**The Women's Movement and the Responses to Violence Against
Women in the USSR and post-Soviet Russia**

by

Lisa Semenoff

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate Studies
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for the
degree of Master of Arts

Institute of Central/East European and
Russian Area Studies
Carleton University
Ottawa, Canada

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your title / Votre référence

Our title / Notre référence

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

—

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

—

ISBN 0-612-19476-0

Name WOMEN'S STUDIES

Dissertation Abstracts International is arranged by broad, general subject categories. Please select the one subject which most nearly describes the content of your dissertation. Enter the corresponding four-digit code in the spaces provided

WOMEN'S STUDIES

0421

U-M-I

SUBJECT TERM

SUBJECT CODE

Subject Categories

THE HUMANITIES AND SOCIAL SCIENCES

COMMUNICATIONS AND THE ARTS

Architecture 0720
Art History 0377
Cinema 0900
Dance 0378
Fine Arts 0357
Information Science 0723
Journalism 0391
Library Science 0399
Mass Communications 0708
Music 0413
Speech Communication 0459
Theater 0465

EDUCATION

General 0515
Administration 0514
Adult and Continuing 0516
Agricultural 0517
Art 0273
Bilingual and Multicultural 0282
Business 0688
Community College 0275
Curriculum and Instruction 0727
Early Childhood 0518
Elementary 0524
Finance 0277
Guidance and Counseling 0519
Health 0680
Higher 0745
History of 0520
Home Economics 0278
Industrial 0521
Language and Literature 0270
Mathematics 0280
Music 0522
Philosophy of 0496
Physical 0523

Psychology 0525
Reading 0535
Religion 0527
Sciences 0714
Secondary 0533
Social Sciences 0534
Sociology of 0340
Special 0529
Teacher Training 0530
Technology 0710
Tests and Measurements 0288
Vocational 0747

LANGUAGE, LITERATURE AND LINGUISTICS

Language 0679
General 0289
Linguistics 0290
Modern 0291
Literature 0401
General 0294
Classical 0295
Comparative 0297
Medieval 0298
Modern 0316
African 0591
American 0305
Asian 0352
Canadian (English) 0355
Canadian (French) 0593
English 0311
Germanic 0312
Latin American 0315
Middle Eastern 0313
Slavic and East European 0314

PHILOSOPHY, RELIGION AND THEOLOGY

Philosophy 0422
Religion 0318
General 0321
Biblical Studies 0319
Clergy 0320
History of 0322
Philosophy of 0469
Theology 0323

SOCIAL SCIENCES

American Studies 0324
Anthropology 0326
Archaeology 0327
Cultural 0310
Physical 0272
Business Administration 0770
General 0454
Accounting 0338
Banking 0561
Management 0503
Marketing 0505
Canadian Studies 0508
Economics 0509
General 0510
Agricultural 0511
Commerce Business 0358
Finance 0366
History 0351
Labor 0578
Theory 0351
Folklore 0358
Geography 0366
Gerontology 0351
History 0578

Ancient 0579
Medieval 0581
Modern 0582
Black 0328
African 0331
Asia, Australia and Oceania 0332
Canadian 0334
European 0335
Latin American 0336
Middle Eastern 0337
United States 0585
History of Science 0398
Law 0615
Political Science 0616
General 0617
International Law and Relations 0614
Public Administration 0452
Recreation 0626
Social Work 0627
Sociology 0631
Criminology and Penology 0628
Demography 0629
Ethnic and Racial Studies 0630
Individual and Family Studies 0629
Industrial and Labor Relations 0630
Public and Social Welfare 0700
Social Structure and Development 0744
Theory and Methods 0709
Transportation 0909
Urban and Regional Planning 0453
Women's Studies 0453

THE SCIENCES AND ENGINEERING

BIOLOGICAL SCIENCES

Agriculture 0473
General 0285
Animal Culture and Nutrition 0475
Animal Pathology 0476
Food Science and Technology 0359
Forestry and Wildlife 0478
Plant Culture 0479
Plant Pathology 0480
Plant Physiology 0817
Range Management 0777
Wood Technology 0746
Biology 0306
General 0287
Anatomy 0308
Biostatistics 0309
Botany 0379
Cell 0329
Ecology 0353
Entomology 0369
Genetics 0793
Limnology 0410
Microbiology 0307
Molecular 0317
Neuroscience 0416
Oceanography 0433
Physiology 0821
Radiation 0778
Veterinary Science 0472
Zoology 0786
General 0760
Medical 0996
Earth Sciences 0425
Biogeochemistry 0996
Geochemistry 0996

Geodasy 0370
Geology 0372
Geophysics 0373
Hydrology 0388
Mineralogy 0411
Paleobotany 0345
Paleoecology 0426
Paleontology 0418
Palaeozoology 0985
Palynology 0427
Physical Geography 0368
Physical Oceanography 0415

HEALTH AND ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCES

Environmental Sciences 0768
Health Sciences 0566
General 0572
Audiology 0992
Chemotherapy 0567
Dentistry 0350
Education 0769
Hospital Management 0758
Human Development 0982
Immunology 0564
Medicine and Surgery 0347
Mental Health 0569
Nursing 0570
Nutrition 0380
Obstetrics and Gynecology 0354
Occupational Health and Therapy 0381
Ophthalmology 0571
Pathology 0419
Pharmacology 0572
Pharmacy 0382
Physical Therapy 0573
Public Health 0574
Radiology 0575
Recreation 0575

Speech Pathology 0460
Toxicology 0383
Home Economics 0386

PHYSICAL SCIENCES

Pure Sciences 0485
Chemistry 0749
General 0486
Analytical 0487
Biochemistry 0488
Inorganic 0738
Nuclear 0490
Organic 0491
Pharmaceutical 0494
Physical 0495
Polymer 0754
Radiation 0405
Mathematics 0605
Physics 0986
General 0606
Acoustics 0607
Astronomy and Astrophysics 0608
Atmospheric Science 0748
Atomic 0607
Electronics and Electricity 0798
Elementary Particles and High Energy 0759
Fluid and Plasma 0609
Molecular 0610
Nuclear 0752
Optics 0756
Radiation 0611
Solid State 0463
Statistics 0346
Applied Sciences 0984
Applied Mechanics 0984
Computer Science 0984

Engineering 0537
General 0538
Aerospace 0539
Agricultural 0540
Automotive 0541
Biomedical 0542
Chemical 0543
Civil 0544
Electronics and Electrical 0548
Heat and Thermodynamics 0545
Hydraulic 0546
Industrial 0547
Marine 0794
Materials Science 0548
Mechanical 0743
Metallurgy 0551
Mining 0552
Nuclear 0549
Packaging 0765
Petroleum 0554
Sanitary and Municipal System Science 0790
General Technology 0428
Operations Research 0796
Plastics Technology 0795
Textile Technology 0794

PSYCHOLOGY

General 0621
Behavioral 0284
Clinical 0622
Developmental 0620
Experimental 0623
Industrial 0624
Personality 0625
Physiological 0989
Psychobiology 0349
Psychometrics 0632
Social 0451

The undersigned hereby recommend to the Faculty of
Graduate Studies and Research acceptance of this thesis,
submitted by LISA SEMENOFF, in partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Piotr Dutkiewicz, Acting Director
Central/East European and
Russian Area Studies

Professor A. Chandler, Supervisor

Abstract

In Russia, support services for women experiencing violence are a recent development. The first support services opened in the early 1990's. This thesis identifies several factors which explain the need for and the timing of the development of support services: state policies, official women's organizations, the legal community, and the women's movement. This thesis reaches the conclusion that the need for support services for women experiencing violence is not new; in Soviet Russia, as in post-Soviet Russia, women experienced violence. Support services, however, were unable to develop in Soviet Russia because the Soviet State did not recognize the need for their development and because the State placed restrictions on the organization of private groups. Women in post-Soviet Russia, although facing new economic hardships, now have the opportunity to improve their position, articulate interests and create new visions of their needs and their place in society.

To the brave, yet gentle, women of Russia making a difference

Acknowledgments

Many people have assisted me and encouraged me in this thesis. Their support has culminated in its final completion. I would like to thank, first of all, the Patricia Allen Memorial Award Committee for supporting this project with a bursary. In addition, I would like to thank Andrea Chandler, my thesis advisor, for her endless patience and her promptness in reading the various versions of this thesis. Her suggestions and insights were always useful and proved of great assistance in better accenting important points. I would also like to thank the various women I met in Russia for their cooperation and assistance. I would also very much like to thank my husband Bruce and my brother John, both of whom spent countless hours in the final editing process of this thesis. There are many other people who have believed in me and believed in this project. Although they are too numerous to list here, their moral support has meant a great deal to me and has not been forgotten.

Table of Contents

Abstract	iii
Dedication	iv
Acknowledgments	v
Table of Contents	vi
 Introduction	 1
Chapter 1	
The Representation of Women's Interests in the Soviet Periods ..	18
Official Women's Organizations in The Soviet Periods	19
<i>Zhenotdel</i> : The Early Soviet Period	19
The Soviet Women's Committee: The Stalinist Period to the	
Gorbachev Period	23
Restrictions on the Formation of Groups and Freedom of Speech	24
Marxist-Leninist Ideology	26
The Promotion of Male Interests Over Female Interests	31
Social Groups and Society	36
Women's Organizations	39
Conclusion	41
 Chapter 2	
The Soviet Legal Community:	
Interpretations of Rape and Wife Assault	42
Violence Against Women: A Historical Overview of the Scope of the	
Problem and the Responses to it	45
Legal Codes and Statutes Relating to Violent Crimes	49
Violence Against Women: Statistics	51
Soviet Literature on Rape and Family Violence	58
Criminologists as Educators	74
Conclusion	75
 Chapter 3	
The Russian Women's Movement and the Articulation of	
Women's Interests	76
The Formation of the Soviet/Russian Women's Movement	76
Economic and Political Factors	76
Women's Groups	79
Official Women's Organizations	80
Independent Women's Organizations	84
Independent Women's Forum - The Dubna Conference	85
Democracy and the Dissolution of the Soviet Union	89

The Second Dubna Conference	90
The Post-Dubna Conference	90
The Mandate of the Independent Women's Movement	92
The Direct Support of Women's Groups	94
The Structure of Women's Groups Within the Independent Women's Movement	96
The Relationship Between the Russian Women's Movement and Support Services: What Does the Women's Movement Gain?	100
Conclusion	103

Chapter 4

The Post-Soviet Development of Support Services for Women Experiencing Violence	104
Levels of Violence Against Women in post-Soviet Russia	106
Rape	107
Wife Assault	110
Motivations for the Development of Support Services	115
Types of Support Services	119
Plans for Expansion	121
Factors Facilitating the Development of Support Services	124
Obstacles to the Development of Support Services	129
The Problem of State Funding	130
The Influence of Support Services on Russian Society	132
Public Education	132
The Need for Reliable Data	133
Professionals: Their Attitudes and Influence	135
Self Defense Training	139
Conclusion	141
Conclusion	143
Bibliography	152

Introduction

The status of women provides the barometer of the level of humanity attained by society.¹

The Soviet Union went to great efforts to improve the status of women. For example, under the Soviet constitution men and women were guaranteed equal cultural, social, political and economic rights.² In order to realize their equal rights with men in Soviet society, women were guaranteed equal access "to education and vocational and professional training, equal opportunities in employment, remuneration, and promotion, and in social and political, and cultural activity".³ By the 1980's, 90% of women were employed composing approximately half of the work force. 54% of those graduating from higher educational institutions were women.⁴ Women held a third of seats in the Supreme Soviet - the highest

¹With this phrase Karl Marx continues the idea of the French utopian socialist Charles Fourier. Cited in Barbara Einhorn, Cinderella goes to market. London: Verso, 1993: 17. This phrase was also paraphrased by Vladimir Lenin in 1920 in the following manner "It is said that the level of culture is best characterized by the legal status of woman". Vladimir Lenin, Women in Society. New York, 1938: 26-27 ("International Woman's Day" Pravda, March 7, 1920) used in The Woman Question: Selections from the Writings of Karl Marx, Frederick Engels, V.I. Lenin, Joseph Stalin. New York: International Publishers, 1951: 63.

²See Lalith deSilva, "Women's Emancipation Under Communism A Re-Evaluation," East European Quarterly. XXVII, #3, September 1993: 302.

³Sexual equality guarantees were incorporated into the first Soviet constitution and later in all subsequent constitutions. For example see Constitution (Fundamental Law) of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (Amended by the First Session of the Seventh Supreme Soviet of the USSR) Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1967: 91; Constitution (Fundamental Law) of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (Adopted at the Seventh [Special] Session of the Supreme Soviet of the USSR, Ninth Convocation on October 7, 1977), Moscow: Novosti Press Agency Publishing House, 1977: 38.

⁴See O.A. Voronina, "Zhenshchina v 'muzhskom obshchestve'," Sotsial'nye Issledovaniya, #2, 1988: 104-105.

legislative body in the Soviet Union.⁵ In addition for most of the history of the Communist period divorce was easily obtainable and abortions were available on demand.

Women's ability to exercise equal rights with men was also understood to be guaranteed through additional provisions for women:

by special labour and health protection measures for women; by legal protection, and material and moral support for mothers and children, including paid leaves and other benefits for expectant mothers and mothers, and gradual reduction of working time for mothers with small children.⁶

These efforts were influenced by the writings of Karl Marx and Frederick Engels who postulated that women's oppression came from an economy that denied women resources and a social system that left them dependent on the men in their lives.⁷ Contributing to productive labour in a socialist society was understood to be the key to the emancipation of women. Employment was to provide women with resources which would guarantee women's equal status with

⁵The quota system was an unpublished policy of the Soviet state that was intended to demonstrate the good representation of various social groups in Soviet political structures. Quotas existed both on national and republic levels. For example from 1980 to 1985 a quota existed for women's participation in the Supreme Soviet of the Russian Federation. 35% of seats were reserved for women. Russian Federation, Rossiiskaia Federatsiia - natsional'nyi doklad k chetvertoi Vsemimoi Konferentsii po polozeniiu zhenshchin (Russian Federation's National Report to the Fourth World Conference on Women), 1994: 6.

⁶Constitution (Fundamental Law) of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics, 1977: 38.

⁷According to Marx and Engels, private property relations under capitalism allowed men to accumulate surplus value while women, who remained primarily in the home, created no surplus value and were, therefore, economically dependent on the material support they received from men. This economic dependence was exploited by men to adopt authoritarian behaviours in the family and to make women socially dependent on men as well. See Friedrich Engels "The Origin of the Family, Private Property, and the State" in Robert C. Tucker, The Marx-Engels Reader, Second Edition, New York: W.W. Norton & Company Inc, 1978: 734-59; Einhorn, 1993: 18-20.

men in society and as such would provide women with full citizenship rights.

Despite the economic gains women made in the Soviet period, serious problems in the lives of women persisted and were left 'underaddressed'. One of these problems was the continuing existence of male violence against women - rape and wife assault - throughout the Soviet period.⁸ The general response of the Soviet state to rape and wife assault accomplished little. The state's response managed to neither substantially deter potential perpetrators nor to mediate the trauma women suffering violence experienced. Although laws against rape existed,⁹ rape remained difficult to prove.¹⁰ Spousal violence experienced by women, although understood to exist, was rarely discussed. For the majority of the Soviet period support services for women experiencing violence - advocacy and counselling programs and safe houses or shelters - did not exist.¹¹

The Soviet state's attention to violence against women, however, was not

⁸'Violence against women' is a term that in the West originally referred specifically to rape and wife assault. In recent years the definition has broadened to include such phenomenon as economic injustice and environmental degradation. This thesis when using the term 'violence against women' refers to its original meaning - rape and wife assault.

⁹All 15 republics within the Soviet Union had their own criminal codes. Each criminal code included statutes outlining penalties for rape.

¹⁰For example, Natalia Khodyreva, a psychologist and one of the founders of the St. Petersburg sexual assault hotline found that of the 4,000 calls the hotline received in its first year (1990-91) only four incidents of rape were prosecuted in court. This Khodyreva attributes to the widespread belief amongst police that women are to blame for rape and consequently police do not take women's reports of sexual assault seriously. Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project, Russia: Neither Jobs Nor Justice - State Discrimination Against Women in Russia, Vol. 7, #5, March 1995: 25.

¹¹This thesis uses 'support services' to refer to a series of services ranging from telephone crisis lines to shelters for battered women that provide women who have experienced violence psychological, economic, legal and moral support as well as ensuring women's physical safety.

uniform. Because the differences within the Soviet period with respect to the treatment of violence against women are significant, I have broken down the Soviet period into four sub-periods according to the state's treatment of violence against women in each sub-period. The first period, 1918-1928, I refer to as the Early Soviet Period. Comparatively, this period is more progressive than the periods that follow. There was a greater focus on women's issues and concerns over violence against women.¹² The second period, 1929-1953, which I refer to as the Stalinist Period, is characterized by its strong state control over the Soviet population and severe penalties for criticism of the state. During this period no crime statistics were published and critical discussion of crime was virtually non-existent. The third period, 1954-1982, which I refer to as the Post-Stalinist Period, is characterized by a growing bureaucratization of the state. Although holding fewer restrictions on public behaviour than the previous period, regulations barring independent social and political movements remained. In this period crime statistics were also not published. The fourth and final period, 1983-1991, which I refer to as the Gorbachev Period, is characterized by policies which encourage members of society to openly discuss societal problems and to form groups around common interests. With the exception of the Early Soviet Period, violence against women was never considered by the state to be of serious public concern nor were steps taken to develop support services for women experiencing violence.

¹²I discuss this period in detail in Chapter 1.

With the advent of the post-Soviet period¹³ support services have emerged in Russia.¹⁴ Support services currently operating include crisis lines, crisis centres and shelters which provide legal, moral and psychological support to women. Although the post-Soviet period has brought some hardships to women,¹⁵ the recent development of Russian support services for women experiencing violence marks a new turning point in women's ability to address their own needs. Women have recognized that the trauma women suffer from violence is a serious problem and they have mobilized to mediate the suffering.

In meeting the needs of women experiencing violence, women developing support services have become actively involved in an open public discussion in an attempt to gain public support and greater influence in society. In this way those developing support services have become part of a Russian civil society.¹⁶ Those

¹³In discussions of the 'post-Soviet period' this thesis refers to events in the Russian Federation beginning in the winter 1991 and extending to the present.

¹⁴The first crisis line exclusively for women opened in Moscow in early 1993 in the Russian Academy Institute of Socio-Economic Problems under the direction of Natalia Rimashevskaja and Marina Pisklakova. Marina Pisklakova, personal interview, June 10, 1995, Repino, Russia.

¹⁵In 1993 women composed 70% of the unemployed. See Russian Federation, *Rossiiskaia Federatsiia - na tsional'nyi doklad k chetvertoi Vsemirnoi Konferentsii po polozeniiu zhenshchin*, 1994: 16. Women have experienced blatant discrimination in their search for employment. Job postings explicitly indicate that an employee of a particular age, sex and body type is being sought, with an allusion to 'extra' (sexual) duties. See Elena Berezhina "Vyzval v kabinet, zaper dver' i pogasil svet...Prinuditel'nyi seks v sluzhebnoy inter'ere," *Ogonok*, #43, October 1995: 48-49; Olga Biriuzova "Defitsinaya rabota: Na vsekh ne khvataet," *Ogonok*, #33, August 1995: 40-43; Alessandra Stanley "Sexual Harassment Thrives In the New Russian Climate," *The New York Times*, April 17, 1994: 1, 8.

¹⁶For a discussion of civil society see Andrew Arato, "Social Movements and Civil Society in the Soviet Union," in Judith B. Sedaitis, Jim Butterfield, *Perestroika From Below: Social Movements in the Soviet Union*, Boulder: Westview Press, 1991: 68.

developing support services are, in their bid for influence, vying for the ears of various sectors of Russian society, including the state.

This new power dynamic is a significant change for the Russian Federation which for most of the Soviet period was dominated by a strict system of hierarchies within a centralized communist party-state structure.¹⁷ Power, in the post-Soviet period, has become diffuse and mobile. Although power continues to be found in state structures, it is also now found in a variety of other places: academic and professional groups, business leaders, local governments, and foreign agencies providing funds to Russian groups.

Thesis Format

This thesis consists of four chapters. Chapter one examines relevant economic, social and political factors which have impacted on the status of women and the ability of groups to organize during the Soviet and post-Soviet periods. This chapter examines the attitudes and policies of the state, and how changes in state policies in the post-Soviet period have prompted the emergence of support services. The purpose of this examination is to explore possible reasons for the lack of support services in the Soviet period and to account for the emergence of support services in the post-Soviet period. The emergence of support services in the post-Soviet period is an important indication of the development of a strong civil society

¹⁷'Communist party-state structure' refers to the combination of formal state structures with corresponding Communist Party structures that would oversee the work of the Soviet state and determine policy directions. See Janos Kornai, The Socialist System: The Political Economy of Communism. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1992: 38-39.

within Russia.

The second chapter examines Soviet statistics on violence against women and surveys literature in criminology in this area. Statistics are used to demonstrate the magnitude of violence against women in the Soviet periods. Literature in criminology shows how information on rape and spousal violence was gathered, interpreted and presented. Criminologists' treatment of violence against women is important because it forms the only Soviet treatment of this subject. As well, information presented by criminologists on violence against women formed the basis for the discussions of rape and spousal violence in legal and law-enforcement training textbooks. Although the Soviet period has formally ended, Soviet criminology continues to form the basis for post-Soviet Russian criminology and continues to inform legal and law-enforcement training. As well, criminologists in the post-Soviet period have become more visible to the public. Some have been the focus of newspaper interviews while others have published materials meant for a wide public audience.

Chapter three examines the relationship between the independent women's movement and the development of support services in Russia. The chapter focuses on how the independent women's movement has facilitated the development of support services for women experiencing violence by encouraging women to identify, articulate and act on their interests. The relationship between support services and the women's movement in Russia is compared to similar relationships in western countries in order to provide an international context for the Russian relationship.

The final chapter looks at three agencies in St. Petersburg and Moscow which have developed support services for women experiencing violence as case studies of the development of support services for women experiencing violence in Russia. The chapter focuses on the motivations and activities of those involved in support services. It also examines the barriers and challenges faced by those involved in support services. Finally, the chapter looks at the ways in which support service organizers have attempted to gain influence in Russian society and the prospects for this influence.

Intent

The purpose of this thesis is to examine the development of support services for women experiencing violence in Russia during the Soviet and post-Soviet periods. Within the Soviet period, this study concentrates most heavily on the Post-Stalinist and Gorbachev periods. In the Post-Stalinist Period, Soviet criminologists began expressing ideas about violence against women that continued to be influential to the end of the Soviet period. The Gorbachev Period marked the beginning of societal changes that continued into the post-Soviet period.

This thesis uses four primary sources of literature: academic literature on Soviet/Russian women, academic literature on crime, academic literature on the Russian women's movement and popular literature on the development of Russian support services. Academic literature on women includes Russian and western analyses of women in the Soviet periods and Russian and western analyses of women's position in post-Soviet Russia. Because women are the primary

organizers and the primary recipients of the support provided by support services this thesis looks at the changing position of women to provide a context for the development of support services.

Academic literature on crime includes both western studies of the Soviet criminal system and Soviet/Russian studies of rape and spousal violence. Western studies place the Soviet legal system within a historical perspective while Soviet/Russian studies identify predominant patterns in approaches to rape and spousal violence. The development of Russian support services for women experiencing violence is, in part, a response to the poor treatment women have received from law-enforcement agencies.¹⁸ To decrease the suffering of women experiencing violence will, therefore, require those involved in support services to improve the treatment women receive from law-enforcement agencies. The ability of those involved in support services to influence law-enforcement agencies will depend heavily on their ability to counteract law-enforcement perceptions of violence against women. Literature in criminology on rape and spousal violence, because of its use in law-enforcement training, forms an important basis for law-enforcement perceptions. This thesis, therefore, looks at the perceptions of rape and spousal violence in literature in criminology which those involved in support services will need to address.

Academic literature on the women's movement¹⁹ includes Russian and

¹⁸Natalia Gaidarenko, personal interview, May 11, 1995, Moscow, Russia.

¹⁹Throughout this thesis 'women's movement' and 'Russian women's movement' refer to women's organizations in the post-Soviet Russian Federation.

western literature assessing the Russian women's movement's prospects for creating a large scale impact on Russian society. The literature assumes that society-wide changes are the most meaningful to women. Literature on the women's movement's prospects is contrasted with primary documents and popular literature on the women's movement which document the incremental, grassroots changes that have occurred in the Russian women's movement. This thesis looks at literature on the women's movement because those developing support services have situated themselves within this movement.²⁰ As such the impact of support services on greater Russian society also demonstrates the impact of the Russian women's movement on this society.

Popular literature, newspaper and magazine articles, on support services documents the development of these services and analyses the need for them within Russian society. Supplementing this literature are five personal interviews conducted in early 1995 with people involved in Russian support services and publications produced by support services.

Two primary challenges exist with the literature chosen. Literature on Soviet/Russian women, crime and the Russian women's movement does not directly address the development of support services. As of yet, there has been no academic analysis of the development of Russian support services. This is best explained by the recent development of support services. The literature on women, crime and the Russian women's movement, however, does provide an important

²⁰Natasha Khodyreva, personal interview, April 12, 1995, St. Petersburg, Russia.

context through which one can understand emerging support services.

A second challenge in the literature chosen is that as of yet there is almost no Western literature on violence against women in the Soviet and post-Soviet periods. Peter Juviler in his article "Women and Sex in Soviet Law", Valerie Sperling in her 1990 article "Rape and Domestic Violence in the USSR" and Lynne Attwood in her 1996 article "The post-Soviet woman in the move to the market: a return to domesticity and dependence?" provide the only analyses of violence against women in the Soviet and the post-Soviet Russian periods.²¹ To overcome this challenge, this thesis focuses on Soviet/Russian literature on rape and wife assault and supplements it when necessary with western literature on violence against women.

It is important to note that some academic and popular literature, in its cursory treatment of violence against women and the development of support services, has suggested that both of these phenomena are largely the product of the Gorbachev and post-Soviet periods. Some authors link rape and wife assault to the rising levels of crime in society and the increasing inability of law-enforcement agencies to deal with this crime.²² Other authors emphasize the effect of the

²¹See Peter Juviler, "Women and Sex in Soviet Law," Dorothy Atkinson, et al., ed., Women in Russia, Sussex: The Harvester Press, 1978: 243-266. See Valerie Sperling, "Rape and Domestic Violence in the USSR," Response to the Victimization of Women and Children, Vol. 13, #3, 1990: 16-22. Lynne Attwood "The Post-Soviet Woman in the Move to the Market: A Return to Domesticity and Dependence?" in Rosalind Marsh, Women in Russia and Ukraine. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996: 255-266.

²²David E. Powell, "Social Problems in Russia," Current History, October 1993: 325-326.

economy and politics on violence.²³ Through economic restructuring, women's economic power in the post-Soviet period has substantially decreased and, it is argued, this has made women more vulnerable to violence. High rates of unemployment amongst women have made them vulnerable to sexual coercion on the job. In addition, unemployment, but decreasing women's economic independence, has made it more difficult for women to leave violent relationships. Moreover, some authors point to the negative effect economic changes have had on men.²⁴ Many men, it is argued are also feeling less powerful and choose to compensate for this powerlessness by controlling the behaviour of women through violence. Soviet restrictions on nudity and violence in printed materials and film which have either been revoked or are simply no longer enforced in the post-Soviet period, according to some authors, facilitated the use of violence against women by popularising an image of women as sex objects and of violence as a good means of meeting one's goals.²⁵ If these authors are correct, then the recent emergence of support services is simply a reaction to the new needs of women resulting from rising crime rates and symbolizes the extent to which life for women in the post-Soviet period has deteriorated.

To accept violence against women (and thus the development of support

²³See Attwood, 1996: 261-264; Tatiana Klimenkova, "What Does Our New Democracy Offer Society?" in Anastasia Posadskaia, *Women in Russia: A New Era in Russian Feminism*. London: Verso, 1994: 31.

²⁴Rob Waters, "A Hotline Movement Grows in Russia," *Ms.*, November/December 1995: 20.

²⁵Lynne Attwood maintains that violence in the post-Soviet period is related to the proliferation of pornographic images of women, to high levels of violence directed against women in Russian film, and the more vulnerable position of women in the post-Soviet period. Attwood, 1996: 263.

services) as primarily a post-Soviet problem one must either accept that violence against women was not a substantial problem during the Soviet periods or that it was a problem which was kept under control. This would suggest that legal or other measures did, indeed, protect Soviet women from violence. If violence against women was not a large problem then the need to provide support to women experiencing violence would not have been great and the absence of specific support services for women experiencing violence understandable.

Although it is true that crime rates for violence against women appear to be high in the post-Soviet period, statistics which became available in the Gorbachev Period also show high levels of violence against women.²⁶ Moreover, violence against women (in its various forms) is both a criminal offense and a social mechanism through which men assert power over women.²⁷ Thus, such violence is intimately connected to the level of power women hold and the existent sanctions against such violence in society.²⁸ What is new in the post-Soviet period is not so

²⁶See Chapters 2 and 4 for a discussion of the methodological shortcomings of Soviet statistics. According to statistics cited by K.A. Tolpekin crime rates for rape have been steadily rising since the 1960s. K.A. Tolpekin, "Iznasilovaniia, zavershivshiesia ubistvom poterpevshikh: statistika i real'nost'," *Sostoianie i tendentsie prestuplenii v Rossiiskom Federatsii*. Moscow: Research Academy of the Ministry of Interior of the Russian Federation, 1993: 108.

²⁷For a discussion of violence as a means of controlling women see Angela Y. Davis, *Women, Culture, & Politics*, New York: Random House, 1989; Susan Brownmiller, *Against Our Will*, New York: Simon and Schuster, 1975; Andrea Dworkin, *Our Blood: prophecies and discourses on sexual politics*, New York: Harper, 1976.

²⁸In cross cultural analyses of cultures in which wife assault was almost non-existent David Levinson found that women's social status particularly financial contributions to the home and the consistent intervention of community into violent situations was the best predictor of low levels of violence. David Levinson, *Family Violence in a Cross Cultural Perspective*, Newbury Park, CA: Sage, 1989: 82-84.

much the level of violence but the publicity devoted to the rise in crime rates, including the rise in rape and spousal violence, which have drawn attention to the problems of crime and its victims.²⁹ Furthermore, some Soviet and western literature has discussed the existence of violence against women in the Soviet period and noted the disinterested and even sceptical response women suffering violence received from law-enforcement agencies when lodging a complaint.³⁰ If, as these discussions of violence suggest, violence against women during the Soviet period was a large and longstanding problem that had not been well addressed by law-enforcement agencies then the recent development of support services may be primarily a response to lifted restrictions on the development of social organizations in the post-Soviet period. The development of support services specifically for women may also be indicative of an expanded view of 'women's concerns' and a heightened gender consciousness amongst women in Russia. If so, the successful development of support services for women experiencing violence would also be indicative of a growing and strengthening women's movement.

The role of women in Russia today and in the future continues to be a topic of heated debate. Has women's overall position deteriorated, improved or stayed the same in the post-Soviet period? Have women lost what few concessions they

²⁹Some of the post-Soviet articles mentioning rape or wife assault include: Nina Antonian, "Ne liudi," *Rabotnitsa*, November 1993: 14-15; T. Kareva, "Tainaia voina," *Rossia*, #30, 1992: 4; L. Golubev, Iu. Kurdriakov, "<<Okhotniki>>," *Krest'ianka*, #6, 1994: 33-34.

³⁰Juviler, 1978: 247-48; Louise I. Shelley, "Inter-Personal Violence in the U.S.S.R.," *Violence, Aggression and Terrorism*, 1(2), 1987: 54-55; Hilary Pilkington, "Russia and the Former Soviet republics: Behind the mask of Soviet unity: realities of women's lives," in Chris Corrin, ed., *Superwomen and the Double Burden: Women's Experience of Change in Central and Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union*, Toronto: Second Story Press Feminist Publishers, 1992: 228-229.

gained during the Soviet periods? Have they gained new opportunities to become significant actors in Russian society? Many authors, including Tatiana Klimenkova, argue that women's position has deteriorated in the post-Soviet period as a result of a break with Soviet policies. Klimenkova blames inappropriate western market values which have, under the guise of benevolent progress, been thrust upon Russian society. Women and men gained much from Soviet government including: access to education, employment and a belief that their lives had a social purpose.³¹ The emphasis on women's hardship during the Soviet period without a thorough analysis of its origins has only served to further decrease women's social position by diminishing the importance of state policies for women.³² The result has been the creation of a moral vacuum in which anarchy reigns and there are no longer any constraints on the treatment of women.³³

Klimenkova, however, fails to adequately explain the origin of discrimination against women in the post-Soviet period. From the context of her article, it would appear that fewer restrictions on society, coupled with the introduction of western values, are the culprits. However, it is difficult to imagine that discrimination against women could have established itself so easily and with so much vigour in such a short time without the existence of a favourable environment.

Lynne Attwood also believes women have suffered significant losses in the

³¹Klimenkova, 1994: 28-29.

³²Klimenkova: 32-33.

³³Klimenkova: 23.

Gorbachev and post-Soviet periods. However, unlike Klimenkova, Attwood does not valorize the Soviet period and sees the roots of women's problems in the post-Soviet period in the Soviet past. In the 1970s, articles began appearing in popular magazines lamenting the masculinization of women which, it was claimed, had subsequently led to a 'social impotency' and to growing rates of alcoholism and aggression in men. With women's increasing self esteem and independence, men had apparently lost the only role that gave their lives meaning, purpose or direction - that of the family breadwinner.³⁴ This idea proliferated into the present and spurred efforts to reduce the level of women's employment.³⁵

Social dissatisfaction with gender roles set the stage for overt discrimination and violence against women in the post-Soviet period. However, Attwood believes that to take hold discrimination and violence needed a capitalist environment. She maintains that violence in the post-Soviet period is related to the proliferation of pornographic images of women, to high levels of violence directed against women in Russian film, and the more vulnerable position of women in the post-Soviet period.

Although different authors, like Klimenkova and Attwood, see the position of women in the post-Soviet period to a lesser or greater degree connected to the position of women during the Soviet period, most are sceptical about women's opportunity to improve their position in the post-Soviet period. This thesis

³⁴Attwood, 1996: 255.

³⁵Attwood, 1996: 256-258.

challenges this scepticism; the development of support services for women experiencing violence is an indication of women's ability to improve their position in society. In so doing, this thesis also examines the role support services, as non-governmental organizations, play in creating a new social model in which people's needs are not met exclusively by the state but by different groups in society. In this model, relationships between various societal groups and between societal groups and the state are constantly being renegotiated. This thesis looks at the factors that facilitate or impede the ability of civil groups, such as support services, to work with other groups and the state and at the sources of power and influence available to groups in this new environment. Given the continuing political instability in Russia, and the extent to which Russian society has changed from its Soviet past, it becomes increasingly important to determine the significance of these changes for women in Russia. The magnitude of these changes will undoubtedly affect the path Russia takes in the future.

Chapter 1

The Representation of Women's Interests in the Soviet Periods

This chapter examines the treatment of women during the Soviet periods within its social, political and economic context in order to explain why a country with a progressive constitution did not provide an environment in which support services could develop. The emergence of support services for women experiencing violence in the post-Soviet period is largely a response to the treatment women experiencing violence received from the state and society during the Soviet periods, as well as a response to societal and political changes which have occurred since the dissolution of the Soviet Union. There are five key factors which have influenced, either favourably or negatively, the development of support services in the Soviet and post-Soviet periods: the role played by official women's organizations in society and politics, the existence of restrictions on the formation of groups and freedom of speech, the ideological conflict between class interests and gender interests, the promotion of male interests over female interests, and the role of social groups. In this chapter, these factors will be analyzed with regard to the various periods in Soviet and post-Soviet history.

As of yet, there is no body of literature which looks at the development of women's support services in Russia. There are, however, extensive bodies of literature which examine official women's organizations, restrictions on society, Marxist-Leninist ideology, and 'traditional patriarchy' in the Soviet and post-Soviet periods and which examine the role of independent women's organizations in a

developing civil society. Although neither body of literature specifically addresses support services, studies in these areas help to explain the timing of support service development.

Official Women's Organizations in The Soviet Periods

Women's organizations in many countries are the main vehicles through which governments communicate official policies to women, and through which women in a population communicate needs and desires to the government. In the Soviet Union, at any given time, there was only one main women's organization which was connected to smaller women's groups on local levels. In the Early Soviet Period, the main women's organization was the *Zhenotdel*, while in the following periods, the Soviet Women's Committee played this role. This section looks at these two organizations and their receptiveness to women's interests and needs, such as the need to provide support to women experiencing violence.

Zhenotdel: The Early Soviet Period

The women's organization of the Early Soviet period is the *Zhenotdel*.¹ Although its members were active in promoting the ideas of communism to women, the *Zhenotdel* also viewed its mandate as the promotion of social programs and policies that would enable women's full participation in political and economic life. As such, the *Zhenotdel*'s members also assumed the role of representing women's

¹The *Zhenotdel* was established in 1918 at the First All-Russia Congress of Working and Peasant Women.

interests to the Communist Party.² The members of the *Zhenotdel* were instrumental in the creation of women's commissions to assess the working conditions of women and provide recommendations for their improvements. They also encouraged the creation of women's sections of government departments to represent the concerns specific to women on various policies.

In the Early Soviet Period, the *Zhenotdel* played a positive role in addressing the issue of violence against women: included in the social programs promoted by the *Zhenotdel* was a campaign to stop the abuse and wife-beating of working women. This campaign originated with the Bolsheviks in the pre-revolutionary period but by the Early Soviet Period became solely the initiative of the *Zhenotdel*. Members of the *Zhenotdel* provided legal aid in court cases involving domestic disputes. As well, the *Zhenotdel* promoted a set of rules of conduct under which abuse of women was not tolerated. Although these rules of conduct never became law, they did give battered women a sense of power.³ Although it has generally been accepted that the *Zhenotdel* raised the status of women, there has been debate about the motivations behind its actions. In Central Asia, for instance, Gregory J. Massell argues that the *Zhenotdel* used the emancipation of women as a vehicle in its attempt to entrench communism in this region.⁴

²Barbara Ranes, *From Baba to Tovarishch: The Bolshevik Revolution and Soviet Women's Struggle for Liberation*, Chicago: Marxist-Leninist Books and Periodicals, 1994, 16.

³See Richard Stites, *The Women's Liberation Movement in Russia: Feminism, Nihilism and Bolshevism 1860-1930*, Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1978: 365.

⁴Gregory J. Massell, *The Surrogate Proletariat*, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, 1974.

The *Zhenotdel* was dissolved in 1930 at the 16th Communist Party Congress, thus eliminating its influence as a force to promote the development of support services. Official statements declared that it had outlived its usefulness and that political consciousness-raising was no longer necessary amongst women.⁵ Barbara Clements argues in a biography of Aleksandra Kollantai that the *Zhenotdel* was plagued by a constant lack of funds and by criticism from members of the Communist Party who refused to accept the need for a women's organization.⁶ Despite this, Gail Warshofsky Lapidus and Barbara Ranes maintain that the work of the *Zhenotdel* was far from ineffectual.⁷ In addition, researcher Richard Stites maintains that the *Zhenotdel's* advocacy of abused women had an empowering effect on women.⁸ The long standing calls for its dismantlement by various members of the Communist Party and the enthusiasm with which it was finally disbanded in 1930 illustrate that the *Zhenotdel* had made a strong impression on the Communist Party and society.

Researcher Gail Lapidus attributes the *Zhenotdel's* unpopularity to the fact

⁵Ranes, 1994: 13-14.

⁶The *Zhenotdel*, although receiving the support of Lenin, never received the full support of the Communist Party. See Barbara Evans Clements, *Bolshevik Feminist: The Life of Aleksandra Kollantai*. Bloomington and London: Indiana University Press, 1979: 239-240.

⁷The *Zhenotdel* trained women in public speaking, organizing and social work. See Gail Warshofsky Lapidus, "Sexual Equality in Soviet Policy: A Developmental Perspective," in Atkinson, et al. eds. *Women in Russia*. England: The Harvester Press, 1978: 120-122; Ranes, 1994: 3-11.

⁸Women were no longer intimidated by their husbands and were enjoying a new freedom. See Stites, 365.

that its policies created social havoc in society.⁹ Lapidus points to the increased number of divorces in the period and the rising number of abandoned children. Researcher Michelle Fuqua takes a different perspective and argues that the priorities of the state began to diverge with the programs of the *Zhenotdel*.¹⁰ Beatrice Brodsky Farnsworth contends that the Communist Party membership, the majority of which was male, was not ready to accept the social dislocation that establishing gender equality would entail and therefore decided to abandon the project.¹¹ Events preceding the *Zhenotdel*'s dissolution support the latter arguments that the state's commitment to women's emancipation was weak and that the state's main interest was the consolidation of political power and influence.¹² With the end of the *Zhenotdel* came the demise of women's central place in Soviet decision making and women's ability to express political and social interests. The dissolution of the *Zhenotdel* also meant the end to legal aid for abused women and campaigns against such abuse.

Although dissatisfaction with women's political organization preceded Stalin,

⁹See Lapidus: 130.

¹⁰Michelle Fuqua argues that the *Zhenotdel* failed to prepare Soviet society for rapid economic and cultural transformations. Michelle Fuqua, The Politics of the Domestic Sphere: The Zhenotdel, Women's Liberation, and the Search for a Novyi Byt in Early Soviet Russia. The Donald W. Treadgold Papers In Russian, East European and Central Asian Studies, The University of Washington: The Henry M. Jackson School of International Studies, #10, 1996:53.

¹¹See Beatrice Brodsky Farnsworth, "Bolshevik Alternatives and the Soviet Family," in Atkinson, et al: 155-164.

¹²In 1926 the status of the Women's Secretariat of the Comintern was downgraded to a subcommittee of the Executive Committee. Later in 1929 special departments of Soviet government including Jewish, Village and Women's were subsumed under Agitation and Mass Campaigns. For a discussion see Ranes, 1994: 13-14.

it was under his leadership that discussion of sexual equality ceased. Women, Stalin proclaimed in 1930, were now emancipated and no longer needed special representation.¹³ Special programming for women was moved under the jurisdiction of individual ministries who would oversee this programming. Stalin, however, continued to make use of Marxist-Leninist arguments that women's equality was tied to their active participation in the productive sphere and encouraged women to exercise their equality by joining the collectivization and industrialization processes.¹⁴

The Soviet Women's Committee: The Stalinist Period to the Gorbachev Period

In the 1940s, the Anti-Fascist Women's Committee, later renamed the Soviet Women's Committee, was created as part of the ongoing campaign for women's employment. This new state sponsored organization for women was controlled by the Communist Party and its mandate was the promotion of the merits of the communist state at home and abroad. Later, in the 1960s, the Committee became an umbrella organization for local women's councils. In this capacity, the Committee represented the state's interests to Soviet women; it, however, did not play a role in the representation of women's interests to the state.¹⁵

¹³Mary Buckley, "Soviet Interpretations of the Women Question," in Barbara Holland, Soviet Sisterhood: British Feminists on Women in the USSR, London: Fourth Estate, 1985: 39; Ranes, 1994, 14.

¹⁴Lapidus, 1978: 131.

¹⁵The official mandate of Soviet Women's Committee was the international promotion of peace and anti-fascism. As an organization created by the state for propaganda purposes its members had contact with female Soviet elite throughout the country. As Ogonyok editor Nadezhda Azhgikhina

Restrictions on the Formation of Groups and Freedom of Speech

Independent women's organizations, which were not allowed to exist in the Soviet periods, could have provided an alternative to official women's organizations and broadened discussions on women's issues. Independent organizations could also have acted as pressure groups to encourage the state to continue its commitment to women's equality. The Soviet party-state, however, was not interested in organizations that could monitor and criticize its activities. Early in the Soviet periods, restrictions were created to suppress independent social and political organizations, eliminating the possibility of their influence in the development of support services.

Amongst the many groups that were abolished in the Early Soviet Period were feminist women's organizations who had long been rivals of the Bolshevik Party.¹⁶ By the Stalinist Period, a system of state controls had developed which heavily restricted the behaviour of its citizens. This system of control took the form of restrictions on the creation of independent social and political movements, strict censorship of mass media and publishing, and restrictions on the freedom of all those believed to be a danger to the state. Such restrictions meant that even

states, the membership of the Committee was composed of the most privileged women in Soviet society, including the famous female astronaut Valentina Tereshkova. Nadezhda Azhgikhina, "A Movement is Born," *The Bulletin of Atomic Scientists*, July/August 1995, 48.

¹⁶Feminist women's organizations, such as the 'League for Women's Equality', the 'Mutual Philanthropic Society', and the 'Women's Progressive Party', maintained that women had interests that cut across classes and that were best realized through apolitical activity. According to the Bolshevik Party, feminist organizations distracted the attention of working women and thus divided the working class. See Stites, 1978: 278-313; A.M. Kollantai, *Izbrannye stat'i i rech'i*, Moscow: Politicheskaiia Literatura, 1972: 61-65.

simple expressions of dissatisfaction with Soviet life could be seen as promoting anti-Soviet sentiments and thus constitute a criminal offense.

By the Post-Stalinist Period, even the organization of public interest groups was seen as a threat to the stability of the state and those involved in these groups faced serious repercussions. Tatiana Mamonova, a dissident author, tells the story of such repression in the introduction to the dissident publication entitled *Women and Russia: Feminist Writings from the Soviet Union*.¹⁷ This anthology, which can best be described as a series of women's reflections on their personal lives, was deemed a danger to the Soviet state. As such, the publication of this work in 1979 resulted in labour camp sentences for some members of its writing collective, while others were exiled.¹⁸ At issue was not only the contents of this publication but also the manner in which it was written and published - independently of the state, thus bypassing official censorship and without state sanction. It was quite apparent that up to the end of the Post-Stalinist Period, the state endeavoured to disallow any influences not deemed to be in its interest. This included women's interests; and hence these restrictions played a negative role in support service development.

During the Gorbachev Period, however, restrictions which had curtailed the activities of independent movements in the Post-Stalinist Period were replaced by looser regulations which allowed for the existence of independent social groups. Amongst the various groups that formed during this period were women's groups.

¹⁷See Tatiana Mamonova, ed. *Women and Russia*. Great Britain: Basil Blackwell, 1984.

¹⁸Mamonova, 1984, 269-173.

However, although groups could exist the state continued to regulate their activities. For instance, the First Independent Women's Forum held in March 1991 in Dubna, Russia faced difficulties when a slanderous newspaper article accused the conference of being 'a lesbian love-in'.¹⁹ Using this excuse the Soviet state placed pressure on the Dubna municipal government to ban the conference. Fortunately for its organizers, the ban was eventually lifted and the conference took place but the incident left organizers stressed and wary of further interferences. Members of law-enforcement, who were present at the conference in order to monitor that no illegal activities were taking place, reinforced a feeling of only limited freedom. However, the fact that the conference was able to occur despite these difficulties is an indication of how much freedom independent organizations had gained by the easing of restrictions.

Marxist-Leninist Ideology

Some academics maintain that the superficial commitment to women's emancipation, demonstrated by the strict control of women's social and political organizations, was not endemic to either communist ideology nor the original Soviet

¹⁹The article was published in *Moskovskii Komsomolets* and led to a temporary official banning of the conference. Following considerable public protest the newspaper acknowledged that the article was founded on false information. However, although the forum proceeded in the end the damaging impact of the article was substantial. Many of the original participants withdrew their registration. The organizing committee was under a lot of stress anticipating future attacks and the *militia* was present at the opening of the forum to guarantee that it was not advocating illegal actions. See also Rosalind Marsh, "The Russian Women's Movement: Anastasia Posadskaia, the Dubna Forum and the Independent Women's Movement in Russia," in Marsh, 1996: 290; Cynthia Cockburn "Democracy Without Women is No Democracy: Soviet Women Hold their First Autonomous National Conference," *Feminist Review*, #39, Winter 1991: 146.

state but appeared only later with the consolidation of power by Joseph Stalin. Stalin's assertion in 1930 that the 'woman question' had been resolved is blamed for bringing to an end the Communist party-state focus on the emancipation of women. The emancipation of women, it is argued, was a significant concern of the Bolsheviks before and immediately following the Russian Revolution.²⁰ Women's equality with men was entrenched in the Soviet constitutions. Restrictions were lifted on women's ability to work.²¹ Abortions were legalized. Marriage and divorce were simplified. In the Early Soviet Period, various types of women's organizations were created to both encourage women to actively participate in the proletariat movement and to improve the living conditions of women so that they could participate fully in economic, social and political life. These examples show the considerable positive role that the ideology was capable of playing.

The ideology, however, did not always lead to the promotion of women's interests. According to Marxist-Leninist ideology, women had no particular political or social interests which differed from the interests of men. Even activities such as child birth and child care, although primarily associated with women, were understood to be interests of the state as a whole. For example, during the Gorbachev Period, men's participation outnumbered women's participation on the Committee on Women's Affairs, Family and Democratic Policy of the Supreme

²⁰See Buckley, 1985, 35; Ranes, 1994.

²¹Prior to the Revolution women needed permission from husbands, fathers or brothers in order to be able to work.

Soviet of the USSR.²² Likewise, women were discouraged from pursuing careers in politics, through propaganda that men's intelligence and strength of character better suited them to politics.²³ The Communist Party undertook campaigns to draw women into politics but these campaigns focused on the role of women as helpers to men in the building of communism. Women, however, were never encouraged to lead the building of communism nor was women's participation sought by the highest decision-making bodies of the Party. In fact, women's general membership in the Communist Party never exceeded 25%. Women's representation in the main decision-making organ at the national level - the Central Committee - at its height in 1990 only reached eight percent.²⁴ Moreover only three women ever participated in the most powerful organ of the Communist Party - the Politburo; of these three, only one held voting status.²⁵ Women's representation was greater in the state bodies where they composed 50% of local Soviets and 35% and 33%, respectively,

²²Of the Committee's 69 members 39 were men and 30 were women. Valentina Konstantinova, "The Women's Movement in the USSR: A myth or a real challenge?" in S. Rai, et al., Women in the Face of Change: The Soviet Union, Eastern Europe and China, London: Routledge, 1992: 205-6.

²³The promotion of women's connection to the home was particularly found in literature exclusively aimed at women. Women's magazines, published by the state for Soviet women, act as a perfect example. For a discussion of women's magazines see Maggie McAndrew, "Women's Magazines in the Soviet Union," Barbara Holland, ed., Soviet Sisterhood: British Feminists on Women in the USSR, London: Fourth Estate, 1985.

²⁴Peter Lentini notes that of these 33 women who were members of the Central Committee most had lesser qualifications than their male counterparts. On this basis Lentini argues that these women played a largely token role in the Committee. Peter Lentini, "A Note on Women in the CPSU Central Committee, 1990," Europe-Asia Studies, Vol. 45, #4, 1993: 729-36.

²⁵In 1988 Alexandra Biriukova was the last woman appointed to the Politburo and she acted only as a candidate member. Maxine Molyneux, "The 'Woman Question' in the Age of Perestroika," New Left Review, Vol. 183, 1990: 35.

of the republic and Supreme soviets. However, researcher Andrea Stevenson

Sanjian points out:

women involved in government are concentrated in the areas of health, education, welfare and socialisation - the traditional 'women's issues' [...] [while] this enhances their access to policy making in areas which typically are of great concern to women, their saturation levels here compared to others, such as in industry or foreign affairs indicate a considerable degree of segregation.²⁶

According to Soviet philosopher Olga Voronina, the reason why the Marxist-Leninist ideology did not recognize women's interests is due to the fact that Marxist-Leninist ideology was produced by men with a 'male view of the world'.²⁷ Marxist-Leninist ideology (complete with its male view) was accepted and fit with the priorities of the Communist Party in the Soviet Union. Voronina maintains that the initiative for women's emancipation in the Soviet Union came not from women themselves but from the communist ideology of men. The predominantly male perspective of communist ideology may explain why women in the Party in the Early Soviet Period had to continuously justify the need for a separate women's body. The experience of Bolshevik women in the Early Soviet Period shows that despite small numbers, motivated women did make substantial changes in society when they were a part of the decision-making bodies. However, Marxist-Leninist ideology did not encourage men to challenge assumptions about women's role in society and more importantly, with the departure of powerful Bolshevik women from central

²⁶Andrea Stevenson Sanjian, "Social Problems, Political Issues: Marriage and Divorce in the USSR," *Soviet Studies*, Vol. 43, #4, 1991: 630.

²⁷Olga Voronina, "Soviet Patriarchy: Past and Present," *Hypatia*, vol. 8, #4, 1993.

decision-making bodies in the Stalinist Period, the male perspectives of society remained undisturbed.

The practical elements of the strengthening of the communist state and the related power structures can also be seen to have played negative roles. Researcher Michelle Fuqua argues that the Communist Party in the Early Soviet Period was not as interested in the emancipation of women as in the entrenching of communist values and the authority of the Soviet state into the population. Communist values included the need for all members of society to be involved in socially productive work. Women in the Early Soviet Period were primarily seen as illiterate and unskilled members of the population who through their ignorance, unless encouraged to seek employment and join social organizations, were likely to halt the progress of communism.²⁸

Another perspective is given by researcher Barbara Einhorn in Cinderella goes to market. Einhorn maintains that pragmatic concerns of the Soviet state overrode other considerations in the formation of state policies on women. Einhorn argues that although communist ideology, and particularly the works of Marx and Engels, saw employment as a necessary pre-condition to women's emancipation, women's mass employment in the Stalinist and post-Stalinist periods came about for pragmatic reasons, tied to initiatives to aid rapid industrialization. The Soviet government was primarily interested in the labour that women could provide in

²⁸Michelle Fuqua, The Politics of the Domestic Sphere: The Zhenotdely, Women's Liberation, and the Search for a Novyi Byt in Early Soviet Russia, The Donald W. Treadgold Papers In Russian, East European and Central Asian Studies, The University of Washington: The Henry M. Jackson School of International Studies, #10, 1996:11-12.

areas of heavy industry - the key to industrialization. In return for their labour women were provided with maternity leaves, child care centres, cafeterias, public laundromats and a host of other services meant to ease the burden women traditionally faced in the home. There was still a heavy domestic burden on women, however, as the provisions of the state did not meet all of the needs of children and the family, were not of a sufficiently high quality, and were not universally available.²⁹

The Promotion of Male Interests Over Female Interests

Perhaps the strongest explanation for the state's lack of a positive role in women's concerns within the Soviet Union is that male interests were given priority over female interests in Soviet society and decision-making bodies. This is not to say that the members within these bodies purposefully promoted inequality or supported violence against women; but endemic to the belief systems of these members was women's inequality with men. Many Russian women and western scholars have used the term *patriarchy* to describe this belief system.³⁰ The existence of patriarchy does not exclude other explanations of why support services did not develop. Rather, the explanation of the prioritization of male interests helps to better explain why many women's issues, including the need for support services,

²⁹Einhorn, 1993: 32-33.

³⁰Valerie Sperling, "Rape and Domestic Violence in the USSR," Response to the Victimization of Women and Children, Vol. 13, #3, 1990: 16. Various authors in Anastasia Posadskaja, Women in Russia: A New Era in Russian Feminism, London/ New York: Verso, 1994.

were not a priority for the Soviet party-state.

In the Soviet Union, beliefs regarding women's inherent inferiority were rarely expressed blatantly but most often manifested themselves subtly. According to Nina Yulina, "patriarchal traditions in overt and covert ways short circuit the realization of equal rights, consigning women to a 'secondary' status."³¹ Women were considered to be less ready for politics, less ready for leadership and less skilled and valuable in the economy. Women's lower skill level or lesser education may have been a valid reason for women to work in unskilled labour as well as having less access to political participation than men in the Early Soviet Period. However, by the Gorbachev Period, women's education generally equalled or was greater than that of men.³² Yet, women were still found in large numbers in low-skilled employment, and were almost completely excluded from the highest decision-making bodies of the state.

One explanation given by Natalia Rimashevskaja and other scholars for women's failure to advance their careers as readily as men and participate in politics is the double burden women face in which they carry the responsibilities associated with their professional lives, as well as most of the responsibilities associated with domestic and family life.³³ Rimashevskaja attributes this to the "[p]opular

³¹Nina S. Yulina, "Women and Patriarchy," Women's Studies International Forum, Vol. 16, #1, 1993: 61.

³²Natalia Rimashevskaja, "Perestroika and the Status of Women," in S. Rai, et al., Women in the Face of Change: The Soviet Union, Eastern Europe and China, London: Routledge, 1992: 15.

³³Rimashevskaja, 1992: 13-17.

consciousness [which] still holds firmly to the patriarchal view that there is a natural division between the roles of men and women. According to this view, women are mothers and carers, men are bread-winners, protectors and public figures."³⁴ Despite the fact that women were given guarantees under article 35 of the Soviet constitution that they would be provided with conditions enabling them to work, these provisions were inadequate to combine work and motherhood. Instead of finding a way to help women better balance career and home life and implement partial solutions such as promoting a greater degree of sharing of family responsibilities between men and women, Soviet policies encouraged women to focus more attention on home life and less on work when the economy no longer needed extra labour. For example, in times of excess labour power maternity leaves for women were increased. Such policies have marginalized women further by making them a less productive and therefore less desirable work force.³⁵

Olga Voronina goes further and identifies patriarchal views in the state. In her article "Soviet Patriarchy: Past and Present" she argues that the policies of the state in the Soviet periods were based on patriarchal directives.³⁶ Voronina defines patriarchy as a 'masculinist paradigm' which standardizes the individual through gender and the ascription and prescription to a person of certain sexual parameters

³⁴Rimashevskaja, 1992: 13-14.

³⁵Rimashevskaja, 1992: 17.

³⁶Voronina, 1993.

in behaviour, thought, feeling and perception.³⁷ According to Voronina, the key to patriarchy in the Soviet Union was the concept of women's inferiority. Women were understood to be less intelligent, less capable, less productive, and thus less valuable than men.

Voronina, however, does not maintain that in the Soviet Union all men benefitted from the discrimination of women. What Voronina argues is that the Soviet party-state was based on a 'male world view' and that the Soviet state institutionalized women's exploitation to meet social and economic goals. In the productive sphere, women's exploitation took the form of lower wages than men, the predominance of women in low skilled and manual labour, and a 'glass ceiling' limiting women's career advancement. In the political and domestic spheres the exploitation of women was realized through the linking of women's interests exclusively with family interests and through strong propaganda efforts which reinforced and promoted the connection of women to the home. Women's exploitation in these spheres reinforced their secondary status.

What remains unclear from Voronina's explanation of patriarchy is what the Soviet state gained from limiting women's career advancement and political participation. It is possible that women's career and political advancement would have threatened the institution of the family and women would no longer serve as

³⁷Other researchers, N. Zakharova, A. Posadskaia, and N. Rimashevskaja of the Soviet Institute of Socio-Economic Problems, have defined patriarchy as an approach to social organization which uses the argument of 'natural predisposition' to ascribe political and economic roles to men and domestic roles to women. These roles when altered disrupt the 'natural' balance in society. N. Zakharova, A. Posadskaia, and N. Rimashevskaja, "Kak my reshaem zhenskii vopros", *Kommunist*, #4, 1989: 56-65.

a flexible labour force. Sanjian argues that women with greater educational and employment opportunities are less eager to marry early and are more likely to file for divorce if the marriage proves unsatisfactory.³⁸ A major source of dissatisfaction for women is the primary responsibility for housework thrust upon them. Demographic considerations and social stability were concerns of the Soviet state in the Post-Stalinist and Gorbachev Period. According to Sanjian, Soviet scholars linked divorce to problems ranging from juvenile delinquency to children's difficulty adapting to regular family roles as adults. The state attempted to increase family harmony by providing increased benefits to mothers with children but to no avail.³⁹ Women were still unable to satisfactorily balance work and family. Rather than provide women with a greater number of labour saving devices or promote a redistribution of labour within the home, the state's policy in the Gorbachev Period became encouraging women to go 'back to the home'. This, however, runs counter to the desires of many women who value the ability to work outside the home.⁴⁰

The analysis thus far presented in this chapter explains why women faced difficulties in the Soviet periods. There still remain to discuss, however, the roles played by various social groups, specifically Soviet academics and independent women's organizations. Those two groups, and their relationship with the state and society, play an important part in developing and hindering support services.

³⁸Sanjian, 1991: 633-39.

³⁹Sanjian, 1991: 639-44.

⁴⁰Rimashevskaja, 1992: 13-14.

Social Groups and Society

Soviet academics played a crucial role in Soviet society as their work was used to rationalize state policies⁴¹ and beginning in the 1960s the most prominent academics made regular reports to the state on their findings. Academics were also included on advisory commissions formulating policy.⁴² It is important to note that Soviet academics were not only involved in writing scholarly articles but also expressed their ideas in newspapers, journals and textbooks, and hence were able to influence large segments of the population.

One aspect of Soviet academic and popular work - sex role socialization - has been critically analyzed by western academics. Mollie Schwartz Rosenhan, for instance, examined first and second grade children's readers. Her study concluded that male images are favoured over female images.⁴³ Males are shown more often than females and when shown are involved in a large variety of political and professional activities. Females are shown in nurturing roles - as mothers. Working women are featured with children or involved in nurturing behaviour.⁴⁴ Deliberate efforts were made in the children's readers to promote distinctly separate

⁴¹Attwood, 1991: 203-206.

⁴²Peter H. Solomon Jr., who studied the influence of academics on Soviet policy through the example of criminologists, argues that academics played a substantial role in policy formation beginning in the 1960s. Peter H. Solomon Jr., Soviet Criminologists and Criminal Policy: Specialists in Policy-Making, New York: Columbia University Press, 1978: 107-125.

⁴³This study examined readers published in 1971 and 1972. Mollie Schwartz Rosenhan "Images of Male and Female in Children's Readers," Atkinson, et al, Women in Russia. Sussex, England: The Harvester Press Ltd., 1978.

⁴⁴Rosenhan, 1978: 299-301.

behaviours in men and women. These readers also conveyed the subtle message that men dominate society and women.

Lynne Attwood also examined Soviet sex role socialization. She argues that adherence to "natural sex role differentiation" theories allots men special privilege. Attwood, looking at the disciplines of psychology, sociology and pedagogy, shows that each group for its own varied and sometimes contradictory reasons believed that differentiation on the basis of sex was vital. Psychologists in the early Soviet period, for instance, believed that separate behaviours were more natural and adaptive in women and men, despite the fact that they believed the environment to be all powerful in determining the personality and vocation of a person.⁴⁵ Coincidentally these adaptive behaviours adhered to traditional roles of women and men in which women were care givers and men were active in the world.

Likewise sociologists and demographers supported differentiation on the basis of sex; they were concerned with ensuring a steady increase in the population and stability within society. They discussed correlations between crime and delinquency and the limited time spent by working women in the family. Their approach to ensuring population growth and social harmony was to encourage women to focus on home life. They, however, were silent about the importance of men's role in the family unit.⁴⁶

Similarly, pedagogists firmly believed that sex role segregation and

⁴⁵Lynne Attwood, The New Soviet Man and Women: Sex-Role Socialization in the USSR, Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1991, 67.

⁴⁶Attwood, 1991: 119, 123.

socialization were not only desirable but necessary for the healthy development of the individual. The individual not given such socialization was bound to become a social misfit and the source of future anti-social behaviour. Pedagogists, therefore, advocated that the education of children should be different, depending on the sex of the child. It was wrong, they believed, to put young women into leadership roles when this contributed little to the development of what they valued most - social interactions.⁴⁷ For young men leadership roles were considered not only appropriate but necessary, since, it was believed that, young men need the attention and admiration of others to develop properly.

In addition to advising the state, Soviet academics, such as psychologists, sociologists and pedagogists expressed their ideas in both academic and mass media publications. In so doing, they reinforced traditional patriarchal ideas that women and men were naturally different and that only men benefitted from leadership roles. Since leadership roles were considered more important and demanding than nurturing family roles, women would always be relegated to a secondary status. This secondary status serves to further reinforce the lesser importance of women's needs and concerns and provides a basis on which one can justify the allotment of fewer resources to women.

This is further reinforced through the segregation of women in employment and decision-making bodies. Women's employment has been especially high in

⁴⁷Attwood, 1991: 138-162.

education, health care, culture, service industries, clothing and textiles.⁴⁸ "[F]eminised industries, that is, where women constitute upwards of 70 percent of the workforce, have the lowest average wages."⁴⁹ This contributes to an overall phenomenon in which women receive lower wages than men in the Soviet economy. For instance figures for 1989 show that 43% of women earned under 150 rubles per month compared to 16% of men while 46% of men and only 16.5% of women earned 200 rubles or more.⁵⁰

Women's Organizations

Some researchers have argued that independent women's organizations have not played a meaningful role for women in Russia and for Russian Society. For instance, Carol Nechemias has argued that women in Russia are too preoccupied with the struggle of everyday life to develop either a 'gender consciousness' or become involved in social and political activities.⁵¹ Likewise, another researcher Norma Noonan has argued that women with a gender consciousness compose only a small proportion of women in Russian society and

⁴⁸Rimashevskaja, 1992: 13.

⁴⁹Rimashevskaja, 1992: 15.

⁵⁰*Zhenshchiny v SSSR*, 1990: 4 cited in Rimashevskaja, 1992: 15.

⁵¹Carol Nechemias, "The Prospects for a Soviet Women's Movement: Opportunities and Obstacles," in Judith B. Sedaitis, Jim Butterfield, eds. *Perestroika From Below: Social Movements in the Soviet Union*. Boulder, San Francisco, Oxford: Westview Press, 1991: 73-96.

therefore have only a minimum impact on politics and society.⁵² Rosalind Marsh also argues that the women's movement is too disorganized and does not represent feminist interests.⁵³ However, the research in this thesis will show that although the Russian women's movement is not a homogeneous organization, it played a major role in the development of support services and hence, has made a significant impact on the lives of many women in Russia.

The independent women's movement, through consciousness raising campaigns and conferences, has been instrumental in encouraging women to articulate unmet needs and to view these needs within the context of 'women's interests'. Amongst the many needs articulated by women have been needs for guaranteeing physical safety and for receiving moral and psychological support in times of crisis. By recognizing such needs of women the independent women's movement has broadened the discussion of women's interests beyond employment and motherhood issues.

Literature on civil society argues that interest groups form in order to exert influence.⁵⁴ Women's groups, particularly those developing support service, need

⁵²Norma C. Noonan, "Does Consciousness Lead to Action? Exploring the Impact of Perestroika and Post-Perestroika on Women in Russia," in *Women Of Russia - Yesterday, Today, Tomorrow* (Conference held June 1-5, 1993), Moscow: Association of Women in Slavic Studies, Institute of Sociology of the Russian Academy of Science, All-Russia Women's Association 'Missia', International League of Women-Writers of Russia, Academy of Management, 1994: 133-139.

⁵³Rosalind Marsh, "From Problems to Strategy? Impressions of the Second Independent Women's Forum in Dubna," *Rusistika*, #7, June 1993, 16-19.

⁵⁴See Andrew Arato, "Social Movements and Civil Society in the Soviet Union," in Judith B. Sedaitis, Jim Butterfield, *Perestroika From Below: Social Movements in the Soviet Union*, Boulder: Westview Press, 1991: 198.

to influence both the state and society in order to improve the treatment women experiencing violence receive. Since the Gorbachev Period, women's groups have been in an environment in which they can openly express their ideas. This, in itself, is a necessary precondition to women's groups' ability to influence.

Conclusion

The factors impacting on support service development explored in this chapter provide a picture of women's issues in the Soviet and Post-Soviet periods. While other factors may have played a part, the lack of representation of women to decision-making bodies and the suppression of independent women's organizations were particularly significant in the stifling of women's concerns and in turn in the development of support services for women experiencing violence. The persistent promotion of male interests over female interests by the Soviet state and society, while providing a barrier to women's expression of interests, only became insurmountable when the state did not allow for women's independent voices. The following chapter will examine the relationship between the low representation of women on legal policy-making bodies and negative perceptions of women experiencing violence.

Chapter 2

The Soviet Legal Community:

Interpretations of Rape and Wife Assault

As discussed in the previous chapter, women were clearly underrepresented in decision-making bodies in both formal state and societal structures. In addition, when women were found in decision-making positions, they were segregated into areas such as social services and health. As such, women were absent from many bodies making decisions on various aspects of their lives.

One important area in which women were absent was crime policy, which has traditionally been the domain of the state and the Soviet legal community. This is not to say that women were not at some level involved in the development of crime policy; however, since women were absent from the formulation of crime policy on higher decision-making levels,¹ no 'women's perspective' on crime policy or on specific crimes developed apart from crimes which directly affected marriage or the well-being of the family.

Rape and wife assault are two crimes in which a woman's perspective should have been present in the development of crime policy but was not. Policies on both

¹Law enforcement policy was determined by the national Ministry of the Interior. However, "[l]aw enforcement in the USSR was primarily a male profession. Men dominated the organization not only in numbers, in their nearly complete monopoly of supervisory positions. Women obtained position in the lower and middle ranks of the *militia* officer corps, yet no women were present in the top ranks of the republican and national MVD [Ministry of the Interior] administration." Women in law enforcement agencies, who composed only 15% of the *militia*, worked primarily with problem youth, in traffic divisions and in investigative divisions. Louise I. Shelley, Policing Soviet Society: The Evolution of State Control. London and New York: Routledge, 1996: 64, 92.

of these crimes were such that it was very difficult for women to secure protection from law-enforcement agencies, except in the most severe cases.² The result was that these policies did not deter potential offenders and, hence, did not protect women. For example, in the case of rape, researchers A.G. Levitskaia, E.N. Orlik and E.P. Potapova argue that "the actions of rapists often do not receive decisive condemnation on the part of the legal authorities and [victims] are harshly judged by societal opinions ... This lack of penalization not only provokes but also stimulates violent sex and this is taken as the norm."³

It is important to note that by crime policy, I refer not only to the actual criminal statutes which were used to prosecute perpetrators, but also to the ways in which the statutes and the crimes have been understood and explained by the legal community. These two facets of crime policy are important because both influenced the manner in which crimes were investigated by law-enforcement agencies. For example, law-enforcement agencies in the Soviet Union would decide whether or not a crime warranted going to court based on whether officers believed a crime had indeed occurred and whether or not this could be proven.

For their direction in how to respond to various types of violence, law-

²For example in the case of spousal violence S. B. Alimov has chided law-enforcement for not taking the consistent and quick action necessary to mitigate this violence. In addition, I. P. Portnov has noted that the *militia* usually received several complaints about an abusive situation prior to the commission of murder or grave bodily injuries. S. B. Alimov, "Aktual'nye voprosy preduprezhdenie nasil'stvennykh presuplenii," *Voprosy bor'by s prestupnost'iu*, #38, 1983, 32. I. P. Portnov, "Teoreticheskie i prikladnye aspekty profilaktiki bytovykh nasil'stvennykh prestuplenii," *Sbornik Nauchnykh Trudov VNI-MVD*, Moscow, #128, 1991: 89.

³A.G. Levitskaia, E.N. Orlik, E.P. Potapova, "Nasilie na svidanie: presuplenie ili moment seksual'noi igry," *Sotsiologicheskie issledovanie*, # 6, 1993: 97.

enforcement agencies looked to directives of the state as well as to the work of criminologists.⁴ The state held a powerful influence over law-enforcement agencies in the Early Soviet and Stalinist Periods while criminologists played only a minor role. However, in the post-Stalinist Period, under Leonid Brezhnev, the work of criminologists became valued by the Soviet state and consequently by law-enforcement agencies.⁵ Criminologists, along with other academics, became respected experts in their field.⁶ Their role as experts also grew during the Gorbachev Period, coinciding with the decline of the leading role of the Communist Party in Soviet society. Since the beginning of the post-Soviet period, criminologists have begun to play an even greater role; they are now a primary supplier of public information on crime and violence.

This chapter examines the legal community's treatment of rape and family violence. The legal community's treatment of this issue is especially important because it illustrates the need for support services and explains why support services did not arise out of state or legal structures, arising instead through the initiative of individual women and non-governmental groups. The chapter begins by providing a historical and statistical background of the treatment of rape and

⁴For a discussion of the state's influence on law-enforcement agencies see Shelley, 1996: 19-82. For a discussion of law-enforcement officer's exposure to the work of criminologists see Shelley, 1996: 88, 96-7.

⁵For a discussion of the role of criminologists in policy making see Peter H. Solomon, Soviet Criminologists and Criminal Policy: Specialists in Policy-Making, New York: Columbia University Press, 1978.

⁶See George W. Breslauer, "The Twenty-Fifth Congress: Domestic Issues," Alexander Dallin, ed., The Twenty-Fifth Congress of the CPSU: Assessment and Context, Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 1977: 8-9.

family violence in the pre-revolutionary Russian and Soviet periods. Against this background, the chapter examines the ways in which information on rape and family violence has been gathered, interpreted and presented by Soviet criminologists. The chapter ends with a look at the role Soviet criminologists have played in the Soviet Periods as educators.

Violence Against Women: A Historical Overview of the Scope of the Problem and the Responses to it

As will be seen in this section, violence against women has been and continues to be an ongoing phenomenon in Russian/Soviet society. In fact, some of the earliest references to rape and wife-beating are found in the laws and court records of Kievan Rus'.⁷ These records show that not only were strict limits placed on rape and wife assault but also that there was a need recognized to compensate injured women for the loss suffered. According to Kievan and Muscovite civil and ecclesiastical laws in the seventeenth century, rape was treated as a serious offense and even a married woman could charge her husband with rape. Although punishment for rape varied with the social station of the perpetrator and victim, even poor women and prostitutes were awarded monetary compensation by the courts.⁸

In contrast, throughout Russian and Slavic history, rape in certain instances

⁷See accounts of the treatment of rape and wife assault by Southern Slavs and Russians beginning with the early Russian Chronicle of Grand Prince Vladimir in Eve Levin, *Sex and Society in the World of Orthodox Slavs 900-1700*, Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1989: 212-246.

⁸For a discussion see Barbara Evans Clements, et al., eds, *Accommodation and Resistance*, Berkeley, Los Angeles, Oxford: University of California Press, 1991: 22.

was perpetrated with impunity. Rape by state rulers was used as a means of punishing a family for political crimes, while in rural communities, rape was an acceptable form of punishing a woman for sexual or other transgressions. For instance, accounts of the seventeenth century show that "[w]hen a man deserved dishonour and execution for treason, his wife, mother, or daughter might suffer also, and his dishonour could take the form of rape."⁹ In addition, "[w]hen a woman did not conduct herself in a mannner appropriate to her place in society - if she insulted men, for instance, or got drunk - rape was popularly considered appropriate retaliation."¹⁰ In fact, a victim's reputation for previous sexual liaisons or careless behaviour was often enough to nullify the need to punish the rapist.¹¹ For instance, in one incident in an Ukrainian peasant village, an accused rapist was acquitted on the grounds that the victim was drunk at the time and sleeping in an isolated place.¹²

Wife-beating, unlike rape, was acceptable within limits. For instance, *The Domostroi* - a handbook believed to be written for the merchant class in the 17th century - advises husbands where to hit their wives so as not to cause them serious injury.¹³ The right of husbands to 'discipline' their wives went undisputed, although

⁹Levin, 1989: 227.

¹⁰Levin, 1989: 245.

¹¹In Ukrainian peasant society "[i]n cases with no witnesses, a rape victim has to prove her innocence on the basis of exemplary character references and at times a physical examination." Christine D. Worobec, "Temptress or Virgin? The Precarious Sexual Position of Women in Postemancipation Ukrainian Peasant Society," *Slavic Review*, #49, #2, Summer 1990: 237.

¹²Worobec, 1990: 237.

¹³Carolyn Johnston Pouncy, ed., *The 'Domostroi': Rules for Russian Households in the Time of Ivan the Terrible*, Ithaca and New York: Cornell University, 1994: 142-43, 182-83.

'excessive violence' was grounds for divorce.

From the eighteenth century, the Russian law on rape dramatically changed while the treatment of wife-beating remained the same. Scrutinising a woman's character and behaviour became standard practice. If a woman was raped without the presence of witnesses or material evidence her complaint was judged on the basis of her moral character.¹⁴ Although the penalties for rape continued to be severe, by the eighteenth century, rape had become difficult to prove because of the increased emphasis on the victim's moral character, and by 1903, husbands could no longer be accused of rape.¹⁵

Bolshevik leaders in the pre-revolutionary and Early Soviet period recognized that rape and wife assault were considerable problems. Between 1913 and 1918, Vladimir Lenin referred to both rape and wife-beating in his speeches. Lenin used rape as an example to illustrate how women's economic dependence on men under capitalism led to women's sexual exploitation.¹⁶ Wife-beating exemplified the cruelty of middle and small-scale farmers whose wives, according to Lenin, "were in fact slaves of their husbands".¹⁷ As such both rape, and wife-beating were understood to be tied to property relations in capitalist society. Thus, according to the

¹⁴Laura Engelstein, The Key to Happiness: Sex and the Search for Modernity in Fin-de-Siecle Russia, Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1992: 76.

¹⁵Engelstein, 1992: 76-84.

¹⁶See references made by V.I. Lenin to rape in V.I. Lenin, On the Emancipation of Women. Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1965: 10,13,24,25.

¹⁷See reference made by Lenin to wife-beating in Lenin, 1965: 13.

Bolsheviks, the only remedy for rape and wife-beating was the replacement of the capitalist system with a socialist system based on equitable relations. Under a socialist system, the Bolsheviks believed that society would perfect itself through social and economic development, and consequently rape and wife-beating were expected to disappear along with all other forms of crime.¹⁸

Lenin believed that women's inequality had two sources: it had been formalized in Russian laws and was culturally propagated through the traditional organization of the nuclear family in which men controlled the family's property. According to Lenin, women's exploitation came from the inefficient but tiresome labour women had to provide their families. In a socialist system, the state would provide *en masse* the services women provided in the home. This would free women to be involved in socially productive work. After sexual equality had been formalized in laws, women's involvement in socially productive work would make this equality a reality and rape and wife-beating, which were intrinsically connected to women's social inequality, would disappear.¹⁹

Although women's equality with men was guaranteed in the Soviet constitution and numerous laws were implemented making women less dependent on men through access to employment and liberalized divorce policies, rape, wife-beating and other crimes did not disappear under the Soviet socialist system. This was due, in part to the lack of consistent effort to fight these crimes, the difficulties

¹⁸See W.E. Butler, "Crime in the Soviet Union: Early Glimpses of the True Story," *British Journal of Criminology*, Vol. 32, #2, 1992: 144-145.

¹⁹Lenin, 1965.

involved in proving a crime and the fact that underlying assumptions about a women's character had not completely disappeared from the pre-revolutionary period. For instance, a campaign initiated in the pre-revolutionary period to stop the abuse and wife-beating of working women was discontinued in the 1930s. In its place, a highly restricted version of this campaign was adopted into the criminal codes of several Soviet republics including: Azerbaijan, Kazakhstan, Kirghizia, Russia, Tajikistan, Turkmenistan and Uzbekistan.²⁰

Legal Codes and Statutes Relating to Violent Crimes

In the criminal code, there are numerous articles under which the threat of violence and violent crimes against women fall; however, the majority are not gender specific. One exception to this is article 134, which is found in the criminal code section "Crimes against political, employment and other rights and the freedom of the person".²¹ In this article, women were protected from violence or the threat of violence if it was used to dissuade them from involvement in social, political or cultural work.²² However, in any other situation, this law did not apply, and

²⁰A. Vengerov, A. Danilevich, Law, Morality and Man: The Soviet Legal System in Action, Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1985: 163; A. M. Beliakova, et al, Soviet Legislation on Women's Rights: Collection of Normative Acts, Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1978: 30.

²¹Ugolovnyi kodeks RSFSR: 94.

²²Voprosy ugolovno-prava i protsessy v praktike Verkhovnykh Sudov SSSR i RSFSR: 1938-1978, third edition, Moscow: Iuridicheskaya literatura, 1980: 183. Statute 134 - *Vospredyatsvovanie osushchestvleniiu parvnopraviiia zhenshchin* [Preventing the Realization of Women's Equality] is found in the Russian Federation's criminal code and appears in the August 1994 revised version of the Criminal Code of the Russian Federation. Ministerstvo iustitsii Rossiiskoi Federatsii, ugolovnyi kodeks RSFSR (s izmeneniiami i dopolneniiami po sostoiianiiu na 1 avgusta 1994), Moscow:

furthermore, its utility was limited in that the intent to dissuade women from the above involvement had to be clearly demonstrated for the law to be enforced.

Other forms of wife assault fell under several other articles of the Russian Federation's criminal code depending on the setting of the violence, the severity of the injuries sustained, and the intent of the perpetrator. For instance, if the perpetrator intended to show disrespect for society, the crime was considered 'hooliganism', which is found in article 206 of the section "Crimes against public safety, public order and the health of the population".²³ If there was no motive other than to injure the victim, the crime was judged according to the severity of the victim's injuries and was dealt with in one of 12 articles ranging in severity of injuries sustained from 'premeditated light bodily injuries or beating' (article 112) to 'premeditated murder' (article 103).²⁴ These twelve articles of the criminal code dealt with various levels of violence in the section "Crimes against the life, health, freedom or worth of the person". It is worth noting, however, that the number of criminal code statutes existing for violence may be misleading. In practice, although a criminal code statute exists for less serious injuries or beatings, unless there are witnesses or discernable injuries, this violence is difficult to prove. For this reason, law-enforcement agencies often refuse to register complaints and instead suggest

Iuridicheskaiia literatura, 1994: 94. Statute 134 is explained in N. A. Beliaeva, et. al, Ugolovnoe pravo: osobennaia chast', textbook, part 1, St. Petersburg: St. Petersburg University, 1995: 165-166.

²³Ministerstvo Iustitsii Rossiiskoi Federatsii, Ugolovnyi kodeks RSFSR (s izmeneniami i dopolneniami po sostoiianiiu na 1 avgusta 1994 g.), Moscow: Iuridicheskaiia literatura: 1994: 157.

²⁴Ugolovnyi kodeks RSFSR: 78-82.

that a woman get a divorce.²⁵

Rape (Iznasilovanie) is also covered in the Russian Federation's criminal code, and is defined in article 117 as sexual intercourse with the use of force, threat thereof, or the helpless position of a victim.²⁶ However, in cases of rape where there are no witnesses or material evidence of coercion, the existence of the crime is often judged according to the moral character and behaviour of the victim. In cases where law-enforcement officers believed a woman acted carelessly or recklessly, they will often refuse to register her complaint of rape.

Often, it is only when the injuries that a woman sustains are so severe that the crime cannot be ignored that action is taken. Clearly, women are not protected by laws that make it difficult to prove the existence of rape or wife assault without the presence of witnesses or of grave injuries. The above discussion demonstrates the failure of the criminal code, and its interpretation of violence to meet the needs of women. It also points to women's need for support services to not only help them deal with violent crimes, but equally important with the treatment they receive from legal authorities.

Violence Against Women: Statistics

Prior to 1924, there is very little in the way of crime statistics. This is largely

²⁵In cases of spousal violence, Tartakovskii found that 50% of *militsia* refusals to pursue criminal proceedings on the basis that the complaints belonged in the civil courts were unjustified. A.D. Tartakovskii. *Konflikt v sfere semino-brachnykh otnoshenii i puti ikh ustanovleniia*. Dushanbe: Maorif, 1989: 18.

²⁶*Ugolovnyi kodeks RSFSR*: 84-85.

the result of tremendous social dislocation following the Russian Revolution. The difficulty in obtaining statistical information has been further exacerbated by efforts made to mask the persistence of crime, as was the case in the Stalinist and Post-Stalinist Periods. During these periods statistics on crime simply ceased to be published.²⁷ An analysis of the statistics on crime which are available show that in 1924, there were 3,920 crimes registered per 100,000 people in the Soviet Union. This fell to approximately 700 crimes per 100,000 people in 1956, only to rise again to 969 crimes per 100,000 people in 1990 and to 1,463 per 100,000 people in Russia in 1991.²⁸ Statistics for rape and attempted rape, available only for 1980 onward, show a steady presence of this crime. In 1980, 20,225 rapes and attempted rapes were registered by Soviet law-enforcement agencies, rising to 21,873 in 1989,²⁹ and to 22,469 in 1990.³⁰ Between 1980 and 1989, rape and

²⁷Crime statistics during the Stalinist period became unavailable while the state declared that crime rates were steadily decreasing and many forms of crime did not exist at all. It was later admitted, in the 1960s during Nikita Khrushchev's time, that the Soviet Union was not a mature communist state. Until its maturity, problems such as crime would progressively diminish but continue to exist.

²⁸The dramatic fall in crime rates is understood by criminologists to be a result of statistical manipulation and the population's reluctance to report crimes. 'Registered crimes' differ from 'reported crimes'. Crimes could be reported to law enforcement agencies without being registered if law-enforcement agencies decided that not enough evidence existed of the crime. See Yakov Gilinskii, "Crime in Russia: The Past, Present and Future," *Current Politics and Economics of Russia*, Vol. 3, #4, 1994: 217.

²⁹See Joseph Serio, ed. *USSR Crime Statistics and Summaries: 1989 and 1990*, Chicago, Illinois: The Office of International Criminal Justice The University of Illinois at Chicago, 1992: 63.

³⁰See *Prestupnost' i pravonarushenie v SSSR 1990.*, Moscow: Iuridicheskaya Literatura, 1991: 47.

attempted rape formed between 1.3 and 0.9% of all registered crimes.³¹ These figures suggest that rape and attempted rape did not form a substantial amount of crime. However, high latency rates for these crimes, in the form of victims' reluctance to file complaints and law enforcement's refusal to register these crimes, would increase the figures on rape and attempted rape an estimated 140 to 1000 percent.³²

Despite Lenin's reference to the crime of 'wife-beating', there are no statistics available for this crime, nor for 'wife battering' and 'wife assault', as it is often referred to in the west. None of these terms exist in Soviet literature on crime. Nor does the phenomenon these expressions describe receive special attention under Soviet criminology. Statistics on 'wife assault' were never published. Instead, law-enforcement agencies and the Ministry of the Interior compiled specific information as to the incidence of 'spousal violence'. The statistical information on spousal violence, however, was also never published and access to it was restricted.³³

³¹Serio, 63.

³²A survey carried out in by the Russian Ministry of Interior Research Institute 1991-92 found that only 40% of rapes were not reported while those involved in the development of support services maintain that the number is much higher and that only 10% of rape victims approach the *militia*. See K.K. Gorianov, "Latentnaia prestupnost': opyt issledovaniia," Sbornik Nauchnykh Trudov VNII-MVD, Moscow, #143, 1993: 129; T. Zabelina, E. Israelan, "Zhenshchiny i Nasilie," Vv i My: The Women's Dialogue, #8, 1993: 7.

³³For an account of government restrictions see D.A. Shestakov Supruzheskoe ubistvo kak obshchestvennaia problema. St. Petersburg: St. Petersburg University, 1992, 5. Shestakov, although referring to restrictions on statistics, does not provide a reasoning for these restrictions. However, according to Butler, one reason widely adduced for making crime statistics a secret is "the ideological inconsistency between the declared achievement of socialism by Soviet society and the continued pervasiveness of criminality ... failing to disclose the incidence of criminality would be a cosmetic touch of self-deception that would enable ideological appearances to be maintained." Butler, 1992: 146.

Soviet information as to the incidence of wife assault was further obscured by the fact that as with the criminal code, in the literature on crime, there was also no standard subject category under which it could be found. Some of the many categories that sometimes refer to spousal violence and the sex of its perpetrators and victims include '*nasil'stvennyye*' (violent) crimes, '*bytovye*' (domestic) crimes, '*bytovye-dosugnye*' (domestic-recreational) and '*semeino-bytovye*' (family-domestic) crimes.³⁴ 'Violent crimes' refer to minor bodily injuries, grave bodily injuries, murder and sometimes to rape. '*Bytovye*' does not have an equivalent in the English language. 'Domestic' is closest in meaning. '*Bytovye*' is broadly interpreted in the Russian language to include all activity which forms a part of the everyday life of a person in the non-productive sphere. '*Bytovye* crimes', therefore, refers not only to crimes involving a person's immediate family but also to crimes involving the variety of people a person often has contact with including neighbours and in-laws. '*Bytovye-recreational* crimes' are crimes that occur during a person's leisure time. '*Family-bytovye*' refers specifically to crimes which occur between family members who are in regular contact with one another.

The obscuring effect of broad categories can be seen in the information compiled by one criminologist, which shows that 60% of grave bodily injuries and 70% of murders occur in the '*bytovoi*' sphere.³⁵ Another criminologist cites figures which show that in 1980, 69.5% of murder and attempted murders were in the

³⁴See I. P. Portnov "Teoreticheskie i prikladnye aspekty profilaktiki bytovykh nasil'stvennykh prestuplenii" *Sbornik Nauchnykh Trudov VNI-MVD*, Moscow, #128, 1991: 95.

³⁵Portnov, 1991, 86.

'family-bytvoi' sphere.³⁶ It is unclear from these figures how many of these crimes involve wife assault or are the result of long term wife battering.

In recent years, Soviet criminologists recognized that the category of domestic violence was too broad to adequately represent the crimes occurring in the family sphere. The dynamics of family violence are different from those in other domestic spheres. For example, the family as a unit often spends extended time in the isolation of individual apartments.³⁷ This isolation can facilitate a conflict that is both long and brutal in its violence.³⁸

Similarly, treating family and spousal violence together also obscures important differences in their dynamics. Family violence includes a broad range of relationships between parents and young children, parents and grandparents, children and grandparents, and between spouses, while spousal violence refers only to the relationship between spouses. Examining spousal violence through the lens of family violence results in an analysis that attempts to find explanations which are consistently valid across these various forms of family violence. This results in certain factors such as gender dimensions appearing less significant, since family violence occurs both between members of the opposite and the same sex. The

³⁶In 1980 there were 21,400 registered murders and attempted murders in 1991 their number rose to 24,000 in 1991. See S.V. Maksimov, V.P. Revin, Nasil'stvennye prestupleniia v sfere semeino-bytovykh otnoshenii i problemy ikh profilaktiki. Moscow, 1993: 18.

³⁷I. P. Portnov found that 77% of murders and grave bodily injuries occur in separate apartments. Portnov: 87. Revin found that 72-75% of premeditated murders occurred in the domestic-family sphere. Revin, 1988: 103.

³⁸S.V. Maksimov, V.P. Revin, 1993: 19. Alimov and Panfilov mention the long duration of family conflicts and their incremental increase. Alimov, 1983: 30; Panfilov, 1977: 56. Also see Revin, 1988: 90, 95.

primary difference between the two forms of violence lies in the importance of gender roles. For example, spousal violence is predominantly perpetrated by husbands against wives and against estranged wives; this appears to be true for between 70% to 95.4% of spousal violence.³⁹ These figures come from the handful of studies which looked exclusively at spousal violence. Although these studies do not look exclusively at wife assault, they provide the best source of information on its incidence.

The fact that wife assault was not treated as a separate category and not recorded as such is indicative of the low priority given to combatting violence against women during the Soviet periods. Violence against women (and violent crime in general) was not given a high priority because the state focused primarily on eliminating economic crime (i.e. private property) and political crimes in order to alleviate other types of crime, such as social crime. In keeping with Soviet ideology, crime was the product of capitalist forces and anti-Soviet elements within society. For example, in the Early Soviet Period, the existence of private farmers was seen as a barrier to the elimination of private property and creation of communism. Farmers were condemned by the Bolsheviks for their individualistic lifestyle and for their poor treatment of their wives.⁴⁰ Although the farmers' poor treatment of their wives was reprehensible, according to Marxist-Leninist ideology, it was a symptom

³⁹Portnov, 87; A.D. Tartakovskii, 1989: 11; Ia. Ia. Sootak, Prestupleniia sovershaemye na pochove konfliktov mezh'du suprugami, (candidate thesis) All-Union Law Institute, Moscow, 1980:10; Iu. Bluvshtein, Bor'ba s prestupleniami v sfere byta, Vilnius: 'Znanie', 1986: 10.

⁴⁰Lenin: 13, 28-29, 67.

of the social decay brought by private property.

According to the ideology, another reason why crime continued throughout the Soviet periods was the persistence of anti-Soviet elements within society - those who still rejected the Soviet state and its values.⁴¹ This analysis became the core of the Soviet definition of crime. Under the Soviet criminal code, a crime was defined as "an action or inaction that puts the communist state and its continued function into jeopardy".⁴² This rejection of Soviet values was understood to involve scattered individuals who would have to be weeded out. As such, no connection was made in the Early Soviet period between various aspects of the Soviet system and the continued existence of crime, in the same way as it had been in the pre-revolutionary period.

This is not to say that special efforts were not implemented to fight crime.⁴³ Experiments were made in crime prevention but these experiments were based on the premise that the individual's environment is all powerful in influencing behaviour, including criminal tendencies. As such, greater efforts were made to control the environment of citizens, particularly those citizens believed most vulnerable to criminal tendencies. Not having the resources to control the environments of all

⁴¹See Robert Conquest, Justice and the Legal System in the USSR. London, Sydney, Toronto: The Bodley Head, 1968: 14.

⁴²P.S. Romashkin, Fundamentals of Soviet Law. Moscow: Foreign Languages Publishing House, 1961: 422.

⁴³See discussions of Soviet efforts to fight crime in W.E. Butler ed., Soviet Law. London: Butterworths, Second Edition, 1988; Robert Conquest, Justice and the Legal System in the USSR. London, Sydney, Toronto: The Bodley Head, 1968; Peter H. Juviler, "Criminal Law and Social Control," in D. Barry, W.E. Butler, G. Ginsburgs, eds., Contemporary Soviet Law. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1974.

citizens, the Soviet state concentrated its attention on specific crimes considered the most serious and the greatest threats to the state, such as murder and illegal economic activities. Consequently, substantial resources were never allocated for fighting rape and wife assault.⁴⁴

Soviet Literature on Rape and Family Violence

The low priority given to combatting rape and wife assault is reflective of the low social danger these crimes were perceived to have by law-enforcement agencies and the state. Soviet literature on rape and family violence has contributed to this perception that rape and wife assault are not a cause for widespread concern. While criminologists argue that rape and family violence are serious problems, they nonetheless marginalize the perpetrators and victims of these crimes. Perpetrators and victims are portrayed as belonging to specific, often disreputable, groups within society. For instance, rapists are either maniacs who attack innocent women or men whose sex drive does not allow them to pass over an easy opportunity for sexual pleasure. Victims, on the other hand, are sometimes the victims of chance but most often are the victims of their own behaviour.

⁴⁴An experiment was conducted in 1992 in Dmitrov Raion of Moscow Oblast where the *militia* paid greater attention to minor crimes, including family disputes. The *militia*'s greater attention to minor crimes appeared to result in a decrease in the incidents of family violence leading to serious injuries. This experiment was limited to only one region of the country and was discontinued as a result of decreased resources despite its success. See V. Ogorodnikov, "Latentnaia prestupnost' i vzaimodeistvie pravookhranitel'nykh organov s naseleniem," in *Latentnaia prestupnost': poznanie, politika, strategii* (Sbornik materialov mezhdunarodnogo seminara), Moscow: VNII MVD, 1993: 173-177.

Most Soviet scholars overemphasize the role played by victims in their own victimization either through their actions or predisposing characteristics.⁴⁵ Such an approach to criminology, which is generally found in the school of victimology,⁴⁶ has been criticized by criminologists in international forums for not displaying a "positive orientation toward its victim of crime... it is concerned with the evaluation of the victim's responsibility and tends to overemphasize the victim's share."⁴⁷ Focusing on the victim implies that the victim has in some way substantially erred and should be held responsible for the crime. Another criticism of this form of victimology is that it uses the victim's behaviour in the criminal encounter to mitigate the offender's guilt and thus takes on the perspective of the offender.⁴⁸

Underlying the Soviet victimological approach is the assumption that rape is closely connected to heterosexual intercourse; rape is seen as a means by which the perpetrator can satisfy his sexual urges. It is possible that rape is portrayed by

⁴⁵See V.S. Minskaia, "Opyt viktimologicheskogo izucheniia iznasilovaniia," *Voprosy bor'by s prestupnostiu*, #17, 1972; A.P. D'iachenko, "Aktual'nye voprosy viktimologicheskoi profilaktiki prestuplenii v oblasti polovyykh prestuplenii," *Viktimologicheskie problemy bor'by s prestupnostiu*, Irkutsk: Irkutsk State University, 1988; D.A. Shestakov, 1992.

⁴⁶Victimology is the study of victimization which includes the gathering of statistical and other information about the victims of crime. Two current approaches to victimology are : the use of information about a victim to explain a crime, and the use of information about victims to demonstrate that victims are not to blame for the violence used against but are generally victims of chance. There is some debate whether the empirical elements(characteristic of the first approach) can coexist with the victim advocacy (a central element of the second approach). For a discussion see R. I. Mawby and S. Walklate, *Critical Victimology: International Perspectives*, London: Sage, 1994.

⁴⁷See Weis Kurt and Sandra Kurt, "Victimology and the Justification of Rape," in I. Drapkin, E. Viana, eds., *Victimology: A New Focus Vol. V: Exploiters and Exploited: The Dynamics of Victimization*, Lexington/Toronto/London: Lexington Books D. C. Heath & Company, 1975: 4-5.

⁴⁸Kurt and Kurt: 4.

Soviet criminologists in this context so as to not appear so reprehensible. Rape has even been justified in the Soviet literature on the basis of socio-biological conditioning in which men are 'naturally' predisposed to pursue women in order to satisfy sexual needs.⁴⁹ Thus, the closer that rape appears to normal sex, the less it is seen as a crime.⁵⁰ Only a few Soviet criminologists have challenged the validity of a strong link between sex and rape. One of these criminologists, A. V. Astrashabov, conducted interviews with convicted rapists in 1983 and 1988 and recorded the main motivations for their actions: a way to spend free time, a way of demonstrating their adulthood, independence and virility, and a desire to gain control over others through the use of force. Of the rapists, only 38% felt that they had satisfied their sexual desire from the rape.⁵¹ Other criminologists (Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov) maintain that rape is most strongly portrayed as connected to psychological factors while sexual desire plays only a very small part in the rape.⁵² Despite these studies, rape continues to be most strongly connected with

⁴⁹G.V. Antonov-Romanovskii, 1981: 50.

⁵⁰For a discussion of a similar phenomenon in the west see Catherine MacKinnon, "Feminism, Marxism, Method, and the State: Toward Feminist Jurisprudence," in T. Brettel Dawson, ed., Women, Law and Social Change: Core Readings and Current Issues, Ottawa: Captus Press, 1990.

⁵¹See A. V. Astrashabov. "Sravnitel'nyi analiz osuzhdennykh za iznasilovaniia." Sbornik nauchnykh trudov, Moscow: VNII MVD, #123: 53.

⁵²See Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov who claim that one of the most significant factors in the biography of a rapist are his first relations with women and first sexual ties with men. The rapist's first relations with women are generally with his mother who is aggressive and domineering. Therefore, perpetrators in rape are not just relieving sexual urges but are more importantly interested in the degradation and punishment of women seen as the embodiment of their mothers. The perpetrator through rape is also attempting to reject feminine qualities and homosexual inclinations. Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov fail to mention the influence of society and social norms on the psychology

sexual desire.

Because of their focus on the sexual aspects and causes of rape, Soviet criminologists often assume that consensual sex often leads to fabricated charges of rape.⁵³ A common scenario used by Soviet criminologists is that of a woman who deliberately seduces a man only to blackmail him into marriage or into giving her money.⁵⁴ Although these examples are derived from actual incidents, they do not reflect the majority of rapes registered. Examples of false claims are used in almost every article on rape. By focusing on false claims, the articles imply that false accusations are fairly prevalent; in contrast, absent from the many articles are actual statistics showing what percentage of charges laid are in fact false claims. Criminologists' emphasis on false claims serves to throw serious doubt on the victims' credibility and in this way benefits the perpetrator.

The tendency in Soviet criminology to focus on victims would imply that there was a high number of victim provoking or precipitating behaviours. In reality, Soviet criminologists have discovered only a small minority of cases in which the victim's behaviour has in some way led to the violence perpetrated against her. According

of the perpetrator and his actions. For instance, Astrakhov found in his study that most rapists did not believe what they had done was wrong. In 1983 35% felt they were justified and 38% felt they had been provoked; while in 1988 only 21% felt provoked. Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov also fail to mention the influence of a perpetrator's father on his development. Iu. M. Antonian, V. P. Golubov, and Iu. N. Kudriakov *Iznasilovanie: prichiny i preduprezhdenie*. Moscow: Ministry of the Interior, 1990:48-53, 168.

⁵³See V.I. Igoshin, "Kriminalisticheskoe izuchenie lichnosti prestupnika po delam ob izanasilovanii i evo takticheskoe i metodicheskoe znanie" (Textbook), Izdevsk: Udmur University, 1993.

⁵⁴See Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov, 1990:30.

to one study, 'provocative behaviour' on the part of victims was present in 13% of rapes registered. However, 'provocative behaviour', included: spending time with a stranger or an acquaintance, going to his home or travelling with him, drinking alcohol together with him and not understanding the rapist's signals alluding to expectations of sexual intercourse.⁵⁵ Other Soviet authors also include being sexually active and not showing discretion in the choice of one's friends as forms of provocation.⁵⁶ Although these actions may be care free, they do not incite rape per se and are far from provocative. Some Soviet authors claim, however, that provocation is present in these seemingly innocent actions, either consciously in the form of a game that the victim plays with the perpetrator, giving him the impression that she consents to sexual intimacy,⁵⁷ or subconsciously, due to either early sexual experiences or a masochism which leads some women into dangerous situations that facilitate rape, such as remote areas at night.⁵⁸ What most authors fail to mention is that consenting to sexual or physical intimacy is not the same as consenting to sexual assault or rape.⁵⁹

Victims are also often thought to be responsible for violence perpetrated

⁵⁵See Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov, 1990:17-18.

⁵⁶See M. E. Pozdniakova, L. N. Rybakova. "Prestupnaia strast' " *Sotsiologicheskie Issledovaniia*, #4, 1989: 67.

⁵⁷Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov claim that "[...]many victims play a sexual game with their future assailants with the meaning of which is unclear to and unrecognized by both of them," Antonian, Golubov, Kudriakov, 1990: 19.

⁵⁸Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov, 1990: 40.

⁵⁹See G.V. Antonov-Romanovskii, "Problemy krimilogicheskovo izucheniia iznasilovaniia" *Voprosy bor'by s prestupnostiu*, # 34, 1981: 50.

against them by their spouses. Studying court cases of spousal violence, Soviet criminologists claim that between 3.6% and 16% of victims in some way precipitated the violence perpetrated against them.⁶⁰ This includes behaviours such as infidelity, crude language, drunkenness, disparaging lifestyle and provocation of an argument.⁶¹ These behaviours are explained by Soviet academics by the victim's low level of education and culture. However, unlike rape, cases of spousal assault that are brought before the courts are usually not limited to a single incident but have been perpetrated over a long period of time. Moreover, in North American literature on wife assault, battered women are occasionally found to trigger violent incidents for the reason that the violence itself is almost preferable to the terror of knowing the next violent incident could happen at any moment.⁶²

Although husbands constitute a small share of the victims of spousal violence, provoking behaviours may pertain more to this group. Soviet criminologists do not differentiate between husbands and wives when discussing precipitating behaviour of victims. Given that wives constitute the majority of victims of spousal violence, this gives the impression that the majority of victims

⁶⁰Revin, 1990, found that 16% of survivors' initiated the conflict or fight leading to their injuries. Ia. Ia. Sootak found that only 5.5% of survivors actively provoked perpetrators and that wives were responsible for only 3.6% of long-term family conflicts. In "Nekotorye voprosy viktimosti supruga", *Sovetskoe pravo*, #5, Tallin, 1980, 358-359. A.D. Tartakovskii, N.A. Abdullaev also found that only 5.5% of survivors actively provoked perpetrators. In *Prestupleniia v sfere semeino-bytovykh otnoshenii i bor'ba s nimi*, Dushanbe: 'Donish', 1989, 72.

⁶¹See G.G. Moshak. *Prestuplenie v seme - istoki i profilaktika*. Kishinev: Kara Moldovenyaskie, 1989, 73-74; D.A. Shestakov, 1992, 67-68.

⁶²Battered women will sometimes trigger violent incidents through their behaviour or choice of language. See *Breaking the Pattern: Understanding Wife Abuse*. Edmonton: Alberta Family and Social Services, Family Violence Prevention, 1991: 17-18.

precipitating violence would also be wives. However, not differentiating on the basis of sex serves to mask some of the reasons why the violence was perpetrated. For example, it is accepted in Soviet criminology that when women inflict grave bodily harm or murder on their husbands, this usually occurs following a period of compounded long term abuse and is often in self defense.⁶³ In contrast, there has never been a Soviet correlation shown between the long-term physical abuse a husband suffers from his wife and his later assault on her. In fact, the Soviet literature published does not give any information regarding the nature of abuse suffered by husband-victims of violence,⁶⁴ which could likely be provoked against themselves through their own violent behaviour. Thus, the circumstances and motivations causing husbands to abuse are likely very different from those leading wives to abuse. These differences would not be apparent in statistics that do indicate the gender of the spouse provoking the violence.

Soviet literature tends to downplay the significance of violence against women not only by focussing on negative aspects of a victim's behaviour but also by focusing on the fringes of society, such as derelicts and people of low educational backgrounds who abuse alcohol. Derelicts are shown to lead an amoral lifestyle and to be rarely involved in socially productive work. Male derelicts hold scornful attitudes towards women. According to various studies, those described as abusing alcohol compose approximately 80% of perpetrators of rape and 85% of

⁶³Revin, 1994:, 29; S.V.Maksimov, V.P. Revin: 24; Shestakov,1992: 25, 42; Moshak, 1989: 82.

⁶⁴Shestakov, 1992: 40-42.

spousal violence. Alcohol abuse and low educational levels are used to show a low level of cultural and moral development.⁶⁵ This implies that these perpetrators are people who have fallen behind the rest of society by failing to take advantage of the opportunities Soviet society provides. As such, they do not reflect the general population and are largely to blame for their own problems.

The role of alcohol was also used by Soviet criminologists to make inferences about the character of the victim and condition of the perpetrator during rape and family violence. This is a discussion central to every article on these crimes. The perpetrator's intoxication while committing the crime, although not in itself accepted as a mitigating factor, implies that the perpetrator had less control over his actions at the time and was more vulnerable to situational factors, such as the situation where a woman conveniently passed out by the road (in cases of rape) or the offensive language on the part of the victim (in cases of wife assault). Soviet criminologists imply that a perpetrator who is intoxicated is not fully responsible for his actions because he is not in full control of his faculties and his actions do not, therefore, accurately reflect his true nature.⁶⁶

Lack of control, is not only associated with alcohol but is also associated with floods of emotions that circumstances such as infidelity draw out. In cases of infidelity, alcohol and emotions - referred to by some authors as 'passion' - combine

⁶⁵See B. A. Blinder, Otvetstvennost' za iznasilovanie po sovetskomu ugolovnomu pravu po materialom Uzbekskoi SSR (Candidate thesis abstract), Tashkent: Tashkent State University, 1966.

⁶⁶D. M. Chechot and D. D. Shestakov, Sotsial'noe zlo-alkogolizm sem'ia i pravo, Leningrad: Leningrad University, 1988.

to produce violent behaviour completely uncharacteristic of the perpetrator's normal behaviour. In the literature on violence against wives, this makes the male perpetrator's actions almost excusable.⁶⁷

In a seemingly inequitable contrast, the consumption of alcohol on the part of the victim is considered to be a stupid and careless act which increases the victim's share of responsibility for the violence perpetrated. Moreover, some criminologists consider drinking with a stranger to be a mitigating circumstance that should be taken into consideration when establishing the nature of the crime committed and the type of sentence required. For women, drinking in the company of acquaintances or strangers is understood to be putting oneself in a vulnerable position, invoking the old adage that "every good girl should know better".⁶⁸ In cases of spousal violence, intoxication is seen as a sign of a negative lifestyle. Drunkenness is seen to be a state in which victims are at their worst - aggressive, using coarse language, etc. It is also understood to be the state in which an aggressor can least control his behaviours in times of conflict. Thus, some authors maintain that if verbally aggressive language was not used with the perpetrator in times of intoxication, violence would not result.⁶⁹ In this way, drunkenness is, once again, a means of blaming the victim. This, in turn, detracts from other reasons

⁶⁷D. M. Chechot and D. D. Shestakov, claim that over 60% of spousal assaults are connected to infidelity. According to these researchers, the discovery of infidelity often throws people into a temporary insanity in which they take desperate measures. D. M. Chechot and D. D. Shestakov, 1988: 205.

⁶⁸See Minskaia, 1972: 22. D'iachenko, 1988: 88.

⁶⁹Although alcohol is not understood as the cause of violence, it is understood as an important facilitating factor in violence. Moshak, 1989: 93.

behind the perpetration of violence.

In addition to seeing individual women as being responsible for the violence perpetrated against them, criminologists also blamed the overall position of women in society as being a reason why violence is perpetrated against women. A perfect example of this is the idea that somehow society and women have changed while men have not. For instance, some authors have explained rape as a result of women's growing choosiness of sexual partners and women's greater sexual experience.⁷⁰ According to this theory, men who find it difficult to find sexual partners resort to rape. In cases of family violence, authors blame women's employment as a reason for violence.⁷¹ One author maintains that this has changed women's role in the family and made them more demanding and less willing to compromise.⁷² This, in turn, has led to conflicts in families where men expect their wives to compromise. Such findings show that although large numbers of women have been actively employed in the Soviet periods,⁷³ the support systems required to ensure stability in a woman's personal and family life during this employment were missing. It may be true that changes in women's behaviour have affected the

⁷⁰G. V. Antonov-Romanovskii, "Problemy krimilogicheskogo izucheniia isnasilovaniia," Voprosy bor'by s prestupnost'iu, #34, 1981: 49.

⁷¹See Moshak, 1989, 9-11; D.A. Shestakov, "Kriminologennaia sem'ia i formirovanie agressivnosti," in Viktimologicheskie problemy bor'by s prestupnost'iu, Irkutsk: Irkutsk State University, 1988, 66-68.

⁷²Shestakov, 1988: 66-67.

⁷³Since 1919 women have constituted between 27.7% and 50.6% of the work force. Natalia Rimashevskaiia, "Perestroika and the Status of Women," in S. Rai, et al., Women in the Face of Change: The Soviet Union, Eastern Europe and China, London: Routledge, 1992: 11.

pattern of violence against women in the Soviet Union, but these changes can not be blamed for its existence. As we have already seen, rape and family violence are not recent phenomena but have an established history in Russian culture. As such, attributing the incidence of violence to current changes in the position of women is really a criticism of the gains made by women in society. This hypothesis is also a statement that women have come too far, especially when their employment results in less time for housework, increased economic independence and higher status - all of which place increased demands on men to change. Clearly, many men do not want to change and hence, refuse to take responsibility for some of the domestic work referred to by Lenin as 'drudgery'.⁷⁴ Should women really be blamed for taking advantage of opportunities to broaden their spheres of activity? The Soviet state's only partial commitment to women's emancipation is more likely responsible for these incidents of violence.

The lack of sympathy shown to victims of rape and spousal violence - emphasised in the analysis of these crimes - reflects the methodology of most studies. Most studies into rape and family violence based their information on interviews with the perpetrators convicted of these crimes. These interviews formed the basis for assessing the actions of both perpetrators and victims. As discussed earlier, the results of many of these interviews showed that perpetrators quite often believed that some action on the part of the victim constituted provocation or justified the violence inflicted. Although the perpetrator's perspective provides

⁷⁴V.I. Lenin, Women and Society, New York: International Publishers, 1938: 12.

valuable insights into the dynamics of rape and wife assault, it is limited in its ability to represent the actions and intentions of the victim.

Only one study used foreign sources to compensate for the lack of information available about Soviet victims of rape.⁷⁵ This study, conducted by M. E. Pozdniakova and L. N. Rybakova, is the first study in Soviet criminology to include in a discussion of rape the impact of rape on its victims.⁷⁶ This study demonstrates that rape is not motivated by a perpetrator's need for sexual gratification. It also found that most rapists are married, and that far from being derelicts, most convicted rapists (96%) were involved in socially productive work, and 62% of rapists had experienced success on the job. Pozdniakova and Rybakova found that victims of rape suffered severe trauma that increased when they were disbelieved and thought poorly of by law-enforcement officials and society.

Another study, which looked closely at the experiences of the victims of wife assault and balanced these experiences with other information available, provides a more sympathetic view of the victim by showing the suffering caused by this violence. A. D. Tartakovskii and N. A. Abdullaev, while not interviewing victims directly, looked at emergency room records which provided details not only of the physical suffering women had experienced but also of the psychological abuse.⁷⁷

⁷⁵See Pozdniakova and Rybakova: 62.

⁷⁶For a discussion of this article see Mary Buckley, *Redefining Russian Society and Polity*, Boulder, San Francisco, Oxford: Westview Press, 1993: 97-99.

⁷⁷A. D. Tartakovskii, N. A. Abdullaev, *Prestupleniia v sfere semeino-bytovykh otnoshenii i bor'ba s nimi*, Dushanbe: Donish, 1989.

They found that psychological and physical abuse were closely connected in situations of wife assault. Psychological abuse preceded physical abuse and prepared the foundation for this abuse by destroying the self esteem of the victim.

The impact of these studies which demonstrate a sensitivity to victims' suffering may have been partially overshadowed by the disproportional influence that criminologists located in Moscow and areas in its vicinity have had on the state and law enforcement policy makers.⁷⁸ Both these studies were conducted in Soviet republics outside of Russia (the first in Kazakhstan and the second in Tadjikistan).

In addition, Soviet criminologists have tended to focus on the most severe forms of these crimes. Moreover, many criminologists tend to base their information on statistics collected from cases involving grave bodily injuries and murder. For example, of the four major Soviet studies of spousal violence in the Gorbachev Period, two use as the basis of information persons that have killed or attempted to kill their spouse.⁷⁹ Also, in literature on rape, the examples used include gang rapes or particularly cruel and brutal injuries inflicted on the victim. The extreme nature of grave violence and murder on the one hand underlines the seriousness of these crimes but on the other hand also diminishes the relative importance of the majority of rape and spousal violence which are not brutally violent nor approach murder.

The strategies for fighting rape and family violence, being primarily of a general nature, also obscure the seriousness of the problem. In fact, the broad

⁷⁸Solomon, 1978: 108.

⁷⁹See Moshak, 1989 and Shestakov, 1988.

range and nature of strategies, concentrating on broad educational, social and law-enforcement programs, take on an almost idealistic or fanciful quality.⁸⁰ This is particularly true of suggestions such as the need to increase the number of recreational facilities and the need to monitor all those who have committed or are considered at risk of committing crimes. Although such programs may have an effect on rape and wife assault, they require a large investment of resources. Given that the Soviet state has never invested a large amount of resources into fighting these problems, it is not surprising that such suggestions were not acted upon. What is puzzling is that criminologists would continue to make such suggestions despite the realization that they would probably never be implemented.

However, not all suggestions require a large investment of resources. For instance, the suggestions made to provide psychological help for those who need it and teach communication skills could be easily incorporated into existing health and educational programs. This is also true of sexual and pre-marital education which teach appreciation and respect for the opposite sex. It must be asked, however, why these have not been implemented already, and if they have, why they have not worked.

The role of intervention in successfully mitigating violence has been discussed by some Soviet criminologists. Intervention is a strategy that could

⁸⁰Antonian, Golubov, and Kudriakov suggest the need to give maximum attention to the person, understanding the difficulty and the contradictory nature of his world, widen opportunities to realize personal demands and interests in various spheres of the world and society, compensate for some demands, build better working and relaxing conditions, give psychological therapy, and assist in educational work. Antonian, Golubov and Kudriakov, 1990: 168.

incorporate both social education and practical strategies. Tartakovskii and Abdullaev identify the non-intervention of neighbours as an important factor in the perpetuation of family violence.⁸¹ V. Petelin, in an article on the motives of hooliganism, maintains that in 26% of abusive situations, others knew about the on-going abuse but took no action.⁸² Some European countries have recognized the role of bystanders in crime. For instance, witness intervention programs have been legislated by Germany, Hungary and Poland in an effort to distribute more fairly the blame in violence against women.⁸³ Unfortunately, intervention as a strategy for crime prevention has attracted the attention of only a small number of criminologists.

The methodologies used in the research on rape and spousal assault and the strategies developed demonstrate that victim's interests are not well represented in the literature on criminology. Although studies focused on the behaviour of victims and women's changing social roles, victims were almost never interviewed. In contrast, interviews with perpetrators are common in the analysis of these crimes and contribute to the adoption of a perspective sympathetic to the male perpetrator. From such a perspective, unless coupled with grave bodily injuries or death, these crimes do not appear to be serious. Of even less importance is the emotional and psychological harm done to the victims of these crimes.

⁸¹Tartakovskii and Abdullaev, 1989: 110.

⁸²V. Petelin, "Ustanovlenie umysla po delam o huliganstve," *Sovetskaja Iustitsija*, 1990, #2: 20.

⁸³See R. I. Mawby and S. Walkate, *Critical Victimology: International Perspectives*, London: Sage, 1994, 164.

The reason for this absence of such research is unclear. This may possibly have been seen as a means of protecting the victims of crimes from further trauma or a belief that victims had already provided sufficient information on their experiences in complaints made to the *miliitsia* (law enforcement officers). Perhaps the biggest reason for not interviewing victims of violence were logistical considerations. Most interviews of perpetrators were conducted on incarcerated populations. Perpetrators' incarceration meant that a large number of perpetrators could be found in a single penal facility which expedited research.

The work of support service organizers in the post-Soviet Period, however, demonstrates that police complaints do not fully capture the experience of women who have suffered violence. The most important elements that are missing from complaints are the extent of a woman's suffering and the dynamics of her coping mechanisms. The director of the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostri' has found that women have been severely traumatized by the experiences of rape and wife assault and that the needs of such women extend not only to legal advocacy but also to psychological support. The director of this centre and others involved in support services have found that in searching for an explanation for the crimes committed against them, women will often blame themselves for the incident. Further discussions with women experiencing violence, however, reveals that this self doubt is not a realistic appraisal of the crimes.⁸⁴

⁸⁴See Tat'iana Gur'ianova, "Nuzhna li Rossii zhenskaia 'skoraia'," *Moskovskii Komsomolets*, Aug.12, 1994: 2; Marina Domashenko, "Sama vinovata?" *Argumenty i Fakty* (Dochki-materi supplement), #1, 1995: 2; Ol'ga Dashkovskaia, "Ne priacha litsa," *Pedagogicheskii kaleidoskop*, #39-40, November 1994: 3.

Criminologists as Educators

The significance of the way in which criminological research has been conducted, interpreted and presented lies in where and how this research has been used. During the Soviet periods, the views of Soviet criminologists on rape and family violence were primarily found in academic theses, journal articles and textbooks. Although, academic theses were often in depth, their analyses of specific aspects of rape and family violence were available to most researchers only in abstract form and therefore did not heavily influence either academic discourse or society.⁸⁵ Through journal articles, criminologists reached a broader audience, but an audience still mainly composed of other criminologists.

The ideas of criminologists, however, probably had the greatest influence through textbooks written for law-enforcement training agencies and legal practitioners. The biases and stereotypes of criminologists who wrote these textbooks undoubtedly had an impact on the legal professionals who read them. Although it is not clear whether criminologists caused or simply reinforced biases about violence against women, it is clear that the biases and stereotypes of criminologists and those of legal professionals correspond. For instance, the myths of law-enforcement workers about women raped, as identified by V. V. Get'man, are similar to the stereotypes and biases of criminologists discussed throughout this chapter. According to Get'man, two widely held myths amongst the *militsia* are that

⁸⁵Only two copies of a thesis were made; one copy of all academic theses was kept by a student's academic department and another was sent to a central thesis bank.

a woman will not be raped if she protests and that a woman often provokes rape.⁸⁶

This corresponds with Soviet scholars overemphasis of the role played by the victims in their own victimization, as previously discussed in this chapter.

Conclusion

Not surprisingly, a lack of women's representation in Soviet decision-making bodies and law-enforcement agencies has corresponded with an unsympathetic and even negative view of women experiencing violence. Such views do not promote concern about the well-being of victims. Instead, criminologists emphasise the negative effect women's employment and changing expectations of men have had on violence. However, rather than suggesting men change, criminologists maintain that it is not men but women who are the problem and that women should change to reflect previous roles and attitudes. Although more progressive studies have been carried out, they have as of yet been unable to exert much influence on the general orientation of criminology. Slowly, new studies are being conducted and some are finally beginning to validate women's negative experiences with violence. The independent women's movement, which has identified the existence of patriarchy in the Soviet state and society, may play a key role in supporting such studies by extending the examination of patriarchy into the spheres of law and law-enforcement.

⁸⁶V. V. Get'man, Issledovanie mifov ob iznasilovannii (diploma work), St. Petersburg: Faculty of Psychology, St. Petersburg University, June 1993: 39-42. Get'man's research is cited in Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project, Russia: Neither Jobs Nor Justice, Vol. 7, #5, March 1995: 24.

Chapter 3

The Russian Women's Movement and the Articulation of Women's Interests

Support service development for women experiencing violence, which arose in the 1990's, was to a large extent a byproduct of the development of a larger women's movement. Many of the women who developed support services were originally members of other women's groups. Other women, although not directly involved with women's groups, benefitted from the networking opportunities made available to them at women's conferences, thus helping them in their support service development activities. This chapter shall examine the forces which brought about the formation of a Soviet/Russian women's movement, the development of this women's movement and the role this movement has played in the development of support services.

The Formation of the Soviet/Russian Women's Movement

Economic and Political Factors

The Soviet/Russian women's movement has its origins in the Gorbachev Period. The change in government policies during this period, namely *glasnost*¹ and *perestroika*, allowed women's groups to develop.¹ *Glasnost*¹ encouraged members

¹In March 1990 Article Six of the constitution, guaranteeing the leading role of the party, was abolished. Tolerance to societal diversity was later enshrined in the October 9, 1990 Law on Public Associations. For a discussion of the significance of these changes to independent and charity organizations see Anne White, "Charity, Self-Help and Politics in Russia, 1985-91," *Europe-Asia Studies*, Vol. 45, #5, 1993: 797-98.

of Soviet society to openly air their grievances while the policy of *perestroika* progressively made Soviet society less dependent on the state.

However, political and economic changes in the Gorbachev Period also lowered the general standard of living for the country and brought new hardships to women. These hardships provided women with important reasons to organize into groups. Unemployment, which since the Early Soviet Period had not been a cause for concern, suddenly appeared under the restructuring of Gorbachev's *perestroika* and grew dramatically following the dissolution of the Soviet Union. Women were especially vulnerable, and began losing their jobs in increasing numbers, largely because of the costs associated with the extra family and maternity benefits which they were legally entitled to receive. In addition, the jobs held by women in the Soviet periods were often in areas requiring little training, and hence it was easy to replace women. In the process of privatization, which began at the end of the Soviet period state enterprises were often offered the opportunity to start up again as if they were new businesses. In this process, enterprise sectors with high numbers of women were often deemed inefficient and closed or temporarily closed and later reopened with a new all-male labour force.² In addition, women whose employment had been concentrated in the public sector of industry, in agriculture, in education, in culture and health care services faced

²Linda Racioppi, Katherine O'Sullivan, "Organizing Women before and after the Fall: Women's Politics in the Soviet Union and Post-Soviet Russia," *Signs*, Summer 1995: 825-26.

greater unemployment than men.³ Salaries in these fields, which had traditionally been lower than in other fields (construction, transportation, mining), when combined with the force of inflation caused many women to join the ranks of the working poor.⁴

Women have likewise faced decreasing levels of political representation. Women were formerly represented in the Supreme Soviet through a quota system which guaranteed them 33% of its seats. In 1990 when the quota was removed women's representation fell to 8.9%. The Congress of People's Deputies reserved 75 seats for members of official women's organizations in 1989; 17% of the Congress Deputies were women. By 1990 the special seats had disappeared and women's representation fell to 5.3%. In the post-Soviet period women's representation to the legislative bodies of the Russian Federation averaged 11.4% in 1993 (women composed 5.6% of Federation Council deputies and 13.6% of State Duma deputies).⁵

The perception of women in the public domain also changed from the previous Soviet period. The freedom brought by *perestroika* removed legal barriers to the sale and distribution of pornographic materials. Unprecedented violence and

³According to researcher Z.A. Khotkina women in the early 1990s composed 70-80% of the unemployed. Z.A. Khotkina, "Novye tendentsii v zaniatosti zhenshchin," In: Z.A. Khotkina, ed., *Zhenshchina i social'naiia politika* (gendernyi aspekt), Moscow: 1992: 48-49. Gabriele Luke, "Women in the New Russia," *Current Politics and Economics of Russia*, Vol. 4, #2, 1996: 82-87.

⁴For a discussion of poverty and the sectors that it affects see Vladimir Mikhalev, "Social Security in Russia," *Europe-Asia Studies*, vol. 48, #1, 1996:15-17. See also Penny Morvant, "Bearing the 'Double Burden' in Russia," *Transition*, September 8, 1995: 6-7.

⁵Rossiiskaia Federatsia, *Doklad Proekt o Vypolnenii v Rossiiskoi Federatsii Konventsii o likvidatsii vseh form diskriminatsii v otnoshenii zhenshchin*, pamphlet, 1993: 6.

nudity were shown on cinema screens. Nude and pornographic images, primarily composed of women's bodies, popularized an image of women as sex objects.⁶ At the same time women's vulnerability to sexual violence was underscored through mass media reports of growing levels of rape. Thus as well as feeling economically and politically alienated, women began to fear for their safety. Women were visibly being given a secondary role in Soviet and post-Soviet Russian society and many men felt free to openly express their preference for men in the economy, politics and society.⁷

Women's Groups

Women's groups during the Gorbachev and post-Soviet periods took the form of official women's organizations and independent (or non-governmental) women's groups. The two types of women's groups differed greatly in their approach to women's issues. Official women's organizations continued to see women through the eyes of the political economy while independent women's groups began to formulate their own visions of women's needs, with some

⁶For a discussion of erotica and pornography in the Gorbachev and post-Soviet periods see Rosamund Shreeves, "Sexual Revolution or Sexploitation?" *RFE Report on the USSR*, August 3, 1990: 4-8. Sergei Varashavchik, "Krasna stotsa fonariami"; Vladimir Chernov, "Pochem vy devochki?" *Ogonyok*, #39, September 1995: 44-47.

⁷For example, Gennady Melikyan, Russia's labour minister, when asked about the problem of women's unemployment in February 1993 responded, "Why should we employ women when men are out of work? It's better than men work and women take care of children and do housework. I don't think women should work when men are doing nothing." H. Womack, "Why Employ Women When there Are Men Out of Work?" *The Independent* (London), March 21, 1993: 11. Cited in Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project, *Russia: Neither Jobs Nor Justice: State Discrimination Against Women in Russia*, March 1995, Vol. 7, #5: 2.

independent groups including in their vision the need to support women experiencing violence.

Official Women's Organizations

Official women's organizations, namely the Soviet Women's Committee and *zhensovet* (women's councils), became active in state and local politics in the late 1980s.⁸ The Committee, using the liberties available under *glasnost*, criticized the state for the lack of career advancement women faced and the hazardous conditions under which they worked.⁹ The focus of the Women's Committees on employment issues was part of a larger re-evaluation of the economic position of women in Soviet society. This focus was also in keeping with the emphasis of Marxist-Leninist ideology on economic relations as the determining relations in society. However, the Soviet Women's Committee, by limiting its criticism to employment issues, did not integrate into its analysis issues not related to employment such as violence experienced by women.

The focus of *zhensovet* were slightly broader than that of the Soviet Women's Committee and included direct work with places of employment, women and families. *Zhensovet* were originally created in the Post-Stalinist Period to promote political and economic commitment of the Soviet state amongst non-

⁸In 1990 the Committee of Soviet Women became the Union of Women of Russia. For a discussion of the organization of Committee of Soviet Women and *zhensovet* see Racioppi, O'Sullivan See: 830-834 and 834-836.

⁹Mary Buckley, "Perestroika and the woman question," B. Deacon and J. Szalia, eds., Social Policy in the new Eastern Europe, Vermont: Grower Publishing Company, 1990: 215-217.

Russian populations and in rural areas. The councils were officially autonomous, but they received directives from communist bodies. As such, the Council's political and social programs were aimed at encouraging women to fulfil and exceed state-set work plans and at improving the state services necessary to facilitate women's employment (daycare centres, cafeterias, etc.).¹⁰

The Women's Councils considered their role to be safeguarding women's and children's interests.¹¹ To this end, pressure was placed on industries to improve poor working conditions, complaints were made against those with 'backward' attitudes about women, and community programs, such as parenting classes were developed. However, since these Councils took their programs from the Communist Party, they did not act as a vehicle for the raising of issues not on the Party's agenda.¹²

When *Zhensovet* were revived in the early 1980s, they focused on employment and the family at the local level and concentrated their efforts on keeping families together. This focus largely reflected the focus of the party-state in the Gorbachev Period.¹³ The role of the family in Soviet society gained increasing

¹⁰Genia Browning, Women and Politics in the USSR: Consciousness Raising and Soviet Women's Groups, Sussex: Wheatsheaf Books, 1987: 96-98.

¹¹Browning, 1987: 96-117.

¹²Browning, 1987: 65-80; Valetina Konstantinova, "The women's movement in the USSR: A myth or a real challenge?" in S. Rai, et al., Women in the Face of Change: The Soviet Union Eastern Europe and China, London: Routledge, 1992: 205-206

¹³Although they were officially autonomous from the state, *zhensovet* were accountable to Communist Party organs at the local level and were officially governed by the Soviet Women's Committee.

importance during this period and safeguarding its interests was a key goal of state policies.¹⁴ While the party-state continued to support women's employment, women's involvement in the work force was blamed by state and society for the deterioration of families and the rise in social problems. Efforts that were made by *zhensovet* to keep families together were efforts to resolve this apparent contradiction.

In their work with troubled families, *zhensovet* almost certainly learned of spousal violence but they, like the Soviet Women's Committee, did not comment on it.¹⁵ It is most likely that *zhensovet* did not completely ignore violence but attempted to find a means to resolve it that would not necessitate the dissolution of the family. The repercussions for putting family life above the rights of individual family members has been discussed somewhat in the post-Soviet period. "Russian women's activists have expressed concern that if the family were recognized as the fundamental unit of society women would have no recourse in situations of domestic violence because they would be limited in asserting their individual rights in a way that [does not] disrupt (sic) family life".¹⁶ However, as letters written by rural women to Soviet newspapers and magazines demonstrate, spousal violence could not be resolved within the confines of the family.¹⁷

¹⁴Browning, 1987: 108-110.

¹⁵In her discussion of the work of *zhensovet* with alcoholic men, Genia Browning alludes to violence. Browning, 1987: 99.

¹⁶Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project: 5.

¹⁷Sue Bridger analyses some of these letters in her article "The Return of the Family Farm," in Rosalind Marsh, ed., *Women in Russia and Ukraine*, Cambridge: Cambridge University press, 1996:

It would be expected that Women's Councils, having been specially organized in rural areas, should have pursued a meaningful resolution of domestic violence and also brought violence to the attention of communist bodies. Domestic violence has long been associated with rural life and, in particular, with alcohol abuse which is believed to be more common in rural areas. Women's Councils did after all see as part of their goal the elimination of 'backward' attitudes about women.¹⁸ Reprimanding the perpetrators of wife assault would have fallen outside of the Councils' mandate but the monitoring of organizations responsible for adjudicating such problems would have been part of their mandate. In this case Comrades' Courts, which were responsible for addressing crimes involving minor social danger, would have been the body to resolve the issue.¹⁹

228-240.

¹⁸'Backward attitudes' was the term used to describe non-Russian practices of bride stealing, polygamy, the veiling of women and dowries. It also included references to the extreme violence, even death, that men would inflict on their wives or other female relatives who they felt acted dishonourably. In the 1920s, the *Zhenotdel's* campaign to emancipate and unveil women in Muslim populations led to the murder of hundreds of women. Richard Stites, *The Women's Liberation Movement in Russia: Feminism, Nihilism and Bolshevism*, Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1978: 339-340. Barbara Raney claims that the *Zhenotdel* also functioned as a shelter for women fearing violence from their husbands. The experience of the *Zhenotdel* shows that violence against women was a phenomenon understood by the Russian population and, in particular, those working with women in the outskirts. Barbara Raney, *From Baba to Tovarishch: The Bolshevik Revolution and Soviet Women's Struggle for Liberation*, Chicago: Chicago Workers' Voice, 1994: 10-11.

¹⁹Comrades' courts, however, were not criminal courts but were instead administrative courts. Their administrative status meant that appearing before them absolved a person from criminal responsibility in return for a social sanction which included such penalties as a decrease in pay, a demotion at work, and public condemnation. Comrades' courts were most often composed of peers; they were found in factories, offices, social organizations, housing collectives, street committees and higher educational establishments. As such they were not impartial nor immune to influence, particularly from state and Party bodies. See Conquest, Robert, *Justice and the Legal System in the USSR*, London: The Bodley Head, 1968: 116-117. See also W.E. Butler, *Soviet Law*, London: Butterworths, 1988: 247-251.

Submissions to Comrades' Courts were welcomed from community organizations as well as from the injured party and the accused. As such the Courts' failure to deal with problems of wife assault to the satisfaction of injured women (recounted in rural women's letters) is indicative of these women's inability to influence the Courts and the inability of organizations such as the Women's Councils, unlike the *Zhenotdel* in the Early Soviet Period, to act as advocates on their behalf. Likewise it is indicative of the failure by both the party and the state to provide meaningful solutions to the problems plaguing women's lives.

Independent Women's Organizations

Independent women's organizations, which were to play a significant role in the development of support services, were made possible through the lifting of restrictions on the existence of independent social organizations.²⁰ By independent women's groups, I am referring to groups which determined their own mandates. Independent groups were numerous and varied a great deal from one another. Some were professional organizations, others were social groups and others still were feminist organizations.

Most independent organizations were locally based and confronted issues relevant to their membership. As such they recognized that they could only speak

²⁰For a discussion on the effect of Gorbachev's policies on social movements see Judith B. Sedaitis, Jim Butterfield ed., Perestroika From Below: Social Movements in the Soviet Union, Boulder: Westview Press, 1991: 3-9.

for a segment of the female population.²¹ This realization made them better able to formulate a clear mandate and made them more representative of the diversity of women's interests than official women's organizations had been in the past. Independence, however, also often translated into an isolation from and ignorance of other women's groups and their activities. Even the knowledge regarding the existence of other groups was limited.

For women's groups, many of which were small with limited resources, isolation often translated into limited political power. Several strategies developed to overcome the isolation of women's groups and to increase their political power. The first strategy took the form of a networking organization. This was developed in 1991 and called ZhISet (women's information network).²² The network created a data base of women's groups and a newsletter. The network was instrumental in the organization of conferences and the coordination of social action.

Independent Women's Forum - The Dubna Conference

A second strategy which emerged was that of organizing a conference or an 'independent women's forum', which would demonstrate to politicians and society that women's groups were numerous, strong and would be a force to contend with

²¹Itogovyi otchyt o rabote I nezavisimovo zhenskovo foruma, Dubna-Moscow, 1991: 6.

²²Anastasia Posadskaia "The Feminine Dimension of Social Reform: From one Forum to the Next," in Rosalind Marsh ed. Women in Russia and Ukraine. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996, 299.

in the future.²³ Thus the objective of conference was to make a political statement while breaking the isolation of women's groups. The conference's objective was met in that it brought women from all over the Soviet Union together. The forum, which was held in March 1991, demonstrated the size and diversity of women's groups in the Soviet Union attracting 200 participants from 48 women's groups.²⁴ This forum was the first public event at which there was an open discussion on violence against women and the need for support services. For example, available references to the discussion of violence describe how during the conference an informal group of women interested in issues of violence developed. Members of this group later brought the subject of violence to the attention of the larger conference. Members stated that the subject of violence had been taboo in the Soviet Union for too long and the country had fallen behind many others in the development of support services for women experiencing violence.²⁵ Little is known about the actual discussion on violence. However, the subject of violence appears to have raised some controversy because references to it are not found in the conference resolutions.

Networking during the conference was a vital component in breaking the isolation of women's groups and, in particular, the isolation of women who were interested in developing support services. Networking was facilitated through an

²³The political aspects of the forum are made clear in the slogan of the conference 'Democracy Without Women is Not Democracy'.

²⁴*Ito govvi otchyot o rabote I nezavisimovo zhenskovo foruma*, 1991: 2.

²⁵*Ito govvi otchyot o rabote I nezavisimovo zhenskovo foruma*, 1991: 16.

openness to participants' interests. The opening of the conference, for instance, allowed time for each participant to introduce herself, her interests, her group and its challenges.²⁶ This exchange of information made it possible for women to identify other women who had similar interests or were involved in similar projects. Out of this introductory session, many women's groups were formed, including those focusing on violence.²⁷

The conference also focussed on the need for women to become more active. This probably had an important impact on the groups present and provided moral support to new women's groups. The conference speakers integrated various strategies from different types of women's groups into their discussions. The opening speaker for the forum, Anastasia Posadskaia, referred to sexual violence as a barrier to women's social, political and economic advancement.²⁸ Women's

²⁶*Itogovyi otechvot o rabote I nezavisimovo zhenskovo foruma*, 1991: 2.

²⁷Natalia Khodyreva, director of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women, first met with M. Aristova, G. Bratukhina, I. Lunin, O. Kocharian and T. Fedorova at the First Women's Forum in Dubna. Following the conference they went on to organize a hot line and special services for victims of sexual violence in St. Petersburg. Natalia Khodyreva, "Sexism and Sexual Abuse in Russia," Chris Corrin, ed., *Violence Against Women in the Former East-Block*, Glasgow University, 1995 (In Print).

²⁸*Itogovyi otechvot o rabote I nezavisimovo zhenskovo foruma*, 1991: 7. Although the report of the conference proceedings does not elaborate on Posadskaia's statement, she is most likely referring to the explanations of violence against women that were used by various international women's groups to lobby for the inclusion of violence against women as a human rights violation in United Nations documents. Similar references are made to violence against women in discussion of United Nations documents on violence against women in a 1995 manual for Russian support services. "Violence is the product of historical inequality between men and women, which led to the domination of women and men's discrimination against women. Violence is one of the main social mechanisms by which women are forced into subservient roles to men in the economy, politics and social life." Tsentr po problemam zhenshchin i sem'i pri institute molodyozhi, "Syostri", *How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*, Moscow: Press-Solo, 1995: 16. In addition, Posadskaia may also be making reference to the widespread belief in Soviet/Russian society that without a man's protection a woman is

need to become active in developing their own independent structures became the focus of discussions. Women at the conference concluded that the organization of independent groups meeting the needs of women, such as support services, is as important as joining the established political structures in order to implement changes that would better reflect women's needs in society.²⁹

However, it was the strong opinion of the conference participants' that women's interests could only gain political recognition under a democratic political system.³⁰ Democracy, with its support of the individual, was expected to support women's individuality and value in society. After all, women did form over half of the Soviet population. In addition, democracy was understood by women's groups to include mechanisms by which members of decision-making bodies would listen to the voices of different groups in society. Women anticipated that in a democratic system decision-making bodies would listen to the diversity of women's voices found in various women's groups. Women also expected that the development of

physically vulnerable to sexual attack. This theme was pursued in a number of films in the Gorbachev Period, particularly the film *Ia Zhenshchina* (I am a Woman). In this film, a married woman falls victim to a gang rape after confronting her husband about having an affair. For a greater discussion of the ways in which violence against women have been represented in film, see Lynne Attwood, "Sex and the Cinema", Igor Kon and James Riordan, eds., *Sex and Russia Society*, Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1993: 64-88. See also Lynne Attwood, ed., *Red Women on the Silver Screen*, London: Pandora, 1993.

²⁹The need for women to actively promote their interests on a number of levels, summarized in the phrase 'the personal is political', is borrowed from the western women's movement who used this phrase to draw attention to the ways in which men's domination of women on a personal level, particularly through the use of violence, also results in men's domination of women in the economy, politics and society. The phrase 'the personal is political' was first used by Kate Millet in *Sexual Politics*, London: Virago, 1977.

³⁰*Izgovori otchvot o rabote Nezavisimovo zhenskovo foruma*, 1991: 7.

democracy would incorporate a representation of women to political bodies more reflective of their proportion in the population.

Democracy and the Dissolution of the Soviet Union

The Dubna conference participants' hope that democracy would improve the situation of women, however, proved to be overly optimistic. Following the dissolution of the Soviet Union, economic conditions deteriorated even further in the Russian Federation and a growing disillusionment with the political structure of the country developed. Democracy, which allowed for freedom of expression and an ability to compete with others for influence and resources, did not hold any guarantees and many women's groups suffered from a lack of access to resources still controlled by former Soviet bureaucrats.³¹ The old Soviet elite and nomenclature, following the dissolution of the Soviet Union, continued to play a leading role in regional politics and through access to property and other resources. Consequently, the ability of women's groups to acquire the resources from government bodies necessary to fulfil their objectives varied greatly from region to region and depended on how sympathetic regional leaders were to the plight of women.

³¹For a discussion of bureaucrats and resources in the post-Soviet period see Norma C. Noonan, "Does Consciousness Lead to Action? Exploring the Impact of Perestroika and Post-Perestroika on Women in Russia," in *Women Of Russia - Yesterday, Today, Tomorrow*, (Conference held June 1-5, 1993), Moscow: Association of Women in Slavic Studies, Institute of Sociology of the Russian Academy of Science, All-Russia Women's Association 'Missia', International League of Women-Writers of Russia, Academy of Management, 1994: 133-139.

The Second Dubna Conference

The further deterioration of living conditions for women in the post-Soviet period provided the women's movement with yet more reason to bolster discussion of women's issues. A second Dubna conference was held in 1992, drawing 500 participants - more than twice as many as Dubna I. It was the intent of the conference, as indicated by its theme "From Problems to Strategies", to help women find a viable place for themselves in society. As with Dubna I, one of Dubna II's greatest achievements was the many networks that formed amongst participants at the conference.³² An example of this is the connection made between Natalia Gaidarenko and Martina Vandenberg who would together later create the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostry'.³³ The *ad hoc* discussion of violence against women at the first Dubna conference turned into a full fledged workshop on violence at the second Dubna conference. During this workshop, Western participants described western support services for women experiencing violence. In the span between the two conferences women's groups had already been organized to develop support services for women experiencing violence.

The Post-Dubna Conference

To date, there has not yet been a third independent women's forum. A forum had been planned for 1993 but did not materialize due to the political crisis in

³²Rosalind Marsh, "'From Problems to Strategy'? Impressions of the Second Independent Women's Forum in Dubna." *Rusistika*, #7, June 1993: 16-19.

³³See Tatiana Zabelina, "Sisters" *Woman Plus*...1/95: 15-16.

October/November 1993 and the approach of December elections.³⁴ The fact that a third forum has not been organized is, in part, an indication that the women's movement has grown and developed, and that general conferences are no longer needed to bring women together. Since Dubna II, in the place of large conferences with broad themes, have been conferences that focused on specific issues of importance to women. As well, lessons learned about the organization of the Dubna conferences made possible the organization of a conference on violence against women and children in 1993.³⁵

These post-Dubna conferences, despite focusing on single themes, were able to promote analyses of themes which integrated various aspects of women's lives. For instance, violence and sexual harassment were integrated into the discussion of a conference sponsored by the Association of Women Lawyers that was held in 1995. In this way, attention was focused on these issues and more meaningful solidarity between those developing support services and professionals able to work with the criminal justice system to help women experiencing violence was solidified. In part this solidarity was built up through frank discussions on violence, and law-enforcement agencies' and the judiciary's treatment of women experiencing violence. Likewise, discussions took place on the myths and

³⁴See Marsh, 1996: 292.

³⁵See T. Zabelina, "Itogi seminara v Institute Molodyozhi," Vy i My: The Women's Dialogue, #9, Spring 1994: 25-27.

stereotypes surrounding victims of rape and wife assault.³⁶

The Mandate of the Independent Women's Movement

It is particularly important that the independent women's movement does not attempt to speak for *all* women; nor is it assuming that the role of an all-Russian women's organization. What we are is an open tribune for any women's organization and for any woman who is seeking her own answer to the 'woman question'.

Anastasia Posadskaya³⁷

The independent women's movement can be described as a loose structure tied together through information networks and conferences, and as such does not have an official mandate. However, there are many common beliefs which unite the various women's groups within the women's movement. Two widely held beliefs are: the need to strive for the improvement of women's position in society and the belief that women have an important contribution to make to public life.

These beliefs, expressed by various groups in different ways, are very much a response to the Soviet state's approach to women issues. As Anastasia Posadskaya argues, the state always made policies for women, deciding what women's needs were and how best to meet them.³⁸ Such an approach was, according to Posadskaya, flawed. Those making decisions for women never really

³⁶See L.A. Morozova, "Zhenshchiny i pravo, (Obzor materialov konferentsi v Saratove)" Gosudarstvo i Pravo, #9, 1995: 133-140.

³⁷Introduction to Anastasia Posadskaya, ed., Women in Russia: A New Era in Russian Feminism. London/New York: Verso, 1994: 6.

³⁸Marsh, 1996: 301.

fully knew what women needed and wanted. Posadskaia also maintains that the Soviet system failed in emancipating women because the state tried to do so by emancipating the sex without emancipating the individual. According to this argument women in general were welcome to enter into politics and take advantage of a wide range of opportunities, but most individual women never had lives that enabled them to do so.³⁹

In the current post-Soviet political climate, groups developing support services face social opposition to their existence. Russian society is not generally sympathetic to the victims of rape or wife assault and women developing support services have found few supporters outside of women's groups.⁴⁰ Hence, this support from women's groups has been particularly important. One of the ways of generating this support has been to create opportunities for women's interaction, which also helps to broaden women's minds on subjects such as violence against women. The support generated out of this dialogue, in turn, helps to build solidarity amongst various women's groups, who although having different strategies and foci, are working in the same direction.⁴¹ Another means by which women's groups

³⁹For a discussion of the barriers to women's career, political and social advancement see Anastasia Posadskaya "Women as the Objects and Motive Force of Change in Our Time," in Posadskaya, 1994: 9-10; Olga Voronina, "The Mythology of Women's Emancipation," in Posadskaya, 1994: 39-41.

⁴⁰Lori Cidylo, "Russia discovers the rape victim," *Financial Times*, August 13/14, 1994: 5; Mike Trickey, "Russian women explode myth of equality," *Calgary Herald*, July 28, 1994: A10.

⁴¹Some of the various women's groups that have cooperated with one another are feminist groups, groups developing support services and lesbian groups. Women's professional organizations have cooperated with feminist organizations. Socially active groups, such as the Committee of Soldiers' Mothers, have also cooperated with feminist organizations, groups developing support services and lesbian organizations. For a discussion of the cooperation between support services and lesbian

within the women's movement have sought to overcome social opposition is by encouraging women to be active in expressing their ideas and interests.⁴² Inherent in this effort is the belief that supporting other women in their projects, ventures, and businesses will eventually have its rewards in the reciprocation of this support to other women. In so doing, it is hoped that one of the problems within the women's movement will be mitigated - that of women, themselves, falling victim to degrading myths and stereotypes about women. It is these myths and stereotypes that bring the opposition full circle, making the environment for support service development more antagonistic and their existence more necessary.

The Direct Support of Women's Groups

Through the organization of conferences open to interested participants, the independent Russian women's movement has facilitated the development of a number of important groups, including those developing support services.⁴³ These groups, becoming more specialized in their goals, have been better able to

women see Lindsay Percival, "Where Abused Women Speak Out," The Moscow Times, Tuesday, January 11, 1994: 24.

⁴²Tatiana Lipovskaia, women's movement activist and coordinator of the Moscow Sexual Assault and Recovery Centre 'Syostry', interview, Moscow, May 1995.

⁴³Natalia Khodyreva, director of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women, first met with M. Aristova, G. Bratukhina, I. Lunin, O. Kocharian and T. Fedorova at the First Women's Forum in Dubna. Following the conference they went on to organize a hot line and special services for victims of sexual violence in St. Petersburg. Natalia Khodyreva, "Sexism and Sexual Abuse in Russia," Chris Corrin, ed., Violence Against Women in the Former East-Block, Glasgow University (In Print). Natalia Gaidarenko met Martina Vandenberg at the Second Independent Women's Conference in Dubna. They were instrumental in opening the Moscow crisis centre 'Syostry' for women experiencing violence. See Tatiana Zabelina, "Sisters," 16.

concentrate on specific aspects of the discrimination women face in Soviet/Russian society. The assistance provided by the independent women's movement through conferences, however, has been indirect. The ability for women's groups, such as those organizing support services for women experiencing violence, to develop depended on expressed interest of conference participants. Even the inclusion of violence against women as a topic of the first Dubna conference was not the decision of the organizing committee but the expressed interest of conference participants.

Specific broad based women's groups have also directly assisted in the development of support services. Many of these groups have included issues of rape and wife assault in the materials they have published and in the activities they have organized. In addition, these groups have shared resources with groups developing support services. A report on women in crisis seeking assistance, for instance, was included in the 1994 research bulletin of the Gender Studies Centre in Moscow.⁴⁴ Likewise, the St. Petersburg Centre for Gender Problems includes discussions of rape and wife assault in its journals.⁴⁵ The St. Petersburg Centre also conducted a workshop on developing support services for women experiencing violence in its 1995 conference "Feminism East-West".⁴⁶ By publishing articles on

⁴⁴"Personality and Family in the Period of Social Transition." *Demography and Sociology Digest*, Russian Academy of Sciences: Institute for Socio-Economic Studies of Population, Moscow, Vol. II, 1994: 28-29.

⁴⁵*Vse liudi svoi*, St. Petersburg Gender Problems Centre Bulletins #1-2, 1993: 60, 71-72, 106-124; Bulletin #3, 1994: 112-15.

⁴⁶"Women East-West: Feminist Theory and Practice" (Conference pamphlet), Repino, Russia, June 9-12, 1995.

violence together with articles on problems affecting women and including discussions on rape and wife assault in its conference agenda, the Centre not only demonstrates that concerns of violence are relevant but also integrates these concerns into the position of women in society.

The Structure of Women's Groups Within the Independent Women's Movement

Unlike the Soviet Women's Committee, which had clearly defined lines of authority and structures, independent women's groups functioned autonomously of one another yet have cooperated to fulfil common goals such as the organization of conferences. As well, one of the characteristics of the organization of individual women's groups has been a flexible structure which allows for individual women's self expression within these groups and allows groups to grow and evolve. Natalia Khodyreva of the St. Petersburg Centre for Gender Problems maintains that when Soviet women's groups were first organized the women involved in them believed that they could work effectively on a cooperative, collective basis. Many groups, however, found it difficult to build the trust necessary to work well together. Women became jealous of one another's success and in their desire to 'out compete' other women began to lose sight of larger goals. In order to resolve this problem, the St. Petersburg Centre for Gender Problems replaced its collective leadership with a modified managerial model in which a single director is responsible for some

decision-making but also consults with fellow workers on other decisions.⁴⁷

Despite adopting a more traditional management style, women's groups did not place restrictions on their members. Fundamentally clear to all women was that their involvement in the various women's groups was a choice (and for many also a form of employment). If women felt that the primary group they were a part of did not reflect all of their interests, they were free to form other groups simultaneously or to leave. An example of this is seen in the creation of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women. Some of the key women responsible for the creation of the Centre were also active members of the Gender Problems Centre.⁴⁸ The focus of the Gender Centre, although including women's experience of violence, goes beyond violence. Its focus is on educating society about male-female stereotypes, asserting the value of women, providing information on the history of women's activism in Russia, affirming women as human beings, and affirming women's position in society. Most members of the Centre, while concentrating their energies on educational campaigns, morally support the practical work of the Crisis Centre. Members of the Gender Centre who were interested in developing support services for women experiencing violence were encouraged to use office resources and space. The support of the Gender Centre aided the development of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for women which has now found support from foreign agencies and Russia businesses and is

⁴⁷Natalia Khodyreva, "The Russian Women's Movement" (unpublished lecture notes), Edinburgh, Scotland, June 1995.

⁴⁸Khodyreva, interview, St. Petersburg, January 10, 1995.

independent of the Gender Centre.⁴⁹

Women's groups also facilitated the development of skills such as the use of computers and other technical equipment, organizational skills and fundraising skills. All of these skills are key factors in the ability of an organization to survive.⁵⁰ No less important is an established network of groups and individuals willing and able to provide support. With a lack of domestic resources available to charitable groups, contacts with foreign funds and organizations have, in particular, become very important.

In the post-Soviet period, with high levels of inflation the real income of Russian citizens has fallen and many citizens have little money to give to charitable groups. Russian governments at various levels are also reducing spending. Those in Russian society with accessible money do not give it away easily. Many of those who are wealthy were once part of the Soviet elite or are the directors and managers of resource enterprises of privatized Soviet industries.⁵¹ Following the pattern of the Soviet periods they are male dominated⁵² and in the post-Soviet period have few incentives to donate money to charitable organizations including

⁴⁹Khodyreva, interview, St. Petersburg, June 4, 1995.

⁵⁰Natalia Popova, "Seminar v Strel'ne," *Vse liudi svostry*, St. Petersburg Centre for Gender Problems, Bulletin #3, 1994: 14-19.

⁵¹Penny Morvant, "The Changing Face of Poverty," *Transition*, January 12, 1996: 58.

⁵²For a discussion of the low representation of women amongst the political and economic elites see Hilary Pilkington, "Russia and the former Soviet republics: Behind the mask of Soviet unity: realities of women's lives," Chris Corrin, ed., *Superwomen and the Double Burden: Women's Experience of Change in Central and Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union*, Toronto: Second Story Press Feminist Publishers, 1992: 184-217.

women's groups. Russian tax laws offer no financial incentive to companies who donate money to charities and even impede the process by requiring extensive paperwork.⁵³

Of key importance is the assistance women developing support services have openly received from women's groups. This assistance has come in the form of joint activities. In St. Petersburg this was seen at the Women's Exhibition. This exhibition, which was essentially a trade fair, was attended by various women's groups who used the occasion to set up tables and distribute information about themselves.⁵⁴ Amongst the various women's groups participating were the International Business and Professional Women's Association, the lesbian organization SAFO, the St. Petersburg Crisis Centre and the Gender Problems Centre.

Independent women's groups, such as the St. Petersburg Gender Problems Centre, have played an important role in creating a data base of women's groups within various regions. This has then been used to organize joint activities for various women's groups. Joint activities have also been facilitated through members common to more than one group. Joint membership in various groups has added to the knowledge base of various women's groups and members have an opportunity to take advantage of whichever representation is most advantageous

⁵³Aleksei Bodungen maintains that companies are only eligible for tax deductions on donations of up to 3% of their profits to charitable organizations. Aleksei Bodungen, "Puti finansirovaniia krizisnogo tsentra," Institute for Youth Centre for the Problems of Women and Children; *Syostry, How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*, Moscow: Press-Solo, 1995: 100.

⁵⁴"Mir Zhenshchiny - Chulki dlia feministok," *Chas Pjk*, April 21, 1995: 2.

at any given moment. This is a political game that women have begun to play to compensate in part for their small numbers.⁵⁵

The Relationship Between the Russian Women's Movement and Support Services: What Does the Women's Movement Gain?

The relationship between general women's groups and issue specific women's groups has not been unidirectional. The women's movement and broad based women's groups have also gained from the information that more specific issue-based and professional groups have gathered. With this information, women's groups, such as the Moscow Centre for Gender Studies, were better able to elaborate on statements such as those made by director Anastasia Posadskaia, that sexual violence is a significant barrier to women's ability to get ahead in politics, society and business.⁵⁶

The relationship between Russian women's groups and support services may become akin to the relationship of the women's movement and support services in the west. In the west, the relationship has become quite symbiotic with feminist

⁵⁵Natalia Khodyreva, interview, St. Petersburg, June 4, 1995.

⁵⁶Itogovyi otchyt o rabote Nezavisimogo zhenskogo foruma, 1991: 7. Violence is widespread and is a lingering fear of many women in Russia. The existence of violence makes women feel vulnerable to men regardless of women's position in the economy or politics. In order to protect themselves women secure a relationship with men who will protect them and in so doing women become subservient to men. This theme has been explored in the west by many authors including Susan Brownmiller. Susan Brownmiller, Against Our Will: Men, Women and Rape. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1975. Russian law-enforcement agencies also believe women to be very vulnerable to victimisation. One study found that most law-enforcement officers (71%) considered women to be the most vulnerable to victimisation of all social groups. United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute: Crime and Crime Prevention in Moscow. Rome: Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute, 1994, #52: 96-97.

scholars taking up issues of violence in academic articles and support services providing more concrete information on the nature of the violence that women experience.⁵⁷

In the west, the information gathered from the running of support services has proven so influential that it has changed the direction of criminology and victimology and begun to influence government policy as well. For instance, the study of victimology in the United States, once dominated by scholarship examining the culpability of victims in crimes committed against them, now includes in its scope academics writing about support service development for women experiencing violence.⁵⁸ The experience of victims during crimes, their reaction to the crime, and the treatment they receive from law-enforcement agencies and society are all now included as elements in the larger study of victimology. The above aspects of victimology have been given a high profile and have increased the victimologists' sensitivity to the need for victim advocacy. The United States and Canada have on various governmental levels implemented information programs on violence against women as have many unions, churches and professional organizations.⁵⁹

⁵⁷Emilio Viano, ed., *Critical Issues in Victimology*, New York: Springer Publishers, 1992: xiv-xv, 1-24.

⁵⁸R.I Mawby, S. Walklate, *Critical Victimology: International Perspectives*, London: Sage, 1994: 19-22.

⁵⁹For discussions of Canadian programs against violence see The Canadian Safety Council, "Violence Against Women-The Bottom Line," *Safety Canada*, Vol. 40, #2, Spring/Summer 1996: 7; James Rusk, "New set of rights for victims introduced: Ontario wants kinder justice," *The Globe and Mail*, November 24, 1995: A6A; Rheal Seguin, "Battered women in Quebec get new aid: Province's policy aimed at prevention," *The Globe and Mail*, December 7, 1995: A2A; Jane Gadd, "More

Foreign funding sources, including American and British feminist organizations, have also influenced the agenda of the women's movement in Russia. Through contacts and conferences, the western women's movement has made Russian women aware that violence against women is an important part of the women's movement. As well, recognizing the importance of supporting women in crisis, many foreign donors have specifically channelled resources in this direction.⁶⁰

In comparison with the west, one area in which the Russian women's movement has lagged behind is in the publication of academic works about women experiencing violence. The Russian women's movement, has of yet generated only limited scholarly works in this area, largely due to difficulties in getting works published and to a relatively small number of scholars with expertise in this area.⁶¹ As of yet, the Russian women's movement has produced only one academic work on violence against women - an unpublished work by St. Petersburg University graduate student V. Get'man. Get'man used a questionnaire to survey 110 people including: rape victims, women seeking support, psychologists, students and the *militia* on their beliefs regarding rape. Using this questionnaire Get'man examined

women, children using shelters: 85,000 spent time in housing for victims of violence over a year. Statistics Canada finds." The Globe and Mail, December 12, 1995: A9.

⁶⁰Institute for Youth Centre for the Problems of Women and Children; *Syosny, How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*: 26-27. Adele Barker, "The Domestic Violence Project," Women East-West, #44, September 1996: 15.

⁶¹Many of the women involved in support service development are practicing psychologists, while many of the academic researchers in women's groups are sociologists and economists. Noonan, 1994: 135.

myths about rape, how widely these myths were held and by which specific groups. She discovered that psychologists and the members of the *militsia* were more prone to believing in rape myths than any other group, and also that men were more likely to believe in these myths than were women.⁶² This is only the beginning of the research that needs to be done on violence against women.

Conclusion

The independent women's movement, with its inclusion of a diverse variety of women's groups, functioned as the nurturing environment under which women could explore new ideas, including those of developing support services. The various types of assistance received from the independent women's movement and individual women's groups not only inspired those who went on to develop support services but made their development possible. In addition, the assistance Russian women's groups have given to support services has been further bolstered by women's groups in the west. As such, the impetus for the development of support services is the collaborative effort of women's groups in Russia and abroad. The effect of the Russian and foreign influences on support services, and the response of support services to these influences will be explored in the next chapter.

⁶²V.V. Ger'man, "Issledovanie mifov ob iznasilovanii" St. Petersburg University, Faculty of Psychology, Department of Professional and Management Psychology, June 1, 1993: 39. This study was obtained from the thesis advisor Natalia Khodyreva.

Chapter 4

The Post-Soviet Development of Support Services for Women Experiencing Violence

Support services in Russia for women experiencing violence, namely crisis lines and crisis centres, have arisen as a result of a number of factors and influences, originating both from within and outside of Russia. As we have already seen, women for most of the Soviet periods were not encouraged to formulate and articulate analyses of their personal lives - rather women were encouraged to concentrate on social and production priorities set by the party-state. The result was a constricted view of women's issues which did not include the issue of violence against women. In addition, while substantial levels of violence against women occurred in the Soviet periods, little effort was made by academics, law-enforcement agencies and the state to understand the impact of this violence on women's lives and thus, many of women's needs went unmet. However, in the Gorbachev and post-Soviet periods, restrictions on freedom of speech and association were lifted. This resulted in an open dialogue on the position of women in society and the formation of numerous women's groups, amongst which have been groups developing support services for women experiencing violence. As I have already discussed in Chapters 1 and 2, there were three necessary elements for the development of these support services: an environment in which violence against women existed, an environment in which the needs of women experiencing

violence were not being met, and an opportunity for those interested in developing support services to organize these support services. However, despite these necessary preconditions, support services would not have developed if women's concerns and the value of women in general were not being validated by a larger group in society - the independent Russian women's movement. As we have seen in chapter 3, the impetus for the actual development of support services was sparked by the supportive atmosphere of conferences organized by the independent women's movement.

The independent women's movement and support services for women experiencing violence are largely anomalies within the current state of the Russian economy. While most social groups are suffering from a lack of state funding, women's groups and support services, largely through foreign funding, have been able to develop a basic level of support for women experiencing violence, and are planning to expand this support in the future. In this way, support services for women experiencing violence have been able to move beyond the confines of the domestic resources available to women in Russia.

This chapter examines the ability of support services to balance the domestic and foreign factors that have facilitated their existence and in so doing also examines the ability of support services to change and be changed by Russian society. The chapter begins with an examination of the levels of violence against women and the popular images of this violence in post-Soviet Russia. This is followed by an examination of the motivations of women developing support services and the types of services developed. Finally, this chapter looks at the ways

in which women developing support services have attempted to influence society and at factors that have either bolstered or detracted from their ability to achieve this influence.

Levels of Violence Against Women in post-Soviet Russia

This section looks at the levels in Russia of the two most common forms of violence against women: rape and wife assault. With regards to the magnitude of the problem, it is difficult to get an accurate picture of the true levels of rape and wife assault because the "official" numbers given by the state are based on the numbers actually reported, and hence, do not include the many incidents that for various reasons go unreported. The difficulty of obtaining meaningful numbers is further exacerbated by the way in which rape and wife assault are recorded and later reported in statistics. Official statistics largely represent violence against women involving serious bodily injuries or death. The absence of statistics for violence involving less serious bodily injuries, which constitutes the majority of violence against women, reflects the neglect by law-enforcement of violence resulting in lesser physical and psychological injuries. It also reflects a societal indifference towards much of the violence women experience. This lack of attention and concern highlights the need for support services.

Rape

It is difficult to determine whether rates of violence against women in post-Soviet Russia are increasing or decreasing. According to a report from the Russian Ministry of the Interior in August 1993, between 1990 and 1992 the number of rapes in Russia decreased. The Ministry of the Interior states that while 15,000 rapes were reported in 1990, 14,100 were reported in 1991, and 13,600 in 1992.¹ However, according to figures provided by K.A. Tolpekin, these rape levels are similar to rape levels reported by the Russian Federation in the late 1970s and early 1980s.² With the exception of 1988 and 1989 when rape levels were 10,902 and 11,560 respectively, from 1978 to 1990 rape levels for the Russian Federation oscillated between 12,000 and 15,010. As well, the Russian Federation's National Report Prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women shows that the number of rapes reported rose again in 1993 to 14,400.³ Law-enforcement officials for the city of St. Petersburg claimed that in 1994, the number of rapes decreased

¹"MVD Notes Increase of Sexual Crimes" (Valery Yakov, *Izvestia* August 12, 1993, 8), FBIS-
USR-93-114, September 1, 1993: 17. "Ministry of Internal Affairs Warns that an Increase in Sex Crimes Has Begun," The Current Digest, Vol. 45, #32, 1993: 24-25.

²In 1978 there were 12,242 rapes, in 1979 12,526, in 1980 13,374, in 1982 13,456, in 1983 14,529, in 1984 14,447, in 1985 12,894, in 1986 12,165, in 1987 10,902, in 1988 11,560, 1989 14,597 and in 1990 15,010. K.A. Tolpekin, "Iznasilovaniia, zavershivshiesia ubistvom poterpevshikh: statistika i real'nost'," Sostoianinie i tendentsie prestuplenii v Rossiiskom Federatsii, Moscow: Research Academy of the Ministry of Interior of the Russian Federation, 1993: 108. Identical figures for the number of rapes in the Russian Federation from 1986 to 1990 are found in Prestupnost' i pravonarushenie 1990, Moscow: Iuridicheskaiia literatura, 1991:48.

³Russian Federation, Natsional'nyi doklad k chetvortoi Vsemimoi Konferentsii po polozeniiu zhenshchin (Russian Federation's National Report Prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women), 1994: 32. Also discussed in "Social Discrimination Against Women is on the Rise" (*Izvestia*, Oct. 25, p.7), The Current Digest of the Post-Soviet Press, Vol. 47, #43, 1995: 18-19.

compared to 1993.⁴ Moscow also reported a decrease in the number of rapes for the first nine months of 1995 compared to the first nine months of 1994.⁵ However despite several recorded decreases in levels of rape, overall rape figures for the Soviet and post-Soviet periods suggest that the levels of rape reported to law-enforcement agencies have not changed substantially from the Soviet periods.

The number of rapes reported to law-enforcement agencies, however, does not accurately represent the number of rapes that have occurred in Russia in the Soviet and post-Soviet periods. In general, official statistics grossly under-represent the incidence of rape for two reasons. First, women who are raped are most often reluctant to go to law-enforcement agencies. Members of law-enforcement agencies, psychologists and support service workers estimate that between 1 in 4 and 1 in 20 women raped actually file a complaint with the police.⁶ According to most experts, the fear of social stigma has made women reluctant to report rape. The social stigma of rape comes from a strong societal belief that most women who

⁴Law-enforcement report that rape along with violent assaults, and theft decreased between 5.4 and 16.2%. Press-sluzhba GUVd, St. Petersburg and Leningrad Region. "Kriminal-94: Itogi bor'by s prestupnost'iu v minuvshem godu," *Kriminalnyi Vestnik*, #5(2129), February, 1995: 1,3.

⁵For the first nine months of 1994, 289 rapes were registered while in 1995 only 280 rapes were registered in Moscow. Viktor Lykov "General-maior militsii Nikolai Kulikov: 'V bor'be s prestupnost'iu my proigraem...'," *Ogonyok*, #47, November 1995: 29.

⁶Based on information from Anatolii D'iachenko, member of the Russian Federation's Ministry of Justice 'Prestupleniia protiv polovoi neprikosnovennosti, sem'i i nraivstvennosti' only one in 4 rapes is reported to law-enforcement agencies. "Vysokaia tyomnaia tsifra," *Kultura*, April 3, 1995: 5. V. Kniazev, Lieutenant of the *militsia* for Khabarovsk Region estimates that only 1 in 8 rapes are reported to the *militsia*. V. Kniazev, "Seksualnyi terror," *Torgovaia Gazeta*, November 13, 1993: 3. According to support service workers only one in 20 to 100 women raped report this to law-enforcement agencies. El'vira Novikova, "Zhenshchiny i nasilie," *Federatsiia*, August 17, 1993: 3.

are raped acted carelessly or were being foolhardy. For instance, Valeria Zakateeva, a doctor whose letter was published in the popular family magazine *Ogonyok*, chastises a young rape victim for not thinking about her parents when she accepted a ride in a car with three young men.⁷

The second reason for the under-reporting of rapes is that law-enforcement officers will often refuse to register crimes. In the Soviet periods law-enforcement agencies attempted to match crime rates to the political objectives of the party-state.⁸ Likewise, the criminal justice system demanded that law-enforcement officers maintain high rates of crime solving. Many officers were, therefore, reluctant to register complaints of crimes which they believed would be difficult to solve.⁹

In the post-Soviet period, law-enforcement agencies have standardized their crime reporting. However, law-enforcement agencies have had to deal with a larger volume of crime in this period. Because of the volume of crime, officers have begun to prioritize the crime according to its seriousness.¹⁰ This has resulted in the tendency of certain crimes to appear to be decreasing. Given the general rise in most violent crimes, experts have suggested the decrease in rape levels is not

⁷Valeria Zakateeva, "V otstutstvie styda," *Ogonyok*, #43, October 1995: 49.

⁸V.V. Luneev, "Kontrol' nad prestupnost'iu: nadyozhny li pokazateli?" *Gosudarstvo i pravo*, #7, 1995.

⁹Luneev, 1995, 90.

¹⁰Luneev, 1995: 92-93. S.A. Daniliuk, Iu. A. Lekontsev, "Rassmotrenie zaiavlenii o prestupleniiakh: problemy i perspektivy", *Sbornik nauchnykh trudov HII MVD*, Moscow, 1993: 5-6.

realistic.¹¹

Wife Assault

Less continues to be known about wife assault than about rape. The first figures on wife assault were published in the Russian Federation's National Report Prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women in 1994. The Report revealed that 14,500 women were killed by their husbands in 1993 while another 56,400 were maimed or otherwise injured.¹² These figures are shocking when compared to the statistics compiled by the World Health Organization for other European countries. In addition, the incidence of women murdered per capita in the Russian Federation exceeds all other countries and is several times greater than in the United States.¹³

Comparing the above 1993 numbers to those from 1991, the number of women killed by their husbands in 1993 increased almost three times in the Russian Federation (from 5,300 to 14,500). Even the 1991 level is a dramatic increase from the 1989 and 1990 figures of 1,623 and 1,914 women, respectively, murdered in the

¹¹L.A. Voloshina, "Tiazhkaia nasilstvennii prestupnost' poslednego desiatiletiia v Rossii". Sostoianie i tendentii nasilstvennoi prestupnosti v Rossiskoi Federatsii. Moscow: Nauchno-issledovatel'skii institut problem ukrepleniia zakonnosti i pravoporiadka. 1993: 39-40. Tolpekin, 1993: 109.

¹²Russian Federation, Russian Federation's National Report Prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women. 1994: 32.

¹³Cited in "The feministki are coming." The Economist. August 12, 1995: 44.

Soviet Union.¹⁴ It is unclear what accounts for this sudden increase in the number of wives killed. In the past, Soviet statistics were manipulated to fit with state policies. It is possible, therefore, that the sudden increase is the product of statistical manipulation rather than reflective of a dramatic change in criminal behaviour.

The increase between 1989 and 1993 in the number of women murdered and the number of women maimed or seriously injured is startling. However, no less startling is the absence of a figure for the number of women reported beaten by their husbands. The lack of statistics available for wife-beating indicates the law-enforcement and state agencies who gathered information for the World Conference on Women did not consider wife-beating important enough to report. According to women providing support services for women experiencing violence, law-enforcement officers do not treat wife-beating seriously.¹⁵

If the post-Soviet statistics are to be believed then levels of rape have remained more or less the same in Russia since the end of the post-Stalinist period while the incidence of wife assault (in the forms of murder and grave bodily injuries), has increased dramatically. It is unclear, however, what accounts for such a dramatic increase in the level of wives murdered. One possible explanation may

¹⁴Interpol International Crime Statistics 1989-1990, Saint Cloud, International Crime Police Organization, 1991: 188-189.

¹⁵Wendy Sloane, "Domestic Abuse Is High, Attention Is Low in Russia," Christian Science Monitor, July 22, 1994: 8. James Meek, "Domestic Violence: Home is where the hurt is for women in Russia," The Ottawa Citizen, June 24, 1995: B1.

be the greater disintegration of the social fabric in Russian society in the post-Soviet period which has made families more isolated and decreased the opportunity for intervention. Soviet criminologists found that spousal murders were usually preceded by spousal assaults and the failure of law-enforcement agencies to monitor domestic offenders was a factor in the escalation of violence. However, lack of intervention in family violence was, according to some criminologists, also a problem in the Post-Stalinist and Gorbachev Period.¹⁶ Some Western studies suggest that incidents violence become more frequent in environments where stress levels are high - where there is unemployment, poverty, other forms of crime.¹⁷ While Russian society is experiencing societal stress, it is unclear why such stress would influence wife assault but not rape.

Women developing support services maintain that both rape and wife assault are increasing with the general rise of violent crimes in Russia.¹⁸ They claim that law-enforcement agencies do not wish to deal with such crimes until the crimes become extremely violent and that officers turn away complaints of rape and wife assault involving minor injuries. Statistics for both rape and wife assault may only

¹⁶V. Petelin. "Ustanovlenie umysla po delam o huliganstve," *Sovetskaya Iustitsiya*, 1990, #2, 20. A.D. Tartakovskii, N.A. Abdullaev, *Prestupleniya v sfere semeino-bytovykh otnoshenii i bor'ba s nimi*, Dushanbe: 'Donish', 1989: 110.

¹⁷Gelles and Straus list 'high levels of stress' as one of the 11 factors why families experience increased levels of conflict and violence. Murray A. Straus and Gerald T. Hotaling, eds., *The Social Causes of Husband-Wife Violence*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1980: 15-17. David Powell, however, links rising greater societal stress with rising levels of rape. David E. Powell, "Social Problems in Russia," *Current History*, October 1993: 325-326.

¹⁸For a discussion on violence in the current period see Rob Waters, "A Hotline Movement Grows in Russia," *Ms.*, November/December, 1995: 20.

reflect the incidence of serious bodily injury experienced by women. Behind the reported statistics are numerous cases of rape and wife assault which did not involve grave bodily injuries.

Although there has been no adequate explanation yet given for the trends in violence against women in post-Soviet Russia, it is clear that violence against women is a serious problem. In fact, the statistics made available on violence against women have caused a societal sensation which has resulted in a large number of articles on rape and wife assault in the popular press. Some articles have focused on the high incidence of rape and warned women not to behave carelessly.¹⁹ Other articles have graphically described brutal rapes and wife murders,²⁰ while still other articles have suggested ways in which family conflict can be reduced by improving communication and by members showing greater empathy for one another.²¹ However, articles have also appeared which focus on the impact of rape and wife assault on the women who suffer this violence. Such articles emphasize the importance of moral and psychological support to women experiencing violence.

The latter articles were written from journalists' interviews with women

¹⁹"MVD Notes Increase of Sexual Crimes" (Valery Yakov, *Izvestia* August 12, 1993, 8), FBIS: USR-93-114, September 1, 1993: 17.

²⁰Nina Antonian, "Ne liudi," *Rabotnitsa*, November 1993: 14-15. N. Astafev, E. Serova "My byli bezzashchitny pered man'iakom," *Moskovskaia Pravda*, March 4, 1992: 1, 8.

²¹Igor Skripiuk, "Milye braniatsia," *Smena*, June 5, 1993: 6. Aleksandr Nikonov, "Boi sovmestnogo znacheniiia," *Ogonyok*, #30, June 30, 1995: 53.

developing support services for women experiencing violence.²² The articles focus not on the need to fear violence or the need to condemn its perpetrators but on the need to provide its victims with support and compassion. Although rape and wife assault in its various forms are crimes, the importance of this violence for women developing support services is that it has a profoundly negative effect on women. The trauma following rape or wife assaults exists regardless of whether or not the violence is formally acknowledged as a crime by the criminal justice system.

In addition, the articles emphasize that a woman is never responsible for the violence perpetrated against her. A woman's actions and behaviours do not provoke or incite rape or other violence. The decision to use violence, whether sexual or physical is always made by the perpetrator.²³

The assertions made by those developing support services that women do not provoke violence contrasts sharply with the assertions of some criminologists who have also been interviewed in the mass media. For instance, in a series of articles, Dmitri Shestakov - one of five leading Russian researchers on family violence - has claimed that women share a large responsibility for spousal violence and are often even aggressors. Shestakov in one interview maintained that "an abused spouse always shares part of the blame for the violence perpetrated".²⁴ In

²²Some examples of articles written from interviews include: Tat'iana Gur'ianova, "Glavnoe - poljubut' sebia," *Moskovskii Komsomolets*, August 12, 1994: 2; Marina Goncharenko, "I v Rossii i v Amerike muzhchiny uzbivaiut zhenshchiny - v Amerike eto schitaetsia prestupleniem, v Rossii - istoricheskoi traditsiei," *Smena*, December 2, 1994: 6; Isaak Glan, "B'iut zhenshchiny," *Kuranty*, September 2, 1995: 7.

²³Gur'ianova, "Glavnoe": 2; Goncharenko, "I v Rossii": 6

²⁴See Lina Zernova, "Muzh i zheny - odna satana?" *Smena*, January 12, 1994: 5.

another interview, Shestakov disputes statistics which show women to be the primary victims of spousal violence. Shestakov claims that although official statistics on family violence show that the ratio of female to male murders is 1:8, in fact this does not accurately reflect violence perpetrated by women. He argues that women are more cunning and more easily conceal their crimes than do men.²⁵ In a third interview, Shestakov claims that it is the wife's propensity to use harsh and condemning language in response to their husbands' drunkenness that leads to violence.²⁶

Motivations for the Development of Support Services

Two primary motivations for women's involvement in the development of support services for women experiencing violence have been a belief in the injustice of violence against women and a belief that the needs of women experiencing violence have not been met by existing services. Many of the women involved in support services consider rape and wife assault to be fundamentally wrong, and to infringe on women's integrity of the person. Violence against women is also understood by some women, such as the assistant director of the Moscow Crisis Centre for Women, to be a fundamental violation of women's basic human rights.²⁷

²⁵The interview appeared in both Russian and English editions of Moscow News. See Viktoria Voloshina "Russia to Legislate on Domestic Violence," *Moscow News*, #20-21, June 2-8, 1995: 22; Viktoria Voloshina, "'Amerikanskaia tragediia' po-russki," *Moscow News*, #26, May 21-28, 1995: 22.

²⁶Elena Berezina, "Suprug opasnei killera," *Ogonyok*, #9, February 1996: 44.

²⁷Violence against women as a violation of basic human rights was added to United Nations Declaration on Human Rights in 1993. For a discussion of how this Declaration has informed Russian

Those developing support services have adopted an explanation for violence against women found in the United Nations declaration on 'On the Eradication of Violence Against Women'. The declaration states that:

Violence is the product of historical inequality between men and women, which led to the domination of women and men's discrimination against women. Violence is one of the main social mechanisms by which women are forced into subservient roles to men in the economy, politics and social life.²⁸

Those developing support services also believe that using violence against women is a learned response which is derived from social conditioning. The legitimacy of using violence is reinforced when there are no functioning sanctions against it. Blaming the victims perpetuates the violence by transferring negative sanctions from the perpetrators to the victims. To delegitimise the use of violence against women, those developing support services focus on the ways in which the behaviour of women suffering violence differs little from the behaviour of the average woman.²⁹

Women involved in support services believe that the harm caused by violence against women cannot be mediated solely through a criminal justice process which only concentrates on the perpetrator of the crime.³⁰ They

support services see "Mirovye soobshchestvo protiv nasiliia". Institute for Youth; Centre for the Problems of Women and Children; *Syostry. How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*. Moscow: Press-Solo, 1995: 13-18.

²⁸Institute for Youth Centre for the Problems of Women and Children; *Syostry. How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*. Moscow: Press-Solo, 1995: 16.

²⁹Institute for Youth Centre for the Problems of Women and Children; *Syostry. How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*. Moscow: Press-Solo, 1995: 19-27.

³⁰Martina Vandenberg, interview, Moscow, May 6, 1995. Waters, 1995: 20.

acknowledge that the Soviet criminal justice system which took this approach, and its successor the criminal justice system of the Russian Federation, have not diminished the harm done to women experiencing violence. For example, the director of the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syosty', in her studies in the early 1980s discovered this shortcoming in the Soviet system's approach to psychopathology.³¹ The director observed that, although the harm done to victims of rape formed the basis for considering rape a crime, the nature of the harm done to victims of rape was neglected by academics studying rape and functioned as only a minor factor in evaluating rape as a crime. The shortcomings of the Soviet approach to violence against women was further reinforced for the director when friends of hers were raped and received little help from the criminal justice system. In another example, the director of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women was a battered wife in the 1980s.³² The director looked for a Soviet analysis of wife assault that could assist her in overcoming her personal trauma but found that Soviet literature on family and spousal violence were of no assistance. The focus of this literature was on the perpetrators of family and spousal violence and the culpability of the victim (see chapter 2). The director, however, did not feel culpable in the violence she experienced.³³

Those developing support services found that not only were law-enforcement

³¹Natalia Gaidarenko, interview, Moscow, May 11, 1995.

³²Linda Percival, "Where Abused Women Speak Out," *The Moscow Times*, January 11, 1994: 24.

³³Natalia Khodyreva, interview, St. Petersburg, January 10, 1995.

officers not sympathetic to the needs of women experiencing violence, but neither were professionals, such as psychologists and lawyers, nor were women's friends and families.³⁴ All of these groups blamed the women experiencing violence for bringing violence upon themselves rather than providing them with support, although there were exceptions to these general trends. Some families were supportive. However, even when professionals, family and friends wanted to be supportive, they did not know how to assist women who had experienced violence.³⁵

Many of those involved in developing support services have, like the director of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women, personal experiences with violence or, like the director of the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostry', have known women who had experienced violence. Others, like the assistant director of the Moscow Crisis Centre for Women, have come to develop support services after they learned of the number of women in Russia experiencing violence. The assistant director of the Moscow Crisis Centre for Women is, in addition to her work with support services, a researcher at the Russian Academy of Science's Institute for Socio-Economic Problems in Moscow. Through a questionnaire distributed to women working in her institute in 1992, the assistant director discovered high levels of wife assault. Although her questionnaire focused on women's rights and not on violence, many women provided the assistant director

³⁴Lori Cidylo, "Russia discovers the rape victim," *Financial Times*, August 13/14, 1994: 15. Mike Trickey, "Russian women explode myth of equality," *Calgary Herald*, July 28, 1994: A10.

³⁵Gur'ianova, "Glavnoe", 1994: 2

with a detailed account of the violence they experienced from their husbands.³⁶

Types of Support Services

It is not clear when the first support services for women experiencing violence were developed in Russia. Some services opened in the early 1990s which provided support to women, along with giving support to other groups such as children. For example, Natalia Khodyreva in 1991, together with Marina Aristova, Olga Kocharin and Igor Lunin, opened a sexual assault crisis line in a psychological clinic for children in St. Petersburg. The crisis line's director, Igor Lunin, agreed to provide assistance to any women calling the line in return for Khodyreva's, Aristova's, and Kocharin's work on the line. For reasons undisclosed to the organizers, the crisis line was closed the following year.³⁷ Khodyreva speculates that the state was not yet ready to admit that sexual violence was widespread.

When they began, some support services consisted of single individuals helping women in crisis. The director of the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre, prior to her work with 'Syostry', counselled women experiencing violence two days a week over the telephone through the agency '*Dusha cheloveka*' (The Human Soul Foundation).³⁸ The assistant director of the Moscow Crisis Centre for women also first worked alone. As the Crisis Centre expanded, she was joined by

³⁶Marina Pisklakova, interview, Repino, June 10, 1995.

³⁷Natalia Khodyreva, "Sexism and Sexual Abuse in Russia," Chris Corrin, ed., Violence Against Women in the Former East-Block, Glasgow University, 1995 (In Print).

³⁸Tatiana Zabelina, "Sisters," Woman Plus, #1, 1995: 15.

first one woman and later by another eight women.³⁹

Many crisis centres in Russia, like the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre which opened in October 1994, have begun with a crisis line. Some, like the Moscow Crisis Centre for Women, have combined a crisis line with other counselling activities. The Moscow Crisis Centre for Women which opened in October 1992, was the first crisis centre in Russia specifically organized for women, and offers personal counselling to people referred to the Centre by Moscow social workers.⁴⁰ The St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women which opened in March 1995 also provides face-to-face counselling to women experiencing violence. Only a few crisis centres, such as the St. Petersburg Women's Centre 'Violence Against Women and Sexism', do not have a crisis line but have opened a shelter for women.⁴¹

In all, according to the Russian Federation's National Report to the World Conference on Women, in 1993, there were thirteen crisis centres organized for women or for women and children experiencing violence. These were located in Ulan-Ude, Tiumeni, Perm, Vokruta, Moscow, Izhevsk, Kursk Region, Samar Region, the Republic of Dagestan, and Saratov Region.⁴² In addition, the assistant director

³⁹Pisklakova, interview, June 10, 1995.

⁴⁰Gabriele Luke, "Women in the New Russia," Current Politics and Economics of Russia, Vol. 4, #2, 1996: 92.

⁴¹Marina Aristova, Director of the St. Petersburg Women's Centre 'Violence Against Women and Sexism', secured an agreement with the St. Petersburg Mayor's Office to open a women's shelter in June 1995.

⁴²Russian Federation, Russian Federation's National Report Prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women, 1994: 33-34.

of the Moscow Crisis Centre stated that in 1995, crisis centres for women were also operating in Ekaterinberg, St. Petersburg, Sergei Posad, Nizhnii Novgorod, Nizhnii Tagin and Tomsk.⁴³ Adele Barker, an American researcher working with Russian support services in 1996, located additional support services for women in Murmansk, Naberezhnye Chelny, Petrozavodsk and Shakhty.⁴⁴ These reports show that support services for women experiencing violence are rapidly growing in Russia.

Plans for Expansion

Most crisis centres would like to expand the types of services they offer. Those offering crisis lines would also like to provide face-to-face counselling and support groups. Many would also like to provide shelters or transition houses for women experiencing violence. Most are trying to increase the quality of assistance they can provide women by securing contacts with lawyers, medical personnel, and social workers who are willing to make their services available to crisis centre clients.⁴⁵

In general, those developing crisis centres consider violence against women to be part of the broader issue of women's treatment in society, and hence are seeking to address a wide spectrum of concerns. One of these aspects is the legal

⁴³Pisklakova, interview, Repino, June 10, 1995.

⁴⁴Adele Barker, "Forum: The Domestic Violence Project," *Women East-West*, September 1996: 15-16.

⁴⁵Nadezhda Os'minina, "Zhenskaia skoraia," *Rabotnitsa*, May 1994, #5: 5-6.

nature of the problem. To address this, some crisis centres, like the centre 'Syosty', are seeking ways to develop closer connections with law-enforcement agencies. This is important since law-enforcement and support services currently work in isolation from one another. Law-enforcement agencies have been given information about support services for women but have not commented on the existence of these services and have not as yet referred women to crisis centres for support.⁴⁶ Crisis centres recognize that cooperation with law-enforcement agencies could lead to opportunities to help more women. Cooperation with law-enforcement agencies could also provide an opportunity for crisis workers to educate law-enforcement officers on women's experience with violence. This could make more friendly the process that women experiencing violence undergo when they approach law-enforcement agencies.⁴⁷ The distance between the two groups is demonstrated by the fact that, presently, crisis workers do not recommend that all women who approach them file complaints with law-enforcement agencies. This is often the case because the benefit of this action, if any, often does not justify the trauma which the woman will invariably experience.⁴⁸ Law-enforcement, as well, has yet to acknowledge a benefit that working together with support services could provide to their work. For example, a potential benefit could include reducing case loads by

⁴⁶Gaidarenko, interview, May 10, 1995.

⁴⁷According to M. Kacheva, a criminal expert at the Institute for court evidence, over 80% of young women who file rape charges with law-enforcement agencies attempt to commit suicide. Cited in *How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*, 1995: 22.

⁴⁸However, filing a complaint with law-enforcement agencies is sometimes the only means by which women who have suffered violence can receive the medical treatment they need. Genine Babakian, "Half Russia's Murders: Husbands Kill Wives". *The Moscow News*, April 19, 1995: 1-2.

channelling women to other agencies better suited to resolving the situation, or when a lack of evidence makes it difficult for law-enforcement to invoke the criminal justice system.

In general, members of law-enforcement agencies hold many negative perceptions of women experiencing violence. For example, Yevgenii Riabstev, the head of the Russian Ministry of Interior's public relations section, blames women for domestic violence, and in reference to spousal violence in one interview Riabstev stated, "After marriage, many women don't look after themselves. They let themselves go physically, and their husbands lose interest."⁴⁹ Many law-enforcement officers also hold victims of rape responsible for this violence. For example, when the staff of a St. Petersburg hotline distributed a questionnaire to one local *militsia* station that asked them questions regarding the *militsia*'s attitudes about rape and rape victims, they found that most of the *militsia* believed that "women can avoid rape by protesting", "women are responsible for rape if they wear provocative clothes or if they go to a man's place to listen to music", "only young, pretty women are raped", or "women willingly participate in sex and later call it rape."⁵⁰ Given these biases, the ability of crisis centres to work together with law-enforcement will largely depend on the ability of crisis workers to change these negative opinions.

In contrast to law-enforcement, some members of other groups, such as

⁴⁹Cited in Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project, Russia: Neither Jobs Nor Justice: State Discrimination Against Women in Russia, March 1995, Vol. 7, #5: 2.

⁵⁰Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project, 1995: 24.

criminologists, have in the post-Soviet period recognized the need for support services.⁵¹ The Russian state has also recognized the need - through its Report to the World Conference on Women⁵² - and has understood that crisis centres benefit both women and the criminal justice system.

Factors Facilitating the Development of Support Services

Several factors have facilitated the logistical development of support services for women in Russia. Some of the most significant factors have been: the ability of women to meet other women interested in developing support services (see Chapter 3), access to foreign resource materials, information on foreign support service models, as well as the cooperation with foreigners, who have provided moral support, financial and infrastructural support.

Exposure to foreign materials and models has been significant to the development of support services in Russia; these materials have been used to compensate for the lack of a Russian model for developing women's support services. The direct influence of foreign materials and models in support services has been observed in several key instances in Moscow and St. Petersburg. For instance, the director of the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostry' was inspired by Penny Parker Ford, a psychologist in Salt Lake City, who used the 12

⁵¹S. B. Maksimov, V. P. Revin, Nasil'stvennyye prestupleniia v sfere semeino-bytovykh otnoshenii i problemy ikh profilaktiki, Moscow: MVD Academy, 1993: 41.

⁵²Russian Federation, Russian Federation's National Report Prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women, 1994: 33-34.

Steps Program, originally developed for treating alcoholism, to help childhood victims of sexual assault.⁵³ In other examples, the assistant director of the Moscow Crisis Centre for Women found her models in Swedish support services,⁵⁴ while the director of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women found her co-counselling models in foreign books on feminist therapy.⁵⁵

The influence of foreign materials and models has been more indirect in other regions of the country. It has come primarily through conferences and publications. For instance, in 1993, a seminar "Women, Youth, Violence" was held in the Moscow Institute of Youth which included three foreign presenters: Lee Lakeman from the Canadian Association of Sexual Recovery Centres, Lisa Hoffman (an American volunteer with women's shelters) and Melissa Stone (an American self defense trainer).⁵⁶ Many participants of the seminar came from smaller cities outside of Moscow.⁵⁷ In June 1994, a second conference was organized entitled "Violence in the Treatment of Women" in which American specialists provided information on medical aid for rape victims. Once again, the conference was

⁵³Gaidarenko, interview, May 11, 1995.

⁵⁴Pisklakova, interview, June 10, 1995.

⁵⁵Natalia Khodyreva, interview, January 10, 1995.

⁵⁶The seminar was organized jointly by the Centre for the Gender Studies and the Problems of Women and the Family, 'Syostry' and Moscow Crisis Line for Children and Teenagers. Tatiana Zabelina, "Itogi seminar v Institute Molodyozhi," *Vv i My - The Women's Dialogue*, #9, Spring 1994: 24.

⁵⁷The report on the seminar mentions participants from Astrakhan, Ekaterinburg, Nizhnii Novgorod, Rzhnev, Riazan, and Dmitrov. Zabelina, 1994: 24.

attended by many people from cities outside of Moscow.⁵⁸ Another important indirect influence was the 1995 'Syosty' compilation of the presentations of the 1993 and 1994 conferences into a manual entitled "How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre" which was distributed free of charge to all those expressing an interest in it.⁵⁹

An important source of foreign influence on support services in Russia has come through Americans living in Russia. Two women in particular - Martina Vandenberg and Lisa Hoffman - have played important roles in the development of support services. Vandenberg, a student of Soviet Studies, met Soviet women who had been raped but had received no support, while in the Soviet Union in 1990 involved in research.⁶⁰ Vandenberg, who had experience with both American and British support services, was determined to develop support services for women in the Soviet Union. After completing her education, she returned to Russia and organized a group of Russians and foreigners interested in developing support services. Since then, this group has expanded and now forms the board of directors for 'Syosty'. Through her involvement with Russian support services, Vandenberg has greatly assisted Russian women in developing western contacts. For example, Vandenberg was instrumental in sending the director of the Moscow

⁵⁸The conference was organized by 'Syosty'. For a discussion see Tatiana Zabelina, "Sisters," Woman Plus, #1, 1995: 17.

⁵⁹Institute for Youth Centre for the Problems of Women and Children; *Syosty, How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*, 1995.

⁶⁰Vandenberg, interview, Moscow, May 6, 1995.

Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syosty' for training to Santa Monica, California in January 1994.⁶¹ She also helped members of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women travel to the United States. In 1995, Vandenberg was involved in an American funding consortium for post-Soviet women known as the Winrock Foundation. In this role, she continued to facilitate the development of support services by making available financing for purchases of office equipment such as computers.⁶²

Lisa Hoffman has also played an important role in Russian support services. She, like Vandenberg, is a student of Soviet Studies and has a background in American support services. Hoffman has travelled throughout Russia, giving interviews and lectures on the need for Russian society to address violence against women as a serious problem and the need to develop support services.⁶³ She has made an important contribution to developing projects that document the level of violence against women currently occurring in Russia.

Western involvement in Russian support services has provided women in Russia with important moral support. This has been facilitated through personal contacts between Russian and foreign women but has also been facilitated through the provision of computers and electronic mail to women in various parts of Russia. Linking women in Russia together through an electronic mail network has been the

⁶¹Zabelina, "Sisters," 1995: 16.

⁶²Martina Vandenberg, "Women's Consortium CIS - USA," *Woman Plus*, #1, 1995: 9-10.

⁶³Lisa Hoffman, presentation to 'Violence Against Women Workshop' at "Feminist Theory and Practice East-West Conference," Repino, Russia, June 10, 1995.

project of The East-West Women's Network. This American agency has helped install e-mail in 10 cities across Russia.⁶⁴ Electronic mail has also given women in Russia a direct link to women abroad through news groups such as the 'Women's East-West Conference'.

The existence of support services in Russia is largely the result of the financial and infrastructural support they have received in Russia and from abroad. As we have seen in Chapter 3, some of this support came from other women's groups within Russia. However, some Russian institutions and businesses have also been an important source of support. For instance, the Moscow Crisis Centre for Women first began when the institute at which the assistant director was an employee offered her the use of a room and a telephone line. In another example, the director of the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostry' received support from the Human Soul Foundation to run a crisis line. The St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women has received two rooms and the use of several telephone lines from Sovinkom bank.⁶⁵ In addition, the Russian Federation's National Report to the World Conference on Women states that a crisis centre for women was organized by the Burliat Ministry of Social Support in Ulan-Ude. The municipality of Vorkuta has organized support services for women through the centre for social help to families and children 'Vozrozhdenie'. In

⁶⁴Network of East-West Women, "NEWW ON-LINE: Proekt 'seti zhenshchin vostoka i zapada' po organizatsii elektronnoi svyazi" (pamphlet), 1995. For information about the e-mail project see also "Electronic Communications: A New Way to 'Talk'," Network of East-West Women, Winter 1994:1, 3.

⁶⁵Khodyreva, interview, April 12, 1995.

Saratov, there are three shelters for adults and children funded by the government.⁶⁶

Obstacles to the Development of Support Services

A major obstacle in the development of support services in Russia for women experiencing violence has been the development of infrastructure. Specifically, a major challenge has been the securing of building space, telephone lines and funding. For the Moscow group 'Syostry', this process took over a year. In another example, the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women was only able to secure a location through the use of personal connections and persistence. In this case, a tip from a friend of one the crisis centre organizers' indicated that the St. Petersburg director of Sovinkom bank would be attending a cocktail party. Several crisis workers appeared uninvited and approached the director for support. This was followed up by six months of intense negotiations, which finally resulted in the support they now receive.

One of the reasons crisis centres find it difficult to procure space is because the changing economic conditions are unfavourable for supporting charitable organizations. Furthermore, there is a general lack of knowledge about crisis centres, particularly the absolute requirement that their locations remain anonymous, in order to protect the employees and women seeking help from further violence. In the case of the Moscow Crisis Centre for Women, initial space and

⁶⁶Russian Federation, Russian Federation's National Report Prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women, 1994: 33-34.

telephone lines have been provided; however, plans for a women's shelter have not yet been realized because finding a location that will be kept secret and at a reasonable price has not been possible. One location had been found but had to be abandoned when neighbours learned of the proposed shelter for their area.⁶⁷ A second location was no longer viable because the landlords would only make it available at commercial rates.

Even existing building space can be jeopardized if its location becomes known. 'Syostry' was forced to find a new location for its crisis centre after a television news crew, following an interview with crisis centre workers, filmed its address and advertized its location. The crew had been warned ahead of time that it could do neither.⁶⁸

The Problem of State Funding

Although many organizations providing social support in Russia receive state funding, groups developing support services are concerned that state funding could jeopardize the freedom that organizers currently enjoy in the structuring and operating of support services. One of the fears expressed is that state 'interference'

⁶⁷ Os'minina, 1994: 5-6.

⁶⁸This incident was recounted by 'Syostry' coordinator Tatiana Lipovskaia in the 'Violence Against Women Workshop' at the 'Feminist Theory and Practice East-West Conference', Repino, Russia, June 10, 1995. Anonymity has become an important issue for women's crisis centres following the rape and beating of one crisis worker in St. Petersburg by her client's husband. Until this point the location of the crisis centre had been published. Lindsay Percival, "Where Abused Women Speak Out," *The Moscow Times*, January 11, 1994: 24. In another incident a crisis worker in Sochi was killed. See "Zhertvam iznasilovaniia pomogut," *Vecherniaia Moskva*, April 20, 1994: 1.

could result in a shift in the focus of support services.⁶⁹ Presently, many support services are run with a combination of volunteers and staff with psychological training. The criteria for choosing volunteers and staff is their sensitivity to women experiencing violence and their ability to effectively provide support. However, state agencies have generally focused more on a person's training than on a person's sensitivity to women.

In addition, receiving state funding makes groups vulnerable to the whims of social and political policies. As mentioned earlier, the sexual assault crisis line in a psychological clinic for children in St. Petersburg was suddenly closed without explanation in 1992, after being open for a year. Economic instability in Russia also makes government funding for social groups difficult to rely upon.⁷⁰

Russian financial support, when available, has also not been able to fund support services to the same degree as have foreign agencies. For example, foreign agencies have funded conferences and the publication of books.⁷¹ They have also funded the procurement of up-to-date office equipment such as

⁶⁹The ways in which government funding changed the focus of Canadian support services is discussed in Gillian Walker, "The Conceptual Politics of Struggle: Wife Battering, the Women's Movement, and the State," *Studies in Political Economy*, #33, Autumn 1990: 63-90.

⁷⁰Maria Gaidash, a Deputy to the Russian State Duma, in an interview with *Nezavisimaja gazeta* stated that the state has no money available for crisis centres and hospices for adult victims of domestic violence, and a network of professional retraining of medical personnel, social workers, lawyers and law-enforcement officers to make the new law on family violence fully effective. Maria Adamushkina "Domestic Violence? There is No Such Problem" (*Nezavisimaja gazeta*, Oct. 31: 6), *The Current Digest*, Vol. 47, #44, 1995: 18.

⁷¹For a discussion of particular conferences and publications funded by foreign agencies see Zabelina, "Sisters," 1995:15-17; Institute for Youth Centre for the Problems of Women and Children; *Syostry*, *How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre*, 1995: 26-27.

photocopiers, computers, printers and fax machines. Foreign funds have also provided for multimedia equipment such as tape recorders, television sets, VCRs and video cameras to enable support services to better document the work they are doing. Access to such technologies has made it possible for support services to extend the scope of their activities beyond the direct provision of support to individual women. Access to technology has also made groups able to focus on the education of society and professionals regarding appropriate ways to respond to women experiencing violence (such as feeling empathy as opposed to passing judgement).

The Influence of Support Services on Russian Society

Public Education

Those involved in support services have long realized the importance of an increased sensitivity to the needs of women experiencing violence. One way of attempting to increase the sensitivity is through public education, which has taken many forms from mass media interviews to public appearances and published materials.

In general, an inexpensive and yet effective means by which Russian support services have educated the public is through newspaper articles. In these articles, organizers focus on the severity of women's suffering and seek to expel the myth that victims are to blame for the violence perpetrated against them, pointing out that it is the assailant who chooses to commit the violent act. Through articles,

organizers are able to anonymously share the life histories of women who have sought help. These stories help to show the common situation where women were in no way responsible for the violence perpetrated against them and yet have been treated unjustly by their families and by law-enforcement agencies.⁷² The director of the Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostry', in one newspaper article, relays the story of a woman in her forties who after being raped was told by the *militzia* not to make a fuss because after all she had long ago lost her virginity.⁷³ Through such examples, organizers try to bring to light the hurtful and inhumane attributes common in Russian society, and in this way to counteract the prevailing myths about rape and wife assault - particularly the myth which is the most insidious of all - that women themselves provoke rape.

The Need for Reliable Data

Another important aspect of public education is that of reporting reliable data obtained through research. Support service organizers have recognized a need to research the levels of violence against women and public attitudes regarding such violence. Currently in progress in Russia is a comprehensive research project on violence against women.⁷⁴ The project has several objectives. The first objective

⁷²Marina Domashenko, "Sama vinovata?" *Dochki-Materi*, #1, *Argumenty i Fakty*, 1995: 2; Valerii Kanaev, "V Rossii ot seksual'nogo nasilia ne zastrakhovana ni odna zhenshchina," *Megapolis Express*, September 21, 1994: 7.

⁷³Babakian, 1995:1-2.

⁷⁴Natalia Khodyreva, presentation at "The Effects of Physical and Sexual Violence on the Health of Women" (Round Table), World Health Organization, St. Petersburg, April 12, 1995, 10:00-12:00.

is to determine and demonstrate the extent of violence against women in Russia. In order to do this, information is being gathered from the various crisis centres for women. It is anticipated, that this information, gathered from the operation of all existing support services for women experiencing violence, will finally provide a clear indication that violence is widespread and a serious problem. In conjunction with this objective, a day of action known as '*Den' Zvonka*' (Day of Telephone Calls) was organized. On this day women who had experienced violence were asked to call their local crisis line to record this violence.⁷⁵

The second objective of the research project is to obtain an understanding of the public's ideas regarding violence through the use of questionnaires.⁷⁶ Those involved in support services realize that by discovering the incongruencies in the perceptions of the Russian population, they become better able to effectively draft their public education strategies. Interesting examples of some preliminary results are that men and women often consider women to hold the main power in families. In parallel with this, however, women who regard themselves as powerful also report that they have suffered verbal and physical abuses.⁷⁷ It is hoped that this research will better explain the origins of these attitudes and ideas surrounding violence.

⁷⁵*Den' Zvonka* was coordinated by the Association of Women's Crisis Centres and occurred on May 22, 1995. "VseRossiiskaia aktsiia 'Bezopastnost' zhenshchiny'," Petersburgskii Krizisnyi psikhologicheskii tsentr dlia zhenshchin (pamphlet), May 1995.

⁷⁶Questionnaires distributed to members of law-enforcement are also included in this research project. Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project, 1995: 24.

⁷⁷Pisklakova who had conducted this research relayed these findings to a meeting of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women on June 8, 1995.

Professionals: Their Attitudes and Influence

Another component of the research project is to measure how widely and how strongly myths about rape and wife assault are held by Russian professionals. This research is particularly important to those working in support services because many have had difficulty finding sympathetic professionals (lawyers, psychologists and medical personnel) to refer their clients to – professionals who do not blame the victim for the violence that has occurred. One woman who had been raped was told by her lawyer to go back and be raped a second time, but this time with a witness so that there would be some evidence. Another woman who had been raped was told by her psychotherapist to have sex with him in order to overcome her fear of men.⁷⁸ A better knowledge of the most common myths held by professionals would help support service organizers to structure specific educational programs targeting professionals.

It is important to educate professionals because professionals continue to command a great deal of respect in Russian society, especially those involved in state supported organizations. The comments professionals make regarding violence against women have a considerable impact on society. This can be seen in the example of Alexander Sanich, the director of 'Iuventa' - an agency which provides health services to children and adolescents. At a round table discussion in St. Petersburg on the effects of physical and sexual violence on the health of women, Sanich made some highly controversial statements about the role played

⁷⁸Babakian, 1995:1-2.

by girls in sexual violence.⁷⁹ He stated that "some people are perpetual victims" and that "many times girls do not know how to behave in social situations". "If girls would be taught the ABC's of love, many incidents of sexual violence could be avoided." When asked by a crisis worker about the responsibility that lies with men and boys in such situations and the need to influence that behaviour, Sanich admitted that this too, was important. Sanich's words were heard far beyond the small gathering in attendance at the round table. His comments that teaching girls how to conduct themselves in different social situations was an important preventative measure against rape were later broadcast in the St. Petersburg women's radio program *Vera, Nadezhda, Liubov'* (Faith, Hope and Love). His comments were given the preamble "here - mothers and grandmothers - is what we can do for our children". Absent from the broadcast was the pointed question to the director posed by the crisis worker.⁸⁰

In waging public education campaigns, support services must also struggle with the biases of the media. Newspaper editors often mock and sensationalize violence against women by placing articles about support services next to photographs of partially nude women.⁸¹

Some groups have taken direct steps to improve the media coverage they receive. For instance, members of the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre

⁷⁹"The Effects of Physical and Sexual Violence on the Health of Women" (Round Table), World Health Organization, St. Petersburg, April 12, 1995, 10:00-12:00.

⁸⁰*Programa Vera, Nadezhda, Liubov'*, Petersburgskii kanal, May 22, 1995, 12:30-13:00.

⁸¹Olga Zaimaia, "Telefon doveria spasite vashi dushi!" *On i Ona*, #20, 1994: 3.

for Women identify members of the media who often cover stories about women and provide them with information about the dynamics of violence against women, victims and perpetrators.⁸² The Centre also provides the media with information about the current position of women in Russian society. This Centre also uses this process when dealing with professionals - especially with psychologists and legal specialists. Academic studies - particularly those which have been highly reputed in the west and which substantiate the need to sympathize with victims of violence - are passed on to professionals by crisis workers. The influencing of journalists and professionals on a personal basis is a long term strategy.

Those developing support services have also attempted to influence members of the Russian Duma. For instance, those developing support services have been one of the main proponents of a new administrative law on family violence which includes a stipulation that social services, such as shelters for women and children, be developed across the country. The proposed law also stipulates that law-enforcement, medical and social agencies be obliged to take action in cases of family violence. However, although the law has the support of many female deputies to the Duma, it is unclear whether it will pass.⁸³ Despite the future of the proposed law, those developing support services have made valuable contacts with criminologists and legislators interested in decreasing levels of family

⁸²Natalia Khodyreva, interview, St. Petersburg, April 12, 1995.

⁸³For a discussion of the proposed law see Maria Adamushkina, "Nasilie v sem'e? net problemy - Tak schitaet muzhskoe bol'shinstvo Gosudarstvennoi Dumi, RF," *Nezavisimaya gazeta*, October 31, 1995: 6; Elena Berezina, Galina Bryntseva, "Kuda bezhat' iz domashnego ada? Segodnia - nekuda. A vot zavtra..." *Ogonyok*, #9, February, 1996: 46-47.

in Russian society. These contacts may provide opportunities for further collaborative efforts.

At the same time, support services are attempting to make themselves more visible to the public and politicians. In Moscow members of 'Syostry', since March 1995, have been involved in a protest march to the Russian White House known as 'Women in Black'.⁸⁴ Dressed in black and walking in silence, women protest all forms of violence. Other groups have joined 'Syostry' in these protests, such as the Committee of Soldiers' Mothers, and buddhist monks. This form of protest has also been adopted by the St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women.⁸⁵ The Crisis Centre, who was joined in the protest by the lesbian women's organization SAFO, used the demonstration as an opportunity to distribute to the public informational leaflets with the Centre's telephone number.

Another goal of support service education has been the targeting of those people who might wish to start their own support services. Those interested are given specially prepared materials on how to start their own support services. The materials are a compilation of translated materials originally printed in other languages and of new materials published by Russians involved in Support Services. As mentioned earlier, the publication "How to Start and Manage

⁸⁴Gaidarenko, interview, May 11, 1995.

⁸⁵In St. Petersburg, on May 18, 1995 the protest took the form of a walk along main city streets with stops at historical locations such as the Winter Palace for short speeches. "Zhenshchiny v chyornom 18 maia v 17 chasov - traurnoe shestvie protesta protiv nasiliia" (pamphlet), Kruzhnyi Prikhodicheskii Tsentr dlia zhenshchin; Tsentre Gednemykh Problem; Dvizhenie "Soldatskie materi Sankt- Petersburga"; Klub professional'no aktivnykh zhenshchin; Zhenskaia Gumanitarnaia kollegiia' Safo - Petersburg, May 1995. Olesia Cherevach, "V chernykh odezhdash peshkom k svetlomy bydyshchemu," Chas Pik, May 19, 1995: 1.

Women's Crisis Centre" was mostly written by members of 'Syosty'.⁸⁶ The book gives historical information about support service development in Russia and discusses philosophical bases for running services, as well as logistical considerations.

Self Defense Training

Although those running support services do not believe that women are responsible for the violence they experience, crisis workers do believe that women can make themselves less vulnerable.⁸⁷ Women can be more aware of their surroundings and the most dangerous places. Women are particularly encouraged to attend self-defense courses. These courses are meant to empower women and decrease women's feelings of physical vulnerability. Due to culturally ingrained responses, women in Russia do not readily physically protest against assailants. Soviet studies of rape have shown that in many cases women did not physically protest sexual violence despite the fact that no weapon was used and the women were not incapacitated.⁸⁸ A goal of self defense training is to empower women to overcome their inhibitions and protest sexual violence. Some Western studies have shown that when women resist, as much as seventy percent of the time they can

⁸⁶ How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre, 1995.

⁸⁷ See Natalia Manushkina, "I vse-taki nado perezhit'," Opasnost' Bez opasnost', April, 1995: 46-47.

⁸⁸ D. Rivman found in a study that in 12.6% of registered rapes victims could have protested but did not. Cited in Iu. M. Antonian, V.P. Golubov, Iu. N. Kudriakov, Iznasilovanie: Prichiny i preduprezhenie. Moscow: Ministry of the Interior, 1990: 25.

terminate the situation with no greater injury to themselves.⁸⁹

Self defense classes for women are something completely new to Russia. In many ways they contradict the current cultural trends which valorize women's helpless femininity. Even law-enforcement agents recommend in a newspaper article that women talk to their assailants rather than protest physically.⁹⁰ They claim that physical protest can escalate the level of violence in many situations whereas women through psychological manipulation can defuse a dangerous situation. It may be true that physical protest has not always been effective but law-enforcement agents fail to consider that the ineffectiveness may be a result of a lack of training in self defense techniques. Without knowledge of the most vulnerable areas on a person's body and strategies for quickly removing oneself from a dangerous situation, physical protest may simply cause an assailant pain without giving the victim an opportunity to run away.

Likewise, psychological preparedness aids a person in getting out of a dangerous situation. Many people, however, do not have the presence of mind in

⁸⁹According to Melissa L. Stone, 75% of rapes can be averted through physical resistance. See Melissa L. Stone "Coping with Violence: Self-Defence Courses Empower Russian Women," Surviving Together, Spring 1995: 48. Some earlier studies had found somewhat lower rates. For example, a 1980 Denver study cited by Marcia E. M. Molmen found that only 33% of women were able to avert rape through physical resistance. However, Molmen states that the women who physically resisted had no self defence training and that with training a larger number of women should be able to avert rape. Marcia E. M. Molmen, Avoiding Rape Without Putting Yourself in Protective Custody, Grand Forks, ND: The Athena Press, 1982: 15. Some other authors recommend carefully choosing the type of resistance of used against an attacker and recommend self defence training. See Jessica Davies, Protect Yourself! A Woman's Handbook: How to be Safer in the Streets, in the Home, at Work, When Travelling, London: Judy Piatkus Publishers, 1990: 103; Manuel M. Estrella Jr. and Martin L. Frost, The Family Guide to Crime Prevention, New York/Toronto: Beaufort Books, Inc., 1981: 131-38.

⁹⁰ V. Kniazev, "Seksual'nyi Terror," Torgovaia Gazeta, November 13, 1993: 2.

an assault situation to carry on an intense discussion. Making use of capacities, including verbal skills, is a good strategy for leaving dangerous situations, but the precise actions taken depends on the victim, the assailant and the situation. Self-defense training physically and psychologically prepares women in dealing with violence.

Conclusion

It is too soon to judge the full impact of support services on Russian society. As of yet, those developing support services have had no visible effect on law-enforcement agencies. However, it does appear that those developing support services have, through their public education campaigns, contributed to the creation of an environment in which violence against women can be openly discussed and in which it is acceptable to treat the victim of violence with sympathy. This has helped to bring violence against women to the attention of Russian legislators. In addition, those developing support services have labelled commonly held ideas regarding women's culpability in the violence perpetrated against them a myth. In this way, they have challenged the views of other social groups, especially the views of law-enforcement agencies and criminologists.

Most importantly, by using actual accounts of women's experience with violence in media interviews, those developing support services have given women experiencing violence a public voice. For women whose pain has for so long been denied, this is an enormous step forward. No less important is the acknowledgement by those developing support services that women experiencing

violence are worthy of support. Communicated with this support is the inherent value of women as human beings in Russian society.

Regardless of any other impact on Russian society, the help support services provided to thousands of Russian women is, in itself, a resounding achievement and an important step forward for Russian women. Such a step could not have been possible without foreign and Russian support. Foreign support has provided support services with financing and technology, while Russian support has helped secure basic logistics that otherwise would have proved prohibitively expensive. In this way, foreign and Russian support have thus far had a complementary effect on the development of support services in Russia. The future of support services and their financing will likely depend on the Russian economy and the domestic and foreign policies of the Russian state.

Conclusion

Lasting societal changes do not come about easily or quickly. Rather, they are the result of incremental steps taken by numerous groups in society, including state bodies and advocacy groups, who raise awareness about the need for change and demonstrate the positive contribution that changes can make to the functioning of the state and to the lives of people in society. Russia has already seen enormous changes in its economic and political structures. The Soviet command system has been replaced with a market driven system which is responsive to the forces of supply and demand. Although this has greatly increased the variety and quality of consumer goods available to Russians, it has also caused unemployment. In addition, decision-making bodies are no longer chosen by a small section of the population but are elected by the people of Russia as a whole. Although not all of these changes have been positive, many members of Russian society now have the opportunity to improve their position in a way they did not have before. Social groups, which were previously restricted can now form freely, organize events and publish materials. As well, members of Russian society can articulate their interests and thus create new visions of their needs and their place in society.

Amongst the many groups benefitting from these changes are women whose ability to formulate and articulate interests was severely restricted for most of the Soviet periods. The large variety of women's groups now in existence demonstrates the diversity of women's interests and the ways in which women have begun to help

themselves. The ability to help themselves has provided women with an opportunity to gain confidence in their abilities and gain sight of the value of women to each other and society. Autonomous women's groups now exist on local levels and thus are able to address various needs of women in particular communities. This has made it possible for women both inside and outside of large centres to receive support in times of need, and empowered them to change their society in a positive direction. Different women's groups also work together on specific projects on local, regional and national levels to organize conferences, to carry out public education campaigns and to publicly protest such things as violence in society.

Women are no longer completely dependent on the state or official state organs through which to channel their interests, and the state no longer controls important resources such as access to information technologies. Although women are no longer dependent on the state, many women's groups are choosing to cooperate with government structures on various levels in order to increase their influence and take advantage of government's infra-structural resources. The state, on national and regional levels, still plays an important role because it heavily influences the direction of society through legislative functions and the mass media attention it receives. Cooperation with government bodies has been particularly important for groups in smaller communities where there are fewer resources. In addition, many local governments, no longer controlled by higher bodies, have proven receptive to supporting women's initiatives, thus increasing the importance of further enhancing and developing these relationships.

Since the beginning of the post-Soviet period, social and political changes, such as the ability to meet freely with foreigners, have had a particularly positive effect on groups developing support services for women experiencing violence. The development of support services came amidst general societal crisis in which women became brutally aware of their political and economic expendability in late Soviet and post-Soviet society. Promises that had been made to women under Communism guaranteeing them equal opportunities for employment no longer had any force as the economic system plunged into even greater crisis. Those developing support services for women experiencing violence have found themselves as one of numerous other women's groups providing support to women. However, in some respects groups providing support services for women experiencing violence differ greatly from the many other groups providing other types of support. While most women's groups have formed in order to respond to problems that have arisen out of the recent changes (examples of which are employment re-training, business training, etc.), support services have developed to provide for a need that the Soviet state failed to fulfil.

This important difference between support services for women experiencing violence and other support services for women underlies the significance of their development to women and women's issues in Russian society. The development of support services for women experiencing violence broadens Russian society's understanding of women's needs and women's issues. No longer are the needs of women connected solely to their roles as mothers or as workers but women have now become worthy of moral and psychological support on the basis of being

human beings.

Viewing oneself as a person worthy of attention and resources is the first step towards a political consciousness. Although women have been legally viewed as persons, society has not treated them with the same respect as men. A raised political consciousness for women, if it translates into actions, may change the position of women in Russian society.

In order to realize lasting, positive changes in the position of women in society, it will be necessary to develop grassroots commitment to support services and women's initiatives. Through their analysis of patriarchal attitudes towards women, Russian academics have shown that women's groups will need to do much work to create positive images of women in society and to change negative perceptions towards women experiencing violence. Changing societal opinions and perceptions will involve public educational efforts, as well as personal alliances that support service groups can build with each other, with other social groups and with government bodies. Work on the local level provides excellent opportunities for developing the types of long-term relationships with other groups that are needed to exert influence. Nevertheless, work on the national level is also critical because it is at the national level that far reaching policies are made and legislation enacted.

The national impact of support services will likely depend on both domestic and international factors. Their impact will depend on the ability of these groups to secure funding, as well as the political and societal cooperation needed to expand. This cooperation will largely depend on the ability of support service groups to develop sympathy for the victims of violence. National support may also depend on

the international community's response to the situation of women in Russia. Certainly, foreign non-governmental organizations have provided assistance to support services and other women's groups. In addition, international expectations surrounding the United Nations World Conference on Women in 1995 did result in the Russian Federation publicly admitting for the first time the existence and magnitude of various forms of violence against women in its society. Particularly significant for support services was the admission that high levels of domestic violence exist in Russian society and that there is a need to develop support services for women experiencing violence.

As of yet, larger funding organizations such as the World Bank have not made women issues a priority in their programs for Russia. In response to this, organizations, such as the Human Rights Watch in a report on Women in Russia, have called upon international political and monetary agencies to encourage Russia to increase the priority of women's issues and to comply with international conventions on the rights of women. The priority the position of women will receive in the future funding agenda will likely depend on the ability of women's groups internationally to promote solidarity with women in Russia.

The failure of Russian society to make the connection between the need for support services and the unresolved problem of violence against women from the pre-Soviet and Soviet periods is indicative of the lack of historical knowledge on the subject. Ironically, those organizing support services are heralded by Russian media for providing psychological support to women who, in the new period, are now in crisis, and subject to growing rates of violence. It is easier for Russian

society to view violence against women as a recent phenomenon.

Connecting support services for women experiencing violence with the problems of the post-Soviet period detracts from their significance. Instead of recognizing that support services signify the growing empowerment of women, they have been seen to be merely a response to a recent phenomenon, and thus support services become the epitome of women's disempowerment in the post-Soviet period. Perhaps the latter view of support services makes their existence more palatable to society by making them appear less threatening to the long established patterns of gender relations. However, this view also makes support services appear to be a foreign solution to a foreign based problem since they developed only after western ideas penetrated Soviet society in the Gorbachev Period.

The foreign nature of support services is underlined with substantial funding that foreign agencies have donated towards their development in Russia. Without the direct and indirect support of foreign agencies, many of the support services would not exist for women experiencing violence today. In addition, the large amount of foreign funding and foreign resources raises the question of the sustainability of support services in Russia and it is unclear how long foreign agencies will continue to fund support services. Realistically, it cannot be assumed that foreign funding will continue indefinitely. Hence, unless Russian involvement in funding support services increases beyond the current levels of a few businesses and municipal bodies, some support services may be unable to continue to offer services in the future.

Western financing also raises the question of the appropriateness of cultural

interference. Western agencies have thus far felt comfortable in assisting in the development of support services, as have Russian groups felt comfortable in receiving this assistance. To a certain degree they have created services that without this help would not exist. However, although many support services receive funding from foreign agencies, the organizers of these services are primarily Russian women with their own visions of and strong commitment to the development and operation of support services. Thus, foreign funding has not been the determining factor in Russian women's decision to develop support services, but rather has increased women's power in their ability to realize their ideas.

Despite the assistance support services receive from foreign agencies, they remain vulnerable to social, political and economic changes in Russian society. In fact, foreign funding has made support services vulnerable to certain types of political changes. For example, if there were a reversal in Russian foreign policy causing foreign funding to cease, many support services would no longer have the financial means to survive. Developing Russian-based social, political and financial support is an important means of overcoming the present vulnerability that some groups face. However, even a commitment of domestic financing, particularly from governmental sources, does not guarantee that support services will receive the support promised. Economic conditions in Russia have made it difficult for the Russian state to fulfil its financial obligations.

Although support services are vulnerable to various changes, those developing support services are also a part of the changes taking place and have taken a prominent role in the public education of Russian society on violence

against women. Thus far, the arguments of those developing support services, although compelling, have lacked a connection to popular and academic discourse on violence against women. As of yet, only cursory critiques have been made of the portrayal of victims in Russian criminology. Those developing support services will eventually need to connect themselves to discourses on violence against women if they wish to become more influential in Russian society.

The support for and relevance of support services to Russian society will ultimately determine the fate of these services for women experiencing violence in Russia. Local governments in certain regions have already shown a positive orientation to support services. Through contacts with other groups working directly with members of society, support services have thus far been able to exert the most influence on the local level. On the national level, support services compete with many other groups for influence. Successfully exerting influence at the national level depends, in part, on the perceived level of expertise and level of societal support a group holds. The future and final form of the proposed law on family violence currently before the Russian Duma will be a litmus test of the level of influence criminologists and those developing support services currently hold over new Russian legislation. Incremental changes, such as the development of support services, have brought to the attention of Russian society the ramifications that violence against women has on women's lives. Attention to women's suffering has also brought with it attention to women's value, and the provision of support to women is only warranted because women hold a value in society. This value, unlike in the Soviet periods, is based not on a women's activity in the economic sphere or

on an ability to give birth but on the recognition of women's value as human beings. The lasting effect of support services will depend on whether the recognition of women's value as human beings continues to grow. Its growth will depend on women's continued ability to express and organize around their interests. This will in turn depend on the direction of Russian politics. Regardless what the future holds, it is unlikely that women who have finally found their voices will easily give them up in the future.

Bibliography

Sources in English

Books and Book Chapters

- Atkinson, D. , A. Dallin, and G.W. Lapidus, eds. Women in Russia. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1977.
- Attwood, Lynne. The New Soviet Man and Women: Sex-Role Socialization in the USSR. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1991.
- Attwood, Lynne, ed. Red Women on the Silver Screen: Soviet Women and Cinema From the Beginning to the End of the Communist Era. London: Pandora, 1993.
- Beaudry, Micheline. Battered Women. Montreal: Black Rose Books, 1985.
- Beliakova, A. M., et al. Soviet Legislation on Women's Rights: Collection of Normative Acts. Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1978.
- Blackman, Julie. Intimate Violence A Study of Injustice. New York: Columbia University Press, 1989.
- Breaking the Pattern: Understanding Wife Abuse. Edmonton: Alberta Family and Social Services, Family Violence Prevention, 1991.
- Breslauer, George W. "The Twenty-Fifth Congress: Domestic Issues." The Twenty-Fifth Congress of the CPSU: Assessment and Context. Ed., Alexander Dallin. Stanford: Hoover Institution Press, 1977: 7-25.
- Bridger, Sue, et al. No More Heroines? Russia, Women and The Market. London and New York: Routledge: 1996.
- Bridger, Susan. "Rural Women and Glasnost." Bradford Occasional Papers: Essays in Language, Literature and Area Studies, #9, 1988.
- Browning, Genia. Women and Politics in the USSR: Consciousness Raising and Soviet Women's Groups. Sussex: Wheatsheaf Books, 1987.
- Brownmiller, Susan. Against Our Will: Men, Women and Rape. New York: Simon

and Schuster, 1975.

Buckley, Mary. "Perestroika and the woman question." Social Policy in the new Eastern Europe. Eds. B. Deacon and J. Szalia. Vermont: Grower Publishing Company: 1990.

Buckley, Mary. "Soviet Interpretations of the Women Question." Soviet Sisterhood: British Feminists on Women in the USSR. Ed. Barbara Holland. London: Fourth Estate, 24-53.

Butler, W.E., ed. Soviet Law. London: Butterworths, Second Edition, 1988.

Chalidze, Valery. Criminal Russia: Essays on Crime in the Soviet Union. New York: Random House, 1977.

Chernyshevsky, N. What is to be Done? (Translation by Benjamin R. Tucker and Cathy Porter), London: Virago, 1982.

Clements, Barbara Evans, et al., eds. Accommodation and Resistance. Berkeley, Los Angeles, Oxford: University of California Press, 1991.

Clements, Barbara Evans. Bolshevik Feminist: The Life of Aleksandra Kollantai. Bloomington and London: Indiana University Press, 1979.

Connor, Walter D. Deviance in Soviet Society. New York: Columbia University Press, 1972.

Conquest, Robert. Justice and the Legal System in the USSR. London, Sydney, Toronto: The Bodley Head, 1968.

Corrin, Chris, ed. Superwomen and the Double Burden: Women's Experience of Change in Central and Eastern Europe and the Former Soviet Union. Toronto: Second Story Press Feminist Publishers, 1992.

Counts, Dorothy Ayers, et al. Sanctions & Sanctuary Cultural Perspectives on the Beating of Wives. Boulder: Westview Press, 1992.

Davies, Jessica. Protect Yourself! A Woman's Handbook: How to be Safer in the Streets, in the Home, at Work, When Travelling. London: Judy Piatkus Publishers, 1990.

Davis, Angela. Women, Culture, & Politics. New York: Random House, 1989.

DeKeseredy, Walter S. and Ronald Hinch. Woman Abuse: Sociological Perspectives. Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc., 1991.

Demography and Sociology Digest: Personality and Family in the Period of Social Transition. Moscow: Russian Academy of Sciences: Institute for Socio-Economic Studies of Population. Vol. II, 1994.

Dreifus, Claudia. Woman's Fate: Raps From a Feminist Consciousness-Raising Group. Toronto: Bantam Books, 1973.

Dworkin, Andrea. Our Blood: prophecies and discourses on sexual politics. New York: Harper, 1976.

Dworkin, Andrea. Letters From a War Zone. London: Secker & Warburg, 1988.

Einhorn, Barbara. Cinderella goes to market. London: Verso, 1993.

Elnett, Elaine. Historic Origin and Social Development of Family Life in Russia. New York: Columbia University Press, 1926.

Engelstein, Laura. The Key to Happiness: Sex and the Search for Modernity in Fin-de-Siecle Russia. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1992.

Estrella, Manuel M. Jr. and Martin L. Frost. The Family Guide to Crime Prevention. New York/Toronto: Beaufort Books, Inc., 1981.

Fuqua, Michelle. The Politics of the Domestic Sphere: The Zhenotdely, Women's Liberation, and the Search for a Novyi Byt in Early Soviet Russia. The Donald W. Treadgold Papers in Russian, East European and Central Asian Studies. Washington: University of Washington Henry M. Jackson School of International Studies, #10, 1996.

Gelles, Richard J. and Cornell, Claire Pedrick. International Perspectives on Family Violence. Lexington, Massachusetts: Lexington Books, 1983.

Gelles, Richard J. and Claire Pedrick Cornell. Intimate Violence in Families. Beverly Hills: Sage, 1984.

Grekova, I. Russian Women. San Diego: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich, 1983.

Hanmer, J. and Maynard, Mary, eds. Women, Violence and Social Control. Atlantic Highlands, NJ: Humanities Press International, 1987.

Hanmer, J., Radford, J. and E. Stanko, eds. Women, Policing, and Male Violence. London: Routledge, 1989.

Human Rights Watch Women's Rights Project, Russia: Neither Jobs Nor Justice - State Discrimination Against Women in Russia, Vol. 7, #5, March 1995.

- Hutchings, Nancy. The Violent Family Victimization of Women, Children and Elders. New York: Human Sciences Press, Inc., 1988.
- Juviler, Peter H. "Criminal Law and Social Control." Contemporary Soviet Law. Eds, D. Barry, W.E. Butler, G. Ginsburgs. The Hague: Martinus Nijhoff, 1974.
- Juviler, Peter H. "No End of a Problem: Perestroika for the Family?" Soviet Social Problems. Eds, A. Jones, et al. Boulder, San Francisco and Oxford, Westview Press: 1991, 194-212.
- Kiczkova, Z. and Farkasova, E. "The Emancipation of Women: A Concept that Failed." Gender Politics and Post-Communism. Eds, Nanette Funk and Magda Mueller. London: Routledge, 1993, 84-94.
- Konstantinova, Valentina. "The Women's Movement in the USSR: A myth or a real challenge?" Women in the Face of Change: The Soviet Union, Eastern Europe and China. Eds, S. Rai, et al. London: Routledge, 1992, 200-217.
- Kon, I.S. and Riordan, J. eds, Sex and Russian Society. Bloomington, Illinois: Indiana University Press, 1992.
- Kornai, Janos. The Socialist System: The Political Economy of Communism. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1992.
- Kurt, Weis and Sandra Kurt. "Victimology and the Justification of Rape." Victimology: A New Focus Vol. V: Exploiters and Exploited: The Dynamics of Victimization. Eds, I. Drapkin, E. Viana. Lexington/Toronto/London: Lexington Books D. C. Heath & Company, 1975.
- Lenin, V.I. On the Emancipation of Women. Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1965.
- Lenin, V.I. Women and Society. New York: International Publishers, 1938.
- Levin, Eve. Sex and Society in the World of Orthodox Slavs 900-1700. Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 1989.
- Levinson, David. Family Violence in Cross-Cultural Perspective. Newbury Park: Sage, 1989.
- Lissytukina, Larissa. "Soviet Women at the Crossroads of Perestroika." Gender Politics and Post-Communism. Eds, Nanette Funk and Magda Mueller. London: Routledge, 1993, 274-286.
- Łoś, Maria. Communist Ideology, Law and Crime. New York: St. Martin's Press, 1988.

- Mamonova, Tatyana. Russian Women's Studies: Essays on Sexism in Soviet Culture. Toronto: Pergamon Press, 1989.
- Marsh, Rosalind, ed. Women in Russia and Ukraine. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.
- Massell, Gregory J. The Surrogate Proletariat. New Jersey: Princeton University, 1974.
- Mawby, R. I. and S. Walklate. Critical Victimology: International Perspectives. London: Sage, 1994.
- McAndrew, Maggie. "Women's Magazines in the Soviet Union." Soviet Sisterhood: British Feminists on Women in the USSR. Ed. Barbara Holland. London: Fourth Estate, 1985, 78-115.
- Millett, Kate. Sexual Politics. New York: Ballantine Books, 1970.
- Molmen, Marcia E. M. Avoiding Rape Without Putting Yourself in Protective Custody. Grand Forks, ND: The Athena Press, 1982.
- Noonan, Norma C. "Does Consciousness Lead to Action? Exploring the Impact of Perestroika and Post-Perestroika on Women in Russia." Women Of Russia - Yesterday, Today, Tomorrow (Conference held June 1-5, 1993). Moscow: Association of Women in Slavic Studies, Institute of Sociology of the Russian Academy of Science, All-Russia Women's Association 'Missia', International League of Women-Writers of Russia, Academy of Management, 1994, 133-39.
- Okun, Lewis. Woman Abuse: Facts Replacing Myths. New York: State University of New York Press, 1986.
- Posadskaia, Anastasia, ed. Women in Russia: A New Era in Russian Feminism. London: Verso, 1994.
- Pouncy, Carolyn Johnston, ed. The 'Domostroi': Rules for Russian Households in the Time of Ivan the Terrible. Ithaca and New York: Cornell University, 1994.
- Ranes, Barbara. From Baba to Tovarishch: The Bolshevik Revolution and Soviet Women's Struggle for Liberation. Chicago: Marxist-Leninist Books and Periodicals, 1994.
- Rimashevskaja, Natalia. "Perestroika and the status of women in the Soviet Union." Women in the Face of Change: The Soviet Union, Eastern Europe and China. Eds. S. Rai, et al. London, Routledge: 1992.

- Romashkin, P.S. Fundamentals of Soviet Law. Moscow: Foreign Languages Publishing House, 1961.
- Sedaitis, Judith B. and Jim Butterfield, eds. Perestroika From Below: Social Movements in the Soviet Union. Boulder: Westview Press, 1991.
- Segal, Boris M. Russian Drinking: Use and Abuse of Alcohol in Pre-Revolutionary Russia. New Brunswick: Publications Division Rutgers Center of Alcohol Studies, 1987.
- Segal, Boris M. The Drunken Society: Alcohol Abuse and Alcoholism in the Soviet Union A Comparative Study. New York: Hippocrene Books, 1990.
- Serio, Joseph, ed. USSR Crime Statistics and Summaries: 1989 and 1990. Chicago: The Office of International Criminal Justice - The University of Illinois at Chicago, 1992.
- Shelley, Louise I. Policing Soviet Society: The Evolution of State Control. London and New York: Routledge, 1996.
- Shreeves, Rosamund. "Sexual revolution or 'sexploitation'? The pornography and erotica debate in the Soviet Union." Women in the Face of Change: The Soviet Union, Eastern Europe and China. Eds, S. Rai, et al. London: Routledge, 1992, 130-46.
- Shupe, Anson, et al. Violent Men, Violent Couples The Dynamics of Domestic Violence. Lexington, Massachusetts: Lexington Books, 1987.
- Sigler, Robert T. Domestic Violence in Context. Lexington, Massachusetts: Lexington Books, 1989.
- Solomon, Peter H. Jr. Soviet Criminologists and Criminal Policy: Specialists in Policy-Making. New York: Columbia University Press, 1978.
- Sonkin, Daniel Jay, et al. The Male Batterer A Treatment Approach. New York: Springer Publishing Company, 1985.
- Stites, Richard. The Women's Liberation Movement in Russia: Feminism, Nihilism and Bolshevism 1860-1930. Princeton, N.J.: Princeton University Press, 1978.
- Straus, Murray A, et al. Behind Closed Doors: Violence in the American Family. New York: Anchor Books, 1980.
- Straus, Murray A. and Gerald T. Holting, eds. The Social Causes of Husband-

Wife Violence. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1980.

Tift, Larry L. Battering of Women: The Failure of Intervention and the Case for Prevention. Boulder: Westview Press, 1993.

United Nations Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute: Crime and Crime Prevention in Moscow. Rome: Interregional Crime and Justice Research Institute. 52(1994).

Van Hasselt. Handbook of Family Violence. New York: Plenum Press, 1988.

Vengerov, A. and A. Danilevich. Law, Morality and Man: The Soviet Legal System in Action. Moscow: Progress Publishers, 1985.

Viano, Emilio, ed. Critical Issues in Victimology. New York: Springer Publishers, 1992.

Voznesenskaya, Julia. The Women's Decameron. Boston: The Atlantic Monthly Press, 1985.

Ylo, Kersti and Michele Bograd, eds. Feminist Perspectives on Wife Abuse. Newbury Park: Sage Publications, 1988.

Zeldes, Ilya. The Problems of Crime in the USSR. Springfield, Illinois: Charles C Thomas, 1981.

Articles

Butler, W.E. "Crime in the Soviet Union: Early Glimpses of the True Story." British Journal of Criminology 32.2(Spring 1992):144-59.

Carnaghan, Ellen and Donna Bahry. "Political Attitudes and the Gender Gap in the USSR." Comparative Politics (July 1990):379-99.

Clayton, E. and J. R. Millar. "Education, Job Experience and the Gap Between Male and Female Wages in the Soviet Union," Comparative Economic Studies 33 (Spring 1991):5-22.

Cockburn, Cynthia . "'Democracy Without Women is No Democracy': Soviet Women Hold their First Autonomous National Conference." Feminist Review 39(Winter 1991): 141-48.

Connexions 42(1993).

Daskov, Gennady V. "Quantitative and Qualitative Changes in Crime in the USSR."

British Journal of Criminology 32.2(Spring 1992):160-66.

D'Cruze, Shani. "Approaching the History of Rape and Sexual Violence: notes towards research." Women's History Review 1.3(1993):377-96.

deSilva, Lalith. "Women's Emancipation Under Communism: A Re-evaluation." East European Quarterly 27.3(September 1993):301-16.

Galeotti, Mark. "Perestroika, Perestrelka, Pereborka: Policing Russia in a Time of Change." Europe-Asia Studies 45.5(1993): 769-86.

Gilinskii, Yakov. "Crime in Russia: The Past, Present and Future," Current Politics and Economics of Russia 3.4(1994):215-31.

Hunt, Margeret. "Wife Beating, Domesticity and Women's Independence in Eighteenth-Century London." Gender & History 4.1(Spring 1992):10-33.

Lentini, Peter. "A Note on Women in the CPSU Central Committee, 1990." Europe-Asia Studies 45.4(1993):729-36.

Lenton, Rhonda L. "Feminist versus interpersonal power theories on wife abuse revisited" Canadian Journal of Criminology (October 1995):567-74.

Luke, Gabriele. "Women in the New Russia." Current Politics and Economics of Russia 4.2(1996): 81-95.

Marsh, Rosalind. "From Problems to Strategy? Impressions of the Second Independent Women's Forum in Dubna." Rusistika 7(June 1993):16-19.

Maryniak, Irena. "Beauty goes East." Index on Censorship 4(1995):57-61.

Mikhalev, Vladimir. "Social Security in Russia." Europe-Asia Studies 48.1(1996):15-17.

Molyneux, Maxine. "The 'Woman Question' in the Age of Perestroika." New Left Review 183(1990):23-50.

Morvant, Penny. "Bearing the 'Double Burden' in Russia." Transition (8 September1995): 4-9.

Morvant, Penny. "The Changing Face of Poverty." Transition (12 January 1996):56-61.

- Petrushevskaya, Ludmila. "Panya's Poor Heart." Index on Censorship 4(1995):51-56.
- Powell, David E. "Social Problems in Russia." Current History (October 1993): 325-30.
- Racioppi, Linda and Katherine O'Sullivan See. "Organizing Women before and after the Fall: Women's Politics in the Soviet Union and Post-Soviet Russia." Signs 20.4(1995):818-850.
- Reiter, E. and Luxton, M. "Overemancipation? Liberation?" Soviet Women in the Gorbachev Period." Studies in Political Economy 34(Spring 1991):50-70.
- Sanjian, Andrea Stevenson. "Social Problems, Political Issues: Marriage and Divorce in the USSR." Soviet Studies 43.4 (1991): 629-49.
- Scronce, Christine A., Corcoran, Kevin J. "The Influence of the Victim's Consumption of Alcohol on Perceptions of Stranger and Acquaintance Rape." Violence Against Women 1.3(September 1995): 241-253.
- Schwendinger, Herman and Julia. "The World According to James Messerschmidt." Social Justice 15.1(1988):123-145.
- Shelley, L. I. "Inter-personal Violence in the USSR." Violence, Aggression and Terrorism 1.2(1987): 41-67.
- Shreeves, Rosamund. "Sexual revolution or 'sexploitation'?" RFE Report on the USSR (3 August 1990): 4-8.
- Sillaste, Galina. "Women in Political Life." Kommunist 8(1991):7-15.
- Sperling, Valerie. "Rape and Domestic Violence in the USSR." Response to the Victimization of Women and Children 13.3(1990):16-22.
- Stalans, Loretta J. and Lurigio, Arthur J. "Responding to Domestic Violence Against Women." Crime and Delinquency 41. 4(1995): 387-98.
- Voronina, Olga. "Soviet Patriarchy: Past and Present." Hypatia 8.4(1993):97-111.
- Walker, Gillian. "The Conceptual Politics of Struggle: Wife Battering, the Women's Movement and the State." Studies in Political Economy 33(1990):63-90.
- White, Anne. "Charity, Self-help and Politics in Russia 1985-91." Europe-Asia Studies 45. 5(1993) :787-810.

Worobec, Christine D. "Temptress or Virgin? The Precarious Sexual Position of Women in Postemancipation Ukrainian Peasant Society." Slavic Review 49.2(1990):227-38.

Yulina, Nina S. "Women and Patriarchy" Women's Studies International Forum 16.1(1993): 57-63.

Zabelina, T. and Issraelian, E. "Russian and Canadian Women: Challenge of the Modern World," International Journal of Canadian Studies 3(Spring 1994):94-104.

Zaharova, N, Posadskaia, A. and Rimashevskaiia, N. "How We Resolve the Woman Question." Kommunist 4(1989):56-65.

Sources in Russian

Books

Antonian, Iu. M. and V. P. Golubev. Iznasilovanie - prichiny i preduprezhdenie [Rape - Reasons and Warning Signs]. Moscow: Russian Federation Ministry of Internal Affairs Academy, 1990.

Antonian, Iu. M. Seksual'nye prestupniki [The Sexual Offender]. Moscow: Russian Federation Ministry of Internal Affairs Academy, 1992.

Antonian, Iu. M. Seksual'nye prestupleniia <Chikatio i drugie> [Sex Crimes: *Chikatio* and Others]. Moscow: Amal'teia, 1993.

Beliaeva, N. A. , et. al. Ugolovnoe pravo: osobennaia chast' [The Criminal Code: General Section]. St. Petersburg: St. Petersburg University, 1995.

Blinder, B. A. Otvetstvennost' za iznasilovanie po sovetскому уголовному праву po materialom Uzbekskoi SSR [The Punishment for Rape Under the Soviet Criminal Code Based on Materials From Uzbekistan]. Diss. Tashkent: Tashkent State University, 1966.

Bluvshtein, Iu. Bor'ba s prestupleniiami v sfere byta [Fighting Crime in the *Byt* Sphere]. Vilnius: Znanie, 1986.

Chechot, D. M. and D. A. Shestakov. Sotsial'noe zlo-alkogolizm sem'ia i pravo [The Social Evil of Alcoholism: The Family and the Law]. Leningrad: Leningrad State University, 1988.

D'iachenko, A. P. "Aktualnye Voprosy Viktimologicheskoi Profilaktiki Prestuplenye

- v Oblasti Polovikh Otnosheniy" [Pressing Questions of the Prevention of Victimization in Sex Crime]. Viktimologicheskiye problemy borby s prestupnostyu [Victimological Problems of Fighting Crime]. Irkutsk: Irkutsk State University, 1988.
- Golik, Iu. V. Sluchainyi prestupnik [Happen-stance Offender]. Tomsk: Tomsk University, 1984.
- Igoshin, B. I., ed. Kriminalisticheskoe izuchenie lichnosti prestupniki po delam ob iznasilovanii i ego takticheskoe i metodicheskoe znachenie [Criminological Study of the Personality of the Rape Offender and Tactical and Methodological Meanings]. Izhevsk: Udmurtskii University, 1993.
- Kim, E. M. and G. A. Romanov. Profilaktika bytovykh prestuplenii organami vnutrennikh del [The Ministry of Interior: Preventing Byt Crimes]. Moscow: Soviet Ministry of Interior Academy, 1989.
- Khotkina, Z.A. "Novye tendentsii v zaniatosti zhenshchin" [New Tendencies in the Employment of Women]. Zhenshchina i social'naya politika (gendernyi aspekt) [Women and Social Politics (gender aspect)]. Ed. Z.A. Khotkina. Moscow: 1992: 48-55.
- Kollantai, A.M. Izbrannye stat'i i rechi [Collection of Articles and Speeches]. Moscow: Politicheskaya Literatura, 1972.
- Kondrashova, T. V. Kvalifikatsiya iznasilovanie [Evaluating Rape]. Sverdlovsk: Sverdlovsk Legal Institute, 1988.
- Maksimov, S. V. and V. P. Revin. Nasil'stvennye prestuplenii v sfere semeino-bytovykh otnoshenii i problemy ikh profilaktiki [Violent Crimes in the Family-Byt Relations and the Problem of Their Prevention]. Moscow: Russian Federation Ministry of Interior Academy, 1993.
- Min'konskii, G. M. and E.F. Pobegailo. "Viktimologicheskaya profilaktika i zadachi ugolovnoi politiki v sfere bor'by s tiazhkimi nasil'stvennymi prestupleniyami" [Preventing Victimization and the Task of Criminal Politics in the Fight Against Violent Crime]. Viktimologicheskiye problemy bor'by s prestupnostyu [Victimological Problems of Fighting Crime]. Irkutsk: Irkutsk State University, 1988, 52-62.
- Moshak, G. G. Prestuplenie v sem'e - istoki i profilaktiki [Crime in the Family - Origins and Prevention]. Kishinev: Kartia Moldoveniacke, 1989.
- V. Ogorodnikov. "Latentnaya prestupnost' i vzaimodeistvie pravookhranitel'nykh organov s naseleniem" [Latent Crime and the Cooperation of Law-

- Enforcement and the Population]. Latentnaia prestupnost': poznanie, politika, strategii (Sbornik materialov mezhdunarodnogo seminara) [Latent Crime: Knowledge, Politics, Strategy (Collection of Seminar Materials)]. Moscow: VNII MVD, 1993, 173-77.
- Pisklakova, M. P. "Krik o pomoshchi - opyt raboty krizisnogo tsentra dlia zhenshchin" [A Cry for Help - the Experience of A Crisis Centre for Women]. Personality and Family in the Period of Social Transition. Moscow: Demography and Sociology, Russian Academy of Sciences Institute for Socio-Economic Studies of Population, Vol. 2, 1994, 121-29.
- Repetskaia, A. L. "Viktimologicheskoe issledovanie telesnykh povrezhdenii i vina poterpebshu" [Victimization Study of Violent Crime and the Fault of the Victim]. Viktimologicheskie problemy bor'by s prestupnost'iu [Victimological Problems of Fighting Crime]. Irkutsk: Irkutsk State University, 1988, 72-78.
- Revin, V. P. Sovremennye problemy izucheniia i organizatsii bor'by s prestupleniami v sferakh semeino-bytovykh i molodezhno-dosugovykh otnoshenii [Current Problems in the Study and Organization of Fighting Family-Byt and Youth-Recreational Crime]. Diss. Moscow: Russian Federation Ministry of Interior Academy, 1994.
- Revin, V. P. "V obosnovanie poniatii <<bytovoe prestuplenie>>" [Understanding "Byt" Crimes]. Ugolovno-pravovye меры бор'бы с преступност'ю в условиях перестройки [Criminal Justice Measures for Fighting Crime in Perestroika Conditions]. Sverdlovsk: Sverdlovsk Legal Institute, 1990, 95-106.
- Shestakov, D. A. "Krimilogennaia sem'ia i formirovanie agressivnosti" [The Propensity of Families to Crime and the Formation of Aggression]. Viktimologicheskie problemy bor'by s prestupnost'iu [Victimological Problems of Fighting Crime]. Irkutsk: Irkutsk State University, 1988, 63-71.
- Shestakov, D. A. Predotvratit' semeinuiu dramu [Preventing Family Dramas]. Leningrad: Znanie, 1981.
- Shestakov, D. A. Supruzheskoe ubiistvo kak obshestvennaia problema [Spousal Killings As a Societal Problem]. St. Petersburg: St. Petersburg State University, 1992.
- Sootak, Ia. Prestuplenie sovershaemye na pochove konfliktov mezhdru suprugami [Crimes Arising out of Spousal Conflicts]. Moscow: Vsesoiuznyi Iuridicheskii za ochnyi Institut, 1980.
- Tartakovskii, A. D. Konflikty v sfere semeino-brachnykh otnoshenii i puti ikh ustraneniia [Family-Spousal Conflicts and the Path to Their Resolution].

Dushanbe: Maorif, 1989.

Tartakovskii, A. D. and N. A. Abdullaev. Prestuplennii v sfere semeino-bytovykh otnoshenii i bor'ba s nimi [The Fight Against Family-Byt Crimes]. Dushanbe: Donish, 1989.

Tikhonenko, S. V. Motivatsiia polovnykh prestuplenii i organizatsii ikh preduprezhdenii organami vnuthennikh del [Motivations for Sex Crimes and the Ministry of Interior's Fight Against Them]. Diss. Moscow: Russian Federation of Ministry of Interior Academy, 1993.

Tsentr po problemam zhenshchin i sem'i pri institute molodyozhi and "Syostry". How to Start and Manage Women's Crisis Centre. Moscow: Press-Solo, 1995.

Articles

Alimov, S. B. "Aktual'nye voprosy preduprezhdenie nasil'stvennykh presuplenii" [Pressing Questions in Preventing Violent Crime]. Voprosy bor'by s prestupnost'iu 38(1983):29-33.

Antonov-Romanovskii, G. V. "Problemy Kriminologicheskogo izucheniia iznasilovaniia" [Problems Studying Rape in Criminology]. Voprosy Bor'by s Prestupnost'iu 34(1981): 46-52.

Astrashabov, A. V. "Sravnitel'nyi analiz osuzhdennykh za iznasilovaniia" [A Comparative Analysis of Rape Offenders]. Sbornik Nauchnykh Trudov VNII MVD 123(1990): 51-57.

Intertsentri Vtziom Ekonomicheskive i sotzial'nye peremenvi: Monitoring obshchestvennogo mneniia [Intercentre Vtziom Economic and Social Changes: Monitoring Public Opinion] AO Moscow: Aspect Press, September 1993.

Levitskaia, A.G., et al. "Nasilie na svidanie: presuplenie ili moment seksual'noi igry" [Date Rape: A Crime or Part of A Sex Game?]. Sotsiologicheskie issledovanie 6(1993): 92-97.

Luneev, V.V. "Kontrol' nad prestupnost'iu: nadyozhny li pokazateli?" [Control of Crime: Are Indicators Reliable?]. Gosudarstvo i pravo 7(1995): 89-102.

Minskaia, V. S. "Opyt viktimologicheskogo izucheniia iznaliovaniia" [Experience of Studying Rape Victimization]. Voprosy Bor'by s prestupnost'iu 17(1972):21-31.

Moshak, G. G. "Preduprezhdenie ubiistv v bytu" [Predicting Murders in the Byt].

- Sotsialnaia zakonost' 3(1988): 51-52.
- Morozova, L.A. "Zhenshchiny i pravo, (Obzor materialov konferentsi v Saratove)" [Women and the Law, (Summary of Saratov Conference Materials)]. Gosudarstvo i Pravo, 9(1995): 133-140.
- Panfilov, G. A. "O soderzhanii poniatii bytovogo prestupleniia" [The Meaning of Byt Crimes]. Voprosy bor'by s prestupnost'iu 26(1977): 50-65.
- Petelin, V. "Ustanovlenie umysla po delam o huliganstve" [Establishing Intent In Cases of Hooliganism]. Sovetskaiia iustitsiia, 2(1990):19-20.
- Portnov, I. P. "Teoreticheskie i prikladnye aspekty profilaktiki bytovykh nasil'stvennykh prestuplenii v gorodakh" [Theoretical and Practical Aspects of Preventing Byt Violent Crimes in Cities]. Sbornik Nauchnykh Trudov VNI MVD 128(1991): 86-97.
- Pozdniakova, M. E. and L. N. Rybakova. "Prestupnaia strast' " [Criminal Passion]. Sotsiologicheskie Issledovanie 4(1989):62-73.
- Rean, A. A. "Sudebno-psikhologicheskii ekspertize po delam ob iznasilovanii" [Court-Psychological Expertise in Rape Cases]. Psikhologicheskii Zhurnal 2.2(1990): 74-81.
- Soboleva, S. B. "Viktimologicheskii aspekt konfliktnykh situatsii v sem'e" [Victimological Aspect of Family Situations]. Voprosy bor'by s prestupnost'iu 25(1976): 37-45.
- Sootak, Ia. "Nekotorye voprosy viktimnosti supruga" [Several Questions About the Spouse's Propensity for Victimization]. Sovetskoe pravo 5(1980): 357-62.
- Voloshina, L.A. "Tiazhkaia nasil'stvennaia prestupnost' poslednego desiatiletiia v Rossii" [Serious Violent Crimes in Russia in the Last Decade]. Sostoianie i tendentsii nasil'stvennoi prestupnosti v Rossiskoi Federatsii. (1993):26-32.
- Voronina, O.A. "Zhenshchina v 'muzhskom obshestve' " [A Woman in a 'Man's Society'] Sotsial'nye Issledovanie 2(1988): 104-110.
- Zabelina, T. Iu. "Itogi seminarov v institute molodezhi" [Seminar in the Institute of Youth Report]. Vy i My: The Women's Dialogue (Spring 1994): 24-27.
- Zykov, V. "O sudebnoi praktike po delam ob iznasilovanii" [Court Practice in Rape Cases]. Sovetskaiia iustitsiia 22(1987): 25-27.

Primary Sources

Constitution (Fundamental Law) of the Union of Soviet Socialist Republics (Adopted at the Seventh [Special] Session of the Supreme Soviet of the USSR, Ninth Convocation on October 7, 1977), Moscow: Novosti Press Agency Publishing House, 1977.

Interpol International Crime Statistics 1989-1990. Saint Cloud, International Crime Police Organization, 1991.

Itogovyi otchyt o rabote I nezavisimovo zhenskovo foruma [Report Proceedings of the First Independent Women's Forum]. Dubna-Moscow, 1991.

Ugolovnyi kodeks RSFSR (s izmeneniiami i dopolneniiami po sostoianiiu na 1 avgusta 1994) [Criminal Code of the Russian Federation (updated 1 August 1994)]. Moscow: Iuridicheskaya literatura, 1994.

"O Sudebnoi praktike po delam ob iznasilovanie" (Postanovlenie Plenuma ot 25 marta, 1964) ["Court Practice In Rape" Directives of the 25 March 1964 Plenum]. Sbornik Postanovlenii Plenuma Verhovnogo Suda SSSR 1924 - 1927 [Collection of Directives of the Supreme Court Plenum of the USSR 1924-1927]. Part 2. Moscow: Izvestia Sovetov Narodnykh Deputatov SSSR, 1981.

Prestupnost' i pravonarushenie v SSSR 1988. Moscow: Iuridicheskaya Literatura, 1989.

Prestupnost' i pravonarushenie v SSSR 1989. Moscow: Iuridicheskaya Literatura, 1990.

Prestupnost' i pravonarushenie v SSSR 1990. Moscow: Iuridicheskaya Literatura, 1991.

Russian Federation, Rossiiskaya Federatsiia - natsional'nyi doklad k chetvertoi Vsemimoi Konferentsii po polozeniiu zhenshchin [Russian Federation's National Report to the Fourth World Conference on Women], 1994.

Sbornik instruktivno-metodicheskikh materialov ministerstva zdravookhraneniia SSSR po pazdelu meditsinskoi pomoshchi zhenshchinam, detiam i podrodkam. [Collection of USSR Ministry of Health Methodological Instructions In Helping Women, Children and Adolescents]. Part 1, Meditsinskaya pomoshch' podrodkam. Moscow: USSR Ministry of the Interior Medical Directorate, 1983.

Voprosy ugolovnogo prava i protsessa v praktike Verkhovnykh Sudov SSSR i

RSFSR: 1938-1978. [Questions on Criminal Law and Process in the Practice of the Supreme Courts of the USSR and RSFSR: 1938-1978]. Third edition. Moscow: Iuridicheskaja literatura, 1980.

Newspapers and Popular Magazines

In English

Adamushkina, Maria. " 'Domestic Violence? There is No Such Problem' ." (Nezavisimaja gazeta, Oct. 31: 6). The Current Digest 47.44(1995): 18.

Agence France Presse "Russian Women Follow West in Countering Rape Trauma." (28 October 1993).

Alova, Natasha. "Sex-Abuse Center Combats Old Attitudes in Russia." Associated Press Ap Worldstream (6 June 1994).

Ashley, Beth. "Russian Women Still in Chains." Gannett News Service (1 March 1994).

Azhgikhina, Nadezhda. "A Movement is Born." The Bulletin of Atomic Scientists (July/August 1995): 47-53.

Babakian, Genine. "Half Russia's Murders: Husbands Kill Wives." The Moscow Times (19 April 1995): 1-2.

Barker, Adele. "Forum: The Domestic Violence Project." Women East-West (September 1996): 15-16.

Bridgeman, Anne. "Women-Russia: Center for Rape Victims Opens in Moscow Next Week." Inter Press Service (29 October 1993).

The Canadian Safety Council. "Violence Against Women-The Bottom Line." Safety Canada. 40. 2(Spring/Summer 1996): 7.

Cidylo, Lori. "Russia discovers the rape victim." Financial Times (13/14 August 1994): 5.

"The feministki are coming." The Economist (12 August 1995): 44-45.

Gadd, Jane. "More women, children using shelters: 85,000 spent time in housing for victims of violence over a year, Statistics Canada finds." The Globe and Mail (2 December 1995): A9.

- Gentleman, Amelia. "Moscow Rape Victims Challenge Years of Apathy to Get Justice." The Times (15 June 1994).
- Ginsberg, Thomas. "Rapes Increase, Police Blame 'Liberalization'." Associated Press (10 August 1993).
- "Human Rights Group Cites Violations in Russia." Associated Press Ap Worldstream (6 July 1994).
- Kabeer, Naila. "Selective rights, collective wrongs - Women, body-politics and the development agenda." Index on Censorship 4(1995): 32-42.
- Kuznetsova, Liliya. "Explosion of Sex Crimes on the Rise in Russia." ITAR-TASS (25 April 1994).
- Kuznetsova, Liliya. "Violence Against Women Discussed by Russian Natl Council." TASS (20 September 1994).
- Meek, James. "Domestic Violence: Home is where the hurt is for women in Russia." The Ottawa Citizen (24 June 1995): B1.
- Percival, Lindsay. "Where Abused Women Speak Out." The Moscow Times (11 January 1994): 24.
- Rusk, James. "New set of rights for victims introduced: Ontario wants kinder justice." The Globe and Mail (24 November 1995): A6A.
- Seguin, Rheal. "Battered women in Quebec get new aid: Province's policy aimed at prevention." The Globe and Mail (7 December 1995): A2A.
- Sloane, Wendy. "Domestic Abuse Is High, Attention Is Low in Russia." Christian Science Monitor (22 July 1994):8.
- "Social Discrimination Against Women is on the Rise" (Izvestia, Oct. 25, p.7) The Current Digest of the Post-Soviet Press 47.43(1995): 18-19.
- Stanley, Alessandra. "Sexual Harassment Thrives In the New Russian Climate." The New York Times (17 April 1994): 1, 8.
- Stone, Melissa L. "Coping with Violence: Self-Defense Courses Empower Russian Women." Surviving Together (Spring 1995): 48.
- Trickey, Mike. "Russian women explode myth of equality." Calgary Herald (28 July 1994): A10.

Voloshina, V. "Russia to Legislate on Domestic Violence," Moscow News 20-21(2-8 June 1995): 22.

Warren, Marcus. "'Kill them' call over sex crimes." The Daily Telegraph (11 August 1993): 10.

Waters, Rob. "A Hotline Movement Grows in Russia." Ms. (November/December 1995): 19-21.

Yakov, Valery. "Ministry of Internal Affairs Warns that an Increase in Sex Crimes Has Begun." CDSP 45.32 (1993):24-25. [From Izvestia (12 August 1993):8.

Zabelina, Tatiana. "Syostri (Sisters) - The Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Center." Violence Against Women 1.3(September 1995): 266-71.

Zabelina, T. Iu. "Sisters." Woman Plus 1(1995): 15-17.

In Russian

Adamushkina, Maria. "Nasilie v sem'e? net problemy - Tak schitaet muzhskoe bol'shinstvo Gosudarstvennoi Dumy, RF" [Violence in the Family? No Such Problem - According to the Male Majority of the State Duma]. Nezavisimaja gazeta (31 October 1995): 6.

Antonian, Nina . "Ne liudi" [Not Human]. Rabotnitsa (November 1993): 14-15.

Astafev, N. Serova, E. "My byli bezzashchitny pered man'iakom" [We Were Helpless Faced With a Maniac]. Moskovskaia Pravda (4 March 1993): 1, 8.

Berezina, Elena and Galina Bryntseva. "Kuda bezhat' iz domashnego ada? Segodnia - nekuda. A vot zavtra..."[Where to Run From Domestic Hell? Today - Nowhere. But Tomorrow...] Ogonyok, 9(February 1996): 46-47.

Berezina, Elena. "Suprug opasnei killera" [A Husband is More Dangerous Than A Killer]. Ogonyok 9(February 1996): 44.

Berezhina, Elena. "Vyzval v kabinet, zaper dver' i pogasil svet...Prinuditel'nyi seks v sluzhebnoy inter'ere" [Took Me to His Office, Locked the Door and Turned Off the Light...Sexual Harassment on the Job]. Ogonyok 43(October 1995): 48-49.

Biriuzova, Olga. "Defitsitnaia rabota: Na vsekh ne khvataet" [Work Deficit: Not Enough To Go Round]. Ogonyok 33,(August 1995): 40-43.

Borin, A. " Domashniaia prestupnost'" [Domestic Crime]. Literaturnaia Gazeta (22

July 1992):13.

Challin, S. "Pozdnye progulki - delo opasnoe osobennno dlia devushek" [Late Night Walks - Dangerous For Girls]. Chas Pik (6 April 1994):9.

Cherevach, Olesia. "V chernykh odezhdakh peshkom k svetlomy bydyshchemu" [In Black Clothing Walking Towards a Brighter Future]. Chas Pik (19 May 1995): 1.

Chernov, Vladimir. "Pochem vy devochki?" [What is Your Price Girl?] Ogonyok 39(September 1995): 46-47.

Daskovskaia, O. "Ne priacha litsa" [Don't Hide Your Face]. Pedagogicheskii kaleidoskop 39-40(November 1994):3.

D'iachenko, A. P. "Vysokaia temnaia tsifra" [Large Dark Number]. Kul'tura (3 April 1993): 5.

Domashenko, M. "Sama vinovata" [Yourself At Fault]. Dochki-Materi, supplement to Argumenti i Fakty, 1(1995):2.

Gadasina, A. "Izmenim Muzhskoi mir?" [Changing a Man's World?] Rossiiskie Vesti (September 1994): 4.

Gaidarenko, N. "V ogne brod est'" [In Fire There A Ford]. Rabochiia Tribuna (14 October 1994): 7.

Ganeeva, O. "<<Shelter>>, shto znachit <<ubezhishche>>" [Shelter Means Sanctuary]. Trud (2 February 1994): 3.

Glan, Isaak. "B'iut zhenshchinu" [They're Beating a Woman]. Kuranti (2 February 1995): 7.

Golubev, V. and Iu. Kudriakov. <<Okhotniki>>[Hunters]. Krest'ianka 6(1994): 33-34.

Goncharenko, Marina. "I v Rossii i v Amerike muzhchiny uzbivaiut zhenshchiny - v Amerike eto schitaetsia prestupleniem, v Rossii - istoricheskoi traditsiei" [In Russia and in American Husbands Beat Their Wives - in America this is Considered a Crime, in Russia - a Historical Tradition]. Smena (2 December 1994): 6.

Gridina, L. "V Rossiiskoi sem'e est' vse vidy nasilie" [The Russian Family Has All Forms of Violence]. Torgovaia Gazeta (29 March 1994): 4.

- Gur'ianova, Tat'iana. ""Nyzhna li Rossii zhenskaia "skoraia"? Glavnoe - poliubut' sebia" [Does Russia Need 'First Aid for Women'? The Most Important Thing is to Love Yourself]. Moskovskii Komsomolets (12 August 1994): 2.
- Illesh, Andrei and Valerii Rudnev. "Kak i za shto cudyat v Rossii" [How and For What People Are Sentenced in Russia]. Izvestia (10 April 1992): 2.
- Kanaev, V. "V Rossii ot seksual'novo nasiliia ne zastahkovana ni odna zhenshchina" [In Russia Not One Woman is Immune to Violence]. Megapolis Express. (21 September 1994): 7.
- Kareva, T. "Tainaia voina" [Secret War]. Rossiaia 30(1992): 4.
- Kniazev, V. "Seksual'nyi terror" [Sexual Terror]. Torgovaia Gazeta (13 November 1993): 3.
- "Kriminal-94" Itogi bor'by s presupnost'iu v minuvshem godu" [Crime Figures For the Past Year]. Kriminal'nyi Vestnik 5(2129) February 1995:1,3.
- Lykov, Viktor. "General-maior militsii Nikolai Kulikov: 'V bor'be s prestupnost'iu my proigraem...'" [*Militia* Major General Nikolai Kulikov: In the Fight Against Crime We Are Losing...]. Ogonyok 47(November 1995): 29.
- Manushkina, Natalia. "I vse-taki nado perezhit'" [And All The Same We Have to Live]. Opasnost' Bez opasnost' (April 1995): 46-47.
- Melekhina, N. "Nasil'niki ne liubiat, kogda kto-to uchit govorit' <<net>>" [Rapists Don't Like to Hear the Word 'No']. Vecherniaia Moskva (June 1994).
- "Mir Zhenshchiny - Chulki dlia feministok" [Women's World - Stockings for Feminists]. Chas Pik (21April 1995): 2.
- Nikonov, Aleksandr. "Boi sovmeznogo znachenii" [Pain of a Cooperative Meaning]. Ogonyok 30(30 June 1995): 53.
- Novikova, E. "Zhenshchiny i nasilie" [Women and Violence]. Federatsiia 92.148 (17 August 1993): 3.
- Os'minina, Nadezhda. "Zhenskaia skoraia" [Women's First Aid]. Rabotnitsa 5(May 1994): 5-6.
- Polopaskaia, L. "<<Sestry>> zhduť zvonka" [Sisters Are Waiting For Your Call]. Tsentri-plus 32.73(August 1994).
- Polozhevets, G. "Ia boiŭ svoego muzha" [I Fear My Husband]. Rabochnaia

Tribuna (3 August 1994): 4.

Ripinskaia, M. "Iznasilovali? Ne speshite veshat'sia" [Raped? Don't Hurry to Hang Yourself]. Golos 26(1994):10.

Samokhvalov, V. E. and E. Dunaevskii. "Iznasilovanie... V ego otsenke vse bylo oshibochno" [Rape...In Its Judgement Everything Was Incorrect]. Kriminal'nyi Vestnik Sankt-Petersburga 2127(3 January 1995): 6.

Skripiuk, Igor. "Milye braniatsia" [Sweethearts Are Fighting]. Smena (5 June 1993): 6.

Tikhonova, O. "Esli vas iznasilovali" [If Your Were Raped]. Kuranti (30 December 1992): 8.

Tikhonova, O. "Sem'ia u nas - eto zapovednik nasiliia" [Our Family is a Precept of Violence]. Kuranti (12 October 1994): 14.

Topil'skaia, E. V. "O pravovom poniatii bespomoshchnovo sosoianii poterpoevshevo" [The Legal Definition of Helpless Condition]. Vestnik Leningradskovo Universiteta, Series 6, Law, 4(1989): 84-88.

Varashavchik, Sergei. "Krasna stotsa fornariami" [Red Light District]. Ogonyok 39(September 1995): 44-46.

Vse liudi svostry [All People Are Sisters]. St. Petersburg Gender Problems Centre Bulletins 1-2(1993), 3(1994).

Zaiarnaia, O. G. "Spasite vashi dushi" [Save Your Souls]. On i Ona 20(1994): 3.

Zakateeva, Valeria. "V otstutstvie styda" [In the Absence of Shame] Ogonyok 43(October 1995): 49.

Zernova, L. "Muzh i zhena - odna satana?" [Husband Wife - Is One A Devil?] Smena (12 January 1994): 5.

"Zhertvam iznasilovanii pomogut" [They Will Help Rape Victims]. Vecherniaia Moskva 73.21221(20 April 1994).

Other Popular Sources

Newsletter Network of East-West Women, Winter 1994.

Unpublished Sources

Interviews

Gaidarenko, Natalia. Director Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostry'. Personal interview. 11 May 1995, Moscow, Russia.

Khodyreva, Natalia. Director of the St. Petersburg Sexual Assault Recovery Centre. Personal interview. 10 January, 12 April and 4 June 1995. St. Petersburg, Russia.

Lipovskaia, Tatiana. Coordinator Moscow Sexual Assault Recovery Centre 'Syostry'. Personal interview. 10 May 1995, Moscow, Russia.

Pisklakova, Marina. Assistant Director Moscow Crisis Centre for Women. Personal interview. 10 June 1995, Repino, Russia.

Vandenberg, Martina. Coordinator Women's Consortium CIS - USA and The Winrock Foundation. 6 May 1995. Moscow, Russia.

Other Unpublished Sources

Get'man, V. V. "Issledovanie mifov ob iznasilovanii." St. Petersburg University, St. Petersburg, Russia: Faculty of Psychology - Department of Professional and Management Psychology. 1 June 1993.

Hoffman, Lisa. Presentation to 'Violence Against Women Workshop. "Feminist Theory and Practice East-West Conference." Repino, Russia. 10 June 1995.

Khodyreva, Natalia. Presentation. "The Effects of Physical and Sexual Violence on the Health of Women" (Roundtable). 11:00-12:00. 12 April 1995. St. Petersburg, Russia.

Khodyreva, Natalia. "The Russian Women's Movement" (lecture notes). Edinburgh, Scotland, June 1995.

Khodyreva, Natalia. "Sexism and Sexual Abuse in Russia." In Chris Corrin, ed.

Violence Against Women in the Former East-Block. Scotland: Glasgow University, 1995 (In Print).

Network of East-West Women, "NEWW ON-LINE: Proekt 'seti zhenshchin vostoka i zapada po organizatssii elektronnoi svyazi" (pamphlet). 1995.

Pisklakova, Marina. Report to St. Petersburg Psychological Crisis Centre for Women Meeting. 8 June 1995. St. Petersburg, Russia.

Programa Vera, Nadezhda, Liubov'. Peterburgskii kanal. 12:00-13:00. 22 May 1995.

Sanich, Alekander. Presentation. "The Effects of Physical and Sexual Violence on the Health of Women" (Roundtable). 10:00-12:00. 12 April 1995. St. Petersburg, Russia.

Peterburgskii Krizisnyi psikhologicheskii tsentr dlia zhenshchin. VseRossiiskaia aktsiia 'Bezopastnost' zhenshchiny' (pamphlet). May 1995.

"Women East-West: Feminist Theory and Practice" (Conference Pamphlet). 9 - 12 June 1995. Repino, Russia.

"Zhenshchiny v chyomom 18 maia v 17 chasov - traumoe shestvie protesta protiv nasiliia" [Women in Black 18 May at 5:00PM - Regular Protest Against Violence] (pamphlet). Kruisnyi Psikhologicheskii Tsentr dlia zhenshchin; Tsentre Gednemykh Problem; Dvizhenie "Soldatskie materi Sankt- Petersburga"; Klub professional'no aktivnykh zhenshchin; Zhenskaia Gumanitarnaia kollegiia' Safo - Peterburg, May 1995.