INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

Bell & Howell Information and Learning
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor, MI 48106-1346 USA
800-521-0600

UMI[®]

**THE DISCURSIVE CONSTRUCTION OF HUNZA, PAKISTAN,
IN TRAVEL WRITING: 1889-1999**

by

TANIA DOLPHIN, H.B.A.

A thesis submitted to
the Faculty of Graduate Studies
in partial fulfillment of
the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario
January 2000
© copyright 2000, Tania Dolphin

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Acquisitions et
services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-48423-8

Canada

The undersigned recommend to
the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research
acceptance of this thesis

'The Discursive Construction of Hunza, Pakistan, in Travel Writing: 1889-1999'

submitted by Tania Dolphin, H.B.A.
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for
the degree of Master of Arts

David Bennett, Thesis Supervisor

Ken Torrance, Chair, Department of Geography

Carleton University
January 2000

Figure 1. Shimshal River Valley, on the way from Passu to Shimshal. Taken June 1988.

Abstract

Travel writing has remained mainly untouched by careful textual analysis until recently. Following in the footsteps of academics, who have begun to focus on concerns of authority and representation in travel writing, this thesis examines travel texts, written by Westerners over the past one hundred years, about Hunza, an area in northern Pakistan. I employ a deconstructive method to examine how language has been used to give travel statements their naturalizing power. Using a variety of narrative and semantic techniques, the authors of the narratives have constructed several dominant representations of Hunza and its inhabitants, some of which have been developed into naturalized discourses of Hunza. In texts that range from eyewitness reports to narratives of self-discovery, the authors have constructed an inferior 'other' in opposition to a superior Westerner. By following the emergence and development of these discourses over a century, I describe how they were constructed, and how they became naturalized over time.

Acknowledgements

A project of this size cannot be accomplished alone. I would not have been able to complete this project without the help of several people and organizations. First and foremost, I would like to thank David Butz, my co-advisor at Brock University for giving me the opportunity to even think of such a project. His guidance and patience, support and encouragement have helped me face new theoretical challenges, and grow intellectually. Second, I would also like to thank my co-advisor at Carleton University, David Bennett, for taking on the responsibility of my work, and accepting the challenge with an open mind. His support allowed me to do what I really wanted to do.

The Ina Hutchinson Award allowed me to continue with my research, and I thank the Department of Geography at Carleton University for that opportunity. In addition, I would not have been able to finish my project without the help of the Graduate Student Association – thank you Diane Berezowski.

I would like to thank Loris Gasparotto in the Cartographic Office of the Department of Geography at Brock University for the excellent map. Thanks go out once again to David Butz for taking the beautiful photographs, and allowing me to reproduce them here.

For all sorts of aid – technical, administrative and theoretical – thanks go to Nigel and Tina, and to Ruth.

And to Arek, of course, for everything.

Contents

Abstract	ii	
Acknowledgements	iii	
Contents	iv	
List of Tables	vii	
Illustrations	viii	
PART I		1
Chapter One	2	
Introduction		2
Is It Geography?		6
Deconstruction of a Method; Deconstruction as a Method		26
Chapter Two. Theoretical Background	33	
Introduction		33
1 Travel...		33
2 ... writing		33
Discourse		38
Colonial and Travel Theory		43
1 Colonial Discourse		43
i Orientalism		47
ii The power of classification		53
2 Representation		57
i Fiction and Truth		61
ii A Question of Authority		62
iii Ethnography vs. travel writing		63
iv Positionality and Plurality		67
'Othering' Writing Strategies		71
1 Narratives		71
i Narrative Types		71
ii Creating Value		80
iii The Modern Unhero		82
2 Language		85
i Portraits		86
ii Timelessness		88
iii The 'Primitive'		89
iv 'Other' Landscapes		92
v Remoteness and Idealization		94

Reader Reception		98
Chapter Three. Historical Context	100	
Introduction		100
Before Modern European Contact		104
Early European Contact		106
British-Dogra Annexation of Hunza		112
Independence		117
Abolition of the Princely States and the Opening of the Karakoram Highway		121
PART II		127
Chapter Four. Information Gathering	128	
Introduction		128
Drew and Biddulph		129
Durand and Knight		139
Reader Reception		150
Chapter Five. Exploration and Adventure	155	
Introduction		155
Etherton		157
Neve		167
Reader Reception		175
Chapter Six. Gender and Imperialism	180	
Introduction		180
Lorimer		182
1 Ethnography or Travel Text?		182
2 Writing Within Discourses of Femininity		186
3 Writing Within Colonial Discourse		191
Reader Response		200
PART III		207
Chapter Seven. Happy Hunza / Developing Hunza	208	
Introduction		208
Tobe		209
Happy Hunza continued		218
Clark, 'capitalist vanguard'		222
Reader Response		235
Chapter Eight. Ecotourism and New Age Travel	242	
Introduction		242
Jamie – Independent Woman		243
Schaller – Independent Activist		250

Lonely Planet – Independent Traveller		257
Reader Response		269
Chapter Nine. Hunza On-line	274	
Introduction		274
Travel brochures		276
Health and Happiness in Hunza		280
Travelogues		285
CONCLUSION		290
Final Remarks	291	
Sources Consulted	301	

List of Tables

Table	Page
1. Partial History of Hunza	101

Illustrations

Figure	Page
1. Shimshal River Valley, on the way from Passu to Shimshal.	i
2. Central Hunza and Nagar, taken from the roof of Baltit Fort.	77
3. Map of Hunza and surrounding areas.	103
4. Truck stop at Jaglot on the Karakoram Highway, just south of Gilgit.	120
5. Tourist rest stop beside the Karakoram Highway, Nagar.	124
6. Ultar Restaurant, Karimabad (Baltit), Hunza.	125
7. Raja Bazaar, Gilgit.	126
8. Central Hunza and Nagar, taken from the roof of Baltit Fort.	137
9. Upper Gilgit River Valley, in Punial, near Yasin.	138
10. Altit Fort and Altit village, taken from Karimabad (Baltit), showing terracing and settlement patterns.	148
11. The Upper Gilgit River Valley, taken from the Government Rest House at Phander.	149
12. Karimabad (Baltit).	166
13. Aliabad, featuring the Karakoram Highway, and some of the Aliabad bazaar.	181
14. Rooftops in old Altit village, taken from Altit Fort.	190

15. Gilgit bazaar, showing used clothing vendor, and signs for tourism-oriented establishment.	240
16. Residential area, Kashgrote, Gilgit.	241
17. Shimshal River Valley, on the way from Passu to Shimshal.	268
18. Altit Fort with Altit village in foreground, from Karimabad.	279
19. Trail near village of Minapin in Nagar.	289

PART I

Chapter One

*It's up to you, who are directly involved with
what goes on in geography, faced with all the
conflicts of power which traverse it, to confront
them and construct the instruments which will
enable you to fight on that terrain*

- Michel Foucault¹

Introduction

Travel writing is one of the most widely read literary genres today. Although its reception is varied, one thing is certain – it has remained mainly untouched by harsh criticism². Recently, however, academics have begun to take an interest in this genre, using it to focus on concerns of authority, knowledge, and representation. For example, Mary Louise Pratt's studies in travel writing³ have focused on the way it has produced the 'rest of the world' for a European readership at certain points throughout history: how it is that these processes and practices legitimate notions of expansion and Empire; and, how travel writing and the Enlightenment worked together to produce a Eurocentric consciousness. Travel writing cannot be seen as one single entity, however. It takes many different forms and can be used to present information in various

¹ Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977* (London: Harvester Press Limited, 1980), 65.

² Patrick Holland and Graham Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters: Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998).

³ Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992).

ways. The following list shows a few examples: (1) narratives that have autobiographical or personal commentary, (2) journeys of life and self-discovery, where the physical journey represents a psychological journey, (3) observational information, which is more a collection of descriptions of 'other' people and lands than direct information about the author, (4) informational narrative, much like a guidebook which 'explains' the landscape and people to readers, or (5) a combination of all the above. Alison Blunt notes that travel writing is a very particular kind of writing as it combines both 'fact' and 'fiction', transcending distinctions between scientific and literary writing, through the practices and statements of an author who produces information that is not easily confirmed⁴. Sara Mills sees travel writing as an instrument of colonial expansion, which was used to serve and emphasize colonial rule⁵.

A great deal of travel writing is seen as escapist or as mere entertainment. Dodd⁶ is one of many writers on the subject who is concerned about this non-critical praise, arguing that it ignores the fact that the author/traveller's attempts to make observations about the visited places or peoples, or, his or her endeavours to 'capture' the peoples and places may simply confirm and reinforce the labels that have already been established.

⁴ Alison Blunt, *Travel, Gender and Imperialism: Mary Kingsley and West Africa* (London: The Guilford Press, 1994), 21.

⁵ Sara Mills, *Discourses of Difference: An analysis of women's travel writing and colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991), 2.

⁶ Philip Dodd, 'The Views of Travellers: Travel Writing in the 1930s,' in *The Art of Travel: Essays on Travel Writing*, ed. P. Dodd (London: Frank Cass and Company Limited, 1982).

This thesis examines some of the travel writing that has been written about Hunza, in northern Pakistan, over the past one hundred years. In it, I attempt to deconstruct the layers of authority and representation found in the texts. This chapter begins with an examination of the question 'Is it geography'? This question has in the past, I think, helped nurture the construction of binary thinking, helped validate certain dominant theories within geography, and narrowed the scope of a great deal of geographical research. This question closes research doors, rather than opens them. I think it is important to pull apart this question, and face the challenge of thinking in less dichotomous terms. After discarding this binary logic, I feel that we, as geography researchers, should examine how we each define our research within the discipline of 'geography'. I have chosen three sets of geographers to exemplify how this question can be addressed in different ways. They have each taken apart this question 'Is it geography', and even discarded it, but have then redefined how their research fits into what 'geography' means to them. Following this, I introduce this research project to my readers – an analysis of discourses in travel writing about Hunza – and then explain how it fits in, and contributes to, an expanded understanding of social life and spatiality.

The final section of this chapter examines the method of deconstruction that I have used in the preparation and writing of this thesis. This methodological analysis leads readers into the next chapter which presents a discussion of the theory and literature that frames this project. Following this, I present a short

history of the area in order to contextualize the travel narratives within Hunza's past and present.

Is It Geography?

This question 'Is it geography?' is often asked of geography majors' work. What does the question mean, though? What are the boundaries of 'geography'? What can be included in the category 'geography'; and, by including some things, what is being excluded? These are extremely difficult questions to answer as there are so many 'fields' within geography – urban, cultural, cartographic, information systems, and physical. How is one to identify a topic as 'geography' or 'not geography'? I believe the answer lies not in closing the boundaries, but in opening them. Geography has a history of connecting with other fields – for example, anthropology, geology, sociology, and more recently, with computers. I believe this interdisciplinary nature is crucial to geography.

Various changes are occurring within the discipline of human geography, not only in the ways people are teaching, and reading, but even in the ways we think of 'geography'⁷. For example, people are beginning to look critically at the role geography played in imperialism⁸. Others, mainly feminist geographers, are examining how the field is gendered and how the simple integration of women

⁷ Felix Driver and Gillian Rose, *Introduction: Towards New Histories of Geographical Knowledge*, vol. 28, *Nature and Science: Essays in the History of Geographical Knowledge*, Historical Geography Research Series (London: Institute of Historical Research, 1992), 1-7.

⁸ Alison Blunt and Gillian Rose, 'Introduction: Women's Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies,' in *Writing Women and Space: Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies*, ed. A. Blunt and G. Rose (New York: The Guilford Press, 1994), 1-28.; A. Kobayashi and L. Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse: 'Race' and Gender in Geography,' in *Reading Human Geography: The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. T. Barnes and D. Gregory (New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 1997), 445-461.

into a gendered field is not enough⁹. Still others are looking at how postmodern and poststructural theory are opening up questions about statements that were once thought of as 'common knowledge'¹⁰.

Let us begin with where geography has been, before we move on to the changes that are happening as we speak. Geography, mainly Western, has been involved fairly consistently in the exploration of, and classification, of the world – into zones, regions, peoples, etc. – and using the information for the construction of categories of race and homogeneous areas¹¹. To some extent, Western geography's role has been racist, say Kobayashi and Peake, as it has 'supported the establishment of Eurocentric/Western domination both politically and intellectually'¹² through defining and mapping boundaries, which have separated the 'privileged' parts of the world and excluded the 'world of the "other"'¹³ based on racial categories. This role of cartographer, explorer, and classifier, helped nurture scientific racism during the nineteenth century, within the political and economic context of the West¹⁴. The concept of the 'blank

⁹ Gillian Rose, *Geography as a Science of Observation: The Landscape, the Gaze and Masculinity*, vol. 28, *Nature and Science: Essays in the History of Geographical Knowledge*, Historical Geography Research Series (London: Institute of Historical Research, 1992), 8-18.

¹⁰ Peter Jackson, *Maps of Meaning* (London: Unwin Hyman Ltd., 1989).

¹¹ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*.

¹² Audrey Kobayashi and Linda Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse. 'Race' and Gender in Geography,' in *Reading Human Geography: The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. Trevor Barnes and Derek Gregory (New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1997), 445.

¹³ Ibid.

¹⁴ Ibid.

space' that needed to be conquered was conceived simply and logically in terms of scientific progress¹⁵. During this time, and continuing through to the present, naturalistic assumptions about peoples and places have been passed down from generation to generation, not only through geography textbooks and teachings, but through travel accounts and information-gathering missions' reports. Since the eighteenth century, the Enlightenment project, with its emphasis on reason and rationality, helped to accentuate and naturalize racist and sexist assumptions and categories through its imposition of logic, in binary terms. The discipline of geography perpetuated and emphasized these binary categories, rationalizing racism and nationhood, through the definition of territories and territorial power¹⁶. Dualistic thinking – the organization of the world into oppositional categories – is not only a way of ordering the world and our existence; but is also a way of exerting power, as one half of the opposition is almost always regarded as more dominant than the other – it is hierarchical. Oppositional thinking is taught to children from a very young age and is a privileged way of learning¹⁷; children are often chastised for not thinking of, and ordering, their world in this way. An inability to structure one's way of thinking this way has been seen as a lack of thoroughness. Oppositions, or dualisms, have an enduring quality – they are powerful in shaping ways of thought, and in categorizing social relations. They

¹⁵ Driver and Rose, 'Introduction,' 2.

¹⁶ Kobayashi and Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse,' 446.

¹⁷ P. Shurmer-Smith and K. Hannam, *Worlds of Desire, Realms of Power: A Cultural Geography* (London: Edward Arnold, 1994).

become so naturalized over time in one's daily activities and actions and thoughts that it is difficult to transform them¹⁸. Although there is still a tradition of racism and naturalistic assumption in geography, there have been some attempts to work through this past theoretically and empirically¹⁹.

In addition to a tradition of collaboration with the process of imperialism, geography has also had a sexist and gendered past. Women have remained on the sidelines while geography has emphasized the notion of separate private and public spheres, which justifies the limits placed on women's movement in the public sphere as well as ignoring the complexity of gender relations as relations of power²⁰. Simply adding women's experiences to an essentialist and positivist field is not enough – it only furthers the structures that are already in place²¹. There is a cry for structures to be challenged, categories to be remade, pulled apart, re-examined, and inequalities to be addressed. According to Driver and Rose²², questions of power and representation have become a great concern; there have been examinations of the close connection of the history of

¹⁸ Kobayashi and Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse,' 447.

¹⁹ for example: Sara Mills, *Discourses*; Peter Jackson, *Maps of Meaning*; Alison Blunt, *Travel*; James Duncan, 'Sites of Representation: Place, time and the discourse of the Other,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993); Denis Cosgrove and Mona Domosh, 'Author and Authority: Writing the new cultural geography,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993).

²⁰ Kobayashi and Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse,' 445.

²¹ Blunt and Rose, 'Introduction,' 8-9.

²² Driver and Rose, 'Introduction', 1-3.

geography with that of science²³; theories like Social Darwinism and environmental determinism and their roles within geography have been critically examined²⁴; and, more recently, there has been more thought put into the notions of space, place and landscape which are now being looked at as cultural products²⁵.

Postmodernism is one strand of thought that came out of a shift from positivism. No longer was positivism accepted as the final answer – authoritative views and dominant theories were challenged, and values and subjective work were seen as valid. According to Kobayashi and Peake, this shift in thought initially involved an affirmation that values really were important to scholarship, with a subsequent transformation and development of the concepts of values, an incorporation of developments in other strains of geography and finally an increase in critical debate recognizing that all modes of knowledge are value-laden²⁶. These authors focus on this transformation to a way of thinking that sees naturalized categories and environments as socially constructed.

²³ D. Livingstone 'The history of science and the history of geography: interactions and implications,' *History of Science* 22 (1984), 271-302; J.M. MacKenzie *Imperialism and the Natural World* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990).

²⁴ D. Livingstone *Darwin's Forgotten Defenders* (Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1987); D.R. Stoddart *On Geography and its History* (Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986).

²⁵ D. Cosgrove and S. Daniels ed. *The Iconography of Landscape* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988); S. Pugh *Reading Landscape: Country-City-Capital* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990).

²⁶ Kobayashi and Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse,' 447.

Postmodernism uses language and linguistic theories to emphasize both the analysis of discourse (which enables an understanding of the regimes of power), as well as deconstruction (which is a methodology to challenge and resist dominant discourses)²⁷. Postmodernism cannot be defined in one, all-encompassing statement. However, there are certain statements that can be made about it with which many proponents of postmodernism will agree. Postmodernism can be seen as a 'fundamental attack', an attack on modernist thinking which looks for universal truth and meaning²⁸. One of the central themes of this mode of thinking is the question of authority and privilege: how can one viewpoint have more status than another?²⁹ Postmodernist theory is very destabilizing in that theoretical frameworks lose the privilege they have obtained over time. In addition to this, there is 'no clear consensus on the criteria by which any claim to privilege will be judged', leading to the idea that any attempt to come to such a consensus should not be made, since its purpose would only nurture a new metanarrative (all-encompassing universal truth)³⁰.

Jackson states that postmodernism was adopted by social scientists to acknowledge the fact that knowledge is socially constructed, rather than simply

²⁷ An in-depth discussion of discourses will be included in Chapter 2, while a look at deconstruction occurs in the second section of this chapter.

²⁸ M. Dear, 'The Postmodern Challenge: Reconstructing Human Geography,' *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, no 13 (1988): 265.

²⁹ Ibid.

³⁰ Ibid., 266.

received³¹. Within the field of geography, postmodernism has created an interest in the problems of essentialized description and representation. Kobayashi and Peake are aware of the importance of this methodology in breaking free from Enlightenment thought, but note that some feminists and anti-racists feel that poststructuralism is still androcentric and does little to change and challenge the positions of many marginalized groups. Often, deconstructionists can become caught up in language and actually do little to change the world³².

Here, I want to look at the work of three sets of geographers (Kobayashi and Peake, Jackson, and England) and how they have adapted this shift in thinking to their own work within the field of geography, emphasizing what they feel is important in the connection between their idea of postmodernism and their research. These three sets of geographers have taken the question, "Is it geography", deconstructed its binary implications, and have put in its place their own thoughts on how postmodernism, in its many forms, can be applied to geography. I have chosen these geographers in order to exemplify some of the ways in which the problems I have discussed thus far, where much of the knowledge within the discipline of human geography has become naturalized, can be addressed successfully.

Audrey Kobayashi and Linda Peake concede that geographers tend to agree on the indivisibility of values and ideologies, and that social constructs

³¹ Jackson, *Maps of Meaning*, 176.

³² Kobayashi and Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse,' 447.

involve some expression of dominant ideologies, but they argue that we should go farther than this³³. They propose a two-step process that will allow the geographer to go beyond the initial acceptance of social construction: (1) an analysis of the processes of social construction to understand how concepts become naturalized – how they are seen as part of the natural order; and (2) a need to develop what they call 'unnatural discourse' which challenges categories so intrinsically naturalized that they may not be seen as a problem. It is only through the critical scrutiny of categories in research that we can expose the ideologies embedded in them. Their research is an ongoing learning process – they wish to become more learned in 'unnatural discourse' in order to expose the ways naturalized tendencies have worked. Their analysis of the processes of social construction is not based on highly sophisticated or theoretical work, but relies on patient and determined empirical work that looks at details and taken-for-granted notions, asks questions that have not been asked before, and then examines language that is used to give statements their naturalizing power. They encourage others to uncover terrain that is uncontested only because it is deemed common sense. They attempt to use and gain control of language in order to comprehend the ways in which discourses are constructed, how they become tenets through repetition, and re-presentation.

Kobayashi and Peake urge other geographers to use the same notions of unnatural discourse to question their own codes. Let me attempt this with the

³³ Kobayashi and Peake, 'Unnatural Discourse,' 448.

title of this subsection: "Is It Geography?" This question is part of the 'natural' discourse of geography – we want to know by asking this question if a person's work fits into the dominant order: does it fit into a proper place within the discipline? The notion of placing something in its proper place is connected to the process of 'othering', and we need to understand that this connection should be avoided – by doing this, we, as geographers, can expand our geographical sphere, develop new ways of seeing. Seeing often involves descriptions and constructions of people and landscapes as 'different'; new ways of seeing involve looking at these constructions not only as created, but as created to justify certain visions and ideologies. The unnatural discourse of seeing needs to include a 'replacement', a re-arrangement of what is seen to fit naturally into a certain place. Perhaps the question, then, could be 'Does the work being done help to look at something in a new way, and does it pull apart and question the things that are often taken for granted within what has been seen to be part of the geographical field?'

Peter Jackson has also looked at the issues of 'unnatural discourse' without actually using the term. In *Maps of Meaning*, he looks at the various changes that are occurring in ideologies, especially in connection to geography³⁴. He looks at how postmodernism, for example, has been adopted by the social sciences, and he presents his ideas on how these changes in thought could and should be incorporated into the discipline.

³⁴ Jackson, *Maps of Meaning*, 175-186.

He states that postmodernism has been embraced by social scientists to question the way knowledge is constructed rather than simply received. Within geography specifically, it has often been used to re-examine the problems associated with geographical descriptions. However, he says the field has gone from modes of representation that include a complete lack of self-reflection to an almost obsessive degree of it. Empiricism is being thrown out and researchers are experimenting with a wide variety of representational modes. He challenges geographers to link the two. The one thing that he finds that most people agree on within the field, is the transition from seeing culture as a unitary concept to seeing it as a plurality. If landscape is a way of seeing, then potentially, there are as many ways of seeing landscapes as there are people to see them. The concept of culture is best seen in terms of the processes through which meanings are constructed and experienced, and for cultural geography to change, it cannot stick to well worn formulae, but should become involved in contemporary intellectual debates, not seeing them as a threat, but as opportunities to evolve. For example, for Jackson, it is no longer enough to have studies of subordinate groups – women, minority groups, etc – but it is now necessary to have studies of gender and racism which focus on the *relations* between dominant and subordinate groups. He warns his readers not to throw out empirical work, but to incorporate this type of research with greater theoretical sophistication. With these tools, geographers will be capable of great contributions to social and cultural theory. His challenge to geographers is to

open up cultural geography to theory that focuses on social and political constructions of culture. For Jackson, however, every map is ambiguous, and so too is every meaning – cultural maps allow several readings, and so he urges geographers to challenge dominant readings³⁵.

Kim England³⁶ is another geographer who has questioned how postmodernism has affected her work. She sees her research as an on-going process, an inter-subjective (dialogic) activity involving reflection, learning from experience, and critical re-evaluation of past research. She looks at how geographers are increasingly more aware of the problems with the presentation of an 'objective' and value-free work, acknowledging a wider acceptance of socially constructed and situated knowledge. 'Problematized fieldwork' is the term she uses for research methods where the researcher confronts the subjects – those who are being researched. She takes a feminist stance within her research, but realizes that the same types of issues exist for researchers with other concerns.

England notes that feminism and postmodernism have opened up the social sciences and are challenging the methodology of neopositivist empiricism. What is attractive about these latter methods is their anchored security – a basis from which research is then carried out. Dichotomies between subject and object

³⁵ Jackson, *Maps of Meaning*, 175-177.

³⁶ K. England, 'Getting Personal: Reflexivity, Positionality, and Feminist Research,' in *Reading Human Geography: The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. T. Barnes and D. Gregory (New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 1997), 69-83.

are needed for objectivity, and this has been encouraged by the notion that the researcher is the expert who has control over both the subjects and the research process. After years of this type of research, the idea of an impersonal and impartial research has become not only embedded in methodology, but has become essential to what is seen as 'good' research. Concepts of partiality and personal subjectivity are seen as a threat to the objective work, and possibly as a threat to the researcher who sees him- or herself as free of bias. England sees openness, complexity and culturally constructed knowledge as crucial to new research and advocates their embrace, not their dismissal. Embracing complexity and openness, the field will be in a constant state of change, with researchers often having to manoeuvre around and move through unexpected circumstances. This means the only thing that can be expected from the research is the unexpected. This is ideal as it underlines the need for 'broader, less rigid conception[s]'³⁷ of the methods that give more flexibility to the researcher. What England encourages is a geography which includes intersubjectivity and reflexivity. By this latter concept, she means a critical and self-conscious analytical examination of the researcher as self. She feels this is crucial to the research as a process as well as the researcher as a person, as it opens up and leads to a more flexible approach to the project, allowing the researcher to be ready for the various challenges and questions that will arise. She warns, however, that at all times, geographers must be aware of, and have

³⁷ England, 'Getting Personal,' 71.

consideration for, the consequences of these interactions with those peoples and places being researched.

For England, then, the researcher is pivotal to the research. She understands that every geographer is different, with varied biographies and histories and experiences, and so, understands that these pasts influence the work. It is a myth to imagine researchers as unbiased and impartial – the researcher affects the fieldwork. This is obvious when acknowledging that the researcher is part of the world that is being researched.

A common thread between these researchers is the fact that they all see categories and boundaries as socially constructed. By acknowledging this, they can see things more fluidly and in a more interdisciplinary fashion. Breaks and divisions in these fluidities are seen as artificial. We must ask why geographers have constructed boundaries – why they were put there in the first place, by whom, and for what reasons?

This thesis results from my own introduction to postmodern thought. As I have shown how several geographers have discarded the question 'Is it geography' and replaced it with their own definition of geography in their research, so too must I. I have shown why this question places limitations on geographical method and research. Previously in this discussion, I attempted to replace the question with another, one that asked if the research helps to look at something in a new way, if it pulls apart the work at hand and questions what has been taken for granted within geography. This is indeed what I have done in this

project. My research takes several travel texts about one area now situated in Pakistan – Hunza – and deconstructs them. I attempt to look at them in a new way, pull them apart, and examine what has been taken for granted.

In a sense, my work encompasses the same ideas as all three of these sets of geographers I have just presented. I feel it is important to see all knowledge as socially constructed, and feel that geography is a discipline within which this notion should be more assertively applied. I realized that many of the naturalized representations and statements made about the people of Hunza had seldom been examined and questioned before³⁸. As deconstruction is often seen to be the 'method' of postmodern thought³⁹, I began to realize how this method of examination would benefit this research. As Kobayashi and Peake have done in their application of 'unnatural discourse', I examined the language that was used to give the statements their naturalizing power. By examining the language, I was able to see the ways in which the representations were constructed, and how they became naturalized beliefs over time and through repetition. Peter Jackson sees the potential of postmodernism in geography as it both enables geographers to re-examine the problems found in geographical

³⁸ Exceptions include David Butz, 'True Stories, Partial Stories: A Century of Interpreting Shimshal from the Outside,' in *North Pakistan: Karakoram Conquered*, ed. N.J.R. Allan (Boulder: Westview Press, forthcoming); David Butz and Kenneth Iain MacDonald, 'Investigating portering relations as a locus for transcultural interaction in the Karakoram region of Northern Pakistan,' *Mountain Research and Development* 18, no. 4 (1998): 333-343; Kenneth Iain MacDonald, 'Push and Shove: Spatial History and the Construction of a Portering Economy in Northern Pakistan,' *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 40, no. 2 (1998): 287-317.

³⁹ Dear, 'The Postmodern Challenge,'.

descriptions and encourages a questioning of the text. The travel texts within this project are indeed geographical descriptions that need to be examined. Through this postmodern experience, I am nurturing my sensitivity to representations in text – and encourage other geographers to do so – in that I no longer accept categories and representations as is. I find it necessary to pull them apart, and examine the purposes for which they were constructed. Kim England has taught me to introduce positionality to my research, and to promote dialogic activity. This only encourages seeing the research as a process, not as a product.

By using these notions, I was able to begin my research. I read many travel books about the area from various time periods, and finally narrowed down the texts I was to use to one or two (sometimes three) per period. I attempted to find texts that exemplified many of the representations common in other books of the same time. By doing this, I could focus on similar representations, and then in later texts, I could draw on certain representations I had previously examined in other time periods. For example, the representation of the 'Happy Hunza' begins in E.O. Lorimer's book⁴⁰, appears later in the forties and fifties, and continues on into the nineties⁴¹. By describing this representation within

⁴⁰ E.O. Lorimer, *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* (London: George Allen and Unwin, 1939).

⁴¹ For example, over time, the image appears in J.I. Rodale, *The Healthy Hunzas* (Emmaus, PA: Rodale Press, 1949); George Band, *Road to Rakaposhi* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1955); Allen E. Banik and Renée Taylor, *Hunza Land: The Fabulous Health and Youth Wonderland of the World* (Long Beach, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1960; Roland Michaud and Sabrina Michaud, 'Trek to lofty Hunza - and Beyond,' *National Geographic* 148

Lorimer's book, I am then able to reintroduce this notion as it applies to later books. What I have done here, is to examine the texts to find the various representations of the area and the inhabitants – this is done by looking at the language used in the texts. For example, by using words that describe the people as cheerful, rosy-cheeked, happy, healthy, and polite, the authors' representations construct an image of the people as continuously happy and healthy. In addition to finding the representations within the texts, I have examined how those representations have created the opportunity for people (mainly Westerners, but not exclusively) to treat Hunza and its inhabitants in certain ways. For example, initially, the people of Hunza were represented as sub-humans: animal-like, barbaric, and warring. This construction of the people as insignificant by the Westerners in the area resulted in their use and abuse as porters and servants. Looking at the texts chronologically was crucial to this project as it allowed me to examine the representations, and note their development over time. As the representations were altered, both the ways in which the people were treated and the activities of the Western travellers towards them changed.

The thesis is divided into three parts, with the opening part acting as an introduction to the methodology, theory and history of the area. The following

(1975): 644-679; Maureen Lines, *Beyond the North-west Frontier: travels in Hindu Kush and Karakoram* (Sparkford, England: Oxford Illustrated Press, 1988); John McCarry, 'High Road to Hunza,' *National geographic* 185, no. 3 (1994): 114-134.

parts deal specifically with the travel texts, with Part Two covering texts written before Independence in 1947, and Part Three covering post-Independence texts. Chapter Four examines texts written before the British campaign of 1891⁴². Initially, much of the information coming out of the area was written by those on missions whose job it was to gather as much information as they could. Mainly, this information was very descriptive – representations of the people, the landscape, and the climate. Much of this information was used in colonial military practices, and so, often focuses on the military activities in the area. The books I have chosen to examine in Chapter Four focus both on information gathering and military conduct.

Later, the style of writing changes as do the purposes of the voyages. The information that reaches the West after the turn of the century is no longer simply under cover of government reports or newspaper articles, but is presented as narratives in travel books. As Hunza was now part of British India, this made it possible in the early decades of this century for adventurers of all sorts to travel and hunt, and allowed for the writing of the travel stories of this time. This time period, from the turn of the century to the 1930s, was a time of exploration and adventure. There was less concern about military practices, and more concern about filling in gaps in the knowledge – both physical and social. The two books I

⁴² This campaign will be further discussed in Chapter Three which discusses Hunza's history.

present in Chapter Five are both written within this genre of exploration and adventure, description and representation.

The next period I examine encompasses the late 1930s. The books written about Hunza were written by people who had spent more time in the area, and interacted with the inhabitants on a more continuous level. The sole book I examine in Chapter Six is one of the first 'ethnographic' studies of the Hunza people, and goes into a fair amount of descriptive detail⁴³. Written by a woman who had been able to spend a considerable amount of time in Hunza, this book presents the beginning of the 'Happy Healthy Hunza' representation that reoccurs over the next sixty years.

Part Two examines texts that have been written since Independence (1947). Chapter Seven presents two types of books that were written in the post-war period of the 1950s and 1960s. Because of political sensitivity in the area, Hunza was kept fairly closed to many foreigners at this time. Only a few travellers managed to obtain permission to enter Hunza. One of the books in this chapter looks at the beginnings of the 'development' theories implemented in the area. The representations this book introduces are very much a result of the author's ideas on development. This time period also includes a large number of books that continue Lorimer's representation of the 'Happy Healthy Hunza'. Perhaps because of the difficulties in obtaining permission to enter the area, it

⁴³ E.O. Lorimer, *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* London: George Allen and Unwin, 1939.

becomes imbued with mysticism and legend. This is the beginning of the representation of the Hunza people holding the secret to the 'fountain of youth'.

Chapter Eight examines texts that have been written more recently. This group of texts includes modern-day adventures, texts that concern themselves with the environment, and those that help the authors 'find themselves'. In addition, development discourse still finds a voice within these texts, often intertwined with these other themes. After the completion of the Karakoram Highway, which connects Pakistan and China, a rise in the amount of adventure tourism in Hunza is evident, and several of the books examined in this chapter cater to this type of traveller. The books in this chapter both introduce new representations of the inhabitants and the area, as well as re-produce many of the same ones that have been used repeatedly so far.

Much of the most recent writing about Hunza has occurred online on the World Wide Web. The growth of the popularity of the Internet over the past decade has spurred a great amount of literature to be published on-line, and writing about Hunza is no exception. In Chapter Nine I examine some of the websites that have been created to publicize the area's tourism industry, as well as sites that have been used to publish travel narratives. Again, the representations found within these sites are similar to those found previously in the travel texts.

Thus, within this examination of travel texts written about Hunza over a certain period of time I accomplish several things: I introduce my readers to

some of the travel texts that have been published since the late nineteenth century; I present the theoretical knowledge that is necessary for this type of project; I contextualize those texts within a historical account of the region; I examine the texts' language with the purpose of finding the various representations existing within those texts; and, I study how those representations, as they change over time, are used to treat the people and their land in various purposeful manners. I combine both empirical work and theory, as Jackson has suggested geographers do. Throughout this process, I have opened up my own notion of geography to a great degree, by focusing on social and political constructions of culture. By doing this, I am able to question the categories and representations that have been constructed within these texts, showing how some have become dominant and naturalized. In sum, this thesis process is a way of expanding my own sensitivity to representational problems in geographical descriptions. I encourage other geographers to do the same.

Deconstruction of a Method; Deconstruction as a Method

'Truth' is to be understood as a system of ordered procedures for the production, regulation, distribution, circulation and operation of statements. 'Truth' is linked in a circular relation with systems of power which produce and sustain it, and to effects of power which it induces and which extend it. A regime of truth.
- Michel Foucault⁴⁴

Foucault's statement introduces the ways in which categories, boundaries and statements can be seen as 'truths' – they are continually re-produced, re-distributed and re-circulated. This process of repetition has a numbing effect – the statements become true, the categories become true, the boundaries become true. They become 'common sense' and are left unquestioned. For example, many of the statements in the travel writing presented here are seen as 'true' – often, the same statements are repeated over a century. 'Others' are constructed definitively so as to be seen as nothing but the truth, while other statements become true only because of the position of the author as an 'expert authority' on the people and land. These 'truths' are re-iterated, and the stories are retold so often that readers believe that the people are exactly as described in the book: the racial divisions noted are necessary for the study of the people, the derogatory remarks are acceptable because of the acceptance of a superior, more knowledgeable researcher/traveller⁴⁵.

⁴⁴ Foucault, *Power/Knowledge*, 133.

⁴⁵ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979).

'The problem,' Foucault states, 'is not changing people's consciousnesses – or what's in their heads – but the political, economic, institutional regime of the production of truth.'⁴⁶ What he is calling for, is a detachment of the power of 'truth' from the various forms of social, economic, and cultural dominance. This role, given to the critic, can be seen as deconstructive in a broad sense, pulling apart the structures and the contradictions within them, and then working with the fragments to create new relationships between knowledge and power⁴⁷.

Shurmer-Smith and Hannam have stated that geographers need to have an appreciation of deconstructionism so we may understand the ways both empowerment and disempowerment depends on thinking outside the societal 'system', or against the grain⁴⁸. For them, one of the most important aspects of deconstructionism is 'decentring', or disempowering the subject. By examining and pulling apart the 'interestedness' of the subject in a certain area, looking at his or her logic and concerns, the categories used are revealed. They insist that there is no 'innocent' position from which to conduct research – only political positions, and these politics need to be examined in order to question the statements of truth being made by them.

⁴⁶ M. Foucault, *Power/Knowledge*, 133.

⁴⁷ Driver and Rose, *Introduction*, 6-7.

⁴⁸ Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, *Worlds of Desire*.

Deconstruction, as with poststructuralism, is said to have originated in 1966 in a conference address given by Jacques Derrida⁴⁹. It is a concept that reverses structuralism by rejecting closure, totality, and dichotomist and binary systems. Gayatri Spivak, in her translator's preface to Derrida's *Of Grammatology*, gives a good overview of the processes involved in poststructuralism and deconstructionism⁵⁰. She shows how structuralism promotes the division between the subject and the object, giving the subject the authority (of knowledge, power) as the object becomes 'illuminated' by the subject. The object becomes something only after the subject has brought intelligibility to it⁵¹. Derrida would problematize this by rejecting the possibility of objective description. Spivak states that there is no simple solution; one cannot simply say that one will not objectify. She states that this distinction between subjectification and objectification is as tentative as other hierarchical oppositions⁵². So, with deconstruction, statements that are presented as the truth, can be examined. It must be remembered that not only must the literature be put under scrutiny, but also the criticism – just as literature does not reveal a single truth, the criticism that follows does not reveal the truth about the literature.

⁴⁹ L. Orr, *A Dictionary of Critical Theory* (New York: Greenwood Press, 1991), 106.

⁵⁰ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, 'Translator's preface' to *Of Grammatology*, by J. Derrida, corrected ed. (Baltimore and London: The John Hopkins University Press, 1997).

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, lvii.

⁵² *Ibid.*, lix.

So, the point of deconstruction is to take apart the structures that appear in any text, then, to reorganize and redistribute them in another way, looking at the reasons they were put together initially.

the task is...to dismantle [*déconstruire*] the metaphysical and rhetorical structures which are at work in [the text], not in order to reject or discard them, but to reinscribe them in another way.⁵³

But how is one to do this? What is meant exactly by dismantling? Derrida's method, if he can be said to have one, is to reverse and displace. By this, he does not simply mean pulling apart the binary opposites – the critic must recognize that within any opposition, there is always a hierarchy, and it is this hierarchy itself that must be deconstructed⁵⁴. I have used deconstruction as my own 'method' here, my own application of general rules in order to take apart many of the dichotomies within the travel writing about Hunza. The notion of a methodology is problematic to Derrida, as we see here:

I have tried to mark the ways in which, for example, deconstructive questions cannot give rise to methods, that is, to technical procedures that could be repeated from one context to another. In what I write, I think there are also procedures that can be transposed by analogy – that is what is called a teaching, a knowledge, applications – but these rules are taken up in a text which is each time a unique element and does not let itself be turned totally into a method⁵⁵.

⁵³ Derrida quoted in Spivak, lxxv.

⁵⁴ Spivak, 'Translator's Preface,' lxxv.

⁵⁵ J. Derrida, 'There is No One Narcissism,' in *Points...: Interviews, 1974-1994*, ed. E. Weber (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995), 200.

Consequently, although Derrida does not like the use of the term methodology, and argues that methodology cannot really describe what deconstruction is, he states it can be used as a set of general rules to be applied in a unique way to each text that is being used. So, if we were to try and condense the actions of deconstruction, we could follow Spivak who tries, tongue in cheek, to present 'deconstruction in a nutshell'⁵⁶: beginning with the location of a text, one pries loose the positive lever of the signifier, one reverses the hierarchy found within, one then displaces this hierarchy – this dismantling is done in order to reconstitute it. This reconstitution is what Derrida calls 'another writing of the question of Being or meaning' and he promotes deconstruction as 'a manner of writing and putting forward another text'⁵⁷.

But all this discussion begs the questions that Spivak asks in her preface: why should we do all this undoing and redoing of a text at all? What is the point? Is it only to criticize a text, to try and master it by showing what the text is missing? Occasionally, critics who deconstruct a text present their work as *the* truth about the text – they often forget that through their authoritative use of language, their own text becomes a truth that needs to be deconstructed in turn. More often, however, deconstruction attempts to open up the closures that are presented in texts. For Derrida, the importance comes from the 'multiplicity of

⁵⁶ Spivak, 'Translator's Preface,' lxxvii.

⁵⁷ Derrida, 'Narcissism,' 212.

levels or tones⁵⁸. For him, texts present a single unitary tone, a continuous speech which is the very authoritative tone and norm that he says calls out for deconstruction. Not only is it important to deconstruct texts to examine and question the truths and authority that are taken for granted within the texts, but also, it must 'challenge institutions, social and political structures, the most hardened traditions.'⁵⁹

Shurmer-Smith and Hannam agree with Derrida on this point. They argue that conventional academic thought needs to be overhauled, not just in the field of geography, but in all subjects⁶⁰. This does not have to be done simply because there is a change in theory happening at the moment – because it is *à la mode* – but because of what this change has revealed: that knowledge is structured and constructed in favour of privileged groups of elites, while 'others' are excluded. These authors embrace poststructuralist thinking as it brings about the empowerment of different types of thought which was previously seen as unimportant and illogical.

⁵⁸ J. Derrida, 'Unsealing ("the old new language"),' in *Points....: Interviews, 1974-1994*, ed. E. Weber (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995), 130.

⁵⁹ Derrida, "Narcissism", 213.

⁶⁰ Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, *Worlds of Desire*.

As Derrida advocates, this thesis is presented as one narration 'among other possible narrations'⁶¹. It is not to be seen as *the* text that reveals the truths about other texts – I hope it will be as deconstructed and criticized as much as the texts I examine.

⁶¹ Derrida, "Narcissism", 203.

Chapter Two. Theoretical Background

Introduction

1 Travel...

Travel is often associated with the concept of 'foreignness', a concept which Shurmer-Smith and Hannam argue incorporates complicated and intricate relations of power and privilege. An object, person, or place designated as 'foreign', is identified as excluded from an assumed, usually Western, 'normal' frame of reference¹. While the division between 'home', or 'normal', and 'foreign' is thought to be clear by most people, Blunt shows us that travel both familiarizes (or, domesticates) the unfamiliar, and, de-familiarizes the familiar².

2 ... writing

Travel writing, as an industry, is booming. Travel narratives are translated into numerous languages, converted to television programmes and films, published in newspapers, magazines, and journals. Today there is even travel on the Internet (see Chapter 9). Travel writing is often considered a 'frivolous' literary genre. My argument is that, despite being labelled as frivolous, travel

¹ Pamela Shurmer-Smith and Kevin Hannam, *Worlds of Desire, Realms of Power; A Cultural Geography* (London: Edward Arnold, 1994).

² Alison Blunt, *Travel, Gender, and Imperialism: Mary Kingsley and West Africa* (London: The Guilford Press, 1994), 17.

writing needs to be examined and questioned critically for the discourses it reproduces. As most successful travel books are enjoyed by a mainly middle-class readership, and are read by more people than ever before, Holland and Huggan argue that these texts remain a refuge for complacent, nostalgic, and unquestioned middle-class values, and cry out for critical analysis³. Freedom, to travel and to write, can be taken for granted only at other peoples' expense. This often reveals practices of cultural superiority that have led some critics to see travel writing as an agent of imperial domination⁴.

Holland and Huggan show that in contemporary travel writing, there is often a distinction made between the traveller and the tourist⁵. It is important for some writers to make this distinction in order to promote their own superiority. The traveller is seen as 'non-exploitative' – innocently satisfying his or her curiosity about other people and places. The tourist is seen as exploitative, loud, and looking for immediate gratification. Self-identified 'travellers' do not believe they are interfering in another culture, but rather, feel they are contributing to places' and peoples' well-being through their interest and open-minded inquiry in the 'other' culture. Blunt has also noted the distinction travellers often make between travel and tourism. The former is perceived as independent,

³ Patrick Holland and Graham Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters; Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998), viii-ix.

⁴ The connections between travel writing and imperialism will be discussed throughout this chapter in more depth.

⁵ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 2-3.

individualistic, and active, while the latter represents mass, passive consumption⁶. This distinction can be seen not only in travel narratives, but in the tourist industry too (brochures, pamphlets, guide books). The industry feeds travellers' feeling of moral superiority by enticing them to off-the-track 'alternative' places. Holland and Huggan state that this distinction is revered because it allows the traveller to see him- or herself as a 'real' traveller, escaping the guilt involved in interfering and changing another's culture. This guilt is placed, then, on the 'tourist'. Travel writers/travellers feel that because they have a more 'real' experience, the narratives they produce are more 'real'⁷. Nevertheless, travel writers' narratives, like tourists', are simply their own versions of what they take to be reality.

Shurmer-Smith and Hannam note that the increase in travel writing parallels an increase in tourism. This increase feeds travellers' desires to familiarize themselves with the appropriate forms of the 'exotic' before leaving home. For this, guidebooks and travelogues are popular, but so is a more nostalgic 'travel autobiography' genre of armchair travel. The travels described in travel autobiography are usually to places that have already been visited by readers, or to those inaccessible places the travellers long to see. This act of travelling becomes a backdrop for the heroic drama of the narrator, where the places and events differ greatly, but the common theme is of an 'innocent'

⁶ Blunt, *Travel*, 19.

⁷ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 2-3.

abroad, surrounded by various 'types' of foreigners, finding him- or herself sailing through various dangerous, annoying, amusing, inquisitive and exploitative scenes. This writing acts as a journey of self-discovery, and not as a journey of any other type of discoveries⁸. Again, the distinction between traveller and tourist is evident, as this type of narrative glorifies the individual who has experienced an 'authentic' experience different to that of the tourist.

With the increase in travel writing, there has also been an increase in the amount of travel writing analysis. Critical research is needed to question the statements that are presented as taken-for-granted within the texts. Sara Mills contends that critical analysis of this genre has been prompted both by what she calls 'Raj revival'⁹ and by an increase in the analysis of colonial discourse, beginning with Edward Said's *Orientalism*¹⁰. Travel writing to her, and to many others, was an instrument of colonial expansion, and served to reinforce colonial rule once in place¹¹. Many theorists have begun looking critically at travel writing in order to examine various types of discourse – race, gender, and colonialism –

⁸ Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, *Worlds of Desire*, 26-27.

⁹ *Raj revival*: 'permeates cultural production in Britain at present, with images and ideological positions of the colonial period being transposed onto British cultural forms of the 1980s and 1990s. Sara Mills, *Discourses of Difference: An analysis of women's travel writing and colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991), 2.

¹⁰ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979).

¹¹ Mills, *Discourses*, 2.

in order to examine the questions of representation, authority, power, and fact and fiction that prevail within this genre¹².

In this thesis, I present an examination of various travel texts used by travel writers in order to present the worlds that they have observed. The voices of these narrators are authoritative, and their narratives are presented as true representations of their experiences. By taking apart – deconstructing – the texts, it becomes evident that not only are the texts constructed, but the contexts, certain situations, and categories used, are themselves constructed. I will begin by examining the notion of discourse and what is involved in the construction and maintenance of a discourse. Following this, I will show how various critical thinkers have used the example of travel writing to show how all texts should be analysed for their discursive implications. I then examine some of the language and narrative techniques used in the construction of travel writing, and finish this chapter with a look at travel writing reception.

¹² Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992); Peter Hulme, *Colonial Encounters: Europe and the Native Caribbean, 1492-1797* (New York: Methuen and Co., 1986); Sara Mills, *Discourses*; Alison Blunt, *Travel*; James Clifford, 'Introduction: Partial Truths,' in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986), 1-26.

Discourse

In order to contextualize the following theoretical discussion, it is necessary to present a brief discussion of Michel Foucault's conceptualization of discourse and discursive formations. Foucault defines *discourse*¹³, as 'a system of possibility for knowledge'¹⁴. Discourses describe 'frameworks that embrace particular combinations of narratives, concepts, ideologies and signifying practices, each relevant to a particular realm of social action'¹⁵. I will follow Derek Gregory's discussion of the term, found in *The Dictionary of Human Geography*¹⁶. He states that there is no single definition for 'discourse', but several things can be attributed to it.

First, discourses are not independent, but are caught up in day-to-day life where they have substantial effects. Second, 'discourses shape the contours of the taken-for-granted world', meaning that they make acceptable – naturalize – a particular point of view. Third, discourses make available only *partial* knowledges, and thus, are 'characterized by particular constellations of power and knowledge and are always open to contestation and negotiation'.

¹³ For extensive discussions of *discourse* and *discursive formation*, see Michel Foucault, *The Archaeology of Knowledge*, trans. A.M. Sheridan Smith (London: Tavistock Publications, 1972), 31-49.

¹⁴ M. Philp, 'Michel Foucault,' in *The Return of Grand Theory in the Human Sciences*, ed. Q. Skinner (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1985), 69.

¹⁵ Trevor Barnes and James Duncan, 'Introduction,' in *Writing Worlds*, ed. Trevor Barnes and James Duncan (London: Routledge, 1992), 8.

¹⁶ Derek Gregory, 'Discourse,' in *The Dictionary of Human Geography*, 3rd edition, 136-137.

Much of the initial work on discourses came from Foucault's work on the relationships between power, knowledge, and representations. Barnes and Duncan show that because it appeals to 'common sense' or scientific status, knowledge, through representation, is itself a power and not simply a manifestation of power relations in the world¹⁷. Because of this, discourses are naturalizing and often remain unquestioned.

Hale reminds us that within the argument of social constructionism, power, 'like all other aspects of social reality, is understood as a process that is accomplished rather than a fact of life'¹⁸. Power is not an object or possession; it is a practice. For example, the work of social scientists is a good example of the notion of power as practice since 'their interpretations carry the authority of science and specialized expertise'¹⁹. Persuasion is the method used to practise this power, and is accomplished by getting people to accept a particular construction as 'the way things are'. After accepting certain constructions, people adjust their behaviour and attitudes to match. Although power is not always coercive, as it often does not carry the threat of violence, it is very hard to resist, as it is 'so grounded in objective, factual evidence'²⁰.

¹⁷ Barnes and Duncan, 'Introduction,' 9.

¹⁸ Sylvia Hale, *Controversies in Sociology* (Toronto: Copp Clark, 1995), 33.

¹⁹ Ibid.

²⁰ Ibid., 34.

Foucault's methods of analysis focus on statements and objects. He asks:

what rules permit certain statements to be made; what rules order these statements; what rules permit us to identify some statements as true and some as false; what rules allow the construction of a map, model or classificatory system; what rules allow us to identify certain individuals as authors, and what rules are revealed when an object of discourse is modified or transformed. ... Whenever sets of rules of these kinds can be identified, we are dealing with a discursive formation or discourse²¹.

So, those interested in the study of discourse are not so much concerned with the 'truth' statements, but rather, with the 'production' of the 'truths' and how things come to be understood as true or false. In order to see how the discursive rules are used to formulate 'true' statements, an examination of: 'the place, the function and character of the "knowers", authors and audiences'²² is necessary. So, for example, we might take several statements that are presented as true about the people of Hunza:

Then, too, writers and observers of the people of Hunza always mention and stress the fact that they are a happy pleasant people. To this I must also assent. I did not see a sad or disgruntled Hunzan.²³

These primitive agricultural methods require the arduous labor of men, women, and children from sunrise to sunset, but the happy,

²¹ Philp, 'Michel Foucault,' 69.

²² Ibid.

²³ John Tobe, *Hunza: Adventures in a land of paradise* (Toronto: George J. McCleod, 1960), 375.

smiling and healthy faces of the Hunzakuts seem to be a more than ample reward for their efforts.²⁴

It is important not to simply re-present these statements as true. What must be done is to reveal 'the sets of discursive rules which *allow* the formation of groups of statements which are ...'true or false''²⁵.

Here I introduce one of Foucault's discussions on truth, to help understand why truth and authority are such important aspects of travel writing. For Foucault, truth is centred on scientific discourse (meaning, things that can be 'proved' by science are 'true'); and, truth is produced and controlled by various institutions (for example, truth is learned in school, or through the media). The production, circulation, re-presentation, and control of truth, links it with 'systems of power which produce and sustain it'²⁶. This is not a power that is in the hands of a few, but a power that everyone is a part of, including those who 'exercise power just as much as those over whom it is exercised'²⁷. But, if truth is centred in scientific discourse and is controlled and produced by a few institutions, should we, as critical thinkers, be suspicious of science, universities, and the media? Foucault says yes, but suggests that we should not focus exclusively on the ideologies of science, as it is more important to detach the power of truth from

²⁴ Renée Taylor and Mulford J. Nobbs, *Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La* (El Monte, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1962), 19.

²⁵ Philp, 'Michel Foucault,' 69 [my emphasis].

²⁶ Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977*, ed. Colin Gordon (London: Harvester Press, 1980), 133.

²⁷ *Ibid.*, 156.

the various forms of privileged structures of culture and economy within which it operates.

The main purpose of the thesis is to examine the sets of rules that allow for certain statements about Hunza to be presented and received as true, by examining the places, functions and characters of both the authors of the travel texts, and of the audiences for whom the texts were written. As Mills suggests,

Foucauldian analyses embody a certain productive scepticism which is useful for readings of all kinds: it is essential to look at all types of writing in just as critical and suspicious a way as one would a literary text²⁸

²⁸ Mills, *Discourses*. 7.

Colonial and Travel Theory

1 Colonial Discourse

Colonial discourse, as a term, can refer to the colonial time period (in Hunza, from 1891 to 1947) and the practises found therein, as well as the language associated with much of the writings of the time. However, the language of colonial discourse continues to this day.

Hulme says that colonial discourse includes a large body of writing where non-European parts of the world were produced for Europe through a discourse that imbricated sets of assumptions, methods of procedure and analysis, and kinds of writing and imagery, normally separated out into the discrete areas of military strategy, political order, social reform, imaginative literature, personal memoir and so on²⁹. I use the term colonial discourse to refer to texts found within the period of high imperialism³⁰ as well as to denote the language that has gone *beyond* the colonial period in Hunza, the language that survives even today

²⁹ Hulme, *Colonial Encounters*, 2.

³⁰ Mills is concerned mainly with the period of 'high imperialism' which encompasses the mid-nineteenth century to early twentieth century, when 'a new colonial relationship emerged, where formal conquest, annexation and administration became the most common relation between Britain and certain other countries, and Britain declared itself to be an imperial nation' and tries not to see colonialism as a unitary and totalizing notion, but concentrates on 'the differences of discursive frameworks which the changes in the colonial situation entailed'. Mills, *Discourses*, 1. She also notes that colonial discourse 'poses itself as referring to 'reality', as telling the 'truth' about other countries'. Mills, *Discourses*, 7-12.

in the travel texts and guidebooks, and that continues 'to color perceptions of the non-Western world'³¹.

Homi Bhabba notes that the main objective of colonial discourse is to:

construe the colonised as a population of degenerate types on the basis of racial origin, in order to justify conquest and to establish systems of administration and instruction. Despite the play of power within colonial discourse and the shifting positionalities of its subjects, ... I am referring to a form of governmentality that in marking out a 'subject nation', appropriates, directs and dominates its various spheres of activity. Thus, despite the 'play' in the colonial system which is crucial to its exercise of power, colonial discourse produces the colonised as a fixed reality which is at once an 'other' and yet entirely knowable and visible³².

Thus, according to Bhabba, one of the effects of this discourse is to produce the colonized people as 'different', while keeping them knowable. This means that these people are separated from the colonizers, yet were kept under constant surveillance. One of the main features of colonial discourse, for Bhabba, is the concept of 'fixity'. This concept, which signifies differences in race, culture, and history, is a binary method of representation: the word itself refers to what is perceived as the 'unchanging other', as well as to their 'disorder [and] degeneracy'³³. It is like the 'stereotype', ambivalent as it wavers between what is known and what must be repeated. This ambivalence, according to Bhabba, is what gives stereotypes their force. It enables a statement or idea to be repeated in the same manner within a history that is continually changing, yet

³¹ Ibid.

³² Homi K. Bhabba, 'The Other Question...', *Screen* 24, no. 6 (1983): 23.

³³ Ibid., 18.

still produce the effect of truth through its repetition. An examination of this ambivalence is important to Bhabba, as it helps him question various positions on oppression and discrimination. He urges readers to move beyond the '*identification* of images as positive or negative, to an understanding of the *processes of subjectification* made possible (and plausible) through stereotypical discourse'³⁴. Simply identifying a stereotype dismisses it. Bhabba wishes to displace stereotypes, by looking at the positions of power, resistance, domination, and dependence that aid in constructing the representation of the colonized.

In order to understand the productivity of colonial power it is crucial to construct its regime of 'truth', not to subject its representations to a normalizing judgement. Only then does it become possible to understand the *productive* ambivalence of the object of the colonial discourse – that 'otherness' which is at once an object of desire and derision, an articulation of difference contained within the fantasy of origin and identity³⁵.

What this entails, then, is an examination of the production of knowledge about non-Europeans that have been presented as statements of truth. This production of knowledge about non-Europeans for a European audience is the concern of not only this particular thesis project, but the work of many critical thinkers, both in and beyond the field of geography³⁶. Mills is one critical thinker who has been prolific in colonial discourse analysis.

³⁴ Ibid [original emphasis].

³⁵ Ibid, 19, [original emphasis].

³⁶ For example: Said, *Orientalism*; Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*; Hulme, *Colonial Encounters*; Mills, *Discourses*; Blunt, *Travel*; Derek Gregory, 'Between the book and the lamp: imaginative

Mills defines three ways that Foucault's work has been helpful in her own studies of colonial travel writing. First, the notion of discourse itself plays a large part in colonial travel writing. Mills defines discourse as follows:

firstly, all language and the system of rules whereby the utterances/texts are produced; secondly, all texts and utterances produced by those rules, regardless of their literary or factual status; thirdly, groupings of texts/utterances³⁷

She argues that one of the more important aspects of discourse is its relation to other discourses; so, travel writing is not only an expression of the author's 'truth' statements, but an arrangement of a group of discursive statements the author must negotiate and deal with.

Second, Mills uses Foucault's work to look at the *surface* of discourse³⁸. Foucault does not believe in revealing any particular hidden meaning in a text, as this assumes that there is an 'illusory truth' that is lying there, waiting to be uncovered. Foucault claims there is no 'hidden reality' to discover, just more interpretation. So, following Mills, in the deconstruction of the travel texts within this study, I am not looking for the 'real' version of the story. Rather, I am pulling the layers away to reveal more and more questions about the text, author, and audience.

geographies of Egypt, 1849-50,' *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* NS no. 20 (1995): 29-57.

³⁷ Mills, *Discourses*, 8.

³⁸ This is important as it ties in with the discussion of deconstruction that is found in the section on methodology.

Third, Mills draws on the work of Foucault because he addresses the problems of claiming scientific authority and truth for the authors' statements. Foucault teaches us that these statements are 'representational practices rather than 'scientific' accounts'³⁹, allowing critical readers to resist the claims that are presented as true solely based on scientific proof.

Incorporating Foucault's ideas in this project allows me to examine the travel texts within the frameworks of discourse, which are essential to question the structures that have been put in place, and which have normalized many of the statements about the people of Hunza. Mills helps her readers understand that discourses are not a highly abstract notion, but also become 'sites of struggle for meaning and also a means of constituting humans as individuals'⁴⁰. This means that discourses are not simply unknown texts that have no effect on anyone; they are what constitute us as subjects. We play a part in the process which includes 'both challenging and rewriting some of the positions within discourse'⁴¹.

i Orientalism

The construction of an 'other' is the basis of Said's *Orientalism*, which shows how the Orient is constructed by Westerners as a discipline, a political

³⁹ Mills, *Discourses*, 68.

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ Ibid.

agenda, and a legitimization for European superiority. Orientalism, for Said, is a discourse with all the attendant language, institutions, imagery, and colonial bureaucracy. The Orient 'is an idea that has a history and a tradition of thought, imagery, and vocabulary that have given it reality and presence in and for the West'⁴². Said believes Orientalism is a discursively constructed:

body of theory and practice in which, for many generations, there has been a considerable material investment. Continued investment made Orientalism, as a system of knowledge about the Orient, an accepted grid for filtering through the Orient into Western consciousness, just as that same investment multiplied – indeed, made truly productive – the statements proliferating out from Orientalism into the general culture⁴³.

This proliferation of statements about the Orient created a product: the Orient, which was and is available for Western study through academia, display in museums, and

theoretical illustration in anthropological, biological, linguistic, racial, and historical theses about mankind and the universe, for instances of economic and sociological theories of development, revolution, cultural personality, national or religious character.⁴⁴

Jackson helps us understand Orientalism further by explaining that the Orient was a European invention: 'a place of romance, exotic beings, haunting memories and landscapes, and remarkable experiences'⁴⁵. This invention was not imaginary, but based on real foundations of English, French and American

⁴² Said, *Orientalism*, 5.

⁴³ Ibid., 6.

⁴⁴ Ibid., 6-7.

⁴⁵ Peter Jackson, *Maps of Meaning* (London: Unwin Hyman, 1989), 149.

imperialism, and became a 'self-referential, closed system, effectively sealed off from the empirical world'⁴⁶.

What Said wants his readers to understand, is that the Orientalist speaks *for* the Orient, describes it, explains its mysteries to the West. Throughout his work, he is concerned with and examines representations as the concrete products of discourse, not as 'natural' depictions of the Orient. The way he does this is to study the 'style, figures of speech, setting, narrative devices, historical and social circumstances, *not* the correctness of the representation nor its fidelity to some great original'⁴⁷. Said argues vehemently that representations are precisely that – representations, however much authority and strength they are given by their authors⁴⁸. The representations are presented through Orientalist discourse, relying on 'institutions, traditions, conventions, agreed-upon codes of understanding for their effects, not upon a distant and amorphous Orient'⁴⁹. Orientalist writing is based also on the notion that if the Orient could present itself, it would, but since it cannot, the West has taken up the job.

MacDonald, for example, looks at the notion of the construction of the Oriental 'other' in his research on Balti porters in Northern Pakistan. The use

⁴⁶ Ibid., 150.

⁴⁷ Ibid., 21 [original emphasis].

⁴⁸ Said, *Orientalism*, 20.

⁴⁹ Ibid., 22.

and abuse of the 'coolies'⁵⁰ was not difficult for most Europeans, as they relied on categories already in place in Kashmir before the British arrived, that constructed the coolie as 'childish, feminine, and bestial'. It was easy to construct the Balti both as 'other' to the European, and as 'coolie':

Portering brought Baltis into a colonial society in which the overwhelming organizing factors were race and class (during both the Dogra and British periods). It is not surprising, then, that we find evidence that the construction of the coolie as a social category is based on the threads of race, class, and ethnicity, all of which were woven into an Orientalist tapestry. ... In Kashmir, the ethnic label Balti became synonymous with the class label coolie.⁵¹

Shurmer-Smith and Hannam explain how Said's Orientalism is tied to a masculine gaze upon the 'other'. They state that the construction of the 'mystical Orient' still remains today, for example, in advertisements for musky perfumes that are labelled 'exotic' or 'Oriental', implying 'passion' and 'sensuality'. The authors say that these types of representations do nothing to examine in any depth the power structures or gender relations in existence in 'foreign' countries, but only appeal to Western fantasies, further representing the Orient as 'feminine', 'passive', and 'sensory'⁵². Building on these fantasies, the Orient is often seen as a timeless place, forever connected to the past. By conceiving it as superficially existing in one time, Westerners can construct their own fantasies

⁵⁰ **Coolie:** 'a name used in British India to designate any labouring man, working for hire; also the hire itself' from E. Balfour, *Cyclopedia*, 334-c, quoted in Kenneth Iain MacDonald, 'Push and Shove: Spatial History and the Construction of a Portering Economy in Northern Pakistan,' *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 40, no. 2 (1998): 304.

⁵¹ Ibid.

⁵² Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, *Worlds of Desire*, 20.

onto it. This is why, according to these authors, the Orient is often presented in one of two ways: as a luxurious, sensual, and passionate place, or as a cruel, cold, stark, yet intriguing place⁵³. Examples of both these representations are prominent throughout my examination of the travel texts from Hunza.

Although Said's conceptualization of Orientalism remains important, there are many writers who feel that his narrative was too much of a 'homogenous form of information'⁵⁴. Mills states that because Said focused mainly on textual elements, he was unable to see the possibilities for a variety of other interpretations. By relying on very well known texts, he was able to ignore the issue of gender, and any cases of 'othering' that did not fit neatly into his theory. Bhabba also acknowledges the importance of Said's work, but argues that Said sees colonial power and discourse as 'possessed entirely by the colonizer, which is a historical and theoretical simplification'⁵⁵. Blunt agrees, stating that Said 'totalizes the dichotomy between colonizing self and colonized other'⁵⁶ by neglecting ambivalence. Butz, in his examination of both *Orientalism* and its subsequent critiques, argues that one of the most important criticisms relating to Said's 'monolithic' presentation of Orientalism is that it 'leaves too little space for

⁵³ Ibid., 19.

⁵⁴ Sara Mills, 'Knowledge, Gender, and Empire,' in *Writing Women and Space: Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies*, ed. Alison Blunt and Gillian Rose (New York: The Guilford Press, 1994), 29; see also Gregory, 'Between the book and the lamp'; Blunt, *Travel*; Bhabba, 'The Other Question...'.

⁵⁵ Bhabba, 'The Other Question', 25.

⁵⁶ Blunt, *Travel*, 24.

those scholars ... whose participation in Orientalist discourse may have been ambivalent ...; who, in fact, may represent significant alternative currents within hegemonic Orientalism⁵⁷. There are many recent studies that examine the extent to which Orientalism was more 'heterogeneous and polyvocal' than Said permitted in his examination⁵⁸. In addition to this, Said argues in *Orientalism* that a 'real' Orient does not exist, however, his argument tends to show how Orientalism produces a misrepresentation of the Orient. Butz examines the question that has been asked by several critics: 'if there is no true Orient to be represented, how can Orientalism be accused of producing a misrepresentation?'⁵⁹ *Orientalism* has been critically received and examined since its publication, and of its importance to scholars from a great variety of fields, there can be no doubt. I agree with Butz when he argues that 'the book is as important for its failings and omissions as it is for its achievements'⁶⁰, particularly in showing how Orientalism is a discourse that 'continually asserts and manifests the right of the European to speak *for* the colonized'⁶¹.

⁵⁷ David Butz, 'Revisiting Edward Said's *Orientalism*,' *Brock Review* 4, no. 1,2 (1995): 62.

⁵⁸ Mills, *Discourse*; Blunt, *Travel*; Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*; David Butz, 'True Stories, Partial Stories: A Century of Interpreting Shimshal from the Outside,' in *North Pakistan: Karakoram Conquered*, ed. N.J.R. Allan (Boulder: Westview Press, forthcoming).

⁵⁹ Butz, 'Orientalism,' 64.

⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, 56.

⁶¹ *Ibid.*, 63.

ii The power of classification

Mary Louise Pratt has researched the production of knowledge in imperial *contact zones*⁶². She does not limit herself to examinations of texts about countries that *were* colonized and are no longer, but to texts about a variety of countries, colonized or not, since, as she states, the implications and aftermath of colonialism, like slavery, are still being lived today⁶³. Pratt examines travel writing and how it has been formed and informed by narrative techniques of science and sentiment to promote the gathering of information and knowledge useful to the period of colonial expansion. Blunt, too, has noted that travel writing began to be characterized by informational discourses, which promoted imperial control through scientific status and self-legitimization; and, created power and knowledge within the colonial discourse by extending knowledge of the natural world⁶⁴.

Carl Linné's publication of *Systema Naturae* (The System of Nature) is important to the beginnings of this informational discourse as it offered a classification system that categorized all plants. It was so complete that it allowed the classification of plants both known to the world and those that had

⁶² **Contact zones:** 'the space of colonial encounters, the space in which peoples geographically and historically separated come into contact with each other and establish ongoing relations, usually involving conditions of coercion, radical inequality, and intractable conflict...[treating relations between colonised and coloniser] in terms of copresence, interaction, interlocking understandings and practices, often within radically asymmetrical relations of power'. Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 7.

⁶³ For the same reason, this project on Hunza also refers to colonial discourse found in travel texts written after 1947.

⁶⁴ Blunt, *Travel*, 33.

not yet been discovered. It was seen to make 'order out of chaos – both the chaos of nature, and the chaos of earlier botany'⁶⁵. The authority of science was promoted through publications of several detailed botanical reports using the new nomenclatures and taxonomy. Pratt indicates that both journalism and travel writing were voices for this authority, by mediating between the scientific community and the larger public⁶⁶. With Linné's classification, the systematizing of nature became a new European project, what Pratt calls a 'planetary consciousness'. Through various scientific publications, newspapers and travel writing, and the rise in travel, the systematizing of nature soon paralleled the expanding search for exploitable markets, resources, and lands to colonize⁶⁷. This 'land-scanning, information-seeking' came to be a major expression of capitalist expansion in the nineteenth century⁶⁸, and was epitomized by the 'I/eye' of the travel story narrator, as I shall show in the next section. Duncan, too, shows that the new classifications augmented the process of collection (of plants, animals, artefacts, and people), and through this process, Europeans became witnesses to the colonial control occurring around the world⁶⁹.

⁶⁵ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 25.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 25-30.

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, 30.

⁶⁸ Pratt, "'Killed by Science": Travel Narrative and Ethnographic Writing,' in *Literature and Anthropology*, ed. Jonathon Hall and Ackbar Abbas (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1986) 211.

⁶⁹ James Duncan, 'Sites of Representation: Place, time and the discourse of the Other,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993), 25-38.

At first, formal classifications were created for plants and animals, but later on, Linné added people to his system. The categories for humans not only described the physical appearance of certain people, but included terms that were seen as characteristic of their 'natural' psychological qualities⁷⁰.

According to Duncan, evolutionary theories, as well as classification systems, were used to promote European superiority and control. With the introduction of Social Darwinism in the latter half of the nineteenth century, European superiority was given 'scientific respectability'⁷¹. Asia and Africa were seen as farther down the evolutionary scale, and this allowed Europe to use this racist taxonomy to justify imperialism in 'backward' places. Duncan shows how Africa, for example, was transformed from a geographical place to a temporal space, placed in the evolutionary past by the Imperialists. Because Africans were thought of as child-like and mentally underdeveloped (Linné's classification described Africans as being ruled by caprice), their subordination to Europeans (governed by laws) was seen as natural – 'science in the service of politics'⁷². These practices were seen as completely natural, as Jackson notes on the construction of racism, because they used 'nature' (physical and biological

⁷⁰ For example, an 'Asiatic' was described as 'sooty', and 'melancholy', 'severe', 'haughty', and 'governed by opinion', compared to the 'European', described as 'gentle', 'acute', 'inventive', and 'governed by laws'. Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 32.

⁷¹ Duncan, 'Representation,' 52.

⁷² Ibid.

criteria), and not history, to explain perceived social differences⁷³. Driver and Rose agree, stating that through this connection between nature and science, the 'other' people and their land became natural objects of scientific study by the colonial observer⁷⁴.

Shurmer-Smith and Hannam remind their readers of the dangers of classification systems, as they are artificial, and serve to privilege one system's perspective over another (when something is included, something else is excluded)⁷⁵. Differences and similarities are sorted, grouped, and placed in different categories. There are things (plants, places, ideas and people) that fall into the cracks of the system, either by not neatly fitting into a category, or by being able to fit into more than one. Sibley, in *Geographies of Exclusion*, examines the problems of ambiguity that arise when the practice of separating things into unlike categories becomes unattainable – at what point does something (A) become something else (not A)?: 'For an individual or group socialized into believing that the separation of categories is necessary or desirable, the liminal zone is a source of anxiety'⁷⁶. Shurmer-Smith and Hannam

⁷³ Jackson, *Maps of Meaning*, 132-133.

⁷⁴ Felix Driver and Gillian Rose, 'Introduction: Towards New Histories of Geographical Knowledge,' in *Nature and Science: Essays in the History of Geographical Knowledge*, Historical Geography Series, vol. 28, ed. Felix Driver and Gillian Rose (London: Institute of Historical Research, 1992), 5.

⁷⁵ Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, *Worlds of Desire*.

⁷⁶ David Sibley, *Geographies of Exclusion: Society and Difference in the West* (New York: Routledge, 1995), 33. Sibley illustrates this liminal zone by looking at the anxiety caused by several binary categories, including child/adult, where the limits of the categories of 'child' are fuzzy, and have changed through time. Adolescents are not welcome in an adult world, but they

state that many people are unaware of the constructedness of categories, and because of this, never confront the categories that they themselves have been placed in. Hence, it is useful to examine and question any categories, to look at the extent of their construction, whose construction they are, and what purposes they serve.

Duncan has shown that deconstruction of taxonomies and discourses of 'other' is important because it problematizes the representation process. By examining and questioning categories, it can be seen that the process of construction always involves power relations that are arbitrated through various institutions, and historical and scientific assumptions. By destabilizing the categories, classifications, narratives, and techniques of 'othering', the way is paved for alternative histories⁷⁷.

2 Representation

Writing does not occur in a vacuum, but within a series of contexts that work on both the writing and the writer. Here, I introduce some current debates on methods of representation, including the 'crisis of representation', and related examinations of the issues of fiction and truth, authority, and positionality that were introduced in the discussion of colonial discourse.

are trying to detach themselves from being seen as children. The problems that adolescents have because of this separation 'demonstrate that the act of drawing the line in the construction of discrete categories interrupts what is naturally continuous': Ibid, 34-35.

⁷⁷ Duncan, 'Representation,' 54.

James Duncan is one author who discusses the concept of representation⁷⁸. He states that a dualism is present in the representation of places: (1) the site to be represented (a place); and, (2) the site from which the representation comes (theoretical, cultural, political viewpoint)⁷⁹. He situates the site (both meanings) within a larger analysis of discourses about the 'other'. He highlights this duality of representation by showing how the 'different-ness' from the site of the 'other' is appropriated and put into a framework of categories that is usable by those in the site from which the representation comes. He maintains that it is simply not enough to show how discourses of 'other' distort places and people. One must also analyse the relations of power so the interests at play in representations can be further examined.

The issue of representation as an epistemological problem has recently received renewed attention from scholars in the social sciences. Duncan and Ley⁸⁰ state that there have been four main methods of representation throughout the twentieth century, two that claim mimesis, and two that challenge these claims: (1) descriptive fieldwork; (2) mimesis loosely based on positivist science; (3) postmodernism; and, (4) interpretive methods based on hermeneutics. The

⁷⁸ Others include: Clifford, 'Introduction'; Blunt, *Travel*; Mills, *Discourses*; Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, *Worlds of Desire*; Paul Rabinow, 'Representations are Social Facts: Modernity and Post-Modernity in Anthropology,' in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986).

⁷⁹ Duncan, 'Representation,'.

⁸⁰ James Duncan and David Ley, 'Introduction: Representing the place of culture,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993), 1-24.

first method, descriptive fieldwork, was most dominant in cultural geography up to the 1950s. The method is based on observation, with a trained observer transcribing what he or she sees⁸¹. This method of visual experience and representation was widely used in the early days of European contact with the people of Hunza, through the use of first-hand and personal experience.

The second method Duncan and Ley describe, mimesis loosely based on positivist science, has been popular in geography since the 1950s. Duncan and Ley argue that it has had little impact in cultural geography because in its drive to produce reductionist descriptions of the world there is little room for the 'differences between places produced by cultural variation'⁸². Both methods described so far accept that mimesis can be achieved.

Postmodernism, the third method, is an attack on mimetic theories of representation. Duncan and Ley see postmodernism as 'decentring' the authority of the writer, through conducting more open-ended research, introducing polyphonic (many voices) methods, or multiple sites of representational control (eg, women in academic spheres, non-academics within their own cultures)⁸³.

The final method Duncan and Ley discuss is the interpretative method. This method also recognizes the role of the interpreter, which renders pure

⁸¹ Ibid., 2.

⁸² Ibid, 3.

⁸³ Ibid.

mimetic representation unattainable. It does not present a value-free and objective researcher, but realizes that the interpretation is a 'dialogue' between the researcher and the data/subjects. Michael Dear states that these two last methods differ in that the former (postmodernism) advocates continual deconstruction, suspicion and questioning, while the latter (interpretive method) insists that there is an inherent truth and unity in the text that can be revealed with enough examination⁸⁴.

There is an ongoing recent debate, coined the 'crisis of representation', which began mainly within anthropology, concerning the most 'authentic' method of representing the world. Cosgrove and Domosh address the issue by saying that there is only a crisis within representation if researchers think they are offering 'some independent truth' about the world, that they really are representing the world authentically⁸⁵. If it is accepted now that both knowledge and representation are constructed, it should be recognized that the problem is not about the representation, but about what and who is constructing the knowledge. Perhaps the issue should be rephrased – from 'what is the most "authentic" way to represent something', to 'what is a better way to represent and communicate meaning'? One thing that has been encouraged within the debate on the 'crisis' of representation, is that there is greater sensitivity in many texts to

⁸⁴ M. Dear, 'The Postmodern Challenge: Reconstructing Human Geography,' *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers*, no 13 (1988): 200.

⁸⁵ Denis Cosgrove and Mona Domosh, 'Author and Authority: Writing the new cultural geography,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993), 25-38.

textuality, revealing the discursive condition for both the writing and the relations behind the production, not simply the final text⁸⁶.

i Fiction and Truth

Hulme argues that within post-structural reasoning, all statements should be seen more or less as fictions, because 'no particular form of words can, on epistemological grounds alone, claim access to reality superior to any other form of words'⁸⁷. Hulme urges that this stance be taken as a starting point, and not as an end point in post-structural discussion. Following Foucault, he would like to see a critical questioning, what he calls 'politics of discourse', of the various claims and assumptions that are implied within statements – not the statements' veracity, but the *claims* to veracity.

Prior to the eighteenth century, 'authenticity' was not something that was seen as a necessary quality of travel writing, states Mills – many writings included words like 'giants', 'monsters', and 'fantasy'. However, this changed after the eighteenth century, when exaggeration was considered 'lying'. In order to combat this charge, most travel writers began to include maps and photographs, or adopted an objective, documentary style of writing, relating only certain types of *believable* information (for example, physical descriptions)⁸⁸.

⁸⁶ Blunt, *Travel*, 78.

⁸⁷ Hulme, *Colonial Encounters*, 7.

⁸⁸ Mills, *Discourses*, 113.

ii A Question of Authority

Although there is some discussion in the literature about the fictionality and the un-importance of travel writing⁸⁹, and its non-relevance to 'literature' as a whole, it is important to understand that many travel texts were written as the 'truth'. According to Mills, the 'truth' is often assumed in these texts because they are written by 'authoritative' Westerners. First, authority is gained as the authors are white, 'honourable' Westerners (in contrast to the native who is often seen as a liar). Second, authority was achieved in a colonial context as many of the male travel writers were connected to various government missions or organizations, so even when traveling alone, they represented the colonial power⁹⁰. The presentations of Hunza people in government reports, eyewitness journalist accounts⁹¹, and environmental protection reports have become what is *perceived* as the 'real' Hunzan – a happy, courteous person, willing to help others at all costs.

Said has said 'there is nothing mysterious or natural about authority'⁹². Because it is so influential and persuasive, he says it is important that it be

⁸⁹ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*.

⁹⁰ Mills, *Discourses*, 114-115.

⁹¹ Good examples of this, within the Hunza context, are the writings of E.F. Knight: E.F. Knight, *Where Three Empires Meet: A Narrative of Recent Travel in Kashmir, Western Tibet, Gilgit, and the adjoining countries* (1893; reprint, Taipei: Ch'eng Wen Publication Company, 1971), see Chapters 26-31; E.F. Knight, *Reminiscences: The Wandering of a Yachtsman and War Correspondent* (London: Hutchinson and Company, 1923), see Chapters 11 and 12.

⁹² Said, *Orientalism*, 19.

analysed, as: 'it establishes canons of taste and value; it is virtually indistinguishable from certain ideas it dignifies as true, and from traditions, perceptions, and judgements it forms, transmits, reproduces'⁹³. Within travel writing, authority is a particularly important topic to examine. Borrowing from all sorts of experiences and fields, the texts mix fact and fable, analysis and anecdote⁹⁴. Holland and Huggan call travel texts 'fictions of factual representation', because while travel writing refers to actual events, places and people, these references are placed within a very personal experiential journey. A tension is formed between the authors' desire to describe the world as it really is, and a desire to frame it within a (pre)-conceived notion of how it should be. Often, the 'truths' writers seek are already in their possession. This is often the case especially in texts written about Hunza during the 1950s and 1960s, with the proliferation of the 'happy, healthy Hunza' representation, which was frequently portrayed in much of the writing the travellers of this time would have read in anticipation of their journey.

iii Ethnography vs. travel writing

Clifford has proposed that ethnographies be called 'fictions'⁹⁵. He teaches us that by the seventeenth century, anything subjective or fictitious had been

⁹³ Ibid., 19-20.

⁹⁴ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 9.

⁹⁵ Clifford, 'Introduction,' 6.

excluded from science; thus, anything other than scientific writing was seen as inventive, subjective and emotional. He suggests that by calling ethnographies 'fictions' reader are encouraged to see them as 'partial' truths, true fictions. Denzin would agree with Clifford. He suggests that ethnographies, as well as autobiographies and biographies, are stories that are 'fictional, narrative accounts of how something happened'⁹⁶. Stories are fictions; constructed from real or imagined facts (events that are believed to have occurred or will occur) and facticities (how those facts were experienced by interacting individuals)⁹⁷. Denzin, following Derrida, encourages deconstructionist readings 'which are always playful, open-ended, and inconclusive [as] no readings or writing of a life is ever complete or final'⁹⁸. Even the best ethnographic texts are systems of truth, with various relations of power and history at work in ways not even the author can always control.

One method of asserting truth and authority that has intrigued Mary Louise Pratt is ethnographers' identification of themselves in opposition to travel writers. It has been common practice, according to her, for anthropologists to assert their 'professionalism' over travel writers' 'amateurism'⁹⁹ - the ethnographer is there to live with the people, while the traveller is merely passing through. The title of one

⁹⁶ Norman K. Denzin, *Interpretive Biography*, Sage University Paper Series on Qualitative Research Methods , vol. 2 (Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, 1989), 41.

⁹⁷ Ibid., 23.

⁹⁸ Ibid., 46.

⁹⁹ Mary Louise Pratt, 'Science,'.

of her essays, 'Killed by Science', comes from this practice: the ethnographer examines travel accounts of the same area he or she is studying, finds what he or she sees to be 'inadequacies' in those accounts, and then illustrates how the ethnographer's information is better - 'killing them [the travel texts] with science'. The practice of putting down previous travellers' writings is found in travel writing too, Pratt says. This is evident in the texts about Hunza. For example, Tobe¹⁰⁰ spends considerable time showing how his study reveals the 'real truths' about the people, as he debunks previous representations.

Many ethnographies include both personal and impersonal content. Pratt tells us that the former, often kept to the beginning of the narrative to describe the opening conditions of the fieldwork, was often used to describe the limitations the ethnographer overcame to carry out his or her fieldwork¹⁰¹. The limitations and obstacles that the ethnographer confronts become 'facts' about the culture¹⁰². They position the reader for the more formal, impersonal narratives that follow. The fact that the 'subjective' part of the text remains tucked in at the beginning of the narrative and does not usually reappear, shows that the 'objective', more professional parts that follow are what are 'really' important and

¹⁰⁰ Tobe, *Hunza*.

¹⁰¹ Mary Louise Pratt, 'Fieldwork in Common Places,' in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986), 27-50.

¹⁰² This phenomenon exists in the travel narratives as well. Both Tobe, *Hunza* and John Clark, *Hunza: Lost Kingdom in the Himalayas* (1956; reprint, New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1980) speak of problems they had with administrators and civil servants while they obtained permits and plane tickets.

considered most authentic. Pratt states that this procedure is a part of travel writing too, and in fact originated in it. Indeed, the process is found in many of the texts I examine¹⁰³.

Pratt urges ethnographers to recognize the contributions that travel writing has made to ethnography, and urges both ethnographers and travel writers to examine the commonalities in the two types of writing. Clifford has noted that ethnography and travel writing are somewhat different¹⁰⁴, but Blunt thinks that this difference may in fact encourage the notions of ethnographic objective and professional authority over travel writing¹⁰⁵.

Malkki is another anthropologist who is concerned with the superior positioning of one field against another. In 'News and Culture: Transitory Phenomena and the Fieldwork Tradition' she discusses the dichotomy that has been created between anthropology and journalism. This construction has been produced as journalists are seen as people who deal in 'news': they 'swoop' in, grab a story and leave; whereas anthropologists deal in 'culture', and as such spend a great deal more time with their research group, often doing follow up work (again, the distinction is evident between the anthropologist, who spends more time with the culture, and the travel writer/journalist who is passing

¹⁰³ In Chapter 6, I look at an example of this process in E.O. Lorimer, *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* London: George Allen and Unwin, 1939, who spent over a year living with the people of Hunza.

¹⁰⁴ Clifford, 'Introduction', 6.

¹⁰⁵ Blunt, *Travel*, 79.

through). This leads to the perception that anthropology is superior to journalism as it delves into more 'profound' kinds of understanding¹⁰⁶. Malkki argues that setting up binary oppositions 'unduly homogenizes and simplifies both kinds of practice'¹⁰⁷, and urges her readers to recognize the importance of acknowledging the connections that exist.

Ethnographic work, and as Pratt argues, travel writing, are enmeshed in changing power inequalities, enacting power relations. What is needed is a turning away from authoritative, objective works to texts that encourage subjectivity, partiality, and emotion.

iv Positionality and Plurality

One method of addressing the issue of authority within a text is to assert one's position within that context. Following Derrida, many authors subscribe to this notion¹⁰⁸. Although it is much more common today than ever before, establishing one's position within the research and stating the partiality of one's work is not entirely without problems. However problematic and political, Pratt

¹⁰⁶ Liisa H. Malkki, 'News and Culture: Transitory Phenomena and the Fieldwork Tradition,' in *Anthropological Locations: Boundaries and Grounds of a Field Science*, ed. Gupta Akhil and James Ferguson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 93.

¹⁰⁷ Ibid., 94.

¹⁰⁸ See, for example: Geraldine Pratt, 'Spatial Metaphors and Speaking Positions', in *Reading Human Geography: The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. Trevor Barnes and Derek Gregory (New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 1997), 168-172; Blunt, *Travel*; Kim England, 'Getting Personal: Reflexivity, Positionality, and Feminist Research,' in *Reading Human Geography: The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. Trevor Barnes and Derek Gregory (New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 1997), 69-83.

states that through this process, there is greater potential for increased democratic, public discussion¹⁰⁹. Blunt also argues that it is crucial to destabilize authoritative authorial presence. However, as long as subjective works are seen as too 'different' and power is practiced through definition and legitimization, 'objective', authoritative writing will continue. To Blunt, it does indeed matter who is speaking¹¹⁰. She promotes the use of author 'positionality' in order 'to reveal the different sites at which identities are constructed and contested through space and time'¹¹¹.

Plurality will also help destabilize the authority of a unitary, fixed voice.

Derrida comments:

I have written books with several columns or several voices... But for this multiplicity of levels or tones, one would have to invent still other forms, other kinds of music. How is one to get them accepted when the 'dominant' demand always requires, or so people want to make us believe, more linearity, cursivity, flattening? A single voice on the line, a continuous speech, that is what they want to impose. This authoritarian norm would be like an unconscious plot, an intrigue of the hierarchies ... the very ones that call for deconstructive analyses.¹¹²

Blunt's research on Mary Kingsley shows how this adventurer identified herself within various traditionally masculine categories – scientific observer,

¹⁰⁹ Pratt, 'Spatial Metaphors'.

¹¹⁰ Alison Blunt, 'Mapping Authorship and Authority: Reading Mary Kingsley's Landscape Descriptions,' in *Writing Women and Space: Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies*, ed. Alison Blunt and Gillian Rose (New York: The Guilford Press, 1994), 54.

¹¹¹ Ibid.

¹¹² Jacques Derrida, 'Unsealing ("the old new language"),' in *Points...; Interviews, 1974-1994*, ed. Elisabeth Weber, trans. Peggy Kamuf (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1995), 130.

explorer, trader – but she also shows how these were undercut with her sense of proper behaviour, constructed as feminine. It is these varied voices Kingsley uses, this coexistence between masculine and feminine identities, that shows ambivalence in the narration, and not ‘fixed, centred constructions’ of the ‘other’¹¹³.

Derek Gregory encourages underlining ‘the plural and the indefinite’, as this resists the tendency to epitomize, or essentialize *the* gaze or *the* text¹¹⁴. In his study of the imaginative geographies of mid-nineteenth century Egypt (of Gustave Flaubert and Florence Nightingale), he stresses that processes of visualization in the construction of Egypt were not unitary or totalizing. Indeed, they were ‘complex, scored through multiple and often contradictory subject-positions’¹¹⁵. It is important to him to examine closely this notion of multiple sites and voices, as often the distinctions between class, gender, and race were even more marked abroad than they were at home.

This discussion reiterates one of Duncan and Ley’s comments: one of the methods of challenging mimetic representation was through the postmodern practice of introducing a ‘polyphony of voices’, and by redistributing the authority of one, into multiple sites¹¹⁶. Throughout the examination of the texts in this

¹¹³ Ibid., 61.

¹¹⁴ Gregory, ‘Between the book and the lamp,’ 30.

¹¹⁵ Ibid.

¹¹⁶ Duncan and Ley, ‘Introduction,’ 8.

project, I will be looking at authority and voice, questioning the methods used by the authors to promote their authority, or as the case may be, to disavow it.

'Othering' Writing Strategies

1 Narratives

Mills argues that travel writing does not simply describe the travel process, but rather is a particular example of the relations of power that are at work to promote various notions of the 'other' that become 'common sense' to certain groups of people¹¹⁷. Although much work has been published on the construction of the 'other', she has looked into how travel writing has also constructed knowledge about the home country. This recognizes the idea that the author is working within certain sets of discursive rules, and that the constructions in the narratives not only involve the people and lands being described, but also the authors. This is similar to Duncan's double implication of the term *site* that I discussed previously: the site of representation, and the site from which the representation takes place. This double site is important to keep in mind as I examine various narrative types and language techniques.

i Narrative Types

Travel writing has, as a defining factor, various common textual modes such as narrative figures, events, and descriptions of objects. Many analyses of fictional literature include an examination of the 'narrator', but Mills states that

¹¹⁷ Mills, 'Knowledge,' 34.

this has been less true in the analysis of travel writing. She argues that it is possible to 'see the narrator as a device through which the narrative becomes comprehensible; the narrator is a construct which gives coherence to a variety of voices, or discourses'¹¹⁸.

Pratt agrees, and presents several modes of narration: 'manners and customs', 'sentimental', and 'confessional'. Within the '**manners and customs**' type of narration, there is little discussion of the narrator's interaction with the people in the area. Any mention of the people groups them into a collective 'they', or a standard 'he', in the style of an 'ethnographic portrait'. Interactions are often described in the form of 'a day in the life', where every action is normalized and made to fit into 'typical' activities. The subject is described in verbs in the present tense, which fail to denote historical events, but describe a 'pregiven custom or trait'¹¹⁹. This is a 'normalizing' discourse which 'fix[es] the Other in a timeless present where all "his" actions and reactions are repetitions of "his" normal habits'¹²⁰. Often, people are described in a 'trivialized domestic sphere behind the back of the land-scanning eye'¹²¹. Pratt tells us that this narrative type also includes representations of the 'other' as comic, exotic, or

¹¹⁸ Ibid., 74.

¹¹⁹ Mary Louise Pratt, 'Scratches on the Face of the Country; or, What Mr. Barrow Saw in the Land of the Bushmen,' *Critical Inquiry* 12 (Autumn 1985): 120.

¹²⁰ Ibid., 121.

¹²¹ Ibid., 127.

pathetic – always a spectacle for the European¹²²; or, they are reduced to 'traces'¹²³. 'Traces' are descriptions of people written in the past tense, which describe the peoples' glorious past civilizations, but ignore interactions with people in the present. For example, travel writers will comment on ruins or ancient buildings, which, according to Pratt, only reduces 'societies to vestiges of a glorious past'¹²⁴.

There is a great deal of landscape description in the 'manners and customs' narrative mode, often in the form of a panoramic view, which reveals the common 'fantasy of dominance', where 'the eye "commands" what falls within its gaze; the mountains "show themselves", "present themselves", the country "opens up" before them'¹²⁵. The point of the travellers who wrote using this type of narration was to gather and present information:

[they would scan for] prospects in the spatial sense – as landscape panoramas – this eye knows itself to be looking at prospects in the temporal sense – as possibilities for the future, resources to be developed, landscapes to be peopled or repeopled by Europeans.¹²⁶

This scan was not for the narrator's own gain, but for the theoretical future gain of the whole Empire. Narrators positioned themselves as 'invisible, passive, and

¹²² Ibid., 128.

¹²³ Ibid., 124.

¹²⁴ Ibid., 130.

¹²⁵ Pratt, 'Science,' 210.

¹²⁶ Pratt, 'Scratches,' 125.

personally innocent conduits for information'¹²⁷, as in the following example of the 'manners and customs' narrative pertaining to Hunza:

Here the wild goat (*C. Falconeri*) roams in great numbers almost undisturbed, his chief foes being the snow ounce (*F. Uncia*), and the wild dog (*C. Rutilans*), of which packs are sometimes seen. ... The principal difficulty in communication is caused by the rivers, which in winter are shrunk to small dimensions, but in summer, fed by snow-fields and glaciers of enormous extent, become impassable torrents, bringing down tons of soil in their turbid waters. Many of the streams are rich in gold, especially those flowing from the Great Rakaposhi Mountain, and it is probable that a scientific search for minerals would be well repaid¹²⁸.

The '**sentimental**' narrative, began as early as the 1780s, and brings the narrator to the forefront – as the focus and the hero, or the 'Unhero', as Pratt says¹²⁹. It often entails a series of events, trials, and tribulations, usually involving the indigenous people¹³⁰. While the previous type of narration gains authority from the use of scientific and informational presentation and lack of people, this type gains its authority from its concern with people¹³¹, as the experiences of the narrator are presented in a self-consciously subjective way. Each of the events, written about in verbs often describing perception or action,

¹²⁷ Ibid., 126.

¹²⁸ John Biddulph, *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh* (1880; reprint Graz, Austria: Akademische Druck - u. Verlagsanstalt, 1971), 22.

¹²⁹ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 75.

¹³⁰ Pratt, 'Scratches,' 131.

¹³¹ Mills, *Discourses*, 76; Pratt, 'Scratches,' 131.

is only of value because the narrator is involved, and 'bears on the interests of the speaker and his *[sic]* journey'¹³².

It was 15 minutes before the jeep turned up and then we went out to get our luggage. Here we ran into a cold snag ... there was no luggage! ... The airport officials assured us it would turn up on the next plane that came. I cursed myself for not personally supervising the luggage going on the plane. ... Here was the first time I'd slipped and I blamed myself and no one else. I resolved that this would never happen again.¹³³

Pratt states that one of the most common events in this type of narration is the 'courtly encounter'. This involves the portrayal of the hero arriving in a new place and presenting him- or herself to the local patriarch. Here the hero is at the centre of someone else's stage, which contrasts significantly with the 'manners and customs' style. The 'sentimental' narrative tends to include the voice of the 'other' in dialogue; relations are based on a desire for reciprocity; and often, amazement and curiosity or even repulsion come from both sides of the encounter.

Often, 'manners and customs', and 'sentimental' narratives are found together. In this case, the former is usually entwined with the narrative events. The landscape is presented in two ways: either as a comfort and safety, or as a discomfort or danger *for the protagonist*; or, as a prompt for an overflow of emotion. In some of the writing about Hunza, much of the landscape is

¹³² Pratt, 'Science,' 207.

¹³³ Tobe, *Hunza*, 129.

described as a discomfort, and great pains are taken to describe fully the trials and difficulties of the land, the dangers of the trails and roads:

Boulders bound in spectacular arcs and plunge into the swollen Shimshal River ... I am exhausted and near panic. Pain stabs my legs after days afoot in these precipitous mountains.... Hypnotized by the dancing rocks, I stand trembling a moment more. Then fear wins. I bolt headlong through the clattering downpour. I no longer feel the sharp rocks underfoot, not the pain in my legs. I reach Tarif Khan [the guide] and grasp his arm.¹³⁴

However, all the trials and dangers seem to be worth the trip, and an outpouring of emotion often occurs when Mount Rakaposhi is seen for the first time:

But there, alone, aloof, like a reigning queen serenely sitting – a true monarch of all she surveyed – sat Rakaposhi...her summit crowned by wisps of clouds that seemed to lend an aura of saintliness, like a halo. In this setting she looked truly majestic. I followed the contours of her lovely, flowing form until my eye reached what appeared to be a forest of pines about a mile or so from the summit. ... And against the backdrop of blue sky, she was like a precious jewel in a most beautiful setting.¹³⁵

Pratt suggests that while the 'manners and customs', information-gathering, narrator is often associated with the state, the 'sentimental' narrator is associated with the private sphere¹³⁶. Nevertheless, this narrator is no less innocent than the previous type, and Imperial expansion is just as much present¹³⁷.

¹³⁴ Sabrina Michaud and Roland Michaud, 'Trek to Lofty Hunza - and Beyond,' *National Geographic* 148 (November 1975): 646.

¹³⁵ Tobe, *Hunza*, 179-180.

¹³⁶ Pratt, 'Scratches,' 133.

¹³⁷ *Ibid.* 132-134.

Figure 2. Central Hunza and Nagar, taken from the roof of Baltit Fort. Central Hunza is on right, Nagar and Mount Rakaposhi are on left and in background. The Karakoram Highway can be seen in the middle foreground. Taken June 1988.

According to Mills, it is not surprising that many women have been strongly influenced by the '**confessional**' type of narrative. Even while many women authors are writing about adventurous events, 'they are far more self-revelatory than men's'¹³⁸. Mills argues that there are significant discursive pressures on women travel writers to position themselves within the 'confessional' mode¹³⁹. Discourses of femininity had a major effect on the construction of women's travel writing, as well as on its reception¹⁴⁰. What was perceived as 'feminine' is what women were supposed to write about, especially in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Mills states that 'feminine' issues revolved around families, maintaining relationships, as well as the moral and spiritual upkeep of the family¹⁴¹. For example, in Chapter 6, the reader will note that Emily Lorimer's narrative¹⁴² is mainly concerned with the private sphere and interactive relationships with other women in the area. Mills writes that within discourses of femininity, middle-class women were presented as restricted in their movements – they were treated as frail objects needing constant help from males, and they were seen as 'pure' and in need of protection from what

¹³⁸ Mills, *Discourses*, 104.

¹³⁹ Ibid.

¹⁴⁰ I will discuss reader response and reception of texts further, at the end of this chapter.

¹⁴¹ Mills, *Discourses*, 94.

¹⁴² Lorimer, *Language Hunting*.

was seen as 'rampant male sexuality'. Through these and other practises, women were seen as powerless. Thus, the discourses of femininity made this position seem 'natural' by equating 'feminine' with 'female', and so, socialized women into these limited roles¹⁴³. Through this process, characteristics such as 'sympathy and interest in emotions and relationships' were categorized as feminine, and therefore 'natural' for women. As women were denied the experience of working outside the home, they were encouraged to care for others and 'consider relationships and interest in other people important, since these traits defined them as "feminine" women'¹⁴⁴. In addition, a great deal of the writing women were encouraged to do was also concerned with what was deemed 'emotional' – diaries, autobiographies, journals, and letters¹⁴⁵. Mills' warns, however, because as much as these women did write sympathetically, they, too, wrote within a colonial context¹⁴⁶.

Holland and Huggan have shown that it is not only women who wrote, and continue to write, within the 'confessional' type of narrative. Holland and Huggan state that the majority of contemporary travel writers 'play self-consciously on the conventions of an already self-conscious genre'¹⁴⁷. This is achieved through a

¹⁴³ Mills, *Discourses*, 95-96.

¹⁴⁴ Mills, *Discourses*, 96.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid, 97.

¹⁴⁷ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 16.

variety of methods: in the presentation of numerous personae, the use of farce, or by using both the journey and the writing as a spiritual quest. These strategies allow authors to include a great deal of autobiographical detail. Holland and Huggan exemplify this through two examples: (a) where the narrator hides behind the eccentricities of the characters he observes; and (b) where the narrator himself is eccentric, 'making a virtue of his madcap antics and wayward sexual fantasies'¹⁴⁸. These two types of travel authors are not specifically introspective in their texts. However, they do tend to present the self through 'an array of stock caricatural motifs'¹⁴⁹.

ii Creating Value

Pratt shows, through her research on colonial discourse, that the act of discovery 'consisted of what in European culture counts as a purely passive experience – that of seeing'¹⁵⁰. Although the experience of making the discovery is unforgettable, the discovery has no meaning on its own, but becomes 'real' and 'valuable' once the traveller returns home, and brings the discovery into being through books, maps, reports, diaries, or lectures¹⁵¹. Pratt describes three methods of creating both qualitative and quantitative value for the travellers'

¹⁴⁸ Ibid., 17.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid.

¹⁵⁰ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 204.

¹⁵¹ Ibid.

experiences. First, landscapes are aestheticized; second, density of meaning is sought; and third, a relation of mastery between seen and seer is created.

The technique of aestheticism presents the landscape as a painting, with a background, foreground, and various symmetries. The pleasure of seeing the landscape is what gives value to the journey. Spurr suggests that when 'the picturesque and the melodramatic are given prominence, they displace the historical dimension, isolating the story as story from the relations of political and economic power that provide a more meaningful context'¹⁵². Once the historical context of the area is displaced, the landscape becomes a painting to be presented to, and judged by, the readers at home.

By 'density of meaning', Pratt is referring to how the landscape is described by representing it as 'rich in material and semantic substance'¹⁵³. This density is realized through the use of an enormous number of adjectives – 'scarcely a noun in the text is unmodified'¹⁵⁴. Pratt tells her readers that the adjectives are often based on nouns: 'mound-like', 'capped', which adds density to the narration. For example, descriptions of colour are often not simple colour adjectives – red, green, blue – but, are much more dense – plum-red, emerald-green, sea-blue. Many of the adjectives are references to objects from the travellers' home, allowing readers to make material connections to the narrative.

¹⁵² David Spurr, *The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing, and Imperial Administration* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993), 48 [original emphasis].

¹⁵³ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 204.

¹⁵⁴ Ibid.

In creating value through mastery, Pratt is referring again to the idea of the landscape as a painting. The difference here is that what the viewer sees is *all there is*, 'the landscape was intended to be viewed from where [the viewer] has emerged upon it'¹⁵⁵. The landscape exists in reference to the viewer, who is static, and so the landscape is unknowable from any other vantage point. This method of describing the landscape as a painting allows the viewer to evaluate it, usually in comparison to high art from Europe. Often, there is no real comparison; according to the viewer, the view is never as meaningful and wonderful as a view in Europe. By evaluating and possessing the landscape, the viewer (representing colonial power) defines it as 'available for and in need of its benign and beautifying intervention'¹⁵⁶. The viewer becomes 'monarch-of-all-I-survey'¹⁵⁷, a term which refers to the panoramic gaze that objectifies the landscape by virtue of the imperial power and authority of the viewer¹⁵⁸.

iii The Modern Unhero

Much travel writing in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries acted as a catalyst for continued conquest and discovery of 'other' nations by Europeans. Authority is reinforced through various methods of narration and

¹⁵⁵ Ibid, 205.

¹⁵⁶ Ibid.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid.

¹⁵⁸ Blunt, *Travel*, 97.

reiterations of 'common-sense' representations. According to Holland and Huggan, although mid- to late-twentieth century travel writers are more aware of their position of privilege, they still seize the rights of mobility and representation that once belonged to the Empire¹⁵⁹. Holland and Huggan think that through the use of patronizing language and persistent cultural nostalgia, travel writers are thinly disguising a desire to resurrect their Imperial past¹⁶⁰. Holland and Huggan call this travel writer the 'gentleman' writer¹⁶¹, which recalls Pratt's colonial 'unhero'. The 'gentleman' writer often attempts to diffuse his or her own authority through various techniques of narration (often comical or farcical), but Holland and Huggan warn their readers that the authority does indeed remain.

Cool detachment on the part of the author is one method to diffuse authority¹⁶². The narrator presents him- or herself as a neutral observer or even as an eccentric. This creates an alibi for 'their cultural gaffes and, at times, their arrogance'¹⁶³. Another strategy that retains the aloofness of the narrator is a system of 'disguises', shifting between various roles with the same ease the narrator uses in moving between places¹⁶⁴. This is useful to the narrator as it allows him or her to benefit from numerous privileges; at certain times taking

¹⁵⁹ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 4-5.

¹⁶⁰ Ibid, 5.

¹⁶¹ Ibid., 6, 28-37.

¹⁶² Ibid., 7.

¹⁶³ Ibid.

¹⁶⁴ Ibid.

advantage of insider information, and at others, hiding behind a foreigner's incomprehension.

Blunt shows how Mary Kingsley's use of humour in her books destabilizes her authority. This is important, especially in women's travel writing when the potential to recreate masculine or imperialist statements arises¹⁶⁵. Holland and Huggan would agree, I believe, as they see the same notion of humour and self-deprecation as a way of hiding the feelings of moral superiority writers have over the nations they visit. Holland and Huggan state that self-deprecating authors present themselves as not taking themselves too seriously, as having an impulse to trivialize many of their observations (which helps discourage judgement of their hidden moral superiority), and as reminding their readers that their observations are their opinions. Many authors pay tribute to those who have come before them, and by doing this, they place themselves within that same tradition, although as pale imitations of their predecessors. It is their own acknowledgement of their insufficiencies and limitations that cause them amusement. Holland and Huggan also state that the use of self-parody helps protect authors from any type of social responsibility; giving them the right to moralize about the ills and problems of 'other' cultures, but exempting them from participation in that same cultural process¹⁶⁶.

¹⁶⁵ Blunt, *Travel*, 73.

¹⁶⁶ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 6-7.

Even though the modern travel writer is more shrewd than those of old in that the writing is less blatantly racist or imperialist, Holland and Huggan argue that today's writing is as much a concern as earlier writing, and should be deconstructed as well. Behind the charming observations and innocent comments lie a series of powerful discourses that are continually re-presented.

2 Language

So far, I have introduced a variety of narrative techniques used by the travel writer. These techniques solidified in the middle of the nineteenth century, when travel writing became a popular genre, and many are still in use today. I will discuss some of the 'othering' language used in the creation of a superior European and inferior 'other'.

Mills states that most travel writing presented a clear distinction between the author, usually British, and the subjects, the 'other' culture being described¹⁶⁷. The British race was recognized and reasserted as the superior 'norm', and the subjects were seen as 'different'. The use of language to describe this difference is far from objective, and is determined mainly by the social and historical contexts within which it is written¹⁶⁸.

¹⁶⁷ Mills, *Discourses*, 88.

¹⁶⁸ *Ibid.*, 89.

i Portraits

Hulme states that one method of 'othering' is to take a partial story about a group of people and present this partiality as 'reality'¹⁶⁹. He tells us that this is done mainly in two ways: (1) by excluding history; or (2), in the presentation of an 'origin' story. The latter is very powerful as it usually offers a 'true' story, or even several stories together, as the whole truth. In the case of Hunza, one story is told repeatedly:

The Mir claims that the rulers of Hunza were and are direct descendants of Alexander the Great. I could find no proof to either confirm or refute this statement. But it is generally believed that not only the Mir, but the people of Hunza are descendants of Alexander or his soldiers.¹⁷⁰

This story is narrated either with some scepticism, or more often, with 'facts' (usually, dates of Alexander the Great's travels in the region) backing up the authors' claim. Usually, the story lies unquestioned. This story has allowed the repetition of the representation of Hunzans as a 'fair-skinned' people¹⁷¹, which constructs them as cleaner, nicer, friendlier, and more like Europeans than any other 'Orientals'.

Said argues that race theory, notions of primitive origins and classifications, and the need for colonial territories were all part of a combination

¹⁶⁹ Hulme, *Colonial Encounters*, 15.

¹⁷⁰ Tobe, *Hunza*, 253; see also: Knight, *Three Empires*, 349; George Band, *Road to Rakaposhi* (London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1955), 20; Mock and O'Neill, *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush* (Hawthorn, Vic, Australia: Lonely Planet Publications, 1996), 11.

¹⁷¹ This representation exists in many texts, but see especially Franc Shor and Jean Shor, 'At World's End,' *National Geographic* 114, no. 4 (1953): 485.

of science, politics, and culture that allowed Europeans to imagine themselves as morally superior to non-Europeans¹⁷². Because of this, 'a vocabulary of sweeping generalities' arose, which classified and defined the 'other':

the tense they employ is the timeless eternal; they convey an impression of repetition and strength; they are always symmetrical to, and yet diametrically inferior to, a European equivalent... For all these functions it is frequently enough to use the simple copula *is*.¹⁷³

In travel writing about Hunza, these generalizations were mainly 'positive', less derogatory than comments made about other places, but nevertheless, still essentialist. Blunt states that although Mary Kinglsey identified with a few individuals, speaking of them by name, most of the time 'the African character' was described in sweeping statements¹⁷⁴. The same can be seen in the writing about Hunza:

The inhabitants of Hunza ... are friendly, hospitable and progressive. They are strong physically and generally fair of face; an industrious people known for their expertise in the engineering of irrigation channels and as tillers of the soil.¹⁷⁵

Clifford reminds us that "Cultures" do not hold still for their portraits¹⁷⁶. Trying to make them do so involves excessive simplification and exclusion, as well as the selection of a temporal focus (in many cases in the case of Hunza, an

¹⁷² Said, *Orientalism*, 232.

¹⁷³ Ibid., 72. [emphasis in original]

¹⁷⁴ Blunt, *Travel*, 103

¹⁷⁵ Maureen Line, *Beyond the North-west Frontier: Travels in the Hindu Kush and Karakorams* (Sparkford: The Oxford Illustrated Press), 123.

¹⁷⁶ Clifford, 'Introduction,' 10.

idyllic, enchanted, post-1891 defeat focus). The essentializing of cultural portraits constructs an image of 'us' versus 'them', which implies a power relationship.

ii Timelessness

Another method of 'othering', connected to creating 'portraits', is to place the 'other' in the past. This is accomplished through the use of words like 'primitive' and 'backward', or by comparing scenes to various past time periods. For example, in *The Golden Peak*¹⁷⁷ when Jamie has just been introduced to one of the women living at the house where she is staying, she writes: 'For a moment I forgot I was in Pakistan and thought "Victorian"'¹⁷⁸. Another example of the same technique is to put the 'other' culture in a time-scale that is unchanging: 'For fourteen centuries, it is said, have these tribes men lived as they do now, unchanging in manners or dress'¹⁷⁹.

Holland and Huggan discuss keeping cultures in the past when they speak of the trope of 'fatal impact'¹⁸⁰. According to this trope it might be better if 'Orientals' had never been introduced to European comforts, as now they yearn

¹⁷⁷ Kathleen Jamie, *The Golden Peak: Travels in Northern Pakistan* (London: Virago Press, 1992; reprint, 1993).

¹⁷⁸ Ibid., 18.

¹⁷⁹ Knight, *Three Empires*, 506.

¹⁸⁰ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 97.

for more. It also sees 'modernization' and interference as something that will destroy the culture:

"Hunza is still hard to reach," he [political agent for the area] said, "but now there is a jeep road to Chalt, first village in the Mir's domain. That 32-mile trip once took two days; now it takes three hours. Eventually the road will go all the way to Baltit, Hunza's capital."

I was upset by the prospect.

"Isolation has been Hunza's salvation," I said. "Its people are healthier, happier, and better off than most in this part of the continent. The road might ruin the country."¹⁸¹

iii The 'Primitive'

The use of 'nature' is another technique of 'othering'. Spurr states that this use is an ambiguous part of colonial discourse¹⁸². On one side, nature is seen as the opposite to culture and civilization: 'primitive peoples live in a state of nature'¹⁸³. On another side, 'natural law' is what gives domination of the earth to more advanced people: 'the land shall belong by natural right to that power which understands its value'¹⁸⁴. Through colonial discourse, the process of domination is naturalized, justifying its domination both over nature and 'primitive' people – 'children of nature':

The people of Hunza get their joy and pleasures out of the simple things in life – the natural, the commonplace, the ordinary. They

¹⁸¹ Shor and Shor, 'At World's End,' 485-7.

¹⁸² Spurr, *Rhetoric*, 156.

¹⁸³ Ibid.

¹⁸⁴ Ibid.

are, from infancy to old age, continually attuned to nature. They are intelligent – they look intelligent. Yet the happy carefree outlook of a child bespeaks their countenance¹⁸⁵.

Said has stated that the process of describing the 'other' as child-like is characteristic of Orientalism, and it is part of the language that groups the 'other' as irrational and 'different', allowing the European to see him- or herself as mature, rational, and 'normal'¹⁸⁶. For example: 'They were as children; mustachioed businessmen danced about in their sandals and threw snowballs down each other's necks'¹⁸⁷. Mills, too, has noted the use of childlike qualities in descriptions. She states that the use of these descriptions reasserts the notion of the 'other' people living in a previous time, as they are 'considered distant from the time of adult Europeans'¹⁸⁸. For example:

Not only she and Shamúli played with [the ball], but the grown-ups "stotted" it far more skilfully than I. They say the women and girls play a lot of ball, and in autumn the women sweep a smooth place under a willow tree, choose teams, and play matches! They *are* a sporting, jolly crowd.¹⁸⁹

Continuing the connection of the 'primitive other' to nature, it was common within travel texts to compare people to animals. Gregory notes that Florence

¹⁸⁵ Tobe, *Hunza*, 625-626.

¹⁸⁶ Said, *Orientalism*, 40.

¹⁸⁷ Jamie, *Golden Peak*, 4, describing some of the men on the bus, during a rest stop, on the way south from China to Gilgit.

¹⁸⁸ Mills, *Discourses*, 89.

¹⁸⁹ Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 117-118.

Nightingale compared Egyptian children to foxes, jackals, and lizards¹⁹⁰. MacDonald shows that Balti porters/coolies were constructed as 'something other than civilized, other than fully human' in order to avoid any moral dilemma from using these people as 'beasts of burden'¹⁹¹. This representation is also evident in the Hunza travel narratives: 'the two trackers ranged ahead like hunting dogs, moving in huge circles, traveling at least three times as far as I did, yet never showing fatigue'¹⁹².

The physical strength of Hunza men is often described in the travel texts. They are seen as being able to carry a great amount of baggage and find their way easily along the difficult trails while remaining happy the entire time:

Hunza men are straight and tall, broad-shouldered, deep-chested, slim-wasted, and heavy-legged. They walk erect with a smooth, effortless glide that can be identified as far as it can be seen. For centuries, Hunzukuts have been known as the most efficient porters obtainable; they carry the heaviest loads, and they appear to be always good natured and uncomplaining. When resting, they seldom take off their heavy pack.¹⁹³

And even more recently:

Shimshalis are amazing porters who carry heavy loads all day long over trails that would leave most trekkers dragging.¹⁹⁴

¹⁹⁰ Gregory, 'Between the book and the lamp,' 36.

¹⁹¹ MacDonald, 'Push and Shove,' 305.

¹⁹² Shor and Shor, 'At World's End,' 500.

¹⁹³ Allen E. Banik and Renée Taylor, *Hunza Land: The Fabulous Health and Youth Wonderland of the World* (Long Beach, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1960), 102-103.

¹⁹⁴ Mock and O'Neill, *Trekking*, 252.

The people are no longer seen as humans when described as a list of features¹⁹⁵. However, these perceived natural characteristics allow the travellers to construct them as perfect porters, useful, yet amiable.

iv 'Other' Landscapes

I have shown how the construction of the 'other' as primitive allowed Europeans to present their superiority. Another common method of 'othering', however, is to minimize human presence altogether, a technique introduced in 'manners and customs' narratives. The people's presence 'scarcely registers at all'¹⁹⁶ - simply a 'trace'. The inhabitants are usually described in a separate chapter or part of the book, or even in a separate volume, and often in the form of 'ethnographic portraits'.

With little mention of the inhabitants, the focus of the narrative is on the landscape.

Not the accessible, collectible, recognizable, categorizable nature of the Linnaeans, however, but a dramatic, extraordinary nature, a spectacle of overwhelming human knowledge and understanding. Not a nature that sits waiting to be known and possessed, but a nature in motion, powered by life forces many of which are invisible to the human eye; a nature that dwarfs humans, commands their being, arouses their passions, defies their powers of perception.¹⁹⁷

¹⁹⁵ Mills, *Discourses*, 90.

¹⁹⁶ Pratt, 'Scratches,' 123.

¹⁹⁷ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 120.

This is particularly true in the case of Hunza, as the landscape is probably unlike the landscape many of the travellers had ever seen. Nicknamed 'Roof of the World', the area is home to many high mountains and deep gorges. Coming from the West many of the authors must have found the landscape to be awe-inspiring. Any reader can perceive the sense of wonder that is portrayed in this quotation:

In places the canyon was so deep that even in midsummer the sun entered only at noon. Over our heads loomed the Kailas mountains, three times as high as the Grand Canyon in Arizona. These rocks were not soft red and pale grey limestone like ours. Threatening, dark-green schists and glossy-black peridotites frowned over us. We wound our way among great jagged boulders, beneath cliffs all fractured and ready to crumble down on us. We crept like beetles over gravel bars along the river, splashed by the flying spray, our horses panting in the loose pebbly sand.¹⁹⁸

The processes of capturing and displaying the sights helped dramatize the difference between 'our' space and 'their' space. The processes themselves, as Gregory, following Said, suggests, are constellations of power and knowledge, centred on 'here', but projected 'there' so those distances gain meaning for us 'here'. This 'poetics' of space becomes a 'politics' of space. The Orient, according to Said, became a 'theatrical stage on which the Occident projected its own fantasies and desires'¹⁹⁹.

Gregory writes of Florence Nightingale's voyage to Egypt in mid-nineteenth century. She is unable to describe much of the landscape, because

¹⁹⁸ Clark, *Lost Kingdom*, 37.

¹⁹⁹ Ibid.; see also Said, *Orientalism*, 71.

she found it 'so unlike nature'²⁰⁰. To her, the nature became 'diabolical'²⁰¹, and gave her feelings of unease. Nightingale compared Egypt to Europe, as a way of familiarizing the unfamiliar, and often used Shakespeare's *Macbeth* as a reference point to try to describe the land²⁰². This same strategy is seen in the quotation from Clark above. He uses the Grand Canyon as a reference he knows his readers will be able to use. Moreover, he reminds his readers that the limestone rocks 'were not ... like ours'.

v Remoteness and Idealization

Shurmer-Smith and Hannam state that places characterized as 'remote' have a strong attraction attached to them. The 'different-ness' is promoted through travel texts and other media. In contemporary society, this notion of 'remoteness' has become commodified²⁰³. The irony can certainly be seen – remoteness is desired, but because of this, 'remote' places are more often visited. Hunza is indeed one of these places; its perceived remoteness spawned

²⁰⁰ Gregory, 'Between the book and the lamp', 35.

²⁰¹ Travel writers in Hunza also speak of terrifying landscapes: see Lorimer, *Language Hunting*; Roland Michaud and Sabrina Michaud, 'Trek to lofty Hunza - and Beyond,' *National Geographic* 148 (1975):644-669.

²⁰² Clark has also used Shakespeare to describe and understand, but in his case, it helps him understand the people: 'The historical plays were a continuous revelation: I found in them the key to so many relationships between the Mir and his people. Likewise, life in this primitive society illuminated passages in the plays which I had not grasped before. For me, Shakespeare had become contemporary literature.' Clark, *Lost Kingdom*, 215.

²⁰³ Shurmer-Smith and Hannam, *Worlds of Desire*, 25.

the representation of Hunza as the Himalayan Shangri-La²⁰⁴. Chapter Three discusses some of the context of this 'remoteness'. However, with the publication of the *National Geographic* article 'Trek to Lofty Hunza – and Beyond' in the 1970s, interest in the area grew. Who could refuse the call to 'seventh heaven'? 'If anywhere in the world a paradise exists, might it not be hidden in so spectacular and unearthly a setting?'²⁰⁵ Duncan states that Europeans temporalized representations of paradise by projecting them into the past²⁰⁶. Spurr agrees, stating that the 'primitive' 'is conceived of in space as well as time'²⁰⁷:

They have no money, no poverty, no police, no crime, no army, no jails, and no juvenile delinquency. Their life in the tiny valley they call home has remained untouched by civilization for more than 2,000 years!²⁰⁸

Spurr states that the process of 'idealization' of the 'savages' was indeed part of the Western colonial expansion process²⁰⁹. With the movement towards a rational, instrumental view of the world, there was 'a certain resistance in the

²⁰⁴ Taylor and Nobbs, *Himalayan Shangri-La*.

²⁰⁵ Michaud and Michaud, 'Trek,' 646.

²⁰⁶ Duncan, 'Representation'.

²⁰⁷ Spurr, *Rhetoric*, 127.

²⁰⁸ Taylor and Nobbs, *Himalayan Shangri-La*, 7.

²⁰⁹ Spurr, *Rhetoric*, 128.

Western imagination'. A sure sign of this resistance was the notion of 'ideal' non-Western people²¹⁰.

If you wanted to show your affection or esteem for a Hunzan or repay him for a kindness, you didn't buy him a bottle of liquor or an expensive bit of jewelry or a motorcar. No, you just gave him a couple of sticks of wood. You couldn't give a native of Hunza a more pleasing gift.²¹¹

The quotation above shows a common representation of the Hunza people – an image of them living a simple life, having no material possessions, and therefore, *naturally* happy. Duncan states that making the 'other' *superior* in this way is as useful a discourse as is making the 'other' *inferior*. The latter allows the European to dominate the 'other', while the former offers up the resources of the 'other' to the European as the indigenous people are thought not to need nor desire, any material goods. In addition, as certain Europeans at the turn of century yearned to free themselves from 'the burden of culture', they constructed the non-European as 'pure' and spiritually superior. Through this process, the 'other' became a therapeutic image for the European. Tobe's attempt to uncover their 'health secrets' exemplifies this process²¹². He promotes the health, happiness, and purity of the Hunza people and encourages his readers to copy their habits. He concludes that unlike Westerners who need 1001 things happening at once, the Hunzans are joyful simply because they are alive:

²¹⁰ Spurr, *Rhetoric*, 132.

²¹¹ Tobe, *Hunza*, 456.

²¹² Tobe, *Hunza*.

We in the Western world have 1,001 things to please us, to entertain and excite us, to thrill and enthrall us. The people of Hunza – they have their little cradle in the sun and that is all!²¹³

Thus, idealization was a sort of compensation package for the processes that had essentially destroyed the traditional ways of non-Western societies. Spurr states that the 'joy' the indigenous people are assumed to have is projected onto the people in order to compensate for the great inequality that exists between the Third World and the West²¹⁴. This joy allows Westerners to feel compassion, even believe the 'other' was 'living out ... some of the West's most ancient ideals'²¹⁵. One reason, perhaps, why many would like to see those people remain in their situation:

But if you pressed me, reluctantly I'd say that the greatest contribution that the West can make to Hunza, or to their good health and longevity, is to stay away. Leave Hunza alone!²¹⁶

²¹³ Tobe, *Hunza*, 625

²¹⁴ Spurr, *Rhetoric*, 132.

²¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 134.

²¹⁶ Tobe, *Hunza*, 632.

Reader Reception

I have presented a variety of narrative and language techniques found in travel writing. Within the colonial context, and beyond, techniques of 'othering' are used to construct indigenous people as inferior to Europeans. So far, I have been concerned with how these texts are produced. I will now discuss briefly how these same texts are received.

Both Mills and Blunt express their interest in examining the reception processes of travel texts. There are few people who examine the reception of texts within an academic setting, but these authors feel that it is important to do so as the reception has certain effects on the ways the texts are both read and written. While Mills and Blunt have focused mainly on the reception of women's travel writing, the examination can be applied to both women's and men's writing. Blunt reminds us that within a poststructuralist context, texts are 'processes of signification articulated only through reading'²¹⁷, and says that readers' responses will be constrained by their ability to 'perceive, read, and interpret as discursively constructed subjects'²¹⁸. One way of examining individual readings of the texts is to look at published reviews. These reviews, because of the authority assumed in them, are influential in 'enabling and constraining' further

²¹⁷ Blunt, *Travel*, 116.

²¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 117.

understandings of the texts²¹⁹. Mills goes so far as to say that the reception of a text determines to some extent what it means²²⁰.

Because a text's reception both enables and constrains its understandings – and also that of further publications – I have included this as part of each chapter. An examination of the reviews of the texts of Hunza will allow me to further question the reasons and rules behind the texts that allowed the statements within them to be presented as true and authoritative.

The following chapter presents some of the historical background of the area in order to provide the beginnings of a context in which to place the travel texts. Following this, Part Two introduces the reader to some of the pre-Partition writings about Hunza, beginning with the 1870s, continuing to the late 1930s. Part Three then examines writings from the 1950s up until a few years ago, as well as present-day Internet narratives. The thesis ends with a few final thoughts that both sum up some ideas I have presented here, as well as re-addressing the idea of a project as a process.

²¹⁹ Ibid.

²²⁰ Mills, *Discourses*, 118.

Chapter Three. Historical Context

Introduction

This chapter creates a context within which to place the travel texts I examine below. The 'partial truths' that follow have been compiled from different points of view, but together create a single representation of the area and its history that can be combined or compared with other representations. By examining the background of the area and people, we can see how interests in the region were formed, and how those interests (political, economic, geographical, etc.) influenced travel writing. I realize the sources I use here are among those that need to be deconstructed. For example, much of the information I use to discuss early European contact was collected by government officials for military purposes. As I discuss this partial history of Hunza, I will highlight some of the vested interests that are served in representing the area as the sources do.

Table 1 outlines some of the events in Hunza's history that have influenced the ways outsiders see the area. Following the table, I discuss these points in more detail. I will show how these events are not simply a history of the area, but also, inevitably, a history of representations of the area.

TABLE 1. PARTIAL HISTORY OF HUNZA

Before Modern European Contact	
13 th century	Islam becomes main faith in area
1390	Hunza gains autonomy from Gilgit
16 th century	Hunza area divided between the twins Moghlot and Girkis, creating Hunza and Nagar
Early European Contact	
1846	Gilgit area occupied by Dogras, with Gulab Singh, Maharaja of Kashmir, in command
1862-1871	<i>Drew explores many of the valleys in the region¹</i>
1870	George Hayward visits Hunza and surrounding areas, but is murdered in July of the same year
1875	<i>Frederic Drew publishes The Jummoo and Kashmir Territories</i>
1872-1877	<i>John Biddulph, serving as Aide-de-Camp to the Viceroy of India, visits Hunza in 1876</i>
1877-1881	<i>John Biddulph on special duty at Gilgit, publishes Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh in 1880</i>
1885-1886	Lockhart Mission to Chitral and surrounding areas.
1885	Safdar Ali Khan murders his father, Ghazan Khan, <i>tham</i> ² of Hunza
1889	Russian Captain Grombtchevski in Hunza
late 1880s	Captain Algernon Durand becomes political agent at Gilgit
1889	Beginnings of forward policy on the part of the British Government with regards to Hunza
British-Dogra Annexation of Hunza	
1891	British-Dogra forces advance on Hunza, and overthrow <i>tham</i> Safdar Ali Khan
1891	Nazim Khan, installed as new <i>tham</i>
1891	<i>E.F. Knight travels to Hunza as a correspondent to cover the events of the Hunza campaign</i>
1893	<i>E.F. Knight publishes Where Three Empires Meet</i>
1897	Hunza becomes a princely state

¹ The visits to Hunza by the authors of the travel narratives are not necessarily themselves significant events in the history of Hunza. However, I include them in this table in order to place them within a temporal context for my reader. I have distinguished them from the other historical events through the use of *italics*.

² The Burushaski (language spoken by many of the Hunza inhabitants) word *tham* or *thum* means king/ruler. In much of the travel literature examined in this thesis, the authors have used the Persian word *Mir* meaning the same thing.

TABLE 1 – *continued.*

1891-1938	<i>Tham Nazim Khan controls Hunza's internal affairs</i>
1909	<i>P.T. Etherton travels to India and China on his search for the elusive Ovis poli (Marco Polo sheep)</i>
1911	<i>P.T. Etherton publishes Across the Roof of the World</i>
1913	<i>Arthur Neve publishes Thirty Years in Kashmir</i>
1934-1935	<i>The Lorimers spend over a year residing in Hunza</i>
1938	<i>Death of Nazim Khan, tham Mohammad Jamal Khan succeeds</i>
1939	<i>Emily O. Lorimer publishes Language Hunting in the Karakoram</i>

Independence

1947	<i>Pakistan's Partition from India and independence from Britain</i>
1947- 1964	<i>Tham Mohammad Jamal Khan allows few visitors to Hunza</i>
1950-1951	<i>John Clark spends twenty months in Hunza</i>
1956	<i>John Clark publishes Hunza: Lost Kingdom in the Himalayas</i>
1958	<i>Renée Taylor and Allen Banik travel to Hunza under the sponsorship of Art Linkletter and 'People are Funny'</i>
1959	<i>John Tobe visits Hunza and then publishes Hunza: Adventures in a Land of Paradise</i>
1960	<i>Renée Taylor and Allen Banik publish Hunza Land</i>
1962	<i>Renée Taylor and Mulford Nobbs publish Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La</i>
1964	<i>Border agreement made with China</i>
1968	<i>Hunza becomes part of Gilgit Administrative District in Northern Areas of Pakistan, Mohammad Jamal Khan remains tham</i>

Abolition of Pakistan's Princely States and the Opening of the Karakoram Highway

1974	<i>Tham's post abolished, Mohammad Jamal Khan loses all official power</i>
1976	<i>Death of Mohammad Jamal Khan</i>
1978	<i>Karakoram Highway completed, full access not granted until 1986</i>
1980	<i>George B. Schaller publishes Stones of Silence after spending some time in Hunza researching animals nearing extinction and areas for National Parks</i>
1986	<i>Karakoram Highway fully accessible, Hunza becomes common tourist destination</i>
1993	<i>Kathleen Jamie publishes The Golden Peak</i>
1996	<i>John Mock and Kimberley O'Neil publish Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush</i>

Figure 3. Map of Hunza and surrounding areas.

Before Modern European Contact

Hunza is located between the province of Punjab in modern-day Pakistan, and Sinkiang (formerly East Turkestan) in China, and is now part of the Gilgit Administrative District in the Northern Areas division of Pakistan. Little is known about the earliest histories of Hunza, but what is known has been compiled from various sources: mythology, and other small pieces of information collected by archaeologists, anthropologists, and language researchers³. Chronicles and commentaries from Tibet that date back to 670 AD make reference to both the region and one of the languages, Burushashki⁴. It has been noted that there are traditions in the area that point to 'some remote period of a Mongol invasion'⁵, although the exact dates are not known. The Hunza area had been under Hindu rule up to about the twelfth century (although there is evidence of Buddhism also existing in the area)⁶, but Mock and O'Neil state that Islam was prevalent throughout the Hindukush and Karakoram by the thirteenth century⁷. In 1390,

³ David Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities: Community Development and Modernity in Shimshal, Pakistan' (Ph.D diss., McMaster University, 1993), 167.

⁴ Tahir Ali, 'The Burusho of Hunza: Social Structure and Household Viability in a Mountain Desert Kingdom' (PhD diss., University of Rochester, 1982), 18.

⁵ John Biddulph, *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh* (1880; reprint, Graz, Austria: Akademische Druck - u. Verlagsanstalt, 1971), 31 (page citations are to the reprint edition).

⁶ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 171.

⁷ John Mock and Kimberly O'Neill, *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush* (Hawthorn, Vic., Australia: Lonely Planet Publications, 1996), 12.

Hunza broke allegiance with Gilgit and became an autonomous state, remaining so until the late nineteenth century⁸.

Hunza, and its neighbouring region, Nagar, once belonged to a single kingdom, but were divided in the late sixteenth century⁹. It is said that upon the death of the first Muslim ruler of Hunza, Maiyru Khan, his twin sons divided the land of Hunza in half along the Hunza river. Moghlot ruled the new state of Nagar while Girkis ruled over Hunza¹⁰. Although the two brothers were frequently at war, they would often 'make peace, intermarry and join forces against invaders and hostile claimants to the throne of the neighboring... dynasty of Gilgit'¹¹.

Ali states that the first detailed commentaries about Hunza appear in the middle of the eighteenth century when they came under control of the Chinese governors of East Turkestan and paid tribute¹² to Yarkand as of 1761¹³.

⁸ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 171.

⁹ Biddulph, *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh*, 27; Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 172.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Ali, 'The Burusho of Hunza', 18.

¹² **tribute**: An amount paid by states to other neighbouring states. It was usually small and considered as 'protection money' to make sure the other state did not attack.

¹³ Ali, 'The Burusho of Hunza', 19.

Early European Contact

Most outsiders are aware of the history of the area beginning in the 1840s with the Sikh occupation of Gilgit. As of 1846, Gilgit was occupied by Dogras, under Gulab Singh, Maharaja of Kashmir¹⁴. The Maharaja attempted several times to extend his territory to the autonomous states north of Gilgit, while the states often raided the Gilgit garrison in order to curtail the Dogra military force¹⁵. A description of these events can be read in *The Jummoo and Kashmir Territories: A Geographical Account*¹⁶. The author, Frederic Drew, one of the first to publish his observations of Hunza, had been sent to Hunza and the surrounding areas to survey the landscape and its inhabitants. He worked under the Maharaja as a geologist, and later became Governor of Ladakh. His interests were informational and militaristic, leading to a fairly one-sided description of the events, informed by his desire to collect information that would be 'useful' to the British Government. Drew played a major role in the 'Gilgit Game', as it came to be called¹⁷. The 'Gilgit Game' played a crucial part in the 'Great Game'. This latter term, coined in the 1830s but in common use by the

¹⁴ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 172.

¹⁵ Ibid.

¹⁶ Frederic Drew, *The Jummoo and Kashmir Territories: A Geographical Account* (Delhi: Oriental Publishers, 1875; reprint, 1971).

¹⁷ John Keay, *The Gilgit Game: The Explorers of the Western Himalayas, 1865-95* (London: John Murray (Publishers), 1979; reprint, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1990), 1. [page numbers refer to reprint edition]. The **Gilgit Game** was the term used to describe the politically- and military-based exploration of the Western Himalayas.

1870s, describes the 'century-long rivalry between Russia and British India for control of Central Asia'¹⁸. Exploration during this time was not as 'routine' as in other areas, as it was motivated by control of trade routes, and security and secrecy surrounding imperial expansion¹⁹. Explorers often worked for the British government, under their guidance, or at least with their permission. Information that was gathered remained in the official and secretive hands of the Intelligence Department²⁰.

Middleton argues that the amount of travel during the 1860s and 1870s was very small indeed, as many considered the hardships imposed by the poor conditions of routes and passes not worth the return information. The following quote from Biddulph is typical of contemporary descriptions of the hardships of travel in the area:

Several valleys exist, into and out of which cattle and horses can only pass during two months of the year, and in which the continual falling of huge masses of rock from the steep mountain sides under the action of frost, snow, and sun, frequently sweeps away the narrow and frail pathways. The roads are of the rudest kind, and necessity has made the inhabitants cragsmen; they pass with ease over places so dangerous that even experienced mountaineers would frequently hesitate to follow them.²¹

¹⁸ Ibid.

¹⁹ D. Middleton, 'Karakoram history: early exploration,' in *The International Karakoram Project*, ed. K.J. Miller (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984), 18.

²⁰ Ibid, 23.

²¹ Biddulph, *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh*, 2.

Visitors to the area were rare, until Biddulph went to the Gilgit area to collect linguistic and descriptive information. Butz²² identifies three particular reasons for this lack of exploration. First, the people of Hunza had a reputation for being fierce and unfriendly, and were renowned for occasional attacks and raids on neighbouring areas. It was common (but not necessarily accurate) knowledge that the people of Hunza were also involved in slave trade, which aided and strengthened this reputation. Second, the routes and passes were in poor condition for those without the practice of using them; other routes in adjacent areas were seen as more accessible. Third, the British and Russians had little direct material interest in the area, as they were more concerned with the resources of Central Asian regions (i.e. Sinkiang).

In the late 1860s, an explorer named George Hayward was sent as an envoy to the Gilgit area, after he convinced the British Government that aggressive exploration of this mountainous region would have an important impact on military strategies and policies²³. In the reports he sent to the RGS, he emphasized the prosperity and commercial opportunities in the area, and the ease of routes. He began to work in the Gilgit and Yasin valleys, but was stopped by various disturbances in the area. Drew tells us that the ruler of Yasin had accepted a visit from Hayward during the winter, and he had planned to

²² David Butz, 'True stories, partial stories: a century of interpreting Shimshal from the outside,' in *North Pakistan: Karakoram Conquered* ed. N. Allan (New York: St. Martins Press, forthcoming), 10. [page numbers refer to the manuscript]

²³ Keay, *The Gilgit Game*, 44-45.

return. However, the ruler became angry with Hayward for many reasons, and Drew's account states that fifty men took him in his sleep and killed him in the forest along with his five servants²⁴. Hayward's death helped foster the ever-growing mistrust between the British government and the independent states around Gilgit.

By 1876, John Biddulph had become one of the first Europeans to visit Hunza, and by 1880, he had seen more of the area than any other person. His travels in the area resulted in *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh*, a major contribution to early information gathered by Westerners about Hunza and surrounding areas²⁵. He provided the British government with two valuable pieces of information which eventually led to the forward military action prior to the 1891 invasion of Hunza. First, he found that the Russians could reach Wakhan and the north side of the Hindu Kush more quickly than the British could reach the southern side (Hunza). Second, he learned that most of the passes in the area were quite accessible, and once the winter had passed, and the passes were open, so too would be all of India. The solution to these concerns for the British Indian government was to extend control of the land north to the passes, establishing Dogra troops to enforce this. He realized that if the forts at Chalt and Chaprot could be held by Dogra troops, the regions of both Hunza and Nagar would be under control. His report stated that he wished to see Chaprot defended by the Maharaja's troops,

²⁴ Drew, *The Jummoo and Kashmir Territories*, 454. [page numbers refer to reprint edition.

²⁵ Much of the following information comes from Keay, *The Gilgit Game*, 86-97.

which would secure Gilgit from attacks, leaving Hunza to be claimed. This was the beginning of a turn in the policies of the British away from disinterest in the region, to a position of deep interest and even the first steps towards control.

In accordance with these new interests, the Viceroy of India sent a mission in 1885 to gain more knowledge about the Hindu Kush area, with Colonel Lockhart at the head. The purpose of the mission was threefold: to gather information regarding resources, inhabitants, routes and passes from Chitral and other provinces; to explore the unknown territory of Kafiristan to Chitral; and, to take gifts and money to all influential people²⁶. In his final report, Lockhart admits that the mission did not find any new or important geographical discoveries, although various passes were visited, and existing information was adjusted and corrected. The final report includes descriptive information relating to existing routes, passes, as well as to future communication possibilities and military accessibility. There is little concern for the people²⁷, and a great focus on the constraints of the environment.

During the same year, the *tham* of Hunza, Ghazan Khan, was murdered by his own son Safdar Ali Khan²⁸. A distinct type of description appears in the

²⁶ W.S.A. Lockhart 'Introduction and Instructions,' in *The Gilgit Mission, 1885-86*, London 1889, IOR L/P&S/20/B57; NDC#4474.

²⁷ But what there is, is somewhat sympathetic: '...on the whole one of the healthiest countries in Asia': W.S.A. Lockhart, 'General Geographical Descriptions,' in *The Gilgit Mission, 1885-86*, London 1889, IOR L/P&S/20/B57; NDC#4474.

²⁸ Keay, *The Gilgit Game*, 174.

narratives at this time – the rulers are presented as scoundrels, weak yet sly²⁹. In fact, the descriptions were also extended to the ordinary people, but we shall see how, after the campaign of 1891, the representation of the ordinary people changed once they were seen as 'good losers'. The initial fear and disgust with the people might have stemmed from a focus on what were seen as barbaric occurrences of raiding and slave trading.

By 1889, the beginnings of a more forward policy in Hunza were apparent. Keay outlines many of the steps that led to the campaign of 1891. Rumours, found to be true, were spread about a Russian Cossack, Captain Grombtchevski, who had entered Hunza territory in order to discuss strategic relations between Hunza rulers and the Russians³⁰. Not only did this possibility bother the British, so too did the close connection that Hunza had with China (they had been paying tribute to Yarkand). The British decided that it would not be in their best interests to allow control of the area to fall to the Russians.

²⁹ For example: 'It was obvious that the Wazir was the important man, but also that the Thum, cowardly, shifty, and with a ridiculous idea of his own importance, must be reckoned with very carefully.'; Algernon Durand, *The Making of a Frontier. Five Years' Experiences and Adventures in Gilgit, Hunza, Nagar, Chitral, and the Eastern Hindu-Kush* (London: John Murray, 1899), 163; 'The rulers of these two States [Hunza and Nagar] were, as might be expected, ignorant and bloodthirsty scoundrels, faithless to their treaty obligations, and incapable of respecting anything but force'; E.F. Knight, *Where Three Empires Meet. A Narrative of Recent Travel in Kashmir, Western Tibet, Gilgit, and the Adjoining Countries* (1893; reprint, Taipei: Ch'eng Wen Publishing Company, 1971), 349.

³⁰ Keay, *The Gilgit Game*, 188-193; Middleton, 'Karakoram history', 26.

British-Dogra Annexation of Hunza

In the late 1880s, Captain Algernon Durand was given the post of political agent in Gilgit³¹. One of his first missions was to get Hunza *tham* Safdar Ali Khan to stop raiding. He later visited Hunza and Nagar in order to explain his plan for co-operative relations between the rulers and the British government. He gained the support of the *tham* of Nagar; but had to offer valuable subsidies in order to receive a promise that the on-going Hunza raiding would stop. The raids continued, and Durand began planning the campaign. After several attacks and disruptive events, the campaign began in earnest at the end of November 1891. Forts were strengthened, troops were enlarged, and garrisons were fortified. The advance was made into Nagar, and after a period of three or four weeks, the fort at Nilt was taken. The troops advanced and took the *tham's* palace while Safdar Ali fled to Sinkiang³². The British government installed Safdar Ali's half-brother, Nazim Khan, in his place, and Hunza became a princely state under the protection of the Government of British India³³.

The last two books I examine in Chapter Four were both written soon after the campaign³⁴. In addition to offering a full-scale narrative of the campaign,

³¹ Keay, *The Gilgit Game*, 175-176..

³² There are many versions and narratives of the whole of the campaign, including E.F. Knight, *Reminiscences: The Wandering of a Yachtsman and War Correspondent* (London: Hutchinson and Company, 1923); Durand, *Making of a Frontier*; Keay, *The Gilgit Game*; E.F. Knight, *Three Empires*.

³³ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 164.

³⁴ Durand, *The Making of a Frontier*; E.F. Knight, *Three Empires*.

both authors include a great deal of description of the terrain and people of Hunza. After the campaign was over, representations of the area and its inhabitants changed dramatically. Where before descriptions of the people as fierce and barbaric were prominent, this ferocity soon turned into something to be admired – they became a ‘proud’, ‘noble’ people. They were no longer seen as a threat, and the landscape was seen as a ‘mystical’ and beautiful place, a ‘forbidden fairy-tale garden’³⁵.

Within a day of the last fight which decided the short campaign, officers could and did traverse the country unarmed; Conway’s mountaineering party wandered all over it six months later without the semblance of an escort, and not one single shot was fired at us after the power of the tribesmen had been broken. They ‘took their licking,’ and bore no malice, and within a year, from the very men who had fought against us, I had organized levies who were ready to fight on our side, who turned out without hesitation when called on, and who did excellent work.³⁶

Even the weather seemed brighter:

The valley here, being broad and running east west, is exposed to the sun’s rays for the greater part of the day; and though Hunza is 8400 feet above the sea, we found it much warmer here than in our cheerless camp at Nilt, where we enjoyed less than an hour’s sunshine a day.³⁷

³⁵ Keay, *The Gilgit Game*, 92.

³⁶ Durand, *The Making of a Frontier*, 207.

³⁷ Ibid, 476.

I shall show in subsequent chapters how, over the course of time, these representations were combined and re-presented in various manners, leading to many of the representations of the area and the people that remain to this day.

Middleton states that the conclusion of the campaign against Hunza brought about other changes as well – changes that would affect the region both scientifically and economically. After 1891, the area was 'rendered comparatively safe' and so various exploratory and scientific missions began to be carried out³⁸. Sir Martin Conway, for example, led a large group sponsored by the Royal Geographical Society in 1892, and explored many of the glaciers and valleys in the northern part of Hunza. Middleton says Conway was the first to have 'opened the Karakoram to private enterprise'. Many explorers and adventurers followed, exploring for their own pleasure as well as for government organizations, geographical, scientific, and adventuring societies.

Before the campaign, and throughout Hunza's history, Hunza had had far-reaching relations with neighbouring states and countries. However, after the campaign *Tham* Nazim Khan lost a great deal of control of external relations to the British Indian Government. On the other hand, the *tham* gained a great deal of internal control as the British agency in Gilgit guaranteed his internal authority and autonomy³⁹. The *tham* took advantage of this power – Butz and Ali state

³⁸ Middleton, 'Karakoram History', 26.

³⁹ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 203.

that his reign was characterized by monarchical absolutism⁴⁰ and commoners came to expect little in the way of benefit from the ruler⁴¹. Additionally, his tight hold on Hunza extended to visitors to the area. Many of the travellers and explorers during his reign (until his death in 1938) had the authorization of the British Indian Government. Although he did not have the authority to resist their visits, he was able to control many of their experiences while they were there – less so with visitors who stayed for longer periods or travelled to places far from his residence. *Thirty Years in Kashmir, Across the Roof of the World*, and *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*⁴² were all written during his reign. Etherton's narrative indeed indicates his lack of contact with commoners in Hunza. His travels through the region focus on meeting with the *tham*, or 'solitary' adventure. Most of his comments about the inhabitants of Hunza focus on his use of them as porters, or as sights – Oriental 'oddities'. Emily Lorimer's visit, which lasted more than a year, seems to have been a bit less controlled. The Lorimers lived quite close to the Baltit fort, and so were in frequent contact with the *tham*, but they also seemed to have a great deal of individual interaction with the 'common' people living close to them. They did spend a great deal of time visiting the *tham* and his court, but they had already established a

⁴⁰ Ali, 'The Burusho of Hunza', 100; Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 204.

⁴¹ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 207.

⁴² Arthur Neve, *Thirty Years in Kashmir* (London: Edward Arnold, 1913); P.T. Etherton, *Across the Roof of the World. A Record of sport and travel through Kashmir, Gilgit, Hunza, the Pamirs, Chinese Turkestan, Mongolia and Siberia* (London: Constable and Company Ltd, 1911;

relationship with him while David Lorimer had been political agent to the area in the early 1920s.

Independence

In August of 1947, both Pakistan and India gained independence from Britain. Religion was the main factor in the division, with Muslim majority areas going to Pakistan, and Hindu majority areas given to India. Gilgit and surrounding areas were to be handed back to Kashmir. The local people were astonished with this return to Kashmir rule – their ancient enemies. However, they were sure the Maharaja would cede to Pakistan. In October, the Maharaja, a descendent of the Hindu Gulab Singh decided to join India. Hindu laws were applied to the mostly Muslim locals, and so, many of the locals began to revolt. After many tense situations that could have cost the lives of many, both Muslim and non-Muslim, a provincial government of Gilgit was formed, and a message of accession was sent to Pakistan. The rulers of Hunza, Nagar, Punial, Yasin and others followed suit. The following summer, however, the Indian air force bombed Gilgit and the fighting over the Kashmir territory continues today⁴³.

Tahir Ali states that after Partition, both Hunza and Nagar were free to govern their own internal affairs⁴⁴. The new *tham*, Mohammad Jamal Khan, who took over in 1938 after the death of Nazim Khan, 'was content to collect taxes, and leave village and household affairs to villagers, as long as his position was

⁴³ John Staley, *Words for my Brother; Travels between the Hindu Kush and the Himalayas* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982), 266-269.

⁴⁴ Ali, 'The Burusho of Hunza', 20.

not threatened'⁴⁵. The limited contact Hunza had with the outside world under colonial rule, continued under the reign of the new *tham*. He was quite wary of changes to the social structure of Hunza, and so he resisted many outside influences. In addition to this, because of sensitive issues surrounding Partition and border control (the Pakistani government had closed all borders the Northern Areas shared with China, India, and the Soviet Union), Hunza was closed to most visitors⁴⁶. Consequently, between 1947 and 1964 (when a border agreement was made with China)⁴⁷, only a few visitors were allowed entry into Hunza. Pakistan had little official reason to send outside visitors to Hunza, and so, those that did visit were mainly people who had been personally invited by the *tham*, or who were on personal business. Most of the visitors stayed only a short time, so the *tham* was able to keep them under his finger, allowing them to mingle only with himself, his family, and a few other chosen higher-up locals. Subsequently, many of the narratives during this period provide a one-sided representation of the area. Many of the 'Happy Hunza' narratives were written during this time, as only certain views of the people were being represented. Contact with the people as a whole was limited, and so, the 'shroud of mystery' that developed as a result of Hunza being closed to outsiders helped nurture the

⁴⁵ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 207.

⁴⁶ Butz, 'True Stories, Partial Stories: A Century of Interpreting Shimshal from the Outside,' in *North Pakistan: Karakoram Conquered*, ed. N.J.R. Allan (Boulder, Westview Press, forthcoming), 21.

⁴⁷ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 210.

representation of the area as 'Shangri-La'. Chapter Seven examines books typical of these representations: *Hunza: Adventures in a Land of Paradise*, *Hunza Land*, *Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La*⁴⁸. John Clark is an exception to this group – he was able, in 1956, to live in Hunza for nearly two years, trying to set up various clinics and schools. The length of his stay was indeed much longer than most of the other visitors during this time, and the reasons for his visit much more political. In *Hunza: Lost Kingdom in the Himalayas*⁴⁹, Clark notes that the *tham* was continually involved in all his interactions with commoner inhabitants. Towards the end of his reign, however, the *tham* grew less concerned with controlling the actions of both visitors and his own people, and gradually allowed greater freedom for them to interact with lowland Pakistan⁵⁰.

⁴⁸ John Tobe, *Hunza: Adventures in a land of paradise*, (Toronto: George J. McLeod, 1960); Allen E. Banik and Renée Taylor, *Hunza Land: The Fabulous Health and Youth Wonderland of the World* (Long Beach, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1960); Renée Taylor and Mulford J. Nobbs, *Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La* (El Monte, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, Inc., 1962).

⁴⁹ John Clark, *Hunza: Lost Kingdom in the Himalayas* (New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1956; reprint, Karachi: Indus Publications, 1980).

⁵⁰ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 211.

Figure 4. Truck stop at Jaglot on the Karakoram Highway, just south of Gilgit. These trucks are carrying supplies to soldiers fighting in Kargil. Taken July 1999.

Abolition of the Princely States and the Opening of the Karakoram Highway

Hunza became part of the Gilgit Administrative District in Pakistan's Northern Areas in 1968⁵¹. The *tham* retained his power, however, until 1974 when the kingship was abolished and Hunza began to report to the Commissioner for the Northern Areas in Gilgit⁵². Mohammad Jamal Khan worked as a member of the Northern Areas council⁵³ until his death in 1976. Although this episode marks an end to an era and the beginning of a new system, Butz argues that the abolition of the princely states in itself did not significantly change social organization in Hunza⁵⁴. It was the gradual exposure to the outside world that had a greater effect on changes in the area.

Recent economic diversification in Hunza has been greatly aided by the completion of the Karakoram Highway (KKH), which joins China with Pakistan⁵⁵. The highway was completed in 1978, with full access in 1986⁵⁶, and brought a boom in the tourist industry, as it allowed for much faster and convenient access through the mountains. For example, the trip between Gilgit and Aliabad, which is fifty miles, used to take 3 days on foot, and now takes a mere two hours⁵⁷.

⁵¹ Ibid., 209.

⁵² Ibid.

⁵³ John McCarry, 'High Road to Hunza,' *National Geographic* 185, no. 3 (1994), 126.

⁵⁴ Butz, 'Developing Sustainable Communities,' 209.

⁵⁵ Ali, 'The Burusho of Hunza', 29.

⁵⁶ McCarry 'High Road to Hunza', 121.

⁵⁷ Ali, 'The Burusho of Hunza', 30.

This has allowed the growth of local commerce as goods made or grown in Hunza are brought to Gilgit and sold in order to buy other goods not readily available⁵⁸. Many people have gone 'down-country' to find jobs, or to go to school, and some return to apply the knowledge they have gained by starting their own businesses, or working within various local organizations in Hunza. Others find employment in civilian government departments, as rest house caretakers, bridge guards, construction supervisors, etc.

*Stones of Silence, The Golden Peak and Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush*⁵⁹ were all written during this time. As I will show in chapter 8, the notion of the 'unknown', following developments such as the KKH completion, were at the heart of a great deal of the literature at this time. The representations in these narratives are highly 'apocalyptic' in nature – the loss of 'innocence' in people, the extinction of animals and environments. Holland and Huggan argue that this type of narrative is specific to the late twentieth century, stating that 'The New Age desire for "global consciousness" and the postmodern fascination with apocalypse come together in commodified expressions of environmental angst'⁶⁰. Many visitors remark on the changes during this time period, and often lament

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ George B. Schaller, *Stones of Silence; Journeys in the Himalaya* (New York: The Viking Press, 1980); Kathleen Jamie, *The Golden Peak: Travels in Northern Pakistan* (London: Virago Press, 1992; reprint, London: Virago Press Limited, 1993); Mock and O'Neil, *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush*.

⁶⁰ Patrick Holland and Graham Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters; Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998), 178.

the passing of something 'essential' about Hunza. On the one hand, the representations are often more sensitive to the situations of the Hunza inhabitants. On the other hand, many of the same representations found in previous narratives are repeated: for example, locals seen as inferior and therefore unable to care properly for their resources and environment; the 'Happy Hunzas'; or, a 'timeless' place that should be left alone without contact.

The partial history I have put forth in this chapter introduces my reader to some of the events in Hunza's past. The purpose here is to introduce my reader to Hunza, and to present how the narratives I examine are situated within a historical context. The events on which I have focused have shown how the outsiders' interests in the area have changed over time. These changes have, in turn, altered the representations of Hunza in Western-authored travel writing. I understand that the sources I use in this chapter include many of those representations I examine throughout the following chapters. These texts are among the first reports written by Westerners, and are therefore useful to the contexts of the first representations of the area. I have intentionally used these sources in an attempt to stimulate further deconstruction. It is most important to do this when presented with texts that are written as *the* 'historical factual truth'. I used these sources to gather information about the time periods within which the narratives were written, enabling me to establish some of the context within which representations of each time period were formed.

Figure 5. Tourist rest stop beside the Karakoram Highway, Nagar. Taken July 1989.

Figure 6. Ulta Restaurant, Karimabad (Baltit), Hunza. This establishment reproduces the 'happy, healthy Hunza' myth in the food it prepares, and through its advertisements. Taken 18 October, 1995.

Figure 7. Raja Bazaar, Gilgit. Sunni mosque in the background. Taken August 1999.

PART II

Chapter Four. Information Gathering

*It is in Asia, perhaps that one realises best what
Great Britain is, and there one sees the pick of
her sons living the larger and nobler life that
men should live*
- E.F. Knight¹

Introduction

This chapter examines four travel texts written about Hunza and the surrounding areas between 1875 and 1899. The texts describe some of the information gathering missions discussed in the previous chapters. They are accounts of some of the first European encounters with local inhabitants. The texts focus on the landscape (as terrain that will need to be traversed), the people (as potential markets, labour pools), and the resources (for European consumption). The first two texts describe the area before the 1891 Hunza campaign, and the third and fourth describe the area after this attack. There are notable differences in the descriptions, as well as in the methods of writing. The first two texts are plainly 'manners and customs' narratives. While the latter two still have this as a focus, they do contain many more instances of human interaction.

¹ E.F. Knight, *Where Three Empires Meet. A Narrative of Recent Travel in Kashmir, Western Tibet, Gilgit, and the adjoining countries* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co., 1893; reprint, Taipei: Ch'eng Wen Publishing Company, 1971), 528.

Drew and Biddulph

Frederic Drew, a geologist, had been employed by the Maharaja of Kashmir to assess Kashmir's mineral deposits in the 1870s². His book, *The Jummoo and Kashmir Territories*³, was the result of his explorations in Kashmir, Ladakh, Baltistan, and 'Dardistan'⁴. It is one of the first European reports on the region, its languages, and inhabitants. Because of his position both as a military man and as a professional geologist, Drew's writing is often cited as one of the most authoritative preliminary reports on the region.

John Biddulph spent at least two decades working in northern India. Along with Drew, he was one of the first European explorers in Central Asia. He worked as aide-de-camp to the Viceroy of India from 1872 to 1877. During that time, he was sent on special duty missions to Yarkand and Wakhan, and to Gilgit after 1877. He later became Political Agent for several areas, and retired from

² John Keay, *The Gilgit Game: The Explorer's of the Western Himalayas, 1865-95* (London: John Murray (Publishers) Ltd., 1979; reprint, Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1990), 68.

³ Frederic Drew, *The Jummoo and Kashmir Territories: A Geographical Account* (1875; reprint, Delhi: Oriental Publishers, 1971).

⁴ **Dardistan:** No area is called this, but it was used as a 'catch-all' phrase to speak of the entire region. This is what Biddulph had to say about the term: 'Dr. Leitner was the first to bring into prominent notice the existence of an Aryan race of great ethnological interest in the remote valleys. His scanty opportunities, however, have caused him to fall into the error of believing that the tribes which he has classed under the name of Dard are all of the same race, and he has applied the term of Dardistan, a name founded on a misconception, to a tract of country inhabited by several races, speaking distinct languages, who differ considerably amongst themselves. As, however, there is no one name which will properly apply to the peoples and countries in question, it will be perhaps convenient to retain the names of Dard and Dardistan when speaking collectively of the tribes in question and the countries they inhabit.' Ibid., 9.

the Political Department in 1895⁵. *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh* is a collection of his observations about Hunza, Gilgit, and parts of Yasin, during his visits in 1876 and 1878. He claims the text includes all that would be of 'general interest regarding the countries and their inhabitants'⁶.

Both books are collections of empirical information gathered by the authors, and collated from various other sources. The texts are set during the initial period of colonial interest in the area, and both report on missions undertaken through the Political Department. Although they often travelled alone, they represented the colonial powers of the British India government wherever they went.

Drew's and Biddulph's narratives are good examples of the 'manners and customs' narrative as shown by the eye-scanning descriptions of landscapes and people (both as rarities and resources), the descriptions of people as objects and lists of physical characteristics, the continual classification of people into groups, and the separation of habits, religions, customs, and languages from the landscape descriptions. An example of the type of writing in these two texts follows:

For physique; they are broad-shouldered, moderately stout-built, well-proportioned men. They are active and enduring. They are good as mountaineers, and those who have been used to act as porters are strong and quick in the work; but in some parts they have never been trained to coolis' work, and will not undergo it. In

⁵ K. Gratzl, Preface to John Biddulph *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh*, (Calcutta, 1880; reprint edition, Graz, Austria: Akademische Druck - u. Verlagsanstalt, 1971)

⁶ Ibid., i.

face they can in general hardly be called handsome, but still they have a rather good cast of countenance; their hair is usually black, sometimes brown; in complexion they are moderately fair, the shade is sometimes, but not always, light enough for the red to show through it. The eyes are either brown or hazel. Their voice and manner of speech is somewhat harsh; those who have learned Panjabi have a particularly hard way of speaking that language⁷.

By so arranging their statements, they have created a 'truth' about the people and lands visited. Although Biddulph disclaims his authority at first, by claiming his information is not the most professional, he does exert an authority through his classification systems, and through the use of scientific names of flora and fauna. Drew also seems to diffuse his authority by stating some of his information is not first-hand; however, his self-proclaimed ability to compare the information in order to make the correct value judgements reinstates it. Although some of the information was obtained through hearsay, Drew states it still has value, as it can be verified through comparison⁸. This statement asserts Drew's authority on the subject, for although he has not visited all the areas he describes, he feels he has enough experience in the area to be considered capable of making assessments in order to ascertain the value of the information. Both authors' authority is further promoted by their connections with the military, and the length of time spent in the area.

While much of the introductory information is presented as a 'bird's-eye' view, it does present the reader with the difficulties of the region. Presentation of

⁷ Drew, *Jummoo and Kashmir*, 424.

⁸ Ibid., 456.

the landscape in such a manner, helps dramatize the differences between 'our' landscape and 'their' landscape, as discussed in Chapter Two. This process allows the landscape to be presented as a theatrical stage upon which Western ideas can be projected. For example, Biddulph's introduction presents the landscape as challenging and barren. The mountains are described as inaccessible, the rivers are difficult to ford as they are often torrential, the paths are 'of the rudest kind', and bridges are primitive and dangerous. This description has the effect both of emphasizing the authors' heroism in overcoming obstacles, and, because obstacles were described as so immense, of excusing errors and omission in their narratives. It also helps to explain why the area had not been explored earlier.

Biddulph focuses quite closely on Hunza and surrounding areas in a few sections of his book. He describes the flora and fauna, but focuses more closely on the people and their habits. Biddulph spent a lot of time in this region, and is quick to discredit previous 'unauthentic' accounts and representations of the people. For example, he objects to the Hunza people being counted as 'mere robber tribes', and emphasizes that they belong to stable agricultural communities, under the government of rulers who 'boast of their long unbroken descent from princes of native blood'⁹. This technique, discussed in Chapter Two, helps underline the authority of the author, by exemplifying his supposed

⁹ John Biddulph *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh*, (Calcutta, 1880; reprint edition, Graz, Austria: Akademische Druck - u. Verlagsanstalt, 1971), 23.

superior knowledge about the people. However, in the end, he does spend a fair amount of time describing the various attacks and raids on caravans in the area, as well as the Hunza peoples' involvement in the slave trade.

Biddulph spends much of his time describing the various groups of people, dividing them into 'castes'¹⁰. He claims authoritatively that the regions are of great ethnographical relevance, and that subsequent opportunities for ethnographic research were available. He discusses marriage patterns, languages, climates, as well as cultural and physical characteristics, usually narrated in the timeless present, typical of 'manners and customs' narrative:

Both men and women wear numbers of charms, sewn in bright-coloured silk, and suspended from the cap or dress by small circular brass buckles. Some of the buckles are tastefully worked. A curious kind of cloth is sometimes woven out of bird's down. That of wild fowl and of the great vulture (*G. himalayensis*) is most generally used.¹¹

The men when young shave the whole top of the head from the forehead to the nape of the neck; the hair on both sides is allowed to grow long, and is gathered into a single large curl on each side of the neck, and the beard is kept shorn.¹²

Drew also divides the people by 'caste' and physical description in order to present his readers with what he feels is the necessary information regarding the 'Dards'. This linguistic strategy, according to Pratt, authoritatively 'fixes' the

¹⁰ Here is another example of my discussion in Chapter Two whereby the Europeans attempted to familiarise the unfamiliar 'other'. Biddulph mistakenly divides the different 'groups' of people into 'castes'.

¹¹ Biddulph, *Tribes*, 74.

¹² Ibid.

areas and people into timeless portraits¹³. For example, Drew describes the people as follows:

They are a dreadfully dirty people, far more so than any other tribe I have ever met with; their faces are blotched with black dirt, which they never think of removing. As a means of purifying, instead of washing, they burn twigs of pencil-cedar, and let the smoke and the scent from it come over them and inside their clothes; they do this before eating, not perhaps generally but on feast-days, and at other times when they think purification to be necessary.¹⁴

In his narrative, Drew underlines his experience in dealing with the inhabitants, in his ability to describe them, and in representing them. This reveals that he has 'researched' his subject, which allows Drew to discredit previous explorers' work with more accurate and authoritative statements. For example:

Dr. Leitner speaks of the Yashkun as "a caste formed by the intermixture between the Shin and a low (?aboriginal) race"; this view does not recommend itself to me; it is more likely that the Kremin had some such origin, but that the Yashkun, who follow all the same occupations as the Shin, and in physique and physiognomy are their equals, should have so originated is far less probable. I am inclined to think that they and the Shin together made up the race (which we may call Dard) that invaded this country and took it from the earlier inhabitants.¹⁵

These statements are not only descriptions of the collective habits of the people, but are judgements about these habits. In the quotation describing clothing and accessories, Biddulph acknowledges that some of the buckles are

¹³ M.L. Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992), 64.

¹⁴ Drew, *Jummoo and Kashmir*, 431, speaking of Buddhist 'Dards'.

¹⁵ *Ibid.*, 427.

tastefully worked. However, he implies that most of the others are not to his taste, and, therefore, tasteless. Drew explains a method of purification, but claims that it is used 'instead of washing'. Washing is a 'normal' daily practice. These people not only do not perform this 'normal' habit, but the habit they do perform should be done, in his opinion, more often. Pratt shows how the explorers' achievements are given value through their ability to judge what they see (see Chapter 2).

It is of great interest to many visitors to the region that the people of Hunza are Maulais, or Ismaili Muslim, followers of the Aga Khan. Biddulph states that 'Mahommedanism'¹⁶ sits but loosely on the Hunza people'¹⁷, and he identifies this as a positive difference to other areas where Islam is seen as 'fanaticism'. The differences between Ismaili and Shia Muslims are often presented in the narratives, with the former often seen in a more 'positive' light. The travellers appreciated that Hunza women were not 'veiled', and that the people did not take too much time out of their daily lives to pray. This is another example of the strategy, discussed in Chapter 2, of Western travellers who attempt to familiarize the unfamiliar by comparing it to something they know. The

¹⁶ Said shows that the name 'Mohammedanism' itself is Orientalist – stemming from a 'constraint acting upon Christian thinkers who tried to understand Islam [as analogical to Christianity]; since Christ is the basis of Christian faith, it was assumed – quite incorrectly – that Mohammed was to Islam as Christ was to Christianity. Hence the polemic name "Mohammedanism" given to Islam, and the automatic epithet "imposter" applied to Mohammed.' Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979), 60.

¹⁷ Biddulph, *Tribes*, 30.

differences between the various methods of celebrating Islam were re-presented in order to make the Shias seems more peculiar, and the Ismailis more familiar.

Figure 8. Central Hunza and Nagar, taken from the roof of Baltit Fort. Central Hunza is in foreground, Nagar and Mount Rakaposhi are in background. Taken June 1988.

Figure 9. Upper Gilgit River Valley, in Punial near Yasin. Taken August 1988.

Durand and Knight

As mentioned in Chapter Three, Captain Algernon Durand was Political Agent in Gilgit during the late 1880s. His narrative is the 'story of the development of the Gilgit Frontier, told in ... letters and diaries, [as] read with interest by some who saw those papers'¹. Durand's position in the army, and his hand in the political works of the newly acquired Hunza, assert his 'official' authority within the regional colonial context. This assertion allowed his narrative to be seen or understood as a mimetic representation of what life was like on the frontier: 'it has this advantage: that having been behind the scenes it has been possible for me to avoid including the inaccuracies of the mere looker-on'².

E.F. Knight, in *Reminiscences*, comments on his family's noble past which allowed him to do what he desired in life: work as a barrister, sailor, a war correspondent, an author, or simply be a 'wanderer'³. He was drawn especially to the stories of Livingstone and other adventurers. While at Cambridge, he got tuberculosis, and so spent much of his time wandering, walking, and writing narratives of his journeys. In 1890, he was working as a war correspondent for *The Times* in Turkey. His cousin, an engineer, working on the road from Kashmir

¹ Algernon Durand, *The Making of a Frontier: Five Years' Experiences and Adventures in Gilgit, Hunza, Nagar, Chitral, and the Eastern Hindu-Kush* (London: John Murray, 1899), ix.

² Ibid, ix-x.

³ E.F. Knight, *Reminiscences: The Wandering of a Yachtsman and War Correspondent* (London: Hutchinson and Co., 1923).

to Gilgit, invited him to return to India with him. Knight says the tales of 'wild adventures' enticed him, as well as the probability of war with the tribesmen of the area, and so he convinced *The Times* to send him.

'Sentimental' narrative includes more explicit involvement of the narrator than 'manners and customs' does. In many cases, the author is the main focus, and the stories that unfold happen around, or with the involvement of, the author. Pratt shows that this type of narrative often includes accounts of a series of events, trials and tribulations. Although these two texts do contain narrative typical of 'manners and customs', they also contain examples of 'sentimental' narrative.

Both Durand and Knight imply the use of 'othering' techniques that construct the indigenous people as inferior to the Europeans⁴. Typical of a 'manners and customs' narrative, many of the descriptions of the villages, landscapes, and people are realized through the use of sweeping generalities and collective depictions:

I was now in what is called Dardistan, among a people of different type and dress to any I had seen before. But the Dards who live in the vicinity of the Gilgit road are not favourable specimens of their races: they have been raided upon, oppressed, and enslaved for ages; for the most part they are miserably poor; their faces have a melancholy, and often a lowering, expression; they have little of the

⁴ First, they minimise evidence of humans, which places Europeans in a superior position to the 'non-existent' 'other'. Second: the inhabitants that *are* present are described in a much more 'positive' light than the rulers at the time. It is very common for the authors to make extremely judgemental remarks about the rulers, while praising the 'ordinary' people. This, however, does not eliminate their supposed superiority over both groups of people. These techniques are examined in more detail in Chapter Two.

cheeriness of the Balti, and are not so patient under their misfortunes.⁵

Here, the authors describe the local people as naïve, even as childlike, which has the effect of constructing them as a primitive 'other', in contrast to a white European standard:

It must be remembered that the people have no proper tools, no crowbars and dynamite to assist them. A tiny pick of soft iron, which looks like a child's garden tool, shovels fashioned out of wood, and a few poles as levers, are all that they have to work with. The use of mortar is unknown; all their walls are of dry masonry. Yet with all these disadvantages, with nothing but their eye as a guide to levels, they have carried out this great irrigation channel for six miles, and turned an arid desert into a garden.⁶

[speaking of Pathans] They also got hold of a lot of old accoutrements and helped themselves, each man buckling about himself as many belts and pouches as he could lay hand on. It was amusing to observe the childish pride and excitement of these half savages as they marched off thus equipped, presenting a wild and ragamuffin, though also formidable, appearance.⁷

We can see from the first quotation that Durand compares the tools the people of Hunza use to children's garden tools, and reduces their achievements in agriculture, which provide staples and vegetables, to a 'garden' – a hobbyist's concern. Durand also notes that the use of dry masonry is quite common. Although he later states that he admires the achievements they have made in irrigation control, the use of the word 'disadvantages' is a judgement statement, that implies a comparison to Western construction techniques. Knight, too, has

⁵ Knight, *Three Empires*, 276.

⁶ Durand, *Making of a Frontier*, 162.

⁷ Knight, *Three Empires*, 372.

resorted to comparing the soldiers to children, not only in appearance, but in the pleasure they take in equipping themselves with weaponry – almost like a child accomplishing his or her first grown up activity.

Like Drew and Biddulph, Knight is concerned with representing the area through its 'different' landscapes. Knight's descriptions often include the difficulties presented by mountains and pathways, as well as the 'desolate' and 'wild' scenery. He does this, I think, for two reasons. First, when he presents the region as hostile and 'impregnable', he excuses difficulties the British troops might have in conquering the area. This 'desolate' landscape makes him proud of what the Empire has achieved. In describing the landscape to the British, he counts himself as part of the colonial project: 'we are actively interfering in the administration of the country, and introducing much-needed reforms, which will produce important results in the immediate future'⁸. Presenting the landscape so harshly, creates a barren wasteland, a theatrical stage, where the Western ideals of domination are easily projected onto the locals:

The desolation of the frontier ravine was more remarkable as we advanced; there was no vegetation, there were no inhabitants, the only life being what we brought with us in our preparations for war – the sepoys, the road-makers, and the transport coolies...⁹

Second, Knight's descriptions of the landscape support the image of the area as a remote, fantastical region, full of mystery and adventure, just waiting to

⁸ Ibid., vii.

⁹ Ibid., 376.

be unveiled and experienced by Europeans. I shall show in the next chapter how images like this encouraged the use of the area as a large 'playground', ripe for exploring and hunting:

Terraces above terraces of orchards and fields, broken here and there by abrupt cliffs, slope steeply up from the river-bed to the Hunza capital, which stands high on the mountainside – a wall-surrounded city, covering a dome-shaped hill, and so forming a pyramid of building rising in steps to the imposing castle of the Hunza monarchs, which crowns the summit.¹⁰

As soon as the 1891 campaign is over, and the region belongs to the Empire, a shift in the impression of the ordinary people occurs for both Durand and Knight. To these colonizing men, the people suddenly become friendly and helpful. As I discussed in Chapter Two, this process is part of the idealization of the indigenous people, allowing European travellers the use of the 'native' for their own purposes:

The Hunzas are a thorough people, and were now as energetically zealous in rendering us assistance as they had been in fighting us a day or two before. A party of tribesmen in the course of a few hours threw a capital temporary bridge across the Kanjut rive to facilitate the passage of our troops...¹¹

The landscape undergoes this change in representation as well. It takes on a pleasant quality, and although the journey is still difficult, the landscape is worth the visit:

There were large orchards of peaches, apricots, apples, and mulberries, while the vines festooned all the other trees. In the spring this must be a lovely valley indeed, the blossoming fruit-trees

¹⁰ Ibid., 468-471.

¹¹ Ibid., 471.

and the green fields below contrasting wonderfully with the mountainous wastes and terrific peaks above. On entering the Kanjut Valley by the desert defiles below Nomal the traveller would never imagine that the ascent could lead him to so pleasant a region.¹²

As I mentioned previously in this chapter, many travellers seem struck by the fact that many of the inhabitants of Hunza are Ismaili Muslim. Both Durand and Knight make note of this, and in so doing, present the Hunza people as friendlier, and more understandable than others in neighbouring regions:

Taking the whole of Dardistan the inhabitants are not warlike, and in the southern portion alone, which is under the religions influence of the Mullahs of Swat, do you find fanaticism.¹³

Knight, in fact, relates the joviality he sees in the people (or projects onto the people) with their religious beliefs:

As the religious prejudices which limit our intercourse with most other Mahomedan races do not exist in this Maulai country, we were quickly enabled to acquire some insight into the character and habits of these new British subjects. We found the Hunzas to be a jovial people, fond of boisterous merry-making over the flowing bowl, and possessed of a sense of humour rare among Asiatics.¹⁴

Not only does this statement infer that the Hunza inhabitants are jolly and more open to different relationships because of their freedom from the prejudices that appear in 'other Mahomedan races', but the author presents another common Orientalist notion: that Orientals are inherently joyless and severe. The peaceful, unbinding lives of the Hunza people seems to stem from their freedom from a

¹² Ibid., 463-464.

¹³ Durand, *Making of a Frontier*, 206.

¹⁴ Knight, *Three Empires*, 493-494.

'fanatical' religion – the visitors/conquerors are able to interact easily with the people: 'One has no religious fanaticism to contend with when dealing with this liberal-minded people.'¹⁵

In Chapter Two, I discussed the use of Shakespeare as a comparison tool for both Clark and Florence Nightingale in their descriptions and interpretations of their experiences, which also worked to familiarize the unfamiliar. Often, the people and places in Hunza are compared to historical European people and places¹⁶. This both familiarizes them for Europeans and keeps the 'other' in the past:

These [ornaments] are of gold, silver, or brass, many being of rather debased design, overloaded with filigree detail. But some of the designs are remarkable and interesting. The brooches worn by all classes are discs of metal with a large hole in the centre crossed by a pin, and are identical in design with the fibulae so common in Scotland and among the ancients.¹⁷

The scenery of the valley became more magnificent as I advanced. I passed the most picturesque forts perched on awful crags, such strongholds as Doré would have drawn to illustrate some mediaeval legend.¹⁸

In the first quotation, Durand presents the 'proof' of the connection of the people of Hunza with the Aryan race. Again, it can be seen how the travel authors make use of their genre – using enough scientific evidence to back up their claims,

¹⁵ Ibid., 351.

¹⁶ I have already quoted Knight comparing people to Northern Europeans in the 'old savage days' in chapter 2. Ibid., 510.

¹⁷ Durand, *Making of a Frontier*, 208.

¹⁸ Knight, *Three Empires*, 461.

without using too much to stifle their writing. In this quotation, not only is Durand comparing some of the 'native' ornaments to those of Scottish origin and 'among the ancients', but, those that do not compare, or are unfamiliar, are immediately not worthy of desire – they are 'debased' and 'overloaded with filigree'.

I discussed in Chapter Two the argument that authority is gained through 'eyewitness' reports¹⁹. These texts not only act as a means of documenting, or describing, the 'other' culture for the readers back home, but they add to the body of knowledge that creates the culture as an opportunity for material gain. Frequently, the descriptions of people were actually an inventory of their availability to become a labour pool – through the act of describing the people in a fashion that constructs them as 'good' porters²⁰ or fighters, as in statements like the following: '[They] "took their licking," and bore no malice, and within a year, from the very men who had fought against us, I had organized local levies who were ready to fight on our side, who turned out without hesitation when called on, and who did excellent work'²¹.

The fact that the 'eyewitness' aspect of their experiences is underlined in these texts persuades the reader of the authenticity of the representation. This is especially important here as both authors describe in detail the day-to-day events

¹⁹ Patrick Holland and Graham Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters: Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998).

²⁰ Kenneth MacDonald, 'Push and Shove: Spatial History and the Construction of a Portering Economy in Northern Pakistan' *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 40, no. 2 (1998): 287-317.

²¹ Durand, *Making of a Frontier*, 207.

leading up to and including the march on Hunza in 1891, which ended in the defeat of this region. Both use accounts of their experiences, as well as military discussions of strategies and advances, to encourage a 'real-life' sense of adventure and authentic war-fare.

I have shown, in these last two narratives, several examples of how the authors assert their authority over the inhabitants of Hunza – both personally and as a representation of the colonial Empire. Using 'eyewitness' accounts and the connections available through colonial administration and military organizations, their authorial authority has been emphasized through their 'truth' statements. Once the superiority is established, the statements can be interpreted by readers as 'true' – the cycle continues. Readers take in the statements made by the author – a certain image and representation is formed in their minds, some readers then travel themselves, arrive on site with preconceived notions of the people and landscape, and look for those sites to describe to people back home. At this point, the image of the 'happy healthy Hunza' that becomes so prevalent in the 1950s and 1960s has not really been fully formed, but Knight especially has shown some of its beginnings in his more generalized descriptions:

But while the Dards were enthusiastic in their enjoyment of their new experiences, and took an intelligent interest in all they saw, the Kafirs, like most savages, looked with a stupid indifference at the marvels round them.²²

²² Knight, *Three Empires*, 527.

Figure 10. Altit Fort and Altit village, taken from Karimabad (Baltit), showing terracing and settlement patterns. Taken 18 October, 1995.

Figure 11. The Upper Gilgit River Valley, taken from the Government Rest House at Phander. Taken 24 August, 1995.

Reader Reception

In my discussion of Michel Foucault, I examined the notion of discourse – how discourse is a ‘system of possibility’ that allows its users to produce statements which are either true or false. Philp states that the rules of discourse are not rules that people follow consciously, but are preconditions for the formation of various statements. He says: ‘Indeed, the place, function and character of the “knowers”, authors, and audiences of a discourse are also a function of these discursive rules’²³. I have shown some examples of the discursive rules behind the formation of the narrative statements with respect to the ‘knowers’ and authors, and will now, following Mills and Blunt, examine some of the functions the audience plays in these formations.

‘Truth’ is not only underlined in the texts, but can be examined in the reviews of the texts. ‘Truth’ is what the audience is after – the readers are looking for *the* essential image of the places and peoples. Mills shows that ‘truth’ was often compared to European ‘reality’. When speaking of the ‘reality’ of another country, ‘it is often the case that critics judge to be lies those events which contradict or do not fit in with a Eurocentric picture of “reality”’²⁴. The

²³ M. Philp, ‘Michel Foucault,’ in *The Return of Grand Theory in the Human Sciences*, ed. Q. Skinner (Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1985), 69.

²⁴ Mills, *Discourses of Difference: An analysis of women’s travel writing and colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991), 116.

audience is looking for an image they already hold. When the text fits this image, it is seen as more truthful than an image that does not fit it.

Unfortunately, I was only able to obtain reviews for E.F. Knight's *Where Three Empires Meet*. This book is deeply entrenched in colonial activity and thought. The representations of the people and landscapes were a way of re-enforcing a feeling of superiority. It encouraged the readers to adopt the same authoritative colonial stance with respect to the people, urging them that what was happening was the right thing, for the Empire and the people of Hunza.

The reviews²⁵ I examined provided quite similar views, in that their authors seemed to be very happy with the work that Knight had done, but were even happier with the colonial enterprises in the region. The reviewers repeat many of the colonialist comments that Knight made throughout the text, and often include their own encouragements to the Empire. Knight is seen as a gentleman, who volunteered his time in order to bring home the 'truth' about the campaign and the situation in the region. Three of the four reviews go into great depth about the colonial interests in the region, presenting the achievements of not just Knight, but the Empire as a whole:

[H]e has pleasant things to say about the introduction of British ways and methods into the administration of the Maharaja's

²⁵ Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight, *Geographical Journal* 2 (1, 1893): 89; Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight, *The Dial* 15 (July 1, 1893): 9-12; Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight, *The Atheneum* 101 (May 20, 1893): 629-630; Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight, *The Nation* 56 (June 22, 1893): 460-461; Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight, *Blackwood's Magazine* 154 (August, 1893): 281-283

country. By no means the least instructive or satisfactory reading in his pages is the notice of steady advance made in Kashmir under the immediate supervision of the Indian Government and its never-failing staff of trained civilians. Reform is here a gradual and not a revolutionary process.²⁶

The reviews repeat the representations of the people already formed by Knight and other previous travellers: 'They are pleasant, good-humoured, able-bodied, and tolerably industrious...'²⁷. They also comment on work that is being done to improve the places and the people.

The resources of Kashmir have never been exploited, though Mr. Knight makes it evident that should British capital ever be admitted into the country there will be ample scope for it. According to some authorities, only one third of the available land is under cultivation, and even that does not produce nearly what it might. Valuable minerals undoubtedly exist, and it is probable that should the long-projected more-than-once-surveyed railway be made, Kashmir will become a large exporter of agricultural produce and of the delicious fruits for which it is famed.²⁸

These comments can be made only because the superiority of the Westerner has already been established. The resources have not been exploited by the indigenous people, and so it seems almost the duty of the colonialist not to let them go to waste²⁹.

I understand why Mills argues so vehemently that the reviews of these texts be seen as an important factor in the way subsequent images are formed,

²⁶ *The Atheneum*, 629.

²⁷ *Blackwood's Magazine*, 283.

²⁸ *The Dial*, 10.

²⁹ James Duncan, 'Sites of Representation: Place, time and the discourse of the Other,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993), 50.

and future books are written. In this case, they are as influential as the books, if not more so, in promoting European superiority.

We are assured that the most warlike Indian races recognise the masterful English pluck and the superiority of the sahib's brain-power, and that the most lawless hill tribes contrast our political consistency favourably with the shifty Russian diplomacy which has often played them false. We can record few more brilliant feats of arms than that by which the fort of Nilt [location of final battle] was carried by feeble native forlorn-hopes, with English officers to lead them.³⁰

In this chapter, I examined the texts that were written just prior to and just after Hunza's defeat in 1891, and have attempted to show how narrative techniques and language have been used by the authors as a representational strategy to present what is 'real'. The four texts examined in this chapter are typical of the 'manners and customs' narrative, although the last two texts also include 'sentimental' narrative. The texts are typical of the information gathering that was common at the time of colonial expansion. The use of various representation techniques and language (e.g. sweeping generalities, portraits, 'other' landscapes, and constructing the people as naïve or childlike), have described, objectified, and classified the indigenous people and have helped construct them as inferior to the European. Barbaric and a nuisance before the 1891 Hunza campaign, the people are later represented as happy and helpful. This change of representation allowed the Europeans to use the locals as a labour force, useful to the Empire. In this position, the 'other' was easily judged

³⁰ *Blackwood's Magazine*, 283.

and compared to the European 'standard' – through this process, becoming even more 'inferior'. These texts have produced a 'truth' about the people of Hunza through the assumed authority of the writers, and the use of 'eyewitness' accounts. Because these texts are almost the first European accounts of the various cultures, they are the initial European representations of the people and landscape of Hunza – some of these remain until present day, others have been modified, while others were replaced. Already, knowledge of different groups of people in the region, including the inhabitants of Hunza, begins to be naturalized – made common knowledge. These representations are not hidden behind meanings or metaphor, they are plainly laid out on the surface of the text. The deconstruction of the texts does not reveal any 'hidden' truths behind the words.

Chapter Five. Exploration and Adventure

The immense distances separating these shooting grounds constitute in themselves an obstacle that requires all the energy and experience of the sportsman to overcome, whilst the route through wild and little-known countries, amongst strange races of nomads, and over ground but seldom trodden by man, is sufficient to put his patience and endurance to the severest test
P.T. Etherton¹

Introduction

This chapter deals with two adventure/exploration narratives set in Hunza between the turn of the century and the 1910s: Etherton's *Across the Roof of the World* and Neve's *Thirty Years in Kashmir*². Adventure writing has been described as 'the energizing myth of empire', where the celebration of adventure was the celebration of empire³. Phillips states that 'realistic adventure stories naturalize the geographies they represent, and normalize the constructions of race, gender, class and empire those geographies inscribe'⁴. The genre is typical of colonial discourse, as:

¹ P.T. Etherton, *Across the Roof of the World. A Record of sport and travel through Kashmir, Gilgit, Hunza, the Pamirs, Chinese Turkestan, Mongolia and Siberia* (London: Constable and Company Ltd, 1911), 1.

² Etherton, *Roof of the world*; Arthur Neve, *Thirty Years in Kashmir* (London: Edward Arnold, 1913).

³ Martin Green, as quoted in Sara Mills, *Discourses of Difference. An analysis of women's travel writing and colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991), 76.

⁴ Richard Phillips, *Mapping Men and Empire: A geography of adventure* (London: Routledge, 1997), 15.

The adventure hero is the perfect colonial subject, or at least the perfect colonial *male* subject. The narrator must keep “face” and a “stiff upper lip”.⁵

A hunter and sportsman wrote the first text I examine here, while a member of the Church Missionary Society with a background in medicine wrote the second. These two texts are located within the colonial context, but there are some differences between the production of these two books and those found in Chapter Four. The emphasis in these latter books was to present the newly acquired ‘other’ land and people to the world. The focus in the texts in this chapter is less on the people and the landscape, and more on the adventures and hunting expeditions (big game animals, specifically wild sheep, ibex, and gazelle) of the narrators.

⁵ Mills, *Discourses*, 77.

Etherton

P.T. Etherton was a lieutenant in the Indian Army at the time he wrote his book. While stationed in the northern areas of the Indian Empire in 1906, he decided to 'undertake a big-game shooting expedition in Central Asia, a scheme as bold as it was comprehensive'⁶. His journey was to include 'the Pamirs, the Thian Shan, and the Great Altai Mountains, thence through Siberia to the Trans-Siberian Railway'⁷. By 1909 he was ready to leave. He is detailed about the extent of preparation that went into a journey of this magnitude; much of the introductory chapter recounts the preliminary travel steps that he took, as he believes this information would 'be of use to future travellers'⁸.

His text is full of tropes that were often found in earlier, nineteenth-century exploration writing. These older narrations constructed representations of the visited place for Europeans at home, representations that would open up the area, conceptually as well as economically⁹. Representations in adventure narratives were built up from these older ones, and discursively constructed a region appropriate both for the needs of colonial Europeans as well as one in

⁶ Etherton, *Roof of the World*, 2.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ Duncan shows how explorer-writers, such as Stanley and Livingstone, did this to Africa in the nineteenth century. Because of late colonial interest in Hunza (compared to other regions of the world), this type of writing continued into the twentieth century: James Duncan, 'Sites of Representation: Place, time and the discourse of the Other,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993), 50.

which the exotic tales of adventure and heroic mastery, sought by readers, were placed.

Although adventure narratives include frequent descriptions of the indigenous people – in *Across the Roof of the World* they are most often represented as porters – the author/hero is nevertheless often portrayed as a solitary explorer. This contradiction only makes sense in a context that makes the indigenous people ‘absent by representing them as less than human’¹⁰.

I started just after daylight on the 31st to ascend the Tragbal Pass, which lies at an altitude of 11,900 feet above sea level.

I camped that night in the bungalow at Gurai, now completely buried in snow, entrance to it having to be effected by burrowing through the white layer hardened by continual frost.

So I set out the next morning at four o'clock in the hope of doing a long march and getting over some of the worst parts of the road before the sun should bring down avalanches from the steep ravine sides through which our way now led.¹¹

In each of these quotations, Etherton speaks as if he is traveling alone, despite the presence of numerous porters and other servants. He speaks of the porters only in certain contexts: at stops where he must change them (‘So, halting only for a cup of tea and to change coolies, resumed the onward march...’¹²); or, waiting for them to come into camp at the rest stops at the end of the day (‘The

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ All three quotations from Etherton, *Roof of the World*, 22-23.

¹² Ibid., 23.

coolies dropped in one after the other up till nine o'clock...¹³); or, in anecdotes about them:

For camp furniture, *i.e.*, bed, table, chair and bath, I do not think the X pattern articles can be improved upon, as they are rapidly put together and seldom break, which is a consideration, especially amongst Oriental servants, who seem to regard everything as armour-plated.¹⁴

To see the coolies at every stage eyeing that [small, but heavy] box and then rushing to secure such a seeming featherweight afforded me much amusement, not lessened by the looks of disgust and disappointment which followed.¹⁵

Etherton's adventure story includes several examples of language used to 'other' indigenous people, in ways I have discussed previously. As I discussed in Chapter Two, Said shows that it is a common Orientalist trope to relate time and place, to compare the Oriental place or person to a place or person located in the past. Etherton accomplishes this:

I did not, however, believe the enterprise to be beyond the power of accomplishment, for I had had the good fortune to gain much of that experience in various parts of the world so necessary to one who would venture into the unknown, travel off the beaten track, and penetrate regions where man is still in the most primitive state¹⁶.

Another Orientalist preconception is the image of the Oriental as inefficient, unruly, haughty and 'governed by opinions'¹⁷:

¹³ Ibid., 32.

¹⁴ Ibid., 6.

¹⁵ Ibid., 21.

¹⁶ Ibid., 2.

¹⁷ This refers to Linné's classification system discussed in Chapter Two. Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992), 32.

A vexed question is that of servants, a really good one being difficult to obtain, the majority of those in Srinagar being more than average scoundrels against whom a stranger needs to exercise considerable caution.¹⁸

Another method that Etherton uses to construct his text for the European audience is to compare the sights he sees to European sights. For example, he sees the waterways of Srinagar as 'picturesque and reminds one of Venice'¹⁹. Immediately following this initial sentiment, the beauty disappears for him, as it does not compare to European beauty, because 'an excursion into the many side streets and alleys dispels the idea, the surroundings and general aspect of dirt and squalor being of a marked order'²⁰.

Comparisons of 'other' landscapes to those of Europe were common practice in travel writing. Gregory shows how Florence Nightingale did this frequently, as did many other travellers visiting places for the first time²¹. Often, the sights were so different from those at home, authors were unable to describe them using their normal vocabulary. Etherton does find the ability to describe, but lets his reader know that he is not responsible for the strange things he presents – the 'oddities' of the Oriental:

Later in the Ili Su I met some Tajik villagers who had never gone beyond their own rocky fastnesses and knew nothing of the Taghdumbash Pamir, 20 miles away, or of the country further down

¹⁸ Etherton, *Roof of the World*, 8.

¹⁹ Ibid., 19.

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ Derek Gregory, 'Between the book and the lamp: imaginative geographies of Egypt, 1849-50,' *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* NS 20: 29-57.

the nullah. Such characteristics are inexplicable to the European, and especially to the energetic Anglo-Saxon; the desire to explore and push into the unknown being innate in our race. As Rudyard Kipling has aptly expressed it, "East is East and West is West, and ne'er the twain shall meet"²².

However, the Oriental is a strange creature, and it is at times difficult to fathom his ideas and appreciate his weird idiosyncrasies.²³

There are a few houses in Khaibar village, the inhabitants of which must lead a dull and gloomy life, shut in as they are by the mountains and practically cut off from the outside world. But then the Oriental is differently constituted to his Western brother.²⁴

The first quotation is a good example of several Orientalist tropes. First, Etherton is 'othering' the people by finding them indescribable – to him, they have 'strange' tendencies, so strange in fact that he is unable to see them without judging them as inferior to his own ways. Not only are 'the Oriental's' practices found to be inexplicable; in contrast to the European's innate energy, the people are seen as 'lazy'. By stating that the European's tendency to explore is innate, 'the Oriental's' desire to stay put makes them lazy. He quotes Rudyard Kipling's famous line 'and ne'er the twain shall meet'. This statement epitomizes his feelings about 'the Oriental' – they are too strange in comparison to the normal European for him to ever believe they are on equal footing.

Another practice of Etherton's that was common at the time, and continued through to the 1960s, is the tendency to visit (or be visited by) the

²² Etherton, *Roof of the World*, 51.

²³ Ibid., 32.

²⁴ Ibid., 51.

rulers of Hunza and surrounding nations²⁵, and avoid prolonged exposure to common people²⁶. As a result, many of the conclusions the visitors come to are based solely on the interaction they have had with the rulers. The common people are erased through this practice, as they are rarely discussed or even encountered. In Etherton's case, interaction with non-elite locals is limited to porters and here the labour relation limits the extent and variety of interaction. Occasionally, he does mention locals, but mainly with reference to their history, which has the effect of keeping the people in the past, and erasing the present people. This practice of historicizing romanticizes the past, and implies that the current inhabitants have nothing to admire: 'In former days raids on caravans using this route were of frequent occurrence, and formed the main source of income to the rulers and people of Hunza'. Etherton does actually discuss the current Hunza inhabitants on one occasion, but in the usual 'manners and customs' method of objectification:

The Kanjutis [people of Hunza] are much akin to the Chitralis, being a fine race of people with fair complexions. They are splendid mountaineers, possessing great powers of endurance, and have ever enjoyed a fine reputation for bravery, while former struggles with their neighbours of Nagar, and their raiding exploits, testify to the warlike qualities possessed by them to a marked degree.²⁷

²⁵ A very common practice, see for example: John Tobe, *Hunza: Adventures in a land of paradise* (Toronto: George J. McCleod, 1960); Lowell Thomas, Jr. and Tay Thomas, 'Sky Road East' *National Geographic* 117, no. 1 (1960): 71-112.

²⁶ Except in the cases of E.O. Lorimer, *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* (London: George Allen and Unwin, Limited, 1939) and John Clark, *Hunza: Lost Kingdom in the Himalayas* (New York: Funk and Wagnalls Company, 1956; reprint, Karachi: Indus Publications, 1980).

²⁷ Etherton, *Roof of the World*, 44-45.

These statements are important as they exemplify how the people are constructed as specific things in order to justify colonialists' use of them. Here, the inhabitants are described as 'splendid mountaineers, possessing great powers of endurance'. This description constructs the inhabitants as worthy porters, guides, and general labourers under colonial rule. Pratt states that this type of description is like landscape description, where the viewer scans the area for prospects. But it also can be described as a 'bodyscape', where the inhabitants are scanned for their potential resources – their ability to become a labour pool. Both types of description erase the culture that exists and replace it with a 'Eurocolonial discursive order' whose authority is maintained²⁸.

This type of scanning practice is very common in colonial texts. The viewer sees the landscape and people from his or her point of view, and presents this point of view as the only sight worth seeing. The 'gaze' as it is called, is often associated with contact zones, although it is also connected with gender, and other discourses²⁹. People are erased through this practice – in landscape scanning, the people are not seen, and in bodyscape scanning, they are not given a voice. Mills reminds her readers that it is common for the traveller to gaze at the indigenous people, but if they return the gaze, the traveller is

²⁸ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 64-65.

²⁹ For example, see Gillian Rose 'Geography as a Science of Observation: The Landscape, the Gaze and Masculinity' in *Nature and Science: Essays in the History of Geographical Knowledge*, Historical Geography Series, vol. 28, ed. Felix Driver and Gillian Rose (London: Institute of Historical Research, 1992), 8-18.

irritated³⁰. This irritation stems from the fact that the superiority of the colonialist is not being respected:

In the front I had two latticed windows, which permitted of the tent being closed, an advantage when travelling in the wilds of Central Asia, where the whole population usually turns out to gaze at the strange antics of the Ferenghi [foreigner] and watch his every movement, as though he were out for their especial benefit and delectation.³¹

Etherton is upset that he has become the centre of attention, as if on display in a zoo, but the narration also shows that he is amused that *he* is seen to be the strange one.

This text is quite typical of colonial adventure discourse, which presented the narrator as hero. Throughout his text, Etherton constructs the region as a place appropriate for European needs and a place in which to locate his exotic tale of adventure and heroic mastery. He minimizes human presence (except for that of the rulers and high status locals) within the text, and places the focus of his narrative on landscape, sport, and heroism. He uses Orientalist and 'othering' techniques and language similar to the authors in Chapter Four: he compares the 'other' sights to European sights; he constructs the people as 'primitive', strange and inferior; and he equates time and place which helps keep the inhabitants of and places in Hunza in the past, negating present people and

³⁰ Mills, *Discourses*, 78.

³¹ Etherton, *Roof of the World*, 6.

places. Hunza, at this time, has been under British control for twenty years. There have been no major 'problems' with the 'natives'; things are calm and relaxed. The region is promoted as an extensive playground for Europe through texts like this one. Etherton constructs both the people and places of Hunza in a way which makes them useful to Europeans. By doing this, he justifies the statements made about them. For example, the Hunza inhabitants are described as perfect mountaineers and porters – an ideal situation for the colonial empire for whom the inhabitants have become one large labour pool. Although the 'happy, healthy Hunza' discourse does not seem implicit in this text, it does indeed contribute to its beginnings. Beginning right after the defeat of Hunza in Durand and Knight's books, the inhabitants of Hunza are presented as excellent porters. In this adventure text, the people are 'willing' to work, and definitely capable – Etherton's descriptions of the porters describes the porters as hard-working and strong. This is their 'proper' place – as porters – and they seem willing and happy to stay in this position.

Figure 12. Karimabad (Baltit). Foreground shows the backs of some commercial establishments. The large structure in the left middleground (with scaffolding) is Baltit Fort, one of the ancestral homes of the mirs of Hunza, and is at least 800 years old. The fort was restored, and is now one of the main cultural and historical attractions of Hunza. Ultar Peak is in the background. Taken 9 August, 1995.

Neve

Arthur Neve arrived in Srinagar in 1882 and worked as a medical missionary in the area. He worked mainly in the medical field, but in 1891 received an award from the Royal Geographical Society for his work on the topography and glaciology of the Himalaya. His book tells the story of his travels and experiences over thirty years in the region, and includes chapters on his journey through Gilgit and Hunza, mainly in Aliabad and Baltit, visiting with the *tham*.

From the beginning, the text introduces the area as a colonial stronghold. Everywhere Neve looks, he sees fascinating battle sites. He has read many of the war stories and compares the sites he sees to the books he has read. He often speaks of places as the site of such and such a battle, or where certain soldiers showed their courage. For example: 'Captain (now General) Aylmer twice faced certain death in igniting the fuse of the slabs which his plucky Pathan orderly placed against the solid gate, behind which stones had been built up'³². He is smitten by stories of heroism and combat, and takes E.F. Knight's *Where Three Empire's Meet* to use as a guidebook to the battle sites, to mentally recreate the battle scenes while standing in front of them. He refers to historic

³² Arthur Neve, *Thirty Years in Kashmir* (London: Edward Arnold, 1913), 161.

figures in the same language as did Knight and Durand³³. By describing places only as places where the colonial battles were fought, he effectively erases the history that came before. The only time the pre-colonial history of the inhabitants is mentioned is when he repeats the notion that Hunza and Nagar have continually been at war since the time of Ayesho. Spurr suggests that this erasure (negation) denies both history and place: the past becomes an absence. This absence, however, is negative: 'a people without history is one which exists only in a negative sense like the bare earth, they can be transformed by history, but they cannot make history their own'³⁴.

Neve presents the area as the place where 'gallant deeds' were performed in the 1890s (the campaign and defeat of 1891 and the subsequent colonial restructuring). Fortunately, even after all the contact that has occurred since this time, the indigenous people are still found to be true to their 'primitive' state and so, therefore, 'offer most interesting problems to students of language

³³ Neve describes Safdar Ali (the ruler at the time of the 1891 campaign) so: 'The man was a scoundrel and debauchee of the worst Oriental type': Neve, *Thirty Years*, 156; Durand says: 'The leaders were scoundrels': Algernon Durand, *The Making of a Frontier: Five Years' Experiences and Adventures in Gilgit, Hunza, Nagar, Chitral, and the Eastern Hindu-Kush* (London: John Murray, 1899), 170; while Knight stated: 'The rulers of these two States were, as might be expected, ignorant and bloodthirsty scoundrels': E.F. Knight, *Where Three Empires Meet. A Narrative of Recent Travel in Kashmir, Western Tibet, Gilgit, and the adjoining countries* (London: Longmans, Green, and Co, 1893; reprint, Taipei: Ch'eng Wen Publishing Company, 1971), 349.

³⁴ David Spurr, *The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing, and Imperial Administration* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993), 98.

or race'³⁵. From the start, he denies their individuality, and presents them as a 'project' for students.

Neve further accomplishes this negation through his picturesque descriptions of the landscape. He presents the Hunza landscape as pretty and calming, and neglects to discuss the hardships and obstacles people have worked to overcome, living in areas that need terracing and extensive irrigation, and where walls and canals need continual maintenance:

Ferns and moss nestle in the crevices of the rocks, sprays of crimson roses stoop down to kiss the ripples; cornfields and orchards, vineyards and gardens cover the well watered terraces and slopes basking in the brilliant sunshine.³⁶

On the other hand, Neve follows in the tradition of presenting the landscape as perilous and risky. This allows him to promote the region as awe-inspiring and challenging to those who wish to follow in his footsteps, as well as to highlight his own abilities in overcoming obstacles. This underlines his position as adventurer, able to master nature:

During the summer months the fresh breeze on the mountain top, jewelled sward, and the vast panorama are inspiring, but with the oncoming winter the hand of death seem laid on everything, the deep snowdrifts obliterate all landmarks, and fierce pitiless blizzards sweep over the desolation, benumbing the faculties of the foolhardy traveller.³⁷

Neve himself is not the foolhardy traveller of whom he speaks.

³⁵ Neve, *Thirty Years*, 139.

³⁶ Ibid., 165.

³⁷ Ibid., 141.

Like other authors, Neve uses European cultural content to describe the landscape and the inhabitants. He cannot simply state that Hunza and Nagar have had their rivalries, he fills the story with what the audience will see as mysticism and romance by making the following statement: 'Between these two States has been a rivalry as keen as the old feuds of Scot and Southerner'³⁸. Most readers will have the background to (mis)understand the power of the rivalry through this comparison.

Neve's narrative is one of the first I found which begins to describe the Hunza people separately from the Nagar people, who inhabit the area directly across the Hunza River. Neve initiates a tradition that follows for some time, which presents the Hunza people as friendly and willing, and the Nagaris as unfriendly and stern. This favourable comparison further develops the 'Happy Hunza' discourse. Neve's narrative includes a list of the differences he finds:

The rivalry was intensified in time by petty raids, and by religion, for while the Hunzas are followers of the Aga Khan and belong to the Maulai sect, the people of Nagar are Shiah... The Hunza face south, live in the sunshine, and are at once more frank and warlike, while the Nagaris dwell under the shade of mountains 25,000 feet high, and live on terraces facing the north, and are said to be less keen sportsmen or fighters.³⁹

Here Neve reiterates the contrast between the two religions: the Hunza (Maulai) inhabitants are seen as superior and 'freer', the Nagaris (Shia) are seen as more 'fanatical'. One can also see from this quotation the beginnings of environmental

³⁸ Ibid., 157.

³⁹ Ibid., 158.

determinism as a reason for the Hunzan's cheeriness. Neve describes the Hunza people as 'more frank and warlike', while the Nagaris are 'less keen sportsmen or fighters'. This statement presents the people of Hunza as courageous. Neve finds courage an honourable trait, as seen by his search for stories of courage and ardour on the part of colonial forces. 'Warlike' is seen here as a characteristic to be admired, and since the people have already been defeated and are no longer a threat, it can be admired without worry. The Nagaris are found to be 'less keen sportsmen or fighters', and to Neve, this seems less courageous, perhaps almost effeminate, and allows the Nagaris to be presented as inferior not only to the colonialists, but to the Hunza people. These differences, which identify Hunzakuts as superior specimens, are attributed to the effect of dissimilar micro-environments.

Neve is indeed the 'perfect colonial male subject'. He walks around Hunza describing and painting, seeing and mastering. He wanders around one village 'camera in hand, seeking for good view-points' and then, with all the privilege available only to the Westerner, looks into the houses of the people to observe their private lives:

We slept without even closing the doors, and of course without weapons, amongst these friendly folk, and in the morning one or two patients were brought to me; and I strolled about the flat housetops, camera in hand, seeking for good view-points, and as I did so, looked down through the roof openings into the simple households, where women were preparing the morning meal, and all greeted me with smiling courtesy.⁴⁰

⁴⁰ Ibid., 164.

There is no discussion describing whether or not he obtained permission to sit upon their roves and peer into their houses. Nor is there any discussion of the peoples' reactions to this objectifying form of study. Neve carries this observational practice through his whole visit to Hunza. As I mentioned, he introduces the area as a project ready for any ethnography or language student, and describes the people and land using the 'manners and customs' method:

The boys are circumcised at the age of four to ten years, after which they are promoted to trousers. The women wear baggy trousers gathered in at the ankles, and in summer a long gown of white or coloured cotton with a small cap, but in winter a brown woollen bag, rather like the other Shin peoples. The language, which they call Yeshkun, is ordinarily spoken of as Boorishki. I am not a ready linguist, and so made no attempt to study it; but from some lists of words I have seen it appears to have no affinity whatever to Kashmiri, in that respect differing from the Shina of Gilgit or the Chiliss [*sic*] of the Indus Valley.⁴¹

The descriptions seem fairly neutral and 'objective' at first until one realizes the vocabulary is quite loaded. For example, by calling the winter dress a 'woollen bag', he is commenting on the strangeness of the custom. In Europe, bags are carried, not worn – a Westerner would never be found wearing one. The dresses, and the people who use them, are thus seen in his eyes as strange and inferior. He does note that 'Yeshkun' is the word the people use to describe their own language. However, in the next phrase, he negates this term, and so erases it in the manner he has done with their history, by presenting the word by which the language is most known, 'Boorishki'. He does admit he has no knowledge of

⁴¹ Ibid., 166-167.

the language; this might seem to diffuse the authority with which he speaks. But he follows this admission with what seems to be definitive statements of its relation to other languages in the area. Thus, although he has just finished saying he knows nothing of the language, he continues to judge its relation to others – this practice is only possible when his authority has been previously well established. The reader then ignores the first statement, and sees the latter statements as ‘true’.

This text does indeed serve to ‘energize the myth of empire’ as stated at the beginning of this chapter. Arthur Neve, in his position as colonialist is able to visit Hunza, describe it, judge it, as well as show it off to his readership. These actions serve not only to underline his privilege, but undermine the Hunza inhabitants. Neve constructs Hunza as a list of battle sights. By describing these ‘heroic’ scenes, he speaks only of colonial history, and eliminates any history that came before colonial interest in the area. He is able to assert his authority and heroism by describing the landscape in two opposing ways: first, he says it is pretty and calming, which negates the hardships of the inhabitants in making the land sustainable; and second, he describes it as dangerous and perilous, which helps describe his own heroism and mastery in overcoming the obstacles it presented him. Like previous authors, Neve constructs the people and places as strange and ‘primitive’, but he is the first to set up a dichotomy between Hunza and Nagar. Hunza is represented as a nicer place, with nicer (more willing)

people, while Nagar is perceived as belonging to the 'ordinary' Oriental stereotype. This representation is reiterated by Lorimer (discussed in the next chapter). The authority and position he feels he has allows him to observe the people as objects. He expects them to perform for him, as it is their rightful role. He presents the people 'as he sees them', but at the same time judges them and renders them inferior. This practice allows the representations of the people to be 'true'.

Reader Reception

Of the four reviews⁴² gathered on Etherton's narrative, only one is pleased with the product. *The Independent's* review tells its readers that the book is full of 'many engaging incidents of travel, hunting and contact with the native peoples'⁴³. This seems to describe the 'adventure' narrative that I have stated this book is. However, the other three reviews were disappointed in the content of the book – it did not contain enough new information about the region:

Of the country through which he passed or of its people, he tells us little, and nothing at all of its other fauna or its flora, and of many of the topics of human and scientific interest which the general reader expects to find in travel-books of little-known regions.⁴⁴

With the effort and expense that is needed to undertake this sort of adventure, it seems Etherton should have used his privilege to a fuller extent, and should have blazed new trails, or at least gathered further information about the people and the landscape. The content expected by these reviews in terms of adventure discourse has not been realized in their opinion. Perhaps the reviewers had expected a 'manners and customs' narrative similar to authors before him. However, the information that *is* gathered and presented in the text is seen as

⁴² 'Sport and Travel in Central Asia,' review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton, *Nature* 86 (May 18, 1911): 388; 'Through Asia from South to North,' review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton, *The Geographical Journal* 37(6, 1911): 649; 'Sport and Travel in High Asia,' review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton, *The Saturday Review* 112 (August 12, 1911): 210; 'The Enchantment of Mountains,' review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton, *The Independent* 72 (June 6, 1912): 1269.

⁴³ *The Independent*, 1269.

⁴⁴ *Nature*, 388.

'straight and unvarnished'⁴⁵, which is a testament to Etherton's ability to use language and narrative technique to present his statements as 'true'.

One reviewer is much more specific about the discursive constraints of the genre – what should or should not be accepted. The reviewer recognizes the dangers that are involved in a mission of this sort, but states that with this type of book, one should expect, 'and rightly, that the author has something new and of importance to tell, and that he can tell it in an interesting way, for the benefit not only of those who are regular sportsmen themselves, but of many general readers as well'⁴⁶. This reviewer defines the genre as 'sportsman's narrative' and states that the author should have 'minutely and sympathetically watched and studied those animals in their haunts, and [made sure] that he has captured something of their secrets which he is able to impart vividly and faithfully to his readers'⁴⁷. This reviewer is expecting not a travel book⁴⁸, not an adventure book, but a sportsman's narrative, and is disappointed that Etherton has not come close to the expectations. The reviewer warns any other sportsmen who are attempting the same type of mission to heed this suggestion, and suggests that they would therefore 'find it greatly to their advantage to cultivate beforehand

⁴⁵ *The Geographical Journal*, 649.

⁴⁶ *The Saturday Review*, 210.

⁴⁷ *Ibid.*

⁴⁸ The reviewer's specifications for this genre are thus: '[a] wealth of new material on many topics that is disclosed by a trained and thoroughly well-informed scientific observer – who, after all, is the best writer of travel-books'. *Ibid.*

some promising line of research, were it only topographic exploration, and they should learn something of the language as well'⁴⁹.

The reviewers of Neve's narrative⁵⁰ are quite pleased with the result of his travels. They are happy that there is a great deal of information, but even more so, that he has described, in a wonderful manner, this 'almost unknown' area to his readers⁵¹. The reviews reinforce the importance given to 'eyewitness' accounts as discussed in the examination of Knight's narrative. Through Neve's first-hand experiences and subsequent descriptions, the book gains merit⁵². Neve's authoritative position is further enhanced, as one reviewer calls him 'something of an anthropologist'⁵³. This statement gives credit and scientific respectability to Neve's 'manners and customs' descriptions of the people and landscape, and constructs Neve as a man of authority. The reviewers applaud the fact that Neve goes to areas where 'very few white men have ever passed'⁵⁴. They describe him as a 'true mountaineer' and are even more impressed by the

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Review of *Thirty Years in Kashmir*, by Arthur Neve, *The Saturday Review* 177 (January 3, 1914): 22-23; Review of *Thirty Years in Kashmir*, by Arthur Neve, *The Athenaeum* (supplement March 21, 1914): 428; and Review of *Thirty Years in Kashmir*, by Arthur Neve, *American Library Association Booklist* 10 (April 14, 1914): 315-316.

⁵¹ *American Library Association Booklist*, 316.

⁵² *The Saturday Review*, 23.

⁵³ Ibid.

⁵⁴ Ibid.

fact that he has met up with several other adventurers in the area, whose names would have been familiar to many of the readers⁵⁵.

One can see several similarities between these two texts and those of Durand and Knight. Although these later travellers are not as connected with the colonial effort (although Neve does work as a medical missionary in the area), they still represent the Empire through their actions and attitude. Authority is sustained through language which gives the traveller superiority. The use of 'manners and customs' narrative constructs the narrator as ethnographer, with the Hunza people the objects of their studies. In other uses of language, the people and their history are negated. Finally, the 'eyewitness' accounts by white Westerners give all four authors the ability to speak 'truths'.

The two later books, however, differ in their focus. No longer are the journeys military missions, but are descriptions of holidays. Etherton and Neve both use their books to describe their adventures traveling across this new British possession. They invite others to see for themselves, and to take the opportunity to observe primitive life.

The next chapter examines E.O. Lorimer's *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, the first book I look at that is written by a woman. It is the last book I examine, however, that is written during the British Colonial period. These two

⁵⁵ *The Athenaeum*, 429.

factors, as well as others, begin to change the face of the travel literature written about the area.

Chapter Six. Gender and Imperialism

*The people round here from the first
unbelievably friendly; we could run out quite
informally at any moment and join them in the
fields and ask what they were at, and why, and
what their various implements were called.*
- E.O. Lorimer¹

Introduction

This chapter introduces several new ideas. First, the sole book I examine in this chapter was written by a woman. Mills has shown that women produce texts under different discursive constraints than do male writers, and I will show how her comments are relevant to *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*. Second, this book is written in a different style and under different conditions than the previous ones. Lorimer spent over a year in Hunza, in the village of Aliabad. As a result, the book tends to focus on the day-to-day issues that came up during her stay. The book is also close to standard ethnography. Third, Lorimer lived in Hunza with her husband, a former Political Agent in Gilgit and a highly respected and accomplished linguist in his own right, which lends both content and authority to Lorimer's book. *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* is one of the first books to develop the discourse of the people as 'happy' – the representation of the 'happy, healthy Hunza' blossoms. I will discuss how this image flourishes over the subsequent decades.

¹ E.O. Lorimer, *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* (London: George Allen and Unwin, Limited, 1939), 80-81.

Figure 13. Alabad, featuring the Karakoram Highway, and some of the Allabad Bazaar. The Lorimers lived roughly 100 metres away during their stay in Hunza. Mount Rakaposhi is in the background. Taken August 1999.

Lorimer

Emily Lorimer was married to David Lorimer, a Political Agent posted in Gilgit from 1920 to 1924. During his four years in Gilgit, David Lorimer studied the Shina, Khowar (from Chitral), and Burushaski (Hunza) languages. Emily often contributed to the collection through her own conversations with indigenous people. After retirement from political service, the Lorimers returned to Hunza. *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* is Emily's story of their visit in 1934, during which time they lived in Aliabad, Hunza, in a bungalow that had been constructed for the Political Agent.

1 Ethnography or Travel Text?

Pratt notes that it is a habit of many ethnographers to see ethnographic writing as superior to, or at least completely distinct from, other forms of writing such as travel writing, journalism, or memoir. Pratt argues, however, that ethnographic writing and the discursive practices that allow its production are often 'inherited from these other genres and are still shared with them today'². Pratt says that contrasting ethnography (superior) to travel writing (inferior) limits ethnography's ability to examine itself as a kind of writing. Liisa Malkki also

² Mary Louise Pratt, 'Fieldwork in Common Places,' in *Writing Culture: The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986), 27.

examines the hierarchical distinction between anthropology and journalism³. She would agree with Pratt that what is needed is an examination of the commonalities between these fields, not further contrasts, because the construction of these binary contrasts only 'homogenizes and simplifies' the two fields⁴. In many cases, ethnography does not reach the 'ideal' of a detached observer who records a culture mimetically. Thus, there is often only a fine line, if any, between some ethnographic writing and some travel writing. Spurr discusses how the study of 'primitive' peoples allows a certain privileged point of view – a position that sees the social world as a representation. This privileged and authoritative position is one 'held in common by the ethnologist *and other Western writers* in the colonial world'⁵. Emily Lorimer certainly held this privileged position with respect to the people of Hunza. She spent more than a year in Hunza, much of it visiting with neighbours, learning various ways of Hunza life, and taking notes on everything she saw. If Malkki defines fieldwork as 'conducting "long-term" participatory research in a "community" or "society" and observing people's "ordinary," "everyday" routines and practices', it seems that Lorimer's book is an ethnographic study of people in Hunza, not 'simply' a travel text. The distinctions between the two genres collapse in this case. The

³ Liisa H. Malkki, 'News and Culture: Transitory Phenomena and the Fieldwork Tradition,' in *Anthropological Locations: Boundaries and Grounds of a Field Science*, ed. Gupta Akhil and James Ferguson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997), 94.

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ David Spurr, *The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing, and Imperial Administration* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993), 26. [my emphasis]

connection to a genre long thought to be scientific and neutral is useful for Lorimer to assert authority for her statements. I will attempt to show here, as Pratt has shown elsewhere, that the two types of writing are similar (and in this case, fairly indistinguishable), and have common discursive rules. However, as I will show, Lorimer's authority is diffused through the many constraints put on her as a woman writer.

In addition to ethnographic 'manners and customs' descriptions, Lorimer's book also contains a great deal of personal narrative. She interacts with many people, has conversations with them in their own language (although their words are translated into English in the text), and comments on numerous activities. Given such a large amount of *personal* narrative, how does this book fit in with ethnographic tradition? Pratt shows that ethnographies usually do contain some 'subjective' material, although this 'sentimental' narrative is separated from the 'objective', 'manners and customs' representations of the society. She states that these sections of the narratives were, and still are, often included in the introductory chapters of the monograph, where they

commonly recount the writer's arrival at the field site, for instance, the initial reception by the inhabitants, the slow, agonizing process of learning the language and overcoming rejection, the anguish and loss of leaving.⁶

These sections of the ethnography help anchor the subsequent 'objective' descriptions. They also help distinguish the writer from the subjects: 'they are

⁶ Pratt, 'Fieldwork,' 31.

responsible for setting up the initial positionings of the subjects of the ethnographic text: the ethnographer, the native, and the reader'⁷.

This process is employed in *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* – Lorimer takes ninety-two pages to introduce herself and her husband, the reasons behind the trip, the stop-over in Kashmir as they wait for the paths to be cleared of snow, the journey north to Hunza, and finally, the initial days in Aliabad. Pratt says that in ethnography, these initial obstacles are presented as an 'impediment to the task of doing fieldwork, rather than as part of what is to be accounted for in fieldwork'⁸. In Lorimer's text, the initial obstacles set up this part of the journey as an adventure. The Lorimers must travel through some of the places near Gilgit at night so the snow is hard enough to take their weight. The rest of the book takes place mainly in one village, and there is little adventure in the traditional sense. The inclusion of these adventurous introductory sections allows the area to be presented as inaccessible, dangerous, and primitive:

The lantern only obscured larger issues, so we banished it behind us, while David and the hill-wise Hunzakuts chose routes and slopes keeping an eye on the general direction. It would have been easy to climb futilely up and down and reach an impasse at every time. Now we swung left to avoid too steep a rise, now hastily veered right to escape an involuntary slide down unseen slopes at the base of which we could hear the torrent crashing below its crust of ice and snow. You would have been sure of an icy bath and a dislocated or broken limb.⁹

⁷ Ibid., 32.

⁸ Ibid., 41.

⁹ Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 50.

Once the Lorimers arrive at Aliabad, and the initial excitement is over, they settle into a regular daily routine, begin the work of language gathering, domestic situations, and observing the various activities of the Hunza people.

Following the style of the other chapters, I will examine some of the 'othering' techniques that construct the author as superior to the indigenous people. However, it will become clear that, although the construction of the 'other' is a major discursive formation within colonial discourse, it is not the only one. Women, who played a role in the colonial context, were also constrained by other discourses, such as those of femininity.

2 Writing Within Discourses of Femininity

Discourses of femininity have changed over time, but there are certain elements that have remained the same for many decades. Mills argues that the discursive structures of femininity 'lay out for women a range of behaviour patterns concerning sexuality, morality, their relations with others which are there to be contested (they are, after all, only discourses), but they are also there to be complied with, in as much as that is possible'¹⁰. During the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, the discourses laid out for middle-class women an array of roles which dealt mainly with the private sphere – '[women] concerned themselves with their families and maintaining relationships, but also tended to

¹⁰ Sara Mills, *Discourses of Difference: An analysis of women's travel writing and colonialism* (London: Routledge, 1991), 94.

the spiritual and moral well-being of the family group'¹¹. These discourses, which affected much of women's lives, also had an effect on how their writing was constructed. For example, when Lorimer asks *The Times* if she could send them some articles while she was in Hunza, to act as 'amateur correspondent', she was 'given some hints as to what sort of articles or news might prove acceptable'¹². Her husband carried on his research on the languages of the area, while she wrote on the daily activities of their lives in Hunza – an illustration of Mills' statement that women were often positioned into writing about personal relations, even while 'they are venturing into the public sphere, through describing travelling'¹³.

A common characteristic of women's travel writing is a focus on descriptions of interactions and relationships with people of the 'other' country, presenting them more as individuals and less as collective 'we':

The No. 1 Household [closest to their own accommodations] consists of grandfather, a charming old man, who proudly boasts that he built the house they live in and himself laid out the fruit garden; his two sons, who now do all the heavy work and who both are lucky enough to have small jobs connected with the hospital – this accounts for the family's relative well-to-do-ness; the elder son's wife is my friend Bibo Gímo, the *rúli gus* [housewife-in-chief]; the younger son's wife is a beautiful girl Naját, who became one of our best friends.¹⁴

¹¹ Ibid.

¹² Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 34.

¹³ Mills, *Discourses*, 95.

¹⁴ Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 117.

However, she does practise 'othering' techniques when she groups the people together in an undifferentiated group – to her, they all look the same:

I solemnly entered their names in my little book and tried to memorize them all and assign them as well as I could to the different houses, but for a long time they all look rather alike to me and all their dresses are much the same so that it was easy to confuse those I saw less often.¹⁵

Mills also states that many women writers were much more concerned with the way they, as narrators and as travellers, appeared to others, because of the socialization process that constructed them as objects to be gazed upon themselves. Lorimer is adamant, for example, about presenting the reasoning behind the clothing she wears to travel:

By 1920 women's fashions had become saner, and I adopted riding breeches like David's with brogues and puttees and a Norfolk jacket for everyday, and smart riding boots and long, well-fitting white coat and white breeches for ceremonial occasions. I rather fancied myself in this gear in 1920. But regretfully studying in the glass the more matronly figure of 1934, I decided to revert to the divided skirt (of more rational length and width than 1912's), and the capacious pockets of a Norfolk jacket. I had no reason to regret this. It proved an eminently practical and comfortable get-up, yet neither unsightly nor unseemly (at least so I imagined).¹⁶

Lorimer is, as I mentioned, quite focused on descriptions of the private sphere, and discusses at length the difficulties of setting up home in Aliabad – acquiring enough wood for the winter, hiring help, obtaining food, getting the large amounts of water needed (for tea, cooking, photography). She is also quite

¹⁵ Ibid., 118.

¹⁶ Ibid., 36-37.

concerned with cleanliness, both of her abode and the physical and mental cleanliness of the people and place around her. Of the clean habits of the local people, she says: 'we never expected that we should find in Hunza a people as scrupulously decent as ourselves in matters of sanitation'¹⁷. Of the cleanliness of the place, she comments: 'Hunza must be, bar none, the cleanest and the tidiest spot on earth'¹⁸. I will return to this idea of Hunza as a clean (read: moral) place when I examine her descriptions of the Nagar people across the river.

These discourses of femininity allow for the discussion of a limited number of topics (e.g., domestic issues, relationships, and the care of others). A great deal of male writing does not contain many of these 'feminine' narrative modes and topics, as the constraints on their writing are somewhat different (e.g., with more mobility, men are able to travel more independently, more authoritatively). There are, however, some discourses that appear in both writings.

One of the discourses that dominates both writings is that of the 'other', although it is less blatantly apparent in Lorimer's than in many of the previous texts. The discourses of femininity within which she writes seem to minimize her authority (as she is 'only' focusing on domestic issues, for example), but the discourses of 'other' that appear within her colonial narrative underline her privilege and authority as a European.

¹⁷ Ibid., 115.

¹⁸ Ibid., 146.

Figure 14. Rooftops in old Altit village, taken from Altit fort. Apricots are drying on the roofs. The peaked metal roof in the background is 'Jamaat Khana', the Ismaili Muslim meeting place. This photograph gives a sense of the rooftops and winding lanes that Lorimer and others would have encountered. Taken 9 August, 1995.

3 Writing Within Colonial Discourse

When in England, Lorimer is the object of the male 'gaze', whereas in Hunza, she is able to 'gaze' upon the local inhabitants with the same authority she is denied in England. Within the colonial context, as a white woman in a society where 'others' surround her, she gains superiority over the indigenous people. This authority is maintained, even though she wishes to befriend the 'natives' and nurture close relationships. The privileges that come with this authority are evident in many instances. Here, she practises Neve's habit of looking into people's houses to observe their habits:

I had a most entertaining half-hour my second afternoon. Some women and little girls were beating a pile of green stuff on the threshing-floor just below, whacking it with a sort of wooden mallet. So I ran out (with pencil and notebook), greeted them, and sat down beside them on the nice dry ground and watched the whole performance.¹⁹

Lorimer affirms her authority by grabbing her notebook and sitting down beside them to watch the locals 'perform' for her²⁰. She constructs them as ethnographic subjects, where their everyday habits are seen as an inventory of curious traits that must be recorded for posterity. Because of her privilege, the people are simply 'available' to her whenever she feels like it, to take up their roles as actors/subjects, when she intrudes on their lives. In addition to transcribing these habits and traits, Lorimer and her husband take many

¹⁹ Ibid., 81.

²⁰ M.L. Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992), 163.

photographs, to document the 'subjects', which they develop on site and distribute to the 'models'. She is often taken aback that 'these illiterate people, who had never seen a picture in their lives, were able at once to recognize and name the tiny reproductions of themselves'²¹. She finds it strange, that the illiterate (read: uneducated) people should be able to understand the concept of photography and identify themselves in the pictures. Defining the 'other' as 'primitive', as I discussed in Chapter Two, tends to construct the people as childlike, naïve, and simple.

Lorimer also reproduces another Orientalist trope when she wishes the people of Hunza would remain in their 'primitive' state forever. For example, on one occasion, she is unhappy when she receives a gift from the *tham* which is not entirely hand sewn: 'We noted with grief that the beautifully hand-embroidered *chogas* with which the Mir presented us this time all had their seams Singer-sewn, and had thus lost (for us) much of their charm'²². These statements not only show how she wishes the society would remain untouched by machinery, but also shows her devaluing the embroidery handiwork that *has* been done on the garments. Several times throughout the book she comments on her desire for Hunza's inhabitants to remain in 'the past':

... and to pay a tribute to our hospitable and beloved Hunzakuts as they were in 1935, as they must have been for uncounted generations in the past, as they may be for generations yet to come, if the poverty and inaccessibility, of their country happily

²¹ Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 176.

²² *Ibid.*, 173.

keep them safely quarantined against the “sick fatigue, the languid doubt,” the unrest and fear and hustle of our civilization.²³

Ninety-nine per cent of the population, however, happily still remain illiterate, and have not fallen victims to compulsory education.²⁴

Yet another Orientalist preconception she has is the notion of what an ‘Oriental’ *is*. Said shows how the use of the word ‘Oriental’ helped define the limits placed on the person defined by the word. He states that every European writer on the Orient was/is able to assume some sort of ‘Oriental precedent, some previous knowledge of the Orient, to which he [*sic*] refers and on which he [*sic*] relies’²⁵. Through vocabulary, rules, and imagery, a set of ideas, knowledge, about the Oriental was established: ‘their race, character, culture, history, traditions, society, and possibilities’²⁶. Over time, Orientals were constructed to have certain traits, and these became ‘essential knowledge’ about them – inherent characteristics that described all Orientals:

Orientals or Arabs are thereafter shown to be gullible, “devoid of energy and initiative,” much given to “fulsome flattery,” intrigue, cunning, and unkindness to animals; Orientals cannot walk on either a road or a pavement (their disordered minds fail to understand what the clever European grasps immediately, that roads and pavements are made for walking); Orientals are inveterate liars, they are “lethargic and suspicious,” and in everything oppose the clarity, directness, and nobility of the Anglo-Saxon race.²⁷

²³ Ibid., 5.

²⁴ Ibid., 217.

²⁵ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979), 20.

²⁶ Ibid., 38.

²⁷ Ibid., 38-39.

Any deviation from what was seen to be 'naturally' Oriental was deemed unnatural.²⁸ I have shown in Chapter Two that teaching and learning through the use of categories permits certain things that do not fit into the specified groups to be seen as aberrant and different. This is what has happened with the representations of the Hunza people. Travellers who expect to see stereotypes of what an Oriental person is 'supposed' to be, suggest that the Hunza people were 'different' (read: superior to) from the 'usual' Oriental, through the promotion of the 'happy healthy Hunza' discourse, observations on the colour of their skin and their relaxed ('non-fanatical') lifestyle. This has two effects. First, the Hunza people are compared with Europeans which helps familiarize them, as discussed in Chapter Two:

There may well be truth in the legend of the European descent of the Hunza Burusho, for in temperament and looks our Hunza friends have nothing of the "Oriental" about them. Take from them the very lightly bronzed complexion, "the shadow'd livery of the burnished sun," to which at this altitude they are "neighbour and near bred," and you could transplant them without incongruity to the moors of Yorkshire or the Scottish lowlands²⁹.

By saying they have 'nothing of the "Oriental" about them', Lorimer is acknowledging the fact that they are unlike what most people think of as the 'usual' Oriental. While she transplants them to Europe, because of the perceived

²⁸ Ibid., 39.

²⁹ Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 106.

fairness of their skin, as well as their 'non-Oriental' actions, she is placing them in the 'natural', another idealized romanticized setting.

Second, this image of the Hunza people as 'different' from the 'usual' Oriental allows for the re-iteration of stereotypes about 'other' Orientals, non-Hunza inhabitants, without feeling that these comments are inappropriate in any way. On the way back from a side trip to Yasin, Lorimer and her husband travel through Nagar. They are away from their 'beloved Hunzakuts', and so find themselves surrounded by 'ordinary' Orientals. Lorimer finds many things in disrepair, an observation that leads her to believe the people do not care about the maintenance of their environment:

... and we found the rest-house dirty and unswept, bathroom and utensils uncared for, and a general atmosphere of grudging incompetence pervading it.³⁰

... the Hunza roads, however steep and difficult, are better designed and better kept than Nagir ones.³¹

Not only are things not up to the Lorimer's own standards; things are not up to what they see as Hunza standards. The Nagaris are simply 'ordinary' Orientals.

Lorimer also comments on the differences in the land found in Hunza and Nagar. In Nagar, she finds the land can be more fertile with less irrigation, and trees are more plentiful. Lorimer wishes it were the Hunza people who lived in

³⁰ Ibid., 275.

³¹ Ibid., 72.

this easier and prettier landscape. It seems to her that Nagar people do not appreciate it, and therefore do not deserve it:

I confess I always covet these lovely villages for Hunza, the more so that the Nagirkuts are far more slack and slovenly in their cultivation than "our" people. All the irrigation water, coming straight from the melting glaciers of Rakaposhi, was now milky and unappetizing. The Nagir people, though not actively uncivil, never volunteer a greeting as you pass and never throw you a kind smile even when they speak.³²

According to Lorimer, the people of Nagar are also unlike the Hunza people in their mental constitution:

... a jolly, cheery, intelligent crowd they looked, not a moron or cretin among them, again in a marked contrast to Nagir, where both abound.³³

Even the rulers of the respective countries do not compare:

one day easily exhausted all our conversational resources – the Mir has nothing like the wide range of interest nor the intellectual curiosity that distinguishes his Hunza colleague – and since his ungracious underlings raised one difficulty after another about supplying our very modest needs... though offered as of course more than adequate payment, we decided to curtail our visit and the Mir greeted our decision with unconcealed relief, though he "only wished we could stay a year".³⁴

These ungenerous descriptions of the Nagar people and their ruler, allow the Hunza people to be seen more positively in comparison. These contrasts allow a further observation by Lorimer, one that has appeared before – relief that

³² Ibid., 273.

³³ Ibid., 73.

³⁴ Ibid., 276.

the Hunza people belong to the Maulai sect of Islam. Because of this, they are 'freer' and therefore, happier:

What the Nagir women and older girls look like I cannot say, for when they sight a man they crouch down with their backs turned and either pull a cloth over their faces or bury their heads in their arms. Give me the Maulai variety of Islam every time!³⁵

Representations that construct the Hunza people as carefree and happy appear continually throughout this book. Lorimer presents the people as simple, happy, self-sufficient folk, eager to burst with joy at any minute:

They are a fine, healthy, good-looking crowd, and always appear cheery and good-tempered.³⁶

But this I can vouch for, that every face you see looks restfully content, breaks readily into a happy smile; that there are in Hunza no nervous gestures and no haunted eyes, and in normal life no irritable words. There is little amiss with a faith which spells happiness and high-principled living without debasing fear of Hell or over-conscious hope of Heaven.³⁷

They are hard-working, and thrifty, tolerant to others; kind and affectionate in the home, gentle to children and the aged, generous beyond their means to the orphan; trustful and just; and they go about their daily work in the happy confidence that God is well pleased.³⁸

This image of the happy worker is reproduced throughout the subsequent decades, as I will show. As discussed in Chapter Two, Spurr says the idealization of the indigenous people constructs them as 'naturally' joyful. He

³⁵ Ibid., 277.

³⁶ Ibid., 82.

³⁷ Ibid., 149.

³⁸ Ibid., 148.

conceives the joy that is often projected onto the people by travellers (joy they seem to have simply from being alive) as a compensation for the great inequality felt by the traveller between the colonized and metropolitan worlds. This practice of idealization is often the result of feeling that the 'other' people are living out 'the West's most ancient ideals'³⁹, which is why, in many cases, the travellers want the people to remain in their 'unchanging' situation.

Lorimer's text shows how Oriental discourse was used to further the authority of the Westerner, but it also shows the discursive constraints of femininity within which Lorimer was working. The negotiation of these two sets of discourses creates a tension in the book that is not found in the previous texts. Mills states that these two groups of discourses do not override one another, but overlap. She argues that many Western women's accounts were not considered to be "'speaking for" the imperial project'⁴⁰. Although Lorimer's text does indeed focus on her 'interactions with people', and she does not concentrate on 'larger colonial issues or strategies'⁴¹, I think it still speaks for the imperial project, although perhaps not as strongly as previous travel texts I have examined. She takes full advantage of her privileged position to prepare notes on the distinctions between 'us' and 'them', continually constructing Orientalist representations.

³⁹ Spurr, *Rhetoric*, 134.

⁴⁰ Mills, *Discourses*, 106.

⁴¹ *Ibid.*

Feminine discourse, which constrains her from being authoritative on a 'scientific' basis, does give her the ability to speak about Hunza individuals on a personal basis, and her authority comes from her intimacy with several of the people. As a woman representing the colonial power, however, she is also their superior, a 'fact' that is taken for granted by readers.

Another authority struggle found in the book is that the author presents it as a light-hearted look at her journey. Indeed, the very first sentence of the book is: 'This is not a serious book'⁴². She also devalues her own work by naming the book after her husband's language research. In so doing, she presents it as secondary to his publications. She does not present the same outward authority that the other authors I have examined do. Many of them stated boldly that what they saw was all that was worth seeing. Their authority was much more openly expressed. Although Lorimer's authority is not claimed overtly, it is still evident in many of her Orientalist observations.

Her book both destabilizes and re-establishes colonial discourse. She is able to present the people as a common group, with a common image, yet she is also able to discuss many of the people on an individual basis.

⁴² Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 5.

Reader Response

Mills argues that constraints are placed on the *production* of texts written by women, and also on the *reception* of women's writing⁴³. She shows that there are disparities in the reviews of men's and women's texts, often stemming from the fact that women's work is not granted the same degree of authority as men's writing. Most women's writing fitting into what is typically thought of as 'feminine' writing is praised, while the writing that does not fit into the stereotype is criticized. Criticism or praise is based on what is or is not acceptable as *women's writing*⁴⁴, rather than on the actual content. The writing is often read as if it were 'confessional' (see chapter 2). This has two consequences: first, it devalues the book as it is seen as 'emotional' and 'subjective'; and second, it concentrates only on the particular individual writing the book, and is not seen as part of the larger colonial context⁴⁵.

The reviews that I was able to find for Lorimer's book varied in praise and criticism⁴⁶. One reviewer who enjoyed the content of the book wrote for the anthropological magazine, *Man*. While the reviewer comments that her photographs are 'attractive', as opposed to informative, the review argues that

⁴³ Mills, *Discourses*, 108.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 109.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

⁴⁶ Review of *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, by E.O. Lorimer, *The Geographical Journal* 94 (2, 1939): 172-173; M.B. Emeneau, Review of *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, by E.O. Lorimer, *Language* 16 (1940): 352-357; Review of *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, by E.O. Lorimer, *Man* 40 (June, 1940): 95.

she is too modest when she encourages her readers not to take the book too seriously. The reviewer finds that the ethnological content of the book 'is of no little anthropological interest'⁴⁷. His review has several things in common with those of the previous texts, in that the 'oddities' and 'quaintness' of the people that are presented in the book are further underlined by being re-presented in the review:

One learns, for instance, of the most ingenious method of dealing with infants, who are packed in dried cowdung which is changed from time to time, and found "vastly preferable to the eternal washing of nappies"⁴⁸

The reviewer also re-presents one of Lorimer's observations about the cleanliness of the people, which subsequently puts down the 'ordinary' (non-Hunza) Oriental: '...while the sanitary arrangements are far in advance of most of the Indian peninsula'⁴⁹. In effect, this reviewer is using the same Orientalist 'othering' language that is used in this and many other books, to construct the people of Hunza as 'others' and as subjects of an ethnographic study.

The second reviewer, M.B. Emeneau, writing for *Language*, a journal focusing on linguistic issues, looks not only at Emily Lorimer's text, but at two of her husband's books as well. The review is five and a half pages long, but it is David Lorimer's book on the Burushaski language that takes up a full four and

⁴⁷ *Man*, 95.

⁴⁸ *Ibid.*

⁴⁹ *Ibid.* The reviewer here speaks of the Indian 'peninsula': this is another way for him to devalue or belittle the 'other', as he is labelling the enormous entire sub-continent nothing more than a mere 'peninsula'.

half pages. His second book is given only half a page, but the reviewer must think this appropriate as it is a book on a small group of people within the Hunza area, of which not much is known, but whose language David Lorimer discovered 'almost by accident'⁵⁰. Emily Lorimer's book is given the same amount of space – half a page. The reviewer gives her some credit by stating the book is of 'great ethnological value', but judges this solely on the fact that she spent 'a full year in the life of the community'⁵¹. Emeneau has a problem with the title of the book, as it misled him/her to believe it had something to do with language studies, and so, judges it as having little value for the linguistic student, despite the fact that in the book there is frequent mention of the language collection process, and a full chapter devoted to the Burushaski language. The reviewer notes that the only way the book would have any value as a whole, were if this language chapter were read by a layman (an English colonial administrator is given as an example), and this layman was 'brought to an interest in linguistic work'⁵².

The final review of Lorimer's book, found in *The Geographical Journal*, is quite scathing. The reviewer has no reservations in stating from the start (after a paragraph speaking highly of her husband), that the book has no value on its own, and is simply a tantalizing *hors d'oeuvre* for people who are waiting impatiently for the publication of her husband's latest book. The reviewer scolds

⁵⁰ *Language*, 356.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*

⁵² *Ibid.*

her for not using her husband's wealth of information about language in *her* book, but then applauds her in the next breath for not doing this as it would not have been a proper (womanly) thing to do:

nowhere has she allowed herself to poach the rich preserves of her husband's notebooks: whenever the text leads her towards any of the many fascinating questions of the origin of the Hunza people or their language she faithfully turns aside at the last moment.⁵³

The reviewer notes that her narrative is not authoritative, as Lorimer's readers have only been presented with a 'personal level' account of the progress of her husband's work. Despite the fact that the reviewer states that her work is that of an 'experienced writer', there are three problems with the book, all stemming from the fact that she is stepping out of the bounds of feminine discourses. First, she presents an 'implied superiority of experience and background' (basically, she is too smart for her own good) when she offers a 'bouquet of erudite quotations from poetry in four (European) languages'⁵⁴. In the text, Lorimer presents this 'bouquet' as a description of the thought processes she underwent as they begin the journey through the snow-covered passes. Lack of sleep, combined with the difficulties of crossing the pass at night, are getting to her, and this is the only way she feels she can stay motivated to keep moving:

My mind restlessly toyed with relevant and irrelevant quotations from the poets (do other people, I always wonder, keep a first-aid outfit of this kind with them?) – "My eyes are closing and my lute is dumb, slower and slower go my songs to sleep – Geometria une et aeterna est in mente Dei refulgens – Because he finds his egg

⁵³ *The Geographical Journal*, 173.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*

contain, green, hungry, horrible and plain, an infant crocodile – De l'enfer il ne sort que l'éternelle soif de l'impossible mort – ...sie zu verscheuchen hab'ich dann gepfiffen die frechen Reime eines Spottgedichts. . . – forest-tribute, sombre slightly” – miles and miles of forgotten poetry reeled through my head...I laughed inwardly (having no wind to spare for outward laughter) to think of starting mountain climbing at fifty plus...⁵⁵

Second, the reviewer finds that she puts down European culture – an activity not to be praised – because she minimizes European tradition. Third, she is too outspoken. The reviewer states that she is ‘constant[ly] nagging’ – an act that is stereotypically seen to be accomplished only by women. In her idealization of the Hunza people, Lorimer states that Europeans could learn a thing or two from them. Prior to this book, authors had applauded not only British tradition but colonial practice. Lorimer should have done the same, according to the reviewer, to fit in not only with discourses of femininity, but colonial discourse as well. When the reviewer comments on this he switches from talking specifically about Lorimer, to speaking of authors in general, having her in mind all the time: ‘If an author is to attempt to assess the value of a foreign culture he should not dismiss the whole tradition of Europe with a sneer’⁵⁶. Not only does this seem to discount her comments by not including her words directly, but it has the effect of erasing her further by the use of the pronoun ‘he’.

⁵⁵ Lorimer, *Language Hunting*, 51-52.

⁵⁶ *The Geographical Journal*, 173.

In this chapter, I discussed how the distinctions between ethnography and travel writing have been diminished in Lorimer's text. Lorimer produced *Language Hunting in the Karakoram* within the discursive practices of two sets of discourses: femininity and colonialism. On the one hand, she has been constrained by the limited range of behaviour that was deemed 'feminine' in her time. She wrote about interactions with people she met, she focused on domestic issues, and spoke of the 'personal' aspects of the Lorimers' journey. However, she also writes within the discourse of colonialism. At home, she is the object of the male 'gaze', but in Hunza, she is able to practise that same 'gaze' over the inhabitants. She uses a great deal of 'othering' language that constructs the people of Hunza as inferior, and as ethnographic subjects who are there to be observed and judged. This text entrenches the 'Happy Hunza' representations (which present the people as 'primitive', happy, healthy, and childlike), which have continued to be reproduced in travel texts up to the present time.

By 1947, India and Pakistan had been liberated from British rule⁵⁷. Many changes occurred over the next few decades, and these changes are noted in the travel texts published during this time. As discussed in Chapter Three, from 1947 until late in the 1970s, Hunza was under strict control because of on-going disputes. There were few visitors to the region – those that were allowed to go

⁵⁷ John Staley, *Words for my Brother; Travels between the Hindu Kush and the Himalayas* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982)

had to go through the *tham* himself in order to gain entry. This political closure spurred several new developments in the representations of the Hunza people.

PART III

Chapter Seven. Happy Hunza / Developing Hunza

Introduction

This chapter examines the first stage of post-Independence (1947) travel writing about Hunza. It looks at various issues, from the promotion of 'happy, healthy Hunza', to the beginnings of American development interests in the area. In this chapter I examine Tobe's *Hunza: Adventures in a Land of Paradise*, Clark's *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, and briefly discuss two other texts that reproduce and develop the 'happy healthy' representation. *Hunza: Adventures in a Land of Paradise*, was written by an organic farmer from Southern Ontario who was so impressed by information he had heard of the longevity and health of inhabitants of a society in northern Pakistan that he decided to investigate for himself. *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas* was written by an American geologist who spent twenty months in Hunza trying to introduce Western ideas to the Hunza people. He was disappointed by the obstacles he encountered, which led him to believe that the people of Hunza, and the rest of Asia, needed to rethink their traditional ways of life in order to begin to develop into a civilized society.

Tobe

*I must emphasize here that every man that I
saw in Hunza appeared to be the picture of
health and contentment.*
- John Tobe¹

John Tobe became interested in Hunza when he read *The Healthy Hunzas*² by J. Rodale. Here he learned of the healthy habits of the people, the purity of their minds and their longevity. He was intrigued, and persuaded Rodale's son to write the *tham* of Hunza to get him an invitation to visit the place for himself.

The text is a 'sentimental' narrative, as defined by Pratt, where the narrator/traveller is the hero of the story. The genre gains its authority in using 'situated human subjects, notably (but not always) the European protagonist'³. Within this type of narrative, narrators present their experiences in a very subjective manner, using active verbs to describe their own perception, or action, as opposed to inactive verbs that describe things in the method that epitomizes the 'manners and customs' narrative, the timeless present⁴:

¹ John Tobe, *Hunza: Adventures in a land of paradise*, (Toronto: George J. McLeod, 1960), 637-638.

² J. I. Rodale, *The Healthy Hunzas* (Emmaus, PA: Rodale Press, 1949).

³ M. L. Pratt, 'Scratches on the Face of the Country; or, What Mr. Barrow Saw in the Land of the Bushmen' *Critical Inquiry* 12 (Autumn 1985): 131.

⁴ M. L. Pratt, "'Killed by Science": Travel Narrative and Ethnographic Writing,' in *Literature and Anthropology*, ed. Jonathon Hall and Ackbar Abbas (Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1986), 207.

I know I should be glad – I should be exultant – because I returned a better man, a wiser man. They have taught me much more than I ever knew before.⁵

However, this text is entwined with 'manners and customs' descriptions of landscape as well. Pratt notes that when narratives are combined like this, the landscape tends to be described by how it affects the author – either as a comfort or discomfort, or as the reason for an outpouring of emotion:

Now the mountains began to take on a more ominous aspect. They were no longer distant hills – something that perhaps you didn't have to encounter. The trail was becoming steep, rocky, precipitous and I began to feel somewhat uncomfortable. I began to fear that the rest of the journey would probably be as bad as this or worse.⁶

Similar to Neve and Etherton, Tobe interacts mainly with the ruler and his family while in Hunza. The initial meeting of the two groups is what Pratt calls a 'courtly encounter', where the protagonist presents himself to the 'local patriarch' and his court. This situation is fairly typical of 'sentimental' narrative. As Tobe approaches Karimabad, he is met first by the Mir's three sons, then later in their palace he meets the Mir himself, his wife, his uncle, as well as his other guests, a group of mountaineers:

As the jeep stopped I saw the Mir coming down the long staircase and there was no problem in recognizing him because he looked exactly like the photographs I'd seen of him. With outstretched arms and a beaming, pleasant smile he welcomed us to Hunza like long lost brothers. He couldn't have been more friendly or gracious.⁷

⁵ Tobe, *Hunza*, 455.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 165.

⁷ *Ibid.*, 218-219.

Pratt says that the courtly encounter places the Westerner at the centre of the action, as an actor on someone else's stage, and often includes the 'other's' voices in dialogue.

Tobe is in Hunza to prove to himself and his readers that Hunza's lifestyle is one of the healthiest in the world. He establishes his authority immediately at the beginning of the book, where he claims to present the information he has obtained in an 'objective' and 'truthful' manner. In as much as the initial European visitors to the area gained their authority through their connection with official organizations, Tobe gains his authority through his freedom from sponsorship or affiliation, which leads him to state: 'I have no one to fear and no one please. I can afford to tell the truth'⁸. In addition to his assumed 'objectivity', Tobe gains further authority through the presentation of his experience as an organic farmer. He claims that this gives him the scientific background and authority to assert that what he has written about Hunza's agriculture is accurate, as he understands the processes involved, and so can 'report factually and truthfully exactly what [he] did learn'⁹.

Like previous authors, Tobe also asserts his authority through the negation of previous travellers' work. He has read a great deal of literature about Hunza, and considers himself a bit of an expert. He thinks it his duty to 'debunk'

⁸ Ibid., 377.

⁹ Ibid., 20.

many of the things that have previously been said about the people. He includes an entire chapter (entitled 'Misconceptions') at the end of the book, where he clears up 'misunderstandings' that have been made by previous visitors:

Hunzans walk 60 to 100 miles as though it were nothing. In fact, one author stated somewhere that the Hunzans could walk 60 miles easier than she could walk upstairs.

I will readily grant that I believe the Hunzan people are the world's best walkers and well they would have to be, because there just happens to be no other mode of locomotion. I'll even go further and say that all through my travels in that territory I did not once see a Hunzan man, or for that matter a Nagirwal, who appeared to be worn from the rugged walks and climbs. So it is clear that they have tremendous reserves of energy and stamina. . .but let's not go overboard.¹⁰

Not only is he not 'proving' they do not walk long distances, he is basically reifying the image of them as great walkers with unbelievable stamina.

As discussed in Chapter Two, Holland and Huggan argue that mid- to late-twentieth century travel writers still seize the rights of mobility and representation that once belonged to the Empire, and through the use of patronizing language, and cultural nostalgia, they attempt to disguise a desire to resurrect their Imperial past¹¹. Holland and Huggan call this writer the 'gentleman' writer, which recalls Pratt's 'unhero'¹². Through various techniques of narration, the travel writer seems to set him/herself up as the 'butt of the joke', as the main 'comical'

¹⁰ Ibid., 618.

¹¹ Patrick Holland and Graham Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters: Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998), 4-5.

¹² Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992, 75.

protagonist. Holland and Huggan argue, however, that this 'gentleman writer' has as much authority as previous authors within the colonial context. Tobe does indeed present himself as a farcical character. He often presents scenarios where laughter is at his expense, or where he is the one making the social 'faux-pas'. For example:

I mentioned to the Mir and the guests that I was happy to see raw uncooked fruit served as a dessert. . . "Because," I went on, "enzymes are essential for health and when foods are cooked, baked, fried, pasteurized or otherwise treated, the enzymes are killed."

The Mir listened to me carefully and for every subsequent meal there was either an uncooked salad, or fruits, or nuts. And from then on "enzymes" became a byword and the butt of many jokes. But even though they laughed and made quite a jest of the business of enzymes, the fact remains that it was inscribed upon their memories and they'll never forget what enzymes are.¹³

By reporting a situation where he is the focal point of the joke, he is no longer presented as 'the' authority. However, he is still the centre of attention, and his authority and superiority is maintained, because, after all, the situation is a 'learning experience' for everyone.

Tobe is one of the travel writers who most exuberantly represents the people as happy and healthy, and so uses his authority as an 'objective' observer in order to 'prove' their health and happiness through the presentation and examination of their healthy diet:

They are genial, pleasant, smiling and cheerful. They have deep respect for authority, profound love of the land, affection,

¹³ Ibid., 229.

compassion and understanding for their neighbours and they are most hospitable to strangers. They hold their heads high, their chests out and they are strong, honest and hard-working. To me this showed clearly and positively that people can live and that agriculture can exist and thrive without chemistry, chemical fertilizers, chemical sprays or synthetic medicines and drugs.¹⁴

Through this re-presentation of the 'happy, healthy Hunza', Tobe is asserting the superiority of the Western metropolitan world. The reiteration of the discourse helps keep the Hunza people in their 'rightful' place. Through the use of words and phrases that describe the people in this way, the solidity of the stereotype is reinforced.

Tobe uses several techniques, discussed in Chapter Two, to maintain the representation of the inhabitants of Hunza as happy and healthy. He argues that the people of Hunza have few possessions, live a simple, healthy life, and are therefore 'naturally' happy. Idealization, Spurr argues, allows the Western traveller the privilege of not feeling guilty for the discrepancies between First and Third worlds¹⁵. The 'other's' perceived 'joy and happiness in simply being alive'¹⁶ is projected onto the 'other' as a way to feel compassion. The Hunza people, for Tobe, become a therapeutic image for him – he uses them to displace his own desire for a healthier and more 'simple' life – they are living a life he himself wishes to lead.

¹⁴ Ibid., 448–449.

¹⁵ Spurr, 132.

¹⁶ Tobe, *Hunza*, 625.

I learned – among, oh, so many other things – that a human being can live without luxuries, without doodads, knickknacks and modern conveniences. I learned that true happiness is found more frequently where ease, luxuries and comforts are unknown. I learned that material wealth was of little or no consequence, but peace of mind, health, happiness, self-sufficiency and longevity were far more important than convenience.¹⁷

First, Tobe represents the 'happy, healthy Hunza' image when he describes Hunza as 'Shangri-La'. This represents the area as a paradise. As I discussed in Chapter Two, this process constructs the place as a 'mystical' place to live, and locates it in the past. Second, Tobe attempts to familiarize the unfamiliar through the Orientalist habit of comparing the people of Hunza to European societies. Here again, the people are compared to Scots, not so much this time because of the fair skins, but because of their 'naturally' natural way of life:

I compared the Hunzans with the Scotch people and I think the comparison has many realistic qualities. Both peoples live in a more or less barren, hilly, rocky, rough country. Both peoples have learned the value of being frugal and thrifty. They waste naught and want naught. They are chiefly outdoorsmen. They are strongly nationalistic. Then, too, they are physically independent and have little or no fear of anyone.¹⁸

Third, Tobe practises the art of describing Hunza people in the 'timeless present', usually when he is observing an activity or trait he believes is common to all. As discussed earlier, this practice not only negates individuality amongst the people, it 'makes their behaviour appear to be an instance of pre-given custom'¹⁹. It

¹⁷ Ibid., 455.

¹⁸ Ibid., 427.

¹⁹ James Duncan, 'Sites of Representation: Place, time and the discourse of the Other,' in *Place/culture/representation*, ed. James Duncan and David Ley (London: Routledge, 1993), 47.

constructs the people as never-changing, and takes away their history – denies the changes that have been made over millennia, and presents them as a portrait – a snapshot of life that will be encased forever in a timeless frame. And fourth, Tobe re-presents the distinctions between the ways the inhabitants of Hunza celebrate Islam, and the ways the inhabitants of other Muslim societies do. By doing this, he repeats the representation of a 'non-fanatical', and therefore happier, society²⁰.

Tobe constructs Hunza and its inhabitants as 'Shangri-La'. By placing the people in a timeless paradise, he constructs them as primitive and 'natural'. This idealization allows him to project his own desires onto the people, and the place itself. As Duncan shows, representations of the 'other' often include this sort of narrative, where the 'other' is 'portrayed as occupying remote places that are rare or unique and therefore desirable, places where one can escape the social and psychological pressures of modernity and retreat into a "simpler", more "natural" place and time'²¹. This presentation of the people of Hunza is a common one, especially after the 1930s. It continues today, fairly unchanged – the area is still seen as a primitive paradise – so fragile, however, that if it is touched by 'civilization', it will lose its purity.

And fortunately or unfortunately, little Hunza lies right in the center [of the mountaineering and trekking areas]. These expeditions often consist of 100 men or more. They bring with them huge supplies of western food and commodities. Besides, their pockets are usually

²⁰ Tobe, *Hunza*, 335.

²¹ Duncan, 'Representation,' 46.

bulging with foreign currency. I fear that these will combine to eventually destroy Hunza. Sad as I am to think that this will happen, I am nevertheless happy that I was there to see it while it was still "Shangri-La."²²

²² Tobe, *Hunza*, 269.

Happy Hunza continued

Several other 'happy Hunza' texts were published around the same time as Tobe's. These books were published and printed with the intention of introducing the people of Hunza to the greatest number of Westerners possible. One was printed as a picture book which represented the notion of paradise²³. Art Linkletter, host of a popular television programme, *People are Funny*, sponsored Banik and Taylor's publication, *Hunza Land: The Fabulous Health and Youth Wonderland of the World*²⁴. Allen Banik was an optometrist who was interested in gerontology, and Renée Taylor was the managing editor for Whitehorn, the publishing company that eventually published several books about Hunza. Taylor's interests were in health, diet, and mental outlook. Banik used his authority as a doctor to underline the healthiness of the people – he examined their eyes in order to study their circulatory systems. This book sets out for its readers the same images of 'happy, healthy Hunza' that have been previously discussed:

In Hunza, I seemed to be in another world; a world of friendliness and good nature. Covetousness, envy and jealousy were nonexistent; no police force was needed to keep order; unlocked doors were not a temptation. But I was most strongly impressed by the evidences of good health I witnessed among the Hunzakuts of all ages.²⁵

²³ Renée Taylor and Mulford J. Nobbs, *Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La* (El Monte, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, Inc., 1962).

²⁴ Allen E. Banik and Renée Taylor, *Hunza Land: The Fabulous Health and Youth Wonderland of the World* (Long Beach, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1960).

²⁵ Banik and Taylor, *Hunza Land*, 173.

However, by promoting the health and happiness of the Hunza inhabitants, the authors were able to present many other common Orientalist images of the surrounding areas:

Nagirites are a complaining people, indolent and sickly. Their houses are poorly constructed; their fields, inefficiently tilled. Flies and other insects in swarms devour fruits and crops; cattle die; disease is rampant; ambition is wanting. The people bitterly criticize the Hunzukuts because they enjoy a better life, and it is believed that the Hunza good fortune is due to the fact that the sun shines longer on that territory.²⁶

The 'other' is kept in their rightful inferior position through the idealization of the Hunzakuts in representations of the 'happy, healthy Hunzas', which places the people in a 'paradise' that is kept in the timeless past, and offers up the resources that belong to the 'other' for use by the Westerner (see Chapter Two).

Their 'usefulness' (to the West) is represented by objectifying their bodies:

Hunza men are straight and tall, broad-shouldered, deep-chested, slim-wasted, and heavy-legged. They walk erect with a smooth, effortless glide that can be identified as far as it can be seen. For centuries, Hunzukuts have been known as the most efficient porters obtainable; they carry the heaviest loads, and they appear to be always good natured and uncomplaining. When resting, they seldom take off their heavy packs.²⁷

The second book, *Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La*, contains many pictures, with small captions underneath each to represent the people as happy and healthy. This book practises full use of the 'timeless present': this has the

²⁶ Ibid., 78.

²⁷ Ibid., 102-103.

effect of keeping the Hunza in the present, which erases their history and individuality. In addition, the authors frequently describe the people in passive statements, underlining the 'simplicity' of their lives, and the slow pace of their activities:

Since the Hunzakuts have no mechanized farm equipment, all grains are harvested by hand. Every village has a plot of land, levelled and hardened, that is used as a communal threshing floor. A stake is driven in the center of the area; then a groups of cows and donkeys are tied together and driven around this stake in a circle, their split-hooves separating the grain from the straw.²⁸

In the making of apricot oil, first, the seeds are removed from the pits and placed in a hollow rock where they are pounded into a pulp with a long thin stone, an operation similar to the use of a mortar and pestle.²⁹

The people are pictured portrait-style, with comments including: 'We were amazed at the Hunzakut's soft skin and lovely complexion'³⁰; 'We were particularly impressed with the wholesome, healthy beauty of the children of Hunza'³¹. The book is written much like Tobe's, in that the 'secrets' of Hunza are 'revealed' to readers. It even contains fourteen pages of recipes so the healthy food of the Hunzas can be made at home, in order for Westerners to learn to live like these healthy people. However, the authors note, the recipes have been

²⁸ Taylor and Nobbs, *Himalayan Shangri-La*, 20.

²⁹ *Ibid.*, 37.

³⁰ *Ibid.*, 38.

³¹ *Ibid.*, 42.

adapted to include 'nutritional products and natural ingredients obtainable in our own country'³².

³² Ibid., 23.

Clark, 'capitalist vanguard'

If we Americans could operate a program based on these principles, ...we could not only win the friendship of non-communist Asian people, we might drive Communism out of existence. This would be the democratic way of doing things and the neutral Asian governments could not logically object to it.
 - John Clark³³

John Clark asserts his scientific background – his authority – from the first page of the book. His biography mentions he has four degrees in geology, that he teaches at Princeton, and during his time in the U.S. Army he spent a great deal of time in China, Iran and India. His own opening sentences also refer to his scientific background. He states that because of his training, he finds it difficult to be subjective, easier to be objective:

When one has enjoyed the crystalline purity of measurements, there is something uncomfortably muddy about an adjective. Why, for instance, must I say "a tiny stone hut," when I could write "a building 15' by 10', and 5' high, made of unmortared gneissic boulders averaging 20" diameter"? It has been necessary to shift my basic attitudes completely, to see things through the eyes of my reader and describe scenes as they would appear to him rather than in the atmosphere of unadorned fact which is natural to me.³⁴

Through these statements Clark sets up his text within an objective framework, so, even though he has had to make some concessions to the reader, the reader understands that behind it all is the 'naked truth'.

³³ John Clark, *Hunza: Lost Kingdom in the Himalayas* (New York: Funk and Wagnalls, 1956; reprint, Karachi: Indus Publications, 1980), 7.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, viii.

Clark sets the framework for his 'experiment' in Hunza early in the book.

No matter what else he says, the following statements trail the reader throughout the book:

What happens when a pre-Bronze Age people, who have never learned to fashion metals or pottery, meet a Western scientist on their home ground? Is mutual understanding possible? How do an intelligent people, isolated for two thousand years, think? What is their response to meeting a man with an entirely different attitude toward life? Are they capable of recognizing the value of an alien philosophy and learning it, or can they only memorize techniques? And what happens to a Westerner who tries to step back in time and live day by day in the manner of his primitive neighbours?³⁵

He constructs the people of Hunza first and foremost as a primitive society, living in a pre-Bronze Age. Although they are 'intelligent', he presents them as a society capable of, but not yet having reached, any level of civilization. Unlike previous authors who wish the people to remain in the past, Clark did not understand (in advance) why they have not moved forward. Clark's journey to Hunza was an experiment. He wanted to see what would happen to a primitive society if given the right opportunities to further themselves:

My object was to attempt to show the members of one Asian community how they could use the resources they already possessed to better their own lives. More important, I would endeavor to teach the people of Hunza that within their own efforts lay their hope of the future, that they could (with a little guidance at first) lift themselves as high as they wished, and that they did not need Communism in order to do so. I knew, of course, that one man could not stop Communism in Asia, but I also knew that one properly managed project like mine could free several thousand

³⁵ Ibid., vii.

Asians from its menace, and could act as a sort of pilot model for larger efforts.³⁶

This political agenda of making sure Western ways of life are taught to the people of Hunza before they are 'brainwashed' by Communism is akin to the situation just before the 1891 campaign. Captain Durand and his administrators were also eager to obtain control of Hunza before the Russians and Chinese.

Clark's experiment was to include several components: he would start up a craft school (wood-working), open a medical dispensary, collect rare butterflies for Carnegie Museum in Pittsburgh, start raising wildflowers so they could sell the seed to the United States, and finally, continue a geological study he had previously started, that would find useful minerals³⁷. Why use this particular area as the setting for his experiment? For Clark, Hunza was different from other regions:

They were upstanding, intelligent, clean and pitifully anxious to work. They were also desperately crowded and impoverished, and the mountains they inhabited were bleak enough to make any change an improvement³⁸.

Clark presents a different view from much of the 'happy, healthy Hunza' discourse, in that he attempts to help the people 'progress', and feels they are in desperate need of improvement. Many of the previous authors wanted the people to stay in the same timeless paradise. Here, Clark realizes that there are

³⁶ Ibid., 3.

³⁷ Ibid., 13.

³⁸ Ibid., 9.

problems in the area (for example, overpopulation, difficult land) and believes he is giving them the right opportunities to reach a level of civilization he believes they are capable of. This construction of the people allows Clark's 'experiment' to be seen as something beneficial and necessary for the people. If left to fend for themselves, they might not survive. If they did, they might be swallowed up by Communism. In addition to this, the initial start-up costs of his experiment were minimal, so developing the area would not cost a great deal, especially once things were established. Why not help the people like this when 'Everyone would benefit, everyone would appreciate that American cooperation had helped him, and the total cost of winning the friendship of several hundred families was only fifty dollars'³⁹?

Clark arrives in Hunza with preconceived notions of how his project will proceed. He believes that the people are so simple that it is just a matter of giving help and advice. The people would be so appreciative of the advice, they would apply it to *his* expectations and then progress through the levels of civilization:

I had naïvely expected that it would be a simple contest between my technical training on the one hand and the poverty and backwardness of Hunza on the other. There might be spectators, but essentially it would be a romantic duel, like that of St. George and the dragon.⁴⁰

³⁹ Ibid., 30.

⁴⁰ Ibid., 70.

It is not until later on in his sojourn that he realizes the experiment is going to be much more than a 'romantic duel'.

Clark practises the Orientalist ideal of keeping the Oriental within the limits of what an 'Oriental' is 'supposed' to be. According to Said, the 'Oriental' was portrayed as indolent, dishonest, inefficient, lazy, and backward⁴¹. Clark uses this representation to explain why he is having so much trouble setting up and maintaining his experiment:

I was expecting these boys to make the whole stride from Stone Age culture to modern precision in a year or two. It would be no shame to them if they did not succeed.⁴²

We were an outfit, not a master and caste servants, and everyone did whatever job needed doing at the time. Some Asians cannot take such treatment and promptly steal and lie, under the misconception that you are an easy mark.⁴³

Bringing in glass by caravan, reglazing the windows, and weatherproofing the door would have cost the Mir of Hunza about twenty dollars, but Asia doesn't reason that way. Let your structure deteriorate, but pay a man to roll your valuables out of the way of encroaching dust and rain!⁴⁴

Clark perceived that their 'Asian-ness' (dishonesty, unpredictable reasoning, and inefficiency) was detrimental to the large-scale implementation of progress. He presents several examples of how his efforts were not appreciated.

⁴¹ Edward W. Said, *Orientalism* (New York: Vintage Books, 1979).

⁴² Clark, *Lost Kingdom*, 157.

⁴³ *Ibid.*, 36-37.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 39.

He did not feel that they did not want the help, but that they simply could not understand why he was trying to help:

They were loud in expressions of gratitude, but I felt at times that they were regarding me as just another foreign traveler to yield revenue as he passed by. Perhaps the trouble lay partly in the fact that no one had ever tried to help them, and they couldn't understand my motives.⁴⁵

He chalked up their resistance to being 'Asian' – they had been backward for so long, it would take a long time for them to come to realize what he was doing, and why. He believed that what he was doing would be beneficial not only to them, but also to larger groups of people. During his stay, he begins to vent his frustrations on, and blame, the Mir for the unwillingness of the people. To Clark, the Mir represents everything he dislikes in 'Asian' culture:

[The Mir's] flawless English and friendly manner continually misled me into the unconscious assumption that he had adopted Western attitudes with his Western dress. It is one of the most dangerous mistakes a foreigner can make in Asia.⁴⁶

He spoke beautiful English, he used all the Western shibboleths, "democracy," "freedom," and the rest, but could it be that at heart he clung to the same autocratic ideas and paternalism that had motivated his forebears?⁴⁷

Clark believes this man is the problem behind his progress with the people – he sees the Mir as a deterrent to the journey from primitive to civilized because of his 'autocratic' and 'paternalistic' ideas. Clark believes the Mir cannot

⁴⁵ Ibid., 100.

⁴⁶ Ibid., 106.

⁴⁷ Ibid., 217.

understand that progress is what these people need. In one situation the Mir lets Clark know that he is concerned for the future of the wood harvest, and wishes to rethink the development and maintenance of the woodcarving school. Clark tells him not to worry, and claims the Mir is just thinking 'like an Oriental' and should be thinking more of the 'common' goals of progress. For Clark, this man is an irritating child-like primitive who will not change⁴⁸:

There is no surer way to convince an unmathematical mind that a project is false than to prove it with mathematics. I wrote a report on the wood supply and on stains to the P.A. [Political Agent], and sent it to him through the Mir, but I knew that it would not be believed. No one in Hunza or Gilgit had the faintest idea how to figure cubic footages of lumber, or knew the simplest details of the woodcarving industry.⁴⁹

Not only is the Mir a deterrent to progress in the area, but so are many of the common people in Hunza and Gilgit. Clark asserts his scientific authority and tries to 'blind them with science'. He speaks, using mathematics to convey the information about the tree harvest, believing they will not be able to understand. Through this method, he negates their voices and concerns, while placing his own concerns above theirs. He believes he knows what is right for the area, and considers it his duty to instigate the changes he feels will help begin the development process. For him, the people are so steeped in stagnant 'Oriental' tradition that unless they are pushed, the changes he wants will never occur.

⁴⁸ This belief of Clark's is akin to the images of the Mirs held prior to 1891, where the Mir is perceived to be 'in the way' of the work that must be done.

⁴⁹ Clark, *Lost Kingdom*, 253.

For Clark, the Westernization of the people's ideas, not simply their clothing, is the most important process, and he believes the key is to teach the people to think like Westerners. If left to their own devices, they will fall even farther back:

Every American who has worked in Asia knows that if you take intelligent but unschooled young fellows who have not been too set in their own cultural mold and raise them in a Western cultural environment, you produce nice average young Westerners who are usually rejected by their own people. On the other hand, an Eastern boy with a purely Eastern education all too frequently becomes a reactionary religio-political leader who complicates rather than clarifies the situation.⁵⁰

Like previous authors, Clark makes the distinction between the Maulais and Shia sects of Islam. In fact, he continues the above quotation by observing that he is happy to be working with the people of Hunza, since they are less 'fanatical' in religious matters. By working in Hunza, he is assured that even those left to have an Eastern education will probably be less likely to become 'reactionary religio-political' leaders. He shows how 'non-fanatical' the inhabitants of Hunza are by presenting the following example. He wants to give some medicine to a woman suffering from ringworm. On her first visit she is accompanied by her husband, and Clark administers the medicine. However, on her next visit she comes alone and he is afraid that her husband will become upset when he finds out she was half-naked in front of him, without a chaperone.

⁵⁰ Ibid., 169.

The husband hears of this and tell him not to be silly, she is ill and needs attention, and he is too busy to accompany her every time:

If this had happened one hundred miles to the south, the woman and I would have both been killed. These people were much more sensible and truly moral than the rigidly fanatic Muslims. ...The Hunzas were more liberal because they were more decent and almost never unfaithful to their mates'⁵¹.

During his stay in Hunza, Clark's observations lead him to record six reasons that account for the East's 'lack of progress': First: *the job or problem is what is important – it is not the relationship of the person to that job or problem*. Clark feels he knows more about horses than his servants do, and wishes to groom and feed them himself, but his servants do not believe it is his position to do so, and so do it themselves. Clark thinks this is a typical example of how 'Asians' waste time and energy. Second: *the family system*. There is too much nepotism and filial respect in his opinion, and in a competitive world, one cannot always co-operate with one's family. Third: *delegation of authority*. The people have too much respect for authority, and so do not rely enough on their own judgement. Fourth: *pure selfishness*. The people do not see themselves as part of a larger group; for them, co-operation only exists within the family unit. Fifth: *learning by rote*. Clark thinks that because the teachers themselves do not understand much of what they teach, they rely on this method of teaching, which only stifles the people's ability to learn for themselves. Last: *a social system that makes dishonesty the best policy*. The people do not trust each other and so

⁵¹ Ibid., 102.

cannot do things for each other. People end up wasting time doing jobs that could be done more efficiently⁵². In effect, Clark is saying that people's traditions and customs are holding them back, and the natural 'Oriental'-ness of their character needs to be changed in order for social and economic change to occur: 'Once the bonds of their own forging were removed, nothing could hold back these people'⁵³. Clark seems to have been influenced by 'modernization theory', particularly that of W.W. Rostow who was quite prominent in the 1950s in advocating several 'stages of modernization'. Rostow speaks of a society needing a 'take-off' point from which to begin the process of modernization. First, the idea that economic progress is possible must be established, either spread through an elite group, or in a 'disadvantaged group whose lack of status does not prevent the exercise of some economic initiative'⁵⁴. Next, education must change to suit the needs of economic progress, and enterprising men [*sic*] are needed to come forward and take risks for the pursuit of profit. This is what Clark tries to establish in Hunza when he starts the craft school, and sets up organizations that will collect butterflies and grow wildflowers for Western export.

Clark claims that there are five principles of Western philosophy that need to be implemented to begin this 'modernization' process. First, he believes

⁵² Ibid., 187-188.

⁵³ Ibid., 189.

⁵⁴ W.W. Rostow, 'Economic Development: The Take-off into Self-Sustained Growth,' in *Political Development and Social Change*, ed. J.L. Finkle and R.W. Gable (New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1971), 143.

objectivity is the key – the people need to distance themselves from their feelings. Second, he believes they should be more *dissatisfied* with their lives. For example, he says they have lived in cold houses for two thousand years. He says they have never been dissatisfied enough to invent a chimney or door that fits the frame. Third, they should have more *confidence*. Only the belief that change *can* be accomplished will lead to that change actually occurring. Fourth, is the *value of the individual*, where a person is their own social unit, not their family. Only through one's own sense of value will one have pride enough to progress. And last, he recommends a *sense of responsibility*. If one is missing this sense of responsibility, one will not be able to apply the initiatives and changes needed⁵⁵. He thinks these principles have 'made possible the spiritual, intellectual, and physical development which the rest of the world desires'⁵⁶.

Clark argues that existing Western representations of Hunza people hindered their progress. He disagrees with the 'happy, healthy Hunza' image, and in fact tries to disprove it through his own observations:

As their diet is deficient in oils and vitamin D, all Hunzas have soft teeth, and fully half of them have the barrel chests and rheumatic knees of sub-clinical rickets. "Happy, healthy Hunza, where everyone has just enough!"⁵⁷

Inasmuch as he tries to debunk this representation of the Hunza people, he is, however, not at all free of propagating other representations, for example, the

⁵⁵ Clark, *Lost Kingdom*, 267-268.

⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 268-269.

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 205.

'non-fanatical' religion of the people, and the representation of the people and area as still living in the Stone Age.

Pratt describes a type of travel writer who she calls the 'capitalist vanguard', whose voice began to be heard by the early eighteenth century in Spanish America, spreading to all expanding areas. 'Far from mystifying European expansionist designs in their writings, the capitalist vanguard tended to thematize them – indeed, consecrate them'⁵⁸. This type of writer was less concerned with discovery than with conquest and achievement. Many of these travellers dealt with the challenges of logistics as well as 'scarcity, inefficiency, laziness, discomfort, poor horses, bad roads, bad weather, delays'⁵⁹. I believe Clark, although writing more than one hundred years after the beginnings of this type of writing, can be described as part of the 'capitalist vanguard'. Many of these travellers criticized the societies they were visiting. The obstacles the travellers came across were seen as a 'failure to rationalize, specialize, and maximize production'⁶⁰. Pratt states that the travellers must construct the people as backward, exactly for this reason – so the readers empathize with the travellers and the changes they are putting in place. This makes the reader see why the intervention is necessary. The capitalist vanguard replaces the visions of the people with the vision of the West. The site that is declared 'backward'

⁵⁸ Pratt, *Imperial Eyes*, 148.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid., 151.

must be 'transformed into a scene of industry and efficiency', and the people that are designated as 'incomplete', must:

be transformed from an indolent, undifferentiated, uncleanly mass lacking appetite, hierarchy, taste, and cash, into wage labor and a market for metropolitan consumer goods.⁶¹

After all, within the capitalist vision, 'Subsistence lifeways, non-monetary exchange systems, and self-sustaining regional economies are anathema to expansive capitalism'⁶².

⁶¹ Ibid., 155.

⁶² Ibid., 154-155.

Reader Response

I found six reviews for John Clark's book, but was not able to find any for Tobe's. Clark's book was very well received. Reviewers were all very pleased with the efforts Clark made to stop Communism from entering and taking over this area, and applaud any interventions by the West to make this happen. Many of the reviewers see him as an adventurer of sorts, as a 'lone American in the rocky welter of the high Karakoram'⁶³. Unlike the adventurer of the turn of the century who was looking for discovery and sport, this American adventurer is looking to find areas that need developing, and to arrest the advance of Communism. The reviewers reiterate many of the phrases used by Clark himself in the text. They encourage the readers to see Hunza and its people as an 'isolated pre-Bronze Age feudal state'⁶⁴, 'backward'⁶⁵, and 'primitive in its stage of development', but 'exploitive in its political controls'⁶⁶. In fact, they believe the people are so far behind in their ways that the book could be used as a 'study of primitive culture'⁶⁷. They enforce the image of the Mir as standing in the way of

⁶³ Margaret Parton, 'Recipe for Asia: Dissatisfaction,' review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark, *New York Herald Tribune Book Review* (March 27, 1960): 7.

⁶⁴ Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark, *Booklist* 52 (July 1, 1956): 455.

⁶⁵ Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark, *Current History* 31 (July, 1956): 44.

⁶⁶ Douglas, William O., 'Quiet Revolutionist,' review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark, *Saturday Review* 39 (June 2, 1956): 18.

⁶⁷ *Current History*, 44.

change, steeped in so much 'crippling tradition', that he cannot get beyond what he sees to be his feudal 'rights'⁶⁸. Many of the reviewers stand behind the implementation of Clark's five-part philosophy of the West. Bringing 'modernization' to societies had become the mission of people like Clark (like civilizing missions of colonial times), and they felt it was indeed the job of the West to accomplish this. This is 'America's [sic] great and abiding contribution to the underprivileged nations of the world'⁶⁹ and is the only way the area will ever get beyond its primitive state. Through the work of people like Clark, '[t]he revolutions are on their way. They will come from the inside'⁷⁰. For the reviewers, the book is an excellent example of the kind of 'modernizing' experiments that should be attempted around the world. By re-presenting many of the Orientalist tropes, in particular about the Mir who is standing in the way of progress, they reinforce the notion that these societies are indeed backward and primitive, and are in dire need of Western progressive help.

The reviews for Banik and Taylor's text⁷¹ also re-iterate the comments and observations made by the authors, here, the representation of the 'happy,

⁶⁸ Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark, *Kirkus* 24 (March 15, 1956): 237.

⁶⁹ *Saturday Review*, 18.

⁷⁰ *Ibid.*

⁷¹ Robert W. Henderson, Review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renée Taylor, *Library Journal* 85 (February 1, 1960): 656; Bennett Epstein, 'Hunza: Closest thing to Shangri-La,' review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renée Taylor, *New York Herald Tribune Book Review* (March 27, 1960): 4; Florence Boochever and Ruth Gambee, Review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renée Taylor, *The Bookmark* 19 (April, 1960): 175; Review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renée Taylor, *Springfield Daily Republican* (April 10, 1960): 40.

healthy Hunza'. The people are represented as simple and primitive. The people's 'curiousness' is what is really focused on in the reviews:

...the women of eighty look about forty, men of ninety can still become fathers, and people often live to be ninety and not uncommonly 120 and even more.⁷²

Hunza, a small principality over 2,000 years old, high in the Himalayas, is part of Pakistan. Hunzukuts are noted for their longevity, "extraordinary health and vigor," said to be due to "their diet and methods of growing food."⁷³

The repetition of these same representations only strengthens the stereotype, and helps nurture the 'reality' of this image. The reception of this, and similar, texts as an authoritative and 'real' representation of Hunza, helped subsequent authors see this representation as true.

The representations of Hunza in these texts are reiterated amply in the reviews. However, each book places its authoritative concerns differently: Clark's text promotes the annihilation of Communism and the expansion of capitalism; in Banik's, the oddities, health and longevity, are what are underlined, in order to fit into the 'happy, healthy Hunza' discourse.

This chapter has introduced some representations of Hunza after Independence. The first two sections examined how the representation of the 'happy, healthy Hunza' helped create a place and a people onto which the

⁷² Epstein, 'Hunza: Closest thing to Shangri-La', 4.

⁷³ Henderson, *Library Journal*, 656.

West's own desires could be projected. This representation is produced through various techniques discussed in Chapter Two, including the idealization of the people, the construction of them as primitive and naïve, and the presentation of them in a timeless past. Most of these techniques had been used previously in texts written before Independence, but this group of texts helped underline the 'reality' of the stereotype because of the increased number of publications at this time that re-presented the 'happy, healthy Hunzas'. The construction of Hunza as the veritable 'Shangri-La' helped idealize Hunza. For Duncan, and others, the reasons that allow for this construction have nothing to do with the actual people of Hunza, but with the Western visitors. These constructions are presented and reiterated in order to offer the place as a 'lost, primitive state of happiness'⁷⁴. The image, the result of Western ideals projected onto a place, is temporalized. Earlier texts constructed the people as less than human, which justified specific uses of them, for example as porters. Here, in the image of paradise, the Westerner is also using the 'other', either for the things believed to be rejected by them (material goods, resources), or for a place to get away from it all. The main purpose the representation serves is to make the Westerner 'happy'.

Clark also describes the Hunza people as belonging to the 'Stone Age', and being 'Oriental' (and everything that implies to his readers), but, because of their 'willingness' to work, he sees the 'potential' in them. He argues that the people of Hunza are capable of, but have not yet been taught *how* to reach a

⁷⁴ Duncan, 'Representation,' 44.

certain level of civilization similar to that found in the West. His purpose is to bring that level of civilization to the people. Influenced by certain 'modernization theory', he wishes to use the time in Hunza to give the people the chance to create their own 'take-off' point towards progress. Clark believes he is teaching them the principles of progress by teaching the people to think for themselves, and establish outlets for these economic changes. He attempts to change many of the inhabitants' 'Asian' ways of thinking, but believes the main obstacle is the 'backwardness' of the society, embraced by the Mir. Clark's narrative is the first examined so far which employs a discourse of development. The previous authors have represented the people as unchanging – whether in the initial representations of the people as barbaric and primitive, or in the later representations of the people as happy and primitive. This text actually discusses the fact that change is occurring within the society, but still tends to represent the people and the land in similar Orientalist and 'other' language.

Figure 15. Gilgit bazaar, showing used clothing vendor, and signs for tourism-oriented establishments. Taken 7 October, 1995.

Figure 16. Residential area, Kashgrote, Gilgit. Taken 20 July, 1997.

Chapter Eight. Ecotourism and New Age Travel

Introduction

In this chapter, I examine three books, each representing a different style of writing; 'confessional', nature writing, and the popular guidebook.

Much of both travel and travel writing today is specialized. As part of that specialization, many travellers seek to escape the repeated routes that 'regular' tourists and travellers take. They become:

countertravelers, resisting the history and cultural myths of Eurocentrism; women travelers, subverting the male traveler's traditional values and privileges; gay male travelers, either seeking liberatory spaces or flouting heterosexual travel codes; and ecological travelers, reacting against the environmental damage that they most frequently associate with tourists.¹

These new-style travellers see themselves as the alternative to 'conventional' travellers, as they attempt to create an identity in opposition to that of the usual tourist. Writing by – and for - countertravellers has been growing since the end of World War II. However, according to Holland and Huggan, as much as the travel authors attempt to create an alternative narrative, one which escapes the traditional representations, many of them still rely on and present 'an array of hoary tropes and clichés (originary, primitivist, exotic, etc)'.² In addition, the 'authentic' encounters they write about are just as commodified and common as the 'usual, traditional' narratives they are opposing.

¹ Patrick Holland and Graham Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters; Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998), 198.

² Ibid.

Jamie – Independent Woman

*The idea of staying in Gilgit for a while was
beginning to grow on me. The summer
stretched ahead; I had a little money, an iron
stomach and no good reason to go home.*
- Kathleen Jamie³

Kathleen Jamie, a poet and author, is Writer in Residence at Dundee University near Edinburgh. She had previously published several volumes of poetry before writing *The Golden Peak* (named after the hotel where she stayed in Gilgit), which was awarded a Scottish Arts Council Book Award. The book describes two journeys to northern Pakistan – it was during her second journey that she visited Hunza. She engages in the increasingly popular practice of writing about external and *internal* travel – examining her thoughts as she sorts out what she wants to do in life, what she believes she is capable of. Jamie takes her freedom of movement in Pakistan for granted. This privileged freedom of movement allows her to wander as she pleases, wax romantic on the sights she sees, and criticize what she feels is excessive development. Although her position as a woman is liberating, and in fact destabilizes the patriarchal roles that have traditionally been presented in travel writing, she does reiterate many of the typically male, Orientalist stereotypes that have been examined so far. Even while she is in a different position in Pakistan than many male travellers, her privilege is constantly supported and underlined both through the liberties she is able to take, and the language she uses to describe her travels.

³ Kathleen Jamie, *The Golden Peak: Travels in Northern Pakistan* (London: Virago Press, 1992; reprint, London: Virago Press, 1993).

An Oriental trope found in Jamie's text is the reference to Pakistan as a country located in the past. She journeys to Pakistan, and later specifically to Hunza, looking for stories of adventure and magic. She arrived with a preconceived image as to what she was going to see:

Within ten minutes [of reading a book about Hunza] I was lost in a lost world of fratricide and hostages, of falcons, tithes and magic frogs, of British and Russian push-and-shove and the story of a gun cast of all the kingdom's copper. I was in clover; this is what the Himalayas were all about.⁴

To her, this is the 'real' Hunza, the one in the past – the Hunza she sees with her own eyes is not as real to her. Many passages in the book refer to the women as 'Victorian', or the sights as 'medieval':

Her clothes were full and modest, her hair tidily drawn back in a plait beneath a black dupatta. For a moment I forgot I was in Pakistan and thought "Victorian".⁵

Two embroideries decorate the walls, because the littlest sister, affectionately known as Moon, is a student of needlework. Again, I thought "Victorian".⁶

Waves of dust blew up from the road into eyes, teeth. I ran blinded and manhandled back to shelter. Medieval figures scurried with sacks drawn round their features.⁷

⁴ Ibid., 72.

⁵ Ibid., 18.

⁶ Ibid., 20.

⁷ Ibid., 80.

In addition to locating the sights and people in the past, she constructs many of the women she meets as childlike, or alternatively, compares them to animals; in effect constructing the 'other' as subordinate to the privileged traveller:

"It is our mother," said Jamila. I thought she meant the garden, for I could see no one. Mrs Shah was so impossibly tiny. A little, tanned, merry lady with a figure like an eighteen-year-old. She emerged from the flowers like a pixie, wearing an outfit I immediately coveted; it was young and fresh in purples and pinks.⁸

At first, when all the unfamiliar names confused me, I thought of Jamila as 'the leopard woman', because of her outfit, her fast, leaner way of moving, and the dark mischief in her eyes.⁹

Jamie also compares Pakistan to Europe. She finds much of Pakistan quaint and 'historic', and so she is only able to describe these scenes to her readers through her knowledge of historical Scotland. As discussed in previous chapters, this practise helps to familiarize the unfamiliar:

I like the Golden Peak because of the dark fireplaces and this extraordinary wallpaper, the bow window and the incongruous camp beds. It makes me think of a Scottish drawing room, billeted in wartime.¹⁰

Northern Areas. It seems hardly the most imaginative of names for an area redolent with romantic-sounding kingdoms: Baltistan, Dardistan, Kashmir. At first I avoided using the term, because I imagined it to be as offensive to the people here as is the term 'North British' to the Scots: a denial of their cultural identity and difference.¹¹

⁸ Ibid., 20.

⁹ Ibid., 19.

¹⁰ Ibid., 8.

¹¹ Ibid., 14.

To Jamie's credit, she is a much more sensitive traveller than many of the previous travellers, in that she tries to be correct about the area's name – she does not like it when the wrong term is used to describe her own home area. However, her methods of describing the 'other' area only through descriptions of her own country place her within the same traditions of travel writing in Hunza that have come before.

Her sensitivity to certain issues includes a concern for the future of the people and sights. On her second visit to Gilgit, she arrives at the hotel and is shocked to see that some changes have been made. She speaks with the owner who tells her it is good for business, but she is very upset: "I thought I might cry"¹². She spends the night in the hotel, but is no longer charmed by its 'character', and sees it now as dirty and damp. The image of a 'charming' and 'quaint' hotel only fits when she believes it will remain the same for years to come.

She comments several times on the amount of tourism in Gilgit and Hunza, and states that too much will eventually destroy the people. A local inhabitant tells her that the people want this type of development; she remains convinced it would do them no good. In fact, she is surprised that they are concerned with obtaining more money in the first place – she does not understand what they would actually do with any of it once they earn it:

¹² Ibid., 55.

"Tourism is good. We need more development," said Ghulam.
 "This is small hotel, not too big."

I thought: "There'll be a funicular railway here one day soon, like Scarborough. You don't need a seer to tell you that.

"Haven't you enough? It's like Switzerland."

"USA, Saudi have! Why not Hunza people? Hotel-building is self-help. We need money."

"And if you make a lot of money, Ghulam, what would you do with it?"

"I would go to Karachi, maybe Europe, to get treatment for my arm."¹³

She wants the people to remain the same, as she believes that the growing tourism industry will make the people 'lose their culture'. James Clifford notes that the theme of the 'vanishing primitive' is common in ethnographic writing¹⁴. It is also quite common in travel writing. Clifford shows that this notion allows for the practice of 'salvage' ethnography, where although the 'other' is lost in time and space, being written about saves them. He does not challenge the importance of recording customs and languages, but questions 'the assumption that with rapid change something essential ('culture'), a coherent differential identity, vanishes'¹⁵. Clifford also challenges the authority that is gained through salvage ethnography – the assumption is that the 'other' culture cannot represent itself, and therefore must be represented by someone outside the culture.

¹³ Ibid., 85.

¹⁴ James Clifford, 'On Ethnographic Allegory,' in *Writing Culture; The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford and George E. Marcus (Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986), 112.

¹⁵ Ibid.

Jamie, although she is sensitive to certain issues, still reproduces many of the Orientalist and 'othering' tropes that I have discussed in earlier chapters. She represents the inhabitants as 'happy and healthy', stating that their happiness comes from their religious affiliations:

Ismaili. He pronounced it I-smiley. These I-smiley people, cheerful, I-smiling men and women. It was hard to reconcile them with their reputation as muggers and highway robbers, who controlled the pass and looted the caravans.¹⁶

From our path we could see the sunbaked playground, where a dozen girls were playing volleyball. Girls in school uniform, a simple sky-blue shalwar-kameez and white chador. The shawl was tied firmly about their middles for the game. It is a sight you never see in downside Pakistan – girls playing in full view, running, shouting, laughing. These I-smiley people, a one-time powerful offshoot of Shi'ism, the sect of the dread Assassins.¹⁷

Holland and Huggan urge their readers to realize that although much of contemporary travel writing is entertaining and seemingly innocent, it still contains many of the traditional methods of 'othering', and reinforces the privilege of the narrator. Jamie is aware of her position in relation to the people she visits, and is even aware of the privilege of her plurality – she fits in to many situations that would not be accessible to a Hunza or Gilgiti woman. Her privilege allows her to use Hunza as a 'therapeutic image', as discussed by Spurr¹⁸. By the end

¹⁶ Jamie, *Golden Peak*, 87.

¹⁷ Ibid., 88.

¹⁸ David Spurr, *The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing, and Imperial Administration* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1993), 132.

of the book, she feels she is confident enough to return to Scotland, knowing what she is mentally and physically capable of doing:

I didn't think I was a person capable of walking down a Himalayan track on a summer's morning, all alone. But I am, I was. A simple thing enough, to walk between two villages with a bamboo stick in one hand. But everything presents itself to our Western minds as choice.... I could have children, and maybe no worries. ... I was capable; and sometimes, a glimpse of what we could be opens in our minds like the fearsome blue crevasses I'd seen on glaciers. I could be a person who lives here.¹⁹

¹⁹ Jamie, *Golden Peak*, 177.

Schaller – Independent Activist

*Pen and camera are weapons against oblivion,
they can create an awareness for that which
may soon be lost forever, and if this book has a
main purpose, it is to induce others to care for
the dying mountain world of the Himalaya.*
- George Schaller²⁰

As much as the 'vanishing primitive' is a theme in some travel writing, concern for endangered species is also common. 'Nature travel' writing focuses more on the natural environment than on the adventures and experiences of the narrator. The narrator's presence/authority is inserted through their moralizing about the surroundings²¹. In many cases, nature writing oscillates between two modes: it can be read as a 'carefully researched, ethically saturated medium for the raising of global consciousness of environmental issues'; but also as a 'popularized, thoroughly commodified vehicle for the recycling of journalistic clichés about endangerment of the planet'²². George Schaller's *Stones of Silence* is an early example of this type of 'nature' writing.

Schaller is a field biologist who has journeyed several times to the Himalaya, Hindukush and Karakoram mountain ranges to collect information on the distribution patterns and status of several species of the animal subfamily *Caprinae*, including musk ox, Marco Polo and bighorn sheep. He travels in

²⁰ George B. Schaller, *Stones of Silence; Journeys in the Himalaya* (New York: The Viking Press, 1980).

²¹ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 184.

²² *Ibid.*, 185.

search of 'areas that would make good national parks or reserves'²³. Schaller uses the book to narrate his experiences of animal watching, but also as a place in which to moralize about the people he feels have diminished the animal numbers. He constructs them as primitive and ignorant in order to establish blame for the extensive loss of natural wildlife.

Schaller begins this construction by making note of the obstacles he had to overcome in order to get to the 'real' issues:

Each journey presented problems: some were political, for the Himalaya borders such sensitive areas as Tibet, Sinkiang, and Russia; others were logistic, for recalcitrant porters, reluctant baggage animals, and washed-out trails are an integral part of any mountain journey; and still others were climatic, whether fierce heat in the desert mountains or piercing winter winds on the Tibetan Plateau.²⁴

He finds it odd that in this day and age one still has to travel 'behind a string of porters or lead[ing] bulky yaks over a glacier trail'²⁵. It brings to mind for him a romantic era of exploration and adventure²⁶. He arrives with preconceived notions of the area, and mentions several times that his surroundings remind him of a bygone romantic era. For him, the landscape, which he sees as 'primitive', is located in the past:

²³ Schaller, *Stones of Silence*, 4.

²⁴ Ibid., 6.

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ Ibid.

Karakoram: a solid name, hard as rock and ice, a name with the primitive ring of howling storms and desolate valleys, a fitting name for the most rugged range on earth.²⁷

He had thought he would be able to observe wilderness in its 'pristine' state, but is upset that here, too, 'man [*sic*] had become a destructive parasite upon the land'²⁸.

Although Schaller is concerned about the contemporary state of affairs, he claims he does not have the same frustration with people of the past. He rails against contemporary people intruding into lands he wishes to set up as national parks, and against people who shoot animals only for trophies, but mentions that he somehow does not hold the same feelings for hunters of old, who belonged to a more 'romantic', heroic time. These former hunters, however, were privileged Europeans, while the contemporary hunters he is upset with are usually local:

Today, when many species cling to a vestige of their former range, to kill merely for some trophy is anachronistic. But the hunters of the past, who lived when ethics were different, who for months braved remote ranges and treacherous tribes, seem of a more heroic mold than the pleasure killers of today.²⁹

Holland and Huggan show that even though many 'nature travel' authors lament the dwindling numbers of animals and the destruction of their environments, the language the books use lapse into 'overwritten myticism'³⁰. This type of lyrical

²⁷ Ibid., 74.

²⁸ Ibid., 100.

²⁹ Ibid., 83.

³⁰ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 186.

preciousness undermines the seriousness of otherwise valid environmental concerns. While the authors underline the seriousness of the situation, the romantic visions of the landscape and people simply reproduce the same stereotypes that have been produced in travel writing all along.

Schaller's text includes the same representation of a 'primitive' people and landscape, which results in them as irresponsible in their own resource and environmental management. For example, in Central Hunza, the men are 'dour' and 'suspicious of strangers'³¹, while farther north in the outlying areas of Hunza (where he has the most concern for the animals, and wishes to set up a national park), the people are considered 'argumentative and devious even by local standards'³². He states clearly that they do not understand the ethical concepts of harmony between people and nature, as they are simply trying to survive on a harsh land:

The concept of ethics – the ideas one has about good and evil – rests upon a main premise that everyone must live in harmony within the natural community. But such an argument has no effect on those concerned solely with surviving, it being difficult to explain to villagers that they are consuming themselves and their descendants into oblivion.³³

Because of his concerns for the declining numbers of rare animals, Schaller focuses his attention on conservation, and his desire to teach the people living there the advantages of maintaining the resources:

³¹ Schaller, *Stones of Silence*, 86.

³² *Ibid.*, 88.

³³ *Ibid.*

"Outsiders come into your valley to kill ibex and sheep for nothing. Your own people kill females and young just for a little meat. The last animals will soon be gone. And you will have lost a valuable resource."

With Beg and Pervez translating, I suggested that the people of Misgar should protect the wildlife in their valley for a few years until populations had increased. Then, for a healthy fee, they could permit outsiders to shoot occasional trophies. In an area where the monthly wage is thirty United States dollars, the income from even one Marc Polo sheep would have a considerable impact on the village economy.³⁴

He feels that large reserves, which would 'maintain the genetic stock', are the answer to the conservation issues in the area³⁵. He does try to address the issues of the people whose land the reserves would be on, and hopes to find areas where 'conflicts with local human interests'³⁶ are minimal:

I felt that northeastern Hunza would make a perfect national park. On a map I drew a line from the Sinkiang border southward past Dhi and across the mouth of the Ghunjerab Valley, then eastward to by-pass the village of Shimshal, and again southward as far as the crest of the Shimshal drainage, and finally eastward to the Sinkiang border.³⁷

Nevertheless, the area he assigns to national park status does indeed interfere with grazing areas³⁸. This does pose some problems, but the 'details could be

³⁴ Ibid., 89.

³⁵ Ibid., 98.

³⁶ Ibid.

³⁷ Ibid.

³⁸ This issue has been addressed by the local people in the area in question. The Shimshal Nature Trust has been written in an attempt to inform non-local people of the issues at hand, and to bring in another point of view. The people's concerns are indeed voiced in the following quotation:

resolved later'³⁹. These details include requesting those who use the grazing land to reduce the numbers of livestock in their herds. As compensation for their loss, they should be given jobs as guides and guards within the park.

The problem with Schaller's text is certainly not the concern for the environment. Neither is it a problem that he is attempting to work with the local people to come to some agreement about environmental management. A main concern is, however, the authority Schaller, as an outsider, imposes on the people by telling them how to deal with their resources. This resembles John Clark's efforts to tell the people of Hunza that it was their customs that needed changing in order for them to amount to any sort of (Western) level of progress. Here, Schaller is letting the people know they have not used their resources in the best manner, and must now conserve those that are left, for two reasons: first, to maximize profits for the people (through hunting fees, park fees); and second, to maximize 'profits' for the environment – the regeneration of the genetic stock. The tone of this narrative is set from the start by the doom and

We also fear that external conservation efforts, like Khunjerab National Park (KNP) and Central Karakoram National Park (CKNP), both of which include parts of Shimshal, will impose rigid and contextually inappropriate restrictions, that will themselves be destructive of what we perceive as our special and historically-sanctioned relationship with nature. The Shimshal Nature Trust outlined below is the most recent of our efforts to improve our quality of life in a culturally and environmentally sensitive way, while retaining indigenous control of our environment.

David Butz (ed), *Shimshal Nature Trust: Fifteen Year Vision and Management Plan* [website online] (St. Catharines, ON: 1997); available from <http://www.brocku.ca/geography/people/dbutz/shimshal.html>; Internet; accessed 13 December, 1999.

³⁹ Schaller, *Stones of Silence*, 99.

gloom title: *Stones of Silence*, which implies that if conservation does not take place, the mountains will no longer resonate with the sounds of life.

Schaller's text is a good example of the way that travel/nature writing has allowed authors to moralize about the inhabitants of a country, and at the same time be concerned for the environment. Holland and Huggan point out that in nature writing there is a problem: as a critique of environmental ignorance, the text itself can become extremely popular and achieve commodity status. This presents a contradiction: the nature book objectifies the phenomena authors are studying (for example, the rare animals of Hunza and surrounding regions), and so these narratives become a collection of natural history 'curios', perhaps even exotic objects of consumption⁴⁰. Nature writing profits and even relies on the 'fear of natural cataclysm', and the boom of this type of writing depends on the threat of extinction of certain animals and environments. There is a 'need' to 'reinstate the myth of a "timeless world" in an era when time, for so many who live in it appears to be running out'⁴¹.

⁴⁰ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 187.

⁴¹ Ibid., 185.

Lonely Planet – Independent Traveller

*All Lonely Planet products are intended for adventurous, independent travelers. The guides cover the must-see spots but also encourage travelers to get off the beaten-track to really get to know the place and people they are visiting.*⁴²

Lonely Planet is a publication company which produces travel and guide books, catering to what they call the 'independent traveller':

Lonely Planet publishes the world's best guidebooks for independent travellers. Our books are known worldwide for reliable, insightful, pull-no-punches travel information, maps, photos, and background historical and cultural information. We've got every continent covered (yep, Antarctica included) with an ever-increasing list of travel guides, atlases, phrasebooks and travel literature.⁴³

Not only do they publish guidebooks, they have a variety of series that cater to several types of travellers:

We are one of the world's leading independent publishers specialising in travel guidebooks, language phrasebooks, travel atlases and trekking & walking guides. The range of Lonely Planet guides now includes Journeys travel narratives and the Pisces series of diving and snorkelling guides. We are also developing a range of new titles including food, restaurants, adventure and other special interest guides.⁴⁴

The series is also on television, where the hosts of the programmes take their viewers to a new country, city or region each time.

⁴² Lonely Planet Publications, 'Media Kit: media FAQ' [website on-line]; available from <http://press.lonelyplanet.com/faq.htm>; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999.

⁴³ Lonely Planet Publications, 'Lonely Planet FAQ' [website on-line]; available from <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/faq/faq.htm>; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999.

⁴⁴ Lonely Planet Publications, 'Guidelines for Writers' [website on-line]; available from <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/faq/guide.htm>; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999.

We send our intrepid travellers on a journey and chronicle their adventures and mishaps along the way. These travellers are not experts, guides or reporters: just engaging storytellers who become fellow travelling companions as the viewer is drawn into the travel experience. Like the guide-books themselves, the sights and activities are an entertaining mix of popular and traditional cultures, landmark attractions and insightful discoveries.⁴⁵

In many cases, however, the series' authors and television hosts have been known to be 'flippant' and 'irreverent'. Many travel brochures do not mention the atrocities which occur in some of the countries they promote. Lonely Planet is one company that does not portray the troubles of various countries as deterrents, but rather as incentives to travel⁴⁶. For example, Holland and Huggan quote Lonely Planet's Burma (Myanmar) guide, where the author has heard mention of 'a smorgasborg of dictators, anti-government rebels, guerrillas, insurgents, and assorted malcontents'. This group of 'hooligans' seems to make travel more exciting and more challenging to the type of traveller that is attracted to this series. On the website for Lonely Planet, the authors have described Pakistan in similar terms:

Impenetrable mountains, *intractable* people, and impossibly romantic cities are just some of the reasons why the North-Western Frontier Province is perhaps the most memorable of Pakistan's destinations. Most visits begin in Peshawar, the *rough and ready* provincial capital. The highlight here is the Old City - a *brawl of vendors* selling everything from tribal jewellery to leather pistol holsters. Clogging horse-drawn tongas choke the streets which are

⁴⁵ Lonely Planet Publications, 'Lonely Planet hits the small screen' [website on-line]; available from <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/prop/tv/vid-men.htm>; Internet; access 19 October, 1999.

⁴⁶ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 200.

thick with *fearsome-looking* Pashtuns - members of a vast tribal society - Afghans and Chitrali.⁴⁷

The authors this publication company hires are often professional writers or researchers, but often, they will hire people known to be 'experts' in certain areas or countries. Both cases are true for *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush*⁴⁸. The authors, Kimberley O'Neil and John Mock, have written several texts for Lonely Planet, and have been trekking in the region for many years. Both are involved in the 'ecotourism' development of the area, and are consultants for Worldwide Fund for Nature (WWF), National Geographic, and the World Conservation Union (IUCN-Pakistan). The book presents Hunza and its surrounding areas through its trekking possibilities. The book describes each trek, stage by stage, and informs the trekker of the sights to see, places to stay, and things to do. Other travel information is also given, for example, the names of visa and permit offices, and information on the availability of supplies and porters. In addition, the authors give statistics on the country and its peoples: the climate, the landscape, the languages and religions.

In fact, *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush* and others like it, are quite similar in presentation and content to the guide-books written under colonial

⁴⁷ Lonely Planet Publications, 'Destination Pakistan' [website on-line]; available from <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/dest/ind/pak.htm>; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999. [all my emphases]

⁴⁸ John Mock and Kimberley O'Neil, *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush* (Hawthorn, Vic., Australia: Lonely Planet Publications, 1996).

rule⁴⁹. These books were full of regulations and guidelines concerning the routes to be taken and the length of stages. They also helped organize the supply and hiring of porters and guides⁵⁰. As one examines the Lonely Planet books, similarities become evident in the layout and the types of information. This series begins with overall descriptions of the history, geography, climate, flora, fauna, people, religions, and languages of the various regions. The text tells the reader what to see, and which routes to take. This series also presents information to help the traveller plan their excursions: office phone numbers, customs, health and welfare, etc, and informs the reader how to deal with porter and guide 'situations': what to do if they either (a) do not cooperate or (b) are very helpful.

MacDonald is one of a few authors who write on the role of the guidebook in the construction of representations. He states that many European travellers' experiences were, and continue to be, shaped and structured by the discursive formations of travel and exploration narratives. Guidebooks aided in the perpetuation of the unbalanced relations of power between travellers and the porters and guides used on expeditions⁵¹. The books are commonly written in the 'prescriptive' mode, explaining how to obtain supplies and porters, what routes to take, and which sights are worth seeing (which implies that those that

⁴⁹ For example: Ernest F. Neve, *The Tourist's Guide to Kashmir, Ladakh, Skardo, etc.* 14th edition (Lahore: Civil and Military Gazette Press, 1927).

⁵⁰ For a more in-depth look at these guidebooks, see Kenneth Iain MacDonald, 'Push and Shove: Spatial History and the Construction of a Portering Economy in Northern Pakistan,' *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 40, no. 2 (1998): 287-317.

⁵¹ MacDonald, 'Push and Shove', 298.

aren't mentioned are not worth seeing). These descriptions have been repeated throughout the travel literature: 'It is this sharing of traveller's lore, the repetition of information, that translates into an almost ritual repetition of the travel experience'⁵². MacDonald stresses that these repetitions are 'intergenerational' – they continue through time without much change from traveller to traveller, creating a history of travel 'that links contemporary representations of people and place to those of the past'⁵³. For example, sixty years after the first 'happy, healthy Hunza' representations, the Lonely Planet website notes: '[*Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush* includes] background notes on the region's people and culture, including those of the semi-mythical Hunza Valley'⁵⁴. MacDonald states that the construction of the 'coolie' has been accomplished over the past 150 years through various representations in travel narratives⁵⁵. Because of the repetition in these narratives, men (within the portering industry) have been categorized by their ethnicity and have been represented as one homogenous group whose characteristics are made apparent only through their behaviour with travellers. So, for example, MacDonald quotes Shaw and Shaw's

⁵² Ibid., 299.

⁵³ Ibid.

⁵⁴ Lonely Planet Publications, 'Propaganda' [website on-line]; available from <http://www.lonelyplanet.com/prop>; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999.

⁵⁵ MacDonald is speaking mainly about the neighbouring area of Baltistan. European/local labour relations began there about a half century earlier than in Hunza.

*Pakistan Trekking Guide*⁵⁶, another Lonely Planet publication, as saying: 'Nagar porters are expensive and difficult'. In Mock and O'Neil's *Trekking*, I have found comments such as:

Trekking parties used to begin from Nagyr, but because of difficulties with Nagyr porters, they now begin from Baltistan. However, Nagyr porters are now eager for work and welcome trekkers to do this route from west to east. ...We have been told Nagyr porters promise to behave!⁵⁷

Shimshalis are amazing porters who carry heavy loads all day long over trails that would leave most trekkers dragging.⁵⁸

Wakhi men are renowned for their endurance and often work as guides and high-altitude porters.⁵⁹

Because these 'traits' are re-presented continually through various narrative media, the traits become essentialized. They become representations of what various groups of people are 'essentially' and 'naturally' like: 'They become recognized not as a truth derived from the generation of knowledge within a particular system of power but as *the* truth, becoming for at least some, the facts which one expects to encounter'⁶⁰. One finds comments such as the following:

Avoid hiring anyone along the trail. Instead hire in the presence of others so at least one person witnesses who goes off with you.

⁵⁶ I. Shaw and B. Shaw, *Pakistan Trekking Guide* (Hong Kong: Lonely Planet Publications, 1993); quoted in MacDonald, 'Push and Shove', 301.

⁵⁷ Mock and O'Neil, *Trekking*, 298.

⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, 252.

⁵⁹ *Ibid.*, 29.

⁶⁰ MacDonald, 'Push and Shove,' 303.

This increases the likelihood of hiring a reliable person and deters thieves and troublemakers.⁶¹

When hiring a freelance licensed guide, try to find one who is associated with (and somewhat accountable to) an established trekking company. The guide is then less likely to create problems and may have more incentive to do a good job.⁶²

In these quotations, the authors approach the hiring process with the preconception that the porters are 'naturally' ready to be negligent on the job. They argue that these 'situations' can only be avoided with discipline and care. This representation recollects Linné's classification system, which categorized Orientals as 'severe, haughty, covetous...Governed by opinions'⁶³.

It is odd to note the juxtaposition of these neo-colonial observations with the way this series has been promoted. The company continues to uphold the distinction between the 'regular tourist' and the [purer] 'traveller'. Even a review of the series, here by the Los Angeles Times, contributes to the reiteration of this distinction: 'As opposed to many travel guidebooks, the Lonely Planet series has been written by travellers who *really* travel'⁶⁴. Holland and Huggan note this distinction appeals to 'untainted motivations and higher ideals'⁶⁵.

⁶¹ Mock and O'Neil, *Trekking*, 81.

⁶² Ibid., 79-80.

⁶³ Mary Louise Pratt, *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation* (New York: Routledge, 1992), 32.

⁶⁴ Lonely Planet Publications, 'Media Kit: series descriptions' [website on-line]; available from <http://press.lonelyplanet.com/series/series.htm>; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999. [my emphasis]

⁶⁵ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 208.

These higher ideals are seen in the company's promotion of 'ecotourism'. For Holland and Huggan, the recent preoccupation with ecotourism comes from the New Age fascination with apocalyptic phenomena which is presented here in 'commodified expressions of environmental angst'⁶⁶. They see it as a method of making leisure consumption available to all, by encouraging local participation in environmental projects and by encouraging environmental awareness through global issues.⁶⁷ Mock and O'Neil, the authors of *Trekking*, see ecotourism as 'being environmentally, economically and culturally responsible while traveling'⁶⁸. Holland and Huggan note that it is as much a 'variant on as an alternative' to tourism, and as such still 'remains governed by tourism's neo-colonial relations of power'⁶⁹ and can be used to justify the 'modernization' of certain areas. Mock and O'Neil advocate ecotourism in northern Pakistan. *Survey of Ecotourism Potential in Pakistan's Biodiversity Project Area (Chitral and Northern Areas)*⁷⁰ presents a set of guidelines regarding ecotourism for the area. Mock and O'Neil construct the area around what the traveller expects to see when they arrive in

⁶⁶ Ibid., 178.

⁶⁷ Ibid., 179.

⁶⁸ Mock and O'Neil, *Trekking*, 90.

⁶⁹ Holland and Huggan., *Tourists with Typewriters*, 179.

⁷⁰ Mock and O'Neil, *Survey of Ecotourism Potential in Pakistan's Biodiversity Project Area (Chitral and Northern Areas)* (Islamabad, Pakistan: A consultancy report for The World Conservation Union (IUCN), January 1996) [report on-line]; available from <http://www.monitor.net/~jmko/karakoram/biodiv.htm>; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999.

northern Pakistan. For example, their Code outlines certain things that must be 'fixed' before they believe travellers will want to visit certain areas:

As long as tourists think that disputes can be expected in a certain area, they will not go there, no matter how beautiful the area. A case in point is Nagyr, one of the most beautiful areas of the Hunza River valley. Nagyr men developed a reputation as argumentative and dishonest, and tourists began to avoid it. However, when Nagyr people saw the wealth generated from tourism flowing to neighboring Hunza, they recognized their role in the problem, and are working to change their reputation.

The Nanga Parbat area also suffers from an image problem. Porters in both the Fairy Meadows and Rupal Valley areas have developed a bad reputation. Members of the community who are aware of the problem are working with villagers and also educating tourists. Rock-throwing is never a constructive way to address any problem.⁷¹

Mock and O'Neil also include guidelines as to what activities are appropriate within ecotourism. They suggest the best ways to construct a tourism industry that 'helps' the local people while appealing to the traveller. They feel these guidelines will create the ideal environment for tourism. For example, they suggest that surplus local foods could be sold to tourists, but then caution that the handlers should learn to handle food more 'hygienically':

Other local foods, especially those that are a seasonal surplus during peak summer tourism, could be produced for sale. Host communities would require assistance to develop hygienic food handling techniques and packaging.⁷²

⁷¹ Mock and O'Neil, 'Constraints on Ecotourism', in *Ecotourism Potential*, [report on-line]; available from http://www.monitor.net/~jmko/karakoram/biodiv.htm#Constraints_on_Ecotourism; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999.

⁷² Mock and O'Neil, 'Ecotourism Activities' in *Ecotourism Potential* [report on-line]; available from http://www.monitor.net/~jmko/karakoram/biodiv.htm#Ecotourism_Activities; Internet; accessed 19 October, 1999.

They maintain their authority by stating that more activities should take place to promote cultural awareness; however, in order to fit the 'needs' of the tourists, the local people should engage in training that will enable them to better their displays and interpretation:

Another activity for the host communities is the establishment of cultural museums and the scheduling of cultural festivals. Silk Route festivals, under the auspices of AKCS and Lok Virsa, are already being held in Hunza and Gojal. In Gojal, Wakhi cultural museums, have been established in Gulmit, Passu, and Shimshal. These activities encourage local cultural pride and promote cultural awareness among tourists. Tour operators can use them as destinations to include in tour itineraries, enhancing Chitral and the Northern Areas as interesting destinations. Local residents should receive training in interpretation and display, to improve the quality of museums and festivals.⁷³

Many of the ideals these authors are presenting are indeed important – including care for the environment. However, the manner in which these ideals are discussed is authoritative, and therefore in need of further examination and critical reflection. This text and *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush* brings to mind Mary Louise Pratt's term – anti-conquest. It describes the way natural history was created as a classification system, giving authority to the educated male imperial voice, in such a way that authority and control was disavowed. Holland and Huggan emphasize that the comparison between imperialism and modern day nature writing (including ecotourist guidebooks) might be going a bit far. However, it is important to note how this type of writing tends to construct nature as an object: 'environmentally conscious travel narratives run the risk of

⁷³ Ibid.

aestheticizing nature as an object of wonderment and control'⁷⁴. It is important to note that nature is not the pristine object that this type of narrative leads one to believe – it is a constructed concept which is becoming the pawn of 'consumer-oriented culture that seeks belatedly to rescue, advertize, and sell the very resources that its own expansionist imperatives have helped to place at risk'⁷⁵. It is not the relationships that travellers have with adventure, ecotourism, and exploration that are necessarily wrong. The problem comes from promoting these actions through practices of control, authority and exploitation:

While there is nothing intrinsically harmful in the transactions between traveler, writer, and reader that satisfy individual fantasies of discovery, exploration, and exotic experience, the relationship of such fantasies to collective geopolitical practices of control, exploitation, and subjugation is problematic at best.⁷⁶

⁷⁴ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 195.

⁷⁵ Ibid.

⁷⁶ Ibid., 204.

Figure 17. Shimshal River Valley, on the way from Passu to Shimshal. Taken 15 August, 1995.

Reader Response

I was only able to find one review of Jamie's text⁷⁷, and unfortunately, none of Mock and O'Neil's book. But, I was able to locate five book reviews of George Schaller's *Stones of Silence*⁷⁸. The short review of Jamie's narrative extols her talents as a writer and poet, and describes in a few paragraphs the sights and sounds of her visit. The reviewer uses sweeping remarks to describe some of her more 'quaint' and 'strange' encounters. The reviewer does not always use the same language that Jamie did in the book, but the implications are indeed similar. The reviewer explains that Jamie travelled by 'bus, jeep, raft and on foot through a harsh but magnificent land'. This quotation sets up Jamie as a lone adventurer – a hero – braving harsh elements in lands that are 'primitive'. The 'primitive' land is constructed by presenting methods of travel that are quite 'different' than those in most Western areas: by raft, and on foot. The review maintains the Orientalist trope of locating the society in the past, as it describes how Jamie is travelling in an area that is caught between 'ancient traditions and the intrusions of the modern world'. They are caught, because they do not understand the 'new' ways of life. They only understand their

⁷⁷ Book review of *The Golden Peak* by Kathleen Jamie, *The Globe and Mail* (May 2, 1992): F5.

⁷⁸ Laurie Bartolini, Book review of *Stones of Silence: journeys in the Himalaya* by George Schaller, *Library Journal* 105 (March 1, 1980): 624; Jeremy Bernstein, 'In Search of a Vanishing World,' Book review of *Stones of Silence*, by George Schaller, *New York Times Book Review* 85 (March 23, 1980): 9; Jean Strouse, 'Of Sheep and Goats,' Book review of *Stones of Silence* by George Schaller, *Newsweek* 95 (March 31, 1980): 77-80; Book review of *Stones of Silence*, by George Schaller, *The New Yorker* 56 (May 19, 1980): 162; Frank Graham Jr., 'Mute Mountains,' Book review of *Stones of Silence*, by George Schaller, *Audubon* 82 (September, 1980): 28.

traditional ways, and therefore are having a difficult time arriving in the 'present'. The one passage that the reviewer quotes at length is a description of one of the 'fantastically adorned trucks that ply the commercial routes of the region'. This simply reifies the 'strangeness' of the 'other' land through the presentation of what might be seen by the readers as one of the more 'bizarre' sights.

Some of the reviewers of Schaller's text comment on the immense amount of detail of the book, but most focus on presenting the text as a combination of three things. First, it is seen as an adventure/nature tale, where the lone naturalist is hunting down (so to speak) the elusive snow leopard and other animals, in order to gather further information about them. This information is what is attractive to many of the readers: 'He's after information, not spiritual truth, and his no-frills style takes you right to the heart and purpose of his work'⁷⁹, which is to 'unravel some of the taxonomic mysteries of the subfamily Caprinae'⁸⁰. Because of the focus on animals, the reviewers 'forgive' him for his representations of the people in the area: 'As a naturalist, Mr. Schaller was concerned with the lives of these wonderful animals and, judging from his book, less so with the lives, fortunes and history of the mountain people who share their habitats'⁸¹.

⁷⁹ *Newsweek*, 77.

⁸⁰ Graham Jr., 'Mute Mountains,' 28.

⁸¹ Bernstein, 'In Search of a Vanishing World,' 9.

Second, the reviews represent the difficulties Schaller states he was presented with. Most of the reviewers speak of the environmental difficulties: 'logistics and environmental conditions prevent[ed] sustained observation', 'remote and hazardous sites in the mountain wilderness' and 'the harsh, high world of ice and stone'⁸². However, a couple of the reviewers repeat Schaller's representations of the people. One reviewer is pleased by the 'splendid sketches' that Schaller has painted of both the animals and the people (the words here imply the 'portrait' style representations discussed in Chapter Two), and with how well he 'fixes these exotic beings in our minds'⁸³. The following quotation certainly shows the readers how the 'hapless'⁸⁴ people are part of the problem when it comes to conservation: '[one of the 'splendid sketches' is of] an outraged guide reading aloud to a circle of sobbing villagers the letter in which his wife tells him that she is running off with another man'⁸⁵. By re-presenting this one image, the reviewer has reiterated Schaller's feelings about the people as incapable of preserving their own environment: they are, by nature, emotionally unstable and pathetic. The 'outraged guide' is a repetition of the image of the problematic guides and porters that travellers expect they will have

⁸² Graham Jr., 'Mute Mountains,' 28; *The New Yorker*, 162; Strouse, 'Of Sheep and Goats,' 77.

⁸³ Graham Jr., 'Mute Mountains,' 28.

⁸⁴ *The New Yorker*, 162.

⁸⁵ Graham Jr., 'Mute Mountains,' 28.

to deal with, and the 'sobbing villagers' represent the people as childlike and naïve.

Third, he is seen as a man who is 'urgently plea[ding]'⁸⁶ for the conservation of the natural environment. Several of the reviewers finish their text with a compelling quotation from Schaller's book which reiterates the idea of the 'vanishing primitive'. One reviewer quotes Schaller's words 'pen and camera are weapons against oblivion' and then asks the question: 'will the future know them only from words and pictures?'⁸⁷ This sets up Schaller in the same fashion that Holland and Huggan have discussed. At the time of colonial exploration, adventurers and explorers searched out new lands in order to be the *first* to 'discover' a place. However, now, the trend is to be the *last* person:

The traveler-writer attests to having been there last, and to having turned out the lights on leaving. All the lights but one: the bedside lamp that allows the reader to accompany the author into the always-receding territory of the exotic.⁸⁸

Schaller becomes fixed for his readers as that last person, the one who was able to capture the exotic nature of both animals and people and, fortunately, present it to his readers.

⁸⁶ Strouse, 'Of Sheep and Goats,' 80.

⁸⁷ Graham Jr., 'Mute Mountains,' 28.

⁸⁸ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 204.

This chapter has introduced some contemporary representations of Hunza. Although recent travel writing is often seen as 'innocent' and simply entertaining, methods of 'othering' continue to be used. Travellers today are often more aware of their privilege and freedom, but it is this same privilege that allows them to use the 'other' for their own purposes, as previous authors have done.

The representations in Jamie's narrative help locate Hunza and surrounding areas in an 'adventurous' place that allows her to learn what she is capable of. Using common Orientalist tropes, she constructs the 'others' as inferior, childlike, primitive, and timeless. Because of these 'traits', she believes the people will not be able to cope with what she feels is excessive development of the area. Through these techniques, she emerges victorious and feels she can meet and overcome any obstacle. Schaller's representations help construct the people of Hunza as unable, or unwilling, to care for their environment. To him, they seem incapable of understanding the gravity of the environmental situation. The representations in *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush* construct the people in similar ways to previous (neo-)colonial authors. These representations help construct Hunza how *travellers* want, and expect, it to be.

The use of Orientalist and neo-colonialist language has the effect of 'placing' the 'other' – a practice that has been in progress since early European contact in the mid-nineteenth century.

Chapter Nine. Hunza On-line

Introduction

Here I examine travel texts about Hunza that exist on-line on the World Wide Web. The Internet includes numerous sites about Hunza. Many promote the tourist industry, some are simply picture galleries of the region, and some are travelogues of journeys. The Hunza websites have been put together within the past couple of years, and therefore, are one of the next steps in the chronology that I have followed throughout the thesis. Internet sites are interesting places to discuss in the context of this project, as the distinction between 'authoritative' sites and 'personal' sites becomes less certain. With Internet and computer capabilities, the meaning of *writing* is not limited to the written word, and so this mixed media format does allow for postmodern expression through the combination of various sounds, music, and speech, and visual impact through both stationary and moving pictures. Also, the fact that the Internet is unmonitored (compared to the editing and publishing processes surrounding the printing of a book), allows anyone with access to an Internet provider, to publish and write about anything they choose to, without, or perhaps only with fewer, discursive constraints from publishing companies. In addition, the ability to follow hyperlinks throughout the narrative allows the reader to create his or her own reading 'route': the ability exists to read the text in a completely different *format* than that within which it was written. However, having said this, the Internet may still be limited in its ability to completely reject or deconstruct the linearity of travel

writing and place representation. Although I believe the Internet has the theoretical potential for being a truly 'post-modern' medium, few people have taken advantage of this, and the discourses I discuss in previous chapters remain prevalent in the narratives of this medium.

I have divided the sites into groups, in order to discuss similar characteristics within the sites as follows: travel brochures, health and happiness in Hunza, and travelogues.

Travel brochures

...Followed by a spectacular drive to Karimabad, Hunza, long renowned as the original Shangri-la. The people here are famous for their longevity and simple, uncomplicated life.¹

Many of the sites about Hunza are travel 'brochures', written with the purpose of giving potential travellers an idea about the place in order to entice them to visit. Several have been written in Pakistan itself², but most are sites prepared by tourist agencies in other countries, advertising biking or trekking tours³. One of the most common ways, in these sites, to introduce Hunza to travellers is to present it as the Shangri-La written about by James Hilton in *Lost Horizons*. The sites commonly state that this area is the 'original' Shangri-La: 'Hunza is undoubtedly [sic] the Shangri-la of James Hilton's novel *The Lost Horizon*'⁴; 'Hunza, [is] the "Shangri La" of northern Pakistan'⁵.

¹ Bestway Tours and Safaris, *Shangri-La Hunza* [website on-line] (Vancouver, BC: 1999); available from <http://bestway.com/itineraries/t01.html>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

² Hunza Travel Service, *Hunza Valley* [website on-line] (Lahore, Pakistan: 1999); available from www.hunzatravel.com; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999 (at homepage, click on "Packages" and then on "Hunza"); Travel and Culture Services Pakistan, *Valley of Hunza, The Shangri-La* [website on-line] (Karachi, Pakistan: 1998); available from <http://tours.hypermart.net/Pakistan/hunza.htm>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Alpine Trekker and Tours, *Hunza Biking* [website on-line] (Islamabad, Pakistan); available from www.alpine.com.pk/hunza.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

³ <http://bestway.com/itineraries/t01.html>; British Karakoram Expedition, *Hunza Valley information* [website on-line] (London: 1997); available from <http://bke97.demon.co.uk/area/hunza.htm>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Concordia Expeditions, Inc., *Hindukush Karakoram Walk* [website on-line] (Buena Vista, CO: 1999); available from www.concordiaexpeditions.com/hindukush.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Concordia Expeditions, Inc., *Hunza Adventure* [website on-line] (Buena Vista, CO: 1999); available from www.concordiaexpeditions.com/hunzatrip.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Concordia Expeditions, Inc., *Bike Hunza* [website on-line] (Buena Vista, CO: 1999); available from www.concordiaexpeditions.com/bikehunza.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

Two of the sites rehearse the repeated discourses of Hunza that originated in colonial times. They have taken the representations constructed by travellers over one hundred years of exploration and adventure and re-presented them on-line. The first of these presents a common image of the area as being 'timeless' and 'unchanging': 'A prehistoric land of peace where people never aged'⁶. The second site re-presents the people in the manner of the writers who wrote about the 'Happy, Healthy Hunzas' – images of the people as forever healthy, smiling, and eager to please. This site notes that people in northern Hunza have fair skin and light eyes, and 'are very hospitable with bright pink cheeks topping a ready smile'⁷. Beyond this, much of the information in these sites informs the traveller on the various treks they may take, with explanations of the sights they will see. This is done in a similar manner to the guidebooks described in Chapter 8:

Day 06: Hunza: Early morning we head for Eagle's Nest where on the high mountains to enjoy a local breakfast with a captivating view of the Hunza Valley. This will be followed by a visit of the Hunza Valley and meeting local folks, understanding the secrets of their

⁴ Travel and Culture Services Pakistan, *Valley of Hunza, The Shangri-La* [website on-line] (Karachi, Pakistan: 1998); available from <http://tours.hypermart.net/Pakistan/hunza.htm>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

⁵ Concordia Expeditions, Inc., *Hindukush Karakoram Walk* [website on-line] (Buena Vista, CO: 1999); available from www.concordiaexpeditions.com/hindukush.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

⁶ Alpine Trekker and Tours, *Hunza Biking* [website on-line] (Islamabad, Pakistan); available from www.alpine.com.pk/hunza.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

⁷ Concordia Expeditions, Inc., *Hunza Adventure* [website on-line] (Buena Vista, CO: 1999); available from www.concordiaexpeditions.com/hunzatrip.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

longevity and also visit some of the important historical sites including the recently renovated, simple yet overpowering, Baltit Fort and the older Altit Fort.⁸

A short drive on the KKH takes us to Passu where we begin our trek on the Batura Glacier (39 mi.). We spend about a week on the Batura; walking over rocks and sand laid between jagged peaks, through pine strewn hills with occasional wild roses, to high shepherd meadows with staggering views of the Batura massive and the largest ice fall in the world.⁹

As can be seen, then, well-worn representations of the people and landscape of Hunza are being re-presented and re-iterated again and again. They have become so naturalized that travellers are *expecting* to see them, and so the tourist agencies are duly re-presenting them in order to entice visitors.

⁸ Bestway Tours and Safaris, *Shangri-La Hunza* [website on-line] (Vancouver, BC: 1999); available from <http://bestway.com/itineraries/t01.html>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

⁹ Concordia Expeditions, Inc., *Hunza Adventure* [website on-line] (Buena Vista, CO: 1999); available from www.concordiaexpeditions.com/hunzatrip.html; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

Figure 18. Altit Fort with Altit village in foreground, from Karimabad (Baltit). The fort is another ancestral home of the mirs of Hunza, close to 900 years old, and has not been restored. Nagar and the Karakoram Highway are on the right. The smokestack beside the highway is part of a brick factory. Taken 6 August, 1997.

Health and Happiness in Hunza

*The ancient Himalayan kingdom of the Hunzas counts for little in today's great power struggles - which suits the Hunzas, who are too busy enjoying life to the fullest... often for more than a century of vigorous mental and physical activity!*¹⁰

A common theme in the Hunza sites is the reification of the 'healthiness' of the people. As in earlier texts, healthiness is often presented in conjunction with their 'happiness'. Tobe¹¹ was interested in the 'glacial waters' of the Hunza area, stating that the water from the mountain glaciers contained the right minerals in the right form to be of great medicinal value to the people. He believed that drinking the glacial waters was one of the keys to the health (and therefore happiness) of the people:

'Tis this wealth of solvent minerals in liquid form that is guided by means of conduits to the stone-terraced fields of the valleys of Hunza and allowed to soak and penetrate into their soil. Then, too, 'tis religiously drunk and otherwise used by all the natives and their animals.¹²

He continues from here to present the 'evidence' of his findings (through the use of scientific expressions and processes¹³). Many of the websites that discuss Hunza health and happiness belong to companies promoting the beneficial and

¹⁰ STV, Inc., *Hunza Health Secrets for Long Life and Happiness* [website on-line] (Torrance, CA: 1997); available from <http://homevideos.com/hunza/b1.htm>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

¹¹ John Tobe, *Hunza: Adventures in a land of paradise* (Toronto: George J. McLeod, 1960).

¹² *Ibid.*, 402.

¹³ *Ibid.*, 403.

even medicinal properties of water similar to that found in Hunza¹⁴. The following is typical of what these sites present and sell:

Further research by Dr. Flanagan and his wife, Dr. Crystal Gael Flanagan, over 20 years had succeeded to create water that was identical to the Hunza type water. They not only duplicated the properties of Hunza water, they also were able to increase the quantity of negatively ionized hydrogen atoms millions of times over that found in Hunza water.¹⁵

Using similar words and methods of presentation to Tobe, this site re-presents the 'Healthy Hunza' discourse once again. The 'fountain of youth' has been found, and through the purchase of this water (not only similar to that found in Hunza, but actually made *better*), anyone can live as old as the Hunza people and sire children at 100, as they are imagined to do.

One site within this group belongs to an adventure touring company in Utah. This company offers what they call a 'Hunza Health Habits Tour' which entails a trip to Hunza to examine the healthy habits of the people. It is interesting to note that on the homepage for this site, they ask their readers:

¹⁴ John Searcy, *How to Live Well Past 100* [website on-line]; available from www.redlazer.com/jsearcy/livewell/; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Kaya Resource Group, *Hunza Water* [website on-line: click on "Hunza water at this site"] (San Francisco, CA: n.d.); available from <http://www.kayaresource.com/microcluster/frame.html>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Brian Joseph Snyder, *Hunza Water: The fountain of youth* [website on-line]; available from www.netreach.net/people/waterboy/hunzawater/; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Jana Shiloh, *Crystal Energy Technology* [website on-line] (Sedona, AZ: 1999); available from <http://alternative-health-4u.com/crystale.html>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Laurence Gilbert, *Does Hunza Water Hold the Secret of Youth?* [website on-line]; available from http://microhydrin.hypermart.net/active_healthyVent_p100.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

¹⁵ Kaya Resource Group, *Hunza Water* [website on-line: click on "Hunza water at this site"] (San Francisco, CA: n.d.); available from <http://www.kayaresource.com/microcluster/frame.html>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

ARE YOU A TOURIST?..... OR A TRAVELER.

A tourist visits to confirm what he already believes of the world. A traveler journeys to challenge the unknown.our company is for travelers.¹⁶

Here too, the authors are making the distinction between tourist and traveller, stating that the latter is obviously the better, because they 'know' how to travel, 'know' how to approach a place with an open mind, and 'understand' the 'other', unlike the mere 'tourist'. This distinction, as I have previously discussed, enables the traveller to feel better about him- or herself while travelling – it appeals to the 'higher ideals' Holland and Huggan discuss¹⁷. In the case of travel brochures, it allows the agency to be seen as more 'authoritative' about the people and sights of Hunza, and the experience is constructed as more 'authentic' than one undertaken by a 'tourist'. Not only does this question validate the 'traveller' as better than the tourist, it also validates many readers' sense of adventure by assuming the locations they are travelling to are an 'unknown' challenge. I refer again to Holland and Huggan who see this type of activity as a concealment of a 'lost nostalgia for obsolete empires and manly discoverer-explorers'¹⁸.

A final site within this group is one that sells videotapes of films and documentaries. One of the films is entitled *Health Secrets of the Shangri-La* –

¹⁶ Larry L. Bailey, *A Sense of Adventure: stop existing and start living* [website online]; available from www.okanogan.net (click on "OkanoganNet sites and pages" then on "A Sense of Adventure"); Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

¹⁷ Patrick Holland and Graham Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters: Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing* (Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998); see also discussion on Lonely Planet series in Chapter 8.

¹⁸ Holland and Huggan, *Tourists with Typewriters*, 199.

Hunza, presented and narrated by Renée Taylor¹⁹ (see Chapter Seven). The description of the film includes a stereotypical representation of the 'long-lived' Hunza people:

"Hunza" is the *true and complete* story of the Hunza people and their country, a land where people live to be over 100.... They are happy people and believe that 100 years is normal old age. ... Perhaps [sic] Hunza gave birth to the dream of eternal youth. It is a place where people have discovered the richness of a graceful and natural life in perfect harmony with nature²⁰.

Together with this film, the website promotes Taylor's book *Hunza Health Secrets for Long Life and Happiness*. This book teaches readers how to copy the healthy ways of the Hunza people to extend their own lives:

Renee Taylor studied the Hunzas, from their wise and hospitable ruler to their universally healthy farmers and herdsmen - learned the secrets of diet and life-style that have made their nation virtually free of disease, crime and stress - and now presents a program of nutrition, exercise and mental expansion that can bring these benefits to you!²¹

The film was given an Award of Excellence as the Winner of The Film Advisory Board, and Taylor herself was designated Woman of the Year by the Biographical Institute of America in 1991. During her travels to Hunza in the

¹⁹ see also Renée Taylor and Mulford J. Nobbs, *Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La* (El Monte, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, Inc., 1962), and Allen E. Banik and Renée Taylor, *Hunza Land: The Fabulous Health and Youth Wonderland of the World* (Long Beach, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1960).

²⁰ STV, Inc., *Health Secrets of the Shangri-La – Hunza* [website on-line] (Torrance, CA: 1997); available from <http://homevideos.com/hunza/v1.htm>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999. [my emphasis]

²¹ STV, Inc., *Hunza Health Secrets for Long Life and Happiness* [website on-line] (Torrance, CA: 1997); available from <http://homevideos.com/hunza/b1.htm>; Internet; accessed 14 December, 1999.

1950s and 1960s for her book, she became an 'expert' in the ways of Hunza yoga, and since then has been an instructor and proponent of the Hunza ways of life: 'Well over 90 herself, Taylor is the living image of spiritual, physical, and mental harmony'²². The mention of awards for both the film and the author herself, give extra credit to the representations of the people of Hunza. For any reader today, this can only boost the level of authority with which Taylor represents Hunza.

²² STV, Inc., *Meet Renée Taylor* [website on-line] (Torrance, CA: 1997); available from <http://homevideos.com/hunza/r1.htm>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

Travelogues

*The Wakhis and other reclusive Muslim tribes in northern Pakistan began regularly seeing foreigners only in 1986, when the northern part of the highway opened to outsiders; the townspeople of Sust could hardly conceal their delight at encountering a person like me.*²³

I found three sites that included travelogues – narratives written by travellers who have journeyed through Hunza²⁴. One is written in journal format, with a date at the beginning of each entry, while the other two look more like the travel books I have examined so far. Once again, these authors pride themselves on being ‘travellers’ as opposed to ‘tourists’, often referring to this distinction. One of the travellers notes the use of the *Pakistan Travel Survival Kit*, published by Lonely Planet, in both planning his trip, and en route as a guidebook for the sights he visits. As I discussed previously, this series of books is interested in promoting ‘higher’ tourism, and reifies the distinction between traveller and tourist. For example, on one occasion, a traveller is in a bus riding along the Karakoram Highway on his way into Hunza, and finds that they must stop as a truck had overturned in front of them. He becomes a ‘responsible traveller’ when he gets out to help with the removal of the landslide from the highway, and states that the ‘tourists’ simply ‘gawk’ through the lenses of their cameras. This narrative

²³ Jeffrey Tayler, ‘On Top of the World: Days of adventure and moments of transcendence along the Karakoram Highway,’ *The Atlantic Monthly* 283, no. 3, March 99 [journal on-line]; available from www.theatlantic.com/issues/99mar/ontop2.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

²⁴ Ibid; Erik Futtrup, *Travelogue Karakoram Highway 1994* [website on-line] (Denmark, 1994); available from <http://hjem.get2net.dk/futtrup/pakistan.html>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999; Iain Stewart, ‘Highway to Heaven,’ *TNT Magazine* [magazine on-line] (London, 1997); available from www.tntmag.co.uk/travel/k/kasmir.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

implies that the 'tourist' merely travels without any consciousness of their surrounding, oblivious to the help that may be needed, and are there only to capture the people on tape. In his description of this dichotomy, he is valorizing his position as a 'true' traveller, as he rolls up his sleeves to help clear the landslide, doing what he believes is the 'right' thing to do.

In addition to re-affirming the traveller/tourist distinction, the three sites represent several of the tropes I have examined so far. The author who was so adamant about the traveller/tourist distinction expresses his desire that Hunza, which he locates in the past, remain in the past:

Luckily this is still an isolated part of the world, the nearest airport at Gilgit can only accommodate small planes. Because it takes over 20 hours to reach Hunza from Lahore, there are no daytripping Pakistanis or Western package tourists coming to gawk at the "tribal" people or their magnificent mountains.²⁵

The author is happy that Hunza is 'still an isolated part of the world', and is glad that not many 'tourists' visit. As I have discussed previously, the idealization of people and places – here, the 'happy, healthy Hunza' discourse – allows the Westerner to project his or her own desires onto the people and their environment. Here, the author is happy that Hunza remains isolated. This implies that he can continue along on in his life knowing that somewhere out there is a place that fits his idyllic image, to which he can return if he needs to feel rejuvenated.

²⁵ Iain Stewart, 'Highway to Heaven,' *TNT Magazine* [magazine on-line] (London, 1997); available from www.tntmag.co.uk/travel/k/kasmir.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

In the travelogue sites, there are also references to James Hilton's Shangri-La²⁶, as well as to 'wrinkled folk who claim to be more than 120 years old'²⁷. There are other references to the health of the Hunza people when one traveller calls them 'robust inhabitants'²⁸, and again, to their 'natural' happiness and innocence: 'I looked forward to meeting the Wakhi Tadjik inhabitants of the highway's northern reaches, who I'd been told are friendly and unjaded'²⁹. This same traveller also re-enacts the common Orientalist activity of making the people seem inferior by constructing them as children (here, even almost as mystical fairies): 'we met Hunzakut shepherds who resembled puckish sprites, with their smiling blue eyes and their rolled wool caps adorned with violets. They ambled cheerfully down the trail, leading their flocks, laughing and calling out greeting to us'³⁰. The traveller has taken experienced shepherds, and

²⁶ Ibid; Erik Futtrup, *Travelogue Karakoram Highway 1994* [website on-line] (Denmark, 1994); available from <http://hjem.get2net.dk/futtrup/pakistan.html>; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

²⁷ Iain Stewart, 'Highway to Heaven,' *TNT Magazine* [magazine on-line] (London, 1997); available from www.tntmag.co.uk/travel/k/kasmir.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

²⁸ Jeffrey Tayler, 'On Top of the World: Days of adventure and moments of transcendence along the Karakoram Highway,' *The Atlantic Monthly* 283, no. 3, March 99 [journal on-line]; available from www.theatlantic.com/issues/99mar/ontop2.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

²⁹ Jeffrey Tayler, 'On Top of the World: Days of adventure and moments of transcendence along the Karakoram Highway,' *The Atlantic Monthly* 283, no. 3, March 99 [journal on-line]; available from www.theatlantic.com/issues/99mar/ontop.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

³⁰ Jeffrey Tayler, 'On Top of the World: Days of adventure and moments of transcendence along the Karakoram Highway,' *The Atlantic Monthly* 283, no. 3, March 99 [journal on-line]; available from www.theatlantic.com/issues/99mar/ontop2.htm; Internet; accessed 31 October, 1999.

constructed them as children, even fairies, running along, laughing, without so much as a thought, a care, a worry or a responsibility.

This chapter began with a brief discussion of the Internet as a potentially postmodern medium, allowing 'experimental' modes of expression. A further examination of the discursive constraints surrounding the Internet would be an interesting subsequent project. However, I think the Internet, in the context of these sites that discuss Hunza, is still limited in its ability to reject or deconstruct the representations and types of writing that originated in texts written under colonial rule. Through the use of repetitive language and techniques such as those discussed in Chapter Two, representations examined throughout the thesis continue to be reiterated in this potentially liberating format. The 'other' continues to be constructed as naïve, childlike, primitive, and inferior. Westerners continue to expect to see certain sights when they arrive in Hunza, and these Internet sites do nothing to deconstruct the same Orientalist, neo-colonial discourses.

Figure 19. Trail near village of Minapin in Nagar. Pisan is the village in the middle. Taken 17 October, 1995.

CONCLUSION

Final Remarks

A narration ... among other possible narrations
- Jacques Derrida¹

Travel writing is a widely read literary genre, which remained critically untouched until recently, when changing academic interests brought to the foreground examinations of authority, knowledge, and representation. I have analysed the constructed representational authority in travel texts. Travel writing has been informed and formed by scientific narrative techniques that have promoted information-gathering useful to colonial expansion. This created relations of power by extending knowledge of 'natural' and 'unknown' parts of the world. The systemizing of nature soon paralleled the expanding search for exploitable markets, resources and land, and was epitomized by the I/eye of the narrator.

Many of the texts I examined have not been analysed before. As deconstruction has been seen as the 'method' of postmodernism, I realized how helpful it would be to this project. I have used deconstruction in a fairly general sense of the term, and examine how language has been used to give travel statements their naturalizing power. By examining the language, I could understand some of the ways that the representations were constructed, and how they became naturalized over time.

¹ Jacques Derrida, "There is No *One* Narcissism," in *Points.... Interviews, 1974-1994*, ed. E. Weber (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995), 203.

Foucault says that truth can be understood as systems of ordered procedures for the production and distribution of statements. Truths are constructed and re-told so often they become naturalized². Foucault suggests that we should detach the power of 'truth' from the various forms of social, economic, and cultural dominance because there are multiple truths and multiple meanings to material language practices. One way of examining how 'truths' are naturalized is through the systematic examination and analysis of daily life and its language practices.

This project has involved the deconstruction of a set of travel texts about Hunza over a period of roughly one hundred years. I chose and used texts that were exemplary of the different representations for each time period. I analysed the representations by examining the language in the texts, and then examining how the representations created an opportunity for people to treat the people and places of Hunza in certain ways. The chronological method of presentation was crucial to this project as it allowed me to examine the representations' developments over time.

A government official and a newspaper correspondent who wanted to present and introduce the area and its people to the world in an informational and 'factual' manner wrote the texts I examined in Chapter Four. The texts were some of the first European accounts of Hunza, and so were important not only as

² Michel Foucault, *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977* (London: Harvester Press Limited, 1980), 133.

information-gathering accounts for the Empire, but for the public at large. As an important part of the information-gathering process, many of the narratives classify the inhabitants in the area. These classifications, used to justify imperialism, promoted European control and superiority and were given scientific respectability through the establishment of Social Darwinism. The texts I examined were written in the 'manners and customs' narrative style which presented the groups of people, usually in the present tense, as a collective 'they', or as a standard 'he'. These essentialist sweeping generalities arose from notions of primitive origins and classifications, and allowed Europeans to represent themselves as superior. This method of narration fixed the 'other' in the past, where they were presented as 'traces' that glorified their past but ignored the people's present; or, in the present, where their actions were simply repetitions of normal habits. Landscape description is common in 'manners and customs' narrative, usually in the style of a panoramic view which often revealed the fantasy of dominance – the eye commanded all that it could see in its gaze – and saw the land and people as valuable resources for the Empire. The people were constructed as inferior to Europeans through the use of language which presented the people as childlike and primitive. These classifications identified the 'other' as 'irrational' and 'different', in opposition to the white European as 'mature' and 'normal'. In these texts, the people, particularly the rulers, were often presented as barbaric and a nuisance. This construction allowed Europeans to justify their expansion into the Hunza area. Following the 1891

campaign, Hunza and its people were presented as cheerful and bright, another construction of the people as inferior, but this time as a 'happy and helpful' lot. This second construction justified the control of the area, as the people and land were seen as an excellent 'acquisition'. The eyewitness narrative techniques of these first texts helped ensure the authority of the narrators' stories.

The texts in Chapter Five presented Hunza and the surrounding mountain area as an enormous playground, where the lone adventurer could travel the lands at his or her³ own leisure. These texts are written in the 'sentimental' narrative style, bringing the narrator to the forefront. The descriptions usually revolved around a series of events often involving the indigenous people. This style of writing obtained its authority as the events were given value only because the narrator was involved. When these texts included both 'sentimental' and 'manners and customs' narrative, landscape was only described by how it affected the narrator. Adventure books of the early twentieth century continued to represent the Empire, and 'manners and customs' narrative was still used in this period to objectify Hunza. The methods of surveillance indicative of this style of narrative suggested the 'power to process and understand that which is seen, and it objectifies ... the colonized subject in a way that fixes its identity in relation to the surveyor'⁴. There is a noticeable absence in these adventure texts, of the

³ Although I have only discussed male adventurers in Hunza, there were a few female adventurers at the time – in particular, see Fanny Bullock Workman, 'Further exploration in the Hunza-Nagar and the Hispar Glacier,' *The Geographical Journal* 32, no. 5 (1908): 495-496.

⁴ Bill Ashcroft, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin, 'Surveillance,' in *Key concepts in post-colonial studies* (New York: Routledge, 1998), 226.

local people. This resulted in the narrator focusing on the landscape, and describing it in such a way that the author appears to be heroic. When local people were mentioned in these texts, the narrator used 'othering' language to construct them as subhuman or inferior, which justified their use as 'beasts of burden'. The physical strength of the men of Hunza was, and continues to be, presented in order to construct them as good porters. The people of Hunza during this time period were useful to the Europeans in many respects – they were able to carry their supplies, guide them around the mountains, as well as 'pose' for their enjoyment and scrutiny.

The collapse of the distinctions between ethnology and travel writing was discussed in Chapter Six with the presentation of Lorimer's book. In this chapter I examined two sets of discourses that affected her writing – those of femininity and those of colonialism. This text was written in a 'confessional' style. Although men write in this style as well, there were significant discursive pressures on women to write within the 'confessional' narrative style. Discourses of femininity had a significant impact on the production of travel writing as well as its reception. Lorimer was indeed constrained by limited behaviour that was seen as 'feminine', and in fact, was under certain constraints to produce a certain 'type' of book – only focusing on domestic issues, discussions of relationships, and the emotional welfare of those around her. Although she was constrained to write about the 'right' things, she also produced the book within the rules of colonial discourse. Denied the male 'gaze' at home, Lorimer freely practised this

privilege over the people in Hunza, and so frequently constructed the people of Hunza as childlike, simple, and 'happy'. In fact, the discourse of the 'happy, healthy Hunza' blossomed after the publication of this text.

The 'Happy Hunza' representation that began in the 1930s lasted for many years, and in fact continues today. Many of the texts during the 1950s and 1960s constructed Hunza as an 'ideal', a paradise. Through language, the people and the places were presented as naïve, and timeless. Hunza, during this time, was presented as a temporalized 'Shangri-La' paradise. This helped locate and maintain the area and its inhabitants in the past through the use of words such as 'primitive' and 'backward'. The joy that was often seen in the people's faces, simply from being alive, was, it seems, a projection of the travellers' own desires onto the people. The travellers were looking for images of people they had already constructed in their mind before their arrival, and the journeys were used to find those idyllic images and re-present them in their own stories. The construction of people as 'naturally' happy allowed for their domination and offered up their resources to the Westerner, as the 'other' was seen not to want or desire them. Clark continued to represent the people of Hunza as primitive and timeless, but, with the idea that they had the 'potential' to become more than they were. He wanted them to understand the ways of Western progress, and eventually to embrace them. His text presented his ideas on modernization, and described his journey as an experiment in how he applied these ideas to Hunza. This presentation allowed him to devalue locals' way of

thinking, replacing theirs with his own. His main obstacle to this process was what he felt to be the 'Oriental-ness' of the Mir, and his wish to maintain the traditional ways of the people. He constructed the common people as primitive yet capable of change, and the ruler as stuck in traditional ways. This representation is akin to that presented in the first set of texts describing Hunza prior to the 1891 campaign.

Contemporary travel writers are often seen as more 'innocent' than their predecessors, but perhaps their language has become subtler. The freedom that many authors have today allows a certain level of privilege and freedom of observation that was not as common previously. Chapter Eight presented several texts written by contemporary authors with this privilege of movement and observation. The 'other', particularly in Jamie, was presented as a therapeutic image. She constructed them as strange and constructed the land as a challenge. She located the people in the past, and wished they would remain there, feeling that development in Hunza would lead to a loss of cultural essence. Schaller constructed the people of Hunza as incapable of caring for their environment through language that presented them as primitive, childlike, and even subhuman. 'Natural law' gives domination of nature to advanced peoples, and he believed that these people were not capable of caring for it in the manner he deemed correct. Mock and O'Neil also constructed many of the people as inferior and as a 'problem' in order to show that 'dealing' with porters was only one more challenge that would add to the whole trekking experience.

Their narrative helped construct Hunza in the image of what the travellers expect of the area. However benevolent the tourism and environmental advice was meant to be, the question must be asked: *Whose* idea of development, tourism and 'nature' were, and are, they trying to promote?

In Chapter Nine, I discussed the potential postmodern implications of the Internet. I examined some of the websites that have been created to publicize the area's tourism industry, as well as sites that have been used to publish travel narratives. I had hoped to see far more deconstructive and challenging narratives on-line, but found only the same representations that have been presented previously.

Although I have maintained throughout that this project is an incomplete story, a 'partial truth,' there is one thing that I have not specifically addressed in this project. I have ignored the reception of the local people – their reactions to these representations, and their involvement in these same representations. This is indeed an important issue, but is one that is outside the purview of this thesis.

I think it was vital to include, throughout the thesis, discussions on the reception of the texts. It is important to examine, question, and deconstruct these travel texts. However, I do not think this goes far enough. If Blunt has said that within a poststructuralist context, texts are 'processes of signification

articulated only through reading'⁵, and that reader responses will be constrained by their ability to 'perceive, read, and interpret as discursively constructed subjects'⁶, then the reception of texts has certain crucial effects on how texts are read and how subsequent texts are written. The examination of book reviews is one way of examining individual readings of the texts, and because these reviews have a certain authority assumed in them, they are influential in enabling further understandings of the texts. I have been able to show how the reception of the travel texts presented here have continued the representations found in the texts, and have underlined the production constraints or freedoms allowed to the authors. The reviews have shown how the authority produced in the texts through various language techniques has been accepted. Through this acceptance of authority, the texts become the 'truth' and the representations, through repetition, become naturalized.

I have taken apart travel texts written about Hunza over the past one hundred years. Spivak reminds us that often the critic's work, through authoritative language, attempts to present *the* truth about the texts⁷. Upon reflection, I admit a certain degree of 'authority' has been produced in this text, but this text should not be seen as an 'absolute 'truth'', as texts are always in a

⁵ Alison Blunt, *Travel, Gender, and Imperialism: Mary Kingsley and West Africa* (London: The Guilford Press, 1994), 116.

⁶ *Ibid.*, 117.

⁷ Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, 'Translator's preface' to *Of Grammatology*, by J. Derrida, corrected ed. (Baltimore and London: The John Hopkins University Press, 1997).

constant state of re-production and re-negotiation. On the other hand, simply because this thesis has not been presented as the 'absolute truth'⁸, does not mean I did not have a desire to open up venues for discussion and to challenge 'social and political structures of the most hardened traditions'⁹. This thesis project has been my initial attempt at this type of writing – and, I hope 'already a palimpsest'. It must be recognised that texts are in a constant state of being re-negotiated and re-produced, but then, so are the authors that construct these texts.

⁸ I have stated throughout this thesis that no text can be, nor that there is any such thing as 'absolute truth'.

⁹ J. Derrida, 'There is No *One* Narcissism,' in *Points....: Interviews, 1974-1994*, ed. E. Weber (Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995), 213.

Sources Consulted

Review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton. *The Independent*, 6 June 1912, p. 1269.

Review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renee Taylor. *Springfield Daily Republican*, 10 April 1960, p. 40.

Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark. *Kirkkus* 24 (1956): 237.

Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark. *Current History* 31 (1956): 44.

Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark. *Booklist* 52 (1956): 455.

Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark. *Library Journal* 81 (1956): 1801.

Review of *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, by E.O. Lorimer. *The Geographical Journal* 94, no. 2 (1939): 172-73.

Review of *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, by E.O. Lorimer. *Geographical Journal* 94, no. 2 (1939): 172-73.

Review of *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, by E.O. Lorimer. *Man* 40 (1940): 95.

Review of *Stones of Silence*, by George Schaller. *The New Yorker* 56 (1980): 162.

Review of *The Golden Peak*, by Kathleen Jamie. *The Globe and Mail*, 2 May 1992, p. F5.

Review of *Thirty Years in Kashmir*, by Arthur Neve. *The Saturday Review* 117 (1914): 22-23.

Review of *Thirty Years in Kashmir*, by Arthur Neve. *The Athenaeum* (1914): 428.

Review of *Thirty Years in Kashmir*, by Arthur Neve. *American Library Association Booklist* 10 (1914): 315-16.

Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight. *The Athenaeum* 101 (1893): 629-30.

Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight. *The Nation* 56 (22 June 1893): 460-461.

Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight. *The Geographical Journal* 2, no. 1 (1893): 89.

Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight. *The Dial* 15 (1893): 9-12.

Review of *Where Three Empires Meet*, by E.F. Knight. *Blackwood's Magazine* 154 (1893): 281-83.

Review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton. *Nature* 86 (1911): 388.

Review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton. *The Saturday Review* 112 (1911): 210.

Review of *Across the Roof of the World*, by P.T. Etherton. *The Geographical Journal* 37, no. 6 (1911): 649.

Adams, Percy G. *Travel Literature and the Evolution of the Novel*. Lexington, Kentucky: The University Press of Kentucky, 1983.

Agnew, John. "Representing Space; Space, Scale and Culture in Social Science." In *Place/Culture/Representation*, ed. James Duncan, and David Ley, 25-38. London: Routledge, 1993.

Ali, Tahir. "The Burusho of Hunza: Social Structure and Household Viability in a Mountain Desert Kingdom." Ph. D diss., University of Rochester, 1982.

Allan, Nigel J. R. "Household Food Supply in Hunza Valley, Pakistan." *The Geographical Review* 80, no. 4 (1990): 399-415.

Alpine Trekker and Tours. "Hunza Biking." Web page, [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.alpine.com.pk/hunza.html.

Ashcroft, Bill, Gareth Griffiths, and Helen Tiffin. *Key Concepts in Post-Colonial Studies*. New York: Routledge, 1998.

Bailey, Larry L. "A Sense of Adventure: stop existing and start living." Web page, [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.okanogannet.com.

Band, George. *Road to Rakaposhi*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1955.

- Banik, Allen E., and Renée Taylor. *Hunza Land: The Fabulous Health and Youth Wonderland of the World*. Long Beach, CA: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1960.
- Barnes, T., and J. Duncan, ed. *Writing Worlds: Discourse, Text and Metaphor in the Representation of Landscape*. London: Routledge, 1992.
- Bartolini, Laurie. Review of *Stones of Silence: Journeys in the Himalaya* by George Schaller. *Library Journal* 105 (1980): 624.
- Bernstein, Jeremy. Review of *Stones of Silence*, by George Schaller. *New York Times Book Review* 85 (1980): 9.
- Bestway Tours and Safaris. "Shangri-La Hunza." Web page, 1999 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://bestway.com/itineraries/t01.html>.
- Bhabha, Homi K. "The Other Question..." *Screen* 24, no. 6 (1983): 18-36.
- Biddulph, John. *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh*. 1880. Reprint, Graz, Austria: Akademische Druck - u. Verlagsanstalt, 1971.
- Blanton, Casey. *Travel Writing: The Self and the World*. New York: Simon and Schuster Macmillan, 1997.
- Blunt, Alison. "Mapping Authorship and Authority: Reading Mary Kingsley's Landscape Descriptions." In *Writing Women and Space: Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies*, ed. Alison Blunt, and Gillian Rose, 51-72. New York: The Guilford Press, 1994.
- . *Travel, Gender, and Imperialism. Mary Kingsley and West Africa*. London: The Guilford Press, 1994.
- Blunt, Alison, and Gillian Rose. "Introduction: Women's Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies." In *Writing Women and Space: Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies*, ed. Alison Blunt, and Gillian Rose, 1-28. New York: The Guilford Press, 1994.
- Boochever, Florence, and Ruth Gambee. Review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renee Taylor. *The Bookmark* 19 (1960): 175.
- British Karakoram Expedition. "Hunza Valley information." Web page, 1997 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://bke97.demon.co.uk/area/hunza.htm>.
- Bullock Workman, Fanny. "Further Exploration in the Hunza-Nagar and the Hispar Glacier." *The Geographical Journal* 32, no. 5 (1908): 495-96.

- Butz, David. "Developing Sustainable Communities: Community Development and Modernity in Shimshal, Pakistan." PhD diss., McMaster University, 1993.
- . Review of *Mapping Men and Empire: A Geography of Empire*, by Richard Phillips. *The Canadian Geographer* 42, no. 2 (1998): 210-211.
- . "Revisiting Edward Said's *Orientalism*." *Brock Review* 4, no. 1/2 (1995): 54-80.
- Butz, David, ed. "Shimshal Nature Trust: Fifteen Year Vision and Management Plan." Web page, 1997 [accessed 13 December 1999]. Available at www.brocku.ca/geography/people/dbutz/shimshal.html.
- . "True Stories, Partial Stories: A Century of Interpreting Shimshal From the Outside." In *North Pakistan: Karakoram Conquered*, ed. N. J. R. Allan. Boulder: Westview press, forthcoming.
- Butz, David, and Kenneth Iain MacDonald. "Investigating Portering Relations As a Locus for Transcultural Interaction in the Karakoram Region of Northern Pakistan." *Mountain Research and Development* 18, no. 4 (1998): 333-43.
- Caputo, John D., ed. *Deconstruction in a Nutshell; A Conversation With Jacques Derrida*. New York: Fordham University Press, 1997.
- Clark, John. *Hunza: Lost Kingdom in the Himalayas*. New York: Funk and Wagnalls Company, 1980.
- Clifford, James. "Introduction: Partial Truths." In *Writing Culture; The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford, and George E. Marcus, 1-26. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986.
- . "On Ethnographic Allegory." In *Writing Culture; The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford, and George E. Marcus, 98-121. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986.
- . *Routes: Travel and Translation in the Late Twentieth Century*. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1997.
- Cockerill, G. K. "Byways in Hunza and Nagar." *The Geographical Journal* 60, no. 2 (1922): 97-112.
- . "Pioneer Exploration in Hunza and Chitral." *Himalayan Journal* 11 (1939): 15-41.
- Concordia Expeditions, Inc. "Bike Hunza." Web page, 1999 [accessed 31

- October 1999]. Available at
www.concordiaexpeditions.com/bikehunza.html.
- Concordia Expeditions, Inc. "Hindukush Karakoram Walk." Web page, 1999 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at
www.concordiaexpeditions.com/hindukush.html.
- Concordia Expeditions, Inc. "Hunza Adventure." Web page, 1999 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at
www.concordiaexpeditions.com/hunzatrip.html.
- Cosgrove, Denis, and S. Daniels, ed. *The Iconography of Landscape*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988.
- Cosgrove, Denis, and Mona Domosh. "Author and Authority: Writing the New Cultural Geography." In *Place/Culture/Representation*, ed. James Duncan, and David Ley, 25-38. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Cresswell, T. *In Place, Out of Place*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1996.
- Curtis, James R. "Shangri-La and Pakistan's Hunza River Valley." *Journal of Cultural Geography* 13, no. 1 (1992): 55-67.
- Dani, Ahmad Hasan. *History of Northern Areas of Pakistan*. Islamabad: National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research, 1989.
- Dear, M. "The Postmodern Challenge: Reconstructing Human Geography." *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* 13 (1988): 262-74.
- Denzin, Norman K. *Interpretive Biography*. Sage University Paper Series on Qualitative Research Methods, 17. Newbury Park, CA: Sage Publications, 1989.
- Derrida, Jacques. *Of Grammatology*. Translated by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1997.
- . "There Is No One Narcissism." In *Points...; Interviews, 1974-1994*, ed. Elisabeth Weber, Translated by Peggy Kamuf, 196-215. Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press, 1995.
- . "Unsealing ("the Old New Language")." In *Points...; Interviews, 1974-1994*, ed. Elisabeth Weber, Translated by Peggy Kamuf, 115-31. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1995.
- Dodd, Philip. "The Views of Travellers: Travel Writing in the 1930s." In *The Art of*

- Travel; Essays on Travel Writing*, ed. Philip Dodd, 127-38. London: Frank Cass and Company Limited, 1982.
- Douglas, William O. Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark. *Saturday Review* 39 (1956): 18.
- Drew, Frederic. *The Jummoo and Kashmir Territories: A Geographical Account*. Delhi: Oriental Publishers, 1875. Reprint, 1971.
- Driver, Felix. "Bodies in Space: Foucault's Account of Disciplinary Power." In *Reading Human Geography; The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. Trevor Barnes, and Derek Gregory, 279-89. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1997.
- Driver, Felix, and Gillian Rose. "Introduction: Towards New Histories of Geographical Knowledge." In *Nature and Science: Essays in the History of Geographical Knowledge*, ed. Felix Driver, and Gillian Rose, 1-7. Historical Geography Research Series, 28. London: Institute of Historical Research, 1992.
- Duncan, James. "Sites of Representation: Place, Time and the Discourse of the Other." In *Place/Culture/Representation*, ed. James Duncan, and David Ley, 25-38. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Duncan, James, and David Ley. "Introduction: Representing the Place of Culture." In *Place/Culture/Representation*, ed. James Duncan, and David Ley, 1-24. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Durand, Algernon. *The Making of a Frontier: Five Years' Experiences and Adventures in Gilgit, Hunza, Nagar, Chitral, and the Eastern Hindu-Kush*. London: John Murray, 1899.
- E.W. Foell. Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark. *Chicago Sunday Tribune*, 10 June 1956, p. 1.
- Ellis, William S. "Pakistan Under Pressure." *National Geographic* 159, no. 5 (1981): 668-700.
- Emeneau, E. M. Review of *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*, by E.O. Lorimer. *Language* 16 (1940): 352-57.
- England, Kim. "Getting Personal: Reflexivity, Positionality, and Feminist Research." In *Reading Human Geography; The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. Trevor Barnes, and Derek Gregory, 69-83. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1997.

- Epstein, Bennett. Review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renee Taylor. *New York Herald Tribune Book Review* (1960): 4.
- Etherton, Lieut. P. T. *Across the Roof of the World. A Record of Sport and Travel Through Kashmir, Gilgit, Hunza, the Pamirs, Chinese Turkestan, Mongolia and Siberia*. London: Constable and Company Ltd, 1911.
- Ferguson, James. *The Anti-Politics Machine: 'Development,' Depoliticization, and Bureaucratic Power in Lesotho*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Foucault, Michel. *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. Translated by A. M. Sheridan Smith. London: Tavistock Publications, 1972.
- . *Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and Other Writings, 1972-1977*. ed. Colin Gordon. London: Harvester Press, 1980.
- Frutrup, Erik. "Travelogue Karakoram Highway 1994." Web page, 1994 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://hjem.get2net.dk/futtrup/pakistan.html>.
- Graham, Jr. Frank. Review of *Stones of Silence*, by George Schaller. *Audubon* 82 (1980): 28.
- Gratzl, K. "Preface to the 1971 Edition." In *Tribes of the Hindoo Koosh*. by John Biddulph. Graz, Austria: Akademische Druck - u. Verlagsanstalt, 1880. Reprint, 1971.
- Gregory, Derek. "Between the Book and the Lamp: Imaginative Geographies of Egypt, 1849-50." *Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers* NS 20 (1995): 29-57.
- . "Discourse." In *The Dictionary of Human Geography*. 3rd. ed., ed. R. J. Johnston, 136-37. Blackwell: Oxford University Press, 1994.
- . "Poststructuralism (Including Deconstruction)." In *The Dictionary of Human Geography*. 3rd ed., ed. R. J. Johnston. Oxford: Blackwell, 1994.
- Hale, Sylvia. *Controversies in Sociology*. Toronto: Copp Clark, 1995.
- Hall, Jonathon. "Introduction." In *Literature and Anthropology*, ed. Jonathon Hall, and Ackbar Abbas, 1-11. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1986.
- Hamid, S. Shahid. "Karakoram and Hunza." *Asian Affairs* 23, no. 1 (1992): 13-19.
- Harrison, John. *Growing Food Organically*. Vancouver: Waterwheel Press, 1993.

- Henderson, Robert W. Review of *Hunza Land*, by Allen Banik and Renee Taylor. *Library Journal* 85 (1960): 656.
- Holland, Patrick, and Graham Huggan. *Tourists With Typewriters; Critical Reflections on Contemporary Travel Writing*. Ann Arbor, MI: University of Michigan Press, 1998.
- Hulme, Peter. *Colonial Encounters: Europe and the Native Caribbean, 1492-1797*. New York: Methuen and Co., 1986.
- Hunza Travel Service. "Hunza Valley." Web page, 1999 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.hunzatravel.com.
- Jackson, Peter. "The Crisis of Representation and the Politics of Position." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space* 9 (1991): 131-34.
- . *Maps of Meaning*. London: Unwin Hyman, 1989.
- Jacobs, Jane. *Edge of Empire: Postcolonialism and the City*. London: Routledge, 1996.
- Jamie, Kathleen. *The Golden Peak: Travels in Northern Pakistan*. London: Virago Press, 1992. Reprint, 1993.
- Kaya Resource Group. "Hunza Water." Web page, [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.kayaresource.com/microcluster/frame.html.
- Keating, Bern. "Problems of a Two-Part Pakistan." *National Geographic* 131, no. 1 (1967): 1-47.
- Keay, John. *The Gilgit Game: The Explorers of the Western Himalayas, 1865-95*. Karachi: Oxford University Press, 1990.
- . *When Men and Mountains Meet: The Explorers of the Western Himalayas, 1820-1875*. London: John Murray Publishers, 1977.
- Knight, E. F. *Reminiscences: The Wandering of a Yachtsman and War Correspondent*. London: Hutchinson and Co., 1923.
- . *Where Three Empires Meet. A Narrative of Recent Travel in Kashmir, Western Tibet, Gilgit, and the Adjoining Countries*. London: Longmans, Green, and Co, 1893. Reprint, Taipei: Ch'eng Wen Publishing Company, 1971.
- Kobayashi, Audrey, and Linda Peake. "Unnatural Discourse. 'Race' and Gender in Geography." In *Reading Human Geography; The Poetics and Politics of*

Inquiry, ed. Trevor Barnes, and Derek Gregory, 445-61. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1997.

Kousmine, Catherine. "L'Exemple Des Hounzas: Un Peuple Sans Maladie." *Lumiere* (1999): 46-48.

Kreutzmann, Hermann. *Hunza: Lndliche Entwicklung Im Karakoram*. Berlin: Dietrich Reimer Verlag, 1989.

———. "The Karakoram Highway: The Impact of Road Construction on Mountain Societies." *Modern Asian Studies* 25, no. 4 (1991): 711-36.

———. "Oases of the Karakoram: Evolution of Irrigation and Social Organization in Hunza, North Pakistan." In *Human Impact on Mountains*, ed. N. J. R. Allan, G. Knapp, and C. Stadel, 243-54. Totowa: Rowman and Littlefield, 1988.

Laurence Gilbert. "Does Hunza Water Hold the Secret of Youth?" Web page, [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at http://microhydrin.hypermart.net/active_healthyVent_p100.htm.

Leaf, Alexander M. D. "Every Day Is a Gift When You Are Over 100." *National Geographic* 143, no. 1 (1973): 93-117.

Ley, David, and James Duncan. "Epilogue." In *Place/Culture/Representation*, ed. James Duncan, and David Ley, 329-35. London: Routledge, 1993.

Lines, Maureen. *Beyond the North-West Frontier: Travels in Hindu Kush and Karakoram*s. Sparkford, England: Oxford Illustrated Press, 1988.

Livingstone, D. *Darwin's Forgotten Defenders*. Edinburgh: Scottish Academic Press, 1987.

———. "The History of Science and the History of Geography: Interactions and Implications." *History of Science* 22 (1984): 271-302.

Lonely Planet Publications. "Destination Pakistan." Web page, [accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at <http://press.lonelyplanet.com/dest/ind/pak.htm>.

Lonely Planet Publications. "Guidelines for Writers." Web page, [accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at <http://press.lonelyplanet.com/faq/guide.htm>.

Lonely Planet Publications. "Lonely Planet FAQ." Web page, [accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at <http://press.lonelyplanet.com/faq/faq.htm>.

Lonely Planet Publications. "Lonely Planet hits the small screen." Web page,

[accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at
<http://press.lonelyplanet.com/prop/tv/vid-men.htm>.

Lonely Planet Publications. "Media Kit: media FAQ." Web page, [accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at <http://press.lonelyplanet.com/faq.htm>.

Lonely Planet Publications. "Media Kit: series descriptions." Web page, [accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at
<http://press.lonelyplanet.com/series/series.htm>.

Lonely Planet Publications. "Propoganda." Web page, [accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at <http://press.lonelyplanet.com/prop>.

Long, F. W. "A Recent Visit to Hunza-Nagir." *Journal of the Royal Central Asian Society* 35 (1948): 161-67.

Lorimer, E. O. "Bleak Hunza Laughs at Hardship." *Travel* 69 (1939): 16-20.

———. *Language Hunting in the Karakoram*. London: George Allen and Unwin, 1939.

———. "The Road to Hunza." *Geographical Magazine* 3, no. 3 (1936): 161-78.

Love, Nancy S. "Foucault and Habermas on Discourse and Democracy." *Polity* 22, no. 2 (1989): 267-93.

MacDonald, Kenneth Iain. "Push and Shove: Spatial History and the Construction of a Portering Economy in Northern Pakistan." *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 40, no. 2 (1998): 287-317.

MacKenzie, John M. "Geography and Imperialism: British Provincial Geographical Societies." In *Nature and Science: Essays in the History of Geographical Knowledge*, ed. Felix Driver, and Gillian Rose, 49-62. Historical Geography Research Series, 28. London: Institute of Historical Research, 1992.

———. *Imperialism and the Natural World*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990.

Malkki, Liisa H. "News and Culture: Transitory Phenomena and the Fieldwork Tradition." In *Anthropological Locations: Boundaries and Grounds of a Field Science*, ed. Gupta Akhil, and James Ferguson, 86-101. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1997.

McCarry, John. "High Road to Hunza." *National Geographic* 185, no. 3 (1994): 114-34.

- Michaud, Sabrina, and Roland Michaud. "Trek to Lofty Hunza - and Beyond." *National Geographic* 148 (1975): 644-69.
- Middleton, D. "Karakoram History: Early Exploration." In *The International Karakoram Project*, ed. K. J. Miller, 17-31. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
- Mills, Sara. *Discourses of Difference. An Analysis of Women's Travel Writing and Colonialism*. London: Routledge, 1991.
- . "Knowledge, Gender, and Empire." In *Writing Women and Space: Colonial and Postcolonial Geographies*, ed. Alison Blunt, and Gillian Rose, 29-50. New York: The Guilford Press, 1994.
- Mock, John and Kimberley O'Neil. "Survey of Ecotourism Potential in Pakistan's Biodiversity Project Area (Chitral and Northern Areas)." Web page, 1996 [accessed 19 October 1999]. Available at <http://www.monitor.net/~jmko/karakoram/biodiv.htm>.
- . *Trekking in the Karakoram and Hindukush*. Hawthorn, Vic, Australia: Lonely Planet Publications, 1996.
- Neve, Arthur. *Thirty Years in Kashmir*. London: Edward Arnold, 1913.
- Neve, Ernest F. *The Tourist's Guide to Kashmir, Ladakh, Skardo, Etc.* 14th ed. Lahore: Civil and Military Gazette Press, 1927.
- Northbourne, Lord. *Look to the Land*. London: J.M. Dent and Sons, 1940.
- Orr, Leonard. *A Dictionary of Critical Theory*. New York: Greenwood Press, 1991.
- Parton, Margaret. Review of *Hunza: Lost Kingdom of the Himalayas*, by John Clark. *New York Herald Tribune Book Review* (1960): 7.
- Phillips, Richard. *Mapping Men and Empire: A Geography of Empire*. London: Routledge, 1997.
- Philp, M. "Michel Foucault." In *The Return of Grand Theory in the Human Sciences*, ed. Q. Skinner. Cambridge: University of Cambridge Press, 1985.
- Pratt, Geraldine. "Spatial Metaphors and Speaking Positions." In *Reading Human Geography; The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. Trevor Barnes, and Derek Gregory, 168-72. New York: John Wiley and Sons, Inc., 1997.
- Pratt, Mary Louise. "Fieldwork in Common Places." In *Writing Culture: The*

- Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford, and George E. Marcus, 27-50. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986.
- . *Imperial Eyes: Travel Writing and Transculturation*. New York: Routledge, 1992.
- . "'Killed by Science': Travel Narrative and Ethnographic Writing." In *Literature and Anthropology*, ed. Jonathon Hall, and Ackbar Abbas, 197-229. Hong Kong: Hong Kong University Press, 1986.
- . "Scratches on the Face of the Country; or, What Mr. Barrow Saw in the Land of the Bushmen." *Critical Inquiry* 12 (1985): 119-43.
- Pugh, S. *Reading Landscape: Country-City-Capital*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1990.
- Rabinow, Paul. "Representations Are Social Facts: Modernity and Post-Modernity in Anthropology." In *Writing Culture; The Poetics and Politics of Ethnography*, ed. James Clifford, and George E. Marcus, 234-61. Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1986.
- Rodale, J. I. *The Healthy Hunzas*. Emmaus, PA: Rodale Press, 1949.
- Rose, Gillian. "Geography As a Science of Observation: The Landscape, the Gaze and Masculinity." In *Nature and Science: Essays in the History of Geographical Knowledge*, ed. Felix Driver, and Gillian Rose, 8-18. Historical Geography Research Series, 28. London: Institute of Historical Research, 1992.
- . "Looking at Landscape: The Uneasy Pleasures of Power." In *Reading Human Geography; The Poetics and Politics of Inquiry*, ed. Trevor Barnes, and Derek Gregory, 342-54. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1997.
- Rostow, W. W. "Economic Development: The Take-Off into Self-Sustained Growth." In *Political Development and Social Change*, ed. J. L. Finkle, and R. W. Gable, 141-61. New York: John Wiley and Sons, 1971.
- Said, Edward W. *Orientalism*. New York: Vintage Books, 1979.
- Schaller, George B. *Stones of Silence; Journeys in the Himalaya*. New York: The Viking Press, 1980.
- Searcy, John. "How to Live Well Past 100." Web page, [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.redlazer.com/jsearcy/livewell.
- Shattock, Joanne. "Travel Writing Victorian and Modern: A Review of Recent

- Research." In *The Art of Travel; Essays on Travel Writing*, ed. Philip Dodd, 151-64. London: Frank Cass and Company, 1982.
- Shiloh, Jana. "Crystal Energy Technology." Web page, 1999 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://alternative-health-4u.com/crystale.html>.
- Shipton, Eric. *Blank on the Map*. London: Hodder and Stoughton, 1938.
- . "Karakoram, 1939." *The Geographical Review* 95, no. 6 (1940): 409-27.
- . "The Shaksgam Expedition, 1937." *The Geographical Journal* 91 (1938): 313-39.
- Shor, Franc, and Jean Shor. "At World's End in Hunza." *National Geographic* 114, no. 4 (1953): 485-518.
- Shurmer-Smith, Pamela, and Kevin Hannam. *Worlds of Desire, Realms of Power; A Cultural Geography*. London: Edward Arnold, 1994.
- Sibley, David. *Geographies of Exclusion: Society and Difference in the West*. New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Snyder, Brian Joseph. "Hunza Water: The fountain of youth." Web page, [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.netreach.net/people/waterboy/hunzawater/.
- Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. "A Literary Representation of The Subaltern: A Woman's Text From the Third World." In *In Other Worlds: Essays in Cultural Politics*, ed. Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, 241-68. New York: Routledge, 1988.
- . "Translator's Preface." In *Of Grammatology* Jacques Derrida, Translated by Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak, ix-lxxxvii. Baltimore: The John Hopkins University Press, 1997.
- Spurr, David. *The Rhetoric of Empire: Colonial Discourse in Journalism, Travel Writing, and Imperial Administration*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1993.
- Staley, John. *Words for My Brother; Travels Between the Hindu Kush and the Himalayas*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1982.
- Stewart, Iain. "Highway to Heaven." Web page, 1997 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.tntmag.co.uk/travel/k/kashmir.htm.
- Stoddard, D. R. *On Geography and Its History*. Oxford: Basil Blackwell, 1986.

Strouse, Jean. Review of *Stones of Silence* by George Schaller. *Newsweek* 95 (31 March 1980): 77-80.

STV, Inc. "Health Secrets of the Shangri-La - Hunza." Web page, 1997 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://homevideos.com/hunza/v1.htm>.

STV, Inc. "Hunza Health Secrets for Long Life and Happiness." Web page, 1997 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://homevideos.com/hunza/b1.htm>.

STV, Inc. "Meet Renee Taylor." Web page, 1997 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://homevideos.com/hunza/r1.htm>.

Taylor, Jeffrey. "On Top of the World: Days of adventure and moments of transcendence along the Karakoram Highway (part 1)." Web page, March 1999 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.theatlantic.com/issues/99mar/ontop.htm.

Taylor, Jeffrey. "On Top of the World: Days of adventure and moments of transcendence along the Karakoram Highway (part 2)." Web page, March 1999 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at www.theatlantic.com/issues/99mar/ontop2.htm.

Taylor, Renée, and Mulford J. Nobbs. *Hunza: The Himalayan Shangri-La*. El Monte, California: Whitehorn Publishing Company, 1962.

Thomas, Jr. Lowell, and Tay Thomas. "Sky Road East." *National Geographic* 117, no. 1 (1960): 71-112.

Tobe, John. *Hunza: Adventures in a Land of Paradise*. Toronto: George J. McLeod, 1960.

———. *I Found Shangri-La*. St. Catherines, ON: The Provoker Press, 1970.

Travel and Culture Services Pakistan. "Valley of Hunza, The Shangri-La." Web page, 1998 [accessed 31 October 1999]. Available at <http://tours.hypermart.net/Pakistan/hunza.htm>.