1

PM-1 3½"x4" PHOTOGRAPHIC MICROCOPY TARGET
NBS 1010a ANSI/ISO #2 EQUIVALENT

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Vous lirez : Votre référence

Quelle : Notre référence

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

GLOBALIZATIONS, POWER, MARGINALITY:
TRANSNATIONAL MIGRATIONS AND THE RESTRUCTURING OF THE URBAN

by
Fuyuki Kurasawa, B.Soc.Sci.

A thesis submitted to
the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research
in partial fulfilment of
the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts

Institute of Political Economy
Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario
August 3, 1995
© copyright
1995, Fuyuki Kurasawa

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Thèse - Bibliothèque

Our file - Bibliothèque

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-612-08905-3

Canada

Name Michael J. F. ...

Dissertation Abstracts International is arranged by broad, general subject categories. Please select the one subject which most nearly describes the content of your dissertation. Enter the corresponding four-digit code in the spaces provided.

--	--	--	--

U·M·I

SUBJECT TERM

SUBJECT CODE

Subject Categories

THE HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

COMMUNICATIONS AND THE ARTS

Architecture 0729
Art History 0377
Cinema 0900
Dance 0378
Fine Arts 0357
Information Science 0723
Journalism 0391
Library Science 0399
Mass Communications 0708
Music 0413
Speech Communication 0459
Theater 0465

EDUCATION

General 0515
Administration 0514
Adult and Continuing 0516
Agricultural 0517
Art 0273
Bilingual and Multicultural 0282
Business 0688
Community College 0275
Curriculum and Instruction 0727
Early Childhood 0518
Elementary 0524
Finance 0277
Guidance and Counseling 0519
Health 0680
Higher 0745
History of 0520
Home Economics 0278
Industrial 0521
Language and Literature 0279
Mathematics 0280
Music 0522
Philosophy of 0998
Physical 0523

Psychology 0525
Reading 0535
Religious 0527
Sciences 0714
Secondary 0533
Social Sciences 0534
Sociology of 0340
Special 0529
Teacher Training 0530
Technology 0710
Tests and Measurements 0288
Vocational 0747

LANGUAGE, LITERATURE AND LINGUISTICS

Language 0679
General 0289
Ancient 0290
Linguistics 0291
Modern
Literature 0401
General 0294
Classical 0295
Comparative 0297
Medieval 0298
Modern 0316
African 0591
American 0305
Asian 0352
Canadian (English) 0355
Canadian (French) 0593
English 0311
Germanic 0312
Latin American 0315
Middle Eastern 0313
Romance 0314
Slavic and East European

PHILOSOPHY, RELIGION AND THEOLOGY

Philosophy 0422
Religion
General 0318
Biblical Studies 0321
Clergy 0319
History of 0320
Philosophy of 0322
Theology 0469

SOCIAL SCIENCES

American Studies 0323
Anthropology 0324
Archaeology 0326
Cultural 0327
Physical
Business Administration 0310
General 0272
Accounting 0770
Banking 0454
Management 0338
Marketing 0385
Canadian Studies
Economics 0501
General 0503
Agricultural 0505
Commerce Business 0508
Finance 0509
History 0510
Labor 0511
Theory 0358
Folklore 0366
Geography 0351
Gerontology
History 0578
General

Ancient 0579
Medieval 0581
Modern 0582
Black 0328
African 0331
Asia Australia and Oceania 0332
Canadian 0334
European 0335
Latin American 0336
Middle Eastern 0333
United States 0337
History of Science 0585
Law 0398
Political Science
General 0615
International Law and Relations 0616
Public Administration 0617
Recreation 0814
Social Work 0452
Sociology
General 0626
Criminology and Penology 0627
Demography 0938
Ethnic and Racial Studies 0631
Individual and Family Studies 0628
Industrial and Labor Relations 0629
Public and Social Welfare 0630
Social Structure and Development 0700
Theory and Methods 0344
Transportation 0709
Urban and Regional Planning 0999
Women's Studies 0453

THE SCIENCES AND ENGINEERING

BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES

Agriculture
General 0473
Agronomy 0285
Animal Culture and Nutrition 0475
Animal Pathology 0476
Food Science and Technology 0359
Forestry and Wildlife 0478
Plant Culture 0479
Plant Pathology 0480
Plant Physiology 0812
Range Management 0777
Wood Technology 0746
Biology
General 0306
Anatomy 0287
Biostatistics 0308
Botany 0309
Cell 0379
Ecology 0329
Entomology 0353
Genetics 0369
Immunology 0793
Microbiology 0410
Molecular 0307
Neuroscience 0317
Oceanography 0416
Physiology 0413
Radiation 0821
Veterinary Science 0728
Zoology 0472
Biophysics
General 0786
Medical 0760

EARTH SCIENCES

Biogeochemistry 0425
Geochemistry 0996

Geodesy 0370
Geology 0372
Geophysics 0373
Hydrology 0388
Mineralogy 0411
Paleobotany 0345
Paleoecology 0426
Paleontology 0418
Paleozoology 0985
Palynology 0427
Physical Geography 0368
Physical Oceanography 0415

HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES

Environmental Sciences 0768
Health Sciences
General 0566
Audiology 0300
Chemotherapy 0992
Dentistry 0567
Education 0350
Hospital Management 0769
Human Development 0758
Immunology 0982
Medicine and Surgery 0564
Mental Health 0347
Nursing 0569
Nutrition 0570
Obstetrics and Gynecology 0380
Occupational Health and Therapy 0354
Ophthalmology 0381
Pathology 0571
Pharmacology 0419
Pharmacy 0572
Physical Therapy 0382
Public Health 0573
Radiology 0574
Recreation 0575

Speech Pathology 0460
Toxicology 0383
Home Economics 0386

PHYSICAL SCIENCES

Pure Sciences

Chemistry
General 0485
Agricultural 0749
Analytical 0486
Biochemistry 0487
Inorganic 0488
Nuclear 0738
Organic 0490
Pharmaceutical 0491
Physical 0494
Polymer 0495
Radiation 0754
Mathematics 0405
Physics
General 0605
Acoustics 0986
Astronomy and Astrophysics 0606
Atmospheric Science 0608
Atomic 0748
Electronics and Electricity 0607
Elementary Particles and High Energy 0798
Fluid and Plasma 0759
Molecular 0609
Nuclear 0610
Optics 0752
Radiation 0756
Solid State 0611
Statistics 0463

Applied Sciences

Applied Mechanics 0346
Computer Science 0984

Engineering
General 0537
Aerospace 0538
Agricultural 0539
Automotive 0540
Biomedical 0541
Chemical 0542
Civil 0543
Electronics and Electrical 0544
Heat and Thermodynamics 0348
Hydraulic 0545
Industrial 0546
Marine 0547
Materials Science 0794
Mechanical 0548
Metallurgy 0743
Mining 0551
Nuclear 0552
Packaging 0549
Petroleum 0765
Sanitary and Municipal 0554
System Science 0790
Geotechnology 0428
Operations Research 0796
Plastics Technology 0795
Textile Technology 0994

PSYCHOLOGY

General 0621
Behavioral 0384
Clinical 0622
Developmental 0620
Experimental 0623
Industrial 0624
Personality 0625
Physiological 0989
Psychobiology 0349
Psychometrics 0632
Social 0451

The undersigned recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies
and Research acceptance of the thesis

"GLOBALIZATIONS, POWER, MARGINALITY:
TRANSNATIONAL MIGRATIONS AND
THE RESTRUCTURING OF THE URBAN"

submitted by Fuyuki Kurasawa, B.Soc.Sc.
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of Master of Arts

Thesis Co-Supervisor

Thesis Co-Supervisor

Director, Institute of Political Economy

Carleton University
23 August 1995

ABSTRACT

This thesis attempts to contest hegemonic representations of globalizations, putting forth alternative visions which highlight the implications of transnational migrations for Euro-American metropolises. It is contended that, when complemented by an ethic of marginality, materialist feminist theories provide the instruments with which to critique dominant interpretations and generate subaltern narratives. Discourses of/on globalizations are then constructed by analyzing transnational migratory and capital movements, both of which shape North Atlantic urban zones into nodes where power and heterogeneity intertwine. To illustrate this, Toronto is examined as the main Canadian contender for global city status; three tales involving immigrants of colour in specific micro-sites emphasize how relations of domination are secured and tactics of resistance are deployed. Finally, the transformations of various forms of identity (those of the subject, the community/nation, and the city) are evaluated in light of a politics of hybridity enacted by subordinate forces.

À maman,
dont l'exemple m'a inspiré au cours
de ce voyage qui semblait parfois sans fin

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Without divesting myself of the responsibility for any and all flaws which the following pages inevitably contain, it must also be recognized that at bottom, this undertaking constitutes nothing more (and nothing less) than a collective effort. Without those who are mentioned below, I firmly believe that this thesis would not have seen the light of day.

First, I would like to acknowledge the financial assistance provided by the Ontario Graduate Scholarships scheme, le Fonds pour la formation des chercheurs et l'aide à la recherche, the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research at Carleton University, Carleton International, and the David Lewis Research Honorarium administered by the BOAG Foundation. Claire Turenne Sjolander (from the University of Ottawa) and Michael Dolan were instrumental in encouraging me to apply to and subsequently enroll at the Institute of Political Economy. Throughout my program of study and research, Elaine Rouleau has been a wonderful administrator; her availability, knowledge, and warmth have proved invaluable. Wallace Clement, Director of the Institute, has created a stimulating, personable, and immensely supportive environment for graduate work -- a rare thing these days. Because they pointed me towards many paths of intellectual inquiry (and were patient enough to let me stumble through them), my teachers at Carleton contributed immeasurably: thanks to Wallace Clement, Katherine Gibson, Fuat Keyman, Wendy Lerner, Colin Leys, Laura Macdonald, Eleanor MacDonald, Rianne Mahon, and Sheila Rowbotham.

in different directions, while their rigour compelled me to tie things together by carving out positions of my own. Nindy Brar, Paul Halucha, John Lee, Heather Mair, Sharan Samagh, and Melanie White have been incredibly supportive colleagues and friends. As we embark upon new journeys, may our paths continue crossing in the years to come.

Finally, I would like to dedicate this thesis to my mother, whose determination and enthusiasm with respect to her ongoing doctoral studies have been a constant source of inspiration.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Title Page	i
Acceptance Form	ii
Abstract	iii
Dedication	iv
Acknowledgments	v
Table of Contents	viii
 Introduction. Intellectual (Re)mappings: An Essay in Self-Reflexivity	1
 Chapter 1. Epistemologies of Globalizations: On Constructing Materialist Feminist Reading Strategies	9
I. "False Antitheses": Scaling the Problem of Binaries	10
II. Out of the Impasse: Materialist Feminisms and the Global-Local Nexus	16
 Chapter 2. Globalizations and the Urban: Worlds in Flow, Worlds of Flows	31
I. Transnational Migrations, Hybrid Ethnoscapes	34
II. Global Capital Flows, Urban Capitalscapes	39
III. Global Cities, Urban Heterotopias	44
 Chapter 3. Urban Power-Geometries: Exploring Toronto's Heterotopias	52
I. Contexts: Toronto in Canada, Canada in Toronto	53
II. First Story: The Eaton Centre	61
III. Second Story: Dixon	66
IV. Third Story: The Garment Industry	73
 Chapter 4. Urban Heterotopias and the Politics of Hybridity: Destabilizing Identities, Regenerating Resistances	83
I. Marxist Strategies: Taming Alterity	84
II. Materialist Feminist Strategies: The Politics of Hybridity	93
III. The Politics of Hybridity in Urban Heterotopias: Revisiting Toronto	105
 Conclusion. Partial Closures, New Openings	113
 References	117

INTRODUCTION
INTELLECTUAL (RE)MAPPINGS:
AN ESSAY IN SELF-REFLEXIVITY

Over the past two years, the intellectual paths -- or minefields, an image which comes more readily to mind -- along which I have travelled have led in several directions, often ending up in surprising, unexpected territories. More than anything else, this project comes out of my attempts to work through and answer the following question: how can dominant accounts of globalizations be contested and subaltern narratives come to the fore? At a most basic level, I contend that a rethinking of the epistemological and theoretical instruments with which to interpret globalizations is needed. It is further argued that this can be realized by studying the everyday tales of domination and resistance involving immigrants of colour in metropolitan settings, as well as by considering the different identities and political visions generated by subordinate social groups. The routes to this current formulation have been filled with twists and turns which can only be (re)mapped by self-reflexive exercises. The following pages will therefore situate my thesis within certain discursive and disciplinary fields, in order to allow the assumptions and positions which underlie it to become clearly visible; this will assist me to reweave the various strands of the stories I narrate into a relatively coherent, though not linear, pattern.

Three key phases, each involving an extensive reworking of the approaches previously adopted, have defined this thesis' final configuration. The initial problématique consisted in formulating a critique of the discursive representations of economic globalization, which depoliticizes the latter by

presenting it as a juggernaut and/or a *fait accompli* to which both subaltern and dominant social groups must adjust. By contrast, I wanted to argue that this marked yet another historical stage in the restructuring of world economic power in the context of North-South relations; essentially, my argument was premised upon a binary distinction established between a globalized, increasingly peripheral South and a globalizing hegemonic block composed of transnational capital and Northern states. Economic globalization was to be conceived as a set of neo-imperialist processes ensuring the continued exploitation of the former by the latter through the structure of the global division of labour: OECD countries and (to a lesser extent) the first wave of NICs concentrate on design- and knowledge-intensive production, notably high technology sectors and advanced producer services, second-generation NICs focus on labour-intensive mass production, and non-industrialized parts of the Third World are limited to primary commodity production (Dolan, 1993). Consequently, I was to draw upon Marxist traditions in international political economy, beginning with classical theories of imperialism (Bukharin, n.d.; Kautsky, 1970; Lenin, 1975), moving through dependency (Cardoso and Faletto, 1979; Frank, 1966) and world-systems approaches (Wallerstein, 1974) to culminate with contemporary neo-Gramscian analyses (Cox, 1987; Gill, 1990).

The weaknesses of this first framework became readily apparent.¹ Adopting a universalist, Archimedean standpoint, I was merely updating the long lineage of totalizing Euro-American narratives of the world economy. In other words, my intent was to add the latest chapter to the story without questioning why this particular story needed to be recounted. To cling to the

¹Using materialist feminisms, Chapter 1 can thus be interpreted as an implicit critique of most of the foundations which underpinned my original project.

idea of mastering the world, of capturing its infinite layers of fragmentation, complexity, and alterity into some sort of holistic representational device, remains a dangerous fiction. Moreover, neatly dividing this construct of a unified whole along North/South or First World/Third World lines tended to reproduce the dichotomous logic which lies at the heart of the tactics of othering. By uncritically employing monolithic signifiers, the colonizing gesture of homogenizing, of flattening out the differences between and among regions of South America, the Caribbean, Africa and Asia would have been inadvertently strengthened. The 'Third World', unknown because fundamentally mythical, would have been spoken for, classified and ultimately, found wanting; a victim of economic globalization, powerless to confront the winds of economic restructuring unleashed by transnational capital.

Best exemplified in the work of Castells (1989), Friedmann (1986), Harvey (1989), Sassen (1988, 1991) and Soja (1989), economic and urban geography allowed me to address some of these limitations by formulating what was to become the second version of the project. More spatially circumscribed and less grandiose in scope, it involved looking at some of the effects of economic globalization in London, Toronto and Stockholm, three North Atlantic global cities whose state forms, kinds of transnational migration and foreign investment vary considerably. I intended to illustrate how the interaction of global movements of people and capital generated distinct patterns of marginalization of Third World immigrants in each urban landscape, focusing on the mechanisms through which labour market and residential segregation were secured. These metropolises were to be located in national settings, corresponding to three types of state (hyperliberal in the Great Britain, social-democratic in Sweden, and liberal-democratic in Canada) whose degrees of transnationalization differed widely. However, the project risked becoming a

state-centric endeavor according to which the main explanatory guidelines would have been obtained by comparing and contrasting state policies towards transnational migration and global capital flows.

Also, far from being abandoned, the totalizing thrust of world economic mappings would have been merely averted. Global metanarratives were to be projected at the scale of the local, giving way to urban metanarratives; the intent and length of the thesis would have required that each of the three urban landscapes be painted in broad strokes, thereby generating unified pictures of global cities. The Archimedean viewer's platform of observation might have shifted from outer space to the CN Tower, yet its need to encompass everything in its gaze, to provide a single comprehensive account of a given city, remained. At another level, the economistic character of this second proposal peripheralized (or blatantly ignored) key cultural concerns which arose directly from some of its arguments. Fundamental questions, dealing with the tangled processes of identity construction in urban settings, were simply missing from the equation.² Also, the project's structuralist bent, which highlighted a certain causal relationship between economic globalization and socio-spatial marginalization, was not conducive to examining strategies of resistance crafted by immigrants of colour; in short, subaltern groups were denied agency.³ By retaining the comparative core of the thesis, the three cities would have been described as ensembles of structures from which social forces were largely missing.

²I would like to thank Rianne Mahon for initially bringing this point to my attention -- notably in terms of national identity. It enabled me to 'bring culture back in', thereby opening up a line of inquiry which was to prove crucial.

³This shortcoming was widely shared among practitioners of the "new" Canadian political economy (NCPE). Mahon notes: "[...] while NCPEists shared Marx's commitment to 'understanding reality in order to change it' there was a tendency to bend the stick too far in the direction of structural forces and pay too little attention to the question of how subordinate forces themselves contributed both to reproduction and to change." (1993: 19, fn 13)

In light of these flaws, the third (and final) phase of the project has been devised to retain traces of the two previous formulations while permitting other avenues to be researched. Its precarious location is that of the borderlines of political economy, a terrain where the themes of "production, space and identity" (Mahon, 1993) are prominently featured. For this task, articulations between poststructuralism, postcolonialism, feminism, and political economy are further developed; the latter is interpreted as being in conversation with, not in opposition to, the former. Because explicitly concerned with intersections among these different discourses, materialist feminisms provide insights out of which the interpretive lenses adopted throughout my thesis are crafted.

Organized around epistemological concerns, the first chapter applies such interpretive lenses to undermine the notion of totality as a useful analytical device -- a device which lies at the core of the first two versions of this project. I contend that, due to Enlightenment-based epistemological assumptions, readings of globalizations coming from the disciplines of international political economy and urban geography rely on a form of dualist reasoning which deploys global/local and objectivism/relativism dichotomies. The critical techniques of knowledge derived from materialist feminisms connect phenomena at different spatial scales to examine the interaction of urban locales and global flows. Moreover, they allow one to elaborate reflexive strategies which abandon the metaphysical foundations of objectivity yet advance marginality as a politico-normative location from which to adjudicate between competing stories of globalizations.

To materialist feminist epistemologies must correspond certain theoretical frameworks, which form the basis for the second chapter. Scripts founded on a eclectic mix of cultural and economic geography, anthropology, urban sociology, and international political economy are put forth as an

alternative to dominant constructs of globalizations. I present stories of flows, investigating the interwoven socio-cultural, spatial, and economic aspects of transnational movements of people and capital. It is further argued that the concepts of 'capitalscapes' and 'ethnoscapes', which identify the shifting socio-spatial configurations generated by global flows, are effective tools for marginal reading strategies. These configurations are most densely woven in metropolises, where ethnoscapes and capitalscapes disjunctively crisscross to form complex patterns of social relations. Nonetheless, common images of global cities do not suit materialist feminisms' emphasis on alterity, domination and resistance as features of urban settings. Newer socio-spatial metaphors are required; those of heterotopias and power-geometries, found in poststructuralist and feminist geographical writings, are well adapted to my purposes.

Having developed theoretical schemas with which to understand the relationship between globalizations and the urban, I then turn to concrete manifestations of power-geometries among some of Toronto's heterotopias in the third chapter. Initially, the city is positioned within the Canadian nation-state in terms of economic restructuring, state immigration and (liberal) multiculturalist policies, and national identity. The comparative portion of the project has effectively been dropped in favour of an examination of three socio-spatial nodes in Toronto: shopping centre, apartment complex, and industry. Materialist feminisms' situated, partial perspectives are consistent with anti-holistic strategies of this type, engendering detailed interpretations of specific metropolitan micro-sites -- the complexity and fragmentation of which cannot be captured by singular urban metanarratives. In the vein of the decentred analytical devices cropping up in cultural studies, the third chapter's contents lend support to the proliferation of moments and sites of struggle across urban matrixes. Furthermore, influenced by postmodern ethnography and the

sociology of everyday life, I try to demonstrate how domination and resistance are always already present in urban locales; far from being exclusively constituted (and victimized) by relations of power, immigrants of colour are shown as negotiating daily struggles against gender, class and racial/ethnic oppressions.

Materialist feminist epistemologies, theories of globalizations, urban metaphors, and surveys of local power-geometries all come together in the fourth chapter, devoted to formulating a politics of hybridity. It is informed by the recent convergence of numerous discursive fields (postcolonialism, feminism, cultural studies, geography) towards matters of identity and difference, evaluating the political effects of a series of responses to these concerns. Discussions of fragmented, multiple identities -- whether of the self, the community or the city -- are understood as clearing the way for alternative imaginaries: radical multiculturalism and a politics of hybridity, in accordance with materialist feminist interpretations of globalizations and urban heterotopias. Hybrid politics are then situated in Toronto, where various subaltern racial and ethnic groups have shaped webs of resistance and alterity.

A global social analytic posits the social not as a fixed or unified structure, but as an ensemble of relations in which connections between cultural, economic, and political practices are overdetermined. Global analysis understands the social in terms of systems and structures of relations. In other words, globalization is a feature of relational thinking. In this respect it is distinct from "totalization." As a unifying strategy, totalization generalizes a logic of the whole from that of a particular region in order to produce a unified or total structure; it is, in this sense, a mode of regionalism written large. [...] While it attends to social totalities, a global analytic is a systemic, not a totalizing, critical framework (Hennessy, 1993: 16).

Well, I am not trying to help you sleep better at night, to say it's really all right, the revolution throbs down there, it's living, it's all ok. You just have to wait for the local to erupt and disrupt the global. I am not telling any kind of story like that. I am asking that we simply do not think of globalization as a pacific and pacified process. It's not a process at the end of history. It is working on the terrain of post-modern culture as a global formation, which is an extremely contradictory space (Hall, 1991a: 39).

[...] it will not be part of our concern to provide a solid and homogeneous theoretical terrain: for all these dispersed genealogies, nor to descend upon them from on high with some kind of halo of theory that would unite them. Our task, on the contrary, will be to expose and specify the issue of at stake in this opposition, this struggle, this insurrection of knowledges against the institutions and against effects of the knowledge and power that invests scientific discourse (Foucault, 1980: 87).

CHAPTER 1

EPISTEMOLOGIES OF GLOBALIZATIONS: ON CONSTRUCTING MATERIALIST FEMINIST READING STRATEGIES

Why begin a thesis on globalization with epistemological reflections? If it needs to be posed, this question should be turned on its head: how could such a task be devoid of explicit epistemological concerns? As various strands of critical theory proclaimed long ago -- or so it seems -- frameworks of understanding are never given nor innocent, though often cloaked in veils of neutrality (Horkheimer, 1972). Interpretive schemes are social constructs, tools devised for specific political interventions and whose applications have specific political effects. The Foucaultian power/knowledge coupling is fruitful in this respect, for as Haraway (1991: 193) reminds us "[...] admitted or not, politics and ethics ground struggles over knowledge projects in the exact, natural, social, and human sciences." Referring to the destabilizing consequences of postmodernist and poststructuralist theories, Salter explains that "[h]ow (and why) we "know" is more important than what we know" (1993: 167). Although I disagree with the implication that poststructuralisms rank these questions, her comments point to the close links which exist among how, why, and what we know; the former delimit the sphere of the latter. With these brief comments, let us enter the politicized fray of interpretation and knowledge production about globalizations.¹

I begin this chapter by identifying the global/local and objectivism/subjectivism dualisms, present in the ways in which globalizations

¹To say nothing of the politics of knowledge dissemination and consumption, the trends which circulate in the academic market of ideas.

are conceived. In order to move away from such dichotomous structures, alternative epistemological and theoretical schemes are put forth; a description of the key components of materialist feminisms will be followed by illustrations of the strategies which the latter provide to break with dichotomous logics, and completed with elaborations of materialist feminist readings of globalizations.

I. "False Antitheses": Scaling the Problem of Binaries

Enlightenment-based forms of knowledge tend to operate through a series of binary oppositions which consist in privileging one term and devaluing (what is constructed as) its absolute opposite. Meaning is achieved through difference, a series of inclusions and exclusions (Derrida, 1974).² In the case of globalization narratives, I have focused on two recurring dualisms: global/local and objectivism/subjectivism. Both are tied to an either/or logic of mutual exclusiveness; one must choose between a universal (macro) scope and a (micro) parochialism, between transcendental foundations of truth or the relativist abyss. I intend to demonstrate that these dichotomies are, to borrow Fraser's (1995) expression, "false antitheses" which prevent alternative explorations from being imagined.

A. Global Analyses. Totalizing Pretensions

The production of totalizing readings and mappings of the global exists as a strong, if not dominant, tendency within disciplines which see the world as

²In Of Grammatology, Derrida illustrates a series of binaries lodged in Western metaphysics, e.g. speech/writing, presence/absence, self/other. Feminist and postcolonial theorists have built on these insights by revealing other dichotomies found at the core of Enlightenment thinking: male/female, public/private, white/black, West/East, First World/Third World.

their object of study. Discourses in international political economy produce explanatory models which conceive of the globe as a unified whole, one which functions according to a single logic and can thus be carved into monolithic components (First World and Third World, core and periphery, Occident and Orient).³ This way of thinking stems from the Archimedean standpoint which is adopted by most analysts of the world economy, who position themselves outside and/or above their 'object' of study. By embracing a god's-eye view, a view from outer space, theorists have written themselves out of their own global scripts. At the same time, they have embraced an objectivist stance which insists on the clear demarcation of facts and values, (supposedly) evacuating normative considerations by masking their own positionalities as subjects constituted by temporally and spatially specific social relations; their own roles in the production of knowledges is denied. In short, global scale, universalism, and objectivist aspirations have been conflated. The perspective of the "unencumbered self" (Benhabib and Cornell, 1987: 10) -- the Cartesian Man who is disembodied from his own contexts and subject positions -- is promoted or, at the very least, striven for. Haraway (1991: 188) insightfully describes this move as "a leap out of the marked body and into a conquering gaze from nowhere. This is the gaze that mythically inscribes all the marked bodies, that makes the unmarked category claim the power to see and not be seen, to represent while escaping representation."

Out of this sweeping, global gaze, certain effects are generated. First, the vexed question of the complicitous relationship between attempts to grasp the world as a knowable totality -- as an unbroken historical narrative and a unified

³Of course, though directed at international political economy, this characteristic is by no means solely attributable to the latter discipline. History and geography, among other fields, have used similar tactics. For an examination of the universalist drive found in geographical writings, see Rogers (1993).

cartographic entity -- and designs to secure domination over it needs to be raised; to know the world in order to master it, to master the world in order to know it.⁴ Said's classic study reminds us of this:

Orientalism can be discussed and analysed as the corporate institution for dealing with the Orient -- dealing with it by making statements about it, authorizing views of it, describing it, by teaching it, settling it, ruling over it: in short, Orientalism as a Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient. (1978: 3)

To what extent, then, do universalizing tales of globalizations constitute mechanisms for dealing with the world, so as to rule over it? The second point concerns the authors of global texts, those who have universalized their particular viewpoints, those who have claimed the world as 'their' oyster. Yet as Rogers' critique of the geographical project asks, whose oyster is it? "The basic problem with such claims is that they belong to a long tradition of mainly Western, mainly male, and mainly white assertions of the right to speak on behalf of humanity and take the world as their intellectual fiefdom." (1992: 513) Archimedes and Descartes have become figures behind whose shadows certain theorists can conveniently hide to write about the world without recognizing their own situatedness within it.

Lest I be misunderstood at this stage, it should be pointed out that I am not arguing for the rejection of global analyses in and of themselves -- quite the contrary, as I hope to demonstrate below. Nonetheless, I do want to throw out a note of caution: the ways in and through which the global has been read and constructed should be problematized. Critical self-reflexivity needs to be exercised in order to sever the ties between a global scale, universalism and objectivist epistemologies, between knowledge about the world and domination of it.

⁴Postcolonial theorists have convincingly argued (and academic circles are grudgingly acknowledging) that the impetus for and subsequent development of the disciplinary fields of world geography and world history are intimately tied to the projects of European colonialism.

B. Local Analyses, Universalist Aspirations

If it is neglected in international political economy, the second term of the global/local binary is very much present in neo-Marxist geographical assessments of globalizations. Apparently spurred by the postmodern turn in the social sciences -- notably Lyotard's (1984) call for the rejection of scientific, hierarchical metanarratives and consequent championing of (supposedly) more democratic, pragmatic forms of knowledge -- many theorists have claimed to abandon universalist ambitions. Instead, in their haste, they have rushed to embrace the local, a spatial scale which is believed to be inherently free from totalizing and objectivist assumptions. Unfortunately, Lyotard's prescriptions have been unproblematically rearticulated in spatial terms without pausing to consider their epistemological implications. For many neo-Marxist urban geographers, the scale (form) of the local is celebrated while Enlightenment forms of knowledge (content) remain intact. Probyn makes this point strongly: "[...] there are differences involved in how we describe and think about the postmodern and difficult questions that cannot be answered by the panacea of locality. The idea that a politics is inscribed on some abstraction we call the local is both ludicrous and problematic." (1990: 186) Local analyses do not necessarily break with the analytical flaws attributed to global tales. Indeed, the intrinsic privileging of local narratives conflates two interrelated yet distinct issues: the choice of spatial scale(s) at which to operate, and the epistemologies which are selected. In other words, 'global' is not synonymous with 'totalizing', nor is 'local' with 'partial.' Neo-Marxist urban geography correctly identifies the epistemological limitations of global metanarratives, but prefers to bypass them by way of a spatial trick -- that is, the shift from one scale

(global) to another (local) without reassessing the foundations which determine how these scales are used to generate knowledge.

The dangers of local metanarratives are illustrated in the writings of what Davis (1990: 84) terms the "L.A. School", a group of neo-Marxist geographers and urban planners clustered around UCLA. Indeed, members of the "L.A. School" boldly universalize what remains, after all, a local situation; Los Angeles is seen as blazing a path which the rest of the world is bound to follow⁵ and/or containing within itself microcosms of all other places in the world. "It All Comes Together in L.A.," proclaims the title of one of Soja's (1989) chapters.⁶ Projecting local configurations as ideal-types promotes a paradoxical form of totalizing parochialism: no need to look elsewhere, for L.A. (or New York, London, Paris, maybe even Tokyo) has it all. Moreover, like their global counterparts, local metanarratives retain objectivist foundations. Metropolises are interpreted as neutral and monolithic entities whose myriad of facets and social groups must be represented as accurately as possible by a particular (Marxist) perspective. Viewed from above by a disembodied gaze, urban landscapes are reduced to unified pictures which carry singular meanings; remarkably little room is left for other viewpoints, the viewpoints of others at the

⁵L.A. is thus envisaged as the contemporary equivalent of Marx's England, which was believed to show the rest of Europe (and the world) an image of its own future.

⁶In a revealing passage, Soja explains:

The particular combinations are unique, both condensed within them are more general expressions and reflections. One can find in Los Angeles not only the high technology industrial complexes of the Silicon Valley and the erratic sunbelt economy of Houston, but also the far-reaching industrial decline and bankrupt urban neighbourhoods of rust-belted Detroit or Cleveland. There is a Boston in Los Angeles, a Lower Manhattan and a South Bronx, a São Paulo and a Singapore. There may be no other comparable urban region which presents so vividly such a composite assemblage and articulation of urban restructuring processes. Los Angeles seems to be conjugating the recent history of capitalist urbanization in virtually all its inflectional forms. (1989: 193)

This tendency is not solely restricted to Los Angeles, however. For others, New York should claim the role of universal local archetype, the "social laboratory for the new society" (Mollenkopf and Castells, 1991: 3).

margins of cities. Without recognizing their own positionalities, neo-Marxist urban theorists have mapped cities through a specific set of lenses, effectively subsuming gender and racial/ethnic dimensions to the dynamics of capitalist production. This tenacious attachment to objectivity can be explained by a fear of drowning in subjectivist waters. Authors shudder at the thought of having their storytelling exposed as a political rather than a impartial endeavour and consequently, of losing their privileged roles as self-appointed interpreters capable of revealing the (supposedly) objective economic structures which lay buried underneath metropolitan heterogeneity.

This section ends with a necessary caveat: one should be wary of uncritical celebrations of localism, which can lead to versions of absolute relativism according to which the proliferation of an infinite set of local discourses is encouraged for its own sake. The search for difference can become a overriding pursuit, one that obscures commonalities and connections. From the fetishism of particularities -- that is to say, the unique spatio-temporal characteristics of local configurations -- arise a troubling conclusion: the incommensurability of local narratives. This position, which reflects the abandonment of global analysis⁷ and a conception of locales as isolated atoms, is clearly untenable in an increasingly interconnected world. Local determinism, and the extreme relativism which it promotes, do not enable the "identification and critique of macrostructures of inequality and injustice which cut across the boundaries separating relatively discrete practices and institutions" (Fraser and Nicholson, 1990: 23), a central aim of critical epistemologies. Relations of domination which are global in scope yet varied in their particular patterns (such as the continued oppression of women, the rapid

⁷ Or, to be more specific, throwing the baby of global analysis out with the bathwater of universalistic metanarratives.

rebirth and spread of racism, the increasing exploitation of workers by transnational capital) cannot simply be ignored. The argument consists in articulating the global and the local, not replacing the former by the latter; one should subvert dichotomies rather than reverse them.

II. Out of the Impasse: Materialist Feminisms and the Global-Local Nexus

At this point, I would like to propose the materialist feminist roadmaps to move out of the impasse created by global/local and objectivism/subjectivism binaries. Continuously under construction, the current versions of materialist feminisms have arisen in the current decade as a result of socialist feminism's engagement with developments in contemporary social theory, notably poststructuralist and postcolonial critiques of Enlightenment modes of thinking.⁸ Hence, rather than being a single, coherent body of literature defined by rigid boundaries, materialist feminisms should be seen as a series of loosely-structured, overlapping discursive fields within which each theorist positions her/himself. Stemming from attempts to explore the tensions between and among modern and postmodern modes of thinking, the debates among materialist feminists have produced certain guidelines to avoid binary logics of the type criticized above.

⁸In this sense, contemporary materialist feminist authors gone beyond earlier forms of materialist feminism which were associated with the socialist feminist paradigm to the extent that the two were used interchangeably.

A. Outlining Materialist Feminisms⁹

What are some of the key components of materialist feminisms? For the purposes of this project, I have selected an admittedly partial set of characteristics to be formulate certain readings of globalizations. First, materialist feminists have participated in the politicization of language and the expansion of what is considered discursive; words are not neutral conveyors or transmitters of social reality, for they actively participate in its simultaneous construction and interpretation. Hence, the meaning of a particular phenomenon is never given, nor does it exist outside the set of social relations within which it is inserted. Challenging the boundary which has been established between the material and the discursive does not signify that the former is denied, but rather that reality cannot exist independently of the acts through which it is explained and constituted (Barrett, 1992). Closely related to this point is the power/knowledge coupling. Indeed, for materialist feminists, claims to know are always perspectival by virtue of their being situated in networks of social relations and formed out of given political projects. Thus, adopting the claims of certain social groups over others leads to what Foucault (1980) identifies as "regimes of truth", in which ideas which conform are legitimated (seen as true) whereas deviant interpretations are expelled (seen as false). Knowledges circulate in and through webs of social power, buttressing and/or eroding existing social orders. In short, power struggles shape knowledge, and knowledge shapes power struggles.

Materialist feminisms have adopted an "anti-essentialist" approach to the social, a refusal to explain away social phenomena by falling back on a (so-

⁹This section does not presume to be a comprehensive outline of the core tenets of materialist feminisms. See Hennessy (1993) and Landry and MacLean (1993) for this.

called) fundamental core, a kernel of truth which underlies all appearances (Graham, 1992).¹⁰ Anti-essentialism recognizes the complexity of social life and the plurality of interpretive schemes which can be employed to interact with it. Because multiple axes of domination exist, the task of materialist feminist analyses consists in studying how social relations are interwoven in given spatio-temporal contexts. Ng strongly conveys this:

Thus, it seems to me that our project is not to determine whether gender, race/ethnicity, class, or the economic system is the primary source of our oppression. The task is for us to discover how sexism and other forms of gender oppression (e.g., compulsory heterosexuality), racism, and class oppression are constituted in different historical conjunctures so that the dominant groups maintain their hegemony over the means of production and reproduction. (1993: 195)

At the same time, materialist feminisms highlight power relations in their various shapes and sizes, with the explicit intent of destabilizing and ultimately transforming the mechanisms through which they operate and are reproduced. Located geographically and historically, interventions are committed to ending macro relations of subordination in their diverse, fragmented micro manifestations. Consequently, the crux of the matter lies in the necessity to simultaneously recognize similarities and differences in the forms that gender, class and ethnic relations of oppression take, to articulate the identification of global structures with the respect of their local specificities and the multiple positionalities of social groups within them. In the words of Mohanty, materialist feminisms aim to conceive of "imagined communities of women with divergent histories and social locations, woven together by the *political* threads of opposition to forms of domination that are not only pervasive but also systemic." (1991a: 4)

¹⁰This does not mean that particular sets of relations cannot be analytically privileged, rather, it implies that the selected pair of lenses is considered a point of entry into social life, not a pre-given instrument to dig up essences.

Where does the materialism fit? The answer is contested among theorists, for the meanings given to the word -- particularly in its relationship to Marxism -- are numerous (Williams, 1983: 197-201). Although resisting the conventional (and crude) opposition of materialism and idealism, materialist feminist authors do focus on the ways in and through which discursively mediated social relations affect the production and distribution of material resources. At the very least, an engagement with issues of working and living for subaltern social groups is to be found: "While discursive categories are clearly central sites of political contestation, they must be grounded in and informed by the material politics of everyday life, especially the daily life struggles for survival of poor people -- those written out of history." (Mohanty, 1991a: 11). Furthermore, materialist feminisms are explicitly concerned with the discursive representations of global capitalism and socio-spatial restructurings (Hennessy, 1993: 6). If it is acknowledged that class relations do not possess an ontological primacy, it is also granted that ethnicity and gender -- to name but two social relations -- cannot be studied without regard to capitalist class processes.

B. Revisiting Dichotomies

Feminists don't need a doctrine of objectivity that promises transcendence, a story that loses track of its mediations just where someone might be held responsible for something, and unlimited instrumental power. We don't want a theory of innocent powers to represent the world, where language and bodies both fall into the bliss of organic symbiosis. We also don't want to theorize the world, much less act within it, in terms of Global Systems, but we do need an earth-wide network of connections, including the ability partially to translate knowledges among very different -- and power-differentiated -- communities. We need the power of modern critical theories of how meanings and bodies get made, not in order to deny meaning and bodies, but in order to live in meanings and bodies that have a chance for a future. (Haraway, 1991: 187)

I begin this section by quoting Haraway at length, for her words seize both the dilemmas and potential rewards of interpreting globalizations with the devices provided by materialist feminist theories. In the passage above, she identifies some of the epistemological and analytical devices which circumvent the dangers of falling back upon the global/local and objectivism/relativism dualisms.

The construction of a binary opposition between global and local has tended to obstruct closer examinations of the global-local nexus, the intersecting and interrelated character of the forms in and through which global practices have become/are becoming localized and local trends have been/are being globalized.¹¹ The global is injecting itself into the local, while the local is spreading across the world. Indeed, one of the most significant features of globalizations relates to the collapse of discursive and analytical boundaries separating spatial scales, the implications of which have barely begun to be appreciated.¹²

When approaching globalizations, materialist feminists insist on the necessity of producing "situated knowledges" (Haraway, 1991). This requires, in the first place, that all tales be perspectival, located (and locatable) in geographical and historical terms. As discursive categories which do not exist as external realities but rather are constituted in and through various interpretive schemes, global patterns have manifested themselves and been

¹¹The use of the global-local nexus is not intended to circumvent or peripheralize other analytical scales, notably the regional, the national, and the continental. The interface of the global and the urban constitutes this thesis' point of entry, other levels playing supporting roles.

¹²As indicated earlier, not all locales are presented as equally significant from a global point of view -- that is to say, as universal ideal-types of globalizations; the concept of 'global cities' serves to identify and distinguish among contenders. The power relations involved in knowledge production and dissemination largely determine which local sites are considered globally meaningful and which are seen as meaningless.

The recent struggles of indigenous peoples in the Chiapas region (Cleaver, 1994) are but one instance of the collapse of scales, a trend which can best be grasped through an study of the global-local nexus.

understood differently across time and space.¹³ Thus, analyses of globalizations must be locally contextualized rather than universally abstracted, situated from a position within the world rather than one outside of it. Moreover, materialist feminists exercise self-reflexivity about their positions within matrixes of class, gender and ethnic relations -- particularly if these positions are constituted by and through the safe spaces of privilege and authority. Different perspectives, derived from multiple locations within webs of social relations, are to be sought and promoted.

Perspectivism also entails the partiality of all knowledges. Because materialist feminist narratives proclaim where and by whom they are generated -- the fact that they come from somewhere and someone -- the limitations and incompleteness of their claims are readily admitted (Grosz, 1993: 209). It follows that partial discourses problematize totalizing undertakings which claim to capture the world in its entirety and reductively tie its complexities to an underlying unity. Yet from sub-Saharan Africa to North America, from Shanghai to Buenos Aires, the innumerable socio-spatial configurations which form pieces of (what we have named) the globe cannot be fully grasped by a singular, all-encompassing framework of understanding. Materialist feminist projects adopt partial modes of seeing; situatedness and partiality are traits to be built upon, not flaws to be transcended in the pursuit of a disembodied Cartesian viewpoint .

Materialist feminist critiques of the dichotomous logic of the objectivism/subjectivism couple begin by abandoning the pretence of objectivity, the distinction between subject and object (Harding, 1986: 647). Attempts to separate knower and known are rejected on the basis of their

¹³Appadurai's (1990) notion of "scapes", indicating that numerous viewpoints of global processes exist, will be used in the next chapter.

scientific objectives, those of gaining mastery over and control of (what are perceived to be) independent, external realities; the neutral gaze is founded upon instrumental rationality, according to which (so-called) objects of study are understood as means in the quest for universal truths. Objectivity relies on a belief in truth as correspondence, the validity of a particular theory being determined by the extent to which it matches observable facts (Grosz, 1993: 190-91). From this follows another troublesome objectivist distinction, that between facts and values; it is believed that the activity of discovery must not be tainted by the subjective beliefs of observers. In other words, knowledge producers must leave (or check) their values at the doorstep of social inquiry.

Instead, materialist feminists insist that all knowledge claims are partisan in that they are created from particular perspectives and are closely linked to specific socio-political projects. Narratives contribute to the construction of competing regimes of truth, which in turn form fields of discursive struggle. The question of which regimes become and remain hegemonic arises out of the power relations which exist in given spatio-temporal contexts. From this point of view, then, stories of/on globalizations mark political interventions which concurrently produce and reflect ideas about the latter set of phenomena. Thus, neo-liberal and neo-conservative accounts of globalizations cannot attribute their wide acceptance to allegedly superior insights or more accurate representations of what is believed to be really happening 'out there'. Hegemonic globalization scripts are partial ones which, by focusing on certain facets, neatly correspond to the projects of dominant social groups in the North Atlantic region -- that is, of (largely) white male transnational capital.

However, having discarded objective standards, materialist feminisms do not revel in a subjectivist mood of 'anything goes' pluralism, whereby all positions would be regarded as equally valid given the dismissal of

metaphysical grounds from which to distinguish among truth claims. Subjectivism and absolute relativism are simply another set of tactics to deny the situated character of knowledges:

Relativism is a way of being nowhere while claiming to be everywhere equally. The 'equality' of positioning is a denial of responsibility and critical enquiry. Relativism is the perfect mirror twin of totalization in the ideologies of objectivity; both deny the stakes in location, embodiment, and partial perspective; both make it impossible to see well. (Haraway, 1991: 191)

In a discursive field, the task of normatively evaluating regimes of truth cannot be abandoned at the hands of existing relations of domination/subordination; if left to their own devices, alternative tales are unlikely to circulate and be disseminated freely. Certain devices are needed to empower subaltern groups, to assist them in endorsing interpretive frameworks which legitimate their own socio-political projects.

To avoid slipping into the murky waters of absolute relativism, three possible strategies have been outlined by materialist feminists. The first position has been named "strong objectivity", since it is contended that the latter term can be redefined as the outcome of partial perspectives and situated knowledges (Harding, 1986; Haraway, 1991). This manoeuvre has the merit of attempting to reclaim the meaning of a certain concept, shifting the ground of what has traditionally been understood as objectivity. Nonetheless, the term itself is problematic as it carries both scientistic and dualistic traces which cannot be erased by attaching "strong" or "weak" signifiers. Objectivism should be abandoned *tout court*.

The second position is that of standpoint theorists, who extend Marx's privileging of the proletariat's perspective to different subordinate groups. The latter are thus believed to possess better interpretative skills by virtue of their marginal locations in webs of social relations. Bar On demonstrates the

dangers of this line of argument: "Although the empowerment of its own members is an important goal for every marginalized social group, by claiming an authority based in epistemic privilege the group reinscribes the values and practices used to socially marginalize it by excluding its voice, silencing it and commanding its obedience to the voice of the dominant group." (1993: 96-7) Because standpoint theories establish hierarchical and essentialist links between subject positions and access to truth, they should not be considered suitable responses to subjectivist dilemmas.

Materialist feminists have turned their attention to a third epistemological stance which, following Neufeld (1993), can be called "theoretical reflexivity". Most fully developed in the work of Fraser (1989: 181-2), a reflexive standpoint enables us to make evaluative judgments about competing narratives on the basis of the socio-political interests to which they correspond and the effects which are sought by their deployment. The merits of particular discourses are derived from two related criteria: 1) their ability to position hegemonic viewpoints and destabilize the reproduction of such hegemonies, and 2) their contributions to the various struggles against oppression waged by women, workers, and people of colour through the creation of emancipatory analytical frameworks.¹⁴ Theoretical reflexivity fulfills these conditions better than either strong objectivism or 'standpointism', the latter tactics striving simply to substitute hegemonic regimes of truth by subaltern ones rather than questioning the mechanisms with which truth is generated. In addition, since tending to exclude perspectives which are considered 'subjective' or those which do not

¹⁴Materialist feminist interventions are not built upon transcendental norms, but rather situated ethics which are located geographically and historically. Opposing metaphysical foundations, Fraser claims: "whereas Habermas purports to ground 'communicative ethics' in the conditions of possibility of speech understood universalistically and ahistorically, I consider it a contingently evolved, historically specific possibility." (1989: 187, fn. 41)

come from a particular standpoint, such strategies stand in an uneasy relationship to the emancipatory ideal of inclusion.

C. Openings: Materialist Feminist Readings of Globalizations

The epistemological insights drawn from materialist feminisms can now be applied to sketch the contours of my own readings of globalizations. First, to avoid the global/local dualism, I propose to examine how the global trends of economic restructuring and transnational migrations operate in specific urban locales. Analyses of the interplay of micro and macro scales, of what Lash and Urry (1994) identify as the twin phenomena of "globalization and localization", are in keeping with Hall's plea for multidimensional narratives which respect specificity and complexity:

I have tried then to describe the new forms of global economic and cultural power which are apparently paradoxical: multi-national but de-centered. It is hard to understand but I think that is what we are moving into: not the unity of the singular corporate enterprise which tries to encapsulate the entire world within its confines, but much more decentralized and decentered forms of social and economic organization. (1991a: 30)

Secondly, the objectivism/subjectivism binary can be subverted by way of a reflexive stance which justifies this thesis' stories of globalizations on politico-normative grounds -- that is, on the basis that they sustain struggles for emancipation in their multiple embodiments. In this respect, an interpretive strategy of marginality, of viewing global occurrences from the margins of the narratives which construct them, proves useful; rather than 'what are globalizations?', the crucial question becomes 'what are the effects of "retell[ing] the story from the bottom up, instead of from the top down" (Hall, 1991a: 35)?' Put differently, what difference does it make to view globalization not from the

exclusive and rarified observation decks of (mostly white male) transnational capital, but rather from the vantage points of (in this instance) immigrants of colour living and working in global cities?¹⁵

In her essay "Choosing the Margin as a Site of Radical Openness," hooks expresses the double meaning of marginality in a way that corresponds to reflexive interpretations of globalizations:

I make a definitive distinction between that marginality which is imposed by oppressive structures and that marginality one chooses as a site of resistance -- as location of radical openness and possibility. This site of resistance is continually formed in that segregated culture of opposition that is our critical response to domination. (1991: 153)

Hence, marginality enables two simultaneous forms of interventions. In the first sense, it compels us to identify and denounce the material forms which the subjugation of various Third World immigrants take in relation to globalizations.¹⁶ Yet as a site of resistance, marginality also points to ways through which other scripts of globalizations -- scripts of/on globalizations' others -- can undermine hegemonic knowledges, revealing the latter's ties to the interests of dominant social groups.

Marginal reading strategies are not intended to deny dominant stories of globalizations, to reposition them at the peripheries of our theoretical understandings in order to centre subjugated knowledges. Instead, they

¹⁵Both metaphorically and literally, the former are symbolized by the top storeys of postmodern glass-and-steel skyscrapers, monuments which inscribe the power of transnational capital in urban texts. As for the latter perspective, it will be employed in Chapter 3

¹⁶The use of phrases such as 'immigrants of colour' or 'Third World immigrants' is not meant to homogenize or deny the considerable differences which exist among and between these groups. It is shorthand for matrixes of oppression which contrast with the privileges of white male transnational capital. In this sense, I follow Mohanty's explanation: "I use the term '*third world*' with full awareness of its problems, only because this is the terminology available to us at the moment." (1991b: 75, fn. 1). Feminists of colour and postcolonial theorists have reappropriated the meaning of 'Third World', giving it a subversive potential which mobilizes oppositional movements while moving away from political binaries; this notion nicely matches my discussion of a politics of hybridity in the fourth chapter.

dislodge the fixed locations of narratives by unsettling the very acts of centring and marginalizing, of creating discursive hierarchies which both reflect and support existing power relations. Materialist feminists ask whose stories of globalization are seen as primary and whose, by the same token, are rendered peripheral? Said's notion of "contrapuntal reading" constitutes such an act of decentring, for it insists on the ties that bind hegemonic and subordinate interpretations: "In juxtaposing experiences with each other, in letting them play off each other, it is my interpretive political aim (in the broadest sense) to make concurrent those views and experiences that are ideologically and culturally closed to each other and that attempt to distance or suppress other views and experiences" (1993: 32-3). Marginality thus demands that the various narratives of/on globalization be situated within discursive fields and webs of power so as to enable studies of the connections among the experiences of transnational capital and those of immigrants of colour in particular spatio-temporal sites.

Choosing marginality is not a matter of speaking for, or striving to become, the subaltern -- an idea which Spivak (1988) has convincingly problematized -- but rather to expose the silences in existing discursive constructions of globalizations, silences which render Third World immigrants invisible and thereby contribute to their continuing marginalization. As Yúdice states: "We need not speak for others, but we are responsible for a 'self-forming activity' that can in no way be ethical if we do not act against the 'disappearance' of oppressed subjects." (1988: 230) Thus, reflexively situating oneself at the margins arises out of the recognition of one's privileges as, for instance, a middle-class, heterosexual, Japanese-(French-)Canadian man writing from Ottawa in 1995. However, the act of acknowledging one's potential authority must sidestep both superficial personal confessions and the silencing

of those who do not fit into supposed ideal profiles of oppression;¹⁷ for materialist feminists, it entails a responsibility to put one's advantages to subversive uses, to challenge the discursive structures which maintain relations of domination and subordination (Hennessy, 1993: 4-5). In short, to bite the hands that feed me/us.

Materialist feminisms politicize apparently neutral definitions of globalizations, arguing that conventional perceptions of these phenomena support the views of (primarily white male) global capitalists who operate in the central business districts of world cities. Therefore, I am not interested in building a more accurate and objective globalization script, a metanarrative to rival other regimes of truth; the purpose of this project is to offer alternative stories which focus on marginalized agents and spaces of globalizations -- globalizations' multiple others. As it will be used throughout, the signifier 'globalizations' refers to uneven and fractal patchworks of temporal accelerations, spatial proliferations and overall intensifications of several flows (diseases, information, goods and services, money, cultures, people) across national territorial boundaries. Although not independent of each other, these patterns are complex and, to borrow Appadurai's term (1990), "disjunctive"; they cannot be reduced to expressions of a unified global logic. Furthermore, globalizations involve fundamental restructurings of socio-spatial relations, for if nothing else, power lies at its very heart. Finally, globalizations are not to be considered a kind of juggernaut which sweeps everything and everyone in its passage, nor as a steamroller which flattens out differences and confirms McLuhan's "global village" prophecies. Varying greatly, the effects of global

¹⁷This latter position, an extreme version of identity politics, relies on essentialist criteria to determine who can speak and who must remain silent. Closely related to some standpoint theories, it attempts to reverse dichotomies (by privileging the second term) rather than to overturn them.

processes are heterogeneous in that they are spread unevenly across spatial sites and social groups. In other words, since the latter are positioned differently in the webs of power relations of which globalizations are composed, they will be affected in widely divergent ways.¹⁸

In keeping with anti-essentialist thinking, materialist feminisms refuse to explain (away) globalizations by bringing them back down to an allegedly fundamental dimension, which is usually understood (economistically) as the restructuring of class relations. Global trends operate at a number of different levels, affecting national, gender, class and ethnic/racial relations; none of these enjoys ontological primacy. However, because of the sheer complexity of socio-spatial processes, materialist feminists need to specify an entry point into social analysis (Graham, 1992: 142-3). For the reasons explained above, transnational migrations constitute my own, partial lenses with which to engage with discourses on/of globalizations. Yet it does not follow that I consider migration to be the essential category of globalizations; the former are only disruptive, marginal and limited points of contact with the latter.

Before moving on, we should return to the matter at hand: the place of materialist feminisms in this project. First, I am concerned with the materialization of power relations which circulate in and through globalizations, the ways in and through which power is expressed, inscribed and made visible in the everyday lives of immigrants of colour located in metropolises. Second, I am arguing that materialist feminist interventions do not call for an exclusive (or, for that matter, primary) focus on women or the restructuring of gender relations.¹⁹ Rather, they attempt to examine the networks of power which are

¹⁸Hence my preference for globalizations (in the plural), which supports the emphasis placed on multiplicity, plurality and difference when tackling social constructs -- which defy the sense of closure invoked by singular narratives.

¹⁹Such a position would follow from an essentialist line of reasoning. On another level, materialist feminist authors problematize the monolithic character of the universal category

formed by the intersections of various social relations. Indeed, for Alcoff and Potter:

[...] feminist epistemology should not be taken as involving a commitment to gender as the primary axis of oppression, in any sense of 'primary,' or positing that gender is a theoretical variable separable from other axes of oppression and susceptible to a unique analysis. [...] Thus, to refer to a liberatory project as 'feminist' cannot mean that it is only for or about 'women,' but that it is informed by or consistent with feminism. It seeks, in current feminist parlance, to unmake the web of oppressions and reweave the web of life. (1993: 3-4)

To claim that materialist feminist approaches should be devoted to (or, more appropriately, restricted to) the analysis of 'women's issues' -- supposing such issues could be specified -- is to diffuse their subversive implications vis-à-vis hegemonic knowledges. As I have tried to indicate throughout this chapter, these radical epistemologies are valuable in that they destabilize the dualist foundations of Enlightenment thought. Striking at the very heart of conventional renditions of globalizations, they provide instruments to construct subaltern discourses.

By calling on perspectival knowledges and looking at connections between the global and the local, materialist feminist strategies have simultaneously dismantled the universalizing thrust of international political economy and neo-Marxist urban geography, and resolved the opposition between the two scales. As for the objectivist/subjectivist binary, it has been effectively sidestepped by appealing to an ethic of marginality. These epistemological reflections on globalizations cannot be left on their own, however; they must be complemented by theoretical frameworks, a task which is undertaken in the next chapter.

'women,' the use of which tends to obscure differences and hierarchies among and between them.

CHAPTER 2

GLOBALIZATIONS AND THE URBAN: WORLDS IN FLOW, WORLDS OF FLOWS

In the previous chapter, globalizations were defined as highly differentiated temporal accelerations, spatial dispersals and overall intensifications of various flows across national territorial borders -- processes which, in other words, have initiated a transition from inter-national to global world(s). Produced from Archimedean standpoints, most often those of white, Euro-American male capitalists, conventional interpretations have constructed a monolithic and totalizing story of globalizations. By centrally positioning a narrative about the expansion and conquest of global capitalism over the world and its inhabitants, and claiming that this particular reality is graspable as a single, unified whole, other dimensions of globalizations -- or even the possibility that one may speak of globalizations in the plural -- have been relegated to the discursive margins; at best, these other stories are seen as footnotes to the main business at hand, that of writing the grandiose adventure of global capitalism.

Grounded in materialist feminist strategies, the globalization scripts which I will present in the following pages focus on the restructuring of matrixes of power in which social groups are embedded. Hence, in addition to transforming class relations, globalizations can be read as a series of gendered and racialized processes. While global capitalism should be part of the picture, I am claiming that globalizations have been shaped by many other transformations. Among these, one to which not much attention has been

devoted serves as my point of entry: transnational migrations. To note, I am providing accounts which are partial, which recognize (rather than claim to transcend) my/their own limitations and situatedness; globalizations identify plural, heterogeneous phenomena, the impacts of which (and interpretations of) vary greatly across and between different locales and social groups.

This project builds upon several important contributions to the literature on globalizations. Castells' remarks about "the historical emergence of the space of flows, superseding the meaning of the space of places" (1989: 348) are suggestive of worlds in/of flow(s), though they imply a binary spatial logic opposing dynamic flows to static places.¹ The more appropriate question -- at least for the purposes of this chapter -- is not so much one of historical transition, but rather of interaction and embeddedness; in other words, how is the space of flows transforming the space of places? Other central writings are those of Sassen (1988) and Harvey (1982), who examine movements of capital and labour in the world economy. Though important, their analyses tend to reduce transnational migrations to labour flows, which are derived from the logic of global capitalism. Such a perspective carries a number of flaws. First of all, workers no longer represent the main immigration category in most North Atlantic zones, having been overtaken by family reunifications and refugees. Further, the diversity and complexity of the gender, racial, national and class compositions of contemporary Third World immigrants tend to be erased by regrouping them under the label of 'labour migration'. Migrant identities are constructed through their insertion in several social processes, capitalist relations of production being only one of these.

¹Moreover, Castells' perspective seems to be rather one-dimensional, referring only to informational/technological flows. Elaborating on the comment cited above, he states. "By this we understand the deployment of the functional logic of power-holding organizations in asymmetrical networks of exchanges which do not depend on the characteristics of any specific locale for the fulfillment of their fundamental goals." (1989: 348)

Most prominently featured is Appadurai's "Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy", whose "landscape" metaphors provide tremendously rich and multilayered frameworks of analysis. These devices seize the thrust of materialist feminist arguments about the necessity for situatedness:

I use terms with the common suffix *scape* to indicate first of all that these are not objectively given relations which look the same from every angle of vision, but rather that they are deeply perspectival constructs, inflected very much by the historical, linguistic and political situatedness of different sorts of actors: nation-states, multinationals, diasporic communities, as well as sub-national groupings and movements (whether religious, political or economic), and even intimate face-to-face groups, such as villages, neighbourhoods and families. (Appadurai, 1990: 296)

Keeping the multi-dimensionality of the social in mind, I would like to introduce two concepts which will guide my investigations into some of the dimensions of globalizations: *ethnoscapes*² and *capitalscapes*³. While the former corresponds to global flows of people (transnational migrations) and the second to global movements of capital, both notions also draw attention to their impacts on the restructuring of various socio-spatial configurations.

Paradoxically perhaps, globalizations have given us the opportunity to see the world not as a seamless whole, but rather -- to paraphrase Soja (1989: 149) -- as ensembles of landscapes composed of interconnected, heterogeneous, nested local mosaics. I now want to turn to one of the main factors which compels us to adopt such a viewpoint, transnational movements

²Appadurai defines an *ethnoscape* as: "[...] the landscape of persons who constitute the shifting world in which we live: tourists, immigrants, refugees, exiles, guestworkers and other moving groups and persons constitute an essential feature of the world, and appear to affect the politics of and between nations to an unprecedented degree." (1990: 297) My discussion of *ethnoscapes* will be restricted to more permanent forms of human movements -- that is to say, immigration from Africa, Asia, South America and the Caribbean to the North Atlantic region.

³I prefer this term to that of "*finanscape*" (Appadurai, 1990: 298), which focuses exclusively on global movements of money; by contrast, the use of '*capitalscapes*' is meant to invoke both capital flows and the local socio-spatial impacts which have been generated by them.

of populations and the ethnoscaples of hybridity to which they have given way in Euro-American worlds. From this ensues a discussion of changing North Atlantic capitalscapes, which are combined with ethnoscaples in global cities. Hence, the final part of this chapter will review three distinct phases of urban analysis in order to retain socio-spatial metaphors suited to the realities of contemporary metropolises.

I. Transnational Migrations, Hybrid Ethnoscaples

This section does not claim to provide a complete, global map of what Castles and Miller (1993) designate as "the age of migration", nor does it examine the reasons which have prompted vast movements of people from the South to the North in recent decades.⁴ These tasks have been pursued elsewhere, in studies whose scope and breadth go well beyond my own (Appleyard, 1991; Castles and Miller, 1993; SOPEMI, 1992; Stalker, 1994). Rather, through the lenses provided by materialist feminisms, partial readings of some of these trends will be presented. Specifically, my focal point is conceived of as the flows of people of colour from Third World areas to North Atlantic urban zones.

Within dominant representations of globalization (in the singular), neo-conservative and neo-liberal accounts riveted on global flows of money, investment, goods and services, transnational migrations remain largely absent; silences in hegemonic discourses. If mentioned at all, population movements

⁴It need only be said here that the factors which account for transnational migrations cannot be reduced to a single dynamic, whether it be cultural, social, political or economic. Instead, it is the interplay of these elements which should serve as a basis for analysis. For instance, Stalker provides a broad list of "why people move": disparities between rich and poor countries, population imbalances, development disruptions, links between sending and receiving countries, mass communications, family strategies, migrant networks, recruitment, and professionals on the move (1994: 21-40).

are either considered to be derived from the functional requirements of world capitalism, or are studied in terms of elite migrations by (disproportionately white, bourgeois, Euro-American male) transnational "symbolic analysts" (Reich, 1992). Marginal reading strategies require that we shift our analytical gazes from such globetrotters to the masses from subaltern gender, racial/ethnic, and class groups who are making their way northward. Given the disjuncture of ethnoscapas vis-à-vis other global trends, as well as the sheer complexity of the phenomenon⁵, only three aspects are studied here: the sources of migration flows to North Atlantic locales, the effects of transnational migrations for Euro-American worlds, and the regulation of these flows by national states.

Since the late 1960s, a dramatic transformation of migratory patterns has occurred in North America and Europe. Though people of colour from different parts of the world have always journeyed (most often unwillingly) to the latter regions⁶, most of the transnational population movements in this area followed transatlantic routes from Britain and continental Europe to North America (Thomas, 1973: 83). Today, the migration axes in Euro-American zones have largely shifted from an East-West to a South-North direction. Sources of migration have proliferated as substantial numbers of peoples from Africa, South America, the Caribbean, and Asia have come to stay.⁷

⁵Appadurai puts it in these terms: "The complexity of the current global economy has to do with certain fundamental disjunctures between economy, culture and politics which we have barely begun to theorize." (1990: 296)

⁶Most prominent in previous centuries were systems of slavery and indentured labour, which forcibly displaced millions of Third World peoples from their homelands. In many respects, the histories of migrations to North America -- to give but one instance of a much wider project -- need to be rewritten from the margins, to integrate the genocidal consequences of European colonization on Aboriginal populations as well as the varied contributions of slaves and indentured workers.

⁷To illustrate this point, the main national origins of recent immigrants to three North Atlantic countries should be examined. For Great Britain, these are: India, Jamaica, Kenya, Pakistan, and Bangladesh (Stalker, 1994: 198); for Canada: Hong Kong, Philippines, Sri Lanka,

By shattering myths of ethnic and racial uniformity, transnational migrations have powerfully and permanently altered the identities of the North Atlantic. Increasingly, the latter is rupturing into ensembles of hybrid ethnoscares from which the histories of people of colour are being (re)written and (re)lived. As boundaries -- both ethno-cultural and spatial -- blur, imaginary maps are being redrawn. Trinh expresses this developing state of hybridity:

[...] Third World has moved West (or North, depending on where the dividing line falls) and has expanded so as to include even the remote parts of the First World. What is at stake is not only the hegemony of Western cultures, but also their identities as unified cultures. Third World dwells on diversity; so does First World. This is our strength and our misery. The West is painfully made to realize the existence of a Third World within the First World, and vice versa. The Master is bound to recognize that His Culture is not as homogeneous, as monolithic as He believed it to be. He discovers, with much reluctance, He is just an other among others. (1989: 98-9)

Global binaries (North/South, First World/Third World, Occident/Orient) are being destabilized, thereby problematizing unambivalent references to (what has been constituted) as monolithic Euro-American 'civilizational' identities; at the very least, if such signifiers are meant to be convenient geographical shorthand, they cannot serve to identify uniform territorial entities. In turn, rather than being conceptualized as monolithic racial or ethno-cultural spaces neatly carved out by borders, North Atlantic nation-states are progressively being transformed into a range of post-colonial landscapes, a patchwork of hybrid locales.⁸

Of course, these ethnoscares do not come into being spontaneously; inserted in specific power configurations, they are molded by existing social relations. Counterposed to scenarios of a "borderless world" (Ohmae, 1990) in

India, and Poland (Stalker, 1994: 179); for Sweden (excluding the Nordic countries) Yugoslavia, Iran, Chile, Turkey, and Poland (Stalker, 1994: 191).

⁸The implications of this way of thinking will be pursued in Chapter 4.

which barriers to global movement have all but disappeared, the experiences of Third World immigrants must be put forth; for whom is the world borderless? As different sites are restructured by flows of all sorts, power is deployed through global mobility -- that is, the ease with which the crossing of national borders is accomplished. As Massey eloquently puts it:

For different social groups and different individuals are placed in very distinct ways in relation to these flows and interconnections. This point concerns not merely the issue of who moves and who doesn't, although this is an important element of it; it is also about power in relation to the flows and the movements. Different social groups have distinct relationships to this anyway-differentiated mobility: some are more in charge of it than others; some initiate flows and movement, others don't; some are more on the receiving end of it than others; some are effectively imprisoned by it. (1993: 61)

Unrestricted freedom of movement, a condition which accompanies disembodied views of the world, is enjoyed by global elites: overwhelmingly white, Euro-American, bourgeois and professional men tied to the activities of transnational corporations. Not coincidentally, from these same groups hail the management gurus, consultants and (dare I say) academics who have created dominant globalization narratives by universalizing their own partial, situated experiences of globetrotting.

Claims of borderlessness are meaningless, even perverse, for Vietnamese refugees who await in Hong Kong holding camps, for Haitians who are constantly denied access to Florida by the U.S. Coast Guard, or for Mexican workers who attempt to cross into Southern California.⁹ For millions of Caribbean, South American, African and Asian immigrants, the boundaries of the North Atlantic are by no means porous, nor even dissolving. New walls are

⁹Robberson (1995) explains how high-tech devices have conveniently served to fortify and militarize the U.S.-Mexico border: "Because of a four-month-old, \$34 million Border Patrol program dubbed Operation Gatekeeper, migrants are changing their tactics and routes in hope of evading newly installed infrared scopes, seismic sensors and a vast array of other equipment to thwart passage."

erected, as the surveillance, monitoring and policing of national borders are being (re)constituted with a vengeance; the huddled masses (of colour), the strangers at the gates, must be kept out, given that the power and sovereignty of national states are to be asserted by controlling the 'ins' and 'outs' of their populations. States act as gatekeepers, attempting to maintain control over the entry of people within their territorial spaces. When outer-territorial techniques of exclusion fail, state authority is deployed internally through the granting or denial of citizenship (and all associated rights) to certain social groups and individuals. Illegal immigrants are constructed as an identifiable category, needing to be expelled for (so-called) trespassing.¹⁰

Conventional perspectives of/on globalizations have identified an apparently major contradiction: while flows of money, goods, services, ideas and information are deregulated to encourage unencumbered mobility, the movement of people continues to be closely regulated (Richmond, 1994). Yet this only seems paradoxical if globalizations are considered to be a singular process whereby boundaries are receding beyond (or outside) the socio-spatial limits of nation-states. Alternatively, if as I have been suggesting throughout this chapter, globalizations are interpreted as multiple reconfigurations of social relations, borders can be understood as sieves or filters which are selectively permeable. Power relations determine which flows are fully mobile in world

¹⁰Quasi-paramilitary (white male) immigration investigators patrol the streets of global cities, raiding buildings to flush out illegal immigrants. In a recent article, the Globe and Mail (1992) describes the scene at the arrest of a black Jamaican man in Toronto.

Two men dressed in black combat pants and boots, one wearing a bulletproof vest, flank an apartment door on the 11th floor of an apartment building in a public housing project in suburban North York. One of the men, wearing a black leather shoulder harness with handcuffs, a radio and a small billy club attached to it, knocks quietly on the door. A woman cradling a baby in her arms opens it [] The woman, surprised, steps back without a word and the men rush for a bedroom door, fling it open and pin the arms of a half-awake man, clad only in his underpants, who is trying to get out of bed. The time is 7.55 a.m. and the Toronto office of the immigration investigative service is making its first arrest of the day.

space and which movements remain tied to place; class, gender, nationality and race/ethnicity are all traits affecting the extent to which particular bodies are mobile.¹¹ Since, unlike other flows, transnational migrations are not (yet?) reducible to electronic circuits inserted in informational webs, the comings and goings of human bodies across national territories can be surveyed with relative ease.

II. Global Capital Flows, Urban Capitalscapes

When weaving materialist feminist tales about global movements of capital, one is required to eschew the dual temptations of economism and totalization. Though the significance of these flows cannot be dismissed, they do not represent the only, or even the essential, facet of globalizations. A further challenge has to do with the need to avoid constructing yet another god's-eye view of the world economy by unproblematically mapping the latter as a uniform whole. According to such narratives, global capitalism has become a universal behemoth which fills every socio-spatial nook and cranny to reshape and bind them into a seamless web. Hence, rather than trying to superimpose global capitalism on maps of the world, or to obtain a capitalist topography of the globe, I propose to focus on transnational flows of capital as well as the impacts of these on the restructuring of urban capitalscapes.

Following Marx's argument in Capital, certain neo-Marxist theorists (Madeuf and Michalet, 1978; Palloix, 1977) have usefully distinguished three transnationalized circuits of capital: commodity capital (global trade in goods

¹¹The distinction between the mobility of capital and the movement of labour is established in Pellerin (1995); as opposed to the latter, transnational capitalists derive benefits from being mobile. One need only think of customs and immigration queues at airports in Europe and North America, comparing the ease of access of, for instance, a black Zairian female refugee and a white British businessman.

and services), money capital (international financial markets), and productive capital (foreign investment in productive activities).¹² While the transnationalization of the first circuit has been pivotal, it is those of the latter two which have most contributed to economic globalizations. In the case of the circuit of productive capital, the trend towards the relocation of certain labour-intensive activities to specific Southern production sites -- known as the new international division of labour in the 1970s (Fröbel, Heirichs and Kreye, 1978) -- continues today. During the course of the last two decades, investment and production flows have ebbed and flowed within the North. The 1980s were marked by a concentration of capital within and between the Triad formed by Western Europe, Japan and North America (Gordon, 1988; UNCTC, 1992: 14), whereas the 1990s have seen a redirection of foreign investment to particular Southern zones (UNCTAD, 1994: 9).¹³ The globalization of the circuit of productive capital has enabled certain transnational corporations to become deterritorialized, essentially eliminating national socio-spatial considerations. As Reich explains in the U.S. context:

National champions everywhere are becoming global webs with no particular connection to any single nation. As American corporations increasingly produce or buy from abroad, and foreign-owned firms increasingly produce in or buy from America, the two sets of global webs are coming to resemble each other -- regardless of their nominal nationality. (1992: 131)

¹²Capital should be conceived not as a thing, but as a relation which connects different gender, class and racial/ethnic groups. Hence, in addition to capitalists, transnational capital circuits involve women, workers, ethnic minorities and immigrants employed in what Hansen calls the "production of global control functions". (1993: 7)

¹³Between 1986 and 1990, 83% of total foreign direct investment inflows and 97% of total foreign investment outflows occurred among OECD countries. The vast majority of these flows were between and within the three regions named above (UNCTC, 1992: 14, 21). However, by 1993, the picture had changed significantly: 41% of global foreign direct investment inflows were received by countries of the South. It is important to note that this shift has only affected certain regions of Asia, South America and the Caribbean, while Africa remains relatively untouched by transnational capital movements (UNCTAD, 1994: 9-13).

Identified by Appadurai (1990:298) as the "finanscape", the formation of transnational networks of money capital represents the most striking feature of economic globalizations.¹⁴ With the advent of telecommunications and informational technologies, spatial distances and time lags have both been effectively annihilated. Instantaneous financial movements have supported global money and credit markets, as well as fully integrated stock exchanges (Harvey, 1989: 160-3; UNCTC, 1988: 101-21). It is here, amidst the electronic networks in and through which financial capital circulates, that the 'borderless world' comes into relief.¹⁵

Dominant representations have accentuated the homogenizing consequences of economic globalization (in the singular), a seamless and placeless web of worldwide flows seeming to have created an undifferentiated North Atlantic space. Another element of the story, that which deals with heterogeneity, has been repressed and/or forgotten. Materialist feminist perspectives highlight this discursive silence to look at the complexity, fragmentation, and divergence among Euro-American capitalscapes in light of integrations, accelerations and intensifications of capital circuits on the world stage. In order to do so, the notion of the international division of labour -- new or otherwise -- should be reconsidered. The latter stems from attempts to

¹⁴Here again, Appadurai's writing is evocative: "Thus it is useful to speak as well of 'finanscapes', since the disposition of global capital is now a more mysterious, rapid and difficult landscape to follow than ever before, as currency markets, national stock exchanges, and commodity speculations move mega-monies through national turnstiles at blinding speed, with vast absolute implications for small differences in percentage points and time units." (1990: 298)

¹⁵Although not developed in this thesis, it is important to note that states have contributed to the transnationalization of the three circuits of capital by way of trade agreements, foreign ownership regulations, and financial deregulation. Hence, processes of economic globalizations have operated through (rather than outside of) state interventions; instead of disappearing or becoming powerless, states have been restructured to face new challenges. On the debates around the specific state forms which are currently emerging, and the extent to which states are central to globalizations, see Cox (1987), Gill (1990), Jessop (1993) and Panitch (1994). Jessop's argument about the transition from a Keynesian welfare state (KWS) to a Schumpeterian workfare state (SWS) is particularly compelling.

translate in spatial terms the observed structure of capitalist production, in which each worker or set of workers specialize in the performance of a given set of tasks; the globe is understood as divided into two regions, each specializing in certain forms of production according to an advanced/backward binary.

In the early 20th century, classical Marxist theories of imperialism devised the concept of the international division of labour (IDL) according to which the world economy was composed of Northern industrial zones and Southern agricultural areas (Bukharin, n.d.; Kautsky, 1970; Lenin, 1975). The idea of a new international division of labour (NIDL) came into being during the 1970s, providing an explanation for the (labour-intensive) industrialization of certain parts of the Third World and the consequent deindustrialization of the North Atlantic (Fröbel, Heinrichs and Kreye, 1978). Recently, it has been argued that a 'new' new international division of labour (NNIDL) has emerged as the informational revolution paved the way for post-industrialism. According to this post-Fordist theory, services and knowledge-based production are concentrated in the North while low-tech, labour-intensive activities have continued to move to Southern locations (Dolan, 1992).

The development of global capital flows, notably of productive and financial capital, has destabilized the analytical power of such dichotomous maps of the world. Indeed, due to the various ways in which capital flows have penetrated and circulated within it, the North Atlantic cannot be conceived of as a uniform, informational space. Insights are to be found in the writings of economic geographers, who have the powerful images of a "global mosaic of regional economies" (Storper and Scott, 1992: 11) and of a "nested hierarchy of regionalized and nodal locales" (Soja, 1989: 158-9). Two defining aspects of Euro-American sites have been noted. First, they are fractured and diverse in the sense that different forms of production -- high-tech and downgraded

manufacturing, consumer and producer services -- exist side-by-side, complementing one another. The sweatshops of 19th-century garment manufacturing and the futuristic skyscrapers of multinational banking are part of the same story, woven together to form the capitalscapes of the late 20th century (Amin and Robins, 1990: 23) . Second, because they are highly integrated within global networks of capital, these same locales are fluid and constantly being reconfigured. As transnational capital moves through them, the productive structures of locales are transformed; successive and overlapping waves of deindustrialization, reindustrialization and postindustrialization, of economic boom and bust, converge to shape contemporary capitalscapes. Soja evocatively frames it in these terms:

Relatively stable mosaics of uneven regional development have suddenly become almost kaleidoscopic. [...] The regional restructuring that has been taking place is much more complex and unstable. It might better be described as an accelerated regional recycling, with regions moving through several phases of development and decline in association with shifting sectoral superprofits, rounds of intensive labour disciplining, and heightened capital mobility. (1989: 172)

Therefore, the economic and spatial mosaics of the North Atlantic can be interpreted as a variety of internally differentiated, interlinked, dynamic, complex, and even contradictory capitalist landscapes. Within them, temporally disjunctive forms of production are integrated into webs of socio-spatial relations which defy singular designations. Capitalscapes should be read as decentred socio-spatial matrices, the meanings and identities of which differ according to subjects' perspectives.

III. Global Cities, Urban Heterotopias

Through ethnoscaples and capitalscapes, divergent yet parallel narratives about the patterns taken by global flows can be told. For materialist feminist analyses, then, the crux of the challenge lies in the necessity to show the connections between the two stories without subsuming the logic of one to that of the other.¹⁶ As worlds in/of flow(s), North Atlantic regions represent a disjunctive patchwork of multiple ethnicities and economies which are crisscrossed by transnational movements of people and capital. Global cities are the strategic sites within this mosaic, "the terrain where a multiplicity of globalization processes assume concrete, localized forms." (Sassen, 1993: 27) As the nodal points of global webs, urban locales constitute the socio-spatial arenas within which ethnoscaples and capitalscapes meet, combining to produce distinctive power configurations. Sassen's interpretive strategy of viewing Euro-American urban landscapes as "analytic borderlands" is appropriate, for it focuses both on "spaces of intersection" and "spaces of discontinuity" between different texts of the city (1993: 3).

To conceive of North Atlantic global cities as socio-spatial articulations of ethnoscaples and capitalscapes, Foucault's notion of 'heterotopias' can be aptly deployed. Heterotopias are sites of difference, "capable of juxtaposing in a single real place several spaces, several sites that are in themselves incompatible." (Foucault, 1986: 25)¹⁷ As Soja has noted, this provides a rich metaphor with which to imagine cityscapes, the microcosms where global

¹⁶As noted earlier, the tendency within the globalization literature has been to view transnational movements of populations as mere subplots whose structure and outcome are derived from those of the tale of global capitalism.

¹⁷Foucault continues by comparing heterotopias to gardens which bring together vegetation from around the world. "The garden is the smallest parcel of the world and then it is the totality of the world." (1986: 25-6) The parallel with global cities is strong, to the point that the latter can be referred to as urban heterotopias.

movements of people and capital are condensed (1989: 240). Heterotopic thinking can be found in Soja's own examinations of urban restructuring, which embody the ideas of difference and nodality:

More than ever before, the macro-political economy of the world is becoming contextualized and reproduced in the city. First World cities are being filled with Third World populations that, in some cases, are now the majority. While these combinatorial world cities increasingly stretch out to shape the international economy in a form of global spatial planning, they also increasingly incorporate internally the political and economic tensions and battlegrounds of international relations. (1989: 188)

The significance of urban heterotopias should not be underplayed. These are nodes where global capital and migration flows to Europe and North America are clustered, the predominant sites for global inflows and outflows of financial and productive capital as well as the destinations for most immigrants of colour. The restructuring of capitalscapes is closely related to changes in transnational migrations; as cities go global, several forms of capitalist production rely on immigrant women and men to provide low-cost workforces. This is the case for producer and financial services, whose concentration in global cities has made the latter "command centres" of global capital circuits (Sassen, 1993: 7). A similar situation exists for consumer services, which have appeared to fulfill the petty bourgeois needs of growing segments of urban populations, as well as for industrial sectors where traditional manufacturing has been replaced by "downgraded" and informational production (Sassen, 1988: 151-2; 1991: 279). Finally, urban heterotopias are places where hybrid ethnoscaples have taken shape. Large and diverse groups of immigrants from Asia, the Caribbean, South America and Africa have made metropolises into arenas for the formation of hybrid ethno-cultural identities and their diffusion

across Euro-American zones. Multiculturalism, difference and hybridity find their richest and most dynamic forms of expression in civic cultures.¹⁸

In global cities, the intersections of capitalscapes and ethnoscapas have created specific ensembles of socio-spatial relations. Thus, rather than being neutral or empty spaces, urban locales are injected with power, places where power is exercised through certain mechanisms to generate different effects for particular social groups. Once again, Soja's words are evocative:

In its particularity, its social specificity, the urban is permeated with relations of power, relations of dominance and subordination, that channel regional differentiation and regionalism, territoriality and uneven development, routines and revolutions, at many different scales. [...] Cities are specialized nodal agglomerations built around the instrumental 'presence availability' of social power. They are control centres, citadels designed to protect and dominate through what Foucault called 'the little tactics of the habitat', through a subtle geography of enclosure, confinement, surveillance, partitioning, social discipline and spatial differentiation. (1989: 153)

Materialist feminist interventions contest the metaphors which account for and interpret the power-laden character of cities, for such images do not simply reflect social processes. In fact, by being discursively applied to frame interpretive categories, they actively participate in constructing urban realities. It is therefore crucial to select metaphors which correspond to the narrative strategies of articulating two tales of globalizations, enabling the complexity and fragmentation of metropolises to be fully expressed.

Early on, metropolises have been imagined as homogeneous spaces. One of the first theorists to conceive of cities as strategic nodes is Hymer (1971), whose seminal article relates the roles of different sites to the operations of transnational corporations. The latter regroup their control functions (management, planning, head offices) in "capital cities", which sit atop Hymer's

¹⁸These aspects will be further examined in Chapter 4.

"There probably wouldn't be a clean hotel or office in the city without them: 60 per cent of greater Toronto's 34,415 cleaners are immigrants." (Watson, 1991a) In addition, the same groups provide personal services (domestic work, childcare, gardening) for the multitudes of what Reich (1992) terms "symbolic analysts" who are found in downtown offices (Sassen, 1988: 22; Sassen, 1991: 279).

In downtown Toronto, 28.7% of all female visible minority workers and 21.0% of all male visible minority workers are employed in the two lowest-paid sales and services categories, the comparable figures for white women and men being 19.6% and 14.3% respectively. By contrast, 36.0% of white female workers and 39.1% of white male workers occupy senior managerial, middle managerial or professional positions, whereas the equivalent figures are 19.1% and 23.1% for women and men of colour (Ontario Ministry of Citizenship, 1995). Consistently, over half of the lowest-paid positions in Metro Toronto's food and hospitality industries (cafeteria and fast food restaurant workers, coffee makers, cooks) are occupied by immigrants (Watson, 1991a). Silvera's analysis of the lives of female Caribbean domestic workers in Toronto eloquently expresses the bleak consequences of these urban power-geometries, created and sustained by racial, class and gender relations of domination:

What is never talked about, or made clear to many of these women, is the widespread prejudice they will come up against in Canada and the racism imbedded within a system which thrives on the labour of women of colour from Third World countries, women who are brought to Canada to work virtually as legal slaves in the homes of both wealthy and middle class Canadian families. In most cases, both their employers are themselves employed and have an average combined income of \$40,000 to \$100,000 a year. Meanwhile, women who work in these homes as domestic servants get as little as \$200 a month for an eighteenth hour day, seven days a week job. (1993: 198)

and "peripheral labor" (Ross and Trachte, 1983: 404-8), "transnational elite" and "permanent underclass" (Friedmann and Wolff, 1982: 322), "informational producers" and "restructured labor" (Castells, 1989: 227-8). Even the most sophisticated extension of binary thinking, the 'dual city' metaphor, cannot capture the complexity of urban configurations. Paradoxically, while aware of the limitations and ambivalent about the merits of dualistic analysis, Castells remains unwilling to part with it in the last instance:

In fact, structural dualism, along the series of dimensions we have indicated, does not result in two social worlds, but in a variety of social universes whose fundamental characteristics are their fragmentation, the sharp definition of their boundaries, and the low level of communication with other such universes. The dual city is a multifaceted reality, but structural dualism manifests itself in the transformation of bipolar dialectics into dual dichotomies. It is in this sense, and only in this sense, that we can speak of dualism. (1989: 226)

Though readily acknowledging the existence of multiple axes of oppression, Castells subsumes fragmentation under polarization.²⁰ Binary tropes are ill-suited to materialist feminist arguments which emphasize multiple, overlapping webs of racial/ethnic, class and gender relations.

In order to abandon binaries while incorporating certain aspects of restructuring related to global migration and capital movements, new socio-spatial metaphors explaining North Atlantic urban landscapes are required.

²⁰In Dual City: Restructuring New York, Mollenkopf and Castells provide a further justification for retaining the dual city metaphor:

Spurred by global restructuring, the postindustrial transformation of New York City has had complicated effects on that city which notions like the dual city or the underclass not only do not capture, but obscure. But despite these flaws, the dual city metaphor has the virtue of directing our attention to the new inequalities that define the postindustrial city, just as depictions of "How the Other Half Lives" defined the emerging industrial city a century ago. The popular embrace of the dual city image urges us to give this phenomenon analytic, as well as political, attention. (1991: 16)

Again, I find the reasoning to be ambivalent and ultimately, unconvincing.

Global cities can be viewed as urban heterotopias, points of articulation between capitalscapes and ethnoscapas. For materialist feminist readings of the urban, the task at hand -- identified by McDowell (1993: 311) following Haraway's (1991) contribution -- consists in developing a "geometry of difference" which is able to convey fractal patterns without falling back upon dualisms. In addition to the sameness implied in the binaries of man/woman, white/black, capital/labour, and native-born/immigrant, another tactic must be avoided: that of simply adding on gender, race and ethnicity to the (supposedly) fundamental opposition between capital and labour, thereby relegating women, immigrants and ethnic minorities to a uniform, peripheral socio-economic category. Metropolises are constructed out of networks of social relations in which race, ethnicity, class and gender intertwine to form connected, yet fractured, patchworks. Advanced by Massey (1992a; 1993), the concept of "power-geometry" conveys these concerns. As she puts it:

'Space' is created out of the vast intricacies, the incredible complexities, of the interlocking and the non-interlocking, and the networks of relations at every scale from local to global. [...] Moreover, and again as a result of the fact that it is conceptualized as created out of social relations, space is by its very nature full of power and symbolism, a complex web of relations of domination and subordination, of solidarity and cooperation. (1992a: 81)

Global cities are thus to be understood as urban power-geometries, socio-spatial entities in which social groups are distinctly positioned vis-à-vis relations of power and difference (Massey, 1993: 61). Shaped by the interplay of ethnoscapas and capitalscapes, condensing global spaces of flows, urban locales exist as multifaceted layerings of past, present and future configurations of social relations; heterotopic nodes, geometries of oppression and resistance.

In the previous pages, I have utilized materialist feminist epistemologies to build theoretical apparatuses capable of grasping specific dimensions of

globalizations. The concepts of ethnoscapes and capitalscapes were employed to explain how transnational circuits of migrants and capital were reshaping Euro-American zones in several respects. I then turned to the issue of finding socio-spatial metaphors which correspond to metropolitan landscapes of hierarchy and difference. The next chapter will apply these models to examine a particular global city, namely Toronto, conceived of as a series of heterotopic points and moments in and through which concrete power-geometries proliferate.

Power in the polis, and this is especially true of racialized power, reflects and refines the spatial relations of its inhabitants. Urban power, in turn, is a microcosm of the strengths and weaknesses of state. After all, social relations are not expressed in a spatial vacuum. Differences within urban structure -- whether economic, political, cultural, or geographic -- are in many ways magnified by and multiply the social hierarchies of power in and between cities, between town and country. These sociospatial dialectics underline the fact that social space is neither affect nor simply given: the rationalities of social space -- its modes of definition, maintenance, distribution, experience, reproduction, and transformation -- are at once fundamental influences upon the social relations of power. (Goldberg, 1993: 185)

As Sankofa Films pointed out in the 1980s, the contemporary city has imagined 'Territories' which map power relations of racial subordination which need not always be articulated in the explicit language of the law. Only by a grasp of the interaction between discourses of the new urbanism in the late twentieth century and hidden articulations of race can the abstract imaginary racialized city be deconstructed and the empirical city of racialized subordination be understood. For it is in this relationship between the imaginary and the empirical that lies at the heart of some of the most insidious forms of contemporary racism. (Keith and Cross, 1993: 11)

[...] the question that we have before us is, "what are the politics of the 'global city' discourse (various researches, studies, professional and academic events, government reports, legislation, and media discussions that constitute the 'global city' as an object of discussion)?" Whose interests does this discourse serve when it constitutes the global city as an object of discussion, deliberation, research, and inquiry? What opportunities does this discourse open up, and what opportunities does it foreclose? What are the broader power relations that sustain, encourage, and reinforce such a discourse? (Isin, 1994: 205)

CHAPTER 3

URBAN POWER-GEOMETRIES: EXPLORING TORONTO'S HETEROTOPIAS

Global cities are socio-spatial arenas where ethnoscaples and capitalscapes intersect to fashion overlapping, complex, and evolving power-geometries which can be read from a multiplicity of subject positions. In this chapter, I want to propose a type of urban materialist feminist analysis which reflexively produces situated narratives of Toronto, (re)telling stories from its margins and (re)writing some of its scripts to make immigrants of colour come into representation as agents who deploy an oppositional politics of everyday life. To begin, Toronto will be positioned within the Canadian nation-state by studying national urban economic trends, state policies vis-à-vis immigration and the sense of collective identity forged by liberal multiculturalism. Having accomplished this, I will turn my attention to analyzing three (social, living, and work) sites where power and resistance are interwoven in Toronto. The first power-geometry is constituted by a shopping mall's food court which is defined by liberal multiculturalism and supported by a low-wage workforce composed predominantly of ethnic minorities and Third World immigrants. A suburban apartment complex, acrimoniously shared by white residents and Somalian refugees who have reconstructed bonds of survival and resistance, serves as the second of Toronto's heterotopic tales. Finally, an examination of the restructuring of clothing manufacturing will highlight the expansion of homework, performed (in the vast majority of cases) by female immigrants of

colour who have developed novel strategies to contest their oppressive situations.

I. Contexts: Toronto in Canada, Canada in Toronto

The previous chapter examined how transnational movements of people and capital are transforming North America and Europe, generating socio-spatial patterns of power relations. Identified as ethnoscapes and capitalscapes, these configurations have come together to form urban heterotopias within which power-geometries thrive. However, as was contended earlier, one should resist the temptation of embracing a view of the globe as a seamless web through which various flows circulate freely from one urban node to another, entirely bypassing the nation-state.¹ All too often, it is forgotten that global flows are regulated by states and that metropolises are inserted within specific national contexts. As such, any analysis of Toronto's situation must take into account the city's privileged status as the principal location for transnational (foreign and domestic) capital in Canada.

Despite the fact that scenarios of national economic restructuring are well documented (and thus need not be repeated in detail), certain key characteristics are worth noting: rapidly accelerating service intensity², the spread of part-time work, and the polarization of the labour market into a structure providing "good jobs and bad jobs" (Economic Council of Canada,

¹Curiously, this is a scenario which prevails in most conservative accounts of globalizations as well as in radical geography and urban studies.

²In its introductory remarks, the Economic Council of Canada puts it bluntly: "The expansion of service employment has been striking. In the late 1940s, 60 per cent of the Canadian labour force worked in the goods sector -- natural resources, manufacturing, and construction. Today -- barely one work life later -- over 70 per cent of workers are employed in services. And the shift is far from over: during the 1980s, virtually all of the net job creation in this country took place in the service sector." (1990:1)

1990). By no means restricted to the Canadian economy, these tendencies are clustered in Northern metropolises which, because experiencing similarly dramatic changes, have been dubbed "post-industrial production sites" (Sassen, 1991). The transformations in global cities include, yet are not limited to, the decline of Fordist manufacturing and its replacement by downgraded and/or high-technology goods production³, the central role of financial and producer services, as well as the expansion of consumer services (Friedmann, 1986; Friedmann and Wolff, 1982; Harloe and Fainstein, 1992; Sassen, 1988 and 1991; Soja, 1989). Though largely based on observations derived from New York, Los Angeles, London and (to a lesser extent) Tokyo, the global city script offers a powerful analytic device to interpret many of the changes recently witnessed in Toronto. In fact, empirical analyses of the latter's economic structure arrive at identical conclusions, the service sector being considered the major engine of growth and employment.⁴ Finance, insurance and real estate (FIRE) and other producer services (advertising, management consultants, legal services, engineering) are seen as strategic branches which lead the thrust of economic restructuring (Canadian Urban Institute, 1991: 19; Gertler, 1990: 39; Todd, 1995: 9-12; Yalnizyan, 1988: 16). These trends converge, giving life to new urban configurations:

While local economic development agencies in such cities as Toronto and Montreal may advocate the (re)creation of a fast disappearing industrial base or the introduction of high-tech production, the market forces at work in spatial development are creating an entirely different, post-Fordist, or postmodern, landscape of tourist attractions, convention facilities, World Trade

³The effects of these changes for garment manufacturing will be tackled in a subsequent section of this chapter.

⁴For instance, the Canadian Urban Institute states: "Like the rest of the industrialized world, the Metropolitan Toronto economy will continue to shift from a manufacturing to a service base. Indeed, over three-quarters of Metropolitan Toronto jobs already are in the service industry, and both the absolute number of service jobs, and its proportion of all jobs in the Metropolitan Toronto economy are projected to substantially increase over the next decade." (1991: 19)

Centres, and a fragmented network of malls and office developments stretched out like a "net of mixed beads" from the CBD. (Todd, 1995: 15)

If the contribution of financial and producer services to the economic globalizations of Toronto cannot be denied, the expansion of consumer and personal services has tended to be neglected in existing accounts. This is likely due to the place-boundedness and labour-intensity of such sectors, which do not readily inspire dramatic images of interconnectedness; consumer and producer services are not reducible to electronic circuits which freely circulate around the world, nor do they leave vertical monuments of their power at the heart of the city. Yet it remains that the views at street level -- with the Filipino- and Jamaican-Canadian women who make their way up Yonge Street early every morning to begin their jobs as domestic workers for the established white Anglo-Canadian bourgeoisie of Rosedale, or the young Vietnamese- and Iranian-Canadian men who prepare and serve fast food at the Eaton Centre's North Mall Food Court -- reveal (and conceal) as much about globalizations as the perspective from atop First Canadian Place or the Royal Bank Plaza. Sassen warns us about the consequences of uncritically embracing the latter outlook over the former:

Sectors of the economy that have been evicted from the "center" and from the dominant narrative of the economy are actually servicing the corporate center of the economy and hence are necessary to that center even though presented as marginal. This devalorization of growing sectors of the economy has been imbedded in a massive demographic transition towards a growing presence of women, African-Americans and third world immigrants in the urban workforce. (1993: 26)

Thus, applying an argument which has been made elsewhere (Friedmann, 1986: 73; Friedmann and Wolff, 1982: 320; Sassen, 1988: 22; Sassen, 1991: 315; Stafford, 1992: 71), I want to partly rewrite (or rather,

reimagine) some of the stories of Toronto's recent round of economic restructuring. Rather than being considered peripheral to the globalizations of this particular cityscape, immigration from the Caribbean, Asia, South America and Africa has been one of the key foundations of its tertiary intensification. In Toronto, as in all Euro-American global cities, the very existence and growth of services depend on the employment of ethnic minorities and immigrants of colour. An article in the Toronto Star puts it more directly: "without immigrant workers, the greater Toronto area wouldn't work." (Watson, 1991a) However, to avoid lumping these groups into a single, homogeneous category, the considerable variations which exist among and between them -- in terms of gender, class, race, age and nationality -- must be remembered (Cross and Waldinger, 1992; Bailey and Waldinger, 1991). At the same time, it must be recognized that, taken as a whole, Third World immigrants are disproportionately concentrated in the low-wage, part-time jobs which serve as the foundation of the city's service-based economy (Brand: 1993: 224; Turner, 1995: 94).

Instead of treating producer and consumer services separately, the articulations among these sectors should be examined. The meteoric rise of financial, real estate and insurance (FIRE) industries in Toronto must be tied (both directly and indirectly) to the spread of a multiplicity of poorly-paid service jobs in which immigrants of colour are over-represented. Office-based employment, which accounts for over half of Toronto's labour market positions (Yalnizyan, 1988: 17), has generated a sustained demand for specialized services (maintenance, security, cleaning, fast food) in which women and men of colour are heavily enlisted.⁵ The same Toronto Star article goes on to say:

⁵The view from the Eaton Centre proves to be revealing; one need only witness the throngs of white male (and increasingly female) managers and professionals, as well as the masses of white female clerks, who converge on the shopping mall's various fast food outlets every weekday at lunchtime.

"There probably wouldn't be a clean hotel or office in the city without them: 60 per cent of greater Toronto's 34,415 cleaners are immigrants." (Watson, 1991a) In addition, the same groups provide personal services (domestic work, childcare, gardening) for the multitudes of what Reich (1992) terms "symbolic analysts" who are found in downtown offices (Sassen, 1988: 22; Sassen, 1991: 279).

In downtown Toronto, 28.7% of all female visible minority workers and 21.0% of all male visible minority workers are employed in the two lowest-paid sales and services categories, the comparable figures for white women and men being 19.6% and 14.3% respectively. By contrast, 36.0% of white female workers and 39.1% of white male workers occupy senior managerial, middle managerial or professional positions, whereas the equivalent figures are 19.1% and 23.1% for women and men of colour (Ontario Ministry of Citizenship, 1995). Consistently, over half of the lowest-paid positions in Metro Toronto's food and hospitality industries (cafeteria and fast food restaurant workers, coffee makers, cooks) are occupied by immigrants (Watson, 1991a). Silvera's analysis of the lives of female Caribbean domestic workers in Toronto eloquently expresses the bleak consequences of these urban power-geometries, created and sustained by racial, class and gender relations of domination:

What is never talked about, or made clear to many of these women, is the widespread prejudice they will come up against in Canada and the racism imbedded within a system which thrives on the labour of women of colour from Third World countries, women who are brought to Canada to work virtually as legal slaves in the homes of both wealthy and middle class Canadian families. In most cases, both their employers are themselves employed and have an average combined income of \$40,000 to \$100,000 a year. Meanwhile, women who work in these homes as domestic servants get as little as \$200 a month for an eighteenth hour day, seven days a week job. (1993: 198)

Paralleling its predominant economic role, Toronto constitutes the primary destination for immigrants in Canada; it is, in other words, the heart of Canadian alterity.⁶ Past claims to 'Britishness' seem long forgotten, even absurd, in the streets of a city where the vast proportion of newcomers have come from Asia, South America, Africa and the Caribbean.⁷ Nonetheless, Toronto's ethnoscape has not come into being spontaneously, shaped as they are by the Canadian state. Two metaphors explain the relationship between the latter and the former, those of the sieve and of the mold. In terms of migration, the state acts as a sieve which separates those who are admitted and allowed to stay within its territorial boundaries from those who are kept out or expelled. Up until fairly recently, Canadian immigration policies were explicitly racist, designed to favour white European (particularly British and French) migrants and exclude Third World people of colour. The formal dismantling of barriers to entry into the country on the basis of race, ethnicity, and nationality occurred in the 1960s, when (apparently) neutral criteria began to be implemented; to this day, family reunifications, refugees, and independent immigrants -- the latter being assessed by a 'point' system based on educational, training, and/or capital requirements -- remain immigration priorities for the Canadian state (Basavarajappa et al., 1993: 9; Stalker, 1994:

⁶In 1993, 28.3% of all immigrants to Canada settled in Metro Toronto (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 1994: 4). Whereas only 16.1% of the Canadian population was composed of immigrants in 1991, the latter represented 12.1% of Metro Toronto's population (Turner, 1995: 12).

⁷As both the Globe and Mail and the Toronto Star reported with seeming alarm, (white) British ethnic origin has faded from 60.7% to 26.2% of the Toronto region's population between 1961 and 1991; 59% of the population claims neither British nor French ethnic origin. Italian, Chinese, East Indian and Black are the other most common responses contained in the 1991 census (McInnes, 1993; Thompson, 1993a). Between 1990 and 1992, almost 80% of immigrants to Metropolitan Toronto have come from the South: 47.7% from East and Central Asia, 9.8% from the Caribbean, 7.1% from Africa, 7% from Western Asia, and 6.2% from South and Central America (Turner, 1995: 14). The myth of the two founding nations can perhaps finally (and belatedly) be laid to rest.

176).⁸ Combined, these changes have dramatically altered migration patterns to Canada which, like those of other North Atlantic countries, have shifted to a South-North axis. Despite (or perhaps because of) this, migration has continued to interact uneasily with the national imaginary:

Historically, Canada has never had a clearly articulated consensus about what role immigration should play in its future. Only rarely have Canadian governments felt it necessary to proclaim clearly defined long-range immigration goals, whether economic, social, or demographic, and Canadians themselves have never shared a common view about immigration, except that they do not want to see too many immigrants admitted to this country. (Knowles, 1992: 180)

This brings us to the metaphor of the mold, which expresses the purpose of state interventions geared toward determining how immigrants relate to and fit within existing conceptions of the nation. In the late 1960s and early 1970s, as migration and demographic trends were correspondingly modified, the Canadian state rapidly moved from endorsing Anglophone monoculturalism to Francophone and Anglophone biculturalism, and finally towards strategies which sought to articulate bilingualism and (liberal) multiculturalism (Lewycky, 1992: 372).¹⁰ Rather uniquely, the latter became, and continues to be considered, a key component in the process of constructing a distinctive Canadian identity; the idealist motto of 'unity in diversity' applies here, liberal multiculturalism promoting tolerance for ethnic and racial diversity in relation to

⁸Nonetheless, it is important to remember that class and gender discrimination still prevail in the national immigration system. Regardless of their actual status, women tend to be classified as dependents, whereas business immigrants can essentially purchase their Canadian citizenship in exchange for investment guarantees.

⁹Between 1991 and 1993, the top ten national senders of immigrants to Canada were: Hong Kong, India, the Philippines, Taiwan, China, Sri Lanka, Vietnam, the U.S., the U.K., Poland, Lebanon, and El Salvador (Citizenship and Immigration Canada, 1994: 5).

¹⁰Trudeau's famous words, pronounced in the House of Commons on October 8, 1971 to inaugurate state-sponsored (liberal) multiculturalism, were as follows: "Although there are two official languages, there is no official culture, nor does any ethnic group take precedence over any other" (quoted in Kobayashi, 1993: 205)

an ethos which combats alterity and difference by enforcing national cohesiveness. To put it more bluntly, the Canadian state has anchored its nation-building project upon liberal multiculturalism (Knowles, 1992: 188; Mitchell, 1993: 279).¹¹ Yet, as a number of progressive critics have asserted, multicultural policies have tended to celebrate plurality without challenging relations of domination which underpin Canadian society. Under the presumption of cultural harmony and acceptance of difference, structural matrixes of power which sustain the racist, sexist, and capitalist facets of subordination faced by Third World immigrants and people of colour have only begun to be addressed (Kobayashi, 1993: 216-7; Lewycky, 1992: 373; Mitchell, 1993: 279-80).¹² Despite noble efforts to the contrary in recent years, liberal multiculturalist discourse still has more to do with folklore than with emancipation.

The three tales which unfold below indicate the outer limits of liberal multiculturalism in Toronto, exploring border zones where notions of tolerance, diversity and plurality are extended to their respective breaking points. When dominant (white European) representations of Canadian identity are perceived to be endangered, the flip side of these ideals comes to the forefront: intolerance, racism, and exploitation step in from the shadows, belying the naive liberal credo of harmony within the multicultural national family. Yet the three power-geometries can also be read as spaces where tactics of resistance are instituted by Third World immigrants, moments during which an everyday

¹¹Despite the recent conservative backlash against immigration, official bilingualism, and (liberal) multiculturalism in certain parts of Canada, the federal government has not (yet?) wavered in its commitment to the latter.

¹²In this respect, I follow Kobayashi's approach toward (liberal) multiculturalism: "To understand this process it is necessary to go beyond the formal institution, to situate Multiculturalism within a national cultural context and to recognize multiculturalism as a web of complex social relationships, a multiplicity of powers and constraints, a shifting composition of cultural representation." (1993: 223-4)

politics of hybridity is elaborated by articulating the normative concepts of difference and equality.¹³

II. First Story: The Eaton Centre

The shopping centre occupies a privileged place in the postmodern urban imaginary (Shields, 1992; Morris, 1993). Indeed, with the Los Angeles Bonaventure Hotel¹⁴, 'the mall' (shortform used by both aficionados and teenagers) has been accused of generating panic-inducing loss of affect and hyperspatial disorientation -- symptoms of a more general malaise. To fully convey this, it is worth quoting Jameson at length:

So I come finally to my principal point here, that this latest mutation in space -- postmodern hyperspace -- has finally succeeded in transcending the capacities of the individual human body to locate itself, to organize its immediate surroundings perceptually, and cognitively to map its position in a mappable external world. It may now be suggested that this alarming disjunction point between the body and its built environment -- which is to the initial bewilderment of the older modernism as the velocities of spacecraft to those of the automobile -- can itself stand as the symbol and the analogon of that even sharper dilemma which is the incapacity of our minds, at least at present, to map the great global multinational and decentered communicational network in which we find ourselves caught as individual subjects. (1991: 44)

Such a rendition of postmodern space carries serious limitations for the development of critical thought, the analyst being presented with two possible strategies. On the one hand, she can remain in a state of exhilaration, uncritically participating in carnivalesque rituals of consumption (Shields, 1991) or, as Morris (1993: 302-3) puts it, "reviewing the spectacle, herself in the spectacle, and the spectacle in herself." On the other hand, she can attempt to

¹³The ideas of a politics of hybridity and radical multiculturalism will be expanded upon in Chapter 4.

¹⁴First made a *place* (if not a *cause*) *célèbre* by Jameson (1991).

'stabilize' herself by (re)deploying a Cartesian view of time and space which relies on totalizing metanarratives and metamappings of the world 'outside'.

I want to advance a different reading of the shopping mall, whereby the latter is approached as a micro-node of power, a site where social relations of gender, ethnicity and class as well as global flows of capital and people crisscross, intersect, and unfold to produce shifting power-geometries.¹⁵ The mall and the city which lies beyond it can be seen as existing in constant interaction, the former attempting to "contain the world within its walls" (Crawford, 1992: 4). For although the urban mall is the product of largely white male Euro-American transnational financial and real estate capital, it also carves signs of other histories and other places.

Located on Yonge Street, shadowed by -- or, more appropriately, reflecting the silhouettes of -- City Hall and the Bay Street skyscrapers of global financial capital, the Eaton Centre can be said to represent the heart of downtown Toronto. Undoubtedly, it remains one of the first and most impressive icons of the North American architectural-cum-commercial invention *par excellence*, the shopping mall. As such, it has been elevated to the status of central player in the pantheon of postmodern architecture.¹⁶

Matching the number of entrances to the building itself, numerous beginnings to the text of the Eaton Centre exist. I have chosen to focus on the North Mall Food Court, a commodified culinary microcosm of late 20th-century liberal multiculturalism which aims to create the impression of a seamless

¹⁵This strategy is inspired by Davis (1985), who deflates some of Jameson's more hyperbolic claims by locating the Bonaventure Hotel within the wider socio-economic context of Los Angeles and the U.S.. The privatization of public spaces, the power of transnational capital, urban decay, polarization along class and racial lines are all issues of which the Bonaventure is a product.

¹⁶Jameson quips about "Toronto's remarkable Eaton Centre." (1991: 20) Later in the same essay, he claims that the Eaton Centre, the Beaubourg in Paris and the Bonaventure are "characteristic postmodern buildings." (1991: 40)

ethno-cultural *mélange*, devoid of the history of Euro-American colonialism and the racism which pervades Toronto's cityscape: "In more than one way, downtown malls cash in on the paradoxical prospect of a new order of urban experience, well protected from the dangerous and messy streets outside." (Crawford, 1992: 24) Fleeting images of the harmonious mosaic, of the liberal multiculturalist utopia, are generated in the shopping centre.

"Aida's Falafel", "London Style Fish & Chips", "Mrs. Vanelli's Pizza & Italian Foods", "A & W", "New York Fries", "Edo Japan", "Bread & Bowl", "Thai Pearl", "Chuck's Fried Chicken", and "Points East Chinese Food", each of these fast food counters lies comfortably beside the other, illustrating the merging of the mosaic and the marketplace. Their names refer to distant (and not so distant) places which, when related to the corresponding culinary fare, are designed to confirm cultural clichés carried by global communications. Yet these restaurants also enable us to retrieve some of the facets and histories of Toronto, imbedded as it is in interconnected flows of all sorts.

New York and London are the two cities on which politicians and planners have most consciously modelled and marketed Toronto as a "world-class city".¹⁷ 'Chips' and 'fries', signifiers which refer to the same signified, stand as symbols of an ambivalent white Anglo-Canadian identity which has historically been caught somewhere between Britain and the United States. The Chinese-Canadian and Italian-Canadian communities, among the oldest and largest post-Aboriginal settler groups in Toronto, are represented side-by-side with newer immigrants from Southeast and Western Asia. Traces remain of the Japanese-Canadians who were forcibly resettled from the West Coast to

¹⁷Art Eggleton, mayor of Toronto from 1981 to 1991, coined the phrase "world-class city". He was an avid supporter of several large-scale development projects which were funded at the expense of much-needed social services. In response, a coalition of progressive social groups called "Bread Not Circuses" was formed (Weinberg, 1991).

Toronto by the Canadian state during the Second World War while most members of their communities were placed in internment camps.

For its part, "Thai Pearl" is a reminder of the exoticization and Orientalization of Asian women enforced by the Euro-American male gaze. The fabled mysteries of the 'East' and mythical submissiveness of its female 'pearls' meld in the imaginary of Toronto's white male transnational bourgeoisie, which carries fantasies leading many of its members to actively support the Thai sex tourism industry; the occasional jaunt to Bangkok, combining business with 'pleasure.' On another level, "Thai Pearl" and "Chuck's Fried Chicken" connect the massive deindustrialization of the Toronto economy to two of the most popular sites (Thailand and the Southern U.S.) where Canadian manufacturing capital has relocated its productive activities. Finally, "Bread & Bowl" can be interpreted as an ironic description of the plight of Toronto's growing numbers of homeless, unemployed and working poor who depend on foodbanks for daily survival.¹⁸ For them, the shopping centre is an exclusionary space, the array of consumer products displayed in shop windows or on restaurant counters tantalizing the senses yet destined to remain unattainable.

On Saturday afternoons, the young, multi-racial female and male middle-class consumers congregating in and around the food court can momentarily appropriate tastes and smells from around the world; this is a global food bazaar, multiculturalism on the go. The boundaries between worlds apparently collapse in this space where, together, cultural alterity and Fordist mass consumption capitalism conspire to destroy any notions of culinary authenticity

¹⁸Yalnizyan quotes an astounding fact, one which places my discussion of the fast food court in context: "In Toronto there are now more foodbanks (180) than McDonald's outlets. Every month, 80,000 to 84,000 people use foodbanks in the country's hotbed of economic activity. About 3-4% of these users are transients. It is estimated that at least 17% (about one in six users) are minimum wage workers." (1990: 9)

or purity. A similar point is made by Rieff, whose discussion of the changing realities of Los Angeles reflects the significance of this phenomenon:

In kitchens all over the Southland, Vietnamese *nuoc mam* fish paste was coming to coexist in the larder with strings of Sonoran chiles, and a refrigerator might well be found to contain leftovers of Iranian *cheto kebab* and also homemade guacamole dip. *La Raza Cósmica*¹⁹: it could be spotted almost any evening, from Western Avenue in Koreatown to Mexican-American Huntington Park, and from the Temple-Beaudry to Chinese Alhambra, sneaking in through the intestinal tract. (1991: 243)

The search for uncontaminated national culinary origins leaves only mongrel traces (or crumbs) in its wake²⁰, hybridity being a key feature (as well as a selling point) of the food court's fare. From the crossing of North American fast food with Asian cuisine arise thoroughly commodified and standardized products, which have become -- to borrow Appadurai's (1990: 295) term -- "indigenized" goods.

Hybridity finds another expression in the disjunctive ethno-cultural relationship between the places to which the restaurants' names refer and the workers who produce and sell their food. Nation, territory, race and ethnicity become jumbled realities in the multicultural swirl. Here again, ideas of origins or purity need to be discarded; the United States, China, Italy, Vietnam, Jamaica, Japan, Canada, Thailand become hyphenated signifiers.²¹ This form of crossbreeding points to another, less benign trend which is emerging in

¹⁹La Raza Cósmica (The Cosmic Race) is the title of a book written in the 1920s by José Vasconcelos, a Mexican author who was countering popular arguments about the desirability of maintaining 'racial purity'. In this work, he predicted that a new breed of people would emerge in the Americas out of the fusing of the different races of the world. The cosmic race's capital city would be named Universopolis (Rieff, 1991: 240-1). Vasconcelos was one of the first theorist of hybridity, a leading theme of contemporary post-colonial analysis.

²⁰This formulation refers to Derrida's (1976) critique of the metaphysical desire for originary meaning, from which arises the ambivalence of interpretive traces.

²¹For instance, one could say that Mrs. Vanelli, an Italian-Canadian woman, has given birth (or, in keeping with the metaphors of migration, has adopted) and is now exploiting Jamaican-Canadian and Vietnamese-Canadian children.

power-geometries such as the Eaton Centre's North Mall Food Court: the heavy reliance on immigrant and minority workers (notably women), who are disproportionately found in the 'bad' consumer service jobs.

III. Second Story: Dixon

At the intersection of Dixon Road and Kipling Avenue, tucked away close to Pearson International Airport in the northwest corner of Metro Toronto, stand six identical condominium towers. Unremarkable at first sight, this grey concrete mass is like so many others sprawled across the generic landscapes of suburban North America. However, 'Dixon' -- as it has come to be known among the Somalian diaspora -- constitutes a strategic power-geometry, another microsite woven into the mosaic of the global city.

What makes Dixon interesting, even extraordinary, is the fact that it has recently mutated into a space where ethno-cultural differences play themselves out in conflictual ways. Over the past six years, about 3,000 Somalian-Canadians and Somalian refugees have moved into the condominium complex, disturbing the ethnic and racial homogeneity of the 6,000 or so elderly white residents (Sharraf, 1993). The liberal values of multicultural tolerance have been pushed to their limits, hegemonic (white European) representations of Canadian national identity being relativized through encounters with unassimilated otherness. A reporter for the Globe and Mail, itself one of the most effective and longstanding mouthpieces of the white Anglo-Canadian bourgeoisie, frames the debate around Dixon as such:

The Somalis have had a profound impact here, not just because of their numbers or the speed with which those numbers have grown. It is also because Somalians are not just Canadians with a different skin colour, curious clothes and interesting food. They are part of a culture that is dramatically different from what has

been the Canadian mainstream. They have different religious beliefs, celebrate different holidays and have attitudes, particularly towards the role of women, that appear to conflict with established Canadian values. They do not homogenize easily with the cultural centre. For adherents of multiculturalism, the Somalis add immeasurably to the Canadian mosaic. For those who still see Canada as primarily a European, Judeo-Christian nation, they have become another irritant. (McInnes, 1992)

Dixon has become a symbol of liberal multiculturalism gone awry, of intolerance in the face of alterity. The six towers and the surrounding land are patrolled by (white male) security guards who, accompanied by attack dogs, have been ordered to 'restore order' by closely monitoring the Somalian-Canadian residents.²² Hence, at the edge of Toronto, some of the worse techniques of apartheid have been effectively applied through a micro-regime of racial/racist surveillance. In the words of Dahir Mohammed Hersi: "A half hour will not pass before a guard knocks on the door (of our apartments) and orders us to do this, or not do that. They have turned this place into a mini-South Africa." (Sharraf, 1993) These events correspond precisely to Smith's (1989: 131-4) incisive analysis of how socio-political conservatism and the concentration of people of colour in specific places are combined to construct scenarios of urban crisis and decline -- that is to say, perceptions that the very presence of others leads to the demise of law and order.²³ To be restored, these ideals are understood as needing to be actively enforced through increased policing and a renewed emphasis on (so-called) common national values, histories and identities: "In much Conservative thought, a nation's moral

²²Private policing was instituted in response to dubious complaints lodged by white residents, for whom the evening gatherings of Somalian-Canadians in the park outside the apartment complex were excessively noisy and as such, 'un-Canadian' (Watson, 1991b).

²³In Dixon, the accusations directed at Somalian-Canadians range from the absurd to the explicitly racist: overcrowding, being noisy and impolite, letting children play in the elevators and hallways, letting the buildings fill with cooking smells, not wanting to learn English, not trying to assimilate, urinating and defecating in the halls and stairwells, spitting, swearing, being bred to mob violence, not observing rules and regulations.

order rests fundamentally on public compliance with a set of common norms enshrined not only in law, but also in the conventions of daily life. This, it seems, is guaranteed only when traditional values and lifestyles are shared." (Smith, 1989: 133) Because Dixon's Somalian-Canadians are seen as posing a threat to such (white European) standards, they must be monitored and reluctantly assimilated through disciplining.²⁴

To understand how this situation came about, one needs to explore the various narratives of globalizations which have collided in Dixon. First, as so many inevitably do, the story of Dixon intersects with some of the tales of global capitalism. During the heady 1980s, the development of worldwide property markets positioned real estate as one of the pillars of metropolitan growth (Sassen, 1991: 185-91). Downtown locations have been prized by transnational corporations, the demand for high-end housing has expanded, and financial capital has increasingly invested in the housing market; all of these factors have had a trickle-down effect, as prices have tended to follow an upward spiral (Harloe, Marcuse, and Smith, 1992: 176). Toronto's boom in residential property prices -- and, more importantly, the rapid profits which could be extracted from it -- fuelled widespread speculation. Dixon has been caught in the midst of this speculative frenzy, as investors attempted to 'flip' several of its units.²⁵ In the late 1980s, when the property market's bubble burst with the rest of the Toronto economy, speculators began renting the condominiums of which they had become the reluctant owners. Today, one-

²⁴Sharif (1994) notes: "They [the condominium owners] told the task force they wanted security increased and that they felt large numbers of immigrants are coming from one country with no intention of integrating into the Canadian way of life. The condo owners told the task force that Somalis 'must obey the law and cooperate.' "

²⁵'Flipping' refers to fast turnover in the initial ownership of condominiums, which are purchased by speculators (in anticipation of a rise in value) and subsequently sold at higher prices.

third of the 1,800 Dixon units are rented, almost all by Somalian-Canadians (McInnes, 1992; Sharraf, 1993).

Dixon has also entered the flows of transnational migrations, becoming a sanctuary for the Somalian diaspora spread across three continents by famine and civil strife; Dixon is an imaginary place, a promised land. Abdi Liban, a recent Somalian refugee, captures this: "Somalis, whether they are in Africa, Europe or America, they know the best place to go to find other Somalis is a place called Dixon. They don't know if that's actually a neighbourhood or a street, but most of them carry the name Dixon with them" (Watson, 1991b). Since 1989, the immigrants living in the residential complex have formed the core of the largest Somalian community outside Africa, Metro Toronto's 30,000 Somalian-Canadians (Sharraf, 1993).²⁶

When explaining the reasons for and the socio-spatial impacts of Somalian-Canadian settlement in Dixon, two discursive strategies can be adopted. The first interpretation focuses on expulsion and segregation, for as the story goes, many people of colour (as well as members of the white working classes) have been displaced from central metropolitan areas to undesirable locations by gentrification. The power of developers, transnational capital and property speculators has conspired to produce skyrocketing housing prices, vast numbers of professionals and managers having successfully (re)colonized downtown residential cores (Smith, 1992). Therefore, gentrification partly explains why most Somalian-Canadians have settled in Toronto's suburbs (such as Etobicoke), whereas previous immigrant groups (such as Italian- and Chinese-Canadians) have tended to build their communities downtown (McInnes, 1992); the virtual absence of affordable housing in Toronto has

²⁶The Somalian-Canadian community is by no means a monolithic group. Most of the recent immigrants are women, children and adolescents, several men being either casualties of or soldiers in the Somalian civil war (Sharraf, 1993). Given recent political events, the traits of future immigrants to Canada might well change rapidly.

pushed Somali immigrants and other economically subordinate social groups to the outskirts of the city. By applying Goldberg's (1993: 188) and Smith's (1989: 38) arguments about residential segregation along racial lines, it becomes clear that racist strategies and policies account to a certain extent for the high concentration of Somali refugees in Dixon. The latter do not enjoy the same economic rights as other Canadians, for they are not permitted to seek employment while awaiting decisions about their refugee claims (Watson, 1991b). Also, despite the fact that most Somali-Canadians are highly qualified, the vast majority remain unemployed or work in low-paying jobs (Thompson, 1993b).²⁷

If recognizing that the factors noted above act as structural constraints is important, it must not enable the racialization of segregated places. Too often, spaces of segregation are presented as wastelands, "ungovernable spaces" inhabited by black underclasses who are victimized by racism, capitalism and patriarchy (Lash and Urry, 1994: 145). The implications of these sorts of tactics are unambiguously damaging:

This notion of 'slumliness' stamped the terms in and through which the urban space of the racially marginalized was (and in many cases still is) conceived and literally experienced by the Other's racial and class other, by those more or less white and to some degree middle class. The slum is by definition filthy, foul smelling, wretched, rancorous, uncultivated, and lacking care. The *racial* slum is doubly determined, for the metaphorical stigma of a black blotch on the cityscape bears the added connotations of moral degeneracy, natural inferiority, and repulsiveness. (Goldberg, 1993: 192)

Dixon has been discursively constituted as Toronto's newest ghetto, a set of racialized highrises where violence is (believed to be) running rampant. Scenes of Somali youth gangs terrorizing elderly white tenants, as well as

²⁷The unemployment rate among Toronto's Somali-Canadians is estimated at 90%, taxi driving constitutes the most common form of employment for Somali-Canadian men (Thompson, 1993b).

rumours of periodic riots pitting Somalian-Canadians with white security guards, abound. Within the span of a few years -- which, not coincidentally, corresponds to the arrival of Somalian refugees -- the portrayals of Dixon have switched from suburban condominium complex to American inner-city slum.²⁸

Another possible narrative draws attention to resistance, looking at the ways Somalian-Canadians have opposed the purposes given to, and the meanings attached to, Dixon. They have strategically intervened in the crisis of the Toronto property market, forcing a transition from the 'flipping' of petty bourgeois condominiums to the (unintentional) provision of low-rent apartments. A cog has been inserted into the wheels which generated massive real estate profits during the 1980s; the ties binding the Dixon complex to global speculative activities have been broken, or at least permanently altered. In another vein, the arrival of Somalian-Canadians has undermined the original design rationale of suburban highrises, many of which were built in the early 1970s to accommodate the lifestyles of white nuclear families and wealthy retirees. Hence, the safe middle-class dream of an ethnically and racially undifferentiated suburbia has been shattered, giving way to the perceived risk of alterity. By moving into Dixon, Somalian-Canadians have enacted processes of reverse gentrification; white flight and the tumbling values of the condominiums -- themselves the product of a racist property market, in which housing prices are related to the ethnic and racial composition of residential

²⁸Even banal accounts of Dixon carry negative connotations: "Here in the northern fringe of Etobicoke, the streets are wide and bare. There are no shops or restaurants, except in widely spaced tightly contained malls. The condominiums and apartments must be like living in cold, vertical villages. There is little within walking distance. This may become known as Somalitown but it will never be a tourist attraction." (McInnes, 1992)

areas -- have been precipitated by the 'Somalianization' of Dixon which has, in turn, enabled more Somalian refugees to settle there.²⁹

As pointed out elsewhere (Castles, 1993: 51-2; Olson and Kobayashi, 1993: 145; Smith and Tarallo, 1993: 64), ethnically-based social networks comprise one of the main strategies of resistance employed by Third World immigrants, who have striven to (re)appropriate certain urban spaces. Rather than exclusively being a product of racist and capitalist oppression, the 'Somalianization' of Dixon can also be attributed to deliberate interventions on the part of Somalian-Canadians, who have contested relations of subordination by forging a sense of community and creating collective tools for struggle.³⁰ At a more basic level, the social networks of Dixon's Somalian-Canadian community have enabled its members to develop tactics of survival. According to Abdi Liban: "You have to understand that back home, we don't have social insurance or anything of that kind. Everyone's social insurance policy is his relatives and friends. If you grow older, or you are somewhat poor, you always rely on the people you know and your relatives. We always depend on each other." (Watson, 1991b) Confronted with extremely high unemployment -- which, as mentioned before, is related to racist policies of various kinds -- and the lack of access to low-cost housing in Toronto, Somalian-Canadians have built powerful bonds of solidarity. Far from being another ghetto oozing with despair, Dixon constitutes, to borrow Sivanandan's (1990) phrase, one of many "communities of resistance" at the margins of global cities.

²⁹It should be noted that one of the reasons Somalian settlers initially came to Dixon was the latter's proximity to the airport, the gateway to the world which connected them to friends and relatives who would soon follow them.

³⁰Osman Ali, executive-director of the Somali-Canadian Association of Etobicoke, explains how collective forces have politicized certain issues in Dixon. "What's happening now is young Somalis are saying 'enough's enough, I'm not going to take any abuse from the security, I'm not going to take any abuse from the management, from the landlords' " (McInnes, 1992)

IV. Third Story: The Garment Industry

A dark alley in Toronto near Yonge and Bloor. A homeless 30-something man paws through the trash. Another man, tall and ominous, looks on. "Used to be the streets were clean," he mutters. "Now, there's garbage everywhere." The vagrant's voice: "Hey buddy, got any spare change?" The man flips a shiny coin into the darkness. As the vagrant's hand reaches out, the man's voice says: "Best thing to do with garbage is burn it." A dragon's breath of fire envelops the vagrant. He staggers, he screams. Fire reflects on metal. Cut. (Mayers, 1994a)

This extract from a Toronto-produced television show serves as an appropriate *mise-en-scène* for the shifting discourses of urban restructuring. Indeed, two competing metanarratives of/on Toronto have been generated, one which portrays it as a postmodern and postindustrial 'Hollywood North', while another situates it in the deindustrialized Great Lakes rustbelt (Keil, 1994: 214). These metropolitan stories, and the images which accompany them, stem from the socio-political struggles which have carved Toronto's evolving ensemble of power-geometries. Thus, which narrative is glorified while the other is delegitimized, which is canonized while the other is thrust into the dustbin of history (or incinerated like all urban 'garbage') is an intensely political matter. In fact, the question can be asked (and must be answered) in a different way: which economic sectors and social groups are constituted as central, and which are being peripheralized? (Isin, 1994: 205; Keil, 1994: 218)

Recently, the 'Hollywoodization' of Toronto has received rave reviews; we are incessantly reminded of the fact that it has become the third largest film and television production centre in North America (after New York and Los Angeles) and the third most important theatre centre in the English-speaking world (after New York and London) (de Reus, 1994: 39; Mayers, 1994b). If the boosters are to be believed, Hollywood and Broadway meet in Toronto,

entertainment capital of the North. Some of their claims should not be dismissed lightly, however, for the glitz and glamour of the \$1 billion entertainment industries have reshaped the regional economy and generated 90,000 (direct and indirect) jobs (Mayers, 1994a).³¹ Postindustrial dreams of grandeur have been sustained by a dual process through which the city has simultaneously absorbed global cultural flows and projected some of its own identities to the world at large.³² The quote with which I opened this section illustrates the point that Toronto -- where futurist-cum-nightmarish television shows such as Forever Knight and RoboCop are filmed -- is currently serving as the backdrop against which the dystopias of North American urban life are played out. Poverty, homelessness, and violence are perceived to be inscribed in the metropolitan text, murderous fantasies about incinerating panhandlers being mere extensions bourgeois desires to get rid of the homeless, out of sight, out of mind.

In parts of Toronto's east end, deindustrialized and postindustrial landscapes clash violently. Carlaw Avenue, once a hub of the city's manufacturing economy, is now strewn with the abandoned carcasses of brickwalled factories. Buildings which have been termed "industrial dinosaurs", such as the seven-storey Colgate-Palmolive plant, stand as monuments of the rustbelt (Papp, 1991). At the same time, previously vacant factories have begun to be occupied by high-tech firms specializing in computer programming and

³¹Employment from cultural industries now surpasses that for both manufacturing and the FIRE sectors (Mayers, 1994a)

³²A few quotes capture this phenomenon. According to Susan Lee, marketing director for the League of American Theatres and Producers "People used to perceive New York as the only place for Broadway, but Broadway has become an international concept and Toronto has been able to capture that." Over the past few years, four major Broadway musicals have been shown in Toronto: Phantom of the Opera, Showboat, Crazy for You and Miss Saigon (Mayers, 1994b). Serving as urban simulacra, parts of Toronto has also been exported to the rest of the world: "For the film and TV industry, Toronto also offers a good mix of architecture that can, at any one time, be new, old, North American or European " (Mayers, 1994a)

graphics (Stefaniuk, 1990). Near the intersection of Carlaw and Eastern are found three entertainment production complexes, containing twelve television and film studios; with street signs acting as enforcing signifiers, the City of Toronto has designated this area the 'Studio District' in a bid to erase its manufacturing roots and propel it into its (perceived) commercial culture future (de Reus, 1994: 41).

More appropriately perhaps, in recognition of the garment industry's historic role, the area surrounding the southern portion of Spadina Avenue has been named the 'Fashion District'. The 'rag trade' has always been strongly associated with immigration, the former being one of the principal sources of employment for women and men upon their arrival in Toronto:

Waves of immigrants have been welcomed by the industry, which has rung with the music of their languages. The first immigrants were from Britain. After that the languages were Yiddish and Eastern European until well into the 1950s; then came Italian and Greek in the 1960s and Portuguese in the 1970s; and finally the languages of Southeast Asia and the dialects of China. (Stefaniuk, 1990)

Long overdue, this municipal consecration -- here again, by way of street signs -- has been overshadowed by claims that the garment industry is but one chapter of a deindustrialization script; according to such diagnoses, we are witnessing a major decline in both the share of the labour force employed in manufacturing and the overall position of the secondary sector in urban economies (Muszynski, 1985; Yalnizyan, 1988).³³ Although Toronto's garment sector has been described as a sunset industry virtually since its creation, reports of its supposed death throes have become increasingly common in the

³³Whereas manufacturing accounted for 35% of total employment in Metropolitan Toronto in 1951, its share was down to 18% in 1992 (de Reus, 1994: 16; Gertler, 1990: 8-12). In the City of Toronto, home of the fashion district, manufacturing constituted only 7% of employment in 1990 (Gertler, 1990: 23). All in all, Metropolitan Toronto has seen about 47,900 manufacturing jobs disappear since 1939 (de Reus, 1994: 28).

1990s; for most, it represents an economic anachronism, a mere relic of late 19th century industrialization (Borowy, 1994: 74).³⁴ Yet because such scenarios focus narrowly on the Spadina Avenue area, they tend to overlook a crucial point: rather than entering a terminal phase, the garment industry is undergoing a period of socio-spatial reconfigurations. Not surprisingly, the recent devaluation of the 'rag trade' is related to its 'colouring' and feminization. As European male and female immigrants have given way to Asian-Canadian women as the main workforce for the industry, analysts have turned their attention elsewhere.

The garment industry has been affected by three trends which have transformed capitalist production in metropolises. Termed the "downgrading of manufacturing", the first of these is characterized by a consistently shrinking share of unionized workers, the erosion of wages and working conditions, as well as the rise of subcontracting, sweatshops and homework (Sassen, 1991: 9, 217-8). Second, several portions of manufacturing have been "informalized", going underground and thus operating outside statist regulatory boundaries (Sassen, 1991: 288). Related to the expansion of the informal economy, the transition from industrialism to "informationalism" constitutes a third notable development; decentralized, flexible networks of small firms and subcontractors have become the predominant organizational form in certain branches (Castells, 1989: 23-4, 32).

Heavily influenced by these tendencies, garment production in Toronto has been completely restructured over the past few decades. "Hollow pyramids", complex webs which link retailers, subcontractors, small sweatshops and homeworkers in hierarchical relationships, have surfaced (ILGWU Ontario

³⁴The titles of recent Globe and Mail and Toronto Star articles support and reflect such (premature) judgments: "The Spadina district has all but faded" (Carter, 1992), "Rag trade future unravelling fast" (Orwen, 1992); "Garment district going into mourning" (Stefaniuk, 1990)

District, 1995: 35). Despite its continual presence, homework has recently emerged as a systematic component of Toronto's garment industry.³⁵ Large unionized factories have been closed, wages have been cut, and production flexibility has increased to compete with overseas factories, obtain rapid turnover times, and respond to shifts in local demand. Technological innovations have allowed electronic data interchange (EDI) systems integrating producers and retailers, computer-aided design (CAD), computer-aided manufacturing (CAM), as well as automated sewing machines, to become commonplace (ILGWU Ontario District, 1995: 28-30). Homework and informationalism neatly interface, as the latter has further fragmented the production process into a series of simple tasks which can, for the most part, be performed by an unskilled labour force working at home with portable machinery (Mitter, 1986: 45-7; Rowbotham, 1993: 33). Therefore, it is possible to state that clothing manufacturing has been unequivocally integrated into the informational economy:

The results of this new way of organizing work is that the production process is both high-tech and low wage. The manufacturer, by decentralizing work, creates a high-tech, flexible and responsive system. A new design and cutting room is CAD/CAM organized and linked to retailers with the newest in information technology -- EDI. Yet, the sewing operations are completed by workers who receive extremely low wages and work in poor conditions. (ILGWU Ontario District, 1995: 40)

Moreover, the creation of informational networks has facilitated socio-spatial decentralizations, production having largely moved from the older Spadina Avenue locations to sweatshops and homes diffused throughout central and suburban Metropolitan Toronto. Connected to one another through data flows, homeworking clusters have multiplied in parts of Mississauga and Scarborough where large numbers of Asian-Canadian women live.

³⁵The ILGWU estimates that Metropolitan Toronto is home to at least 3,000 homeworkers in this sector alone, most of whom are Third World immigrant women (Orwen, 1992).

Overwhelmingly, homeworkers are Chinese- and Southeast Asian-Canadian women who, due to the articulations of racism, sexism and capitalist restructuring, have come to form intensely exploited segments of Toronto's labour force. The oppressive conditions under which homework is performed are reminiscent of those decried by Engels in The Condition of the Working Class in England in 1844; today, the homes of many Third World immigrant women in Toronto are hardly distinguishable from mid-19th century Manchester factories. By temporal juxtaposition, the ILGWU Ontario District makes this point: "The conditions in the garment industry that the union had fought to eradicate at the turn of the century had re-emerged as the conditions of the late 20th century." (1995: 43) In general, homeworkers are paid below minimum wage³⁶, receive no benefits or overtime pay³⁷, and must provide for their own equipment and operating costs. Children frequently assist in the sewing of garments, thereby providing a source of unpaid labour power, while women contract work-related health problems (ILGWU Ontario District, 1993: 2-4; ILGWU Ontario District, 1995: 43).

Undeterred by these considerable obstacles, women of colour who are employed as homeworkers have actively challenged their subordination. Previously isolated from one another because individualized and scattered throughout the city, homes are being connected to form webs of resistance. Three reasons account for the significance of this form of collective organizing. First, by cutting across space, it enables bonds of solidarity to be built among women who do not share the same workplace. Second, it challenges the

³⁶In two studies, the ILGWU has found that over 60% of homeworkers are not receiving the minimum wage in Ontario; their average wage is \$5.25/hour, with some women obtaining as little as \$1/hour (ILGWU Ontario District, 1993: 2; ILGWU Ontario District, 1995: 43)

³⁷This is hardly surprising, given that the work week varies from an average of 46 hours to more than 100 hours during peak periods (ILGWU Ontario District, 1993: 4, ILGWU Ontario District, 1995: 43).

public/private divide by politicizing forms of capitalist exploitation which affect women in the private sphere; no longer can the latter remain invisible and thus exempt from state regulations. Third, it links women belonging to different ethno-cultural groups who, while respecting the many differences which exist among them, are engaging in coalitional politics. With the assistance of the International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union (ILGWU), the Homeworkers' Association was created in 1992 in order to reach out to women from the Vietnamese- and Chinese-Canadian communities (Borowy, Gordon and Lebans, 1993: 308-10). In order to extend their struggles to other social groups and sites, the Homeworkers' Association and the ILGWU participated in the launching of the Coalition for Fair Wages and Working Conditions for Homeworkers.³⁸

One of the groundbreaking strategies devised by and for homeworkers has been the 'Clean Clothes Campaign', which has sought to simultaneously identify global processes such as homework and recognize the many local embodiments of and corresponding initiatives to the latter. Rowbotham underlines this point:

Laboriously and with considerable difficulty, homeworkers *themselves* are beginning to make global links. Historically, this is of tremendous significance. It indicates the possibilities of a new kind of labour movement which challenges hierarchies of race, ethnicity, gender and class. [...] ideas of organising emerging through local networks, community groups and trade unions [are] contributing to a new kind of internationalism.. (1993: 3)

Co-ordinated out of Amsterdam, with the involvement of groups from the Philippines, Bangladesh, India, Sri Lanka, Mexico, Jamaica, the Netherlands, England and Canada, the 'Campaign' has been guided by certain principles. Consumption has been intensely politicized by generating discourses around

³⁸Some of the members of this coalition are: the Chinese Workers' Association, the National Action Committee on the Status of Women, the Workers' Information and Action Centre of Toronto, the York University Centre for Research on Work and Society, Mujer a Mujer, and the Coalition of Visible Minority Women (Manicom, 1992: 67).

homework through various means: conferences, street protests, videos, leaflets and newsletters. These avenues have been pursued so as to transform clothing consumers into critical individuals who are in a position to challenge retailers about the conditions under which their garments are produced, consequently creating public support for the demands of homeworkers. Further, the Campaign has attempted to make designers, retailers and other agents in the "hollow pyramid" responsible (and thus publicly accountable) for imposing extremely exploitative working conditions on immigrant women of colour (Rowbotham, 1993: 86-9).

Toronto's version of the 'Clean Clothes Campaign' was inaugurated in 1992 by the Coalition for Fair Wages and Working Conditions for Homeworkers. Appropriately, a series of demonstrations have been organized outside the Eaton Centre, a site which is crucial for the three large Canadian retail firms (Hudson's Bay Company, Eaton's, and Dylex).³⁹ Press conferences have been held to release the names of retailers and high-end designers of clothing sewn by homeworkers receiving less than the minimum wage. In addition to the three mentioned above, these names include stores and labels which are well established in the Eaton Centre⁴⁰ -- itself conceived as a place of struggle by homeworkers. Tying the first and third stories to one another, the shopping mall has served as the beginning and end point of my explorations into the power-geometries of global cities.

³⁹Among the flyers which have been distributed by homeworkers and their supporters is the "Clean Clothes Score Card": "Test your clothes: Are they clean? The next time you buy clothes, ask the Retailer these questions: 1. Does the retailer or any of her/his suppliers use homeworkers? 2. Are they paid at least minimum wage? 3. Are homeworkers paid on time? 4. Are they paid for all hours of work? 5. Are homeworkers given reasonable turn around time to complete each job? 6. Has the original supplier registered for a Homeworkers permit, as required under the Employment Standards Act? 7. Does the original supplier/employer make contributions to Unemployment Insurance and Canada Pension Plan? 8. Were the homeworkers intimidated from joining the Homeworkers' Association?" (Manicom, 1992: 59)

⁴⁰They include Club Monaco, Alfred Sung, Jones New York, Linda Lundstrom, and Cotton Ginny (ILGWU Ontario District, 1993: 9)

This chapter has examined the role of the nation-state in the formation of metropolitan patchworks, as well as three instances in which the presence of immigrants of colour has significantly modified the meanings attributed to and social relations involved in some of Toronto's urban heterotopias. The shopping centre has been constituted as a metaphor for commodified versions of liberal multiculturalism, which go hand-in-hand with the exploitation of Third World immigrants and people of colour in the consumer service sectors. Established as a vital space for both Somalian-Canadian renters and white owners, the Dixon condominium towers have been conceived as staging-grounds for capitalist speculation, racism, and the development of tactics of resistance and survival. The consequences of both the devalued status and informational revitalization of garment manufacturing have been related to the rapid growth of homework; the latter has been overwhelmingly performed by female immigrants of colour, who have organized themselves to challenge the structures of domination which exist in Toronto's clothing industry. All too often, then, liberal multiculturalism has become a narrative device with which to gloss over power relations under the banner of inter-racial/inter-ethnic harmony. Scattered throughout the urban fabric and grounded in new socio-spatial imaginaries, a daily politics of resistance needs to articulate a respect for alterity and the empowerment of subaltern groups. I term this a politics of hybridity, the theme of the next chapter.

I am at home in myself; and myself is all these experiences, cultures, value-systems that I have gone through. I don't consider myself an exile because I would have to ask myself then what I am exile from. I may be in the literal sense exiled from my country, but today, at the end of the twentieth century, when all our boundaries are breaking down, we should be looking not to roots in some place but to resources within ourselves for our understanding of our place in society, our place in a particular country, our place in culture. [...] And the struggle is where I am, the struggle is here and now. But, of course, I carry a double consciousness with me: that of my place in this society, my place in the struggle of black, working-class people here and now, and that of my place in the struggles of Third World peoples in Third World countries both here and there. And I am not exiled from that. I may not be in the vortex of those struggles but I am involved in them. And therefore I do not understand the question of exile. I do not understand the question of domicile. The heart is where the battle is. (Sivanandan, 1990: 16)

CHAPTER 4

URBAN HETEROTOPIAS AND THE POLITICS OF HYBRIDITY: DESTABILIZING IDENTITIES, REGENERATING RESISTANCES

The current chapter proposes to awaken themes which have been left dormant in this thesis: the political projects coming out of materialist feminist epistemological stances, notably how an ethic of marginality can respond to alterity; the effects of transnational migrations and hybrid ethnoscapes on our ways of imagining the North Atlantic; and the implications of viewing Euro-American metropolises as urban heterotopias, as sites where differences proliferates and identities of the self, the community/nation, and the city need to be reconsidered. Penetrated and shaped by divergent ethnoscapes, global cities have been transformed into minoritarian cities. In a sense, they now constitute postcolonial locales in which alterity and oppression feed off each other. An article reflecting on the implications of these changes appropriately frames the issues in such terms:

Today, Toronto is a city of strangers. And the unknown, the "other" continues to be anxiety-producing. Toronto, a city that has prided itself on its tolerance and adaptability, is being put to the test. Is it possible for people from more than 100 different cultural groups to live together in harmony, or is that a pie-in-the-sky dream? (Toronto Star, 1992)

Put differently, how do we deal with difference and flux? I begin by analyzing the work of Jameson, Harvey, and Castells, three Marxist theorists who have engaged with alterity in urban settings. It is contended that their writings foster either strategies which are incapable of effectively critiquing reactionary place-politics, or an ethnocentric discourse of tolerance for cultural diversity (liberal

multiculturalism) which is perfectly compatible with global capitalist narratives. Called a politics of hybridity, materialist feminist alternatives are put forward to offer an unbounded sense of place and a respect for alterity devoid of assimilationist designs (radical multiculturalism). Throughout, I advocate certain ways of thinking about difference in relation to identity; migrant subjectivities, diasporic communities, and decentred cityscapes are parts of this picture, as are applications of the latter normative and theoretical instruments to study Toronto, where a politics of hybridity is taking shape in the daily lives of Third World immigrants.

I. Marxist Strategies: Taming Alterity

Faced with a multiplication of urban heterotopias, radical intellectuals have suggested various interpretive frameworks. For some, globalizations and alterity have provoked a general sense of unease, of deep-seated insecurity and powerlessness.¹ Enlightenment metanarratives seem to have vanished -- or at least, to have been seriously debilitated -- yet nothing has come to replace the 'old certainties'. This poses a particularly difficult problem for certain self-identified Marxists, who have devised political interventions to counter these (apparently) angst-producing times. Three of the most influential responses, those of Jameson (1991), Harvey (1989; 1993) and Castells (1989), are examined here.

In Postmodernism, or, The Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism, Jameson relies on Mandel's (1975) analysis to argue that a stage of late (or multinational) capitalism has been attained, to which corresponds the rise of postmodernism

¹In response, Massey provocatively asks: "Why is it that for so many of the academics who write about time-space compression, who are in relative control of their new mobility and means of communication, who jet off to (or from) Los Angeles to give a paper on it, does it generate such feelings of insecurity?" (1993: 63)

in the cultural sphere. Submerged by the decentred spatial web of global capitalism, the modern subject has become disoriented and fragmented, losing his bearings and, consequently, the Archimedean standpoint from which he could maintain a critical distance vis-à-vis his surroundings (1991: 48-9).² The high modernist perceptual devices on which he relied, as well as any related political projects, have been rendered ineffective by postmodern hyperspace (1991: 412-3). Thus, according to Jameson, we require an "aesthetic of cognitive mapping", a totalizing strategy of imagining the new global space as well as our positions within it. By way of cognitive mapping, individual and collective subjects can firmly ground themselves socially and spatially, thereby (re)gaining a sense of place within the set of global class relations (1991: 51). For Jameson, totalization (whether it be at the global or the local level) is not merely a tool for socio-political empowerment; more to the point, it is a *sine qua non* of socialist struggles at any spatial scale³.

Harvey's entries into the debates around the reconstruction of emancipatory politics are contained in both The Condition of Postmodernity and a follow-up article (1993). Paralleling Jameson's claims, Harvey believes that postmodernity is characterized by 'time-space compression', a new phase in the accelerating capitalist process which Marx identified as the annihilation of space through time (1989: 293). Within the realm of the global economy, where socio-spatial barriers between different worlds are seemingly collapsing, time-

²The use of the masculine is deliberate here.

³Jameson's attachment to and belief in the political necessity of totalizing approaches is evident in the following passages: "Surely this is what the cognitive map is called upon to do in the narrower framework of daily life in the physical city: to enable a situational representation on the part of the individual subject to that vaster and properly unrepresentable totality which is the ensemble of society's structures as a whole." (1991: 51) He goes on to claim: "The political form of postmodernism, if there ever is any, will have as its vocation the invention and projection of a global cognitive mapping, on the social as well as the spatial scale." (1991: 54) In Chapter 1, I have argued against strategies of totalization, attempting instead to put forward situated and partial materialist feminist readings of the global.

space compression creates insecurity, ephemerality and fragmentation (1989: 296). Since modern interpretive schemes and a secure sense of place have been destabilized, political interventions need to be rethought. Harvey dismisses a full-blown politics of difference, considered to be "a fragmented politics of divergent special and regional interest groups" (1989: 302), proposing in its wake a politics of "place-identity" which would enable agents to situate themselves by linking places to personal and collective identities. He favours a (so-called) non-exclusionary politics of place which examines the capitalist processes through which difference is (re)produced (1993: 25). Despite the fact that some of the limitations of projects grounded in place-based identities are acknowledged -- notably the possibility that they may be recuperated for exclusionary and reactionary ends (1993: 4), and their ineffectiveness in challenging the mobility of transnational capital (1993: 24) -- Harvey fails to address them directly; these dangers are considered the price which we must be willing to pay to reconstruct radical politics.⁴

The third work which I will examine is Castells' The Informational City, whose political implications have been overlooked in spite of its widespread acclaim in academic circles. Castells posits that the current phase of capitalist restructuring is related to the transition from industrialism to an "informational

⁴In dealing with difference, the tension between universality and particularity -- and the apparent threat which a politics of difference poses for Marxism -- are made explicit in Harvey's first recommendation to resolve the crisis of historical materialism.

The treatment of difference and 'otherness' not as something to be added on to more fundamental Marxist categories (like class and productive forces), but as something that should be omni-present from the very beginning in any attempt to grasp the dialectics of social change. The importance of recuperating such aspects of social organization as race, gender, religion, within the overall frame of historical materialist enquiry (with its emphasis upon the power of money and capital circulation) and class politics (with its emphasis upon the unity of the emancipatory struggle) cannot be overestimated. (1989: 355)

The first sentence is promising, yet the one that follows reveals a concern for recuperating other struggles and maintaining a universalist political unity; alterity is to be controlled

2 of /de 2

PM-1 3 1/2" x 4" PHOTOGRAPHIC MICROCOPY TARGET
NBS 1010a ANSI/ISO #2 EQUIVALENT

PRECISIONSM RESOLUTION TARGETS

mode of development" in which knowledge has become the central source of productivity and economic growth. This new "techno-economic paradigm" has sprung forth through the rapid expansion of microelectronics, cybernetics, telecommunications and other information-processing technologies (1989: 10-2). Capitalist production is now organized according to a space of flows, the "placeless logic" of informational networks enabling corporations to be virtually autonomous vis-à-vis particular socio-cultural contexts (1989: 169-70). Subtitled "The Reconstruction of Social Meaning in the Space of Flows", Castells' conclusion boldly states that "the historical emergence of the space of flows [has superseded] the meaning of the space of places"⁵ (1989: 349); the substance of specific locations has been dissolved, annihilated in and through global informational circuits; previously unitary, "place-based societies and cultures" are unstable and fragmented. More often than not, social groups attempting to counter the space of flows have relied on defensive strategies which have, in turn, led to various forms of tribalism and/or fundamentalism (1989: 349-50). Undeterred by these risks, Castells insists that retrieving the social meaning of places remains imperative. Concretely, local communities must safeguard and promote their socio-cultural identities and those of the sites where they live (1989: 350-1).⁶

⁵This formulation, and some of its implications, have been examined in Chapter 2

⁶Castells is aware of the dangers of this argument, yet goes on to state that

At the cultural level, local societies, territorially defined, must preserve their identities, and build upon their historical roots, regardless of their economic and functional dependence upon the space of flows. The symbolic marking of places, the preservation of symbols of recognition, the expression of collective memory in actual practices of communication, are fundamental means by which places may continue to exist as such, without having to justify their existence by the fulfillment of their functional performance (1989: 350-1)

These propositions are troubling, for grounding resistance in an exclusionary history ("roots", "symbols", "collective memory") suggests that the latter has been constructed in a sphere devoid of power relations. Materialist feminists must ask by whom and for whom is history written? Whose history is remembered?

Having come up against globalizations and the spread of urban heterotopias, Jameson, Harvey and Castells convincingly argue that the traditional foundations of emancipatory political struggles need to be reconceptualized. Moreover, their insistence that any new tactics be spatially grounded -- given the recognition that relations of power operate in and through space -- is extremely insightful. Still, when read with materialist feminist lenses, their prescriptions for renewing socio-spatial politics do not follow through on the potentially radical implications of their diagnoses of the current epoch. It is as if, having seen the (postmodern) abyss toward which their analyses lead, all three authors pulled back in horror to hang on, in the last instance, to the vestiges of Enlightenment categories.⁷ At bottom, their proposals are geared toward the taming of alterity.

The comprehensive nature of the three theorists' explanations can be conceived as both the source of their widespread appeal and their Achilles heel. On the one hand, a certain sense is made of a apparently chaotic and highly disjunctive series of cultural, socio-spatial, economic and political tendencies. Whether it be by way of the cultural logic of late capitalism, flexible accumulation and time-space compression, or a new informational mode of production, the possibility of understanding and critiquing the current wave of transformations is presented. On the other hand, metanarratives of this sort exercise closure towards other interpretations, those coming from the margins and seeking to provide situated and partial stories of globalizations. As Bhabha puts it, in a discussion of Jameson's work which is applicable to the other two authors: "What must be mapped as a new international space of discontinuous

⁷This move is similar to Althusser's notion of overdetermination, with which he was able to argue against a unidirectional base-superstructure model while retaining the determination of the economic sphere in the last instance.

historical realities is, in fact, the problem of signifying the interstitial passages and processes of cultural difference that are inscribed in the 'in-between', in the temporal break-up that weaves the 'global' text." (1994: 217) None of them problematizes the singular meanings attributed to certain fundamental terms; 'nation', 'city', and 'subject' are either assumed to be unitary entities or, if (believed to be) fragmented, as needing to return to an 'original' state of unity.

It follows that order, security and unity can be revived strictly by remapping the globe to rediscover one's sense of direction and socio-spatial position within the worldwide matrix of flows. Massey has noted that this binary line of thinking operates by opposing place (the site of Being) to a number of signifiers of volatility (or Becoming, such as postmodernism, time-space compression, and the space of flows); in such accounts, place is touted as the last bastion of homogeneity, stability, and thus, of opposition to the dissolution of coherence and the promise of emancipation (1992: 12; 1993: 63). Ultimately, Jameson, Harvey and Castells have adopted a sense of place which, because it carries several flaws, can be qualified as "unprogressive". Locations are given monolithic identities, requiring an introverted (and often essentialist) search for shared historical origins as well as the construction of boundaries between inside and outside, between included self and excluded Other (Massey, 1992: 12; 1993: 64).

This unprogressive sense of place does not empower leftists with the discursive tools to critically engage with and provide clear alternatives to the conservative attachment to place. Reactionary local movements, which thrive on xenophobic, racist, classist and/or homophobic tendencies to keep others, however they may be defined -- immigrants, people of colour, prostitutes, the poor, the homeless, the working classes, gays and lesbians -- out of certain spaces, cannot be successfully countered by the Marxist theories studied

above.⁸ Indeed, due to their undifferentiated conceptions of place, the latter are open to capture by exclusionary place-based politics; the following cases will illustrate this point. In Los Angeles' San Fernando Valley, white middle-class and bourgeois homeowners' associations have sprouted to maintain the 'character' and 'quality of life' of suburban neighbourhoods; 'nimby' (not-in-my-back-yard) protests have proliferated (Davis, 1990: 204-6).⁹ Renaming their city 'Hongcouver', certain white Vancouverites have been clamouring against (what is perceived to be) a tidal wave of Asian immigrants. An alarming number of the former have opposed the growing presence and visibility of so-called 'monster houses' inhabited by Hong Kong Chinese capitalists, who are believed to be responsible for the irreversible destruction of the 'Canadian' (that is to say, white Anglo bourgeois) identity of 'distinguished' districts such as Shaughnessy (Mitchell, 1993: 273-4). Returning to Toronto for a moment, two cases of a reactionary politics of place come to mind. The report of a meeting in the basement party room of the (in)famous Dixon complex depicted white condominium owners, enraged Somalian-Canadian tenants, as such:

They are emboldened by their numbers and their shared grievances. They mutter each to each. They *understand* each other, because they live here, have for years owned condos here, have watched in disgust as this placid suburban community has been mutilated by a misguided immigration policy and hostile,

⁸As noted earlier, Jameson, Harvey and Castells are aware of the precariousness of advocating the retrieval of place-based identities and a historically-rooted sense of place. Nonetheless, while rejecting defensive localisms, they are less willing to be critical of the potential implications of their own conceptions of place -- notably the assumptions which the latter share with conservative politics

⁹Entitled "Homegrown Revolution", the third chapter of City of Quartz contains a fascinating discussion of 'nimby' struggles. Davis remarks:

'Community' in Los Angeles means homogeneity of race, class and, especially, home values. Community designations -- i.e. the street signs across the city identifying areas as 'Canoga Park', 'Holmby Hills', 'Silverlake', and so on -- have no legal status. In the last analysis, they are merely favor granted by city councilmembers to well-organized neighborhoods or businessmen's groups seeking to have their areas identified (1990: 153)

filthy immigrants who sit around all day and *laugh* at the discomfort of the Canadians who were there first.¹⁰ (DiManno, 1993)

The second instance can be traced back to the hostility manifested towards Caribana, a festival of Caribbean-Canadian culture held every summer in Toronto, by segments of the city's Italian-Canadian community. Verbal conflicts have arisen over plans to hold a limited number of activities in an area which has metamorphosed from an Italian-Canadian stronghold to a space incorporating Italian-Canadian residences with both Caribbean-Canadian and Italian-Canadian businesses. Fearing that the coming of Caribana would mark the death knell of the neighbourhood's distinct identity, a number of Italian-Canadians voiced their opposition at a public meeting with cries of "we were here first" and "we built Canada".¹¹ (Murray, 1994a; 1994b) What these disparate illustrations have in common is the display of a particular (not to say peculiar) sense of place, eerily confirming Massey's warning.

At most, the strategies favoured by Jameson, Harvey and Castells uphold liberal multiculturalism, a pluralist discourse which merely tolerates (or even encourages) cultural diversity while aspiring to contain alterity.¹² In the North Atlantic regions, this is realized by implicitly deploying (and simultaneously denying or hiding) ethnocentric, Euro-American norms to classify societies and cultures in hierarchical manners (Bhabha, 1990: 208).¹³

¹⁰At the same meeting, an older German-Canadian woman proclaimed "If the Somalis don't like our rules, they should go back where they came from. We don't need them." (DiManno, 1993)

11

¹¹A Caribbean-Canadian woman, who had lived in the area for over two decades, replied "We all built Canada. You pay taxes, we pay taxes too." (Murray, 1994a)

¹²The distinction between liberal and radical forms of multiculturalism follows that which Bhabha (1990: 207-8) establishes between cultural diversity and cultural difference. The ideas of radical multiculturalism and cultural difference (or what Bhabha terms the "third space") will be elaborated in the following section.

¹³Jameson's process of global cognitive mapping bears a striking resemblance to that contained in liberal multiculturalism. Both presuppose the ability to use a universalizing

Liberal multiculturalism is an ambiguous notion, given that it potentially opens the way toward abandoning essentialist concepts of nationhood yet also takes national boundaries as its frame of reference. Furthermore, under the cloak of enlightened cosmopolitanism, relations of domination, oppression and exploitation are not challenged; struggles for emancipation are discarded in favour of celebrating multiple languages, folklores and cuisines (Castles et al., 1988: 13; Kobayashi, 1993: 216-7).¹⁴

Frequently couched in terms of the "united colors of capitalism" (Mitchell, 1993), liberal multiculturalism nicely complements hegemonic narratives of economic globalization (in the singular). Dominant social groups can appropriate the principles of open-mindedness and tolerance for diversity in order to further economic restructuring, branding as racist or xenophobic those who oppose the penetration of particular locales by global capital flows.¹⁵ Art

interpretive scheme (or map) to locate, classify and evaluate all socio-cultural contexts vis-à-vis an existing central, Archimedean vantage point

¹⁴Discussing his involvement in the British anti-racist struggle of the 1970s, Hall relates a humorous instance where 'liberal multiculturalism' was deployed.

The enemy had to be what we called "multi-culturalism." Because multi-culturalism was precisely what I called previously "the exotic." The exotica of difference. Nobody would talk about racism but they were perfectly prepared to have "International Evenings," when we would all come and cook our native dishes, sing our native songs and appear in our own native costume. It is true that some people, some ethnic minorities in Britain, do have indigenous, very beautiful indigenous forms of dress. I didn't. I had to rummage in the dressing-up box to find mine. I have been de-racinated for four hundred years. The last thing I am going to do is to dress up in some native Jamaican costume and appear in the spectacle of multi-culturalism. (1991b: 55-6)

¹⁵In the context of Vancouver, Mitchell explains:

Capitalists and politicians seeking to attract Hong Kong Chinese investment target "localists" as racist, and endeavor to present themselves and the city as non-racist. Their willingness to attract foreign capital, to advertise the city as "open for business" is deliberately conflated with a willingness to engage with Chinese immigrants and businesspeople in the spirit of racial harmony. (1993: 264-5)

A related argument is presented by Harvey:

If capitalists become increasingly sensitive to the spatially differentiated qualities of which the world's geography is composed, then it is possible for the peoples

Eggleton, the former conservative mayor of Toronto responsible for the "world-class city" pitch, understood the degree to which liberal multiculturalism and transnational capitalism make good bedfellows. In a speech to promote the metropolis as site for Hong Kong Chinese investment and immigration, he declared:

Our city has a tradition of civility and tolerance for people of other languages and customs. We have a tradition of reaching out and the vast majority of people in Toronto will greet immigrants with open arms. Our diverse ethnic make-up plays an important role in promoting our international growth. The many close ethnic links we have will be catalysts in cultivating international trade and investment. (Goodspeed, 1991)

Having questioned what are viewed as some of the more problematic ramifications of taming difference, where do materialist feminist analyses go from here? The next section will attempt to sketch the outline of a different politics, a politics of difference which engages with globalizations.

II. Materialist Feminist Strategies: The Politics of Hybridity

To put it boldly, the new kind of critic and artist associated with the new cultural politics of difference consists of an energetic breed of New World *bricoleurs* with improvisational and flexible sensibilities that sidestep mere opportunism and mindless eclecticism; persons from all countries, cultures, genders, sexual orientations, ages and regions with protean identities who avoid ethnic chauvinism and faceless universalism; intellectual and political freedom-fighters with partisan passion, international perspectives, and, thank God, a sense of humor that combats the ever-present absurdity that forever threatens our democratic and libertarian projects and dampens the fire that fuels our will to struggle. Yet we will struggle and stay, as those brothers and sisters on the block say, "out

and powers that command those spaces to alter them in such a way as to be more rather than less attractive to highly mobile capital [] The qualities of place stand thereby to be emphasized in the midst of the increasing abstractions of space. The active production of places with special qualities becomes an important stake in the spatial competition between localities, cities, regions, and nations (1989: 295)

there" -- with intellectual rigor, existential dignity, moral vision, political courage and soulful style. (West, 1990: 36)

Cornel West's fighting words embody the spirit of materialist feminist interventions, which refuse to view globalizations and their various manifestations -- whether they be called 'hyperspace', 'time-space compression' and/or 'the space of flows' -- as inherently threatening to emancipatory struggles. From these perspectives, then, our condition of "overlapping territories and intertwined histories" (Said, 1993: 3) simultaneously closes off and opens up certain possibilities, compelling us to reassess the categories and premises on which radical politics have been founded.

A. Migrant Subjectivities

One of the missing dimensions of the Marxist analyses presented above concerns a reconsideration of the subject, whose identities should be problematized.¹⁶ Reinstating Cartesian Man -- that is, the universalized figure of the white, bourgeois, Euro-American male who occupies a transcendental standpoint both outside and above time and space -- as the privileged agent of social change cannot be envisaged by materialist feminists.¹⁷ Cartesian Man, the creator and devoted supporter of liberal multiculturalism, poorly hides his assimilationist designs towards others. 'They' can be tolerated by abandoning the differences which imperil his identity, or by hanging on and retreating to

¹⁶Though our positions differ slightly, the question of the subject was initially brought to my attention by Baban's (1993) discussion of Kristeva, Bhabha and Said.

¹⁷Massey interrogates the motives of those who long for the return of the sovereign self, thereby unwittingly situating and relativizing their own (unacknowledged) perspectives: "The point, however, is that much, if not all, of what has been written has seen this new world from the point of view of a (relative) élite. Those who today worry about a sense of disorientation and a loss of control must once have felt that they knew exactly where they were, and that they *had* control." (1992: 9)

(mythical) concepts of authenticity (Bhabha, 1990: 213; Trinh, 1989: 89). As several theorists have convincingly argued, an understanding of the self as a fully centred, complete, universal and coherent being has become a considerable barrier to formulating effective strategies of resistance. Most obviously, such a vision excludes the many partial subject positions which are constituted out of historically and spatially specific social relations; it denies political effectivity and legitimacy to those at the margins, such as Third World immigrants who are positioned (and position themselves) at the intersections of binary views of identity (Butler, 1990: 14; Mohanty, 1991a: 36-7; Trinh, 1989: 104).

For materialist feminists, different subjects (or, more appropriately, subjects of difference) are required. By virtue of being embodied in and through matrixes of class, gender and ethnic/race relations, identities should be seen as decentred, partial, situated and unstable. Through these lenses, all subjects -- even Cartesian Man, despite his claims to the contrary -- become ambivalent, living on borderlines. Trinh's prose evokes this concern for alterity:

A critical distance from myself means that I am not i, am within and without i. I/i can be I or i, you and me both involved. We (with a capital W) sometimes include(s), other times exclude(s) me. You and I are close, we intertwine; you may stand on the other side of the hill once in a while, but you may also be me, while remaining what you are and what i am not. [...] "I" is, therefore, not a unified subject, a fixed entity, or that solid mass covered with layers of superficialities one has gradually to peel off before one can see its true face. "I" is, itself, *infinite layers*. (1989: 90, 94)

Hence, rather than being given or essential, identities are to be interpreted as processes which are constantly (re)negotiated, which are partially constituted as moments of being and becoming (Hall, 1990: 225). Contradictory and open to subversion, identities can be represented as effects of power relations and discourses which interpellate and fragment the self (Butler, 1990: 147).

Yet what difference do subjects of difference make? The significance of adopting fractured views of the self comes fully into view when examining the latter's relationship to the other, for by undermining binaries, subjects of difference seek to become radically open to alterity; otherness cannot be captured and brought back to the monolithic spaces of sameness by incomplete, decentred selves. Instead, it must be engaged with intersubjectively, accepted and left to flourish (Bhabha, 1990: 212-3; Grosz, 1990: 81; Sennett, 1990: 148). This demands nothing less than acknowledging, even embracing, the otherness which lies within each of us. As subjects of difference, variously located in webs of identity-formation, we must strive to become what Kristeva (1988) terms "strangers to ourselves".¹⁸

The figure of the migrant has been seized upon by several feminist and postcolonial authors as an incarnation of the post-Cartesian subject, as a metaphor which is well suited to explain the experiences of selves who are produced through disjunctive global flows. Said convincingly asserts the necessity of this migratory position:

Yet it is no exaggeration to say that liberation as an intellectual mission, born in the resistance and opposition to the confinements and ravages of imperialism, has now shifted from the settled, established, and domesticated dynamics of culture to its unhoused, decentered, and exilic energies, energies whose incarnation today is the migrant, and whose consciousness is that of the intellectual and artist in exile, the political figure between domains, between forms, between homes, and between languages. (1993: 332)

¹⁸Kristeva makes a lyrical plea to this effect.

Étrangement, l'étranger nous habite: il est la face cachée de notre identité, l'espace qui ruine notre demeure, le temps où s'abîment l'entente et la sympathie. De le reconnaître en nous, nous nous épargnons de le détester en lui-même. Symptôme qui rend précisément le "nous" problématique, peut-être impossible, l'étranger commence lorsque surgit la conscience de ma différence et s'achève lorsque nous nous reconnaissons tous étrangers, rebelles aux liens et aux communautés. (1988: 9)

The migrant trope is not meant to invoke cosmopolitans or globetrotters, privileged (and self-defined) universal subjects who believe themselves to be citizens of the world unencumbered by ties to place. Rather, it refers to the experiences of certain people of colour who have permanently journeyed from the South to the North Atlantic, thereby becoming simultaneously "rooted and rootless" (Trinh, 1989: 335). More so than other subjects, Third World immigrants are likely to become strangers to themselves who, while recognizing their own situatedness, do not use the latter to generate authentic identities or a sense of belonging. Because homecoming -- the quest for or return to one's original roots -- is considered an impossible and ultimately undesirable voyage, migrant subjects find comfort in occupying multiple sites and engaging in border struggles (Chambers, 1994: 74-5; Said, 1990: 361).¹⁹ To adopt a marginal viewpoint is perilous, for it entails being inevitably situated along the interstitial spaces where one is both included and excluded from dominant narratives (Grosz, 1990: 77). Yet as I claimed in Chapter 1, marginality also enables alternative stories of globalizations to come to the fore, stories of globalizations' (all too forgotten) others.

B. Diasporic Communities

If recognizing the fractured, migrant character of subjectivities is a crucial step towards political renewal, it is also worth heeding Sivanandan's advice about the atomistic forms of identity politics which can stem from an excessive focus on the subject (1990: 34). To paraphrase his argument, changing the self must not be conflated with changing the world, nor must the former become the only site from which emancipatory strategies are conceived to be capable of

¹⁹As illustrated in Chapter 3 and in the next section, some members of the Somalian-Canadian community exemplify this migratory imaginary

emerging. Thus, migrant subjectivities are to be read as building blocks in the quest for different "imagined communities" (Anderson, 1991) and "imagined spatialities" (Keith and Pile, 1993b: 17), not as ends in and of themselves.

In this respect, Hall has noted that globalizations have further spoilt the myth of symmetry between the territorial entity of the nation-state and cultural identities (1991a: 22). Based on gender, class and ethnicity, other forms of collective identities have coalesced both above and below national contexts, articulating the global and the local into transnational -- one could even say postnational -- patterns. Like that of the migrant, the metaphor of the diaspora has been established to interpret identities which cannot be contained within the confines of the modern Euro-American nation, which are dispersed across multiple places and histories. Thinking diasporically, as derived from Jewish as well as black experiences of displacement and resistance, enables many insightful ways of seeing and being:

Black diasporic imaginaries therefore inscribe a poetics of time and space which is always unimaginable. Paradoxically, Glissant's suggestion that that the dislocation of the historical continuum produces a 'non-history' complete with the erasing of the collective memory, can be taken as radically productive. It facilitates focus on a system of organizing experiences, space, which is the project of another temporality, not only a different history, but in effect the history of different spaces: the African diaspora. (Hesse, 1993: 169)

Diasporic communities share a sense of ambivalence toward the nation, being part of it yet never completely belonging to it; seen as strangers lying within, they are located inside the territorial boundaries of the nation-state but outside its historical lineage. Hence, their very presence disrupts nationalist fantasies and the concepts upon which the latter rely: unity, purity, homogeneity, origins, roots (Chambers, 1994: 71-3). Applying the idea of diasporic configurations, it is possible to explore the collective identities of Third World immigrant

communities shaped out of movement and residence, out of differences and similarities.

Gilroy's (1993a) work represents a key contribution to diasporic thinking, for it illustrates the benefits of wearing migrant lenses. In it, he analyses the histories and spatialities of the black Atlantic, the African diaspora which has taken shape in the North-Atlantic world and served as one of modernity's others. To convey the state of fragmentation, flux and flow in which this transnational formation has taken shape, Gilroy employs the trope of ships crisscrossing the spaces between the Caribbean, Africa, Europe and North America (1993a: 4, 16). The notion of the black Atlantic operates as an alternative to the nation-centric frameworks which have conventionally defined identities, whether they be related to subjects or communities (1993a: 6). For subjects of difference living both globally and locally in diasporic formations, hybridity replaces authenticity as a central tenet: "it ain't where you're from, it's where you're at", proclaims the title of another of Gilroy's writings (1993b). Blacks, and migrant subjects more generally, have acquired a "double consciousness"²⁰ of simultaneously belonging 'here' and 'there', perhaps neither 'here' nor 'there' -- wherever 'that' may be. Hermetic identities are torn apart, existing side-by-side in disjunctive relation to each other; to become hybrid, to become part of diasporic webs (1993a: 144).

C. Decentred Cityscapes

To migrant selves and diasporic collective identities must correspond an equivalent view of place, the latter providing the socio-spatial context within

²⁰The concept of "double consciousness" was first formulated in W. E. B. Du Bois' The Souls of Black Folk (published in 1903), which sought to express the ambivalence of being both American and black. For an extended discussion of Du Bois' ideas, see Chapter 4 of The Black Atlantic (1993a: 111-45).

which the former can be formed and expressed. In other words, our (often neglected) assumptions about place play a crucial, if unrecognized, role in fostering the recognition of migrant subjectivities and hybrid communities. Materialist feminist geographers (McDowell, 1993; Massey, 1993) have made important contributions in this direction, advocating a "progressive sense of place" which welcomes -- rather than shying away from -- globalizations and alterity. Accordingly, it is asserted that locales should be invested with certain traits (McDowell, 1993: 310-14; Massey, 1993: 66-7). Instead of havens of stability with clearly demarcated borders, they can be interpreted as changing matrixes of power relations whose boundaries are highly porous; notions of inside and outside, of insiders (selves) and outsiders (others), are to become floating signifiers without territorial moorings.²¹ Further, as I tried to show in Chapter 3, places need to be endowed with divergent, contested identities rather than the singular meaning which is imposed on them by dominant social groups; places are to be considered perspectival entities, generated by proliferating subject positions. Global cities consist not only of the central business districts (CBDs) where transnational capital roams freely, but also of marginal zones where people of colour, immigrants, women, gays and lesbians, and workers survive by destroying the homogenizing corporate definitions of metropolises.

This unbounded sense of place, which radically differs from that prevailing in modern Euro-American thought, is expressed in and through the daily existences of subaltern groups. It prevails among Mexican peasants, who

21 Massey puts it this way:

Instead then, of thinking of places as areas with boundaries around, they can be imagined as articulated moments in networks of social relations and understandings. And this in turn allows a sense of place which is extra-verted, which includes a consciousness of its links with the wider world, which integrates in a positive way the global and the local. (1993: 66)

inhabit borderless yet specific sites where the outside is seen as a frontier rather than a limit (Esteva, 1987: 132). An ethic of hospitality, of respect for alterity and openness to difference according to which collective identities are forged not on the basis of being and/or belonging but on that of struggles against domination, can thereby be developed (Esteva, 1987: 137). A parallel political (as opposed to territorial) definition of place underlies hooks' appeal: "Marginality as a site of resistance. Enter that space. Let us meet there. Enter that space. We greet you as liberators." (1991: 152)

By exploring the relationship between the metaphors of walls and borders, the forging of a progressive sense of place in North Atlantic global cities can be contemplated. Amid the ephemerality and alterity the metropolitan fabric, power lines run through to create walls which divide social groups and maintain the domination, oppression and exploitation of some over others. Walls operate both to ensure the reproduction of socio-spatial inequalities and, by segregating various groups into contained urban spaces, prevent exposure to difference (Marcuse, 1995; Sennett, 1990: xii).²² These exclusionary purposes are not permanently realized, however; they can be undermined, rigid walls being transformed into permeable borders. The latter may subsequently act as sites of encounter where differences intersect, where essentialist identities are destabilized. It is here that borders crossings are undertaken by migrant subjects and diasporic communities (Sennett, 1990: 200-1), boundaries constituting strategic points of struggle where entrenched racial/ethnic, gender and class hierarchies become difficult to sustain. Through resistance and confrontation, power relations can be challenged by subordinate social groups

²²To support his argument about the structures which underlie the apparent amorphous form of urban spaces, Marcuse employs the image of the quartered city which contains five inter-related parts and corresponding kinds of walls. a dominating city with ramparts, a gentrified city with stockades, a suburban city with stucco walls, a tenement city with barricades, and an abandoned city with prison walls (1995: 244-8)

who occupy border zones. Thus, as contested spaces, cities offer the prospect of an "openness to unassimilated otherness" (Young, 1990: 227) whereby inclusionary differences thrive and constellations of others -- that is to say, all subjects and communities, even Cartesian Man who is relegated to merely being a stranger to himself -- meet unoppressively (Young, 1990: 238-9). Both aspects of urban life, its hierarchical power-geometries and its radical potential (respectively symbolized by walls and borders), are evoked in Gilroy's description of contemporary London:

Thus foregrounding the role of music allows us to see England, or more accurately London, as an important junction point or crossroads on the webbed pathways of black Atlantic political culture. It is revealed to be a place where, by virtue of local factors like the informality of racial segregation, the configuration of class relations, and the contingency of linguistic convergences, global phenomena such as anti-colonial and emancipationist political formations are still being sustained, reproduced, and amplified. (1993: 95)

D. Hybrid Politics

Migrant subjectivities, diasporic communities and a progressive sense of place, all embedded in decentred urban landscapes, contribute to imagining materialist feminist discourses in relation to globalizations and its various effects. These emancipatory political strategies, which I will term a politics of hybridity, can be summed up by three key concepts: space, difference, and articulation. First, a situated and decentred spatial politics should supersede totalizing endeavours which impose fixity on flux and homogeneity on difference. To use Chambers' phrase, we need "to journey without maps", immersing ourselves in alterity instead of fleeing from or taming it for fear of losing our political bearings (1994: 94). The complexity of socio-spatial configurations, and subjects' consequent interpretive limits and partial

perspectives, must be readily acknowledged.²³ Multiple other mappings, readings of other spaces and groups, can trace local and global networks through which struggles have emerged (Mohanty, 1991a: 3). In addition, this spatial politics should aim to multiply sites and communities of resistance so as to interrupt the circulation of power wherever it is exercised and whomever it subjugates (Laclau and Mouffe, 1985: 170-1; Soja and Hooper, 1993: 200). From (what were perceived as) a few privileged loci (nations, states, factories, or homes), we move to a more diverse -- and ultimately more inclusive -- sense of where politics matter. The global/local binary, according to which globally-oriented projects are deemed valuable in contrast to the (assumed) insignificance of local tactics, must thereby be undermined; the politics of hybridity are deployed simultaneously at both scales (Smith, 1993: 9-10).

The second component of a politics of hybridity consists in radical multiculturalism. Also known as a politics of difference, it insists that, as a defining characteristic of globalizations, alterity should be maintained rather than transcended in the name of principles of unity and sameness.²⁴ Cultural difference cannot simply be reduced to a matter of diversity within the universalist framework of a shared (ethnocentric) human heritage, the potential

²³Chambers makes a convincing case for abandoning Enlightenment-based, Euro-American cartographic practices in global cities:

The fluctuating contexts of languages and desires pierce the logic of cartography and spill over the borders of its tabular, taxonomic, space. Beyond the edges of the map we enter the localities of the vibrant, everyday world and the disturbance of complexity. Here we find ourselves in the gendered city, the city of ethnicities, the territories of different social groups, shifting centres and peripheries -- the city that is a fixed object of design (architecture, commerce, urban planning, state administration) and yet simultaneously plastic and mutable: the site of transitory events, movements, memories. (1994: 92-3)

²⁴West (1990: 19) usefully summarizes the main tenets of the politics of difference "[] to trash the monolithic and homogeneous in the name of diversity, multiplicity and heterogeneity, to reject the abstract, general and universal in light of the concrete, specific and particular; and to historicize, contextualize and pluralize by highlighting the contingent, provisional, variable, tentative, shifting and changing." These elements can serve as criteria to distinguish liberal multiculturalism from its radical counterpart.

"incommensurability" between social groups needing to be fully recognized (Bhabha, 1990: 208-9; Butler, 1990: 14). Hybrid identities must be asserted against centripetal forces which constantly pull the margins towards their own dissolution into a monolithic core. At the same time, if all subjects and collective identities are becoming hybrid, their journeys towards and experiences of hybridity vary greatly. In this sense, then, Bhabha's (1990: 211; 1994: 218) notion of the "third space" -- a site where hybridity is built from processes of encounter and negotiation among groups whose marginality and differences remain unassimilated -- constitutes an important contribution to our understanding of the basis of radical multiculturalism.

Although hybrid politics rightly insist on a respect of otherness, differences cannot be allowed to congeal into essentialist and exclusionary mechanisms; particular strategies must not be transformed into introverted pursuits of authenticity (West, 1990: 34-5). For materialist feminists, articulation across the field of differences is thus considered a pivotal objective, given that micro-sites and micro-struggles are to be perpetually (re)connected into unstable, inclusive socio-spatial patterns of resistance (Hall, 1991b: 58; Laclau and Mouffe, 1985: 188).²⁵ Articulatory practices cannot be grounded in a dualist logic of belonging/not belonging to unproblematized identities, the latter being rendered as always already plural and fragmented. Thus, articulation stems from affinity, the search for and creation of points of intersection amongst the webs of migrant subjects, diasporic communities and metropolitan spaces. Informal, flexible, and temporary alliances connecting social forces situated in

²⁵Despite the fact that their analysis is concerned with the possibility of post-Marxist radical democracy, Laclau and Mouffe's comments about articulatory practices are equally relevant for a politics of hybridity: "Between the logic of complete identity and that of pure difference, the experience of democracy should consist of the recognition of the multiplicity of social logics along with the necessity of their articulation. But this articulation should be constantly re-created and renegotiated, and there is no final point at which a balance will be definitively achieved." (1985: 188)

several locales can be formed only if the irreducible character of both differences and similarities between certain forms of opposition to class, gender, and racial/ethnic subordination is accepted (Mohanty, 1991a: 38; Soja and Hooper, 1993: 189). Common fronts can be mobilized in response to certain issues and events as well as to affirm broadly-based agendas, though this must be tempered by the recognition that each group may hold different emancipatory aims. As a result, no struggle should be privileged *a priori*, nor should it be assumed that tactical divergences need to be permanently reconciled. Hybrid politics are devoid of metaphysical guarantees; they are without telos, yet also without the false security provided by a belief in pre-given unity. Put simply, alliances need to be constructed, not assumed to exist (Butler, 1990: 149; Laclau and Mouffe, 1985: 178). Others, who are concurrently positioned and position themselves at the margins, can challenge the hierarchical and exclusionary effects of globalizations by articulating their affinities into interwoven matrixes of hybridity and resistance.

III. The Politics of Hybridity in Urban Heterotopias: Revisiting Toronto

The streets of Canada's cities are indeed sites of struggle where difference is acted out, creating landscapes that include racism, residential segregation, ethno-cultural variations in access to work and its rewards, as well as street festivals, 'ethnic' restaurants and schoolyard games. The interests of Canadian citizens are as diverse as the landscapes of francophone Trois-Rivières, the Kahnawake Indian Reservation, Vancouver's Chinatown and Toronto's old elite district of Rosedale. Such places must be seen, therefore, not simply as cultural landscapes, but as manifestations of political objectives that cannot be accommodated without struggle and contradiction. (Kobayashi, 1993: 224)

Opening this section in similar ways to the last chapter, I wish to extend the discussion of the Eaton Centre's North Mall Food Court to Toronto itself. As

previously argued, the food court is a microcosm of the city which lies outside the shopping centre's walls, a city filled with relations of power and alterity. Far from being insignificant, the presence of cuisines from around the world on the streets of Toronto represents one of the first and most visible indications of its ethno-cultural kaleidoscope. Chinese and Italian fare, coming from long established and large communities, competes with North American fast food in the race to multiply outlets.²⁶ Yet restaurants serving both Mexican and Greek, or Ethiopian and Italian cuisine, are increasingly common as immigrants from other parts of South America, Asia, Africa, Europe, and the Caribbean have come together in Toronto. If not dead, ideas of authenticity and purity have been dealt severe blows in the culinary realm; indeed, the phrase 'truly Canadian' has a hollow ring to it, the hybrid product of some non-assimilationist melting pot. Multinational food is a key component of urban heteropias shaped by worlds in/of flow(s), where fixed understandings of 'here' and 'there' are subverted. Relating his experiences in Toronto's Indiatown, Ayanoglu (1993) provides a fascinating account of how certain transnational boundaries have collapsed:

Gerrard East (near Coxwell Ave.) feels as Indian as Bombay or Bangalore -- silk, spice, sitar music, tightly packed sidewalks, plus irresistible wafts of the many flavors of a cuisine that has taken 5,000 years to evolve. [...] I searched all over India for a Dosa to equal the Magoons' [the proprietors of the Madras Express Café on Gerrard Street East] and only found one that came close (in the Bengal Sweet Shop, South Extension Part 1, New Delhi). Upon my return, I rushed to Gerrard St. for the real thing and admitted to Sneha Lata that hers was better than anything I had over there.

²⁶According to the 1991 census, Italian and Chinese constitute the second and third largest 'ethnic origins' of Metro Toronto residents -- respectively 8.1 % (311,215) and 6.0 % (231,820) of the population (Turner, 1995: 28). Indicating their popularity as well as capitalism's ability to infiltrate the cultural sphere, both of these cuisines are mass produced and available in highly commodified, fast food versions.

Transformed by global flows of capital and people, the seemingly impenetrable walls of urban landscapes have crumbled. In the case of Toronto, the signifiers 'Little Italy' and 'Chinatown' have lost their racialized referents as the borders demarcating ethnic communities from one another have become more and more porous. Once a bastion of Italian-Canadian culture, Little Italy has recently metamorphosed into a zone where hybridity reigns by way of continuous influxes of Vietnamese, Chinese, Portuguese and Spanish populations (Vieira, 1992). For its part, Chinatown has been restructured by complex migratory and class processes which have led to a spillover of areas of Chinese-Canadian settlement from the downtown core to the suburban sprawl; to be precise, one must now speak of six Chinatowns in Metro Toronto.²⁷ Accelerating investment and immigration on the part of members of the Hong Kong Chinese bourgeoisie, as well as the presence of a growing Chinese-Canadian middle class, have shattered some of the barriers which ensured the containment of the Chinese-Canadian community within specific sites of the urban grid. While workers are still highly concentrated in the older Chinatown districts, Chinese-Canadians capitalists have indirectly challenged mechanisms of socio-spatial segregation by appropriating portions of Toronto's suburbs initially designed for white middle class families (Gray, 1992; Li, 1994). Instead of neatly keeping differences apart, the dynamics of global cities generate multiple patchworks of otherness.

²⁷Li's analysis power relations within Toronto's Chinese-Canadian community provides an excellent example of interpreting urban heterotopias. She writes:

Today, Chinatown is both modern and postmodern, with new transglobal enterprises, real estate and insurance companies, doctors', dentists' and attorneys' offices, social services, banks, and movie theatres. Although these are signs of the Chinese community's growth, they also indicate another important change: while remaining a distinctive town-within-the-city, Chinatown's boundaries are blurring. With the increasing globalization of the economy, Chinatown is in some sense disappearing as an entity. New actors and power centres have emerged, destabilizing the traditional enclaves, social organizations and cultural life. (1994: 16)

Metropolises are also sites of cultural contestation where issues of representation and appropriation come to the fore. In Toronto, seemingly innocent events such as the staging of Show Boat at the North York Performing Arts Centre, or that of Miss Saigon at the Princess of Wales Theatre, have become highly politicized issues. These plays have been converted into symbols of anti-racist struggles, a number of community groups (such as the Coalition to Stop Show Boat and the Korean Women's Collective) opposing the common capitalist practice of commodifying and exoticizing situations of racial oppression for mass entertainment (Gombu, 1993; Hanlon, 1993; Henry, 1994; Platiel, 1993; Valpy, 1993). The representation of people of colour living in other places and other times have been fundamentally problematized by those for whom such images still resonate powerfully; the others who inhabit Euro-American worlds have come to resist the latter's ability to construct, appropriate and disseminate accounts of themselves. Show Boat and Miss Saigon are not only harmless historical tales about African-Americans in the 1880s or Vietnamese people during the Vietnam War set against the musical backdrops of American slavery and imperialism, for they implicitly touch upon the continuing oppression of African-Canadians and Asian-Canadians in Toronto.

At another level, as struggles have been partially transferred from (apparently) distant homelands to the streets of Toronto, the transnationalization of ethno-national and religious questions has reshaped urban patterns.²⁸ By erecting monuments of various kinds, immigrants have engraved parts of their

²⁸Appadurai discusses this phenomenon in the following terms:

[...] the central paradox of ethnic politics in today's world is that primordia (whether of language or skin color or neighborhood or of kinship) have become globalized. That is, sentiments whose greatest force is their ability to ignite intimacy into a political sentiment and turn locality into a staging ground for identity, have become spread over vast and irregular spaces, as groups move, yet stay linked to one another through sophisticated media capabilities. (1990: 306)

collective identities into the urban text. Three recent cases illustrate such practices. The first relates to the construction of an Islamic Centre in North York, funded by local Muslim communities as well as by the World Islamic Call Society and the Kuwaiti, Jordanian and Saudi Arabian states. A brochure about the Centre explains its purpose in relation to dominant Euro-American beliefs:

In the face of the predominantly non-Islamic ideas and culture on this continent, TARIC [Toronto and Region Islamic Congregation] is dedicated to the preservation and propagation of Islam throughout North America. Here in the heart of this Western continent, it will be a beacon of the Islamic presence and a symbol of Islamic achievement. (quoted in McAteer, 1991)

Seen in this way, Toronto is one of the strategic nodes in the spiritual quest pitting Christianity to its historic Other for the hearts and minds of North Americans. The second case centres around the contested heritage of Alexander the Great, a bust of whom stands on Danforth Avenue. This modest site has served as a battleground between Greeks and Macedonians, both groups claiming ownership of the figure represented there. Clashes have erupted, replaying conflicts which remain unresolved in Greece: "Some Greeks clung to the statue with the country's blue and white flag wrapped around their bodies as police tried to tug them away [...]. Aleksander Kostov said his hand was injured when a man ripped a sign out of his hands and broke it into pieces. It read 'Freedom for Macedonians in Greece'." (Honey, 1990) Another instance of deterritorialized politics is provided by Toronto's 80,000-strong Sikh community, which has built six temples in the area -- including the largest one in North America (Vieira, 1992). In many respects, the struggle for an independent Khalistan and the construction of Sikh identity are enacted in Toronto as much as they are in the state of Punjab. Inderjit Bal, one of the leaders of the Sikh community, makes this explicit: "We're asking Canadians to recognize Sikhs as

an independent nation and we want Canadians to help us achieve our goals." On Khalsa Day, the anniversary of the Sikh nation's founding, Toronto landmarks such as Exhibition Place and Nathan Phillips Square are transformed into platforms for nationalist demands (Small, 1994). Sikh immigrants renew their ties to the "imagined community" back 'home', forming transnational alliances in which certain North Atlantic metropolises act as points of articulation.

Additional tales of migrant subjectivities and diasporic communities abound in global cities. In the days preceding the 1994 World Cup finals between Italy and Brazil, the streets of Toronto were briefly converted into competing cheering sections for the two teams. Amidst the euphoria, it was as though parts of Rome and São Paulo had furtively merged into mutant patchworks. To be Brazilian-Canadian or Italian-Canadian meant to live in liminal spaces between 'here' and 'there', neither entirely 'here' nor 'there'; the hyphenated identities which these subjects deployed were hybrid, not dichotomous. Ana Maria Lyrio, a Brazilian-Canadian soccer enthusiast, understood this well: "Everybody cheers for us, because everybody belongs to us and we belong to everybody. We are a nation of different cultures. Dutch, English, Italian, German, Portuguese, African, French. We are like a nice blend of coffee." (Gombu, 1994b)

Confronted to reactionary groups and racist policies (as explained in Chapter 3), Toronto's Somalian-Canadian community has not turned to essentialist, inward-looking tactics. Instead, it has advocated strategies which demonstrate how resistance can stem from a politics of hybridity. Every July 1, Somalian-Canadians meet to simultaneously celebrate Somalia's Independence and Union Day and Canada Day; they conceive of themselves as belonging to two homelands, one not excluding the other (Thompson,

1993c). Further, their actions have been informed by a progressive sense of place, an ethic of hospitality which respects and welcomes otherness. Responding to white intolerance and growing tensions, Somalian-Canadians organized a neighbourhood festival at which Somalian music and food were offered to all who attended (Welsh, 1994). The gathering was not intended to promise eventual assimilation or demonstrate sameness, but rather to create a space where cultures could meet unoppressively through an intersubjective process of acceptance and mutual transformation toward hybridity.²⁹

Finally, any discussion of the politics of hybridity in Toronto would be lacking if it ignored Caribana, the aforementioned festival of Caribbean-Canadian cultures which is held in the city each summer. Caribana represents a tangible example of a "third space" where radical multiculturalism is allowed to flourish, where unassimilated differences are recognized and negotiated. Indeed, as Harney (1992) perceptively puts it, "Caribana has been one the few true spaces of multi-racial communication in this nation, one of the few spaces in which Caribbean people have been able to speak for themselves in the multi-racial and multicultural conversation that should be Canada." The diasporic networks of Gilroy's black Atlantic, tying parts of Africa, the Caribbean and North America to one another, come alive during and are condensed in the celebrations. Permeable identity-borders are crossed back and forth by all participants, subjects and communities whose hybridities are celebrated and whose fragmented consciousnesses are extended to social groups at large (van Rijn, 1994). To images of the hierarchical, walled city or the necessary taming of differences is conterposed an alternative reality, that of inclusive, heterotopic nodes:

²⁹This constitutes a pivotal difference between the discourses of liberal and radical multiculturalism. Whereas the former affirms that 'we' are all essentially identical, the latter acknowledges difference in order to develop a respect for alterity

To be around a mas-camp is to experience a vision of this city that is heaven to the hell of shattering storefronts. Fathers and sons try on costumes and laugh; people from the Caribbean of African, East Indian, Chinese, Syrian and European descent, (and many of all these descents) dance in the driveway in front of chest-high speakers; an Italian-Canadian who joined the camp gets a hug from an older woman and is reminded of his aunt; people are taut with excitement about the nearing chance to display their culture to the rest of their nation. (Harney, 1992)

Caribana thus offers moments during which boundaries break down, enabling imagined spatialities and communities to construct articulatory practices founded upon emancipatory affinities vis-à-vis multiple relations of domination. If a politics of hybridity finds hope and inspiration in radical interpretations of a popular festival, an appropriate gesture of theoretical humility has been posed. For in the end, materialist feminisms cannot be otherwise (or elsewhere) than grounded in the daily struggles of subaltern groups located at the margins of globalizations, and in the experiences of those of us who journey towards marginality as a becoming.

CONCLUSION:

PARTIAL CLOSURES, NEW OPENINGS

Though not waiting to invoke a sense of closure -- preferring to leave the ideas which arise from this thesis unravel in various directions -- I would like end by briefly invoking some of the themes which have only begun to be explored here, connecting these to the subaltern narratives of globalizations contained in the preceding chapters.

As emancipatory movements reinvent themselves at the turn of the 20th century, surfaces of engagement between poststructuralism, Marxism, feminism and postcolonialism should continue to be constructed in the quest for alternative knowledges and ways of seeing the world. Out of the meeting of these perspectives, radical imaginaries can spring forth to (re)position political economy's many contributions. A hybrid approach, it has always been fashioned by interstitial spaces which lie between disciplinary fields, which connect them to one another and challenge clearly demarcated boundaries. The radically critical and creative spirit of political economy is to be found at border zones, the horizons of which include the humanities and the social sciences; the unstable yet potent brew of philosophy, economics, history, cultural studies, geography, political science, literary studies, sociology, and anthropology still holds the promise of innovative, transdisciplinary research. In short, political economy can be conceived as a discursive space of permissiveness and transgression.¹

¹I owe this evocative phrase to Rianne Mahon.

Shaped by critical dialogues among different strands of social theory, such a space has been effectively maintained by materialist feminist epistemologies (Graham, 1992; Haraway, 1991; Hennessy, 1993; Mohanty, 1991a; Ng, 1993). Indeed, Chapter 1 contends that the latter provide tactics to dismantle the (global/local and objectivist/relativist) dualisms on which are premised conventional outlooks on globalizations. The key traits of materialist feminisms -- which include an acknowledgment of social processes' inescapable discursivity, a commitment to anti-essentialism, a recentring of daily life, and a concern for global capitalisms -- enable us to create frameworks of understanding which articulate global and local scales, thereby forming a reflexive ethic of marginality.

At another level, because globalizations are increasingly linked to fundamental restructurings of the socio-spatial fabrics of Euro-American areas, the need to construct subaltern tales and to identify alternative dimensions of globalizations has become increasingly urgent. Specifically, on the heels of Third World feminist and postcolonial writings (Appadurai, 1990; Mohanty, 1991a; Trinh, 1989; Said, 1993), the numerous implications of transnational migrations are to be considered in more depth; this requires that the progressive seeping of the Third World into the First, as well as the diffusion of hybridity throughout economic and ethno-cultural mosaics, be recognized as defining features of urban configurations. In turn, examinations of metropolises must be supported by metaphors conveying their complexity, hierarchy and alterity (McDowell, 1993; Massey, 1992b and 1993; Sassen, 1993; Soja, 1989).

Keeping this in mind, materialist feminist epistemologies can be tied to theoretical investigations of transnational flows and the fractured mosaics appearing across North Atlantic zones, as is the case in the second chapter. In

addition to global capital flows which have moulded local capitalscapes into integrated yet divergent networks of capitalist production, particular attention has been devoted to the hybrid ethnoscaples burgeoning out of the massive movements of populations from Asia, the Caribbean, South America and Africa to Euro-American territories. Colliding and intersecting with one another, ethnoscaples and capitalscapes have produced complex patterns of domination and alterity in global cities, best captured by the metaphors of heterotopias and power-geometries.

Concerns about the ways that relations of power are established, maintained and exercised in metropolitan settings should be complemented by analyses of the processes by which these same relations are undermined. The micro-tactics of subordinate groups, their daily webs of survival and opposition, need to be further theorized and interpreted. Rather than being a fixed or sutured entity where power is centralized and hegemony is secured, the social should be understood as a set of matrixes in which political struggles proliferate. Overlapping points of contestation escape capture, mechanisms of subordination having to be constantly renegotiated. In other words, emancipatory research agendas cannot simply privilege domination over resistance; though often undervalued, the latter is tightly woven into -- and thus an integral part of -- the former.

Chapter 3 draws upon these arguments to discuss both specific power-geometries in Toronto and the city's embeddedness in the Canadian nation-state. Involving immigrant and minority workers in the Eaton Centre's North Mall Food Court, Somalian-Canadians in Dixon, and women of colour in the garment industry, these heterotopic nodes are shown to be composed of capitalscapes and ethnoscaples. By refusing to describe it as a coherent totality, Toronto is viewed as an ensemble of scattered micro-sites where relations of

power are exercised and struggles to oppose subordination are staged in a variety of social spaces, living spaces and work spaces.²

Finally, studying urban resistance through the lenses of a politics of hybridity, in which communities recognize the necessity to maintain autonomous projects while participating in coalitional activities, constitutes a crucial intervention. Hybrid politics pose a substantial number of challenges for traditional analytical frameworks, multidimensional collective identities (those of women, people of colour, immigrants, and workers) being capitalized on to build intersections and form a multiplicity of alliances. Articulatory practices have become more and more extroverted, cutting across territorial boundaries to organize diasporically. In the era of globalizations, subjects need to think and act simultaneously in different spaces and at different scales.

Hence, the fourth chapter critiques different responses to the question of alterity in urban heterotopias. On the one hand, because they fail to fully address the consequences of otherness, Marxist strategies either end up supporting liberal multiculturalism's tolerance for diversity, or are susceptible to recuperation for reactionary political ends. On the other hand, materialist feminisms are fully compatible with the requirements set out above, fostering a "third space" of radical multiculturalism in and through which migrant subjectivities, diasporic communities and decentred urban patterns are expressed. Hybrid perspectives foster other readings of global cities like Toronto, whose structures are injected through and through by the acts of Third World immigrants who strive to establish alterity and challenge relations of domination.

²I would like to thank Michael Dolan for this formulation, which succinctly captures the argument about proliferating power-geometries conveyed in Chapter 3.

REFERENCES

- Alcoff, L., and E. Potter. 1993. "Introduction: When Feminisms Intersect Epistemology." In Feminist Epistemologies. Edited by L. Alcoff and E. Potter. New York and London: Routledge.
- Amin, A., and K. Robins. 1990. "The re-emergence of regional economies? The mythical geography of flexible accumulation." Environment and Planning D: Society and Space 8, 1: 7-34.
- Anderson, B. 1991. Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism. Revised ed. London and New York: Verso.
- Appadurai, A. 1990. "Disjuncture and Difference in the Global Cultural Economy." In Global Culture: Nationalism, Globalisation and Modernity. Edited by M. Featherstone. London and Newbury Park: Sage.
- Appleyard, R. F. 1991. International Migration: Challenge for the Nineties. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.
- Ayanoglu, B. 1993. "Street snack attack." Toronto Star, September 27.
- Baban, F. 1993. "The Representation of Culture and Globalization, and the Role of Intellectuals in IR Theory." Department of Political Science, Carleton University. Unpublished manuscript.
- Bailey, T., and R. Waldinger. 1991. "The Changing Ethnic/Racial Division of Labor." In Dual City: Restructuring New York. Edited by J. H. Mollenkopf and M. Castells. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Bar On, B.-A. 1993. "Marginality and Epistemic Privilege." In Feminist Epistemologies. Edited by L. Alcoff and E. Potter. New York and London: Routledge.
- Barrett, M. 1992. "Words and Things: Materialism and Method in Contemporary Feminist Analysis." In Destabilizing Theory: Contemporary Feminist Debates. Edited by M. Barrett and A. Phillips. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Basavarajappa, K. G. et al. 1993. Impact of Migration in the Receiving Countries: Canada. Geneva: International Organization for Migration.

- Benhabib, S., and D. Cornell. 1987. "Introduction: Beyond the Politics of Gender." In Feminism as Critique: On the Politics of Gender. Edited by S. Benhabib and D. Cornell. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Bhabha, H. 1990. "The Third Space: Interview with Homi Bhabha." In Identity: Community, Culture, Difference. Edited by J. Rutherford. London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Bhabha, H. 1994. The Location of Culture. London and New York: Routledge.
- Borowy, J. 1994. "Why We Must Gain Democratic Control Over Toronto's Economy." In Toronto Region in the World Economy: Proceedings of a Symposium on How the Toronto Region is Affected by Changes in the World Economy. Edited by E. F. Isin. Toronto: York University Urban Studies Programme.
- Borowy, J., S. Gordon, and G. Lebars. 1993. "Are These Clothes Clean? The Campaign for Fair Wages and Working Conditions for Homeworkers." In And Still We Rise: Feminist Political Organizing in Contemporary Canada. Edited by L. Carty. Toronto: Women's Press.
- Brand, D. 1993. "A Working Paper on Black Women in Toronto: Gender, Race, and Class." In Returning the Gaze: Essays on Racism, Feminism and Politics. Edited by H. Bannerji. Toronto: Sister Vision Press.
- Bukharin, N. n.d. Imperialism and World Economy. London: Martin Lawrence. First published in 1927.
- Butler, J. 1990. Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity. London and New York: Routledge.
- Canadian Urban Institute. 1991. Metro in Transition: An Overview of Demographic, Economic and Public Policy Trends and their Implications for the Social Development Strategy of Metropolitan Toronto. Toronto: Canadian Urban Institute Urban Focus Series 90-10.
- Cardoso, F. H., and Faletto, E. 1979. Dependency and Development in Latin America. Translated by M. M. Urquidí. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press.
- Carter, J. 1992. "The Spadina district has all but faded." Globe and Mail, November 26.
- Castells, M. 1989. The Informational City: Information Technology, Economic Restructuring, and the Urban-Regional Process. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Castles, S. 1993. "Ethnicity, Community and the Postmodern City." Communal/Plural 1: 47-61

- Castles, S., M. Kalantzis, B. Cope, and M. Morrissey. 1988. Mistaken Identity: Multiculturalism and the Demise of Nationalism in Australia. Sydney: Pluto.
- Castles, S., and M. J. Miller. 1993. The Age of Migration: International Population Movements in the Modern World. London: Macmillan.
- Chambers, I. 1994. Migrancy, Culture, Identity. London and New York: Routledge.
- Citizenship and Immigration Canada. 1994. Facts and Figures: Overview of Immigration. Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services Canada.
- Cleaver, H. 1994. "Comment: The Chiapas Uprising." Studies in Political Economy 44: 141-57.
- Cox, R. W. 1987. Production, Power, and World Order: Social Forces in the Making of History. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Crawford, M. 1992. "The World in a Shopping Mall." In Variations on a Theme Park: The New American City and the End of Public Space. Edited by M. Sorkin. New York: Hill and Wang.
- Cross, M., and R. Waldinger. 1992. "Migrants, minorities, and the ethnic division of labor." In Divided Cities: New York & London in the Contemporary World. Edited by S. S. Fainstein, I. Gordon, and M. Harloe. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Davis, M. 1985. "Urban Renaissance and the Spirit of Postmodernism." New Left Review 151: 106-13.
- Davis, M. 1990. City of Quartz: Excavating the Future in Los Angeles. London and New York: Verso.
- De Reus, M., ed. 1994. Metropolitan Toronto: A profile of Canada's principal business and financial centre. Toronto: Board of Trade of Metropolitan Toronto.
- Derrida, J. 1974. Of Grammatology. Translated by G. C. Spivak. Baltimore and London: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- DiManno, R. 1993. "Troubles of a neighbourhood in flux." Toronto Star, August 7.
- Dolan, M. 1992. "Power in the 'New' New International Division of Labour: Third World Production in a Post-Fordist Era." Paper presented at the Conference on Democratic Politics, Carleton University, Ottawa, November.

- Dolan, M. 1993. "Global Economic Transformation and Less Developed Countries." In Global Transformation and the Third World. Edited by R. O. Slater, B. M. Schutz, and S. R. Dorr. Boulder and London: Lynne Rienner.
- Economic Council of Canada. 1990. Good Jobs, Bad Jobs: Employment in the Service Economy. Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services Canada.
- Esteva, G. 1987. "Regenerating People's Space." Alternatives XII, 1: 125-52.
- Foucault, M. 1980. Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings 1972-1977. Edited by C. Gordon. New York: Pantheon.
- Foucault, M. 1986. "Of Other Spaces." Diacritics 16, 1: 22-7.
- Frank, A. G. 1966. "The Development of Underdevelopment." Monthly Review 18, 4: 17-31.
- Fraser, N. 1989. Unruly Practices: Power, Discourse and Gender in Contemporary Social Theory. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- Fraser, N. 1995. "False Antitheses: A Response to Seyla Benhabib and Judith Butler." In Feminist Contentions: A Philosophical Exchange. Edited by L. J. Nicholson. New York and London: Routledge.
- Fraser, N., and L. J. Nicholson. 1990. "Social Criticism without Philosophy: An Encounter between Feminism and Postmodernism." In Feminism/Postmodernism. Edited by L. J. Nicholson. New York and London: Routledge.
- Friedmann, J. 1986. "The World City Hypothesis." Development and Change 17: 69-83.
- Friedmann, J., and G. Wolff. 1982. "World City Formation: An Agenda for Research and Action." International Journal of Urban and Regional Research 6, 3: 309-44.
- Fröbel, F., J. Heinrichs, and O. Kreye. 1978. "The World Market for Labor and the World Market for Industrial Sites." Journal of Economic Issues XII, 4: 843-58.
- Gertler, M. S. 1990. Toronto, the State of the Regional Economy. Working Papers of the Canadian Waterfront Resource Centre. Ottawa: Minister of Supply and Services Canada.
- Gill, S. 1990. American Hegemony and the Trilateral Commission. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.

- Gilroy, P. 1993a. The Black Atlantic: Modernity and Double Consciousness. Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press.
- Gilroy, P. 1993b. "It ain't where you're from, it's where you're at." Chap. in Small Acts: Thoughts on the politics of black cultures. London: Serpent's Tail.
- Globe and Mail. 1992. "An investigator's day: The magic word is refugee." March 7.
- Goldberg, D. T. 1993. Racist Culture: Philosophy and the Politics of Meaning. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Gombu, P. 1994. "For the 'best party in town', College St. is the place to go." Toronto Star, July 17.
- Gombu, P. 1993. "Most at forum want to sink Show Boat." Toronto Star, April 20.
- Goodspeed, P. 1991. "Eggleton rolls out Metro welcome mat." Toronto Star, June 21.
- Gordon, D. M. 1988. "The Global Economy: New Edifice or Crumbling Foundations?" New Left Review 168: 24-64.
- Graham, J. 1992. "Anti-essentialism and Overdetermination: A Response to Dick Peet." Antipode 24, 2: 141-56.
- Gray, J. L. 1992. "Chinatown moves to the Suburbs." Globe and Mail, April 1.
- Grosz, E. 1990. "Judaism and Exile: The Ethics of Otherness." New Formations 12: 77-88.
- Grosz, E. 1993. "Bodies and Knowledges: Feminism and the Crisis of Reason." In Feminist Epistemologies. Edited by L. Alcoff and E. Potter. New York and London: Routledge.
- Hall, S. 1990. "Cultural Identity and Diaspora." In Identity: Community, Culture, Difference. Edited by J. Rutherford. London: Lawrence & Wishart.
- Hall, S. 1991a. "The Local and the Global: Globalization and Ethnicity." In Culture, Globalization and the World-System: Contemporary Conditions for the Representation of Identity. Edited by A. D. King. Binghamton, N.Y.: Department of Art and Art History, State University of New York at Binghamton.

- Hall, S. 1991b. "Old and New Identities, Old and New Ethnicities." In Culture, Globalization and the World-System: Contemporary Conditions for the Representation of Identity. Edited by A. D. King. Binghamton, N.Y.: Department of Art and Art History, State University of New York at Binghamton.
- Harlon, M. 1993. "Blacks worried by Show Boat backlash." Toronto Star, April 13.
- Haraway, D. 1991. "Situated Knowledges: The Science Question in Feminism and the Privilege of Partial Perspective." Chap. in Simians, Cyborgs and Women: The Reinvention of Nature. London: Free Association Books.
- Harding, S. 1986. "The Instability of the Analytical Categories of Feminist Theory." Signs 11, 4: 645-664.
- Harloe, M., and S. S. Fainstein. 1992. "Conclusion: The divided cities." In Divided Cities: New York & London in the Contemporary World. Edited by S. S. Fainstein, I. Gordon, and M. Harloe. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Harloe, M., P. Marcuse, and N. Smith. 1992. "Housing for people, housing for profits." In Divided Cities: New York & London in the Contemporary World. Edited by S. S. Fainstein, I. Gordon, and M. Harloe. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Harney, S. R. 1992. "A clear case of systemic racism." Toronto Star, August 25.
- Harvey, D. 1982. "The Production of Spatial Configurations: the Geographical Mobilities of Capital and Labour." Chap. in The Limits to Capital. Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press.
- Harvey, D. 1989 The Condition of Postmodernity: An Enquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change. Cambridge: Blackwell.
- Harvey, D. 1993. "From space to place and back again: Reflections on the condition of postmodernity." In Mapping the Futures: Local Cultures, Global Change. Edited by J. Bird et al. London and New York: Routledge.
- Hennessy, R. 1993. Materialist Feminism and the Politics of Discourse. New York and London: Routledge.
- Henry, J. 1994. "'Show Boat' protest watershed for blacks." Toronto Star, November 15.
- Hesse, B. 1993. "Black to Front and Black Again: Racialization through contested times and spaces." In Place and the Politics of Identity. Edited by M. Keith and S. Pile. London and New York: Routledge.

- Honey, K. 1990. "Ancient rivalry flares on Danforth." Toronto Star, July 30.
- hooks, b. 1991. "Choosing the Margin as a Space of Radical Openness." Chap. in Yearning: Race, Gender, and Cultural Politics. London: Turnaround.
- Horkheimer, M. 1972. "Traditional and Critical Theory." Chap. in Critical Theory: Selected Essays. Translated by M. J. O'Connell et al. New York and Toronto: Herder and Herder.
- Hymer, S. 1972. "The Multinational Corporation and the Law of Uneven Development." In Economics and World Order: From the 1970s to the 1990s. Edited by J. N. Bhagwati. London: Macmillan.
- ILGWU Ontario District Council. 1993. ILGWU 1993 Homeworkers' Study: An investigation into wages and working conditions of Chinese-speaking homeworkers in Metropolitan Toronto. Toronto: International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union.
- ILGWU Ontario District Council. 1995. Designing the future for garment workers. Toronto: International Ladies' Garment Workers' Union.
- Isin, E. 1994. "The Dangers of Discourse on the 'Global City'." In Toronto Region in the World Economy: Proceedings of a Symposium on How the Toronto Region is Affected by Changes in the World Economy. Edited by E. F. Isin. Toronto: York University Urban Studies Programme.
- Jameson, F. 1991. Postmodernism, or, the Cultural Logic of Late Capitalism. Durham, N.C.: Duke University Press.
- Jessop, B. 1993. "Towards a Schumpeterian Workfare State? Preliminary Remarks on Post-Fordist Political Economy." Studies in Political Economy 40: 7-39.
- Kautsky, K. 1970. "Ultra-imperialism." New Left Review 59: 41-6. First published in 1914.
- Keil, R. 1994. "The Politics of Urban Research in Toronto." In Toronto Region in the World Economy: Proceedings of a Symposium on How the Toronto Region is Affected by Changes in the World Economy. Edited by E. F. Isin. Toronto: York University Urban Studies Programme.
- Keith, M., and M. Cross. 1993. "Racism and the Postmodern City." In Racism, the City and the State. Edited by M. Cross and M. Keith. London and New York: Routledge.
- Keith, M., and S. Pile. 1993. "Introduction Part 1: The politics of place." In Place and the Politics of Identity. Edited by M. Keith and S. Pile. London and New York: Routledge.

- Knowles, V. 1992. Strangers at Our Gates: Canadian Immigration and Immigration Policy, 1540-1990. Toronto and Oxford: Dundurn Press.
- Kobayashi, A. 1993. "Multiculturalism: Representing a Canadian Institution." In Place/Culture/Representation. Edited by J. Duncan and D. Ley. London and New York: Routledge.
- Kristeva, J. 1988. Étrangers à nous-mêmes. Paris: Gallimard.
- Laclau, E., and C. Mouffe. 1985. Hegemony and Socialist Strategy: Towards a Radical Democratic Politics. London and New York: Verso.
- Landry, D. and G. MacLean. 1993. Materialist Feminisms. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Lash, S. and J. Urry. 1994. Economies of Signs and Space. London and Thousand Oaks: Sage.
- Lenin, V.I. 1975. Imperialism, the Highest Stage of Capitalism. In The Lenin Anthology. Edited by R. C. Tucker. New York: Norton. First published in 1917.
- Lewycky, L. 1992. "Multiculturalism in the 1990s and into the 21st Century: Beyond Ideology and Utopia." In Deconstructing a Nation: Immigration, Multiculturalism and Racism in '90s Canada. Edited by V. Satzewich. Halifax: Fernwood.
- Li, X. 1994. "One Face, Many Stories: Redefining Chinese Identity." Border/Lines 33: 15-21.
- Lyotard, J.-F. 1984. The Postmodern Condition: A Report on Knowledge. Translated by G. Bennington and B. Massumi. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.
- McAteer, M. 1991. "Metro's new Islamic centre seen as bridge between cultures." Toronto Star, May 18.
- McDowell, L. 1993. "Space, place and gender relations: Part II. Identity, difference, feminist geometries and geographies." Progress in Human Geography 17, 3: 305-18.
- McInnes, C. 1992. "A home called Dixon." Globe and Mail, November 28.
- McInnes, C. 1993. "Census balance shifts away from French, British origins." Globe and Mail, February 24.
- Madeuf, B., and C.-A. Michalet. 1978. "A New Approach to International Economics." International Social Science Journal XXX, 2: 253-83.

- Mahon, R. 1993. "The New Canadian Political Economy Revisited: Production, Space, Identity." In Production, Space, Identity: Political Economy Faces the 21st Century. Edited by J. Jenson, R. Mahon, and M. Bienefeld. Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.
- Mandel, E. 1975. Late Capitalism. Translated by J. De Bres. London: Verso.
- Manicom, L., ed. 1992. From the Double Day to the Endless Day: Proceedings from the Conference on Homeworking held in Toronto, Canada, November 13-15, 1992. Ottawa: Canadian Centre for Policy Alternatives.
- Marcuse, P. 1995. "Not Chaos, but Walls: Postmodernism and the Partitioned City." In Postmodern Cities and Spaces. Edited by S. Watson and K. Gibson. Oxford: Blackwell.
- Massey, D. 1992a. "Politics and Space/Time." New Left Review 196: 65-84.
- Massey, D. 1992b. "A Place Called Home?" New Formations 17: 3-15.
- Massey, D. 1993. "Power-geometry and a progressive sense of place." In Mapping the Futures: Local Cultures, Global Change. Edited by J. Bird et al. London and New York: Routledge.
- Mayers, A. 1994a. "Silver screen brings gold to Metro." Toronto Star, September 24.
- Mayers, A. 1994b. "Metro's stage-struck economy." Toronto Star, September 25.
- Mitchell, K. 1993. "Multiculturalism, or the United Colors of Capitalism?" Antipode 25, 4: 263-94.
- Mitter, S. 1986. "Industrial restructuring and manufacturing homework: immigrant women in the U.K. clothing industry." Capital & Class 27: 37-80.
- Mohanty, C. T. 1991a. "Cartographies of Struggle: Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism." In Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism. Edited by C. T. Mohanty, A. Russo and L. Beneria. Bloomington and Indianapolis, Ind.: Indiana University Press.
- Mohanty, C. T. 1991b. "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." In Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism. Edited by C. T. Mohanty, A. Russo and L. Beneria. Bloomington and Indianapolis, Ind.: Indiana University Press.

- Mollenkopf, J. and M. Castells. 1991. "Introduction." In Dual City: Restructuring New York. Edited by J. H. Mollenkopf and M. Castells. New York: Russell Sage Foundation.
- Morris, M. 1993. "Things to do with shopping centres." In The Cultural Studies Reader. Edited by S. During. London and New York: Routledge.
- Murray, M. 1994a. "Italian community angry over plans for Caribana." Toronto Star, July 6.
- Murray, M. 1994b. "Politicians blamed for clash of 2 cultures." Toronto Star, July 11.
- Muszynski, L. 1985. The Deindustrialization of Metropolitan Toronto: A Study of Plant Closures, Layoffs and Unemployment. Toronto: Social Planning Council of Metropolitan Toronto.
- Neufeld, M. 1994. "Reflexivity and International Relations Theory." In Beyond Positivism: Critical Reflections on International Relations. Edited by C. T. Sjolander and W. S. Cox. Boulder and London: Lynne Rienner.
- Ng, R. 1993. "Racism, Sexism, Canadian Nationalism." In Returning the Gaze: Essays on Racism, Feminism and Politics. Edited by H. Bannerji. Toronto: Sister Vision Press.
- Ohmae, K. 1990. The Borderless World: Power and Strategy in the Interlinked Economy. New York: HarperCollins.
- Olson, S. H., and A. L. Kobayashi. 1993. "The Emerging Ethnocultural Mosaic." In The Changing Social Geography of Canadian Cities. Edited by L. S. Bourne and D. F. Ley. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press.
- Ontario Ministry of Citizenship. 1995. Ethnocultural Data Base Table VMB2A, 1991 Census. Toronto: Ontario Ministry of Citizenship Ethnocultural Data Base Office.
- Orwen, P. 1992. "Rag trade future unravelling fast." Toronto Star, October 3.
- Palloix, C. 1977. "The Self-Expansion of Capital on a World Scale." Review of Radical Political Economics 9, 2: 3-28.
- Panitch, L. 1994. "Globalisation and the State." In Socialist Register 1994: Between Globalism and Nationalism. Edited by R. Miliband and L. Panitch. London: Merlin.
- Papp, L. 1991. "Can Toronto stem the flight of industry?" Toronto Star, November 9.

- Pellerin, H. forthcoming. "On the movement of labour and the mobility of capital: International migration in the contemporary period." International Journal of Political Economy.
- Platiel, R. 1993. "Sold-out Show Boat preview wins praise." Globe and Mail, October 6.
- Probyn, E. 1990. "Travels in the Postmodern: Making Sense of the Local." In Feminism/Postmodernism. Edited by L. J. Nicholson. London and New York: Routledge.
- Reich, R. B. 1992. The Work of Nations: Preparing Ourselves for 21st-Century Capitalism. New York: Vintage.
- Richmond, A. H. 1994. Global Apartheid: Refugees, Racism, and the New World Order. Toronto and Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Rieff, D. 1991. Los Angeles: Capital of the Third World. New York: Simon & Schuster.
- Robberson, T. 1995. "Peso's Devaluation Spurs Mexicans to Migrate." The Washington Post, in Manchester Guardian Weekly. February 5.
- Rogers, A. 1992. "The Boundaries of Reason: The World, The Homeland, and Edward Said." Environment and Planning D: Society and Space 10, 5: 511-26.
- Ross, R., and Trachte, K. 1983. "Global Cities and Global Classes: The Peripheralization of Labor in New York City." Review VI, 3: 393-431.
- Rowbotham, S. 1993. Homeworkers Worldwide. London: Merlin.
- SOPEMI (Continuous Reporting System on Migration). 1992. Trends in International Migration. Paris: Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development.
- Said, E. W. 1978. Orientalism. New York: Vintage.
- Said, E. 1990. "Reflections on Exile." In Out There: Marginalization and Contemporary Cultures. Edited by R. Ferguson et al. New York: New Museum of Contemporary Art, and Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press.
- Said, E. W. 1993. Culture and Imperialism. New York: Knopf.
- Salter, L. 1992. "Bridge over Troubled Waters: A Response to Panitch and Wainwright." Studies in Political Economy 40: 163-74.

- Sassen, S. 1988. The Mobility of Labor and Capital: A Study in International Investment and Labor Flow. Cambridge and New York: Cambridge University Press.
- Sassen, S. 1991. The Global City: New York, London, Tokyo. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Sassen, S. 1993. "Analytical Borderlands: Economy and Culture in the Global City." Unpublished manuscript.
- Scott, A. J., and Storper, M. 1992. "Industrialization and Regional Development." In Pathways to Industrialization and Regional Development. Edited by M. Storper and A. J. Scott. London and New York: Routledge.
- Sharrif, A. 1994. "Somali dust-up with guards sparks riot." Now, October 20-26.
- Sharrif, A. 1993. "Highrise divide." Now, August 19-25.
- Shields, R., ed. 1992. Lifestyle Shopping: The Subject of Consumption. London and New York: Routledge.
- Silvera, M. 1993. "Speaking of Women's Lives and Imperialist Economics: Two Introductions from *Silenced*." In Returning the Gaze: Essays on Racism, Feminism and Politics. Edited by H. Bannerji. Toronto: Sister Vision Press.
- Sivanandan, A. 1990. Communities of Resistance: Writings on Black Struggles for Socialism. London and New York: Verso.
- Small, P. 1994. "Sikhs honor anniversary of Khalsa." Toronto Star, April 25.
- Smith, M. P. 1993. "Transnational Migration, State Violence, and the Globalization of Grassroots Politics." Paper presented at the 31st International Conference of the International Institute of Sociology, Paris, June 21-25.
- Smith, M. P., and B. Tarallo. 1993. "The Postmodern City and the Social Construction of Ethnicity in California." In Racism, the City and the State. Edited by M. Cross and M. Keith. London and New York: Routledge.
- Smith, N. 1992. "New City, New Frontier: The Lower East Side as Wild, Wild West." In Variations on a Theme Park: The New American City and the End of Public Space. Edited by M. Sorkin. New York: Hill and Wang.
- Smith, S. J. 1989. The Politics of 'Race' and Residence: Citizenship, Segregation and White Supremacy in Britain. Cambridge: Polity Press.

- Soja, E. 1989. Postmodern Geographies: The Reassertion of Space in Critical Social Theory. London and New York: Verso.
- Soja, E., and B. Hooper. 1993. "The Spaces That Difference Makes: Some notes on the geographical margins of the new cultural politics." In Place and the Politics of Identity. Edited by M. Keith and S. Pile. London and New York: Routledge.
- Spivak, G. C. 1988. "Can the Subaltern Speak?" In Marxism and the Interpretation of Culture. Edited by C. Nelson and L. Grossberg. Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press.
- Stafford, J. 1992. "The Impact of the New Immigration Policy on Racism in Canada." In Deconstructing a Nation: Immigration, Multiculturalism and Racism in '90s Canada. Edited by V. Satzewich. Halifax: Fernwood.
- Stalker, P. 1994. The Work of Strangers: A Survey of International Labour Migration. Geneva: International Labour Office.
- Stefaniuk, W. 1990. "Garment district going into mourning." Toronto Star, June 2.
- Thomas, B. 1973. Migration and Economic Growth: A Study of Britain and the Atlantic Economy. 2nd ed. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Thompson, A. 1993a. "British dominance fades in Metro, census finds." Toronto Star, February 24.
- Thompson, A. 1993b. "Making their way in a new world." Toronto Star, May 6.
- Thompson, A. 1993c. "Metro Somalis celebrate holidays of two 'homelands'." Toronto Star, July 1.
- Todd, G. 1995. Globalization & Local Political Economy: Toronto as a World City. North York: York University Political Science Department Occasional & Working Paper Series.
- Toronto Star. 1992. "Toronto's face reflects the world." June 7.
- Trinh, M. T. 1989. Woman, Native, Other: Writing Postcoloniality and Feminism. Bloomington and Indianapolis, Ind.: Indiana University Press.
- Trinh, M. T. 1990. "Cotton and Iron." In Out There: Marginalization and Contemporary Cultures. Edited by R. Ferguson et al. New York: New Museum of Contemporary Art, and Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press.
- Turner, T. 1990. The Composition and Implications of Metropolitan Toronto's Ethnic, Racial, and Linguistic Populations. Toronto: Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto Multicultural and Race Relations Division.

- Turner, T. 1995. The Composition and Implications of Metropolitan Toronto's Ethnic, Racial, and Linguistic Populations 1991. Toronto: Municipality of Metropolitan Toronto Multicultural and Race Relations Division.
- United Nations Centre on Transnational Corporations (UNCTC). 1988. Transnational Corporations in World Development: Trends and Prospects. New York: United Nations.
- United Nations Centre on Transnational Corporations (UNCTC). 1992. World Investment Report 1992: Transnational Corporations as Engines of Growth. New York: United Nations.
- United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD). 1994. World Investment Report 1994: Transnational Corporations, Employment and the Workplace. New York: United Nations.
- Valpy, M. 1993. "If we shadows have offended: Shakespeare." Globe and Mail, November 28.
- Van Rijn, N. 1994. "Caribana puts on the glitz." Toronto Star, July 31.
- Vieira, P. 1992. "Community no longer hides identity." Globe and Mail, June 3.
- Wallerstein, I. 1974. "The Rise and Future Demise of the World Capitalist System: Concepts for Comparative Analysis." Comparative Studies in Society and History 16, 4: 387-415.
- Watson, P. 1991a. "Foreign-born workers keep Metro moving." Toronto Star, September 21.
- Watson, P. 1991b. "Somalis find home." Toronto Star, September 23.
- Weinberg, P. 1991. "An NDP Mayor for Toronto?" This Magazine 25, 3: 10-2.
- Welsh, M. 1994. "Metro's Somalis play host at get-to-know-us party." Toronto Star, September 25.
- West, C. 1990. "The New Cultural Politics of Difference." In Out There: Marginalization and Contemporary Cultures. Edited by R. Ferguson et al. New York: New Museum of Contemporary Art, and Cambridge, Mass.: MIT Press.
- Williams, R. 1983. Keywords: A Vocabulary of Culture and Society. Revised ed. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press.
- Yalnizyan, A. 1988. A Statistical Profile of Toronto's Labour Market, 1976-1987. Toronto: Social Planning Council of Metropolitan Toronto.

- Yalnizyan, A. 1990. Reflections on Full Employment: Toronto in the Late 1980s. Toronto: Social Planning Council of Metropolitan Toronto.
- Young, I. M. 1990. Justice and the Politics of Difference. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Yúdice, G. 1988. "Marginality and the Ethics of Survival." In Universal Abandon? The Politics of Postmodernism. Edited by A. Ross. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

END

0 3-0 6-9|6

FIN