Governing Environmental Conduct in Canada: The Case of Subjectivity and Environmental Citizenship

By

Norah Kielland

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

Legal Studies

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario

© 2011
Norah Kielland
NOTICE:
The author has granted a non-exclusive license allowing Library and Archives Canada to reproduce, publish, archive, preserve, conserve, communicate to the public by telecommunication or on the Internet, loan, distribute and sell theses worldwide, for commercial or non-commercial purposes, in microform, paper, electronic and/or any other formats.

The author retains copyright ownership and moral rights in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

In compliance with the Canadian Privacy Act some supporting forms may have been removed from this thesis.

While these forms may be included in the document page count, their removal does not represent any loss of content from the thesis.

AVIS:
L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque et Archives Canada de reproduire, publier, archiver, sauvegarder, conserver, transmettre au public par télécommunication ou par l'Internet, prêter, distribuer et vendre des theses partout dans le monde, à des fins commerciales ou autres, sur support microforme, papier, électronique et/ou autres formats.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur et des droits moraux qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

Conformément à la loi canadienne sur la protection de la vie privée, quelques formulaires secondaires ont été enlevés de cette thèse.

Bien que ces formulaires aient inclus dans la pagination, il n'y aura aucun contenu manquant.
Abstract

Recent trends in environmental governance have placed increased pressure on individuals to adopt additional responsibility to improve environmental conditions, and voluntarily internalize environmentally friendly behaviors. Using the governmentality framework enables a deeper analysis of the techniques of government that have steered individual conduct towards adopting environmentally friendly lifestyles. Focusing on Foucault’s work on subjectivity and the *Technologies of the Self*, the technologies of therapeutics, consumption, and community are presented as the primary means of governing individual conduct towards environmental subjectivity. This is witnessed through the environmental citizenship initiatives brought about in the Canada Green Plan. Here, the push for education on environmental issues, consumption of environmentally friendly products, and community involvement represents a calculated effort to encourage individuals to subjectify themselves in accordance with the principles of environmental citizenship. Thus, the resulting environmental subjectivity is the effect of power relations that guide individual conduct, while also obscuring the sources of power that enable it.
Acknowledgements

This project could never have been accomplished without the support and encouragement of my friends and family. I would like to thank my parents and my boyfriend Mark for their continuous support that helped me carry on when I wanted to least, my friends for providing me with welcomed distractions, and my supervisor Peter Swan for the guidance and advice that helped me see this thesis through to completion. Each of you has contributed to my success in different, but integral ways, and I would like to express my gratitude for helping me achieve a goal I had always thought was beyond my grasp.
Table of Contents

Introduction ........................................................................................................... 1

Chapter One: Trends in Environmental Regulation ........................................... 8
  1.1 The Expansion of Environmental Awareness – Regulatory Approaches .... 9
  1.2 Regulatory Shifts – Deregulation ................................................................. 15
  1.3 The Trend Towards Individual Action ......................................................... 20
  1.4 Conclusion ................................................................................................. 23

Chapter Two: Approaches to Individualized Environmental Solutions ............ 25
  2.1 Approaches to Individual Environmental Conduct .................................... 26
  2.2 Governmentality ......................................................................................... 31
  2.3 Environmental Governmentality ................................................................. 33
  2.4 New Directions .......................................................................................... 40
  2.5 Conclusion ................................................................................................. 43

Chapter Three: Conceptual Framework for Governing Individual Conduct ... 45
  3.1 Foucault and the Self .................................................................................. 47
  3.2 Modern Applications of Technologies of the Self ..................................... 50
  3.3 Technologies of the Community ................................................................. 60
  3.4 Situating Environmental Technologies of Conduct in Governmentality ...... 64
  3.5 Conclusion ................................................................................................. 65

Chapter Four: Environmental Citizenship in Canadian Policy ....................... 67
  4.1 Environmental Citizenship and the Green Plan ......................................... 68
  4.2 Theoretical Application ............................................................................. 71
    Technologies of Therapeutics ................................................................. 73
    Technologies of Community ................................................................. 79
    Technologies of Consumption ............................................................. 83
  4.3 Situating Environmental Citizenship within the Governmentality Framework 87
  4.4 Environmental Citizenship: Outcomes ..................................................... 91
  4.5 Conclusion ................................................................................................. 94

Conclusion ........................................................................................................... 96
Works Cited ......................................................................................................... 103
Introduction

Recently, voluntary individual action as a solution to environmental issues has become more prominent, these actions usually place an emphasis on participating in local recycling programs or purchasing energy efficient appliances to reduce energy consumption. Increased scrutiny of the adverse environmental impacts resulting from routine activities has been particularly intense throughout the late 1980s and 1990s. This scrutiny centered on the negative environmental impacts of individual habits that emphasized increased landfill waste, water consumption and pollution stemming from energy consumption.\(^1\) As such, this individually based environmental concern was also mirrored in media reporting techniques that increased not only the quantity of news item relating to the environment, but also the quality of articles geared towards individual solutions for reducing environmental impacts.\(^2\) In addition, other literary materials such as consumer-based manuals were also met with great success, such as The Green Consumer Guide, which educated and instructed individuals on how live more environmentally friendly lifestyles.\(^3\) Thus, the increased availability and demand for individually based environmental solutions, whether through consumer guides, media reports or consumer goods, signaled a willingness amongst individuals to voluntarily accept more responsibility for environmental conditions and to take steps to reduce their environmental impact. This trend reflects what Michael Maniates calls the ‘individualization of the


environment’, where management of environmental issues is increasingly being placed within the realm of individual control. The increase of individually based environmental solutions places improvement of environmental conditions within the scope of individual responsibility.\(^4\)

Moreover, this increase in individual responsibility for environmental conditions remains rooted in voluntary action, where individuals willingly change and monitor their behavior in order to lead environmentally friendly lifestyles.

This shift towards individualized environmental solutions shares similarities with the recent concept of environmental citizenship. The concept of environmental citizenship maintains that in addition to environmental protection provided in public legislation or regulations, individuals are obliged to accept additional responsibility for the environment in their personal lives. This requires individuals to actively reduce their personal environmental impacts through activities such as recycling or composting programs as a means of reducing landfill waste.\(^5\)

Individuals are encouraged to adopt additional obligations for the environment rooted not only in ethical considerations for the environment, but also for obligations owed to follow citizens to keep a clean and safe environment. These responsibilities are based in voluntary action, making education and awareness campaigns crucial to the promotion of environmental citizenship.\(^6\)

Here, education for environmental citizenship informs individuals of their adverse environmental impacts and the necessary lifestyles changes that must be made in order to improve environmental conditions. Lifestyles changes, such as purchasing local or organic products are

---

\(^4\) Michael Maniates “Individualization: Plant a Tree, Ride a Bike, Save the World?” (2001) 1 Global Environmental Politics 31 at 33.


\(^6\) Ibid.
consistent with environmental citizenship since these changes enable individuals to lower their
environmental impacts.\textsuperscript{7}

The connection between individualized solutions to environmental issues and
environmental citizenship has a significant relationship to the Canadian environmental policy
structure. In promoting responsible environmental action, the government of Canada has made
great efforts to educate its citizens regarding personal environmental impacts and the methods of
reducing environmental impacts in line with sustainable development. Through the
environmental citizenship initiatives brought in through the 1990 \textit{Canada Green Plan},\textsuperscript{8} the
Canadian government took steps to persuade its citizens to voluntarily adopt environmentally
sound lifestyles in accordance with their prescribed guidelines. Extensive education programs
were utilized as a means of encouraging individuals to make lifestyle changes that would reduce
environmental impacts and promote sustainable development. This placed more emphasis on
individual action to improve environmental conditions, where individuals were responsibilized
into making lifestyle changes. Thus, this thesis aims to shed light on this trend in an effort to
better understand how individuals have come to voluntarily adopt environmental values and
conduct, and its connection to the concept of environmental citizenship. To achieve this, an
analysis of the historical, cultural and political shift in the Canadian environmental atmosphere
will provide the contextual foundation for this trend towards individualized environmental
solutions, while an analysis of the \textit{Green Plan} will situate individual conduct within
environmental citizenship. This will then be analyzed using the Foucaultian theory of
governmentality in order to determine how proper environmental conduct is promoted through

\textsuperscript{7} Seyfang, G. “Shopping for Sustainability: Can Sustainable Consumption Promote Ecological Citizenship?” (2005)
14 Environmental Politics 290.

governmental policy and the methods used to encourage individuals to modify their behavior to match environmental guidelines. As such, this thesis will examine three separate but interrelated research questions:

1. How has environmental citizenship been developed in Canada?
2. How has good environmental citizenship been internalized at the individual level resulting in voluntary self-regulation?
3. How do questions 1 & 2 function within a governmentality framework?

This project will provide a greater understanding of how individual environmental conduct is shaped and illuminate the methods used by government to encourage individuals to internalize environmentally friendly behaviors and monitor their behavior. This research will provide insight into the initial policy framework utilized to develop and encourage environmental behaviors at the individual level. As individualized solutions to environmental problems continue to be popular, this research will illuminate the initial policy framework and mechanisms for encouraging behavioral changes towards environmentally friendly lifestyles.

In addressing these research questions, this project is divided into four chapters. The first chapter provides a brief examination of the pertinent environmental history in Canada to illuminate shifts in environmental values and environmental regulation. The pre and post WWII attitudes relating the environment and natural resources, the broadening of environmental values, environmental social movements and political atmosphere as they each contribute to the promotion of environmental awareness at the individual level. Key developments, such as the influence of neoliberalism and the deregulation of the environment, have placed more importance on voluntary individual action, while also introduced the need to govern individual conduct towards environmental aims. In addition, the increase of individually based environmental solutions, such as consumer guides, environmentally safe products, recycling
programs, media reports suggests that individuals had begun to adopt behaviors consistent with prescribed environmental aims. As such, this chapter articulates the shift in Canadian environmental policy to accommodate individually based actions. It serves to illuminate the shift towards individualized environmental solutions in Canadian environmental policy, but also the correlating increase in the voluntary adoption of environmentally friendly lifestyles. In doing so, this chapter provides the historical and empirical framework needed to explore the research questions by shedding insight on how individualized environmental solutions were developed in Canada.

The second chapter reviews relevant theoretical approaches that can be applied to the adoption of environmentally sound conduct. This will include an overview of the concept of political consumption, ecological modernization, and governmentality. In addition, it will also assess these approaches for their ability to address increases in environmentally responsible conduct and internalization of environmentally friendly behaviors. In reviewing the relevant literature, I interpret the governmentality framework as the most effective method of understanding the governance of individual conduct, as well as the policy instruments used to promote environmental subjectivity. Focusing on the concept of environmental subjectivity provides insight into the methods of stimulating voluntary behavioral changes and self-regulation. It also contributes to existing environmental governmentality literature regarding the application of biopower or disciplinary power to environmental regulation by illuminating the methods of encouraging individuals to willingly identify with and internalize behaviors consistent with prescribed environmental aims. In doing so, this chapter introduces the concept of governing within advanced liberal governmentalities in order to concentrate the governance of voluntary individual conduct and the means of encouraging environmental subjectivity. In other
words, this chapter reviews the relevant literature in order to attain the appropriate theoretical framework, while contributing to existing environmental governmentality literature by focusing the concept of subjectivity.

The third chapter expands on the concept of subjectivity in relation to governance of individual environmental conduct. Foucault’s concept of the technologies of the self will be discussed as the foundations for understanding the mechanisms used to encourage individuals to adopt a particular subjectivity, while also building on these technologies to include a more modern adaptation. Here, Nikolas Rose’s framework for shaping individual conduct through technologies of consumption, therapeutics and community provides inroads into the variety of methods that are used to encourage individuals to subjectify themselves in accordance to environmental aims. For example, environmentally friendly consumer goods enable individuals to purchase products that are consistent with environmentally friendly lives, while educational materials such as pamphlets and guides instruct individuals on environmental impacts and responsiblize them into making lifestyle changes. In addition, the concept of environmental citizenship utilizes the community as a means of influencing and encouraging individuals to adopt additional obligations for environmental conditions. As such, these technologies are used to encourage individuals to develop an environmental identity and regulate their conduct accordingly. Thus, this chapter establishes the conceptual framework for understanding individual conduct is shaped through subjectivity and situates these technologies within the governmentality framework.

The final chapter applies the conceptual framework to Canada’s environmental policy scheme. The 1990 Canada Green Plan serves as Canada’s first comprehensive environmental plan and introduces the concept of environmental citizenship. This requires individuals to
actively inform themselves on environmental issues, to take steps to reduce their personal environmental impacts and to empower others to do the same. The environmental citizenship initiatives rely on educational efforts as a means of influencing behavioral changes, and changes in consumption habits as a means of carrying out their commitment to living environmentally responsible lifestyles. In doing so, communities are targeted as the prime method of the principles of environmental citizenship, based on the communities’ ability to influence individuals into adopting the necessary behavioral changes. These environmental citizenship initiatives utilize the technologies of therapeutics, consumption and community as a means of encouraging individuals to adopt environmental subjectivity and internalize the principles of environmental citizenship. Moreover, the ability to influence the behavior of individuals through education, consumption and community is reflective of a power relationship, where power represents the ability to guide and shape the conduct of individuals. Through these technologies, the government of Canada was able to govern individual conduct at a distance, which obscured the sources of power that steered individual conduct towards specific environmental aims.
Chapter One: Trends in Environmental Regulation

Recently, individual solutions for environmental issues have become more prevalent. Individuals are increasingly persuaded to adopt environmentally friendly behaviour as a means of reducing environmental stresses, such as pollution or degradation. Such individualized approaches include participating in recycling programs, purchasing products with a lower environmental impact, and reducing energy consumption by utilizing public transportation to commute to work. These voluntary changes encourage individuals to adopt and internalize environmentally responsible behaviours, without governmental coercion. In this way, these individuals willingly take on additional responsibility and self-regulate in accordance with environmentally friendly behaviours. This form of regulation marks a stark change from the stronger regulatory approach resulting from the social mobilization efforts during the 1970s. Increases in voluntary self-regulation can be attributed to the decentralization and deregulation of environmental issues occurring throughout the 1990s. More importantly, through these shifts in environmental regulation, individuals have become more aware of their personal environmental impacts and modified their actions accordingly. This trend in environmental regulation serves as the empirical problem for the current project, which seeks to understand how individual environmental action is promoted and internalized in Canada. This chapter will establish that there indeed has been a trend towards the individualization of environmental regulation.

In order to confirm this shift, the current chapter examines three trends in environmental regulation. The first section examines the rise of environmental awareness and the corresponding formation of environmental organizations that elevated the level of environmental concern. These efforts were successful in the creation of several environmental regulations,
where industry infractions of environmental regulation led to sanctions and penalties. This form of regulation is contrasted in the second section, where the environment became deregulated and decentralized. This increased the reliance on other actors to participate in environmental regulation, but also introduced neoliberal influences placing more importance on individual action. Moreover, the trends towards environmental governance also placed more importance on individuals and the means of eliciting the desired environmental changes. The last section examines the adoption of environmentally friendly conduct at the individual level specifically. Here, trends towards increased media representation, recycling programs and changes in consumption habits indicate that individuals have begun to modify their conduct in order to mediate their environmental impacts.

1.1 The Expansion of Environmental Awareness – Regulatory Approaches

The post WWII period is commonly associated with the rise of environmentalism, and the corresponding rise in environmental regulation. The increased development occurring in this period had taken a clear environmental toll as industrial expansion led to greater pollution and depletion of natural resources. Moreover, scientific and technological advances contributed to the enhancement of environmental awareness by revealing the environmental stresses resulting from post war population booms and industrial pollution. It exposed the complex and interconnected nature of environmental issues, stimulating both awareness of environmental impacts and expanded environmental issues beyond conservation of natural resources to include pollution, health concerns, nuclear testing etc.. People had begun to experience environmental degradation firsthand, such as poor air quality, and looked to the government for regulatory
redress. This is exemplified through Rachel Carson's influential work on *Silent Spring*, which was crucial in attracting attention to the harms of pesticide use and inciting regulatory changes, while also inspiring other group mobilization efforts with respect to similar environmental hazards. The rise in environmentalism associated with this era signified the shift in environmental values, where action must be taken to ameliorate environmental conditions for a common good.

Enhanced awareness of environmental impacts and changing environmental values led to the creation of a diverse range of environmental groups, each with different environmental agendas. These groups differed both in organizational structure, ranging from local grassroots organizations to more formal lobby groups, but also in ideological foundations. While some organizations choose to work within the liberal democratic structure to advocate for stronger regulatory protections, others took a more radical route maintaining that the current governmental framework should be dismantled in order to be more sensitive to different bio regions. For example, the environmental justice movement was formed during this period, focusing its attention on the distributional and procedural aspects of environmental hazards. The distributional element of the movement was based on the discovery that poor minority communities faced much heavier environmental burdens, such as industrial waste, than wealthier communities. Procedural fairness was also key component needed for redressing institutional sources of environmental injustice, where proponents opposed closed-door environmental

---

decision-making and demanded grassroots participation. Sources of environmental injustice include the hazardous living conditions faced by the Africville community in Halifax. Here, a poor minority community was consistently inundated with environmental harms, such as industrial waste and insufficient access to clean water, and were unable seek redress from the city of Halifax. Eventually, as a result of poor living conditions the community was relocated in 1960 without the residents consent or input. Similar conditions were also seen on aboriginal reserves, which were also exposed to hazardous environmental conditions and did not have access to clean water. Thus, the environmental justice movement both contributed to increased awareness of environmental hazards and advocated for greater participation in the environmental decision-making process.

Also contributing to the expansion of environmental awareness was formation of several different environmental organizations. Radical environmental organizations advocated for drastic changes to our social and economic system in order to properly protect our environment. These groups were often associated with biocentrism or deep ecology, which criticise anthropocentric understandings of nature and advocate for systems that place equal value on all life forms. A good example of this was the development of Greenpeace, an environmental group formed in Vancouver to protest nuclear testing. The group notoriously utilized the media to gain national attention and increase awareness for their environmental causes. In addition to Greenpeace, a variety of other less radical environmental organizations were formed to address

---

18 Judith McKenzie Environmental Politics in Canada: Managing the Commons in the Twenty-First Century (Don Mills, Ontario: Oxford University Press, 2001) at 77.
different environmental concerns. For example, wilderness preservation efforts were promoted though the formation of such groups as Sierra Club, pollution and recycling efforts were advanced by Pollution Probe and legal environmental issues were addressed through the creation of the Canadian Environmental Law Association. While these environmental groups may have differed in their ultimate environmental goals, their formation was instrumental in promoting awareness of environmental concerns.

This enhanced level of environmental awareness and concern translated into regulatory gains. This period led to significant changes in natural resource management in order to accommodate pollution prevention and conservation ideals. Numerous pieces of legislation at both the provincial and federal level were created to reduce pollution and protect wildlife. Since the regulation of the environment can fall under both federal jurisdiction, as the regulation or trade and commerce, and provincial jurisdiction as the regulation of property, cooperative regulations were formed at both levels. For example, the Canada Water Act was a federal piece of legislation that set out water pollution guidelines, which were enforced at the provincial level. Other important federal acts aimed at reducing pollution included the Clean Air Act, Ocean Dumping Control Act and the Canada Water Act. Also important during this era of environmental regulation was the establishment of federal and provincial departments of environment. The creation of the Environment Canada signified the importance of environmental issues and consolidated much of the environmental regulations under one department. While this was also true at the provincial level, the provincial departments had the

---

20 Ibid, at 61.
additional task of enforcing the newly enacted regulations. These provided significant regulatory changes, where industries faced sanctions and punitive damages for non-compliance. As such, this type of environmental regulation is characterized by its ‘command and control’ system, meaning that industries are forced to comply with environmental regulations or receive penalties and sanctions.

However, the increases of environmental protection in Canada have not been without influence. It is important to acknowledge the role of the United States in the development of Canada’s regulatory policy. The United States has had a large impact on Canadian environmental policy for a number of reasons. For one thing, Canada did not have the same level of social mobilization as the United States, and the environmental movement started later on in Canada. This meant that although some environmental organizations were formed in Canada, such as Greenpeace, many organizations were actually offshoots of American Groups. Furthermore, Canada lacked the cohesive level of social mobilization demanding environmental change that was present in the United States. As such, Canada tended to develop its environmental legislation based American legislation, but modified to suit the Canadian Context. For example, the American environmental justice movement developed from the civil rights movement with well-documented environmental discrimination. The Canadian political and social context was different; Canada did not have a similar civil rights movement and the sources of environmental injustice are less cohesive and piecemeal.

---

23 Melody Hessing, Michael Howlett & Tracy Summerville Canadian Natural Resource and Environmental Policy, 2nd eds, (Vancouver: UBC Press, 2005) at 56. [Hessing, Howlett & Summerville]
25 Ibid at 146.
26 Hessing, Howlett & Summerville, supra note 23 at 148.
27 McKenzie, supra note 24 at 120.
developed extensive environmental regulation in the 1970s, Canada was slower to incorporate participatory elements requiring public involvement.° Though Canada did incorporate extensive environmental regulations throughout the 1970s, it is important to recognize the American role in promoting Canadian environmental regulation.

By analyzing this period of environmental regulation, it becomes apparent that this era of environmental policymaking was characterized by increasing environmental concern that translated into regulatory policy. This growth in environmental concern was rooted in social mobilization efforts that influenced systemic changes to benefit the common good.30 The increase in environmental awareness and change in environmental values prompted groups to mobilize and lobby the government for increased regulatory protection. This was successful in that it led the creation of a variety of environmental regulations taking a strict regulatory approach where non-compliance with environmental regulations results in sanctions. The following section will discuss the regulatory transformation towards a voluntary compliance approach. These voluntary approaches expand environmental regulation beyond the state, displacing some its environmental responsibility onto other actors. This shift marks as important change in environmental regulation, where the role of individual within environmental governance can be examined.

1.2 Regulatory Shifts – Deregulation

Throughout the 1990s, there was a marked shift away from the ‘command and control’ style regulations of the previous era towards cooperative environmental regulation. During this time, both federal and provincial departments of environment faced significant budgetary reductions. This resulted in significant losses in staffing, and decreased their ability to monitor pollution. For example, the Ontario Ministry of Environment lost 31% of its staff and severe budgetary cuts weakened its ability to control pollution in the Great Lakes.31 Free-market incentives were favoured over strict environmental regulation, where governmental control of environmental regulation was inefficient compared to industry self-regulation. The combination of budgetary cuts and free market incentives meant that the government had lost its regulatory power over industry and in its place stood voluntary compliance codes. These voluntary measures were favoured over government involvement as a cost effective mechanism for regulating the environment.32 This reduced coercive regulations and placed more emphasis on voluntary compliance and cooperative agreements, requiring both industry and citizen groups to monitor and control environmental issues. Analyzing the role of voluntary mechanisms in environmental regulation will highlight the trend towards a deregulated atmosphere, where more attention is placed on voluntary action.

The budgetary reductions to federal and provincial departments of environment depleted their monitoring and enforcement abilities, causing the government to turn attention to voluntary mechanisms as a method of regulating the environment. This moved away from coercive forms of regulation, towards a cooperative partnership approach where industries were actively

32 Judith McKenzie Environmental Politics in Canada: Managing the Commons in the Twenty-First Century (Don Mills, Ontario: Oxford University Press, 2001) at 112.
involved in their own regulation. The expansion of industry based self-regulation occurred in a number of ways, with varying degrees of governmental input. One method of regulation was achieved through voluntary agreements between government and industry, where industries pledged their commitment to pollution reduction. These were known as ‘memorandums of understanding’ and were signed with various Canadian industries as the Canadian Chemical Producers Association and the Motor Vehicle Manufacturers association. It is important to note that these companies were not actually required to reduce pollution, but merely pledge their commitment. Other government initiated forms of voluntary regulation included voluntary challenge programs, where industries were challenged to reduce pollution to meet desired quotas. For example, the Accelerated Reduction /Elimination of Toxics program challenged industries to reduce the amount of 30 types of toxic chemicals by 90% by the year 2000. Lastly, voluntary programs without any government input were also introduced as a form of voluntary industry self-regulation. The most notable of these programs is the Responsible Care Program offered by the Canadian Chemical Producers Association. This enabled participating industries to monitor their own practices by providing environmental codes of conduct, policies, strategies and administrative procedures that would improve environmental standards. This form of voluntary self-regulation was very successful, where increasing industry participation suggests that this form of regulation will continue to grow. Furthermore, this shift in environmental regulation

---

34 Ibid. at 224.
35 Ibid at 225.
36 Ibid at 229.
represents the growing role played by civil society in environmental regulation, and the
decreasing role played by the government.\textsuperscript{38}

This increase of outside involvement in environmental management was also reflected
through increased participation of citizen groups. While citizen involvement in environmental
protection was not a new phenomenon, the reliance on community organizations to participate in
the management of environmental issues has grown since the 1990s.\textsuperscript{39} Also resulting from
budgetary and staff cuts to governmental departments of environment, the government became
increasingly dependent on the participation of community groups in environmental
management.\textsuperscript{40} Here, there was an increasing reliance on both local environmental groups and
volunteers to become involved in, and contribute to the management of environmental issues.\textsuperscript{41}
In this way, these groups became co-managers of local environmental issues, taking an active
role in the management of the environment by sharing environmental decision-making and
responsibility with government. This is significant because it highlights an increased willingness
among environmental communities to voluntarily take an active role, but in doing so, reduces the
government’s role in managing environmental issues. Thus, citizen involvement and co-
management initiatives resulted in partnerships between communities and governments, where
communities were more actively involved in environmental issues. For example, a local
community organization in Hamilton was responsible for monitoring water quality and
discovered contaminants leaking from the nearby Rennie Street Landfill. This was reported to

\textsuperscript{38} Ibid, at 237.
\textsuperscript{39} Anthony H. J. Dorsey & Timothy McDaniels “Great Expectations, Mixed Results: Trends in Citizen Involvement
in Edwards A. Parson eds. Governing the Environment: Persistent Challenges, Uncertain Innovations (Toronto:
University of Toronto Press, 2001) at 258.
\textsuperscript{40} Ibid, at 262.
\textsuperscript{41} Ryan Plummer & Susan M. Arai “Co-Management of Natural Resources: Opportunities and Barriers for Working
with Citizen Volunteers” (2005) 7:4 Environmental Practice 221 at 222.
the authorities, and resulted in a fine for the City of Hamilton. This example illustrates that in
light of the government’s reduced ability to monitor environmental issues, citizen groups took on
additional responsibilities for the environmental management in their communities.
Furthermore, it highlights the cooperative relationship between communities and government in
the management and control of the environment.

The shift towards decentralization of environmental regulation is significant for a number
of reasons. Firstly, the budgetary cuts to departments of environment, reduced administrative and
staffing abilities, and increased reliance on voluntary mechanisms of regulation are consistent
with neoliberal ideology. This neoliberal influence has important implications for individuals as
it tends to construe social action within individualistic terms, where citizenship is associated with
economic and entrepreneurial interests. This means that neoliberal influences encourage
individuals to take an active role in environmental issues as a means of acting in their own best
interest. Second, this shift away from ‘command and control’ regulation towards a cooperative
approach represents a shift towards environmental governance. Here, environmental regulation
is expanded beyond state action to include several actors such as corporations, nongovernmental
organizations, communities etc.. Under an environmental governance framework, regulatory
mechanisms and process are aimed at influencing environmental actions, knowledge and
behaviours. This bears significance for individual action because a governance framework
focuses on encouraging voluntary behavioural changes in order to elicit the desired

42 Beth Savan, Christopher Gore & Alexis J. Morgan “Shifts in Environmental Governance in Canada: How are
610. [Savan]
276.
44 Savan, supra note 42 at 606.
45 Maria Cameron Lemos & Arun Agrawal “Environmental Governance” 31 Annu. Rev. Environ. Resour. 297 at
299.
environmental response. Thus, the environmental governance framework seeks to promote individual change as both a component of environmental regulation and a means of reducing environmental impacts.

The shift in environmental regulation that occurred in Canada during the 1990s has had a variety of effects. The budgetary cuts to federal and provincial departments of environment reduced their administrative and monitoring capabilities leading to greater reliance on industries, environmental organizations and community groups to monitor the environment. In doing so, the government lost some of its environmental authority while encouraging others to take on more responsibility for the environment. The reduction of governmental authority in environmental regulation and increase of voluntary measures coincides with both the rise of neoliberalism and environmental governance. Influences of neoliberalism on environmental regulation have led to a decreased regulatory atmosphere, placing increased importance on self-regulation and voluntary individual action. The role of environmental governance has broadened the number of actors participating in environmental regulation, while focusing on individual behavioural changes as a means of achieving the desired environmental goals.

While the examination of industry influence has been crucial for outlining the shifts in environmental regulation and has played a crucial role in highlighting the rise of voluntary self-regulation, neoliberal influence and environmental governance, the remainder of this project will focus on the voluntary behavioural changes at the individual level. Thus far, my analysis has established that there was a shift in environmental regulation, where the rise of neoliberalism and environmental governance has affected environmental regulation to include individual action.

\[46\] Ibid. at 311.
The following section elaborates on the ways in which individuals have begun to modify their conduct to incorporate environmentally friendly behaviours.

1.3 The Trend Towards Individual Action

The shift toward deregulation of the environment has had direct implications for individual environmental responsibility, where decreases in regulation have translated to increases in individual responsibility. For example, in 1979 the government of Ontario decided to reduce landfill waste by requiring that 70% of containers be reusable, thereby placing the responsibility of reducing landfill waste on industry. However, in 1985 industries successfully lobbied the government and reduced that number to 30% in exchange for implementing recycling programs. This reduction meant that the responsibility of reducing landfill waste was shifted onto individuals, who were becoming increasingly responsible for recycling efforts.\(^{47}\) This shift represents what Michael Maniates calls the ‘individualization of responsibility,’ where the environmental burdens are increasingly placed within the realm of individual action.\(^{48}\) This is significant because while environmental issues were increasingly being placed within the realm of individual action, individuals were beginning to accept these additional responsibilities. In keeping with the example of recycling, the introduction of curb side recycling programs in Canada was met with success. While recycling programs were not yet available in all cities, cities that implemented recycling programs had high participation rates.\(^{49}\) This indicates that individuals were willing to accept additional responsibilities for the environment when given the


\(^{48}\) Michael Maniates “Individualization: Plant a Tree, Ride a Bike, Save the World?” (2001) 1 Global Environmental Politics 31at 33.

opportunities. The following discussion will provide additional examples where individuals have begun to conduct themselves in an environmentally friendly manner.

During the regulatory shift in the 1990s, individual consumption and waste came under increased scrutiny, as more focus was placed on issues ranging from wasteful energy consumption habits to the massive amounts of garbage produced on a yearly basis. Individuals were urged to acknowledge their personal environmental impacts while adopting alternative habits in order to reduce waste. This included changes such as utilizing public transportation and purchasing energy efficient products. These messages are evident in media reports, which were increasingly reporting on individual environmental impacts. A study of environmental issues reported in the Canadian media between 1970 and 1990 showed that there was a significant shift in the way that environmental issues were presented to the public during this period. Between 1970 and 1990, the number and scope of environmental problems being reported increased significantly, signaling a new found concern for environmental issues in Canada’s growing environmental consciousness. However, what had started as a means of informing the public about environmental harms and movements, shifted to include methods of individual participation in environmental issues. By the 1990s 25% of media headlines pertaining to environmental issues contained information on how the individual citizens could live and participate in society in an environmentally friendly way. This shift in environmental representation suggests that individuals were becoming increasingly aware of their personal

---

52 Ibid. at 153.
impact and were informing themselves on how to adopt appropriate behaviours that would reduce their environmental impact.

The acceptance of environmental responsibilities at the individual level is also reflected through the growth of environmentally friendly consumer products. Studies had shown that consumption patterns present in the 1970s exceeded the earth’s capacity to regenerate its resources, and by the mid 1990s consumption was 30% higher than the rate needed to allow the earth to regenerate its resources.\textsuperscript{53} Since consumption is an inherent component of modern society, attention had to be paid to decrease consumption impacts in order to alleviate the stresses on natural resources. Green consumerism offered individuals an alternative, where consumption practices are modified to be more mindful of environmental impacts. This enabled individuals to reduce their environmental impact by selecting environmentally friendly products. Individual adoption of environmentally friendly lifestyles became hugely popular, evident through the sell out success of \textit{The Green Consumer Guide}, a manual outlining how to purchase items with a lower environmental impact.\textsuperscript{54} Furthermore, Canadian retailers such as Loblaws began to develop environmentally friendly product lines to incorporate the growing demand for environmentally sound products. More attention was placed on packaging as well, where the amount of product packaged using recycled paper grew from 1% in 1988 to 33% in 1991.\textsuperscript{55} Thus, the growth of green consumerism represented the adoption of environmentally responsible


\textsuperscript{54} \textit{Ibid.}

conduct at the individual level, while its individualistic nature and deregulated market approaches was consistent with neoliberalism.\textsuperscript{56}

Both the growth in media representations and increasing rates of environmentally responsible behaviours such as green consumption and recycling, illustrate the trend towards individual acceptance of environmental responsibility to reduce their environmental impacts. In acknowledging this increased responsibility, individuals have begun to modify their behaviours to be sensitive to environmental impacts. In keeping with the trend towards environmental governance, this shift signifies the change in environmental behaviours consistent with the desired response of reducing individual environmental impacts.

\textbf{1.4 Conclusion}

The changes in environmental regulation have had significant implications for individuals. While the growth of environmental concern in the 1970s led to the creation of a variety of environmental groups and organizations, and government control of environmental issues, there was a marked shift away from this form of regulation during the 1990s. Here, more emphasis was placed on collaboration as a form of environmental regulation; specifically, neoliberalism and environmental governance placed more importance on individual environmental action. This is evidenced through changes in media reports advocating increasing levels of individual environmental action, increased participation in recycling programs, and increased consumption of environmentally friendly goods. These events suggest that individuals are taking more responsibility for their impact on the environment. Thus, shifts in environmental regulation towards environmental governance, coupled with an increased call for individual

responsibility, suggests that there has indeed been a shift in environmental regulation towards individual self-regulation.

The following chapter will examine this issue and review relevant theoretical frameworks to better understand how individuals have come to voluntarily accept and internalize environmental responsibilities. The theoretical frameworks reviewed include political consumption, ecological modernization and governmentality. Through this review, I will establish the most effective framework for analyzing how environmental conduct is influenced at the individual level.
Chapter 2: Approaches to Individualized Environmental Solutions

The previous chapter established that the shift towards environmental governance has included individual action as a component of environmental governance. Here, there has been a trend towards encouraging behavioural changes at the individual level as a means of eliciting the desired response, such as reducing energy consumption, waste etc. Furthermore, the increase in environmentally conscious behaviours in Canada suggests that individuals have indeed begun to accept additional responsibility for their environmental impacts, and modify their behaviours accordingly. Thus, having established the individualization of environmental issues, it becomes necessary to understand how this phenomenon occurred. Reviewing the relevant literature in the area of individual action within environmental governance, such as the concept of political consumption, ecological modernization and governmentality, will provide the theoretical framework needed to understand regulation of environmental conduct. In assessing these approaches to individual environmental conduct, a governmentality analysis offers the most appropriate framework for examining the methods in which environmental conduct is influenced. As such, this chapter will both review the relevant literature in the area of environmental governance, while contributing to existing literature on environmental governmentality by focusing more closely on the methods in which individuals activity shape and regulate their own conduct.

This chapter is structured into three fields of analysis; first, it will review the relevant approaches to individual environmental conduct in order to determine the most appropriate framework. This will illuminate a variety of methods in which individual action can contribute to environmental governance, while ultimately selecting the governmentality framework based
on its attention to governing as a means of eliciting the desired behaviour. Second, this review will highlight the existing applications of a governmentality analysis within the realm of environmental policy, such as natural resource management and urban environmental policies, in order to understand how recent environmental policy influences behaviour through a governmentality analysis. Having examined the relevant literature on environmental governmentalities, the last section will suggest focusing more closely on the concept of environmental subjectivity as a means of shaping individual conduct. Doing so will contribute to the existing literature on environmental subjectivity by providing more insight into the methods utilized to persuade individuals to adopt environmentally responsible behaviours.

2.1 Approaches to Individual Environmental Conduct

As discussed in the previous chapter, green consumption as a means of reducing individual environmental impacts has increased. Here, individuals change their consumption habits to reflect their commitment to environmentally friendly lifestyles. As a result, companies and industries have tailored their products to suit these lifestyle changes and reflect environmentally sound values. Since green consumerism is a prominent aspect of environmentally responsible behaviour, it becomes necessary to examine individual consumption within the realm of environmental governance in order to determine whether changes in consumption can account for the greater shifts in environmental behaviours and attitudes. Here, the recent concept of political consumption is significant, since it maintains that consumption can invoke large-scale changes in environmental attitudes. This approach claims that there is a link between ethical consumption, or the consumption of green products, and greater social and political changes. In its basic sense, political consumerism refers to the ability for individual
consumers to change objectionable practices through their purchasing power.\textsuperscript{57} Through proper product labelling, individuals inform themselves about a particular company’s manufacturing practices, and choose products that employ environmentally sound practices. For example, labels may identify products made using sustainable production practices, organic materials or fair-trade goods.\textsuperscript{58} Policy initiatives should aim to stimulate proper environmental labelling through the standardized labelling practices and environmental codes of conduct in order to inform consumers about environmentally friendly alternatives.\textsuperscript{59} Given the proper information via environmental labels, consumers are empowered to purchase (or boycott) certain products, leading to a change in political and economic attitudes toward the environment.\textsuperscript{60} The application of political consumerism to the current examination of environmental behaviours at the individual level would suggest that the growth of individual environmental awareness and environmentally friendly products is linked to increased demand. Moreover, this bottom-up approach to shifts in environmental behaviour suggests that consumption is a viable method of promoting systemic changes to environmental attitudes.

Although political consumerists would advocate that the influx of green products and greater understanding of environmental impacts is related to increased ethical consumption, there are a number of reasons why this approach is not suitable for the current project. Firstly, political consumerism assumes that all consumers will develop similar concerns for the environment and actively seek out alternatives. It applies a generic level of concern where each

\textsuperscript{58} Magnus Boström & Mikael Klintman \textit{Eco-Standards, Product Labelling and Green Consumerism} (New York, Palgrave McMillan, 2008) at 10.
\textsuperscript{59} \textit{Ibid.}
\textsuperscript{60} \textit{Ibid} at 69.
individual or community places equal importance and demand for environmental products.\(^6\) Furthermore, consumer opinion and purchasing behaviour is highly susceptible to corporate influence. By identifying themselves as ethical manufacturers, companies are able to develop and profit from green consumption like any other sort of product. In this way, green consumption is less related to demand and more dependent on business interest in developing environmentally sound products.\(^6\) Most importantly, this approach ignores the social and political context of environmental issues, which is the best predictor of how individuals understand their role within environmental governance. For example, in a recent study, individuals from the United Kingdom were more likely to feel like they should take an active role in promoting environmentally responsible consumption, whereas as individuals from Norway felt that that was the responsibility of the government.\(^6\) Since the importance of environmental issues are best predicted by political context over individual consumption, the concept of political consumption focuses too much on bottom-up approach to environmental change, while ignoring the governmental role in promoting proper environmental behaviours. As such, this framework focuses too much on consumption and is blind to the other factors that influence changes in conduct.

Moving toward a more encompassing framework, the ecological modernization theory provides a more promising engagement with structural changes that incorporated environmental aims. This framework moves beyond the examination of consumption to include an institutional analysis, but remains focused on market solutions for environmental issues. The ecological modernization theory was developed to explain the environmental policy changes occurring


\(^6\) Ibid. at 474.

\(^6\) Ibid. at 472.
throughout the latter half of the decade, where there was a surge in technological advancements to produce environmentally sound products. These technological advancements were rooted in precautionary action, prompting more efficient uses of resources while lowering waste and pollution, such as recycling programs. As such, the ecological modernization theory examines this progression of environmental policy that utilized market-based instruments to ameliorate environmental harms, reduce pollution and increase resource efficiency. While ecological modernization relates to the institutionalization of environmental considerations, the manner of achieving this ranges from weak to strong variants. The weak variant relies heavily on science and technology, where a strong relationship between science and industry would enable industries to develop scientific innovations to advance sustainable development and promote efficient use of resources. This technocratic, market-driven variant depends primarily on industry as a means of institutionalizing environmental considerations in line with sustainable development. Here, consumption and production techniques are reformulated to account for environmental considerations and concerns. Other stronger variants of the theory require a more open, participatory approach, where communities and environmental organizations are actively involved in promoting systemic changes to incorporate environmental considerations. This moves beyond reliance on industry and science to promote sustainable development, to promote a democratic approach to environmental decision-making.

---

64 Peter Christoff “Ecological Modernization, Ecological Modernities” (1996) 5:3 Environmental Politics 476 at 477. [Christoff]
66 Christoff, supra note 64 at 490.
While the ecological modernization theory works well as a means for explaining the environmental policy trends occurring over the past few decades, such as the increased participation by both industry and environmental organizations, there are a number of issues which suggest it would not be the most effective framework for examining individual conduct. Most importantly, ecological modernization does not specifically address changes in individual behaviours towards environmental aims. The reasoning for changes in environmental action at the individual level is not discussed, which suggests that the ecological modernization theory is not capable of dealing with it, or it is assumed that environmental threats are so pressing that all individuals will participate. While the introduction of participatory environmental programs, such as recycling and composting initiatives, are consistent with stronger variants of the ecological modernization theory, it fails to address the individual motivations for adopting environmentally responsible behaviours. When examining the weaker variant of the theory relying on technology or industry incentives, the theory still falls short of addressing individual behavioural changes toward the environment. Too much emphasis is placed on technological advancement and market based solutions, which are often determined using a cost-benefit analyses. Many actions associated with good environmental behaviour, such as buying local or organic produce are not necessarily cost effective and recycling programs do not provide the individual with any economic benefit. Moreover, the environment is determined according to its market value, rather than to ethical considerations. This becomes problematic because the process of adjusting individual behaviour is an intensely moral endeavour. Continuous self-

70 Ibid.
reflection is necessary when striving to achieve ideal environmental behaviour, linking self-regulation with ethics and morality. In acknowledging the deficiencies of the ecological modernization framework to address individual behavioural changes, a theoretical framework more sensitive to the methods of influencing environmental conduct must be utilized.

2.2 Governmentality

The Foucauldian concept of governmentality addresses the drawbacks of the previous approaches by providing a more comprehensive framework for examining how environmental conduct is promoted through environmental policy, paying close attention to the processes used to shape individual behaviour. According to Foucault, governmentality was the result of the movement away from traditional forms of government, associated with the methods of maintaining rule over a given territory, towards the government and control of populations. This broadened the scope of government to issues surrounding the government of the self and morality, the government of family as it relates to the economy and lastly the state as it relates to politics. According to Foucault, governance of these issues provided a basis for government to secure economic prosperity by ensuring the productivity of its citizens. To do so, the government focused on imposing political tactics on its population aimed at constructing and shaping social behaviours.

Thus, governmentality can be described as the ‘the conduct of conduct’,\(^7\) meaning that government functions both as a verb, the act of behaving appropriately, as well as a noun, as the standard of appropriate behaviour. Both uses of the term are crucial to governing, where a myriad of different institutions utilize different regulatory aims in order to deliberately shape behaviour according to desired outcomes.\(^8\) Government action is thus both a conscious and rational effort to change human conduct, involving a variety of different governmental techniques aimed at collective and individual conduct.\(^9\) However, individuals are also involved in their own self-government, where they are encouraged to reflect on their own behaviour in order to govern themselves more effectively. Thus, governmentality includes the examination of both of how authority it exercised over a given population but also how individuals govern themselves.\(^10\)

In reviewing the different approaches to individualized approaches to environmental aims, the governmentality framework is best equipped for examining the methods of influencing individual conduct. While the political consumption approach is able to address the influx of green consumer products, it focuses too much on a bottom-up approach to environmental changes and fails to address the political context of individual environmental changes. Ecological modernization is more effective in this respect since it addresses the institutional changes that incorporated environmental concern, but is silent on the preliminary methods of encouraging and shaping environmentally responsible behaviour. As such, the governmentality framework overcomes these drawbacks by addressing both the shifts in environmental

---


\(^9\) Ibid.

\(^10\) Ibid. at 12.
governance that is more critical of individual conduct, and the methods of influencing individuals to adopt environmentally friendly behaviours. The following section expands on the concept of governmentality as a means of shaping individual environmental conduct, while reviewing the relevant applications to environmental policy.

2.3 Environmental Governmentality

To this point, it has been established that the governmentality framework is the most effective means of examining the increases in environmentally responsible behaviour due to its attention to the methods of shaping individual conduct. While governmentality is understood as the ‘conduct of conduct’ that involves the deliberate, rational and calculated effort to shape conduct in line with desired aims, it now becomes necessary to understand how it operates. Firstly, governmentality is a problematizing activity, where conduct is perceived as problematic and in need of adjustments. However, problematic conduct is not a pre-given, and must be constructed as such and made visible. This a slow process, achieved through various events, sites and actors, such as politicians, media and special interest groups, that reveal specific conduct as problematic.\(^8^1\) Problematizing conduct causes groups and individuals to question their own behaviour in order to govern themselves more effectively.\(^8^2\) These problematizations rely on formalized knowledge, or expertise in order to provide a common language to debate and assess conduct. For example, some level of formalized knowledge or expertise is employed to determine if conduct is dangerous, unproductive, inefficient etc. in order to achieve the ideal or

---


desired manner of conducting oneself. Second, governmentality examines the methods in
which conduct becomes open to intervention. This involves two aspects of governing, the
rationalities of government and the technologies of government. The former refers to the
methods of thinking about a particular problem that renders it open to intervention. The latter
refers to the tools and techniques used to modify conduct and act on the rationalities of
government. While the rationalities of government refer to the methods of representing and
knowing a problem, the technologies of government refers to the methods of transforming it.

Prior to discussing the relevant applications of environmental applications to a
governmentality analysis, it is important to emphasis the relationship between expertise and the
environmental regulation. As mentioned earlier, expertise is a crucial component of
governmentality because of its ability to create and shape knowledge, but it is also crucial in the
normalization process. According to Foucault, normalization refers to the coercive process of
standardizing behaviour, where normal behaviours are differentiated from abnormal
behaviours. Here, expert knowledge permeates through our regulatory framework by
providing the knowledge upon which laws and policies are formed and outlining the correct
methods of behaving. For example, the creation of laws, codes and regulation are often
informed by experts in the field, and are not the sole contribution of government actors or
politicians. In this way, expertise feeds into the regulatory framework, by providing support
for regulatory aims and contributes to the normalization effect by distinguishing desirable from

---

83 Peter Miller & Nikolas Rose Governing the Present: Administering Economic, Social and Personal Life
84 Ibid. at 15.
86 Ibid. at 22.
undesirable conduct. This occurrence does not only occur at the policy level, individual citizens increasingly turn to expertise to guide their decisions and manage their lives. This influences how citizens see, understand and interact with their surroundings, thereby directly influencing values and creating norms. As a result, expert knowledge both informs and legitimates environmental policy, but also contributes to the normalization of proper behaviours and attitudes taken towards the environment.

By applying a governmentality analysis in the area of individual environmental conduct, the correlations between a governmentality analysis and environmental conduct become apparent. As the previous chapter outlined, the rise of environmental awareness was in part attributed to the technological advancements that illuminated environmental impacts and degradation, necessitating behavioural changes to reduce these impacts. Furthermore, the influence of neoliberal ideology throughout the 1990s placed more importance on individual changes as a solution for environmental problems. Increased media reports on individual environmental actions, and the growing discourse surrounding individual waste brought increased visibility and scrutiny to individual conduct. As such, this amounts to a problematization of conduct, drawing attention to behaviours in need of proper government in order to achieve a more sustainable environment. While this problematization amounts to the first step in a governmentality analysis, attention must now shift towards outlining the methods in which individual environmental conduct has been made open to intervention in order to determine how individuals have come to internalize environmental behaviours. Turning to the

---

88 Ibid. at 576.
90 Ibid. at 41.
existing literature on environmental governmentality provides insight as to the methods of shaping individual conduct in the areas of resource management and urban environmental policy.

The works of prominent authors in the field of environmental governmentality, such as Timothy Luke, Eric Darier and Paul Rutherford, have provided a body of literature situating environmental policy within the realm of governmentality. Here, Foucault’s work on biopower is extended to include the management of natural resources and sustainable development goals. Biopower functions as a component of governmentality, concerning itself with the governance of all aspects of human life in order to ensure the maximum health and prosperity among populations. The concept of biopower can be expanded beyond the control of populations to include the management and control of natural resources. Doing so normalizes environmental attitudes that support biopolitical aims, while also enabling greater control over natural resources. Thus environmental policy can be regarded as an extension of biopower that seeks to gain greater control of environmental resources as a means of securing the optimum health of populations, while also normalizing conduct that upholds these aims. Also important in applying biopower to environmental policy is the intricate relationship between power and knowledge. In this context the connection between the biopower and power/knowledge is utilized to influence environmental knowledge as a method of supporting policies aimed at maintaining healthy populations. In addition, environmental knowledge is also used to create and foster

---

94 This relationship asserts that power and knowledge are intricately intertwined in order to affirm power through the strategic use of knowledge or expertise, which is in turn influenced by power. This forms a complex relationship where power is sustained through the use of knowledge that leads to the production of truths pertaining to a particular issue. Michel Foucault “Truth and Power” in Colin Gordin eds. *Power/Knowledge: Selected interviews and Other Writings* (Pantheon Books: New York, 1980) at 133.
environmental norms, consistent with the population aims of biopower. In turn, individuals and populations begin to normalize these environmental norms, and adjust their behaviour accordingly.

Examples of utilizing biopower as a means of shaping environmental conduct include the World Watch Institute, which reconfigured environmental management within terms of sustainable development and based on economic value. The environment is interpreted within economic projects, which influences the way we understand and interact with our environment. In addition, studies on climate change have also focused on governmentality and biopower as a means to explaining how climate becomes governable, and the reliance on expert knowledge to promote sustainable development policies. Through the control of natural resources as a means of maintaining ideal populations, individual behaviour is shaped to comply with these goals. The intricate relationship between power/knowledge and biopower normalizes and supports changes in conduct, where individual changes in behaviour are reflective of this process.

Urban environmental policies have also been the object of governmentality analyses in order to demonstrate how urban settings create and promote environmental conduct through waste and consumption reduction policies. Attempts to reduce and manage waste through recycling initiatives and changes in consumption practices have been analysed using the governmentality framework, focusing on disciplinary power as means of influencing individual conduct. In this case, governmental efforts to shape the attitudes and behaviours of its citizens

---

96 Ibid. at 145.
97 Ibid. at 133.
99 This form of power is normally associated with the production of docile bodies and the internalization of proper conduct within the context of specific institutions, such as the education system or military. Through this complex disciplinary process involving observation, surveillance and examination, the desired behaviour becomes normalized. Michel Foucault Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison (New York: Pantheon Books, 1977) at 167.
are often framed within the context of good environmental citizenship. Persuading citizens to act in an environmentally sound manner is rooted in environmental obligations, where each citizen is encouraged to actively participate in improving environmental conditions. This involves activities such as education about environmental harms, community based initiatives promoting participation in environmental aims and partnership with industries to increase environmentally sound products. Here, urban environmental initiatives represent calculated efforts to bring environmental aims within the realm of visibility in order to shape environmental conduct towards the adoption of a green identity. These policies encourage a variety of repetitive tasks, such as sorting recyclables, looking for products with environmental certifications etc, where repeating these tasks on a regular basis leads to the normalization of environmentally sound behaviours. As such, disciplinary power indicates individual conduct is shaped through discipline and normalization, where increases in environmentally friendly behaviours can be attributed urban environmental policy that has normalized this type of conduct.

Also relevant in the area of urban environmental policies is the manner in which individuals contribute to their own environmental subjectivity. Subjectivity is understood as the outcome of a personal project, related to the individuals’ own construction of their ecological

---

100 Mike Raco & Rob Imrie “Governmentality and Rights and Responsibilities in Urban Policy” (2000) 32 Environmental Planning A 2187 at 2188.
101 Ibid.
103 Ibid. at 599.
104 Subjectivity refers to the process in which individuals come to identify themselves as belonging to a certain type or category, in the context of environmental policy, the process in which individuals come to identify themselves as environmentally responsible. Peter Brand “Green Subjection: The Politics of Neoliberal Urban Environmental Management” 2007 31:1 International Journal of Urban and Regional Research 616.
identity. This is demonstrated through increasing environmental programs aimed at influencing domestic life such as composting, recycling and energy conservation, or programs aimed at influencing lifestyle choices through green consumerism, which are largely dependent on individual action. Here, concepts of environmental citizenship and environmental obligations also utilized to promote self-driven environmental action, where individuals are encouraged to actively participate in environmental programs as a means of attaining environmental citizenship. By taking an active role in environmental management through the participation in environmental programs, individuals are persuaded to become self-governing environmental citizens. In this way, individual conduct is shaped through programs aimed at stimulating environmental subjectivity, where individuals are encouraged to become self-governing environmental citizens actively involved in regulating their own conduct.

Through the examination of the relevant applications of governmentality in the area of resource management and urban environmental policy, the ways in which individual conduct is shaped becomes apparent. The analysis of biopower and disciplinary power reveal the legitimization and the normalization of environmental conduct, however neither concept provides guidance on how individuals strive to achieve environmental conduct and meet established norms. Here the literature on environmental subjectivity provides more insight into the internalization of environmentally responsible behaviour by framing it as a personal individual project linked to individual self-management. While the literature on environmental subjectivity is useful for understanding the individual’s role in their government, it does not provide a comprehensive analysis of the governmental programs and methods of achieving

106 Ibid. at 626.
individual self-regulation in accordance with environmental aims. As such, I suggest that focusing more attention on Foucault’s later work on individual subjectivity would contribute to the existing environmental governmentality literature by providing more detail on how individuals come willingly adopt environmentally sound behaviour. In doing so, I will build on notions of environmental subjectivity by revealing the technologies utilized to influence behavioural changes and stimulate environmental subjectivity.

2.4 New Directions

While Foucault’s earlier work on disciplinary power and governmentality focuses on techniques that produce docile, normalized subjects, this process only explains one aspect of the subjectification process. Equally important are the techniques individuals use to regulate themselves, and how these techniques contribute to the subjectification process. Specifically, an examination of how the individual acts on oneself in order to achieve perfection or the ideal state of happiness. Foucault turns his attention towards governing within a liberal society, as a means of exploring this issue. Since liberalism is associated with the reduction of government and the promotion of free choice, the question then becomes how to govern the free choice of individuals. Focusing on the methods of governing in ‘advanced liberal’ governments will provide insight as to what techniques are utilized to influence individual conduct to match desired aims. This form of government is characterized by its ability to govern through freedom to attain the desired conduct while promoting individuals to become self-reliant and self-

---


governing. In liberal government, the individual is both a target and partner in government, since individual conduct is a target of regulation but also necessary to accomplish governmental objectives. The goal of government in liberal societies is to create a perceived sense of freedom among individuals, where an entrepreneurial, competitive and self-serving spirit is fostered in order to shape their conduct.

By taking steps to achieve fulfillment, the individual becomes an entrepreneur for their own wellbeing. Individuals take on an enterprising role, actively participating in their self-interest. Government policies are then directed at empowering the individual to choose a particular direction on their path to self-realization. A key aspect of the entrepreneurialism is the concept of ‘new prudentialism,’ where governmental efforts are geared towards responsibilizing individuals into making prudent decisions that reduce risk in their lives. This encourages individuals to participate in risk management practices as means of improving their wellbeing. This also marks the site of professional intervention into the lives of individuals in order to educate risk minimization and preventative methods. By emphasizing the role of individual choice, advanced liberal governments encourage individuals to take steps towards their own fulfillment and risk management, while also participating in the government of these choices. These individual choices towards self-improvement then contribute to the constitution of that individual’s sense of self.

111 Ibid. at 24.
In addition, governing in liberal societies seek to influence individual choice in accordance with governmental aims through their community memberships. Individual choice is governed by stimulating entrepreneurialism and self-fulfillment, but is also governed in accordance with the obligations owed to smaller communities to which the individual belongs. Individuals no longer belong to one form of national citizenship. Instead, they indentify with several smaller communities, such as family, neighbourhood and workplace, in turn, each of these contribute to that individual’s identity and value system. The individual’s personal identity and values are tied up with the values and identity of the communities in which they belong. Thus, shaping individual conduct through free will and choice is also oriented towards influencing community ties. Doing so causes individuals to alter their conduct to accommodate the increased obligations owed to other members of their community.

Through this preliminary examination of methods of influencing individual conduct in liberal governmentalities, there are clear similarities between liberal government and the individualization of environmental problems. Concentrating more on this aspect of governmentality provides insight into the reasoning for the internalization of environmentally responsible behaviour by framing these actions as a personal project linked to self-improvement and fulfillment. Thus, environmental policy provides a foundation of environmental obligations through laws and regulations as well as suggesting environmental behaviours associated with individual choice. Focusing on methods of influencing individual conduct through responsibilization, education, ethical obligations and empowerment provide a deeper

---

116 Ibid at 57.
understanding of how government sways individuals into adopting environmentally sound behaviours. Furthermore, the promotion of environmental citizenship coincides with liberal government as the expansion of citizenship beyond the conventional national form of citizenship to various fields of participation. In this way, campaigns for environmental citizenship would serve as a tool of shaping individual conduct through the promotion obligations owed to the community.

2.5 Conclusion

While the increase of individualized environmentally friendly conduct can be analyzed using a variety of different approaches, the governmentality framework is the most suitable avenue for examining the individual internalization of desired conduct. Both political consumerism place and ecological modernization approaches place too much emphasis on market based solutions, while ignoring how environmentally responsible behaviours are developed and promoted. On the other hand, the governmentality framework is more sensitive to the methods of influencing individual conduct in line with desired environmental goals. This is exemplified through the use of biopower and disciplinary power which normalize environmental conduct in the area of natural resource management and urban environmental policies. While these processes are necessary for the creation and promotion of environmental conduct, these analyses do not provide any insight as to how individuals voluntarily work on their own conduct in order to match the desired environmental conduct. Meaning, the previous analyses focus on the methods of normalizing conduct through disciplinary power, while providing little insight into the methods in which individuals willingly transform themselves and their behaviours. In

this way, focusing more on Foucault’s later work on the ‘technologies of the self’ expands on
this aspect of the subjectification process, to provide more insight as to the techniques
individuals use to work on their own conduct. This expands on the concept of environmental
subjectivity to provide a comprehensive understanding of how individual conduct is shaped and
influenced.

Focusing on the methods of governing within liberal societies will provide the necessary
framework for examining environmental subjectivity since it concentrates on how to guide
individual choice in accordance with desired objectives. In this form of government, individuals
are encouraged to work on their own behaviour as an entrepreneurial task for self-improvement.
Also important is the methods of influencing individual conduct by stimulating community
obligations. Thus promoting environmental conduct is linked to the personal project for self-
improvement, and the environmental obligations and responsibilities owned to other members of
their community.

The following chapter will build the framework of governing in liberal societies, while
situating the analysis in the area of environmental regulation. It will illuminate the techniques
and technologies used to influence voluntary changes in environmental conduct, such as
responsibilization, education, and the promotion of environmental obligations. The roles of
community and citizenship will also be analyzed both for their own merits in promoting
environmental conduct and for its relation to individual conduct. This chapter will highlight the
relationship between environmental citizenship and the internalization of environmentally
responsible behaviour.
Chapter Three: Conceptual Framework for Governing Individual Conduct

The previous chapter discussed the strength of the governmentality framework in addressing environmental conduct is developed and suggested advanced liberal governmentalities are better equipped to understand the methods and motivations behind the voluntary adoption of environmentally sound behaviours. Expanding on Foucault’s concept of the Technologies of the Self in relation to the goals of governmentality provides a key point of analysis for understanding environmental governance within the frame of governmentality but also the methods through which individuals willingly act on themselves in order to abide by proper environmental behaviour. Governmental techniques are geared towards stimulating a certain type of environmental subjectivity in order to shape individual conduct through their chosen ecological identity. As such, governmental techniques are geared towards encouraging this ecological identity by fostering an entrepreneurial spirit among individuals, where behaving in an environmentally friendly manner enables them to take greater control over the management of their lives. In addition, the adoption pro-environmental behaviours allow individuals to act in their own best interests. It is through these techniques that individuals contribute to their own subjectification by altering their conduct in line with governmental aims. This chapter will explore the methods of encouraging these behavioural changes through governmental techniques utilizing consumption habits, education and community relationships as a means of influencing and shaping individual conduct consistent environmental aims. This will illuminate the governmental techniques used to encourage individuals to internalize environmentally friendly behaviours.
In order to reveal the methods of shaping the free choice of individuals to coincide with governmental aims, this analysis will focus on three areas influencing individual choice. Governmental techniques utilizing consumption, therapeutics\(^{119}\) and community obligations can each be applied to the area of environmental governance in order to elicit the desired behavioural changes. Environmentally conscious products influence individuals to adopt environmentally sound lifestyles and purchase products that will benefit themselves and their families. Furthermore, environmentally sound behaviour is also promoted though educational material aimed at imparting proper environmental values and critical thinking skills that will allow individuals to foster healthy relationship with the environment. Lastly, communities also shape individual conduct by adding additional obligations owed to other members of the community to maintain environmental quality and reduce personal environmental impacts. All these methods persuade individuals to choose environmentally sound behaviours and lifestyles that illuminate the ways in which individuals are fashioned into environmentally conscious subjects, regulating their conduct in accordance with desired environmental aims.

Debates surrounding proper methods of interacting with the environment usually center on the concept of ecological ethics, which focus on articulating the level of intrinsic values that should be attributed to our natural surroundings.\(^{120}\) There is little consensus on the level of intrinsic value assigned to the environment, as different factions advocate different levels of environmental value. The gradation of environmental position flows from an anthropocentric

\(^{119}\) Therapeutics does not only refer to psychologists or health care professionals, but to any expert guidance that provides skills on how to cope with daily life, and manage oneself more effectively, a good example being education. Nikolas Rose *Powers of Freedom: Reframing Political Thought* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999) at 89.

\(^{120}\) Patrick Curry *Ecological Ethics: An Introduction* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2008) at 47.
view, where the environmental concern is framed within human interests, all the way to radical views of the environment as equally deserving of interests as humans. Although there is a lack of agreement on the level of value that should be attributed to the environment, generally the discipline of environmental ethics debates human conduct in relation to the environment. The application of Foucault in assessing environmental conduct departs from this position on environmental ethics to focus on techniques used by individuals to modify their behaviour in order to conduct themselves in an environmentally conscious manner. Thus, Foucault’s work on ethics focuses on how individuals come to conduct themselves in an ethical manner, not on the determination of ethics. The following analysis will examine governmental techniques that persuade individuals to internalize environmental behaviours and regulate their conduct accordingly.

3.1 Foucault and the Self

Although Foucault’s earlier work focused on disciplinary tactics that normalize desired behaviour as evidenced in military and psychiatric institutions, he later turned his attention to the methods in which individuals actively strive to achieve desired behaviour. This is achieved through his analysis of the Technologies of the Self, where he examines the methods used by individuals to act on themselves in order to achieve a desired state. Foucault describes the Technologies of the Self as the technologies which permit individuals to effect by their own means, or with the help of others, a certain number of operations on their own bodies and souls, thoughts conduct and way of

---

121 Ibid. at 49.
122 Ibid. at 63
being, so as to transform themselves in order to attain a certain state of happiness, purity, wisdom, perfection or immortality.\textsuperscript{124}

Essential for achieving this ideal state is the methods through which individuals come to know and understand themselves, as it is though this additional self knowledge that individuals are able to work on their thoughts and behaviours in order to transform themselves and their conduct. In addition, it is also crucial for individuals to know and understand themselves in order to form the basis of their identities.\textsuperscript{125} In doing so, individuals engage in exercises that enable them to act on themselves order to develop and transform themselves into a certain mode of being.\textsuperscript{126} Thus, Foucault’s concept of Technologies of the Self describes the methods in which individuals contribute to their self-formation and work on themselves in order to achieve a specific state.

In order to develop this idea of individuals who actively participate in their own self-formation, Foucault focuses on two historical periods, Greek/Roman antiquity and early Catholicism. Through these periods, Foucault notes the number of different methods used by individuals to act on themselves in the hopes of gaining more knowledge about themselves and achieving the ideal state. Greek and Roman antiquity places more focus on techniques of self-mastery in order to achieve greater knowledge about the self. This includes confessional practices such as writing letters,\textsuperscript{127} self-examination through education,\textsuperscript{128} and physical training or mental training such as meditation.\textsuperscript{129} Decades later, the technologies of the self used during the early Christian era focused more on self-denial as a means of attaining greater self-
knowledge. This involved self-examination through renouncing one's will and public displays acknowledging sin. By acting on their self-will, and denying themselves, individuals were freed from temptation and had the clear mind necessary to attain the self-knowledge needed to transform oneself. Though the methods of working on the self differed from Greek antiquity to the early Christian era, these methods are still relevant in illuminating the ways in which individuals strive to understand themselves and attain a desired state.

Utilizing the concept of Technologies of the Self sheds light on the mechanisms used by individuals in order to achieve a desired state, however this is not a coercive process as individuals must willingly choose to participate. This makes freedom a necessary precursor to self-formation, so that individuals are freely able to explore their own self-formation while making ethical choices. This importance of freedom and choice in shaping individual conduct continues to be crucial in liberal democracies. While the importance placed on freedom increased throughout the nineteenth and twentieth century, this did not mean that freedom was to be exercised without constraint or influence. Governing within advanced liberal societies must balance aspirations of its free citizens with regulatory aims that ensure productivity and general well-being. As such, this form of government seeks to produce individuals who are able to govern themselves through proper judgment, foresight and calculation thereby reducing the need for the state to intervene. Under the realm of free choice, the government of individuals

---

130 Ibid at 243-245.
occurs through encouraging autonomous individuals to take an active role in the promotion of their identity and their capacity to realize their aspirations and maximize their potential.\textsuperscript{134}

3.2 Modern Applications of Technologies of the Self: Consumption and Therapeutics

With the growth of liberalism stressing the importance of personal freedom and the promotion of self-regulating, autonomous individuals came the need to develop a web of technologies aimed at governing the creation and promotion of autonomous individuals.\textsuperscript{135} Elaborating on the technologies employed in advanced liberal governments as discussed in the previous chapter reveals the methods of influencing the individuals into voluntarily changing their conduct. The term ‘technology’ does not refer to the traditional understanding of the term as the mechanical or computational advancements. Instead, it refers to the techniques used to shape individual conduct in order to achieve a desired outcome.\textsuperscript{136} The technologies of government function within the realm of freedom, where individuals are persuaded to make proper decisions in line with their best interests, happiness or self-fulfillment. A variety of technologies are used to sway individuals into adopting the desired conduct, loosely fitting into two categories, consumption and therapeutics.\textsuperscript{137} The following discussion will expand on the methods of influencing individual choice in line with government aims while providing insight as to how these technologies coincide with environmental aims.

One of the methods of influencing the choice of individuals in line with desired outcomes is through technologies of consumption, which affect the relationship between individuals and

\textsuperscript{134} Ibid. at 84.
\textsuperscript{136} Nikolas Rose \textit{Powers of Freedom: Reframing Political Thought} (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999) at 52.
\textsuperscript{137} Ibid. at 84.
products. Social-psychological research, such as polls or market research, is utilized to associate products with certain lifestyle choices or images. By incorporating images of lifestyle choices into consumer goods, individuals also come to identify these goods with the targeted lifestyles. In this way, individuals use consumption as a means of attaining their desired lifestyles or as a means of reflecting their personality. Thus, consumption contributes to the individuals' constitution of their image and personality. Furthermore, consumption comes to encompass the liberal ideology of individual entrepreneurship, where it is assumed that individuals possess an innate desire to act in their best interests and purchase products that will aid them in their quest for fulfillment and happiness. This reduces the need for governmental intervention to promote desired lifestyle choices, as this type of technology relies on individuals willingly adopting the desired lifestyles in their project for self-betterment. The knowledge gained through consumer goods advertising educates individuals as to how the desired lifestyle can be achieved, and responsibilizes them into doing so.

This idea of responsibilization is a recurring theme in advanced liberal governments, as it encourages individuals to take a greater role in their self-government. Here, individuals become more involved in the management of a particular issue, but in doing so, assume responsibility for these activities and must carry out these activities in accordance with the appropriate manner of behaving. Responsibilization seeks to integrate individual conduct and technologies used to promote appropriate methods of behaving, with the goals of government. In this way, liberal government increasingly relies on individual subjectivity as a means of

---

138 Ibid.
139 Ibid at 87.
140 Ibid at 88.
governing, where individuals are encouraged to modify their conduct in accordance with governmental aims.\textsuperscript{142} This responsibilization trend can be seen in concept of ‘new prudentialism’ as it relates to consumption. This concept requires that individuals bear the responsibility to reduce their risk, which often translates to the purchasing of certain products like insurance.\textsuperscript{143} This information is often relayed through marketing practices that inflate risk in order to cause individuals to safeguard themselves and purchase their product.\textsuperscript{144} It has the effect of responsibilizing the individual into taking precautions to reduce and manage risk for their wellbeing and the wellbeing of their family. Steps to avoid risk are not limited to insurance, but can also include modifying daily lifestyle choices such as purchasing different consumer goods, daily exercise, and buying healthier options.\textsuperscript{145} Thus, individual conduct is shaped through the anxieties surrounding risk, where individuals take on the additional responsibility to mitigate their risk though changes in consumption habits.

The technologies of consumption can easily be applied to the recent increases in environmentally friendly products and the concept of green consumerism. As previously mentioned, green consumerism relates to purchasing products that are environmentally conscious and attempts to reduce the negative impacts of manufacturing. Through marketing practices and proper labelling, consumers are able to identify which products are environmentally friendly, and change their consumption practices accordingly. The visual aspects of environmental labelling and certification serve as educational tools that both inform and empower consumers on how to

\begin{thebibliography}{9}
\bibitem{142} Ibid.
\bibitem{143} Mitchell Dean \textit{Governmentality: Power and Rule in Modern Society} (California: Sage Publications Inc., 1999) at 166.
\bibitem{144} Nikolas Rose \textit{Powers of Freedom. Reframing Political Thought} (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999) at 159.
\bibitem{145} Ibid. at 160.
\end{thebibliography}
adopt environmentally sound lifestyles. In this way, the marketing of green products educates consumers regarding which products are environmentally conscious, though this information consumer are able to identify themselves as being environmentally conscious and reflect their image and their personal commitment to the environment. In addition to associating green products with a particular lifestyle, labelling as a component of environment marketing serves a visual and informative purpose that educate individuals on the benefits of environmentally friendly products. This can be seen in environmental labels that promote the use of energy efficient appliances as a method of reducing energy costs, and organic labelling as a method of mitigating the health risks associated with pesticides and other harmful chemicals. This form of marketing influences individuals’ choices through their concerns associated with environmental degradation, energy costs, health and food production, where purchasing the identified environmentally safe products will help to mitigate these risks. Through the purchasing of environmentally conscious products, individuals are able to alleviate these concerns while acting in their own best interests and the best interests of future generations. Thus, green consumer goods shape individual conduct through promoting environmentally friendly lifestyles, where the consumption of green products display personal commitments to environmental causes and reduce the chances of negative side effects.

Another method of influencing individuals into adopting certain behaviour sets or lifestyles is through the technology of therapeutics, which is concerned with the care of the

---

147 Nikolas Rose Powers of Freedom: Reframing Political Thought (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999) at 89.
This involves endowing the individual with the proper tools so that they can achieve self-realization. This occurs under the direction of an expert authority, such as counseling, self-help manuals, training courses etc. that help guide individuals on their path to self-actualization in the most appropriate and productive manner. This can also occur as a self-guided undertaking, where individuals act on themselves in order to achieve a desired state of being by reducing dissatisfactions, increasing happiness or improving autonomy. In this type of technology, therapeutics is not limited to psychologists or health care professionals, but can occur in any form of interaction where the individual encounters a dilemma that leads to self-inspection, self-monitoring or self-transformation. The manner in which individuals cope with everyday situations reflects not only their personal identity, but is also an opportunity for personal growth and self-actualization. Therapeutic forms of technologies provide the basic skill sets for individuals to cope with everyday lives, by allowing the greater self-understanding needed to work on oneself. Furthermore, these types of technologies function within the realm of free choice, encouraging individuals to willingly partake in endeavours that will lead to self improvement. These technologies of therapeutics frame changes in conduct as an entrepreneurial undertaking, where individuals modify their behaviour in order to reach greater self-understanding and personal contentment. Thus the technologies of therapeutics provide individuals with the skill sets needed to reflect on and modify their behaviour, but also contribute to the subjectification process, by helping individuals transform themselves into a specific type of person.

---

151 Ibid. at 90.
152 Ibid. at 93.
153 Ibid.
These therapeutic technologies come in a variety of forms, one being formal education and continual learning. Educational practices provide individuals with the knowledge and skills to achieve a desired purpose. Through education, individuals come to understand the inextricable relationship between lifelong learning and their future goals and aspirations, where continued education is necessary for their improvement.\textsuperscript{154} While this ongoing search for new knowledge encourages a competitive approach to learning that enables individuals to maintain the current skills and knowledge for employability, continued education also provides individuals with increased knowledge about themselves and their behaviours.\textsuperscript{155} During the educational and learning process, individuals are forced to examine their own practices in relation with those being taught, a process which strengthens their self-knowledge.\textsuperscript{156} Thus, education informs individuals of the correct methods of behaving and responsibilizes them into making these changes. Individuals are encouraged to develop their own potentials in order to become productive and happy citizens while endowing them with the necessary skills sets and knowledge needed for self-regulation.

In addition to responsibilizing the individual, education adds a moralizing aspect to self-regulation. By providing the foundational rules and methods of behaving, education imposes moral guidelines on the individual. However, this is not solely a disciplinary process as the combination of supervised and unsupervised work periods causes the individual to exercises a level of self-awareness and self-examination. By becoming self aware and examining their behaviour, individuals are better able to govern their conduct in accordance with moral

\textsuperscript{154} Ulf Olsson & Kenneth Peterson “The Operation of Knowledge and Construction of the Lifelong Learning Subject” in Andreas Fejes and Katherine Nicoll eds. Foucault and Lifelong Learning: Governing the Subject (New York; Routledge, 2008) at 67. [Olsson & Peterson]

\textsuperscript{155} Naomi Hodgson “Educational Research, Governmentality and the Construction of the Cosmopolitan Citizen” (2010) 4 Ethics and Education 177 at 179.

\textsuperscript{156} Olsson & Peterson, supra note 154 at 71.
This moral intervention into the choices of individuals is important because even in liberal societies, steps must be taken to ensure the moral wellbeing of the population. Education becomes an important way to influence the conduct of individuals while not infringing on their autonomy.158

Another significant component of therapeutic technologies is self-help literature. Again, this type of technology is still concerned with providing the skills needed for individuals to modify and improve their behaviour, but it is a more self-guided project than formal education. This exercise is highly individualistic, where individuals voluntarily identify problematic areas of their life in need of change. Although this is a self-driven project, individuals must still turn to expert advice in order to identify, understand and correct their behaviour. Through the use of questionnaires, quizzes, manuals and mantras, individuals are able to gain knowledge about themselves while monitoring their behaviour.159 As such, individuals take an active role in their self-improvement by choosing to participate in endeavours that will improve their quality of life. This fits into the practice of liberal government through the emphasis placed on choice, where individuals chose to modify their conduct.160

The therapeutic technologies of education and self-help literature can be seen in the recent trends toward environmental education. The underlying aspiration of environmental education is to promote environmental awareness, increase knowledge surrounding the environment and change our behaviour towards the environment. For the purposes of environmental education, environmental behaviours refer to attitudes motivations and

---

158 Ibid at 102.
160 Ibid. at 72.
commitments towards the environment. As such, environmental education strives to effect changes in environmental behaviours and attitudes at the individual level, but also lead to whole scale changes among a collective population.\textsuperscript{161} In order to achieve these aims, emphasis is placed on imparting the proper skills sets needed to change individuals’ mindsets to allow them to behave in a more environmentally friendly manner. This may include such skill sets as critical thinking or reasoning skills in order to equip individuals with the ability to assess and evaluate their own behaviours.\textsuperscript{162} In addition to these skills, environmental education is intended to impart a greater sense of environmental values and perceptions, so that individuals can properly assess and understand their own environmental behaviour. Although teaching values and perceptions is more abstract than the concrete skill sets, it is equally important since understanding environmental values is the first step required to change individual behaviour.\textsuperscript{163}

Self-help literature in the form of environmental guides and manuals enable individuals to reflect on and evaluate their conduct towards the environment. However, this form of learning is less formal and more self-driven then that of a traditional schooling atmosphere, since the individual is not under the constant supervision of an instructor. In this form of education, individuals voluntarily seek out information to help them live more environmentally friendly lifestyles. This information can take the form as guides, manuals, pamphlets etc. all aimed at informing individuals about alternative lifestyles that are conducive with the environment. These


materials typically inform individuals on how to live environmentally friendly or ‘green’ lifestyles, as green living is associated with a lifestyle that is cognisant of environmental impacts and framed in a manner that benefits the individual and their family.\textsuperscript{164} These materials are geared towards educating individuals about the multitude of ways in which they impact the environment, from using hazardous cleaning products that are damaging to their health to purchasing clothing and food that are less damaging to the environment.\textsuperscript{165} This informs individuals on how to manage their lives in a more environmentally conscious manner, while making them more aware of their environmental impact. Environmental literature influences individual conduct by educating them on how to manage their lives in an environmentally friendly manner in order to attain the ideal state of environmental consciousness.

Environmental education, whether through a school-based setting or informal self-help setting, has important implications for understanding the voluntary adoption of environmental conduct. Both serve as therapeutic technologies, where under the guidance of either a teacher or literary material individuals come to recognize and understand their relationship with the environment in order to develop an environmental consciousness. Environmental education requires individuals to examine and assess their behaviour towards the environment, and suggests changes that would improve their lives and the lives of those around them. Furthermore, it imparts environmental values that advocate the correct ways of interacting with the environmental while also articulating how individual actions affect environmental impacts. In doing so, education adds a moralizing dimension by imparting environmental values rooted in ethical obligations to the environmental and those who affected by negative environmental

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{enumerate}
\item [\textsuperscript{164}] Erinn Morgan \textit{Going Green: A Step-By-Step Instruction for Living a Budget-Conscious, Earth-Friendly Lifestyle in Eight Weeks or Less} (Boston: Course Technology, 2009).
\end{enumerate}
\end{footnotesize}
impacts. Through education, individuals are both responsibilized and moralized into voluntarily altering their conduct to incorporate environmental aims. In doing so, individuals contribute to their subjectification as environmentally responsible individuals, who willingly alter and monitor their conduct to achieve the desired level of environmental responsibility.

Although the technologies of consumerism and the technologies of therapeutics may seem completely separate, as the former relates to consumer goods and the latter relates to individual self-care, the two technologies are actually mutually dependant. Technologies of consumption rely on psychological expertise to inform their marketing practices and create demand, while technologies of therapeutics utilize marketing to create demand for therapeutic programs. For example, green consumer manuals provide individuals with the skills needed to adopt environmentally friendly lifestyles, but must utilize marketing tactics to promote sales and stimulate demand. Furthermore, therapeutic programs also require individuals to change their consumption habits and purchase green consumer products, utilizing environmental logos or other marketing tactics as means of enabling individuals to achieve environmentally friendly lifestyles. Both technologies utilize free choice and the development of self-actualization through free choice. The combination of both consumer and therapeutic technologies in individual self-care has specific implications in the area of green consumerism. Green consumerism was discussed in the previous chapter as a possible explanation of trends towards individual action in environmental issues, and was ultimately eliminated for its inability to properly address the reasoning behind green purchasing. However, situating green consumption within advanced liberal governmentalities overcomes ideological barriers by addressing green

167 Ibid
consumption as means of benefiting individuals, thus influencing their purchasing habits. More importantly, shaping individual conduct using the technology of green consumption is also informed by the technologies of environmental education. Individuals learn about alternative green lifestyles and their environmental impacts through education initiatives and are responsibilized into purchasing green products.

3.3 Technologies of the Community

In collaboration with technologies of the self, where individuals actively shape their own conduct in line with desired aims, the community also plays a crucial role. Through community ties, individuals take on additional responsibilities and obligations to conduct themselves in a manner that is mindful of those around them. In this way, an individual’s conduct becomes governed ‘through their community.’ There have been significant changes to the concept of community that have enabled this process. Firstly, the breadth and number of different community organizations has grown from a single national citizenship to include communities based on geographic location, lifestyle choices, religious views etc. Since individuals are encouraged to participate in a number of community organizations, this shift in the concept of community resulted in increasing the avenues of shaping individual conduct through increasing community associations. A second feature of government though community functions through the changing character of the community, where individuals were primarily only responsible for themselves, they now owe responsibility and obligations to all members of the community. Individuals still function within the community as autonomous and responsible


\[\text{169} \quad \text{Ibid. at 90.}\]
agents, but their conduct is constrained by the obligations owed to their fellow community members. \(^{170}\) Lastly, individuals identify themselves as belonging to a particular community, and shape their behaviour to coincide with that of their chosen community. The process of encouraging individuals to self-identity with a particular community is promoted through education, campaigns and marketing tactics. \(^{171}\) The combination of increased avenues of community allegiance, increased community obligation and voluntary identification with community obligations all enable individuals to be governed through their community associations.

The technologies of governing through the community centre on encouraging individuals to identify themselves in a particular community. Often, community identification does not come naturally to individuals and requires effort in order to educate the individual as to the similarities between their own actions and values and those of the potential community. \(^{172}\) As previously mentioned, identification is promoted through educational campaigns aimed at informing and responsibilizing the individual into participating in a particular community. This restricts individual conduct through the additional obligations owed to the community. In this way, community involvement campaigns stimulate participation and work to promote self-identification in community objectives. This in turn shapes individual conduct through their relationship with their community.

Another method of promoting community involvement is through technologies aimed at stimulating agency. This type of technology is closely tied with the formation of citizenship and community empowerment, as both citizenship and empowerment help to illuminate the methods

---

\(^{170}\) Ibid at 91.

\(^{171}\) Ibid at 92.

\(^{172}\) Ibid at 94.
and motivations that produce agency.\textsuperscript{173} The techniques of stimulating citizenship seek to empower individuals to become active participants in their community and work towards its improvement. Taking an active role requires individuals to inform themselves and make responsible decisions in order to contribute to the management of the community. This has clear ties to the entrepreneurial nature of liberal government by stimulating individuals to take part in community initiatives in order to develop their potential.\textsuperscript{174} Empowerment, as it relates to both citizenship formation and agency, also seeks to encourage self-reliance. Through community initiatives, individuals are informed about how to participate within a particular community and order to take an active role in its management.\textsuperscript{175} The technologies of agency encourage and empower individuals into taking a more active role in the development and management of their community. Through this participation individual conduct is influenced though obligations owed to other community members, where they are empowered to alter their conduct in accordance with the desired manner of behaving.

Situating the technologies of the community within the emerging field of environmental citizenship not only exemplifies how this notion of community functions within environmental governance, but also how environmental citizenship comes to shape the conduct of individuals. Environmental citizenship involves extending environmental duties and obligation into private life, in addition to the more public aspects of environmental regulation.\textsuperscript{176} This involves commitment to a common environmental good, where individuals acknowledge their own duties


\textsuperscript{174} \textit{Ibid.}


\textsuperscript{176} Andrew Dobson \textit{Citizenship and the Environment} (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003) at 89.
and obligations to the environment and to their fellow citizens. Although environmental obligations are extended to elements of private life, such as requiring individuals to engage in recycling programs, this extension primarily exists on a voluntary basis, meaning that it still functions within the realm of individual choice. These voluntary obligations are rooted in moral and normative claims to the environment, where fulfillment of environmental obligations is related to the individual’s personal commitment to environmental values over concrete environmental duties such as following environmental laws.

Since much of environmental conduct advocated by environmental citizenship occurs on a voluntary basis, efforts must be taken to inform and persuade individuals into adopting environmentally responsible conduct. Information and education campaigns are key components in both illuminating individual environmental impacts and promoting environmentally sound conduct consistent with environmental obligations. Incorporating more formalized mechanisms of environmental education into the schooling system, would allow a greater audience to understand their environmental impact on others while learning ways to reduce their environmental impact in line with sustainable development. Through education individuals become aware of their potentially destructive environmental behaviour and its impact on other people in their community. Concern is then generated for their own environmental behaviour as well as its effect on others. In this way, proper information and education as a method of

---

178 Derek Bell “Liberal Environmental Citizenship” (2005) 14 Environmental Politics 179 at 181.
180 Andrew Dobson Citizenship and the Environment (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2003) at 183
promoting environmental citizenship serves to inform individuals of their environmental impacts in hopes of influencing them to voluntarily adopt environmental obligations.

Relating the concept of environmental citizenship back into the technologies of the community clarifies the methods in which individual conduct is shaped through the community to which they belong. Environmental citizenship seeks to gain new members through education initiatives aimed at persuading people to understand their environmental impacts and voluntarily take on additional obligations and responsibility to decrease their impact. Through information and education initiatives, individuals learn about their personal impacts, identify with the specific goals of environmental citizenship, and are empowered to make changes that will benefit their community. In this way, the concept of environmental citizenship is located within the technologies of citizenship, as a method as influencing individual conduct through their group associations.

3.4 Situating Environmental Technologies of Conduct in Governmentality

Both the technologies of the self, as related to consumption and therapeutic practices, and the technologies of the community are utilized in the formation of subjects. These practices refer to the mechanisms by which individuals willingly act on themselves in order to achieve an ideal state of being. Positioning these methods of influencing individual conduct within the concept of governmentality illuminates the important relationship between the self and ideal environmental conduct. Governmentality described as the ‘conduct of conduct’ requires both technologies of power and technologies of the self to shape the conduct of subjects.\(^{182}\) The technologies of power refer to the disciplinary aspect of power that coercively normalizes conduct into the

---

subject, for example the environmental regulations, laws and codes of conduct. On the other hand, the technologies of the self relate to the methods utilized by individuals to willingly subjugate themselves on the path to happiness, for example the processes utilized by individuals that allow them to attain the desired environmental behaviours. In the context of environmental governance, the processes used by individuals in order to achieve this ideal environmental conduct, such as technologies of consumption, education and environmental citizenship, illuminate the voluntary methods in which individuals are made into environmental subjects. Thus, outlining the methods in which individuals willingly become environmental subjects clarifies how voluntary individual conduct fits into an environmental governmentality framework.

3.5 Conclusion

The technologies of the self utilized by advanced liberal governments in order to persuade individuals to adopt the desired conduct proves to be useful when examining what motivates individuals to voluntarily adopt environmentally friendly behaviours. The combination of the technologies of consumption, therapeutics and community all contribute to shaping individual conduct to match ideal environmental behaviours. Through the consumption of green products, individuals are able to self-identify themselves with environmentally sound lifestyles while benefiting themselves and their families. This technology of consumption works in tandem with the technologies of therapeutics, where individuals work towards their own self-care under the guidance of a professional. In this way, environmental education equips individuals with the basic skill sets and self-reflection required to adjust their behaviour in line

\footnote{Ibid.}
with prescribed environmental conduct. Lastly, the technologies of the community also shape individual conduct through campaigns aimed at promoting individuals to identify with a particular group so that they willingly adopt additional obligations. The goals of environmental citizenship correspond with this form of influencing individual conduct, as educational material is circulated to inform individuals of their environmental impact and persuade them into taking on additional environmental responsibility. Thus, through the combination of green consumption, environmental education and environmental citizenship individuals develop a concern for the environment in order to become environmental subjects.

The following chapter will apply this conceptual model to environmental regulation in Canada. Focusing on the Guide for Environmental Citizenship published by the Canadian Government as well as the subsequent governmental literature will exemplify how these technologies serve to shape individual conduct and how this functions in Canada. The analysis will focus on key aspects of promoting environmentally behaviours through education, consumption and increased environmental obligations in line with environmental citizenship through government action.
Chapter 4: Environmental Citizenship in Canadian Policy

This chapter demonstrates how Canadian environmental policy fits into a
governmentality framework and the strategies employed to shape individual environmental
action. The technologies of therapeutics, community and consumption are used in a manner that
encourages individuals to voluntarily modify their behaviour in line with environmentally
responsible conduct. Furthermore, these technologies reveal the manner in which individuals
voluntarily modify their behaviour to match desired environmental conduct, thereby
transforming themselves into environmental subjects. Examining these technologies in the
Canadian context, the concept of environmental citizenship advanced by the Canadian
government is crucial. This concept of environmental citizenship embodied all the technologies
used for shaping conduct by encouraging individuals to actively inform themselves on
environmental issues, take responsible action and empower others to do the same. Devised
through Canada’s Green Plan in 1990, the concept of environmental citizenship is espoused by a
variety of different initiatives such as The Environmental Citizenship Learning Program, The
Community Action Program and the Environmental Choice Program. These programs were
implemented as a means of persuading the Canadian public into adopting environmental
citizenship through a combination of educational resources, community partnerships and
encouraging changes in consumption. This chapter will apply the conceptual framework
developed in the previous chapter to Canadian environmental policy to demonstrate how the
Canadian government steered individuals into voluntarily adopting environmental citizenship,
thereby revealing the implicit power relations involved in shaping individual conduct.
To achieve this, this chapter will first provide a brief summary of the *Canada Green Plan* and the voluntary environmental action promoted through environmental citizenship. The resulting environmental citizenship initiatives will be related back to the conceptual framework involving the technologies of therapeutics, community and consumption. This application will highlight the various environmental programs developed through the *Green Plan*, and its calculated effort to shape environmental conduct. Since the process of modifying conduct is not outside the realm of power, this analysis sheds light on the power relations that are implicated during environmental subjectification. Lastly, these technologies facilitate what is known as ‘government at a distance’ where governing occurs through smaller networks, which obscures the sources of power that form environmental subjectivity. Thus, I argue that the environmental citizenship initiatives represented a deliberate effort to shape individual conduct to coincide with the goals of environmental citizenship through indirect means, placing more importance on voluntary individual changes while concealing the sources of power that caused them.

### 4.1 Environmental Citizenship in Canada and the Green Plan

Throughout the late 1980s, Canadians grew increasingly concerned about environmental issues and began demanding government action. At that time, the Progressive Conservative government was weary of imposing coercive regulation or taxation on industry since stricter environmental regulation may have negative economic impacts. In order to balance environmental concerns with economic impacts, the Mulroney government selected an environmental policy scheme consistent with sustainable development. Here, economic development and industry regulation would be retooled to incorporate environmental concerns,
reducing the need for coercive regulation. In 1990, the Canadian government passed its first comprehensive environmental plan titled Canada’s Green Plan, which allocated 3 billion dollars to the Department of Environment and other governmental departments with the goal of improving environmental conditions. The Green Plan recognized growing environmental concerns, but maintained that voluntary self-regulation was more effective than government action in addressing these issues. In promoting voluntary self-regulation, the Green Plan opted for largely indirect methods of influencing environmental change, focusing its attention on creating and disseminating literary materials as a means of eliciting behavioural changes. As a result, only 20% of the budget was allocated to directly influencing environmental change through the introduction of new regulations. In order to persuade Canadians into adopting environmentally friendly behaviours, the Green Plan created a multitude of policy initiatives aimed at promoting environmental awareness and the voluntary actions associated with environmental citizenship. Central to the implementation of environmental citizenship was the creation of an environmentally literate society, so that citizens were “equipped with the knowledge, skills and values necessary for action.” To address these needs, a variety of programs were created to improve environmental awareness and stimulate responsible action, such as The Environmental Citizenship Learning Program, The Community Support Program and The Environmental Choice Program. While the programs emphasize different methods of promoting environmental citizenship though means such as education, community involvement

and responsible shopping habits, each program remained under the ‘environmental citizenship initiatives’ outlined by the Green Plan.\textsuperscript{188}

Prior to examining how the environmental citizenship initiatives encouraged changes in individual conduct, it is first important to understand how the government of Canada defines environmental citizenship. At its most basic definition, environmental citizenship is defined as the idea that “organizations and people have a responsibility to protect the environment”\textsuperscript{189} however, a more detailed definition reveals additional requirements. According to The Primer on Environmental Citizenship, the term has three fundamental elements. Firstly, environmental citizenship requires individuals to inform themselves about environmental issues and take action. This moves beyond mere environmental awareness and promotes a thorough understanding of environmental issues.\textsuperscript{190} Secondly, environmental action is based on our ethical obligations and responsibility towards the environment.\textsuperscript{191} Lastly, these environmental obligations are also rooted in the communities to which we belong, both on the local and international scale and between humans and non-humans living in the same ecosystem.\textsuperscript{192} Thus, environmental citizenship takes a holistic approach towards individual action, requiring that people understand environmental issues and their impacts on others. Moreover, it describes our ethical responsibility to our natural surroundings, rooted in community obligations and is dependent on environmentally informed decisions.

\textsuperscript{188}Ibid. at 146.
\textsuperscript{190}Environment Canada, \textit{A Primer on Environmental Citizenship} (Ottawa: Environmental Citizenship Learning Program, 1993) at 9.
\textsuperscript{191}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{192}Ibid.
The environmental citizenship initiatives introduced in the *Green Plan* provide the foundation for examining the government of individual environmental conduct. As the first comprehensive environmental plan in Canada, it illuminates the methods of influencing individual conduct while relying on voluntary action. It represents the indirect methods of governing individual conduct in order to improve environmental conditions without imposing coercive regulations. As such, it corresponds with the methods of governing in advanced liberal societies, where environmental citizenship initiatives encourage individuals to adopt and self-regulate in accordance with the principles of environmental citizenship. Consequently, individuals take on more responsibility for environmental conditions, which reduces the need for government to implement coercive regulations that could infringe on personal autonomy. The following analysis will examine the technologies aimed at stimulating environmental subjectivity in line with the goals of environmental citizenship. This will provide insight into the methods of governing environmental conduct, speaking to the goals of environmental citizenship and the power relations that promote environmental subjectivity.

4.2 Theoretical Application

In understanding the technologies used to sway individual conduct towards environmental aims, it is important to acknowledge the implicit power relationship involved in behaviour modification. While Foucault’s later work focused on subjectification and the technologies of the self, he maintained that the subjectification process cannot be examined outside the gambit of power. Power is integrated into everyday life and attaches itself onto individual identity, as power is able to influence individual subjectivity.\(^{193}\) Here, power is

---

\(^{193}\) Michel Foucault “The Subject and Power” (1982) 8:4 Critical Inquiry 777 at 871.
characterised by its ability to guide individual conduct, functioning to influence the actions of others. These power relationships are defined as a “mode of action which does not act directly or immediately on others. Instead, it acts upon their actions: an action upon an action, on existing actions or on those which may arise in the present or the future.” Relationships of power influence action by inciting or encouraging particular types of action while discouraging other types. The exercise of power thus consists of guiding conduct to achieve a particular outcome. In the same way that freedom is necessary to shape the ethical conduct of subjects, freedom is also necessary for the exercise of power. Subjects must be free to choose from a variety of different scenarios, in order to fall under the influence of power relations that guide their actions towards a specific end. Thus, during the subjectification process, power relations are implicit in guiding individuals conduct towards a desired aims. This occurs through structuring the fields of action available to individuals, in order to encourage the desired conduct and discourage undesirable behaviour.

This power relationship is essential to the environmental citizenship initiatives introduced in the Canada Green Plan as it is geared towards encouraging environmental subjectivity and influencing environmental conduct. The technologies used to govern conduct in advanced liberal governments work in conjunction with power relationships to guide individuals into adopting a particular subjectivity and to self-regulate accordingly. As such, the following section will apply the conceptual framework discussed in the previous chapter to the environmental citizenship initiatives introduced in the Green Plan. This will provide insight into

194 Ibid. at 798.
195 Ibid.
196 Ibid at 790.
the methods of shaping individual environmental conduct and the inherent power relations used to guide subjectivity.

- Technologies of Therapeutics

As a component of the environmental citizenship initiatives, the Environmental Citizenship Learning Program was devised as the most effective means of influencing individual conduct to coincide with the goals of environmental citizenship. Ensuring adequate environmental literacy and environmental awareness was the principal means of achieving the necessary behavioural changes. The Program acknowledged that the current sources of environmental education were inadequate and government intervention was required to increase the quality and quantity of environmental education. In doing so, the Program devised a framework for addressing these deficiencies by utilizing communities and schools to teach the principles of environmental citizenship. This included forming partnerships with provincial school boards as well as local organizations like The Boy Scouts of Canada, professional and business organizations like the Canadian Association of Petroleum Producers, as well as various museums and recreational parks. Furthermore, the Program’s primary focus was to develop educational materials that would stimulate the environmental literacy needed for behavioural changes.

In utilizing education as a means of influencing changes in conduct, the Environmental Citizenship Learning Program relied on education as a technology of therapeutics to influence the relationship one has with oneself. As discussed in the previous chapter, this technology is
used to guide individuals on the path to achieving a desired state; in this case, the Program encouraged a state of environmental awareness and responsibility. Here, responsibilization remains a common theme throughout the environmental education process. Through environmental education, individuals become aware of their environmental impact, learn the methods of mediating these impacts, and in doing so assume greater responsibility for the improvement of environmental conditions.

In developing educational material to promote environmental literacy and encourage environmental citizenship, the Environmental Citizenship Learning Program created ‘primers’ to be circulated among all providers of environmental education and to individuals themselves. These primers contained the fundamental environmental concepts that could be reasonably understood by all Canadians, providing general information on the methods of implementing environmentally responsible behaviours.

The Primer on Environmental Citizenship was one such primer that was developed to identify the essential aspects of environmental citizenship, provide guidance on how environmental citizenship should be taught, and highlight the important concepts that should be emphasized. This comprehensive guide educated individuals on fundamental ecological principles, such as water cycles and climate change, while articulating our environmental impact in four key areas; atmospheric change, water consumption, wildlife protection and waste

---


management. In order to mediate these impacts, individuals were encouraged to become environmental citizens and follow the three required principles:

- Acquiring a better understanding of the environment and environmental issues
- Translate this knowledge into responsible action at home, in the community, at school and in the work place
- Using this knowledge and experience to enable and empower others

It maintains that once individuals are educated and become environmentally literate, they will be able to turn this knowledge into responsible action. Here, responsible action requires individuals to actively seek out ways to reduce their environmental impacts, such as reducing energy consumption and responsible shopping, while also empowering others to adopt environmental citizenship. In effect, it placed environmental issues within the realm of individual control, where individuals are able modify their behaviour in a manner that would ameliorate environmental issues. *The Primer on Environmental Citizenship* provided guidance for educators, whether they came in the form of schools or community organizations, to teach individuals about environmental impacts and how to promote the idea that environmental issues are within the control of individual action. In doing so, these educational resources promoted behavioural changes by responsibilizing the individual into adopting lifestyles consistent with environmental citizenship.

In addition to comprehensive guides, more specialized educational materials were also created to draw attention to specific issues. For example, the pamphlet on environmental citizenship titled *An Environmental Citizen...Who Me?* discussed how environmental citizenship

---

204 Ibid.
205 Ibid. at 135-138.
can be incorporated into a daily routine. This pamphlet urged individuals to adopt environmental
citizenship on the basis that

“as Canadians, it is our responsibility to care for the environment. It’s also in our best
interests. Many Canadians have begun to put their concern into action – recycling is a
good example. But we need to do much more and get everyone involved.”

In order to get individuals involved in environmentally friendly lifestyles, it offered a detailed
list of daily activities that negatively impacted the environment, such as bathing, driving to work
or cleaning the house, and the steps that individuals could take to reduce their environmental
impact. Once individuals were aware of these simple measures, they were invited to complete a
quiz on environmental citizenship so that they could assess their current environmental impact
and modify their behaviour in accordance with environmental citizenship. Here, an individual
was encouraged to “think about your own actions as you read about a day in the average life of a
Canadian. Can you see how closely your life is connected to the land, air and water? Are there
things you could do differently?” In effect, these resources persuaded individuals to reflect on
their behaviour and their impact on the environment. This type of educational material reiterates
that environmental issues are within the realm of individual action, where modifying daily
activities and habits can improve environmental conditions. Individuals were thus encouraged to
modify their behaviour and adopt environmental citizenship based on their personal
responsibility to care for the environment.

In responsibilizing the individual into adopting environmental citizenship, the
development of educational resources appealed to ethical concerns. Environmental education
and literacy were key tools for raising awareness while also introducing a moral and ethical

---

208 Ibid.
209 Ibid
element to the environment. These materials were geared towards the creation of environmental awareness and values.\textsuperscript{210} Through educational efforts the federal government sought to alter the manner in which individuals interacted with their environment by encouraging changes to their environmental values. This provided individuals with the rationale to voluntarily alter their conduct, which can be seen in educational material, one of which stated:

"Being a citizen an equal, participating member of a community involves responsibilities as well as rights. The ethical message of environmental citizenship is simply that we all have a responsibility to care for the environment. This responsibility derives from the fact that we are not isolated units, but members of a broader community."\textsuperscript{211}

In this respect, educational materials created a link between environmental action and ethical responsibility, so that individuals associated behavioural changes towards the environment with ethical responsibility. Bringing the environment within the realm of ethical concern sought to influence individual conduct based on their own capacity to reduce environmental stresses for the sake of others affected by their environmental impact.

Environmental education was not solely a responsibilizing or moralizing effort since it also equipped individuals with the skills needed to understand and modify their behaviour in line with environmental citizenship. Specifically, it enabled individuals to reflect on their environmentally harmful actions while providing them with the skill sets needed to reduce their impact. This can be seen in the \textit{Environmental Citizen’s Action Guide}, which provided individuals with a comprehensive step-by-step guide on how to reduce their environmental

\textsuperscript{211} Environment Canada, A Primer on Environmental Citizenship (Ottawa: Environmental Citizenship Learning Program, 1993) at 9.
impact in various areas such as transportation, yard work, shopping, cleaning etc.²¹² This guide educated individuals about their personal environmental impacts and supplied an extensive list of areas where personal impacts could be reduced.

The Environmental Citizenship Learning Program utilized the technologies of therapeutics to encourage subjectivity consistent with environmental citizenship. Through the development of environmental education materials, whether formal guides such as the Primer on Environmental Citizenship or the Environmental Citizen’s Action Guide or less formal pamphlets, the Program encouraged behavioural changes and provided individuals with the skills sets needed to monitor their own conduct. Through this education, individuals were responsibilized into adopting good environmental citizenship practices by being persuaded that environmental improvement was within the realm of their own control.

Furthermore, environmental education taught individuals about environmental values and their relationship to negative environmental impacts. In doing so, it added a moral and ethical justification for behaviour modification. In following the steps to achieving environmental citizenship, individuals were thus constructed into environmental citizens. This is crucial to the process of forming and promoting environmental subjectivity, but also for illuminating the power relations at work in the formation of environmental citizenship. Indeed, the process of individuals modifying their behaviours to match environmentally friendly lifestyles reflects the trend towards subjectivity, but also the result power relations that indirectly changed individuals’ environmental actions. Here, environmental education reflects these power relations by shaping individual conduct in a manner that is consistent with policy aims, through the encouragement of ideal environmentally responsible behaviours, and discouragement of others.

• **Technologies of Community**

Communities and organizations were also utilized to shape individual conduct and further promote the benefits of environmental citizenship in Canada. While the *Education for Environmental Citizenship: A National Flagship Initiative* report established environmental education as the prime method of achieving environmental citizenship, these education efforts were to be carried out “by targeting communities and organizations. The aim is not to target people directly.” 213 The rational for this was that “people are most likely to be motivated by the communities and organizations they are closely associated with.” 214 In doing so, the Federal government relied on communities and organizations as the primary avenues for distributing educational material, and encouraging its community members to adopt behaviours consistent with environmental citizenship. The government recognized that individuals are educated and influenced through their associations with work, school, voluntary organizations, unions, professional organizations etc. As such, the government sought to form partnerships with these organizations to advance the principles of environmental citizenship. The use of community organizations to educate and influence their members coincides with the technologies of community discussed in the previous chapter. Here, individual conduct is shaped through community ties, which impose additional obligations and constraints on individual conduct. 215 These technologies of the community focus on promoting community members to identify with environmental causes, but also by empowering members to take an active role in the environmental management of their community.

---

To harness the power of community, the Environmental Citizenship Learning Program established partnerships with a variety of communities and organizations. These partnerships were formed to advance environmental citizenship and included a wide range of members from national teaching associations such as the Association of Universities and Colleges Canada and the Canadian Education Association, to more locally based organizations such as the Federation of Canadian Municipalities. Since community influence was deemed the most effective manner of influencing individual conduct, the Program focused on recruiting new communities and organizations as a means of increasing environmental awareness. This led to the creation of the Community Support Program, which funded 50% of community projects that aimed to promote long term behavioural changes. In accepting funding, these communities and organizations were required to share their results with others, as a means of empowering other communities to implement environmental citizenship. In addition, funding was also provided for the creation of new environmental organizations, such as environmental youth development programs and volunteer organizations. These funding opportunities encouraged individuals to introduce the environmental citizenship into their current communities and create new environmentally conscious communities. This was intended to expand the number of communities adopting environmental citizenship, which in turn would expand the avenues for influencing individual conduct.

In conjunction with the funding opportunities, community action plans were created to provide communities with the skills needed to manage themselves in an environmentally friendly manner.

---

217 Ibid. at 26.
manner, and empower members to adopt the principles of environmental citizenship. The environmental citizenship initiatives funded these community action plans, which were disseminated at the provincial and municipal levels, such as *Community Action for the Environment: Helping Your Community Go Green*. This action plan guided Ontario communities through the process of preparing and implementing community action plans as well as providing ideas on environmental projects that could be adapted to fit community needs, like awareness campaigns, fundraisers or cleanup programs. Moreover, it encouraged individuals to take an active role in improving the environment within their community, which corresponded to the technologies of agency.

As mentioned in the previous chapter, the technologies of agency shape conduct through tactics aimed at stimulating empowerment and citizenship within a community. Individuals are empowered to become active, self-reliant citizens who work towards the improvement of their communities. Through the funding opportunities offered by the Community Support Program, individuals were empowered to take responsible action towards the environment, and were provided with the tools needed to do so. This in turn led to a more environmentally responsible community. For example, the Atlantic Coastal Action Program created through the *Green Plan* encouraged community partnerships, environmental citizenship and community involvement. Through funding opportunities, this program dealt primarily with the creation of

---

local communities in order to stimulate involvement in environmental issues.\textsuperscript{222} In managing community action plans, Environment Canada provided guidance and training for communities on how to become active in environmental issues as well as structuring the main areas of environmental concern, such as water quality, responsible stewardship and ecosystem management.\textsuperscript{223} The Atlantic Coastal Action Program had a significant impact on the levels of environmental awareness and improved environmental conditions along Atlantic coastlines and harbours.\textsuperscript{224} This exemplified how the Canadian Government governed communities towards environmental aims, where communities were able to take an active role in environmental issues while conforming to governmental guidelines. Here, community action plans stimulated adherence to environmental citizenship by empowering its members to participate in responsible environmental action as a means of improving environmental conditions.

Through the environmental citizenship initiatives, the Community Action Program formed partnerships with a variety of community organizations as a means of advancing the principles of environmental citizenship. The funding opportunities encouraged community organizations to participate in environmental citizenship programs that would lead to long lasting behavioural changes among their members. Increasing the number of communities that promoted environmental citizenship had a direct impact on individual conduct by increasing the avenues of influence, encouraging individuals to identify with the goals of environmental citizenship and to modify their behaviour accordingly. In addition, funding was allocated to enable communities to take a greater role in the management of environmental issues. Following the community action guides enabled communities to manage the environment in a manner that

\textsuperscript{223} Ibid at 30.
\textsuperscript{224} Ibid at 36.
was consistent with environmental citizenship. These elements of the technologies of community thus enabled the federal government to govern individual conduct through community associations. Moreover, they represented the government’s use of power to influence individuals into adopting environmental citizenship. By relying on the community to govern individual conduct, power relations were used to indirectly guide individuals into adopting environmental subjectivity.225

- Technologies of Consumption

While environmental citizenship initiatives were aimed at promoting behavioural changes, responsible consumption remained an integral component of environmentally responsible action. The idea of responsible consumption was advanced through the Primer on Environmental Citizenship, where responsible consumption required individuals to actively inform themselves on environmental impacts related to consumer goods, and to change their conduct accordingly.226 This idea was advanced through various other educational materials and environmental programs such as the Environmental Citizen’s Action Guide, which outlined how to retool consumption in line with responsible action, and the Environmental Choice Program, which developed a network for identifying environmentally responsible products. These programs sought to promote responsible consumption as an aspect of environmental citizenship, thereby influencing the relationship between individuals and environmentally friendly consumer goods.

225 According to Foucault, power functions through the ability to influence and guide the action of others, Michel Foucault “The Subject and Power” (1982) 8:4 Critical Inquiry 777 at 871. Thus, the Government of Canada utilizes power to create partnerships with communities in order to indirectly guide individuals towards subjectivity, where increased avenues of influence through partnerships with multiple community organizations, helps to structure the field of action towards these aims.

The programs listed above utilized the technologies of consumption as a means of encouraging and influencing purchasing habits to coincide with environmentally responsible lifestyles. These technologies focus on shaping the relationship between individuals and products as a means of encouraging subjectivity. Here, consumer goods are marketed in a manner that reflects an environmentally friendly lifestyle, where purchasing these goods reflects an individual’s commitment to the environment. In doing so, consumption contributes to the subjectification process by altering purchasing habits to coincide with environmental citizenship. Examining the Environmental Choice Program and environmental consumer guides in more detail reveals the methods of persuading individuals to modify their behaviours to incorporate environmentally responsible consumption.

The Environmental Choice Program is an environmental labelling scheme that signals to consumers which products were manufactured in an environmentally friendly manner. While the program was introduced prior to the environmental citizenship initiatives, the Green Plan acknowledged the important role industries played in empowering individuals to make environmentally responsible decisions and brought the program under the umbrella of the environmental citizenship initiatives. The Environmental Choice Program provided environmental certification for companies that followed the required criteria. In turn, companies were able to label their products with the Environmental Choice Logo, a logo comprising of three intersecting doves forming a maple leaf. This symbolized the relationship between society, government and industry needed to improve the environment. At the time the Green Plan passed, the program had already been applied to 14 different product categories, ranging from

---

227 Nikolas Rose *Powers of Freedom: Reframing Political Thought* (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1999) at 84.

automotive fuels to household waste. It provided individuals with the necessary information to identify environmentally friendly products and empowered them to make environmentally sound choices. In order to increase consumer demand for these products, the federal government increased funding to the program so that it could increase its marketing efforts. This relationship between industry and government as a means of influencing individual purchasing behaviours is connected to power. The Environmental Choice Program functions to structure the possible fields of action available to individuals in order to encourage environmentally friendly consumption and discourage non-environmentally friendly consumption. This elevates the importance of responsible consumption in the adoption of environmental citizenship, creating a comprehensive marketing framework that guides individuals towards an environmental subjectivity. Here, a power relationship is used to build a marketing framework that is used to influence consumption towards environmental ends. As such, the Environmental Choice Program represents the federal government’s strategy to utilize marketing tactics to promote environmentally sound lifestyles through consumption.

Consumer purchasing as part of environmentally responsible lifestyles is also maintained through educational materials. Both the Primer on Environmental Citizenship and environmental citizenship pamphlets advocated responsible consumption as a part of responsible action and urged individuals to use responsible consumption as a means of empowering others. Furthermore, the Environmental Citizen’s Action guide outlined a step-by-step process on how to shop responsibly. Actions included purchasing local and organic produce to reduce both harmful pesticides and pollution associated with transportation of goods as well as buying

\[^{229}\text{Ibid.}\]
\[^{230}\text{Environment Canada, A Primer on Environmental Citizenship (Ottawa: Environmental Citizenship Learning Program, 1993) at 133.}\]
products with less packaging to reduce landfill waste. Individuals were also encouraged to purchase items with the Environmental Choice logo and other products made from recycled material as a means of reducing pollution. This provided individuals with a rationale for responsible consumption, and equipped them with the knowledge needed to do so. Responsible consumption was framed in a manner that benefited the environment through reduced waste and pollution, and provided less hazardous alternatives to the individual. Moreover, this created a link between consumer goods and environmental action, where individuals acted on their commitment to the environment through changes in purchasing.

The environmental citizenship initiatives shaped individual conduct through the connection between environmentally friendly lifestyles and responsible consumption. Marketing campaigns and environmental certification programs funded by the federal government exposed individuals to environmental logos that enabled them to choose products in line with environmentally friendly lifestyles. Increases to the marketing budget of the Environmental Choice Program established the importance of responsible consumption within the environmental citizenship framework, while relying on marketing techniques to increase demand for environmentally responsible products. Since responsible consumption remains in the realm of choice, these efforts both responsibilize and empower individuals to choose environmentally friendly lifestyles, as a means of improving current environmental conditions and improving the quality of life for future generations. In this way, responsible consumption is consistent with the goals of environmental citizenship. These practices are directed towards influencing the

\[\text{Environment Canada, An Environmental Citizen's Action Guide (Consultation Draft) (Ottawa: Environmental Citizenship, 1994) at 13.}\]

\[\text{Ibid.}\]

\[\text{Gill Seyfang "Shopping for Sustainability: Can Sustainable Consumption Promote Ecological Citizenship?" (2005) 14 Environmental Politics 290 at 291.}\]
relationship between individuals and consumer goods in a manner that will encourage environmentally responsible lifestyles. In doing so, they educate and empower individuals to adopt environmental citizenship by modifying their purchasing habits. In effect, individuals are encouraged to adopt environmental subjectivity through responsible consumption. It is through the process of modifying consumption patterns to conform to environmental citizenship that government and industry use their power to influence the purchasing behaviour of individuals and lead them towards environmental citizenship.

4.3 Situating Environmental Citizenship within the Governmentality Framework

The technologies of therapeutics, community and consumption employed throughout the environmental citizenship initiatives described above provide insight into the power of government to use techniques that guide individual conduct. The education efforts promoted through the Canadian Environmental Citizenship Program provided individuals with the necessary skill sets, values and self-reflection needed to adopt behavioural changes. Environmental education was disseminated through communities, in order to take advantage of the important influence communities’ play in encouraging individuals to adopt environmentally responsible lifestyles. This meant creating partnerships with community organizations to increase the avenues of influence used to promote environmental citizenship. Since achieving an environmentally friendly lifestyle consistent with the principles of environmental citizenship involves changes to consumption habits, the federal government developed an environmental labeling system that encouraged and empowered individuals to purchase environmentally responsible products. The combinations of these three technologies represent the manner in which individual conduct was shaped through non-coercive policy instruments that encouraged
environmentally friendly lifestyles. In encouraging individuals to subjectify themselves as environmental citizens, power was disseminated through these technologies to structure the field of action available to individuals to conduct environmentally friendly lifestyles. In doing so, individuals constructed themselves into environmental citizens, which monitored and regulated their behaviour according to government specifications.

While power flowed through the technologies of therapeutics, community and consumption functioned to affect subjectivity, it also facilitated what Peter Miller and Nikolas Rose call ‘government at a distance’. This refers to the method of governance used to overcome challenges posed by distance, in order to find an indirect method of guiding conduct. Here, government is expanded beyond a centralized source of authority, where the calculated use of technologies such as law, education and statistics are used to form smaller networks. The principal goals of government seek to become flexible enough to be adapted into a variety of different networks, such as communities or organizations, through which individual conduct can be managed. Thus, ‘government at a distance’ is enabled when the values and norms of others have been successfully internalized to provide the norms and standards for an individual’s own conduct. In this way, individual conduct can be controlled without infringing on personal autonomy, as it can be managed through smaller networks that encourage government inspired behavioral changes.

To achieve government at a distance, technologies are needed to make individual conduct amenable to change. As such, the calculated uses of comprehensive and diverse technologies

---

236 Ibid. at 278.
are necessary to influence the actions of individuals, which utilize expertise as a method of

guiding their personal choices.\textsuperscript{237} Ultimately, these technologies aim to encourage individuals to
evaluate their behaviour in relation to an ideal standard of conduct and to modify their behaviour
accordingly.\textsuperscript{238} In this respect, government policy serves as this ideal standard and provides the
underlying goals and values that are transcribed into individual conduct.\textsuperscript{239}

The environmental citizenship initiatives and the corresponding technologies of
therapeutics, community and consumption correlate with these goals and function to support
government at a distance. Specifically, they formed the strategies with which the Government of
Canada could advance a normative framework that presented the ideal standard of environmental
conduct that individuals should strive to achieve. For example, both the technologies of
therapeutics and consumption found in the Canadian Environmental Citizenship Learning
Program and the Environmental Choice Program were aimed at encouraging individuals to
reflect on and adjust their behaviour to match the principles of environmental citizenship. In
effect, this encouraged individuals to transcribe these environmental goals into their own values
and actions. While the technologies of therapeutics were primarily aimed at educating
individuals on proper environmental behaviours, the technologies of consumption were aimed at
influencing consumption habits to be consistent with an environmentally responsible lifestyle.
Moreover, the technologies of community seen in the Community Support Program utilized
communities to influence individual conduct, thereby aligning community goals with the goals
of the federal government. As such, the technologies seen in the environmental citizenship
initiatives assisted ‘government at a distance’ by encouraging subjectivity, so that individuals

\textsuperscript{237} Ibid at 286.
\textsuperscript{238} Ibid. at 285.
\textsuperscript{239} Ibid at 287.
reflected on and modified their behaviour to ensure consistency with the principles of environmental citizenship.

Inherent in these technologies is a reliance on responsibilization as a means of encouraging individuals to self-regulate in accordance with the goals of government. This concept places more emphasis on the responsibility and obligation owed to others as a means of governing conduct, where individuals are persuaded to modify their conduct based on this rationale.\textsuperscript{240} Responsibilization is a common theme running through the technologies of therapeutics, consumption and community, where individuals are encouraged to acknowledge their negative environmental impacts on others, and alter their behaviour to address this. As discussed in the previous sections, the technologies of therapeutics and consumption worked to influence the adoption of environmental values, and maintained that improvement of environmental conditions were within individual control. In addition, the technologies of community encouraged individuals to reduce their environmental impact based on the environmental obligations owed to other community members. In effect, this placed additional responsibility on individuals to adopt environmental citizenship as a means of fulfilling this sense of responsibility; thereby persuading individuals modify their conduct in accordance with government objectives.

The technologies of therapeutics, consumption and community enabled government at distance by encouraging individuals to subjectify themselves in accordance with the goals of government. This is consistent with the methods of governing in advanced liberal societies since it works to govern individual conduct in a manner that does not infringe on their personal autonomy, and functions to align their personal aspirations with the goals of government. In

\begin{footnotesize}
\textsuperscript{240} \textit{Ibid} at 289.
\end{footnotesize}
terms of environmental citizenship, these technologies align individuals’ personal aspirations with environmentally friendly lifestyles. In addition, relying on non-coercive and self-driven approaches to governing environmental conduct conceals the inherent power relations involved in producing subjectivity. Power is inherent in the formation of environmental subjectivity, serving to inconspicuously guide individual conduct towards environmental aims. Through the calculated use of technologies that enable government at a distance, the sources of power that guide and govern conduct are further obscured. For example, the desire to purchase environmentally friendly products may appear to be self-motivated, however this is a calculated governmental effort to elicit behavioural changes through education, green consumerism or community influence. As such, these technologies enable ‘government at a distance’, but also mask the power relations that guide individual subjectivity.

4.4 Environmental Citizenship: Outcomes

In establishing that individual environmental conduct is indirectly governed through a variety of technologies aimed at stimulating environmental citizenship, it becomes important to examine how the environmental citizenships initiatives have resonated with contemporary environmental conduct. The federal government’s strategy to encourage voluntary adoption of environmental behaviours is consistent with psychological research in the area. These psychological studies show that environmentally responsible behaviours are most successfully internalized when they are voluntarily adopted. Internalizing environmentally responsible behaviours requires that individuals are made aware of a particular environmental issue, provoking environmental action that is rooted in an intrinsic response. For example, an

individual is aware of recycling programs and chooses to participate based on the self-satisfaction he/she receives from helping the environment. This means that individuals are most likely to internalize and self-regulate according to environmentally responsible behaviours when they are adopted as a result of a self-lead personal project, free from pressure.\textsuperscript{242} Moreover, individuals are most receptive to adopting environmentally responsible behaviours when they perceive the government as supporting their autonomous choice to engage in these behaviours. As such, environmental behaviours are most successfully adopted when government policies support the autonomous choice of individuals to modify their behaviours, where the reasoning for changing is rooted in intrinsic responses such as personal commitment, satisfaction or well being.\textsuperscript{243}

Data from Statistics Canada suggests that federal government efforts to modify individual behaviour have followed the psychological explanation for behaviour change. Indeed, Statistics Canada has reported that since the 1990s, environmentally responsible conduct has increased to a point where the majority of Canadians have adopted environmentally responsible actions. These environmental behaviours consist of energy conservation such as adjusting the thermostat during the day and evening, and purchasing ‘low-flow’ products to reduce water usage, increases in biodegradable cleaning products, decreases in pesticide use, and community participation in recycling programs.\textsuperscript{244} Moreover, 45% of Canadians were determined to be ‘very active’ in their participation in environmental behaviours, noting that reasons for not adopting environmental


behaviours were related to availability of environmentally friendly alternatives and not a lack of concern.\textsuperscript{245} This suggests that the environmental citizenship initiatives of the early 1990s were successful in establishing a basis for influencing the behaviours of the majority of Canadians to reduce their environmental impacts. These facts exemplify both greater environmental awareness and the growth of responsible consumption consistent with the original principles of environmental citizenship.

This data suggests that Canada’s environmental citizenship initiatives have effectively facilitated environmental self-regulation at the individual level. Here the statistical information provided by Statistics Canada demonstrates the increase of environmentally responsible behaviour since the introduction of the environmental citizenship initiatives during the mid 1990s. In doing so, it connects the indirect means of influencing individuals conduct through the Environmental Citizenship Learning Program, Community Action Program and Environmental Choice program with long term behavioural changes in line with the goals of environmental citizenship. Moreover, the psychological data examining the governmental role in environmental behaviour modification contextualizes the effectiveness of these environmental programs. Here, the psychological data shows that individuals look to government to support and guide their decisions, which confirms the important role government plays in establishing ‘ideal’ environmental behaviour. In terms of the environmental citizenship initiatives, governmental efforts sought to influence environmental behaviours through education and guidance, while responsibilizing the individual into adopting environmental citizenship. In doing so, the environmental citizenship initiatives utilized non-coercive means of shaping individual behaviour so as to not impinge personal autonomy, while encouraging the

\textsuperscript{245} Avani Babooram “Canadian Participation in Environmentally Active Lifestyles” (2008) 2:4 EnviroStats at 7.
internalization of environmentally responsible behaviours. In effect, this enabled the government of individual conduct to voluntarily adopt environmental citizenship, while still respecting individual autonomy.

4.5 Conclusion

The environmental citizenship initiatives exemplify the means of governing individual conduct through the technologies of education, community and consumption. The Environmental Citizenship Learning Program created and disseminated several education materials aimed at promoting environmental citizenship through educating individuals on environmental values and providing individuals with the skill sets needed to behave responsibly. This enabled individuals to become more aware of their environmental impact and responsibilized them into making the necessary changes. In addition, the federal government formed partnerships with various educational and community organizations to increase the avenues for promoting environmental citizenship. Communities were encouraged to participate in environmental community building initiatives and to take an active role in improving their community through responsible environmental action. Lastly, the creation of the Environmental Choice Program utilized marketing tactics to empower individuals to adopt environmentally sound lifestyles. Responsible consumption was linked to environmentally responsible action, where individuals were able to fulfill their environmental obligations through changes in consumption.

These technologies encouraged individuals to subjectify themselves in accordance with the principles of environmental citizenship and responsible environmental action. In addition, they facilitated ‘government at a distance,’ which overcomes issues of distance to govern
conduct through indirect means. Thus, programs such as the Environmental Citizenship Learning Program or the Environmental Choice program functioned to shape individual conduct through voluntary means and revealed the methods of promoting environmental subjectivity. Inherent in the subjectification process are the power relations that worked to influence the actions of another, in this case, the power relations that influenced individuals into adopting environmental citizenship. Here, the relationship between power and government at a distance was able to affect environmental subjectivity, while concealing the power relations that guided the subjectification process. This is supported through statistical and psychological research that suggests that environmental behaviours have increased since the introduction of the environmental citizenship initiatives, and that individual adoption of these behaviours is dependent on government guidance. As such, the environmental citizenship initiatives developed through the 1990 Canada Green Plan were crucial to the advancement of environmentally responsible behaviours and the formation of environmental subjects.
Conclusion

The environmental citizenship initiatives developed through the Canada Green Plan provide the foundation for understanding the development and promotion of environmentally friendly behaviour at the individual level. Here, the technologies of therapeutics, consumption and community enable the government of individual conduct through the concept of subjectivity. This method of governing produced environmentally conscious citizens who regulated their conduct in line with the principles of environmental citizenship and helped to achieve environmental goals through non-coercive regulations. In doing so, this situated the development of environmentally friendly behaviour within the governmentality framework, where increases in environmentally friendly behavior were the result of a policy framework that encouraged and supported these changes. Although the Green Plan was dropped during the mid 1990s, it formed the policy basis for encouraging subjectivity that is used in current environmental policy. As such, this thesis sheds light on the policy framework that was used to promote environmentally friendly lifestyles and its implications on new environmental programs that follow this governance framework.

Establishing the methods of governing environmental subjectivity not only clarified the manner in which individuals came to internalize environmentally friendly behaviors, but also formed the foundation for promoting environmental subjectivity that is still used in liberal democratic societies such as Canada. Much of the policy initiatives found in the Green Plan that sought to persuade individuals into making environmentally sound choices, remain prevalent in contemporary environmental policy. Following a consultation with 5500 Canadians, the federal
government released *A Framework for Environmental Learning and Sustainability in Canada* that was presented at the 2002 World Summit on Sustainable Development in Johannesburg.\textsuperscript{246} Here, the federal government once again acknowledged that learning does not occur solely in the classroom, recognizing that partnerships must be formed with schools, communities, and associations to in order to promote environmental awareness and sustainable development. This strategy was aimed at improving access to information and environmental education, developing a network of alliances with community and governmental organizations, and promoting sustainable living through participation in responsible consumption. In order to achieve these goals, it increased funding opportunities for environmental communities, access to educational resources on environmental issues via the internet, and training and research to support learning initiatives.\textsuperscript{247} Although the concept of environmental citizenship was not specifically mentioned in the 2002 Framework, it shared the same goal of promoting environmental awareness and imparted upon citizens the necessary skills to empower them to make environmentally responsible choices.\textsuperscript{248} As a result, the framework for achieving these goals of sustainable development mirrored the environmental citizenship initiatives developed in the *Green Plan*. By encouraging individuals to become aware of and informed about the environment, and targeting community associations for support, the *Framework for Environmental Learning and Sustainability in Canada* continued to encourage individual subjectivity through technologies of therapeutics and community.

This policy framework was reaffirmed in 2005 when Canada joined the United Nations Decade for Education and Sustainable development, which confirmed education as the prime

\textsuperscript{247} Ibid. at 14.
\textsuperscript{248} Ibid. at 2.
method of achieving behavioural changes towards the environment. The federal government report titled *Education for Sustainable Development in Canada: The Work of the Federal Government*, maintained that education efforts were integral to continue awareness of sustainable development efforts and empower individuals to make lifestyle changes. The report built on environmental education by introducing e-learning initiatives to promote sustainable development and expanded programs targeting consumer awareness. These included additional environmental labelling programs such as the Energuide program in order to inform consumers on energy efficient appliances, and the Auto$mart program in order to educate consumers on how to maintain vehicles in a manner that reduced fuel consumption costs. In addition, community involvement in environmental issues remained a priority, establishing a continued effort to encourage involvement and environmental awareness through community partnerships and funding programs. In turn, this community influence empowered individuals to adopt environmental citizenship and adjust their behaviours according to sustainable development targets. In doing so, it continued to utilize community associations as a means of encouraging individuals to adopt environmentally friendly lifestyles.

The recurrent use of environmental citizenship principles in Canadian environmental policy reflects a sustained effort to encourage environmental subjectification by relying on the technologies of therapeutics, consumption and community. These technologies worked to influence voluntary changes in behavior through education, consumption and community efforts, and serves as the foundation for current policies seen in *A Framework for Environmental Learning and Sustainability in Canada* and *Education for Sustainable Development in Canada:*

---


250 Ibid. at 8.

251 Ibid. at 10.
The Work of the Federal Government. While this thesis provides a greater understanding of how environmentally friendly behaviours are promoted and developed through Canadian policy, environmental subjectivity also has implications for new and ongoing environmental programs. Programs aimed at stimulating environmentally friendly behaviours, also continue to rely on environmental subjectivity in order to produce the voluntary compliance that is necessary for these program to operate. For example, the expansion of composting and green bin programs offered through municipalities has prompted the release of a variety of materials to educate individuals on the merits of adopting composting practices and the environmental benefits. Information found on both federal and municipal websites is oriented towards educating individual on how to adopt additional environmentally friendly programs into their lifestyle, as well as the logistical issues of how these programs operate, such as which items are compostable. In doing so, waste management and recycling programs continue to utilize the technologies of governing environmental conduct, since they are administered through communities and rely on environmental education to influence consumption habits. Thus, current environmental programs aimed at promoting lifestyle changes, such as recycling, waste management, water and energy conservation, rely on creation of environmental subjectivity in order to stimulate the voluntary participation necessary for success.

In addition, these technologies have significant implications on individuals’ environmental identities. These technologies represent a continued and comprehensive effort to encourage environmental subjectification through various governmental programs in order to empower individuals to make the necessary behavioral changes. The use of the technologies of subjectification in the field of environmental governance are important, since they obscure the sources of power that guide individual conduct. The implicit power relationship that influences
and sways conduct towards environmental aims, functions to structure the field of action in order to attain the desired level of environmental citizenship. For example, the recent government reports pledge continual support for environmental awareness and educational programs as a means of eliciting the desired behavioural changes. These programs are intended to equip individuals with the skills needed to reflect on and modify their behavior, as well as the moral obligation and responsibility to reduce their environmental impact. In doing so, this structures the field of action in such a way so that individuals will strive to achieve the principles of environmental citizenship, making this seem like a self-motivated idea instead of an intentional act to guide behaviour. Consequently, this elevates the governmental role in creating and fostering environmental identities, where the adoption of environmentally responsible lifestyle is connected to a governmental framework that inconspicuously steered individuals towards this path.

This becomes apparent when one considers the types of actions typically associated with environmentally responsible lifestyles, such as composting and recycling, purchasing environmentally safe products, conserving energy, reducing waste and participating in local and community environmental organizations, as all have been encouraged and promoted through government policy. The expansion of e-learning initiatives, environmental labels and community partnerships demonstrates the continued effort to persuade individuals to adopt the ideal environmental identity. In doing so, the governmental role in promoting and creating environmental subjectivities remains an integral component, as it operates to guide individuals into autonomously adopting ecological identities that are consistent with policy aims.

While this thesis has shed light on the technologies used to stimulate subjectivity consistent with governmental aims, future research in the area of environmental conduct could
build on the current project by focusing on the production and constitution of environmentally friendly behaviour. In acknowledging the power relationship that stimulates environmental subjectivity, it is important to understand how these sorts of behaviours have come to represent the dominant method of acting in an environmentally responsible manner. As Foucault mentioned in his essay on the *Technologies of the Self*, the manner in which individuals turn themselves into subjects represents only half of the equation in a power relationship. Equally important is the power/knowledge relationship that has led to the normalization of conduct, which differentiates and standardizes conduct as good or bad, and incorrect or correct. This would provide more insight on the development of these environmentally responsible behaviors, and would involve more analysis into the rationality for motivating individual action and the power that influences how individuals come to understand their relationship with the environment. For example, the report titled *Education for Sustainable Development in Canada: The Work of the Federal Government* expands on technologies of consumption by adding additional environmental logos as a means of empowering individuals to adopt environmentally friendly lifestyles. However, while buying environmentally friendly product may help to reduce an individual’s environmental impact, there may have been a greater reduction had the individual just abstained from purchasing consumer goods in the first place. In other words, this analysis would involve an examination of what sorts of rationalities are employed and how have they been normalized so that individuals understand their primary role in protecting the environment through recycling, turning off lights, purchasing environmentally friendly products.

Future analysis on the constitution of environmentally responsible conduct, can thus build on the current analysis of environmental subjectivity. By analyzing the Canadian environmental citizenship initiatives of the early to mid-1990s, this thesis revealed the methods used by
government to manage individual conduct. Specifically, it examined how these initiatives used the technologies of therapeutics, consumption and community to shape individual conduct in accordance with government environmental aims. Establishing ‘government at a distance,’ these technologies obscured the power of government in creating individual environmental subjectivities. The recurrent use of these technologies have significant implications for new environmental programs and environmental identities, as they highlight the central role the government plays in creating the identities necessary for voluntary conformity to environmental citizenship.
Works Cited


Bell, D. “Liberal Environmental Citizenship” (2005) 14 Environmental Politics 179.


Haury, D. “Assessing the Educational Dimension of Environmental Education Resources Provided by Non-Formal Groups” in Edward Johnson & Michael Mappin eds. Environmental


