
- Justice Building 5
- St Laurent Square 6
- Design Proposal 7
- Wellington St. 8
- Bank of Canada 9
- St. Andrews Church 10
- East Memorial Building 11

SECTION

Public to Private Gradient of Program

Public

Private

ELEVATION
North (Facing the Ottawa River)

Materiality:

The materiality for the design proposal is derived from its context. As seen in part 4.2, one of the consideration studies done involved looking at the materiality of the buildings along Wellington St and found that the newer the building, the lighter the stone it seemed to use. As it progressed towards the most contemporary buildings (the Supreme Court and Library and Archives) their design principles aimed to achieve a monolithic building, accentuated by its materiality.

In keeping with its context and the evolution of the site, the building's materials are locally (or nearby) source, Ontario Limestone. It is made up of large rectangular blocks arranged vertically on the facade to accentuate the verticality and rhythms found along Wellington. The materiality of its history and its story slopes down from the heights of its neighbours as it is contrasted by glazing.

The glazing speaks to some of its context south of the Capital Plateau, such as the Bank of Canada, creating a stronger link. However, the glazing is designed to semi-reflect its surroundings, highlighting the site's heritage, and rise to a tower respecting the composition and spirit of place of the plateau. Its corners facing the Supreme Court and West Memorial Building also contain smaller towers, the ones which frame and protect the views to its neighbours.

Materiality Studies: Glazing

1. Rose Center for Earth and Space	NYC
Polshek Partnership Architects	2000

2. Time Warner Center	NYC
Skidmore, Owings & Merrill	2003

¹ Sandaker, Bjorn & Arne Eggen (1992) *The Structural Basis of Architecture*. Second Ed. Routledge pg. 296

² Sandaker, Bjorn & Arne Eggen (1992) *The Structural Basis of Architecture*. Second Ed. Routledge pg. 102

PERSPECTIVE
East Along Wellington St.

4.4 *the Public & the Courts: the Details*

A central aspect to the design proposal is the reinvigoration of the public image of the Federal Courts. In theory, by stimulating the relationship between the courts and the public at large, the building acts as a catalyst to strengthen both the identity of the courts and consequently the malleable Canadian identity explored earlier in Part One. This thesis argues that the completion of the Capital Plateau through the construction of the Federal Courts of Canada Building is enough to spark conversation and promote dissemination of knowledge of the Judicial System. To strengthen this concept and truly establish a connection between the public and the Federal Courts, however, this notion is carried as a major consideration in the design proposal through a series of concepts. The first is showcasing the significance of the courts. This is achieved by the concept of combining the public and main courtrooms in a celebratory, central space herein referred to as the **“Heart of the Building”**. Another concept takes the values that optimize the relationship between the public and the courts- **Transparency, Security and Justice**- as organizational tools in the design. (This has been explored above) In detail, this is accentuated by “axes of transparency” which create visual connections between the courts and its context.

The Hierarchy of the Courts:

The hierarchy of the courts is represented through its levels of accessibility in the central celebrated space.

The lower level contains the public realm. This level theoretically engages the public and is the first level at which the dissemination of knowledge occurs. The second level contains the 2 main courtrooms representing the two branches of the Federal Courts System- the Federal Courts of Canada and the Tax Court of Canada. On the final level of the central celebrated space one finds the Federal Courts of Appeal Courtroom. As the highest authority of the Federal Courts of Canada system before one reaches the Supreme Court, this Courtroom differs as it is preceded by three judges rather than one, and carries authority over both the Federal Courts of Canada and the Tax Courts of Canada. As such, It is situated to cover the space over the two courtrooms that sit below, and has an indirect visual link to the Supreme Court of Canada through the "transparency axis" located at the North East corner of the building.

Bringing Wellington to a more 'approachable' scale:

A challenge in working with a pavilion/ crown building north of Wellington Street and the Federal Courts program becomes the entrance condition. How can an entrance be both grand, and approachable/ not intimidating? The larger massing of the buildings only add to the challenge. In order to keep a simple entrance then, this design proposal finds an approach through the manipulation of its massing.

The concept:

By creating a massing strategy that brings the building closer to a human scale at its entrance it both highlights its entrance condition and increases perceived approachability by the public at large.

Part Four: Design Proposal

ELEVATION
South(Facing Wellington)

The Heart of the Building:

Floating above the atrium, the main courtrooms become the metaphorical and physical heart of the building reflecting the significance of the courts within the judicial system. Suspended above the central public space, they speak to the court's nature as a public forum, the transparency to the public at large, and to the significance of the courtrooms' role within the judicial system. Consequently, the proximity between the public and courtrooms attempts to make a statement regarding their significance to national values within Canadian culture and society.

As both the significance and accessibility of the courtrooms are showcased, the building- whose functions revolve around the courtrooms- itself becomes a symbolic protection of its sanctity from the corruptions of subjectivity in the objective eyes of the law. The concepts behind the design develop a utopian proposal based on symbols and values.

SECTIONAL PERSPECTIVE
CENTRAL CELEBRATORY SPACE

The Connections:

The central celebratory space floats isolated from the building above the central public space. Its connections to the building come in the form of bridges. With the concept of transparency between the courts and the public these bridges are situated in consideration to the two 'axes of transparency' located on the South-Wellington Street- Façade.

On the second and fourth level – respectively aligning with the two levels of courtrooms centrally located- the public entrances and bridges are offset and brace the south west axis on either side. For privacy and security, the judges transverse a completely separate system of circulation. Their access to the central courtrooms then occurs through a fifth level, fully enclosed (in translucent glazing) bridge. Once within the central space they can travel vertically to the respective judicial chamber for the case they are overseeing. As this happens on the first level which does not entertain public access, the transparency is achieved through aligning their bridge to the South East axis precisely. Security is still maintained through a differentiation in levels, series of glazing and translucent/opaque members.

SECTIONAL PERSPECTIVE
Connections to Central Celebratory Space

Axes of Transparency:

A central concept carried throughout the entire building is the notion that the court should operate with transparency as a public entity. The architectural representation of this notion is visible in many different parts of its language, one of which are the axes of transparency. The building's organizational system revolves around two different viewpoints.

The first is the transparency between the courts to the public and outside world. This is accomplished through axes parallel and perpendicular to Wellington Street dividing the facades in three segments roughly related to the proportions of the Supreme Court. These axes dominate the interior organization of the building. The exception: As Cliffe Street Central Heating Plant is located directly between the proposed site and the Ottawa River, the two axes from north and south are offset from each other and both end at the central celebratory space.

The second viewpoint, is that from the building to its surroundings. These occur at forty-five degree angles. The framed views are protected from various advantageous viewpoints within the building and frame: The Supreme Court of Canada (as the superior court of the judicial system), Wellington Street (Representing the courts strengthened relationship with the public), East and West Memorial Blocks- some of which contain the department of justice, and lastly, the atrium frames Library and Archives Canada as the keeper of our collective memory and identity.

SECTION
Accentuating Axes of Transparency

Selected Protected Views:

Framed Views to:

- 1 Supreme Court of Canada
- 2 Ottawa River
- 3 West Memorial Building
- 4 Wellington Street/Entrance

Axes of Transparency:

- a from Wellington Street

Materiality:
Security & Transparency

1

4.5 Floorplans: Understanding Program Distribution

With a complex program and a goal to create a fully accessible yet secure facility, its program distribution is best understood through its floor plans. Beginning on the first level, the spaces range from public to private in direct relation to their distance from the entrance, as well as floor level above. The main character defining spaces (identified in part 3.3) then are brought out of the private spaces of the courts and exhibited for the public.

The Character Defining Spaces of the proposal can be seen on page 113 and are listed as follows:

- 1 Main Entrance
- 2 Public Atrium
- 3 Libraries
- 4 Hall of Honour
- 5 Floating Courtrooms
- 6 Lucien Cardien Conference Room

Additionally, some character defining elements will be its unique shape and materiality, its protected views and respected axes of transparency, the floating experience of its symbolic centre and its connection to its built context and the Ottawa River.

Part Four: Design Proposal

Please note that level nine and ten have not been included in the diagram above. Level nine follows the office layout and principles of Levels six-eight and level 10 is the symbolic beacon of the “tower” housing the Judge’s Lounge and with the unique ability to overlook between Wellington Street to the Ottawa River and the landscape in between.

LEVEL ONE

① Main Entrance	⑥ Information Desk	⑪ Federal Court Library
② Central Staircase	⑦ Coatroom/ Lockers	⑫ Hall of Honour
③ Public Elevators	⑧ Atrium	⑬ Administration
④ Employee Elevators	⑨ Libraries Entrance	⑭ Drop off and requests
⑤ Security	⑩ Tax Court Library	⑮ Archives transition

LEVEL TWO

1 Central Staircase	6 Waiting Areas	11 Court Information	16 Archives
2 Public Elevators	7 Tax Courtroom	12 Court Support	
3 Employee Elevators	8 Federal Courtroom	13 Public Viewing Areas - Archives	
4 Security Checkpoint	9 Smaller courtrooms	14 Archives Desk	
5 Bridge to main courts	10 Judicial Chambers	15 Archives Offices	

LEVEL THREE

1 Central Staircase	6 Project Room/ Motions	11 Corporate Services Offices
2 Public Elevators	7 Court Administration Public	12 Corporate Services
3 Employee Elevators	8 Court Administration Offices	13 Archives Offices 3rd
4 Registry Services Desk	9 Court Registry Offices	
5 Registry Information	10 Judicial Chambers	

LEVEL FOUR

1 Central Staircase	6 Waiting Areas	11 Court Information
2 Public Elevators	7 Translation/ Press	12 Court Support
3 Employee Elevators	8 Federal Court of Appeal	13 Tribunal Rooms
4 Security Checkpoint	9 Smaller courtrooms	14 Court Administration Services
5 Bridge to main courts	10 Judicial Chambers	15 Archives

LEVEL FIVE

1 Employee Elevators	6 Law Clerks
2 Judge's Corridor	7 Offices
3 Conference Room	8 Secured Archives
4 Legal Services	9 Archives Office
5 Projects Room	

LEVEL SIX-NINE

① Employee Elevators	⑥ Chief Justice- Visual Connection to Supreme Court
② Security/ Circulation Desk	⑦ Judicial Assistants
③ Conference Room*	⑧ Reading/ Lounge Room
④ Administration	③ Conference Room*
⑤ Judicial Chambers	Lucien Cardin Conference Room (Character Defining Space)

4.6 Architectural Interventions on Heritage Sites:

“Change, however, is inevitable. Buildings, streetscapes, and urban areas evolve and change according to the needs of their inhabitants. Therefore, it is important to determine the role of contemporary architecture in contributing to this change in ways that conserve and celebrate the special character and quality of the historic environment that communities have recognized as important and wish to conserve for future generations.”¹

There has been a high level of skepticism when combining the concepts of conservation and contemporary design. The misconception that the contemporary design and lack of continuity in architectural style will diminish the value of the historical landscape is too well established. For the proposed site and Federal Courts Building proposed, for example, it has been a popular idea to refer to the architectural styles of its heritage context as an attempt to conserve its values. Is there no place for today’s values to be represented in the ‘Heart of the Nation’ known as the Capital Plateau?

This thesis maintains that, through understanding the values of its heritage context, respecting its governing principles (such as heights and massing as put forth

¹MacDonald, Susan (2011) *Contemporary Architecture in Historic Urban Environments*. The Getty Conservation Institute. 26.2 Fall 2011

in the Vienna Memorandum of 2005) and responding to them, will increase the value of the heritage/historical landscape as it adds a layer to its evolution. A large range of heritage values are exhibited on the plateau including, social, historical, political, intangible and architectural. Constructing a contemporary building on the site should not diminish its value if the architectural design is mindful of its heritage. The plateau's story does not end today, so in consideration for future heritage, a contemporary design needs to adapt to the complex and make part of a cohesive whole, all the while maintaining the identity pertaining to its time.

The biggest challenge in assessing the successfulness of contemporary architecture in a heritage site is the question of **subjectivity**. As heritage sites carry significance, their history and prominence make projects proposed on these sites highly contentious. The subjectivity of taste can overshadow the quality of the project being put forth. Quality, however, is measurable and therefore objective. "Prescriptive planning tools such as height restrictions, envelope limitations, and requirements to use certain materials all attempt to provide qualitative design measures."² In an attempt to achieve a high quality of design three considerations to follow include: Certainty (in understanding and planning), consistency and communication. Susan Macdonald, for the Getty Conservation Institute argues that it **is the quality of the relationship between the old and the new that is critical**. The significance in the relationship will emphasize the characteristics of its heritage values and uses these to add a rich layer to the landscape.

This thesis, recognizes and interprets the principles of the historic site in such a way that it sustains its heritage values. The design proposal culminates in a contemporary, utopian representation and through the years will stand as a monument to the evolution and development of the capital plateau. Made up of understanding the character of national identity and history embedded in the heritage of the site, the proposal aims to enhance the character and qualities of the site through the completion of its intangible heritage of urban plans in a response that is thoughtful and representative of its place through understanding and its time through architectural language.

²MacDonald, Susan (2011) *Contemporary Architecture in Historic Urban Environments*. The Getty Conservation Institute. 26.2 Fall 2011

¹UNESCO (2005) *Vienna Memorandum 'World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture: Managing the Historic Landscape'*. Item 21

Conclusion:

“Only when understanding our place, we may be able to participate creatively and contribute to its history.”

Christian Norberg-Schulz - *Genius Loci A Phenomenology of Architecture* (1976)

Vincent Massey, in his 1951 Royal Commission on National Development in the Arts, Letters and Sciences, report states that “...Architecture has the greatest influence of all the arts on the manner of living but is largely ignored by the public.”² Architecture has a unique power. As a constant visual and experiential stimulator, architecture has the power to evoke emotion and influence the thoughts and feelings of the onlooker. It is through its power that it can strengthen the sense of identity and cultivate an association to place.

This thesis attempts to strengthen the sense of identity of the federal courts and Canadian identity. A point made in part four states that to create **identity in architecture**, there must simultaneously exist a **location** of significance, a **function** of significance and a **respect** and **context** which adds to its value.

On the vacant west block of the Judicial Precinct on Canada’s Capital Plateau, one

¹ Norberg-Schulz, Christian (1976) *Genius Loci, Towards a Phenomenology in Architecture*. Rizzoli

² Massey, Vincent (1951) *Royal Commission on National Development in the Arts, Letters and Sciences*. 216

finds a site full of history and significance that has been largely neglected and left as a void in the 'Heart of the Nation'. This site carries the historical landscape and heritage values of the entire plateau, therefore conservation principles were used in the architectural intervention of the site. "A deep understanding of the history, culture and architecture of place, as opposed to object buildings only, is crucial to the development of a conservation framework"¹

Through the recognition and understanding of the site's significance, character and heritage value of its context an appropriate design proposal was made that aims to not only maintain but strengthen its values and its character. As a void in the city, **this proposal pays homage to urban planning of the area spanning as far back as 1912 in the completion of the Judicial Triad** as a reflection to a smaller scale of the Parliamentary triad.

Through adequate architectural strategies such as maintaining the correct proportions and building heights, emphasizing principles of its architectural context such as verticality and materiality and exposing the building, its program and its value to the public, this proposal culminates its century of urban planning strategies occupying the last vacant site north of Wellington Street and completing the composition of the Capital Plateau. Adding an additional layer of its design in contemporary values, creates a dialogue of the evolution of architecture in the national image in the capital.

Understanding and responding to the needs of its program, the design proposal speaks to the value of a **just** society by highlighting the significance of the courts as the centre of justice. The design proposal speaks to its **democratic** state by becoming a truly public and accessible building. It becomes a monument to justice by the significance of its location and through the language of its architecture. It portrays the **courtroom as the epicentre of justice**. And lastly, it creates a **humane environment** through scale, proportion and the experience promoted.²

¹UNESCO (2005) *Vienna Memorandum 'World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture: Managing the Historic Landscape'*. Item 21

²McConnell, John C. (1984) *Courthouses of the Commonwealth*. "The Houses of the Law" Massachusetts.

This thesis asks the question “***How can architecture’s ability to become a symbol of identity be utilized to evoke and strengthen the relationship between the Federal Courts of Canada and their association to Canadian identity and place?*** “

This thesis does not promote that architecture should physically represent national identity, but rather that through its influence it has the power to educate and strengthen the sense of national identity. In short, this thesis believes that by completing the judicial precinct and in turn the Capital Plateau, a conversation will be sparked; a dialogue that seeks to understand what the Federal Courts are and why they belong on the plateau. The design proposal becomes the key with which they begin to understand the judicial system, its role in democratic identity and it is through this education that the society’s sense of national identity is strengthened.

In order to provide a high quality design proposal, it begins by recognizing and understanding (a) the values held within Canadian identity (b) the heritage values and context of its site and (c) the role and needs of the Federal Courts of Canada. It plans to (a) respect its context, character and ‘Spirit of Place’ through thoughtful architectural language, and (b) symbolically unify the now dispersed Federal Courts and represent their needs in a contemporary design proposal which represents both the values of its time and of its history. Lastly, through its intervention, the design proposal utilizes its architecture to (a) open and improve the relationship between the courts and the people, (b) present architecturally its values and character defining elements and (c) educates on its function and the identity of the Federal Courts and in turn national identity.

UNDERSTAND

- 1 National Identity
- 2 The Capital Plateau
- 3 The Federal Courts

PLAN

Heritage Considerations
Program Requirements

INTERVENE

- 4 Design Proposal
 - Effect of Design Proposal
 - ‘Spirit of Place’ of the Plateau
 - Image of the Federal Courts
 - Malleable National Identity

The process outlined as approached from a Heritage and Conservation strategy.

A Note on the Most Recent Site Proposals:

1. Memorial to the Victims of Communism:

The proposed site, the west block of the Judicial precinct, has, for years, been the last prime, vacant plot of land in the Capital Plateau. It is then of no surprise that there have been a number of proposals through the years. Many, as seen in the history of Urban Planning, were for a building to house the Federal Courts, the most recent of which was presented in the early 2000's by NORR Architects in the Pierre Elliott Trudeau Judicial Building. Although they gained some traction, no proposal to the site has been as controversial as the latest proposal to house the Memorial to the Victims of Communism adjacent to the Supreme Court of Canada.

Spearheaded by the Toronto organization 'Tribute to Liberty', the design proposal for the Memorial to the Victims of Communism follows a 2014 open competition and is composed of "a walk and a remembrance walk and the folds of memory." The proposal for the monument has faced a large amount of controversy both over its location and its political implications- the push by Stephen Harper's Conservative government, the subject it addresses, and whether it is truly representative as a 'National' monument as it only represents a small portion of Canadian backgrounds.

With the backing of many Ottawa architects, members of parliament and the community at large, the memorial on this site was halted after the results of the 2015 Federal Election. The subject of architectural controversy, this instance served to demonstrate the significance of both the site and the function which belongs both in the Capital Plateau and within the Judicial Precinct. The program should be judicial in nature, should demonstrate values of our democratic and national identity and lastly encouraged both by the government and populace at large.

¹Tribute to Liberty (2015-accessed) Online resource

Memorial to the Victims of Communism²

Ottawa, ON (on proposed site)

Tribute to Liberty Foundation

2013-2015

Widely challenged project due to the selected site on the judicial precinct.

Created a public square in the landscape.

²Tribute to Liberty (2015-accessed) Online resource

2. Pierre Elliott Trudeau Judicial Building:

After nearly a century of urban planning, NORR won the competition in the early 2000's for the design of the Federal Courts Building on the vacant West Block of the Judicial Precinct and proposed site for this thesis. With an estimated completion date of 2007, NORR's proposal seemed the closest the Federal Courts Building ever came to being constructed.

The most significant aspect of the project is that the building, although a contemporary approach, carries architectural language that speaks to the national image. After site visits and conversations with Public Works and Federal Courts personnel I have been informed that although their proposal was well thought out it did not consider the expansion of the courts and were it to be built today it would need significantly more program area to accommodate the courts. As the massing proposed by NORR is already larger than the suggested size similar to the Justice Building it begs the question, what happens when the courts continue to grow? Where will they be accommodated?

Unfortunately, not much information is available on the proposal. Due to political alignments and interests, no information is available through NORR or other channels, therefore the only information available comes from a Government Experience Profile found in their archives.

Some of the things their proposal fails to address include: its connection/context with Library and Archives Canada, its materiality (it is visually similar to the color palette but seems to be using brick and a darker stone breaking the pattern set by the Supreme Court and Library and Archives Canada). It carries a mixture of horizontal and vertical patterns but does not set a continuous rhythm and a lack of architectural language to function. On the other hand, it appropriately speaks to the steep sloped roofs, the use of towers and the completion of the Judicial Precinct. It is a solid proposal, however I believe a few aspects need to be reconsidered in the event they follow through with the project as they could still hold the contract.

¹ARCHIAL | NORR ,(2007) Government Experience Profile

Appendix A: Recent Site Proposals

¹ARCHIAL | NORR , Government Experience Profile

Appendix B:

Please note that due to not having the appropriate security clearance, I was unable to acquire the Canadian Judicial Fit Up Standards, although these were requested in October 2015. As a substitution then, the U.S Courts Design Guide¹ has been used with discretion as subtle considerations for size requirements and design development. Below are a few tables and diagrams which helped guide some of the design process.

Table 3.3
Interior Circulation Requirements

SPACES	% CIRCULATION
Courtrooms ¹	17%
Judges' Chambers ²	8% - 17% ¹
Jury Assembly Area	11%
Grand Jury Suite	13%
Trial Jury Suite	17%
Central Court Libraries	24%
Clerk's Office	24%
Other Courtrooms	19-21%
Common Building Spaces	20%

¹ This space enables movement from spaces associated with the courtroom to the courtroom itself.

² Varies based upon whether a collegial or collated scheme is selected. Consult with the Administrative Office of the U.S. Courts.

¹Judicial Conference of the United States (2007) U.S. Courts Design Guide. Accessed 2016. online

²Judicial Conference of the United States (2007) U.S. Courts Design Guide. Accessed 2016. online

Maximum ceiling heights for courtrooms and associated spaces are as follows:

Table 4.1
Ceiling Heights

SPACES	SIZE	
	FEET	(mm)
APPELLATE COURTROOMS AND ASSOCIATED SPACES		
En Banc Courtroom	18	(5,500)
Panel Courtroom	16	(4,900)
Attorney Work Room ¹	10	(3,000)
Judges' Conference/Robing Room ²	10	(3,000)
DISTRICT JUDGE COURTROOMS AND ASSOCIATED SPACES		
District Judge Courtroom	16	(4,900)
Special Proceedings Courtroom	18	(5,500)
Attorney/Witness Rooms	10	(3,000)
Attorney Work Room ¹	10	(3,000)
Judges' Conference/Robing Room ²	10	(3,000)
MAGISTRATE AND BANKRUPTCY JUDGE COURTROOMS AND ASSOCIATED		
Magistrate Judge Courtroom	16	(4,900)
Bankruptcy Judge Courtrooms	16	(4,900)
Attorney/Witness Rooms	10	(3,000)
Attorney Work Room ¹	10	(3,000)
Judges' Conference/Robing Room ²	10	(3,000)

¹ Only one per courthouse, not one per court

² Provided only when chambers are located in a remote location from the courtroom

³Judicial Conference of the United States (2007) U.S. Courts Design Guide. Accessed 2016. online

Bibliography

Print Sources:

1. Cohen, Andrew (2007) *The Unfinished Canadian: The People We Are*. 1st Ed. McClelland and Stewart
2. Vale, Lawrence J. (2008) *Architecture, Power, and National Identity*. 2nd Ed. New Haven: Yale University Press
3. Taylor, John H. (1986) *Ottawa: An Illustrated History- The History of Canadian Cities*. Toronto. J.Lorimer.
4. Cameron, Christina. (2000) "The Spirit of Place: The Physical Memory of Canada" *Journal of Canadian Studies*. Spring 2000 35,1
5. National Capital Commission *A Capital in the Making*.
6. Kalosha, Olga. (2011) *Against the Aparatus of Legacy: 10 Chapters on Ottawa's Architecture*. Thesis. Carleton University
7. Giguere, Joy M. (2014) *Characteristically American: memorial architecture, national identity and the Egyptian revival*.
8. Gordon, David.(2006) *Planning Twentieth Century Capital Cities*. Taylor & Francis.
9. Federal Heritage Building Review Office. (1982) *Building Reports Volume 28 87-34 to 87-41*.
10. National Capital Commission. (1984) *A Study of National Capital Symbols: Inventory and Analysis*. Government of Canada.
11. Maitland, Leslie Louis Taylor. (1990) *Historical Sketches of Ottawa*.

Bibliography:

12. City of Ottawa. (1969) Ottawa Central Area Study. National Capital Commission.
13. Du Toitt Allsopp Hillier. (1987) The Parliamentary Precinct Area: Urban guidelines. National Capital Commission
14. Polo, Marco Colin Ripley. (2014) Architecture and National Identity: The Centennial Projects 50 Years On. Dalhousie Architecture Press
15. Hennessy, Edward (1984) 'Foreword' in Robert, J. Courthouses of the Commonwealth. 1st Ed. University of Massachusetts Press
16. Greber, Jaques (1950) Plan for the National Capital General Report
17. Gellner, Ernest (1983) Nations and Nationalism. 1st Ed. Cornell University Press
18. Wilson, Scott Gruft, Andrew(2005) Substance over Spectacle: Contemporary Canadian Architecture. 1st Ed, Arsenal Pulp Press
19. Sudjic, Deyan (2005) La Arquitectura del Poder. 1st Ed. Translated. Ariel
20. Fung, Jason (2011) Architecture and Canada; The Character of Context. Thesis. Ryerson University, Toronto
21. Frye, Northrop. (1971) The Bush Garden: Essays on the Canadian Imagination. Toronto: Anansi.
22. Massey, Vincent. (1951) Report: Royal Commission on National Development in the Arts, Letters and Sciences. Ottawa: Edmund Cloutier.
23. Finlay, Karen. (2004) The Force of Culture: Vincent Massey and Canadian Sovereignty. Toronto, University of Toronto Press.
24. Adams, Annmarie (2001) The Monumental and the Mundane: Architectural History in Canada. *Acadiensis* xxx2 Spring 2001
25. Byers, Michael(2007) Intent for a Nation: What is Canada For?. Douglas and McIntyre Ltd. Vancouver/Toronto
26. "Citizen X" (1997) Who are the People of Canada Anyway? Waiting for the Next Referendum. Eastend Books. Toronto
27. Francis, Diane (1996) Fighting for Canada. Key Porter Books. Toronto
28. Kennon, Donald R. (2000) The United States Capitol Designing and Decorating a National Icon. Ohio University Press. Athens
29. Carmona, Matthew(2003) Public Places, Urban Spaces the Dimensions of Urban Design. Architectural Press. Oxford
30. Ibbitson, John (2005) The Polite Revolution: Perfecting the Canadian Dream. McClelland & Stewart.
31. Craig, Lois (1978) The Federal Presence. MIT Press. Cambridge Mass

32. Rawls, John (1971) *A theory of Justice*. Harvard University Press. Revised 1999
33. Supreme Court of Illinois (2011) *Minimum Courtroom Standards in the State of Illinois*. Springfield

Lectures as Sources:

1. Fortin, Lyette and Robert Allsopp (2015) *Heart of the Nation: Long Term Vision Plan Presentation*. September 16, 2015. Ottawa
2. Franck, Karen (2015) *Making and Remaking Memorials: A Contested Process*. November 04 2015. Carleton University. Ottawa
3. Gordon, David and Alain Migueles(2015) *A Retrospective on Capital Planning*. NCC. November 18 2015. Ottawa

Online Sources:

1. du Toit Allsopp Hillier. (2006) *Site Capacity and Longterm Development Plan for the Parliamentary and Judicial Precincts Area*. Public Works and Government Services Canada
2. Parks Canada. (2015) *The Canadian Register of Historic Places*. Accessed on multiple occasions for heritage research
3. Government Canada Department of Justice.(2015) *Canada's Justice System How it works- About*
4. Ottawa Past and Present (2015) *1938-2015 Photograph and Article Galleries*. Wellington and Parliamentary Precincts
5. City of Ottawa.(2014) *GeoOttawa Maps and historical references 2015*
6. Paquette, Gilles, and Pierre Boyer. (2010) *The Capital Question*. Ottawa: Canada Studies Foundation, Accessed 2015 multiple dates
7. Department of Justice Canada. *Canada's System of Justice*. Minister of Justice and Attorney General of Canada. Accessed 2015. Web
8. Parks Canada. (2010) *The Standards and Guidelines for the Conservation of Historic Places Canada*.
9. Urbsite. (2009)*The Last Temporary*. August 29 2009 Accessed 2015-10
10. Court Administration Services (2015) *The Role of the Federal Court of Appeal, The Role of the Federal Court* 2015-09-09

Bibliography:

11. Alhasani, Nadia M. (1996) Tradition vs. Modernity: The Quest for Cultural Identity. TDSR Volume VII No. II 1996. (35-42)
12. Torre, Susana (2007) Architecture and the Construction of Cultural Identity, Latin America. AAT Paper
13. Torabi, Zorah and Sarah Brahman (2013) Effective Factors in Shaping the Identity of Architecture. Middle-East Journal of Science. Idosi
14. Urbsite. (2011) Justice Under Construction. Accessed 2015-10
15. National Capital Commission (2007) Canada's Capital Views Protection Document. du Toit Allsopp Hillier. Ottawa
16. National Capital Commission (2014) Capital Urban Lands Master Plan. Ottawa. March 2014
17. Norberg-Schulz, Christian (1976) Genius Loci, Towards a Phenomenology in Architecture. Rizzol. Accessed Winter 2016
18. The Getty Conservation Institute, Online Resources. Accessed between 2015-2016
19. MacDonald, Susan (2011) Contemporary Architecture in Historic Urban Environments. The Getty Conservation Institute. 26.2 Fall 2011
20. ARCHIAL | NORR (2000-2010) Government Experience Profile. Accessed 2015
21. Tribute to Liberty (2015-accessed) Online resource
22. UNESCO (2005) Vienna Memorandum 'World Heritage and Contemporary Architecture: Managing the Historic Landscape'. Accessed 2016
23. UNESCO World Heritage Sites (accessed 2015-2016)
24. Anderson, Lawrence (2014) John M. Roll US Courthouse, Ehrlich. Arch Daily. accessed 2016
25. Morphopedia (2009) Morphosis Architects Online Portfolio. Thom Mayne Accessed 2015
26. Sveivan, Megan (2011) United States Courthouse, Meier. Arch Daily
27. Adamson Associates Architects (2013) Online Portfolio. accessed 2016
28. Mockbee, Samuel(2001) Ethics or Moral Philosophy. Vol. 11 Springer. pg 188
29. Court Administration Services, Canada (2015) The Role of the Federal Court of Appeal (2015-09-09)
30. Australian Government (2011) Creating Places for People. Developing an Australian Urban Design Protocol. Accessed 2016
31. Judicial Conference of the United States (2007) U.S. Courts Design Guide. Accessed 2016. online
32. Urbsite. (2015)The Judicial Triad. Be Careful What you Wish For. December 17 2015 Accessed 2016-02