**The Materiality of the Photographically-Illustrated Book: A Case Study
of Dr. John A. Knowles Renshaw's Extra-Illustrated Edition of *The
Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* by John Ruskin (1880)**

by

Cortney L. Murray

School for Studies in Art and Culture, Department of Art History

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of
Graduate Studies and Research in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of
Master of Arts
in Art History

Carleton University

OTTAWA, Ontario

© 2009, Cortney L. Murray

Library and
Archives Canada

Published Heritage
Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Bibliothèque et
Archives Canada

Direction du
Patrimoine de l'édition

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Your file Votre référence
ISBN: 978-0-494-51975-2
Our file Notre référence
ISBN: 978-0-494-51975-2

NOTICE:

The author has granted a non-exclusive license allowing Library and Archives Canada to reproduce, publish, archive, preserve, conserve, communicate to the public by telecommunication or on the Internet, loan, distribute and sell theses worldwide, for commercial or non-commercial purposes, in microform, paper, electronic and/or any other formats.

The author retains copyright ownership and moral rights in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

AVIS:

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque et Archives Canada de reproduire, publier, archiver, sauvegarder, conserver, transmettre au public par télécommunication ou par l'Internet, prêter, distribuer et vendre des thèses partout dans le monde, à des fins commerciales ou autres, sur support microforme, papier, électronique et/ou autres formats.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur et des droits moraux qui protègent cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

In compliance with the Canadian Privacy Act some supporting forms may have been removed from this thesis.

While these forms may be included in the document page count, their removal does not represent any loss of content from the thesis.

Conformément à la loi canadienne sur la protection de la vie privée, quelques formulaires secondaires ont été enlevés de cette thèse.

Bien que ces formulaires aient inclus dans la pagination, il n'y aura aucun contenu manquant.

Canada

Abstract

This thesis examines the material value of nineteenth-century photographs in the extra-illustrated book. Specifically, I focus on Dr. John A. Knowles Renshaw's accumulation of albumen, and salted paper prints with lithographs, engravings, and drawings tipped into John Ruskin's 1880 edition of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*. In my study of these volumes, I explore the pastime of extra-illustrating among book collectors, situating Renshaw's literary and artistic interests within the cultural milieu of Victorian Britain. I focus on a sequence of photographs in Volume One by James Robertson, Felice Beato, Francis Frith, Maxime DuCamp, and Félix Teynard that depict the Near East and reveal Renshaw's response to British imperialism and the ideology of 'Orientalism.' Drawing on material culture studies, my thesis considers Renshaw's photographically-illustrated volume as a personal artefact that illuminates Renshaw's cultural history and his reception to Ruskinian thought.

Acknowledgements

I would like to thank, first and foremost, my advisor Carol Payne for her guidance, enthusiasm and patience throughout the editing process of this thesis and for organizing monthly group meetings. While I was enrolled in her course, Topics in Photography, our class discussions on the role of material culture and memory studies in photography triggered my interest in the nineteenth-century photographic album.

I am indebted to a number of people and organizations that made my research possible. First I would like to thank the staff of the Photographs Department at National Gallery of Canada, whose assistance was integral to this project, especially Ann Thomas and Lori Pauli who encouraged me to study from one of the albums in the Photographs Collection. I am grateful to Jacqueline Warren and Shawn Boisvert for their help during numerous visits to consult the books, and to John McElhone for his assistance in identifying the production techniques and chemical characteristics of the photographs and prints in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*.

I would also like to thank the British curators and librarians who assisted me by correspondence through email and during my research trip to the United Kingdom in September, 2008. I am grateful to Rebecca Patterson and Diane Tyler for their assistance at Lancaster University's Ruskin Library referring to the William Abercrombie Collection and recommending other contacts and archives to benefit my research. I am thankful to Karen Cliff at Trafford Local Studies, for finding genealogical information about the Renshaw family.

I would like to express my warmest thanks to family, friends, and colleagues who were always willing to listen and discuss my project with me. I could not have completed this thesis without the loving support of my husband Ryan, I thank him for his confidence in me and assistance with learning LaTeX, the typesetting program with which I wrote this thesis.

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: A Material Culture Approach to <i>The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated</i>	14
Chapter 2: Gender and Class: J. A. Knowles Renshaw's Identity and The Pastime of Extra-Illustrating	42
Chapter 3: Aesthetics and 'Orientalism': Photographs of the Near East	71
Conclusion	98
Bibliography	104
Illustrations	113
Appendix 1	133
Appendix 2	142

List of Figures

- 1 John Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, 1880 edition, extra-illustrated by the insertion of over 200 etchings, lithographs, photographs, watercolours, three volumes, folio 35 x 24.5 cm, property of J.A. Knowles Renshaw, National Gallery of Canada, PSC76:178 . . . 113
- 2 *J.A. Knowles Renshaw's bookplate*, on the inside of the front board of Volume One of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, Motto: *Virtus repulsae nescia sordidae* 114
- 3 *Untitled*, date unknown, artist unknown. 34 x 49 cm, albumen paper print. PCS76:178:2 115
- 4 *Arles: The Tympanum and Lintel of the Central Door of Saint-Trophême with Christ of the Apocalypse, France*, Charles Nègre, 1852, 34 x 49 cm, salted paper print, PCS76:178:4. 116
- 5 *The Mosque of Sultan Qaytbey, Cairo*, James Robertson and Felice Beato, before 1863, 34 x 25.3 cm, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:6. 117
- 6 *Untitled* Francis Frith, date unknown, 34 x 25.3 cm, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:7. 118
- 7 *Street View of Cairo* Francis Frith, 1858, Mammoth-plate albumen print, Michael G. and Jane Wilson/ The Wilson Center for Photography, London. (Plate 20 in *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine A Victorian Photographer Abroad* by Douglas R. Nickel). 119
- 8 *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, chromolithographic print, PCS76:178:8. 120
- 9 *"The Holy Land" Egypt*, anonymous, date unknown, watercolour, PCS76:178:18.121
- 10 *Upper Egypt. Great Temple of Dendera. Rear Façade*, Maxime Du Camp, after 1849, published by Gide et Baudry, 16.4 x 21.3 cm, PCS76:178:19.122

- 11 *Emerald of Ravenna looted by the Patriarch*, Francesco Maggioto and Francesco del Pedro diresse, inscription: *Smeraldo Esarca di Ravenna fa Saccheggiare la Patriarchale di*, PCS76:178:17. 123
- 12 *Island of Fileh (Philae) Oriental Colonnade- View of Ruins*, Félix Teynard, salted paper print, printed by H. de Fontenay et Cie. in 1851, published by Goupil et Cie. Paris, London, Berlin and New York, PCS76:178:19. 124
- 13 *Sabil Um Abbas, Cairo*, James Robertson and Felice Beato, ca. 1858, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:24. 125
- 14 *Fountain of the Mosque of Mohammed Ali, Cairo*, James Robertson and Felice Beato, ca. 1858, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:33. . . . 126
- 15 *Ruins of Kirkstall Abbey, West Yorkshire*, anonymous, date unknown, 34 x 49 cm, albumen paper print. 127
- 16 *Avignon. West Side of the Palace of the Popes*, Charles Nègre, 1852, salted paper print. 128
- 17 *Rouen Cathedral, St. Maclou, France*, Bisson Frères (Louis-Auguste Bisson and Auguste-Rosalie Bisson), date unknown, albumen paper print. 129
- 18 *Plate I: Ornaments from Rouen, St. Lo and Venice*, John Ruskin, R. P. Cuff, lithograph in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*. 130
- 19 *Lakenhalle (Cloth Hall) in the Grote Markt, Ypres, Belgium*, anonymous, date unknown, 34 x 49 cm, albumen print. 131
- 20 *Jerusalem Palestine*, Maxime Du Camp, date unknown, published by Gide et Baudry, salted paper print, PCS76:178:34. 132

Introduction

During the nineteenth century the photographically-illustrated book was a means for publishers and collectors to expand ideas, organize aesthetic interests and display a photographers' work. According to Heinz K. Henisch and Bridget A. Henisch in *The Photographic Experience 1839-1914: Images and Attitudes* "The photographically-illustrated book refers to a published volume illustrated with actual photographs. Pages were left blank for this purpose, and photographs "tipped-in" between pages."¹ Offering an alternative to traditional methods of book illustrating, the distribution of photographs into books contributed to a changing method of viewing art and photographic reproduction. In this study I will focus on a group of photographically-illustrated books *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* from the National Gallery of Canada's Photographs Collection, comprising over one hundred lithographs, engravings, albumen and salted paper photographs and watercolours, all inserted into three volumes.²

As a medium for his collection, Dr. John Alfred Knowles Renshaw (1871-1926) used Ruskin's 1880 edition of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, as a means to display his taste in art and literature. The books provide insight into Ruskin's contemporary readership, collecting pastimes among British gentlemen, and the distribution of art in publications. Although much has been written on albums and nineteenth-century photography, less attention has been paid to the value of photographs in extra-illustrated publications, particularly Renshaw's copy of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*. This study draws on the growing body of literature

¹Heinz K. Henisch and Bridget A. Henisch, "The Photographically Illustrated Book," in *The Photographic Experience 1839-1914: Images and Attitudes* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1994), 316.

²S. C. Hodgson, *Hodgson and Co. Sale Catalogues 1956-57* (London: Messrs. Hodgson and Co., 1956), 42. *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* refers to J. A. Knowles Renshaw's extra-illustrated edition of John Ruskin's publication *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* (See Appendix 2, no. 656.).

addressing the nineteenth-century photographically-illustrated album, as discussed in length below. In using this object as a case study, I will discuss the emergence of photography within both the tradition of collecting and extra-illustrating and how it reflects British gender and class identity.

The books were acquired by the National Gallery of Canada in 1976, by James Borcoman, Curator of Photographs, who established the gallery's extensive holdings of nineteenth-century photography. *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* was most likely purchased due to Borcoman's approach to photography which emphasized connoisseurship; the book contains the 'art photographs' of some of the most celebrated nineteenth-century photographers including, Roger Fenton, the Bisson Frères, Blanquart-Evrard, and Charles Nègre. The photographically-illustrated books are a valuable addition to the National Gallery's collection of nineteenth-century photography, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* can be easily construed as a series of rare books. Thus, their material form and content makes them difficult to classify in a museum. They could be stored as rare books in the library's archives, or as part of the Prints and Drawings Collection because most of the extra-illustrations are engravings, lithographs and watercolours. The National Gallery of Canada, however, has stored them in their Photographs Collection. This study emphasizes the cultural history of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, using material culture as a framework.

The basic premise of material culture is that objects such as albums, books, and art reflect the customs and cultural codes of the collectors and their society. By examining the material culture of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, I explore various links among the social and artistic processes that reflect the tradition of collecting and extra-illustrating books during the nineteenth century. A material culture approach offers a new way of viewing photographs as objects. Those inserted in

The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated illuminate their production, circulation and ownership. Addressing the materiality of photographs, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart argue that the material characteristics of photographs have a profound impact on the way images are read and used;³ while Prown's methodology of object analysis offers a means to interpret the photographically-illustrated books considering their provenance, function and value. This thesis will reconsider the status of the extra-illustrated book as a reflection of Renshaw's identity and collecting interests. By identifying the social and historical contexts of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, I expect that a new perspective will emerge on the importance of the physicality of photographs. This study contributes to the growing literature on material culture approaches to photographs crossing the boundaries among cultural anthropology, literary and visual culture.

Renshaw's collecting interests extend to his private library, which includes over fifty rare literary classics. The importance of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* as part of that library makes these volumes valuable personal objects, expressing his identity and status. I will discuss the nature of Renshaw's collecting interests and the practice of extra-illustrating which denotes his social status and wealth. This thesis will reconsider the nature of the photographically-illustrated book as a reflection of the identity of the compiler, and provide a new perspective on the interaction between text and image and the emergence of photography as a means of preserving places and monuments of the past. As such, Renshaw's books bring to light some of the current debates about photography, gender identity and the construction of the British Empire.

To illustrate this, I will refer to a sequence of photographs in Volume One by James Robertson, Felice Beato, Francis Frith, Maxime DuCamp, and Félix Teynard

³Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories: On the Materiality of Images* (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 3.

that depict “the Orient” or the Near East and reflect the motivation of the Victorian gentry to collect, classify and preserve their colonial past. Some of the areas of inquiry include Edward Said’s ideology of ‘Orientalism’ in relation to the photographs of the Near East, the visual perception of the ‘Orient’, as well as the place of commercial photographs in the history of the photographically-illustrated travel publications.

Literature Review

Renshaw’s photographically-illustrated edition of Ruskin’s well-known text is a rich resource for the study of nineteenth-century photographs and the visual culture of Victorian England. Various scholars have focused on the photographically-illustrated book as an object of inquiry and their approaches have been fundamental to my understanding of the photographically-illustrated book. Glenn Willumson’s essay, “Making Meaning Displaced Materiality in the Library and Art Museum,” discusses the photographic album as a personal performance in which “the process of choosing, sequencing, organising...is an intensely individual expression.”⁴ Similarly, Alison Nordstrom’s “Making a Journey: The Tupper scrapbooks and the travel they describe,” focuses on the material value of the travel album and the use of commercial photographs.⁵ Both Willumson’s and Nordstrom’s treatment of material culture and the photographic album will inform my study of the materiality of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*. Martha Langford has written in *Suspended Conversations: The Afterlife of Memory in Photographic Albums*, on the experience of studying albums and examining amateur photography. Her discourse on texts and objects focuses on the family album as “a paradigm, a metaphor, and a ritual,” expressing

⁴Glenn Willumson, “Making Meaning: Displaced Materiality in The Library and Art Museum,” in *Photographs Objects Histories On the Materiality of Images*, Ed, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 63.

⁵Nordstrom Alison, “Making a Journey: The Tupper scrapbooks and the travel they describe,” in *Photographs Objects Histories On the Materiality of Images*, Ed, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 81.

that photographs require more than visual engagement.⁶ Langford's discussion of the album provides another perspective on the personal nature of Renshaw's books and their function. The development of the photographic album and domestic use of photographs are also examined in Andrea Kunard's essay on "Traditions of Collecting and Remembering: Gender, Class and the Nineteenth-Century Sentiment Album and Photographic Album," which examines the use of sentiment albums as a reflection of the Victorian women who assembled them and how their pastime reflects gender and class values. Kunard's M.A. thesis, "Assembling Images: Interpreting the Nineteenth-Century Photographic Album with a Case Study of the Sir Daniel Wilson Album," is useful in understanding feminine collecting interests during the nineteenth century. Discussing the male collecting and extra-illustrating tradition, I intend to build on her statement that "nineteenth century albums operated as a site for individuals to consolidate relationships on both a personal and social level, as well as acting as a repository for ideas, feelings and memories."⁷

The manner in which Renshaw expressed his identity is shown in the books he collected, which reflect to his status and wealth as a gentleman. John Tosh's study, *Manliness and Masculinities in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Essays on Gender, Family and Empire*, is fundamental to analyzing themes of masculine identity during the nineteenth century and to uncovering Renshaw's pastime as a collector. Both his biography and collecting interests will be explored in relation to Susan M. Pearce's study *On Collecting: An Investigation Into Collecting in the European Tradition* which examines the role that collecting has in fulfilling a person's role and identity.⁸

⁶Martha Langford, *Suspended Conversations: The Afterlife of Memory in Photographic Albums* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001), 10.

⁷Andrea Kunard, *Assembling Images: Interpreting the Nineteenth-Century Photographic Album with a Case Study of the Sir Daniel Wilson Album* Master's thesis, (Carleton University, Ottawa, ON, 1996), 227-228.

⁸Susan M. Pearce, *On Collecting: An Investigation Into Collecting in the European Tradition* (London and New York: Routledge, 1995), 33.

Russell Belk and Melanie Wallendorf's essay, "Of Mice and Men: Gender Identity in Collecting," argues that gender is implicated in collecting.⁹ By examining Renshaw's pastime, I will look at how the process of extra-illustrating books reflects gendered codes of collecting.

Collecting books and the tradition of extra-illustrating were a phenomena that burgeoned in the nineteenth century. This popular pastime is important for understanding the value and function of Renshaw's books. Robert Wark's "The Gentle Pastime of Extra-Illustrating" analyzes the practice of extra-illustrating as a gentleman's hobby, where collectors could express their taste in literature and art.¹⁰ Also, Daniel Tredwell in *A Monograph on Privately-Illustrated Books* discusses his personal experience as a bibliophile and extra-illustrator of books. As an additional theoretical guide, I draw on "Unpacking My Library: A Talk About Collecting," Walter Benjamin's discussion of his own collecting interest. This well-known essay provides another perspective on the ownership of books and their material value during the nineteenth century.

Ruskin's *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* is a commonly studied text in architecture, art history and literary studies. Although this thesis does not concentrate specifically on Ruskin's publication *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, analyzing the arrangement of his text with extra-illustrations is important in understanding Renshaw's motivation. *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* is one of Ruskin's most notable publications, in which he advocates the principles of architecture and encourages the restoration and preservation of current architecture. Further investigation on Renshaw's response to other works by Ruskin, including "The Educational

⁹Russell W. Belk and Melanie Wallendorf, "Of Mice and Men: Gender Identity in Collecting," in *Interpreting Objects and Collections*, Ed, Susan M. Pearce (London and New York: Routledge, 1994), 241.

¹⁰Robert R. Wark, "The Gentle Pastime of Extra-Illustrating Books," *The Huntington Library Quarterly* 56 (1993), 151.

Value of Art,” and the *Political Economy of Art*, will indicate how he applies Ruskin’s concepts regarding the dissemination and accumulation of works of art and advocate that collectors should help to preserve works of art from the past.

Of particular importance to this thesis is scholarly literature on British imperialism that addresses the use of photography in the Near East and beyond. James R. Ryan’s *Picturing Empire: Photography and the Visualization of the British Empire* discusses the role of photography in collecting and controlling British imperial subjects.¹¹ The sequence of photographs of the Near East will establish Renshaw’s fascination with collecting photographs of the ‘Orient,’ and indicate a point of departure from Ruskin’s narrative. A key source discussing the influence of the West on the East is Edward Said’s *Orientalism*, which situates the British imperial interests within the ideology tied to photography as a means to promote colonialism. Kathleen Stewart Howe’s *Excursions Along the Nile: The Photographic Discovery of Ancient Egypt* will be useful to my study, for it focuses on the history of travel photography and the cultural trend among photographers like James Robertson and Felice Beato who toured the ‘Holy Land.’¹²

In *Scenes In a Library: Reading the Photograph in the Book, 1843-1875*, Carol Armstrong focuses on the positivistic aspects of photographs appearing in books. She uses a linguistic approach to studying the link between written text or language, in contrast to the material culture methodology adopted here. Despite our different methods, her interpretation of the nineteenth-century photographically-illustrated book informs my study of Renshaw’s illustrated volumes. Both Armstrong and Douglas Nickel analyze Francis Frith’s album *Egypt and Palestine Photographed and Described*. In explaining the text image relationship, Nickel considers the way the

¹¹James R. Ryan, *Picturing Empire Photography and the Visualization of the British Empire* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1997), 11.

¹²Kathleen Stewart Howe, *Excursions Along the Nile: The Photographic Discovery of Ancient Egypt* (Santa Barbara: Santa Barbara Museum of Art, 1993), 12.

photographs were acquired by means of publication and the exchange value of photographs. He argues that the significance of Frith's album lies in its arrangement and the current demands in Victorian publishing. Following Nickel's study, I will look at Renshaw's album and use of commercial photographs as his response to the circulation of photographs to photography as a medium for illustrating books.

Examining the reproduction of photographs, Walter Benjamin's "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction" is a significant study that discusses the expansion of photomechanical printing in the nineteenth century. Benjamin's celebrated essay examines the photograph's mechanical properties and informs my study of the nineteenth-century photographs in Renshaw's illustrated volumes. I will also examine how the arrangement of photographs of the Near East relates to or departs from Ruskin's narrative. Following W. J. T. Mitchell's study in *Picture Theory: Essays on Verbal and Visual Representation*, I argue that the way Renshaw organized the text and photographs in some instances indicates that he intended to illustrate the text, but that the photographs of the Near East 'resist' Ruskin's textual reference.

Methodological and Theoretical Approach

My study will draw upon the methodology of material culture, outlined by Edwards and Hart, as well as upon that developed by Jules Prown in his essay, "Mind in Matter: An Introduction to Material Culture Theory and Method." As I will discuss in more detail in Chapter One, Prown suggests a three-stage object analysis. The first describes the object itself, based on external evidence.¹³ Chapter One, accordingly, focuses on a comprehensive analysis of the physical properties of the books, including an inventory of the content, the arrangement, materials, and techniques used to create

¹³Jules David Prown, *Art as Evidence: Writings on Art and Material Culture* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001), 79.

Renshaw's books. The National Gallery of Canada's curatorial file on the Volumes provides information on the date of acquisition, the arrangement and identification of various photographs included in the three volumes.

Prown's second stage of analysis involves a deduction or "sensory experience of the object."¹⁴ The first chapter introduces the experience of reading the books. At this point I acknowledge my own cultural biases while studying an object from the nineteenth century. In the second and third chapters, having progressed from the object itself in its description to the interaction with the photographs in the books in deduction, this analysis moves to speculation.¹⁵ At this stage I focus on the evidence in the book such as the compiler's bookplate, which leads to further inquiry and archival research that helps determine who the compiler was, and how his illustrated volumes fit into the context of his private library.

A foundational text for my study is *Photographs Objects Histories*, edited by Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart which emphasizes the uses, meanings, and production of photographs which impact upon their meaning. Art historians, archaeologists and anthropologists are known for using this specific approach in order to understand how objects originate and explain their aesthetic or cultural significance. Applying a material culture approach is fundamental in understanding the book's function and value. Recent scholarship addressing the material culture of photographs will frame my approach considering the photograph's presentation in the book. The editors of this volume have argued that photographs are frequently studied in relation to the connoisseurial, as a 'fine print'; thus, the photograph's physical presence or presentational form has often been overlooked.¹⁶ Considering photographs as objects, Edwards and Hart will inform my approach to Renshaw's photographically-illustrated

¹⁴Prown, *Art as Evidence*, 81.

¹⁵*Ibid.*, 83.

¹⁶Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 1-2.

book. Following their work, I discuss how it was assembled, its purpose in a private and public setting, and how it reflects the interests of the compiler.

Archival research on the provenance of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* has been fundamental to this study. Renshaw's bookplate in the first volume has led to further investigation on Renshaw's biography, drawing from bookplate history, provenance and genealogy records. Literature addressing the ownership and use of books includes a directory of *Armorial Families* which identifies Renshaw's name and armorial plate, as well as his social status and brief family history. *Provenance Research in Book History* by David Pearson is useful to point out further reading and resources, especially the provenance indices in Great Britain.

As well, my research trip to England in September of 2008 at the British Library and correspondence between British librarians and curators throughout the year have been exceptionally productive in helping understand the history of Renshaw's books. A fundamental part of this research trip was locating the sale catalogue of Renshaw's library in "A Catalogue of Books Comprising the Property of J.A. Knowles Renshaw (decd.)," sold by Hodgson & Company. It lists the books that comprise Renshaw's private library, including *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, which confirms how the books were exchanged, and encourages further inquiry into Renshaw's pastime as a collector. As a means of comparison to Renshaw's practice of extra-illustrating his books, the William Abercrombie Archive at Lancaster University's Ruskin Library was a rich resource for examining the readership and influence of Ruskin during the nineteenth century. At this library I referred to the Abercrombie Archive, comprising three bound volumes of printed, photographic and manuscript material relating to Ruskin, as well as an interleaved copy of *The Art of England* assembled by William Abercrombie in 1884. I will examine how this extra-illustration of Ruskin's *The Art of England* can be compared to Renshaw's extra-illustration of

The Seven Lamps of Architecture.

In addition, my study applies genealogical research to inform both the history and context of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* and Renshaw's biography. I draw primarily from the following sources: *National Census Returns of England and Wales* 1871- 1901, *Records of the Renshaw Family* from the Trafford City Council, the "Medical Register," excerpts from the *National Probate Index of Wills and Administrations* 1853-1943, clippings from "Renshaw's Obituary" in 1926 from the *Altrincham, Bowdon and Hale Guardian* and *The Times Newspaper*. As well, I consulted biographical annals of the Renshaw family held by Trafford Local Studies and registers from *The London Gazette* that include information on his involvement in the Manchester Regiment of Volunteer's second battalion in 1902 and 1906.

In terms of critical theory, my focus on photographs depicting the Orient in Chapter Three draws on Said's argument in *Orientalism*, as later discussed in photographic terms by James R. Ryan, that 'the Orient' was created by Europeans and that photography was a means to order visually these regions and peoples. My study of these photographs has been shaped by post-colonial theory, as I interpret Renshaw's collection of photographs as a way of claiming authority or reacting to 'the Orient'. To illustrate this, I examine a sequence of photographs by James Robertson and Felice Beato, Francis Frith, Maxime DuCamp and Félix Teynard whose works documenting Egypt, Palestine, Jerusalem and Istanbul represent the Near East as a British possession.

Organization of Thesis

Chapter One focuses on the first and second stage of object-analysis proposed by Prown, I describe the experience of reading *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* and I analyze the book's physical characteristics, such as the dimensions

and materials of the books and photographic techniques of the albumen and salted paper prints. Following Edwards and Hart's approach by focusing on the materiality of photographs, I will examine the arrangement of photographs throughout the text, emphasizing the importance of their presentation in John Ruskin's publication, while highlighting his concepts and influence in Victorian England during the nineteenth century. By identifying the owner's bookplate and tracing the previous ownership of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, I will add to knowledge about its provenance.

Chapter Two concentrates on the biography of the owner of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* and is based on archival research of the Renshaw family and the sale catalogue of J.A. Knowles Renshaw's private library. I will outline the social values of the British gentry and the tradition of collecting and extra-illustrating books as a pastime among British gentlemen. The tradition of extra-illustrating provides a basis for understanding the role of gender and the social class values in Victorian England, particularly regarding Ruskin's concepts on "The Educational Value of Art," which suggests that those who owned and had knowledge about art were considered to be cultured. This chapter situates Renshaw's books within the practice of extra-illustrating books, and their inclusion of travel photographs suggests that the books were used as a guide to illustrate his potential travel experience on the Grand Tour.

Finally Chapter Three applies Prown's third stage of object-analysis, by focusing on a sequence of photographs of the Near East and speculating that they reflect Renshaw's response to British imperialism. Literature addressing the use of photography to depict 'the Orient' is fundamental in contextualizing the early photographic documentation of places like Egypt and in revealing the popular interest and dissemination of photographs. This chapter also outlines Renshaw's distribution and accumulation of photographs in his books, which include prints by amateur travel photographers.

Renshaw's use of prints and photographs in his text relate to Ruskin's concepts in the "Political Economy of Art," reflecting the current art market and the circulation of photomechanical prints.

Chapter 1: A Material Culture Approach to *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*

The first time I was given access to *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* at the National Gallery of Canada (Fig.1), I was wearing white gloves in a quiet, orderly, institutional environment meant to protect the books and preserve the past. I was introduced to the compilation by Ann Thomas and Lori Pauli, Head Curator and Associate Curator of the Photographs Collection. The books had to be propped up to avoid cracking the spine and causing damage from mishandling and also because they were too heavy to hold. The inflexibility of the pages made the books seem new, yet the paper was almost ready to crumble and touching them would damage the prints over time. Studying this object and drawing from Edwards and Hart's methodology of a material culture approach to photographs, my research is, as they describe, "materiality...is concerned with real physical objects in a world that is physically apprehendable not only through vision but through embodied relations of smell, taste, touch and hearing."¹ While leafing through the books, the musty smell caused from the oxidization of paper chemicals triggered memories of sorting through old family albums. Yet unlike a family album, this compilation includes Ruskin's text, interleaved photographs and other collected prints and drawings. Opening the front cover I discovered the bookplate that read, "J. A. Knowles Renshaw," situated beneath a family coat of arms and the motto *Virtus repulsae nescia sordidae*. (Fig.2).² Clearly this was the owner and compiler of the collection and I was anxious to know more about him. The first, second, and third volumes of Ruskin's illustrated book

¹Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories: On the Materiality of Images* (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 3.

²Jon R. Stone, *The Routledge Dictionary of Latin Quotations: The Illiterati's Guide to Latin Maxims, Mottoes, Proverbs and Sayings* (New York: Routledge, 2005), 332. *Virtus repulsae nescia sordidae* translated to English means "virtue, which knows no base repulse (or disgrace of defeat)," or, more loosely "shines with unsullied honours, neither receives nor resigns the badges of office at the will of popular whim." -Horace.

all belonged to John Alfred Knowles Renshaw, a collector of rare books. Comprising part of his private library, the books would have been placed sequentially on a bookshelf waiting to be handled and read.

Edwards and Hart have encouraged scholars to ask “how are albums, used? Are they intended to be read formally? In a large group? Privately? Albums have weight and tactility (sic) they often smell, often of damp, rotting card - the scent of ‘the past’.”³ The act of reading this book reflects the function of the archive and the institution that in part determines how artistic material will be displayed in a public or private setting. Martha Langford describes the ephemeral quality of the album in contrast with the museum archive and the ways that we view albums. She says:

In the clinical surroundings of the vault, the luxurious materials of the covers make a striking impression... Beautiful and immutable, they appear as private worlds, preserved for the ages in their conditioned resting place. When their pages are turned, some albums and pictures seem remarkably fresh, otherworldly in their direct mediation with the past.⁴

With this tantalizing sense of Victorian culture, I realized that the album’s history needed to be excavated from layers of media. This project has forced me to reformulate the way I see the world of images not framed and mounted on a wall for the spectator, but instead handled, leafed through, and unfolded like a personal letter. The books would have been read slowly, each image unfolded carefully. The world of reading and viewing photographs has changed dramatically. Today, placing photographs in an album has largely become a lost pastime. As the witness to this change in craftsmanship, certain senses have been forgotten and ways of viewing have shifted. Despite my own cultural and temporal bias, the album allows me to imagine what this private world would have looked like and how these books would have been read. Andrea Kunard writes in her M.A. thesis, “Assembling Images: Interpreting

³Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 11.

⁴Martha Langford, *Suspended Conversations: The Afterlife of Memory in Photographic Albums* (Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2001), 6.

the Nineteenth-Century Photographic Album with a Case Study of the Sir Daniel Wilson Album,” that “I have regarded albums as challenging larger issues of historical research where understanding fluctuates between that which is known and that which is forever lost.”⁵ Perhaps what is lost is memory and the inherent value that was once placed on these books. As Prown has argued, “more transient or variable are those values that have been attached by the people who originally made or used the object, by us today, or by the people at any intervening moment.”⁶

The ephemeral nature of Renshaw’s photographically-illustrated volumes displays a collection of images that would be folded, cropped, and later removed to be mounted in frames and exhibited in the gallery. Each lithographic or photographic print demonstrates the practice of inserting pictures to fit the book, and removing them from their original context. Many of the photographs unfold themselves to become disconnected from the book or function as markers, separating the text and prints due to their scale, weight, and content.

Material Culture

Combining my primary data with material culture as a framework, the photographically-illustrated books will allow me to understand the practice of collecting. Material culture provides a foundation of inquiry and investigation, as the evidence of the object extends from the perspective of the perceiver; according to Prown, a material culture investigation is “the study through artifacts of the beliefs values, ideas, attitudes and assumptions of a particular community or society at a given time.”⁷ As noted in the introductory chapter, a foundational text for my study of material culture is *Pho-*

⁵Andrea Kunard, *Assembling Images: Interpreting the Nineteenth-Century Photographic Album with a Case Study of the Sir Daniel Wilson Album* Master’s thesis, (Carleton University, Ottawa, ON, 1996), 13.

⁶Jules David Prown, *Art as Evidence: Writings on Art and Material Culture* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001), 72.

⁷*Ibid.*, 70.

tographs Objects Histories: On the Materiality of Images, in which Edwards and Hart stress the materiality of photographs, rather than focusing on their content. They argue that “the idea that somehow photographs maintain a level of material transparency and what is important about them is the image content alone... militates against the idea that photographs are solid physical objects.”⁸ In brief, writing on photography has principally focused on questions of representation, whereas Edwards and Hart propose studying the materiality of photographs to discover “how they are used as social objects, through creation, exchange, and ownership.”⁹

Edwards and Hart’s treatment of material culture explores the trajectory of photographs, revealing history marked by dramatic changes of ownership, physical location, or material changes.¹⁰ The presentational form of the photographs in Renshaw’s books reflect the values of the owner and his response to photography. Edwards and Hart consider the importance of photographic materiality, and they have suggested that “there has been remarkably little work that concentrates analytically on the physicality of photographs.”¹¹ They have analysed how “the photograph’s materiality requires the embodied conditions of viewing, literally performing the images in certain ways.”¹² My material culture analysis of Renshaw’s books, therefore, draws on Edwards and Hart’s example by emphasizing the physical properties of the pictures, in addition to how the books are read and compiled.

Prown’s discussion on material culture in *Art as Evidence: Writings on Art and Material Culture* will be useful in understanding how material culture can be applied to art historical research moving towards greater objectivity in studying the past. Prown argues that “the study of systems of belief through an analysis of artifacts,

⁸Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 6.

⁹Ibid.

¹⁰Ibid., 4.

¹¹Ibid., 10.

¹²Ibid., 11.

offers opportunities to circumvent the investigator's own cultural perspective."¹³ The connection between Renshaw's books and material culture will help me to discover how the photographically-illustrated book fits into photographic history. As objects such as albums "satisfy the practical or aesthetic needs of the owner."¹⁴ In this way Renshaw "made a type of statement, albeit a nonverbal statement...Yet it is the nonverbal, unspoken, perhaps even unconscious, nature of this statement that gives it particular importance."¹⁵ My approach follows Prown's argument that "by undertaking cultural interpretation through artifacts, we engage the other culture in the first instance not with our minds, the seat of our cultural biases, but with our senses."¹⁶ Prown proposes a method of object-analysis in three stages:

The analysis proceeds from description, recording the internal evidence of the object itself; to deduction, interpreting the interaction between the object and the perceiver; to speculation, framing hypotheses and questions which lead out from the object to external evidence for testing and resolution.¹⁷

Following this methodology, my inquiry into material culture will consider the books as evidence of the pastime of collecting and 'extra-illustrating' books with photographs.¹⁸ The first stage of object-analysis is *description* where I will trace the artefact's provenance, and place and time of origin as well as evidence of the material arrangement. My discussion continues by addressing those concerns.

¹³Prown, *Art as Evidence*, 75.

¹⁴*Ibid.*, 53.

¹⁵*Ibid.*

¹⁶*Ibid.*, 75.

¹⁷*Ibid.*, 79.

¹⁸Robert R. Wark, "The Gentle Pastime of Extra-Illustrating Books," *The Huntington Library Quarterly* 56 (1993), 151. Robert Wark describes the term 'extra-illustrating': gathering works of art on paper mostly prints, less frequently drawings, and occasionally, after the mid-nineteenth century, photographs that could serve as extra-illustrations to the text.

Provenance

The history of this volume's provenance, informs present understandings of the material form of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* in the ways the books have been circulated, valued and used. Indeed, tracing its provenance indicates that the meaning of Renshaw's private collection of books is constantly shifting; from a personal repository of pictures, to a rare book auctioned as photographic literature, to an exhibit held by the National Gallery of Canada. As such, the object's value continuously changes. In the essay "Making Meaning: Displaced Materiality in the Library and Art Museum,"¹⁹ Glenn Willumson argues that the shift from private to public, from a commercial commodity to a confined social meaning and back to a commodity on the art market, marks the photo-object. He says that "Too often this socio-cultural inscription suppresses the materiality of photographs as they are squeezed within the rhetorics of canonical histories of photography and concomitant spaces of collection and exhibition."²⁰ This changes the way the object is valued and understood.

James Borcoman, a former Curator of the National Gallery of Canada's Photographs Collection, acquired *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* from a dealer affiliated with the rare book business at Daguerreian Era in Pawlet, Vermont in 1976.²¹ Renshaw's books were sold among various albums and illustrated books, including photographs of travels depicting landscapes, architecture, and ethnological subjects. Among the photographically-illustrated books listed in "Photographic Antiques and Literature" is an album entitled *Ethnological Study*, which includes forty-four albumen prints and a note identifying it as "A typical gentleman's collection" of

¹⁹Glenn Willumson, "Making Meaning: Displaced Materiality in The Library and Art Museum," in *Photographs Objects Histories On the Materiality of Images*, Ed, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 62.

²⁰Ibid.

²¹John Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* (Photographically-Illustrated Book: National Gallery of Canada, 1880).

the Victorian period.²² According to this dealer's description,

All but one of the photographs are of women (four of them white), the single exception, a photograph of a group of young boys wearing cod pieces. A rare and interesting study piece. (Another book titled *England*) a beautiful album, folio made of quarter leather, inscribed "Photographs of Places in England visited by Arthur, Elizabeth & Edith Potts, from October 1st to November 9th, 1885." With one hundred and five gold-toned albumen prints ranging in size from 2.5x4.5 to 8x11 inches. An unusually fine selection of stock photographs (Valentines, Friths- both FF& Co & the earlier Frith's series, Wilson's, etc.) well organized and for the most part, especially well preserved, many in mint. Includes relatively scarce large views of Stonehenge. Most views have legends in ink, a few mounts foxed. A particularly fine example of a Victorian travel album. (priced at six hundred and fifty American dollars).²³

In relation to other photographic antiques sold at Daguerreian Era, the *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* would have been valuable to the development of the National Gallery's Collection of nineteenth-century photographs. Renshaw's books were exhibited in "Photographs from the Collection" from March 18 to April 17, 1977. From 1979 to 1981, the collection was included in the exhibition "Points of View: Photographs of Architecture," which was presented at the Museum of Fine Arts in Montreal, the Vancouver Art Gallery, the Norman MacKenzie Art Gallery in Regina, and the Mount St. Vincent Art Gallery in Halifax.²⁴ This album was an important addition to the National Gallery's Photographs Collection because photographically-illustrated books and albums were a significant part of nineteenth century visual culture and as a photographic illustration of Ruskin's writing, the books are significant because they show that Ruskin influenced the thought of his time. Renshaw's photographically-illustrated books relate to other photographs in the collection from the nineteenth century by photographers whose views record, preserve, and collect their cultural past, such as France's Mission héliographique. The albumen and salted

²² "Albums & Illustrated Books," in *Photographic Antiques & Literature, Pawlet Vt., Daguerreian Era* Vol. 7. (1974), 63.

²³ Ibid., 63-64.

²⁴ National Gallery of Canada, *Points of View: Photographs of Architecture* (Ottawa, Montreal, Vancouver and Regina: National Gallery of Canada's Travelling Exhibition, 1979-1981).

paper prints ‘tipped in’ to the books represent Renshaw’s accumulation, organization, and ownership of architectural views. Yet despite the aesthetic importance of Renshaw’s books in the National Gallery’s collection, little attention has been paid to the books as material objects and their connection to their owner.

The only record of Renshaw’s books prior to their NGC acquisition can be found in an auction sale catalogue, sold by Messrs. Hodgson and Company between 1956 and 1957.²⁵ In *Property of a Gentleman: The Formation, Organization and Dispersal of the Private Library 1620-1920*, Robin Myers and Michael Harris have argued that “sale catalogues of private libraries appear like a meteor at the moment of dissolution as a by-product of a commercial process, rather than a careful record of a life-time of painstaking accumulation.”²⁶ Renshaw’s collection of books was sold by his son Richard Charlesworth Knowles Renshaw. This private library includes *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, among many first-edition books by well-known British writers such as William Combe, Charles Dickens and William Shakespeare (Appendix 2).²⁷

The specific edition of the *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* addressed in this thesis was published in 1880 by George Allen, an engraver, publisher, and one-time assistant to Ruskin, who took over the publication of all of Ruskin’s books from 1874 onwards.²⁸ In William Abercrombie’s volume, titled “John Ruskin,” an article from an 1883 edition of the *Pall Mall Gazette* contains an interview with George Allen discussing the trade in ‘pirated’ Ruskins, specifically identifying a London auctioneer who was selling pirated editions of his books, and it is possible that Renshaw’s edition

²⁵S. C. Hodgson, *Hodgson and Co. Sale Catalogues 1956-57* (London: Messrs. Hodgson and Co., 1956), 42.

²⁶Robin Myers and Michael Harris, *Property of a Gentleman: The Formation, Organization and Dispersal of the Private Library 1620-1920* (Winchester: St. Paul’s Bibliographies, 1991), 4.

²⁷Hodgson, *Sale Catalogues*, 39-43.

²⁸John Dixon Hunt and Faith M. Holland, *The Ruskin Polygon: Essays on the Imagination of John Ruskin* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1982), 167.

of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* was pirated or simply bought as an unbound copy.²⁹ In response to this trade, Ruskin refused to let other publishers sell authorized editions, because he only wished his own editions to be in circulation.³⁰ It is therefore not surprising that Renshaw would have collected *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, as Ruskin was very influential at that time, both in shaping public opinion and as an important art critic.

Prior to the National Gallery of Canada's acquisition of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, an exhibition was organized, called *The Photograph as Object 1843-1969: Photographs from the Collection of the National Gallery of Canada*, in order to showcase the young collection that had been established in April of 1967.³¹ The exhibition was circulated by the National Gallery from 1969 to 1971.³² This selection and monograph, written by Borcoman, the Head Curator of the Photographs Collection at that time, will frame my discussion of both the photograph's value as a material object and as an expressive medium for Renshaw's illustrated book. Perhaps Borcoman's tenets led him to acquire Renshaw's photographically-illustrated books in the first place.

When discussing the nature of nineteenth-century photographs, it is important to keep in mind that they would have been treated as objects and remain tied to their material qualities. One of the precursors of materiality discussed by Edwards and Hart is "the aesthetic appreciation of the material, such as the chemically controlled tonal balance, similar to...an artist's metal plate engraving, for example."³³ They quote Ian Jeffrey's statement that "until recently photographic historians were often collectors or curators intent on establishing a canon of prime works and, as a con-

²⁹William Abercrombie, "Pall Mall Gazette," in *John Ruskin* Vol. 2. (1883), 41.

³⁰Ibid.

³¹James Borcoman, *The Photograph as Object: Photographs from the Collection of the National Gallery of Canada* (the National Gallery of Canada, 1969-71), 3.

³²Ibid.

³³Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 6.

sequence, they adopted premises and methods from fine art and connoisseurship.”³⁴ Borcoman valued the materiality of photographs within the basis of aesthetics, coming out of a print-based understanding of the photographic medium. In other words, he evaluated photographs on a basis of ‘technical’ excellence and, therefore, material considerations were of utmost importance; the ‘best’ photographs were those that married expression with technical ‘mastery’ and material ‘quality.’ Beaumont Newhall writes in his exhibition catalogue at the Museum of Modern Art that “the best photographs,...demonstrate a careful crafting of the image that displays the photographer’s intimate knowledge of the medium - evident in the colour, texture and fine detail of the finished print.”³⁵ With this in mind, Borcoman argues that “All too often discussions about the photograph revolve around what it should be rather than what it is and what it has been.”³⁶ Thus, the work of celebrated nineteenth-century photographers including Charles Nègre, the Bisson Frères, Roger Fenton and Francis Frith, to name a few that were tipped into *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* would have been valuable as ‘fine art prints,’ they are therefore valued in terms of aesthetics. Borcoman notes that, “As an expressive medium the photograph has followed two principal paths, the more obvious one being the product of a consciously artistic process and the less obvious one, that of a documentary activity.”³⁷ This statement reinforces the idea that the photograph can be considered an object with its own laws and its own existence.³⁸ When photographs are placed in a book, frame, or album, however, they establish material characteristics that make them part of the object, specifically through the way that the chemical properties of photographs are preserved. According to Borcoman, certain photographs transcend their original

³⁴ Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 6.

³⁵ Willumson, *Making Meaning*, 75.

³⁶ Borcoman, *The Photograph as Object*, 4.

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ Ibid.

purpose and in doing so a new object is created that is capable of stimulating an experience of an entirely different order within the viewer.³⁹ Borcomans approach was essentially that of a fine art connoisseur and as such, it differs markedly from a material culture approach, which emphasizes historical context gleaned through the object; nonetheless, Borcomans emphasis on materiality is useful for my study. In light of Borcoman's ideas of photographs as objects, further discussion on photograph and book-making techniques will provide insight into the value of photographs as objects during the nineteenth century.

Photographic Techniques

Edwards and Hart point out that "the photograph is a three-dimensional object, not only a two-dimensional image; therefore, its chemical composition, mount, size, and presentational form are all parts of its materiality contributing to the object's cultural meaning."⁴⁰ The photographs included in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* appear as albumen silver and salted paper prints, their colour ranging from sepia to ochre hues in the highlighted areas of the image. What distinguishes the material characteristics of the photographs from one another is that the salted paper print has a matte surface whereas the albumen prints are slightly glossy.

The process of salted paper printing involves soaking fine paper in a salt solution, after which one side is then brushed with a solution of silver nitrate.⁴¹ The paper is then exposed to sunlight through a contact negative, which prints a positive image in silver. The difference between this process and the albumen print is that with the salted paper print there is no colloidal binder such as albumen.⁴² Albumen printing, developed in the mid-1850s, introduced detailed images with the longest

³⁹Borcoman, *The Photograph as Object*, 4.

⁴⁰Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 1.

⁴¹Mike Ware, "Salted Paper Print," in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 1237.

⁴²Ibid.

tonal range.⁴³ Compared to the salt paper print, this process shows considerable improvement because the added chlorides increase light sensitivity and the photographs appear clearer. Albumen prints were made when a beaten egg white was combined with a salt solution. The paper was then immersed in the solution and made sensitive to light with silver nitrate. The paper was then ready to be contact-printed and exposed to sunlight for a period of five to ten minutes.⁴⁴ The final stage involved rinsing and toning, commonly with gold, to fix the image.⁴⁵

Photographs were viewed, appreciated, and used not only as images, but also as objects. Producing a satisfactory and durable photograph required time and effort; therefore, photographs were treated not just as valuable images, but as precious objects to be placed in frames, albums, and books.⁴⁶ Mounting photographs in a book indicates the value that the compiler placed on the images. Edwards and Hart have discussed how “the objects that embed photographs are in many cases meaningless without their photographs; for instance, empty frames or albums.”⁴⁷ Prints and photographs were interleaved between the pages to preserve them; the bookbinder placed ‘guards’ in the form of narrow strips of paper that would be sewn into the book with the prints attached to them.⁴⁸ This would prevent the book from buckling due to the number of illustrations in it. Guards were inserted after the prints, which could then fold out. The assembly of the books is marked by flawless craftsmanship and precision; such a production would have required a lot of time and money. According

⁴³Caryn E. Newmann, “Albumen Print,” in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 23.

⁴⁴Ibid.

⁴⁵Ibid.

⁴⁶Francois Brunet, “Photographic Practices,” in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 1089.

⁴⁷Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 11.

⁴⁸Jane Greenfield, *ABC of Bookbinding: A Unique Glossary with Over 700 Illustrations for Collectors & Librarians* (Delaware: Oak Knoll Press, 1998), 34.

to the National Gallery's photographic conservator John McElhone, inserting the albumen and salted paper prints in the books preserves their material condition, to some degree, from deterioration.⁴⁹

The issue of durability with albumen and salted paper prints during the nineteenth century was described by Edgar Clifton in 1887, who said, "So soon may all follow A 'Permanent way,' And from out of our albums No prints fade away. For when Albumen's yellow, and Chloride is flown, Platino and Carbon Shall still hold their own."⁵⁰ Ultimately, this question of permanence in part explains Renshaw's method of storing albumen and salted paper prints in the books. According to Edwards and Hart, albums from the nineteenth century often imitate other objects, "like precious books, religious books...with heavy embossed covers, gold tooling and gold-edged pages... clearly a reference to medieval devotional books."⁵¹

Can Renshaw's books be considered devotional? How do the binding and material of the books reflect the values of the owner? Part of the cover boards are made of marbled paper (Fig.2). 'Marbling', is the process of decorating paper on the edges of books with colours floated on a gelatinous paper, which is spattered or combed into patterns.⁵² The craft of marbling paper, as it appears in Renshaw's books, was first introduced to Europeans who traveled to Turkey, Persia, and the Near East after the middle of the sixteenth century, who brought home samples of marbled paper.⁵³ In London, by the middle of the nineteenth century, the development of mechanized bookbinding methods decreased the need for hand bookbinders who used

⁴⁹Cortney L. Murray, *Interview with John McElhone Photographs Conservator at the National Gallery of Canada* (Interview, January 29, 2009).

⁵⁰Edgar Clifton, "The Last Print in Silver," in *The Albumen and Salted Paper Book: The History and Practice of Photographic Printing 1840-1895*, Ed, James M. Reilly (Light Impressions Corporation, 1980), 101.

⁵¹Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 11.

⁵²Greenfield, *ABC of Bookbinding*, 44.

⁵³Richard J. Wolfe, *Marbled Paper: Its History, Techniques, and Patterns* (Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990), 3.

marbled paper and the marbler's craft to embellish many of the books.⁵⁴ This process was commonly employed among bookbinders for flyleaves, pastedowns, sides, and edges.⁵⁵ The style and material of Renshaw's books not only indicate current trade attempts, but also reflect his interest in the craftsmanship of the book. During the late Victorian and early Edwardian periods, this decorative phase of bookbinding became increasingly popular. The way that a book was bound reflected the values of the owner, and was an emblem of taste, and a symbol of literary culture in English society.⁵⁶

The three volumes of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* would have been sold in sheets or sewn in boards. Since all of the edges of the pages were left uncut, the expectation was that they would eventually be given permanent binding and the edges could then be trimmed without reducing the margins.⁵⁷ During the nineteenth century, books were often issued in sheets, so that the bookseller, library, or private customer could give them to their own bookbinders to bind them separately in half leather or paper-covered boards.⁵⁸ Some of the photographs in Renshaw's books have been mounted on card; their dimensions and weight create a tangible history of their creation and ownership. Each photograph is 'tipped in' or pasted along the 'gutter' of the book, and the heavy card acts as a bookmark to separate the photographs from the text and lithographs.⁵⁹ Most of the photographs are covered with thin paper to protect their fragile surface, as they are truly delicate objects. The 'folio' sized book, 35 x 24.5 centimeters, interleaves large format photographs that

⁵⁴Wolfe, *Marbled Paper*, 1.

⁵⁵Joel Silver, *Marbled Paper* (<http://www.finebooksmagazine.com/issue/0306/marble.phtml>, November 2008).

⁵⁶Gerard Curtis, *Visual Words: Art and the Material Book in Victorian England* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2002), 216.

⁵⁷Myers and Harris, *Property of a Gentleman*, 26.

⁵⁸Ruari McLean, *Victorian Book Design and Colour Printing* (London: Faber & Faber, 1972), 6.

⁵⁹Greenfield, *ABC of Bookbinding*, 35. The term 'gutter' means adjoining inner margins of two facing pages. Also called back, binding or inner margin.

are carefully folded at the edges.⁶⁰

Roman numerals and fading annotations appear on the back of most prints, which indicate that the pictures may have been sequenced prior to their binding. The original inscriptions in graphite could have been made by the compiler, or they could have been marked and annotated by subsequent collectors and institutional hands. In order to access information on Renshaw's photographically-illustrated book, the curatorial file provides classifications, identification, and locations on most of the photographs in each volume. This method of classification identifies inscriptions, the size of the image, the mount and the date acquired, providing basic information on the books.

Description

Each of the three volumes is comprised of half-brown moroccan leather with marbled paper covers and five raised bands on the spine. *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* is gilt-stamped on the spine. Below appears the heading *Ruskin Part I Illustrated*, which is followed by *Part II and Part III Illustrated* for the subsequent volumes. At the bottom of the spine is the date 1880, which identifies Ruskin's edition. Ruskin's well-known text has been dismantled and rebound in three volumes, each measuring 35 x 24.5 centimeters and containing approximately two hundred prints or lithographs of religious genre scenes, architectural views, and ornamentation appropriated from various sources. Ruskin's publication was originally printed with illustrations; these lithographs were 'tipped in' to the books.⁶¹ The uncut leaves of Renshaw's books contrast with their formal binding and half brown moroccan leather covers. In bookbinding terms, pages like these are called 'proof obsolete' to indicate

⁶⁰Greenfield, *ABC of Bookbinding*, 31. The term 'folio' indicates the number of times a printed sheet of paper is folded to make a section, giving the general size and aspect of a book.

⁶¹Ibid., 70. 'Tipping in' is the process of pasting the edge of a leaf to an adjacent leaf, or inserting and adhering added material in a bookblock with a narrow area of adhesive.

that the leaves of the book have been left untrimmed.⁶²

The photographs, lithographs, and watercolours included in the books are mounted on sheets which are either uniform in size with the pages of the text, or which fold out of the book. The publication would have been taken out of its original binding so the extra-illustrations could be interleaved at appropriate places. Ruskin's *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* was then rebound and expanded to three volumes, rather than the one or two in which the books were originally published.⁶³ The inserted photographs are broadly arranged by location in each volume, with the exception of the photographs of the Near East which group Cairo, Palestine, Istanbul and Jerusalem together sequentially in Volume One. An analysis of the arrangement of pictures and text will help viewers understand how the compiler intended to narrate Ruskin's text, and identify whether or not the photographs refer to specific passages in Ruskin's book.

Ruskin's *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*

An understanding of Ruskin's *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* and his significance as an important art critic and literary figure during the nineteenth century provides insight into Renshaw's illustrated volumes and reveal the popular interests of Victorian collectors. Considered a philosopher of the arts and a chief critic of architectural expression, Ruskin's influence during this period encouraged the documentation of historical monuments and works of art. Ruskin wrote *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* in response to the urgent necessity to preserve ancient monuments, while observing the influences of good architecture.

The Seven Lamps of Architecture was first published in 1848, and was one of many publications that established Ruskin's reputation as a writer with the ability

⁶²Greenfield, *ABC of Bookbinding*, 54. A 'proof obsolete' is a leaf or leaves left untrimmed to show that the book has not been unduly cut. Also called 'witness'.

⁶³Wark, *The Gentle Pastime*, 151.

to convey both experience and the significance of the act of seeing.⁶⁴ The narrative of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* can be described as a moral guidebook for architects, where Ruskin establishes guidelines using the analogy of the Lamps of Sacrifice, Truth, Power, Beauty, Life, Memory, and Obedience, which are organized into seven chapters. The lamps are the lights or ‘spirits’ that the architect must work from; their purpose is to preserve and create work inspired from the past. While it is important to discuss Ruskin’s book as the basis of this compilation, my intention here is to develop briefly an understanding of the narrative and explain how the text is sequenced throughout the three volumes. In this thesis, I will position Ruskin’s narrative as the medium through which Renshaw expresses his own taste and frames some of the ideologies of British imperialism.

The arrangement of Ruskin’s publication in Volume One begins with Chapter One: “The Lamp of Sacrifice,” in which Ruskin argues that the expression of the ‘Spirit of Sacrifice’ involves using precious materials such as marble for the construction of monuments. Ruskin argues that, “of two kinds of decoration, this ‘spirit’ would choose the more elaborate because it was so, in order that it might present more cost and more thought.”⁶⁵ Here, Ruskin criticizes the fact that in ‘modern times’ it is more common to produce the largest results at the least cost.⁶⁶ Chapter Two: “The Lamp of Truth,” argues that architects must be honest about the nature of the material of the building. Ruskin’s principles establish a way of thinking about architecture, which is part of his motivation to change the conditions of both architecture and art. Janice Hart argues that Ruskin “can be seen as a barometer, if an idiosyncratic and sometimes aberrant one, of changing public attitudes.”⁶⁷ During the nineteenth

⁶⁴Janice Hart, “Ruskin, John (1819-1900),” in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 1223.

⁶⁵John Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* New ed. (New York: The Noonday Press, 1961), 10.

⁶⁶Ibid.

⁶⁷Hart, *Ruskin*, 1225.

century there was a growing interest in the restoration of ancient monuments, which perhaps in part explains why Renshaw felt inspired to collect pictures of architecture.

Volume Two includes the remaining pages of “The Lamp of Truth,” which is followed by Chapter Three, “The Lamp of Power,” in which Ruskin discusses the value of massive structural elements to represent ‘powerful’ architecture. This chapter refers to the mass of buildings, emphasizing the elements of neo-Gothic architecture. Chapter Four: “The Lamp of Beauty” considers the significance of ornamentation inspired from nature. In “Multiple Essences,” Kent Bloomer analyzes *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, saying, that although “a quick reading of Ruskin suggests that his imagery was rooted in a neo-medieval setting, a more careful study reveals that he sought basic principles of design that could belong to the age of industrialized architecture.”⁶⁸ The influence of Ruskin’s publication is expressed in both Renshaw’s illustration of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* and in the craftsmanship of the bookbinding.

Volume Three includes the last part of “The Lamp of Beauty,” where Ruskin argues that beauty in architecture derives from nature. He says that architecture does not have to imitate nature, but “she is nevertheless to place her most exuberant vegetable ornament just where Nature would have placed it... Thus the Corinthian capital is made beautiful.”⁶⁹ In Chapter Five: “The Lamp of Life,” Ruskin says that life is associated “with the creations of architecture which are of inert substance... they are an expression of vivid life which has been concerned in their production.”⁷⁰ In Chapter Six: “The Lamp of Memory,” Ruskin argues that when architecture becomes memorial or monumental, a true perfection is attained by civil and domestic buildings because “their decorations are animated by metaphorical or historical meaning.”⁷¹ In the final chapter “The Lamp of Obedience,” Ruskin discusses the economy of current

⁶⁸Kent Bloomer, “Multiple Essences,” *Paradigms of Architecture* 22 (1986), 33.

⁶⁹Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, 114.

⁷⁰*Ibid.*, 151.

⁷¹*Ibid.*, 182.

architecture when he says that, “a day never passes without our hearing our English architects called upon to be original, and to invent a new style... We want no new style of architecture. Who wants a new style of painting or sculpture? But we want some style.”⁷² Ruskin’s argument refers to some of the cultural debates regarding the preservation and continuity of art and architecture with the rise of industrialization.

The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated is especially relevant given Ruskin’s status as a leading art and social critic during the nineteenth century in Great Britain. Perhaps Renshaw sought to express his own taste in architecture by compiling the books and incorporating the medium of photography. Furthermore, it demonstrates the way he valued the medium of photography as a way to illustrate Ruskin’s ideas. Although Ruskin advocated the use of photography early in his career, as a draughtsman, he considered it solely as a tool. However, he was ambivalent towards photography’s claims to the status of art. According to Vicki Goldberg in *Photography in Print: Writings from 1816 to the Present*, “At some point, Ruskin changed his mind. He decided that photography used neither the soul nor the active, designing intellect, and therefore could not be judged a high art.”⁷³ Therefore, Renshaw’s decision to include photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* was a personal choice, indicating that he valued its mechanical or transcriptive nature. As Ruskin noted, “It is certainly the most marvellous invention of the century; given us, I think, just in time to save some evidence from the...wreckers. As regards art, I wish it had never been discovered, it will make the eye too fastidious to accept mere handling.”⁷⁴ Clearly Ruskin disapproved of photography as an art form, he compared it to the patient study of the chiaroscuro landscape, arguing that “photographs supersede no

⁷²Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, 207.

⁷³Goldberg, “John Ruskin: Various Writings 1845-1879 Excerpts,” in *Photography in Print: Writings from 1816 to the Present*, Ed, Vicki Goldberg (Albuquerque, New Mexico: University of New Mexico Press, 1981), 152.

⁷⁴Ibid.

single quality nor use of fine art...”⁷⁵ Renshaws use of photographic-illustrations, therefore, seem to contradict Ruskins own perceptions about photography; yet, at the same time, they provide a telling glimpse into nineteenth century visual culture and the emerging medium of photography into the art market.

Arrangement

A close examination of the photographs contained in Renshaw’s books might help to understand Renshaw’s motivation in extra-illustrating the text and how the pictures reflect both his social status and pastime. Given the large quantity of lithographic and photographic prints in all three volumes, my analysis will focus on the arrangement of the photographs in volume one, briefly describing the lithographs and text arranged between them, and will identify the photographs from volumes two and three. Overall, there are thirty-nine albumen silver and salted paper photographs of architectural views, sculptures, and landscapes of the Near East (including Cairo, Palestine, Istanbul, Greece, and Jerusalem) and Europe (including France, Germany, England, Rome, and Venice). The photographs were taken by such celebrated Victorian photographers as James Robertson, Felice Beato, Francis Frith, Maxime DuCamp, Félix Teynard, Charles Nègre, Roger Fenton, and Louis Désiré Blanquart-Evrard.⁷⁶ In addition to these named photographers and locations, several photographs are anonymous. An albumen paper print of *the Church of Saint Maclou, Rouen, West Façade* by the Bisson Frères (Louis-Auguste Bisson and Auguste-Rosalie Bisson) measuring 39.5 x 31.5, has been removed from the first volume. It was part of the National Gallery of Canada’s 1982 travelling exhibition *Eugène Atget*, which toured to the Art Gallery of Hamilton, the Art Gallery of Victoria, and the Glenbow Museum in Calgary.⁷⁷

⁷⁵Goldberg, *John Ruskin: Various Writings 1845-1879 Excerpts*, 153.

⁷⁶Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*.

⁷⁷National Gallery of Canada, “Eugène Atget,” (Travelling exhibition to the Art Gallery of Hamilton, the Art Gallery of Victoria, and the Glenbow Museum in Calgary, 1982).

The first pages in Volume One include the title page from *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* and Ruskin's lithograph (Plate IX) of the *Tracery from the Campanile of Giotto* in Florence. The *untitled* (Fig.3) photograph that follows, measuring approximately 35 x 49 centimeters, is folded at the 'gutter' or inner margin of the book.⁷⁸ The print is meant to 'foldout' larger than the bookblock, so the reader must open the print to see the entire photograph.⁷⁹ The albumen print emphasizes the central portal, or front entrance, of an anonymous Gothic cathedral. This print is followed by an *Untitled* coloured lithographic print that also 'folds out' from the book. The next sequence of pictures includes a photograph of *Arles: The Tympanum and Lintel of the Central Door of Saint-Trophime with Christ of the Apocalypse, France* by Charles Nègre (Fig.4). Since this photograph is 'tipped in' and folded at the 'gutter' of the book, the sepia or yellow hues are visible around the edges of the photograph where the oxidization in silver has occurred. Because it was kept folded in the book, the photograph's material quality has preserved the chemicals that would have otherwise shown significant deterioration.⁸⁰ The large format prints selected for the book would have been considered rare and expensive, as only someone with enormous wealth would have been able to afford such a production. The way in which the photographs were pasted into the book clearly shows that Renshaw valued them as precious objects. Pages from the *Preface to the 1880 Edition of The Seven Lamps of Architecture* are arranged next. Following Ruskin's text is an albumen print of an *Untitled* building which expands on both sides of the book, requiring a tactile experience of the picture for the viewer, who must handle the pages and rotate the book sideways to view it. This print, like many others in the books, is enigmatic,

⁷⁸Greenfield, *ABC of Bookbinding*, 35. The term 'gutter' means adjoining the inner margins of two facing pages. Also called back, binding or inner margin.

⁷⁹Ibid., 29. Foldout is material larger than the bookblock incorporated by sewing or tipping in. Also called throw out or full apron.

⁸⁰Murray, *Interview with John McElhone*.

depicting an unidentified building.

Out of twenty photographs in Volume One, twelve represent places in the Near East (the following sequence of prints will be discussed in further detail in chapter three of this thesis). Albumen prints of Cairo, Egypt and Constantinople (present day Istanbul) by James Robertson and Felice Beato appear on the right-hand side of the book. The first is *The Mosque of Sultan Qaytbay* taken in 1857, in Cairo and the second is an *Untitled* (Fig.5), print of a street view in Cairo. Six chromolithographic prints of 'Moorish' architectural designs (Fig.8) follow this photograph.⁸¹ The chromolithographs are interleaved between the pages xi and xii of the *The First Edition of The Seven Lamps of Architecture*.⁸² Inserted among the photographs and lithographs, Volume One also contains two watercolours: the first is a sketch of three columns from architectural ruins and the second is a watercolour of a landscape (Fig.9), inscribed as '*Holy Land*' *Egypt* on the reverse in graphite. Next comes a photograph of a *Street Scene in Cairo*, which is inscribed with Robertson and Beato's signature. The following picture is a photogravure of a relief on the façade of the *Grand Temple at Denderah, Egypt* (Fig.10) by Maxime du Camp with an inscription which reads: *Haute Egypte, sculptures de la façade posterieure*.⁸³ This scene is followed by a lithographic print by Francesco Maggioto (Fig.11), the first of a series of prints representing secular or religious subject matter.

Appearing before the *Table of Contents*, *List of Plates*, *Introduction*, and the first page of Chapter One, is a salted paper print by Félix Teynard (Fig.12) that

⁸¹David Batterham, *The World of Ornament Illustrated* (London: Taschen, 2006), 120. The word 'Moorish' refers to motifs taken from the Alhambra Palace in Granada or from the Alcazar Palace in Seville, Spain, deriving from Arabic art that borrows principal components from Byzantium. The never-ending design was of enormous interest to modern industry..

⁸²McLean, *Victorian Book Design*, 77. The term 'chromolithography' (a title coined by G. Engelmann for the process patented by him in Paris in 1837) is used for full colour printing by lithography.

⁸³Mary Warner Marien, *Photography: A Cultural History* 2nd ed. (New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2006), 514. The photogravure is an etching process modified to reproduce photographs. The process could be used commercially to make many copies, or with a hand-press to make a few, as was done by the Pictorialists.

was published by Goupil & Cie, entitled *Ile de Fileh (Philae), colonnade orientale, ruines vues du points*.⁸⁴ Two lithographs precede an albumen print of *Islamic Tombs* inscribed in Arabic calligraphy or kufic script, followed by an albumen print of a *Topographic view of Cairo* by Robertson and Beato. This particular arrangement of lithographs next to photographs alludes to the fact that Renshaw was perhaps comparing the medium of lithography to photography.

Interleaved between pages nine to fourteen of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* are two albumen prints by Robertson and Beato: the first is the *Sabil Um Abbas* (Fig.13), a public drinking fountain identified with the inscription on the photograph 'fontaine,' and the second is a photograph of a *Street in Constantinople*, which is identified by the inscription on the lower left hand side as *une rue de Constantinople*. These photographs are followed by seven lithographs representing religious scenes and two photographs which represent the Near East: an albumen print from a glass negative of *Fountain of the Mosque of Mohammed Ali* taken by Robertson and Beato in 1857 (Fig.14) and a salted paper print by Maxime Du Camp of an aerial view of the *Jerusalem* (Fig.20).⁸⁵ The next three lithographs, representing sacred sites like the Garden of Gethsemane, the Pool of Siloam, the Church of the Holy Sepulchre, and the Pool of Hezekiah, are followed by pages fifteen to sixteen of "The Lamp of Sacrifice" and five lithographs of sculptures. Tipped in the book after the lithographs is an anonymous albumen print of a *Relief Sculpture*, beneath the Latin inscription "Perierat et Inventus," and an albumen print measuring 30.2 x 26.4 cm, which was taken in Constantinople and whose inscription signed by Robertson and Beato reads, "Kloik du sultan sur le Bosphore près les eaux douces d'asie," which was taken in Constantinople and measures 30.2 x 26.4 cm.

⁸⁴Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, Translated: Island of Fileh (Philae) Oriental Colonnade, View of Ruins.

⁸⁵Kathleen Stewart Howe, *Excursions Along the Nile: The Photographic Discovery of Ancient Egypt* (Santa Barbara: Santa Barbara Museum of Art, 1993), 73.

Pages seventeen to twenty-four of “The Lamp of Sacrifice” and a lithograph of a sculpture of a saint follow Robertson and Beato’s photograph. The next tipped-in albumen print shows a portrait bust of *the Head of a Barbarian Captive* and the initials inscribed on the photograph, ‘R F’, identify that it was taken by Roger Fenton. Fenton’s photograph is followed by a lithograph of *Rouen Cathedral* and a *Untitled* print by Lemerrier of the interior of a courtyard. The last sequence of photographs in volume one departs from the previous narrative of the views of the Near East, showing the compiler’s tendency to include both lithographic and photographic views of the same site. For example, he has also added an albumen print of *The Portal of Abbey Church of Saint Riquier* in France, as one of the examples of flamboyant Gothic architecture. This photograph can be interpreted as the compiler’s response to Ruskin’s principles in this chapter regarding architectural ornamentation. To the student of architecture during the nineteenth century, Ruskin’s works would have acted as a guide for identifying elements of Gothic architecture while travelling.

Page twenty-six of “The Lamp of Sacrifice” precedes the albumen print of *Saint Maclou, Rouen, West Façade* (Fig.17) by the Bisson Frères, which was removed from the book around 1982 for the National Gallery of Canada’s exhibition. Ruskin’s first lithograph, Plate I: *Ornaments from Rouen, St. Lo and Venice*, (Fig.18) would have appeared after this print. Here, Ruskin argues that in “the central gate of Rouen is the most exquisite piece of pure flamboyant work existing.”⁸⁶ Renshaw’s inclusion of a photograph of Rouen beside Ruskin’s print shows his intention to follow Ruskin’s narrative. However, the photograph’s meaning has shifted and the compiler’s original intention is obscured because of its removal from its original context for the exhibition.

Ruskin’s argument in this section of “The Lamp of Sacrifice” is that all of the achievements of architecture from the Gothic period are falling to ruins, and this

⁸⁶Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, 27.

corresponds to the inclusion of an albumen print of *The Lakenhalle (Cloth Hall)* in the Grote Markt, Ypres (Fig.19). This print is historically significant because it shows a view of the architecture before it was destroyed in World War One, functioning as a document that preserves the architectural past. Although Ruskin does not specifically mention this example in his publication, this print helps readers to understand how Renshaw intended to illustrate Ruskin's text.

The last arrangement of illustrations in this volume is interleaved between pages twenty-nine to fifty-four of Chapter Two: "The Lamp of Truth." These illustrations include seven lithographs depicting secular and religious subjects, four lithographic views of Venice, five decorative prints of floor mosaic designs, and one lithograph of the *South front of the British Museum*. The last print in this volume is Ruskin's lithograph, *Part of the Cathedral of St. Lo, Normandy*.

Volume Two

Acompanying the second volume are ten photographs in addition to sixty-eight lithographs, engravings, and photo-mechanical prints. The photolithographs and photogravures that reproduce works of art allow us to see how the copied works of art would have been displayed inside a book as a form of preservation. Due to the extensive number of prints included in Volumes Two and Three, I will focus on the arrangement of the photographs. Although lithographs, engravings, and other photomechanical prints deserve further examination, they are beyond the scope of this thesis. The first anonymous albumen print measures approximately 35 x 49 centimeters and is folded in the middle of the book, showing a view of the *Ruins of Kirkstall Abbey* (Fig.15), a medieval Cistercian Abbey located in Britain. This print represents Ruskin's principles regarding architectural ruins and preservation as well as the photographer's interests in the aesthetic qualities of ruins. The decaying photograph and the archae-

ological ruin of the Abbey create a strong parallel between the preservation of the material print in the book and the conservation of ancient architecture.

The first anonymous albumen print, inscribed “Mars Hill Athens,” shows several men standing in suits and military uniforms. Some are reclining while others stand in the foreground, as if posing for the photographer. The second anonymous photograph shows the landscape of Athens and the Parthenon with the inscription “I, BECK ATHENS.” Perhaps these views illustrate Renshaw’s travels or his response to photo-mechanical printing. Inserted between the lithographs and engavings, they signify a period in artistic production when copying and reproducing artwork were part of preserving and imitating real objects or places. The insertion of these lithographs demonstrates the nature of the art market, as prints by Lemercier, Strixner and Goupil & Cie. would have been bought and inserted in books like these; such prints would have been ideal for the reproduction of masterpieces of art, both ancient and contemporary.⁸⁷

The prints included are evidence of the evolution of the development of visual media during the nineteenth century, demonstrating changes in what was being sold and collected. Other photographs arranged among lithographs and engravings include a salted paper print, titled *La Porte Rouge* by Blanquart-Evrard, with a inscription on the back reading *Façade septentrionale de l’Église de Notre-Dame. XIII siècle*.⁸⁸ The following salted paper print shows *the Apse of the Notre Dame Cathedral*, Paris. These two prints might have been extracted from a photographic album such as *Photographic Memories*, published by Blanquart-Evrard in 1853, in which Isabelle Jammes identifies the origins of the edited photo albums in the catalogue raisonné.

⁸⁷Pierre Lin Renié, “The Battle for a Market: Art Reproductions in Print and Photography from 1850 to 1880,” in *Intersections: Lithography, Photography and the Traditions of Printmaking*, Ed, Kathleen Stewart Howe. Vol. 17 (Albuquerque, New Mexico: University of New Mexico Press, 1998), 42.

⁸⁸Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, Translated: Red Gate. Northern Façade of the Notre-Dame Cathedral. XIII Century.

Perhaps Renshaw owned this album, or bought the print separately and selected the photographs that could illustrate his book.⁸⁹ The next albumen print measures approximately 35 x 49 centimeters. It is folded at the gutter of the book, with an inscription on the back that reads *Apostles- Rheims*. This print focuses on the jamb sculptural figures of the cathedral. The next anonymous albumen print, with an inscription identifying it as *Cathedral Abbeville*, focuses on the central façade of the cathedral and is followed by a lithographic print titled *Cloches Chartres*. The final photograph in this sequence is an albumen print of the *Façade of Strasbourg Cathedral*. Finally, a series of lithographs precedes an anonymous albumen print of the Palazzo Rezzonico in Venice whose print folds out beyond the closed book. The last photograph in volume two, a salted paper print, is identified in graphite as a *Vatican Sarcophagus*.

Volume Three

Renshaw's third volume of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* includes nine albumen and salted paper prints 'tipped in' to the book and fifty-nine lithographs and photo-mechanical prints. Among these photographs, the first shows *the Palazzo Vendramin-Calergi* and the second is of the *Palazzo Franchetti-Cavalli-Gussoni* in Venice. Perhaps these would have been bought as a series of views from Venice. Next, an albumen print by Roger Fenton of a portrait bust of *Julius Caesar* is interleaved with other photomechanical prints of paintings and lithographs. There are also three salted paper prints of sculptures of Roman gods, which would have perhaps been sold in a series. The first two are unidentified, with inscriptions below the images reading 'Vatican'. The third salted paper print is of a Roman sculpture inscribed as the 'Titans'. The following salted paper print shows an aerial view of a military

⁸⁹Isabelle Jammes, *Albums photographiques dits par Blanquart-Evrard, 1851-1855 : une exposition du Department des Relations Publiques de Kodak-Pathé* (Paris: Bibliotheque Forney, 1978), No.512.

base on the *West Side of the Palace of the Popes in Avignon*, taken by Charles Nègre in 1852 (Fig.16). Soldiers are walking in groups of three and a ‘ghost’ effect in this photograph is created due to the length of exposure time, which creates a faint impression of the figure on the print.⁹⁰ The same process of salt paper printing was used for the *Equestrian Statue of Marcus Aurelius* on the Capitoline Hill; and the last photograph included in volume three is a view of *the Pantheon*, where the anonymous photographer captures the façade to include the Obelisk Macuteo in the foreground and a horse-drawn carriage at the entrance; these were likely included to measure the scale of the building.

The photographs in Renshaw’s three volumes typify the imperial and aesthetic interests of Britain during the nineteenth century, in which people increasingly identified their nation with the creative civilizations of antiquity. Public buildings in England often emulated the styles and proportions of Greece and Rome.⁹¹ The photographs in Renshaw’s illustrated volumes show travels through Europe and the Near East where the reader is reminded of popular architectural sites that many nineteenth-century photographers documented. Further speculation in Chapter Two about the tradition of collecting and extra-illustrating books will reveal Renshaw’s pastime in order to understand his personal response to Ruskin’s text.

⁹⁰Gordon Baldwin, *Looking at Photographs: A Guide to Technical Terms* (California: Getty Publications, 1991), The nature of nineteenth-century photographic processes caused any exposure of a negative with a shutter speed slower than 1/60 of a second to cause objects in motion to blur. Sometimes this was used intentionally to produce a ghostlike image.

⁹¹Mark Haworth-Booth, *The Golden Age of British Photography, 1839-1900* (New York: Aperture, 1987), 82.

Chapter 2: Gender and Class: J. A. Knowles Renshaw's Identity and The Pastime of Extra-Illustrating

Ownership is the most intimate relationship that one can have to objects. Not that they come alive in him; it is he who lives in them. So now I have erected one of his dwellings, with books as the building stones, before you, and now he is going to disappear inside, as is only fitting - Walter Benjamin.¹

In his essay, "Unpacking My Library: A Talk About Collecting," Walter Benjamin discusses the motivations behind collecting. For Benjamin, "Everything remembered and thought, everything conscious, becomes the pedestal, the frame, the base, the lock of his property."² In short, a collector lives intellectually through his collection. This chapter explores Renshaw's pastime as a collector, principally through the case study of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* and a discussion of extra-illustrating as a pastime among British gentlemen. Following Benjamin, I will look at collecting and illustrating practices to discover Renshaw's identity. My goal here is not simply to outline Renshaw's biography, but to understand his life experiences within the broader milieu of the Victorian gentry. I argue that collecting contributes to the way the compiler expresses his identity and, therefore, also reflects contemporary gender and class values.

Using a material culture approach allows me to interpret Renshaw's collection of photographs not simply as representations, but as objects with an "intimate" relationship to Renshaw's life and of his culture. Photographs tipped into *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* show how absorbed Renshaw was in his collection. As Edwards and Hart point out, photographs were "not merely purchased and filed away, but used, and engaged with constantly."³ In his material culture methodology,

¹Walter Benjamin, "Unpacking My Library: A Talk About Collecting," in *Illuminations*, Ed, Hannah Arendt (Hammersmith, London: Fontana Press, 1973), 69.

²Ibid., 62.

³Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories: On the Materiality of Images* (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 12.

Jules Prown reserves the third stage for a focus on “speculation”: framing hypotheses and questions that lead from the object to external evidence for testing and resolution. Following the first chapter’s focus on a close reading of the books, informed by Prown’s approach to material culture, this chapter will address ‘deduction,’ how the reader interacts with the object. In this way, the chapter will illuminate Renshaw’s status as a collector within the dominant gendered and class terms of his time.

Susan M. Pearce investigates how collections form part of our dynamic relationship with the material world. Her argument in *On Collecting: An Investigation into Collecting in the European Tradition* is that “for an object group to count as a ‘collection,’... it must have been created as a special accumulation, intended at some point to fulfill a particular social and psychic role, and considered by the collector’s society to be appropriate for his role.”⁴ I will use Pearce’s discussion of collecting in the European tradition to understand how Renshaw’s accumulation of extra-illustrations in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* relates to his identity, as well as how his pastime reflects a particular gendered role in society.

Biography: Gender and Identity

John Alfred Knowles Renshaw was born on July 8, 1871, in Ashton-on-Mersey: Sale, Greater Manchester, into a prosperous upper-middle-class family.⁵ In 1869, his father, Charles Jeremiah Renshaw, married Susan Fanny Knowles. Their union bore four children: Charles Adolphe Renshaw (1870-1913), John Alfred Knowles (1871-1926), Frank Norman (1875-1896) and Susan Beatrice (1878-?).⁶ John and his older brother Charles both pursued careers as medical doctors, guided by their father, who was a

⁴Susan M. Pearce, *On Collecting: An Investigation Into Collecting in the European Tradition* (London and New York: Routledge, 1995), 33.

⁵National Archives of the United Kingdom, *Census Returns of England and Wales, 1901* Government Report.

⁶“Renshaw; Charles Jeremiah (1841-1916); M.D., F.A.S.L; Medical Practitioner,” in *Altrincham and Sale Guardian* (Trafford Local Studies, December, 1916), DS/UK/395.

doctor of medicine and Fellow of the Royal College of Surgeons. Renshaw was noted as an imaginative child: “as a school-boy at the early age of nine, he showed the dawn of that alert resourcefulness that characterized his later life.”⁷

Renshaw was named after his grandfather John Knowles (1810-1880), of Trafford Manchester.⁸ He was a Manchester businessman who from 1845-1875 owned the Theatre Royal on Peter Street, which was one of his many business ventures (another included the running of a marble works).⁹ Ruskin’s 1880 edition of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* coincides with the year of his grandfather’s death. Although there is no evidence of any connection between John Knowles and Ruskin, it is possible that Renshaw inherited some of the books or pictures in his compilation of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* from a previous generation since some of the engravings, lithographs, and albumen prints would have been produced much earlier in the nineteenth century. In 1888, Renshaw, then seventeen years old, commissioned a portrait bust of his grandfather soon after his death, solidifying his relationship to his grandfather, his status as a gentleman, and his position as the possible heir to his grandfather’s inheritance.¹⁰

Books circulated during the nineteenth century, such as *Advice to Young Men on their Duties and Conduct in Life* by Timothy S. Arthur, address how gender was constructed and provide insight into how young men like Renshaw placed great importance on their position in society and their education. Some of the established characteristics of a gentleman that they noted include “an adherence to truth, delicacy, and politeness.”¹¹ Secondly, in “Gentlemen and Their Book-Plates,” Brian

⁷ “Dr. Knowles Renshaw Death of Distinguished Specialist Loss to Medical, Public and Political Circles,” in *Altrincham, Bowdon and Hale Obituaries* (Guardian, 1926).

⁸ Arthur C. Fox-Davies, “Renshaw Coats of Arms,” in *Armorial Families: A Directory of Gentlemen of Coat-armour* Vol. 2. (London: Hurst & Blacklett, Ltd, 1930).

⁹ Public Monument and Sculpture Association National Recording Project, *John Knowles* (<http://pmsa.cch.kcl.ac.uk/MR/MR-MTH36.htm>, March 2008).

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Timothy S. Arthur, *Advice to Young Men on their Duties and Conduct in Life* (London: J.S.

North Lee has argued that the status of ‘gentleman’ implies good birth and social standing.¹² Lee further argues that men who were considered “honourable and refined, by modern understanding of the term, were also somewhat leisured, and the best of them had time for books.”¹³ In *Armorial Families: A Directory of Gentlemen of Coat-Armour*, Renshaw’s name and coat of arms are identical to those on his bookplate (Fig.2) that appears on the inside of the front board of volume one of the National Gallery’s *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*.¹⁴ The abbreviation after his name, ‘Esq’ or ‘esquire’, shows that he was a member of the gentry in Great Britain at the time, the class of landowning people ranking just below nobility.¹⁵ These facts reinforce his gentlemanly status in society and explain how he could afford the elaborate production of extra-illustrated books. He is known in *Armorial Families* as “the late John Alfred Knowles Renshaw, Esquire, a retired Captain of the Second Battalion of the Manchester Regiment.”¹⁶

As a student, Renshaw attended private school, and was accepted at the University of Cambridge at the age of eighteen. He graduated with a Bachelor of Arts at the age of twenty-one and then pursued a post-graduate degree and was awarded a Master of Arts, a Bachelor of Medicine, and a Bachelor of Surgery at twenty-five years of age.¹⁷ At this time, schools like Oxford and Cambridge were places reserved for the sons of the gentry, clergy, and the more distinguished professions.¹⁸ Being the son

Hodgson, 1855), 82.

¹²Brian North Lee, “Gentlemen and their Book-plates,” in *Property of a Gentleman: The Formation, Organisation, and Dispersal of the Private Library*, Ed, Robin Myers and Michael Harris (Winchester: St. Paul’s Bibliographies, 1991), 49.

¹³Ibid., 63.

¹⁴David Pearson, “Bookplates, Book Labels and Book Stamps,” in *Provenance Research in Book History* (London: British Library & Oak Knoll Press, 1994), 54. A bookplate is an ownership label printed from an engraved or etched block, cut in metal or wood. The design is usually armorial or pictorial, and it normally (but by no means always) incorporates the owner’s name or initials.

¹⁵Victoria Neufeldt and David B. Guralnik, *Webster’s New World Dictionary, Third College Edition* 3rd ed. (New York: Macmillan, 1997).

¹⁶Fox-Davies, “*Renshaw Coats of Arms*”, 1638.

¹⁷*Dr. Knowles Renshaw’s Obituary*.

¹⁸Martin J. Wiener, *English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit, 1850-1980* (Cam-

of a physician he would have facilitated his entry into university and the medical profession. At this time, there was a concern among fathers to prepare their sons for their future. John Tosh's *Manliness and Masculinities in Nineteenth-Century Britain* informs my understanding of the broader social values towards gender and status in Victorian Britain. As Tosh argues, "for an adulthood world moral qualities that were required were summed up with the word 'manliness,' which meant courage, resolution, tenacity and self-government or 'independence'."¹⁹ It is possible that during this time, Renshaw developed an interest in collecting art and literature, perhaps inspired by his father who wrote the books *Some of the Bye-Paths in the History of the Church of St. Martin Ashton-upon-Mersey: and of the Rectory*,²⁰ and *Impressions of the North-West of Ireland during a summer holiday in Connemara*.²¹ Both of these books were extra-illustrated, and the former includes notes about the old church which he collected during his lifetime. At Cambridge, too, he would also have been surrounded by social critics, who following Ruskin, urged men in all classes to remain content with their lives, seeking "not greater wealth, but simpler pleasures."²² Ruskin himself, for example, promoted clergymen and physicians as men who "provided for the nation."²³

Renshaw studied medicine at the University of Manchester and the London Hospital, and Vienna before becoming a Doctor of Medicine at the age of thirty.²⁴ Renshaw became the House Surgeon at the Manchester Royal Infirmary, Honourary Aural Surgeon at the Manchester Eye, and Ear Hospital and Honourary Physician at the bridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 22.

¹⁹John Tosh, *Manliness and Masculinities in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Essays on Gender, Family and Empire* (Great Britain: Pearson, 2005), 110.

²⁰Charles J. Renshaw, *Some of the Bye-Paths in the History of the Church of S. Martin Ashton-upon-Mersey and of the Rectory* (Phoenix Press, 1914).

²¹"Renshaw; Charles Jeremiah".

²²John Ruskin; Edward T. Cook and Alexander Wedderburn, eds., *The Works of John Ruskin* (London and New York: George Allen, Longman's Green, 1912), 38-39.

²³Ibid.

²⁴*Dr. Knowles Renshaw's Obituary*.

Manchester Hospital for Consumption and Diseases of the Throat.²⁵ As a physician, Renshaw had a comfortable material life enabling him to afford to collect rare books and works of art. The elaborate material production of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* is one example of his financial success, and owning art works of both rare and popular literature would have made him fashionable within his elite social circle. His education and career as a doctor of medicine not only suggest that Renshaw established his status in the company of other men by learning the appropriate codes of masculine behaviour, but also that these factors reflect his power and privilege in the social order.²⁶ Tosh argues that “manliness expresses perfectly the important truth that boys become men not just by growing up, but by acquiring a variety of manly qualities and competencies as part of a conscious process.”²⁷ Victorian publications on morality such as *Advice to Young Men* (and specifically its chapter on “Improvement of the Mind”), are especially useful in understanding how knowledge was valued. In *Advice to Young Men*, Timothy S. Arthur argues that “Books of facts and books of principles should make by far the larger portion of a young man’s reading, ...the book of travel opens up to us the manners, customs, and peculiarities of other nations.”²⁸ The pleasure of travelling would have appealed to many men including Renshaw, whose interest in travel is shown by what he collected. Renshaw’s obituary in *The Guardian* suggests he was a prominent individual, for the title reads “Dr. Knowles Renshaw Distinguished Specialist Loss to Medical, Public and Political Circles.” In private life, he is described as someone who was,

A charming host, courteous, hospitable and well read far beyond the limits of his own profession; it was profitable to discuss with him some happening in English history, some turn in politics, some heraldic emblem, some aspect on Paleolithic man. His interest in local affairs revealed yet another side of his

²⁵ *Dr. Knowles Renshaw’s Obituary*.

²⁶ Tosh, *Manliness and Masculinities*, 114.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 31.

²⁸ Arthur, *Advice to Young Men*, 39.

versatile nature, deepening as it did the affectionate esteem in which he was everywhere held.²⁹

Renshaw's seeming resourcefulness and scholarly achievements influenced both social and political affairs. Renshaw lived from 1871-1926. During Renshaw's lifetime the British Empire was significantly reshaping how people in England saw themselves and the world around them. Ideas of patriotism, nationalism, and imperialism in the late Victorian and early Edwardian periods were, as Tosh argues, constructed as a "man's business."³⁰ Tosh further claims that this was reflected in the way that "acquisition and control depended on the energy and ruthlessness of men and its place in the popular imagination was mediated through literary and visual images which consistently emphasized positive male attributes."³¹ Renshaw would have been influenced by the politics and representation of British national character. An article in the *London Gazette* states that Renshaw enlisted in the second battalion of the Manchester Regiment of Volunteers in 1902, was appointed as house surgeon and Captain in 1905 and participated in the Second Boer War.³² Soon after he resigned his commission in 1907, Renshaw married Amy Taylor with whom he had three sons: Arthur, Richard Charlesworth and Peter Knowles Renshaw. Richard inherited part of his father's property when he died April 25, 1926, including his private library which he sold at auction in 1956.³³

Renshaw's position of authority as a Captain in the Second Boer War supports Tosh's argument that "the main target for empire propaganda was not the working class but the 'service class,' the upper levels of society from whom colonial administrators and officers in the army and navy were traditionally drawn."³⁴ The introduction

²⁹ *Dr. Knowles Renshaw's Obituary.*

³⁰ Tosh, *Manliness and Masculinities*, 195.

³¹ *Ibid.*

³² "Volunteer Corps, Royal Garrison Artillery (Volunteers)," in *London Gazette* (London, April 1902), 2285.

³³ *Dr. Knowles Renshaw's Obituary.*

³⁴ Tosh, *Manliness and Masculinities*, 197.

of cadet corps, together with volunteer movements such as the Manchester Regiment of Volunteers, was what promoted this ideology of a common masculine identity. Tosh discusses how “overseas expansion depended on manpower, and on the supply of men of a certain type - practical, resourceful and self-reliant.”³⁵ Men who chose colonial careers or set off in search of adventure abroad, as Renshaw did, were making a statement about their masculinity. Renshaw’s social status as a gentleman, his education, and military rank as Captain reveal much about his identity and how this was tied to gender constructions.

Collecting

Renshaw’s pastime as a ‘bibliophile’, or collector of books, is apparent in a catalogue of books from his private library, described in the “Hodgson and Co. Sale Catalogues, 1956-57,” by S.C. Hodgson. Renshaw owned approximately fifty rare literary classics by celebrated authors including Shakespeare, Chaucer, Plutarch, and Sir Francis Bacon. The documentation of his books in the catalogue establishes both the original context and function of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, while distinguishing these three volumes as unique. In his essay on collecting books, Benjamin provides his view of the relationship of a book collector to his possessions. Benjamin’s personal anecdote provides an interesting account of this common pastime among men in the nineteenth century and relates to Renshaw’s own experience with his private library. Benjamin argues that,

Collectors are the physiognomists of the world of objects... One has only to watch a collector handle the objects in his glass case. As he holds them in his hands, he seems to be seeing through them into their distant past as though inspired.³⁶

³⁵Tosh, *Manliness and Masculinities*, 197.

³⁶Benjamin, “*Unpacking My Library*”, 62.

The collector's affection for his books is one that Benjamin says "borders on the chaos of memories," where "the only exact knowledge is the date of publication and the format of the books together with the order of the catalogue."³⁷ Ruskin's 1880 publication of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* has an exact date provided, but the pictures interleaved in Renshaw's books date from much earlier. Furthermore, the catalogue provides evidence of other books that Renshaw owned, some of which include: Thomas F. Dibdin's *A Bibliographical, Antiquarian and Picturesque Tour in France and Germany, plates, 3 vols, polished calf gilt, g.e.* 1821; Pierre-Jean de Beranger's *OEuvres, illus., 5 vols, morocco, g.e.* Paris, 1834; and Charles Dickens' *Bleak House, illus., First Edition, 1852-3* and *Nicholas Nickleby, with illustrations by Phiz, First Edition.* Many of the books that Renshaw collected included illustrations; however, only in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* were photographs added to the books. Benjamin's experience as a book collector provides further insight on the bibliophile's deepest desire, a drive to acquire new things "to renew the old world."³⁸ Renshaw clearly valued his material possessions; the notion of his books as property suggests that "collectors are people with tactical instinct."³⁹ The current material condition of the books indicates that Renshaw went to great pains to care for his property, which stems from his feeling of responsibility.⁴⁰ One of the indications of Renshaw's status as a book collector is his mark of ownership, the coat of arms that appears on his bookplate. The quality of the materials used in binding *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, especially the use of half leather morocco and gold inscriptions, can be viewed as a symbol of both his wealth and his sense of prideful ownership.

³⁷ Benjamin, "Unpacking My Library", 61, 62.

³⁸ Ibid., 63.

³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁰ Ibid., 69.

Book collectors associated beautifully bound books with aesthetic values, morality and knowledge. Furthermore, moral guides to young men established principles of etiquette for a polite society, through self-education and by means of collecting. According to these books, "A vast amount of knowledge may be gained in the course of a few years, by rightly employing those leisure hours which every one has; and this knowledge, if of a practical kind, will always insure to a man the means of elevation in the world."⁴¹ These publications recommended that works of facts and principles should be read over works of fancy and fiction, which should only be read in order to improve taste.⁴² Important values were associated with 'politeness' and status in Victorian society. As Tosh argues, "those with 'position' certainly valued progress in manners and refinement."⁴³ In this sense, gentlemanliness can be viewed in terms of how a man's status and appearance in society are determined by what he owns and by how he fulfills social expectations. Renshaw's ownership of lavishly illustrated books indicates the importance of appearances.

Book collecting, binding, and selling reveal the societal functions and gender distinctions held by Victorian society. In the essay, "Of Mice and Men: Gender Identity in Collecting," Russell W. Belk and Melanie Wallendorf argue that "gender is implicated in the associations of the objects collected, and the gendered uses of the collections."⁴⁴ Renshaw's collecting interests in history and philosophy suggest his status as a cultured gentleman, for he owned Plutarch's *The Lives of the Noble Grecians and Romanes*, Plinius Secundus' *The Historie of the World*, Chaucer's *Workes*, and Bacon's *Sylva Sylvarum*. These selections suggest his inclination towards classical and medieval philosophy and history, and are works that the ideal Englishman would

⁴¹ Arthur, *Advice to Young Men*, 41.

⁴² Ibid., 35.

⁴³ Tosh, *Manliness and Masculinities*, 83.

⁴⁴ Russell W. Belk and Melanie Wallendorf, "Of Mice and Men: Gender Identity in Collecting," in *Interpreting Objects and Collections*, Ed, Susan M. Pearce (London and New York: Routledge, 1994), 241.

have read and owned. Renshaw's books on leisure and travel, such as Walton and Cotton's *The Complete Angler*, a biographical sketch and description of the branches of angling, would have been typically geared towards a male audience. Works of travel were in Renshaw's library, such as William Combe's *The Three Tours of Doctor Syntax* and *A Bibliographical, Antiquarian and Picturesque Tour in France and Germany* by Rev. Thomas Frognall Dibdin, who also wrote *The Bibliomania or Book-Madness*, a book that describes Renshaw's book collecting interest.

Many of the extra-illustrations interleaved in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* are religious, which perhaps reflect Renshaw's moral and spiritual tenets. As a Christian, Renshaw owned two copies of the *Bible* and a *Book of Common Prayer*. Renshaw's inclusion of religious lithographs with secular subject matter expresses his underlying moral or spiritual beliefs. An example of a religious illustrated book is George G. Perry's 1865 publication of *The History of the Crusades*, released by the Society for Promoting Christian Knowledge. Goldman points out that "religious works originating in magazine and book illustrations appeared frequently in volumes with little or no regard for their original settings."⁴⁵ This suggests that the considerable number of pictures depicting religious subject matter, about seventy-one prints overall in the three volumes, represents both Renshaw's Christian values and what was popularly distributed and collected at that time. Renshaw would have been viewed as a gentleman whose collecting interests and education made him an intelligent member of society. As the precept, "Man, know thyself," is vital to the young gentleman's development of his "mental and moral nature," Renshaw's books are evidence of both his pastime and identity.⁴⁶

⁴⁵Paul Goldman, *Victorian Illustrated Books, 1850-1870: The Heyday of Wood-Engraving: The Robin de Beaumont Collection* (London: British Museum Press, 1994), 28.

⁴⁶Arthur, *Advice to Young Men*, 37.

Pearce's study *On Collecting: An Investigation into Collecting in the European Tradition* critically addresses the role of material culture in relation to collecting objects and their exchange values. Pearce argues that "objects are capable of engaging in a cultural dialogue with human individuals from which social changes will emerge."⁴⁷ Her analysis of collecting provides insight into how collecting contributes to Renshaw's identity and ultimately reflects how gender and class values are constructed. Pearce argues that "the collecting individual uses objects, like language, to create and project the image of himself and how he sees the world."⁴⁸ These established patterns of gendered collecting are further discussed by Belk and Wallendorf who focus on four case studies to address the question of whether the process of collecting is inherently a male or female activity.⁴⁹ Likewise, my case study of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* focuses on Renshaw's selection of books and extra-illustrations and how they represent his identity. Quoting a seminal book on collecting, Douglas and Elizabeth Rigby argue that "grand scale collecting almost always calls for aggressive and material ambition to a degree uncharacteristic of women, aside from women's historic economic position."⁵⁰ Opinions about the threat of women's growing sphere of influence to men also existed, and Belk and Wallendorf speculate that this was due to the fact that "collecting was a metaphor and metonym for capital accumulation."⁵¹ They maintain that gendered stereotypes of collecting in a male tradition included aggressiveness, competitiveness, mastery, and seriousness, while those traits of collecting regarded as feminine included care, creativity, nurturance, and preservation.⁵² These scholars argue that despite historical stereotypes, the activity of collecting is

⁴⁷Pearce, *On Collecting*, 10.

⁴⁸*Ibid.*, 32. A similar argument is proposed by Belk and Wallendorf who argue that "gender is expressed, shaped and marked through the process of collecting".

⁴⁹Belk and Wallendorf, *Of Mice and Men*, 241.

⁵⁰*Ibid.*

⁵¹*Ibid.*

⁵²*Ibid.*

not inherently masculine or feminine because the traits associated with male collecting are useful in acquiring objects, while the traits defined as feminine are important in curating and maintaining the collection.⁵³

I argue that Renshaw's collecting interests, as well as the genre of his books, travel, and religious narratives, all relate to his taste and the selection of pictures in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* are coded in terms of gender. This idea of "powerful achievement" lies at the heart of his decision to extra-illustrate Ruskin's publication. Belk and Wallendorf also conclude that "collections perform the societal function of gendering the achievements exemplified in masculine control over nature, and conquering the west."⁵⁴ Renshaw's involvement in the military, his education, and his social status establish powerful connections between his masculinity and pastime as a collector, and show how his ownership of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* reflects his belief in the British national character. As Pearce says,

men can see themselves, and just as importantly, are generally seen, as embracing a range of characteristic images in unison. Most of these images are the subject of collections which men make in order to encourage a correctly masculine view of themselves which they and others may be induced to hold, and they are, therefore, men collecting themselves in the direct sense.⁵⁵

In this sense, Renshaw's books embody an image of the gentleman collector, while his collection of photographs from the Near East reflects the values of British imperialism. By understanding how men constructed their identities with their collections, we can gain insight into the dynamics of gender and how the ideology of imperialism was created. My study of specific photographs in volume one of Renshaw's books in Chapter Three of this thesis will reveal how the Near East was documented, collected and reinterpreted.

⁵³Belk and Wallendorf, *"Of Mice and Men"*, 242.

⁵⁴*Ibid.*, 251.

⁵⁵Pearce, *On Collecting*, 212.

Extra-Illustrating

According to Wark in “The Gentle Pastime of Extra-Illustrating Books,” the tradition of extra-illustrating was popular among the gentry of Great Britain for about a hundred and fifty years, from the mid-eighteenth century to the early-twentieth century.⁵⁶ Renshaw’s books are examples of this practice of adding extra-illustrations to a text, creating a completely new, unique compilation. I will use Wark’s analysis to frame my discussion of how the photographically-illustrated book fits into the tradition of extra-illustrating. Despite Renshaw’s version of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* being a photographically-illustrated book, at the time it would have been termed an extra-illustrated or privately-illustrated book. Wark describes this tradition, stating that “the idea was to start with a book that interested you. It might be on almost any subject- biography, history, travel, Shakespeare, and the Bible were among the most frequent choices.”⁵⁷ This practice is evident in Renshaw’s accumulated works of art on paper, with books containing prints and drawings. After the mid nineteenth century, photographs and photo-mechanical reproductions began to appear that could serve as “extra” illustrations to the text.⁵⁸

What is interesting about *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* is that Renshaw is neither publisher nor printer, but an interested collector who has brought together selected photographs, lithographs, drawings, and watercolours to extra-illustrate Ruskin’s text on architecture. Wark argues that “There may well have been competition among the practitioners to see who could produce the bulkiest extra-illustrated version of a given book.”⁵⁹ The number of illustrations included in Renshaw’s books, the quantity of pictures and the size of the prints reveal his ac-

⁵⁶Robert R. Wark, “The Gentle Pastime of Extra-Illustrating Books,” *The Huntington Library Quarterly* 56 (1993), 151.

⁵⁷Ibid.

⁵⁸Ibid.

⁵⁹Ibid.

complishments, social status, and wealth. I argue that Renshaw personally selected and accumulated the pictures in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* over a period of time and that, although Ruskin's book would have been widely collected, this extra-illustrated copy is unique in all respects.

This pastime among gentlemen suggests that there was an interest in the relationship between visual and verbal modes of communication at the turn of the nineteenth century, particularly in England.⁶⁰ The relationship between text and image will be further discussed in Chapter Three of this thesis. Wark indicates that the illuminated books by Thomas Rowlandson and William Combe, under the entrepreneurship of the publisher Ackermann, mark the peak of this concern for intertwining pictures and text.⁶¹ The sale catalogue of Renshaw's bibliographic collection includes extra-illustrated books by William Combe, including *The English Dance of Death*, *The Dance of Life*, and *The Three Tours of Doctor Syntax*, each of which has added illustrations by Thomas Rowlandson. Renshaw also owned Ackermann's *Microcosm of London*, with 103 coloured plates by Thomas Rowlandson and Augustus W. N. Pugin, which provides evidence of Renshaw's fondness for owning well-known publications with illustrations. The growth of this interest can also be followed through the steadily increasing volume of illustrations of standard literary classics.⁶² An example of this is an edition of Shakespeare published with illustrations in 1740; similarly, Renshaw owned William Shakespeare's *Comedies, Histories and Tragedies* from 1601 and the note in the catalogue reads "Published according to the true Originall Copies."⁶³ Renshaw's collection of illustrated books helps readers to understand why he owned and extra-illustrated a copy of Ruskin's *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*.

⁶⁰Wark, *The Gentle Pastime*, 152.

⁶¹Ibid.

⁶²Ibid.

⁶³S. C. Hodgson, *Hodgson and Co. Sale Catalogues 1956-57* (London: Messrs. Hodgson and Co., 1956).

The impulse to collect and extra-illustrate books went hand-in-hand during the nineteenth century. There was a developing interest in owning luxurious editions, for both their material qualities and for their reading pleasure. According to Wark, this tradition can be traced back to 1780, when extra-illustrating first became popular in Great Britain.⁶⁴ An English clergyman named James Granger wrote a book entitled *A Biographical History of England, from Egbert the Great to the Revolution, 1688*.⁶⁵ Granger's name is often associated with the practice of extra-illustrating. Indeed, the verb 'grangerize' indicates illustrating an already printed book with engravings and prints obtained elsewhere, often by removing them from other books.⁶⁶ In the preface to his publication, Granger notes that books should include engraved portraits of distinguished writers. He says, "such a collection will delight the eye, recreate the mind, impress the imagination, fix the memory, and thereby yield no small assistance to the judgement."⁶⁷ Wark addresses the fact that Granger "was providing a guide for the acquisition and ordering of a collection of portrait prints that would be physically independent from the book."⁶⁸ Granger formed a large collection of portrait prints for himself upwards of fourteen-thousand, according to the title page of the auction catalogue of his sale, held in April 1778 but he kept them as separate sheets, not mounted in books.⁶⁹ According to Wark, Richard Bull, a friend and contemporary of Granger, extra-illustrated *A Biographical History of England* to include the engraved portraits.⁷⁰ Maurice Robert and Frederic Warde provide another, more cynical, perspective on the role of the bibliomaniac in relation to extra-illustrating. They claim that,

⁶⁴Wark, *The Gentle Pastime*, 153.

⁶⁵Ibid.

⁶⁶Neufeldt and Guralnik, *Webster's New World Dictionary*.

⁶⁷Wark, *The Gentle Pastime*, 154.

⁶⁸Ibid., 153.

⁶⁹Ibid., 154.

⁷⁰Ibid.

The bibliomaniac is responsible for the cramming and bloating of books in an excess of zeal which, of old, transformed the most splendid works into compendia of documents, card-index files, and albums of autographed scribbled that had only the remotest relation to the text. He is responsible too, for books with pages uncut, as though by remaining unread they should not proclaim their insignificance.⁷¹

A Monograph on Privately-Illustrated Books: A Plea for Bibliomania by Daniel Tredwell whose paper was read in 1880 to the Rembrandt Club of Brooklyn, New York, presents an interesting account on the experience of 'privately illustrating books', or extra-illustrating them. He says that "there is a natural egotism or self-glorification in the relation of one's own achievements, even when so modestly told."⁷² Here, Tredwell is referring to his own masculine egotism and self-glorification of compiling books. Tredwell collected and extra-illustrated books, just as Renshaw did, Tredwell's monograph explains of the broader practice of extra-illustrating among gentlemen during the nineteenth century. He enthusiastically says, "Nearly forty years ago, I began amusing myself with books by adding an occasional print. Private illustrating was almost an unknown passion in this country at that time."⁷³ Privately illustrating a book comprises inserting prints which do not belong to the original book, but which are pertinent to the subject of the book. According to Tredwell, "Sometimes the pictures for the pages atone, And the text is saved by beauties not its own."⁷⁴ This pastime is unlike our current tendency to treat photographic albums or scrapbooks as repositories for printed ephemera and photographs; bibliophiles from this period would have been aware of the practice of dismembering a book in order to add their own illustrations. Other collectors' experiences of extra-illustrating illuminates this tradition. Thomas Turner of Gloucester for example, extra-illustrated

⁷¹Maurice Robert and Frederic Warde, *A Code for the Collector of Beautiful Books* (New York: The Limited Editions Club, 1936), 6.

⁷²Daniel M. Tredwell, *A Monograph on Privately-Illustrated Books: A Plea for Bibliomania* (Brooklyn: Fred. Tredwell, 9 Boerum Place, 1881), 2-3.

⁷³*Ibid.*, 11.

⁷⁴*Ibid.*

an 1802 edition of Shakespeare in 1835 by binding each volume in green morocco and impressing his coat of arms in gold on the cover.⁷⁵

However, this caused considerable controversy; for critics of this practice believed that it encouraged the dismemberment of many old books that happened to contain portrait engravings, especially because of the rapid rise in the price of these prints.⁷⁶ Tredwell encountered a similar response, claiming that:

There are one hundred and forty-seven prints inserted in the text of this book, which is only a common octavo... It is now very rare. Few persons in this room have ever seen it. But, however great the folly in destroying so valuable a book for so insignificant a one, the knowledge incidentally acquired while engaged upon it was most thorough... compensation for the mischief otherwise done.⁷⁷

Renshaw's insertion of prints and photographs for Ruskin's *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* would have been equally controversial. As discussed in Chapter One of this thesis, Ruskin responded to the selling of 'pirated' editions of his books by refusing to have any other editions besides his own in circulation.⁷⁸ Ruskin's publication already included fourteen illustrations, which he says "were not only, every line of them, by my own hand, but also written also by myself, with savage carelessness,... and will, I say, be always hereafter valuable."⁷⁹ However, by the nineteenth century, the problem of dismembering books with valuable prints was corrected by the large number of modern London print dealers who reproduced old prints, paintings, and drawings specifically to meet the needs of extra-illustrators.⁸⁰ *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* fits into the tradition of extra-illustrating, despite the fact that this was the only book by Ruskin that was featured in Renshaw's library,

⁷⁵Wark, *The Gentle Pastime*, 160.

⁷⁶Ibid., 161.

⁷⁷Tredwell, *A Monograph on Privately-Illustrated Books*, 12.

⁷⁸William Abercrombie, "Pall Mall Gazette," in *John Ruskin* Vol. 2. (1883).

⁷⁹Ruari McLean, *Victorian Book Design and Colour Printing* (London: Faber & Faber, 1972), 116.

⁸⁰Wark, *The Gentle Pastime*, 160-161.

examining other collectors' interest in Ruskin will provide insight into readership during the nineteenth century.

The Abercrombie Archive at the Ruskin Library provides a perspective on another collector, William Abercrombie (1838-1908), a dedicated Ruskinian. This archive includes extra-illustrated books unlike those Renshaw compiled. Abercrombie's collection includes three bound volumes titled 'John Ruskin,' with cuttings, letters, photographs, and ephemera, which all relate to Ruskin.⁸¹ The newspaper clippings that Abercrombie collected comprise significant articles on Ruskin's life, some of which were featured in the *Pall Mall Gazette*. An article of an interview with George Allen, Ruskin's publisher, on "The Educational Value of Art," is particularly significant because it relates Renshaw's extra-illustration of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* to Ruskin's social and artistic critique.⁸² An article from *The Weekly Chronicle* written regarding Ruskin's letters on art from *Modern Painters* is based on an original paper for the National Association for the Promotion of Social Science, on 'Education in Art.' It provides another perspective on the refinement of taste and education in art during that period. There is a connection between Renshaw's ownership of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* and Ruskin's opinions about educated British manhood. I will briefly analyze how Renshaw's extra-illustration of Ruskin's books reflect his principles.

Art Education

In his letters on "Art Criticism and Art Education: 'Modern Painters'; a Reply" from *The Weekly Chronicle*, Ruskin responds to the editor about the importance of knowledge in art. Ruskin's argument, that "the work of man both of knowledge and feeling are of importance to art," suggests that the books that Renshaw extra-

⁸¹Abercrombie, *John Ruskin*.

⁸²*Ibid.*

illustrated reflect his status as an educated, upper-class gentleman and that he had knowledge of art.⁸³ Ruskin discusses how the public judges art by first asking “who does the public include?” By addressing a separate public for every picture and every book, he distinguishes between a public that possesses knowledge of art and a public that does not.⁸⁴ Ruskin maintains that only people who are intellectually trained are able to appreciate and have enlightened views about art. According to Ruskin, the debate is “whether there can really be great Art which has no influence whatsoever on the multitude, and is appreciable only by the initiated few.”⁸⁵ Ruskin specifically refers to Joseph Mallord William Turner, whose works were rejected by critics who Ruskin felt were unqualified to denounce his work.⁸⁶ Ruskin’s opinions about art education sheds light on Renshaw’s pastime of extra-illustrating *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*. Ruskin’s reflection on the cultivation of taste in art is shown in his response to Rev. Osborne Gordon:

You ask me if the cultivation of taste be the proper ‘ergon’ of a man’s life.. Your expression- cultivation of taste- is too vague in two ways;- it does not note the differences between cultivation of one’s own taste- and of other people’s; and it leaves open to various interpretations that most vague of all words- taste- which means, in some people’s mouths, the faculty of knowing a Claude from a copy, and, in others, the passionate love of all the works of God.⁸⁷

Ruskin considers the future direction in art studies for youth. He states that “they should use the practical power of drawing,” applying precision, taste, and “critical power by contemplating works of art in their own judgement.”⁸⁸ In addition, the student’s study of the history of art should use “a more archaeological range,

⁸³ John Ruskin, “Art Criticism and Art Education: ‘Modern Painters;’ a Reply,” in *Arrows of the Chace: Being a Collection of Scattered Letters Published Chiefly in the Daily Newspapers, -1840-1880* Vol. 1. (Sunnyside, Orpington, Kent: George Allen, 1880), 15.

⁸⁴ *Ibid.*, 21.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 19-20.

⁸⁶ *Ibid.*, 23.

⁸⁷ Edgar T. Cook, *The Life of John Ruskin* Vol. 1, (London: George Allen & Company, Ltd., 1911), 155.

⁸⁸ Ruskin, “Art Criticism and Art Education”, 40.

because every day renders the destruction of historical memorials more complete in Europe owing to the total want of interest in them felt by its upper and middle classes.”⁸⁹ Finally, Ruskin proposes the practical application of the study of design to manufacturing. These suggestions for a valuable art education, especially regarding the student’s study of the history of art in the nineteenth century, relate to Renshaw’s selection of historical architectural and sculptural monuments represented in prints and photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*. Ruskin’s critique of the educated individual reflects some of the moral and class values of the Victorian and early Edwardian periods, and provides insight about Renshaw’s identity as a collector. Ruskin believed that “good first-class men” were those who had learned a range of subjects and had proficiency in English, Greek, and Italian literature as well as English and French History and Archaeology.⁹⁰ The promotion of literature at this time was met by the national sentiment or belief in “Englishness,” of English literature and book ownership. Ruskin encouraged reading and owning a private library, as he believed that it “advanced knowledge and the possession of power over the ill-guided and illiterate.”⁹¹ Gerard Curtis argues in *Visual Words: Art and the Material Book*, that Ruskin ennobled the ownership of books, and believed that every young man should set out to collect books as soon as possible.⁹² Renshaw’s books, therefore, reflect his cultural milieu and represent the educational value of displaying pictures in a book as reference. On the other hand, pictures inserted in the books may have been used as learning tools to connect Ruskin’s principles in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* to places Renshaw visited throughout Europe and the Near East.

⁸⁹Ruskin, “*Art Criticism and Art Education*”, 41.

⁹⁰*Ibid.*, 47.

⁹¹Gerard Curtis, *Visual Words: Art and the Material Book in Victorian England* (Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2002), 217.

⁹²*Ibid.*

The Photographically-Illustrated Book and Travel

The number of lithographs compared to photographs in Renshaw's extra-illustrated edition of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* reflects the circulation, production, and exchange of photographs during the late nineteenth century. The development of photography transformed the system of illustrating books; during Renshaw's lifetime, there were various opinions on the value of photographs as art and their compatibility with other illustrations. Daniel Tredwell's discourse on privately-illustrating books will frame my discussion on the context of photographically-illustrated books. Tredwell points out that there was a strong prejudice against photographs among illustrators. He says that "they certainly are not the most desirable illustrations for books for their liability to fade; secondly, they are not works of art."⁹³ Tredwell's argument about the fading of photographs is associated with the fear of both albumen and salted paper prints fading and relates to the photograph's material qualities. These debates inform us how photography entered into the tradition of extra-illustrating and how it became accepted as an art form. It is also possible that there was a common fear that associated the chemical fading of the photographic image with the vanishing of memory and knowledge. Tredwell believed that when faithful representation is the object to be obtained, the photograph becomes invaluable.⁹⁴ While Renshaw treated the photographs as precious objects to be placed in his books, he would have also been aware of their ephemeral character. The material forms of photographs, as Edwards and Hart have argued, "have exceeded a direct indexical visual use, and created literally and metaphorically another dimension to the image."⁹⁵

François Brunet has also discussed the importance of the photographically-illustrated book as a material object. He argues that "there was a paradox between the asso-

⁹³Tredwell, *A Monograph on Privately-Illustrated Books*, 15-16.

⁹⁴*Ibid.*, 16.

⁹⁵Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 5.

ciation of photography and paper, geared towards making photographs compatible with the space and economy of books and more generally printed material.”⁹⁶ The association of photography with the book suggests the importance of the materiality of photographs. This factor, Brunet argues, is one that “needs to be considered in order to understand more generally why so much of the nineteenth century photographic practice tended to treat photographs as objects.”⁹⁷ In *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* for example, the ‘tipping in’ process opens up the possibility of adding personal illustrations to private memoirs intended for restricted circulation.⁹⁸ Renshaw’s *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, is an example of the changes that took place in book illustration with the introduction of photo-mechanical reproduction.

The title page of Renshaw’s edition includes the name of the publisher and the printing house: Chiswick Press: Charles Wittingham, Took’s Court, Chancery Lane. Charles Wittingham was renowned for his excellence in printing and the association of Wittingham and the publisher William Pickering resulted in books which neither could have produced alone, books which are among the greatest of British book design.⁹⁹ Renshaw could have had the books bound at this printing house or had a separate bookbinder compile the books for him. Photographically-illustrated books of this type were popular during the Victorian era; volumes such as James Robertson’s *Photographic Views of Constantinople* (1853) and *Photographic Views of the Antiquities of Athens, Corinth, Aegina* (1854) were collected widely.¹⁰⁰ Lon-

⁹⁶Francois Brunet, “Photographic Practices,” in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 1090.

⁹⁷*Ibid.*

⁹⁸Heinz K. Henisch and Bridget A. Henisch, “The Photographically Illustrated Book,” in *The Photographic Experience 1839-1914: Images and Attitudes* (Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1994), 318.

⁹⁹McLean, *Victorian Book Design*, 5.

¹⁰⁰John Hannavy, “Books Illustrated with Photographs: 1850’s,” in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 188.

don publisher Charles Whittingham produced a similar volume for the members of the Photographic Club in 1857, including work by such figures as Francis Bedford, William Lake Price, and Hugh Diamond.¹⁰¹ The photographically-illustrated books sold by the firm Bernhard Tauchnitz of Leipzig were made up of pages from earlier printed but unsold editions, to which empty pages for photographs had been added before rebinding. The same process would have been used to create Renshaw's books.

During the nineteenth century, most books with photographs would have been available in significant editions to be sold to the public; however, little distinction was made between the books with texts and those with captions.¹⁰² *Excursions daguerriennes* (1839), published by Nicolas-Marie Paymal Lerebours, was one of the earliest albums containing reproductions based on daguerreotypes. This volume included views of celebrated monuments in Egypt, Nubia, Palestine, and Syria, as well as Greece, Spain, Italy, France and other countries in Europe.¹⁰³ The photographically-illustrated book evolved from hand-made and hand-captioned single-copy photographic albums to publications including photographic prints or, more commonly, photo-lithographs.¹⁰⁴

A considerable number of books containing single tipped-in photographs offered alternatives to old methods of illustrating books with engravings. "Photographic illustrations enriched such books on landscape and history, and their value for scientific, technical, and art-historical studies was soon recognized, if not actually from the beginning."¹⁰⁵ The pasted-in albumen and salted paper prints in Renshaw's books depict architectural views, representing several tourist sites in Europe and the Near

¹⁰¹Hannavy, *Books Illustrated*, 188.

¹⁰²Richard Pare and Phyllis Lambert, *Photography and Architecture: 1839-1939* (Montreal: The MIT Press, 1985), 13. "So great a sense of veracity is imparted by a successful daguerreotype that it is understandable why a small number of men persevered in their efforts to bring back images of far-off places..."

¹⁰³Ibid., 13.

¹⁰⁴Brunet, *"Photographic Practices"*, 1090.

¹⁰⁵Henisch and Henisch, *"The Photographically Illustrated Book"*, 321.

East. During the nineteenth century, the British often linked their nation to antiquity, suggesting that Renshaw collected photographs to reflect his interest in historical buildings and monuments of places that he travelled. During the first fifty years of the century, a large public appreciated painted panoramas and, later, dioramas, which presented illusions of the monumental sacred past.¹⁰⁶ Photography's daguerreotype process was commonly used to record the Grand Tour, where photographers were dispatched to photograph the Mediterranean, Italy, Spain, and Egypt. These photographers acted both as artists and as entrepreneurs, making sure that their photographic prints would rival those of lithographers and aquatint engravers; they marketed their work for the tourist trade, often through London print dealers.¹⁰⁷

In "Retracing the Outlines of Rome: Intertextuality and Imaginative Geographies in Nineteenth-Century Photographs" Maria Antonella Pelizzari discusses how nineteenth-century travellers to Italy sought to bring back personal records of their visits.¹⁰⁸ Amateur photographer Charles Scrase Spencer Dickins was a gentleman-tourist who kept written annotations to capture the immediacy of his experience. *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* also resembles a guidebook or personal record of travels made throughout Europe and the Near East. During the early-nineteenth century, British photographers and travellers such as William Henry Fox Talbot used photography and technologies associated with photography's pre-history including the camera lucida, as a medium for recording views. Pelizzari, therefore, argues that "the distance between home and abroad, in addition to the lack of drawing skills and speed in recording an interesting scene were the factors involved in his use

¹⁰⁶Mark Haworth-Booth, *The Golden Age of British Photography, 1839-1900* (New York: Aperture, 1987), 82.

¹⁰⁷Ibid.

¹⁰⁸Maria A. Pelizzari, "Retracing the Outlines of Rome: Intertextuality and Imaginative Geographies in Nineteenth-Century Photographs," in *Picturing Place: Photography and the Geographical Imagination*, Ed, Joan M. Schwartz and James R. Ryan (London and New York: I.B. Tauris, 2003), 55.

of photography.”¹⁰⁹ Renshaw (like Talbot, Dickins, and other gentlemen travellers) possibly participated in the Grand Tour. As Pelizzari states, “Dickins followed the well-worn path of many British travellers on the Grand Tour,... his journey, like his photography, was at the cusp between the aristocratic tour and the massive flow of tourism in Italy.”¹¹⁰ This historical phenomenon situates Renshaw’s selection of pictures in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* within his personal recollections of places that he visited, revealing the relationship between Ruskin’s written text and the photographs.

From the eighteenth century onwards, increasing numbers of British gentlemen travelled abroad for pleasure.¹¹¹ Typically they undertook a trip to Paris, and a tour of Italian cities including Venice and Rome. As Jeremy Black argues in *The British and the Grand Tour*, “Of the few that went further to Italy, those who went on the Grand Tour were interested in classical architecture and archaeology.”¹¹² Although no written evidence proves that Renshaw went on a Grand Tour, I speculate that his collection of photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* represents the facts of his experience on the Grand Tour and encloses common architectural views that other travellers like Dickins used to illustrate their accounts. I believe that Renshaw toured Europe and the Near East during the late-nineteenth century, beginning in London, (as shown with the photograph of Kirkstall Abbey) and travelling to the Near East (visiting Cairo, Palestine, Istanbul, and Jerusalem). In Europe he likely travelled through France, visiting the church of Saint Riquier, Rouen Cathedral, the Cathedral of Abbeville, Strasbourg Cathedral, Rheims Cathedral, the Cathedral of Notre Dame and Chartres Cathedral, as well as Belgium’s Ypres Cathedral (also

¹⁰⁹Pelizzari, *Retracing the Outlines of Rome*, 56.

¹¹⁰*Ibid.*, 59.

¹¹¹Jeremy Black, *The British and The Grand Tour* (London: Croom Helm, 1985), 1.

¹¹²*Ibid.*, 23. Contemporary and historical writing about the Grand Tour are extensive. A thorough discussion is, unfortunately, beyond the scope of the present study..

known as Cloth Hall). He also likely travelled to Venice and Rome in Italy, revealing his interest in the Palazzi of Venice that Ruskin commended during his own travels to Venice.

Although the arrangement of photographs in the three volumes is not consistent with the usual pattern of travel, I argue that Renshaw used Ruskin's book both to help organize his own experiences, and in some instances to illustrate Ruskin's text. Perhaps he was inspired by other books that he collected, like William Combe's *The Three Tours of Doctor Syntax* and Thomas F. Dibdin's *A Bibliographical, Antiquarian and Picturesque Tour in France and Germany*. Travelling through Europe and the Near East would have contributed to Renshaw's sense of achievement and cultivation as a gentleman. Photographs displayed in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* would have given Renshaw the opportunity to share these experiences and travels with his social circle, enlightening others with his knowledge and wealth.

In *On Longing: Narratives of the Miniature, the Gigantic, the Souvenir, the Collection* Susan Stewart discusses the relationship that individuals have to objects and the difference between the collection and the souvenir. She argues that "the space of the souvenir is the body (talisman), the periphery (memory), or the contradiction of private display (reverie), the space of the collection is a complex interplay of exposure, hiding, organization and the chaos of infinity."¹¹³ Stewart's analysis informs my discussion of the difference between Renshaw's photographs in his illustrated volumes as souvenirs that authenticate an experience through their connection to an originary experience. Whereas the collection of photographs and prints, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* represent "a hermetic world and the chaos of infinity in which the past replaces origin with classification."¹¹⁴ She argues that the "souvenir

¹¹³Susan Stewart, *On Longing: Narratives of the Miniature, the Gigantic, the Souvenir, the Collection* (Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1993), 139.

¹¹⁴*Ibid.*

is mapped against the life history of an individual.”¹¹⁵ Renshaw’s photographically-illustrated books show that he planned and organized photographs, lithographs and watercolours, and their placement in the volumes reflect the process of buying and exchanging them, so that each picture is “in effect a genealogy.”¹¹⁶ It is possible that Renshaw bought the photographs and prints as souvenirs, or personal mementos of travel experiences. Stewart says, “The point of the souvenir may be remembering, or at least the invention of memory; the point of the collection is forgetting- starting again in such a way that a finite number of elements create, by virtue of their combination, an infinite reverie. The question is what is inside?”¹¹⁷ Stewart refers to the scrapbook as a souvenir rather than a collection because “the whole dissolves into parts, each of which refers metonymically to a context of origin and acquisition.”¹¹⁸

By extra-illustrating John Ruskin’s *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, Renshaw engages directly with Ruskin’s writings. This chapter has analyzed how Renshaw’s collecting practices and extra-illustrating reflect his status as a gentleman. I have further argued that while Renshaw felt inspired by both Ruskin’s architectural critique and by the moral nature of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, these books were perhaps also used as a strategy for collecting works of art, for reflecting on travel, and as a way of establishing order. Ultimately, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* is a reflection of Renshaw’s status and identity. The volumes provide a glimpse of the phenomenon of illustrating books, the nature of readership, a variety of aesthetic, social, economic and educational developments, as well as matters of taste.¹¹⁹ By acknowledging that during this period cultural ideologies of imperialism were associated with gender and class during this period, the importance of Renshaw’s pastime

¹¹⁵Stewart, *On Longing*, 139.

¹¹⁶Ibid., 136.

¹¹⁷Ibid., 152.

¹¹⁸Ibid.

¹¹⁹Goldman, *Victorian Illustrated Books*, 12.

is reinforced. As Belk and Wallendorf argue, a collection can be used both to reconstruct real life, and to fill in what is missing from real life with worldly images that are closely associated with mythic images.¹²⁰ The pastime of extra-illustrating books and ideologies of gender demonstrated by the process of collecting have been discussed in this chapter. Further examination of what the photographs of the Near East reveal about British Imperialism and Orientalism will be discussed in the following chapter.

¹²⁰Belk and Wallendorf, *“Of Mice and Men”*, 247.

Chapter 3: Aesthetics and ‘Orientalism’: Photographs of the Near East

In an 1850 article from *Humphrey's Journal*, entitled “Photography as a Medium of Illustration,” Dr. Heinrich Mayer discusses how photographs are used to embellish a text, replacing lithographic prints and engravings. According to Mayer, “the photographic tourist is now endowed with means of bringing home, in a short lapse of time, the richest stores of landscape...instaneous pictures furnish us with objects in motion, preserving the memory in inimitable truth.”¹ Photography’s apparent ability to record reality inspired many tourists, artists, and amateurs to explore and record the British Empire. Renshaw’s extra-illustrated edition of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* is further evidence of the developing art market and consumption of photographs during the late Victorian and early Edwardian periods. Following Edwards and Hart, I argue that material characteristics impact the way we ‘read’ photographs through the way in which “they are made, used, kept, and stored for specific reasons... because viewing implies one or several physical interactions.”² Using their approach of material culture, I will discuss the arrangement and function of photographs in Renshaw’s extra-illustrated volumes.

The sequence of photographs by James Robertson, Felice Beato, Francis Frith, Maxime Du Camp, and Félix Teynard of the Near East in Volume One of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* will be used as a case study of the Western imperialist impulse to record and photograph the Near East. My discussion in this chapter will draw on Said’s seminal theorization of ‘Orientalism’, illuminating the social and historic significance of Renshaw’s illustrated volume. Photographs of the Near East were intended for classifying the ‘Orient,’ thus providing evidence of Colonial control.

¹Dr. Heinrich Mayer, “Photography as a Medium of Illustration,” *Humphrey's Journal of Photography and the Allied Arts and Sciences*, 1 (1850), no. 1, 294.

²Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories: On the Materiality of Images* (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 2.

Scholarship by James R. Ryan, Kathleen Stewart Howe, and Douglas Nickel will provide important models for understanding the historic and ideological context of these photographs.

My objective in this chapter is to develop an understanding of specific photographs of the 'Orient' and to investigate how their materiality relates to current trends and theories about the mass-production of art. Ultimately, I will show how the accumulation, distribution, and preservation of photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* relates to Ruskin's ideas on *The Political Economy of Art*.

Orientalism

Said's 1978 *Orientalism* is a seminal post-colonial studies text. As such, it also offers invaluable insights into the study of photographs of the Middle East. Said's notion of "Orientalism" is based on the premise that the 'Orient' was a "creation of the West" and a means for Europeans to differentiate themselves from the Oriental "Other."³ Said further argues that "the choice of 'Oriental' was canonical... it had been employed by Chaucer and Mandeville, by Shakespeare, Dryden, Pope and Byron and designated Asia or the East, geographically, morally, culturally."⁴ For mid-nineteenth century Europeans, the 'Orient' comprised the Near, Middle and Far East, which had been "considered since antiquity a place of romance, exotic beings, haunting memories and landscapes, remarkable experiences."⁵ Literature describing the 'Orient' helped facilitate the ideology of the Eastern exotic landscape, and its political and historical importance to the West. More generally, Said argues,

Orientalism can be discussed and analyzed as the corporate institution for dealing with the Orient- dealing with it by making statements about it, authorizing

³Edward Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1978), 1.

⁴Ibid., 31.

⁵Ibid., 1.

views of it, describing it, by teaching it, settling it, ruling over it: in short, Orientalism as a Western style for dominating, restructuring, and having authority over the Orient.⁶

Shaping both aesthetic and academic thought, 'Orientalism' acted as a middle ground between the 'imaginary' and the 'real', granting Westerners the experience of the Orient- whether by means of literature, art or travel. Indeed, travel literature animated the imaginary East. As Nickel describes, "...it allowed the writer the opportunity to distill from it aspects that, when purified of superfluous actuality, could be preserved and offered up again to his armchair counterpart as authentication of an ideal encounter of the place."⁷

Linda Nochlin in "The Imaginary Orient" applies Said's literary theorization of 'Orientalism' to visual culture, arguing that 'Orientalist' paintings need to be understood in terms of political domination and imperial ideology.⁸ Nochlin maintains that paintings of the 'Orient' by artists like Jean-Léon Gérôme featured in an 1982 exhibition "Orientalism: The Near East in French Painting 1800-1880," should be re-evaluated as "part of the vast control mechanism of colonialism, designed to justify and perpetuate European dominance."⁹ Orientalist paintings and photographs during the mid-nineteenth century evoke the "absence" described by Nochlin as an element of the "picturesque."¹⁰ She says the "Oriental world is a world without change, a world of timeless, atemporal customs and rituals...Yet these were in fact years of violent and conspicuous change in the Near East as well."¹¹ Likewise, the photographs of the 'Orient' in Renshaw's illustrated volume depict this 'absence' or 'picturesque' characteristic, as visual evidence of the 'Orientalist' ideology. *The Seven*

⁶Said, *Orientalism*, 3.

⁷Douglas R. Nickel, *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine: A Victorian Photographer Abroad* (New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2004), 147.

⁸Linda Nochlin, "The Imaginary Orient," in *The Politics of Vision: Essays on Nineteenth-Century Art and Society* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Westview Press, 1991), 34.

⁹Ibid.

¹⁰Ibid., 36.

¹¹Ibid.

Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated is an example of a collector's fascination with the 'Orient': how it was depicted in photographs, collected and classified.

Out of twenty photographs inserted in the first volume of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, twelve are albumen and salted paper prints depicting Egypt, Palestine, Jerusalem, and Constantinople. Renshaw's selection of these photographs reflects his Western interest in classifying and collecting things associated with the Near East. According to Ryan, "the invention of photography concurred with the expansion of Britain's overseas Empire."¹² As part of the Manchester Regiment, Renshaw would have participated quite directly in the promotion in the British Empire. Ryan argues that "imperialism involved not only territorial acquisition, political ambition and economic interests but also cultural formations, attitudes, beliefs and practices," which relates to Renshaw's attraction to the 'Orient' and belief in Britain's ostensible racial superiority. Ryan draws on Said's argument to explain the significance of photographs taken by Europeans when he says, "photography- with its detail, ubiquity and currency... played a significant role within the construction of the imaginative geography of Empire."¹³ Photographs depicting the Near East are, therefore, linked to the consumption, distribution and preservation of popular British imperial interests.

As a British collector, Renshaw accumulated prints by commercial photographers whose views of the East both shaped and reflected the Western interest in the geography, history, and culture of 'the Orient.' His collection expresses both his status in society and his personal political views. One great observation as Said points out is that "men make their own history, that what they can know is what they have made, and extend it to geography: as both geographical and cultural entities...are man-

¹²James R. Ryan, *Picturing Empire Photography and the Visualization of the British Empire* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1997), 11.

¹³Ibid., 25-26.

made.”¹⁴ According to this theory, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* offers a glimpse of the cultural construction and distinction between the ‘Orient’ and the ‘Occident.’¹⁵ The British occupation of Egypt, therefore, meant cultural and military supremacy and knowledge of Orientals, their race, character, culture, history, traditions, society and possibilities.¹⁶ Said quotes a speech by Arthur James Balfour in 1910, made to the House of Commons in Great Britain. He says, “We know the civilization of Egypt better than we know the civilization of any other country. We know it further back; we know it more intimately; we know more about it.”¹⁷ This imperial concept, according to Said, defines the English sensibility towards Egypt, because the noun “we” means “the English, a distinguished, powerful man who feels himself to be representative of all that is best in his nation’s history.”¹⁸

Renshaw’s status as Captain in the Manchester Regiment’s Volunteer Corps and his involvement in Britain’s military campaign in the Second Boer War of 1899-1902 relate to Said’s discussion of the distinguished man, whose civilizing mission in the East was about “domination.”¹⁹ Said stresses the fact that “Egypt was not just another colony: it was the vindication of Western imperialism...it was to become the triumph of English knowledge and power.”²⁰ Britain’s colonizing mission in Egypt reaffirmed the Western relationship to the East, which assumed that the West had a right to dominate the East by occupying land. Renshaw would have interpreted the Orient through both visual images and literature about travel to the Near East.

The motivation to include photographs of Cairo by Robertson, Beato, Frith, Du Camp and Teynard, followed by engravings and lithographs of Christian subjects,

¹⁴Said, *Orientalism*, 4-5.

¹⁵*Ibid.*, 5.

¹⁶*Ibid.*, 38.

¹⁷*Ibid.*, 32.

¹⁸*Ibid.*, 34.

¹⁹*Ibid.*

²⁰*Ibid.*

demonstrates the difference between Christianity and the religion of Islam, perhaps also insisting on Britain's superiority and right both to own and control 'the Holy Land.' Many prints in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* represent biblical narratives. In particular, one lithograph found in the first volume is part of a series that is dispersed throughout all three volumes. The Italian title may be translated as *Emerald of Ravenna Looted by the Patriarch* (Fig.11) by Francesco Maggioto. Its placement amongst photographs of sacred monuments, mosques, and Arabic civilians is particularly significant. As Said argues, Orientalist writing established that "all pilgrimages to the Orient passed through, or had to pass through the Biblical lands; most of them in fact were attempts either to relive or to liberate from the large, incredibly fecund Orient some portion of Judeo-Christian/ Greco Roman actuality."²¹ This can be applied to the photographers whose travels during the nineteenth century were largely based on documenting and classifying 'the Holy Land'. A watercolour tipped into Renshaw's books, depicts Egypt as 'the Holy Land' (Fig.9), illustrating a coastline with soldiers who are dressed in red carrying rifles. It is possible that the artist either witnessed this view or was simply imagining the 'Orient.' This is one of only two watercolours in the three volumes, and its placement among the other photographs of the Near East shows its significance.

Photographs of the Near East

During the nineteenth century many photographers set out to record the 'Orient.' The growing popularity of travelling in unexplored landscapes and amidst unknown cultures appealed to photographers like Du Camp, Teynard, Frith, Robertson and Beato. Their photographs document the Eastern landscape through a Western lens. Appearing in Renshaw's first volume, their photographs will be discussed throughout this chapter in relation to 'Orientalism.' The photographic survey of Cairo, Egypt

²¹Said, *Orientalism*, 168.

by Robertson and Beato in 1857, for example, provides an important visual record of the city's architecture during the reign of Muhammad Ali (1769-1849), who was responsible for overthrowing the Mameluk dynasty in Egypt, destroying all of the Mameluk palaces and monuments that had existed since the thirteenth century.²² During his reign, he modernized Cairo, and aided political and social welfare by developing commerce, agriculture and education.²³ The Mosque of Muhammad Ali became the symbol of the city of Cairo. It was documented by Robertson and Beato during their survey in 1857 (Fig.14).²⁴ Photographers travelling to Cairo during the mid-nineteenth century produced views of mosques, tombs, and residential streets, revealing the current empirical and aesthetic Western view of 'the Orient' as a "material possession, a material imagination."²⁵

One such traveller was James Robertson (1813-1888), a British amateur photographer who was appointed as the Chief Engraver at the Imperial Mint in Constantinople.²⁶ While living in Constantinople, Robertson depicted the region's landscape and architecture for the tourist market. The photographs tipped into *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* are part of a larger series of images that were taken with his brother-in-law, Felice Beato, when they toured the 'Holy Land' together in 1857. Felice Beato (c.1834-1906) was a British photographer who had been born in Italy. He is best known for his war and travel photographs of the Far East, and scholars believe that he learned photography from his brother-in-law James Robertson.²⁷ Both Robertson and Beato's signatures are visible on their prints, which often include a

²²Doris Behrens Abouseif, *Islamic Architecture in Cairo: an Introduction* (Cairo: The American University in Cairo Press, 1996), 168.

²³Ibid.

²⁴Ibid.

²⁵Said, *Orientalism*, 169.

²⁶Bridget A. Henisch and Heinz K. Henisch, "Robertson, James (c.1813-1888)," in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 1201.

²⁷Luke Gartland, "Beato, Felice (c.1834-1906)," in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 128.

description or title of the view from their photographic surveys in Egypt, Jerusalem, Constantinople, and Athens. Robertson's mentorship helped foster Beato's later success as a photographer in India, China, Japan, Korea, the Sudan, and Burma.²⁸ A closer reading of the photographs interleaved in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* will reveal how prints by commercial photographers like Robertson, Beato, and Frith reveal a distinctly 'European' view of 'the Orient.'

The first albumen print by Robertson and Beato in Volume One is the *Mosque of Sultan Qaytbay*, Cairo (Fig.5). Because of this photograph's permanent placement, readers are drawn into the photograph as if they were travelling through the labyrinthine streets in ancient Cairo. The viewer's eyes are drawn to the bottom right-hand corner, where the print is cropped and the architecture crowds the view of the street. The contrast between the light and shade creates a network of rectangular forms which emphasizes the lattice work on the *mashrabiyya* (or windows) that is typical of the architecture in Cairo and extends over the street.²⁹ The photograph helps the viewers to imagine Cairo with its narrow streets, as old, dusty, and strangely abandoned. One can imagine the melodious sound of the wailing *muezzins'* call of prayer drowning out the street noise, but Robertson and Beato's view is uncluttered by inhabitants, save four Arabic men in the distance who draw the viewer's eyes to the towering minaret of the Mosque of Sultan Qaytbay, which looms over the street. The fading chemicals in the photograph and the sun's bleaching of the minaret gives viewers a sense of the atmospheric effects of light on the photograph. Robertson, perhaps informed by his background as an engraver, was especially known for his documentation of sacred buildings and monuments. His photographs show an interest in the camera's ability to render the surface textures of buildings with light and shade.

²⁸Gartland, "*Beato, Felice*", 130.

²⁹Behrens Abouseif, *Islamic Architecture*, 36.

Ruskin's emphasis of the picturesque element of architecture and ruins helped foster a romantic nostalgia for the past which attracted photographers to the charms of the Orient. The picturesque 'Orient' was appealing to tourists, Robertson and Beato's prime clientele. According to Ruskin in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* the picturesque is a "peculiar character which separates the picturesque from the characters of subject,... it is *Parasitical Sublimity*, in brief, one could capture the picturesque, when objects in the picture are suggestive of other forms like mountains or rocks."³⁰ Ruskin points out that elements of the picturesque are visible in pictures that contain "angular and broken lines, vigorous oppositions of light and shadow, and grave, deep, or boldly contrasted colour... that remind us of rocks or mountains, or stormy clouds or waves."³¹ In Robertson and Beato's photograph, the angular forms of the architecture gesture towards the picturesque through the rugged shapes that resemble mountains. The Near East would have attracted amateur photographers, because a great deal of light was needed to form the image. At this time, bright sunlight was required for making photographs, as it allowed for sharp contrast in the rendering of monuments.³² The architecture illustrated in this print dwarfs the Arabic men (Fig.5). Robertson and Beato's choice of composition shows the tendency to isolate the building from contemporary life, with only a few small human figures to provide a sense of scale as "staffage."³³ Colette Boisvert in her M.A. thesis "Contextualizing Staffage in Nineteenth-Century Expeditionary Photography 1858-90," argues that "staffage" was characterized by the "representation of people on a small scale in relation to the whole of the composition."³⁴

³⁰John Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* New ed. (New York: The Noonday Press, 1961), 193.

³¹*Ibid.*, 194.

³²Helmut Gernsheim, *The Rise of Photography, 1850-1880: The Age of Collodion. Vol. 2 of Vol. 2*, (London: Thames and Hudson, 1988), 120.

³³Colette E. Boisvert, *Contextualizing Staffage in Nineteenth-Century Expeditionary Photography 1858-90* Master's thesis, (Carleton University, Ottawa, ON, 2000).

³⁴*Ibid.*, 4.

The photographers' use of people to measure the scale of the architecture is also shown in their photograph of the *Sabil Um Abbas* in Cairo (Fig.13), a public drinking fountain. The French inscription on the photograph, 'fontaine', is next to Robertson and Beato's signatures. This scene depicts four Arabic men, two of whom are leaning against the side of the building while the others are seated on the steps. These men were clearly posed for the picture. With a shutter speed that took longer than fifteen minutes, mid- nineteenth-century cameras were unable to capture detail if the subjects they were photographing were in motion. The design of this public fountain shows the influence of Turkish architectural elements during the reign of Muhammad Ali. Robertson and Beato would have been aware of the fountain's architectural and religious significance, as buildings where the public had access to free water were considered sacred.³⁵ The combination of white marble with wood that was carved, painted, and gilded; the introduction of floral or acanthus-leaf patterns and the elaborate geometric patterns of the iron grill windows would have appealed to tourists and photographers alike.³⁶ This albumen print is twice the size of Robertson and Beato's view of *The Mosque of Sultan Qaytbay* and folds at the inner margin of the book. The building's bleached façade and semi-circular pavilion stand in stark contrast to the figures posed in front of the building. Their darker complexions are more emphasized and their poses make them appear both as lethargic and indifferent to the camera's presence. This photograph is distinct from other views of Cairo by Robertson and Beato because of their inclusion of Arabic people who posed in the foreground of the composition.

This photograph reflects racial typologies according to western notions of the 'Orient.' The photograph calls to mind Said's discussion of the creation of Arabic typologies. He argues that "there resonated the tradition of experience, learning and

³⁵Behrens Abouseif, *Islamic Architecture*, 31.

³⁶Ibid., 33.

education that kept the Oriental-coloured to this position as object studied by the Occidental-white, instead of vice versa.”³⁷ Howe also discusses Western attitudes towards the Near East and its inhabitants during the nineteenth century as seen in photography of the time. She argues that,

Images of Egypt expose preconceptions and values of the people who made and purchased them. Colonial attitudes determined the insistence by late nineteenth-century commercial photographers and their customers that Egyptians were quaintly costumed types (sic) reinforced attitudes of cultural superiority because the photograph was perceived as documenting an objective reality.³⁸

The inclusion of Arabic men in the foreground of this photograph not only indicates that they were used as a means for measuring the scale of the building, but also reveals the perceived cultural superiority of the “Occident-white” over the “Oriental-coloured.”³⁹ As Ryan states “the use of photography as a means of picturing ‘race’ was closely tied to an increasing concern with the accuracy of systems of human classification.”⁴⁰ He refers to *Systema Naturae* (1735), a book which defined human races in taxonomic terms based on certain criteria, including the shape of the head and a person’s skin colour. The British influence in Egypt during the mid-nineteenth century involved establishing military power, introducing administrative reform, and maintaining order over the land. The photographs by Robertson and Beato represent the allure of the ‘Orient’ to the West, as well as the distribution and ownership of pictures of Oriental landscapes and types. Photographic representations of Egypt encouraged more travellers and generated a desire in the market for more pictures catering to collectors and scholars.

Renshaw’s aesthetic interest in the picturesque quality of ruins in the Near East is

³⁷Said, *Orientalism*, 228.

³⁸Kathleen Stewart Howe, *Excursions Along the Nile: The Photographic Discovery of Ancient Egypt* (Santa Barbara: Santa Barbara Museum of Art, 1993), 12.

³⁹Said, *Orientalism*, 253.

⁴⁰Ryan, *Picturing Empire*, 146.

represented in his selection of Teynard's salted paper print of the *Island of Fileh (Philaë) Oriental Colonnade- View of Ruins* (Fig.12). Teynard was one of many travelling photographers during the mid nineteenth century who was particularly interested in the potential of photographs to record monuments and travel experiences. Teynard's photographic survey in 1851 of the 'Orient' produced around one hundred and sixty prints of architectural records along the Nile.⁴¹ These views were published in an 1858 two-volume book titled *Egypte et Nubie* which was subtitled *Sites et Monuments les plus intéressants pour l'étude de l'art et de l'histoire* by Goupil et Cie. These volumes were described as a "photographic atlas." It was based on one of the first photographic expeditions to record views of the 'Orient,' and in this sense photography became an important aspect of empire.⁴²

The effect of salted paper prints is evident in Teynard's photograph, for the paper's chemicals give the picture a grain-like quality. In addition, the deterioration of the paper's chemicals is shown in this particular print, through the visible loss of tonal detail. In this print, Teynard captures the natural destruction of the temple in the form of broken rocks, creating a picturesque effect of light, shade and rough textures. The aesthetic characteristics of ruins relate to Ruskin's concept of the picturesque in which he argues that the picturesque can only be "found...in noble natural objects, woods, rocks, or mountains."⁴³ Consequently, Renshaw's selection of this particular view indicates that he not only collected prints by one of the most well-known photographers of the 'Orient,' but that he also chose prints that reflected his own taste and perception of the Near East.

Alongside these views of the Near East, an untitled and unidentified photograph (Fig.6) shows another street scene in Cairo. The inscription on the bottom-left corner

⁴¹Kathleen Stewart Howe, "Teynard, Félix (1817-1892)," in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 1382.

⁴²*Ibid.*, 1383.

⁴³John Ruskin, *Modern Painters* (Sunnyside, Orpington, Kent: George Allen, 1883), 15.

of the print would have shown the signature of the photographer, but it was cropped to fit the dimensions of the book. The view is almost identical to the photograph of a *Street View of Cairo* (Fig.7) taken by Francis Frith in 1858, featured in both Howe's *Excursions Along the Nile* and in Nickel's *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine*. Although it is unidentified, the photographic print in Renshaw's volume shows similar characteristics to Frith's choice of subject matter, including both the size of his albumen prints and his method of publishing his works specifically for albums and books. Frith's autobiographical account of the modern city of Cairo in *Egypt, Nubia and Ethiopia: Illustrated by One Hundred Stereoscopic Photographs* offers further insight into the nature of Robertson and Beato's photographic excursion. Frith's touring strategy, artistic inspiration and distribution of his views in this publication show similarities to other surveys such as Robertson and Beato's that have been often overlooked. Nickel argues that "the first-hand experience that Frith proposed as an imperative for travel illustration was part of a broader development in Victorian visual culture that made photographic "presence" an artistic ideal."⁴⁴

Applying Jules Prown's stage of speculation to a comparison of the two photographs of street scenes in Cairo (Fig.6,7) they reveal numerous stylistic similarities, including the same subject, the photographer's positioning of the camera, and his use of single-point perspective. Both prints feature a mausoleum in the foreground, which dominates the compositions and whose horizontal pattern of stone masonry directs the viewer's eye towards the crowded residential street in the distance. The size of the untitled print from Renshaw's volume would have matched the *Street view of Cairo* before it was tipped in the book and the format of Frith's albumen prints reveal his tendency to print mammoth photographs. However, the untitled print includes three Arabic men posed beside the mausoleum, whereas the photograph cited by Howe and

⁴⁴Nickel, *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine*, 130.

Nickel does not include human subjects, instead featuring an uninhabited street. Due to the required length of lens exposure, the mid-nineteenth-century camera was unable to capture busy street life, and the faint ghost-like impression visible in the main traffic area of the street suggests that there were in fact people in the photograph. The quality and context of photographs become apparent when recovered from books, albums, or exhibition catalogues because the photograph's materiality changes as it is reconsidered within new contexts. This phenomenon is described in a passage by Howe:

It may be said of some very old places, as of some very old books, that they are destined to be forever new. The nearer we approach them, the more remote they seem; the more we study them, the more we have yet to learn.⁴⁵

During his travels in the 'Orient,' Frith captured views and narrated them in his 1862 photographically-illustrated book, *Egypt, Nubia, and Ethiopia* which is based on Frith's photographic survey of the Near East in 1859-60. It incorporates stereoscopic views with commentary by Rev. Samuel Sharpe and descriptions and illustrations by Joseph Bonomi.⁴⁶ His travels begin in Cairo, before following the river to Denderah, Thebes, Hermonthis, Philae, Biggeh and Nubia, thereby providing insight into the endeavours of other travelling photographers in the Near East.⁴⁷ In Cairo, he photographed Islamic tombs, mosques, and residential streets. Frith refers to the combination of neo-Gothic and Islamic elements in architecture when he writes that "The modern capital of Egypt abounds with beautiful specimens of architecture, which the Italians call 'Saracenic,'⁴⁸ a style that uses elements of the neo-Gothic architecture of the Victorians, combined with Islamic or Indian elements."⁴⁹ Frith

⁴⁵Stewart Howe, *Excursions Along the Nile*, 43.

⁴⁶Nickel, *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine*, 130.

⁴⁷Francis Frith, Joseph Bonomi and Samuel Sharpe, *Egypt, Nubia and Ethiopia: Illustrated by One Hundred Stereoscopic Photographs* (London: Mssrs Negretti and Zambra, 1862), vii.

⁴⁸Ibid., viii.

⁴⁹David Mizan Hashim, "Indian and Mogul influences on Mosques," in *Encyclopedia of Malaysia*

points out that “this beautiful style of architecture seems to have gradually declined, and it is now entirely superseded by the Turkish. All the larger buildings which have been erected at Cairo within these thirty years are in a mawkish style, a mixture of Chinese and Italian, imported from Constantinople.”⁵⁰ Frith believed that the scientific accuracy of photography offered a view of Egypt that was unrivaled by other methods of recording:

Some of our English artists have also published beautiful volumes of the picturesque ruins in this land, most interesting for the draftsman; but we cannot but sometimes fancy that they have sacrificed somewhat of scientific accuracy to artistic effect. But when we look at Photographic views, we are troubled by no such misgivings. Here we have all the truthfulness of nature, all the reality of the objects themselves, and at the same time, artistic effects which leave us nothing to wish for.⁵¹

The concept of recording a view with a camera was associated in Frith’s mind with the ability of photography to capture nature, a concept that was discussed extensively by contemporary writers including Ruskin, who critiqued the medium of photography as an art form. While Frith stressed the advantages of the photographic medium and its potential as a form of art, Ruskin was ambivalent about photography as art.⁵² Ruskin regarded it as a useful tool for rendering detail, but criticized its mechanical nature. Nickel argues that Frith’s photographs captured some of the stylistic and moral characteristics that Ruskin promoted in *Modern Painters*. Nickel emphasizes Ruskin’s idea that “the artist should retain in his delineation of natural scenery a fidelity to the facts of science so rigid as to make his work acceptable and credible to the most sternly critical intellect.”⁵³ Nickel concludes that Frith would

Architecture, Ed, Fee Chen Voon. Vol. 5 (Malaysia: Editions Didier Millet, 1998), In the *Encyclopedia of Malaysia Architecture* “Indian and Mogul influences on Mosques” defines “Saracenic” as architecture derived from the name ‘saracen’ given to Arabs or Muslims and specifically used by the British during the Crusades.

⁵⁰Frith, Bonomi and Sharpe, *Egypt, Nubia and Ethiopia*, viii.

⁵¹Ibid., v.

⁵²Nickel, *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine*, 91.

⁵³Ibid.

have been familiar with Ruskin and was perhaps responding to “a movement toward scientifically objective art that was recognized and promoted by Ruskin.”⁵⁴

In his study, *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine: A Victorian Photographer Abroad*, Nickel discusses the influence of Ruskin as an icon in Victorian society at length. He argues that Ruskin “represents a shorthand for cultural productions and bodies of thought that have since defined what we take to be the central concerns of their time,” and he believes that Frith’s work reflects Ruskin’s social ideologies.⁵⁵ Nickel’s argument is instructive in showing how Renshaw’s collection of pictures was tied to the accumulation of knowledge and to the values of the British Empire. Renshaw’s photographically-illustrated books, like Frith’s *Egypt, Nubia, and Ethiopia*, would have been considered emblematic of social status. Those who subscribed to Frith’s book “were affiliated through a university... and the extensive printed text issued with the photographs assumes a literate audience.”⁵⁶ Nickel’s enquiry into the readership of Frith’s photographs relates to both how Renshaw acquired his photographs and to the significance of Frith’s historical view concerning other travel photographers. Nickel’s statement that “Frith’s photographs spoke to their Victorian audiences in ways that we can never fully recover” reveals the significance of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* as material evidence of how gentlemen-collectors expanded their private libraries to include photographs. Nickel considers Frith’s photographs and writings, in *Egypt, Nubia, and Ethiopia*, as larger parts of the enterprise of “publication, the sources of patronage, and the conditions and reception for his images.”⁵⁷ Photographs of the Near East reveal Renshaw’s imperialist interest in documenting and classifying historical sites in Cairo, Palestine, Constantinople, and Jerusalem through photographs marketed by publishing houses and print deal-

⁵⁴Nickel, *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine*, 91.

⁵⁵Ibid., 15.

⁵⁶Ibid., 75.

⁵⁷Ibid., 16.

ers. *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* displays the impact that the photographic reproduction and dissemination of works of art had on the public during the nineteenth century.

Mechanical Reproduction

Benjamin's essay, "The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction", will inform my analysis of the way that photomechanical prints mediate viewers' experiences of both the 'original' and its reproduction. Benjamin's influential essay will also help show that the photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* reflect a specific period of artistic creation, when depicting a place, monument, or painting was part of the motivation to preserve and imitate real objects and artifacts. Benjamin's argument will help interpret Renshaw's use of photographs in his illustrated volumes, not only as a collection of pictures, but also as evidence of the development of artistic media from engravings and watercolours to lithographs, photogravures, and the photographer's reproduction of the 'Orient.' The development of the photographically-illustrated book reflects a changing method of both viewing art and photomechanical reproduction. Drawings and engravings were traditionally used for documentation; however, the photograph introduced a new level of realism.

The photogravure based on a photograph by Du Camp (Fig.10) calls to mind Benjamin's discussion of "aura" and the translation that occurs between an original and a reproduction. Benjamin argues that "technical reproduction can put the copy of the original into situations which would be out of reach for the original itself...and enable the original to meet the beholder halfway, be it in the form of a photograph or a phonograph record."⁵⁸ Applying the photomechanical process of photogravure to the hieroglyphic relief sculpture on the Grand Temple of Denderah is a perfect example

⁵⁸Walter Benjamin, "Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction," in *Illuminations: Essays and Reflections* (Schocken, 1969), ii.

of what Benjamin considered the photomechanical reproduction of the original work of art.⁵⁹ Unlike the albumen and salted paper prints, the photogravure process is ink-based, using an etching technique similar to aquatint engraving. On this print a translation of the French title and inscription identifies the picture as, “Upper Egypt. Great Temple of Dendera. Rear Façade, Maxime Du Camp, after 1849, published by Gide et Baudry.”⁶⁰ According to John McElhone, Photographs Conservator at the National Gallery of Canada, both this photogravure of the Temple of Dendera and a salted paper print of *Jerusalem* (Fig.20) by Du Camp, are in excellent condition, compared to other salted paper prints in the Photographs Collection, and part of this is the result of being ‘tipped in’ to the volume.⁶¹

Du Camp studied photography with Gustave Le Grey and romanticized the ‘Orient’ as a “site of an extinct culture.”⁶² While travelling to the Near East with Gustave Flaubert in 1849-1851, Du Camp produced the first travel album of its kind, titled *Egypte, Nubie, Palestine et Syrie* composed of over one hundred and twenty-five photographs.⁶³ Du Camp’s photographic record of the Great Temple of Dendera shows Benjamin’s concept that “the technique of reproduction detaches the reproduced object from the domain of tradition.”⁶⁴ Tipping-in photographs or reproductions into a book coincides with the “desire of the public to bring things “closer” spatially and humanly.”⁶⁵ The pleasure of owning books and photomechanical works of art in Renshaw’s private library demonstrates his desire and to collect the architecture of the ‘Orient.’

⁵⁹ Benjamin, *Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction*, ii.

⁶⁰ John Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* (Photographically-Illustrated Book: National Gallery of Canada, 1880).

⁶¹ Cortney L. Murray, *Interview with John McElhone Photographs Conservator at the National Gallery of Canada* (Interview, January 29, 2009).

⁶² Julia Ballerini, “Du Camp, Maxime (1822-1894),” in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 441.

⁶³ Ibid., 442.

⁶⁴ Benjamin, *Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction*, iii.

⁶⁵ Ibid.

Conversely, Benjamin explained that “even the most perfect reproduction of a work of art is lacking in one element: its presence in time and space.”⁶⁶ The unique existence of the work of art includes the changes that occur in physical and chemical deterioration over time, which is ultimately part of its “aura.”⁶⁷ The element that shows its passage through time refers to its “here and now, its unique existence and concepts of authenticity.”⁶⁸ Benjamin’s critique of mechanical reproduction is central to understanding the concepts behind the shift in artistic media and the framework in which the ‘Orient’ was documented and why Renshaw acquired the photographs.

During the mid to late-nineteenth century, the development of photomechanical processes gave publishers the ability to distribute views of the so-called ‘Orient’ by means of subscription and to sell prints serially. Many of the photographs of the Near East appearing in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* were originally mass-produced photographic objects. Each photograph was collected, exchanged, and stored over a period of time. The photographic market gave collectors the opportunity to own individually-bound volumes of photographs. One example of a tipped-in photograph from a published volume of photographs is Teynard’s salted paper print of the *Island of Fileh (Philae) oriental colonnade- view of ruins* (Fig.12). As discussed earlier, inscriptions on the print reveal its original source and where it was reproduced. Identified on the print, the English translation of the French inscription reads, “printed by H. de Fontenay et Cie in 1851, by Félix Teynard, published by Goupil and Cie. in Paris, London, Berlin and New York.” This salted paper print was potentially part of Teynard’s first major book comprising views from his *Voyage en Egypte et en Nubie* with 160 plates, which was sold to an international network of dealers in Paris, London, Berlin, and New York, who distributed one another’s

⁶⁶ Benjamin, *Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction*, ii.

⁶⁷ Ibid.

⁶⁸ Ibid.

paintings, prints and photographs.⁶⁹

The Political Economy of Art in the Photographically-Illustrated book

In a lecture entitled *The Political Economy of Art*, Ruskin examines the modes of preservation and distribution of works of art, and his concepts reflect the current debates of Renshaw's time. The accumulation of photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* and Renshaw's reception of Ruskinian thought are central to understanding the material culture of the books. As Edwards and Hart have argued, "it is through material intervention and the presentational form that people mark their own desires on the machine-produced or mass-produced object of modernity, reasserting the use as author."⁷⁰ The way in which Renshaw collected photographs shows how he valued photomechanical reproduction. Ruskin advocated that one of the outcomes of the political economy of art is "to act more for preservation and less for production," and the presentation of pictures in books represents the motivation to preserve British culture.⁷¹ Ruskin clearly informed Renshaw's thinking in his compilation of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*. Accordingly, the production and distribution of specific photographs in Renshaw's books will help to understand further the materiality of the photographs.

The method of publishing photographs in albums and books enabled collectors like Renshaw to acquire and use these pictures for their privately-illustrated books in order to display their knowledge. As Glenn Willumson has argued, in "the process of choosing, sequencing, organising and captioning photographs for the album, the compiler transforms the meaning of selected images into an intensely individualistic

⁶⁹Pierre Lin Renié, "Goupil & Cie (active 1850-1884)," in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*, Ed, John Hannavy (New York: Routledge, 2007), 601.

⁷⁰Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 14.

⁷¹John Ruskin, *The Political Economy of Art or A Joy Forever and its Price in the Market* (New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1886), 71.

expression.”⁷² Photographers of the ‘Orient’ like Robertson and Beato, Du Camp, Teynard, and Frith were among those who published their views commercially. For example, many of Robertson’s photographs were placed in albums and published in London, and were sold to the Western residents of the city and to travellers.⁷³ In addition, Beato’s photographs were distributed in albums and sold to British officers and soldiers, as well as to commercial publishers in London, who exhibited and sold the prints to the public.⁷⁴ As Luke Gartland notes, “Beato’s photographs of Asia constituted the standard imagery of travel diaries, illustrated newspapers, and other published accounts, and thus they helped shape ‘Western’ notions of several Asian societies.”⁷⁵ The manner in which Robertson, Beato, Frith, Teynard and Du Camp marketed their photographs through publication and commercialization provides insight into the dissemination of photographs at this time, while their incorporation into book form shows how the public responded to this medium and how it became completely individual. In turn, these photographs exemplify ‘Orientalist’ representations of the Near East. Also, the way photographs have been used in Renshaw’s album reflects Willumson’s argument that the personal nature of album “breaks the bond of the materiality of the photograph from its links to commerce and mass production.”⁷⁶

One of Ruskin’s key ideas about the dissemination of art was that it should be affordable to those who want to gain knowledge about art, but that it should not be considered too dear. He believed that there ought to be a balance between enjoying many pictures a little bit and enjoying one picture very much; he suggests that the purchaser “might want to possess the large quantity because quantity elim-

⁷²Glenn Willumson, “Making Meaning: Displaced Materiality in The Library and Art Museum,” in *Photographs Objects Histories On the Materiality of Images*, Ed, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 63.

⁷³Henisch and Henisch, “Robertson, James”, 1201.

⁷⁴Gartland, “Beato, Felice”, 128.

⁷⁵Ibid., 131.

⁷⁶Willumson, *Making Meaning*, 63.

inates the chances of destruction.”⁷⁷ Ruskin considers whether art should be made cheap and available to everyone. His ideas potentially promoted the accumulation and distribution of works of art; whether in public or private collections, lithographs, engravings, and photographs were widely available. Ruskin’s observations about the current destruction of art and architecture provide information about how photography played a role in recording those works of art and architecture that were destined to be destroyed. Ruskin’s aim in advocating the political economy of art is:

To bring great art in some degree within the reach of the multitude; and both, in larger and more numerous galleries than we now possess, and by distribution, according to his wealth and wish, in each man’s home, to render the influence of art somewhat correspondent in extent to that of literature.⁷⁸

The practice of accumulating works of art in Renshaw’s compilation reflects his pastime, his belief in the preservation of engravings, lithographs, and photographs, and his response to the principles of distribution and accumulation. Ruskin associated the success of a nation with its accumulation of literature, art, and history from the past, and with “building itself upon the work of the past.”⁷⁹ The need to preserve art and architecture from destruction was attached to the imperialist impulse of colonialism. Ruskin recommends that instead of “effacing memorials of those they succeeded and subdued, they should guard the spoils of their victories.”⁸⁰ With the prospect of using photography to document the history of the Near East, this collection perhaps constituted Renshaw’s way of reconciling his view of the Empire. Ruskin argues that preservation is a key component of political economy, when he says,

Let us leave the great things, then, and think of little things; not of the destruction of whole provinces in war, which it may not be any business of ours

⁷⁷Ruskin, *The Political Economy of Art*, 51.

⁷⁸*Ibid.*, 53.

⁷⁹*Ibid.*, 56.

⁸⁰*Ibid.*, 57.

to prevent; but of the destruction of poor little pictures in peace, from which it surely would not be much out of our way to save them.⁸¹

Considering the price of Britain's efforts to produce new art, Ruskin believes that above all, "pictures, statues, and wall-patterns already in existence need to be taken common care of, and kept from damp and dust."⁸² Storing old pictures in books was Renshaw's way of preserving art; this practice shows how he treasured them as material objects. In addition, the reproduction of architecture and art through photography was, in Ruskin's opinion, "artistically valueless, but would be historically and documentarily valuable, in the event of the destruction of the original pictures."⁸³

Ruskin advocated the distribution of art through public galleries, but he viewed the private ownership of art "as an important means of study... and also as a means of refining the habits and touching the hearts of the masses of the nation in their domestic life."⁸⁴ As a gentleman and active member in society, Renshaw was considered 'well-read.' His private library and knowledge of art and politics would have reflected what he valued and believed in. Renshaw's extra-illustration of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* corresponds with Ruskin's philosophy about "intellectual property," which includes books, works of art, and objects of natural history. He believed that these all gave a sense of "wealth" and "well-being."⁸⁵ While *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* stores pictures, it also displays Renshaw's interests in both literature and art.

The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated can be compared to Alison Nordstrom's study of William Vaughn Tupper's scrapbooks, as many of the photographs tipped-in to Renshaw's books were perhaps collected from commercial photographers' travel publications. Similarly, Tupper's album includes mass-produced al-

⁸¹Ruskin, *The Political Economy of Art*, 57.

⁸²Ibid., 67.

⁸³Ibid., 70.

⁸⁴Ibid., 96.

⁸⁵Ibid., 120.

bumen prints depicting monuments, street scenes, landscapes, and local costume.⁸⁶ Nineteenth-century travel albums such as Tupper's scrapbooks were commonly used to store photographs and were considered valuable by their owners; the prints would have been treated as material objects. Nordstrom argues that the photographs in Tupper's scrapbook are considered individual paper objects: "an album's pages and images exist in an indissoluble relationship to one another."⁸⁷ Therefore, understanding the way they are sequenced in the book is crucial. Ruskin's publication allowed Renshaw to store and display his interests, and his books were clearly designed as a personal, rather than commercially-produced collection.

Text and Image

The location of the photographs in relation to Ruskin's text has an impact on both the narrative of Renshaw's extra-illustrated volumes and his reading of Ruskin. According to Willumson, "The transformation of the photo-object by an organising system has significant implications for its materiality, its meaning, its social effect and the way such objects have been assessed within the history of photography."⁸⁸ *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* is an example of how nineteenth-century book collectors such as Renshaw viewed literature and illustrations in books as intimately linked. My analysis of the interaction between text and image in Renshaw's books principally draws on W. J. T. Mitchell's argument that "art history must reflect on the relationship of language to visual representation and make the problem of "word image" a central feature of its self-understanding; it ought to be a subject of investigation and analysis, collaboration and dialogue."⁸⁹ While these two modes

⁸⁶Nordstrom Alison, "Making a Journey: The Tupper scrapbooks and the travel they describe," in *Photographs Objects Histories On the Materiality of Images*, Ed, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart (London and New York: Routledge, 2004), 81.

⁸⁷Ibid., 94.

⁸⁸Willumson, *Making Meaning*, 66.

⁸⁹W. J. T. Mitchell, "Word Image," in *Critical Terms for Art History*, Ed, Robert S. Nelson and

of expression are seemingly connected, it is essential to look beyond the resemblance and differences to understand how Renshaw intended to connect the pictures to the text.

Following Edward's and Hart's approach, I inquire into both Renshaw's reception to Ruskin's publication and how he used the book as a medium for acquiring and arranging photographs. By considering the materiality of the photographs and their presentational form, their placement in Renshaw's illustrated volumes make them "socially salient objects, as active and reciprocal rather than simply implications of authority, control and passive consumption."⁹⁰ Renshaw carefully planned his sequence of photographs, prints, and watercolours, as each picture includes Roman numerals and annotations on the back of the prints. The series of photographs by Robertson and Beato, Frith, Teynard, and Du Camp all indicate his departure from Ruskin's narrative in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* and his personal response to the 'Orient.' While Ruskin's text alludes to the possibility of including the principles of architecture of Egypt, he does not refer to Renshaw's selection of photographs, prints, and watercolours in a direct sense. There are checkmarks added to page xii of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture's Preface of the First Edition* where Ruskin states that "I could as fully, though not with the accuracy and certainty derived from personal observation, have illustrated the principles subsequently advanced from the architecture of Egypt, India, or Spain, as from that to which the reader will find his attention chiefly directed, the Italian Romanesque and Gothic."⁹¹ Ruskin's statement is particularly important because here he acknowledges the architecture that he excluded from his publication. Renshaw's extra-illustrated volumes show how he expressed his aesthetic taste through his choice of text and pictures. His inclusion

Richard Shiff 2nd ed. (Chicago & London: The University of Chicago Press, 2003), 53.

⁹⁰Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 15.

⁹¹Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, xii.

of photographs of the Near East also allowed him to expand on and demonstrate his understanding of the principles Ruskin advocated. Perhaps *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* was used as a guidebook, as a repository for his aesthetic and historical interests. Ultimately, the photographs of the Near East portray Renshaw's reception of British imperial exploration and the ideology of 'Orientalism.'

Mitchell's case study of Jacob Riis's "photographic essay" demonstrates the conjunction of photographs and text, in which the text is "invasive."⁹² In Riis's photographic essay, for example, Mitchell argues that the surveillance photographs "resist the text-photo relation... because the photographs may be 'evidence' for propositions quite at odds with the official uses that Riis wants to use them for."⁹³ Mitchell's example in which the textual element dominates the photograph, informs my analysis of the sequence of photographs of the Near East and their arrangement in Ruskin's *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*. The photographs depart from the narrative of the text, while dealing with different cultural, historical and national developments, they alter and expand Ruskin's volume.

The phenomenon of extra-illustrating books in part explains how Renshaw saw the potential to create an entirely new artifact, through a combination of his favourite author and specific works of art that he wanted to preserve. As the arrangement of photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* is completely personal, it is impossible to access fully how Renshaw intended the reader to interpret his collection and indeed, this thesis is more engaged with questions of Renshaw's reception of Ruskin. For instance, in the *Preface to the First Edition of The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, Ruskin expresses his regret over the imperfection of his execution of the plates or illustrations, when he says "the text was written before the illustra-

⁹²W. J.T. Mitchell, *Picture Theory: Essays on Verbal and Visual Representation* (Chicago: University Of Chicago Press, 1995), 285.

⁹³Ibid., 286.

tion of plates could be completed.” He further explains that the plates do not do justice to the sublime and beautiful characteristics of the architecture, when he says “I shall be grateful if the reader will in such cases refer the expressions of praise to the Architecture, and not to the illustration.”⁹⁴ Renshaw seems to have interpreted Ruskin’s statement as an opportunity to illustrate the books and express his own view of architecture.

Photographs of the Near East, such as those by Robertson and Beato, Frith, Du Camp, and Teynard, would have captured the attention and collecting interests of a cultivated gentleman like Renshaw, particularly regarding the customs and history of ‘the Orient.’ *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, demonstrates the motivation to collect, exhibit, organize, and preserve the works of art that were valuable to Renshaw. The arrangement of pictures and text shows how Renshaw intended to narrate *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, and focusing on a specific sequence of photographs depicting ‘the Orient’ helps to identify whether or not the photographs refer to specific passages in Ruskin’s book. As Edwards and Hart describe, there are many layers of narrative in the “processes of intention, making, distributing, consuming, using, discarding and recycling, all of which impact on the way in which photographs as images are understood.”⁹⁵ The addition of photographs to literature ultimately reflects the traditional pastime of extra-illustrating. As Ruskin’s ideas regarding the political economy of art were extremely influential, Renshaw’s response to Ruskin’s concepts of art and architecture are visible in his photographically-illustrated book.

⁹⁴Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, x.

⁹⁵Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 1.

Conclusion

A material-culture perspective is fundamental to understanding the value of photographs as objects in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*. Specifically, this method has allowed me to address how Renshaw's extra-illustration of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* was a means to display his taste in both art and literature, and how the volumes reflect British imperial and aesthetic values during the nineteenth century. In short, the compilation is an expression of the broader link between art and society, following Ruskin's call for art to reflect public taste. The photographically-illustrated books are significant artefacts that provide evidence of the pastime of collecting among gentlemen during the nineteenth century, the influence of Ruskin, and the history of nineteenth-century photographs. This thesis reaffirms the cultural importance of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* by connecting literary theory, post-colonial studies, nineteenth-century photographic history and the aesthetic theories of Ruskin, while crossing the boundaries between art and literature.

In the first chapter of this thesis I applied Jules Prown's methodology of object analysis. With a close reading of the physical properties of the books and photographs, I considered the way the reader engages with the volumes, in effect re-enacting the narrative. The sophistication of the binding and condition of the photographs emphasizes how the photographs were treated as objects: their chemical properties, mount and size all indicate high value. By placing albumen and salted paper prints in the book, for example, they have been preserved from deterioration to a degree. The numbering on the back of the photographs, and skilfull bookbinding technique indicate that Renshaw carefully planned the organization of photographs and prints in the three volumes. Renshaw's extra-illustrated volumes demonstrate his personal response to Ruskin, a close reading of the arrangement of the photographs and prints

show how he intended to illustrate Ruskin's text. For instance, Renshaw responds to Ruskin's description of Rouen cathedral and flamboyant Gothic architecture by including the photograph by the Bisson Frères entitled *Church of Saint Maclou*. This photograph's removal from the volume obscures the original narrative and Renshaw's intention to illustrate the text, it simultaneously demonstrates the importance of photographic materiality.

Research on provenance history has significantly influenced both my study of the album's material history and Renshaw's biography. The sale catalogue of Renshaw's private library shows how the material value of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* has shifted from a personal repository of illustrations to an antique photographic commodity. In turn, the shift in context from Renshaw's private library to a public institution changes the meaning of Renshaw's volumes.¹ When *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* was purchased by the National Gallery of Canada by Borcoman, Renshaw's album was valued for its inclusion of nineteenth-century photographs by celebrated commercial photographers. According to Willumson, "photographs are often confined to the concomitant spaces of the museum collection and exhibition": thus, photographs in the albums are defined in terms of aesthetics, not materiality.² Borcoman's exhibition catalogue *The Photograph as Object* confirms his approach towards photographs as objects, considering photographs as "an artistic process and that of the documentary activity."³ By understanding how Renshaw's album was valued, I have expanded its material history demonstrating that a photograph is not simply a "metaphor of the photographer's experiences" but rather a record of Renshaw's aesthetic taste.⁴

¹Willumson, *Making Meaning*, 62.

²Ibid.

³James Borcoman, *The Photograph as Object: Photographs from the Collection of the National Gallery of Canada* (the National Gallery of Canada, 1969-71), 3.

⁴Ibid.

Following Edwards and Hart, I have argued that thinking about photographs in Renshaw's illustrated volumes as material objects "encompasses processes of intention, making, distributing, consuming, using, discarding, and recycling, all of which impact the way in which photographs as images are understood."⁵ Through this approach, I have demonstrated that photographs placed in albums require further investigation into their material condition, construction, function, and provenance history. Addressing material culture analysis, Edwards and Hart argue that writing on photography often made references to the photograph as an object; however these "tantalizing and fleeting appearances, were never to be pursued fully or systematically."⁶ To this end, I have discussed how photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* are indivisible from the book, and, therefore, inseparable from Renshaw's personal pastime as a book and art collector. Functioning as three-dimensional objects, photographs in albums require physical engagement in the way they are handled and read. The arrangement of photographs in Ruskin's publication has partially helped conserve their chemical composition, while it also impacts upon the way we read Ruskin's text.

In Chapter Two, I associated Renshaw's identity as a collector to the gendered practices among men in the Victorian period. His private library illuminates the cultural attitudes of the British towards reading and collecting as a leisure activity that reflects both knowledge and cultivation. I addressed Renshaw's pastime of extra-illustrating as a social phenomenon among book collectors who express their views in literature and art. Renshaw's books are important because they demonstrate the emergence of photography into the tradition of extra-illustrating, informing us about how photographs were used and became a popular art form for public engagement. At the same time, Renshaw's collecting interests suggest he was 'well-read' and that

⁵Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories*, 1.

⁶Ibid.

he likely travelled on the Grand Tour as part of his cultured education. Informing my perspective on gendered collecting, Russell W. Belk and Melanie Wallendorf argue that “gender is implicated in the associations of the objects collected, and the gendered uses of the collections.”⁷ Applying their argument to Renshaw’s collecting interests shows how acquiring prints and illustrating a book relates to the broader experience of gentlemen-collectors during the Victorian period because ownership gave him a ‘masculine’ sense of achievement and pride.

A close analysis of photographs of the Near East in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* in Chapter Three indicates a departure from Ruskin’s narrative while situating Renshaw’s acquisition of photographs of the Near East within the context of the theory of ‘Orientalism.’ As evidence of how British collectors identified both with imperialism and the developing art market, Renshaw’s photographically-illustrated books are historically significant and confirm the influence of colonialism. Western enchantment with the ‘Orient’ and Britain’s belief in racial superiority are represented in the photographs by Robertson and Beato, Frith, Du Camp, and Teynard. As James R. Ryan has noted, “commercial photography - particularly of the Near East- played a significant role in the naturalization of European ideas of the Orient during the second half of the nineteenth century.”⁸ This study, then, builds on the arguments proposed by such scholars as Ryan and Said, by drawing connections to the concept of Orientalism, Colonialism and commercial photography and demonstrating how Renshaw personalized these views within his collecting interests.

Considering Renshaw’s response to Ruskin’s *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, I have determined that Renshaw used the publication as a means to organize his experiences and in some instances he was able to acquire photographs and prints that could

⁷Russell W. Belk and Melanie Wallendorf, “Of Mice and Men: Gender Identity in Collecting,” in *Interpreting Objects and Collections*, Ed, Susan M. Pearce (London and New York: Routledge, 1994), 241.

⁸Ryan, *Picturing Empire*, 67.

reflect Ruskin's text, although this was not his primary motivation. The arrangement of photographs of the Near East in Volume One represents a departure from Ruskin's narrative and they confirm Renshaw's interest in the 'Orient.' Furthermore, Renshaw's choice to illustrate *The Seven Lamps of Architecture* in part reflects his aesthetic sensibility and belief in preserving art and architecture of the past; indeed, he was influenced by Ruskin's writing on artistic and social values.

While I have traced Renshaw's personal legacy through a material-culture-studies approach, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated* still raises a number of questions and concerns that could not be addressed within the relatively limited scope of a thesis: how do the photographs of French Gothic architecture in Renshaw's compilation relate to Ruskin's ideas on the Neo-Gothic architecture and the Arts and Crafts movement? What was the impact of France's Mission héliographique on British documentation of historical monuments? What do the photo-mechanical reproductions of paintings in Renshaw's illustrated volumes signify about the art market and publishing practices during the nineteenth century? Do these extra-illustrated books reflect contemporary Positivist thought? Given the significant number of illustrations in the books, I have concentrated on the first volume and was unable to study the second and third volumes in great detail and determine whether or not the photographs correspond to Ruskin's narrative. I hope that my study will inspire further investigation into the visual culture of the Victorian period and the use of photographs in extra-illustrated publications.

With over two hundred illustrations comprising *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, this artifact provides a rich resource of artistic material. It is an important part of the visual culture of Victorian Britain. Renshaw's volumes are also a by-product of cultural production and collecting practices and should be regarded within the larger processes of art creation. There are various ways in which scholars could

build on this album's history and I have pointed out only some of the possibilities—provenance, the practice of collecting, the impact of British imperialism, Orientalism and John Ruskin's writing.

As I pursue a career in Art History or continue my studies at the Doctoral level, I hope to investigate the ethnography of photographic practices and develop a greater understanding of how material objects impact the art world through consumption and distribution. As well, I would like to explore the trajectory of Art Institutions and Museums in digitally reproducing and exhibiting artefacts and help to enhance art education and access to collections. I hope that my study will encourage further inquiry into material culture as a model for investigating art and the importance of albums as part of an artistic and social process.

Bibliography

- “Volunteer Corps, Royal Garrison Artillery (Volunteers)”. in *London Gazette* London, April 1902, 2283–2285.
- “Dr. Knowles Renshaw Death of Distinguished Specialist Loss to Medical, Public and Political Circles”. in *Altrincham, Bowdon and Hale Obituaries* Guardian, 1926.
- “Albums & Illustrated Books”. in *Photographic Antiques & Literature, Pawlet Vt., Daguerreian Era*. Vol. 7. 1974, 742–765.
- “Renshaw; Charles Jeremiah (1841-1916); M.D., F.A.S.L; Medical Practitioner”. in *Altrincham and Sale Guardian* Trafford Local Studies, December, 1916, DS/UK/395.
- Abercrombie, William. “Pall Mall Gazette”. in *John Ruskin*. Vol. 2. 1883.
- Alison, Nordstrom. “Making a Journey: The Tupper scrapbooks and the travel they describe”. in *Photographs Objects Histories On the Materiality of Images*. , Ed, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart London and New York: Routledge, 2004.
- Arthur, Timothy S.. *Advice to Young Men on their Duties and Conduct in Life*. London: J.S. Hodgson, 1855.
- Baldwin, Gordon. *Looking at Photographs: A Guide to Technical Terms*. California: Getty Publications, 1991.
- Ballerini, Julia. “Du Camp, Maxime (1822-1894)”. in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Batterham, David. *The World of Ornament Illustrated*. London: Taschen, 2006.

- Behrens Abouseif, Doris. *Islamic Architecture in Cairo: an Introduction*. Cairo: The American University in Cairo Press, 1996.
- Belk, Russell W. and Melanie Wallendorf. "Of Mice and Men: Gender Identity in Collecting". in *Interpreting Objects and Collections*. , Ed, Susan M. Pearce London and New York: Routledge, 1994.
- Benjamin, Walter. "Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction". in *Illuminations: Essays and Reflections* Schocken, 1969.
- . "Unpacking My Library: A Talk About Collecting". in *Illuminations*. , Ed, Hannah Arendt Hammersmith, London: Fontana Press, 1973.
- Black, Jeremy. *The British and The Grand Tour*. London: Croom Helm, 1985.
- Bloomer, Kent. "Multiple Essences". *Paradigms of Architecture* 22 (1986).
- Boisvert, Colette E.. *Contextualizing Staffage in Nineteenth-Century Expeditionary Photography 1858-90*. Master's thesis, Carleton University, Ottawa, ON, 2000.
- Borcoman, James. *The Photograph as Object: Photographs from the Collection of the National Gallery of Canada*. the National Gallery of Canada, 1969-71.
- Brunet, Francois. "Photographic Practices". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Canada, National Gallery of. *Points of View: Photographs of Architecture*. Ottawa, Montreal, Vancouver and Regina: National Gallery of Canada's Travelling Exhibition, 1979-1981.
- . "Eugène Atget". Travelling exhibition to the Art Gallery of Hamilton, the Art Gallery of Victoria, and the Glenbow Museum in Calgary, 1982.

- Clifton, Edgar. "The Last Print in Silver". in *The Albumen and Salted Paper Book: The History and Practice of Photographic Printing 1840-1895.* , Ed, James M. Reilly Light Impressions Corporation, 1980.
- Cook, Edgar T.. *The Life of John Ruskin*. Vol. 1, London: George Allen & Company, Ltd., 1911.
- Curtis, Gerard. *Visual Words: Art and the Material Book in Victorian England*. Aldershot, England: Ashgate, 2002.
- Edwards, Elizabeth and Janice Hart. *Photographs Objects Histories: On the Materiality of Images*. London and New York: Routledge, 2004.
- Fox-Davies, Arthur C.. "Renshaw Coats of Arms". in *Armorial Families: A Directory of Gentlemen of Coat-armour*. Vol. 2. London: Hurst & Blacklett, Ltd, 1930, 1638-1639.
- Frith, Francis, Joseph Bonomi and Samuel Sharpe. *Egypt, Nubia and Ethiopia: Illustrated by One Hundred Stereoscopic Photographs*. London: Mssrs Negretti and Zambra, 1862.
- Gartland, Luke. "Beato, Felice (c.1834-1906)". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography.* , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Gernsheim, Helmut. *The Rise of Photography, 1850-1880: The Age of Collodion*. Vol. 2 of. Vol. 2, London: Thames and Hudson, 1988.
- "John Ruskin: Various Writings 1845-1879 Excerpts". in *Photography in Print: Writings from 1816 to the Present.* , Ed, Vicki Goldberg Albuquerque, New Mexico: University of New Mexico Press, 1981.

- Goldman, Paul. *Victorian Illustrated Books, 1850-1870: The Heyday of Wood-Engraving: The Robin de Beaumont Collection*. London: British Museum Press, 1994.
- Greenfield, Jane. *ABC of Bookbinding: A Unique Glossary with Over 700 Illustrations for Collectors & Librarians*. Delaware: Oak Knoll Press, 1998.
- Hannavy, John. "Books Illustrated with Photographs: 1850's". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Hart, Janice. "Ruskin, John (1819-1900)". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Haworth-Booth, Mark. *The Golden Age of British Photography, 1839-1900*. New York: Aperture, 1987.
- Henisch, Bridget A. and Heinz K. Henisch. "Robertson, James (c.1813-1888)". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Henisch, Heinz K. and Bridget A. Henisch. "The Photographically Illustrated Book". in *The Photographic Experience 1839-1914: Images and Attitudes* Pennsylvania: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1994.
- Hodgson, S. C.. *Hodgson and Co. Sale Catalogues 1956-57*. London: Messrs. Hodgson and Co., 1956.
- Hunt, John Dixon and Faith M. Holland. *The Ruskin Polygon: Essays on the Imagination of John Ruskin*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1982.

- Jammes, Isabelle. *Albums photographiques dits par Blanquart-Evrard, 1851-1855 : une exposition du Department des Relations Publiques de Kodak-Pathé*. Paris: Bibliotheque Forney, 1978.
- Kunard, Andrea. *Assembling Images: Interpreting the Nineteenth-Century Photographic Album with a Case Study of the Sir Daniel Wilson Album*. Master's thesis, Carleton University, Ottawa, ON, 1996.
- Langford, Martha. *Suspended Conversations: The Afterlife of Memory in Photographic Albums*. Montreal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press, 2001.
- Lin Renié, Pierre. "The Battle for a Market: Art Reproductions in Print and Photography from 1850 to 1880". in *Intersections: Lithography, Photography and the Traditions of Printmaking*. , Ed, Kathleen Stewart Howe. Vol. 17 Albuquerque, New Mexico: University of New Mexico Press, 1998.
- . "Goupil & Cie (active 1850-1884)". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Mayer, Dr. Heinrich. "Photography as a Medium of Illustration". *Humphrey's Journal of Photography and the Allied Arts and Sciences*, 1 (1850), no. 1, 293–296.
- McLean, Ruari. *Victorian Book Design and Colour Printing*. London: Faber & Faber, 1972.
- Mitchell, W. J. T.. "Word Image". in *Critical Terms for Art History*. , Ed, Robert S. Nelson and Richard Shiff 2nd ed. Chicago & London: The University of Chicago Press, 2003.
- Mitchell, W. J.T.. *Picture Theory: Essays on Verbal and Visual Representation*. Chicago: University Of Chicago Press, 1995.

- Mizan Hashim, David. "Indian and Mogul influences on Mosques". in *Encyclopedia of Malaysia Architecture.* , Ed, Fee Chen Voon. Vol. 5 Malaysia: Editions Didier Millet, 1998.
- Monument, Public and Sculpture Association National Recording Project. *John Knowles*. <http://pmsa.cch.kcl.ac.uk/MR/MR-MTH36.htm>, March 2008.
- Murray, Cortney L.. *Interview with John McElhone Photographs Conservator at the National Gallery of Canada*. Interview, January 29, 2009.
- Myers, Robin and Michael Harris. *Property of a Gentleman: The Formation, Organization and Dispersal of the Private Library 1620-1920*. Winchester: St. Paul's Bibliographies, 1991.
- Neufeldt, Victoria and David B. Guralnik. *Webster's New World Dictionary, Third College Edition*. 3rd ed. New York: Macmillan, 1997.
- Newmann, Caryn E.. "Albumen Print". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography.* , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Nickel, Douglas R.. *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine: A Victorian Photographer Abroad*. New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 2004.
- Nochlin, Linda. "The Imaginary Orient". in *The Politics of Vision: Essays on Nineteenth-Century Art and Society* Cambridge, Massachusetts: Westview Press, 1991.
- North Lee, Brian. "Gentlemen and their Book-plates". in *Property of a Gentleman: The Formation, Organisation, and Dispersal of the Private Library.* , Ed, Robin Myers and Michael Harris Winchester: St. Paul's Bibliographies, 1991.

- Pare, Richard and Phyllis Lambert. *Photography and Architecture: 1839-1939*. Montreal: The MIT Press, 1985.
- Pearce, Susan M.. *On Collecting: An Investigation Into Collecting in the European Tradition*. London and New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Pearson, David. "Bookplates, Book Labels and Book Stamps". in *Provenance Research in Book History* London: British Library & Oak Knoll Press, 1994.
- Pelizzari, Maria A.. "Retracing the Outlines of Rome: Intertextuality and Imaginative Geographies in Nineteenth-Century Photographs". in *Picturing Place: Photography and the Geographical Imagination*. , Ed, Joan M. Schwartz and James R. Ryan London and New York: I.B. Tauris, 2003.
- Prown, Jules David. *Art as Evidence: Writings on Art and Material Culture*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 2001.
- Renshaw, Charles J.. *Some of the Bye-Paths in the History of the Church of S. Martin Ashton-upon-Mersey and of the Rectory*. Phoenix Press, 1914.
- Robert, Maurice and Frederic Warde. *A Code for the Collector of Beautiful Books*. New York: The Limited Editions Club, 1936.
- Ruskin, John. "Art Criticism and Art Education: 'Modern Painters;' a Reply". in *Arrows of the Chace: Being a Collection of Scattered Letters Published Chiefly in the Daily Newspapers, -1840-1880*. Vol. 1. Sunnyside, Orpington, Kent: George Allen, 1880.
- . *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*. Photographically-Illustrated Book: National Gallery of Canada, 1880. 3 volumes.
- . *Modern Painters*. Sunnyside, Orpington, Kent: George Allen, 1883.

- Ruskin, John. *The Political Economy of Art or A Joy Forever and its Price in the Market*. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1886.
- . *The Works of John Ruskin*. London and New York: George Allen, Longman's Green, 1912.
- . *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*. New ed. New York: The Noonday Press, 1961.
- Ryan, James R.. *Picturing Empire Photography and the Visualization of the British Empire*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1997.
- Said, Edward. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books, 1978.
- Silver, Joel. *Marbled Paper*. <http://www.finebooksmagazine.com/issue/0306/marble.phtml>, November 2008.
- Stewart, Susan. *On Longing: Narratives of the Miniature, the Gigantic, the Souvenir, the Collection*. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 1993.
- Stewart Howe, Kathleen. *Excursions Along the Nile: The Photographic Discovery of Ancient Egypt*. Santa Barbara: Santa Barbara Museum of Art, 1993.
- . "Teynard, Félix (1817-1892)". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Stone, Jon R.. *The Routledge Dictionary of Latin Quotations: The Illiterati's Guide to Latin Maxims, Mottoes, Proverbs and Sayings*. New York: Routledge, 2005.
- Tosh, John. *Manliness and Masculinities in Nineteenth-Century Britain: Essays on Gender, Family and Empire*. Great Britain: Pearson, 2005.
- Tredwell, Daniel M.. *A Monograph on Privately-Illustrated Books: A Plea for Bibliomania*. Brooklyn: Fred.Tredwell, 9 Boerum Place, 1881.

- United Kingdom, National Archives of the. *Census Returns of England and Wales, 1901*. Government Report.
- Ware, Mike. "Salted Paper Print". in *Encyclopedia of Nineteenth-Century Photography*. , Ed, John Hannavy New York: Routledge, 2007.
- Wark, Robert R.. "The Gentle Pastime of Extra-Illustrating Books". *The Huntington Library Quarterly* 56 (1993).
- Warner Marien, Mary. *Photography: A Cultural History*. 2nd ed. New Jersey: Pearson Prentice Hall, 2006.
- Wiener, Martin J.. *English Culture and the Decline of the Industrial Spirit, 1850-1980*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004.
- Willumson, Glenn. "Making Meaning: Displaced Materiality in The Library and Art Museum". in *Photographs Objects Histories On the Materiality of Images*. , Ed, Elizabeth Edwards and Janice Hart London and New York: Routledge, 2004.
- Wolfe, Richard J.. *Marbled Paper: Its History, Techniques, and Patterns*. Pennsylvania: University of Pennsylvania Press, 1990.

Illustrations

Figure 1: John Ruskin, *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, 1880 edition, extra-illustrated by the insertion of over 200 etchings, lithographs, photographs, watercolours, three volumes, folio 35 x 24.5 cm, property of J.A. Knowles Renshaw, National Gallery of Canada, PSC76:178

Figure 2: *J.A. Knowles Renshaw's bookplate, on the inside of the front board of Volume One of *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*, Motto: *Virtus repulsae nescia sordidae**

Figure 3: *Untitled*, date unknown, artist unknown. 34 x 49 cm, albumen paper print.
PCS76:178:2

Figure 4: *Arles: The Tympanum and Lintel of the Central Door of Saint-Trophime with Christ of the Apocalypse, France, Charles Nègre, 1852, 34 x 49 cm, salted paper print, PCS76:178:4.*

Figure 5: *The Mosque of Sultan Qaytbey, Cairo*, James Robertson and Felice Beato, before 1863, 34 x 25.3 cm, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:6.

Figure 6: *Untitled* Francis Frith, date unknown, 34 x 25.3 cm, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:7.

Figure 7: *Street View of Cairo* Francis Frith, 1858, Mammoth-plate albumen print, Michael G. and Jane Wilson/ The Wilson Center for Photography, London. (Plate 20 in *Francis Frith in Egypt and Palestine A Victorian Photographer Abroad* by Douglas R. Nickel).

Figure 8: *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, chromolithographic print, PCS76:178:8.

Figure 9: *“The Holy Land” Egypt*, anonymous, date unknown, watercolour, PCS76:178:18.

Figure 10: *Upper Egypt. Great Temple of Dendera. Rear Façade*, Maxime Du Camp, after 1849, published by Gide et Baudry, 16.4 x 21.3 cm, PCS76:178:19.

Figure 11: *Emerald of Ravenna looted by the Patriarch, Francesco Maggioto and Francesco del Pedro diresse*, inscription: *Smeraldo Esarca di Ravenna fa Saccheggiare la Patriarchale di*, PCS76:178:17.

Figure 12: *Island of Fileh (Philae) Oriental Colonnade- View of Ruins*, Félix Teynard, salted paper print, printed by H. de Fontenay et Cie. in 1851, published by Goupil et Cie. Paris, London, Berlin and New York, PCS76:178:19.

Figure 13: *Sabil Um Abbas, Cairo*, James Robertson and Felice Beato, ca. 1858, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:24.

Figure 14: *Fountain of the Mosque of Mohammed Ali, Cairo*, James Robertson and Felice Beato, ca. 1858, albumen paper print, PCS76:178:33.

Figure 15: *Ruins of Kirkstall Abbey, West Yorkshire*, anonymous, date unknown, 34 x 49 cm, albumen paper print.

Figure 16: *Avignon. West Side of the Palace of the Popes*, Charles Nègre, 1852, salted paper print.

Figure 17: *Rouen Cathedral, St. Maclou, France*, Bisson Frères (Louis-Auguste Bisson and Auguste-Rosalie Bisson), date unknown, albumen paper print.

Figure 18: *Plate I: Ornaments from Rouen, St. Lo and Venice*, John Ruskin, R. P. Cuff, lithograph in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*.

Figure 19: *Lakenhalle (Cloth Hall)* in the Grote Markt, Ypres, Belgium, anonymous, date unknown, 34 x 49 cm, albumen print.

Figure 20: *Jerusalem Palestine*, Maxime Du Camp, date unknown, published by Gide et Baudry, salted paper print, PCS76:178:34.

Appendix 1

Volume One: Arrangement of Illustrations in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*

- p.4. Title page: *The Seven Lamps of Architecture*, John Ruskin's 1880 publication.
- PCS76:178:1. *Plate IX: Tracery from the Campanile of Giotto, Florence*, John Ruskin, R. P. Cuff, lithograph.
- p.5. *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: New Edition, 1880*, verso identifies the publisher: Chiswick Press Charles Wittingham, Tooks Court Chancery Lane.
- PCS76:178:2. *Untitled*, date unknown, anonymous, size, albumen paper print, see (Fig.3)
- PCS76:178:3. *Untitled*, date unknown, anonymous, coloured lithograph.
- PCS76:178:4. *Arles: The Tympanum and Lintel of the Central Door of Saint-Trophîme with Christ of the Apocalypse, France*, Arles, France by Charles Nègre, date unknown, albumen paper print, see (Fig.4).
- p. v-x. *Preface to Edition of 1880*, p.vi, vii, *Preface to First Edition*, p. x."
- PCS76:178:5. *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, size, albumen print. (view of building).
- PCS76:178:6. *The Mosque of Sultan Qaytbey*, James Robertson and Felice Beato, before 1863, albumen paper print, see (Fig.5).
- PCS76:178:7. *Untitled*, Francis Frith, date unknown, albumen paper print, see (Fig.6).
- PCS76:178:8. *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, anonymous, date unknown, chromolithograph, see (Fig.8).

- PCS76:178:9. *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, anonymous, date unknown, chromolithograph.
- PCS76:178:10. *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, anonymous, date unknown, chromolithograph.
- PCS76:178:11. *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, anonymous, date unknown, chromolithograph.
- PCS76:178:12. *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, anonymous, date unknown, chromolithograph.
- PCS76:178:13. *'Moorish' Architectural Design*, anonymous, date unknown, chromolithograph.
- p.xi-xii. *The First Edition of The Seven Lamps of Architecture*.
- PCS76:178:14. *Ruins of columns*, anonymous, date unknown, fold-out watercolour.
- PCS76:178:15. *Street Scene in Cairo*, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print, (possibly by Robertson and Beato).
- PCS76:178:16. *Upper Egypt. Great Temple of Dendera. Sculptures on the Rear Façade*, Maxime Du Camp, after 1849, printed 1852, published by Gide et Baudry, 14.4 x 21.3 cm. see (Fig.10).
- PCS76:178:17. *Emerald of Ravenna looted by the Patriarch*, by Francesco Maggioto and engraved by Francesco del Pedro diresse, lithograph. see (Fig.11).
- PCS76:178:18. *'The Holy Land' Egypt*, anonymous, date unknown, watercolour, see (Fig.9).
- PCS76:178:19. *Island of Fileh (Philae) Oriental Colonnade- View of Ruins*, Félix Teynard, salted paper print, printed by H. de Fontenay et Cie, in 1851, published by Goupil & Cie., see (Fig.12).
- p.1-8. *Table of Contents, List of Plates, Introduction* and first page of *The Lamp of Sacrifice*
- PCS76:178:20. *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, lithograph, (shows people surrounding a tomb).

PCS76:178:21. *Christ Placed in the Sepulchre*, caption: “Cristo Deposto Nel Sepolcro, T. Gaddi dip., A. Tricca dis., F. Livy inc. lithograph.

PCS76:178:22. *Untitled*, Robertson and Beato, date unknown, size, albumen paper print, (view of Arabic Tombs).

PCS76:178:23. *Aerial View of Cairo*, Robertson and Beato, date unknown, albumen paper print.

p.9-10. *Chapter One: Lamp of Sacrifice*

PCS76:178:24. *Sabil Um Abbas, Cairo*, Robertson and Beato, date unknown, albumen paper print, see (Fig.13).

PCS76:178:25. *A Street in Constantinople*, inscription *une rue de Constantinople* Robertson and Beato, date unknown, albumen paper print.

PCS76:178:26. Lithograph, captions *Fran co Barbieri pin., L. Metalli del., Ces Ferrieri soul., Vol IV Tar ouv. I27.*

PCS76:178:27. Engraving, inscription on verso “Moses”, captions *Mofé che difseta le Turbe., Quadro di Gregorio Pagani., Carlo Lafino fece all’ acqua forte Gaet. va fcellini termino a bulino.*

PCS76:178:28. *Puits de Moyse*, coloured lithograph, incription on back “Moses well”, Emile Sagot del., Lith de A. Godard a Paris.,

p.11-14. *Chapter One: Lamp of Sacrifice.*

PCS76:178:29. Coloured lithograph, caption *Gedrucht unter der Direction von Strixner in Stuttgart, N. Strixner del 1825.*

PCS76:178:30. Coloured lithograph, inscription on back “Lamentation of Christ,” date unknown, artist unknown.

- PCS76:178:31. *Untitled*, artist unknown, date unknown, coloured lithograph.
- PCS76:178:32. Lithograph, caption “London: Published Jan 1 1858 by Droosten Allen & co 126 Strand, H. Richter., T.W. Huffam.”
- PCS76:178:33. *Fountain of the Mosque of Mohammed Ali, Cairo*, Robertson and Beato, 1857, albumen paper print, see (Fig.14).
- PCS76:178:34. *Palestine Jerusalem* Maxime Du Camp, published by Gide and Baudry, salted paper print. see (Fig.20).
- PCS76:178:35. *Untitled* anonymous, date unknown, fold-out lithograph.
- PCS76:178:36. *The Garden of Gethsemane*, and *Pool of Siloam*, W. H. Bartlett and R. Brandard, John Consen, 2 lithographs. date unknown.
- PCS76:178:37. *Church of the Holy Sepulchre* and *Pool of Hezekiah Jerusalem*, W. H. Bartlett, E. Challis, and J. C. Bentley
- p.15-16. *Chapter One: The Lamp of Sacrifice.*
- PCS76:178:38. *The Sleep*, *sixteenth century marble*, lithograph, caption *XVIe siècle Marbre. Le Sommeil No 1*, anonymous, date unknown.
- PCS76:178:39. *Untitled* anonymous, date unknown, lithograph. (marble sculpture)
- PCS76:178:40. *Relief Sculpture Perierat et Inventus*, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print.
- PCS76:178:41. *Untitled*, inscription on back “Flight to Egypt”, Jok Schocrel. *p inxt: Gedrucht unter der Direction von Strixner in Stuttgart., I. Benjamin del*, date unknown, coloured lithograph.
- PCS76:178:42. *Untitled* anonymous, date unknown, lithograph. (marble sculpture)

PCS76:178:43. *Untitled* anonymous, date unknown, lithograph. (marble sculpture)

PCS76:178:44. *Untitled* inscription on print *Kloik du sultan sur le Bosphore pres les eaux douces d'asie*, Constantinople, Robertson and Beato, measuring 30.2 x 26.4 cm, albumen print.

p. 17-20. *Chapter One: Lamp of Sacrifice.*

PCS76:178:45. *Untitled* anonymous, date unknown, lithograph. (marble sculpture)

PCS76:178:46. *Portrait Bust of the Head of a Barbarian Captive*, inscription: 'R F' by Roger Fenton, albumen print, date unknown.

p.21-22. *Chapter One: The Lamp of Sacrifice.*

PCS76:178:47. Lithograph, caption *Cathedral de Rouen-Portrail du Midi*, anonymous, date unknown.

p.23-24. *Chapter One: The Lamp of Sacrifice.*

PCS76:178:48. Lithograph, caption *Blois Interieure de la cour du Chateau. Desiné d'après nature par Dupuis., Im. de Lemercier, Bernard et Cie., Architecture de Louis XII de Francois, Victor Petit lith.*

PCS76:178:49. *Portal of the Abbey Church of Saint Riquier*, France, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print.

p.25-26. *Chapter One: The Lamp of Sacrifice.*

PCS76:178:50. (this photograph was removed from the book) *Saint Maclou, Rouen, West Facade*, Bisson Frères (Louis-Auguste Bisson and Auguste-Rosalie Bisson), date unknown, albumen print. see (Fig.17).

PCS76:178:51. *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, engraving.

PCS76:178:52. *Plate I: Ornaments from Rouen, St. Lo and Venice*, John Ruskin, R. P. Cuff, lithograph. see (Fig.18).

p. 27-28. *Chapter One: The Lamp of Sacrifice.*

PCS76:178:53. *Lakenhalle (Cloth Hall) in the Grote Markt*, Ypres, Belgium, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print, see (Fig.19).

p.29-30. *Chapter Two: The Lamp of Truth.*

PCS76:178:54. *Coronation of the Virgin*, caption *A. botticelli dip., F. Lair dis., F. Livy inc., L'incoronazione della vergine*, lithograph.

p.31-46. *Chapter Two: The Lamp of Truth.*

PCS76:178:55. *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, coloured lithograph.

PCS76:178:56. *Untitled*, date unknown, lithograph, (view of Venice).

PCS76:178:57. *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, lithograph, (Assumption of the Virgin Mary).

PCS76:178:58. *The Death of Elisco*, caption *La Morte d'Elisco Pittura a fresco de cosimo Ulivelli, Carlo Bozzolini dip., Gaet Vascellini inc. CXII*, date unknown, lithograph.

p.47-48. *Chapter Two: Lamp of Truth.*

PCS76:178:59. *South Front of British Museum*, printed by C. F. Cheffins. Lithograph.

p.49-50. *Chapter Two: The Lamp of Truth.*

PCS76:178:60. *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, (view of Venice), engraving

PCS76:178:61. *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, (view of Venice and Canal), engraving

PCS76:178:62. *Steps Leading up the Rialto, Venice*, anonymous, date unknown, lithograph.

PCS76:178:63. *Mosaic Tufsboden, caption II. 4, der natürlichen Grofse., Farbendrack. u. Lith. bei H, Delius, chromolithograph.*

PCS76:178:64. *Mosaic Tufsboden, caption Genahter. Teppich dem Grabstein des Gard Bee, bei Kairo., 1/4 der natürlichen Grofse, chromolithograph.*

PCS76:178:65. *Untitled, anonymous, date unknown, (wall design), chomolithograph.*

p.51-52. *Chapter Two: The Lamp of Truth.*

PCS76:178:66. *Untitled, anonymous, date unknown, engraving and hand coloured.*

PCS76:178:67. *Untitled, anonymous, date unknown, engraving and hand coloured.*

PCS76:178:68. *Fragments of Stained Glass from the Church of Notre-Dame, caption Fragments tirés des Verrières donnés par Louis XI a L'Église Notre-Dame, Lith de A. Godard, Edmond Du fommerard d'après les dessins de M Lébis, date unknown, lithograph.*

PCS76:178:69. *Engraving, date unknown, caption Giacomo Guarana inv. Francesco del Pedro diresse ed. incise., Sconfitta degli unni Sotto Il doge pietro tribuno.*

PCS76:178:70. *Engraving, date unknown, caption Pietro Novelli inv., Francesco del Pedro diresse., Giovanni del Pian inc., Translazione del sacro corpo di san marco da allesandria a venezia.*

PCS76:178:71 *Plate II: Part of The Cathedral of St. Lo, Normandy, John Ruskin, R. P. Cuff, lithograph.*

p.53-54. *Chapter Two: The Lamp of Truth.*

Volume Two: Arrangement of Photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*

- 1 *Ruins of Kirkstall Abbey, West Yorkshire*, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print, see (Fig.15).
- 2 *Mars Hill Athens*, anonymous, date unknown, inscription on print "Mars Hill Athens," albumen print.
- 3 *Athens*, anonymous, date unknown, inscription on print "I BECK ATHENS," albumen print, (view of the Parthenon).
- 4 *Red Gate. Northern Façade of the Church of Notre-Dame. 13th Century*, Louis Désiré Blanquart-Évrard, inscription on the back of the print "La Porte Rouge, Façade septentrionale de l'Église de Notre-Dame, XIII siècle," date unknown, albumen paper print.
- 5 *Metropolitan Church of Notre-Dame*, Blanquart-Évrard, date unknown, albumen paper print.
- 6 *Untitled*, anonymous, date unknown, size 35 x 49 centimeters, (jamb figures from a Cathedral)
- 7 *Abbeville Cathedral*, anonymous, date unknown, size, inscription on verso "Cathedral Abeville," albumen print.
- 8 *Strasbourg Cathedral*, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print.
- 9 *Rezzonico Palazzo, Venice*, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print.
- 10 *Vatican Sarcophagus*, anonymous, date unknown, salted paper print, inscription "Vatican Sarcophagus."

Volume Three: Arrangement of Photographs in *The Seven Lamps of Architecture: Illustrated*

- 1 *Palazzo Vendramin-Calergi, Venice*, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print.
- 2 *Palazzo Franchetti-Cavalli-Gussoni, Venice*, anonymous, date unknown, albumen print.
- 3 *Portrait bust of Julius Caesar*, Roger Fenton, date unknown, albumen print.
- 4 *Greco-Roman Sculpture 'Vatican'*, anonymous, date unknown, salted paper print, inscription on print "Vatican."
- 5 *Greco-Roman Sculpture 'Vatican'*, anonymous, date unknown, salted paper print, inscription on print "Vatican."
- 6 *Titans* anonymous, date unknown, salted paper print, inscription on print "Titans," (Greco-Roman sarcophagus? reclined woman and relief scene)
- 7 *Avignon. West Side of the Palace of the Popes*, Charles Nègre, date unknown, salted paper print (view of a military base below a fortress), see (Fig.16).
- 8 *Equestrian Statue of Marcus Aurelius, Capitoline Hill*, anonymous, date unknown, salted paper print.
- 9 *The Pantheon, Rome*, anonymous, date unknown, salted paper print.

Appendix 2

A Catalogue of Books Comprising The Property of J. A. Knowles Renshaw (decd.) of Ashton-on-Mersey, Cheshire. Sold by Order of R. C. K. Renshaw, Esq.

Including: The Second Folio Shakespeare, 1632 Folio Editions of Holland's Pliny, Harington's Ariosto and other Books of the 17th Century- A fine copy of Bury's Coloured Views of the Liverpool and Manchester Railway-Ackermann's Microcosm of London and other Books with Coloured Plates- Books relating to the County of Cheshire. Which will be Sold by Auction by Mssrs. Hodgson & Co. (Sidney Hodgson and Wilfred B. Hodgson) At their rooms No. 115 Chancery Lane, London, W.C.2 (Fleet Street End) on Thursday, November 22nd, 1956 and following day, at one o'clock punctually.

- 609 Percy (T.) *Reliques of Ancient English Poetry*, three-quarter red morocco gilt, t.e.g., 1856, and 3 others 4 vols
- 610 Shakespeare (W.) *Works*, illus., Henry Irving Edition, inscribed by Henry Irving to his son Henry, 8 vols, cloth 1890
- 611 Walton and Cotton. *The Complete Angler*, by J. Major, plates, morocco gilt, g.e., 1844, and others 9 vols
- 612 Suckling (Sir J.) *Works* (no portrait, w.a.f), half calf, 1696, and others (10)
- 613 Dibdin (T. F.) *A Bibliographical, Antiquarian and Picturesque Tour in France and Germany*, plates, 3 vols, polished calf gilt, g.e., 1821
- 614 Callot (J.) *De Drove Ellendigheden van den Oorloogh*, title and 17 plates, mounted on thick paper, oblong, red morocco gilt n.d.
- 615 Béranger (P. J. de) *Oeuvres*, illus., 5 vols, morocco, g.e. Paris, 1834

- 616 Dickens (C.) *Nicholas Nickelby*, Illustrations by “Phiz”, First Edition, in the 19/20 parts, with wrappers and advts. (one wrapper wanting and most wrappers slightly defective) 1838-39
- 617 Dickens (C.) *Little Dorrit*, illus., First Edition, in the 19/20 parts with wrappers and advts., and the slip inserted at page 481 (the first wrapper torn) 1855-57
- 618 Dickens (C.) *Our Mutual Friend*, illus., First Edition, in the 19/20 parts, with wrappers and advts., and the slip in part I relating to the title (a few wrappers slightly defective) 1864-65
- 619 Dickens (C.) *Bleak House*, illus., First Edition, in the 19/20 parts (some wrappers wanting, w.a.f.), 1852-3, and 1 other (2)
- 620 Dickens (C.) *Dombey and Son*, illus., First Edition, with the 12 extra portraits, calf gilt, g.e., by Tout 1848
- 621 Dickens (C.) *David Copperfield*, First Edition, calf gilt, g.e., by Zaehnsdorf 1850
- 622 Bewick (T.) *History of British Birds*, First Edition, 2 Vols, 1797, and Quadrupeds, 1800, woodcuts, 3 vols, uniform calf gilt (some joints worn) 1797-1800
- 623 *Real Life in London*, coloured plates by Rowlandson, 2 vols, calf (4 plates wanting, w.a.f.), 1821, and 1 other (3)
- 624 [Combe (W.)] *The English Dance of Death*, coloured plates by T.Rowlandson, First Edition 2 vols, half roan. 1815-16.
- 625 [Combe (W.)] *The Dance of Life*, coloured plates by T. Rowlandson, First Edition. (title slightly defective), half roan [1817-18]
- 626 Combe (W.) *The Three Tours of Doctor Syntax*, coloured plates by Rowlandson, Miniature Edition, 3 vols, half calf (one leaf wanting), 1823, and 2 others 5 vols.

- 627 Alken (H.) *Illustration of Popular Songs*, 43 Coloured plates (dated 1822), with leaf of address after title, oblong folio, old half morocco T. McLean, 1825
- 628 Ackermann's *Microcosm of London*, 103 coloured plates, by Rowlandson and Pugin, the plates water-marked between 1808 and 1821 (one-plate, "View of the Thames", lacking, and some plates showing traces of offset), 3 vols, 4to, old morocco, g.e. [1808-21]
- 629 Bury (T. T.) *Coloured Views on the Liverpool and Manchester Railway*, 16 Fine Coloured Aquatint Plates, including the three extra folding plates of passenger, goods and cattle trains by Shaw and Hughes (one slightly torn), 4to, old half calf R. Ackermann, 1833 Folio, & c.
- 630 Thomas Aquinas (St.) *Questiones disputatae de Veritate* [Hain 1419], initials in red and blue, 483 ll., double columns (some worm-holes throughout), folio, half vellum. Colonie, p. me Johannem Koelhoeff de Lubeck, 1475
- 631 *The Byble* (very imperfect copy, w.a.f.), folio, unbound [1551?], and 1 other (2)
- 632 *The Bible* [D. & M. 231], woodcut titles, Geneva Version, with Tomson's revised New Testament, folio, russia (joints worn) R. Barker, 1610
- 633 Plutarch. *The Lives of the Noble Grecians and Romanes*, by Sir T. North [S.T.C. 20068], folio, half calf (2 ll. of table slightly defective) 1603
- 634 Plinius Secundus. *The Historie of the World*, translated by Philemen Holland [S.T.C. 20029], First Edition, 2 vols in 1, folio, old calf, with gilt arms on sides (re-backed) A. Islip, 1602
- 635 Chaucer (G.) *Workes* [edited by T. Speght, S.T.C. 5080], fine woodcut title (last 3 ll. slightly defective), 19th Century morocco gilt A. Islip, 1602

- 636 Shakespeare (W.) *Comedies, Histories and Tragedies*, Published according to the true Originall copies, The Second Impression, portrait by Martin Droeshout on title, folio, red crushed morocco extra, g.e., by Rivière. Printed by Tho. Cotes, for Robert Allot, and are to be sold at the signe of the Blacke Beare in Pauls Church-yard. 1632. This copy, which measures 12 x 8 inches, bears the armorial book-plate of the late owner; it was given to him in May 1917 by a Miss Hilton who had inherited it from her brother W. H. Hilton on his death in 1907. Though the body of the work is sound and clean, the leaf of verses by Ben Johnson is in facsimile, a few leaves at the beginning and end have been cleaned or carefully repaired, and some small portions of text filled in. It will therefore be sold not subject to return.
- 637 Shakespeare (W.) *Comedies, Histories, and Tragedies*, Fourth Edition (title and several ll. defective and some ll. Wanting, sold not subject to return), folio, calf 1685
- 638 Homer. *Iliads* [S.T.C 13634] and *Odysseys* [S.T.C. 13636], translated by G. Chapman, engraved titles, etc. (3) in 1 vol, modern red morocco gilt, g.e. (sold not subject to return [1611-15?])
- 639 Ariosto (L.) *Orlando. Furioso in English Heroical Verse* by Sir J. Harington, engraved title-page and plates, red crushed morocco gilt, gilt inner borders, g.e., by Clark 1634
- 640 Aleman (M.) *The Rogue: or the Life of Guzman de Alfarache* [translated by J. Mabbe], old calf (repaired, and title slightly stained and frayed) 1623
- 641 Jonson (Ben). *Works*, portrait, old calf (re-backed) 1692
- 642 Beaumont (F.) and J. Fletcher. *Fifty Comedies and Tragedies*, portrait, old calf

- (joints worn) 1679
- 643 Bacon (Sir F.) *Sylva Sylvarum*, portrait and engraved title, old calf, 1651; Juvenal and Persius, translated by B. Holyday, plates, old calf, 1673, and 2 others 4 vols
- 644 [Burton (R.)] *The Anatomy of Melancholy*, engraved title (mounted, and wants the "Argument of the Frontispiece," w.a.f.), modern panelled calf gilt 1632
- 645 Browne (Sir T.) *Works*, First Edition, half calf (no portrait) 1686
- 646 Montaigne (M. de) *Les Essais*, portrait, Paris, 1635 and Machiavelli (N.) *Works*, 1720 2 vols, old calf
- 647 *Book of Common Prayer*, L.P., old dark green morocco extra, with gilt centre arms of Robert Harley, Earl of Oxford (back worn) 1687
- 648 Plot (R.) *The Natural History of Oxfordshire*, map and plates, old calf Oxford, 1677
- 649 Leycester (Sir P.) *Historical Antiquities...concerning Cheshire*, map, old calf 1673
- 650 Ormerod (G.) *The History of the County Palatine and City of Chester*, map and plates, 3 vols, old diced russia gilt, g.e. (some joints worn) 1819
- 651 Ormerod (G.) *The History of Cheshire*, by T. Helsby, plates, Second Edition, 3 vols, boards, cloth back 1882
- 652 Earwaker (J.P.) *East Cheshire*, photo and other illus., 2 vols, 4to, cloth 1877
- 653 Taylor (H.) *Old Halls in Lancashire and Cheshire*, illus., half morocco, Manchester, 1884, and others relating to Cheshire 5 vols

- 654 *Heraldic MS- Arms of the Gentry of Cheshire in alphabetical order* [by John Holland 1707-1713], on 19 ll., old boards, with W. Hogarth's book-plate pasted inside front cover.
- 655 Fox-Davies (A. C.) *Armorial Families*, coats-of-arms Seventh Edition, 2 vols, 4 to, buckram gilt 1929
- 656 Ruskin (J.) *Seven Lamps of Architecture*, illus., Extra-Illustrated by the insertion of over 200 etchings, photographs, etc., 3 vols, folio, half brown morocco gilt, t.e.g. 1880
- 657 Burnet (J.) *Turner*, plates, half morocco gilt, t.e.g., 1852, and 1 other 2 vols
- 658 Thackeray (W. M.) *Works*, 24 vols, cloth, v.y., and others miscellaneous (58)