INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI

**A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700 800/521-0600**

**MITRA SEJARA: EXPLORING THE ROLE OF MODERN
INDONESIAN WOMEN'S NGOS AS CONDUITS FOR PUBLIC
PARTICIPATION INTO POLICY FORMATION**

By

CAROLYN M. WALLACE, B.E.S.

A thesis submitted to
The Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research
In partial fulfillment of
The requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

Norman Paterson School of International Affairs

**Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario**

May 1997

© copyright
1997, Carolyn M. Wallace

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Acquisitions et
services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4
Canada

Your file Votre référence

Our file Notre référence

The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.

L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

0-612-22105-9

The undersigned hereby recommend to the Faculty of
Graduate Studies and Research acceptance of this thesis
submitted by CAROLYN M. WALLACE partial fulfilment
of the requirements for the degree of Master of Arts.

Maureen Appel Molot, Director
The Norman Paterson School
of International Affairs

Professor M. Rudner, Supervisor

ABSTRACT

This research examines the suitability of Modern Indonesian Women's NGOs to act as conduits for public participation into policy formation on women. The multistakeholder approach to policy development proposed would gather grassroots type input into the Government of Indonesia's policies on enhancing the role of women in national development. This research uses a holistic, feminist methodology that stresses examination of context. Contexts examined include women's position and historic experiences, legislative framework, types and location of WID activity, legal requirements for NGOs in Indonesia, and government-NGO relations.

Participation and NGO literatures are examined to support MIWNs proposed role. Participation is found to provide benefits to participants and policy. NGOs as a group have characteristics supporting their involvement in grassroots participation, and weaknesses including accountability, representativeness, and transparency. MIWNs stand to contribute their unique feminist agenda to policy formation if allowed a channel to policy formation. This may generate resistance from those who will lose power.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I wish to acknowledge the support and contribution made by many people during the preparation of this thesis. My first acknowledgement is for the Indonesian citizens who shared their thoughts and experiences with me. I hope that I have accurately captured the essence of their thoughts.

My second acknowledgement goes to the group of people who supported the academic and logistical aspects of bringing this thesis together. This group includes my supervisor and two advisors. My supervisor, Dr. Martin Rudner contributed his knowledge of Indonesia. Dr. Rudner's knowledge of the Indonesian context both politically and socially helped me understand a wider range of factors affecting my subject. My first advisor Dr. Susan McLellan who's specific contribution centered on the feminist issues, and women in Indonesia. Last, but certainly not least, my second advisor Dr. John Saxby who's knowledge and experience in working with NGOs contributed to a more accurate and balanced representation of NGOs.

A special acknowledgement goes to Dr. Bala Hyma at the University of Waterloo. Dr. Hyma has been my mentor during the seven years I have studied development issues. Her patience and support (despite my no longer being a Waterloo student) have been invaluable, both technically and morally. My studies with Dr. Hyma at Waterloo provided me with a background that prepared me to tackle a multifaceted issue like this.

A final acknowledgement goes to my supporting cast. This is my family who supported and pushed me through the YEARS of preparation. Without them this thesis would not be the same.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	PAGE
Acceptance Sheet	ii
Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Table of Contents	v
List of Tables	x
List of Figures	xi
1.0 Introduction	1
1.1 The Researcher	2
1.2 Situation	3
1.3 Feminist Research Theory	4
1.4 Methodology	7
1.5 Structure	10
2.0 Situating Women in the Indonesian Context	15
2.1 Women in Indonesia Today	16
2.1.1 Demographics	19
2.1.2 Marital Status	20
2.1.3 Education	20
2.1.4 Employment	23
2.2 Construction of Women in Indonesian Society	27
2.2.1 Ibuism	29
2.2.2 Raden Adjeng Kartini	30
2.2.3 Hari Ibu	33
2.3 1965, Women's Organizations and the Parti Komunis Indonesia	34

2.3.1 GERWANI	35
2.3.2 1965 Coup	36
2.4 Conclusions	38
3.0 Government Context	43
3.1 Ideological Context; GOI, Culture and GAD	44
3.2 National Development Plan	48
3.2.1 Formulation of GBHN and Repelita	49
3.2.2 Aspects Relating to the Role of Women	51
3.3 State Ministry for the Role of Women	58
3.3.1 Establishing the Ministry	58
3.3.2 Mandate	60
3.3.3 Functioning of the Ministry	62
3.3.4 Weaknesses of the Ministry	64
3.3.5 Comment on the State Ministry for the Role of Women	71
3.4 Conclusions	74
4.0 Non-Governmental Organizations	78
4.1 Participation	80
4.1.1 Why Public Participation?	80
4.1.2 Levels of Participation	84
4.1.3 Empowerment	85
4.2 Non-Governmental Organizations	87
4.2.1 Defining 'NGO'	88
4.2.2 Modern Indonesian Women's NGOs	91

4.2.3 NGO Characteristics	93
4.3 NGOs as Development Partners	100
4.4 Discussion	106
5.0 Location of WID Activity in Indonesia	110
5.1 Formal Consultation Structure	111
5.2 Governmental	112
5.2.1 Family Welfare Movement	112
5.2.2 Komisi Nasional Kedudukan Wanita Indonesia	114
5.2.3 Coordination for Development	114
5.2.4 WID Advocacy Committee	116
5.2.5 Clearing House for ASEAN Women's Programme	117
5.2.6 Biro Pusat Statistik	118
5.3 Quasi-Governmental	119
5.3.1 Kongress Wanita Indonesia	119
5.3.2 Wives of Civil Servants Associations	122
5.4 Non-Governmental	123
5.4.1 NGOs with Women Specific Projects	124
5.4.2 Modern Indonesian Women's NGOs	124
5.5 Academic	128
5.5.1 Women's Study Program	129
5.5.2 Women's Study Centres	130
5.6 Legal	131
5.7 Bilateral Assistance	131
5.8 International	132

5.9 Discussion: MIWNs and their Sustainability	133
6.0 Legal Context and Government Perception of Women's NGOs in Indonesia	140
6.1 Non-Governmental Organizations in Indonesia	142
6.1.1 Legal Position of NGOs	142
6.1.2 Indonesian Government Attitudes Towards NGOs	146
6.1.3 Civil Society in Indonesia	151
6.2 Attaining a Collaborative Status	152
6.3 Discussion	155
7.0 Conclusion	160
Appendix A: Number and Percentage Distribution by Province and Age Group	169
Appendix B: Distribution of Male Versus Female Civil Servants by Department	171
Appendix C: Distribution of Civil Servants by Rank and Sex (1992)	172
Appendix D: Five Policy Approaches to Including Women in Development Planning	174
Appendix E: Organizational Structure of the State Ministry for the Role of Women	175
Appendix F: Policy Approach to Enhancing the Role of Women in National Development	176
Appendix G: Organizational Structure of PKK	177
Appendix H: National Standing Committee on the Status of Women	178

Appendix I: Declaration on the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region	180
Appendix J: Kongress Wanita Indonesia	181
Appendix K: Organizational Structure of Dharma Wanita	186
Appendix L: Women's Study Centres	187
Appendix M: Jakarta Declaration for the Advancement of Women in Asia and the Pacific	191
Appendix N: Message of the Fourth Ministerial Conference of Non-Aligned Countries Devoted to the Role of Women in Development	194
Appendix O: Laws Governing NGOs in India and Malaysia	198
References	199

LIST OF TABLES

Table No. 2.1: Population Distribution by Age Group, Sex, and Marital Status (92)	20
Table No. 2.2: % Population 10+Yrs Illiterate	22
Table No. 2.3: Educational Attainment of Population 10+Yrs (%)	23
Table No. 2.4: Spatial-Temporal Distribution of Employment by Gender and Sector	26
Table No. 2.5: Average Monthly Income by Level of Education (Rp.)	26
Table No. 3.1: 1978 & 1983 GBHN and Repelita's III & IV	53
Table No. 3.2: 1988 GBHN and Repelita V	54
Table No. 3.3: 1993 GBHN and Repelita VI	55
Table No. 3.4: Presidential Decrees on State Ministry for the Role of Women	59
Table No. 3.5: Presidential Decree on the Functions of UPW	60
Table No. 4.1: The Benefits and Disadvantages of Collaboration	105
Table No. 5.1: Main Areas of Concentration by Women's Studies Centre	130

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure No. 2.1: Age Distribution of Population by Sex ('92)	19
Figure No. 2.2: % Distribution of Male versus Female Public Servants by Rank ('92)	24
Figure No. 2.3: State Construction of Women In Indonesia	29
Figure No. 4.1: Levels of Participation	84
Figure No. 5.1: National Consultation Mechanisms for Enhancing the Role of Women	111

1.0 INTRODUCTION

The title of this report, "Mitra Sejara: Exploring the Role of Modern Indonesian Women's NGOs as Conduits for Public Participation into Policy Formation" is an allusion to the Government of Indonesia's (GOI) revised goal¹ to 'enhance the role of women in national development'. Translated into English, the term *mitra sejara* means 'harmonious partnerships'. The title was selected for two reasons. First, it highlights contradictions involved in defining the goal of 'enhancing the role of women in national development'; secondly it can be interpreted to allude to a potential role of women's NGO's as collaborators² for government in working towards this goal.

The question posed by this research is: "Do modern Indonesian women's NGO's (MIWNs) have a role to play as collaborators for GOI in its goal of enhancing the role of women in national development?³". Specifically, are MIWNs a legitimate conduit for public participation into policy formation? This research is intended as a candid examination of factors, and their interaction, as they relate to the thesis. MIWNs are identified as a group of women's NGOs which share characteristics including the use of a feminist perspective. They aim to improve women's position in Indonesian society and to achieve a redistribution of power. The characteristics used to identify NGOs as MIWNs put them in a position of providing unique input into a participatory process of policy formation.

MIWNs input may offer a different, feminist perspective as compared to that of organizations like KOWANI. This perspective is important to the type of input in that MIWN objectives are to transform current relations to realize the emancipation of women. This goal differs from the objective sought by GOI and government connected organizations.

The research is conducted using a feminist methodology. The question of whether or nor MIWNs are good candidates for participating in policy formation contains a feminist issue. The issue is that of GOI sharing the power to define policies with MIWNs. Feminist research in general poses a challenge to redistribute the power to define⁴, and increasing women's involvement in defining their own development. This research examines the specific situation of how Indonesian women can realize this power to define through public participation in shaping policies and projects of which they are the intended beneficiaries. It is about finding the means for women to define their own needs and being involved in the decision of how those needs should be addressed.

Indonesia was selected for this study because of the progress and commitment it has already made towards its goal of enhancing the role of women in national development. I believe that the programs operating in Indonesia, and mechanisms established make it a good candidate for research into women's issues.

1.1 The Researcher

This research was conducted from the perspective of a female, western, academic, outsider. The fact that this study is being conducted from the perspective of an outsider offers advantages, and suffers from weaknesses. In the area of strengths; socio-cultural biases acting within Indonesia can be examined from an 'objective' perspective. The researcher does not have a personal interest in putting one agenda above another, nor am I in a position to influence the balance of contending agendas. Weaknesses of this research arise from an incomplete understanding of Indonesian culture, tradition, and history. While an outside observer brings objectivity to the study of internal factors, this perspective is shaped by the life experiences and values of the

researcher. It may appear a contradiction, but a strength of this research is its objectivity, and its weakness is subjectivity.

1.2 Situation

As will become evident in later chapters, Indonesia presents a number of complications and contradictions to this area of research. Theoretically, this research should not have been possible if all that is said by and about the Indonesian government were true. First, the image of Indonesia as an authoritarian regime, closed to the outside world should have made my meeting with Indonesians to discuss this subject impossible. Second, as will be discussed in Chapter Six, the authoritarian regime and ORMAS should not allow the existence and operation of the 'modern Indonesian women's NGOs' that this research is interested in.

The truth about Indonesia is far more complicated than this research can demonstrate. My ability to do this research does bring certain realities to the fore however. While on the surface Indonesia is an authoritarian regime, there must exist elements of permissiveness. This element of permissiveness is evidenced by the existence of unregistered NGOs. The repressive nature of Indonesia, and its strict traditionalism is challenged by the willingness of individuals to discuss women's issues with a foreign student. This willingness indicates an ongoing debate on social change.

Historically Indonesia has been a closed society, protective of its tradition and fragile national unity. The rate and direction of social change has been rigorously monitored and moderated. It is my observation that there is an unanswered call for significant change in women's position in Indonesian society. I do concede that rapid legislation of the range of changes some women are calling for could endanger unity and the

balance between tradition and change. However, maintenance of unity and harmony cannot be sustained while a significant group feel they are being denied justice. Control over the rate and direction of social change is loosening. President Suharto's push for economic development has meant that exogenous trends are gaining access to Indonesian debates and social thinking⁵. Despite appearing to be a rigidly controlled country, there is room for movement and debate as evidenced, among many factors, by the conduct of this research.

1.3 Feminist Research Theory

"...I think that feminists do uniquely contribute to social science by seeing patterns and causes and effects and implications of questions that nonfeminists have not seen and do not see."
(Judith Lorber qtd in Reinharz, 1992, p 13)

This paper employs a feminist approach to research. I use the term feminist approach, rather than feminist methodology to indicate my view that feminist research is not an isolated practice, separate from the larger body of social research. Feminist researchers have developed non-traditional research techniques, and adapted traditional techniques to feminist research⁶. The tools used in this research are traditional in form, and feminist in function. Feminist research can be an interpretation or approach to implementing traditional, mainstream social research techniques. The distinction of the feminist approach derives not so much from the techniques used, but from the nature of the questions asked by the researcher.

An appropriate analogy, to describe a 'feminist' approach to implementing research techniques, is the adjustability of focal length in photography. The research 'equipment' used is fairly standard, but can be used to produce significantly different results. Different images of the same subject can be created depending upon the

operator. The operator of a camera uses her own discretion in framing the photo (setting research parameters), and deciding what aspect of the subject matter should be drawn into focus. By applying a feminist approach, the researcher gains a different perspective on the subject matter. This perspective has the potential for generating previously unrecognized options or paths.

Feminist research places emphasis on the value of examining the context in which actions take place, as a means of attaining a deeper level of understanding. This approach is reflected in my emphasis on context in chapters two, three and five. In view of the fact that every event or action is precipitated by a set of circumstances, and influenced by the interaction of factors, the researcher cannot hope to understand her subject in isolation from its environment. In the case of women in Indonesia, influential factors exist in the political, economic, social, cultural, and historic experiences of women.

It is useful to show women's experience in a broad context, in order to expand researchers' and policy makers' understanding of influencing factors. Experience has proven that carefully planned development efforts can fail if important influencing factors have been missed. Development planning, carried out without context, risks being out-of-synch with real needs and opportunities. This shortfall was a source of failure in early development projects that were designed to transfer Western solutions to Third World problems. The lack of context rendered Western conceived 'Band-Aid' solutions unworkable, at great financial cost, and the loss of a decade of development.

In the case of this research's thesis, we must consider the context, both current and historical, in which women's NGOs exist and their relationship to GOI. I will not be

prescribing any forms of collaboration in this thesis, but will be exploring the feasibility of collaboration between MIWNs and GOI. While not uniquely feminist, it goes one step beyond answering the question of whether or not MIWNs represent a legitimate conduit for public participation into policy formation. It is the author's belief that MIWNs represent a powerful force for achieving women's emancipation, and that results can best be achieved through multi-level, multi-sector co-operation or collaboration of efforts.

I am making my observations and interpretation on the basis of a western education with a strong focus on gender theory, as developed and/or presented by: Maxine Molyneux; Caroline Moser; Mayra Buvinic; Canadian Council for International Co-operation; Lise Ostergard; Rao, Anderson and Overholt; and Overholt, Anderson, Cloud and Austin. I accept the concepts and assumptions that make up the GAD paradigm, and they have informed and shaped this research. My use of GAD as an appropriate approach to development influences my evaluation of events and policies.

The concept behind analyzing the contextual situation is the same as the 'Access and Control' profile of the Harvard Analytical⁷ model, only at a more macro level. It draws to the fore the interrelation between different levels of government and society that affect the implementation of policies. Policy is articulated at the macro level and may not be responsive to the micro-level reality of those affected by it. By engaging stakeholders in the dialogue, including their experiences, policy makers can enhance the effectiveness of policies.

Aside from potentially inefficient or misguided policies, there is another danger in improperly conceived policies and projects. Repeated or spectacular failure of efforts

aimed at improving women's position can lead to public perception of the goal as being inappropriate. Even enthusiastic participants can become discouraged and withdraw their support from collaborative efforts that fail. Such a withdrawal of support would increase fragmentation of effort, a condition that will impede progress towards improving women's position in Indonesian society.

1.4 Methodology

Research for this study was conducted in four ways. The first form of research involved conducting a literature search and review in Canada as well as speaking with individuals in Canadian government agencies with experience working on women's issues in Indonesia. A research period in Indonesia was conducted during which three things were accomplished; private interviews, collection of government documents and relevant literature, and finally social observation. Further research and literature review was carried out on NGO theory and Indonesian NGOs. While in Indonesia, I carefully followed the English language paper, The Jakarta Post, which provided a highlight of social debate and government position on issues including the appropriate role for NGOs, and individuals' rights to organize for social change.

Interviews composed the major research component and were carried out over a two month period in Jakarta and Bandung, Java. Due to a language restriction, all interviews were conducted in English either in the interviewees' office or home, and almost always in private or with small groups of interested individuals. Most interviews began with a brief discussion of my study interests and activities while in Indonesia. I would introduce myself as a Canadian student visiting Indonesia, researching Indonesia for a paper I would be writing when back at school in Canada. I would then

explain that I was interested in learning about how the policies on women were formulated, who was involved, what types of activities were being undertaken and by whom for women in Indonesia, and that I would welcome the opportunity to speak with them about Indonesia's approach to improving women's position. In all interviews, I asked permission to take notes of our conversation from the interviewee prior to taking out pen or pad.

Interviews were conducted in a semi-structured manner, allowed to follow the individual's flow of thought. Interviews were conducted with Indonesian women and men involved with women's issues, either in government, educational institutions, NGOs, or other relevant organizations. As a condition of many of the interviews, no names or organizations will be identified other than government departments and well established organizations.

The semi-structured approach used in interviews produced a range of interrelationships between activities and organizations that was instrumental in identifying the location of WID activity in Indonesia. These interrelationships might not have been uncovered had structured interviews been conducted which were limited to individuals' own organization. This approach provided the space for interviewees to expand on areas of their interest and to spin-off to related topics that I may not have been previously aware of.

Open-ended interviewing helped dispell some misperceptions I had developed from my literature review and interviews in Canada prior to visiting Indonesia. The Indonesian interviews were friendly, largely helped by the manner in which interviewees were selected based on personal introductions. My research did not set out to capture a

representation of all Indonesian women's opinions or experiences. What it did was explore the experiences and knowledge of a loosely connected group of women relating back to efforts to enhance the role of women in national development in Indonesia, and improving their position in Indonesian society.

My decision to use semi-structured interviews was both a product of the research and a method of research. By choosing to use a feminist approach to research, I had to become involved in my research as an individual in addition to the conventional role as observer. This approach decreases objectivity on the one hand, while increasing my awareness of the myriad of factors that were interacting to define and drive what I was observing. As was discussed, the majority of my own research was done in the form of semi-structured or open-ended interviews. This form of research differs from conventional survey type or closed-ended interviews in the following way; open-ended research interviews provide the researcher with non-standardized information that helps to draw out individual experiences and allows researchers to see the differences among people, while closed-ended research tries to test hypotheses that have been formed prior to the interview process (Reinharz, 1992, pp 18-9).

Of the twenty-eight individuals interviewed in Indonesia, twenty-six were women. During the course of our conversation(s) we covered a broad range of subjects, some related to my area of study and others of a more friendly, personal nature. I would welcome the opportunity to meet these women again and would feel privileged to call them friends. The men interviewed were also very cordial, but appeared less comfortable and did not enter into the more friendly discussions about family, my husband, and general life aspirations as did most of the female interviewees.

Individuals interviewed were identified by previous interviewees⁸, beginning with an employee of a government institution focusing on women in development in Indonesia. From the first interview, all others followed a logical progression of interrelated activities. In almost all instances, I had the great fortune of being provided with personal introductions from one interviewee to the next. This fact enhanced the informal approach and provided a climate in which friendly discussions and personal exchanges were possible despite the relatively restricted research time. No further interviews were conducted when interviews stopped producing references to new organizations or individuals, and when all suggestions had already been contacted.

If I were listening to someone else describe their research methodology in this manner, my first concern would be that only a closed circle of individuals who support the same agenda would be interviewed. I was aware of this possibility and looked for evidence of this potential bias while conducting my interviews. I found that the interviewees represented a broad range of perceptions and frequently held contradictory views and opinions. The interviewees as a group were heterogeneous, although by necessity had the following characteristics in common: urban based, English speaking, generally held some level of official capacity whether governmental, NGO, or academic, and all had achieved at least a high school education.

1.5 Structure

The first chapter (Chapter Two) presents information unique to a feminist research approach. One section of this chapter is dedicated to creating a picture of women's condition in Indonesian society. This is achieved through interpretation of statistical data on women in four areas: demographics; marital status; education; and employment. The limitations of using quantitative analysis are discussed, and

hypotheses for qualitative analysis of the statistical findings suggested. The next two sections are intended to provide the context of women's experience in Indonesia. The ideological construction of what it means to be a woman in Indonesia is explored. Finally, one of the key historic events in Indonesia's past is examined, as it related to the women's group GERWANI, and to control exerted by GOI over women's organizations today.

Chapter Three focuses on the institutional framework used by the government in developing and implementing their goal of enhancing the role of women in national development. It contains two major components, the State Ministry for the Role of Women (UPW) as the primary institutional mechanism and the Broad Guidelines on State Policy (GBHN)/ Repelita as the policy. These two areas combine to form the institutional framework context of this research.

In the section dealing with UPW, the formation, mandate, rationale, and functioning of the Ministry are explored. The limitations inherent in UPW as the national mechanism for enhancing the role of women are identified and discussed. This section is created to provide an in-depth look at the mechanism that is responsible for improving women's position. By gaining an understanding of what UPW is capable of, what limitations it faces, and what resources it has, future efforts can be designed to overcome the weaknesses and capitalize on the strengths. Suggestions are made regarding the future role of UPW.

The second section on GBHN and the Repelitas reviews the process used to create the women oriented section of these documents. Policy objectives from each of the four five year periods are presented and discussed to demonstrate the evolution of focus

and to develop an understanding of the government's official agenda for women. Finally, the government's ideological context is examined to provide the institutional backdrop.

Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) are the subject of Chapter Four. The first section explores the concept of participation. This research focuses on supporting MIWNs as a legitimate conduit for public participation into policy formation. This section looks at what benefits participation has for participants. Also, it examines different types of participation. The discussion of benefits accruing to participants is somewhat tangential to the central focus of MIWNs as conduits for participation. However, it is included to provide an understanding of why participation is desirable from a social perspective in addition to the practical benefits discussed in the next section.

The second section on NGO's focuses on the definition of a non-governmental organization, the range of activities included in this category, the relative strengths and weaknesses of NGOs as agents of development. Finally it will explore the international NGO literature, with an emphasis on Indonesia or South-East Asia, to support the premise that NGOs represent a legitimate channel for public participation into policy making. The roles played by NGOs in development, and the benefits that governments may derive from collaboration are discussed. The last sub-section is perhaps the most important in supporting this research's premise by finding support for that role.

Chapter Five looks at the formal consultation structure used to formulate policy. This chapter contains this research's contribution to the literature on women NGOs in Indonesia. A 'Road Map' to the location and types of activities focusing on women is

created. The road map is an overview of the locations of women in development (WID) oriented activities in Indonesia. The organizations are divided into the following groups: government, quasi-government, non-governmental organizations, educational, legal, Multilateral assistance, and international conventions. This 'roadmap' to WID activity represents an addition to the literature on women's organizations in Indonesia. In the process of conducting research, a typology of women's WID activities was found to be missing. The list created is not exhaustive due to research limitations, but provides a good framework for understanding the relationship of different loci of activity.

Also in Chapter Five is a discussion of my thesis's corollary. The main question I am trying to answer is whether or not MIWNs in Indonesia have a legitimate role to play as a conduit for public participation into GOI's policy formation relating to women, if such public participation is desired by GOI. The corollary this section looks at is what impact the existence or restriction of a channel to authority has on the sustainability and functioning of modern women's NGOs in Indonesia.

Chapter Six applies findings and concepts developed up to this point to the Indonesian case. The situation of NGOs in Indonesia is explored with reference to legal regulations, and Government of Indonesia (GOI) attitudes towards them. It explores the context in which collaboration would take place. These discussions are included to test whether the findings of the previous chapter are relevant to the Indonesian case.

¹ The original goal was the development of equal partnerships between men and women. While the goals of the government policy have not necessarily changed, the term *mitra sejara* has been substituted. The notion of harmonious partnerships is well suited to the Javanese culture in which confrontation is undesirable and harmonious relationships valued.

² I choose to use the term 'collaborators' in place of 'partners' to illustrate that partnership is an unlikely and possibly ill-advised relationship to build between NGOs and GOI. Partners implies a sharing of goals, beliefs, priorities, and agreement on a

unified course of action that is not currently feasible in Indonesia, if it is any where in the world. The spheres of non-governmental and governmental can co-exist and interact in a positive way, but I do not believe that NGOs would welcome a relationship in which they risk being subsumed by government bureaucracies, decision making, or agendas. A partnership would require trust from both parties that does not exist.

³ MIWNs are being examined as a group of organizations that could represent a particular 'voice' in the dialogue on policy formation. This research does not suppose that they are, or should be the only 'voice' represented in the public participation. An exclusive consultation with MIWNs is more an advisory position to GOI than it is a public consultation.

⁴ The 'power to define' is the power to define the dialogue and definition of what is desired, normal, acceptable, etc. It is having the ability to influence how events are perceived. Much of our history has been recorded from a male perspective, it has been 'defined' by male experiences and male perceptions. Feminism seeks to redistribute power to include women in the dialogue to define, in this case, the development of policies affecting them.

⁵ I do not mean to imply that social change, particularly in the area of women's position in society, is propelled by exogenous forces. It should be recognized that with the recent shift to economic development, Indonesia has been opened to more exogenous trends and social debates.

⁶ Shulamit Reinharz presents a discussion and samples of feminist research in her book Feminist Methods in Social Research (1992)

⁷ The Harvard Analytical model is the most widely recognized and accepted gender sensitive planning tool that has been developed out of the gender theory on which this research is based.

⁸ This 'organic' approach was developed out of necessity, but proved to be a very effective means of identifying locations of WID activity. The paucity of information on the relationship of WID activities made identification of potential interview candidates almost impossible. By gaining a personal introduction from one interviewee to the next, I was able to foster an interview environment which was more open than that possible had I approached organizations as a researcher requesting an interview. Interviewees provided names of people who were, in their opinion and now in mine, actively involved and personally dedicated. They were able to provide knowledgeable and insightful comments on the subject, both pro and con. Had I arranged interviews through the organizations themselves I would have found myself interviewing a carefully selected and prepared representative who would report the government approved version. This did happen in one case when the individual who agreed to be interviewed was intercepted by the organization's external correspondent.

2.0 SITUATING WOMEN IN THE INDONESIAN CONTEXT

This chapter provides the situational background of women in Indonesia. It is in keeping with the holistic, feminist research approach. The historic and situational information presented in the sections below provides a background for the next dimension, institutional framework, covered in Chapter Three. This chapter addresses the first dimension, the women of Indonesia whose participation would be channeled into policy and program development by MIWNs.

Policies formed in isolation from the context in which they will operate are likely to be unsuccessful. If policies relating to the role of women are created without a clear picture of women's condition and situation, women's strategic gender interests are not likely to be met because the policies were not informed by a comprehensive understanding of women's reality. This need for an understanding of context to policy formation can be partly met through public participation in policy formation and decision making¹.

The value of public participation is a normative assumption, consistent with the gender theory used in this research. As a student and as a development planner, I believe that public participation is a fundamental requirement for sustainable development. Participation in policy formation is as appropriate to the Indonesian situation as it is everywhere. Countries such as Canada have formally recognized the legitimacy and value of public participation, as have international institutions such as the United Nations². Stakeholder input gathered through such participation can provide information and perspectives not available through bureaucratic channels; it can provide life experience. Public participation has benefits other than potential improvements in the quality of policies produced. Opening the process of policy formation to public

involvement increases citizen's control of policies and can improve accountability of officials to the public with regards to the policy areas. Potential benefits to participants are discussed in Chapter Four.

The aim of this research is to determine whether or not Indonesian women's NGOs are a suitable conduit for public participation into the process of policy and program development related to women. This chapter explores the context of women's historic experience in Indonesia, and provides an image of women's current position and condition in Indonesian society through the use of statistical data and literature review. This information is relevant to understanding if women would be willing and / or interested in having their views represented by MIWNs (to influence policy formation).

The following sections provide: a brief description of women in Indonesia; cultural perceptions of women; and a history of the experiences of women's organizations in Indonesia. This information builds the context for the formation of policies relating to women. It represents one aspect of the holistic approach that is a trademark of feminist research. Later chapters will explore the legislative contexts, characteristics of NGOs, and the range of activities currently being carried out which relate to enhancing women's position.

2.1 Women in Indonesia Today

Under Indonesia's 1945 Constitution, women were granted equal rights with men, but "[w]omen are not yet fully integrated into the development process in Indonesia. This condition persists in spite of equity before the law." (ADB, 1991, p 48). Equality in principle does not ensure equality in practice. The effective implementation of equality

legislation is hampered by a number of factors including the resistance of tradition and custom to change. In the Indonesian experience, equity legislation has had an impact on women's position. Women obtained the right to vote at the time of independence (Kallgren, 1980, p 21), and exercised this right in the first national election held in 1955.

Conversely, some legislation aimed at improving women's position in society has fallen short of more progressive expectations. For instance, the new marriage law introduced in 1974, did not fully meet women's demand for the abolition of polygamy (Wieringa, 1985, p 103). The development of a new marriage law, ostensibly one that would abolish polygamy, was a driving force on the women's side of the revolutionary struggle. Women wanted to be free not only of Dutch colonialism, but also wanted to be equals in their own country.

Indonesian women experience a contradiction with regards to their equality. Traditionally, they exercise a high degree of control with regards to intra-household resource allocation and decision making. Women are traditionally involved in financial management within and outside the household. Women's power in these spheres enhances their position in society, but they are still limited to traditional spheres. Women are not limited to the reproductive sphere, but nor are they experiencing equality and equal access to all spheres in the public and private domains.

Section 2.1 explores the situation of women in Indonesian society, using statistics to present a picture of their condition. The four areas included in this section are: demographics, marital status, education, and employment. These sections are designed to provide an overall picture, not a detailed discussion. In depth examination

of specific factors would be required to adequately inform policy and development planning.

Much of the information used in this section is drawn from Government of Indonesia statistical publications. The statistics produced by Biro Pusat Statistik (BPS) are regarded as reasonably accurate. No reason to suspect manipulation of the data was encountered during research. However, restriction in number of categories and the wording of survey questions may yield biased or distorted results. In the case of employment statistics, official figures cannot accurately represent informal sector employment and thus the apparent results are incomplete and may indicate a higher number of women as non-working. Another example is literacy statistics that do not capture literacy in all languages used in Indonesia, hence skewing the results towards a higher level of illiteracy³.

This research is not able to correct for these distortions, or assess the scale of distortion, therefore the official figures will be used. Though the statistics may not be exact in some areas, they are sufficient to provide the level of representation required for the purpose of this chapter, which is to present an image of women's position and condition in Indonesian society. It may also be assumed that where distortion exists, they are of similar magnitude for both men and women. By making this assumption, errors of classification will not effect the statistics for women relative to men.

"...the economic, sociological, and political fact that most women the world over have been relegated to their own separate "women's world", and while they have often been powerful in that realm, for the most part they have been excluded - at high cost to their societies - from the mainstream of economic and political power as well as from the decision-making process." (Wilner, 1980, p 2)

2.1.1 Demographics

According to the 1992 national census conducted by the BPS in 1992, women represent 50.3% of the Indonesian population. As shown in Figure No. 2.1 below, there are slightly more males in the age range 0-4 years and 5-24 years. This reverses after the age of 25, with women constituting a larger percentage of the population.

Figure No. 2.1: AGE DISTRIBUTION OF POPULATION BY SEX (1992)

Source: Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p.p. 12-13

Indonesia's population profile is considered to represent a healthy age distribution, with the bulk of its population being in the most productive stage (ie of working age). Figure No. 2.1 shows Indonesia's population distribution as an almost normal distribution curve. It is uni-modal, its peak occurring in the 5-24 yr. group. The curve tapers off at both ends. The small number of young children⁴ is likely a product of Indonesia's successful population control program, which encourages families to have only two children. The sharp decline after age 54 reflects Indonesia's life expectancy of 61.5⁵ years (UNDP, 1991, p 127). A break down by province and age group is provided in Appendix A.

2.1.2 Marital Status

The population distribution by marital status is presented in Table No. 2.1. According to these statistics women marry at an earlier age than men, with 3% of women and 0.29% of men aged 15-19 years married. This difference continues in the 20-29 years age group for single men where 15.08% of men are single versus only 9.87% of women. The difference in marriage rates between men and women in the younger age groups reflects government policy that limits the minimum age at which an individual can marry. The age is two years higher for men than it is for women. Another significant difference between the sexes appears in the divorce statistics. Young women are more than three times as likely to be divorced as compared to young men in the 15-19 years age group.

Table No. 2.1: Population Distribution by Age Group, Sex, and Marital Status (1992)

AGE GROUP	SINGLE		MARRIED		DIVORCED		WIDOWED	
	FEMALE	MALE	FEMALE	MALE	FEMALE	MALE	FEMALE	MALE
< 14 yr.	70.50%	64.29%	0.03%	0.10%		0.58%		0.27%
15 - 19 yr.	18.08%	18.87%	3.00%	0.29%	4.23%	1.31%	0.02%	0.13%
20-29 yr.	9.87%	15.08%	29.96%	16.64%	25.13%	30.79%	1.54%	2.04%
30 - 39 yr.	0.97%	1.38%	30.45%	31.49%	23.70%	25.49%	4.67%	5.75%
40 - 49 yr.	0.28%	0.23%	18.73%	21.83%	16.81%	16.97%	12.15%	11.31%
50 - 54 yr.	0.13%	0.04%	7.14%	9.63%	8.69%	7.21%	12.79%	10.41%
55 - 64 yr.	0.10%	0.07%	7.72%	12.27%	12.89%	9.01%	30.78%	24.70%
65+ yr.	0.07%	0.04%	2.70%	7.75%	8.55%	8.64%	38.08%	45.39%

Source: Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 23

2.1.3 Education

Education is a powerful asset for any individual. For women it is also a tool for emancipation. Much of women's advancement in employment depends on their ability to obtain education and training. As will be discussed, women have experienced success in obtaining skilled positions in the public service. Though this opportunity may

have derived from a shortage of trained individuals initially; it set a precedent for inclusion of women in higher levels of the public service.

The importance of improving women's access to education / education level is recognized in the GBHN and Repelita. Specific strategies exist which are aimed at improving women's education. The current status of women's educational attainment is presented in the following two tables, Table No. 2.2 and Table No. 2.3, which present statistics on literacy and educational attainment, by sex, of the Indonesian population ten years old and older.

Eliminating illiteracy was identified as the first policy objective in Repelita VI for enhancing the role of women. Chapter Three presents Repelita VI's policy objectives. The first point identifies, "Improving the educational level of women, as shown by decreasing the number of illiterate women" as a policy objective. A study of illiteracy rates is included to provide insight into women's education level. Women's illiteracy is consistently higher than that of men. The spatial-temporal distribution of illiteracy between men and women, as demonstrated by the ratio of illiterate men to illiterate women is fairly constant (i.e.: between urban and rural, and between 1990 and 1992).

The average ratio is 1:2.17⁶. The lowest ratio of male to female illiterates, 1:1.94, occurs during the 1990 census in the rural area. The greatest disparity, 1:2.8, occurs in 1990 in the urban area. This finding is counter intuitive as one would normally expect the illiteracy ratio to be greater in the rural area. Evidently, the distinction between men's and women's education is less pronounced in the rural areas. This is probably attributable to the predominance of male and female participation in agricultural

production. In 1992 there were 22,842,843 illiterates⁷; of these, 15,381,928 were women. The overall illiteracy rate for the population ten years of age and over was 16.06% in 1992.

Table No. 2.2: Percentage Population 10+Yrs Illiterate

	<u>URBAN</u>		<u>RURAL</u>		<u>NATIONAL</u>	
	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male
1990 ^a	11.42	4.09	25.92	13.35	21.31	10.39
1992 ^b	11.67	5.21	26.18	13.32	21.34	10.64
RATIO	'90/1:2.8	'92/1:2.24	'90/1:1.94	'92/1:1.96	'90/1:2.05	1:2.01

Source: a) Biro Pusat Statistik, 1992, p 56, b) Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 80

The second aspect of education examined is the educational attainment of the population ten years of age and over. The percentage of female and male educational attainment for the years 1990 and 1992 are presented in Table No. 2.3 below. The difference in education by sex is less significant than the difference in literacy. The figures below indicate that women are less likely than men to achieve post-secondary education. At the primary education level, the number of males in excess of females is 8.1% of the number of females. At the university level, the number of males exceeds females by 77.5%. This demonstrates a rapid decline in women's access to education, relative to men.

The decision to have female children continue their education is influenced by the construction of the concept of 'woman' in society. There are also non-gendered factors that influence educational attainment. As noted previously, in rural areas, education is frequently foregone for participation in agricultural production. Where there is a strong emphasis on the need for women to share in domestic labour, in preparation for an early marriage, women are less likely to continue schooling. Women's triple role means that

there are more factors competing with education for women's time than there are for men. Marriage and children are significant factors in women's decision whether or not to remain in school, especially at the higher levels of education.

Table No. 2.3: Educational Attainment Of Population 10+Yrs (%)

	<u>Incomplete</u>		<u>Primary</u>		<u>Junior High</u>		<u>Senior High</u>		<u>University</u>	
	Fem	Male	Fem	Male	Fem	Male	Fem	Male	Fem	Male
1990 ^a	52.90	42.40	28.97	31.78	9.41	12.07	7.68	11.75	1.03	2.00
1992 ^b	54.33	44.54	27.40	30.44	9.21	11.53	7.88	11.51	1.08	1.97
	+1.43	+2.14	-1.57	-1.34	-0.2	-0.54	+0.2	-0.24	+0.05	-0.03

Source: Biro Pusat Statistik, 1992, p 61, Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 80

2.1.4 Employment

Employment statistics can be used by researchers as a starting point to understanding women's experience of employment. The quantitative analysis conducted on statistics should then be supplemented by qualitative analysis, which requires the application of more non-traditional feminist research methods⁸. This enables the researcher to uncover the living relationship of influencing factors through a sample of individual experiences. Qualitative analysis can greatly expand upon the information provided by quantitative analysis. This section is limited to quantitative analysis, but goes beyond identification of statistical traits. It raises questions about what socio-economic or political factors may be producing the results. Qualitative analysis could test the validity of assumptions, and uncover the interrelation of influencing factors.

Women constitute a significant proportion of Indonesia's public service. The number of women versus men by government department is presented in Appendix B. Women public servants are concentrated in departments responsible for issues more traditionally linked to women's role. The department with the highest percent of women

staff is the Department of Health with 54.21%, while the Department of Education & Culture has the largest number of women staff members at 651,508. The Department of BAKIN has the lowest percentage of women at 0.74%, and DEWAN TELKOM has the smallest number of women staff members at 2.

Figure No. 2.2: % Distribution of Male Versus Female Public Servants by Rank (1992)

Source: adapted from Biro Pusat Statistik, 1992, p 37

The distribution of civil servants by sex is presented in Appendix C, and summarized in Figure No. 2.2 above. As may be observed, the overall number of women public servants is lower at every level. Women have a unimodal distribution, peaking at the II/A level, whereas men dominate at the upper and lower ends of the rank scale.

Public service jobs account for a small percentage of women's employment. Building a picture of where women work requires looking at the different sectors. Knowing where women work, and what constraints they face in their employment is useful in policy formation. Working women are subject to restriction that men are not, and as such are not able to seek, or find employment in some sectors which men can work in. They are

restricted in the hours they are permitted to work and the industries in which they can be employed (Int. 14).

Table No. 2.4 depicts the distribution of men and women in three employment sectors. The first two rows show the difference between urban and rural work forces. Agricultural production dominates in the rural area, accounting for over 66% of both male and female workers. The opposite situation exists in the urban sector where the large majority of workers are employed in the tertiary sector. The distribution of men and women by sector is almost identical in the rural area. In the urban area, 10% more women than men work in the tertiary sector, and 7% more men than women work in the secondary sector. This difference is likely created by traditional gender roles which would encourage women's employment in the service oriented tertiary sector, and men's employment in the production oriented secondary sector.

The bottom rows of Table No. 2.4 compare the overall distribution of men and women by sector at a three-year interval. This information demonstrates how men versus women are concentrated by sector of employment. The comparison of data from 1990 and 1993 shows how employment patterns have changed over time, but unfortunately cannot be tied to the success or failure of specific programs. The third aspect demonstrated by this table is the effect location has on the gender distribution of employment.

Examination of the figures indicates that during the three year period between surveys, little change in distribution by sector has been observed. The gap between male and female employment in the primary and tertiary sectors has narrowed slightly, while it has

increased marginally in the secondary sector. These changes are not sufficient to indicate a change in gender roles and are more likely the result of sampling error.

Table No. 2.4: Spatial-Temporal Distribution of Employment by Gender and Sector

	PRIMARY SECTOR⁹		SECONDARY SECTOR¹⁰		TERTIARY SECTOR¹¹	
	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male
Urban ('93)	9.6%	11.66%	20.29%	27.55%	70.11%	60.79%
Rural ('93)	66.2%	66.52%	11.54%	12.53%	22.26%	20.95%
Total ('90)	49.61%	50.85%	15.37%	17.66%	35.01%	31.49%
Total ('93)	50.95%	50.34%	13.90%	16.97%	35.15%	32.69%

Source: Biro Pusat Statistik, 1992, p 24 and Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 35

Table No. 2.5 below shows the monthly incomes of men and women by level of education. These figures highlight the continued impact of gender on women's relation to waged employment, after obtaining education and finding employment. Women are not considered to be breadwinners in their family, and therefore do not receive the same wages or benefits as their male coworkers (Int. 14). GOI has however implemented pay equity policies to counteract the observed unequal pay for equal work based on sex. The legislation has not been in place long enough to be assessed as having achieved success or failure.

Table No. 2.5: Average Monthly Income by Level of Education (Rp.)

EDUCATION	FEMALE	MALE	RATIO (M:F)
No Education	35,734	70,842	1:0.5
> Primary	39,038	74,019	1:0.53
Primary	47,281	86,435	1:0.55
Vocational Junior High	85,810	124,448	1:0.69
General Junior High	71,407	111,476	1:0.64
Vocational Senior High	117,031	148,104	1:0.79
General Senior High	118,788	151,830	1:0.78
Diploma	338,269	444,738	1:0.76

Source: Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 63

Raw data on salaries paid to men and women in the same job were not available, so level of education is substituted for type of job. This makes the implicit assumption that men and women of equal education will obtain equivalent employment. This is not likely the case; women will be restricted in their ability to gain higher paying jobs. Wage discrepancies identified in Table No. 2.5 may represent a difference in type of jobs available to women, as opposed to women receiving less than their male counterparts for the same job. Ascertaining the correct weight to assign to these two factors is not feasible with the available information¹².

Trend analysis of the income ratios reveals an inverse relationship between income gap and level of education. The ratios calculated reveal that in the lower education classes, the income gap is around 50%, while women earn roughly 75% of men's income at higher levels of education. Making a calculation based solely on these ratios would overstate the average income of women, relative to men. In the highest three levels of education, there are likely to be at least twice the number of male employees.

2.2 Construction of Women in Indonesian Society

Women's position in society is largely dictated by their socially ascribed gender roles, which are defined as being different from their biological roles which are linked to being male or female. Gender roles are dynamic social constructions that are influenced by local, national, and international socio-economic factors. Until recently, the impact of extraneous factors on the evolution of Indonesian women's gender role has been reduced by the nation's closed cultural climate.

The past decade has produced a shift in perception of women's issues, and of women's awareness of how these issues affect them. Women are increasingly willing to discuss issues that were previously socially unacceptable (Int. 28). The changes in Indonesia's national dialogue may be partially explained by the increased penetration of international discourses into the mainstream of Indonesian dialogue. For example, the current push for industrialization called for under the official development plan has also permitted the entrance of foreign ideas and discourses. The fact that Indonesians are increasingly being exposed to international debates and influences is neither inherently good nor bad, but it does have an effect on national discourses as evidenced by changes in gender perceptions and willingness to discuss issues¹³.

The study of gender relations and gender theory theory tells us that women and men live under different rules and are expected to operate in different, though not mutually exclusive, spheres. This double standard is seen by some to limit the potential of many women around the world. The gender roles which define the standards are products of deeply entrenched culture and tradition. Gender based discrimination has been internalized and has facilitated the exploitation of women's resources for development. Changing gender relations is complicated by this internalization which has been used to legitimize women's exploitation and inferior rights.

The internalization of women's roles in Indonesia is embodied in Julia Suryakusuma's concept of Ibuism¹⁴. In her article, "State Ibuism: The Social Construction of Womanhood in the Indonesian New Order", Julia Suryakusuma (1991) presents her concept of Ibuisation. The word 'Ibuisation' is created from the word Ibu, which means mother, but has expanded to addressing women with respect who do not have children.

The term Ibuism refers to the interaction of factors which define womanhood in the Indonesian context. A conceptual framework of these factors and their interaction is presented as Figure No. 2.3

2.2.1 Ibuism

Figure No. 2.3: State Construction of Women in Indonesia

Source: Suryakusuma, 1992, p 54

Ibuisation is shown as the exertion of state power, through five areas, to define women. State structures figure prominently in this model, as do state created concepts, such as the military's dual function, wife's associations, and the state as a guide in social values. State Ibuism is defined as, "the ideology imbued in government rhetoric and in many government programs for women" (Suryakusuma, 1991, p 46). The state structure in Indonesia is strong, and has the potential to influence the social construction of women, and thereby their position in society.

The concepts and ideas that compose State Ibuisation come from all areas of life. Assumptions made by government about what women's role should be, are reflected in policies addressing the enhancement of women's role. The policies contained a reproductive emphasis, and stress a productive requirement for women to become active participants in the national economy and contributors to its economic prosperity.

2.2.2 Raden Adjent Kartini

Discussion of Indonesian women's identity would be incomplete without reference to Raden Adjent Kartini, the woman celebrated as the ideological founder of the women's movement in Indonesia. Modern day interpretations of Kartini, and the government's use of Kartini, give rise to conflict over the appropriate goals of a women's movement in Indonesia.

Kartini (1879-1904) was a Javanese princess¹⁵ widely recognized as the initiator of the women's movement for equal education, freedom of choice and independence. Her vision of change for women became widely known through the posthumous publication of letters she wrote, mostly to acquaintances in Holland. Today, the government of

Indonesia uses her name, and a selective representation of her vision of women, to direct¹⁶ current activities and programs for women.

For the most part, the literature and interviewees agree that Kartini's life and her letters were instrumental in raising Indonesian women's consciousness regarding their position in society and the restrictions they faced (Doran, 1987; Douglas, 1980; Geertz, 1964; Hull, 1982). Controversy exists over what Kartini's vision for women was, and it must also be viewed in the context of her time. While her name is used by some to represent progressive thinking of women, Kartini's vision did not directly challenge the status-quo of her day.

In one view, the purpose of higher education in Kartini's philosophy was to enable a women to better fulfill her role as wife and mother. In Kartini's thinking, women's goals were to, "make them more capable of fulfilling the great task which Mother Nature has entrusted to them: mother" (Hull, 1982, p 121). She envisioned women improving themselves to become better companions to their husbands, not to raise their position and challenge that of men. This is how GOI presents her goals.

The goal of becoming better companions to men is a safe image around which to encourage the development of women's organizations. It does not threaten traditional male privilege or advocate a radical redistribution of power or resources. It can improve women's condition, but will do little or nothing to improve their position within the social structure. In GAD terminology, women's practical gender interests are being met, but not their strategic gender interests.

GOI depicts Kartini's 'feminist' views as a product of western¹⁷ influence, but the image invoked ignores 'leftist' aspects of her visions and has been used to counter progressive-women's rights advocates. Literature reviewed for this research contains a range of different representations of Kartini, her goals and her beliefs. GOI's image focuses on aspects that reinforce a traditional role for women, allowing the more radical aspects to be lost to the pages of history. In this manner, GOI gains another degree of control over the direction of women's organizations.

The vision created by Kartini, and the version of it promoted by GOI, has a distinct class bias. Due to her status as a *priyayi* woman, Kartini was primarily interested in other women of her elevated social standing. The women's movements attributed to Kartini's influence tend to be dominated by the perception of an elite class. This perception results in the adoption of goals that are unresponsive to the reality of poor women, and has resulted in an emphasis on improving women's role as wife and mother (Hull, 1982; Robinson, 1987; Wieringa, 1985; Doran, 1987).

There is no doubt that Kartini's thinking, or its modern day representation, has led to important changes and is at least symbolically recognized in Indonesia. Kartini's vision is preserved in the Kartini Schools for Girls established in 1912 to provide the education Kartini felt was essential for upper-class Javanese women. An annual contest is held to select the Indonesian women who most resembles Kartini (Wieringa, nd, p 6). The desired resemblance is superficial and does not extend to the revolutionary character of her thinking, much as the government's use of her image and vision is merely a superficial resemblance.

What is remembered of Kartini appears to be carefully tailored to support the current aims of the government. By presenting Kartini as a national heroine, the government is effectively setting the agenda and goals of women, by providing them with a non-controversial, non-revolutionary model to follow. Kartini may have been enlightened in her day, but now her image is invoked as a convenient and conservative figure. GOI's portrayal of Kartini has manipulated her beliefs and subverted them to reinforce the social norms they wish to propagate.

2.2.3 *Hari Ibu*

"In honour of the women of Indonesia, Presidential Decree No. 316, 1959, recognized the 22nd of December as 'Hari Ibu', Indonesian Women's Day, a National Day to be observed throughout the Country."
(KOWANI, 1993)

Hari Ibu is the only national women's holiday. Its literal translation is 'Mother's Day'. Under the New Order Government, its symbolism has been reduced to women's reproductive role as mothers, at the exclusion of the political, participation and public issues aspect of the 1928 congress which it is intended to honour (Int. 14). This day serves as a reinforcement of women's reproductive role. It celebrates women as mothers, not women as advocates for change.

Many progressive women's groups do not support Hari Ibu. It is perceived to be elite and urban based by the majority rural, working women (Int. 12). Some interpret the government's portrayal of women, and the image reinforced by Hari Ibu to be stagnant, if not counter-productive to the goal of improving women's position. During the 1994 celebration of Hari Ibu, some 100 women spoke out against what the day has come to symbolize (Int. 15).

Celebration of International Women's Day, March 8, is discouraged by GOI. GOI upholds the view that International Women's Day is a Western imposition, of no relevance to Indonesians (Int. 15). A small number of independent women's NGOs celebrated the day in 1995, an action which was publicly denounced by UPW (Int. 14). March 8 and December 22 have very little in common. Both days celebrate women, but each has a distinct agenda. The Indonesian version is carefully orchestrated not to raise controversy, and to generate support for the desired image of the Indonesian woman.

2.3 1965, Women's Organizations and the Parti Kommunist Indonesia

A significant aspect of the history of women's organizations in Indonesia is GERWANI, its goals, and its demise. This aspect of Indonesia's history remains influential today, due to the effect it had on perceptions of women's 'proper' place. The vision of GERWANI created by the military made improper the advocating for changes in women's identity by grass-roots women's organization. GERWANI's experience has also been used by GOI to enhance its influence over the operation of current women's groups.

This section covers three areas related to GERWANI, and its impact on current women's organizations. The first section provides an overview of what the organization was. The failed coup of 1965, and GERWANI's alleged involvement are presented in Section 2.3.2. Finally, Section 2.5.3 presents a look at the impact of 1965 on current women's NGOs.

2.3.1 GERWANI

GERWANI was a revolutionary women's organization that strove for women's emancipation. By some reports, it was the largest women's organization in the history of Indonesia with a membership exceeding 1.5 million prior to its dissolution (Wieringa, nd, p 23). Critics claim that these figures have been inflated to give more emphasis and importance to the organization (Douglas, 1980).

GERWANI is no longer in existence. Its dissolution was the result of military retaliation following the coup attempt of 1965. Women, who were members of GERWANI were accused of the ritualistic mutilation and murder of army officials in what has come to be known as the September 30th Movement¹⁸. There exist few references to GERWANI within Indonesia today, so complete has been the military campaign to erase its existence.

GERWANI's status regarding the communist party PKI raises some controversy. Some reviews of women's organizations claim that GERWANI was the women's wing of PKI (Douglas, 1980). Others claim that GERWANI's activities were often related to those of PKI, but that no formal link existed between the two organizations (Wieringa, 1985 & Doran, 1987). The goals of GERWANI were of a 'left' nature in that they focused on grassroots activities to help lower class and rural women. GERWANI "fought for a transformation of society, and for women to be active and vocal members of that society" (Wieringa, 1985, p 107).

Their programs differed from those of current women's organizations in that they addressed women's daily needs and were not class biased. Despite the noticeable lack

of historic reference to the organization, GERWANI appears to have provided services to a vast number of women and consisted of a large membership (Wieringa, nd). Its rapid and complete erasure stands as a strong warning to any persons or organizations trying to resurrect it, or form a new pro-active mass-women's organization.

Government policies on forming organizations, acting in the rural areas, and meeting in groups, virtually preclude GERWANI's resurrection. An organization such as GERWANI would find opposition from a number of directions in Indonesia today. Some of the most powerful groups in Indonesia consist of GOI, ABRI, and Islam, none of whom would welcome the resurrection of GERWANI. Large women's organizations exist in Indonesia today, but they bear little resemblance to GERWANI, in structure or mandate. As will be discussed in the following chapters, these large women's organizations have strong links to the government. One, the Family Welfare Movement (PKK), is the only organization permitted to operate in the rural areas.

2.3.2 1965 Coup

The end of GERWANI was precipitated by the events of September 30, 1965. The official story spread by the military is that six generals were tortured and ritualistically slaughtered by young female members of GERWANI (Wieringa, 1985; Doran, 1987; Douglas, 1980).

"[A] contingent of specially trained young women from GERWANI participated in the assassination of six of the top generals of the Indonesian army...In the eyes of the Indonesian public, however, GERWANI was firmly associated with the murders, and perhaps worse, the torture and humiliation of the generals before their deaths."
(Douglas, 1980, p 169)

There is disagreement in the literature over the true proponents of the coup. The military called it an attempted Communist coup, as did much of the world. The Cornell Paper suggests that it was an intra-military reshuffling (Schwarz, 1994). Others suggest the involvement of the CIA as an extension of the cold war, in an effort to block the expansion of communism (Wieringa, 1985 & Schwarz, 1994). This paper's purpose does not include debating the events of that evening. Whatever the true motivation for the coup, its impact on current social structures and government remain. It is these factors that are of relevance to this research and the efforts to enhance the role of women, because of the effect it has on perceptions of non-governmental organizations and on civil society.

An undisputed fact is that the retaliation following the coup brought about one of the most violent periods of destruction in the 20th century. During the two-years following the coup, an estimated 750,000 Indonesian's were executed and tens of thousands arrested and detained without trial. Individuals known to have been members of GERWANI were amongst those targeted in the post-coup purge. Indonesians still vividly remember the post-coup retaliation against GERWANI and no mass women's groups have evolved to replace GERWANI (Doran, 1987; DeGroot, nd; Wieringa, 1985).

"The memory of GERWANI has been virtually wiped out in the official history of the Indonesian women's movement, and it is still very dangerous for an ex-member to admit publicly that she participated in any GERWANI activity. The end of Indonesia's largest women's organization was sudden, swift, and unexpected indeed." (Wieringa, nd, p 27)

Associating GERWANI not only with murder, but more specifically the manner in which the murders were committed, increased public rejection of the organization. Honour is very important in Indonesian society, and GERWANI's alleged humiliation of the

generals before their murder was un-Indonesian, a perversion of what is pure and good. Because of this cultural characteristic, the crime GERWANI members were accused of was particularly damaging to that organization and to subsequent pro-active women's organizations. Many people today believe what the government says about GERWANI's involvement in the 1965 coup attempt. This turns people against women's NGOs that are not 'controlled' by the government (Int. 15). During all my research, I have been unable to determine whether GERWANI was or was not involved in the coup.

Government influenced organizations such as KOWANI, the PKK, Dharma Wanita, and Dharma Pertiwi are seen as 'proper' women's organization who's goals are socially acceptable and morally sound. These are the only 'non-governmental' organizations recognized as mechanisms for enhancing the role of women in national development. KOWANI, which is an umbrella organization including some Dharma groups, is the only NGO included in government consultations (see Chapter Five). Under the New Order, the recognized women's organizations have come to resemble arms of the government. These organizations are perceived by some as being class-biased and ineffective in addressing women's needs (Ints 1, 7, 8, 12, 15).

2.4 Conclusions

This chapter explored women's objective condition in Indonesian society through statistics in the following areas: marital status; employment; educational attainment; illiteracy monthly income; and sector of employment. The statistics demonstrate that women lag behind men in education, literacy, salaries, and marry at a younger age. As will be explored in the next chapter, GOI develops policies in the Repelita aimed at enhancing the role of women in national development. The policies do not however

meet the needs of all Indonesian women. This is why I see a role for MIWNs as conduits for public participation into the formation of these policies.

A conference held in Bandung, hosted by the Institut Teknologi Bandung and York University included a summary of women's condition in four areas (education, health, employment and socio-cultural). The summary is as follows:

- A) Data on education at the macro level has shown that 15.7 million, or two-thirds of the 23 million "illiterates" are women. Female enrollment in post primary education is lower as compared to male enrollment, namely 39.5% as compared to 60.6% at the junior high school level, and 36.2% compare to 63.8% at all senior high school levels. As far as university enrollment is concerned, it is composed of 32.6% females as compared to 67.4% male students. Another issue of concern is the low participation of women in "Science and Technology",
- B) In the area of health and nutrition, the condition of women is till far from satisfactory. Maternal mortality is still high. It is estimated that there are 400-450 deaths per 100,000 live births for the country as a whole, which is equal to about 20,000 deaths per year. For Maluku, West Kalimantan and West Nusa Tenggara, respectively, the relevant estimates are 490, 530, and 780 deaths per 100,000 live births,
- C) Employment opportunity is one of the major challenges for the future. In 1988, the female labour force represented 37.4% of the total labour force and this number is expected to reach 40.2% towards the end of Repelita V (1994). While the absolute number of females in the labour force has increased, their status as well as their productivity and their salaries are low;

and their health, welfare, as well as their working conditions need to be improved and;

- D) There are a number of socio-cultural and traditional values which are not supportive to the advancement of women. One problem which is closely related to socio-cultural values is the problem of early marriage. A situation analysis reveals that in 29.7% of marriages in the urban areas and 37.5% of those in the rural areas, women are married at the age of 16 or lower¹⁹. (Kettle, 1992, p 22)

Post-coup events and perception remain a factor in determining the nature of the relationship between non-governmental organizations and GOI, as well as public perceptions and acceptance of non-governmental organizations. These relationships will be covered in later chapters, along with the legal framework in which Indonesian NGOs operate. This chapter provided some background to increase our understanding and awareness of the historic factors that contribute to shaping the NGO reality today.

Fear of another uprising provides legitimization for the strong government stance on mass organization, and perceptions of GERWANI's (as a women's NGO) involvement has created an atmosphere in which women's organizations appear to require some sort of connection with government to be accepted as 'proper' (Gender and Democracy, 1992). Some of the more prominent women's organizations (i.e.: KOWANI and members) are being made into policy implementers, partially through manipulation of history. Because of their close ties to GOI, these organizations are not able to provide the same type of input that MIWNs could.

¹ Another aspect concerning potential success of public participation is whether GOI policy is likely to address strategic gender interests. Because GOI has already made a strong commitment to "enhancing the role of women in national development" I am making the assumption that there is a genuine desire to improve women's position in Indonesian society. As will be explored, in this and subsequent chapters, there exist a number of factors that work to limit changes in women's roles in society.

² Examples of NGOs participating in the United Nations events are: the Conference on Environment and Development in Rio, 1992 and the Conference on Women in Beijing, 1995.

³ By not capturing literacy in all languages used in Indonesia, individuals who are literate in a language other than those surveyed will be miscounted as illiterate. In this manner, the classification error skews the results towards a higher level of illiteracy/lower level of literacy.

⁴ It must be noted that the first cohort represents a small age range, thus giving an exaggerated image of the difference in size of the first and second cohort.

⁵ Life expectancy is the 1990 figure provided by the UNDP. Life expectancy is one area where Indonesian women exceed men, women's life expectancy is 105.9% that of men, this is reflected in the larger number of women than men in the upper end of the graph.

⁶ I am willing to accept the male:female ratio as being representative of the actual situation on the assumption that the error of classification in the original survey would result in the same distortion for both men and women. In this case, the ratio is accurate although the actual percentages may be skewed.

⁷ Number of illiterates is calculated on the basis of their being 68,352,858 women and 66,686,723 men aged 10+ yrs in 1990, the 1992 figures used are 72,080,263 and 70,121,380 respectively. These figures are taken from BPS 1992, 1993.

⁸ A useful discussion of non-traditional feminist research methods is provided in Shulamit Reinharz' *Feminist Methods in Social Research*, 1992.

⁹ The Primary Sector includes: agriculture; forestry; hunting; and fishing

¹⁰ The Secondary Sector includes: mining & quarrying; manufacturing; industry; electricity; gas; water; and construction

¹¹ The Tertiary Sector includes: wholesale trade; retail trade; restaurants; transportation; storage; communications; financing; insurance; real estate; business services; and public services

¹² If sufficiently disaggregated data were available, a regression analysis could be conducted to determine how much of the income difference is created by job entry restriction versus income discrimination.

¹³ By saying that exogenous ideas are influencing national dialogue on women, I am not implying that they are the only force which is acting to bring about change, but it is one factor.

¹⁴ Julia Suryakusuma, in her work "State Ibuism: The Social Construction of Womanhood in the Indonesian New Order", discusses the term 'Ibuisim' which derives from the term Ibu which is the Indonesian equivalent of the english Mrs., and the literal translation of which is mother.

¹⁵ Although the title Princess is the literal translation of Kartini's title, her father was not a sovereign. He was a highly-placed administrator in the Dutch colonial regime. The area from which he drew his title was not under his control in the manner of a monarch, but more as a governor. The family did belong to the traditional Javanese elite, *priyayi*.

¹⁶ GOI's portrayal of Kartini and use of her name are fairly subtle, exerting influence at the ideological level, not policy level.

¹⁷ To GOI, 'western' influence connotes something which is un-Indonesian and a threat to Indonesian cultural identity. Western ideas are portrayed as inappropriate for Indonesia. In the matter of human rights, President Suharto uses the argument of cultural relativism to deflect criticism of Indonesia's treatment of human rights, particularly in regards to Timor Timur.

¹⁸ Two pieces written by Saskia Wieringa, Ibu or the Beast: Gender Interests in Two Indonesian Women's Organizations and "The Perfumed Nightmare: Women's Organizations After 1950" provide a good description of Gerwani's purpose, function and demise.

¹⁹ The legal age for marriage is two years younger for women (16) than it is for men.

3.0 GOVERNMENT CONTEXT

The previous chapter presented an overview of women's position in Indonesian society, showing where women lag behind men in employment, education, literacy, and wages. The existence of such disparities indicates that further efforts will be required to eliminate these forms of gender based discrepancies. The existence of gender based discrepancies does not indicate that the governing body, or development agencies are blind to the challenges faced by women; it indicates that there is a need to address gender based issues. Indonesia has developed institutional and policy mechanisms to address their goal of 'enhancing the role of women in national development'.

As will be explored in this chapter, the Government of Indonesia (GOI) is aware of the need to address gender based disparities, and has taken steps to do so. Specifically, this chapter will explore the formation of the State Ministry for the Role of Women (UPW) and the inclusion of a women specific section in the Broad Guidelines on State Policy (GBHN) which is used as the basis of the country's five-year development plans (Repelita). The process by which GBHN and Repelita's are created will be covered, but the consultation mechanism is explored in Chapter Five.

Understanding the institutional and policy frameworks in which policies and projects aimed at helping women are formed will assist in assessing the potential of MIWNs as conduits for public participation into the formulation of policies and programs (either as part of or in addition to the frameworks presented here within). The government context is one of the three contexts explored in this research that will influence the viability of MIWNs role as conduits for public participation. The context of women's situation was

the subject of Chapter Two and the NGO context will be covered in Chapters Five and Six.

This chapter covers the institutional framework designed by GOI for addressing their goal of enhancing the role of women in national development, and the policy framework into which MIWNs would be providing input. It also contains a discussion of UPW, as the major mechanism that could play a coordinating role if MIWNs were to be involved in GOI's addressing women's issues. UPW's strengths and weaknesses, as well as its sometimes vague role¹ are relevant to the potential for incorporating public participation into policy formation (beyond the consultations currently held with KOWANI as described in Chapter Five) and are explored in this chapter.

3.1 Ideological Context: GOI, Culture and GAD

"This special status...is in reality a double edged sword because it is obtained at the expense of a tightening of the shackles that tie Indonesian women to an exploitative ideological and social structure."
(Gender & Democracy, 1992, p 19)

As a student of women and development I use the Gender and Development (GAD) paradigm, the major thrust of which is that women's issues are not 'women's' issues. They are gender issues and need to be kept in the mainstream of development and policy formation, addressed in planning from the first stages. According to GAD, gender issues should not be treated as separate 'add-ons' to development. My use of the GAD paradigm influences the manner in which I interpret GOI's efforts to enhance the role of women. GOI's mechanisms and frameworks reflect the Women in Development (WID) paradigm in the way they separate women's issues from the main body of policy, and

UPW from the line ministries. Policies developed using WID are not intrinsically ineffective, just as those using GAD are not intrinsically effective.

The Indonesian government's approach to addressing women's needs in national development planning is to constitute them as a special target group, or 'interest group' (Douglas, 1980; Robinson, 1987; Papanek, 1983). Separating 'women's' issues out of the mainstream of development planning risks marginalizing women's strategic gender interests by making them add-on criteria. The decision to recognize women as an interest group, requiring specific and separate programs, promotes the impression that women can never truly be equal to men (Douglas, 1980). At the foundation of this assumption is the belief that women can not compete with men for positions of power or employment/educational opportunities without special consideration.

Chapter Two showed that women in fact have not achieved equality in competing against men in these areas. Mandating equality through affirmative action type programs does not address the cause of the inequality². Women are not unable to compete with men because they are inferior to men and need to be assessed by a more lenient measuring stick; they cannot compete with men because of social and cultural constraints which place them at a disadvantage. Special programs benefit women by addressing their practical needs for education, employment, and health (a.o.) in the short term. According to GAD, the long term objective should be to alter the socio-cultural factors which disadvantage women so that they can compete equally with men and will no longer require 'special' programs.

As will be covered in the next section, GOI's approach to enhancing the role of women in national development carries two contradictory messages. Women are encouraged to become active participants in the new Indonesia and its development, but are urged not to forget their *kodrat* nature as women. Although women have achieved equality in principle, they still do not experience equal status in daily life. The Indonesian Constitution and State Philosophy (Pancasila) call for Indonesia to be an egalitarian society with regards to gender. However, practice is circumscribed by cultural norms and values that continue to influence the acceptable spheres of activity for women and a focus on the home and household unit.

GOI development policies and programs target family units. The family is seen as the smallest social unit, responsible for formulating values, attitudes, and behaviour. Women are identified as the nucleus of the family, and as such they teach their children societal norms and values" (Suryakusuma, 1991). This is reflected in the 'Five Duties of Women³', two of which are to "educate and guide their children [as the next generation of Indonesians]", and to "procreate for the nation" (Papanek, 1983; Prindiville, 1989; Suryakusuma, 1991; Wieringa, 1985; Wieringa, 1988; Sullivan, 1983)

Changing women's position in Indonesian society is not uniquely dependent upon women. It requires changes in gender relationships. For this to occur, the socio-cultural climate in Indonesia needs to change. Men and women must be able to be mutually supportive in 'harmonious gender partnerships' (Int. 26). The legislative act of formulating policies and issuing development directives will never be sufficient to ensure an improvement in women's position.

Gender planning for development requires a holistic approach. Advancing the position of women within a specific context (culture) is dependent on numerous factors. Indonesia needs to develop a multi-fronted attack on discrimination against women which involves cultural values, policy, and curriculum (Int. 25). GOI has recognized this need in its approach to advancing women's position, as demonstrated by the inclusion of women's issues at multiple levels. Though a positive sign, this does not go far enough to ensure the goal is met. Universal support for, and commitment to, advancing women's position within GOI and its agencies appears to be lacking.

A shift towards increasingly pro-active gender policies raises fear amongst politicians. GOI is afraid of gender and empowerment terminology (Int. 25). Recently, the goal of policies aimed at improving women's position has been changed from 'equal partners' to 'harmonious partnerships', a less threatening concept in Indonesian society. The division between men and women is a long-standing tradition. Challenging this tradition challenges fundamental aspects of Indonesian identity.

The national slogan 'Unity in Diversity' could embrace the valuable differences between men and women as a constructive force, or it can be used to limit the pace of change⁴. Social disruption is not a sufficient reason to legitimate the unreasonable restriction of social change when it affects the human rights of half the nation's population. National unity is not the only thing perceived as being threatened by a redefinition of women's role. Other groups including religious or strongly traditional communities may see changing women's role as eroding their values and threatening their traditions.

Preservation of national unity is a valid concern, but how long can it be used to defend control exerted by government over the rate of social change? It is unrealistic to expect legislation of gender equality one day and the existence of equality the next. It is possible that a rapid transition in women's gender role would result in civil unrest.

This danger is relevant specifically to the issue of MIWNs playing a more proactive role in defining and encouraging change. The feminist nature of MIWNs draws additional suspicion from GOI and some sectors of the population because of the perceived 'foreign' or Western origins of these concepts and ideologies⁵. Religious groups in particular resist a feminist agenda that might touch on issues of women's rights in relation to men, family, and spheres of activity.

3.2 National Development Plan

The New Order in Indonesia has brought an unprecedented level of economic and structural development, all in the context of its five year development plans. Some feel that Indonesia's push for economic development and industrialization offers opportunities for women's advancement (Int. 26) while others see the industrialization process as a super-exploitation of women's human resources (Int. 14).

The 'Broad Guidelines of State Policy' (GBHN) is the instrument used to create the 5-year development plans (Repelita)⁶. Formulated once every five years by GOI, each section relates to a specific sector of national development. The preparation of each section is informed by the Ministry responsible for that sector, through the process outlined in the following section.

The development plan provides guidance for development at both the national and provincial levels and is used in the annual planning and development activities of the 27 provinces. The GBHN defines the goals of development in Indonesia as, "the creation of a just and prosperous society, equity materially and spiritually within an independent, united, sovereign and democratic nation of the Republic of Indonesia, and the achievement of security, peace, public order and a dynamic condition within the country as well as promoting friendly and peaceful relationships in the world." (UPW, 1987, p 1)

The current five-year development plan is Repelita VI, enacted in 1994/95. This plan is intended by the Indonesian Government and its various agencies to be the Take-Off point in Indonesia's evolution from traditional agrarian society to modern industrial nation. Increased emphasis on economic growth has increased the burden carried by women. It also marks a shift from a Women in Development (WID) approach to more of a Gender and Development (GAD) approach, which recognizes that improving the role and status of women is not based solely on women, but on society and changing the socio-cultural climate (Int. 26).

3.2.1 Formulation of GBHN and Repelita

The GBHN are produced every five years, and identify the policy areas the government will focus on during the following five years. The policy areas identified in the GBHN, and accepted by the President, are then used by the National Planning Agency (BAPPENAS) to create the development policies that compose the Repelita. All three official political parties have the right to submit their own version of which issues should be addressed in the GBHN (Int. 2).

Formulation of the Repelita is composed of six phases:

1. Council for State Resilience & Security studies reports submitted and produces recommendations of policy areas;
2. Team Sembilan edits and streamlines the Council's submission;
3. People's Consultative Assembly discusses the proposals and opens debate on the policy areas to be included in the GBHN which it produces;
4. BAPPENAS takes the GBHN and translates the policy areas into development policies and priorities;
5. The President reviews and submits the document to Parliament; and
6. Parliament accepts the Repelita and releases it as a Presidential decree. (Int. 2 & 3)

Each Ministry provides input into this process. During the final year of the current Repelita, the State Ministry for the Role of Women (UPW) begins reviewing the first four years to identify areas of strength and weakness. A report is prepared for submission to the planning agency which outlines: what work was done in the area of enhancing the role of women; obstacles encountered; suggestions for how the next Repelita might better address women's interests and be implemented more effectively (Int. 2). This report is used by BAPPENAS to develop appropriate strategies and avoid past mistakes.

UPW's involvement in the preparation of the Repelita chapter addressed at women has varied greatly. One of the past Repelita's entire section on women was prepared by individuals outside BAPPENAS and associated with UPW (Int. 2). The completed draft was accepted by BAPPENAS and included, in its entirety, in Repelita V. This demonstrates how UPW can be an effective policy forming body, if it has sufficiently

capable staff who are strong enough to stand behind their work and ensure that women's issues are not marginalized. In regards to this thesis, UPW could facilitate the inclusion of input from MIWNs at this point. The consultation structure currently used is examined in Chapter Five.

3.2.2 Aspects Relating to the Role of Women

This section looks at the content and evolution of emphasis in GOI's policies relating to women. These policies are macro level and generally broad statements of women's rights in development and their resource needs (ie: education, training, employment). There is a strong focus on women's reproductive role, with an emerging emphasis on women's economic contributions to Indonesia's development. The macro policies do not give a strong direction for the formulation of micro policies or programs. Consultation with grassroots, such as that suggested with MIWNs, could help GOI, BAPPENAS, and UPW translate these macro policies into effective and recipient specific policies and projects.

As mentioned in the above section, both the GBHN and the Repelita contain a chapter on women in national development. This chapter was first introduced in 1978 and has been part of the four development plans produced during the 1978-1993 period. The content and language of this chapter has changed over time to reflect changing perceptions and evolving gender relations. GOI claims that development policy, as laid out by the development plan, aims to achieve structural transformation in the long run, such that women's position in socio-economic terms would improve. The GBHN explicitly requires both men and women to participate in all aspects of development,

having equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities as participants in national development (UPW, 1987).

The National Basic Strategies of the Enhancement of the Role of Women in Development Towards the Year 2000 were created by UPW in cooperation with The National Commission on the Status of Indonesian Women. It stresses that young professional women should be given a higher priority and become one of the primary target groups for women's programs (UPW, 1987). Currently, development programs aimed at women are oriented towards the following four groups of women:

- A. women in low income groups in the rural, urban and coastal areas;
- B. women in isolated areas and transmigration areas;
- C. women heads of households; and
- D. young women of 15-19 years old

The policy objectives aimed at enhancing the role of women in national development are reviewed below.

Table No. 3.1 contains the three policy objectives for the enhancement of the role of women from 1978 (A,B,C), and the fourth objective added in 1983 (D). The 1978 policies are the first to address women as a special interest group. Examination of the policy objectives reveals an emphasis on women's role in creating and maintaining healthy and prosperous families. Increasing women's participation in economically productive activities, without redistributing gender roles in the domestic sphere, can erode women's position⁷ by overtaxing their time and energy. The works of Myra Buvinic and Caroline Moser on WID policies is summarized in Appendix D; this table

lists the five policy approaches, their goals and impact on women. The addition of new roles for women without a redistribution of their current burden is identified as eroding their condition by considering their available time to be highly elastic. Women's spheres of activity and responsibility are expanded without any reduction in their established workload.

Table No. 3.1: 1978 & 1983 GBHN and Repelita's III & IV

- A. Since overall development demands the maximum participation of both men and women in all fields, women have the same rights, responsibilities and opportunities as men to participate fully in all development sectors;
- B. The role of women in development should increase harmoniously with their role in creating healthy and prosperous families, guiding the young generation, the youth and under-five's, in the context of the development of the total Indonesian;
- C. In order to accelerate women's roles and responsibilities in the development process, women's knowledge and skills in various fields should be developed according to their needs and capabilities; and
- D. In order to promote the participation of women in development it is necessary to further increase the activities of women for the improvement of family welfare, among others through the programs of the Family Welfare Movement (PKK).

Source: KOWANI, 1985, p 12

The first policy objective places an increased burden on women by calling for their 'full' participation in development. The second policy objective calls attention to women's role in raising the next generation of Indonesians, reminding women not to neglect this role as a result of their increased participation in national development. The skills development objective has the potential to meet women's practical gender needs for training to obtain employment, and their strategic gender needs by empowering them and contributing to the redefinition of traditional gender roles. Chapter Five describes

the Family Welfare Movement (PKK) and its functions regarding the enhancement of the role of women.

Table No. 3.2: 1988 GBHN and Repelita V

- A. The women's status in the community and their role in development should be continuously enhanced and directed towards facilitating their maximum contribution to nation building in accordance with their nature, self-esteem and dignity as women;
- B. The role of women in development should increase harmoniously with the development of their responsibilities and role in creating and developing healthy and prosperous families, and that children and youth are future assets of the nations and thus there should be protection of their right for survival, physical, psychological, intellectual and behavioral development and to lead a harmonious life within the community and its environment;
- C. To enhance the role and responsibility of women in development, their capabilities should be further promoted by increasing their knowledge and skills and a more conducive socio-cultural climate should be further developed to enable women to increase their participation in development;
- D. The participation of women in development should go together with increase in family welfare, among others, through the Family Welfare Movement (PKK) as a social mobilization movement growing from the grassroots level with women as motivators.

Source: UNFPA, 1993. p 2

Table No. 3.2 contains the four policy objectives set out in 1988. The Asian Development Bank has this to say in their 1991 report, "While continuing an emphasis on family welfare, Repelita V places greater emphasis on a stronger economic role for women not only as intermediaries for their families, but also for themselves as individuals" (p 37). While Repelita IV was to include the introduction of WID sections in each chapter, this feature was only incorporated in Repelita V (Int. 2). The inclusion of sections on women in individual chapters in addition to the section focusing on women was a great accomplishment. These programming advances also represent an ideological advancement and an improved awareness of women's issues in the Line

Ministries. This process facilitated cooperation between the ministries and UPW in the implementation phase of Repelita V. A drawback to these policies is the interpretation of women as an untapped, cheap source of labour to fuel economic growth.

The current development plan, Repelita VI, comprises the seven policy areas shown in Table No. 3.3 below. This Repelita represents the first substantive changes to the chapter since its inclusion in the GBHN in 1978. The increased level of cooperation between UPW and Line Ministries attained during Repelita V has declined, and the WID sections included in different sections in Repelita V was not repeated. The level of influence exerted by UPW over the final content was also significantly less (Int. 2).

Table No. 3.3: 1993 GBHN and Repelita VI

A. Improving the educational level of women, as shown by decreasing the number of illiterate women;B. Improving the quality of women by enhancing their economic participation, development and mastery of science and technology;C. Improving women's health, including the health of their family, thus enabling women to play a more active role in development;D. Improving the quality and productivity of the female labour force by providing strong and stable legal protection of their rights and social welfare;E. Improving the dual role of women in the development of the family and their active participation in society in a harmonious and balanced manner;F. Developing a more supportive social and cultural climate which upholds women's dignity and status; andG. Strengthen women's organizations and create a more active role for women in national development.

Source: GOI, 1994, pp. 63-64

Some interviewees felt that Repelita VI has started to incorporate aspects of GAD style development (Int. 26) and were supportive of it, while others considered it a

disappointment and interpret it as weak. The latter may be a result of the low level of input provided by UPW in the last round of policy consultation (Int. 2). Some of the policy objectives address areas of strategic interest for women which is an encouraging change. A deeper challenge is changing cultural perceptions, this is vital to developing more balanced gender roles.

Skeptics warn that although Repelita VI can be interpreted as advantageous to women, it is open to interpretation and manipulation (Int. 3). This is a valid point, particularly as the Repelita is created every five years and its implementation is left to departments and bureaucrats who interpret it through the lens of their objectives and priorities. This ties back into the area of responsibility for ensuring that programs and policy are gender sensitive. Guidelines and targets set out every five years will not always be followed by line ministries, and UPW's current mandate is only to advise when consulted, not enforce. Under these conditions, line ministries who do not place great emphasis on gender issues may not implement that section of the Repelita.

Repelita VI placed increased emphasis on the issue of developing human resources, with women identified as an important target group. There exists a view in Indonesia that women's gender roles will expand as they move towards the 21st century and enter the next stage of development. Women's gender role is seen as expanding in the areas of family educator and as active participants and beneficiaries of Indonesia's economic development. The final policy objective is encouraging for pro-active women's NGO's. Their potential role in improving women's position will be discussed in the later chapters.

In general, the policies appear to place more demands on women than they assist women by calling for increased participation by women, but not for a redistribution of roles already fulfilled by women. The policies stress how women, as Indonesian citizens, are to increase their dual role in the home and the national economy. While fulfilling this dual function, women are to recall their essential nature "*kodrat*"⁸ and maintain the integrity of the family and the young generation.

The early wording of policy on women clearly arose from a history of gender relations based on assumptions inherent in patriarchal structures. In patriarchal structures, women are defined by their womanhood and bound to their roles as mother and wife. In Indonesia the State has constructed the notion of Ibuism to define women. This concept is discussed by Julia Suryakusuma in her work "Ibu or the Beast: The Social Construction of Womanhood in the Indonesian New Order" (1991) and was discussed in Chapter Two.

There is an aspect of efficiency policy (see Appendix D) inherent in Repelita and GBHN policies. They aim to improve women's condition by increasing their involvement in new areas of economic activity. Viewing women as a development priority in this manner assumes women's time to be highly elastic, that they will be able to increase participation in new areas without a reduction in their traditional roles. Such development is unsustainable and will ultimately fail because it will overtax women's time and energy resources. The transition in policies and targets from 1978 to 1993 has shown improvements in the formulation of goals.

3.3 State Ministry For The Role Of Women

As previously mentioned, UPW is one of GOI's main mechanisms for its goal of enhancing the role of women in national development.. The following sections provide an overview of: the establishment of UPW, UPW's mandate, the functioning of UPW, and the limitations faced by UPW in carrying out its mandate.

3.3.1 Establishing the Ministry

Under the New Order government, Indonesia is making efforts to honour the promise of equality for women made by the future leaders in the pre-independence era. The first formal organization initiated by GOI to address women's issues was the Indonesian National Commission on the Status of Women⁹ (KNKWI). KNKWI was established July 31, 1968 by the Department of Home Affairs, assisted by Kongress Wanita Indonesia (KOWANI)¹⁰ (Int. 18). KNKWI's purpose (see Chapter Five) was to provide a forum for discussion of women's particular needs in development, and to act as an advisory body to GOI in its policy formulation. One decade later, GOI created a new mechanism.

The origin of a ministry aimed specifically at aiding women began with the creation of a Junior Minister position in 1978. There does not appear to have been a single catalyst for the emergence of government commitment at this time. Rather, a combination of old promises, new attitudes, and continuous pressure by women for gender equality. This date coincides with the early years of the United Nations' Decade for Women. Increased international awareness of women's special needs in development may have been a factor in crystallizing support for such an organism in Indonesia. The other important aspect to consider is the prominent role played by women in the fight for

independence, for which they were assured that the country they helped establish would be free of all inequality, including gender based discrimination.

The Junior Ministry was elevated to the status of the State Ministry for the Role of Women (UPW) in 1983 by Presidential decree shown in Table No. 3.4 below. UPW provides the institutional mechanism for implementation of GOI's commitment to women. It is in line with the ideological basis provided by the National Constitution as embodied by the state principles, and directed by the policies of the GBHN which state that women are men's equals in all aspects of development. As indicated above, government action to promote women's equality had been promised prior to independence¹¹. Some Indonesians feel that the Old Order was politically and socially unstable, not conducive to addressing women's issues (Int. 25). The New Order, under President Suharto, created UPW thus ensuring women's issues have a place in the nation's formal agenda.

Table No. 3.4: Presidential Decrees on the State Ministry for the Role of Women

<p>Presidential decree #25, 1983, Chapter I, Section I, Article 8; The Minister of State for the Role of Women...has the principal task of ensuring an increase in the role of women in all fields of development.</p>
--

Source: UPW, 1988, pp. 13-14

The organizational structure of UPW is included as Appendix E. UPW staff is composed of the Minister, Mrs. Hj Mien Sugandin; the Executive Secretary; 3 Expert Staff, Mrs. Marwati Suwindi, Mr. Imron Arsyad, and Mrs. Sulbianti; four Assistant Ministers, Dr. (Mrs.) Trisuawati, Prof. DR. Soedarsono, Syamsiah Achmad, and Mr. W. Wibadswa; 12 Deputy Assistant Ministers and associated working groups (names provided by Int. 28).

As will be discussed in subsequent sections, the only permanent staff member is the minister herself. Implications and consequences arising from this situation are also discussed.

3.3.2 Mandate

"The Ministry for the Role of Women (UPW) is a State Coordinating Ministry. In Indonesia this means that the Ministry is responsible for policy guidance and provision of advice and monitoring for effective policy implementation in the relevant sectors. As a coordinating ministry, UPW has the extensive task of reviewing all policies and programs affecting women, which are implemented by other ministries and agencies of the government. It must also consult with these institutions to ensure that their respective plans are gender responsive." (UNFPA, 1993, p 1)

UPW is a coordinating and advisory body with no significant program funding or implementation roles. This limits the effectiveness of UPW by making it dependent on cooperation from line ministries. The primary functions of the ministry are identified in Table No. 3.5.

Table No. 3.5: Presidential Decree of the Functions of UPW

Presidential decree #25, 1983, Chapter I, Section II, Article 7 (functions of the Ministry);

1. Prepare the formulation of government policies regarding all things that influence the role of women in all fields of development;
2. Plan all things required for the formulation of policies mentioned in the above article, in an orderly and encompassing manner;
3. Coordinate activities aimed at increasing the role of women in development in all fields in order to achieve cooperation that is harmonious, synchronized, organized, encompassing and determined within the overall context of the government development program;
4. Coordinate operational activities of various agencies and government departments wheresoever the increase of the role of women in development is concerned, the administration and type of coordination involved to be determined by the State Ministry for the Role of Women; and
5. Forward to the President reports and explanatory materials as well as recommendations and opinions in the field for which the Minister is responsible.

Source: UPW, 1988, pp. 13-14

UPW functions, as assigned by the President, appear to cover the range *required* to ensure women's involvement in national development. Experiences of UPW since the declaration have shown that these roles are insufficient for *ensuring* women's equality. As mentioned above, UPW is designed as an advisory body. Its function does not extend to project design or training, a fact which limits its potential to enforce gender responsiveness on other ministries.

The Indonesian approach to integrating women into national development is conceptualized in the figure included as Appendix F. This figure illustrates the extent to which the state philosophy, Pancasila, influences policy. It is included as both a foundation and a goal in women's programs. The six program areas are derived from the Repelita. The five blocks at the base of the figure show which organizations and departments contribute to the goal.

Women's participation and needs appear to be identified in their relation to men. Women's role as wife and mother is stressed, as well as the desire to draw women into the modern sector and the interventions required to achieve this goal. The program areas, objectives, and goal stress the need for integrating women into national development but do not challenge gender roles or the status quo. There is a considerable amount of written commitment by the Indonesian government to improving women's position, but now in the sixth Repelita women still do not enjoy a position in Indonesian society equal to that of men¹².

GOI has made extensive reference to, and use of NGO's in their policies relating to women. Non-governmental organizations and women's organizations are explicitly identified in Appendix F as being involved in government efforts to achieve the state goal. There exists some debate over GOI's relationship with the women's organization to which they refer. GOI formal consultation framework is presented as Figure 5.1, once again "NGOs" are identified as part of the consultation process. However, as will be explored, formal consultation with NGOs is limited to the umbrella organization KOWANI (Int. 2) at present.

The purpose of this research is to establish the legitimacy and potential of other women's NGO's, specifically what I will be defining as modern Indonesian women's NGOs (MIWNs), to act as channels for public input into policy formulation.. It is my belief that collaboration with MIWNs would enhance the quality of policies and programs aimed at helping women. The non-KOWANI MIWNs could offer a different perspective on women's requirements and visions.

3.3.3 Functioning of the Ministry

Both the Repelita and the Broad Guidelines on State Policy (GBHN), as was discussed earlier in this chapter, make explicit recognition of women's rights and needs, but there lacks a strong mechanism for implementation. The main bodies responsible for implementing GOI's WID policies lie outside the official government in the form of women's organizations which are linked to government policy (see Chapter Five for a detailed discussion of these organizations). This section reviews the functioning of UPW and its relation to the line ministries.

UPW's mandate restricts it to an advisory and monitoring position, and as such UPW does not receive program funding. The budget allocation for UPW is intended to cover staff and operating expenses only. The 1995/96 budget contained a threefold increase in allocations to enhancing the role of women. This increase may, in part, be linked to the United Nations conference held in Beijing in September 1995 (Int. 12). While no breakdown of this increase was available, it would have been spent on increased research, report preparation, and other preparations for participation in the Beijing conference.

Concentrating responsibility for ensuring that policies and programs are sensitive to women's issues under UPW may have an impact that is contradictory to the purpose of UPW. Segregating responsibility may permit the continued marginalization of women's issues from mainstream planning in other ministries who do not consider it their responsibility given the existence of UPW. Under the current format, individuals or 'desks' within line ministries are responsible for the gender sensitive aspects of their ministry's policy and programming. This structure provides the opportunity for failure to address gender issues, either for lack of training, low responsiveness on the part of the ministry, or a failure of that individual to proactively include gender sensitivity.

While UPW's role as a State Ministry remains limited to being an advisor, line ministries may continue to pay insufficient attention to women's needs in their policy and programming by marginalizing input of line ministry personnel responsible for gender aspects. As a result, women are likely to remain marginalized unless UPW is granted authority to ensure that programs implemented by line ministries have passed through a gender analysis and have been classified as at least gender neutral, if not in favour of

women. UPW is not able to enforce the consideration of gender aspects in line ministry operations, it is only mandated to provide support for initiatives undertaken by the line ministries.

While granting UPW more of an enforcement, rather than passive advisory role, would increase the gender responsiveness of policy and programming in the short run, its existence is not desirable in the long run according to the GAD paradigm used in this research. So long as the ultimate responsibility for ensuring that gender issues are considered lie outside the programming unit, they are at risk of marginalization. The ultimate goal, according to the GAD paradigm is to integrate gender into the policy framework from the ground up and to avoid making gender issues an 'add-in'.

3.3.4 Weaknesses of the Ministry

At present, UPW is not strong enough to guarantee that women's issues are integrated into all development policies. This weakness is attributable to a number of factors that are discussed in this section. Commitment to enhancing the role of women in national development, on the part of GOI, appears to be increasing. Institutional strengthening efforts are being undertaken and gender awareness is being disseminated through line ministries, albeit slowly.

The most frequent criticism of UPW encountered during interviews concerned the current Minister Mien Sugandin. Proponents of women's issues frequently compare her to the previous Minister, Sulaikin Murpratomo, who was seen as very capable. While it does not appear to be a formal policy, the four women appointed to the position of Minister of UPW have all been past presidents of KOWANI. Their individual

backgrounds however have varied significantly. The current minister is regarded with skepticism for the paucity of her credentials. The following are three comments heard during research for this thesis, the sentiments expressed below were echoed in one form or another by many of the individuals interviewed.

- The previous Minister had 'vision' and was backed by two very strong Assistant Ministers, Ibu Samsiah Achmad and Ibu Achie Luhulima. When the new Minister was installed, much of the staff changed as well. Ibu Achmad was retained to manage UPW's preparation of Indonesia's Beijing representation. (Int. 3)
- The current Minister of UPW is seen as counter-productive. There is a strong sentiment that her high-school education and employment as a secretary do not adequately qualify her for a position at this level of responsibility. Her support of the traditional "Kodrat" image of Indonesian women, and her husband's close ties with GOLKAR raise further suspicion of her appointment as Minister of UPW. The previous Minister was very dedicated but was not reinstated at the end of her five-year term. There is speculation that her term was not renewed because she was too proactive, pushing for change at a faster pace than that desired by GOI (Int. 12)
- While the prior Minister had legal training and addressed gender issues, the current Minister is looked upon very skeptically. She has frequently made statements that are contradictory to the improvement of women's position in Indonesian society¹³. Professional women see the current Minister as a step backward, due to her limited education and secretarial experience (Int. 28).

Other than the Minister herself, UPW does not have permanent staff members. The individuals working in UPW are generally on secondment from other departments within

the Indonesian government. The lack of a regular staff creates difficulties in the areas of institutional strengthening and gender awareness training. A CIDA funded institutional strengthening project is helping increase knowledge of gender theory and practice amongst the staff of UPW. Consistency and continuity are difficult to maintain with an ever-changing staff, although progress is being made.

Some staff who chose to work in UPW are drawn to the ministry because it presents an opportunity for career advancement (Int. 3). An individual making a lateral shift into UPW may encounter less competition for advancement. Once the individual has obtained the desired promotion within UPW they can make a lateral shift back into another department. While statistics of such occurrences are not documented, it is an issue to be conscious of, as any individual operating in this manner seriously detracts from the objective of UPW. If UPW becomes known as an easy path to promotion, its effectiveness would be undermined by staff's ulterior motives for participation.

The majority of individuals brought into UPW have not received gender awareness training prior to their transfer into the ministry. Resources spent on training programs for ministry staff do not guarantee long-term benefit for UPW as the individuals receiving the training can potentially be transferred back out of the ministry. Individuals who have received gender awareness training and are subsequently transferred or returned to another government department may contribute to enhancing the level of gender sensitivity in the other ministry. This dispersion of skills is desirable in the long-term, but weakens UPW in the short-term.

UPW has been providing gender awareness training to staff through a number of channels. One project sends groups of Indonesian public servants to the Asian Institute of Management for one-week sessions (Int. 25). Other programs are run as workshops in Indonesia and receive funding from various agencies, such as the Canadian International Development Agency, UNIFEM, and ILO, to provide training for staff of other ministries (Int. 25). The departments that receive staff with gender training will then have an increased level of gender awareness. In this manner, awareness of gender issues can be disseminated to an increasing number of government departments.

It would be of particular benefit to have staff with gender training working in the line ministries that are responsible for the planning and implementation of policies that will affect women. The more widespread gender awareness is, the closer women's issues are to being mainstreamed into national development. So long as there exists a special ministry such as UPW to handle the gender aspects of national development, women are at risk of remaining a secondary criteria in planning.

After calling attention to weaknesses of UPW, it should be stated that Indonesia is making positive steps in addressing women in their national development. While establishing a state ministry such as UPW does not ensure achieving the goal of mainstreaming women into development, it is a concrete action that enhances the profile of women's issues and adds credibility to women's demands for change. The concentration of responsibility for sensitizing development to women's needs within UPW represents a WID approach. The development of gender expertise on-staff in line

ministries would be a GAD approach and theoretically has a higher potential to realize emancipation of women.

A UNFPA document examining the integration of women's issues into national planning identified five problem areas encountered by UPW in its efforts to increase women's role in national development. The five problem areas as identified by UNFPA are the following:

1. The data base for planning is insufficiently disaggregated by sex and critical elements that could contribute to gender-responsive planning do not exist.
2. The personnel of planning agencies in the sectors and in the provinces lack the orientation, training and skills to develop policies and plans which are sufficiently sensitive to the differing needs of women and men to effectively integrate women and development concerns in the planning process.
3. Women's Study Centres, while a foundation mechanism for integrating women's issues into national planning, exist more at the level of potential than reality. Their ability to provide the caliber of research required for targeted, gender-responsive planning is as yet limited and of variable quality. (Women's Study Centres are discussed in Chapter Four under academic)
4. Integrated planning is interpreted by many sectors as more of the same...more P2W [enhancing the role of women in national development] programs. It is apparent that sector Ministries confuse "gender-responsive planning" with the goals of the P2W program, that is to increase or enhance the participation of women in programs and projects. Planners thinking in the sectors is, therefore, directed towards increasing numbers and to counting heads rather than to addressing issues such as who has

access, control, who benefits...in other words the gender approach being promoted by UPW.

5. There are structural and functional barriers to integration. UPW, the Ministry charged with the responsibility to ensure integration is *not a primary actor* in the development of policies and plans. BAPPENAS, the national planning body responsible for coordinating the planning and budgeting process, is not structured in a manner which assists the integration procedure. Separate Bureaus have responsibility for certain areas and concerns relating to women are dealt with under the Directorate for Social and Cultural Affairs. No focal points or structured collaboration routines exist through which integration with the economic sectors might be achieved. (UNFPA, 1993, p 8)

From the research conducted for this report, I feel that the above list of problems is accurate and have included it for this reason. The list provides a quick summary of some impediments to the successful working of the UPW. As a State Ministry who's primary role is to advise and oversee, it suffers from lack of resources and lack of effectiveness in policy implementation. In its 1991 report on women in Indonesia, the ADB puts forth the opinion that:

"As a State Ministry, the office suffers from extreme limited resources, both financial as well as human resources. Consequently, the Office cannot monitor nor evaluate program implementation by other agencies and is therefore dependent on the *goodwill* of those agencies. Instead, the Office only compiles reports [from information] received from other agencies" (1991, p 39)

In its own self-evaluating report, "National Basic Strategies of the Enhancement of the Role of Women in National Development Towards the Year 2000", the following

'hampering' factors were identified as impeding the advancement of development goals relating to women.

1. The potentials of the private sector and non-governmental organizations are not yet fully utilized in the development process;
2. Coordination, integration, synchronization and simplification have not been applied between as well as [within] the government sector, the private sector and non-governmental organizations;
3. The absence of an established monitoring and evaluation system for the enhancement of women's role in development;
4. The lack of statistical data and social indicators for policy formulation and planning of the enhancement of women's role in development;
5. Insufficient professional women workers for the formulation of cross-sectoral and integrated programs for the enhancement of women's role in development; and
6. Insufficient research and scientific publications on Indonesian women to support policy formulation and planning, caused by the inadequate relationship of research and policy. (UPW, 1987, pp 59-60)

The above excerpt of Basic Strategies compiled in 1987 demonstrates that there exists the institutional capacity to identify factors inhibiting UPW from being an effective advocate for women in national development. However, in 1995, nine years after the Basic Strategies were created, the same problems exist. Creating the opportunity for MIWNs to participate in policy formation, and act as advisors or consultants to UPW is one means to address some of the above issues (especially 1-3).

The Basic Strategies identified 'hampering factors' for enhancing the role of women in 25 areas and developed strategies for dealing with these factors. This document made important steps towards understanding why UPW and the national mechanism were not effective, and described how to overcome the problems. From my research, I concluded that these problems remain today, almost exactly as they were identified in 1987. That these problems remain, despite the presence of strategies to fix them, implies that the root problem is not a lack of means to implement change, so much as it is a lack of will to see the changes made. I do believe the will to make change exists in UPW, LIPI, KNKWI, and MIWNs. This will needs to be facilitated, and made more universal to achieve results.

3.3.5 Comments on the State Ministry for the Role of Women

The ultimate objective of GAD oriented development is to integrate gender concerns in development at the ground level, rather than necessitating the operation of a separate ministry such as UPW. However, the government's explicit recognition of the special needs of women in development planning, as demonstrated by the creation of UPW, the inclusion of a women oriented chapter in the GBHN, and the successful inclusion of a women section at the line ministry level in Repelita V are useful transition activities.

UPW's indirect role in policy formation is not sufficient to ensure consideration of gender issues by all ministries. Women's issues are generally handled by a women's desk within the line ministries (ADB, 1991). By separating planning for women into a separate task, these ministries have effectively relegated women related issues to a secondary criteria. If these issues remain outside the main body of policy formation and

development planning, the objective of mainstreaming women into the development process will never be achieved.

UPW's role could evolve in two manners and still improve its effectiveness. In the first instance, UPW could be granted more discretionary powers to alter policies and programs developed by line ministries. This would require increased funding of UPW to create a competent staff trained in gender sensitive techniques.

Another direction UPW could take is to expand their resources and enhance their public consultation capacity. This would improve their advisory capabilities by encouraging the development of more inclusive consultation mechanisms and the establishment of new relationships with MIWNs in addition to current relationships with the national women's organization (KOWANI). In this instance, gender awareness training would be required at the line ministry level and each ministry would be responsible for ensuring that policies respond to women's needs. UPW's involvement in policy would then be changed to reviewing line ministry policies to ensure that they have included the required criteria.

Both of these alternatives require a solidification of GOI's commitment to women. An organized training program would have to be implemented to improve the institutional capacity of GOI departments for the implementation of gender sensitive planning techniques. As previously mentioned, the budget allocation for women was increased for 1995/96. This could signify an increasing commitment to improving women's condition, in which case further increases can be expected in subsequent budgets. It could also be an isolated event in response to the international conference, with funding

levels dropping back in the next fiscal year. Hopefully this is not the case, and that this budget increase was the result of improved awareness of the issues.

An issue for consideration, in the analysis of the Indonesian experience of applying gender sensitive concepts to development planning, is that there exist a number of different agenda competing for dominance in providing direction to the efforts. On one hand, there is GOI's goal, which has changed. The GOI goal began as the development of an 'equal partners' (*mitra sejajar*) relationship between men and women; and has since changed to developing 'harmonious partnerships' between men and women. On the other side, the more radical goal of MIWNs is to achieve women's emancipation.

Future direction of activities aimed at women would be enhanced by reaching a consensus of the desired goal. The differences in goals between policy makers and Indonesian women need to be synchronized before meaningful public input into policy formation can be realized. Perhaps GOI's more conservative version is the appropriate short-term goal, and the MIWNs' goal of emancipation a long-term goal? This is an issue that can only be resolved by the groups involved, who have an in-depth understanding of the interaction of social and cultural factors. From the point of view of an outside researcher, it is apparent that the pace of change will be determined by the flexibility of social acceptance. I suspect that the fabric of national unity could not withstand a rapid and total redefinition of women's role. Social resistance should not however be accepted as a rationale for limiting the eventual scope of reform.

3.4 Conclusions

As indicated above, there is fear and distrust among the Indonesian population and GOI of gender terminology and a resistance to the evolution of traditional standards and values. The 'importation' of gender equality may be interpreted as a threat against the nation. Women's attainment of equality will have to be an endogenous process, preferably originating at the grass roots level and informing the national level. Inclusion of groups like MIWNs in a consultative capacity is one means of achieving this.

Indonesia has embarked on the path to gender equality and the emancipation of women. Identifying the need to incorporate gender awareness in national planning, and taking steps to achieve this put Indonesia ahead of other countries in Asia. Despite weaknesses, progress is being made. More importantly, past efforts can inform future planning such that progress will continue until the goal is achieved. At this time, a universal commitment is lacking and continues to impede change. Examination of policies and practices has revealed that GOI, while ostensibly supporting women's equality, remains concerned about how it will effect the balance of power within the nation. Until this fear is dispelled and gender terminology ceases to be denied, MIWNs' dreams of emancipation¹⁴ will remain unrealized.

This chapter examined the government context that would affect MIWNs' role as conduits for public participation into the formation of policies relating to women. It has been shown that UPW could benefit from increased public consultation. The requirement for change to be defined from within Indonesia further strengthens the argument for MIWNs providing that input. Later chapters will explore the remaining two

contexts relevant to this research, NGO's as conduits for public participation, and the current legal and ideological context affecting NGOs in Indonesia today.

National development efforts must not be allowed to stagnate as the goal of enhancing the role of women in national development approaches the beginning of its third decade as a policy objective. Women as consumers of development are changing. Perceptions and ideas regarding women's role in development and their experience of development must be reexamined or the approach used will fail to assist women (Int. 28). Gender roles, as a dynamic social construction, are influenced by factors ranging from the personal to the international. In order to capture the evolving needs of women, to advance their position, policy makers require an accessible public consultation mechanism. This research explores the role of MIWNs to provide some of the required public participation.

The Indonesian concept of the population as a 'Floating Mass' that only becomes politically active once every five years to elect their government representatives is not conducive to encouraging open public participation into policy formation. However, public participation provides many benefits, both to the quality and effectiveness of policies and programs developed and to the individuals who participate, these benefits are discussed in Chapter Four.

Open public participation by women into policy formation to enhance their role in society could, in and of itself, meet strategic gender interests in capacity building. The danger lies in quasi-participation, when there exists the appearance of open participation. Such is the case in GOI's limitation of which women's groups it consults. The primary

consultative relationship is with KOWANI, as will be discussed in Chapter Five, and this does not produce representative participation.

¹ I found UPW's role to be vague despite a clear statement of mandate. The ministry is responsible for ensuring that policies formulated by other line ministries are gender sensitive yet they are not provided with sufficient gender training or enforcement capacity.

² What is meant by equal standing in competition for jobs or election is assuming equivalent qualifications. The strategic gender interests of women in this instance is the elimination of gender bias in the selection process. At present, many countries, including Canada and Indonesia employ 'positive/affirmative action' or 'employment equity' policies. This will help women meet their practical gender needs in the short term but does not address the underlying bias which must be reversed to meet women's strategic interests.

³ The Five Duties of Women as taught by PKK, KOWANI, Dharma Wanitas, and Dharma Pertiwis are: 1) to be loyal companions of their husbands; 2) to procreate for the nation; 3) to educate and guide their children, 4) to regulate the household; and 5) to be useful members of society.

⁴ The national security focus of GOI tends to repress social issues which have the potential of disrupting national security. Challenging traditional gender roles and cultural perceptions of women is a discourse that has the potential to raise emotional support and resistance, which might be seen as destabilizing unity.

⁵ Feminism is viewed and presented by GOI as a culturally inappropriate Western import. There exists at least one pro-active women's group which vocally supports feminism as appropriate and useful to the Indonesia context, this organization is discussed in Chapter Five.

⁶ Five five-year plans are sometimes referred to as 25-year Perspective Plan. The 25-year Perspective Plan does not have any criteria beyond those laid out in the individual five-year plans.

⁷ This statement is not part of GOI's statement but rather arises from the body of gender theory used by me, the author.

⁸ Kodrat is the nurturing, mothering role of women as the bearers and educators of children. It is women's nature and destiny according to Indonesian traditional views. The government of Indonesia support a specific image of the "kodrat" woman, an image to which women are supposed to aspire. The image contains elements of physical appearance, dress, conduct, manner, and mindset.

⁹ The Indonesian National Commission on the Status of Women, and its role in women's issues is examined in Chapter Four.

¹⁰ KOWANI will be explored in Chapter Four. It is an umbrella organization of national women's organizations.

¹¹ While no Indonesian government existed as such prior to independence, the post-independence leaders were already well established and in a strong position to make promises to rally support for independence.

¹² The goal of equality with men is not necessarily universal for all Indonesian women. It refers specifically to the segment of the Indonesian population who's views would be represented by MIWNs in consultations.

¹³ While conducting research in Indonesia, the English language paper in Jakarta reported that the Minister had made a statement calling upon women to consider their own responsibility in instances of rape. These comments were not well received by progressive women's groups who felt that she was damaging the progress women have made.

¹⁴ Emancipation is not a goal universally espoused by Indonesian women. Many feel protected by traditional values and are suspicious of 'western' ideas. The individuals who agreed to meet with me and discuss their views on women and change do want to see fundamental changes that I have chosen to describe as emancipation. This choice of language is that of the author, but is an accurate representation of the desires expressed during interviews.

4.0 NON-GOVERNMENTAL ORGANIZATIONS

"NGOs have an essential role to play in the construction of any society or nation. They can be seen as the white corpuscles in the blood stream. Without their presence, a society can catch all kinds of diseases which make its harmonious development difficult." (UNICEF qtd in Shahari, 1983, p 56)

Previous chapters have addressed the context of women's position and experience within their society, and the institutional context in which policies and programs for 'enhancing the role of women in national development' are developed in Indonesia. The next step in my exploration of the legitimacy of MIWNs to act as conduits for public participation into policy development requires defining and assessing NGOs and MIWNs, and the potential functions they might fill.

This research draws together two major issues/ areas of study. The first issue is the value of public participation in policy making, value to participants, value to the process, and the resulting policies. The second issue is the validity of NGO knowledge and the range of insight NGOs can provide for policy formation. I believe that non-governmental organizations draw together groups of individuals whose skills and experience differ from those of government officials.

NGOs are not a free resource to be exploited by governments, rather they are organizations which typically have a close relationship to, and knowledge of grassroots and grassroots issues. This characteristic (and others discussed in the NGO section below) makes them a valuable source of input into process and policy formation. Benefits of public participation are derived by both the process/government (in the form of information) and by the participating NGOs (in the form of effectiveness, status, and legitimization of NGO knowledge and experience). These issues form the basis of this

chapter and are the justification for including a section on participation and empowerment.

This chapter has a threefold purpose. It explores public participation and empowerment by looking at what forms participation can take, what benefits participants can derive, and how individuals make the decision whether or not to participate. The discussion of intrinsic benefits derived by individuals and organizations through participating in such a process are included for their relevance in providing justification for the desirability of participation as well as to support the corollary to the thesis of how MIWNs stand to benefit from having access to authority and the policy making process (see Chapter Five for discussion).

The next section explores the literature on NGOs, with particular emphasis on NGOs in the Asian, and specifically Indonesian, context. This section looks at the characteristics of NGOs as voluntary, non-governmental organizations. A sub-section deals with the group of organization classified in this research as 'modern Indonesian women's NGOs' (MIWNs). Briefly, MIWNs are those organizations dedicated to improving women's position in Indonesian society either broadly or in specific sectors. The expansion of the official consultation mechanisms (see Figure 5.1) supported by this research is the inclusion of opportunities for MIWNs to become involved in defining and carrying out the dialogue on enhancing women's role in national development.

The third area of inquiry covered in this chapter seeks to answer the question 'Are NGOs an appropriate channel through which to collect participatory input into policy formation?'. In the more specific context of this report's thesis, it asks "Would MIWNs

make good development collaborators¹ for government in addressing the enhancement of women's role in national development, and improving women's position in Indonesian society?" The international literature on civil society and people-centred development was consulted to draw out a consensus on what legitimate roles NGOs play. This argument is based on the acceptance of the value of public participation in the policy making process. In short, this argument is that public participation has the potential of providing policy making bodies with insights, information, and suggestions that cannot be gathered through conventional research methods and which will ultimately improve the effectiveness and efficiency of the policies developed.

The remaining two chapters of this research address the specifics of NGOs in Indonesia. Chapter Five is designed to provide a 'Road Map' to women's activities in Indonesia and GOI's official consultative structure. It explores the range of activity related to enhancing the role of women in national development. Chapter Six covers the legal and ideological context in which NGOs exist. The legal framework which these organizations work in or around and the atmosphere of the current relationship between GOI (the policy making body) and MIWNs (as the bodies who would convey women's input into the policy making process) are discussed.

4.1 Participation

4.1.1 Why Public Participation?

Awareness of the benefits and characteristics of public participation enhances appreciation of the value and function of MIWNs acting as conduits for public participation into policy development relating to the role of women. This section looks at benefits derived from the act of participation by participants or organizations. In his

book Participation, Jack Nagel encourages us to ask the question "Cui Bono?" [whose good?] (Nagel, 1987). When studying participation, it is important to recognize participants' agenda and reasons for participating, as well as the motivation of the organizing body to invite participation. While this research cannot identify all of the agenda contending for dominance of the process of policy formation relating to women, it does draw attention to the fact that conflicting agendas² exist (ie: GOI, official women's NGOs, and MIWNs).

Promoting public participation into policy formation has the potential to enhance the development of effective programs and policies because it provides the means to gather types of information not available through statistical data analysis or research. One function it fills (from the government point of view, participant benefits are discussed later) is to help harness the individual experiences of participants and their analysis of their needs and resources. Public participation is a component of democratic decision making which can provide valuable information to government and policy setting bodies and allows participants to share in the ownership of the process. There can be a downside to public participation in systems that allow only quasi-participation³. In these instances, the process can misuse the notion of participation to generate support for policies or projects.

David Harding describes three forms of participation between NGOs and the public: NGOs gathering information about a community; a community exercising control over an activity or process; or the reduction of development costs by using local resources (Harding, 1994, p 9). The second of these three forms represents the notion of empowerment. His third form, use of local resources can be interpreted as either a

positive or negative situation. If the 'local resources' are willing to bear the cost of participating (non-monetary costs of participation) and benefit from the process, then this form is agreeable. If the government is off-loading costs to the public for service provision, and participant costs are not offset by perceived benefits, it is an exploitative arrangement for the 'local resources'.

The act of participation has developmental and educative benefits for participants. The process of participation can create new values, attitudes, skills, knowledge and beliefs. It can also serve as a conscientization of citizens around their rights and issues of development. This aspect of participation is not always welcomed by governments depending on their underlying agenda and the manner in which the status quo will be affected. Involvement of the public in government processes can help increase the accountability of officials by increasing the transparency of the process.

Benefits derived from participation can be summarized as:

Political Efficacy: Learning how the system works and developing the skills that enable participants to be effective in their contribution to decisions.

Interaction: The process of interacting with a diverse group will foster more democratic perspectives amongst participants. Learning to accept and interact with people who have different ideas, beliefs, skills, and values helps participants recognize that all people have the same right to protection under democracy.

Involvement: The act of participation in a decision or policy making process gives participants a feeling of ownership, of being part of the process. This feeling of connection with the results and acceptance of their formation as a democratic process

encourages greater commitment by individuals to the system as a whole [this could be a valuable benefit to strengthening national unity]. (Nagel, 1987)

The areas of education and personal development yield intrinsic benefits to participants. These benefits can include, but are not limited to: enhanced perception of self-worth for having taken part; increased identification with the community or peer group through joining together for change; improved self-confidence and feeling of legitimacy in participating, and a sense of purpose and belonging. These benefits are not however always sufficient to invoke participation from all concerned.

Intrinsic benefits derived from taking part in a public participation can be offset by costs of participation. Participation in any process can involve many kinds of costs to participants. These costs may include, but are not limited to the following: monetary contributions; opportunity cost of participant's time; travel costs; and less tangible costs related to perceptions, political implications, and gender roles⁴. In political systems where participation is not part of the established process or where comments of a critical nature can be construed as opposing national interests, participants may be taking personal risks by participating. Women in particular may suffer personal costs due to social perception, being criticized for taking time away from their reproductive responsibilities.

My research leads me to feel that the non-monetary costs are most relevant to the case of MIWNs and policy relating to women. The fact that NGOs such as MIWNs are not included in the national mechanisms for the enhancement of the role of women or included in the official consultation strategy makes it virtually impossible for them to

represent their views, or to ultimately affect the national dialogue on women. MIWNs potentially incur additional non-monetary costs because of their legal standing under ORMAS (see discussion on MIWNs this chapter and ORMAS in Chapter Six).

4.1.2 Levels of Participation

Figure No. 4.1: Levels of Participation

Source: CCIC, 1991, p 40

Benefits of public participation described in the above section are not achieved universally or consistently in all processes involving public participation. The level of benefits achieved by participants, the process, and the resulting policies depends on a range of factors⁵ including the level of participation offered to participants. CCIC has

identified four levels of participation, as presented in Figure No. 4.1. Each successive level represents an increase in participants' decision-making role. Potential benefits increase by level of participation in this figure. The CCIC model equates participation, particularly at the higher levels, with empowerment (as denoted by 'decided by ourselves' on the right side of the figure).

At the first level, participants are involved solely as recipients of benefits. They do not have any input into policy or programs, rather they are the passive recipients of development that may or may not be suitable. At the second level of participation the intended beneficiaries are nominally involved in the process, but not in any substantive way. This is still a top-down approach to planning. Participants do not have control of the process or outcome and are primarily involved in actions that are decided by persons other than the participants. Third level participation represents a limited degree of bottom-up participation in that the participants are consulted and involved in the identification of the problems they face and the needs they experience. The fourth level of participation represents full empowerment. Participants are in charge of the process. They are involved from the first phase to the last, planning, implementing and evaluating solutions to problems they have identified.

4.1.3 Empowerment

This sub-section examines various concepts of empowerment taken from the literature on gender theory⁶. The term empowerment generally means to give an individual power in themselves or their environment. It does not have to translate into the transfer of power from one group to another. Empowerment takes the form of increasing the ability

and freedom of individuals to make decisions and take action, hopefully in a positive-sum relationship.

Undertaking empowerment initiatives aims to increase the benefits of an individual or individuals without detracting from the freedom or benefits of another or others. Power is frequently interpreted as being of a fixed quantity, where increasing the power of one group is only accomplished by decreasing the power of another. This misperception underlies much resistance to citizen empowerment by authoritarian regimes. In the case of involving MIWNs in policy formation, some groups will lose power relative to the empowerment of others. In such cases empowerment can be interpreted as an erosion of the status quo and a reduction in the relative position of those benefiting under the current power distribution. This reduction will be resisted, as will any process that will result in a redistribution of power.

In his book, Empowerment: The Politics of Alternative Development, John Friedman identifies three areas where empowerment can take place:

Social Power: Relates to individual's access to 'bases' of production at the household level. These bases include the following: information; knowledge; skills; financial resources; and social participation;

Political Power: Refers to the individual's access to the decision making process and ability to participate in/affect outcomes relating to their own person; and

Psychological Power: Entails the individual's perception of their own effectiveness and capacity to effectuate changes. The psychological strength of an individual affects their self-image and feeling of being able to make a difference. (Friedman, 1992, p 33).

If MIWN's were to be included in the consultative process of formulating policies on women, they would be realizing an increase in their political and psychological power. They would also be gaining status/power/recognition as being legitimate organizations whose knowledge and experience are relevant. By increasing the perceived legitimacy of MIWNs and NGOs in general, there exists the potential to erode the status of currently recognized organizations such as KOWANI and its member. At present KOWANI (see discussion Chapter Five) is the only NGO organization identified as an official mechanism by GOI. This is a source of status and prestige which equates to power for KOWANI and its member organizations, they are exclusive.

If the consultation mechanism were to be expanded to include MIWNs, KOWANI would lose status/power in relation to MIWNs. In Indonesian society, status and position are important to both individuals and organizations. The loss of recognition on the part of KOWANI is likely to be resisted by KOWANI and the women who make up its member organizations. Such resistance is one potential source of opposition to recognizing MIWNs as valuable contributors to policy formation. The legitimization of their knowledge and experience poses a threat to the current balance of power, which it would redistribute. A redistribution of power is in keeping with the feminist goal of women's emancipation from oppression by patriarchal structures and a redistribution in the power to define dialogue⁷.

4.2 Non-Governmental Organizations

To convincingly demonstrate that NGOs are a valuable development resource and a legitimate voice for articulating grassroots needs and interests, we must examine the nature and roles of NGOs. This section breaks the inquiry into three areas. Sub-

section 4.2.1 explores the range of activities classified as NGO and the activities they undertake. The second sub-section presents a review of NGO characteristics assembled by a review of NGO literature. The literature reviewed is not exclusively Indonesian based, but the NGO characteristics presented are organization not country based. Finally, the accepted or justifiable roles for NGOs to carry out in the political and/or policy arenas are presented in sub-section 4.2.3.

4.2.1 Defining 'NGO'

What does the term 'Non-Governmental Organization' mean? The key word is 'non', which does not indicate what type of organization an NGO is, merely what it is not. The term 'Non-Governmental Organization' was introduced to common English usage by the United National Economic and Social Committee in Resolution 288(x) on February 22, 1950 (de Fonseka, 1995, p 58). The term NGO, and its equivalents, have been adopted into common usage and are the subject of extensive debate. The range of terms used in the literature, which are being treated as synonymous with NGO are discussed below.

NGOs are organizations primarily composed of volunteers, in some cases they have support staff and/or leadership which are paid positions. In the literature, NGO is used interchangeably with voluntary organizations, volunteer associations, private development organizations, people's organizations, or the "third sector" (Smillie, 1993, p 14). For the purposes of this research, all of these terms refer to the same classification of organization. In this paper, 'women's groups' and 'women's organizations', are used interchangeably with 'women's NGOs'. The term 'modern Indonesian women's NGOs' (MIWNs) has been created to identify a group of organizations which share characteristics as discussed later in this chapter.

The literature divides NGOs into a range of categories for the purpose of analysis. These categories are the following: Big NGOs (BINGOs), Middle NGOs (MINGOs), Little NGOs (LINGOs), Government Organized NGOs (GONGOs), Grassroots Organizations⁸ (GROs), Voluntary Organizations (VOs), and Community Associations (CAs). As will be addressed in the next chapter, GOI has developed relationships with certain organizations it classifies as NGOs which I have classed as quasi-governmental, and which would fall into the category GONGO (i.e.: KOWANI, Dharma's). David Korten describes GONGOs as those organizations whose actions are defined more by donors, or as in this case GOI, than any internally defined mission (Korten, 1990, p 103). Another description of these organizations is provided by James Riker, GONGOs "are promoted by government through official sponsorship, funding, and guidance to carry out government-defined priorities and activities" (Riker, 1995a, p 26).

In societies where the public tends to distrust or resent government actions, being *non-governmental* is a distinct advantage (Clark, 1991, p 45). General acceptance of the legitimacy of NGOs as a voice for change is emerging at national and international levels (UNDP, 1993, p 98). International organizations have begun to pressure more repressive governments to stop blocking NGOs from carrying out their function as catalysts for development, both social and political (Korten, 1990, p 100). The current international climate is often favourable to NGOs, which are perceived as being valid organizations who are sometimes more flexible in their approach than government. NGOs characteristics are discussed in Section 4.2.2.

Despite their ambiguous name, NGOs generally focus on specific areas of operation with clear mandates. NGOs can be divided into six general categories by virtue of their activities: relief and welfare agencies; technical innovation organizations; public service contractors; popular development agencies; grassroots development organizations; advocacy groups and networks (Clark, 1991, pp 34-5). In this research, I have identified MIWNs as fitting in the fifth and sixth categories. The range of activities of these women's organizations as identified by this research is: advocacy, development projects, income generation, training, public awareness, education, legal reform, policy critics, and labour rights.

NGOs in Asia today operate in a number of different forms. NGOs operate from the local to international level. The following is a brief description of the forms operating in Asia.

1. Large national NGOs working in several states in different parts of the country and sometimes acting as intermediaries channeling funds from donors to smaller local NGOs;
2. Large national NGOs working in most districts of one state;
3. Medium-sized national NGOs working in a large number of villages in one or two districts of one state;
4. Small national NGOs working in a group of villages in one locality;
5. Large international NGOs with in-country representation providing funding and support to national NGOs; and
6. Small international NGOs working directly in one or two localities (Farrington 1993, pp 30-1).

The types of activities carried out by NGOs are frequently similar to development efforts carried out by governments. This fact highlights an important potential relationship between governments and NGOs. Co-operation between the two could lead to more efficient allocation of resources. However, cooperative relationships between the NGO and government are not always feasible even if it is desirable. The roles played by NGOs in democratic development, even when similar or overlapping with government activity can be a complement rather than a challenge to the role of government (Phillips, 1995, p 5). The relationship between GOI and NGOs in Indonesia is discussed in Chapter Six.

An understanding and awareness of the circumstances under which they formed and operate, and of the issues that motivated their formulation enhance understanding the nature of NGOs. The MIWNs this research is concerned with appear to have evolved as; supplements, alternatives, critics, and watchdogs⁹ in relation to government activities in the field of women's issues. Women's NGOs or NGO with women's programs in Indonesia have different mandates and beliefs. One group of women's NGOs bases their actions on feminist principles and gender theory, I have chosen to identify these organizations as 'modern Indonesian women's NGOs' (MIWNs).

4.2.2 Modern Indonesian Women's NGOs

The group of organizations identified as 'modern Indonesian women's NGOs' (MIWNs) have been grouped together because they share some significant characteristics. They are still subject to the same advantages and faults as other NGOs, but they have similar goals. The four words selected to identify these organizations summarize the characteristics they share. The organizations are based on 'modern' ideas about

women's role and the desire for emancipation from oppression by patriarchal structures. Organizations members are of Indonesian citizenship, they are part of an endogenous trend, not exogenous or 'Western' as some opponents might argue. The members are predominantly, though not necessarily, women. Finally, MIWNs are NGOs whether officially registered or operating illegally.

MIWN's position in Indonesian society is not clearly presented by either the literature or interviews, but my research showed that there do exist women's NGOs that are relatively autonomous from the state. Some of the organizations classed as MIWNs are registered under ORMAS, while others are either foundations, associations, pre-cooperatives, or so far unnoticed by the state and operating in an illegal/unregistered status. The small and diverse nature of MIWNs, and their sometimes unofficial status made it impossible to capture a large sample during research. Examples of MIWNs, their focus and methodology identified during research are discussed in Chapter Five.

MIWN management is typically composed of women in the urban areas who have received either high school or university training. During their education, they were exposed to 'modern' ideas and learned about gender issues. The exposure did not necessarily occur as part of a curriculum, but may have taken place in discussion groups or other awareness raising activities. The increased awareness of women's issues made them committed to changing some aspect of women's position or condition.

The women who compose the MIWN management level feel an obligation to use their acquired knowledge and skills to bring about change at the local level. Their 'modern'

ideas for changing women's roles in society are disseminated to their urban and/or rural constituency. Family and social ties to populations in the rural area facilitate this dissemination. MIWN management are generally at least one or two generations removed from rural villages but at least some members will have strong links to the population of the rural areas.

The group of organizations identified as MIWNs draws their constituency from a range of areas including industrial workers, victims of violence, research organizations, and women in both the rural and urban areas. As is discussed in Chapter Five, not all MIWNs have the same structure with regards to membership. Some focus on dissemination of information or the training and facilitation of other MIWNs' activities.

4.2.3 NGO Characteristics (*Strengths and Weaknesses*)

"Social movements are seen as having certain unique characteristics, but in reality they have many features in common with other civil society institutions. It cannot be assumed that social movements are more effective than other bodies in civil society: their relatively informal, spontaneous character brings advantages but also disadvantages in both the mobilization of support and the achievement of leverage" (Shaw, 1994, p 648)

NGO characteristics provide some advantages, but the same characteristics can also represent disadvantages. In many instances, a characteristic that represents a benefit under one set of circumstances may become a disadvantage or weakness under changed circumstances or scale of operation. This sub-section takes a broad look at

NGO characteristics and how they affect the organization's functioning. NGO characteristics can be a double-edged sword, and for this reason NGOs should not be considered to be a "magic bullet" that can solve any development problem (Edwards, 1995).

Recognition of NGO weaknesses, by development planners and consultation participants, in addition to championing their strengths will increase their effectiveness as contributors to development planning and policy formation. "The problem of...[pro-NGO] perceptions is not that they are necessarily false, but that they are seldom examined empirically" (MacDonald, 1992, p 3). Familiarization with an organization's abilities and limitations can enable a better match between needs and means. While failure to assess individual organizations' value could undermine the success NGOs have achieved in legitimizing their role in development. To realize the most benefit from their strengths, and minimize their weaknesses, each NGO should be assessed for its own merits in relation to the task.

As previously mentioned, when assessing the capacity of NGOs, the double-edged nature of their characteristics should be kept in mind. One aspect of this dichotomy was discussed, but another arises from perception as much as from function. John Clark quotes Sheldon Annis as describing how strengths can become weaknesses when, "in the face of pervasive poverty 'small scale' can merely mean 'insignificant', 'politically independent' can mean 'powerless' or 'disconnected', 'low-cost' can mean 'under-financed' or 'poor quality', and 'innovative' can mean simply 'temporary' or 'unsustainable'." (Clark, 1991, p 54).

Recent literature has begun to question the universal 'goodness' of NGOs. New NGOs are emerging as aid money continues to be funneled through NGOs as service providers and analysts. Unemployed professionals (more in the north than Indonesia) are setting up NGOs to access contracts. This situation detracts from some of the assumed strengths of NGOs (knowledge of local issues, contact with grassroots, personal experience) and moves into more of a 'contract culture' (Harding, 1994, p 21). Another weakness is the lack of regulation and self-regulation of NGOs. NGOs enjoyed a 'honeymoon' decade in the 80's with regards to international perception and literature that portrayed them as benevolent and morally just. This era fostered an environment in which donors, after accepting the benefits of NGOs as development practitioners, and the NGOs themselves ceased being critical of NGO limits with regards to capacity, representativeness, accountability, and transparency. David Harding summarizes this issue succinctly as, "The sector has perhaps lived with too much easy praise – and is in danger of believing its own myths." (Harding, 1994, p 2).

Because of the diversity of organizations labeled as NGOs, it is difficult to identify specific strengths or weaknesses. Certain characteristics of NGO structure, and or interaction suggest advantages:

"NGO activities are tiny when compared with the government's - but NGOs not infrequently have the edge in quality at the micro level and show an ability to be innovative, to involve the participation of people, and to be responsive to local conditions in a way that often contrasts with [GOI] efforts" (Holloway, 1989, p 148).

The following list is derived from a Canadian study. It is a list of pragmatic benefits offered by the nature of NGOs¹⁰:

- volunteers are less costly than paid staff, thereby reducing the cost of delivering services as compared to government delivery;
 - voluntary organizations are more efficient and cost-effective than government bureaucracies due to their small size and the direct relation between planning and implementation;
 - voluntary organizations are independent and constitute a watch on government, the business community or other institutions in society. The watch-dog function can be very valuable as feedback in a co-operative NGO-government environment or as a counter balance when no open relationship exists;
 - voluntary organizations create jobs, paid and unpaid;
 - voluntary organizations represent a back-door for participants to engage in the broader community and to develop skills useful in subsequent voluntary action or employment;
 - volunteers provide a liaison with the community and foster understanding by increasing awareness of different views and needs; and
 - voluntary organizations provide the means through which people can become involved in issues of concern to them aside from participation in official channels.
- (adapted from Canadian Government, 1977, pp 25-6).

The following list of beneficial NGO characteristics is taken from a collection of studies on Asian and Indonesian NGOs:

- A high level of commitment on the part of staff, and their ability to identify themselves with the problems of their members/beneficiaries enhances NGOs ability to plan and implement effective development efforts (Holloway, 1989, p 143);

- NGOs are generally of a more horizontal structure which encourages accurate reporting of progress because members are not afraid of negative repercussions within the organization if they make negative reports on progress (Holloway, 1989, p 143)¹¹;
- They generally take on small, focused projects which they have sufficient resources and experience to do well (Holloway, 1989, p 143);
- the diversity of NGOs provides them with a flexibility and ability to take independent action, they are able to forge alliances with a range of other actors, though these alliances are by nature informal and subject to change (Korten, 1992, p 99);
- The ability to 'catalyze social innovation' (Korten, 1992, p 99);
- Priorities are set within the organization based on direct observation where GOI priorities are based on policy (Holloway, 1989, p 143);
- There is greater flexibility of finding ways to reach the poor which are not limited to village hierarchy (but cannot ignore traditional social structure either) (Holloway, 1989, p 143);
- NGOs have less rigid operation and can be flexible in trying new alternatives that GOI would find difficult to attempt (Holloway, 1989, p 143);
- NGOs have particular strength in; encouraging local decision-making, participation, bottom-up planning and accountability (Holloway, 1989, p 156);
- NGOs provide an alternate source of innovation for government to devise new and effective means to address development problems (Riker, 1995b, p 94);
- NGOs' direct contact with their constituents makes them more aware and responsive to needs than GOI which tends to be dominated by elite interests (Cleary, 1995, p 10);

- NGO have two sources of knowledge to contribute to development, technical expertise about the services they provide and people to whom they provide services, and popular knowledge about their constituencies (Phillips, 1995, p 5);
- NGOs' direct access to marginalized groups and their regular contact with them makes NGOs more cognizant of their interests and needs and places NGOs in the position of mediator between the individuals and the institutions, they can best articulate people's needs into specific demands for government to meet (Berninghausen, 1992, p 196);
- NGOs bottom-up approach to development allows them to reach the poorest and most marginalized members of the target group (MacDonald, 1994, p 3);
- Women's NGOs have proven themselves to be effective in presenting women's priorities at various levels, from local to international (OCDE, 1991, p 55); and
- Women's NGOs have had success in increasing the space for women to participate in decision making processes (OCDE, 1991, p 55)

The above two lists focused on the positive, beneficial characteristics typical of NGOs. Based on these characteristics alone, NGOs do appear to be the elusive magic bullet of development. NGOs also have inherent weaknesses that can offset or negate their benefits as agents of development. Again, the weaknesses discussed below do not apply to all NGOs. A given NGO may display all, some or none of these traits.

"For all their much-vaunted flexibility, non-profit organizations [NGOs] remain organizations. As they grow in scale and complexity, they are vulnerable to all the limitations that afflict other bureaucratic institutions – unresponsiveness, cumbersomeness and routinization, lack of coordination...they are not immune to...tensions that arise between flexibility and effectiveness, grassroots control and administrative accountability" (Lester Salamon qtd in Tandon, 1994, p 6).

NGOs, in countries where government does not facilitate or encourage them, are at risk of: isolation, duplication, competition, and failure to learn from collective success or failure¹² (Egbert, 1983, p 67). The risk could be minimized by networking and free exchange of information between NGOs working in the area of women's issues. Further weaknesses arise from NGOs marginal position in the development process, their lack of formality and resources that make project implementation inconsistent, small-scale, and possibly ineffective (Holloway, 1989, p 147).

A current difficulty experienced by MIWNs is the lack of a network between them. An article published about the recent dissolution of the Indonesian women's group. *Yayasan Perempuan Mardika*¹³(YPM) demonstrates the value of networking and experience sharing among MIWNs to promote collective learning. A founder of the now dissolved organization published a summary of her impression of the events leading to YPM's end. She identified areas that are a common weakness of NGOs. The weaknesses arose from a lack of professionalism, accountability to their members, and a problem of control. The lack of professionalism in some NGOs leads to problems of accountability to donors in fulfilling requirements for administrative reporting and progress reporting.

Another area of NGO weakness is their position vis-à-vis authorities and donors. NGO priorities may be overshadowed by pressure from donors, or priorities and programs may be altered to fit donor requirements to receive funding (MacDonald, 1992, p 15). Also, as NGOs are increasingly recognized as efficient and effective implementer of development, more international development funding is being channeled through NGO. In an effort to access this new source of finances (Korten, 1990), governments may co-

opt NGOs or set up quasi-NGOs (GONGOs). NGOs may feel they have to change their objectives to satisfy funding requirements. This can weaken their ability to represent members or constituents.

Another weakness brought on by the availability of funding is the development of 'opportunistic' NGOs set up to access funding to benefit individuals who have no commitment to development issues (Riker, 1995a, p 48). The existence of 'opportunistic' NGOs puts the reputation and image of legitimate NGOs in peril. In his discussion of NGO roles in the 'creation and maintenance of a pluralist, democratic civil society' Ian Smillie points out the different realities faced by NGOs. In reference to Indonesian NGOs he points out that the endogenous NGO may be led into 'unfair and unwinnable contests with their governments' (Smillie, 1993, p 36).

In the Indonesian case, mechanisms for networking between local NGOs would be very useful to overcome these weaknesses. Local NGOs are excluded from KOWANI that is the primary networking organization for women's groups in Indonesia. The local NGOs tend to maintain low visibility that restricts vital institutional learning, resource sharing, and coordination at the regional and national level. The current climate of distrust makes such networking difficult, if not impossible. Networking in Indonesia is made more complex by virtue of the nation's vast size and plurality of cultures, languages, and difference of needs.

4.3 NGOs as Development Partners

Section 4.1 showed the benefits derived by participants through public participation. There is a growing awareness of the value of public participation, for both participants

and policy makers. Increasing public participation has moved from being an idealistic undertaking to being a requirement for sustainability (UNDP, 1993, p 99). Gathering input from the grassroots level during policy formation contributes to the development of effective policies that have a higher chance of achieving their desired impact (Farrington, 1993, p 8). NGOs may not be the magic bullet of development, but they can add to the process.

The literature supports NGOs as important components in building and maintaining civil society¹⁴, as promoters and practitioners of people-centred development, and as agents of democracy. They act as 'counter-balances' to government in civil society (Edwards, 1995, Liefer, 1995), more specifically protecting human-rights, providing the means for communication between the government and the public, opening the way for public participation and providing the means to develop skills required to be activists (Edwards, 1995, p 4). NGOs like the MIWNs studied here can fulfill the role of conduit to bring participation from the grassroots to policy formation.

The value of NGOs as development agents can be applied to MIWNs who have a role to play in development. MIWN's area of knowledge and expertise focuses on enhancing women's position in Indonesian society and in reforming discriminatory practices which disadvantage women. Their expertise and knowledge, gained through operating and being in contact with women, covers topics of relevance to GOI policy formation on women's issues. It is partially for this reason that MIWNs are being proposed as a conduit for public participation into policy formation on enhancing the role of women in national development.

NGOs are often described as components of democratic development and as elements of a civil society. Civil society can be understood to mean "the network of institutions through which groups in society in general represent themselves - both to each other and to the state" (Shaw, 1994, p 647). NGO literature identifies NGOs as being one category of institution, or actor, in a civil society. The other role identified for NGOs relates to enabling people-centred development that "encourages the fullest participation of the people in conceptualizing their development needs and in development decision-making with regards to the control and use of scarce resources" (Heyzer, 1995, p 4). MIWNs would be contributing to this last role by becoming involved in the policy formation process.

NGOs have performed the role of influencing government policies, laws, and legislation with a fair degree of success in Asia since the mid 1980's (Bhatt, 1995, p 86). Three roles are identified for Asian NGOs to fill at the political level:

- to support and empower local communities at the grassroots, which is essential for achieving sustainable development;
- to develop greater political influence through networking within and across national boundaries; and
- to participate in shaping the direction of development agendas (Heyzer, 1995, p 8)

According to David Korten, NGOs have important roles to play in democratic development. They supplement political parties as varied and flexible mechanisms through which citizens define and articulate a broad range of interests; meet local needs; make demands of government; educate the population on the principles and skills required for effective participation; and serve as watchdogs on the state's

tendency to 'centralize its power and to evade civic accountability and control' (Korten, 1990, p 99)

NGOs in Indonesia, MIWNs included, have a role to play as catalysts for redirecting the development agenda from an emphasis on economics to one more representative of people's needs (Heyzer, 1995, p 5). Many of the larger programs for women in Indonesia assume that an improvement in women's economic position will translate into improvements in social status and their role within society (Berninghausen, 1992, p 219). If women's issues are only viewed at the macro level, government planners and policy makers will remain unable to develop effective policies to help women at the grassroots/micro level. Involving MIWNs in policy formation is one way to incorporate bottom-up input.

From GOI's perspective, there are benefits to be gained from tapping into MIWNs as a resource for development. In an era of shrinking economic resources, government capacity in terms of staff, programming, and resources are also diminishing. NGOs represent a potential source of innovation and bring a wealth of experience, contacts, and expertise at the local level that the government cannot otherwise access. The potential synergy of combining skills and resources could contribute to the discovery of new approaches and the resolution of old development problems (Riker, 1995b, p102).

This type of co-operation would permit MIWNs to play the role of policy advocates, in integrating their grassroots knowledge into government programs and policies at the development stage. MIWNs' value as development resources is not to be confused as their being in the service of the government. Use of MIWN knowledge and skills as

resources in policy formation is intended to benefit MIWNs as well as the policies which could be made to support MIWN goals through their involvement in the formulation.

MIWNs could provide GOI with insights into women's gender specific interests that could improve efforts to enhance the role of women in national development. NGOs in Indonesia operate in a 'pluralistic' mode (Smillie, 1993, pp. 16-7) characterized by a clear separation of power between the three sectors¹⁵, this creates obstacles to collaboration on both sides which need to be overcome for MIWN-GOI consultation to be successful.

Co-operation between GOI and NGOs should not be idealized as simple or a panacea to all development problems however. It is not as simple as maximizing the joint effort by tapping each party's comparative advantage (Farrington, 1993, p 7). There are many factors that will influence the outcome of GOI-NGO co-operation. Theoretically, each party would benefit from the interaction, but past experience in Indonesia has shown that is not necessarily so (Holloway, 1989, p151). The GOI-NGO relationship is discussed further in Chapter Six.

Each side will consider a number of factors before choosing to enter into any formal collaboration. Fear of repression or retaliation from government may cause NGOs to avoid entering into a consultative relationship. Governments are generally afraid of losing control of the development process or of appearing ineffective. A balance sheet of benefits and disadvantages from both perspectives is presented as Table No. 4.2.

Table No. 4.2: The Benefits and Disadvantages of Collaboration

FROM THE GOVERNMENT PERSPECTIVE	
BENEFITS	DISADVANTAGES
1. Better delivery facilities for government services	1. GO services shown to be inefficient by NGOs' presence and actions
2. More information available from the grassroots	2. NGO mobilization work promotes social instability
3. More interaction with 'targets'	3. Demand for government services may increase beyond capacity to meet it
4. Enhanced cost-effectiveness	4. NGOs compete with government for donors' funds
5. Field-testing facilities for new technologies	5. Weakening of government mandate and credibility
6. Appropriate training inputs available from NGO specialists	6. The unaccountability of NGOs
7. More co-ordination of GO-NGO activities possible; more control of NGOs in general	
FROM THE NGO PERSPECTIVE	
BENEFITS	DISADVANTAGES
1. Improved access to policy formation	1. Co-optation by government and greater bureaucratic controls
2. Access to specialist research facilities and expertise	2. The NGO grows to assume a more bureaucratic character
3. Opportunity to improve government services 'from within' by training	3. Loss of NGO autonomy and independence
4. Access to new technologies 'from above'	4. Relegation to mere delivery activities to the detriment of NGOs' wider programme
5. Opportunities for passing on technologies and models for replication or 'scaling up'	5. Government takes credit for NGO achievements

Source: Farrington, 1993, p 317

NGOs cannot transform the power structures of a nation without the co-operation of government (Clark, 1991, pp 64-6). This is not to say that NGOs should join government efforts at a cost of abandoning their own agendas. It is merely a recognition that the state plays a central role in defining the nation's dialogue. The state is responsible for the formulation of macro-level policies and national agenda setting. It is through NGO-GOI interaction that MIWNs can influence macro-level policy formulation, most likely in a consultative relationship. As implied by the title of this

research, a harmonious partnership between the two sides, not an equal partnership, is being examined.

4.4 Discussion

A fundamental question concerning NGOs is 'why?' not 'what are?'. The 'why' behind NGOs has roots in morals. It relates to individuals' rights to influence process and policy that affect their existence. The push for increased social activism, and increased co-operation between government and NGOs (as a vehicle for public participation and influence) is about ownership of process. Involvement of NGOs in the planning and implementation stages is not the only means for effective, responsive development; in some cases they may not even be able to contribute. However, they do possess characteristics as described in Sub-section 4.2.2 that put them in the position of being able to make a valuable contribution.

Development as it affects the lives and potential of many individuals is a multistakeholder process. There exist multiple groups and individuals who have a stake in the direction and pace of development. Multistakeholder consultations on development issues are not a universal practice however. Often, the process of defining development is carried out in a top-down fashion. A top-down approach, while potentially allowing development to progress quickly, does not recognize or validate stakeholder ownership of the process of development. Public participation has the potential of benefiting individual participants as well. However, if people are not able to participate in the development process, when there exists a reasonable chance of a positive-sum gain, they will not realize any of the benefits described.

Enhancement of NGO participation in planning national development constitutes one form of multistakeholder approach¹⁶. UN related recognition of the legitimacy of NGOs' role in the development process arose during the preparation of Our Common Future, when Gro Harlem Brundtland made great efforts to consult NGOs for the unique perspective they could contribute (Clark, 1991, p 6). Also, the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development employed a multistakeholder approach, drawing participants from environmental groups (NGOs) around the world. The legitimacy of multiple stakeholder input into the process was formally identified and NGOs granted a precedent setting place in the conference and during its preparation^{17, 18}.

The development and adoption of multistakeholder approaches can give formal recognition to the legitimacy of NGO claims to provide input into political and policy forming processes. The shift from economics centred development to social justice is led by the realization that the economic model of development is "morally and intellectually bankrupt" (Macdonald, 1994, p 4).

"Thinking about the role of civil society at both national and international levels reveals that NGOs' role in development is not subordinate or peripheral to government's role, but central. If development is about empowering people, about challenging existing hierarchies of class, race, ethnicity and gender...then NGOs are potentially the best situated to undertake these tasks." (MacDonald, 1994, p 13)

Justifying a role for NGOs in this process is premised on the assumption that MIWNs are willing to become involved with the government. Even if GOI were to consider MIWNs capable of making valuable contributions to developing effective policies to 'enhance the role of women in national development', it is not a certainty that co-operation with GOI policy makers would be desired by MIWNs. Productive co-operation

requires the existence of a minimum degree of trust and acceptance between the two groups. If the balance of power is too uneven, co-optation, not co-operation will be the result. During my research I developed the impression that MIWNs were wary of GOI through not to the degree that they abandoned their objectives.

NGOs expose themselves to the risk of retaliation from officials when they address controversial issues against the interests of status quo (Clark, 1991, p 7). The nature of the potential relationship between MIWNs and GOI depends on the socio-political climate in which the interaction takes place. The next chapter explores the location of women oriented efforts in Indonesia. Chapter Six looks at the legal and ideological context in which MIWNs and other Indonesian NGOs are operating.

¹ I chose to use the term 'collaborator' in place of 'partner' to emphasis the reality of NGO-GOI relations. A partnership arrangement is would not likely receive strong support from either side. Reasons for this are explored in Table No. 4.1.

² These contending agenda recall feminist theory which believes that power can be derived from having the power to define dialogue. In this case, GOI, KOWANI (and members), and MIWNs are competing to define the dialogue on women's place in Indonesian society.

³ Quasi-participation is a term that I am using to identify instances where people are involved as participants to provide legitimization for decisions already taken or policies already created. This type of rubber stamping counter-acts the value of participation for achieving higher effectiveness in development. Once citizens, as participants, loose confidence in the validity of their participation they may become skeptical about investing their time and effort in subsequent decision making.

⁴ Intangible costs associated with gender roles might include the fear of permission to participate being denied on the basis of gender, the possibility that views may not be considered valuable because they have been expressed by a women, or harassment from men or authorities for speaking out.

⁵ Each public participation undertaking is different, it success or failure influenced by the nature of the issues, willingness to participate from all potential interests, ability of different groups to represent and articulate their views, and logistical concern which may influence participants ability to reach or attend sessions.

⁶ As indicated in the introduction to this paper, this research is based on a literature of gender theory and its application to the Indonesian case.

⁷ Power is often have the power to define what is true, what is important, what is desirable, what is needed. If MIWNs were able to include their knowledge and

experience in the policy making process, they would be legitimized by government and share in the process of defining the dialogue on women's position in Indonesian society.

⁸ Edwards & Hulme define NGOs as "intermediary organization engaged in funding or offering other forms of support to communities and other organizations", and GROs as "membership organizations of various kinds or community based organizations". (1995, p 15)

⁹ Ian Smillie provides a good discussion of these roles (1993, p 18).

¹⁰ This list of benefits has been selectively adapted from a Canadian publication to make them applicable to the Indonesian case

¹¹ Holloway suggests that lower level officials in GOI may be tempted to report unsuccessful projects as successful to continue funding or to avoid a negative image (1989, p 143).

¹² The next chapter will discuss the case of Yasanti, and how one ex-member feels other NGOs could learn from its demise.

¹³ I am referring to the article "Myth of the Effective Little NGO", according to the author YPM was one of only two NGOs working with women workers and is the only NGO to have been voluntarily disbanded by its members.

¹⁴ Michael Leifer describes civil society as "human freedom and dignity and the right not to be subjected to political oppression", a universal not subject to cultural relativism (1995, p 354)

¹⁵ The three sectors referred to here can be defined as the public or government, the private or citizens, and the third sector, voluntary sector or NGO sector.

¹⁶ NGO involvement as conduits for public participation is not the only means governments can achieve multistakeholder development. Recently Status of Women Canada undertook a pan-Canadian consultation with stakeholder to develop better consultative mechanisms to ensure that future action by SWC follows from the priorities of Canadian women. It happened that many of the participants were representatives of women's organizations and spoke on behalf of that entire group.

¹⁷ A group, the Canadian Participatory Committee (CPCU) for UNCED was set up to coordinate the participation of Canadian NGOs in all of Canada's preparations for UNCED, and a selected number were part of the Canadian Delegation.

¹⁸ The researcher served as an NGO coordinator at the Canadian National Secretariat for UNCED during the final lead-up to the conference, and as such was in a position to observe this first hand.

5.0 LOCATION OF WID ACTIVITY IN INDONESIA

In the course of researching available literature on women in Indonesia, the need was identified for an inventory of WID activities. This chapter presents my research findings on the location and type of activities and organizations working on women's issues. It constitutes this research's contribution to the body of literature on women's NGOs in Indonesia. The information presented in the following sections is derived from: review of literature on women in Indonesia; government publications on programs and policies for enhancing the role of women in national development; and personal interviews with individuals from the different categories.

The information presented in these sections does not represent an exhaustive listing of all WID activity, only those which could be identified and researched within the constraints of the research (a/o.: time, financial, linguistic, accessibility, identification of potential contacts, willingness of individuals to be interviewed). As discussed in the introduction, the complex socio-political climate in Indonesia acted to limit the possible range of this research¹

Limitations of this research are such that the inventory created is not exhaustive, but more a conceptual framework for identifying types and location of activities, interaction between categories, and opportunities for strengthening and reinforcing efforts. The 'roadmap' of WID activity is presented in Section 5.2., and could be used as a benchmark for extending consultative mechanisms to include organizations classed as MIWN in this research.

5.1 Formal Consultation Structure

Figure No. 5.1: National Consultation Mechanisms for Enhancing the Role of Women

Source: UPW Pamp. 'Machinery for the Advancement of Women', 1991

The national consultation mechanism, as presented in UPW promotional pamphlet, is included as Figure No. 5.1. In Figure No. 5.1, the thick lines represent formal 'line' consultations, and the thin line represents consultative relationships. Looking at this diagram of the consultation mechanisms used to develop policies for improving women's position, it appears as though extensive consultations are taking place.

However, there is little or no public consultation with NGOs if KOWANI is reclassified as a government organization because of its close ties to GOI. The rest of this section describes and classifies the locations of WID activity discovered during research. As already noted, this is not an exhaustive list but provides a roadmap to the types of activity taking place. Where organizations identified in Figure No. 5.1 are discussed, the nature of their input and ability to influence policy will be addressed.

5.2 Governmental:

The primary governmental mechanism for the enhancement of the role of women in national development in Indonesia is the State Ministry for the Role of Women. As discussed in Chapter Three, UPW as a 'State' ministry serves in an advisory capacity only. Programs aimed at women are implemented by 'line' ministries in their respective areas. Ideally, staff of each ministry should be trained in GAD so that gender considerations might be incorporated into projects and policies as a foundation rather than being implemented as add-ons.

5.2.1 Family Welfare Movement (PKK)

PKK is the tenth² section of the Village Resilience Council (Suryakusuma, 1991, p 58). The organizational structure and guidance mechanisms for PKK and LKMD is included as Appendix G. The Family Welfare Movement (PKK) is the most wide spread of the women's organizations, and is run by the Ministry of Home Affairs with cadres from the national to village level in over 70,000 villages. Both PKK and LKMD are identified in Figure No. 5.1 as part of the formal consultation mechanism. Communication between PKK and GOI is primarily top-down with weak mechanism for bringing grass-roots information up to the policy level.

"The PKK aims at a universal appeal based on the dual premises that all individuals are members of a family and that every one seeks welfare. The target of the PKK programmes is that the family be recognized as the basic unit of society. Further, since the mother performs the central role in the family, the programmes are focused on her and on women in general, stressing their maternal and economic roles. The PKK is based on a structure that enables it to reach down to the grassroots of society, and to plan and coordinate its activities with government programmes and sources of funding" (UNFPA, 1989, p 30).

PKK is the only mass-membership organization authorized by GOI to operate in the rural areas. The organization has a very strong ideological and practical link to the government (Wieringa, 1985, p 103). The state philosophy, Pancasila, is taught at all levels in Indonesia; in the rural areas the PKK is responsible for its teaching in the rural areas (Int. 26).

PKK runs a program which provides seed money for the establishment of revolving credit funds. This initiative is jointly financed by the national and provincial governments, the banking system (soft loans), and loans or grants from industry (Int. 26). In 1992 there was Rp. 42 billion in PKK revolving funds (Int. 26).

5.2.2 Komisi Nasional Kedudukan Wanita Indonesia (KNKWI)

In 1968 the Ministry of Home Affairs in conjunction with KOWANI established the Indonesian National Commission of the Status of Women (KNKWI) to assist in identifying and addressing women's issues (Int. 25, Int. 28). Its formation was influenced by the UN and made possible by the New Order government which had committed itself to improving women's position.

KNKWI's original function was similar, although smaller in scope than that of UPW. Since the development of UPW, the role of KNKWI has changed and become much less visible. It carries out an important function in facilitating the discourse of women's issues. The commission draws together representatives from different sectors in 'open and to the point discussion' (Int. 28) between government and NGO members. KNKWI's information pamphlet is included as Appendix H.

KNKWI does not support the 'affirmative action' approach to improving women's position. Which more closely resembles a WID approach and GOI's goal than it does a GAD approach and MIWNs' goal of emancipation. KNKWI believes that quality and not quantity should be the goal when designing policies to improve women's position in society (Int. 28).

5.2.3 Coordination for Development

There is an effort underway to gather information to inform the development of Repelita policies using bottom-up techniques (Int. 23). The project, 'Pilot Model for Gender Responsive Effective People's Participation in Development Planning' is a grassroots oriented project funded by the United Nations Development Fund for Women. The two year

pilot project was scheduled to start September 1994. The executing agency is the Directorate General for Village Community Development of the Ministry of Home Affairs (UNIFEM, 1994). Universitas Indonesia and two women's study centres are also involved as collaborating agencies.

The coordination meetings for development start at the village level and the information is filtered up to BAPANAS at the national level, through the sub-district, district, regency, and provincial levels. The project concentrates on one sector as a model and involves eight villages in each of two provinces (Int. 3).

There is another project funded by the United Nations Development Fund, the 'Pilot Gender-Responsive Development Planning: Department of Home Affairs'. This is a 30 month top-down gender program executed by the Bureau of Planning, Department of Home Affairs. The pilot project was planned to correspond with ongoing planning activities. Its objective is to develop gender analysis and gender-responsive planning skills amongst GOI policy makers, planners, and program staff (UNDP, 1993).

As discussed previously, MIWNs experience and skills are different from GOI. By involving MIWNs in the consultation process, both GOI and the MIWNs benefit. Being able to influence national dialogue is a strategic benefit for MIWNs, as will be discussed at the end of this chapter. Because MIWNs have a day-to-day relationship with their members and/or constituents, they are constantly aware of needs and problems. GOI only engages in policy formation every five years and does not have grassroots contact in the intervening period. If MIWNs were permitted to participate in policy formation, GOI would benefit from their

daily experience. MIWNs would not be working for GOI, as they would benefit from the participation.

5.2.4 WID Advocacy Committee

The WID Advocacy Committees (WAC) were set up by the previous Minister of UPW. They operate at the provincial level and district level to address women's specific needs in development planning. In Figure No. 5.1, they are identified as the Provincial and District/Municipal WID Teams respectively. At the provincial level WAC includes a staff member of the provincial development planning association (BAPPEDA) while other committee members are drawn from the Women's Studies Centres (WSC's) and government recognized women's groups (Int. 2).

This organizational form has not yet resulted in open consultation which has the potential of identifying women's needs at the grassroots level because of the restriction of what groups can participate. At present the WID Advocacy Committee does not meet women's strategic gender needs or gather the type of public participation that MIWNs could supply. The content of these discussions tend to focus on funding activities rather than research or policy (Int. 12). At the district/municipal level, the same structure is repeated as shown in Figure No. 5.1.

UPW does support the activities of the WACs, the Chair and Vice-Chair of the provincial WACs are invited to an annual conference of WACs hosted by UPW to discuss women's programs (Int. 2) and how to implement policies and report on progress (Int. 26). This is another means by which the government is attempting to gather information and

disseminate information to improve the effectiveness of policies on women. During the 1994 celebration of Hari Ibu, 16 of the 27 provinces received awards from GOI for their support of women's issues (Int. 12), this was an effort to increase the perceived value of such activities and encourage WAC members to continue increasing the effort and emphasis involved in their discussions.

5.2.5 Clearing House for ASEAN Women's Programme

Indonesia is a member of ASEAN, and as an extension of that membership, participates in the ASEAN Women's Program (AWP). The Clearing House for ASEAN Women's Program was set up in the National Science and Research Institute (LIPI) following the 1980 AWP meeting in Bangkok in 1980. It is intended as a documentation centre for UPW. While the intention was for the information in the Clearing House to be used by UPW, this objective has not been realized. No requests for information have been made by UPW during the 1990's, and UPW has not provided the Clearing House with copies of documentation it has produced (Int. 1). Three other member countries, Thailand, Philippines, and Brunei have documentation centres which operate under their Ministries for women (Int. 1).

The Clearing House represents an underutilized opportunity for intra-governmental cooperation on addressing women's issues. It has a large collection of materials on women in the form of international papers, United Nations Documents, current academic work, books addressing specific issues of women's strategic needs, and academic papers. Combining the resources and documentation of UPW and the Clearing House would reduce duplication, cut costs, and potentially increase effectiveness.

In the *"Approved Guidelines for the Implementation of the Declaration of the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region and Mainstreaming of Women in ASEAN"*, the fourth objective of the *"Declaration of the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region"* (Appendix I) is to be addressed at the regional level by "Promot[ing] active involvement of NGOs in AWP and other ASEAN activities", and at the national level by "Support[ing] and encourag[ing] grassroots participatory processes and planning approaches using local talents, expertise and resources", and by "Promot[ing] GO-NGO partnerships in the planning, implementation and monitoring of gender-responsive programs" (AWP, 1993, pp 4-5)

5.2.6 Biro Pusat Statistik (Central Bureau of Statistics)

BPS is responsible for collecting national data. They have begun to publish a volume focusing on women and their social condition. In 1995, editions were available for 1992 and 1993. The information published by BPS is primarily quantitative, statistical findings. The inclusion of more qualitative techniques to incorporate a gender perspective could provide more illuminating results. By looking beyond mere numbers, GOI may gain a better insight into the strategic interests of the women they wish to empower³.

The conclusions drawn from this data tend to support government objectives and indicate government success in improving women's condition. Some are skeptical of the results, saying, "It is a matter of interpretation. They [GOI] do it from their perspective. If we do it with our perspective we can use it as a weapon - prove that women are still ignored, especially in the rural areas" (Int. 8). Criticism of BPS data collection techniques included: phrasing of questions to elicit a desired response; desire of respondents to please the

surveyor leading to inaccurate results; failure to provide women a private consultation in which they can respond without being heard by men; asking about sensitive issues which women will not respond to openly (Int. 8).

5.3 Quasi-Governmental:

The current relation between government and non-governmental organizations today is such that most of the organizations recognized by the government as NGO's could arguably be classified as governmental. This is due to the control exerted by the central government over the actions of individuals to organize, meet in groups, and carry out activities in urban or rural areas. The organizations classified as 'Quasi-Governmental' are so classed because of their close relationship with the government. They are the type of organizations classed as GONGOs in the literature. The term NGO used by UPW in Figure No. 5.1 refers to these organizations, KOWANI in particular.

5.3.1 Kongres Wanita Indonesia (KOWANI)

"As the NGO machinery for the integration of women in development, KOWANI has a working programme supportive of national development policies...It is currently engaged in intensive programmes in support of the national aim to create or redirect norms that are conducive to the small happy and prosperous family ideals." (UNFPA, 1989, p 22)

The largest organization in this class is Kongress Wanita Indonesia (KOWANI), with 25 million members (Int. 17). KOWANI is an umbrella organization for national women's organizations. A pamphlet prepared by the organization to describe its purpose is included as Appendix J. It's specific purpose is to adopt and implement the GOI policies on women as laid out in the GBHN (Int. 18). All of KOWANI's issues are adopted by member

organizations and implemented from the top level down to the grassroots (Int. 18). Appendix J contains a list of the organizations that are members of KOWANI.

In a report prepared by the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), KOWANI is encouraged to use its role as the official umbrella organization for national women's organizations to influence government policy and "bring critical issues to the attention of decision-makers" (UNFPA, 1993, p 3). KOWANI's membership is restricted to national organizations, with roughly a third of its member organizations being composed of wives of civil servants associations (Douglas, 1980), though the Dharma associations only account for seven⁴ (Int. 18) of the seventy-two member organizations.

The restriction to national organizations has implications for the types of interests and experiences members can contribute to policy making. The types of organizations that can maintain a national profile and carry out activities in all provinces will yield fundamentally different experiences than would a local, grassroots oriented NGO. The diverse and expansive nature of Indonesia as a country has implications for women's interests. The differences between regions will mean that daily activities are different, conditions are different, and women's interests are different.

The ten spheres of women's activities addressed by KOWANI (according to Sullivan⁵) are:

1. the creation of good relations within and between families;
2. correct child care;
3. the use of hygienic food preparation techniques and close attention to nutrition;
4. care that clothing is suited to its proper functions - protection, morality, modesty;

5. intelligent use of house space to meet needs of hygiene, privacy, entertainment, etc.;
6. the securing of total family health - in physical, mental, spiritual and moral spheres;
7. effective household budgeting;
8. efficient basic housekeeping, calculated to maximize order and cleanliness;
9. the preservation of emotional and physical security and a tranquil environment in the home; and
10. the development of family attitudes appropriate to the modernization process - planning for the future (Sullivan, 1983, pp 154-5).

While I am left with the impression that KOWANI is not capable of accurately representing⁶ women's needs to the government in their role as the official NGO national machinery, the organization does fulfill many valuable functions. It participates in international fora on women and provides support for a number of initiatives. KOWANI's status as the only women's organization with access to authority and policy formation gives the organization a privileged or exclusive position. Opening the consultations to include organizations like MIWNs will eliminate KOWANI's exclusive status. This potential loss of status is likely to be resisted.

In the present relationship with GOI, KOWANI implements GOI policy and generates support for those policies amongst its members. KOWANI also fulfills practical roles (see Appendix J) and engages in dialogue with GOI. There is a difference in how KOWANI does, and how MIWNs might affect the dialogue. This difference arises from the nature of their respective constituents, mandates, and ideological foundations. MIWNs are more

likely to take a feminist stand that aims to redistribute power. They are more likely to orient their participation to shaping, rather than implementing policy.

MIWN's feminist agenda is not the only agenda that could benefit policy making. MIWNs are not able to represent all the women of Indonesia, there exist other groups of organizations which could act as conduits for other agenda. The desired public participation format would draw together representative conduits from all agenda⁷.

5.3.2 Wives of Civil Servants Associations

1974 brought a number of changes for women in Indonesia. The long awaited Marriage Law reforms were introduced to mixed reaction. It also marked a major restructuring of women's organizations by the government. Wives associations were brought together as Dharma Wanita (wives of civil servants) and Dharma Pertiwi (wives of ABRI) (Int. 14). Their membership and organization mirror that of their associated government institution, with wives holding the equivalent position in the Dharma unit to that of their husband (Suryakusuma, 1991, p 53). A chart showing Dharma Wanita's organizational structure is included as Appendix K.

Although membership is not optional to wives of civil servants, some members derive distinct benefits from participation. The Dharma wives of civil servants associations can provide a status benefit to its higher place members (Int. 23). The new wave of women activists are skeptical of the large women's organizations. Dharma Wanita has been nicknamed "Drama Wanita" due to their wearing of uniforms and perceived habit of traveling in large groups - looking very dramatic and important (Int. 7).

"...it [Dharma] is employed to exert major pressure to ensure the success of New Order development through the concept of the family as the smallest administrative unit and ideologically through the principle of 'family relations'." (Gender and Democracy, 1992, p 1)

5.4 Non-Governmental:

NGO activity aimed at effecting a change in the role of women in national development takes place in a variety of forms. Among the forms found in Indonesia are: indigenous NGOs, collaboration between Indigenous NGOs and foreign NGO's, collaboration between indigenous NGOs and international NGOs (CARE, Ford Foundation, Aga Khan Foundation, sponsorship of indigenous NGOs by international NGOs or multilateral organizations (i.e.: International Labour Organization, United Nations programmes, Asian Development Bank).

There are other identifiable groups of women's organization in Indonesia who might also wish to act as conduits for public participation into policy formation. One such category of indigenous activities are religion groups who work with women in both the rural and urban areas. These organizations are not the focus of this research, and are not to be considered part of the 'modern Indonesian Women's NGOs' (MIWNs) on which I have focused. Religious women's group activities tend to focus on women's practical gender needs and on the interpretation of religious doctrine as it relates to the role of women and as such excludes them from the group of organization studied in this research.

My decision to exclude religious women's groups⁸ from the category MIWN does not imply that I feel them to be of no value, or that their activities are insignificant and should not be drawn into the policy making process. The objectives and motivation arising from their religious base does not place them in the category identified by my criteria. My reasons for

excluding religious based groups is twofold. The foremost reason is that there is tension between Islam and GOI which dates back to Independence which I believe precludes any potential for collaboration. The second is that religious-based activities are not based on gender theory and do not fit the criteria for this research.

5.4.1 NGOs with Women Specific Projects

Of the thousands of NGO in Indonesia, some have projects aimed at women. The projects might fit the same profile as MIWN activities, but the larger organization does not. For this reason I am classifying them separately. This section includes some examples of activities and organizations in this classification.

One NGO with women specific projects is AKATIGA. This organization uses the Harvard Analytical Model and Caroline Moser's work (Int. 21, 22). Other groups such as international organizations like OXFAM provide gender training for NGOs. There is also co-operation with Netherlands and Canadian NGOs, to help Indonesian NGOs hold gender awareness training sessions. These sessions are more progressive than the government related activities (Int. 21, 22). In 1995, the Australian government donated Rp. 10 million to increase awareness of women's rights in Irian Jaya. The funds were distributed among NGOs working on women's issues by the NGO forum Fokker Irian Jaya (Hani, Jakarta Post, 11/06/95).

5.4.2 Modern Indonesian Women's NGOs (MIWNs)

I was able to locate MIWNs on Java, Bali, Lombok, and Kalimantan. I do not know whether they exist in other provinces. MIWNs generally develop in urban areas with a university.

Due to the geographic diversity of Indonesia, the MIWNs most likely to be able to engage in collaboration with GOI at the national level are those located on Java. It would be desirable to develop a network between all MIWNs, as they are currently excluded from membership in KOWANI because they do not meet the criterion of being national.

MIWNs employ a threefold strategy in addressing women's issues. The first strategy involves approaching the problems in women's awareness of issues and rights. The second strategy involves the reformation of law's affecting women, such as the marriage law⁹. The final strategy employed by Indonesian women's NGO's is demonstrations (Int. 15). Given the current relationship of GOI with NGO's, demonstrations are not very frequent.

I will not include any long discussion of particular MIWN activity. The list below gives and indication of the objectives and activities of the MIWNs identified in this research¹⁰. The discussion at the end of this chapter looks at one MIWN in detail, to explore how it might have benefited from a channel to authority.

- Organization A provides counseling to women who are the victims of violence, abuse, or rape;
- Organization B researches and analyses information from a gender/feminist perspective. It also disseminates this information, runs a reference library, and acts as an advocate for women's right nationally and internationally;
- Organization C works with women workers in the urban area, helping them protect their rights and tries to encourage the development of legislation to help the workers;

- Organization D provides gender analysis training and acts as an organizer for other NGO seeking gender analysis training. This organization has contact with the CIDA funded Women's Support Project;
- Organization E is a social justice organization that holds public meetings to increase awareness of social issues with a focus on women's issues. This group also travels around Jakarta presenting conscious raising theatre (Detlor, 1994, p 33); and
- Organization F is a human rights organization (its is discussed further below).

These are not the only MIWNs in Indonesia; they are included here to provide an example of the types of activities MIWNs carry out. They and other MIWN carry out activities in the areas of research, health care, consciousness raising on women's issues, increasing legal literacy, child care, and more specifically feminist techniques such as theatre.

MIWNs share the characteristics described in Chapter Four, but are not a homogeneous group of organizations. They range in form and function, are registered and unregistered. Not all MIWNs are membership organizations. One in particular focuses on education and acts as a facilitator for the development and operation of other MIWNs.

The following discussion is included as an example of how a MIWN might be formed, or changed. A strong women's human rights organization was founded in 1990¹¹. The founding members possessed training and / or experience in the areas of: psychology, sociology, journalism, community organizations and law. When first established, Organization F was structured as a foundation but changed to an association in 1993 when

it determined that its desired role could not be adequately fulfilled in that form (Int. 14). This organization has male and female members in the urban and rural areas.

Despite strong government rejection of feminism as an unsuitable western concept, many of the Indonesian women's NGO's believe in the concepts of feminism and seek to increase awareness of feminist issues (Int. 15). A booklet, Some Question on Feminism and its Relevance in South Asia (Bhasin & Khan, 1986) is used to promote the applicability of feminist concepts to South Asian and the Indonesian experience. The questions discussed include:

- ⇒ Isn't feminism a western notion and therefore quite irrelevant in South Asia?
- ⇒ All this sounds reasonable, but then why is feminism so threatening? Why is it always under attack? Why is it so often ridiculed and misrepresented? Why does it invite so much hostility?
- ⇒ Are you saying that even though men do not realize it, in the long run feminism will be good for both women and men?

Another aspect of MIWN activity in Indonesia relates to the Asia-Pacific NGO Symposium held in Manila in 1993 was attended by 50 women activists from Indonesia and resulted in the recognition of the need for regional cooperation between NGOs (Int. 14). The Women's Forum was formed out of this impetus. The Women's Forum held forums addressing women's issues in different location throughout Indonesia in the year preceding the Beijing conference (Int. 14). The main purpose of this organization is to prepare for the 1995 Beijing Conference, after that its future is unclear (Int. 14), it received some of its funding from external sources including the Ford Foundation and LIMPAD (Int. 14) to produce a

newsletter and hold 10 workshop/seminar/training sessions. The newsletter was distributed bi-monthly to women's study centres, UPW, and other women's organizations. The continued existence of the Women's Forum could act as a partner to KOWANI in providing input from women into national consultations.

5.5 Academic:

The university system in Indonesia has three types of universities. The demand for education has greatly outstripped GOI's ability to provide university level education and as a result private industry has entered into the business of post-secondary education. The three types of universities are as follows:

1. **Government University:** There are 33 state universities. The state universities are authorized to set their own courses, exams and are classed as degree granting institutions.
2. **Certified Private University:** The private industry universities have obtained government recognition and meet national standards for university education. These institutions can do their own examinations and are degree granting institutions.
3. **Uncertified Private University:** There are a large number of such institutions in Indonesia. These universities have not obtained government recognition or certifications. Students are required to pass national exams in their area of study to be granted a degree. The uncertified private universities are not authorized to grant degrees. (Int. 4)

Women's activities take place at three levels within the universities:

- **Women's Study Program:** An M.A. program in women's studies is offered at Universitas Indonesia on their Jakarta campus.

- Women's Study Centres: Women's Study Centres (WSC) are located in universities throughout Indonesia, and do not offer courses or degrees. WSC members are drawn from various faculties in the social sciences. WSC are responsible for the preparation of the Situational Analyses of women as directed by UPW. A complete list of WSC is included at the end of this paper as Appendix L.
- Women's Study Groups: Women's Study Groups provide a forum for discussion of women's issues by members who are students at the university within which the study group is located.

5.5.1 Women's Study Program

The M.A. program is taught in a top-down fashion and does not employ a holistic approach to women's issues (Int. 2). The study of women's issues is still compartmentalized, not taught as an inter-disciplinary study or integrated into the broader curriculum of the university. There is an on going effort to improve the quality of the program. In addition to women's studies at the university in Jakarta, Indonesia has programs set up through which Indonesian student can go to partner countries¹² to study women's issues. Lieden University has provided gender awareness training to individuals recommended by the WSCs. The course was offered as a five month introductory course (total 40 participants) and a two month advanced course (total 10 participants) (Int. 4). The Netherlands NGO FINA is involved in a joint institution building project with the university (Int. 4).

My research revealed that there does exist a strong basis of ability and professors, though I was left with the impression that a small number of very capable women are responsible for the extent of success of women's programs in Indonesia. The WSCs have begun to draw

upon the knowledge resources of the women's NGOs, and helping them in their capacity building by inviting them to participate in their programs as either lecturers or student on an informal basis (Int. 4).

"The staffing and the institutional capacities of these units need to be strengthened...This calls for qualitative and quantitative strengthening, not only is the number of staff insufficient, the depth and scope of the work must be improved as well." (Gulardi, 1992, p 4)

5.5.2 Women's Study Centres

Table No. 5.1: MAIN AREAS OF CONCENTRATION BY WSC

University	Main Areas of Concentration
Universitas Indonesia	urban women's problems, methodologies, theory, and concepts of WID
Universitas Gajah Maja	water and sanitation, tourism, health (socio-cultural aspects, food, and nutrition of women and child), informal sector (traditional markets, small scale industry)
Universitas Airlangga	violence against women in the family, women's participation in the industrialization process, family (socio-cultural aspects), women and child health (reproductive aspects)
Universitas Udayana	women in law, women workers
Universitas Sumatera Utara	women in industry, rural areas
Universitas Hassanudin	women and fisheries (coastal areas), home workers
Universitas Sriwijaya	women workers (economic, demography, socio-cultural aspects)
Universitas Sebelas Maret	women in the informal sector, environment (slum areas)
Institute Pertanian Bogor	rural areas, time studies, family, agriculture
Universitas Diponegoro	law, women workers, family, coastal area development, sexual harassment
Universitas Brawijaya	rural areas (agriculture), home workers
Universitas Tangungpura	informal sector, agriculture (shifting cultivation)

Source: Women's Support Project, 1994, np

As indicated above, WSCs are responsible for the preparation of Situational Analyses. Provinces are asked by the national departments to allocate funds to the Women's Study Centres (WSCs) to carry out research required for producing Situational Analyses (Int. 2).

UPW provided each province with a guideline for collecting and analyzing information for the Situational Analyses (Int. 26). By providing reviews of women's position in all geographic areas of Indonesia, the Situational Analyses could be used to highlight spatial differences in women's needs and goals. This information could be used in the development of regional priorities and policies which impact the role of women.

Though the Situational Analyses *could* represent a valuable tool for effective policy formation, their effectiveness as a tool depends upon their being created on a regular basis and across all provinces. At present, their creation is sporadic as not all areas are covered by WSCs, or not all WSCs have the resources to develop the situational analyses. If consistent funding and technical resources were committed to the regular preparation of Situational Analyses, they could be used as a bench mark for monitoring progress in improvements in women's position.

5.6 Legal:

The Legal Aid Foundation of Indonesia addresses women's issues among the range of rights it defends. There is some indication that a separate organization may emerge which will focus specifically on women's rights (Int. 14).

5.7 Bilateral Assistance

Indonesia receives bilateral ODA support for improving women's position from other countries, including but not limited to; Canada, Australia, and the Netherlands. The Women's Support Project (WSP) funded by the Canadian International Development Agency is one such joint effort. The WSP is in its second phase and involves cooperation

with UPW and other government agencies, it is fundamentally an institutional strengthening project. WSP provides funding for PBS to carry out gender disaggregated analysis of their data (Int. 12). Its broader focus is to help develop institutional capacity in the area of gender sensitive development planning. The second phase began in 1996, after the successful completion of phase one which produced a draft series of training manuals for UPW.

5.8 International

Indonesia's involvement in, and commitment to improving women's position includes a number of international aspects. The international aspects included in this research derive from Indonesia's membership in ASEAN (AWP covered above), United Nations, and the Non-Aligned Movement. GOI has ratified a number of international agreements relating to the rights and status of women:

1. UN Convention on Political Rights of Women (1952) ratified with Law No. 68/1958;
2. UN Convention (ILO No. 100) on Equal Remuneration for Men and Women for Work of Equal Value with Law No. 80/1957
3. UN Convention on Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women with Law No. 7/1984
4. Nairobi Forward Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women

Indonesia participated in the 1995 UN Fourth World Conference on Women in Beijing. Prior to the September 1995 conference, Indonesia was involved in two regional preparations. Indonesia was involved in preparation for the UN conference at both the national and international levels. In the regional conferences, Indonesia played important roles in the development of their statements for the UN conference.

The Asian and Pacific regional conference was held in Jakarta June 7-14, 1994 and resulted in the production of the *"Jakarta Declaration for the Advancement of Women in Asia and the Pacific"* (Appendix M). The *"Jakarta Declaration"* committed participants to pursuing these objective in "cooperation with the United Nations system, and other regional and international organization as well as non-governmental organizations" (Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, 1995).

As the representative of the founding nation of the Non-Aligned Movement (NAM), Indonesian's State Minister for the Role of Women Ibu Mien Sugandhi chaired the Fourth Ministerial Conference of Non-Aligned Countries Devoted to the Role of Women in Development held in Beijing 1 September 1995. This conference produced the *"Message of the Fourth Ministerial Conference of Non-Aligned Countries Devoted to the Role of Women in Development"*. Items 6, 13, and 17 of the NAM Message point to women's need for increased access to decision-making and the role of NGOs "work in assisting developing countries in the implementation of their national plans" (Appendix N).

5.9 Discussion: MIWNs and Their Sustainability

The consultation structure shown in Figure No. 5.1 does not include MIWNs. The only "NGO" consulted is KOWANI, which by my categorization is closer to a government organization than an NGO. There do exist a number of NGOs which are working on women's issues. In particular there are MIWNs. They are operating in a range of areas, working on research or directly with their constituents.

The Modern Indonesian Women's NGO (MIWNs) this research concerns itself with would stand to benefit from having access to authority and the policy making process. For MIWNs to function, they require three things; a constituency, a capable management, and the means through which to convey their members/beneficiaries needs and to have a channel to authority and the policy making process. The first two requirements are being met, there is an increasing awareness in both the urban and rural areas of women's gender specific needs, and from my research there are a significant number of MIWNs and a number of women involved with these organizations or in studying women's issues. It is the third area in which they fail.

MIWNs are triply marginalized; first they are NGOs, and many unregistered NGOs, secondly they are women, who generally have limited access to decision making and policy formation (as identified by UPW and NAM Message), and third they are feminist organizations which are viewed by some (government and citizens) as using inappropriate Western concepts. The ability to convey information from the bottom-up is a strategic requirement for the survival of MIWNs. The ability to affect decision-making and policy formation provides the MIWNs with legitimacy, both in the eyes of their constituents and GOI. It is a source of status and recognition of legitimacy and capability, and finally it provides a purpose and sense of accomplishment for the organization.

Without a channel to authority, MIWNs are at risk of breaking down. The recent dissolution of Yayasan Perempuan Mardika (YPM) is an example of a MIWN which could have benefited by access to the policy making process. One of the foundation's founding members, Nori Andriyani, talks about the internal discord which led to the dissolution in

November 1995. Nori points to internal disputes and donor demands for accounting and reporting as the causes of the organization's final dissolution.

YPM was founded by a number of university students whose study of social and political issues led them to wanting to devise and carry out their own projects. Nori speaks of the exhilaration of being able to directly fight injustice, and the desire to do more than the traditional women's role, wanting to help people fight for justice, freedom, and democracy. As a foundation, the organization was legally formed and registered with a notary. It received funding from a number of agencies who placed women's issues high on their funding priority list.

With funding and enthusiasm, YPM started recruiting members among the workers they were assisting. The management was composed of five individuals, additional staff members were difficult to find. The ideal staff member for YPM is described as follows: "The ideal YPM staffer was a progressively political feminist, willing to work in a new NGO. She must be prepared to have an uncertain future and no career path, and be happy to receive a small wage. She would also have to move from her comfortable home to live with the workers. In short, we looked for women prepared to commit class suicide." (Andriyani, 1996). Even the original five members' commitment began to wear down under hard conditions, demands for progress reports and financial accounting, and disputes over direction.

Under increased pressure for accountability from donors, the relationship between foundation members deteriorated and requirements stopped being met. The author's

objective in recounting this discouraging experience was to help other organizations recognize their relative strengths and weaknesses in advance of problems such as YPM experienced. "Once again, the long march is started by a single step. Hopefully the YPM experience can still contribute something to that long march to people's democracy in Indonesia" (Andriyani, 1996).

Nori attributes the breakdown and eventual personal conflicts between the founding members as the cause. There may be another reason or factor which might have allowed the organization to overcome these problems. As mentioned above, to be sustainable, MIWNs have three requirements. The first two components, constituents and management were initially met, before the breakdown, the third (channel to authority or policy formation) was never available. YPM did not have a channel to authority or policy making. Had such a channel existed, YPM would have had another, visible, means of acting on behalf of their constituents. The internal debates and disillusionment might have been avoided if the organization had had the opportunity to use their knowledge and acquired expertise to help formulate policies at either the micro or macro-level which would benefit the women workers.

The ability to influence policy provides individuals and groups with a sense of direction, purpose and accomplishment. Donor demands for progress reports would be more easily made if visible results of the organization's efforts were available. The lack of access to policy making is not the only cause of YPM's failure. Other factors are identified in Nori's article which would not have been avoided had the channel existed. However the sense of purpose and accomplishment that consultation of MIWNs by GOI in formulating policies on

enhancing the role of women in development could provide the MIWNs might have provided the cohesion necessary to keep YPM, or other MIWNs together.

During my research, it was subtly hinted that one of the outspoken MIWNs I was studying had a particular asset in the form of a family connection with a highly placed government official that protected it from being subject to a government crackdown. If this is true, it shows an interesting juxtaposition of traditional and modern relationships and agenda. This particular organization openly advocates for pursuing a feminist agenda of emancipation for women. This agenda has the potential of making the organization a 'threat to national security' by actively working for fundamental changes in gender roles and legislation, something which challenges traditional values and is perceived as a threat to social stability.

If this organization is experiencing a degree of protection from government restriction or disbandment due to a family relationship between an official of the organization and an official of the government, it is benefiting from a client-patron relationship. Thus, the organization which to the extent of my research most directly challenges traditional assumptions and values related to gender, which by the definition used in this research makes it the most 'modern', owes its relative freedom of operation and existence to a client-patron relationship. This organization has a management that is able to sustain itself and produce results without any apparent direct activities or membership in the rural areas.

MIWNs form, function, and survive in a situation filled with contradictions. Chapter Six will cover the legal restrictions and government attitude towards NGOs, both of which tend to restrict NGO activity and operation. Laws and negative perceptions are not the only

restriction on NGO survival, they are also limited by their ability to be effective. The existence of bottom-up channels to influence policy making comes out as a requirement for the continued survival of MIWNs. The reason for this is twofold. On the one hand, the consultative process as shown in Figure No. 5.1 is restrictive of who can provide input into the process, who has access to process and power to define the dialogue. The second reason for MIWN's inability to directly access the policy making process arises as a result of the legal restrictions on NGOs. Some MIWNs are legally formed as either NGO's, Foundations or associations, many more are not registered which leaves them operating in an illegal position and subject to disbandment. Under these conditions, many of the MIWNs are not in a position to even request access to the policy making process.

There is a dichotomy among NGOs in Indonesia. There are legal organizations and non-legal organizations. The legal organizations are nominally represented by KOWANI, the only NGO formally included in the official government consultative framework. The other organizations (which number in the thousands) have a tenuous existence. Survival of MIWNs is not ensured by obtaining legal status, neither is it impossible for those in technically illegal situations.

¹ In a confidential communication with a staff member of an international development organization, I was informed that a study had been initiated to study the experience and existence of NGOs in Indonesia. The researchers were unable to conduct this research due to a conflict of agendas and disagreement over what the research finding should indicate. About the inability to reach a consensus, my contact had the following to say: "...it is precisely this atmosphere of secrecy about everything that we are trying to change."

² The ten sections are: Security, defence and order; Education and the comprehension and practical application of Pancasila; Information; Economics; Development of infrastructure and environmental protection; Religion; Health, population and family planning; Youth, physical education and art; Welfare; and PKK (Suryakusuma, 1991, p 58)

³ Empowerment terminology, as feminist terminology is not used in Indonesia. For the purpose of this report empowerment terminology is employed because it most accurately describes women's goals. The GOI term, which is deemed less threatening and more culturally acceptable, is the 'enhancement of the role of women in national development'.

⁴ A review of the member organizations reveals that there are an additional five organizations (#'s 13, 15, 29, 30, and 44) which are associated with the various arms of the military (Navy, Police, Armed Forces, Air Force).

⁵ The Sullivan piece is critical of KOWANI and identifies these ten spheres as KOWANI's objectives. The objectives identified in Appendix J cover a broader range of activities. Appendix J is a pamphlet designed to promote the organization. The ten items identified in this list may be the most fundamental of KOWANI's goals, while the pamphlet lists all activities.

⁶ KOWANI has a reported membership of 25 million members, but the organization is designed in a top-down fashion and takes its objectives directly from GOI policy. This form of organization is not structured to bring grassroots participation, bottom-up, to the policy making process. Additionally, KOWANI's member organizations are limited to those with a national scope of operation. This requirement effectively excludes grassroots oriented groups who are more likely to focus on local issues which, given Indonesia's geographic and cultural diversity, are not likely present in many of the 27 provinces.

⁷ When I say that all agendas should be represented in the public participation/consultation process, I am indicating all agendas which have been determined to meet 'legitimacy' criteria such as representativeness, accountability, and transparency.

⁸ Of all the other possible groups of women's organizations, I have chosen to mention the religious based groups because they have a strong agenda, and one which is quite different from that of MIWNs. There are likely other groupings of women's organization who should be drawn into the policy making process.

⁹ The Marriage Law was reformed in 1974, nearly three decades after its reform was promised in the early days of independence. Women activists feel that the reform was not sufficient and that women's rights will not be protected until further reforms are made.

¹⁰ In the interest of confidentiality, I have chosen not to provide many details on the activities on these organizations, or indicate by interviewee number where the information has come from.

¹¹ Individual and organization anonymity was promised to interviewees at the time of interviewing. Therefore, any organization which needs to be referred to by name will be a pseudonym.

¹² Memorial University has such an arrangement.

6.0 LEGAL CONTEXT AND GOVERNMENT PERCEPTION OF WOMEN'S NGOs IN INDONESIA

Chapter Four described the nature and types of NGOs, their general characteristics and provided a composite of modern Indonesian women's NGOs (MIWNs) in Indonesia. The literature reviewed indicated that there exists support for NGOs acting as conduits for public participation in policy formation. The benefits and drawbacks of collaboration for both parties were summarized in table form.

In the final analysis, this research's question of whether or not MIWNs represent a legitimate conduit, for public participation into policy formation, has been answered in the affirmative. The proposed role for MIWNs has been supported by several sources in the literature, concentrating in the Southeast Asian area. This support does not however automatically translate into collaboration between GOI and MIWNs on improving policies aimed at women. There are a number of contextual issues that affect the realization, and indeed even the desirability, of collaboration.

This chapter applies the discussions from previous chapters to the Indonesian case, exploring the feasibility of MIWNs representing women's interests by collaborating with GOI to develop effective policies for 'enhancing the role of women in national development'. To develop an understanding of whether such a relationship is feasible, this chapter explores the current position of NGOs in Indonesia vis-à-vis the government and legislation.

The previous chapter presented an overview of the location of activity relating to women in Indonesia. It showed that there exists an extensive range of organizations including

MIWNs. The activities cover a broad spectrum of issues relevant to women's strategic and practical gender needs operating in Indonesia. Providing a channel by which MIWNs (and other representative groups of organizations) can convey this information for use in formulating policies for 'enhancing the role of women in national development', has the potential of improving the effectiveness of future policies in identifying and addressing women's specific needs. The discussion at the end of Chapter Five highlighted the importance of a channel to authority/policy formation for MIWN sustainability. It should be noted that collaboration between GOI and MIWNs does not imply that MIWNs need to join GOI efforts, adopt its mandates, or implement the same projects.

The discussion at the end of this chapter arises from comments received during interviews. The researcher was left with the overall impression that while many state and private mechanisms exist which focus on enhancing the role of women, they are driven by different agendas. It is the researcher's belief that providing MIWNs with the means to act as conduits for grassroots input into policy formation could yield a number of benefits. The benefits experienced by MIWNs, the potential for better policies, and the empowerment of participants and the constituents they represent.

Another area of benefits exists. It is less tangible and perhaps a part of empowerment. At present, a number of agendas are driving the development of policy on enhancing the role of women in national development in Indonesia. This division of effort and lack of a unified goal (or at least 'satisficing' goal, see conclusions) decreases the impact of resources spent on women's issues. The possibility of finding a common goal among GOI, official NGOs, MIWNs, and others can be enhanced by allowing women to

participate in defining the dialogue on their own needs and gender interests. As discussed in Chapter Four, the use of a multistakeholder approach to policy development and planning encourages participants to feel ownership of the process. This association increases participants' commitment to the successful implementation of projects and policies they have helped define.

6.1 Non-Governmental Organizations in Indonesia

"The fact that non-governmental, grassroots organizations of this type can become a major force in political life by providing one of the only opportunities for political participation has not escaped the attention of the Indonesian government. This has been illustrated by their recent increased security measures to observe and control all social movements in both rural and urban areas" (Berninghausen, 1992, p 251)

6.1.1 Legal Position of NGOs

The Indonesian term for non-governmental organizations is *Lembaga Swadaya Mawuarakat* (LSM) which translates into 'self-help group'. The use of this imagery calls upon the traditional practice of *Gotong Royong* and does not have the negative political implications of being 'not-of-the-government'. The type of voluntary action represented by *gotong royong* is a traditional component of Asian communities including Indonesia (Serrano, 1994, p 272). For the purposes of this research the term 'LSM' will be referred to as NGO, in the sense that LSMs fall into the categories of voluntary or grassroots organizations discussed in the Chapter Four.

NGOs in Indonesia operate in an environment of political repression (Farrington, 1993, p 33); the primary legislative instrument created by GOI to monitor and direct NGO activity is the *Undang Organisasi Kemasyarakatan* (ORMAS). ORMAS was developed by GOI to provide a means of control over organizations GOI viewed as potentially destabilizing

and therefore threatening to its position (Cleary , 1995, p 11; Riker, 1995a, Berninghausen, 1992,). Indonesia is not unique in passing legislation to control or monitor the activities of NGOs. Laws passed in India and Malaysia on the registration and use of foreign funding are included as Appendix O.

While 'restrictive' legislation is discussed by researchers and NGOs as limiting NGO function, NGOs still exist and carry out development activities. The large number of registered and unregistered NGOs operating in Indonesian highlights a difference between policy and enforcement. GOI has elements of authoritarianism juxtaposed with elements of permissiveness where NGOs are concerned. This complex relationship is discussed in Section 3.1.2.

Law No. 8-1985 on Social Organizations adopted by GOI (ORMAS) included the following stipulations for the existence and operation of NGOs:

- I. the state ideology, *Pancasila*, be the guiding principle of all social organizations;
- II. registration of social organizations is obligatory;
- III. social organizations must report and receive approval for all foreign aid;
- IV. an umbrella organization be set-up to coordinate the activities of social organizations;
- V. social organizations operating at village level coordinate all activities with the village community resilience institution (LKMD); and
- VI. GOI can suspend and dissolve social organizations (Riker, 1995a, pp 46-7; Serrano, 1994; Berninghausen, 1992¹).

ORMAS was passed by Parliament in 1985, to be enforced within a two year period (Serrano, 1994, p 279). Despite the regulations (ORMAS) imposed by GOI on the establishment and operation of NGOs, there has been a virtual explosion in the number of NGOs in Indonesia, particularly in the past two decades beginning in 1980 (Int. 14)². The existence of so large a number of NGOs "should be understood as a symptom of a process of change as much as an agent for change" (Liefer, 1995, pp 355-6). Michael Liefer indicated that the climate in Indonesia has already changed such that these organizations have been formed, and that they have been formed to act as agents of change.

Indonesia has three recognized forms of organization: Social Political consisting of the three official political parties; ORMAS type organizations which have membership; and non-ORMAS type organizations which are supposed to focus on specific interests³ (Int. 26). Permission from the government is required prior to establishment of an NGO, and the organization's mandate must be approved by the Department of Home Affairs (Int. 14). Foundations and Associations are not required to meet as stringent mandate requirements as ORMAS, they tend to focus on projects and fall under the authority of the Ministry of Home Affairs (Int. 27). Some women's NGOs have organized themselves as 'Foundations' to avoid falling under the jurisdiction of ORMAS (Cleary, 1995, p 11).

A large number of organizations do not comply with the government ORMAS regulations (Int. 14). Increasing efforts by GOI since 1978 to control NGOs, and increasing dissatisfaction with restrictions on social organizations and political action provided the impetus for this increase in NGOs (Berninghausen, 1992, p 193). The legal position of many of the women's NGOs is tenuous, particularly those that have used semantics to

avoid falling under ORMAS, because by law any organization with members is required to obtain government permission (Int. 26). The existence of unregistered NGOs is testimony to the non-registered NGO's perception of ORMAS as being repressive, not of a relaxed GOI attitude towards operation of NGOs⁴.

Estimates of the number of NGOs in Indonesia vary Michael Liefer estimated 6,000 such organizations in 1995 (p 355), and a recent article by Susan Sim quotes GOI's estimate of 8,000 NGOs (1996, internet). Neither of these sources indicates what organizations are included in the figure, though likely it includes such non-ORMAS organizations as foundations and associations. A Foundation only requires the signature of a notary to be legal, and no legal requirements exist at present for the formation of an Association; this relative scarcity of legislation has led to many women's groups using the semantic differences in type of organization to circumvent legislative restriction (Int. 14).

The requirement for NGOs to join umbrella organizations is interpreted by some as an attempt by GOI to exert control over NGO activities by subjecting them to control by an umbrella organization (eg. KOWANI). The umbrella organization is in turn "instrumentalized...as supervisors of the smaller NGOs which would otherwise be difficult to keep track of" (Berninghausen, 1992, p 195). NGOs which attempt to avoid ORMAS regulations do so to avoid drawing attention to their activities, to avoid being controlled by GOI defined agendas, and out of fear of co-optation if they are brought under the jurisdiction of umbrella organizations they view as government tools. The literature examined in the course of this research was all critical of ORMAS, describing it as a "classic [example] of repressive laws informed by the national security doctrine that

guided authoritarian governments in Asia...in the 1960's and 1970's" (Serrano, 1994, p 280)

NGOs face dissolution under ORMAS if they are found to be in violation of any of its articles or if their activities "could disrupt political stability and security...discredit or undermine governmental authority...disturb the implementation of a government program...or undermine the unity and integrity of the nation" (Berninghausen, 1992, p 201). The existence of ORMAS and permit regulations (discussed in the next section) hinder the strengthening of individual organizations and make inter-organizational cooperation more difficult (Int. 14).

6.1.2 Indonesian Government Attitudes Towards NGOs

There is a general atmosphere of distrust between NGOs and the government. The alleged involvement of the women's NGO, GERWANI, in the 1965 coup attempt has marred the image of women's organizations. The government fears NGOs will cause disunity if they are permitted to operate without the guiding hand of government. Despite these negative factors, the climate⁵ in Indonesia appears to be opening up to the prospect of NGOs operating in a more autonomous manner.

NGO and GOI have maintained a strained and antagonistic relationship throughout the New Order, and operate in a climate of distrust and suspicion (Holloway, 1989, p 146). There may exist a circular causality for the antagonistic relationship in which NGO distrust of GOI prompts attempts by GOI to control NGO activity that further increases distrust and worsens the situation. "A recent review of the various NGO-government forums and networks emerging in Indonesia raised the question of whether the purpose

behind these has been to control, co-opt or promote NGO development activity." (Aditjondron and Eldridge qtd in Riker, 1995a, p 45). So long as MIWNs cannot trust GOI motivation for inviting co-operation, they will be resistant to investing much of their time and/or resources. Successful collaboration between the two sides, even on a limited basis, could do much to improve the level of trust and enable further co-operation.

GOI's fear of communism and the potential threat its reemergence poses to national unity is used as an argument against allowing organizations to form and carry out programs, particularly involving recruitment in the rural areas⁶. "The political context of a repressive state still makes Indonesia a dangerous place for many NGO activities, especially those which can be construed as being political or concerned with rural organization." (Farrington, 1993, p 33). Government publications and current newspapers convey the impression that the government remains concerned over potential civil unrest being fostered by NGOs in the rural areas. GOI's stance against the formation of autonomous NGOs is in contrast to the emerging public call for more democratic practices by government and a loosening of civil liberties, but is consistent with the government's security emphasis.

"Since..1965 the Indonesian government has placed heavy emphasis on state security and ensuring complete loyalty to the official state philosophy of Pancasila. This has created a hostile environment to many NGOs, particularly those with Muslim, Catholic or Protestant religious origins and those working in organized development activities at the local level whose activities might have a destabilizing effect on the New Order." (Farrington et al, 1993, p 273)

GOI believes that the existence and operation of NGOs not under their control causes the following problems. They:

- encourage a split between people and the government;
- encourage religious extremism and disunity;
- confuse the people about government aims and destabilize them;
- expose government mistakes and shortcomings, causing government officials to lose face; and
- are of no significance at the national level where all important decisions are made by the government (Cleary, 1995, p14).

Government officials accuse NGOs of trying to discredit the government in the eyes of the Indonesian people and the international community, they see NGOs speaking out internationally against practices and conditions in Indonesia as being anti-Pancasila and anti-constitution (Riker, 1995c, p 203). GOI has made attempts to replace NGOs with organizations it controls (Cleary, 1995, p 13), this has taken the form of introducing new organisms, requiring that all NGOs join umbrella organizations, or through co-optation of existing organisms.

Collaboration between GOI and women's NGOs has some proponents within GOI, even at high levels. GOI staff are beginning to recognize the potential value of harnessing NGOs resources, particularly in the areas of gathering grassroots input and encouraging popular participation (Holloway, 1989, p 149). My research uncovered support for co-operation with MIWNs at the policy making and professional staff levels⁷.

MIWNs working for progressive change to improve women's position in the New Order are considered highly destabilizing. The goal of improving women's position in society entails a redistribution of social power and resources which would entail a shift in power

relations and government. Improving women's position in society means redefining repressive and discriminating social and traditional values. Tradition is an important part of Indonesian society. Changing some traditions, such as the role of women, faces opposition from groups who do not want a redistribution of power or who regard changes to women traditional role as a threat to their culture and/or beliefs. Trying to change tradition and customs, changing the balance of power, is a difficult issue in Indonesia. This is true where such a change may impact, or be perceived to impact, national unity⁸. The need to maintain national unity provides a rationale for controlling the rate of social change, but this is an uneven process.

The following are a series of comments taken from the Jakarta Post during the period May - July 1995. This collection of quotes provides a valuable insight into the friction around NGOs:

- Former Minister of Environment and Population, Emil Salim, urges government to view NGOs as components of progress rather than as opponents of the government, and to ease control and lessen the security approach used by the military and police towards NGOs (Salim, Jakarta Post, 1995).
- The government should let go of their mistrust of NGOs and embrace them as partners in development (Salim, Jakarta Post, 1995).
- "This Perception [of NGOs as opponents of government] is completely wrong but it could turn out to be correct if the NGOs themselves fail to choose the right direction or overplay their roles" Military Commander Major General Wiranto at the one-day seminar 'NGOs Roles in Improving the Community's Social and Political Role in National Development' held in South Jakarta (Military tells NGOs to be more active, 12/06/95).

While the General's speech was ostensibly aimed at encouraging NGOs and improving the national climate of co-operation between NGOs and government, his speech contains veiled threats to NGOs with regards to their proper place in national development. Major General Wiranto continued to urge NGOs to undertake actions to correct the misperceptions and undertake activities which will improve their image vis-a-vis the government. Ultimately calling on NGOs to be open in all their activities to avoid miscommunication and misperception and to act in a manner which honours "the rules of the game" as defined by Pancasila.

Another issue that affects a larger segment of the population than NGOs, is the requirement of a permit for a gathering of five or more people. Without this permit, police have the right to break up meetings and act on this authority frequently. There is growing resentment from students, scholars, and the growing educated middle class who wish to address social issues. With Indonesia's gradual opening up to the outside world, this resentment is becoming a stronger basis for action

The government has carried out a number of actions which the NGO community views as threatening. In January 1995, the government banned NGO newsletters. The following newsletters were banned in January: Mitra Media (women's issues newsletter); Independent; Kabar Dari Pijar; Kompak; and Bina Dharma (Int. 15). In November 1996, the government gave notice that it was preparing to crack down on 31 NGOs deemed problematic (Sim, 1996, internet). This demonstrates how GOI can elect to enforce ORMAS. GOI likely knew of the existence of these 31 organizations prior to this crack-down, but recent actions has forced GOI to bring them under control⁹

6.1.3 Civil Society in Indonesia

Does a civil society exist in Indonesia, or is Indonesia ready for the emergence of a civil society? Even if we are willing to accept the legitimacy of NGOs' role as active participants in defining development, to act as a counterbalance to the state, this role will not be realized if a climate for positive interaction does not exist. Some characteristics of the Indonesian case make it difficult for the existence or creation of a civil society. These characteristics include: the emphasis on maintaining national security and unity which is a central trait of the New Order Government, *Dwi-Fungsi* the dual role of the army both as military and political may not leave space for the operation of civil society organizations, the issue of political succession creates fears of instability (Liefer, 1995, pp 357-9). As noted in Chapter Four, Indonesian NGOs operate in a pluralistic mode, where power is divided between the sectors.

There is some debate in the literature over whether or not civil society is an appropriate concept to use in Indonesia. One side states that civil society is a western concept that has been imposed on Indonesia, that it is alien to the tradition and culture (Serrano qtd in Tandon, 1994, p 271). Michael Liefer argues that if we can interpret the concept of Pancasila as being an articulation of civil society, it is thus an endogenous concept (Liefer, 1995, p 357).

A second issue that may influence the potential for NGOs to participate in policy formation is the emergence of a middle class. There are mixed perceptions on what the emergence implies, and what its role might be.

"The emergence of a small but growing middle class who want to have greater account taken of their interests by a government which is not used to the kind of constant application of checks and balances to be found in western political practice." (Liefer, 1995, p 355)

The middle class has the potential to bring about revolt (Int. 20) against the government. Classically it is a displeased middle class that mobilizes forces for social change. Thus this could become a possibility in Indonesia. There may be a link between an increase in middle class, those with formal training, skills and an increased awareness of social issues. The middle class could provide the necessary skills and resources to make NGOs a strong partner in development and effectuating social change.

Unlike the lower class, the middle class generally has time to become involved in non-subsistence activities such as social activism. GOI claims that the middle class represent a 'privileged section of society'. Stating that even when they (middle class) may feel they are representing the needs and interests of the poor, they may not be correct, and government cannot allow itself to be unduly influence by pressure from this group of society (Liefer, 1995, p 358). If public participation is to occur, some checks must be developed to ensure that special interests do not distort existing inequalities. Attention must be paid to weighing the input from many sources to develop an accurate image of needs.

6.2 Attaining a Collaborative Status

Previous chapters have provided the background and support for MIWNs acting as conduits for public participation into policy formation. The co-operative or collaborative relationship between MIWNs and GOI required to enable this to happen does not presently exist. There are however signs such as the loosening of control, to suggest

that such a relationship may be possible in the future, even the near future. This section looks at how the MIWN-GOI relationship would have to change for collaboration to be realized. This section draws on the work of John Clark.

The institutional framework studied in Chapter Three, and the formal consultative framework shown in Chapter Five do not indicate any room for the involvement of MIWNs in defining the national dialogue on women's issues. Previous chapters have shown that both GOI and MIWNs stand to benefit from such co-operation, and have suggested ways in which it might be accomplished. This chapter has shown the legal framework and context in which Indonesian NGOs operate, and it has shown GOI to be unsupportive and untrusting of NGOs. What would have to change?

As discussed in Chapter Four, there appears to be a circular relationship of distrust between the two sides. "The mutual distrust and jealousy appears to be deep-rooted. Government fear that NGOs erode their political power or even threaten national security. And NGOs mistrust the motivation of the government and its officials" (Clark, 1993, p 5). One distrust engenders the other, and the circle continues. Past and current joint undertakings between GOI and NGOs have not succeeded in dispelling suspicion of GOI intentions, and newspaper articles demonstrated GOI's mistrust of NGOs.

Clark's articulation of a healthy state-NGO relationship as a prerequisite for cooperation (Clark, 1993, p 4) echoes my previous argument that a common objective or mutual goal needs to be defined). The definition of a common goal requires that GOI foster an environment conducive to involving MIWNs in open discussion. John Clark identifies the

following eight policy instruments GOI could use to foster collaboration (Clark, 1993, p 9):

1. Factors of governance (encouraging public debate and consultation, and the right to organize interest groups);
2. NGO regulations and the legal framework (for example, regarding registration and reporting, auditing and accounting requirements);
3. NGO incentives (including taxation policies on income or local fund-raising, duties on imports, subsidies for NGOs, etc.);
4. Collaboration (use of NGOs in program/project implementation);
5. Involvement in policy-making (serving on committees, assisting with public consultations);
6. Public disclosure of information (NGOs serving as a conduit to inform the public about development schemes which effect them);
7. Coordinating requirements within the NGO sector; and
8. Direct expenditure, including official support (grants, contracts, etc.), and research benefiting the NGO sector.

These instruments would help foster an environment where MIWNs could become involved in policy formation. The regulation of NGOs by legislation such as ORMAS is not unique to Indonesia, and ORMAS would not have to be abolished for trust to improve. ORMAS would have to be more clearly defined, a process which should involve NGOs to ensure that the regulations are acceptable to both sides.

6.3 Discussion

The previous chapter and above section provide an introduction to the theory of NGOs as participants in development, the concept of a multistakeholder approach, the legal position and restrictions on NGOs, and the extant relationship between government and NGOs in Indonesia today. This leads to a question of what direction future relations between the two sectors will take.

I think that the existing structure of women's organizations "consulted" by GOI in policy formation need to be supplemented by a network of local women's organizations which are not currently being drawn into the process. The networking initiated as preparation for the UN conference in Beijing in 1995 could provide a platform upon which to build a network among unaffiliated women's organizations, to draw their input into policy formation.

Realizing a cooperative climate in which government would welcome NGO collaboration and NGOs would be willing to collaborate with GOI is a prerequisite for any NGOs serving as conduits of public participation for their constituents. The current climate does not appear to support collaboration, but there are people in government, certainly in UPW and LIPI, who are willing to support an increase in consultation, with non-established partners such as the MIWNs.

In the 1990's, Indonesia's government is focusing on economic growth and moving the national economy into the 'take-off' stage of development. This has necessitated an opening up of the country to international scrutiny and increased social influence. The protection of Indonesian culture is no longer under rigorous control of GOI. State

security, political perpetuation, and national unity remain central concerns of GOI, but increasingly Indonesia's civil society is calling for change.

With increased national exposure and increased exposure to international discourse, exogenous trends have become more influential in informing national discourse. Focusing on women's issues, this increased exchange of information appears to have strengthened local efforts at improving women's position in Indonesian society. A strong pool of intellectual resources for women has developed in Indonesia. These resources are spread throughout the three sectors.

Future improvements in women's position might best be informed by co-operation between the sectors. Such co-operation will remain incomplete and government controlled so long as the current climate remains unchanged. Significant changes in the attitude of GOI towards NGOs, and NGOs' attitude regarding government objectives are required.

The present consultation relationships between GOI and women's groups raises suspicion amongst the truly non-governmental organizations. MIWNs view organizations like Dharma Wanita, Dharma Pertiwi, and KOWANI as examples of co-optation not co-operation. While formal consultation linkages exist between these organizations and GOI, their value in informing policy appears much less than their value in implementing policy. Although consultation is taking place, it is debatable whether KOWANI and its member organizations should be considered external to the government given their mandate to implement government policy through top-down policy dissemination.

"All organizations [including]...women's organizations were tightly controlled under government umbrella organizations, and these constraints continue in the early 1990's. There have also been attempts by the government to replace NGO networks with government-controlled versions." (Farrington et al, 1993, p 274)

The form of open participation advocated in this thesis is not consistent with current policies. The 'floating mass' theory of public participation makes meaningful discussion between government and civil society impossible. If sustainable and responsive changes are to be made, NGOs offer the best mechanism, at least cost for GOI. In the case of policies to enhance the role of women in national development, MIWNs appear to represent a valuable source of public participation.

It is precisely the local NGO, like MIWNs, which are excluded from KOWANI for not being national, who are likely to have the grassroots constituency necessary to identify the strategic needs of women around Indonesia. If GOI were to foster a more open and supportive atmosphere for these organizations, and for networking between these organizations, they would represent a valuable development resource. Participating MIWNs would also experience benefits as discussed in Chapter Four.

Indonesian women have identified a lack of skill and training as a limitation in addressing women's needs. The NGO community has the ability to tap considerable intellectual resources and experience. The grassroots organizations operating at the local level in response to local needs and concerns are in touch with women's needs continually. Constant feedback and research into local needs is something that GOI cannot afford resources to maintain. At present policy is formulated on information gathered every five years from a national perspective.

The State Ministry for the Role of Women has been identified as lacking adequate staff. This is partially attributable to; a lack of funding, a lack of permanent staff, insufficient training, and lack of clout. There are however, a small number of very capable individuals currently or recently working at the Ministry. They could act as a focus point for information collection from a network, or networks, of local NGOs. This would complement, not necessarily replace the consultative function currently fulfilled by KOWANI.

¹ The phrasing of the ORMAS in Berninghausen differs from Riker's in that it additionally calls for the organization to not only operate by Pancasila, but to actively disseminate it in all their activities (1992, p 200)

² Though I could not find any reference to a connection between the supposed increase in 1980 and the introduction of ORMAS in 1985, I strongly suspect that there is a causal relationship. It would be interesting to examine statistics of when and how many NGOs were formed for each year of the 1980's to study the relationship between these two factors.

³ The legal status of NGOs was very difficult to determine. It appears that organizations classed as NGO's by the government are of the type identified here as quasi-governmental. The 'true' NGO organizations encountered during research had not obtained government recognition because they believed it was oppressive and would impede their activities. Another factor to consider when looking at NGO's dealing with women's issues is the negative connotations associated with women's groups as a result of the 1965 coup as discussed in Chapter 4.

⁴ As previously mentioned, GOI must have some elements of permissiveness for 'illegal', unregistered NGOs to exist and operate. The ORMAS regulations provide the legal justification for GOI to crack-down on any activities it opposes, or organizations which become too outspoken. The wording of ORMAS gives GOI great latitude in closing down NGOs, when GOI chooses to exercise their authority.

⁵ I was frequently left with the impression, if it was not explicitly stated, that NGO co-operation would be welcome. There were of course reservations as to how this co-operation would be realized.

⁶ PKK, the Family Welfare Movement is the only organization permitted by government to operate in the rural areas.

⁷ These were confidential interviews with employees of two GOI departments. The individuals, at least in their conversations with me, supported co-operation with NGOs in working towards the goal of enhancing the role of women in national development.

⁸ The recognition of religions other than Islam, and GOI's refusal to include the Jakarta Charter in the first principle of Pancasila had serious impacts on national unity. Islamic followers declared themselves a separate nation, ruled by Islam. Changing women's

role is resisted by Islam, and GOI risks creating further tension if it is seen to actively support a feminist goal such as women's emancipation.

⁹ The actions were speaking negatively about Indonesia. This is an example of GOI 'permitting' an NGO to exist until it decides to enforce its 'authority'.

7.0 CONCLUSIONS

Undertaking public consultation is the implementation of a multi-stakeholder approach that validates the rights of groups and/or individuals to participate in defining a dialogue affecting them. The development of additional consultation channels (in addition to the existing relationship with KOWANI) to the formation of policies on women in Indonesia will include new 'voices' in the dialogue. Each voice or conduit for participation should be selected to bring a new perspective, experience, and expertise to the process of policy formation.

GOI's role in gathering public participation involves weighing the potential value of different voices/conduits. In many instances, the most vocal groups are not representative of the majority. Well organized and articulate groups may be representing special interests that are not shared by the majority. Allowing such biased representation can skew the resulting policy in favour of special interests and disadvantage smaller or less articulate groups. Development planners work with stakeholders to gather the range of perspectives present in the target population and balance the participation of all groups to produce the most representative results.

Though the objective of public consultation is to reach consensus on what policies are desired, a more frequent situation is what planners call 'satisficing'. Satisficing is when stakeholders agree on a solution that satisfies enough of their needs that they are willing to support the decision. Not reaching consensus is not a failure of the public participation process. Public participation helps reach decisions that are acceptable to all stakeholders represented when the process ends in satisficing.

A difficulty in organizing public consultation is the identification of potential stakeholders. Reducing the potential of biased representation (vocal extremists who are not representative of any large group) can be achieved by examining potential stakeholders before commencing public consultations. The value of each participant's potential contribution should be assessed for criteria such as representativeness, accountability, and transparency. The initial assessment would likely be carried out by development planners¹. This research examined the group of organizations I have identified as MIWNs as potential stakeholders.

MIWNs are not the only potential stakeholders who should be considered for participation in public consultations on policy formation relating to women. They do represent a particular, possibly unique 'voice'. MIWNs voice provides a view that will not be duplicated by non-modern women's groups. This unique characteristic contributes to their identification as a desired stakeholder in this process. The preceding chapters have dealt with a range of topics relating to the desirability of MIWNs as stakeholders/conduits for public consultation.

Therefore, this research asks if MIWNs are an appropriate conduit for public participation into GOI policy formation aimed at enhancing the role of women in national development. Both the nature of MIWNs and the researcher's approach suggest the use of a feminist methodology to answer this question. The question of whether or not MIWNs are appropriate conduits is actually a number of different questions. Each chapter was written to address an area of study, or question raised.

A feminist aspect of this question is the need to give women the power to define the dialogue on their own development. MIWNs 'modern' goal of women's emancipation from discrimination under a patriarchal system is a distinctly feminist goal. As a stakeholder, MIWNs unique contribution would be the desire to achieve a redistribution of power. MIWN management is composed of educated women, primarily in the urban areas, who dedicate their resources to increasing awareness of women's issues, challenging existing factors that discriminate against or disadvantage women. This experience and expertise is valuable to the process, although it may be in stark contrast to the existing agenda or other groups' agendas².

The study of women's condition in Indonesian society demonstrated that women are still not experiencing the equality mandated by Indonesia's Constitution. Inequalities in the sectors discussed highlights the need for pro-actively addressing women's position in Indonesian society. This need has been recognized by GOI, first in the establishment of KNKWI and later the Junior Ministry, the inclusion of a chapter on women in the GBHN, UPW, and undertaking gender training of GOI staff.

Under the existing institutional context, there is no room for MIWNs to act as conduits for public participation into policy formation. This does not mean that the experience and knowledge they could offer the process are not desirable. At present, UPW is restricted in its capacity to ensure the goal of enhancing the role of women in national development is being pursued effectively. It has staffing, mandate, and image problems, which restrict its capacity and authority to develop gender-sensitive programs and ensure that GOI policies and programs are gender responsive.

I suggested two possible changes in the role of UPW. UPW could be granted more discretionary powers to alter policies and programs developed by line ministries, or it could become more of a consultation organization which would co-ordinate public participation into policy formation, and gather grassroots type feedback on the effectiveness and success of existing or past policies. In the first instance, UPW would become an enforcement agent, and in the second a process facilitator and coordinator. UPW could coordinate MIWNs role as conduits for public participation.

In the discussion on participation and its benefits, it was indicated that gathering public participation into policy formation offers potential benefits to participants, government, and to the resulting policies. Enabling public participation is an example of a multi-stakeholder approach to planning and development. In a multi-stakeholder approach, the policy making body (GOI) is recognizing the stake or interest different groups have in the outcome of the process. By engaging the public in the process, in the beginning, GOI is empowering participants and giving them ownership of both process and policies. Policies formed in consultation with the public are generally better supported by participants, because they share in its 'ownership', and will have been involved in negotiation between competing agenda. The representatives of the different 'agendas' will have been exposed to the range of agendas and have reached a satisficing mutually acceptable agenda.

If we are willing to accept that: 1] Indonesian women have issues they want presented to government, and that there is a precedent for women to do so (i.e. GERWANI); 2] GOI's policy making on enhancing the role of women in national development would be enhanced by public consultation; and 3] Public participation in policy formation is

beneficial to both participants³ and policies, then the next question is whether NGOs are stakeholder in the process, and whether they can represent grassroots type participation.

NGOs are a very varied group of organizations. Their form offers pragmatic benefits, has a number of beneficial characteristics, and some characteristics which are weakening. Of interest with NGOs is that the same characteristics which are beneficial to an organization may also be a weakness under different circumstances, points of view, or scales. I refer to this as the double-edged nature of NGO characteristics.

MIWNs were identified as a sub-group of NGOs. They were selected because of the feminist nature of their mandates and actions. This group of women's organizations has a significantly different agenda and mandate from the official women's organizations such as KOWANI, Dharma Wanita, and Dharma Pertiwi that GOI currently consults. Despite the large number of women those organizations nominally represent, they do not really challenge the policy formation. The officially recognized women's NGOs (which I class as quasi-governmental organizations) have close ties with GOI and act as policy implementers and promoters and supporters of GOI.

GOI does currently have a consultation framework for formulating these policies. The 'public' aspect of this consultation is limited to KOWANI and its member organizations (which include the Dharma's). All member organizations of KOWANI are required to have national organizations, to operate in all 27 provinces. This characteristic alone excludes MIWNs which are by nature local as opposed to national. MIWNs would contribute a different perspective to the consultation process.

It is not only the national criteria of KOWANI that keeps MIWNs from joining. There are ideological differences and legal restrictions. MIWNs are feminist organizations and tend to hold the women's groups associated with GOI in contempt. They have more desire to make change happen, to challenge the distribution of power, and to redefine women's roles in Indonesian society. Many NGOs including some MIWNs are non-legal. For a range of factors including ideological differences, some NGOs do not comply with GOI's NGO regulations, ORMAS. By not complying with the ORMAS regulations, these organizations put themselves in a non-legal and tenuous position.

The fact that a large number of NGOs (6,000 – 8,000) operate in Indonesia, some registered, some not, highlights the complex nature of the Indonesian environment (authoritarian vs. permissive). The registered MIWNs tend to be structured as associations or foundations, the two least restrictive of the three legal forms of NGO in Indonesia. The existence and operation of so many NGOs is in contrast to the perception of GOI and their ORMAS regulations as being restrictive and hostile to NGO activities. The Indonesian context is very complicated. GOI has authoritarian characteristics juxtaposed with permissiveness. Recently, GOI has shown its teeth where NGOs are concerned, banning NGO newsletter in 1995 and threatening retaliation against 31 NGOs in 1997.

The climate of NGO-GOI relations is characterized as hostile. Mutual distrust and suspicion is a serious impediment to MIWNs acting as conduits for public participation. Under present conditions, even if GOI were to offer a collaborative arrangement to

MIWNs, they would be unlikely to accept. A number of changes would have to be made before an environment conducive to MIWN-GOI collaboration is realized.

Current activities and forums organized by GOI to 'support' NGOs are suspected of being more co-optation than collaboration. GOI views on NGOs seem somewhat contradictory, which may be taken as an indication that the climate is changing, and that GOI is interested in fostering an enabling environment for NGOs. In my research, I found government officials who were supportive of pursuing collaborative relationships with NGOs. This may be a characteristic of the emerging civil society in Indonesia. NGOs are identified as having a role to play in democratic systems as counter-balances to government. That is one function that MIWNs would be fulfilling if they acted as conduits for public participation by collaborating with GOI on policy formation and/or evaluation.

Both sides stand to benefit from collaboration. The corollary to my thesis is how having a channel to authority and policy formation would enhance the sustainability of MIWNs. Without a channel to authority, MIWNs are denied one of the three components required for their sustainability. MIWNs meet the first two requirements, they have membership and they have capable management. What they lack is the means to convey their experience and demands to GOI. They are relatively cut-off from making an impact at the national or policy level.

Being able to convey information to, or impact policy at, the government level is a strategic requirement for organizations like MIWNs. The recent dissolution of YPM may have been avoided had the management had the opportunity to influence policy in the

manner advocated here. Having access to authority provides MIWNs with a sense of direction, purpose and accomplishment. It also validates MIWN knowledge and experience, legitimizes their representations of constituents and members, and bestows status. MIWNs have the potential of experiencing empowerment and institutional strengthening through collaborating with GOI.

Empowering feminist organizations like the MIWNs in this paper not only challenges the power distribution between the sexes, it redistributes power among stakeholders. At present KOWANI is the only 'NGO' officially recognized as a mechanism for enhancing the role of women in national development, and included in the consultation framework. This exclusive status gives KOWANI status and power. If the consultative framework were expanded to include broader participation, of which MIWNs would be a part, KOWANI stands to lose status, power, and prestige. As a large and powerful organization, KOWANI is likely to resist such a redistribution.

In part for this reason, I would not recommend eliminating KOWANI from consultations. KOWANI is a useful network of national women's organizations, whose involvement in and support of policies is very useful. I would suggest that an alternative network be set up (as discussed, it could be based on the network developed for Beijing) to draw together local NGO currently excluded. Establishing an alternate network would also benefit MIWNs by facilitating institutional strengthening and learning between MIWNs.

In short the answer to my question is 'YES!'. I base this response on the exploration and discussions in this paper. For the answer to be yes, there must be both demand and supply, and a forum in which to take place. The previous chapters supported that: there

is a demand for representation; there is the basis for a demand for input; NGOs are a legitimate conduit; MIWNs have a unique contribution to make in the form of knowledge and experience; and both GOI and MIWNs stand to benefit from collaboration in policy formation.

Now is my chance to state, unsupported (aside from all the preceding pages), my belief that there is a need for more representative public participation into policy formation and that MIWNs are one group of organizations which have a valuable contribution to make to the process. MIWNs activities are based on similar principles and paradigms to those that I based this paper on. They are feminist in nature and use gender theory and the GAD paradigm. During my research I was impressed with the range of activities related to women taking place, I was struck by how much greater the potential was if only the activities could be harmonized and the knowledge they represent incorporated into planning and development.

¹ The current CIDA project (Women's Support Project) might be able to work with GOI as part of its institutional strengthening project to identify criteria and methods of evaluation for determining the value of potential participants. The capacity would then be developed within GOI. In the current climate of distrust, there would have to be transparency of process in the selection criteria and the opportunity for review.

² A specific example is the difference between the feminist MIWN agenda and the type of agenda desired by a groups of strictly Islamic religious women's organizations. It is difficult to imagine these two groups, who appear to be diametrically opposed, could find a common agenda. The two groups are not likely to ever reach consensus on the ultimate position in society desired for women. They can however work together to define steps towards improving women's condition and position. The women from these two groups may not desire the same position in society, but there are most likely common steps to both of their ultimate goals. It would be inappropriate for either of these groups (as an example) to act as a conduit for public participation for the other.

³ Where the participation of new groups (such as MIWNs) and there is a redistribution of power, some groups will lose power. The strongest example is KOWANI who will lose their status as the exclusive NGO identified as an official mechanism for enhancing the role of women in national development.

Appendix A: Number and Percentage Distribution by Province and Age Group

NUMBER AND PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF MEN BY PROVINCE BY AGE GROUP

PROVINCE	0-4 YEARS			5-24 YEARS			25-54 YEARS			55+ YEARS			Province	
	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	TOTAL	% of Nat.
1 Daerah Istimewa Aceh	9.8	0.2%	178021	51.2	1.0%	927956	31.8	0.6%	575898	7.1	0.1%	128400	1810999	2.0%
2 Sumatera Utara	11.2	0.6%	590590	50.0	2.9%	2648385	31.2	1.8%	1649944	7.7	0.4%	406792	5296770	5.8%
3 Sumatera Barat	12.0	0.3%	238423	45.7	1.0%	909510	30.9	0.7%	615561	11.4	0.2%	226681	1990175	2.2%
4 Riau	9.8	0.2%	166606	47.0	0.9%	802782	37.1	0.7%	634297	6.2	0.1%	105090	1708775	1.9%
5 Jambi	8.2	0.1%	88457	48.8	0.6%	526644	35.7	0.4%	384897	7.3	0.1%	78748	1078746	1.2%
6 Sumatera Selatan	10.7	0.4%	352009	49.9	1.8%	1648327	33.2	1.2%	1097012	6.3	0.2%	208231	3305248	3.6%
7 Bengkulu	11.9	0.1%	75004	48.1	0.3%	304575	32.8	0.2%	207417	7.3	0.1%	45952	632948	0.7%
8 Lampung	10.6	0.4%	345420	48.1	1.7%	1562832	33.4	1.2%	1082685	7.8	0.3%	254520	3246431	3.6%
9 DKI Jakarta	7.9	0.4%	332485	45.6	2.1%	1922005	39.9	1.8%	1690122	6.6	0.3%	279388	4214000	4.6%
10 Jawa Barat	9.5	1.9%	1708647	46.2	9.1%	8319743	35.3	7.0%	6362368	9.1	1.8%	1632948	18023706	19.8%
11 Jawa Tengah	8.9	1.4%	1265800	43.8	6.8%	6223752	35.3	5.5%	5021953	12.0	1.9%	1709541	14222467	15.6%
12 Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta	6.6	0.1%	94013	42.3	0.7%	602110	35.9	0.6%	511374	15.2	0.2%	216657	1424439	1.6%
13 Jawa Timur	8.4	1.5%	1337309	41.5	7.3%	6614730	38.7	6.8%	6180664	11.4	2.0%	1825634	15958336	17.5%
14 Bali	7.3	0.1%	102236	42.4	0.7%	595980	38.8	0.6%	545213	11.6	0.2%	162425	1406276	1.5%
15 Nusa Tenggara Barat	12.8	0.2%	220702	47.0	0.9%	810677	31.7	0.6%	547009	8.5	0.2%	147365	1725580	1.9%
16 Nusa Tenggara Timur	12.3	0.2%	205405	47.1	0.9%	785745	31.9	0.6%	532117	8.7	0.2%	145002	1668603	1.8%
17 Timor Timur	15.3	0.1%	61224	45.1	0.2%	180748	33.9	0.1%	135831	5.7	0.0%	22839	400682	0.4%
18 Kalimantan Barat	11.6	0.2%	198746	49.0	0.9%	842435	33.2	0.6%	571481	6.2	0.1%	105766	1719256	1.9%
19 Kalimantan Tengah	10.4	0.1%	78332	47.9	0.4%	361475	35.8	0.3%	269786	6.0	0.0%	45052	754645	0.8%
20 Kalimantan Selatan	10.0	0.1%	133071	44.9	0.7%	596493	38.4	0.6%	509951	6.7	0.1%	88600	1329381	1.5%
21 Kalimantan Timur	9.7	0.1%	98189	43.4	0.5%	437862	41.5	0.5%	418992	5.4	0.1%	54089	1009132	1.1%
22 Sulawesi Utara	8.6	0.1%	110773	45.7	0.6%	587445	35.7	0.5%	459660	10.1	0.1%	129814	1286563	1.4%
23 Sulawesi Tengah	10.2	0.1%	92542	49.1	0.5%	444094	33.4	0.3%	301937	7.2	0.1%	65250	903733	1.0%
24 Sulawesi Selatan	9.3	0.4%	324963	48.8	1.9%	1708855	33.3	1.3%	1165383	8.7	0.3%	302902	3501752	3.8%
25 Sulawesi Tenggara	12.7	0.1%	89620	49.0	0.4%	345769	32.2	0.2%	227476	6.1	0.0%	43362	706227	0.8%
26 Maluku	11.8	0.1%	116256	48.4	0.5%	478161	32.2	0.3%	317655	7.7	0.1%	75660	987732	1.1%
27 Irian Jaya	10.4	0.1%	91753	45.7	0.4%	402622	39.9	0.4%	351854	4.0	0.0%	35168	881387	1.0%
TOTAL		9.5%	8696596		45.6%	41591713		35.5%	32357534		9.4%	8543874	91193999	100%

Source: adapted from Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 13

NUMBER AND PERCENTAGE DISTRIBUTION OF WOMEN BY PROVINCE BY AGE GROUP

PROVINCE	0-4 YEARS			5-24 YEARS			25-54 YEARS			55+ YEARS			Province	
	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	% of Prov.	% of Nat.	Number	TOTAL	% of Nat.
1 Daerah Istimewa Aceh	9.8%	0.2%	170545	47.7%	0.9%	82741	35.4%	0.7%	613475	7.1%	0.1%	123181	1734942	1.9%
2 Sumatera Utara	11.3%	0.6%	591727	47.4%	2.7%	2481690	33.3%	1.9%	1746879	8.0%	0.5%	419817	5241162	5.7%
3 Sumatera Barat	9.5%	0.2%	198260	44.5%	1.0%	934150	33.6%	0.8%	704444	12.5%	0.3%	261621	2099685	2.3%
4 Riau	9.0%	0.2%	156172	48.9%	0.9%	849134	36.0%	0.7%	625559	6.1%	0.1%	106489	1737180	1.9%
5 Jambi	8.7%	0.1%	86948	49.4%	0.6%	512089	36.0%	0.4%	373589	6.0%	0.1%	61832	1037458	1.1%
6 Sumatera Selatan	10.4%	0.4%	338876	48.4%	1.7%	1583388	34.1%	1.2%	1117474	7.2%	0.3%	234430	3274168	3.5%
7 Bengkulu	11.6%	0.1%	70767	48.5%	0.3%	295952	33.5%	0.2%	204303	6.5%	0.0%	38566	610589	0.7%
8 Lampung	10.6%	0.3%	317820	47.3%	1.5%	1413597	34.9%	1.1%	1041960	7.2%	0.2%	216465	2888842	3.2%
9 DKI Jakarta	8.1%	0.4%	346172	47.4%	2.2%	2029537	38.1%	1.8%	1630733	6.4%	0.3%	272573	4279016	4.6%
10 Jawa Barat	9.6%	1.9%	1722883	45.1%	8.7%	8068792	36.1%	7.0%	6451456	9.2%	1.8%	1644173	17890892	18.4%
11 Jawa Tengah	8.3%	1.3%	1210688	42.0%	6.7%	6162066	36.7%	5.8%	5382837	13.1%	2.1%	1919507	14675127	15.9%
12 Daerah Ist. Yogyakarta	7.0%	0.1%	104872	37.9%	0.6%	568257	38.0%	0.6%	569755	17.0%	0.3%	255289	1488173	1.6%
13 Jawa Timur	7.5%	1.4%	1286130	40.0%	7.4%	6821265	39.0%	7.2%	6647280	13.5%	2.5%	2288341	17057426	18.5%
14 Bali	7.4%	0.1%	104601	39.4%	0.6%	553231	40.4%	0.6%	567291	12.8%	0.2%	180380	1405925	1.5%
15 Nusa Tenggara Barat	11.1%	0.2%	192602	46.6%	0.9%	808201	34.4%	0.6%	596009	7.9%	0.1%	136780	1733582	1.9%
16 Nusa Tenggara Timur	11.4%	0.2%	193267	44.6%	0.8%	754959	35.3%	0.6%	597062	8.7%	0.2%	147066	1682354	1.8%
17 Timor Timur	14.3%	0.1%	54086	44.1%	0.2%	166403	36.5%	0.1%	137599	5.1%	0.0%	19404	377502	0.4%
18 Kalimantan Barat	11.4%	0.2%	185937	48.5%	0.9%	784486	34.1%	0.6%	558137	6.0%	0.1%	98370	1836766	1.8%
19 Kalimantan Tengah	11.5%	0.1%	81515	47.3%	0.4%	335644	35.6%	0.3%	252426	5.7%	0.0%	40402	710058	0.8%
20 Kalimantan Selatan	10.4%	0.2%	140178	44.3%	0.6%	598793	37.3%	0.6%	511013	7.4%	0.1%	98529	1350458	1.5%
21 Kalimantan Timur	10.0%	0.1%	97091	47.9%	0.5%	463312	37.2%	0.4%	358838	4.8%	0.1%	46322	967046	1.0%
22 Sulawesi Utara	7.9%	0.1%	97752	43.0%	0.6%	533973	37.6%	0.5%	467397	11.5%	0.2%	142716	1242087	1.3%
23 Sulawesi Tengah	10.6%	0.1%	92427	48.9%	0.5%	428144	34.8%	0.3%	304528	5.8%	0.1%	50888	876087	0.9%
24 Sulawesi Selatan	9.1%	0.4%	332333	45.4%	1.8%	1659106	36.0%	1.4%	1316901	9.5%	0.4%	347688	3656028	4.0%
25 Sulawesi Tenggara	13.0%	0.1%	92852	48.5%	0.4%	346338	31.6%	0.2%	225487	6.9%	0.1%	49497	714246	0.8%
26 Maluku	11.4%	0.1%	106605	47.4%	0.5%	442275	33.5%	0.3%	312260	7.7%	0.1%	71630	932677	1.0%
27 Irian Jaya	11.2%	0.1%	92016	45.9%	0.4%	377682	39.7%	0.4%	327075	3.2%	0.0%	26255	823038	0.9%
TOTAL	9.2%	8469152	44.2%	40810236	36.5%	33642768	10.1%	9311310	82243526	100%				

Source: adapted from Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 12

Appendix B: Distribution of Male Versus Female Civil Servants by Department

DEPARTMENT	% FEMALE	# FEMALE	% MALE	# MALE	TOTAL
1 Dalam Negeri	17.66%	31108	82.34%	145043	176151
2 Luar Negeri	19.03%	745	80.97%	3169	3914
3 Hankam	27.77%	41503	72.23%	107951	149454
4 Kehakiman	19.73%	10875	80.27%	44244	55119
5 Penerangan	26.05%	14217	73.95%	40357	54574
6 Keuangan	15.58%	9526	84.42%	51619	61145
7 Perdagangan	22.47%	3401	77.53%	11735	15136
8 Pertanian	17.12%	14659	82.88%	70966	85625
9 Perindustrian	20.70%	3433	79.30%	13151	16584
10 Pertambangan Dan Energi	13.63%	1327	86.37%	8407	9734
11 Pekerjaan Umum	10.70%	4281	89.29%	35726	40011
12 Perhubungan	11.23%	5850	88.77%	46239	52089
13 Pendidikan Dan Kebudayaan	36.93%	651508	63.07%	1112662	1764170
14 Kesehatan	54.21%	152038	45.79%	128424	280462
15 Agama	27.10%	58823	72.90%	158236	217059
16 Tenaga Kerja	21.21%	5115	78.79%	18999	24114
17 Sosial	34.69%	7644	65.31%	14392	22036
18 Koperasi	23.28%	4167	76.72%	13734	17901
19 Kehutanan	8.19%	2655	91.81%	29761	32416
20 Parpostel	25.06%	827	74.94%	2473	3300
21 Transmigrasi	20.33%	3800	79.67%	14894	18694
22 Sekretariat Negara	14.24%	420	85.76%	2530	2950
23 Sekretariat MPR	27.07%	72	72.93%	194	266
24 Sekretariat DPA	23.01%	78	76.99%	261	339
25 Sekretariat DPR	17.46%	214	82.54%	1012	1226
26 Mahkamah Agung	25.21%	323	74.79%	958	1281
27 Kejaksaan Agung	19.33%	3722	80.67%	15532	19254
28 Badan Pemeriksa Keuangan	17.81%	343	82.19%	1583	1926
29 Sandi Negara	20.37%	78	79.63%	305	383
30 BAKN	21.14%	1031	78.86%	3846	4877
This table continued on next page					

DEPARTMENT	% FEMALE	# FEMALE	% MALE	# MALE	TOTAL
31 Lembaga Administrasi Negara	27.91%	182	72.09%	470	652
32 DEPANRI	32.08%	17	67.92%	36	53
33 Dewan Telkom	14.29%	2	85.71%	12	14
34 Lapan	15.40%	227	84.60%	1247	1474
35 Bakin	0.74%	8	99.26%	1066	1074
36 LIPI	20.39%	1150	79.61%	4491	5641
37 Batan	17.22%	756	82.78%	3635	4391
TOTALS	32.94%	1036126	67.06%	2109359	3145489

Source: adapted from Biro Pusat Statistik, 1993, p 53

Appendix C: Distribution of Civil Servants by Rank and Sex (1992)

RANK	% FEMALE	# FEMALE	% MALE	# MALE	TOTAL
Rank I Avg.	12.99%		87.01%		
I/A	7.28%	11,169	92.72%	142,258	153,427
I/B	17.39%	33,010	82.61%	156,809	189,819
I/C	13.76%	18,749	86.24%	117,505	136,254
I/D	12.51%	16,479	87.49%	115,249	131,728
Rank II Avg.	39.44%		60.56%		
II/A	40.76%	440,069	59.24%	639,590	1,079,659
II/B	40.51%	268,260	59.49%	393,948	662,208
II/C	38.26%	230,316	61.74%	371,661	601,977
II/D	34.94%	110,788	65.06%	206,293	317,081
Rank III Avg.	27.33%		72.67%		
III/A	30.64%	97,299	69.36%	220,258	317,557
III/B	26.22%	39,828	73.78%	112,073	151,901
III/C	19.21%	14,663	80.79%	61,667	76,330
III/D	16.27%	6,511	83.73%	33,510	40,021
Rank IV Avg.	11.01%		88.99%		
IV/A	12.27%	2,744	87.73%	19,618	22,362
IV/B	10.26%	709	89.74%	6,199	6,908
IV/C	7.79%	308	92.21%	3,644	3,952
IV/D	5.93%	92	94.07%	1,460	1,552
IV/E	7.04%	42	92.96%	555	597
TOTAL	33.11%	1,291,038	66.89%	2,602,295	3,893,333

Source: Biro Pusat Statistik, 1992, p 37

Appendix D: Five Policy Approaches to Including Women in Development Planning:

ISSUES	WELFARE	EQUITY	ANTI-POVERTY	EFFICIENCY	EMPOWERMENT
Origins	Earliest- model of social welfare under colonial administration- modernisation/ accelerated growth economic development model.	Original WID - failure of modernisation development policy- influence of Boserup and First World feminists- Declaration of UN Decade for Women	Second WID - toned down equity due to criticism linked to Redistribution with Growth and Basic Needs	Third WID approach- Deterioration in world economy -economic stabilisation policies and adjustment rely on women's economic contribution to development	Most recent-Product of the failure of equity approach -Third World Women's feminist writing and grassroots organisations.
Period Most Popular	1950-70; still widely used	1975-85; attempts to adopt it during and since Women's Decade	1970's onward; limited acceptability	Post 1980's; now most popular	1970's onward; accelerated during '80's, still limited
Purpose	Bring women into development as better mothers.	Gain equity for women in the development process.	Ensure poor women increase their productivity.	Ensure development is more efficient and more effective.	Empower women through greater self-reliance.
Needs met	Meet practical gender needs in women's reproductive role.	Meet strategic gender needs in terms of women's triple role.	Meet practical gender needs in women's productive role.	Meet practical gender needs in the context of declining social services.	Reach strategic gender needs in terms of women's triple role.

Source: Moser, 1989, 1993

Appendix E: Organizational Structure of the State Ministry for the Role of Women

NOTE :

- Echelon I
 Echelon II

Source: GOI pamphlet "Machinery for the Advancement of Women" 1994, np

Appendix F: Policy Approach to Enhancing the Role of Women in National Development

Source: GOI pamphlet "Women in Development Policy and Programme" 1994, np

Appendix G: Organizational Structure of PKK

Source: Suryakusuma, 1990, p 62

Appendix H: National Standing Committee on the Status of Women (KNKWI)

The INDONESIAN NATIONAL COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN

KOMISI NASIONAL KEDUDUKAN WANITA INDONESIA KNKWI

1. Secretariat
Jln. Merdeka Barat 15
Gedung B Lantai Dasar 1/17
Jakarta Pusat (10110)
Tel. 371.035 ext. 117

2. Special Library:
The National Library
Jln. Salemba Raya 28 A
Jakarta Pusat (10002)
Tel. 310.1411 ext. 334

KOMISI NASIONAL KEDUDUKAN WANITA INDONESIA

WHY ?

Realizing the necessity of a national women oriented institution with international relations while simultaneously responding to an appeal of the United Nations Economic & Social Council (ECOSOC) for all member countries to set up a national commission along the line of the UN Commission on the status of Women which resorts under ECOSOC, and consequently a similar request from the main Indonesian women groupings at that time, the Indonesian Government in 1968 established the Indonesian Commission on the Status of Women or Komisi Nasional Kedudukan Wanita Indonesia, known by its initials KNKWI.

KNKWI's objectives : to monitor and help improve the position and status of (Indonesian) women in the family and in society.

WHEN ?

Set up on July 31, 1968 by letter of Decision (Decree) No. 34/Kpts/KESRA/VII/1968 from the Minister of State for People's Welfare.

WHAT & WHO ?

KNKWI is an autonomous semigovernmental body having a consultative status with the government e.g. the Minister of State for the Role of Women. It consists of 45 members:

1/3 members from relevant government agencies;
2/3 Non Government Organization members from women organizations affiliated to KOWANI (Indonesian Women's Congress).

Membership qualifications incl academic degree or equal educational experience, proficiency in one of the United Nations official languages, able and willing to work for the advancement of Indonesian women's position and participation in the era of development.

Organizational structure :

- A Presidium of 5 members (elected for a 5 year period);

K N K W I

- Expert members (approved for a 5 year period);
- Sub-commissions :
 - Morals & Religion
 - Education & Culture
 - Health & Social Welfare
 - Law & the Family
 - Human resources & Politics
- Ad-hoc committees for special tasks.

WHERE ?

KNKWI is located in Jakarta, the capital city of the Republic of Indonesia. See front page for addresses.

HOW ?

Subsidized by the government for its basic administrative needs, KNKWI has to seek the cooperation and funding also from other sources to achieve its objectives.

In its procedure KNKWI may thus :

- Conduct surveys, research or other means to collect data relating to the status, position or role of the Indonesian women;
- Consequently convey its recommendation or report to relevant government or non government organizations;
- Participate in government or non government pilot projects or other national activities which are related to KNKWI's objectives;
- Engage the assistance of UN agencies or other institutions to carry out a KNKWI project as long as such aid does not in any way jeopardize national interests.

ACTIVITIES.

In the past and at present KNKWI has had good relations with both non government (like DNIKS, CIDA of Canada, the ASIA Foundation, UNDP and others) and government institutions beside the Office of the State Minister for the Role of Women. Past activities outside research and data

INDONESIAN NATIONAL COMMISSION ON THE STATUS OF WOMEN

collecting : KNKWI was responsible for the inclusion of a person's marital status on the Personal Identification Card (KTP) Indonesian citizens carry with them.

Together with KOWANI, KNKWI was instrumental in including the special paragraph on women's participation specified in the Guidelines of State policy (GBHN) as of the third Five Year Development Plan.

Following the Nairobi Forward Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women (Kenya 1985) KNKWI assisted the Office of the State Minister for the Role of Women in drafting a Basic national Strategy.

This was discussed at an extended conference at national level in October 1986 and resulted in a document on "A Basic national Strategy for the Improvement of Women's Role in Development towards the years 2000" which was subsequently presented to the Government.

Also in view of this KNKWI has started a Women's Potential File. Contributing to this file will be the outcome of further research into the potentials and opportunities of female government employees in view of the national development drive, which is now being prepared in cooperation with the Office of the State Minister for the Role of Women.

KNKWI has always kept an eye on the proceedings of the UN Commission on the Status of Women and related issues in particular the Convention on the Elimination of all forms of discrimination against women which it translated into Indonesian for distribution and discussion after responding to its draft in 1976.

Marking one decade of the Convention KNKWI sponsored a one-day seminar in December 1989 to collect data and views on its implementation so far. If from its initial stage KNKWI has had a historic working relation with the Ministry of Social Affairs, in its later development KNKWI has been closely related to the Office of the State Minister for the Role of Women.

In view of the Era of Information its link with the National Library as a past and current data resource will be strengthened.

Appendix I: Declaration on the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region

The Minister for Foreign Affairs of Brunei Darussalan, the Minister for Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia, the Minister of Foreign Affairs of Malaysia, the Secretary of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of the Philippines, the Minister for Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Singapore, and the Minister of Foreign Affairs for the Kingdom of Thailand.

DESIRING to further intensify the aims and purposes of the Bangkok Declaration of 1967, the Declaration of ASEAN Concord of 1976, and the Manila Declaration of 1987;

RECOGNIZING the importance of active participation and integration of women in the region in sharing the future development and progress of ASEAN and the necessity of meeting the needs and aspiration of women in the ASEAN Member Countries;

AWARE that women constitute half of the total population of the ASEAN region; and

TAKING cognizance of the multiple roles of women in the family, in society, and in the nation and the need to give full support and provide facilities and opportunities to enable them to undertake these tasks effectively;

DO HEREBY DECLARE THAT:

In the context of strengthening regional cooperation, collaboration and coordination for the purpose of advancing the role and contribution of women in the progress of the region, each MEMBER COUNTRY, either individually or collectively, in ASEAN shall endeavour:

1. To promote and implement the equitable and effective participation of women whenever possible in all fields and at various levels of the political, economic, social and cultural life of society at the national, regional, and international levels.
2. To enable women in the region to undertake their important role as active agents and beneficiaries of national and regional development, particularly in promoting regional understanding and cooperation and in building more just and peaceful societies.
3. To integrate in national plans the specific concerns of women and their roles as active agents in and beneficiaries of development specifically considering their role as a productive force to attain the full development of the human personality.
4. To design and promote programmes involving the participation of community and non-governmental women organizations towards strengthening national and regional resilience.
5. To strengthen solidarity in the region and international women forum by promoting harmonization of views and of positions.

Bangkok, Thailand, October 1988

Appendix J: Kongress Wanita Indonesia (KOWANI)

KOWANI

KONGRES WANITA INDONESIA

THE INDONESIAN WOMEN'S CONGRESS

**Member of ASEAN Confederation
of Women's Organisations, ACWO
Affiliated to ASEAN**

**Member of International Council
of Women, ICW, on consultative
status with U.N., Category I**

**58, JL DIAM BONJOL
JAKARTA 10310 - INDONESIA
TEL.: (62 - 21)3152787,3152785
FAX.: (62 - 21)3152784**

KONGRES WANITA INDONESIA, Acronym, "KOWANI" (THE INDONESIAN WOMEN'S CONGRESS)

KOWANI is a federation of nationally based voluntary women's organisations established in 1928 December, and is situated in Jakarta, the capital city of the Republic of Indonesia

It obtained official recognition as one of the national machineries in the national mechanism for women's full integration in national, regional, international development, under the coordination of the Office of the Minister of State for the Role of Women

Courtesy call to The President of The Republic of Indonesia

◆ KOWANI LOGO AND MOTTO

The Logo

1. Base color: terra cotta symbolizes patriotism
2. Five green leaves depict the Pancasila, five principles of the State Philosophy, and the 1945 State Constitution
3. Melati (Jasmine) flower with two buds, symbolizes the relationship between KOWANI and the young generation identical to the relationship between mother and child

The Motto

Merdeka Melaksanakan Dharma (Free to Serve) is KOWANI's Motto printed in golden letters

The principle of equality, ingrained in the Pancasila and contained in the 1945 State Constitution renders to the women freedom to serve for their country and their nation on an equal footing with men

The Logo and the Motto depict the mission and function of KOWANI as the vehicle for the realization of Indonesian women's aspirations based on the Pancasila State Philosophy, the 1945 State Constitution and patriotism. They also reflect women's responsibility towards the wellbeing of the nation, the

community, the family, her ownself development and of the youth who are the future builders of the nation.

◆ BASIC PRINCIPLES

KOWANI's mission is based on the Pancasila State Philosophy and the 1945 State Constitution. The Pancasila sets out : Belief in the One and Supreme God; Just and Civilized Humanity; Unity of Indonesia; Democracy guided by the wisdom of Consultation among Representations; Social justice for all of the Indonesian people.

◆ AIM

The main aim of KOWANI is to coordinate women forces into concerted, endeavours aimed at the full implementation of women & men equality of rights and responsibilities, opportunities, as accorded by the 1945 State Constitution, – in order that women can become defacto equal partners of men in national development, in the family, in the community, in the world society.

◆ GENERAL OBJECTIVES

1. To strengthen KOWANI's function as the spearhead and vehicle of the Indonesian women's movement by strengthening unanimity, coordination, and cooperation among women of Indonesia
2. To formulate the main policies and strategies of the women's movement aimed at the total development of women in a just and prosperous society based on the Pancasila and the 1945 State Constitution.
3. To secure cadre forming among women in all fields in cooperation with relevant institutions, agencies, to maintain sustainability and quality of the women's movement.
4. To promote the new image of the Indonesian Woman.
5. To contribute to world peace by strengthening friendship, mutual understanding and cooperation among nations through the women in particular based on equality of rights and status.

◆ PRIORITIES

In pursuing the said aims and objectives, Kowani resorted to priority setting of 5 areas of concern, as in the following :

1. Education, Science and Technology.
a.o. eradication of illiteracy, women leadership training, youth development, promoting women's role in Science and Technology, and promoting professionalism in various fields.
2. Laws
Legal literacy, legal aid and advocacy for full implementation of CEDAW.
3. Economy and Co-operatives.
a.o. income generating and promoting small entrepreneurship, facilitating access of women to credits; the national co-operative campaign; consumer education and protection, and appreciation and promoting consumption of domestic products

4. Employment.

Promoting low educated women workers status through training schemes, monitoring working condition of women workers, advocacy for protection and social security of women workers; expansion of employment opportunities for women through self employment activities.

5. Population and Environment Family planning balanced with implanting the small Happy Prosperous Family Norm – environment and conservation preservation, clean and healthy life style campaign.

◆ STRUCTURE

KOWANI is a policy making body, managed by the Executive Board composed of one President, one or more Vice Presidents, one Secretary General, one or more Recording Secretaries, one or more Treasurers, and Standing Committee Conveners, and is based on a collective management system.

In pursuing efficiency, effectiveness of the policies made, KOWANI may implement pilot activities/projects as a guidance for member organisations as the implementing agencies.

The highest authority is vested in the five yearly plenary meeting, the Congress, which elects the Executive Board and formulates the five year Work Plan.

There are as many Standing Committees as there are areas of special concern as determined by the Congress.

The Standing Committees formulate their respective programme of activities conforming the Work Plan.

The 1993-1998 Board - Structure includes 11 Standing Committees listed in the here under :

1. Standing Committee on Organisations, Structures, Procedures and Cadre forming.

Attending Regional ACWO Seminar on AIDS in Bangkok 1993

2. Standing Committee on Education, Science and Technology.
3. Standing Committee on Mental Enrichment and Culture.
4. Standing Committee on Health, Family and Social Welfare.
5. Standing Committee on Environment.
6. Standing Committee on Economy and Cooperatives.
7. Standing Committee on Employment.
8. Standing Committee on Laws.
9. Standing Committee on International Relations.
10. Standing Committee on Humanitarian Foundations.
11. Standing Committee on Public Relations, Information and Documentation.

◆ INSTITUTIONS FOSTERED BY KOWANI

1. "Yayasan Seri Derma", Scholarship Foundation; renders scholarships to needy, promising girls and women; Manages a dormitory for girl students in Yogyakarta (Central Java).
2. "Yayasan Kesejahteraan Anak & Remaja", Child and Youth Welfare Foundation; conducts kindergarten, primary and secondary schools; also provides youth guidance.
3. "Yayasan Hari Ibu, Women's Day Foundation", manages the Mandala Bhakti Wanitatama or the Unified Women's Movement Monument in Yogyakarta, promotes women's vocational skills through formal and non formal education; manages the Women's Movement Museum.
4. "Yayasan Daya Wanita", Women Entrepreneurs Foundation, promotes economic productivity of women entrepreneurship and product marketing; conducts a womens craft promotion centre; manages a Home for Elderly Women.
5. "Yayasan Binakerta", Women Service Centre, Focusses on vocational skill training and job placing to help strengthen women's status in employment.

Others :

1. The KOWANI Women's Library.
2. The Indonesian Women's Cooperative, KOPWANI, which is a loan and savings cooperative. It has a unit which renders public service primarily for members.
3. The Family Welfare Counseling Bureau catering to women and youth.
4. GOTA : Parents Movement Against Drug Abuse.

Brief History of the KOWANI

The recognition obtained by the Indonesian Women's Congress as an NGO national machinery in the National Mechanism for women's full integration in development under the coordination of the Office of the State Minister for the Role of Women, and the recognition of women as equal partners of men in the current national development process, is not to be separated from the significant role played by the early women patriotic freedom fighters and emancipationists during the colonial time since the early years of the 19th century

Attending The ICW Meeting in Lucerne 1990

Outstanding women during that period, such as M. Christina Tiahahu, Cut Nya Dien, Cut Mutiah, R.A. Kartini, Walanda Marais, Dewi Sartika, Nyai Achmad Dahlan, Rangkeyo Rasuna Said and others were recorded in History as being the nine National Heroines.

The first Indonesian women's organisation was established in as early as 1912. Others soon followed, motivated by the strong urge to work together to obtain a better status and quality of life for women and for the family, and to strengthen nationalism and patriotism.

On 22nd December, 1928 in Yogyakarta, motivated by their common cause and the need for unity in action and thought thirty women organisations convened the first All Indonesia Women's Congress, where they adopted the decision to establish an umbrella organisation now known as KOWANI, Indonesia Women's Congress.

Training

Hence the 22nd December, 1928 Congress marked the start of the historical unified Indonesian Women's movement, which became an integral part of the nationalistic movement publicly announced on 28 October, 1928 through the equally historical Youth Pledge.

The women in KOWANI not only struggled for social development, but also took an active part in the independence war in 1945, shoulder to shoulder in close alliance with the men in the battlefield and at the homefront.

The above described significant and unrelenting women's contribution was given due recognition in the 1945 State Constitution, which accords equal rights, responsibilities and opportunities to women and men. In honour of the women of Indonesia, Presidential Decree No. 316, 1959, recognized the 22nd of December as "Hari Ibu", Indonesian Women's Day, a National Day to be observed throughout the Country.

Another official recognition and token of appreciation was given to KOWANI in 1983, when the President of Indonesia performed the inauguration ceremony of the monumental building "Mandala Bhakti Wanitatama" constructed by the government and dedicated to the women of Indonesia. On this auspicious occasion the President of Indonesia presented the key of the building to the KOWANI President in function.

Most rewarding, and of great significance to the women's movement was the appointment of Ms. Maria Ulfah as the first woman Minister in the 1950's; Ms. Maria Ulfah married to Mr. Soebadio who majored in Law was a one time President of KOWANI.

True to their commitment to the advancement of women, KOWANI was instrumental in setting up the National Commission on the Status of Women in 1968, also in the ratification in 1974 of the National Marriage Law, which was KOWANI's brainchild. The IWY in 1975 and the World Plan of Action promulgated in 1976 at the launching of the UN decade for women resulted in the strengthening of the political commitment in Indonesia to the acceleration of the women's advancement process.

This political commitment manifested in the appointment of a new ministerial office, the Office of the Associate Minister for the Role of Women in 1978, with the function of coordinator and focal point in the National Mechanism for full integration of women. The privilege to assume this new function was again given to a KOWANI leader, the then outgoing President of KOWANI Mrs. Lasiah Soetanto.

This Office was promoted to State Minister in 1983; in the same year 1983 the ex Secretary General of KOWANI Mrs. Nani Soedarsono was appointed Minister of Social Affairs.

In 1987 the President of KOWANI for the 1983-1988 office period, Mrs. A. Sulasikin Murpratomo succeeded Mrs. L. Soetanto as Minister of State for the Role of Women.

As a recognized NGO partner in development KOWANI has established a communication and information network, and co-operation where necessary, with related government institutions,

Greenary Action

with the office of the Minister of State for the Role of Women in particular.

In this position KOWANI participate in policy making, evaluation processes at central level, including in the formulation process of the Broad Guidelines of State Policy every five years.

At the international level KOWANI has since 1931 participated in international strategy formulation processes for women's advancement, for world peace, and sustainability of the Earth through UN conferences, workshop, etc., and other fora.

Two other outstanding KOWANI women leaders, Dr. Yetty Noor and Mrs. Suwarni Salyo who is a Law graduate were appointed member to the UN Commission on the Status of Women, respectively for the period 1976-1978, and 1980-1986.

In manifesting their strong commitment to international cooperation for world prosperity and peace through women endeavours KOWANI joined the International Council of Women, ICW, in consultative Status with UN, Category 1, as a fullfledged member in 1973.

In step with the world movement aimed at promoting a safe and sustainable planet Earth, KOWANI not only mobilizes women's active involvement in environment related programmes, but also strongly advocates consumers rights and their full enforcement at national and international level to secure welfare of present and future generations.

Fully supporting the Nairobi Forward Looking Strategies recommendations on regional cooperation in WID, KOWANI was one of the founders of the ASEAN Confederation of Women's Organisations, (ACWO) incepted in November, 1981 in Jakarta which became the NGO partner of the ASEAN Government WID mechanism called ASEAN Women's Programme, AWP.

◆ **LIST OF MEMBER ORGANISATIONS,
Recorded In 1993**

Comprising social, professional, functional, religious based organisation :

1. Asiyah
2. Persatuan Ibu Kecintaan Kepada Anak Turun Menurun
3. Wanita Taman Siswa
4. Wanita Katholik Republik Indonesia
5. Wanita Sahati
6. Pasundan Istri
7. Persatuan Wanita Tarbiyah Islamiah
8. Puteri Narpowandowo
9. Wanita Syarikat Islam
10. Persatuan Wanita Republik Indonesia
11. Persatuan Wanita Kristen Indonesia
12. Muslimat Nahdatul Ulama
13. Persit Kartika Chandra Kirana - *Army*
14. Budi Istri
15. Bhayangkari - *Police*
16. Persatuan Wanita Nasional
17. Ikatan Keluarga Wanita Gajah Mada
18. Rukun Wanita Indonesia
19. Ikatan Bidan Indonesia
20. Dharma Wanita Pariwisata Pos dan Telekomunikasi
21. Persatuan Istri Tehnisi Indonesia
22. Persatuan Organisasi Wanita Setanah Air
23. Dharma Wanita Departemen Dalam Negeri
24. Ikatan Istri Dokter Indonesia
25. Dharma Wanita Perusahaan Jawatan Kereta Api
26. Gerakan Wanita Sejahtera
27. Dharma Wanita Departemen *Luar Negeri*
28. Ikatan Sarjana Wanita Indonesia
29. PIA Ardhya Garini - *Air Force*
30. Jalasenastri - *Navy*
31. Wanita Kesatuan Organisasi Serba Guna Gotong Royong
32. Dharma Wanita Kejaksaan Agung RI
33. Persatuan Wanita Sarjana Hukum Indonesia
34. Wanita Islam
35. Peripurna Garini
36. Dharma Wanita Perhubungan Laut
37. Persatuan Istri Veteran Republik Indonesia
38. Dharma Wanita Departemen Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan
39. Wanita Satya Praja
40. Kohati PB Himpunan Mahasiswa Islam
41. Dharma Wanita Departemen Penerangan
42. Dharma Wanita Departemen Agama
43. Ikatan Wanita Pengusaha Indonesia
44. Ikatan Keluarga Wartawan Indonesia - *Armed Forces*
45. Wanita Musyawarah Kekeluargaan Gotong Royong
46. Persatuan Wredatama Republik Indonesia
47. Persatuan Istri Insinyur Indonesia
48. Persatuan Wanita Tarbiyah Islamiyah
49. Wanita Swadiri
50. Korps Wanita Veteran Republik Indonesia
51. Keluarga Widuri

52. Bidang Kewanitaan Persatuan Purnawirawan ABRI
53. Himpunan Wanita Karya
54. Angkatan Muda Pembaharuan Indonesia (AMPI) Wanita
55. Wanita Persatuan Guru Republik Indonesia
56. Al Hidayah
57. Wanita Himpunan Kerukunan Tani Indonesia
58. Wanita Budhis Indonesia
59. Wanita Forum Komunikasi Putra/i Purnawirawan dan Putra/i ABRI
60. Ikatan Sarjana Farmasi Indonesia
61. Ikatan Kesejahteraan Keluarga ABRI
62. Fatayat Nahdatul Ulama
63. Wirawati Catur Panca
64. Wanita Shufiah
65. Perwita Wana Kencana
66. Wanita Pemuda Panca Marga
67. Korps Pergerakan Mahasiswa Islam Indonesia Putri
68. Wanita Gabungan Usaha Pembaharuan Pendidikan Islam (GUPPI)

Courtesy call to Ibu Tien Soeharto Patroness of KOWANI

20 Wanita Gabungan Usaha Pembaharuan Pendidikan Islam

Appendix K: Organizational Structure of Dharma Wanita

Source: Suryakusuma, 1990, p 61

Appendix L: Women's Study Centres

Daerah Istimewa Aceh

Pusat Studi Wanita
Pada Pusat Penelitian
Univ. Syiah Kuala
Jl. Darussalam, Banda Aceh
Tel: (0651) 21977 ext. 143

Sumatera Utara

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Sumatera Utara
Jl. Dr. Mansur No. 9
Kampus USU, Medan
Tel: (061) 536210, 524033

Pusat Studi Wanita
IKIP Medan
Jl. Pancing, Medan Estate
Pasar V
Medan, Tel: (061) 613365

Sumatera Barat

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Andalas
Jl. Perintis Kemerdekaan No. 77
Padang 25128
Tel: (0751) 21527, 28981

Kelompok Studi Wanita
IKIP Padang
Jl. Prof. Dr. Hamka
Kampus IKIP Air-Tawar
Padang 25131
Tel: (0751) 51260 ext. 213-217

Bengkulu

Pusat Penelitian Peranan Wanita
Universitas Bengkulu
Jl. Raya Kandang Limun
Bengkulu, Tel: 21170, 21884

Sumatera Selatan

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Sriwijaya
Jl. Srijaya Negara
Palembang 30139
Tel/Fax: (0711) 354423

Jambi

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Jambi
Jl. Prof. Dr. Sri Soedewi
Telanaipura, Tel: (0741) 24131

Jakarta

Pusat Studi Wanita
IKIP Jakarta
Komplek IKIP Rawamangun
Jakarta 13220, Tel: 4890856

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Terbuka
Jl. Cabe Raya, Pondok Cabe, Ciputat
Kotak Pos 6666
Jakarta 10001

Kelompok Studi Wanita
Universitas YARSI
Jl. Letjen Suprpto
Cempaka Putih
Jakarta 10510

Jawa Barat

Kelompok Studi Wanita
FISIP UI
Gedung C-303
Kampus Baru Universitas Indonesia
Depok 16424
Tel: 7270026 ext 221
Fax: 7270006

Kelompok Studi Wanita
Fak. Psikologi UI
Kampus Universitas Indonesia
Depok

Pusat Studi Wanita
Lembaga Penelitian IPB
Jl. Raya Pajajaran
Bogor
Tel: (0251) 325125, 32496

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Padjadjaran
Jl. Dipati Ukur 35
Bandung 40135
Tel: (022) 83271, 83278 ext.173

Pusat Studi Wanita Madini IAIN
Sunan Gunung Kijati
Jl. Raya Cipadung No. 105
Ujung Berung, Bandung
Tel: (022) 87507

Pusat Studi Wanita
IKIP Bandung
Jl. Dr. Setiabudi No. 229
Bandung 40154
Tel: (022) 213161-213164
Fax: (022) 213651

Kelompok Studi Wanita
Pusat Penelitian Teknologi
ITB
Jl. Ganesya 17
Bandung
Tel: (022) 2503307, 2501768

Kelompok Studi Wanita
PPLH-ITB
Jl. Sangkuriang 42 A
P.O. Box 1371
Bandung 40135
Tel: (022) 2500606
Fax: (022) 2504602

Jawa Tengah

Pusat Studi Wanita
Lembaga Penelitian
Universitas Diponegoro
Jl. Imam Barjo, SH No. 5
Kotak Pos 270
Semarang 50241
Tel: (024) 411450, 311516
Fax: (024) 318381

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Sebelas Maret
Kampus UNS
Jl. Ir. Sutami No. 36 A
Surakarta, Tel: (0271) 32916

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Muhammadiyah
Jl. A. Yani Kartasura
Surakarta, Tel: 47414

Daerah Istimewah Yogyakarta

Pusat Studi Wanita
Lembaga Penelitian dan
Pengembangan Pendidikan
IKIP Yogyakarta
Kampus IKIP, Karangmalang
Yogyakarta 55281
Tel: (0274) 86168, 86903
Fax: (0274) 65500

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Gadjah Mada
Jl. Asem Kranji
Sekip Utara Blok K-5
Yogyakarta
Tel: (0274) 88688 Ext. 2417
Fax: (0274) 63974, 61196

Jawa Timur

Pusat/Penelitian Studi Wanita
Universitas Airlangga
Jl. Darmawangsa Dalam Selatan
No. 15
Surabaya 45997
Tel: (031) 522494
Fax: (031) 42557

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Jember
Jl. Veteran No. 3
Kotak Pos 59
Jember 68118
Tel: (0331) 21270

Penelitian Studi Wanita
Universitas Brawijaya
Jl. Mayjen Haryono 169
Malang 65113
Tel: (0341) 51611-15 Ext. 130
Fax: (0341) 65420

Pusat Penelitian/Pusat Studi Wanita
IKIP Malang
Jl. Surabaya 6
Malang 65145
Tel: (0341) 51312
Fax: (0341) 51921

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Muhammadiyah
Jl. Karimata 43
Kotak Pos 104
Jember 68121
Tel: (0331) 86728

Pusat Studi Wanita dan
Kemasyarakatan
Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang
Jl. Bendungan Sutami 188-A
Malang, Tel: 51149

Riau

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Riau
Jl. Patimura No. 9
Pekanbaru, Riau
Tel: (0761) 21341, 23430

Kalimantan Barat

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Tanjungpura
Jl. Iman Bonjol
Pontianak 78124
Tel: (0561) 39630, 39636
Fax: (0561) 39637, 39638

Kalimantan Tengah

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Palangka Raya
Kampus Unpar Tanjung Nyaho
Jl. Yos Sudarso
Palangka Raya 73111A
Tel: (0514) 21492, 21722

Kalimantan Timur

Kelompok Studi Wanita
Universitas Mulawarman
Samarinda
Tel: (0541) 41118, 41797

Kalimantan Selatan

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Lambung Mangkurat
Jl. Brigjen H. Hasan Basri
Banjarmasin 70123
Tel: (0511) 54195, 54177

Sulawesi Tengah

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Tadulako
Kampus Bumi Tadulako Tondo
Palu
Tel: (0451) 22355, 22611

Sulawesi Selatan

Pusat Studi Wanita
IKIP Ujung Pandang
Kampus IKIP, Gunungsari Baru
Ujung Pandang
Tel: (0411) 83930, 83617 Ext.18

Pusat Studi Wanita
Lembaga Penelitian
Universitas Hassanudin
Jl. Perintis Kemerdekaan Km. 10
Kampus UNHAS Tamalanrea
Ujung Pandang 90245
Tel: (0411) 510107 Ext. 2726
Fax: (0411) 510088, 318034

Sulawesi Utara

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Samratulangi
Manado
Tel: (0431) 64460
Fax: (0431) 64386

Sulawesi Tenggara

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Halu Oleo
Kampus Universitas Halu Oleo
Kendari, Tel: (040) 21503

Maluku

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Pattimura
Kotak Pos 95
Jl. Ir. M. Puthena
Kampus Unpatti
Ambon 97233, Tel: (0911) 3560

Nusa Tenggara Barat

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Mataram
Jl. Pendidikan 37
Mataram
Tel: (0364) 23004, 23007

Bali

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Udayana
Jl. Bali No. 1
Denpasar

Tel: (0361) 22666, 22949

Timor Timur

Kelompok Studi Wanita
Balai Penelitian Pengembangan dan
Pengabdian Masyarakat
Universitas Timor Timur
Jl. Kaikoli
Dili 88110

Irian Jaya

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Cendrawasih
Jayapura

Nusa Tenggara Timur

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Nusa Cendana
Kampus Undana PENFUI
Jl. Adisucipto
Kupang 85001
Tel: (0391) 21680

Lampung

Pusat Studi Wanita
Universitas Lampung
Jl. Prof. Sumantri Brojonegoro No. 1
Bandar Lampung 35145

Tel: (0721) 75173
Fax: (0721) 72767

Source: Indonesian Women In Development: Information Kit and Sectoral Brochures

Appendix M: Jakarta Declaration For The Advancement of Women in Asia and The Pacific

The participants in the Second Asian and Pacific Ministerial Conference on Women in Development, having met in Jakarta from 7 to 14 June 1994, have reviewed and appraised the implementation of the Nairobi Forward-looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women adopted by the World Conference to Review and Appraise the Achievements of the United Nations Decade for Women: Equality, Development and Peace, held in Nairobi in 1985, and prepared for the Fourth World Conference on Women: Action for Equality, Development and Peace to be held in Beijing from 4 to 15 September 1995;

Reaffirming their commitment to the provisions contained in the Charter of the United Nations and relevant international conventions and instruments, in particular the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women;

Recognizing the national competence of all countries to formulate, adopt and implement their respective policies on the advancement of women, mindful of their cultures, values and traditions, as well as their social, economic and political conditions;

Emphasizing the importance of the empowerment of women as a cornerstone of sustainable development and the strategic role of women as agents and beneficiaries of development and in the alleviation of poverty;

Aiming at achieving the full realization of the advancement of women as equal partners with men, in the family and society, based on a harmonious and mutually beneficial partnership between men and women;

Aiming also at enhancing women's full involvement and active participation in policy- and decision-making processes at all stages;

Desirous of promoting and protecting the human rights of women at all stages of their life cycle;

Noting with appreciation the efforts and progress made by the members and associate members of ESCAP to promote the objectives of the United Nations Decade for Women: Equality, Development and Peace, reaffirmed in the Nairobi Forward-looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women, their commitment and leadership shown in the creation and implementation of programmes to meet these objectives, and the significant contribution made by non-governmental organizations, particularly grass-roots, social development and professional women's organizations, research and higher educational institutions;

Acknowledging efforts at the sub-regional level to create frameworks for the advancement of women, such as the Declaration of the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region, the Pacific Platform for Action: Rethinking Sustainable Development for Pacific Women towards the Year 2000, and the South Asian Association for

Regional Cooperation (SAARC) Perspective with regard to the Fourth World Conference on Women;

Noting further the invaluable contributions of donor countries, multilateral agencies and non-governmental organizations in providing technical and financial assistance for women in development programmes;

Having reaffirmed the principles to which we are committed, pledge our efforts towards the advancement of women in our region, concentrating on the following areas:

- 1. The advancement of women has a bearing on peace and development, and has implications at all levels, and should therefore be addressed locally, nationally, regionally and globally. In particular, women as agents and beneficiaries of development must be fully integrated into policy formulation, planning, decision-making and implementation.**
- 2. Women should have equal rights, obligations and opportunities with men in all fields and at all levels of development. Their empowerment and the improvement of their political, social and economic status are essential for human development, and self-reliance of women and their families.**
- 3. Formal, non-formal and informal education is essential for empowering women with knowledge, skills and self-confidence for full participation in development.**
- 4. Priority should be given to health programmes targeting women and the girl-child throughout their life cycle, particularly in the fields of nutrition, basic health and reproductive health.**
- 5. The increasing global concern about the human dimensions of development requires the integration of gender concerns in all stages and at all levels of sustainable development as a means to ensure human well-being, equitably enjoyed by all people. The interrelationship between population, resources, the environment and development should be fully recognized, properly managed and brought into a harmonious and dynamic synergy.**
- 6. Alleviation of poverty and the eradication of absolute poverty are fundamental to the achievement of sustainable development and the advancement of women. Consistent efforts towards achieving a balanced gender partnership are a prerequisite for the full development of human potential.**
- 7. Strengthening of national machineries for the advancement of women in various dimensions and with effective collaboration between Governments and non-governmental organizations is essential for the full and equal integration of women in people-centred development.**
- 8. The human rights of women and the girl-child are inalienable, integral and indivisible parts of universal human rights and consequently all forms of discrimination against women, sexual exploitation and gender-based violence should be eliminated.**

9. Violence against women in the family, society and conflict situations must be eliminated if women are to enjoy their rights as individuals and members of the family, society, state and global communities. In this respect, the implementation of the provisions of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, the Convention on the Rights of the Child, the Declaration on the Elimination of Violence against Women, and other relevant human rights instruments and United Nations resolutions is crucial. The role of women in peace-building and conflict resolution should be enhanced and strengthened.
10. The media are urged to respect fully the dignity of women, in particular by portraying women positively in all their diverse roles.
11. United Nations bodies and specialized agencies, intergovernmental organizations, donor countries and agencies, non-governmental organizations, the private sector and the general public are urged to support and assist the members and associate members of ESCAP in implementing the following Plan of Action.

Adopt the following Plan of Action for the Advancement of Women in Asia and the Pacific as a means to accelerate the attainment of the objectives of the Nairobi forward-looking Strategies in the Asian and Pacific region, and to contribute to preparations for the Fourth World Conference on Women: Action for Equality, Development and Peace. The participants therefore commit themselves, taking into account the social, economic and political conditions of each country, to take all necessary measures to ensure effective implementation of the following Plan of Action at the national, regional and international levels in cooperation with the United Nations system, and other regional and international organizations as well as non-governmental organizations.

Source: E/CN.6/1995/5/Add.1 Commission on the Status of Women (1995)

Appendix N: Message of The Fourth Ministerial Conference of Non-Aligned Countries Devoted to The Role of Women in Development

1. We, the Ministers of the Non-Aligned Countries, have gathered in Beijing, on the eve of the Fourth World Conference on Women: Action for Equality, Development and Peace in order to express the will of our Governments to work constructively and make a firm political commitment towards the adoption of a Platform for Action that establishes the priority actions to be carried out in the five years before the new century, in order to achieve the full and effective implementation of the Nairobi Forward-looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women.
2. We reaffirm our political resolve to ensure the advancement of women, our commitment to equality between women and men as a matter of human rights and a condition for economic and social justice, and our conviction that women's full and equal participation in all the spheres of society is a prerequisite for equality, development and peace. We also urge that effective actions be taken for the eradication of all forms of discrimination against women and for their full and equal enjoyment of all human rights.
3. We acknowledge the progress that, though unsatisfactory, the international community has made in the search for equality between women and men and the advancement of women. None the less, we express our deep concern over the critical situation of deprivation in which the great majority of the women of the world live in the developing countries, particularly in the least developed countries and the countries of Africa, and our belief that the Beijing Conference provides the great opportunity for the international community to leap forward by decisively committing itself to change and to achieving rapid and effective implementation of its Platform for Action.
4. We observe that despite the bright promise and expectations for revitalizing development as a consequence of recent economic and political changes in the post-cold-war era, the results so far have proved to be disappointing due to the prevalence of an unfavourable economic environment. The gap between the rich and the poor nations continues to widen and the negative impact of changes has been stronger on women, particularly those of the developing countries.
5. We affirm that only an international environment conducive to development and peace can guarantee the achievement of equality between women and men. Although the obstacles and difficulties faced by women have similar and common characteristics, their manifestation may differ in relationship to the level of development and other factors. Women of the developing countries carry a disproportionate burden of the afflictions to which contemporary women are subject, and the obstacles to their advancement go hand in hand with the difficulties that our countries face in dealing with the problems of poverty, violence and underdevelopment.
6. Therefore, it is imperative that in the implementation of the Platform for Action special attention is paid to the deep-seated obstacles that hinder progress - namely, poverty and lack of access to education, health care and decision-making.

7. Women constitute the majority of the more than one billion people living in poverty. Poverty has, among others, structural causes of both a national and international nature that need to be addressed through democratic participation and profound changes in economic structures in order to ensure the access of all women, in particular women in rural areas, as vital development agents, to productive resources, opportunities and public services, and not only through humanitarian aid and anti-poverty programmes which address women merely as beneficiaries of development. We thus consider it of the greatest importance that the persistent and increasing burden of poverty on women constitutes the first critical area of concern of the Platform for Action, as an unequivocal message of the urgency with which this scourge must be viewed and eradicated.

8. Illiteracy remains one of the fundamental impediments to the advancement of women and to development, as females make up more than 70 per cent of illiterate people. Lack of education continues to feed the vicious circle of women's exclusion from the mainstream of social, economic and political processes, consequentially limiting their options. Basic formal and informal education for girls and life-long education and training for women is a right, and investing in it, with its exceptionally high social and economic return, has proved to be one of the best means of achieving sustainable development and sustained economic growth.

9. Women have the right to enjoy the highest possible level of physical and mental health. Although the highest priority for developing countries must be to increase the access of women to basic health services, it should be acknowledged that solutions require a broad approach since women's health is affected by social, political, economic and environmental factors.

10. We express our strongest condemnation of all forms of violence against women and reiterate our commitment to preventing, investigating and punishing all such acts, and to giving support and assistance to all individuals and all groups particularly vulnerable to violence. In this regard, we also express our deep concern over the immense suffering to which women of different regions of the world are being subjected, many times to a greater degree than men, as a result of emerging or recently exacerbated forms of conflict and manifestations of violence and discrimination. The particularly cruel, massive and complex nature of these conflicts requires new and urgent approaches by the international community in order to combat both their unfolding and root causes. In this context, we reiterate the need to embrace the principles and implement the actions envisaged in the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action, as well as the Final Document of the Jakarta Summit and relevant resolutions of the United Nations, and we urge the Beijing Conference specifically to address all forms of violence against women and girls.

11. We reaffirm that the international community should take the necessary steps to enhance cooperation to prevent and combat terrorism, which aims at the violation of human rights and impacts negatively on women and girls, as enunciated, inter alia, in the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action.

12. We reaffirm the right of all peoples to self-determination, in particular, peoples under colonial or other forms of alien domination or foreign occupation, as enunciated, inter

alia, in the Vienna Declaration and Programme of Action. In this context, we also reaffirm our commitment to the protection of these rights of women and girls.

13. We urge our Movement to advance in the process of promoting equal access by women to decision-making positions in all fields and at all levels. The present situation of women's participation in political life in developing countries 10 years after the end of the United Nations Decade for Women, requires our urgent attention and most serious commitment to change. We view the fact that in four non-aligned nations, women are presiding over the destinies of their countries in their capacity as Head of State or Government, as a positive and encouraging signal of change.

14. We affirm that the role of our Governments is fundamental for the efforts directed to the advancement of women and express our commitment to reinforcing public initiatives more widely and vigorously in this field. We also affirm that issues pertaining to social development cannot be left to the forces of the market.

These continue to be the primary responsibility of Governments, as well as of the international community. It is imperative to apply a gender perspective in the formulation of policy and programmes and to elaborate national plans that are applicable at all levels and that can be periodically reviewed, for the implementation of the actions called for in the Platform for Action, specifying the respective responsibilities of the different sectors and actors of development.

15. The uneven results achieved in the fulfilment of the targets of the Nairobi Forward-looking Strategies have demonstrated the critical importance of providing adequate means to make the proposed objectives a reality. Success in implementing the Platform for Action cannot be achieved unless the international community reinforces national efforts, especially by making available new and additional resources. We therefore urge States and international financial institutions participating in the Conference to include in the Platform for Action the institutional and financial means that can make its concrete implementation viable.

16. We note the role played by the United Nations in the quest for the advancement of women. Its contribution, as well as that of its agencies and of the international financial and development institutions, will be important for success in achieving the objectives of the Conference. We consider it necessary that impetus be given to the process of widening the participation of women within the United Nations, especially those from developing countries, to achieve equitable geographical representation, with an emphasis on decision-making posts. The United Nations should serve as an example to States and to the international and regional institutions.

17. We recognize and support the work of the non-governmental organizations in the impetus given to the cause of the advancement of women. Their work in assisting developing countries in the implementation of their national plans must continue, bearing in mind that Governments have the principal responsibility for development in their respective countries.

18. We call upon the States that have not yet done so to ratify the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women.

19. We express our commitment to the ratification and full implementation of the Convention on the Rights of the Child and call upon States to take the necessary measures for the survival, protection and development of the girl-child.

20. We note that the views and recommendations from the declarations of the previous Non-Aligned Ministerial Conferences on Women in development, especially the Third Conference, held in Havana, Cuba, in 1990, continue to guide our positions. Equally, the criteria stemming from the World Conference on Human Rights in Vienna, the United Nations Conference on Environment and Development in Rio de Janeiro, the Global Conference on the Sustainable Development of Small Island Developing States in Barbados, the International Conference on Population and Development in Cairo and the World Summit for Social Development in Copenhagen should assist us in the conception and implementation of the Platform for Action.

21. We express our full support to the Group of 77 in its task of representing the developing world during the negotiations of the Fourth World Conference on Women and reiterate that the negotiations should be based on genuine interdependence, mutuality of interests and benefits and shared responsibilities.

22. We therefore firmly commit ourselves to achieving the goals of equality, development and peace, and to the removal of all obstacles to women's full and equal participation in all spheres of life.

Source: A/CONF.177/11 (1995) Second Review and Appraisal of the Implementation of the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women to the Year 2000

Please Note

**Page(s) not included with
original material and unavailable
from author or university. Filmed as received.**

198

UMI

REFERENCES

- Andriyani, Nori; "Myth of the Effective Little NGO", in Inside Indonesia, No. 46 (1991) Australia
- Anonymous; "Gender and Democracy" unpublished (1992) Indonesia
- ASEAN Women's Programme; ASEAN Clearinghouses on Women in Development, Center for Scientific Documentation and Information - Indonesian Institute of Science in Cooperation with UNICEF (1994) Jakarta
- Berninghausen, Jutta & Kerstan, Birgit; Forging New Paths: Feminist Social Methodology and Rural Women in Java, Zed Books (1992) USA
- Bhasin, Kamla & Khan, Nighat Said; Some Questions on Feminism and its Relevance in South Asia, Kali for Women, Indraprastha Press (1986) New Delhi
- Bhatt, Anil; "Asian NGOs in Development: Their Role and Impact", in Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects and Challenges for People-Centred Development, Heyzer, Nolan; Riker, James; & Quizon, Antonio (Eds.), St. Martin's Press, Inc. (1995) NY
- Biro Pusat Statistik; Indikator Sosial Wanita Indonesia 1992, Government of Indonesia (1992) Jakarta
- Biro Pusat Statistik; Indikator Sosial Wanita Indonesia 1993, Government of Indonesia (1993) Jakarta
- Canadian Council for International Cooperation (CCIC); Two Halves Make a Whole: Balancing Gender Relations in Development, CCIC (1991) Ottawa, Canada
- Canadian Government; People in Action, Report of the National Advisory Council on Voluntary Action to the Government of Canada (September 1977) Canada

- Canadian International Development Agency; NGO Program: People in Action, CIDA (1980) Hull
- Clark, John; Democratizing Development: The Role of Voluntary Organizations, Kumarian Press (1991) Connecticut
- Clark, John; "The State and the Voluntary Sector", Human Resources Development and Operations Policy, The World Bank (1993)
- Cleary, Seamus; "In Whose Interest? NGO Advocacy Campaigns and the Poorest. An Exploration of Two Indonesian Examples", in International Relations Vol 12 (5) pp. 9-35 (1995)
- de Fonseka, Chandra; "Challenges and Future Directions for Asian NGOs, in Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects and Challenges for People-Centred Development Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects and Challenges for People-Centred Development, Heyzer, Nolan; Riker, James; & Quizon, Antonio (Eds.), St. Martin's Press, Inc. (1995) NY
- DeGroot, Kandida; "Background information on the Indonesia women's movement", unpublished, no date
- Government of Indonesia; Repelita VI: A Summary (1994/95 - 1998-99), Department of Information (1994) Jakarta
- Detlor, Pamela; Gender and Development Across Cultures: Searching for a Common Ground in Indonesia, University Consortium on the Environment (1994) Indonesia
- Doran, Christine; "The Indonesian Women's Movement" in Indonesian Politics: A Reader, Center for Southeast Asiaa Politics @ James Cook University of North Queensland (1987) Australia

- Douglas, Stephen; "Women in Indonesian Politics: The Myth of Functional Interest" in Asian Women in Transition, Chipp, Sylvia & Green, Justin (Editors), Pennsylvania State University Press (1980) USA
- Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific; "Indonesia Country Report: Review of Implementation of the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women 1985-1992", Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (1995) Indonesia
- Edwards, Michael & Hulme, David; Non-Governmental Organizations Performance and Accountability: Beyond the Magic Bullet, Earthscan Publications (1995) UK
- Egbert, Sundar; "The Reality of Voluntary Effort - A Perspective from the Developing World" in Action for Social Progress, 21st International Conference on Social Welfare (1983) Canada, pp 66-69
- Farrington, John; Non-Governmental Organizations and the State in Asia: Rethinking Roles in Sustainable Agricultural Development, Routledge (1993) Great Britain
- Friedman, John; Empowerment: The Politics of Alternative Development, Blackwell Publishers (1992) Oxford
- Geertz, Hildred; Letters of a Javanese Princess, W.W. Norton (1964) USA
- Gulardi, Tresnaningtias; "State of the Art of Women's Studies in Indonesia", Faculty of Social and Political Sciences, University of Jakarta, paper (1992) Jakarta
- Harding, David; "From Global to Local: Issues + Challenges Facing NGOs", Olive Information Service, Avocado Series 2/94 (1994) South Africa
- Heyzer, Noeleen; "Toward New Government-NGO Relations for Sustainable and People-Centred Development", in Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects

- and Challenges for People-Centred Development, Heyzer, Nolan; Riker, James; & Quizon, Antonio (Eds.), St. Martin's Press, Inc. (1995) NY
- Holloway, Richard; Government, NGOs and the Rural Poor in Asia: Doing Development, Earthscan Publications (1989) Great Britain
 - Hull, Valerie; "Women in Java's Rural Middle Class: Progress or Regress" in Women of Southeast Asia, Occasional Paper No. 9, Northern Illinois University Center for Southeast Asian Studies (1982) USA
 - Jakarta Post, The; articles from May, June and July 1995, Jakarta, Indonesia
 - Kallgren, Joyce; "Women in Asian Cities, Their Political and Economic Roles: Research Problems and Strategies" in Asian Women in Transition, Chipp, Sylvia & Green, Justin (Eds.), The Pennsylvania State University (1980) USA
 - Kettle B., Carden F., Soemirat J.; The ITB-York University Forum on Gender and Development, University Consortium on the Environment (1992) Indonesia
 - Kongres Wanita Indonesia; "Women as the Driving Force in Development: Why and How? The Case of Non-Governmental Women's Organizations in Indonesia", Konggres Wanita Indonesia (1985) Jakarta
 - - - -; Kongres Wanita Indonesia / The Indonesian Women's Congress, information pamphlet, KOWANI (no date) Jakarta
 - Korten, David; Getting to the 21st Century: Voluntary Action and the Global Agenda, Kumarian Press (1990) USA
 - Leifer, Michael; "The Challenge of Creating a Civil Society in Indonesia", in The Indonesian Quarterly, Vol 23(4) pp. 354-360 (1995)
 - MacDonald, Laura; "Turning to the NGOs: Competing Conceptions of Civil Society in Latin America", Carleton University (1992) Ottawa, Canada

- MacDonald, Laura; "NGO's: Agents of a New Development" DRAFT, Canadian Council for International Cooperation (1994) Ottawa
- Nagel, Jack; Participation, Prentice-Hall (1987) New Jersey
- OECD; "Development Co-operation 1991 Report", OECD (1991) Paris
- Oey-Gardiner, Mayling; Women in Development: An Update for Indonesia, Asian Development Bank, Programs Department (Dec. 1991) Indonesia
- Papanek, Hanna; "Implications of Development for Women in Indonesia: Research and Policy Issues" in Women in Developing Countries: A Policy Focus Women in Developing Countries: A Policy Focus, Kathleen Staudt & Jane Jaquette, Editors, The Haworth Press (1983) New York
- Phillips, Susan; "Redefining Government Relationships with the Voluntary Sector: On Great Expectations and Sense and Sensibility", Carleton University (1995) Canada
- Prindiville, Joanne; Women and Islam in Indonesia, Canadian International Development Agency (1989) Canada
- Reinharz, Shulamit; Feminist Methods in Social Research, Oxford University Press (1992) NY
- Riker, James (1995a); "Contending Perspectives for Interpreting Government-NGO Relations in South and Southeast Asia: Constraints, Challenges and the Search for Common Ground in Rural Development", in Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects and Challenges for People-Centred Development, Heyzer, Nolan; Riker, James; & Quizon, Antonio (Eds.), St. Martin's Press, Inc. (1995) NY
- Riker, James (1995b); "From Cooptation to Cooperation and Collaboration in Government-NGO Relations: Towards an Enabling Policy Environment for People-Centred Development in Asia", in Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects

- and Challenges for People-Centred Development, Heyzer, Nolan; Riker, James; & Quizon, Antonio (Eds.), St. Martin's Press, Inc. (1995) NY
- Riker, James (1995c); "Reflections on Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects and Challenges for People-Centred Development", in Government-NGO Relations in Asia: Prospects and Challenges for People-Centred Development, Heyzer, Nolan; Riker, James; & Quizon, Antonio (Eds.), St. Martin's Press, Inc. (1995) NY
 - Robinson, Kathy: "What Kind of Freedom is Cutting Your Hair?" in Development and Displacement: Women in Southeast Asia, Chandler, Glen, Sullivan, Norma, and Branson, Jan (Editors), Centre for Southeast Asian Studies at Monash University (1988) Victoria
 - - - -; "Kartini's Vision and the Position of Indonesian Women" in Mankind, Vol 17(2), (Aug. 1987)
 - Sen, Gita & Grown, Caren; Development, Crises, and Alternative Visions: Third World Women's Perspectives, Monthly Review Press (1987) NY, NY
 - Serrano, Isagani; "Civil Society in the Asia Pacific Region", in Citizens Strengthening Global Civil Society, CIVICUS (1994) USA, pp. 271-318
 - Schwarz, Adam; A Nation in Waiting: Indonesia in the 1990's, Westview Press (1994) Boulder, USA
 - Shahani, Leticia; "Why Should Intergovernmental Organizations Take Voluntary Organizations Seriously?" in Action for Social Progress: The Responsibility of Governmental and Voluntary Organizations, 21st International Conference on Social Welfare (1983) Canada pp. 56-59

- Shaw, Martin; "Civil Society and Global Politics: Beyond a Social Movements Approach", in Millennium: Journal of International Studies. Vol 23 (3) pp 647-667 (1994)
- Sim, Susan; "We'll crack down on problematic NGO's, warns Indonesia", Singapore Press Holdings (1996) [internet]
- Smillie, Ian; Non-governmental Organization and Governments: Stakeholders for Development, Ian Smillie & Henny Helmich (Eds.), development Centre of the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (1993) Canada
- State Minister for the Role of Women; Indonesian Country Report: Review of implementation of the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the advancement of women 1985-1992, Government of Indonesia (June 1994) Jakarta
- State Minister for the Role of Women; National Report of Indonesia on the Implementation of the Nairobi Forward-Looking Strategies for the Advancement of Women, Government of Indonesia (1990) Jakarta
- State Minister for the Role of Women; Country Report of Indonesia: The Changing Role of Women with Special Emphasis on Their Economic Role, Government of Indonesia (1989) Jakarta
- State Minister for the Role of Women; Women in Development: Policy and Programme, (pamphlet) Government of Indonesia (1994) Jakarta
- State Minister for the Role of Women; Machinery for the Advancement of Women, (pamphlet) Government of Indonesia (1994) Jakarta
- State Minister for the Role of Women; A Brief Sitauatin Analysis of Women, (pamphlet) Government of Indonesia (1994) Jakarta

- State Minister for the Role of Women; The Implementation of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women During 1985-1994, Government of Indonesia (1994) Jakarta
- State Minister for the Role of Women; National Basic Strategies of the Enhancement of the Role of Women in Development Towards the Year 2000, Government of Indonesia (1987) Jakarta
- State Minister for the Role of Women; Situational Analysis of Indonesian Women, Tjkrowinoto, Moeljarto & Muttalib, Jang Aisjah & Sajogyo, Poedjiwati (writers), Government of Indonesia (1988) Jakarta
- Sullivan, Norma; "Indonesian Women in Development: State Theory and Urban Kampung Practice" in Women's Work and Women's Roles, Lenore Manderson, Editor, Development Studies Monograph No. 32, Canberra Australian National University (1983) Australia
- Suryakusuma, Julia; "State Ibuism: The Social Construction of Womanhood in the Indonesian New Order" in NAV, Vol 6 (2), June 1990
- Tandon, Rajesh & de Oliveira, Miguel Darcy; "An Emerging Global Civil Society", in Citizens Strengthening Global Civil Society, CIVICUS (1994) USA, pp. 1-18
- United Nations; Jakarta Declaration for the Advancement of Women in the Asia and the Pacific, United Nations (1994) NY
- United Nations Development Program; Human Development Report 1991, United Nations (1991) NY
- United Nations Development Program; "People in community organizations" in Human Development Report 1993, United Nations (1993) NY

- United Nations Population Fund; Women, Population and Development: Background document for the Second Asian and Pacific Ministerial Conference on Women in Development, UNFPA, June 1994, Jakarta
- - - -; Incorporating Women Into Population and Development: Knowing Why and Knowing How, no date of publication
- - - -; Indonesian Women: A Review of UNFPA Supported Women, Population and Development Projects in Indonesia 1979-1988, United Nations (Jan. 1989) Jakarta
- - - -; "Integrating Women's Issues into the Government of Indonesia's National Development Planning Process", United Nations (1993) Indonesia
- UNIFEM Project Document; Pilot Model for Gender Responsive Effective People's Participation in Development Planning, United Nations (1994)
- Wieringa, Saskia; "The Perfumed Nightmare: Indonesian Women's Organizations After 1950", The Hague, ISS (1988) Holland
- - - -; "Ibu Or the Beast: Gender Interests in Two Indonesian Women's Organizations" in Feminist Review, pp. 98-113 (1985)
- - - -; "Women's Interests and Empowerment: Gender Planning Reconsidered" in Development and Change, pp. 829-848, Vol 25 (1994) UK
- Wilner, Ann Ruth; "Expanding Women's Horizons in Indonesia: Toward Maximum Equality with Minimum Conflict" in Asian Women in Transition, Chipp, Sylvia & Green, Justin (Editors), Pennsylvania State University Press (1980) USA
- Approved Guidelines for the Implementation of the Declaration of the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region and Mainstreaming of Women in ASEAN, 8 pages, April 23, 1993 file name DAWP2/NCRFW-1
- Declaration on the Advancement of Women in the ASEAN Region, (July 1988) Bangkok

- Previous Recommendations 1975-1993 and Draft Platform for Action Fourth World Conference on Women 1995, (March 1994), E/CN.6/1994/10

GENDER AND DEVELOPMENT LITERATURE

- Buvinic, Mayra; "Women's Issues in Third World Poverty: A Policy Analysis" in Women and Poverty in the Third World, Buvinic et al (eds.), Johns Hopkins University Press (1983) USA
- Jacobson, Jodi; "Closing the Gender Gap" in State of the World 1993, Lester Brown (Ed.), World Watch Institute, Norton & Company (1993) USA, pp 61-79
- Molyneux, Maxine; "Socialist Societies Old and New: Progress Towards Women's Emancipation ?", Feminist Review, Vol. 8 (1981), pp 1-34
- Moser, Caroline; "Gender Planning in the Third World: Meeting Practical and Strategic Gender Needs" in World Development Vol 17(11) pp. 1799-1825 (1989) Great Britain
- - - -; Gender Planning and Development: Theory, Practice and Training, Routledge (1993) NY, NY
- Mosse, Julia; Half the World, Half a Chance, Oxfam Publications (1993) Oxford
- Rao, Aruna & Anderson, Mary & Overholt, Catherine (Eds.); Gender Analysis in Development Planning, Kumarian Press (1991) USA