1. The first step in the process of creating a new product is to identify a market need. This involves conducting market research to understand what consumers want and what problems they are facing.

PRECISIONSM RESOLUTION TARGETS

PIONEERS IN METHYLENE BLUE TESTING SINCE 1974

18000 COUNTY ROAD 9, BLOOMSBURG, OH 43820 USA
TEL 612 486 7887 FAX 612 486 7887 TLE 2000000000

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file - Votre référence

Our file - Notre référence

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

**ECODEVELOPMENT AND LOCAL ACTION: FEMINIST
PARTICIPATORY RESEARCH IN GOA, INDIA**

by

Barbara Ann Shaw, B.A.

**A thesis submitted to
the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research
in partial fulfilment of
the requirement for the degree of
Master of Arts**

Department of Geography

**Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario**

September 1992

**copyright
1992, Barbara Ann Shaw**

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Vous êtes votre référence

Vous êtes votre référence

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-79799-1

Canada

Carleton University
Ottawa, Canada K1S 5B6

This thesis contains coloured
photographs &/or explanatory tables
which when microfilmed may lose their
significance. The hardcopy of the
thesis is available upon request from
Carleton University Library.

The undersigned recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies
and Research acceptance of the thesis

**ECODEVELOPMENT AND LOCAL ACTION: FEMINIST PARTICIPATORY
RESEARCH IN GOA, INDIA**

submitted by Barbara A. Shaw, B.A.
in partial fulfilment of the requirements for
the degree of Master of Arts

Thesis Supervisor

Chair, Department of Geography

Carleton University

ABSTRACT

Research for this thesis was undertaken with an environmental 'action' group in Goa, India, whose underlying philosophy is one of ecodevelopment. Ecodevelopment means that environmental parameters are the starting point for development: economic development is 'ecologized'. Implicit to this philosophy is the assumption that local people's knowledge is the starting point for development that will be sustainable. A feminist participatory research framework was utilized for the research process. Its objective is empowerment in a process that brings together theory and practice.

This thesis will examine the existence of resistance by local people to development that is perceived to be environmentally or socially inappropriate. Such resistance abounds in Goa, although it often stops short of open defiance or protest. Participatory research, as a method of social investigation that involves relatively powerless members of society as full and active participants, and ecodevelopment, as a kind of development that is premised on the participation of local people, may be effective tools in mobilising latent resistance for social change.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

There are several people that I would like to thank for their help with this thesis. My supervisor, Dr. Fiona Mackenzie, has given me constant support and encouragement during my time at Carleton. Her insightful comments about my thesis have pushed me to examine many issues from new perspectives. I thank her for her patience and her time. I would like to thank my advisor, Dr. Fraser Taylor, for his careful consideration of various drafts of this thesis. The quick turnaround time was greatly appreciated.

I am also grateful to the Canadian International Development Agency and Canadian Bureau for International Education for the financial support that made this research possible.

In Goa, there are several people whose kindness made my stay memorable. Especially, I would like to thank Reggie Gomes of GRID for his warmth, hospitality and friendship. His support, both personally and with my research, is appreciated. Zeferino Fernandes and Bonnie Menezes of GRID and Albertina Almeida of Bailancho Saad also deserve special mention. Their assistance during the research and, especially, their friendship is remembered. This research is, in part, a result of

the cooperation of the women and men in Curpavaddo and Quellosim who took time from their busy lives to talk to the researchers and I. Their participation in this research is gratefully acknowledged.

Family and friends have given me much support throughout the course of my M.A. career. David Broscoe provided invaluable editorial comment and map-making assistance in this thesis. His support throughout the research process is warmly acknowledged. I would like to thank Josephine for providing needed relief when I needed a break.

Finally, I would like to dedicate this thesis to the memory of my mother. Her courage, strength and love have made it possible.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Acceptance Sheet	ii
Abstract	iii
Acknowledgements	iv
Table of Contents	vi
List of Figures	viii
 CHAPTER ONE -- INTRODUCTION	
1.1 Background	1
1.2 Research Goals and Objectives	2
1.3 Environmental Crises and Development	5
1.4 Women and Environmental Change in the South	9
1.5 Outline of remaining chapters	14
 CHAPTER TWO -- THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	
2.1 Introduction	16
2.2 Power and 'Everyday' Resistance	18
2.3 Political Economy of the Environment	23
2.4 An Alternative Framework: Ecodevelopment	
2.4.1 Introduction	28
2.4.2 Gandhian tradition in India	29
2.4.3 Sustainable Development: a critique	32
2.4.4 Ecodevelopment	36
2.4.5 Participation	41
2.4.6 Local Knowledge: a role for the poor in development	50
2.4.7 Ecodevelopment as political economy of the environment	54
2.5 Conclusions	56
 CHAPTER THREE -- METHODOLOGY	
3.1 Introduction	59
3.2 Feminist Participatory Research	61
3.3 Feminist critique of 'traditional' Social Sciences research methodology	64
3.3.1 Critique of positivist Social Sciences research methodology	65

3.3.2 Advocacy	69
3.3.3 Conscious empowerment through feminist participatory research	72
3.4 Issues for research in Goa	74
 CHAPTER FOUR -- GOA: CONTEXT FOR LOCAL ACTION	
4.1 Introduction	80
4.2 The setting	82
4.2.1 Physical and socio-economic profile	85
4.2.2 Population characteristics	89
4.2.3 Land tenure arrangements	94
4.3 Goan development in the Indian planning context and avenues for community participation	99
4.3.1 Community Development	101
4.3.2 Participation for women	103
4.3.3 Environmental Projects as avenues for participation	107
4.3.4 Participation through central government programmes: the reality	113
 CHAPTER FIVE -- CASE STUDY AND DISCUSSION	
5.1 Introduction	116
5.2 The context for NGO activity	116
5.3 Action Groups and development processes in India	119
5.4 Goa Research Institute for Development: a Goan action group	127
5.5 The primary research process	131
5.6 Results of the OPES evaluation	137
5.7 Resistance and awareness of oppression	142
5.8 GRID's potential to mobilise villagers to bring about social change	149
 CHAPTER SIX -- CONCLUSION	156
6.1 Comments on the research methodology	156
6.2 Comments on the theoretical framework	164
6.3 Concluding remarks	168
 BIBLIOGRAPHY	171

LIST OF FIGURES

	Page
4.1 Map of India	83
4.2 Map of Goa	84
4.3 Broken Bund -- Curpavaddo, Goa	98
4.4 DWCRA, Benaulim -- papad production	106

CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background

The ideas for this thesis developed from volunteer experience in India in 1984-85. As a participant in a cross-cultural exchange programme, I spent two months at an orphanage in northern Uttar Pradesh, India. I arrived at the orphanage near the end of the monsoon, after a brief stay in the sequestered and privileged diplomatic section of Delhi. One of my first images of life outside the capital city was of a woman and two small children huddled under a plastic covered 'lean-to' trying to start a woodfire in the mud. It was shock at the magnitude of gross disparities in the distribution of property and wealth, which became obvious during my stay at the orphanage and during several months of travel afterwards in India and Nepal, that inspired this thesis.

Not only in India and Nepal, but throughout the South, existing socio-economic disparities frequently have been exacerbated by styles of development, such as 'modernization', that are based on 'Northern' scientific and economic paradigms and have reinforced cultural, economic and political dependencies. The result often has been ecological destruction and marginalization of the poor, especially poor women.

Environmental degradation and poverty have become mutually reinforcing processes.

The incompatibility between economic development as 'modernization' and the 'environment' has created social conditions conducive to a counter-strategy of 'environmentally conscious' or 'green' development. This counter-strategy is supported on three fronts: by 'traditionalists', defending their non-modern way of life (for example, tribal people); by marginalized people who have been pushed out or ignored by the modern sector (for example, the poor, especially poor women, throughout most of the developing world); and by 'post-materialists', members of elite societies who are questioning the modern project (Friberg and Hettne 1985:235-236). A green philosophy of development, however, cannot be reduced to a set of appropriate technologies -- it must also contribute to a process of social change, while creating a sustainable relationship between humans and their environment.

1.2 Research Goals and Objectives

This thesis is based, at the broadest level, on the assumption that development as 'modernization' has led to many changes in societies of the South. These changes are reflected in widespread environmental disruption and the growing disparity between rich and poor within and between countries. The effects of environmental disruption in the South may be felt more acutely by the poor, particularly poor women, who are often responsible for most of the labour in agriculture and for

collecting fuel and water for the family. Consequently, my interests in pursuing this research focused primarily on two interrelated issues. First, I wished to explore the potential of an alternative development strategy -- 'ecodevelopment' -- to facilitate equitable societal development without creating unacceptable environmental costs. Second, through an investigation of empowering research methodologies and development philosophies, I wanted to develop a research framework within which community empowerment might be an explicit aim. The research methodology is as important as the theoretical framework to the process of empowerment. How research is done affects what information is uncovered: the research process affects the research product. Methodology, consequently, is critical to the research project. This thesis will represent an initial exploration of these issues.

The objectives of my research were these: to understand the dynamics of the relationship between development (as proposed by both the Central government in its Five Year Plans and the Goa State government in its development plans) and local environmental change, within the contexts of both ecodevelopment and Goan political economy. How have local needs, particularly women's needs, been articulated, and to what extent have these needs been met within the local non-governmental organization (NGO) community and government-sponsored rural development programmes?

Research for this thesis was undertaken in Goa, India. I went to Goa in December 1990 with the intention of evaluating the impact of 'ecodevelopment' camps

for rural development workers, on rural development. The foundations of ecologically sound development practices are taught at these camps. 'Ecodevelopment' means that environmental parameters are the starting point for development. Inherent in this approach is the belief that local people's knowledge about resources and environmental processes is fundamental to development that will be sustainable. I hoped to work with a women's social forestry group to further my understanding of the impact of these camps for rural women in Goa. Information about the camps and the women's social forestry group had been found in documents in Canada. The evaluation was not possible however, since there had been only one eco-development camp in Goa in 1985 and the social forestry group did not exist.

Consequently, I modified the research project, although my interests still focused on eco-development and participatory development, especially in the effects for women. I worked with a small Goan non-governmental organization (NGO) with whom I had corresponded in the months preceding my arrival in Goa and whose philosophical foundations were based on eco-development. I will argue in this thesis that eco-development-based NGOs may have enormous potential to mobilise small-scale resistance to inequitable social structures among the poor. Consequent participation in decision-making by the poor, about issues that affect their lives and livelihood, may lead to empowerment and create local pockets of social change. Resistance by local people may be especially strong to processes of development that are perceived to be environmentally and/or socially unacceptable by the poor. The

research will explore the differential impact that the process of mobilisation may have for women and men.

This chapter will provide the background to that study. India's development, since independence from the British in 1947, has been based on large-scale industrialization and 'modernization'. In the next section, the environmental consequences of the failure of 'modernization' as a viable development model will be outlined. The following section will develop the links between women and environmental change in the South. Finally, I will conclude with a brief outline of the chapters that follow.

1.3 Environmental Crises and Development: the failure of modernization

In the modern context, development for the South has usually meant imitating historical processes of modernization that occurred in Europe and North America. This process of 'modernization' has been the dominant development paradigm in recent decades. This concept of development is rooted in a positivist scientific paradigm whose foundations are held to be objective, neutral and universally valid (Shiva and Bandyopadhyay 1986:86). For the South, development as modernization often has meant rapid resource depletion and the diversion of resources away from basic needs (Shiva 1986:255). In this way, ecological destruction and economic exploitation of nature have become part of the same process. This process is based on

a perceived dualism between nature and society. Within this dualism, the value inherent in the reproduction of society and the reproduction of nature (both of which are necessary functions) is considered by modernization theorists through a discussion of use values and exchange values (Redclift 1987:178). Often, these categories fail to capture the complexities of either form of reproduction or the interaction between them. The result has been widespread environmental crises which threaten human survival and call for a radical redefinition of 'development'.

'Development', conceived of as modernization by many Northern-trained economists and planners, evolved in a different socio-economic context -- that of the North (the developed market economies and the centrally planned economies) -- from that of the countries for which it is now intended. Both the market economy model and the State economy model are varieties of the same basic paradigm. They agree that the 'end' of development lies in the Northern concept of modernization while differing as to the relative role of state and market (Friberg and Hettne 1985:206). In these models, development is based on a linear model of growth, through which all societies must progress -- from pre-modern to modern -- and its success is measured in terms of GNP (Gross National Product), GNP per capita and other macro-economic indicators. The gap between 'developed' and 'underdeveloped' is seen merely as a time lag (Prieswerk 1985:84). As any country grows wealthier, wealth 'trickles down' to benefit everyone. Recent concerns about the validity of this premise are seen in efforts to measure the social aspects of development by

international agencies such as UNICEF (1989), some social scientists and many NGOs. The modernization paradigm has continued to be the dominant one guiding development policy, however, and is largely espoused by the major lending institutions -- the World Bank and International Monetary Fund (in spite of cursory acknowledgement of factors of 'social' development and the so-called 'greening' of the World Bank in recent years) -- and consequently most national governments in the South.

This view of 'modernization' as development is based on reductionist premises, in that the components of any system are viewed in isolation from their inter-relationships:

To be rational in that model implies the ability to see every relevant experience as an experience which can be broken into parts, reassembled and manipulated in practical ways and measured in its effects...[The model] treats economic variables as the tangible and quantifiable factors in a society. The rest are reduced to externalities (Hyden 1980:313 cited in Higgott 1983:97).

Development, seen in this context, is something that is independent of both social justice and the environment. In this model, the environment has been considered solely as an 'enabling' mechanism for economic growth. Constraints to growth are seen to lie in the failure of the social system rather than in any limits to resource availability (Redclift 1987:8). Thus, the 'environment' becomes something that is 'outside' ourselves (ibid:79). As nature is transformed by new technologies and economic endeavour, development and natural resources are 'created' (ibid:159).

Vandana Shiva and Jayanta Bandyopadhyay, however, argue that nature and natural resources are the foundation of any technological development:

Paradoxically, the increasing dependence of the industrialized societies on the resources of nature, through the quick spread of energy and resource-intensive production technologies has been accomplished by the spread of the myth that increased dependence on modern technologies means a decreased dependence on nature and natural resources (Shiva and Bandyopadhyay 1986:84).

In this view, technological innovation ultimately is determined by the availability of natural resources.

Modernization policies in development in recent decades have not been successful, as is evidenced by a persistence and growth of low-income rural and urban populations, growing inequality within and between countries and indications of declining GNP growth rates in some parts of the South (World Bank 1989). These problems are rooted in, and exacerbated by, widespread environmental degradation.

Most environmental problems, in both the North and the South, are augmented by human interaction with the environment (Dasmann 1985:215). Many of these problems are large-scale and may involve degradation or depletion of land, soil, water and forest resources. Environmental problems in the South are apparent also in the 'pollution of poverty' as can be seen in the marginal conditions in many peri-urban and rural settlements throughout the developing world: poor water, inadequate sanitation and housing, malnutrition and disease (ibid:11). People who are impoverished by the degradation of subsistence resources through processes of

modernization, may, in turn, contribute to environmental degradation through continued use of those resources, in order to ensure survival. In either case, it is the poor that directly bear the costs of environmental degradation. Given the gendered division of labour that prevails in the South, it is women who bear a disproportionate share of the burden.

Clearly, these environmental concerns must be an integral part of any development model, if development is to be meaningful for all members of society. The next section will outline the links between women and environmental change in rural societies in the South, in order to develop an understanding of women's relationship to environmental resources.

1.4 Women and Environmental Change in the South

In rural areas throughout most of the South, studies have shown that, often, it is women who grow food crops, gather water and fuel and perform most of the other work that sustains the family (Dankelman and Davidson 1988:4). Primarily, it is women who interact with environmental resources. This work is seldom counted in the 'formal' economy, that is, the economic sector geared to capital-intensive, large-scale production (Todaro 1985:280). Consequently, development as 'modernization', which measures progress through activity in the 'formal' sector, has tended to marginalize women in the South. Women's unpaid contributions in the 'informal'

socio-economic sphere largely have been ignored. The 'informal' sector generally includes subsistence activity in labour-intensive, small-scale production, for example, subsistence agriculture in rural areas, work that seldom appears in employment or unemployment statistics. (Todaro 1985:280).¹

Planners and administrators, working within a framework of development as 'modernization', have conceived of development as a move toward the cash economy. This means that it is cash crops and other conventionally 'productive' activities that have received most of their attention. Development efforts usually have been focused on males in the community and on elite, urban, educated women who work in the 'formal' sector, since they earn a wage and are counted in the national labour participation rates (Nelson 1979:11; CIDA 1990). Decision making among development planners has remained "not only male-dominated but also gender blind in orientation" (Moser 1989:1800). Women have received little benefit from education and training programmes, or agricultural innovations that, generally, have taught new skills to men. For example, in the past decade, in India, enrolment of women in most

¹ The formal sector/informal sector dichotomy is somewhat problematic: the strength of capitalist economic production lies in the fact that it does not organize its own reproduction. Reproductive activity generally occurs outside the 'formal' sector. As well, the social cost of those not employed in the 'formal' sector is absorbed by forms of production that survived the advent of capitalism and are usually considered to be part of the 'informal' sector (Cooper 1983:9). There are many links between the two spheres:

The more one learns about the informal sector, the more its personnel and operations seem to overlap the formal one and the further its internal organisation, however unique, seems from the anarchy implied by its title (ibid:41).

By one definition, the 'informal' sector exists wherever governmental regulatory officials do not reach (ibid).

training programmes has been minimal and agricultural extension services have seldom reached women (CIDA 1990:4).

Yet, the culturally determined gender division of labour in agriculture in the South ensures that it is women who are most immediately affected by the agricultural consequences of diminishing reserves of forest and other natural resources, often the result of 'modernization'. In most areas of the South, including India, a gender division of labour in agriculture is evident. It is women who are responsible for most (70-90 per cent) of the agricultural labour, although the specific gender determined allocation of tasks will vary within and between countries. Studies from India indicate that there may be much variation in female participation rates in Indian agriculture. The pattern that has been documented shows, broadly, that in paddy (rice growing) regions, high agricultural productivity correlates positively to the proportion of female agricultural labourers, while in wheat or coarse grain growing regions, low agricultural productivity correlates positively to the proportion of female agricultural labourers (Chen 1989:WS-79). 'Green revolution' improvements in rice production have not decreased the labour intensive demand of its production. 'Green revolution' wheat production, on the other hand, has become highly capital-intensive. In agriculture, mechanisation of agricultural production often has meant that women have been displaced from income-earning opportunities (Jain 1982:26). Where agriculture has been mechanised, it is men, generally, who perform the mechanised tasks, while women's activity in agriculture largely is restricted to subsistence production. In most

cases, however, where women have high participation rates in agricultural production and these tasks are not mechanised, they are responsible for sowing, weeding, crop maintenance, harvesting and processing, while men will prepare the land. As well, women are usually responsible for growing subsistence food crops and the care of small animals (Dankelman and Davidson 1988:4). Soil erosion and disruption of the hydrological cycle because of forest destruction consequently become areas of immediate concern for women working in agriculture.

Access to land and other resources is another area that has important ramifications for the poor, especially for poor women. In purely economic terms, access to land can buffer the poor from absolute poverty (Agarwal 1988:533). In India, women's limited access to private property resources means that rights to communal land resources, especially for gathering items for daily use, are critical. For families with less than two hectares of land -- a situation that is common in South Asia -- common property forest resources may provide more than twenty percent of total household income, especially for fuel and fodder. This can include 91-100 percent of firewood, 69-89 percent of grazing needs and 8-10 percent of food intake (Agarwal 1989:WS-56). Diminishing access to common property resources, as industrial development and commercial forestry have expanded in the hill areas and the pace of environmental degradation has accelerated, means that this form of sustenance is being seriously eroded (ibid:WS-56).

Environmental degradation in the form of ground water depletion and salinity means that the time needed to collect water for family use also has increased (Baruah 1988). Forest destruction disrupts the hydrological cycle through alteration of infiltration rates and groundwater recharge.

In many areas where drought is said to have occurred there has not even been a reduction in rainfall. It is the water-retaining capacity of the soil that has been reduced and this has been caused by its over-exploitation for intensive agriculture and deforestation (Goldsmith 1985:36, emphasis in original).

Industrial and domestic pollution of water sources exacerbates this problem and creates a health hazard also. Available information indicates that women may spend several hours and cover long distances in search of potable water each day (Baruah 1988).

It becomes clear that there are concrete links between women's work, modernization and environmental change, in India and the rest of the South. Development efforts based on the premises of modernization seldom have acknowledged the ways in which women's lives and roles have been affected by conditions of changing technology in the South. Most economists and planners have viewed women as passive or neutral factors in the socio-economic and technological changes that have been implemented in the name of 'modernization'. In reality, these changes have had profound impacts on the lives of women. Environmental destruction as a result of modernization policies means that, in practical terms, women's workload becomes heavier as more time and longer distances are involved in the collection of those items necessary for the survival of the family. Consequently, the destruction of environmental resources may be linked to the marginalization of women, especially in

the South. Although many governments and development organizations have taken 'official' steps to remedy this situation, for the majority of women, very little has changed. The consequent poverty of women often is expressed through lower education levels, fewer employment opportunities and less access to land, capital and technology (Todaro 1985:155).

Environmental degradation can be seen to be a consequence of present development policies that are based on a philosophy of 'modernization' and it is people of the South, particularly poor women, who often are affected directly by the environmental consequences of these policies. The land from which they must seek their livelihood has become more marginal, and "resembles ever more closely the surface of the moon" (Goldsmith 1985:37).

1.5 Outline of remaining chapters

Chapter two outlines the theoretical framework within which research was conducted. Based on a political economy of the environment, ecodevelopment is discussed as an alternative model to the dominant development paradigm of modernization. Participation of local communities is the key to a successful ecodevelopment strategy.

Chapter three discusses the methodological principles for the research process.

Feminist participatory research, as an empowering research framework, was chosen as an appropriate framework to investigate a participatory development model.

Empowering research is 'for' the researched. The research instrument, used during the interview process in two Goan villages, is included.

Chapter four examines the context for local action in Goa through a description of the physical setting, socio-economic profile and people. Through a discussion of the Indian planning process, existing government programmes are examined as potential avenues for local people's participation in decision-making about local developmental initiatives.

Chapter five discusses the primary research process. Goa Research Institute for Development (GRID) is introduced through a brief theoretical discussion of action groups in India. Primary research focused on an evaluation of an environmental education programme that had been taken by GRID to two Goan villages in 1987. Through the research process, it was hoped that local instances of 'everyday resistance' also would be revealed. The potential for an action group such as GRID to mobilise 'everyday resistance' and create meaningful avenues for participation for local people is explored.

Chapter six concludes this study with a brief summary of findings and comments on the theoretical and methodological implementation.

CHAPTER TWO THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

2.1 Introduction

In recent years, the issues of environmental degradation and the marginalization of the poor, especially poor women, have received increased attention in the literature about development in the South. There has been dissatisfaction with the performance of development programmes, since, in an economic sense, these programmes have failed to meet their targets, and in a social and material sense, poverty has not been eliminated.

This chapter will present an outline of the theoretical framework for an alternative development model, within which fieldwork in Goa, India, was carried out. Ecodevelopment will be discussed as a framework for the implementation of a philosophy of political economy of the environment and community participation will be developed as an essential component of eco development.

Central to the development of the theoretical framework is the notion of 'everyday resistance' (Scott 1985) and its conceptualization within power relations.

Resistance by the poor to exclusion from decision-making in development processes and/or to processes of development that may affect them adversely, often through environmental degradation, can be seen as a building block for effective community participation and is an area that has been neglected by many development theorists. Frequently covert, 'everyday resistance' nevertheless reveals a consciousness or understanding about inequitable social structures. Mobilisation of 'everyday resistance' may be an effective avenue for participation for hitherto excluded communities, possibly leading to positive development action, and will be explored in this thesis through fieldwork in Goa.

The following sections in the chapter will develop the framework for the research process, through an examination of the concept of a 'political economy of the environment'. Given the failure of conventional development policies, this approach attempts to define economically viable, socially desirable and ecologically sound patterns of resource use and ways of life. This means that power and politics are important in any analysis (Sachs 1984:vi). Ecodevelopment, as a concept that utilizes the principles of a political economy of the environment, will then be developed as an alternative basis for ecologically sustainable and participatory development. Within this context, the concepts of participation and 'local knowledge' will be examined.

2.2 Power and 'Everyday' Forms of Resistance

Evidence of resistance to both environmentally degrading forms of development and the exclusion of the poor from decision-making in development processes abounds. 'Everyday forms of resistance', which often stop short of open defiance, reflect the ongoing struggle between the poor and those people who dominate (Scott 1985:29). Consequently, it becomes important to understand the workings of power and domination at the level of subjugation rather than to ask why certain people or institutions dominate (Foucault 1980b:97). Especially, it is important to question through what means subjugation is maintained and/or challenged and what strategies comprise the resistance to the power relationship.

The relationship between the dominant and the dominated and the institutions that maintain that relationship are the results or effects of power. Michel Foucault's views on power are useful here. Foucault defines 'power' in terms of the multiple force relations that exist in any situation. Because of the inherent inequality of the force relations, states of power are created that are always local and unstable. Power, then, becomes the process which transforms, strengthens or reverses these relations through constant struggle and confrontation (1980a:92,93). Strategies of confrontation become the frontier for the relationship of power, since victory implies a change in the exercise of power (Foucault 1983:225).

As the immediate effect of divisions, inequalities and disequilibria in any system, relations of power are not exterior to other relationships; rather, they permeate every relationship and are fundamental to economic processes, knowledge systems and relationships between the sexes. Power, therefore, is not acquired, seized or shared: it is exercised from innumerable points (Foucault 1980a:94). Any relationship of power consists of action being taken on activities of a well-defined and known 'other' (as opposed to taking action on the 'other' directly) (Foucault 1983:220).

Foucault describes several circumstances which enable power relations to be exercised. First, there is a system of differentiations which permits one group to act upon the activities of another, for example, through legal systems, traditions of status and privilege, economic privileges, cultural differences or shifts in the process of production that may affect privilege. Second, the privileged group may be acting to maintain privilege or to accumulate profit and exercises some means of bringing power relations into being, for example, through the threat of armed confrontation, economic dominance or surveillance. Third, these relations are maintained by institutions that preserve privilege (academic or military institutions or institutions that may mix traditional and non-traditional legal structures, as for example, the family). These institutions achieve an effective and certain relation between the 'privileged' and the 'other' (1983:223).

Three kinds of struggle against the effects of power relations have been

identified by Foucault: struggles against forms of domination (ethnic, social and religious), against forms of exploitation that separate individuals from what they produce and against those things that tie individuals to a particular group and submit them to others in this way, for example, caste, class or feudal relations (Foucault 1983:212).

Mats Friberg and Bjorne Hettne suggest that there is a dialectical model of social change, that parallels Foucault's discussion of power and resistance and consists of four elements:

- 1) the existence of a dominant system at a particular place and time;
- 2) the existence of one or more countersystems to the dominant one;
- 3) that the expansion or contraction of the dominant system occurs because of continuous struggle between actors in each of the different systems;
- 4) that social systems are human products (Friberg and Hettne 1985:227-228).

It becomes clear that power relations are rooted in a system of social networks (Foucault 1983:224). Domination represents the general structure of power, a situation that has been consolidated through long-term confrontation between adversaries (ibid:226). A strategy of confrontation or resistance is implicit in this state (ibid:225).

Importantly, resistance exists wherever there is power. Power relationships depend on the existence of multiple points of resistance everywhere in the power

network (Foucault 1980a:95). Strategies of confrontation and resistance usually focus on the privileges of knowledge and the effects of power that are linked with knowledge, competence and qualification (Foucault 1983:212). This plurality of resistance is spread over time and space and is often mobile and transitory (Foucault 1980a:96).

For many of the poor in the Third World, resistance to the dominant system often manifests itself in subtle forms such as 'foot-dragging', feigned ignorance, pilfering, slander, arson, sabotage or flight, as James Scott (1985:29) points out. These actions require little or no coordination or planning and may often represent individual coping strategies (*ibid*). Self-help or escape may not represent true rebellion; rather, it indicates an awareness of oppression that is a step beyond the stage of acceptance of the social order (Sinha 1990:213).

The greater the disparity in power relations, the more likely it is that the 'full transcript' of resistance is hidden (Scott 1985:286). Scott has identified two arenas in which actors interact and where resistance may be provoked. In the 'public' sphere, interactions will be stereotyped and ritualistic, that is, true feelings will be masked. This is the 'public transcript' (Scott 1990:3). Its existence means that every inference about an act of deference by the powerless will have to be based on information outside the act itself, that is, on the 'hidden transcript', or the discourse that takes place outside the public sphere (*ibid*:4). The 'hidden transcript' includes all actions,

ranging from speech, to gestures and practices, that will be specific to given social sites and may be read differently by various actors (ibid:14, 27). Although it may be argued that the 'hidden transcript' is insignificant and rarely acted upon, Scott suggests that the 'hidden transcript' sustains resistance and is, in fact, a building block for more institutionalized forms of resistance (ibid:191, 201).

Everyday resistance is informal and covert, concerned with immediate, de facto gains (Scott 1990:33). If successful, it remains unnoticed and unacknowledged. This means that, within relationships of domination, the only 'public' window on the 'hidden transcript' will be acts of desperation, revolt or defiance (ibid:87).

Poor people experience deprivation and oppression within a concrete setting, as for example, in rising land rents, higher interest rates or a degraded land base, not in a theoretical or abstract way. There is a "personalization of causes of distress" (Scott 1985:348): any attack will more likely occur against a particular landowner than against the system of landholding. Consequently, resistance begins close to the ground, rooted in daily experience. The enemy is not impersonal, historical forces but real people. The goals of resistance, then, are to gain work, land and/or income (ibid). Generally, it will be easier to initiate peasant organization around concrete demands or grievances such as local environmental degradation than around more general political changes (Huizer 1986:25). Mobilisation around concerns of 'everyday resistance' ideally will lead to participatory development that will benefit all members of the community.

This thesis will explore the existence of resistance among a poor and marginalized segment of Indian society. What is the role of 'everyday' resistance in the process of social change? How might this resistance be mobilised? In the remaining parts of this chapter, I will develop a framework within which these questions may be answered.

2.3 Political Economy of the Environment

Within the dominant development paradigm of modernization, natural resource conflicts and ecological destruction are viewed as separate from the economic system. Consequently, the resource demands of development as 'modernization' have often led to a narrowing of the resource base for the survival of the economically poor and powerless in two ways: through a direct transfer of resources away from basic needs and/or through the destruction of essential ecological processes that ensure the renewal and sustainability of natural resources (Bandyopadhyay and Shiva 1988:1224). Solutions to ecological crises that are perpetrated by modernization policies of development often are suggested to lie in the expansion of the market system, through investment in pollution control or technological change, for example (ibid:1229). Natural resource parameters have not been internalized within the framework of conventional economics.

In contemporary geographical studies, political economy has challenged the

concept of economic growth as a static goal, focusing instead on the nature of the process of economic development (Johnston, Gregory and Smith 1986:350). Through an examination of the dialectical relationship between society, politics and economics, the historical context of the means used to achieve economic growth is investigated, especially in its effect on the lives of 'ordinary' people (Wilber 1988:1-2). Political economy:

...attempts to uncover root causes of social phenomena in the conditions attaching to, and social and political implications of, capitalist production (Johnston et al. 1986:350).

The outcome of economic forces becomes clearly related to the behaviour of social classes and the role of the state in accumulation of capital (Redclift 1987:3).

A political economy of the environment considers the environment to be an integral part of the economy: as the resource base upon which economic growth is premised and whose capacity to reproduce itself is threatened by the very process of economic growth. Consequently, through an understanding of the environment's physical capacity, environmental change is related to factors such as policy and ideology, at different levels of political activity, to achieve a structural analysis of the social, political and economic spheres (Redclift 1987:5).

Resource problems, then, are examined through the relationships between the social system and the environment (Emel and Peet 1989:57; Sachs 1971:9). A political economy of the environment identifies who benefits and who does not from

any development process, especially in the context of environmental consequences, in different historical contexts and under different socio-political systems (Sachs 1971:134). The important issue is this: the determination of who gets access to how much of a scarce resource and for what purpose (Agarwal 1987:17).

Michael Redclift describes the 'environment' as a set of dynamic relationships among "physical space, natural resources and a constantly changing pattern of economic forces" (1987:79). The process of environmental change therefore becomes inseparable from economic forces at both the international and local levels. Present-day environmental crises can be seen to be an outcome of a worldwide economic and structural crisis, since there are structural linkages between economic development and the environment in and between both the North and the South.

The structural linkages between North and South may be illustrated through a discussion of recent trends in global agricultural production. The international redivision of labour in both agriculture and industry has brought about many changes to the environment in the South (Redclift 1988:640). Multinational corporations play an increasingly important role in agriculture and the food industry worldwide. Thus, the environment has become 'internationalized', often serving political interests that are based far from the physical location of the natural resources (Redclift 1987:86). Bandyopadhyay and Shiva argue that Structural Adjustment Policies of the International Monetary Fund (IMF) and World Bank -- an increasingly common condition for most

external financial assistance to the South, including India since late 1991 -- are creating longterm institutional changes towards privatization and strategies of export-led growth, that influence both the pattern of control over and utilization of resources (1988:1231). For example, the international redivision of labour in agriculture means that different stages of the food system are integrated through technological changes in farming, food processing and distribution. Farming practices in low-income countries become linked to market demand in the North (Redclift 1987:86). Consequently, shifts in the international division of labour, that determine which products will be produced where, are occurring in ways that meet the needs of agro-industry and undermine the development of sustainable food systems in the South (ibid:87). The introduction of new agricultural production technologies that originated in the North and are aimed at large-scale monocultural production for export have caused agriculture in many areas of the South to shift away from environmentally sustainable systems towards greater specialization and economic dependence upon the North (Redclift 1987:82).

Redclift argues that poor people in the South are "held in a vice by the terms of trade which govern intersectoral and international relations" (1984:130).

Development as 'modernization' has meant that control of environmental resources has been lost to local people and assumed by multinational corporations. Thus, the environment is being transformed in such a way that it is becoming less productive from a local point of view (Redclift 1987:51). Redclift concludes that the key to

changing the direction of development processes, that they might better meet the needs of the poor, lies in acknowledging the political and redistributive effects of environmental objectives. This means that the removal of structural obstacles to equitable development will be the key to improving the lives of the poor in the South (1984:130). Further, through an examination of such things as specific land uses, use of soil resources and vegetation or patterns of investment and disinvestment in the capabilities of the land, it becomes evident that there is a dynamic relationship between patterns of access to resources and the capacity of the environment for production (Blaikie 1989:18). Environmental quality may change through improvement or degradation of resources and often may be dependent upon who has access to land and other resources.

The developing world has paid a high social and ecological price for economic growth and modernization and it is the ecological factors that accentuate further the inequality and divisions between rich and poor, both within and between countries (Sachs 1984:19; World Bank 1989). A reconciliation of economic and ecological goals is needed to improve the quality and variety of life, especially in the developing world (Riddell 1981:111). Robert Riddell has called this a fusion of political economy and political ecology, since in practice, environmental policies are seldom neutral (ibid:177).

2.4 An Alternative Framework: Ecodevelopment

2.4.1 Introduction

The concept of ecodevelopment, as an alternative framework for development, has emerged in response to the widespread environmental crises faced today. It is a reaction to the 'reductionist science' that has guided modernization, in which economic variables have been the main tangible and quantifiable variables in society.

This section will be comprised of several subsections. To begin, the Gandhian philosophical tradition in India will be outlined to illustrate the historical context for an ecologically aware and participatory development in India. In the section that follows, the concept of 'sustainable development' will be critiqued to provide background to discussion of a strategy of ecodevelopment as an alternative development paradigm. Participation and local knowledge will be introduced as key components of an ecodevelopment strategy. Through participation, everyday resistance may be mobilised toward positive social change and local people may be more fully involved in development processes. Finally, ecodevelopment will be discussed as a framework which implements a philosophy of political economy of the environment.

2.4.2 Gandhian Tradition in India

The fundamental principles of ecodevelopment have a long history in India. Ecodevelopment proponents such as Ignacy Sachs (1980, 1982, 1984, 1990) have drawn heavily on Gandhian philosophy to develop their ideas of a participatory and egalitarian development. (Gandhian in this sense encompasses an expanded and elaborated body of M.K. Gandhi's concepts and ideals.) Tradition on the subcontinent is generally founded on the basic assumption that humans, nature and society exist in harmony. Although there may be stresses and strains in these relationships, there cannot be any irreconcilable conflict or confrontation. 'Development' is a condition of harmony among these three elements (Naik 1983:346). The Gandhian approach to development for India is derived from Indian tradition and is based on the principles of Truth and non-violence¹. Development is seen as a combination of material, moral and cultural progress since "grinding pauperism cannot lead to anything but moral

¹ For Gandhi, Satya or Truth was the ideal or goal of human existence. Not insignificantly, Gandhi entitled his autobiography The story of my experiments with Truth. Truth is God. Truth pertains to all aspects of life: thought, speech and action, both individually and collectively (Baruah 1986:13). Because Truth is God and both the ground and goal of life, an individual exists only to the extent that she/he manifests or realizes Truth (Kapoor 1986:14).

Gandhi felt that attainment of 'absolute' Truth was impossible since all Truth was relative to its circumstances. One could only apply Truth to the extent that one saw it. This meant that two people could define Truth differently. Ahimsa or non-violence, then, was a necessary corollary to Truth. Ahimsa encompasses more than non-violent action, however. A term borrowed from the Jains, in its broadest sense it means 'non-injury' to any living creatures in thought or action, and, in a positive sense, includes love, charity and active service to others (Kapoor 1986:17). The practice of non-violence requires courage, patience and sacrifice.

degradation" (Gandhi n.d. cited in Mishra 1977:374).

Gandhian 'development', then, is based on a material programme, the goals of which are the elimination of poverty and the satisfaction of basic human wants, as the starting point for moral and cultural progress (Mishra 1977:374). The material programme is based on five principles or aims: that development should be rural-centered and village-based; that a policy of swadeshi or self-reliance is to be promoted in the village; that full employment will ensure that everyone will have a chance to earn a decent livelihood; that economic equity and fair distribution are to be achieved through land reform and promotion of trusteeship and; society is to be based on a cooperative organization (Baruah 1986:19). These aims are accomplished through decentralization, local participation, village and small-scale industry, education and an emphasis on the poorest in society (ibid:17).

The strongest point of the Gandhian programme is the concept of swadeshi or self-reliance. It is the manifestation of holism in the Gandhian framework for development and encourages an ecological awareness of the need for harmony between nature and society. Swadeshi means the use of indigenous solutions and inputs. It may be an 'end' in itself to promote 'decolonization of the mind' and cultural emancipation, but it is also a 'means' to material progress and the elimination of poverty, thereby reinforcing moral progress (Baruah 1986:18; Sachs 1980:48).

Under a policy of swadeshi, distribution is optimized when it is simultaneous with production. Swadeshi and decentralization mean that villages produce for themselves (swadharma) and where this is impossible, the village purchases what it needs from its nearest neighbour (paradharma) (Mishra 1977:375). As the basic unit of development, the village becomes self-sufficient in its vital needs for example food and clothing, yet interdependent with nearby villages for many things (Baruah 1986:18). This implies a capacity for autonomous decision-making and selective control over external relations (Sachs 1980:48). Optimally, growth is endogenous and agriculturally based, and industrialization is mostly local, small-scale and labour-intensive (Richards 1982:123).

Through swadeshi, Gandhi felt that Indian villages could make considerable achievements:

When our villages are fully developed, there will be no dearth in them of men [sic] with a high degree of skill and artistic talent. There will be poets, village artists, village architects, linguists and research workers...Today they are dung heaps. Tomorrow they will be like tiny gardens of Eden where dwell intellectual folk whom no one can deceive or exploit (Gandhi 1946 cited in Sachs 1980:49).

The pursuit of Truth through non-violence is implicit in the Gandhian model for development. Its goal is sarvodaya (the welfare of all), rather than the greatest good of the greatest number, since development implies furthering the greatest good of all members of society. Sarvodaya is realized in a federation of small village republics with thoroughly decentralized economic and political structures that only

provide for the essential needs of the community (Power 1971:36). The material base of sarvodaya was designed as the key to moral and cultural uplift. Material progress was a concrete way to improve village life through cooperation (Sachs 1980:51).

The Gandhian movement and its ideals survive in India today, although the movement is small-scale and overshadowed by India's push for modernization and industrialization. As the dominant paradigm for development in recent decades, modernization has created unacceptable environmental costs and has exacerbated existing disparities within and between countries. Increasingly, however, the links between all aspects of the social and natural worlds are being recognized by some development theorists and practitioners and many NGOs. The Gandhian model of development represents a precedent for holistic and ecologically sensitive development in India.

2.4.3 Sustainable Development: a critique

The failure of the environment to support development, defined as economic growth, has led to the creation of the concept of 'sustainable' development within the development industry. Focusing on the environment, this concept directly contradicts both the neoclassical and Marxist (and Neo-Marxist) views that the environment is something to be transformed through the application of capital and whose capacity to provide for, and absorb wastes from, the processes of economic development is

limitless (Redclift 1984:7). According to these views, human knowledge and innovation are seen to be the only limiting factors to growth and these are considered to be boundless in theory, since improved technology can deal with any problem (Colby 1990:9,. 'Sustainable development' means redefining development since this kind of unfettered technological growth has created unacceptable environmental costs (Redclift 1987:5). Non-quantifiable aspects of development -- the externalities of neoclassical and Marxian analysis such as environmental degradation and the 'pollution of poverty' -- need to be taken into account, since economic activity depends on the physical and social environment as well as economic constraints. In its broadest sense sustainable development encompasses much more than ecological sustainability: it requires a global political will and ideological commitment to the attainment of international parity (Riddell 1981:9). It is the lack of political and ecological commitment in the sustainable development rhetoric espoused by many development theorists today, that Redclift (1987) has identified as one of the hindrances to truly sustainable development, since sustainability becomes meaningless without political commitment. Real improvements in the standard of living for a growing population cannot occur without massive redistribution of wealth.

At the heart of the sustainability debate, therefore, is the essence of global communalism, namely an ecological basis to economics and local self-reliance. That means not just a comprehensive shift in power, but also wholesale changes in institutional alignments...This was a topic that, understandably, but frustratingly, the Brundtland Commission (1987) failed to address (O'Riordan 1989:93).

Michael Colby argues that 'sustainable growth', rather than sustainable development, is the basic theme of the Brundtland Report Our Common Future (Colby 1990:19). He argues that this approach to nature represents a kind of 'resource management', since the concern for nature is based on the fact that nature is beginning to hurt 'economic man' [sic] (ibid:22). He claims that 'ecology is being economized' in this approach (ibid:23). Current development goals are accepted within a framework of incremental planning, and national accounting systems are revised to reflect resource depletion or exhaustion and to 'internalize' social costs through such measures as the 'polluter pays principle' (Colby 1990:30). 'Sustainable growth' as it is being espoused by most of the development industry today is still a concept based on maximizing economic growth, albeit within the constraints of the environment. What has changed is that the environment has become one of the variables in the development formula. Environmental costs are brought within what is perceived to be an acceptable limit.

Redclift also criticizes this approach to sustainability. He critiques what he calls the concept of 'environmental managerialism' as ethnocentric and ahistorical, a problem-centred solution that is positivist in its outlook (although he is somewhat more optimistic about the Brundtland Report than Colby) (Redclift 1988:638, 648). He argues that this approach to natural resource management assumes that there is an optimum balance of natural resource use and that long-term interests in the environment are convergent no matter how much short-term interests may diverge (ibid:639). Further, he argues that there is no understanding of structural linkages

between environment and development in the North and South in this approach (ibid:640).

Redclift's criticisms of environmental managerialism focus on four broad areas:

- 1) in utilizing tools such as environmental impact assessments (EIAs), the environment is considered after the development objectives are set (Colby also sees EIAs as negative since damage control thereby becomes institutionalized [1990:16]);
- 2) environmental consequences are separated from economic and social ones, as for example, when ecological areas are protected. In the South, this means that access to the environment is reduced for the poor who may depend on it for livelihood. Environmental management thus becomes a means of social control;
- 3) the market, and its distributive effects are taken as 'givens'. The emphasis then becomes 'compensation' for environmental damage, rather than setting environmental objectives that reduce the poverty and vulnerability of the poor;
- 4) these techniques deflect attention away from the context of environmental change, so that structural, often international problems become synonymous with the areas where they occur (for example, famine in the Sahel or flooding in Bangladesh) (Redclift 1988:644).

An alternative to perceptions of sustainable development as 'environmental

managerialism' or 'environmental management' will take perceptions of environment held by different classes and interests into account and will also examine the channels that exist for articulating those interests (Redclift 1988:646). Redclift argues that the 'environment' must be conceptualized in a less reductionist way that takes account of both processes of production and reproduction within social systems as a whole (ibid:648).

2.4.4 Ecodevelopment

The concept of sustainability lies at the heart of theories about ecodevelopment. Ecodevelopment has been described as a triangle of basic needs, self-reliance and ecological sustainability (Dasmann 1985:215). Ecological sustainability becomes just one of the underlying principles of ecodevelopment. Cultural and social sustainability are addressed as well. The attainment of human dignity through social justice and satisfaction of basic human needs become as important as the maintenance of the environmental base. The environmental base establishes the parameters within which development can occur. Growth is not an 'end' in itself, but a 'means' to development. (Sachs 1984:17). Consequently, the relationship between nature and society must be reconceptualized (Colby 1990:23).

The most basic characteristic of ecodevelopment is that it is profoundly political (Farver and Glaeser 1984:169). It is this overt political agenda that

differentiates an ecodevelopment framework from the Gandhian perspective, since Sarvodayans seldom challenge openly the existing power relations through their programming. Within an ecodevelopment framework, analysis of political variables is included from the very beginning of the development process -- that is, who has the power to mobilise resources, to reap the benefits or to stall the process (Glaeser and Vyasulu 1984:35)? The implications of this kind of analysis for policy may be considerable:

...the [environmental] crisis is clearly related to the faulty economic relations between the North and the South...It is shown that a different set of economic relations with the countries in the Centre (the Capitalist, northern [political] sphere) could enable Guatemala, for instance, to earn the same amount of net foreign exchange from the export of raw cotton by growing less than one percent of the cotton it now grows. Such a strategy would free over ninety-nine percent of the best lands in Central America for other uses (Farver and Glaeser 1984:170).

An ecodevelopment strategy, as political economy of environment, would examine the relations between individuals and the local, national and international power structures (Farver and Glaeser 1984:176). Strategies of resistance within power relations would be important to such an examination. This is 'sustainable' development in its broadest sense.

A clearer definition of sustainable development, both in concept and practice is required if the concept of sustainable development is to become meaningful (The Stanley Foundation 1990:9). A major criticism of the sustainable development concept of the Brundtland report has been the lack of political will to make sustainable development a reality (Redclift 1987, 1988; Colby 1990; O'Riordan 1989). As well, if

the Brundtland report's recommendations are to be taken seriously, as a guideline for transition to truly sustainable development, the direction of the development process must be changed to account more fully for indigenous experience (Colby 1990:27). Ecodevelopment, in its overtly political stance and focus on local diversity could be the practical means of implementing truly sustainable development. Through an identification of the arenas of resistance to existing power relations, manifestations of resistance by local people may be transformed into real participation by local actors in the development process.

The nebulous distinction between sustainable development as it has been defined by much of the development industry and ecodevelopment might be analyzed as differences between 'shades of green': 'light green' describing sustainable growth and implying that the environment is still 'outside' us, that humans are still at the centre of all ecosystems and 'dark green' to describe ecodevelopment, whereby environmental and ecological concepts have been internalized such that humans are part of an indivisible 'whole'. It is a question of having environmental concerns rather than an ecological perspective.

Ecodevelopment is a long-term paradigm that would seek to 'ecologize the economy' (Colby 1990:24). Within a framework of ecodevelopment, human activities and ecosystem processes and services would be synergistic. This is a different approach than the 'back to nature' simple symbiosis of deep ecologists, however.

Rather, it implies an integrated co-evolution of human society and nature (ibid:23-24).

Richard Norgaard calls the co-evolutionary approach to development adaptive, since sustainability is achieved among mutually dependent and changing systems. Knowledge, values, resources, technology and organization constantly evolve, putting selective pressure on one another. In this way, they co-evolve in such a way that each reflects the other (Norgaard 1988:616-617).

Ecodevelopment, then, identifies long-term concerns and productivity that are sustained by ecosystems. Sustainable ecological development is ensured through use of resources that are inexhaustible, renewable, recyclable or re-usable (Dasmann 1985:215). Farms, industries and cities, for example, are each as self-contained as possible, since self-reliance -- not autarky -- is a goal of ecodevelopment. This kind of self-reliance corresponds to Gandhian swadeshi. The goal is not the creation of wholly self-reliant entities, however. Referring to South Asia, Rajni Kothari states:

Our preferred scenario for the region should not be one of self-contained villages but, rather, one of thousands of small, nucleating towns towards which the rural landscape gravitates. This will put an end to the present duality of metropolitan and rural cultures (Kothari 1979:466).

The complementarity of different activities is emphasized, giving particular attention to renewable resources and bio-processes (Sachs 1984:19).

It is important to distinguish between local, regional and national levels of self-reliance, since national self-reliance often has been a goal of some Marxist

(Dependency) development theorists. A strong and self-reliant state, however, in and of itself may not be consistent with self-reliance at a local or regional level. To achieve self-reliance in the sense of ecodevelopment, self-reliance at all three levels -- local, regional and national -- must be combined (Friberg and Hettne 1985:222-223). Ecodevelopment, then, can be seen as a holistic and organic alternative framework for global societal development, where relationships between components of any system, on all scales, are important and there is diversity within any system.

A society organized by these principles of ecodevelopment would be 'physiocratic', in that the earth's natural resources would be the ultimate precondition for human development, 'ultra-democratic', since people would control their own situation and 'structurally undifferentiated' in that the division of labour would occur within rather than between individuals (Friberg and Hettne 1985:207). It follows that the goals of development would include the following society-wide values: cultural identity, self-reliance, social justice and ecological balance (ibid:220).

With its emphasis on decentralization, it can be seen that ecodevelopment works best from the 'bottom-up' -- as a grassroots endeavour. Ideally, it grows from local foundations to be incorporated into regional and national governments. Ecodevelopment-based societies would rely less on huge, remote structures of control and more on small-scale and natural horizontal communities (Friberg and Hettne 1985:219).

The strategies of ecodevelopment are diverse, encouraging local solutions to global problems such as environmental degradation and poverty. A horizontal approach to the development process that integrates local and regional development is used, rather than the vertical specialization hierarchies and 'top-down' strategies that are common in the modernization paradigm (Sachs 1984:20). Diversity is encouraged. Each society will find its own strategy since there is not a single, universal path to development (Friberg and Hettne 1985:219).

2.4.5 Participation

The key to any strategy of ecodevelopment, then, is the concept of decentralization, which ideally leads to broad-based local participation. Broad-based participation in decision-making, however, implies the existence of a socio-political context within which people may freely organize to articulate their concerns. Some scholars have argued that this is the 'missing link' between theory and policy in ecodevelopment (Glaeser and Vyasulu 1984:35). The broader, participatory organizational framework that facilitates basic needs oriented development differs from development models that emphasize purely growth-oriented objectives. Franklyn Lisk claims that the main difference between this framework and growth-oriented models is that the satisfaction of private consumption basic needs must relate directly to ownership and control of productive assets as well as to the levels and distribution of basic needs output at the household level (Lisk 1985:19). Feminist scholarship

suggests that it is necessary to go within the household, to the individual level of needs articulation, since a gender difference is found to exist in most societies in access to and control of critical resources (Berry 1984a:23 cited in Taylor 1992:245).

To advocate decentralization of decision-making as a strategy of ecodevelopment does not mean the elimination of vertical linkages; rather it implies both vertical as well as horizontal linkages between communities: vertical linkages between national, regional and local-level authorities in decision-making and horizontally, between neighbouring communities with respect to the identification of basic needs, especially when these needs may coincide, creating opportunities to coordinate development efforts and save scarce capital and other resources (Lisk 1985:23). This is an elaboration of the Gandhian concept of paradharna. The key point is that information flow is two-way; that vertical communications linkages from the micro arena to the macro policy arena allow people to participate in setting national and international development agendas (Korten 1990:147). Two-way information flow is impossible without effective mechanisms for local participation in decision-making.

Popular participation, then, may be a 'means' of satisfying basic needs -- a short-term 'results' oriented process -- in situations where resources are scarce. It may be an 'end' in itself, however, since it may lead to the fulfillment of intangible requirements of human well-being and welfare, such as human rights, social justice,

equality, self-confidence and dignity. Individuals gain control or influence over institutions that take key decisions pertaining to her/his well-being (Lisk 1985:28). In this way, everyday resistance may give way to meaningful participation by previously disempowered people in development processes that affect their lives and livelihood.

Participation as an 'end' means that it is the process as it unfolds over time that is of the utmost importance. This dynamic process will develop and strengthen the capabilities of poor and marginalized people to intervene directly in development initiatives (Oakley 1991b:116). Further, the concept of participation as a dynamic process cannot be contained within a project framework (Oakley 1991a:23). Participation of this nature cannot be proclaimed, it must be developed (ibid:193).

The actual form that a participatory development organization will take will be different in time and space. A successful framework for India may be totally inappropriate elsewhere. What is important is that a successful participatory framework will be flexible and respond to changing conditions, while implementing locally-made decisions. Decentralization such as this will ensure that the basic needs of the very poorest are met. A people-oriented foundation will foster 'real' development that is sustainable.

Peter Oakley presents three forms that 'participation' may take in practice:

- 1) as contribution;

- 2) as organization that may be externally conceived or that may emerge on its own;
- 3) as empowering, in that participants gain the skill and confidence to manage projects and have a say in negotiations, learning to decide for themselves and take action (1991b:17).

It is participation as empowerment that is the basis of ecodevelopment. Real empowerment may make everyday resistance, which is generally hidden or invisible, visible.

Effective popular participation at the local level within a framework of ecodevelopment may lead, as well, to the attainment of more conventionally accepted development goals, such as increased levels of employment and income. This in turn may raise effective demand for basic needs goods and services, as well as improve supply management in the production and distribution of those goods and services, all of which are goals of modernization theories of development (Lisk 1985:19).

Participation, as empowerment, however, will be effective only through an equitable redistribution of decision-making powers and resources within society through decentralization. It is the ownership and control of key productive assets that is crucial to the decentralization of development processes. Changes in the way resources are allocated in relation to the production and distribution systems will guarantee the provision of essential services to the poor more surely than will narrow financial and economic considerations (ibid:27). Participation as empowerment, may,

in fact, generate some of the resources necessary to meet basic needs, through local labour and capital costs in the provision of essential public services and infrastructure such as health, education, water and roads (ibid:24).

Sheila Zurbrigg adds a caveat to the analysis of community participation and decentralization. In her experience, 'community participation' without empowerment often has meant 'self-help' only. She criticizes this concept as tacitly placing the ultimate responsibility for development on the poor themselves (Zurbrigg 1984:147). These programmes, she claims, shift responsibility, but not power or control over resources, to the poor.

Responsibility without corresponding input into the functioning of the existing system can indeed be worse than an empty gift (Zurbrigg 1984:148).

In effect, the government and the socio-economic organizations are absolved of any primary responsibility for rural poverty. As well, 'self-help' programmes that do not facilitate empowerment of the poor perpetuate the idea that underdevelopment may be solved through technical solutions, that the elimination of poverty will be found in the right 'mix' of inputs (ibid:148-149). For the middle class in the South, projects such as food assistance, adult literacy, agricultural extension and nutrition are conveniently conspicuous and harmless from a ruling class point of view. These programmes, however, cover the real causes of poverty -- the need for an equitable distribution of resources and the structural changes to ensure that distribution of resources will remain equitable (Fugelsang 1984:46-47; Korten 1990:20).

In many instances, conflicting interests in most communities mean that community participation often will be only token, since there is an effective divide between those few people who own and control land and resources and those people -- the poor and landless -- whose labour is controlled (Zurbrigg 1984:150). Further, differing class, caste, ethnic and gender interests mean that communities cannot be assumed to be homogeneous entities (Mackenzie 1992:29). Consequently, it should not be assumed that all voices will be heard automatically in the process of participation. For example, efforts to include poor and marginalized people in processes of development do not guarantee that poor and marginalized women's voices will be heard. Even in projects where women's participation has been targeted, grassroots participation as labourers and beneficiaries seldom ensures that women's participation in decision-making processes has changed. An evaluation of a CIDA supported social forestry project in southern India found that:

Women as participants and beneficiaries are visible at the grass roots level of project implementation. Women, mainly from scheduled tribes and castes, are hired as wage labourers either in nursery or plantation work where they account for at least 50% of the task force. 16% of the Village Forest Workers are women, 14% short of the 30% initially targeted. Above the VFW level, women are generally absent from the project and the [Andhra Pradesh Forest Department] (Pomerleau 1990:v).

'Trickle down' policies have failed elsewhere and they are equally ineffective in the realm of participation. Explicit efforts must be made to ensure that women's concerns and needs are addressed within processes of participation if the process is to be successful.

Given women's disadvantaged position vis a vis men in Indian society, participation must also be evaluated with respect to meeting women's practical or strategic gender interests. Gender interests differ from 'women's' interests that are homogeneous and determined by biology. Maxine Molyneux describes gender interests as those interests that may be developed by groups of women or men because of their social positioning through gender attributes (1985:232). Carolyn Moser furthers this analysis in a planning context to describe practical gender needs and strategic gender needs (1989:1803). Practical gender needs arise from the concrete conditions of women's experience. Identified by women within a specific context, they are generally a response to an immediate, perceived necessity (ibid). Strategic gender needs, on the other hand, arise from analysis of women's subordination to men and the consequent strategic gender interests in an "alternative, more equal and satisfactory organization of society than exists at present, in terms of both the structure and nature of relationships between men and women" (ibid:1803). From this perspective, Moser criticizes conventional 'basic needs' approaches to women in development:

In reality, basic needs such as food, shelter and water are required by all the family, particularly children, yet they are identified specifically as the practical gender needs of women, not only by policy-makers concerned to achieve developmental objectives, but also by women themselves. Both are therefore responsible for preserving and reinforcing (even if unconsciously), the sexual division of labour (Moser 1989:1803-1804).

Development and participation, as empowerment, may mean that satisfaction of practical gender needs such as employment, adequate fuel and water supplies, housing

and health, however, could become the basis of a secure support base through which the bottom-up mobilisation of women could occur. Women who organized into political pressure groups could ensure that government policies to address women's inequitable status in society become action, thereby challenging women's strategic gender interests in society at large (Moser 1989:1811,1816).

Natural resource based community problems may be the catalyst for genuine community participation that empowers the poor and may in fact be the key to equitable development. Examples of community mobilisation around natural resource based problems abound: two of the better-known instances in the Indian context are the Chipko movement in northern India and the opposition to the Narmada basin dam project in Maharashtra, Gujarat and Madhya Pradesh in southwestern India. It must be noted, however, that at this time, participation in natural resource-oriented development projects typically is not very substantial. Oakley cites several reasons for the low levels of effective participation in these instances:

- 1) external control of the project (through central government, multilateral or bilateral aid agencies or other international donors);
- 2) environmental projects are often technical solutions to technical problems;
- 3) participation is generally based on voluntary contributions;
- 4) education about the project is often paternalistic, based on an 'outside' extension agent teaching local people how to do something better;
- 5) the project -- and thus, participation -- is generally of limited duration, for

example contour ploughing or grading of banks along waterways;

6) the extension agent usually ignores local knowledge (1991:120).

It might be noted that both of the examples cited as successful instances of community mobilisation around local natural resource-based problems originated within the communities themselves. To increase local participation, such resource-oriented development projects must be based on long-term understanding of the problems rather than short-term incentives or coercion. As well, local people must share in the explanation of the causes of resource degradation in order to identify more with possible solutions (ibid:121). This may be a process that locally-based non-governmental organizations (NGOs) might be in a position to facilitate.

Real participation is not just a matter of people learning what their common interests may be. With respect to community decision-making about local resource use, Wade states:

...the ability to make people do what they may not immediately want to do, by means of sanctioned rules, is a key ingredient of any arrangement for common pool resource management (1988:209).

The key is that the community itself sets the rules and sanctions, that control of and access to community resources is decided through a process of genuine participation for all members.

Given that the central question for ecodevelopment is one of the distribution of resources, community participation is central to its implementation, since development

or change will not be sustainable unless all people, including the poor, are involved in decision-making. Empowerment of the poor means that everyday resistance to inequitable social relations may become overt. Grassroots responses to seemingly local ecological conditions can have global reverberations, since community survival often depends on non-local forces such as externally imposed forestry management or industrial development (Shiva 1986:257). Grassroots participation can be seen as the essential 'hinge' that can join the micro and macro arenas of decision-making and action (Goulet 1989:145). Since local participation is vital at all stages of development, ideally, the community is involved in the design and implementation phases of projects as well as in monitoring, evaluation and distribution of benefits (Bartlemus 1986:73). Ecodevelopment builds on existing formal and informal groups and works to achieve self-reliance through local resource use (Riddell 1981:113).

2.4.6 Local Knowledge: A role for the poor in development

The 'top-down' approach to development that has dominated the modernization paradigm has essentially ignored community participation in development and consequently, has by-passed the considerable knowledge of local populations. Ecodevelopment theorists, on the other hand, begin from 'peasant' rationale believing that the starting points for scientific research and verification are found in the cultural context of knowledge (Sachs 1984:19). The value of local knowledge may be illustrated through a discussion of conflict over resource use.

Ecological movements in the developing world usually focus on the right of access of the poor to natural resources and have three main elements:

- 1) economic conflict between two kinds of development -- one that is sustainable through collective management and one that maximizes the economic growth rate;
- 2) technological conflict between one method aimed at minimizing ecological costs and one 'borrowed' regardless of suitability in the local context and aimed at 'modernization';
- 3) scientific conflict over the politics of knowledge -- one that is local and one that is from 'outside' and that sees a sharp division between the expert and non-expert (Shiva 1986:258).

It becomes clear that perception, knowledge and values may vary significantly for different interest groups. Since the politics of ecology are closely linked to the politics of knowledge, the way that nature is perceived will determine the pattern of utilization of resources (Shiva and Bandyopadhyay 1986b:86). Although the modern scientific disciplines claim to be 'objective, neutral and universally valid' (ibid), they can be seen to be a response to economic interests. National and trans-national economic objectives influence the content and structure of knowledge about natural resources, which in turn reinforces particular forms of resource utilization. Thus, economic and political values are built into knowledge about natural resources. Modern scientific thinking about natural resources usually leads to single resource

exploitation for economic gain. Based on reductionist rationale, natural resources are considered to be isolated and non-interacting and acquire economic value only when they are exploited. In the case of forest resources, forests become trees and trees become wood for commercial use and profit (Agarwal 1989:WS-59). This kind of scientific thinking, however, generally ignores the cultural context of human relationships to nature and natural resources. Humans have a historically created relationship with nature that has evolved over a period of time (as much as 3000 years in India) and is closely connected to the socio-economic and political context within which it was developed (Stamp 1989:125). Society-environment relationships will vary over time and space.

Shiva and Bandyopadhyay claim that modern scientific thinking represents 'private' interests that violate ecologically based 'public' interest. In an ecologically based system, natural resources consist of relationships and inter-dependencies which have intrinsic value and are rooted in an understanding of how nature's processes support survival. It is the cognitive failure of reductionist science to realize ecological inter-dependencies that has created the environmental instabilities that today threaten survival. Economic growth has been based on externalizing the 'real' costs of production and on commercializing or commoditizing what were once common property resources. Resource withdrawal has been based on the demand of the market rather than on the capacity for renewal of those resources and this has led to short-term economic gain but long-term resource depletion (Shiva and Bandyopadhyay

1986a:86).

This kind of logic, which has underlain the modernization paradigm, ignores indigenous wisdom about local resources.

Centralised urban and professional power, knowledge and values have flowed out over and often failed to recognize the knowledge of rural people themselves (Chambers 1983:82).

Consequently, local participation in decision-making has been negligible and everyday resistance to inequitable development processes has become one of the primary manifestations of local knowledge. The rich and diverse base of local knowledge has been ignored by much of the development industry. Obvious problems of language barriers and lack of significant social contact have contributed to this omission, but colonial dominance and belief in the universal value of the modern 'scientific' method have precluded any attempts to draw on this pool of local knowledge.

Local people's knowledge is a vastly underutilized resource that could be mobilised to stimulate both rural and urban development. Local words and concepts may differentiate or combine categories that development experts from 'outside' have seen differently and provide valuable insight for project implementation (Chambers, 1983:94). Rural people's knowledge is especially strong about those things that touch their lives directly. This may mean that it is in agriculture and natural resource management -- the traditional tasks of many women in the South -- that this knowledge has its greatest advantage. This is not to suggest that there is no place in

development for 'outside' knowledge. Rather, it may be that through a combination of both local and outside knowledge -- on local and global scales -- that truly effective and equitable development may be derived. Traditional sources of knowledge can be a source of power for local people as they struggle to overcome both environmental and economic oppression, and to voice what has previously been restricted to the largely invisible form of everyday resistance.

2.4.7 Ecodevelopment as Political Economy of the Environment

Within most of the development industry, 'sustainable' development has essentially meant the incorporation of environmental concerns as an 'add-on' to conventional policies. This policy of 'react and cure' is clearly inadequate given the environmental crises being faced today (MacNeill et al. 1991:30). The present institutional and policy framework for environment and development is not capable of meeting the inherent political challenge. Environmental and resource management agencies, both national and international, may meet their given mandates, but they cannot address the sources of the environmental problems being faced. Their mandates generally limit them to action on the negative effects of development which can be seen to be merely the symptoms of the problem (ibid:31).

Macro models of development and change assume away the diversity of local conditions (Sachs 1990:5). As well, 'environmental managerialism' in the North

tackles resource degradation as a scientific problem, which means that research is limited to studies about such things as acceptable levels of pollution (The Stanley Foundation 1990:7). Consequently, institutional responses to environmental degradation are often ad hoc and piece-meal. Most environmental data are collected in empirical studies with pre-established categories and choice of variables that describe a situation at one point in time. Process and change are seldom addressed in these studies. A systematic treatment of the relationship between changing patterns of access to resources and environmental change is needed (Blaikie 1989:24).

Ecodevelopment, as an approach that is less ideologically inflexible than many other approaches to development, may be a means through which environmental problems may be addressed. The approach is overtly political, addressing questions of both local and non-local power structures, that are inherent in development processes. Colby suggests that there may be three conditions which will facilitate the transition to eco-development: the threat of global changes in climate and the ozone layer; far-reaching problems of resource depletion and degradation; and the dismantling of ideological and military competition between the U.S. and the U.S.S.R. (1990:35). Admittedly, the changes in the international and national structures that would be necessary to accommodate widespread support for this approach to development may be difficult to imagine at this time. Colby states:

Change is often resisted due to behavioural and cultural inertia, despite economic imperatives...The widespread perception at this time is still one of tradeoffs between environment and development (1990:33,34).

(The 'tradeoffs' attitude was prevalent at the June 1992 United Nations Conference on Environment and Development in Rio de Janeiro, Brazil, as was evidenced by U.S. president Bush's refusal to sanction some agreements because he believed that American jobs would be lost.)

Most of the support for an ecodevelopment framework to this point is found in small scale, locally-based groups that are committed to activism and social experimentation. Sachs sees value in these isolated experiments. First, for the participants, there is a social learning process of self-reliance. Second, attempts at organizing locally for a better life are, at the same time, a struggle for the redistribution of power between people, the state and organized business. As well, these scattered local movements may, in time, merge into coalitions capable of influencing the course of political life (Sachs 1984:vi). It is small-scale action such as this upon which the case study for this thesis is based.

2.5 Conclusions

A strategy of ecodevelopment may offer an alternative to conventional development paths. Structural linkages between local level and regional, national and international systems of production are identified as the source of failure of conventional development policies. Change emanates from small-scale, local level action, radiating outward and upward as local people gain confidence and knowledge

through local participation. Through participation, everyday resistance may be mobilised and may lead to positive development action. Effective participation at all levels is the central issue for an ecodevelopment strategy.

Friedman has advocated that change must be initiated from 'above'. He sees central government policies establishing 'Agropolitan Districts' which are "centrally guided but locally based" (Friedman 1981:248). The question that he fails to address is the question of political will. The Integrated Rural Development Programme (IRDP) in India is based on development blocks, as is the system of local government, panchavati raj. Both were established by central government order, and both have failed to meet the needs of the rural poor. Their failure will be discussed further in chapter four.

Ecodevelopment, on the other hand, advocates that local concerns will be identified at the local level. Change at higher government levels will come as support grows, through local mobilisation and participation. Locally based NGOs may be able to mobilise local 'everyday resistance' into social movements that will challenge local, national and/or international power structures. As 'insiders' local NGOs may be privy to the hidden transcript of resistance at the local level. What is lacking in the literature about ecodevelopment, however, is explicit attention to how the needs of a heterogeneous community may be met. For example, gender interests will manifest differently depending on which class interests are represented. Careful attention to

whose interests are being represented will ensure that an ecodevelopment framework for equitable development will be successful.

The case study in this thesis will examine the extent to which an outside agent -- a small environmental NGO in Goa, India -- that is working within a philosophy of ecodevelopment, may facilitate community empowerment through creation of effective channels of participation. In order to assess the potential, evidence of 'everyday resistance' will be sought. The case study will be developed in chapter five.

Chapter three will examine the methodological principles that formed the basis of the research process.

CHAPTER THREE METHODOLOGY

3.1 Introduction

The theoretical underpinnings for this research are based on the assumption that the cultural context of knowledge should be the starting point for scientific enquiry (Sachs 1984:19). One of my interests in this thesis, then, is to explore a Social Science research methodology that might accurately capture the complexities of social change, for example, as may result from development processes in the South. In particular, I wanted to create a window on 'everyday resistance' in Goa, and to examine whether the impacts of development might be perceived differently by rural women and men. I wanted a methodology that reflected these interests and that might facilitate empowerment and social change. I chose to work within a feminist participatory research framework.

Primary research was conducted through close interaction with individuals and groups involved with development processes in Goa. I worked with GRID (Goa Research Institute for Development), a small environmental 'action' group with whom I had corresponded while in Canada. GRID's political objectives are clearly articulated in its opposition to forms of development that do not start from the needs of the poor or that appear to exceed the capacity of the environment to support them.

Many hours of discussion with the director of GRID, as well as participation in that group's planning and strategy meetings, meant that many of the complexities of both Goan and Indian society became clearer to me. I participated frequently in the activities of GRID during my stay in Goa and established firm friendships within this group. Through my association with GRID, I carried out a series of interviews in two villages that had participated in one of GRID's environmental education programmes. I also attended weekly meetings of Bailancho Saad, a Goan feminist collective that was informally associated with GRID. Discussions with members of Bailancho Saad provided insight into the particular problems faced by Goan women. This is the only autonomous feminist group in Goa and although urban-based, many of its members have extensive experience working in rural settings in Goa and the rest of India.

To deepen my understanding of the impacts of processes of development and change in Goan society, I established contacts with three government agencies -- the Social Forestry department, the Rural Development Agency, and the Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas programme (a subsidiary programme of the Rural Development Agency) -- and visited some of their projects, after meeting several times with programme directors. As well, I visited the 'Peaceful Society', a Gandhian NGO involved in a programme of rural 'uplift', on two occasions. Other sources of information consulted included census materials, both Central and State government planning documents and newspaper clippings. Primary documents were consulted in order to provide a context within which the oral data could be evaluated; thus it was

hoped that local events could be placed into the context of the broader State and Central government agendas.

This chapter is written in three parts. Part one will describe a feminist participatory research framework. The second part will outline the conceptual postulates underlying my choice of research methodology. Through a critique of 'traditional' positivist social science research methodology, I will establish the basis for the choice of a feminist participatory research framework and discuss the implications of this critique for my work in Goa. Part three will outline the issues that shaped the research project in Goa. An outline of the research instrument used for interviews in two Goan communities will be included.

3.2 Feminist Participatory Research

Feminist participatory research is a three part process of social investigation, education and action, where gender is an important consideration at each stage of the research process (Maguire 1987:3). Its objective is empowerment in a process that brings theory and practice together (Dele 1988:89).

A feminist participatory research approach implies much more than a set of research techniques: its ideological foundation is based on clear opposition to the assumptions of dominant social science research (Maguire 1987:31). It is assumed

that everything we do has a political nature, that all research work affects the distribution of power in society. Neutral or value-free science becomes impossible given this assumption. Researchers must be clear about their political stance vis-a-vis their research project (ibid:35). This can be a complex issue since there may be a fine line between research that is culturally sensitive and research that is in collusion with oppressive sexist or racist policies and practices that are considered to be 'traditional' (ibid:69).

Participatory research, then, is a method of social investigation that involves relatively powerless members of society as full and active participants. The research community presents its own analyses of its own social reality, and this empowering process may be a means of taking action. Ideally, problem posing is a collective process whereby group ownership of the research creates participants as 'subjects' of their own research. Participants (both the researcher and the researched) learn through doing and most importantly, those involved in the production of knowledge are involved in the process of deciding how and when it will be used (Maguire 1987:30). As co-participants, researcher and researched will share a common 'transcript' of social interaction. The researcher will be privy, to some extent, to the hidden transcript of resistance. This 'democratization' of research fosters a belief among the researched in their capacity to generate change as a result of participation and their growing power to utilize knowledge (ibid:39). 'Ordinary' people may begin to understand the connections between their situation and experiences and the broader

social, economic and political context (Maguire 1987:101). In this way, research may have immediate and direct benefit to the community (Hall 1975:29). Local people learn to organize and pressure for accountability from the existing structures, to transform everyday resistance into a positive force for change.

...[T]he people directly experience their collective capacity to act, resist and challenge structures which do not serve their interests (Zurbrigg 1984:192).

As such, this kind of 'collective questioning' is not an 'end' in itself but a necessary 'means' to create social change (ibid:192). The external researcher, as a person that is committed to the cause, becomes a learner as well as a facilitator (Shiva and Bandyopadhyay 1987:186).

Feminist participatory research implies that explicit attention is given to how men and women as individual groups may or may not benefit from any initiative (Maguire 1987:107). Attention is given to gender issues at each 'phase' of participatory research. These phases are flexible and may occur concurrently. As outlined by Patricia Maguire, they include:

- 1) organization of the project and knowledge of the working area;
- 2) definition of generating problematics;
- 3) 'objectivization' and 'problemization' -- linking the local interpretations of problematic social conditions to the broader context;
- 4) researching social reality and analyzing collected information, and;
- 5) collective definition of action projects (1987:40-42).

Methods in feminist participatory research may consist of a combination of both quantitative and qualitative approaches. Feminist research methods reflect the dialectic between theory and action and are not constrained by a set of rigidly defined rules as is often the case in traditional research (Duelli Klein 1983:96). Methods are appropriate to the context of the research and may include some combination of the following: secondary research from government documents or local NGOs, and discussions with the community through local leaders and small groups to reveal perceptions about the local situation and the potential for change, open-ended interviews, participation in (formal or informal) groups already involved in movements for social change, surveys, participant observations or oral histories (Maguire 1987; Kirby and McKenna 1989:65-85).

3.3 Feminist Critique of 'Traditional' Social Science Research Methodology

Traditional Western science states that the observer and the observed, the knower and the known, are separate, that the one must not 'contaminate' the other if true objectivity is to be attained (Dubois 1987:111).

Feminist perspectives on empowering research methodologies counter the underlying postulates of this 'traditional Western science' and have been based on three underlying assumptions:

- 1) that a critique of positivism has been established, as for example, in the recognition that all research is political and in the postmodern 'decline of the

absolutes’;

- 2) that social or political change requires ‘advocacy’ approaches to enquiry;
- 3) that research that will change, as well as increase our understanding of the world, will have conscious empowerment of the researched built into the research design (Lather 1988:570).

Each of these assumptions, and the implications for research in Goa, will be discussed in the sections that follow.

3.3.1 Critique of positivist social science research methodology

Research as understood conventionally is a full-time activity of academic professionals, and their expertise in their respective fields of specialization have guaranteed them their monopoly on research as an activity. The restriction so far has not merely been on who does research, but also on what research gets done or gets emphasized. Research possibilities get limited by the way in which powerful groups of society can register their research priorities on the research system. Because this mediation is very indirect and subtle in operating in the reward system, it becomes extremely easy to believe that research is an autonomous and socially neutral activity (Shiva and Bandyopadhyay 1987:113)

It becomes evident that scholarship exists within relations of power, which it counters, redefines or implicitly supports. Thus, it is never apolitical (Mohanty 1988:62). It follows that science is not value-free; it is shaped by culture and politics. Further, how we conceptualize what is to be known and legitimated is determined by our culturally-based models of reality (Dubois 1983:105). Consequently, the values and epistemology of the researcher inform each phase of the

research process (ibid:107). The fundamental difference between a positivist approach to research and a feminist approach lies in the purpose for which social knowledge is generated: positivist research in its politically neutral stance generally is supportive of the status quo, accepting the political, economic and social structures as 'givens', while feminist-informed enquiry has power relations as the central concern and asserts that the production of knowledge should be for emancipatory purposes (Maguire 1987:15). An examination of both the suitability of methods chosen to achieve the research aim and the reasons why the particular problem was chosen are clearly articulated: feminist scholars become 'agents of social change' and therefore 'political' (Duelli Klein 1983:90, 96).

Within positivist social science research methodology, the adherence to principles of a value free, neutral and uninvolved approach and a hierarchical, non-reciprocal relationship between the research subject and object creates a situation of clear domination of research subject over research object (Mies 1983:119,120). For women and other disadvantaged groups, this has meant that most research has been 'on' rather than 'for' the researched. In this way, new knowledge is simply 'added on' to existing knowledge that has largely been defined by elite, white, Western males. Information from and about women and other groups is evaluated within the framework of that existing knowledge (Duelli Klein 1983:90).

A fundamental aim of positivist research in the social sciences is to establish

universalities and generalizations, in order to formulate a grounding for scientific prediction and control (Maguire 1987:24,92). Within a feminist framework, historically specific generalizations, set in a contextual analysis, are preferred. Research starts from the present awareness of local people about the various social, political and economic forces and processes of development affecting their lives and relates this awareness to an identification of the macro-level situation and its manifestation in that local situation (Shiva and Bandyopadhyay 1987:185). Sally Falk Moore calls this kind of research 'processual analysis', whereby there is an oscillation between fieldwork and the macro-level situation in order to assess their impact on one another over time (1986:12).

In this kind of analysis, human society is viewed as consisting of a heterogeneous group of culturally diverse men and women for whom the impact of any action or intervention will be different. Gender categories will vary for both women and men across class, race and culture (Harding 1987:7). This means that when one's interest is to examine the experiences of women, the categories of class, race and culture will preclude analysis of a universal 'woman' and 'woman's experience'. Many feminists have argued that in a world defined by men, the category of 'Other' (as in opposition to 'Self') has been assigned to women (DeBeauvoir 1957 in Rossi 1973:676).

Males have made their own sex the norm from which to regard phenomena -- among which phenomena are females. Considering women as 'the other sex' resulted in treatises about her as a human being with her own peculiarities: her body, her psyche, her position and role, her problems. Such studies do not

have their counterpart for the male sex (Schrivjers 1979:98).

Some scholars argue that women remain the 'second' or 'other' sex partly because it is believed that their specific reproductive functions keep them closer to nature with fewer possibilities to spend their energy on cultural creation (ibid:100). The difference between 'woman' as a cultural and ideological 'Other' and women as the real material subjects of their own history is the central question of feminist-informed enquiry (Mohanty 1988:62; Moore 1988:188).

Chandra Mohanty (1988) develops the analysis of 'Otherness' further to criticize what she terms 'Western feminist colonialism'. She is concerned with the use of the concept 'Third World woman' as a 'singular, monolithic subject':

An analysis of 'sexual difference' in the form of a cross-culturally singular, monolithic notion of patriarchy or male domination leads to the construction of a similarly reductive and homogeneous notion of what I shall call 'Third World difference' -- that stable, ahistorical something that apparently oppresses most, if not all, the women [and to some extent the men] in these countries (ibid:63).

It is in the production of this Third World difference, she contends, that Western feminists appropriate and colonize the lives of women in the South.

For my research in Goa, this meant that it was important for me to begin from the experiences of the women and men that I hoped to work with and interview, since I could not presume to know the specific reality of their situation. I had to ask myself why I was doing this research and to acknowledge my biases. GRID's mandate -- to fulfil a perceived need for a "support structure for action groups and other progressive

forces in Goa" within a framework of ecodevelopment and participatory development -
 - meant that this group was in clear opposition to the prevailing development policies of both the Central and State governments (Gomes 1991:pers.comm.). My interest in working with GRID was based on my interests in alternative forms of development, especially ecodevelopment, that might lead to empowerment and I wanted my research to be action-oriented and supportive of GRID's philosophies.

3.3.2 Advocacy

Sandra Harding (1987) states that the purposes of research and analysis should not be separate from the origins of the research problem. She points out that in the context of most positivist Social Science research:

Questions about women that men have wanted answered have all too often arisen from desires to pacify, control, exploit or manipulate women (Harding 1987:8).

Consequently, most information that has been generated about women has been used by government departments, advertisers or the medical or judicial systems. In contrast, the goal of feminist-informed enquiry is to provide information about social systems that women may want or need (Harding 1987:8). It is a matter of acknowledging who benefits from the research. This means that it must be the research subjects themselves who decide which questions will be asked in the research project.

Much Northern scholarship about the South has shown a paternalistic tendency to set the research agenda. Evidence of this kind of scholarship is manifested in the policies of most Northern 'aid' to many parts of the developing world, which often reflect the political (ideological), economic and military interests of the donors, rather than the needs of the recipients, with an overall strategy of stabilizing economic and political relations between the donor and recipient countries (Zurbrigg 1984:214-215). Further, Patricia Stamp (1989) argues that most development aid (and thus, research about the South) has been based on the perception of enormous gaps in scientific knowledge between the giver and receiver. She pinpoints the relationship between the aid expert and aid recipient (and researcher and researched) as a significant locus of power relations and knowledge about the aid recipients (and researched) (1989:149).

As researchers, it may be impossible to overcome these inherent power relationships between ourselves and the researched completely. Class, race and country of origin may conspire against a white, Western middle-class woman endeavouring to establish non-hierarchical relationships with rural Goans. But, in attempting to become involved with the people we are working with and avoiding a 'spectator' stance, positive and concrete steps are taken to overcome differences in perception that may exist. Within a feminist framework, the researcher looks to the researched to generate questions for investigation. The researcher is involved with her research subjects -- "an active participant in actions, movements and struggles for women's [and other disadvantaged groups'] emancipation" (Mies 1987:124). The

researched become 'co-subjects' in the research project (Glaeser and Suri 1984:153). In this way, 'spectator knowledge' is avoided (Mies 1987:124). Objectifying the researched implies that they are 'passive spectators' rather than active subjects in their own lives (Maguire 1987:18).

In deciding to work with GRID, I chose to support their objective of opposing what they perceived to be environmentally inappropriate government sponsored development. What is at issue in these cases is the idea that perception, knowledge and values vary significantly for different interest groups. How nature is perceived will determine the pattern of resource use. In Goa, this fact was manifested in government support of large-scale industrial development by multi-national companies such as an 'Electronics City' that is being built in a proposed Free Trade Zone and a proposed rubber tire manufacturing plant. This kind of development is opposed by GRID and other local forces in Goa, since the environmental consequences in such a rich agricultural area are considered to be much greater than any economic gain from this local point of view. The intent of my research, then, given my connections with GRID, is to support their challenge of the existing power relations. This research is 'for' GRID.

I spent considerable time getting to 'know' GRID and its philosophies. I worked many hours at the office, reading documents found in their resource centre and held in-depth conversations with the director, the three contract workers and the

resource librarians. I also participated in a High School environmental education programme (acronym -- OPES -- Operational Programme on Environmental Sciences) that GRID held in late January 1991. This experience helped to solidify the relationships I was establishing with those people associated with GRID and I was able to observe one of their programmes first-hand. I emphasized that I was there to learn and feel that we were able to establish a subject-subject relationship.

3.3.3 Conscious Empowerment through Feminist Participatory Research

Conscious empowerment means that research will have political and action-oriented dimensions that are aimed at creating a new collective consciousness and mobilisation for further social action among the researched (Mies 1983:134-135). Changing the status quo becomes the starting point for the research question. Poor people are marginalized not only from a perspective of the distribution of material resources, but also with respect to knowledge production (Kirby and McKenna 1989:33). Participation in the research project means that participants gain through a learning process of self-reliance. Attempts at organizing locally for a better life are also a struggle for the redistribution of power between local people, the State and organized business (Sachs 1984:iv). In this way the research project becomes a process of conscientisation both for the 'researcher' and 'researched'.

Research that is 'for' the researched tries to take the researched groups'

needs, interests and experiences into account and has an explicit aim of facilitating an improvement in that group's lives -- the researched are empowered through a validation of their lives (Duelli Klein 1983:90). This means:

assuming a perspective in which women's [and other disempowered groups'] experiences, ideas and needs (differing and different as they may be) are valid in their own right, and androcentricity -- man as the norm -- stops being the only recognizable frame of reference for human beings (ibid:1983:89).

Ideally, everyday resistance by local people, to processes of development that are perceived to be inequitable, becomes the starting point for research and empowerment.

Involvement with the research subjects demands a 'conscious subjectivity' (Duelli Klein 1983:94) or 'conscious partiality' (Mies 1987:122) on the part of the researcher, whereby the subjective experience of each of the 'researched' is validated and acknowledged. The critical and dialectical relationship between the researcher and the researched or 'inter-subjectivity', through the researcher's partial identification with the research 'objects' can lead to a correction of distortions on both sides and avoids the subject/object split (Mies 1987:122; Duelli Klein 1987:94; Kirby and McKenna 1989:99-100). Because the hierarchical research situation of traditional Social Science research often creates a situation of distrust, many of the data collected with quantitative methods may be irrelevant or invalid and responses may reflect 'expected behaviour' (Mies 1987:123) or the 'public transcript' of social interaction. On the other hand, praxis-oriented research requires reciprocity between the researcher and the researched rather than theoretical imposition, and data collection, perhaps qualitative, which better reflects the social realities of the researched (Lather

1988:572).

A women's research project or research for other oppressed groups should not be expected to start a conscientisation movement (ibid:137). The research project should be linked to an ongoing movement which will be a permanent base for conscientisation and mobilisation (Zurbrigg 1984:197). Otherwise, the research project will be "at best, a pleasant episode in the lives of the women [and men]" (Mies 1983:137). GRID, as a participatory and advocacy oriented development group, provided an established base of activism within which issues and priorities for research could be discussed.

3.4 Issues for Research in Goa

The research was undertaken with GRID, a Goan NGO whose stated aim is in clear opposition to the dominant power structure. This NGO gives its support to local Goan groups that are challenging the kind of industrial and large-scale development being propounded by both the Central and State governments. Feminist participatory research was felt to reflect GRID's philosophy of empowerment and social change with a framework of ecodevelopment. GRID's platform is not explicitly feminist. Although their aim is to facilitate empowerment of Goa's poorest, the focus has not been on women specifically. It has been assumed that development or empowerment for any community would necessarily benefit women and men equally. A specific

concern of this research was to encourage GRID to look more explicitly at the problems faced by rural Goan women. To increase my understanding of the issues, I participated in meetings with Bailancho Saad, a Goan women's collective and consulted with Bailancho Saad members about the research project. As well, two members of Bailancho Saad assisted during the interview process. I was interested in examining the following issues, which have been identified by Maguire in a more general context:

-- GRID hopes to empower local communities in their struggles against environmental degradation. To what extent are struggles against environmental change or degradation manifested through instances of everyday resistance? In such a strongly patriarchal society such as Goa, to what extent are women in the communities being empowered?

-- Do the problem-posing fora exclude or marginalize women, as is often the case in 'open' community meetings where women seldom have an equal voice? In its objective to reach the 'poorest of the poor' are explicit efforts being made to reach poor women, who, arguably, are the most disadvantaged among any class?

-- If women are being excluded from meaningful participation in the problem-posing forums of participatory research, does this mean that only 'male' problems are being defined and valorized?

-- To what extent does women's double burden of work for a wage and work for the family limit their participation in GRID's programmes?

-- Do women and men have different concerns about the kind of development that is occurring in Goa? How are these differences articulated and how might they be reconciled? (adapted from Maguire 1987:105-107)

The objective was to find answers to these questions through my relationship with GRID and through interviews carried out in two villages -- Curpavaddo and Quellosim -- that previously had been involved with a GRID programme. In 1987 and

1988, GRID had implemented a programme of environmental education -- an OPES for villages -- in rural areas in Goa. There was no follow-up to the initial programme and 'OPES for villages' has been discontinued, although GRID is hoping to revive it in 1992 or 1993. Consequently, GRID was interested in assessing the needs of these villages as they are presently perceived, as well as gauging the impact of the earlier programme. Since GRID's objective is to reach the most disadvantaged sectors of society, I attempted to concentrate the interviews with women in the area, although this was not always easy or possible, given the hierarchical and patriarchal nature of the society. The two villages in which the interviews were conducted are part of a tribal belt in Goa, although the inhabitants are not recognized as tribal in the census, since most practice some form of Christianity or Hinduism. They are struggling to be recognized as the aboriginal inhabitants of the State since their religious conversion was often the result of the uncompromising colonialism of the Portuguese. At present, they are known as the 'OBCs' or 'Other Backward Classes'. Forty-two interviews were conducted within an open-ended format and focused on issues that had been discussed with both GRID and Bailancho Saad.

The issues/questions in the interviews were the result of a collaborative effort among us and reflect the interests of everyone involved in its creation. The 'questions' in the interview guide were meant to act as catalysts for discussion of issues that were of interest to all of us. The interviews were taped in Konkani, the local Goan language. Three interviewers/interpreters conducted the interviews and I

was present at each interview. Two of the interviewers are women, members of Bailancho Saad, and one, a man, is an activist associated with GRID. What follows is a summary of the issues and questions around which the interviews were focused.

Issue: Household composition

Questions: Name, sex, age
 Are you the household head?
 How many people live in your house? number of males/females and their relationship to you?

Issue: Tenancy/Access to Resources

Questions: Do you or your household own any land? size? which crops are grown? trees? animals?

OR

Do you have access to any comunidad land, or government revenue land (forest)?
 Has your access to the available resources/land (trees, agricultural land, etc.) changed over your lifetime (due to changes in tenancy or ownership, due to overuse/exhaustion of these resources)?
 If practicing agriculture, do you use traditional (organic) methods, or do you use chemical fertilizers, pesticides, herbicides? If using chemicals, when did you start using them and what benefits do you expect from their use?

Issue: Daily Activities/ Employment

Questions: Do you have a job for which you are paid? What is your job? Is it seasonal? What is your wage, or do you receive payment in kind?
 What do you do in the course of a 'typical' day (in this season) -- what time do you get up in the morning, what chores do you do, how long do you work, what do you do in your 'free' time, what time do you go to bed at night?

Issue: Changes in the Village/Area

Questions: What have been the most important changes in your village in your lifetime? (especially with respect to your access to water, forest products, agricultural production and soil erosion)?
 How have these changes affected you? Has the nature of your daily tasks changed -- does it take longer to gather wood, is water closer/further away than before, have harvest yields increased/decreased, etc.?
 What do you see as your village's most urgent problem/need? Has this changed over time?

Issue: OPES Participation

Questions: What was the nature of your participation in the 1987 village OPES programme? Did you help to organize it? If not, who did? Were you a group leader? Did you help in any way to run it? Tell me what you remember of the programme? What was most useful/beneficial? Did the programme meet the needs of your village? If not, how could it have been improved? *** Should there have been a separate meeting for women?

Issue: Longterm effects of the programme

Questions: What kind of impact has the programme had in the village? Have you contacted any NGOs or government departments as a result of action that was initiated during the programme? (Be specific, which issues/groups/departments)? Have you taken any initiative to form any associations among yourselves since the OPES programme was held? Details? Have you since become more aware of other environmental issues in Goa/India? Which ones? Should there be any follow-up/further action from GRID? Explain.

Issue: Knowledge of Bailancho Saad

Questions: Have you heard of Bailancho Saad? How did you hear of them? Are they meeting a need in Goa? Do you think that women have particular (or special) concerns regarding the environment?

Finally: Any further comments/questions? Anything not covered in this interview that you would like to add?

It was initially hoped that a second set of interviews could be conducted to follow-up on information from the first set and to identify potential local leaders from among the interviewees. Especially, through further contact in the villages, a reciprocal relationship of trust and familiarity would have been encouraged and a window on the 'hidden transcript' of resistance may have been revealed. As well, through the follow-up process, it was hoped that mechanisms of collective action could

be established. However, I experienced persistent difficulties getting the interviews translated and transcribed in Goa and received the incomplete set of transcripts two days before departing Goa. Follow-up will have to come from GRID and will depend on available resources, both financial and personnel.

As a result of these difficulties, the focus of the research shifted from looking to the interviews for evidence of local organization, to an exploration of the potential of an ecodevelopment based NGO, such as GRID, to facilitate community mobilisation. GRID's mandate is to facilitate participatory development in Goa in order to encourage local people to take action on issues that affect their lives or livelihood. This thesis will explore this potential in the context of Goa.

Further details of the research process in Goa will be elaborated within the discussion of the body of the thesis.

CHAPTER FOUR

GOA: THE CONTEXT FOR LOCAL ACTION

4.1 Introduction

The primary purpose of this chapter is to discuss the avenues for participation in developmental processes that are available to Goans through Indian Central government development programmes as set out in its Five Year Plans. It is against this background that the need for an alternative development strategy is argued and the case study in chapter five is developed. The NGO that is the focus of the case study for this thesis bases its action on opposition to what it feels are environmentally and socially inappropriate government developmental policies in Goa.

Since Goa's incorporation into the Indian union in 1961, development has been premised on the state's immense natural resource wealth. Great disparities exist between rich and poor in Goa, as elsewhere in India. The predominance of a style of development based on industrialization and capitalization of natural resources exacerbates the disparities between rich and poor, and is illustrative of relations of power that are in operation in Goa. Capitalization of natural resources has meant that local people's control of and access to resources and land have been lost to 'outside'

interests.

To facilitate discussion of these issues in chapter five, and to develop the background for present government development policies, the first part of this chapter will discuss the context of Goan society, including its unique colonial history. A brief discussion of the physical and economic characteristics of Goa will be followed by a description of the general characteristics of the Goan population, including the preservation of caste within Christianity. During the research process, interviews were conducted in two predominately Gauda villages in Goa. The Gauda, the aboriginal inhabitants of Goa, will be discussed in the section that follows. The final section will outline land tenure arrangements in Goa. Access to and control of resources have been identified in this thesis as crucial factors in determining how resources will be used. The government proposed creation of an Export Processing Zone (EPZ) in Goa has meant that many people have lost access to land once used for crops and grazing of animals. Specifically, the institution of Comunidade will be described.

Comunidade is a system of landholding in Goa that predates the arrival of the Portuguese in 1510 and maintains considerable influence today. Indian 'land to the tiller' legislation will also be discussed.

The second part of the chapter will introduce avenues for participation in developmental processes that are available to Goans through Indian Central government efforts, especially the Community Development initiative. Specifically,

participation for women, through the 'Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas' programme, will be critiqued and people's participation in the Indian Forest Department's social forestry programmes will be examined.

4.2 The Setting

Located on the southwest coast of India, Goa became a Portuguese colony in 1510, its natural harbours and wide rivers being an ideal base for the seafaring Portuguese. The Portuguese were lured to the area by the potential of tremendous profits to be made in the trade of spices and Goa soon became the capital of the Portuguese empire in the 'East' (Government of India [GOI] 1979:137). Goa remained under Portuguese colonial control until 1961, fourteen years after the rest of India gained independence from the British. At that time, Goa, Daman and Diu -- the three Portuguese enclaves in India became a Union Territory of India. The state of Goa was established on May 30, 1987.

Broadly, the state has three main physical regions: the mountainous region of the Sahayadries (foothills of the Western Ghats), the plateaux of the central area of the State with abutments that reach to the coast in many places, and low-lying river basins and coastal plains (Government of Goa [GOG] 1979:3). Goa comprises thirteen districts or talukas (see map, figure 4.2). The climate is sub-tropical and the annual southwest monsoon brings 2500-4300 millimetres precipitation each year, usually

Figure 4.1

Source: *The World Today*
Compiled by M. Droxy
Trent University, Peterborough, 1980, p.31

Figure 4.2

Source: Government of India 1990

between June and September (GOG 1979:12).

4.2.1 Physical and Socio-economic Profile

Goa is endowed with a rich and diverse resource base: forests, fertile agricultural land, mineral ore deposits, navigable rivers (especially important are the Mandovi and the Zuari) and an important natural harbour (GOI 1983:11). Most economic development in the state, since the time of the Portuguese, has been based on natural resource extraction.

Forests are found mainly on the slopes of the foothills of the Western Ghats in the talukas of Sanguem, Satari, Quepem and Canacona and to a lesser extent in Pernem, Bicholim and Ponda (GOI 1983:16). Government estimates place forest cover at 24.3 percent of total land area in the state (GOI 1983:12).

Agriculture is the leading economic activity in the state. 'Net cultivable land' covers 42 percent of total land area (GOI 1983:12). Paddy (rice), ragi, maize, jowarm, bajra (a type of millet) and pulses are the most important crops, while cashews, coconut, arecanut, mango, jackfruit, banana and pineapple are also grown. Cropped land is categorized as 'paddy' land (27.8 percent of cropped area) or 'non-paddy' land (72.2 percent). The paddy land is found primarily in the coastal talukas. Cashew is the main horticultural crop (46.2 percent) followed by coconut (13.9 percent) (GOI

1983:12).

Goa has considerable marine and inland fishing potential. Prawns are the most important inland variety, while the off-shore varieties of mackerel and sardines comprise as much as 70 percent of total fish production in the State. Marine fishing is a seasonal activity (June to September) while inland fishing is done throughout the year (GOI 1983:16).

Mining has been an important economic sector in Goa, which is well-endowed with mineral resources: iron-ore, manganese and ferro-manganese as well as limestone, clay, bauxite, quartz and silica. Regular export of iron and manganese began in 1947 (GOI 1983:17). The Portuguese did not have the capital to develop the mines, so Goans faced a kind of 'double colonialism': the mines were developed for the Portuguese with Japanese and West German capital and technology (Newman 1989:2). All of the mineral products in Goa are exported through the Port of Mormugao, at the mouth of the Zuari River, one of the best natural harbours on the west coast of India (GOI 1983:18). Goan iron-ore accounts for almost one-third of India's total iron-ore production and approximately one-half of India's exports of iron-ore (Carvalho 1979:3). There are 550 mining concessions covering an area of 500 square kilometers, 350 square kilometers on forested land, approximately 22.8 percent of forested land, based on government estimates of forest cover (ibid:3). There has been much protest in Goa at the extent of environmental damage as a result of the

2

PM-1 3 1/2"x4" PHOTOGRAPHIC MICROCOPY TARGET
NBS 1010a ANSI/ISO #2 EQUIVALENT

PRECISIONSM RESOLUTION TARGETS

PIONEERS IN METHYLENE BLUE TESTING SINCE 1974

MICROD
SOLUTIONS

1000 COUNTY ROAD 8, BURNING WOOD, OH 44027 USA
TEL 812 435 7057 FAX 812 435 7057 TLA 8/2000/0000

mining operations (Gomes 1991:pers.comm.).

To date, there has been little emphasis on large-scale industrial development. At the time of the 1981 census, there were 1,945 small-scale village and rural industrial units with a capital investment of 22.3 million Rupees (Rs.) (one Canadian dollar was equivalent to 7.21 Rs. in 1981 according to Bank of Canada information) employing 15,070 persons and producing a wide variety of goods. Twenty-eight large-scale and medium-scale industries had been constructed with an investment of 138 million Rs. and employing 5,000 people. Two State institutions have been established to promote industrial development in Goa -- the Goa Industrial Development Corporation (GIDC) (formerly the Goa, Daman and Diu IDC), to set up industrial estates by providing necessary infrastructural facilities, and the Economic Development Corporation (EDC) whose objective is to promote industrial development in the State (GOI 1983:18-19).

Large-scale industrial development appears to be the goal of future industrial growth in the state. There is an 'Export Processing Zone' (EPZ) that has been proposed for Goa in the planning document Regional Plan for Goa 2001 A.D., developed in 1988. The proposal concurs with Indian Central government initiatives to encourage foreign investment. It is suggested that the area holds good potential for the development of an electronics industry (hence the proposal is commonly referred to as "the electronics city") (GOG 1988:56). The area of the Verna Plateau, alongside

the Zuari River has been selected as the preferred site for construction (GOG 1988:35). The Verna Plateau was selected for several reasons: both Goa's international airport and a railway station are nearby at Dabolim; Mormugao Harbour has easy access; and the National Highway to both the State capital -- Panjim -- and the largest regional city in the south of the state -- Margao -- forms one of the borders of the EPZ. Plans for development of this area mean that the energy sector will have to be expanded, and it has been suggested that extra sources of energy might include nuclear (ibid). Conveniently, there is a nuclear development just over the southern border of Goa, at Karwar in Karnataka -- a highly contentious development that has been the target of persistent and intense protest, to the extent that the development has been scaled down by two-thirds and the remaining reactors are in danger of not being fully commissioned. This protest has been supported by many activists in Goa, especially because of the potential ramifications for the Goan environment due to the close proximity (Shehakunja 1991:pers.comm.).

The Goan coastline is 105 kilometres in length, with white sand beaches bounded by coconut palms. Tourism, drawing on the beauty of the setting, has been an important economic sector in Goa and has seen tremendous growth in recent decades. The number of tourists visiting Goa rose from 85,000 in 1970-71 to 400,000 in 1980-81, more than doubling by 1987-88 to 827,000 (GOG 1989:93-94). Much of this development has been financed by foreign-owned hotel chains, with the result that there has been a very rapid growth in the tourist industry, especially in the hotel

sector. As a consequence, the tertiary sector has grown faster than the primary or secondary sectors of the Goan economy (GOI 1983:20).

4.2.2 Population Characteristics

Provisional data from the 1991 census¹ show that the sex ratio in Goa dropped from 975 (females to 1000 males, compared to the all-India figure of 933) in 1981 to 969 in 1991 (929 for all-India). The sex ratio in Goa is affected by two contrary trends: high levels of out-migration of educated Goans for employment in other parts of India and in the Gulf States and high male in-migration to work for the Port Authority and steel manufacturing at Mormugao harbour (Newman 1989:4). Exact figures are not available for either out-migration or in-migration. Further decline in the sex ratio at the time of the 1991 census reflects the continuing marginal position of women in Indian society. The literacy rate in Goa climbed to 77% in 1991 from 57% in 1981 (compared to 43% in 1991 and 36% in 1981 for all-India). In Goa, male literacy is 77% (53% for all-India), while female literacy is 68% (32.5% for all-India) (Athreya 1991:41; GOI 1991:4). There is considerable debate about the actual levels of literacy in India, perhaps attributable to its method of determination: census takers

¹ The census was completed in March, 1991. Provisional tables, that supplied broad trends, were available in April, 1991, while I was still in Goa. To date (July 1992), further information from the census has been sparse in Ottawa. It is estimated that results will be available in "late 1992". As far as possible, information in this section will rely on data from the 1991 census. Where that is not possible, the 1981 census information will be used.

ascertain verbally whether persons can "read or write with understanding in any language" (GOI 1991:33).

The rural population of Goa comprises 59 percent of the total population (GOI 1991:1). This figure was 68 percent in the 1981 census and compares to the all-India rural population figure of 77 percent at that time (GOI 1988:5). The figures for employment in agriculture are less straightforward. In 1981, the percentage to total population of 'main workers' (a person who had economically productive work for six months or more during the previous year to the census) was 30.89 percent (40.06 percent males, 15.33 percent females). Marginal workers comprised 4.46 percent of the population and worked less than six months in the year preceding the census. Fully 64.65 percent of the population were classified as non-workers (51.52 percent males, 78.12 percent females). Non-workers were deemed to have not participated in any economically productive work (GOI 1983:i, 4-5). What is missing from these statistics is any indication of the dependency ratio (percentage that represents children under fifteen). Given the adverse sex ratio for women, the high percentage of female 'non-workers' is significant. An estimate of 'informal' sector activity is not available. The high 'official' rate of unemployment was confirmed during fieldwork through personal observation. The only estimates of numbers of people employed in agriculture are given for 'main workers'. The percentage of 'main workers' classified as cultivators or agricultural labourers was 28.57 percent (22.88 percent males and 46.10 percent females) (ibid:i).

Hindus form the major religious community in the State (66% in Goa, Daman and Diu at the time of the 1981 census), Muslims comprise nearly 4.5% and Christians (predominately Catholic) approximately 29% (GOG 1989:12). The relatively large Christian population is a legacy of Portuguese colonization. Since it was the prevailing view of sixteenth century Europe that the religion of the King should be the religion of the subjects, the official policy of the Portuguese in Goa was one of conversion (GOI 1979:153). From 1540 onward, there was a policy of religious persecution, when a decision was taken to destroy all temples and mosques. By the end of the sixteenth century, there were more than 50,000 Christians in Goa (ibid:154). A Portuguese language policy was enforced and the local languages of Marathi and Konkani were prohibited. All non-Christian religious books were burned (GOI 1979:194).

The effect of this religious persecution was greatest in the coastal talukas of Tiswadi, Salcete, Bardez and Mormugao, the Velhas Conquistas or old conquests -- areas of first and most complete contact with the Portuguese. Consequently, these areas are more 'Catholic' than other areas of Goa (Newman 1989:10). The notorious Portuguese 'Holy Office of the Inquisition' changed outwardly almost all Indian habits and customs of the now-Christian population to Portuguese dress and folklore. This led to an exodus of Hindus to regions outside of Goa (GOI 1979:237). Goan Christians, however, maintained many 'Indian' habits and customs. Konkani prevailed (secretly) as the language of folk culture, although, generally, Hindu Goans use the

Devnagari script for Konkani while Christians use a Roman script. The preferred medium of educational instruction since the departure of the Portuguese, however, is English or Marathi. This preference broadly reflects religious differences, English being the choice of Christians and Marathi the choice of Hindus.

Caste², as another Indian 'custom', has been preserved within Christianity. Caste was not discouraged by the Portuguese, since they claimed that it corresponded to their own class system. Consequently, the caste pattern of Goan villages conforms to those in the rest of India. Members of either the Brahmin caste or the 'Charrodo' caste (the Goan equivalent of the Kshatrya caste) are generally dominant in their villages. Their members predominate among the modern, urban middle and upper classes and are members of village associations, landowners and shopkeepers. Most of the village population -- farmers, tenant cultivators, labourers, fishers and toddy tappers (collectors of the sap of coconut trees, to be used in the production of feni, a local Goan liquor) -- will be of the Sudra caste (Newman 1989:5). The survival of caste in Christianity well may reflect Portuguese concern with control over a conquered population rather than any concern for that population's 'spirituality': the survival of certain indigenous 'customs' might de-fuse potential resistance to

² The Varna system of caste in India has four broad classifications: the 'twice-born' Brahmin, Kshatrya and Vayshya and the Sudra or servants of the 'twice-born'. The 'untouchables' (or harijans -- Gandhi's 'children of God') are at the bottom of this ladder and outside the formal system. Within these broad categories, there are hundreds of sub-castes or precise occupational listings in the 'jati' system of caste (Baker 1990:43-48).

Portuguese hegemony.

As well as caste, which is ascribed at conception, there are many classes based on wealth and/or profession. This means that, as well as upper class Brahmin landowners, there will be some evidence of upper class Sudra (the lowest caste in the Varna system) living in relative opulence, when some members of these families may have worked as stewards on ships, for example, and earned substantial income (GOI 1979:238). Groups such as toddy tappers, fishers, carpenters and masons, members of the Sudra caste, may have access to a relatively stable income and consequently may be part of the 'middle' classes (GOI 1979:239). The actual distribution of wealth in Goa is not clear from any of the census information, although the large number of 'non-workers' in the census would seem to indicate a large lower class unemployed in the 'formal' sector.

The Gauda are the aboriginals of Goa, although they are not counted as such in the census. They are subsumed into the categories of Hindu and Christian, their conversion largely a result of contact with the colonizers -- both Aryan and Portuguese (GOI 1979:233-234). They share the same appearance, folk culture and socio-economic position as tribal populations in other parts of western India, despite their different religious affiliations (Newman 1989:5). It is estimated that in 1971 there were between 25,000 to 35,000 Gauda in Goa (between 3.1 to 4.4 percent of a total population of 795,120 at the time of the 1971 census) living mostly in rural areas of

the State (GOI 1979:205,234). The Gauda are generally Christian, Hindu or Nava Hindu. Nava Hindu Gauda were baptized by the Portuguese during the sixteenth century but reconverted to Hinduism around 1928 when Portuguese religious persecution was relaxed somewhat (GOI 1979:234).

4.2.3 Land Tenure Arrangements

An understanding of the land tenure system is necessary to understand environmental issues. The process of environmental change is inseparable from economic forces, at both the international and local level. How land and resources will be used, and to whose benefit, will be determined largely by who owns and controls them.

Land tenure in Goa was traditionally determined by what is now known as the Comunidade, an institution that pre-dates the arrival of the Portuguese. Although the original name may be lost, the institution was maintained by the Portuguese colonizers. The origins of this institution are not clear, but the earliest records date from 1054 A.D. on the Konkan coast (southwest India) (Pereira 1981:9-11). As a system of land tenure, Comunidade is a complex institution: each village may have its own particular arrangement. At a basic level, however, the village associations (Comunidade) are run by Gaunkars, the male members of the dominant caste (Newman 1989:8). Traditionally, the Comunidade has been responsible for

maintaining public roads, rainwater drainage and irrigation systems, top-draining marshy land, public security and other such community matters. Prior to independence from the Portuguese, there was no other governing body at the local level (such as the elected Panchayat³ today), and non-members (landless people) had no input whatsoever into decision-making (Pereira 1981:24). Comunidades were:

always....agricultural associations of private interest, associations for promotion of agriculture and serving their members (ibid:29).

Membership in the Comunidade is restricted to males only, and is an heritable right, passing through male family members. Traditionally, its activities knew no bounds other than those demarcated by the collective interest. All activities were undertaken for the members and only for them (Pereira 1981:29). The institution of Comunidade was maintained through the period of colonization by the Portuguese, primarily as a means of ensuring payment of taxes (ibid:75). Today, Comunidade and Panchayat coexist in Goa. Comunidade continues to be a system of communal landholding among landowners, while the Panchayat acts mainly as the administrative arm of the Central government at the local level. There tends to be little 'common property' land in Goa administered by the Panchayat, as in the rest of India (Gomes 1991:pers.comm.; Fernandes 1991:pers.comm.).

³ Panchayati raj was instituted by the Central government, in the rest of India, from 1957 onwards. It became a part of the Goan political scene after Goa's incorporation as a Union Territory of India in 1961. There is a three-tier arrangement: Gram Panchayat at the village level, Panchayat samiti at the 'development block' level and Zila Parishad at the district level. Members are elected for a term of office at each level. At the village level, the Panchayat is one of the basic institutions for carrying out various programmes of rural development. The Panchayat identifies potential beneficiaries of various 'anti-poverty' programmes (GOI 1990:452)

Land tenancy laws in Goa have undergone some change in recent decades. In 1964, the 'Goa, Daman and Diu Agricultural Tenancy Act' came into effect. All tenants of paddy fields were protected under this act. Prior to 1964 tenancy had been guaranteed for six years, under Indian tenancy legislation, to be renegotiated at that time; now tenancy became an heritable right. As payment, tenants would give one-sixth of their harvest to the landlord (Fernandes 1991: pers.comm.). In 1969, the land tenancy law in India was amended to provide a procedure whereby tenants would have the right of purchase of lands cultivated by them. To strengthen this law, in 1976, the 'Fifth Amendment' was passed in Indian parliament. This amendment stated that on the 'tiller's day' (the day that the Amendment became law):

every tenant would be deemed to have purchased from his landlord the land held by him as a tenant and such land would vest in [him] free from all encumbrances subsisting on the said day (GOI 1981:14).

The Fifth Amendment, however, was challenged by the original landowners in Indian Supreme court. In 1979, this law was declared unconstitutional by the Supreme Court and landlords were able to demand the arrears owed them by the tenants. The tenants appealed this decision and the status of this amendment remains a question today since a decision has not been made on the appeal (Newman 1989:9; Gomes 1991:pers.comm.). This has led to a number of problems with the maintenance of agricultural lands. Since ownership is unclear, neither former owners or former tenants wish to invest their time or capital into land that they may lose when the court ruling is finally handed down. For example, a consequence of this uncertainty has been that bunds around paddy fields in Goa have not been maintained to prevent the

intrusion of salt water onto paddy land. Land in several areas has been inundated by sea water and has become salinized and unusable for paddy agriculture (Fernandes 1991:pers.comm). See photo, figure 4.3.

Land ownership in Goa today (based on 1988 figures) is largely private (54% of the total), although it may be unclear as to how much of this land is, in fact, under dispute because of a lack of clarity in the 'land to the tiller' legislation, since Comunidade land has also been disputed under the legislation. Official statistics state that government-owned land accounts for 32% of the total and comunidade for 11% (GOG 1988:20). Ninety-one percent of agricultural holdings are less than two hectares (GOG 1988:25). Figures for the percentage of land in holdings under two hectares were unavailable, but personal observation confirms that there is little large-scale agriculture. There is no information about women's access to and ownership of land in the Indian census material. Little of the available information from the census or other government sources is disaggregated by sex. Neither was sex-disaggregated data available from any of the NGOs contacted during fieldwork in Goa.

Figure 4.3, Broken bund -- Curpavaddo, Goa

4.3 Goan Development in the Indian planning context and avenues for community participation

In Goa, since 'liberation' from the Portuguese in 1961, development has been determined by Indian Central government policy, whose guiding principles since the first Five Year Plan (FYP) in 1952, have been growth, modernization, self-reliance and social justice (GOI 1985:23). Planned economic development has been based on rapid industrialization and the capitalization of agriculture (Sen 1990:4). Planners assumed that a high economic growth rate would ensure the elimination of poverty (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:20).

In India, national plans are made sectorally against a theoretical model of growth, such as projected growth of Gross National Product (GNP) or Gross Domestic Product (GDP). Sectoral plans (for example, agriculture, rural development and industry) are then parcelled out in State Plans with professional and political negotiation about State shares of both budgets and projects. Ideally, national plans reflect an aggregate compilation of pre-determined State Plans. State plans are made in accordance with national goals (the sectoral objectives) but also take into consideration what are called 'departmental requisitions or demands' from within each State. In a perfect world, State plans emerge from district and sub-district plans; but in reality State plans are largely a result of priorities and preferences at the national level (Jain 1983:19).

Most decisions about what will be done in any particular locality are made in the State capital city without any reference to the articulated needs of an area. Further, that the needs of the poor are articulated at the State level even when they are determined at the district level, assumes that district officials have the poor's interests in mind. This has been shown seldom to be the case (Zurbrigg 1984:150; Joseph and Desrochers 1984:25; Dreze 1990:A-90-A-99). Although a district may make its needs known to the Central State planning unit, in a study done in Karnataka it was found that only eighteen percent of the allocation for the district was actually determined at the district level. Most allocations of projects and resources were decided at the State or National levels, regardless of their relevancy for that area (Jain 1983:20).

This kind of centralization of the planning process has profound implications for the poor. Avenues of participation for the poor have not been institutionalized into the planning process. Especially, inclusion of questions of environmental change and women's concerns become problematic. It is impossible to merely 'add on' the problems of environmental degradation and reaching women, particularly poor women, to an existing process which does not have mechanisms to include the poor. A survey done in Mangalore in the state of Karnataka in southwestern India, revealed that both poor women and men were not even aware of poverty alleviation programmes implemented by the Central government (Jain 1983:21). When interviewees were asked about Rural Development Agency programmes during fieldwork in Goa in 1991, responses confirmed that many of the rural poor were unaware of or unclear about the

poverty alleviation programmes being administered from the Goan capital city Panjim.

Explicit efforts have been made to address the issue of 'participation', at least in theory, in recent Indian 'Five Year Plans' (FYPs).⁴ Participation, however, is not defined in the document. An emphasis of the Seventh FYP of 1985-90, for example, was to involve local people to ensure success of development efforts. Decentralization of planning and development administration and the increased participation of voluntary organizations and NGOs was thus called for to achieve this goal (GOI, 1985:414-415). It was not clear in the planning document, however, whether participation meant increased contributions of labour and local materials (self-help) or whether it would lead to empowerment, that is, participation in decision-making processes about what resources would be available to whom and for what purpose. That concrete mechanisms to entrench this kind of participation were not articulated, however, would seem to support the idea of 'participation' as 'self-help'. Community development remains separate from economic development as modernization in the planning process.

4.3.1 Community Development

A Community Development Programme (CDP) has been a part of the National

⁴ The Eighth FYP is not yet available (July 1992), probably due to recent political instability in India.

FYPs since October 1952. The main objectives of the programme have included area development, self-help programmes (in which people's 'participation' has been the essential feature), and development of the whole community with emphasis on the weaker and underprivileged sections. The government's role was deemed to be the provision of technical assistance and funding; it was expected that people would be responsible for their own development (that people would 'participate') (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:11). The Integrated Rural Development Project (IRDP) was launched as a CDP initiative in 1978-79 and was expanded country-wide in 1981. The IRDP is administered through District Rural Development Agencies (RDAs) and carries out programmes such as provision of minor irrigation works, work animals and bullock carts and assistance for small-scale dairy, goat and fishing operations (GOI 1990:448). As well, IRDP supports non-agricultural activities such as the 'Training of Youths for Self-Employment' (TRYSEM) programme and the 'Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas' (DWCRA) programme (GOG 1987:4). These programmes are administered from the 'top-down', parcelled out from a national-level plan.

The CDP, however, has failed to remove rural poverty. By 1980, the Indian Central government acknowledged:

The pace and the manner in which the problem of rural poverty has been dealt with so far leaves much to be desired both quantitatively and qualitatively...The bottom deciles of the rural poor i.e. the landless and rural artisans, have in most cases been left untouched (GOI 1980:169).

The CDP has tended to benefit the relatively wealthy, who have better access to land,

credit and marketing facilities. For example, studies have shown that office holders in gram panchayats (village government), panchayat samitis (development block governments) and cooperatives have tended to benefit more from development funds channelled through them. These institutions are usually dominated by upper castes and landowners, although there is some recent evidence that the 'middle' classes are becoming more prominent as property owners (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:25; Dreze 1990:A-95-A-99). The 'trickle down' effect generally has not worked in the case of these institutions.

4.3.2 Participation for women

The Sixth FYP (1980-85) indicated that efforts were being made to meet the needs of women. The 'Development of Women and Children in Rural Areas' (DW CRA) was introduced in 1982-83 as a pilot project of the Rural Development Agency. As well, a radical step to raise the status of women advocated the introduction of legislation to confer joint title to both husband and wife in all development activities involving the transfer of assets and distribution of land and house sites (GOI, 1985:321). Interestingly, this legislation was not mentioned as an objective in the Seventh Plan (Agarwal 1988:559). This would be an especially important step, since it is access to ownership and use of resources which determines to whom the benefits of development will accrue. With respect to the effectiveness of legislation in changing systemic gender bias, Agarwal is not optimistic, however:

The laws have not affected practice in large measure; conditions in India are not conducive to women claiming their legal rights...[S]trong gender biases impinge on the functioning of village councils, bureaucracy and even judiciary, typically affecting the implementation of laws in male interests (1988:571).

In spite of the failure to carry through on the issue of women's ownership of assets such as land and housing, women are accorded continued priority in the Seventh FYP. Women's disadvantaged position in Indian society is acknowledged: low literacy rates relative to men, lower health and nutritional status, low participation rates in the 'formal' economy and inequitable rates of pay in the formal paid economy, displacement of women by mechanization in agricultural labour and a growing number of single-parent, women-headed rural households due to massive migration of men to the urban areas (GOI, 1985:321).

The DWCRA programme was continued in the Seventh Plan (1985-1990) and has since grown in scope. In Goa, DWCRA is organized out of the capital city, Panjim.⁵ Groups of women throughout the State are organized to undertake small-scale income generating projects. Each group is provided with a 15,000 Rs. (approximately \$1550.00 Canadian at the exchange rate of 9.65 Rupees:1 Canadian dollar in April 1991) 'start-up' fund from which revolving loans are given to individual members of the group and from which the group leader's travel expenses

⁵ The information about the Goan DWCRA is taken from discussions with project officers during several visits to the offices of the RDA and DWCRA in Panjim and Margao, in February, March and April 1991.

are paid. Each group is accountable to the district level Gram Sevaka (village worker) and any money received must be signed for, with a guarantee of repayment.

I was taken to see a DWCRA project in Benaulim, a village in South Goa, by the local Gram Sevaka. Formed in 1986, a group of ten women makes papad (a kind of thin, crisp, spicy bread). They work at this activity for approximately five hours each day, in addition to their 'usual' daily tasks, earning about 200-250 Rupees each per month (approximately \$20.00-\$25.00 Cdn.). When school is out, their daughters participate in the group's activities. See photo, figure 4.4. Through the DWCRA, the group is given assistance to market their product. Other groups in Goa were involved in the production of baby dresses and crocheted items and in selling coconuts.

Stamp criticizes these kinds of income generation projects for women since they do not challenge the sexual division of labour (1989:61). There is no accounting for the structural problems underlying women's (and the poor's) poverty. The activities are often undertaken as a part-time endeavour to supplement 'family' income. In this way, they seldom challenge the existing structures of oppression or the sexual division of labour (ibid:40). Reinforcement of the perceived sexual division of labour was apparent in other projects initiated by the Rural Development Agency. Training programmes for boys included courses in automobile mechanics, welding, carpentry, masonry and plumbing, for example, while girls received instruction in tailoring, knitting, doll-making, fibre crafts and batik printing (GOG 1987:6).

Figure 4.4, DWCRA group, Benaullim, Goa -- Papad production

Moser concurs with Stamp's analysis, stating that such projects (housing and income generation projects such as papad production) meet practical gender needs, satisfying planners' goals of meeting 'women's' needs (1989:1804). She criticizes these measures for often making it more difficult for women to recognize and formulate their strategic gender needs (ibid). The line between strategic and practical gender needs may not be clearly defined in many cases, however. Ideally, in organizing to meet practical needs, women and other disadvantaged groups may gain self-confidence necessary to address strategic needs. In meeting practical needs that arise from inequitable relationships, disadvantaged groups may, in fact, be redefining the terms of that relationship.

4.3.3 'Environmental Projects' as avenues for participation

At the Indian Central government level, environmental concerns generally have received growing 'official' attention in recent years. During the Sixth Plan of 1980-85, an Indian Department of the Environment was established. As well, the constitution was amended and environmental protection and improvement was introduced in the Directive Principles of State Policy and the 'list of Fundamental Duties'. Environmental monitoring was strengthened and new legislation on forests and water pollution was enacted, including a requirement for environmental impact assessment on all major projects (GOI, 1985:5).

The Seventh development plan of 1985-1990 acknowledges:

The costs of environmental degradation are generally borne by those who do not benefit from the activities which cause the degradation. In this process it is the poor, who are least able to protect themselves, who suffer most. In rural areas, deforestation, soil erosion, flooding and waterlogging affect farmers more severely (GOI, 1985:5).

As well, the Seventh Plan of 1985-90 reveals that approximately one-third of the total geographical land area of India is subject to widespread erosion. An additional one-sixth of the land area is degraded due to waterlogging and alkalinity, ravines and shifting cultivation. In this Plan, it is estimated that six billion tons of soil and a further five to eight million tons of plant nutrients are lost annually through erosion and degradation (GOI, 1985:10). Most of the problems with erosion are caused by poor land management, particularly poor management of forests in upland areas.

Since 1952, National Forestry Policy has suggested that one-third of the total geographical area of India should be under forest cover. Recent forest cover estimates from the National Remote Sensing Agency, however, are well below that target (in the range of fifteen to twenty percent, with only seven percent being what is termed 'adequately forested') (Indian Express, March 31, 1990). The Seventh Plan states:

The reduction in forest cover has resulted in serious soil erosion and ecological damage on a scale leading to desertification, with serious repercussions on society, particularly in vulnerable regions such as the hill areas (GOI, 1985:16).

(One might add the heavily populated Plains areas of both Bangladesh and India to the list of vulnerable areas, as is evidenced by substantial increases in flooding in recent years -- a result of massive deforestation in the hills, particularly in the Himalayas.)

The Seventh Plan thus advocates the ambitious aim of achieving tree cover over one-third of the geographical area of India by the year 2000 (GOI, 1985:21).

To this end, a Social Forestry department has been established within the Indian Forestry Department. In Goa, this department is part of the 'Wastelands Development Scheme'.⁶ Chambers and Leach state that development of wasteland (degraded land) may present special opportunities for the poor:

Paradoxically, degradation is an opportunity for the poor, if it can be they who command and develop the degraded resources. The 35 million ha of degraded land in India are one such opportunity. Had the Forest Department protected it, and were it covered in a fine stand of trees, the practical potential for the poor would be less. As it is, the potential is immense for them to plant and own trees where few or none grow now and to have them as savings banks and insurance to back their livelihood strategies, enabling them to get out of debt and acquire other assets (Chambers and Leach 1987 cited in Chambers 1988:6).

Social forestry may offer the poor a means of gaining control over land that was previously unavailable to them.

At a formal level, social forestry is a means of involving communities in afforestation and forest protection. The objective is to raise quick-growing and other species to meet fuelwood, fodder and other requirements of the local rural population from forests in and around their villages to minimize pressure on existing forests. Concurrent aims are to maintain ecological balance and to create employment

⁶ Information about the Goan Social Forestry programme was obtained through a series of meetings with the Assistant Conservateur of Forests in Ponda in February and March 1991.

opportunities for the rural poor (GOG 1988:150). Social forestry may be of two types: community forestry, where trees are planted on community land, or farm forestry, where trees are planted on private land. In Goa, the social forestry programme is intended to be of the community forestry variety. The 'community' that is consulted, however, is the Comunidade. The Social Forestry Department does not like to deal with the Panchayat (the local political body), since the department feels that the Panchayat is corrupt and unreliable, bound by political expediency and therefore likely to misuse any funds that they might receive (Reddy 1991:pers.comm.). The Comunidade must sign over the land to be forested to the Social Forestry Department for twenty-five years. In return, the Comunidade shares fifty percent of the net proceeds from the harvest of the trees that are planted when they reach maturity. The financial benefits are shared only with the Comunidade. Employment at the plantation is available to the landless (who are not usually members of the Comunidade) at a rate of 18-25 Rupees per day, the same for men and women. This essentially means that it is women who are employed at the nurseries and plantations since men can receive a higher wage (40 Rupees) as day workers on road construction works. (Women's wages on road construction works vary from 20-25 Rs. per day.)

A field visit to a Social Forestry project in Ponda taluka in Goa with the chief social forestry officer was undertaken in March 1991. Established in 1989-90, acacia, casuarina, cashew, eucalyptus, jackfruit and other fruit trees were growing on formerly barren land. The predominant species by far, however, was acacia. The area is

fenced to keep out cattle and the fence is to be removed after four years. Grasses within the enclosure are cut and burned and a fire line is maintained to prevent fire from destroying the plantation. Two young boys are employed as 'guards' to keep cattle out; there had been no problem with local people cutting the young trees for fuel. There is a nursery at the social forestry office in Ponda, where 10,000 acacia seedlings are available for free distribution to people in Ponda. The officer repeatedly stressed the Social Forestry programme's employment benefits for the poor. Acacia is not a species that can be coppiced; therefore the only benefit to the landless, for the present, is employment. After eight years, the acacia will be harvested and the profits from the sale will be split evenly between the Comunidade and the Forest Department. Neither the department or the government through its census data have any reliable statistics about landlessness or near-landlessness in the communities.

The department has a 'micro plan questionnaire' to determine the community's forest needs. The Social forestry officer, however, said that the questionnaire is seldom used. Consultation tends to be informal, and any assessment of potential tertiary benefits such as improved water quality and quantity, soil protection or increased soil fertility are based on a visual assessment. When asked why the existing questionnaire was not used in assessing the needs of the villages involved in a social forestry project, the officer said that he felt a fifty percent effort on his part was sufficient and that a process of community consultation would be too slow. He added that there would be a problem because many of the villagers are illiterate, although he

did acknowledge that villagers might be more familiar with local tree species. With respect to assessing community needs, he was also of the opinion that women needed to be consulted separately from the men and mentioned concerns with male alcoholism and feni production (Goan cashew or coconut liquor) among women that he had spoken to (Reddy 1991:pers.comm.).

Acacia is the tree species of choice of the Social Forestry department, since it is quick-growing and grows well on barren land. This was certainly apparent at the social forestry site in Ponda: the three year old acacia stood at a height of approximately three metres. Acacia is known for its ability to fix nitrogen in the soil and therefore helps to increase soil fertility on barren land. Almost all of the social forestry projects in Goa have been undertaken on barren land. The stated intention of the Goan social forestry department is to plant other species besides acacia after eight years, once the first harvest has occurred. Since all of the projects were begun in 1986 and later, whether this will happen remains uncertain. If it is the Comunidade that remains in control of the land used for the social forestry projects, their interests undoubtedly will lie with the plantation of harvestable and saleable species rather than with species which may have multiple uses, but are slower growing, and that have been shown to reflect women's interests.

4.3.4 Participation through central government programmes: the reality

Despite ambitious aims to address issues of environmental degradation and the marginalization of women, the Indian government's commitment to change in developmental policy to this time has been piece-meal and inadequate. Environmental laws have not been strictly enforced and efforts to involve the rural poor, especially poor women, in rural development, that are made in one part of the Five Year Plan document are not backed up by substantive changes in how the economic 'pie' is divided up in the rest of the Plan. 'Community development' is considered to be something quite different from 'economic development'. Clearly, the issue of effective community participation is not being addressed adequately by the Indian planning community in its national plans. What is lacking in most nationally instituted programmes is any real form of accountability by the implementing agency outside the village or district (Zurbrigg 1984:141; Joseph and Desrocher 1984:28). Existing relations of power between the dominant elite and the poor are being supported through inadequate legislative policy enforcement. Modernization and rapid industrialization remain the ultimate objectives of the Indian planning community.

A methodological change in the planning process is called for. Issues of distribution and changing ownership of the means of production are important issues and must be addressed, not only through changes in the rhetoric of the planning document, but through concrete mechanisms to ensure that change is supported

through legislation that will be enforced. As well, further questions need to be asked. Especially, the question of who benefits and who does not through any developmental initiative must be examined. In the selection of a particular style of development and technology, whose interests are being served? In the selection of a development project (such as the 'Electronics City') whose needs are being met: those of non-local and/or local elites or those of local poor (Jain 1983:23). Development based on these issues becomes a question of social justice, defence of human rights and safeguarding cultural diversity (Goulet 1985:9).

Effective community participation may, in fact, be an entry point for changes to be made in the development process, since, in theory at least, participation may touch on many important issues -- especially issues of social and environmental degradation. Environmental issues may be a means of addressing the practical gender needs of women, an acknowledged disadvantaged group in Indian society and in ensuring that the needs of the rural poor are met. An empowered rural poor may then demand a commitment to equitable and sustainable development from the Indian Planning community.

The government has not defined community participation in terms of empowerment, such that the needs of the poorest adequately might be met, and that the poor might be given the tools with which to address their marginal position in Indian society. Most Goans have little say in decision-making processes at either the

state or national government levels. Consequently, many NGOs have taken on the task of working directly with the concerns of the poor, at a local level.

The next chapter will present a case study of a Goan non-governmental organization -- Goa Research Institute for Development. This environmental action group works with the poor to challenge measures implemented through Central and State government initiatives that are felt to be inappropriate at a local level.

CHAPTER FIVE CASE STUDY AND DISCUSSION

5.1 Introduction

This chapter will discuss the results of research undertaken in Goa, India. The chapter will begin by providing a conceptual framework for a discussion of action groups and their role in development processes. An analysis of a Goan action group -- Goa Research Institute for Development (GRID) -- follows. Primary research involved an evaluation of an environmental education programme that this non-governmental organization (NGO) had carried out in 1987. The programme had been discontinued, but was to be revived in future. Interviews were conducted in two villages that had participated in the 1987 environmental education programmes. Results will be discussed and GRID's potential to mobilise local people around issues of local environmental change will be explored.

5.2 The Context for NGO activity

In India, the penetration of the State into rural communities and the spread of industrialization have not benefitted the rural poor and in many cases have worsened their position (Everett 1986:17). Although knowledge of the extent of oppression

seldom reaches beyond the local context, it has been noted that poor people very often are aware of the causes of their poverty. As well, local people are often in possession of valuable knowledge about sustainable and equitable natural resource use. Although the poor may seem to accept or conform to inequitable patterns of daily life, this conformity could be the result of a kind of 'pragmatic resignation'. Such resignation may stem from the need to make a daily living or from the fear of repression -- remembered or anticipated -- rather than from consent or complicity with the existing dominant elite (Scott 1985:40). It thus becomes possible that the poor might support land reform, for example, when and if it were an option. Until that time, however, resistance is restricted to less visible forms, such as resentment of large landowners (ibid:326). It is not that the poor do not have an understanding of their problems; rather, they lack the confidence to act on them (Everett 1986:1).

Appearances of powerlessness, unawareness and acquiescence may be a condition of survival, for a chance of casual work, for the next loan from the trader, landlord or money-lender, for freedom from petty persecution and expropriation (Chambers 1984:106).

Almost universally, the experiences of poor peasants mean that they are familiar with change: small peasants can become both landless and 'proletarianised' (Huizer 1986:15). Although the poor may have trouble imagining any other social relation than that of dominant and dominated, most will not find it difficult to imagine a reversal of the distribution of status and rewards within the social system. Ritual

holidays (such as 'Holi'¹ and 'Carnival'² in Goa) break habitual codes of deference through a reversal of the existing social order. It is important to note that these rituals often get out of hand, prompting strenuous efforts by the dominant elite to eliminate or restrict them (Scott 1985:331; Scott 1990:80).

It can be argued that there is a kind of 'pre-revolutionary consciousness' inherent in acts of 'everyday' resistance. The inevitability of oppression through inequitable land distribution and other structural inequities can lead to forms of apparent apathy, which in fact can be relatively easily broken by any significant change for the worse or better. Thus, the potential for change is being generated at points of conflict and contradiction within the system (Addo 1985:10). Consequently, social change occurs as a shift in the balance between the dominant order and counter order and can be affected by the autonomous choices of ordinary people (Foucault 1983:224; Friberg and Hettne 1985:227-228).

The important question, then, is how can this potential for open resistance be transformed into active mobilisation that finally challenges the overall system (Huizer

¹ Holi, or Shigmo, as it is called in Goa, is a Hindu festival of forgiveness signified by the throwing of pink-coloured water on those with whom you have a grudge, after which sweets are exchanged and all is forgotten. It is usually celebrated with parades and fireworks.

² Carnival is a Christian festival held in Goa, a legacy of the Portuguese. Preceding the austere period of Lent, Carnival was originally a spontaneous, exuberant celebration in Goan villages. In recent years there has been much opposition to the appropriation of this festival by commercial interests to promote tourism in the State.

1986:18-19)? What is the role of outside leadership in mobilising this latent potential for social change?

5.3 Action Groups and Development processes in India

It has been estimated that there are thousands of voluntary agencies, NGOs and action groups in India, involved in a wide range of activities, including aid, development, health care, education, feminism, environment, human rights, conscientisation and organization (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:34). At a formal level, their only common characteristics may be that they are registered under the Societies Registration Act of 1861 as nonprofit, nonpolitical (in that they are not affiliated with any political parties) and nongovernmental. Most of these grassroots groups emerged after 1965 and are composed of radicalized, middle class youth working towards societal transformation (Sethi 1984:306). Their focus is the poorest and most oppressed groups, working to build coalitions to confront those in power: landlords, government officials or commercial interests (Everett 1986:18).

One of the major contributions of voluntary groups can be seen in their responsiveness to local situations. Working with neglected issues and populations, many voluntary groups tackle issues that are normally overlooked by both developmental and political organizations (Sethi 1984:309). Over time, many voluntary groups may undergo an evolution from development activities, to

conscientisation, to organization as they progressively come to view development in terms of people's awareness, conscientisation, mobilisation, organization and participation (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:51).

Based on work in India, Harsh Sethi classifies voluntary groups according to their organizational characteristics:

- 1) development/charity groups;
- 2) action groups that are primarily involved in processes of conscientisation, mobilisation and organization of oppressed people, without an explicit political purpose;
- 3) political groups that are similar to action groups, but with clearly defined political purposes and goals;
- 4) pre-party political formations whose purpose is to graduate to the level of party politics;
- 5) support groups that have specialized tasks, such as publishing journals, establishing documentation and resource centres or lawyers' forums, usually working in tandem with other groups (Sethi 1984:306).

This thesis will be concerned primarily with exploring the realm of the second group -- that of action groups. Within this realm, Sethi describes what he calls 'Semi-Political Action Groups' (SPAGs). These groups, although political in nature, function outside the framework of organized politics and parties.

They are a reflection of a growing disenchantment with traditional roles and organizations, and should be seen as attempts by the alienated sections to bring meaning and relevance into their activities (Sethi 1982 cited in Joseph and Desrochers 1984:41).

Generally working with the poor, their objective is empowerment and conscientisation through organization around specific issues (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:41-42).

Development is seen, not as a problem of efficient implementation and management, but as a struggle to establish the economic and political rights of the poor within the context of local ecological concerns, culture and education (ibid:52; Everett 1986:18).

SPAGs discard the 'top-down' model of development, creating alternative power structures and development models, such as ecodevelopment, that can ensure participation of the poor in decisions about their own future (Sethi 1978 cited in Joseph and Desrocher 1984:53). Rural poor are organized around issues that are central to daily life, such as subsistence rights, access to health care or violence against women (Everett 1986:18). Action of this kind is concerned with building a more equitable society and has enormous potential for organising the poor towards a goal of social change.

The impact and coverage of action groups may be limited, however, since they often work in isolation, organizing local people around issues of local importance. Development and/or conscientisation projects may therefore be difficult to extend or duplicate. As well, action groups are vulnerable to funding cutbacks which threaten their ability to continue their work, since they often may depend on the goodwill of the rich, or on 'outside' funding, usually international NGOs and governments (Joseph

and Desrochers 1984:54-55). Given the inherent 'macro constraints' in the Indian situation -- that of a strong, business and industry-oriented Central government -- small size threatens the very survival of action groups, making them vulnerable to attacks from local and national vested interests (Sethi 1984:309).

Everett offers a further criticism: since most activists are male, "gender issues have not been adequately integrated into the struggle against rural power structures" (1986:18). There is ambivalence over the importance of gender issues, and conflict over the impact of gender issues at the grassroots, especially among grassroots activists. A gender imbalance among activists ensures that women's concerns are given a lower priority than class or caste issues (Everett 1986:22). Men will sometimes use women for direct action in a struggle without consulting them when planning the action (ibid:19). Women's needs and interests are not being taken into account. Yet, it is poor women in particular that are most directly affected by the adverse environmental consequences that often have been the result of industrialization and modernization policies.

Everett offers several theoretical propositions that link feminism to grassroots movements. She contends that state, caste, class, tribal, regional and male oppression are interconnected and that male complicity perpetrates the overall system of oppression. Consequently, class, caste, tribal or regional struggle that does not take gender explicitly into consideration implies a transfer of power from one set of males

to another. Raising gender issues within grassroots movements, a necessary condition for women's empowerment, means that women must organize autonomously, at least to some degree. As well, she argues that the struggle for women's empowerment will increase the strength of the oppressed group, both women and men, in its struggle for power (1986:19).

A key to increasing women's participation in grassroots movements lies in increasing the number of women leaders at the village level. This could be facilitated by a more equitable gender balance among the activists themselves. but there are enormous obstacles to these changes (Everett 1984:22). For instance, in India, women, traditionally, have not spoken in public, and for women in leadership roles, travel outside their village will mean possible slander (for an example of how women's participation in social action can affect their reputation, see Sharma et al. 1985:189 and Jain 1984:1792) and that their husbands or fathers and brothers will have to assume housework and childcare responsibilities (ibid:23). Organizational factors thus become very important in the origins of women's participation. Especially, there must be a pre-existing communications network and infrastructure within a social base, as a prerequisite for 'spontaneous' activity (Freeman 1975 cited in Everett 1981:177). The Indian situation, however, is very complex. Language, caste, class, urban/rural, social and religious barriers make communication more difficult. Two potential networks do exist, however, that might facilitate organizational growth of women's groups: mahila mandals (or rural women's

associations) set up by both governmental and voluntary organizations as well as women's fronts of political parties (Everett 1981:177-178). It may be here that action groups could have their greatest organizational impact.

Many analysts view participation by small scale actors in the development process as something that takes place outside the macro policy arenas or, at the least, as something subordinate to upper level decision-making. To be truly successful, however, participation must be linked from the local, micro level to the core decision-making processes of national development strategies (Goulet 1989:160). This is a process that action groups may be in a position to promote. With respect to the politics of transformation or social change, Kothari states that 'macro' and 'micro' are only differential expressions of the same process (Kothari 1984:223). Action is needed on both fronts if effective change is to occur. Change becomes an ongoing process of struggle where both macro- and micro-level actions are important. Local consciousness and commitment may ensure that larger scale political movements remain responsive to local needs. On the other hand, micro-level action on its own cannot bring about large-scale structural change. Consequently, micro-level action should lead to macro-level involvement, which in turn will intensify micro-level participation. These two types of actions ideally reinforce one another and are augmented significantly if there is cooperation and contact between action groups at a regional and/or national level (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:61).

There may be obstacles to effective participation moving from the micro to the macro arena, however. Privileges and interests of the ruling elite may mean that they will strenuously support the status quo. As well, questions of effective scale of action mean that creative organizational and managerial innovations will be needed to transfer a successful micro-level initiative to the macro arena (Goulet 1989:167). How, then, can successful micro-level participation reach the macro arena? Goulet cites four necessary preconditions for this to happen:

- 1) a critical mass of micro actors and activities;
- 2) allies in the macro arena;
- 3) a cause to mobilise the poor (for example, often the poor will not fight the 'landlord' system but they will fight a particular landlord that they resent);
- 4) the powerful must be vulnerable to loss, for example, through electoral processes, if they deny entry to the new claimants (Goulet 1989:169).

Action groups in India may be able to facilitate the satisfaction of these criteria. Their work among disadvantaged groups usually focuses on specific issues or grievances that are particular to a time and place. Through mobilisation, 'everyday resistance' may take on a more visible form. Many action groups form alliances and contacts through broad-based umbrella groups in India. This combination of mobilisation of the poor and action groups' loose alliances on a regional and national level may mean that electoral processes could provide the poor with an effective lever -- the essential 'hinge' factor (Goulet 1989:145) -- to influence decision-making

by the dominant elite.

Huizer states that 'consciousness-raising' among poor peasants begins with small group meetings focused on local issues where people discover common worries and gain a measure of self-confidence through such exchange (1986:21). This stage begins a dialectical process of change that responds to the amount of tolerance or intolerance from the dominant group. The second stage of growth of the organization generally occurs in response to elite resistance to the first stage. This stage may be followed by support from urban-based allies, which in its turn is usually met with organized repression from the elites. Subsequent demands are often broadened to pressure for a more overall change in the rural power structure (for example, land reform) and may be supported by more radical means such as non-violent protest in the form of land invasions (ibid:22). It seems that in most instances, the best and most sustainable way forward will be through small efforts and 'little pushes' that occur time and again. These local manifestations of resistance may redefine the frontier for the relationship of power. Ideally, these small changes will support each other and gradually build together into a greater movement (Chambers 1983:190). Action groups may be a means of facilitating the kind of organizational growth that will lead to social change.

The main impact of action groups, then, may be in creating various pressure movements organized around specific issues (often environmental issues) which will

ensure greater participation of poor and marginalized people, especially marginalized women, in decision-making processes of development (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:75). It may be around these issues that action groups may be most successful in organising the poor to pressure the socio-political system for change. Action groups may be most effective as proxies or advocates for formerly powerless people in national and international policy arenas (Goulet 1989:186). Mobilisation of the poor may lead to demands for more equitable social structures that will facilitate meaningful participation in decision-making processes for all members of society, including the poorest.

5.3 Goa Research Institute for Development: a Goan action group

Research was undertaken in Goa from December 1990 through April 1991. Primary contact was with a small environmental action group called Goa Research Institute for Development (GRID)³. This NGO was established in 1984 as a support forum for already-initiated socio-political action in Goa (Devasundaram and Raj 1990:8). GRID is premised on a philosophy of ecodevelopment. Environmental parameters are taken as the starting point for development and people are the base. This kind of development is 'bottom-up', responsive to local environmental imperatives and local people's needs. Since the ecodevelopment approach is overtly

³ Unless otherwise noted, information in the remainder of this chapter is taken from discussions with GRID members, director Reggie Gomes and activists Bonnie Menezes and Zeferino Fernandes, or from personal experience during the research process itself.

political, GRID's objective is to challenge the dominant power structures in Goa and India, through an examination of the relationships between individuals and local and non-local social, economic and political structures, because it is these relationships that GRID perceives to be the major impediment to equitable development.

GRID developed from the involvement of the Bombay Urban Industrial League for Development (BUILD) in the fisherpeople's struggles of 1978 in Goa. Local fishers were opposed to the intrusion of mechanised trawlers into traditional fishing grounds. During the period from 1980 to 1984, Reggie Gomes of BUILD decided to work in Goa, outside the BUILD structure. He and other Goan activists reached a consensus about the need for a research and documentation centre as a support forum in Goa. The defined role of GRID, then, was to play a support and supplementary function to developmental intervention processes in Goa. GRID has since evolved to become an action group in support of on-going struggles, and its present structure includes a director (Reggie Gomes), two persons working in the documentation centre in Panjim, the capital city, and three activists who work on an ad hoc, mostly volunteer basis. The director and activists at GRID have a deep level of commitment to the struggle against inequitable development processes in Goa. Their commitment comes from the heart and is such that each has foregone other career opportunities to engage in this struggle.

As a research cell, GRID's objectives are to analyze issues of government

planning that affect the socio-economic life of local people and to propose alternatives benefiting the masses at large (Devasunaram and Raj 1990:8). To achieve this end, the activities of GRID have included the following:

- 1) documentation -- the collection, codification, compilation and publication of data on specific topics related to environment and development issues;
- 2) research/study -- specific enquiry in support of social action movements;
- 3) action programmes -- activities of non-institutional character such as coordination of parallel interventions in particular struggles or direct field involvement through surveys, for example; and
- 4) education -- direct awareness creation and information sharing processes (ibid:9).

Decisions at GRID are taken through a Board of Governors (required by any group registered under the Societies Registration Act in India). This board is comprised of three individuals, none of whom necessarily have any special qualifications for the position other than an interest in the issues and an affiliation with one of the founding members of GRID. As well, the board has general body members including activists working under the auspices of GRID.

Funding for GRID comes primarily from a German NGO -- Bread for the World -- and the Indian Ministry of the Environment. The question of funding raises important questions for an NGO such as GRID, that works within an ecodevelopment

framework, since there is a recognition that all acts are overtly political. To what extent does the receipt of government funding compromise programming, when, in large measure, that programming is based on opposition to government-sponsored development policies? To whom does GRID become accountable? However, funding such as GRID receives to support its environmental education programmes enables the organization to pursue its objectives of general education among the Goan public about issues of environmental degradation. It is a fine line to tread between maintaining ideals and extending the potential 'reach' of programmes. It should be noted that GRID's funding from the Indian Ministry of the Environment is designated solely for the environmental education programmes. Other NGOs in Goa have opted not to apply for, or accept, any government or other external support at all. Although this means that these organizations remain accountable only to their membership, it also means that the potential 'reach' of programmes remains very limited. Working outside of any institutional framework and within a very small budget limits the impact such groups may have on any level beyond the immediate geographic location and limits the political challenge that may be mounted. These issues present difficult dilemmas for action-oriented NGOs.

Research undertaken with GRID focused on GRID's fourth objective, that of education. The research took the form of an evaluation of an environmental education programme called 'Operational Programme on Environmental Sciences' or OPES, begun in 1986. The next section will discuss the research process.

5.4 The primary research process

The aim of the OPES programme is to create awareness of environmental issues in Goa in two ways: through a formal, two week series of lessons for high school students in the eleventh standard and a less formal format that is used to take the programme to villages.

OPES for high schools generally involves approximately 60 students each time, from various high schools in a particular district. Although many issues are discussed in a general way, students are involved in the discussion of issues of particular relevance to Goa, and are taken on two field trips -- one that is local and focuses on problems of urbanization, and a day-long outing to expose students to some of the other environmental issues important in the Goan context.

In January 1991, I participated in an OPES programme for high school students held in Margao, the regional capital of South Goa. Students participated from six different schools in Margao and the programme was held for two hours in the late afternoon after the regular school day had finished. The programme focused on a particular theme each day, including forests and wildlife, urban and rural environment, mining and sand extraction, industrial pollution, fisheries and mangroves, tourism, agriculture and allied industries, water resource management, energy and women and environment. A 'mini-field trip' was held on the third day and included a stop at a

squatter camp near the bus stand in Margao. The residents of the squatter camp were migrant workers from the neighbouring state of Karnataka and were presently involved in nearby road construction. Their living conditions were crowded and unsanitary. The children spoke to some of the residents and discovered that their water source was a broken pipe in a paddy field and that some people complained of frequent illness among their children. The programme organizers stressed to the children that it was important to question people in circumstances different from their own and not to make assumptions. The main emphasis of the discussion following this trip developed the idea that one must take it upon oneself to do something about inequities that were found. The students also participated in poster, essay and skit competitions. A field trip to South Goa completed the OPES programme. Highlights of the trip included stops at the Salaulim Dam and irrigation project and the consequent resettlement area, a drive through a forest reserve area, a stop at Palolem beach to see traditional fishers hauling in their nets and, finally, a stop to see the shell of the Agonda hotel, a development that had been abandoned because of local agitation. Students were able to talk to local people who had been involved in the struggle against the hotel development. Discussion among the organizers at GRID about the OPES curriculum following the completion of the high school OPES programme focused on two curriculum issues: that the introductory session to the programme be changed to give a broader evaluation of the nature of the environment and development crisis, both locally and globally, and that it include discussion of gender from the very beginning, as an integral part of the programme rather than as an 'add-on' at the end of the

programme.

The OPES for villages had been held in two years only -- 1986 and 1987 -- and was very different in its format. A proactive programme, it aimed to inform people about issues such as the consequences of large-scale industrial development in a rich agricultural area such as Goa. More than that, GRID hoped to initiate village organization among people who had been marginalized by processes of development and who had not had any effective voice in decision-making processes about issues that affect their lives directly. The village OPES focused on a particular issue important to the area and was held in each of approximately ten villages in the area that would be directly affected by the proposed developments. The programme would occur either in the morning or the evening, lasting for four hours. The programme would be introduced through a one hour talk by a resource person, which would cover some of the pertinent environmental issues in Goa and would be enhanced with visual aids (posters, slides). A lecture note would be given out to those able to read. Following the lecture, participants would be asked to share their concerns during a discussion session. There would be quiz and skit competitions for which there would be prizes. GRID had discontinued this programme in 1987, because of too few resources within the organization, but was hoping to revive it in 1992 or 1993. To this end, I undertook an evaluation of the 1987 OPES for villages.

The 1987 programme was focused around the creation of an 'Electronics City'

industrial development on the Verna Plateau. The Verna Plateau is part of a proposed Free Trade Zone and this development is being vehemently opposed by many groups in Goa. One of the activists from GRID took me up onto the Verna Plateau to see the construction that had already occurred for the Electronics City. There were several large buildings, one identifiable as a Bosch washing machine factory. Discussion with a building site manager revealed that washing machines were going to be produced for export only. Presently, India's main export market is Eastern Europe and the former Soviet Union. At this time we met local people who were using the land on the plateau to dry fish and to graze cattle. It was the dry season, so there was no cropping in evidence, although crops are grown on this land during the monsoon.

Discussion at the OPES programme centered on the adverse environmental and social impacts of the Electronic City development for local people. Post-programme evaluation showed a need for follow-up support by a full-time person, something that GRID had not pursued. In the villages of Curpavaddo and Quellosim, afforestation of barren hills above the villages emerged as a primary concern. Since the land belonged to the Comunidade institution, however, and the Comunidade did not agree to afforest the land, no action had been taken. It was therefore felt that there was a need for legal and administrative support from GRID in order for groups such as these to take action on issues.

I focused the evaluation in these two villages. This choice was based on

personal interest in afforestation issues, although the evaluation itself did not focus specifically on afforestation. The villages are located at the base of the Verna Plateau, beside the Zuari River, one of the largest rivers in the state. (see figure 4.2, page 84). Estimates from a health care worker in the area, suggested that there might be a combined total of two hundred and fifty households in the two villages. Census information did not provide separate information for the two villages. The people were primarily Christian Gauda, members of the 'Other Backward Classes'. The Gauda occupy a disadvantaged and marginal position in Goan society. It is hard to establish reliable figures for the number of Gauda in the area, since the Gauda are not acknowledged in the census. More than eighty percent of those interviewed were tenant farmers. Even in households that owned some land, some family members (usually women and children) would work seasonally in other people's fields.

In order to assess the OPES programme's development impact, the research instrument, given in chapter three, was derived from the following evaluation questions:

- 1) does this activity meet the felt needs of the villages?
- 2) has it resulted in 'development'?
- 3) are the benefits sustained?
- 4) what potential is there for 'spread' effects?
- 5) does the project concentrate on the weakest sections in society or is the emphasis on technical inputs?

- 6) who are the main beneficiaries? if not the poorest, why not?
 - 7) how are women's needs and interests articulated through the programme?
- (adapted from Fernandes and Tandon 1981:40,68; Agarwal 1986:39-40)

Secondly, I hoped to obtain information about local people's perceptions of development and change. How had recent industrial development affected their lives? If industrial development in Goa was viewed negatively by local people, what action, if any, was being taken to oppose it? What role (potential or actual) was there for the OPES programme to mobilise this opposition/resistance to change? These questions will be discussed in the next section.

Forty-two interviews were conducted on six different days over the period February 10 to March 10, 1991. Sunday was the best day to find people at home. Three people acted as interpreters/interviewers, each of them activists in Goa. Two were women from the organization Bailancho Saad, a feminist collective in the Goan capital city Panjim, the third was a man and member of GRID. All three interviewers did an excellent job, being sensitive and reflexive during the interview process. All were familiar with participatory research methods. Transcription of one of the interviews done by the male activist from GRID may support Everett's (1986:18-22) contentions about gender bias in voluntary groups discussed on page 122 in this chapter) in that male activists may not always be aware of the extent and role of women's participation in household labour:

Interviewer: Is your father not home? Ask him whether he knows...you have been cultivating the land... he must be in charge...

Respondent: No, he does not know. My mother does everything. But she is not home.

Interviewer: He should know about the owner of the land (February 25, 1991, interview F).

I would like to emphasize that this kind of exchange was not common in the other transcribed interviews. It is not my intention to denigrate the work done by this activist; I point it out merely to emphasize and support Everett's observations about possible gender bias in voluntary groups.

5.5 Results of the OPES evaluation

The most overwhelming response to questions of the OPES programme's effectiveness was that the programme had failed to meet its objective of facilitating organization around issues of environmental degradation. Especially, it was felt that there was not any follow-up to the programme (admittedly, GRID had acknowledged this lack in its own summary of the programme):

They just finished the programme and went away. there was no follow-up programme. They did not take any action (February 17, 1991, interview D).

I remember the slide show...planting trees...for every tree that is cut another tree should replace it so it brings rain. Nobody does it. There were no more speeches on this topic. People are educated by such speeches. You have come here after four years (March 3, 1991, interview A).

They wanted to start a programme to plant trees. So there was to be a follow-up to educate them, so they promised to come and do something. But they didn't (February 24, 1991, interview F).

When there was a group discussion they should have chosen a leader who could have formed a sub-committee to take the responsibility. But instead they completed the programme and went away. There was confusion; we thought they would do it and vice versa (February 17, 1991, interview E).

They said they would come back. Later they didn't come...To be effective the person should have had a follow-up programme at least two or three times (February 17, 1991, interview C).

To most of the participants, the OPES programme had represented another case of outsiders coming in to talk and show them 'pretty pictures'. Mobilisation was not one of the perceived objectives of the programme.

Another apparent problem with the OPES programme had to do with women's participation in it. Almost unanimously, it was agreed that the majority of participants had been women. In spite of this fact, women's voices were seldom heard at the meetings:

Women are told to keep quiet...even if women come forward, who listens to them (February 19, 1991, interview A)?

Interviewer: Did women also attend [the programme]?

Respondent: Yes...If they were asked questions they were responding. They didn't have much knowledge, but they answered what they comprehended.

Interviewer: But women work in fields so they must have knowledge about fields?

Respondent: They answered those questions (February 17, 1991, interview E).

There were many women present, but they didn't speak much (March 3, interview A).

The ladies here don't talk much. They feel shy (February 17, 1991, interview A).

Mostly the men were explaining. Women don't talk much, they feel shy...I feel there should be [a separate meeting for women] because when they are with men they don't talk much, they don't express themselves (February 17,

1991, interview B).

Both women and men were quite clear that women's voices were not heard in many of the arenas of public decision-making.

Overall, there was a feeling among the villagers that a programme such as the village OPES had enormous potential to affect an improvement in their lives:

Such programmes should be conducted regularly. Educated people left the village. There is nobody (February 24, 1991, interview G).

[The programme] could be held once or twice a year.

Interviewer: Would you do something afterwards?

I am ready (February 17, 1991, interview E).

The programme met a need, but it should be a continuous process. GRID should return, maybe every three to six months in the beginning to help to establish the process [of collective questioning] (February 17, 1991, interview F).

...people learn a lot [from such programmes] so they can think on their own (February 24, 1991, interview B).

Once they were aware of the objectives of the OPES programme, many of the people interviewed were very enthusiastic about its potential to facilitate a challenge to inequitable social structures that affected their lives.

Evaluating the 1987 OPES programme from the evaluation criteria listed on page 135 of this chapter, the programme appears not to have met the felt needs of the villagers in the following areas:

- 1) benefits such as village organization were not sustained or spread;
- 2) the programme attempted to focus on the weakest sections in the villages,

however, the methodology was not clearly thought out. Consequently, the main beneficiaries were not necessarily the poorest, or women in the village;

3) there was no effort to ensure that women's voices would be heard during the programme. It was assumed that the needs articulated by the men that attended the meeting necessarily reflected the needs of everyone in the village.

Despite this largely negative evaluation of the 1987 OPES programme for villages (these criticisms do not apply to the OPES programme for high school students), I feel, as the people interviewed did, that there is enormous potential for this programme to work towards a goal of supporting social change in villages such as these. GRID was well aware of the major shortcomings of the programme, mostly a result of there not being any follow-up whatsoever. Discussion with Reggie Gomes on April 10, 1991, following the completion of the interview process, centered around how this programme might be improved in future. The conclusions of that discussion included the following ideas:

Since the objectives of the OPES programme are to encourage formal and informal community organization, to get people talking about the issues, and that the village OPES should be focused on a specific issue rather than a general programme, there is a need to go to every village beforehand to find out (in a less formal way than I did, what the villagers perceive the issues to be.

This process was to be as participatory as possible, that is, the leadership was to be turned over to a village committee as soon as possible, and this aim was to be understood by all participants from the beginning.

It is necessary to involve the local Panchayat leadership to some extent, since there is a fear of alienating a potentially influential ally. It is important, however, that this 'official' participation be minimized in order to generate

confidence among presently powerless people.

Small-scale community action can have an effect on a more macro scale as a factor in consciousness raising. However, simultaneous action is needed on both the micro and macro level to break down inequitable structures. (Reggie Gomes told me of plans to initiate a socio-legal forum in Goa to create a more just social, political and economic environment. Meetings to create this forum began in April 1991.) (summary of comments made by Gomes 1991)

There was no discussion of how to integrate women more effectively into the OPES process at that time, but in previous discussions, I had suggested that GRID explicitly target women in its programmes and possibly consult with Bailancho Saad on how best this might be achieved. It is my belief that GRID must aggressively seek the participation of women on an equal footing with the men in the organization, that is, as activists and board members. At this time, there are no formal channels for addressing women's problems. Women, arguably, are the most disadvantaged among the poor in Goan society, given the disparity with men in wages and literacy, for example. If GRID's mandate is to reach the poorest in Goa, poor women's needs, as differing as they may be, must be explicitly addressed and valorized in GRID's activities. The evidence from the interviews clearly supports the contention that women are the prime caregivers in the South (see Boserup 1970 or Dankelman and Davidson 1988, for example). Not only women, but their children and the elderly, would benefit from such a shift in emphasis. As well, it is women who are responsible for most of the agricultural work. Said one woman respondent:

"[Women] work in the fields. They sow seeds, do replanting, remove weeds. They harvest crops." (February 19, 1991, interview B) One woman stated that she also did

the ploughing. As well, it is women who gather wood from the hill. Another respondent stated: "When I have no work to do, I am always on the hill [to get firewood]." (March 3, 1991, interview E) Consequently, it is women who may be in the strongest position to act on issues of adverse environmental change and inappropriate (from a local perspective) development.

5.6 Resistance and awareness of oppression

Through the evaluation process, the intention was to gain some insight about Scott's (1985; 1990) 'everyday resistance' in Goa and local people's awareness of issues of environmental degradation and development. However, I encountered several difficulties in the research process that made this information less accessible. Since I wanted to create a window on Scott's 'hidden transcript', I needed to develop a degree of familiarity and solidarity with the researched that I hoped might be facilitated through the use of a feminist participatory research methodology. Further, I felt that this methodology, as discussed in chapter three, reflected GRID's philosophy of empowerment and social change.

First, there was little evidence of village unity, in either of the villages in which the interviews were conducted and there were no autonomous groups. Class, caste and gender differences precluded mass organization around common interests. In describing research she undertook in India in the mid 1970s, Mies states:

It would have been impossible for us to mobilise and organize the scattered women, through the research project alone. Even if it is action-oriented, a research project on its own should not do such work (1983:137, emphasis in original).

Where autonomous groups do not exist, researchers can find themselves in "the typical research position of outsiders who have come to snoop around", no matter how participatory their intentions (ibid:137). To some extent, this is how the activists/interviewers and I felt when we went to the villages. On an initial visit, a village leader who was to be my introduction to the village, questioned me intensely about what I was doing. He was especially wary that I just wanted to 'study' them and to take that information away. Other villagers were also suspicious of us and consequently, it was Scott's 'public' transcript that was most visible. Only occasionally were there any glimpses of the hidden transcript. For the hidden transcript to be revealed, both the activists and I needed to spend more time in the villages to develop the necessary level of trust.

Second, that time was limited, partly because of my own self-imposed deadlines, and partly because of difficulties in getting transcriptions of interviews. It was a persistent difficulty, one that I was unable to resolve. In the end, I brought a partially transcribed set of interviews back to Canada. Ideally, follow-up contact with interviewees may have facilitated the development of a relationship of trust and familiarity between myself and the research subjects in the villages. Potential local leaders and local perceptions of problems could have been identified through the transcripts and the participatory research process could have continued.

In spite of these difficulties, there were instances of resistance and awareness of oppression that were revealed through the interview process. Most apparent was local people's awareness of oppression. With respect to the Electronics City development, respondents showed a clear understanding of the implications of the development for their lives and livelihood:

There are all kinds of problems. This is all farmland. Now outsiders have been given facilities. Lands were taken over and poor people were in crisis...Government has taken over and given it to an outsider...Cultivation was beneficial. They have destroyed the farmland. They are utilizing more water (February 17, 1991, interview C).

[The] landlord has property. He plans to sell it (March 3, 1991, interview D).

There is Electronics City on the top. We are here but who knows who they will hire (March 3, 1991, interview E)?

Whatever we were getting from the plot [sold by the landlord for the Electronics City development], we get it no more...it was filling our stomach...Plots are lost. Everybody has lost land (February 24, 1991, interview H).

Yes people complained. My brother-in-law went and vehemently told them that we cultivate the land and we need it for betterment. He told the collector. They let us have a small plot for planting. There are some land disputes for which solution has not been found (March 3, 1991, interview F).

...Now some factories are coming up over there. So we don't get too much wood since it has been cut down because of the factories (February 24, 1991, interview A).

Only when we cultivate [the land appropriated for the Electronics City development] will we benefit. Otherwise not. We can live on it when we cultivate it (March 3, 1991, interview G).

These concerns were very different from those of Comunidade members. Discussion with Comunidade officials about their concerns with the Electronics City land acquisition revealed that their primary grievance was that they were not receiving what

was considered to be a fair price for the land. Questions of livelihood were absent.

In spite of having an awareness of the source of their problems, villagers feel incapable of changing the situation:

About participation, after the whole day's work, I feel exhausted...Women are told to keep quiet...Even if women come forward, who listens to them (February 19, 1991, interview A)?

They had told us not to encourage the building of the factories which are done by cutting up the forests and the fields...What can I do? What can a lady do (February 17, 1991, interview B)?

I don't go for such programmes. If anything has to be done my son does it. I have never gone and I do not discuss anything with other people... I have not gone in midst of people and discussed any matter (February 19, 1991, interview B).

They discussed. But they do not have insight. What can they do? What can we do (February 17, 1991, interview C)?

People have no time, they go for work (March 10, 1991, interview F).

Who listens to us (March 10, 1991, interview A)?

Most people lacked confidence in their own ability to act. Especially, people were afraid of reprisal from landowners and employers:

...most people won't interfere...These men who are conscious are in politics and they bribe the people. If one does anything, they don't appreciate (February 17, 1991, interview P).

This statement was implicit in many of the responses to questions of possible action to fight the Electronics City development. Many people were afraid that overt action against landlords, government or the Comunidade might threaten potential

employment or livelihood opportunities.

Evidence of everyday resistance was revealed only occasionally. In order for the 'hidden transcript' of resistance to be disclosed to me as an outsider, a far greater level of trust would have had to have been established than happened. There were, however some glimmerings of 'everyday resistance', mostly in the form of flight. Flight, as identified by Scott (1985:29), may represent an individual strategy to cope with an inequitable or oppressive situation. Many Goans work in the Persian Gulf states, leaving families behind and many more aspire to join them. The jobs often are not glamorous and pay low wages, albeit higher than would be received in Goa. Many people borrow money in order to take up employment. One respondent had recently returned from Kuwait where she had been working for approximately one year as a 'domestic':

My first three months' salary I had to give to the agent, then because of the Gulf crisis I had to come down [come back to Goa]. I bought this gold chain out of the money I had. Also, I had 120 dinar of which I got 1800 Rupees (roughly \$200 Canadian at an exchange rate of 9.45 Rupees:1 dollar Canadian at the time of the interview) of Indian currency (February 24, 1991, interview A).

Many respondents spoke of family members working in the Gulf, primarily in Kuwait, Oman and Bahrain. The outbreak of war in the Persian Gulf in January 1991 was causing great hardship among many Goan families as many people had returned to Goa to face already high levels of unemployment and underemployment.

Further evidence of everyday resistance, taken from the interview transcripts,

relates the story of villagers getting together to fight the landlord:

Actually we mundkars [tenants] got together and filed a memorandum to the landlord saying suppose someone is sick -- in order to get a doctor or ambulance, we need a road here [from the main road to their houses]...He says he's not giving, that we should lift and carry our sick to hospital just as we are doing it. Before the path was still narrower. Now, recently, it has been made a little broad by us. Since the landlord is adamantly not giving us land, we try to do something on our own...Even after telling the landlord that the Panchayat is ready to construct the road if he would give us the land, he refused. Actually, if the road was constructed it would even benefit the landlord himself, because he's got this big property and coconuts. He could transport them back. Now they have to walk and carry the coconuts right up to that road (around 100 to 200 metres). I don't know why exactly he doesn't want to give us that road (February 24, 1991, interview E, emphasis mine).

The tenants were taking steps to remedy their situation, stopping short, however, of outright defiance of the wishes of the landlord.

Another example of 'everyday' resistance came on a second visit with a woman who kept health records (births, deaths, marriages, illnesses, etc.) for the villages. This woman pointed out that people had been expanding their houses against the direct orders of the landlord. Rather than expanding outward from the perimeter of the housing area, however, regulations for distance between dwellings were being violated. The landlord seldom came into the housing area. Through actions such as these, local people were challenging the dominant local power relationship, although this resistance again stopped short of open defiance.

One further glimmer of resistance came from a fish seller who became very agitated when asked about wood that was piled outside of her house. This woman

was unable to collect it herself because of poor health, but became quite confused when asked where she may have purchased it, or who may have gathered it for her. We did not pester her about this issue, but our suspicion was that the source of the wood was illegal, although we were never able to confirm that suspicion.

These statements seem to support Scott's thesis of the existence of 'everyday resistance' (1985; 1990). Admittedly, the evidence was not strong, especially given the circumstance of limited contact with the interviewees. Still, people indicated that they were employing methods of everyday resistance, and exhibited a remarkable understanding of the causes of their poverty. Discussion with activists at both GRID and Bailancho Saad confirmed not only the existence of everyday resistance, but also overwhelming evidence of people's awareness of oppression. People, however, generally were not aware of potential avenues for their protest. For the research process, had the interview transcriptions been available, follow-up contact could have allowed further discussion about problems as they were perceived by the interviewees and potential community leaders could have been identified. Further contact would have aided the development of a relationship of trust between the interviewees and myself.

The following section will explore to what extent an environmental education programme such as GRID's OPES programme could be a catalyst to mobilize this latent resistance and to organize villagers to struggle for social change.

5.7 GRID's potential to mobilise villagers to bring about social change

As an action group involved in a variety of activities, GRID has the potential to mobilize villagers around issues of environmental degradation, in order to challenge the frontier of power relations in Goa and India effectively. What is needed is greater grassroots involvement at the same time that pressure is being applied at local, regional and national government levels. GRID activists have been lobbying government officials on various issues, including the establishment of a rubber tire manufacturing plant and public violations by mining companies in Goa's mountainous regions.

Presently, however, there are organizational problems within GRID that militate against such a strategy. GRID's activities during 1990 and 1991 were limited to documentation and implementation of the OPES for high schools programme. Some initial action to support ongoing local struggles had been taken by some of the activists with GRID, but internal struggles at GRID, revolving around the composition and nature of the Governing Board, has meant that sustained action on the part of GRID in response to any requests for support from local Goan social action groups has been impossible. Most requests for support have been rejected by the Board, to the immense frustration of the GRID activists. Commitments to confidentiality preclude further disclosure as to the exact nature of the struggle with the Board. At time of writing (July 1992), there had been no word as to the outcome of this struggle.

In the meantime, the GRID activists have been acting on their own, in less institutionalized ways, to support other struggles. For example, in April 1991, one of the activists had been organising meetings throughout Goa and lobbying members of the Goan Legislative Assembly to mobilise support for protest against the construction of a rubber tire manufacturing plant by an Indian-American consortium. Thapar Dupont Limited is proposing to import discarded machinery for this factory from DuPont's West Virginia plant, using technology that is out-dated in the United States (the Nylon 6,6 process). Members of GRID were involved in the preparation of a Goan Legislative Assembly 'House Committee Report' in July 1990 that recommended that the plans for this proposal be abandoned. Despite the recommendations of this report, plans to build this plant have gone ahead and the necessary infrastructure constructed. Recent letters from the director of GRID indicated that GRID was under intense pressure to discontinue its support for this protest.

With respect to the OPES programmes for villages, previous village OPES programmes have not been truly participatory in nature: the problems being defined were those identified by the GRID activists and not the villagers themselves. There are local problems that became apparent through the interview process, for example, the need to line and protect polluted wells, action that was being blocked by the landlord, as well as the need for a road to a housing area cited as an example of evidence of resistance. Issues such as these might be good entry points for activism.

Villagers would be most easily organized around issues that affect their daily lives directly. Participation in such activism might serve to develop confidence among people who previously had no channels for their grievances. Participation of this nature might develop and strengthen the capabilities of poor and marginalized people to intervene directly in development initiatives and would be a dynamic process that could lead to empowerment for the participants. In other instances of activism, GRID has relied on local communities to identify local problems. Given the proactive platform of the OPES programme, GRID could make the process more participatory through consultation with villagers before the actual programme implementation, and by relying on local response to the programme in follow-up action to set the agenda for action. It is the lack of follow-up that has been identified as the main problem with the 1987 OPES programme for villages.

Mobilisation and participation by local people would be greatly aided by outside support, such as GRID could provide, at least in the beginning. Such support, after the initial intervention with the OPES programme, for example, might take the form of more frequent, less formal visits to the villages. In this way 'ordinary' people, not only local government leaders, would gain confidence to organize themselves to challenge the existing relations of power. As outside agents, activists in NGOs such as GRID, may bring fresh insight to local areas about power relations that have become institutionalized over time, and consequently, may appear to be inevitable. Attempts at organizing locally for a better life are, at the same time, a

struggle for the redistribution of power within the dominant social structures. Many of the villagers we interviewed were not even aware of the existence of GRID or Bailancho Saad. Clearly, these people will not avail themselves of the resource and support functions of either group in this situation.

The OPES programme itself might be a valuable tool in facilitating the process of mobilisation and organization. Poor people often lack the confidence to act in order to change inequitable power structures. The OPES programme's proactive agenda may serve as an entry point for outside organizers into the village. The OPES programme would facilitate a learning process for both activists and local people. Through participation in the programme, local people would become aware of the support function GRID could provide for social action. 'Everyday resistance' could be channelled to more overt forms of resistance to challenge inequitable social structures, such as unfair land tenancy arrangements. Follow-up from the programme could come in the form of support and advice for newly formed social action groups. Most importantly, it is imperative that female activists work to create women's networks, both formal and informal, to encourage rural women's mobilisation and organization. Activity of this nature on the part of GRID might mean a reassessment of priorities among its other activities. A huge commitment of time and resources would not necessarily be called for; rather, an increased commitment to grassroots organizing. If the process were participatory in nature, GRID activists would act in the capacity of advisors to support continued action on the part of the villagers themselves.

Leadership responsibilities would be turned over to the villages as soon as was feasible. Outside intervention may not always be necessary to initiate local action around issues of inequitable social relations. However, disempowered local communities may lack the confidence to initiate local action on their own. In these instances, intervention by outside agents, committed to participatory processes, may provide an impetus to mobilisation and organization.

Mobilisation around issues of environmental change will not necessarily translate into formal political participation for the villagers. But mobilisation and participation may mean that villagers will become aware of the potential of asking for change. Through mobilisation, villagers gain self-confidence. In an analysis of the participation of women in the Chipko movement in the Tehri Garwhal region of northern India, Kishwar states:

...each phase of participation represents an irrevocable step of some kind and does change somewhat the collective consciousness of women (1988:2762).

In a fundamental sense, in mobilising villagers, particularly women, around issues of most immediate concern to their everyday livelihood interests -- employment or securing cultivable land, for example -- GRID would be addressing these villagers' immediate 'practical needs' (Moser 1989; Molyneux 1985). Participation would be a means of defending their livelihood. In a less tangible sense, mobilisation and participation through GRID's OPES programme may be a means of addressing the villagers' strategic needs vis a vis the dominant classes, through education and

organization of villagers to have a say in government and institutions that affect their lives. As well, women's 'strategic gender interests' in society at large could be addressed (ibid). Enhancing women's environmental consciousness and their confidence in their ability to act may in fact lead to a redefinition of gender relations within the villages.

GRID may be able to act to 'oil the hinge' between micro and macro policy arenas. GRID's approach, based on a philosophy of ecodevelopment, means that political awareness is focused on issues of environmental change. Lobbying efforts at the government level and organization and action at the grassroots level around issues such as appropriation of land for the Electronics City development may provide the most sustainable way forward, "through small efforts and little pushes that occur time and again" (Chambers 1983:190). GRID's activists are already lobbying at State and Central government levels. Local responses to seemingly local conditions may have national or international reverberations, since local development may depend on externally imposed industrial development, as in the case of the Electronics City (Shiva 1986:137). GRID has affiliations with other local and regional NGOs throughout India. As a coalition, such as has been formed to fight the Narmada Basin

development⁴, these small groups together may pressure for change through electoral processes at local, state and central government levels. In this way, GRID may be able to facilitate satisfaction of Goulet's criteria for successful transfer of micro level action to the macro arena (Goulet 1989:169, discussed on page 125 of this chapter).

Government institutional responses to environmental and social questions in India have been ad hoc and piece-meal, addressing the symptoms and not the causes of the problems. Government policies clearly have failed to meet the needs of the poor in Goa, and in India. Questions of who benefits from any development process, and who gets access to which resources and for what purposes have not been addressed adequately. Action groups such as GRID offer a new vision and a new way forward that may benefit local people.

⁴"The Sardar Sarovar dam being constructed...on the Narmada river, when ready, will submerge 37000 hectares (ha) of land under 9.5 billion cubic metres (cu m) of water out of which only 5.7 billion cu m will be actually usable. It will also displace people, pollute groundwaters and destroy grasslands and forests. However, it will generate 1,450 mw of electricity, which estimates reveal will be all used by tube-wells to flush out excess salts from the region" (Kumar 1990:23). A coalition of more than one hundred NGOs has been formed to oppose this development.

CHAPTER SIX CONCLUSION

This thesis has represented an exploration of an empowering research framework and methodology. The results do not present a definitive statement; rather, they discuss an exploration of an alternative development framework that potentially may offer the poor a means of addressing inequitable developmental structures that affect their lives and livelihood. An overt political stance has served as the connecting theme between the research framework and research methodology. Participation has been presented as the key component of empowerment for the poor, both through the research process itself, and within the context of 'development'.

6.1 Comments on the research methodology: feminist participatory research

GRID's philosophy of ecodevelopment is based on empowerment of marginalised people and social change. This process is dynamic and to be understood needs a methodology that is reflexive and flexible, since methodology informs what is learned during the research process. Scott's (1990) 'hidden transcript' will not be revealed unless the researcher develops a degree of familiarity and solidarity with the researched that is not possible within the traditional Social Sciences research

framework. Participatory research has emerged from the experience of researchers confronting the politics of their research, since all research exists within relations of power (Mohanty 1988:62). Traditional research, in its politically neutral stance, is supportive of the status quo, accepting political and social structures as givens and therefore reinforcing the powerlessness of the researched (Maguire 1987:15). Since control and production of knowledge is a means of changing power relations, researchers must ask themselves whether their research supports the status quo, or whether it supports the empowerment of marginalised people.

Researchers working within an empowering research methodology such as feminist participatory research, however, are faced with many contradictions. First, traditional research in the South, because of colonialism and neo-colonialism, has generally reflected a relationship of dominance of Northern researcher over Southern researched (Mies 1983:119). Feminist participatory research explicitly attempts to overcome this hierarchical relationship. The intent of the research process is non-hierarchical and reciprocal. However, relationships defined by class, race and country of origin cannot be overcome unilaterally. Even for women researchers who may share the experience of sexism with some of the researched, as academics we share academic, elite privilege that is largely reserved for men, and we come from an imperialist country. This is not easily overcome in the eyes of marginalized people. Research that is undertaken with an already established group or NGO with whom there has been established a degree of solidarity may change the power dynamic

between researcher and researched. In the case of the research for this thesis, the members of GRID were educated and politicized. All were extremely sensitive to the colonial shadow in traditional research method. I fully believe that we established a reciprocal relationship of trust and respect. The same cannot be said for the relationship between myself and the villagers interviewed during the OPES evaluation. Partly, this is the result of the amount of time spent in the villages, and partly, it reflected my position as the 'Other' -- the North American woman that had come to study them. I was unknown and to some extent unknowable in the villages, a function of my race and country of origin. In this instance, I do not believe that this relationship could have been overcome effectively in the context of an M.A. research 'project'. Maria Mies has stated:

...uninvolved 'spectator knowledge' must be replaced by active participation in actions, movements and struggles for women's emancipation. Research must become an integral part of such struggles (1983:124, emphasis in original).

Researchers must be active participants in social movements with the researched, something that is difficult to establish from 'scratch', especially in the context of a research thesis.

The relationship between researcher and researched is further complicated when Northern researchers arrive fully funded, with money and time to study the lives of people who live thousands of miles from their home. Researchers have certain responsibilities to the funding agencies, and that shapes and affects the research enterprise. How do obligations to academic or other institutions shape the research

enterprise? I arrived in Goa to find that the groups I had hoped to work with were no longer (and possibly never had been) in existence, despite what I had read in Canada. In redefining my research, I felt very constrained by the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA) research award that I had received. The director of GRID had some exciting ideas for research which I did not feel free to pursue because of the nature of my original proposal to CIDA, and I did not feel that there was time enough to correspond to have the new ideas approved, given the limited time of my stay in Goa. Consequently, the changes in my research topic were guided by predetermined conditions, rather than the interests of GRID.

Further, the 'view from below' that we get through participatory research, has ethical and political significance (Mies 1983:123). Mies contends that, for researchers working in the South:

Perhaps [mobilization and organization] should not even be attempted: the researchers usually leave the area after a certain period of time and the women who are left behind will have to face the political consequences of their mobilization (1983:137).

Given the time constraints for an M.A. thesis such as this, the pressure to produce written work that conforms in some degree to accepted academic standards, precludes the time commitment and involvement necessary to facilitate the mobilisation of the 'view from below', even for urban-based women in the South (Mies 1983:137). Mobilisation from 'below' may encounter harsh resistance from 'above'. To be successful, mobilisation that is initiated by participatory researchers must be actively supported in the face of opposition.

Sandra Kirby and Kate McKenna develop this point further:

It is the rare researcher who can do full justice to a research question if there is no experiential basis from which to begin...Researching from the margins is best accomplished by those who live on the margins...Because they experience the world differently, they have a better sense of which research questions need to be addressed (1989:105).

An exception to 'insider' research may be found in collaboration with people close to the experience of the research, when the researcher takes direction for the focus and questions from her collaborators and clearly identifies her experiential self at the beginning of the research process (Kirby and McKenna 1989:105), as, for example, may happen when research is undertaken with NGOs already active in the community. What happens, then, if research is undertaken with a research partner in the country or area in which the researcher is working? Does a graduate student have the flexibility necessary to make it a true collaborative effort? Will there be a time when a thesis may be co-authored by the graduate student and her research partner? Although I consulted with GRID extensively about the research project, my need to ensure that academic criteria were met in order to fulfil the requirements of an M.A. thesis meant that final control of the project remained with me for the duration of the evaluation of the OPES programme.

This leads to discussion of the question of 'cultural appropriation'. What role should a white Canadian researcher have in research processes in another culture? Should only Indians (Goans?) do research about India (Goa)? Is an upper class urban

Indian woman necessarily any more able as a researcher, merely by virtue of her country of origin? I see much room for exchange and sharing of knowledge, as well as for solidarity. My conviction that there is much to be gained from cross-cultural exchange, and that structural problems between North and South cannot be solved by the South alone, however, has been challenged as just another expression of cultural hegemony and the Northern colonial attitude that we have the 'right' to be a part of the process. These are tough questions. Cultural sensitivity must be balanced with attention to who speaks for and represents a particular cultural viewpoint. In any cultural context, whose gender and class interests are represented? Homogeneity in any gender, class, race or cultural grouping must not be assumed (Maguire 1987:210).

The question of the researcher's responsibility to the researched -- in this study, especially to the people in the villages that we interviewed -- is an issue that has been difficult to resolve. I was quite aware, at least on some intuitive level, of the potential effect that my research could have on the lives of those from whom I gathered information. This awareness took on different urgency during the research process. Expectations were raised among the people who were interviewed. During successive visits to the villages where the interviews were done, people we had already spoken to approached us to voice their excitement about what we were doing and what it might mean for them. However, my funding and time were limited and difficulties with obtaining interview transcriptions meant that our presence in the villages basically ended. GRID's involvement was partly a result of my enthusiasm for it, so once I

left, GRID gave it up, mostly because they were deeply involved in other struggles. It is a small organization and resources are limited. The OPES evaluation was completed, but it had been intended by me that the evaluation would lead to other action in the villages. I am in fairly frequent contact with GRID through letters. But, as far as I know, GRID has not had any further presence in the two villages where the interviews occurred, and I certainly have not. Ethically, we had/have a responsibility to the people we interviewed. We led them to believe that something would come from their participation in this project. But, I am in Canada, and GRID is involved in other struggles. A village leader had questioned me intently at the beginning of the research process about why I wanted to 'study' them, and although I assured him that it was not my intention to simply do that and take the information away, essentially that is what has happened.

To what extent, then, was my research with GRID 'participatory'? The intent of the research was participatory, with GRID, in that it was consistent with GRID's philosophy and was a collaborative effort with the director and activists. My time frame curtailed this project, however, and I am the one who is in control of what information will be used and how, at least for now. I should stress, though, that making my research participatory with GRID was not my intention in the beginning. I wanted my research to be participatory with the villagers I interviewed. That turned out to be unrealistic, however, and I changed the focus of the research to examine the potential of an ecodevelopment based NGO to facilitate social change. Perhaps that is

part of the flexibility of a methodological approach such as feminist participatory research. But, as a consequence of the change of focus, Scott's (1990) 'hidden transcript' in the villages remained mostly hidden to me. In retrospect, I would say now that my research was best restricted to an examination of GRID, the organization. There were fewer barriers to understanding: language, education and ideology were common among us. To have achieved a level of reciprocity in the villages whereby a participatory research framework could have been implemented effectively would have required an initial 'settling in' period that was not feasible within the parameters of an M.A. thesis. Maguire (1987) spent one year working at a home for battered women before undertaking the research which forms the basis of her book about feminist participatory research.

Almost everything I had been able to read about participatory research before attempting my research had been based on research undertaken in North America, in situations where the power dynamics, although still very much an issue, were not of the same nature as they are when working in a North-South context. The North-South relationship creates a whole new set of issues for a participatory researcher which need to be considered in a much more systematic way.

Perhaps the ideal situation for a successful participatory research project in the context of an M.A. thesis may be found in the collaboration of an outside researcher working in solidarity with a group already active in a movement for social change.

The 'outside' perspective may bring a new perspective to on-going work. The researcher's energy and enthusiasm may act as an impetus for research that may be mutually beneficial.

6.2 Comments on the theoretical framework

Resistance to dominant structures among the poor, despite 'pragmatic resignation', manifests in subtle forms such as foot dragging, slander and flight (Scott 1985:25). Power relations depend on the existence of a multiplicity of points of resistance everywhere in the power network, each a special case, and often mobile and transitory (Foucault 1983:212). 'Everyday resistance' such as this sustains resistance and may be a building block for more institutionalized action against inequitable structures. For this everyday resistance to be revealed, however, a window on the 'hidden transcript' is needed (Scott 1985:286).

The existence of everyday resistance confirms that the poor are aware of the local causes of their oppression. For example, in Goa, large-scale industrial development and the development of mass tourism are changing the face of the state radically. During the interview process for my research, it became clear that local people are well aware of the negative effects of this kind of development on their livelihood and way of life. They feel incapable of changing it, however.

Action groups working within a framework of ecodevelopment offer a potential means of mobilising 'everyday resistance'. Ecodevelopment means that every action is recognized as being political in nature. Consequently, an ecodevelopment-based action group not only organizes people, but 'sides' with them. Questions of both local and non-local power structures are addressed. Having an awareness of both the 'macro' and 'micro' situation, action groups may be in a position to spread critical awareness among those left out or victimized by development.

An ecodevelopment perspective also means that the environment becomes the base from which all development begins. The key question for development becomes this: who gets access to what resources and for what purpose (Agarwal 1987:17)? Environmental parameters are clearly defined -- the economy is ecologized (Colby 1990:24). Often, the marginalization of the poor is reflected in diminished access to critical resources, or environmental degradation such as forest destruction and soil loss. External control of resources often has meant that the needs of outsiders are met while local sustainable food systems have been undermined (Redclift 1987:87). This appears to be the situation with respect to the Electronics City development on the Verna Plateau in Goa. Local people's control of and/or access to land on the plateau that was formerly used for livelihood pursuits has been usurped by large-scale industrial interests.

Access to key resources and decision-making fora are key to meaningful

participation in development processes for local people. This question is overtly political. Consequently, the environmental consequences of developmental processes may represent potent issues around which to organize the poor, since environmental degradation often may affect their livelihood directly. Action groups may become proxies or advocates for formerly voiceless people in 'macro' decision-making fora. NGOs such as GRID may facilitate the creation of action groups among the poor in order that they may work on their own behalf. Development thus becomes a struggle to establish the political and economic rights of the poorest (Joseph and Desrochers 1984:52; Everett 1986:18), rather than a problem of implementation or management of policy.

Most of the support for an ecodevelopment framework is found in small-scale, locally-based groups, like GRID, that are committed to activism and social experimentation (Sachs 1990:vi). Since the poor are often aware of their oppression through inequitable power relationships with the dominant classes, such small-scale action may have value. Action groups may thus facilitate a social learning process of self-reliance. Attempts at organizing locally are, at the same time, a struggle for the redistribution of power, and challenge the frontier of local and non-local power relations. Small, geographically separate movements, may in time, merge, providing the poor with the 'hinge' to transfer action from the 'micro' arena to the 'macro' through pressure in electoral processes. Action groups, through their support and mobilisation of formerly disempowered people, may work to 'oil the hinge', from the

'micro' to the 'macro' policy arenas, organizing advocacy movements around specific issues to pressure the socio-political system for change. In this way, grassroots responses to seemingly local conditions can have global reverberations (Shiva 1986:257).

Given the failure of government policies to meet the needs of the poor in India, local organizing may represent the best way forward to ensure that the needs of the poor are met. Institutional responses to issues of environmental change clearly have been inadequate, addressing the symptoms, not the causes of environmental degradation. Structural inequities have not been addressed, ensuring that poor people's interests will continue to be marginalized. Small scale ecodevelopment based action that supports empowerment of the poor may provide the best way forward to challenge the effective frontier of power relations. Action groups such as GRID support grassroots mobilisation while at the same time lobbying government and institutions.

What has been lacking in the ecodevelopment framework to this time is any analysis of gender issues. For example, GRID was not an explicitly feminist organization. My research was informed by a feminist framework and my intention was to focus on the differential impacts of development for women and men in the communities in which the research was conducted. Although GRID's aim was empowerment of Goa's poorest, the focus was not on women. It was assumed that development or empowerment for the community would necessarily benefit women

and men equally. Consequently, I found myself treading a fine line between being frustrated with GRID's gender blindness and great admiration for the level of commitment to social change and improvement of the lives of the poorest.

Feminism and ecodevelopment need not be mutually exclusive ideological standpoints. Ecodevelopment represents an alternative development framework that recognizes the heterogeneous nature of communities and processes. Feminism also recognizes this heterogeneity. A feminist ecodevelopment would recognize gender as one of the frontiers of power relations within communities. This recognition would ensure that women's interests would be acknowledged and the needs of all members of communities could be met.

6.3 Concluding remarks

Policies of industrial development and modernization in India have led to many environmental changes that have been reflected in widespread marginalisation of the poor and increasing disparity between rich and poor. These processes affect poor women most acutely. The needs of the poor have not been addressed, and continue to be marginalized in development and planning processes. Small scale action may provide the poor with their only means of voicing their concerns for now, given the bureaucratization and institutionalization of developmental processes in India. GRID's activities have focused on local resistance and struggles against forms of social

domination, and class and feudal relations, while at the same time relating the struggle to macro structural constraints. Such activity has tremendous potential to meet the needs of Goa's poorest. The key to ensuring that development will benefit all members of society, not only those with access to land and capital, lies in a participatory development and decision-making process, whereby there is open access to decision-making fora. Ecodevelopment based action groups, such as GRID, may be in a position to facilitate this kind of participation. The Gandhian tradition means that there is a precedent for decentralized and environmentally conscious development in India. GRID's present activities are focused on documentation. Internal problems with the Board of Governors have meant that the director and activists have had little latitude for action. A re-priorizing of activities may mean that GRID's potential, to ensure that the needs of the poor are met, will be enhanced.

Research that ensures access to the research process for participants may support such a redistribution of decision-making, that the poor may become full and active participants in development. That there are no hypotheses to prove and no experimental groups to influence means that feminist participatory research attempts to provide an overt and mutually interactive process between researcher and researched (Kirby and McKenna 1989:104). The researcher's key responsibility and ultimate accountability is to the participants. In this way, local knowledge about resources and processes may be given voice and local people involved in the creation and use of knowledge. This empowering process may enable the poor to mount effective

challenges to the frontier of power relations. Whether participatory research works in the long-term, however, will depend on the creation of resources and organizational structures to sustain collective action and reflection over time, and to link up the myriad of small-scale actions already in existence worldwide (Maguire 1987:198). This organizational requirement is no small challenge.

The line between participatory research and ecodevelopment based action is often blurred, since both are dependent upon the full and active participation of formerly disempowered groups and individuals. With respect to feminist participatory research, Maguire states:

Participatory research is time consuming, demanding and troublesome. The accomplishments and rewards are often small in scale. Perhaps the primary lesson for me is that redistribution of power and empowerment of people are not events, but rather long haul struggles. These processes require both tangible and intangible resources, including determination, respect and a profound belief in people's ability to grow, change and create change. The temptation is to dismiss or underestimate our efforts because they do not appear long-term, transformational, radical or important enough. The challenge is to celebrate our collective accomplishments, however small, and nurture ourselves as we move, however slowly and imperceptibly in the direction for social justice (Maguire 1987:198-'99).

Although she is discussing feminist participatory research in this passage, the issues that she raises apply equally well to a participatory development framework such as ecodevelopment. It is the process of empowerment, both through development processes and the research process, that takes on importance. It is in such small-scale action as may result from participatory processes in both research and development efforts that truly equitable social structures may be created.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Addo, Herb. Development as Social Transformation: Reflections on the Global Problematique. Boulder: Westview Press. 1985.
- Agarwal, Anil and Sunita Narain. "Village Ecosystem Planning." Drylands Networks Programme Issues Paper. No. 16. New Delhi: Centre for Science and Environment. March, 1990.
- Agarwal, Anil and Anita Anand. "Ask the Women who do the Work." New Scientist. 4 Nov., 1982. pp. 302-304.
- Agarwal, Bina. "Rural Women, Poverty and Natural Resources." Economic and Political Weekly. Vol. XXIV, No. 43. Oct. 28, 1989. pp. WS-46-WS-65.
- Agarwal, Bina. "Who sows? Who reaps? Women and Land rights in India." Journal of Peasant Studies. Volume 15, no. 4. 1987-88. pp. 531-581.
- Agarwal, Bina. "Under the Cooking Pot: the Political Economy of the Domestic Fuel Crisis in Rural South Asia." IDS Bulletin. Volume 18, no. 1. 1987. pp. 11-22.
- Agarwal, Bina. Cold Hearths and Barren Slopes: the Woodfuel Crisis in the Third World. Maryland, USA: Riverdale Co. Inc., Publishers. 1986.
- Alfonso, Ave Cleto and Tensing C. Rodrigues. Tourism in Goa: Socioeconomic Impact. New Delhi: Institute of Social Sciences, Manuscript Report two. 1989.
- Amin, Samir. "A Propos the Green Movement." in Addo, Herb. op cit. pp. 271-281.
- Angle, Prabhakar S. Goa: An Economic Review. Bombay: The Goa Hindu Association Kala Vibhag. 1983.
- Athreya, Venkatesh. "Literacy: Emerging Trends." Frontline. April 13-26, 1991. pp. 40-44.

- Bahuguna, Sunderlal. "Women's non-violent power in the Chipko Movement." Manushi. No. 7. 1981. pp. 129-133.
- Bahuguna, Sunderlal. "Chipko: the People's Movement". The Chipko Movement (brochure). Madras: Reliance Printers. December, 1986. pp. 1-12.
- Bandarage, Asoka. "Women and Development: Liberalism, Marxism and Marxist-Feminism." Development and Change. Volume 15. 1984. pp. 495-515.
- Bandyopadhyay, J. et al., eds. India's Environment: Crises and Responses. New Delhi: Natraj Publishers. 1985.
- Bandyopadhyay, Jayanta and Vandana Shiva. "Political Economy of Ecology Movements." Economic and Political Weekly. June 11, 1988. pp. 1223-1232.
- Banerjee, Nirmalee. "The Weakest Link." IDS Bulletin. Volume 12, no. 3. 1981. pp. 36-40.
- Bartlemus, Peter. Environment and Development. Boston: Allen and Unwin Incorporated. 1986.
- Baruah, Nilim. Environmental Sector Study -- India. (unpublished document) Ottawa: CIDA. August, 1988.
- Baruah, Nilim. The Gandhian Approach to Development. Unpublished Master's Thesis. Carleton University. 1986.
- Berremen, Gerald D. "Chipko: Nonviolent Direct Action to Save the Himalaya." South Asia Bulletin. Vol. V, No. 2. Fall 1985. pp. 8-13.
- Blaikie, Piers. "Environment and Access to Resources in Africa." Africa. Vol. 59 (1). 1989. pp. 18-40.
- Boserup, Ester. Integration of Women in Development: Why, When, How? United Nations Development Programme. 1975.
- Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein. Theories of Women's Studies. London and New York: Routledge and Kegan Paul. 1983.
- Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein. "Introduction: Theories of Women's Studies and the autonomy/integration debate." in Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein. op cit. pp. 1-26.

- Buvinic, Mayra et.al. "Behind the Scenes: A Content Analysis of the Interviews." in Huston, Perdita, ed. Third World Women Speak Out: interviews in six countries on change, development and basic needs. New York: Praeger. 1979. pp. 127-148.
- Centre for the Protection of Goa's Environment. Handbook on Environment for General Public: Conservation and Development Issues. Palolem, Goa: Centre for Protection of Goa's Environment. 1988.
- Chambers, Robert and Melissa Leach. "Trees to Meet Contingencies: Savings and Security for the Rural Poor." ODI Social Forestry Network. Network Paper 5a. October 1987.
- Chambers, Robert et.al. To the Hands of the Poor: Water and Trees. Boulder and San Francisco: Westview Press. 1989.
- Chambers, Robert. "Sustainable Rural Livelihoods: A key strategy for people, environment and development." in Czech, Conroy and Miles Litvinoff, eds. The Greening of Aid: Sustainable Livelihoods in Practice. London: Earthscan Publications. 1988. pp. 1-17.
- Chambers, Robert. Rural Development: Putting the Last First. Sussex: Longman Scientific and Technical Press. 1983.
- Chen, Martha A. "Women's Work in Indian Agriculture by Agro-Ecological Zones." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XXIV, No. 43. Oct. 28, 1989. pp. WS-79-WS-89.
- Chen, Marty. Strategies to increase the economic productivity of Rural Women: Experience from India and Bangladesh. (unpublished paper) Ottawa: CIDA. October, 1983.
- CIDA. Women in Forestry: Case Study of the Andhra Pradesh Social Forestry Project --India. (Draft Copy) Ottawa: CIDA. March, 1990.
- CIDA. Women in Development Profile for India. Ottawa: CIDA. May 1990.
- CIDA. Review of the Situation of Women in India. Ottawa: CIDA. n.d.
- Colby, Micheal E. Environmental Management in Development: the Evolution of Paradigms. World Bank Discussion Paper no. 80. Washington: The World Bank. 1990.

- Commoner, Barry. "Environmental democracy is the Planet's best hope." Reprinted in The Utne Reader. July/August, 1990. pp. 61-63.
- Cooper, Frederick. "Urban Space, Industrial Time and Wage Labour in Africa." in Struggle for the City: Migrant labour, capital and the State in urban Africa. New Haven: Yale University Press. 1983. pp. 7-50.
- Copely, Antony. Gandhi. New York: Basil Blackwell Ltd. 1987.
- Dandekar, Hemalata. "Indian Women's Development: Four Lenses." South Asia Bulletin. Spring, 1986. pp. 25-29.
- Dankelman, Irene and Joan Davidson. Women and the Environment in the Third World. London: Earthscan. 1988.
- Dasmann, R. "Achieving the Sustainable Use of Species and Ecosystems." Landscape Planning. Vol. 12. 1985. pp. 211-219.
- Daugherty, H. et al. Ecodevelopment and International Cooperation. Ottawa: CIDA. 1979.
- DAWN. "Alternate Visions, Strategies and Methods." Women's World Journal. No. 6. pp. 15-19.
- DeBeauvoir, Simone. "The Second Sex: A Not-So-Rebellious 'Other'." in Rossi, Alice S., ed. The Feminist Papers. New York: Bantam Books. 1974. pp. 672-705.
- Del Vasto, Lanza. Gandhi to Vinoba. New York: Schocken Books. 1974.
- Devasundaram, Alex and Mohan Raj (facilitators). Participatory Institutional Assessment -- GRID. April 9-13, 1990.
- Diamond, Irene and Lee Quinby, eds. Feminism and Foucault: Reflections on Resistance. Boston: North East University Press. 1988.
- Diamond, Irene and Lee Quinby. "Introduction." in Diamond, Irene and Lee Quinby. op cit. pp. ix-xx.
- DN and GK. "Sexual Division of Labour." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XXIV, No. 34. Aug. 26, 1989. pp. 1949-1950.
- DN. "Reservations for Women in Panchayats." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XXIV, No. 23. June 10, 1989. pp. 1269-1270.

- Dogra, Bharat. "World Bank's Poverty Increasing Projects Suvarnarekha and Narmada." NFS -- India. January, 1991. pp. 1-10.
- Dreze, Jean. "Poverty in India and the IRDP delusion." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XXV, No. 39. September 29, 1990. pp. A-95-A-104.
- Drijver, C. "People's Participation in Environmental Projects in developing countries." Landscape and Urban Planning. Vol. 20. 1991. pp. 129-139.
- Drijver, Carel. People's Participation in Environmental Projects in Developing Countries. Issues Paper, No. 17. Leiden, The Netherlands: Dryland Networks Programme, Centre for Environmental Studies. March, 1990.
- Driscoll, Kathleen and Joan McFarland. "The impact of feminist perspectives on research methodologies in the Social Sciences." in Tomm, Winnie. op cit. pp. 185-191.
- DuBois, Barbara. "Passionate Scholarship: notes on values, knowing and method in feminist Social Science." in Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein, eds. op cit. pp. 192-209.
- Duelli Klein, Renate. "How to do what we want to do: thoughts about feminist methodology." in Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein, eds. op cit. pp. 88-104.
- Emel, Jacque and Richard Peet. "Resource management and natural hazards." in Peet, Richard and Nigel Thrift, eds. op cit. pp. 49-76.
- Everett, Jana. "'We were in the forefront of the fight': Feminist Theory and practice in Indian grassroots movements." South Asian Bulletin. Vol. 6, no.1. 1986. pp. 17-24.
- Everett, Jana. "Approaches to the 'Woman Question' in India: From Maternalism to Mobilization." Women's Studies International Quarterly. Vol. 4, No. 2. 1981. pp. 169-178.
- Falconer, Julia. "Forestry Extension: A Review of the Key Issues". ODI Social Forestry Network. Network Paper 4e. June 1987.
- Fals-Borda, Orlando. "The Challenge of Action Research." Development. Volume 1. 1981. pp. 55-61.
- Farver, M. Taghi and Bernhard Glaeser. "The Politics of Ecodevelopment: A Cart before the Horse?" in Glaeser, Bernhard. op cit. pp. 169-194.

- Fernandes, Walter and Rajesh Tandon, eds. Participatory Research and Evaluation: Experiments in Research as a Process of Liberation. New Delhi: Indian Social Institute. 1981.
- Fleming, Sue. "Between the Household: Researching Community Organization and Networks." IDS Bulletin. Volume 22, no. 1. January, 1991. pp. 37-43.
- Food and Agriculture Organization. Tree Growing by Rural People. Rome: FAO. 1985.
- Fortmann, Louise P. and Sally K. Fairfax. "American Forestry Professionalism in Third World." Economic and Political Weekly. Vol. XXIV, No.32. August 12, 1989. pp. 1839-1844.
- Foucault, Michel. "Afterword: the subject and power." in Dreyfuss, Hubert L. and Paul Rabinow, eds. Michel Foucault: Beyond Structuralism and Hermeneutics. Chicago: University of Chicago Press. 1983. pp. 208-226.
- Foucault, Michel. "Method." in History of Sexuality: An Introduction, Volume One. New York: Random House Inc. 1980. pp. 92-102.
- Foucault, Michel. "Two Lectures." in Gordon, Colin ed. Power/Knowledge: Selected Interviews and other Writings, 1972-1977. New York: Pantheon Books. 1980. pp. 78-108.
- Friberg, Mats and Bjorne Hettne. "The Greening of the World -- Towards a Non-Deterministic Model of Global Processes." in Addo, Herb. op cit. pp. 204-270.
- Friedman, John. "The Active Community: Toward a Political-Territorial Framework for rural development in Asia." Economic Development and Cultural Change. Volume 29. 1980-81. pp. 234-261.
- Fugelsang, Andreas. "The Myth of People's Ignorance." Development Dialogue. no. 1-2. 1984. pp. 43-62.
- Gadgil, Madhav. An Approach to Ecodevelopment of Western Ghats. Discussion Paper for the Workshop on Ecodevelopment of Western Ghats. Trivandrum. May 11-13, 1984.
- Gandhi, M.K. Non-violence in Peace and War -- Vol.II. Ahmedabad: Navajivan Publishing House. 1949.
- Gandhi, M.K. An Autobiography. Ahmedabad: Navajivan Press. 1927.

- Geiger, Susan N. G. "Women's Life Histories: Method and Content." Signs. Volume 11, no. 21. pp. 334-351.
- Ghosh, Sujit Kumar. "Gandhian Call of 'Back to the Village' and Planning from Below." Economic Affairs. Volume 22. 1977. pp. 361-367.
- Glaeser, Bernhard and Vinod Vyasulu. "The Obsolescence of Ecodevelopment?" in Glaeser, Bernhard. op cit. pp. 23-38.
- Glaeser, Bernhard and Surindar Suri. "Environmental Goals and Development Needs of the Third World: the Example of India." in Glaeser, Bernhard. op cit. pp. 137-156.
- Glaeser, Bernhard, ed. Ecodevelopment: concepts, projects, strategies. Oxford: Pergamon Press. 1984.
- Goa Research Institute for Development, eds. House Committee Report on Nylon 6,6 Project. Prepared by the House Committee appointed by the Goa Legislative Assembly. Published courtesy of Navhind Times, Panjim, Goa. November 1990.
- Government of Goa (GOG). Statistical Pocket Book of Goa 1987-88. Panjim: Government Printing Press. 1988.
- GOG. Rural Development Agency -- Goa: Guidelines for availing its assistance. Panjim: Casa Fernandes. 1987.
- GOG. Gazeteer of the Union Territory Goa, Daman and Diu. Panjim: Government Printing Press. 1979.
- Government of India (GOI). Census of India 1991, Series 6, Goa: Provisional Population Totals. Panjim: Government Printing Press. 1991.
- GOI. India 1990. New Delhi: Ministry of Information and Broadcasting. September, 1990.
- GOI. Handbook of Policy and Related Documents on Women in India. New Delhi: National Clearinghouse for Information on Women, Women's Development Division, National Institute of Public Co-operation and Child Development. 1988.
- GOI. Seventh Five Year Plan 1985-1990 -- Volumes I and II. New Delhi. October, 1985.

- GOI. District Census Handbook: Goa District, Daman District and Diu District -- Village and Town directory. Panjim: Government Printing Press. 1983.
- Goldsmith, Edward. "Dear President of the World Bank." Development: Seeds of Change. Vol.3. 1985. pp. 35-38.
- Goulet, Denis. Incentives for Development: the Key to Equity. New York: New Horizons Press. 1989.
- Goulet, Denis. "The Global Development Debate: The Case for Alternative Strategies." Development and Peace. Vol. 6. 1985. pp. 5-17.
- Gupta, Avjit. Ecology and Development in the Third World. New York: Routledge Press. 1988.
- Hall, Budd. "Participatory Research: An Approach for Change." Convergence. Volume XIII, no. 2. 1975. pp. 24-30.
- Harding, Sandra, "Introduction: Is there a feminist method?" and "Conclusion: Epistemological Questions." in Feminism and Methodology. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press. 1987. pp. 1-14 and pp. 181-190.
- Harris, Ishwar. "Sarvodaya in Crisis: The Gandhian Movement in India Today." Asian Survey. Volume 27(9). 1987. pp. 1036-1052.
- Harris, Ishwar. "The Bhoodan Movement: An Investigation into Vinoba Bhave's Legacy." Asian Thought and Society. Volume XI, No. 32-33. July-November, 1986. pp. 165-183.
- Harrison, Paul. "Stone Lines or Earth Dikes." New Internationalist. May 1988. pp. 20-21.
- Higgott, Richard A. Political Development Theory. Kent: Croom Helm Ltd. 1983.
- Heyser, Noeleen. "Towards a Framework for Analysis." IDS Bulletin. Volume 12, no 3. 1981. pp. 3-7.
- Hoskins, Marilyn. "Community Forestry depends on Women." Unasylva. Vol. 32, No. 130. 1982. pp. 27-32.
- Huizer, Gerrit. "Peasant Movements Reacting to Pauperization: The Dialectics of Liberation." in Misra, R.P. and Nguyen Tri Dung, eds. Third World Peasantry: A Continuing Saga of Deprivation, Volume One. New Delhi and Bangalore: Sterling Publishers Private Ltd. 1986. pp. 13-59.

- IDRC. Participatory Research in IDRC. Ottawa: unpublished document. n.d.
- Jacquette, Jane. "Women and Modernization Theory: A Decade of Feminist Criticism." World Politics. Volume 34. 1981-82. pp. 267-284.
- Jain, Devaki. Development as if Women Mattered. (lecture delivered at OECD/DAC meeting, Paris) January 26, 1983.
- Jain, Devaki. Integrating Women in Development Planning -- the Indian Model. New Delhi: Social Studies Trust. 1982.
- Jain, Shobhita. "Women and People's Ecological Movement: A case study of Women's role in the Chipko movement in Uttar Pradesh." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XIX, No. 41. October 13, 1984. pp. 1788-1794.
- Johnston, R., D. Gregory, D. Smith. The Dictionary of Human Geography, 2nd edition. Oxford: Basil Blackwell. 1986.
- Joseph, George and John Desrochers. Development, Human Rights and Action Groups. Bangalore: Centre for Social Action. 1984.
- Juyal and Vikasbhai. "The Gandhian Approach to Development, Part 2 -- in practice." Ideas and Action. 129(3). 1979. pp. 17-24.
- Kahn, Herman et.al. The Next 200 Years: a scenerio for America and the world. New York: Morrow Publishers. 1976.
- Kantowsky, Detlef. Sarvodaya: the other Development. New Delhi: Vikas Publishing House Pvt. Ltd. 1980.
- Kapoor, I. M.K. Gandhi's Alternative and India. unpublished M.A. thesis, Carleton University. 1986.
- Kirby, Sandra and Kate McKenna. Experience, Research and Social Change: Methods from the Margins. Toronto: Garamond Press. 1989.
- Kishwar, Madhu. "Nature of Women's Mobilisation in Rural India: an Exploratory Essay." Economic and Political Weekly. Vol. XXIII, No. 52 and 53. Dec. 24-31, 1988. pp. 2754-2763.
- Korten, David. Getting to the 21st Century: Voluntary action and the Global agenda. Connecticut: Kumarian Press. 1990.

- Korten, David C. "Community Organization and Rural Development: a Learning Process Approach." Public Administration Review. Vol. 5. 1980. pp. 480-511.
- Kothari, Rajni. "The Cultural Roots of Another Development." Seeds of Change. Vol. 3/4. 1981. pp. 80-82.
- Kothari, Rajni. "Environment and Alternative Development." Alternatives. Vol. V. 1979-80. pp. 427-475.
- Krolick, Stanford and Betty Cannon. Gandhi in the "Postmodern" Age: Issues in Peace and War. Golden, Colorado: Colorado School of Mines Press. 1984.
- Kumar, R. Ashok. "Narmada Dam: Do we need it?" 2001. September, 1990. pp. 23-27.
- Lacy, Creighton. The Conscience of India. New York: Holt, Reinhart and Wilson. 1965.
- Lather, Patti. "Feminist Perspectives on Empowering Research Methodologies." Women's Studies International Forum. Volume 11, No. 6. 1988. pp. 569-580.
- Lisk, Franklyn, ed. Popular Planning for Basic Needs: Concepts, Methods, Practice. (Chapters 1 & 2) New York: St. Martin's Press. 1985.
- Mackenzie, Fiona. "Development from within? The struggle to survive." in Taylor, D.R.F. and Fiona Mackenzie. op cit. pp. 1-32.
- MacNeill, Jim et al. Beyond Interdependence: the meshing of the world's economy and the earth's ecology. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press. 1991.
- Maguire, Patricia. Doing Participatory Research: a Feminist Approach. Amherst: Centre for International Education, University of Massachusetts. 1987.
- Maguire, Patricia. Women in Development: An Alternative Analysis. University of Massachusetts: Centre for International Development. 1984.
- Martin, Biddy. "Feminism, Criticism and Foucault." in Diamond, Irene and Lee Quinby. op cit. pp. 3-19.

- Mazumdar, Vina. Traditional Women and their Integration in Modern Development: an Inquiry into two models in India. New Delhi: Indian Council of Social Science Research. n.d.
- McCall, Michael. "The implications of Eastern African Rural Social Structure for Local-level development: the case for Participatory Development based on Indigenous Knowledge Systems." Regional Development Dialogue. Volume 9, no. 2. Summer, 1988. pp. 41-72.
- McCalla Vickers, Jill. "Memoirs of an Ontological Exile: The Methodological Rebellions of Feminist Research." in Miles, Angela and Geraldine Finn, eds. Feminism in Canada: from Pressure to Politics. Montreal: Black Rose. 1982. pp. 27-45.
- McCormack, Thelma. "Feminism and the new crisis in methodology." in Tonn, Winnie. op cit. pp. 13-30.
- McCormack, Thelma. "Development with Equity for Women." in Black, Naomi and Ann Baker Cottrell, eds. Women and World Change: Equity issues in development. Beverly Hills and New York: Sage Publishers. 1981. pp. 15-31.
- Merton, Thomas, ed. Gandhi on Non-violence. New York: New Direction Publishing Corporation. 1964.
- Mies, Maria. "Towards a methodology for feminist research." in Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein, eds. op cit. pp. 117-139.
- Mies, Maria. "The Dynamics of the Sexual Division of Labour and Integration of Rural women into the World Market." in Beneria, Lourdes, ed. Women and Development: the sexual Division of Labour in Rural Societies. New York: Praeger Publishers. 1982. pp. 1-28.
- Mishra, G.P. "Gandhian Model of Rural Development: A Retrospect and a Prospect." Economic Affairs. Volume 22. 1977. pp. 372-383.
- Misra, R.P. "A Critical Analysis of the Traditional cost-benefit Approach to Economic Analysis." Development: Seeds of Change. Vol. 3/4. 1981. pp. 51-59.
- Misra, B.P. and V.K. Narraj. "India: Blending Central and Grass Roots Planning". in Stohr, W.B. and D.R.F. Taylor, eds. Development from Above or Below? John Wiley and Sons. 1981. pp. 259-279.

- Mohanty, Chandra. "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." Feminist Review. Volume 30. 1988. pp. 61-87.
- Mohanty, Manoranjan. "Changing the terms of discourse: A Poser." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XXIV, no. 37. pp. 2069-2072.
- Molyneux, Maxine. "Mobilization without emancipation? Women's Interests, the State, and Revolution in Nicaragua." Feminist Studies. Volume 11, No. 2. Summer, 1985. pp. 227-251.
- Moore, Sally Falk. "Introduction" and "Epilogue." in Moore, Sally Falk. Social Facts and Fabrications: Customary Law on Kilimanjaro, 1880-1980. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 1986. pp. 1-12 and pp. 320-329.
- Moser, Carolyn. "Gender Planning in the Third World: Meeting Practical and Strategic Gender Needs." World Development. Volume 17, No. 11. 1989. pp. 1799-1825.
- Moser, Carolyn and Kate Young. "Women of the Working Poor." IDS Bulletin. Volume 12, no. 3. 1981. pp. 54-62.
- Mulakala, Anthea. Women as Agents of Transformation: The Inter-Island Traders of Agricultural Produce in the Caribbean. Unpublished Master of Arts thesis, Carleton University, Ottawa. 1991.
- Muntemba, Shimwaayi. "Research for Sustainable Development: the Role of NGOs." Development. Vol. 2/3. 1989. pp. 65-67.
- Myrada, A.P.F. "NGOs in South Asia: People's Participation and Participation." World Development. Volume 15. 1987. pp. 39-49.
- n/a Update. published by the Narmada Bachao Andolan, Badwani, Madhya Pradesh. June-July, 1990.
- n/a Forest Management Partnerships: Regenerating India's Forests -- Executive Summary of the Workshop on Sustainable Forestry. New Delhi: Sept. 10-12, 1990.
- n/a "Of forests and people." Economic and Political Weekly. June 18, 1988.
- n/a. "Forestry Projects: How Women can Help -- and Help Themselves." Appropriate Technology. Vol. 9, No. 3. December, 1982. pp. 13-15.

- Naik, J.P. "Development and Gandhian Tradition in India." Review of Politics. Volume 45. 1983. pp. 345-365.
- Nakhre, Amrut, W. "Peace Action as Peace Education: An Analysis of Satyagraha on Participants". Bulletin of Peace Proposals. Volume 12(2). 1981. pp. 205-214.
- Nelson, Nici. Why has Development Neglected Rural Women? Willowdale: Pergamon of Canada. 1979.
- Newman, Robert S. "Appendix III, Goa: The Transformation of an Indian Region." in n/a. Tourism as a Religious issue. Baga, Goa: proceedings from conference held February 1-10, 1989. pp. 1-13.
- Norgaard, Richard B. "Sustainable Development: A co-evolutionary view." Futures. Vol. 20, nos. 4-6. 1988. pp. 606-620.
- Oakley, Ann. "Interviewing Women: a Contradiction in terms." in Roberts, H., ed. Doing Feminist Research. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul. 1981. pp. 30-61.
- Oakley, P. and D. Marsden. Approaches to Participation in Rural Development. Geneva: International Labour Organisation. 1984.
- Oakley, Peter. Projects with People: the practice of participation in rural development. Geneva: ILO. 1991a.
- Oakley, P. "The concept of Participation in Development." Landscape and Urban Planning. Vol. 20. 1991b. pp. 115-122.
- Omvedt, Gail. Women in Popular Movements: India and Thailand during the Decade of Women. Paris: UNRISD. 1986.
- Omvedt, Gail. "Ecology and Social Movements". Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XIX, No. 44. Nov. 3, 1984. pp. 1865-1867.
- Omvedt, Gail. "On the Participant Study of Women's Movements: Methodological, Definitional and Action Considerations." in Huizer, Gerrit and Bruce Mannheim, eds. The Politics of Anthropology. The Hague and Paris: Mouton Publishers. 1979. pp. 373-393.
- O'Riordan, Timothy. "The challenge for Environmentalism." in Peet, Richard and Nigel Thrift, eds. op cit. pp. 77-102.

3 of/de 3

PM-1 3 1/2"x4" PHOTOGRAPHIC MICROCOPY TARGET
NBS 1010a ANSI/ISO #2 EQUIVALENT

PRECISIONSM RESOLUTION TARGETS

PIONEERS IN METHYLENE BLUE TESTING SINCE 1974

MicroD

1000 COUNTY ROAD 6, SUITE 100, SAN ANTONIO, TEXAS 78207 USA
TEL: 512 683 7800 FAX: 512 683 7801 TUL 910000000

- Pandungkarn, Chakrit N. "People Centred Development as a Social Development Concept: Resistance and Hurdles to Overcome." in Social Development Alternatives. UN Centre for Regional Development. pp. 261-273.
- Parekh, Bikhu. "Gandhi's Concept of Ahimsa." Alternatives. Volume XIII. 1988. pp. 195-217.
- Peet, Richard and Nigel Thrift, eds. New Models in geography: the Political Economy Perspective, Volume one. London: Unwin Hyman. 1989.
- Pereira, Rui Gomes. Goa Vol. II: Gaunkari - the old village associations. Panaji: Printwell Press. 1981.
- Plant, Judith, ed. Healing the Wounds: the Promise of Ecofeminism. Toronto: Between the Lines. 1989.
- Pomerleau, Christine. Women in Forestry: Case Study of the Andhra Pradesh Social Forestry Project -- India. Ottawa: Draft copy of report to Canadian International Development Agency. March, 1990.
- Power, Paul F., ed. The Meanings of Gandhi. Honolulu: The University Press of Hawaii. 1971.
- Prieswerk, Roy. "Cultural Identity, Self-reliance and basic needs." Development: Seeds of Change. Vol. 3/4. 1981. pp. 83-91.
- Redclift, Micheal. "Sustainable Development and the Market: A framework for analysis." Futures. Vol. 20, nos. 4-6. 1988. pp. 635-650.
- Redclift, Micheal. Sustainable Development: Exploring the Contradictions. London: Routledge Publishers. 1987.
- Redclift, Micheal. Development and the Environmental Crisis: Red or Green Alternatives? London and New York: Methuen and Co. Ltd. 1984.
- Richards, Glyn. The Philosophy of Gandhi. London and Dublin: Curzon Press Ltd. 1982.
- Riddell, Robert. Ecodevelopment. England: Gower Publishing Company Limited. 1981.
- Rigby, Andrew. "Practical Utopianism: A Gandhian Approach to Rural Development in India." Community Development Journal. Volume 20. 1985. pp. 2-9.

- Rodricks, L.M. FTZs: Cat's Paw or Beachheads of Imperialism? Bombay: BUILD Documentation Centre. 1985.
- Roy, Ramishray. "One True World or Many: A Gandhian Perspective". Alternatives. Volume XII. 1987. pp. 291-321.
- Roy, Ramishray. Self and Society: A Study in Gandhian Thought. Delhi, Beverly Hills, London: Sage Publishers. 1985.
- Sachs, Ignacy and Dana Silk. Food and Energy: Strategies for Sustainable Development. Tokyo: United Nations University Press. 1990.
- Sachs, Ignacy. "The Strategies of Ecodevelopment." Ceres. (17) 4. 1984. pp. 17-21.
- Sachs, Ignacy. "Preface." in Glaeser, Bernhard. op cit. p. vi.
- Sachs, Ignacy. "Environment and Development Revisited: Ten Years after the Stockholm Conference." Alternatives. Vol. VIII. 1982. pp. 369-378.
- Sachs, Ignacy. "Gandhi and Development: A European View." in Galtung, Johan et al. Self Reliance: A Strategy for Development. London: Bogle L'Ouverture Publications Ltd. 1980. pp. 45-57.
- Sachs, Ignacy. "Environment and Styles of Development." African Environment. Vol. 1. 1974. pp. 9-33.
- Sachs, Ignacy. Political Economy of Environment: problems of method. Paris: Ecole Pratique des Hautes Etudes and Mouton and Co. 1972.
- Savara, Mira and Sujatha Gothoskar. "An assertion of Womanpower: Organizing Landless Women in Maharashtra." in Kishwar, Madhu and Ruth Vanita, eds. In Search of Answers: Indian Women's Voices from Manushi. London: Zed Books Ltd. 1984. pp. 134-149.
- Scott, James C. Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts. New Haven and London: Yale University Press. 1990.
- Scott, James C. Weapons of the Weak: Everyday Forms of Resistance. New Haven and London: Yale University Press. 1985.
- Sen, D. and P.K. Das. "The Management of People's Participation in Community Forestry: Some Issues." ODI Social Forestry Network. Network Paper 4d. June, 1987.

- Sen, Gita and Caren Grown. Development, Crises and Alternative Visions. New York: Monthly Review Press. 1987.
- Sen, Ilina, ed. A Space Within the Struggle: Women's Participation in People's Movements. New Delhi: Kali for Women. 1990.
- Sethi, Harsh. "Groups in a new Politics of Transformation." Economic and Political Weekly. Vol. 19 (Jan.-Mar.). 1984. pp. 305-316.
- Sethi, J.D. Gandhi Today. Durham, N.C: Academic Press. 1978.
- Shah, G. "The Gandhian Approach to Rural Development, Part 1." Ideas and Action. 125(6). 1978. pp. 3-6.
- Shah, Parmesh and Andrew Weir. "Approaches to Social Forestry in Western India: Some Aspects of NGO Experience." ODI Social Forestry Network. Paper 5b. London: Agricultural Administration Unit. October, 1987.
- Sharma K., B. Pandey and K Nautiyal. "The Chipko Movement in the Uttarkhand Region, Uttar Pradesh, India: Women's role and participation." in Mumtemba, Shimwaayi. Rural Development and Women: Lessons from the Field, Volume II. Geneva: ILO. 1985. pp. 173-193.
- Sharma, Sudesh Kumar. "Rural Development in India: Programmes, Strategies, Perspectives." Community Development Journal. Volume 15. 1980. pp. 2-9.
- Shepard, Mark. Gandhi Today: A Report on Mahatma Gandhi's Succesors. Arcata, California: Simple Productions. 1987.
- Sheth, D.L. "Grass Roots Initiatives in India." Development. Volume 2. 1984. pp. 22-26.
- Shiva, V. and J. Bandhyopadhyay. "The Evolution, Structure and Impact of the Chipko Movement." Mountain Research and Development. Volume 6, Number 2. 1986. pp. 133-142.
- Shiva, V. and J. Bandhopadhyay. "Environmental Conflicts and Public Interest Science." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XXI, No. 2. Jan. 11, 1986. pp. 84-90.
- Shiva, Vandana et al. "Social Forestry -- No Solution within the Market." The Ecologist. Vol. 12 (4). 1982. pp. 158-168.

- Shiva, Vandana. Staying Alive: Women, Ecology and Development. London: Zed Books. 1989.
- Shiva, V. "Development: the 'New Colonialism'." Development. (1) 1989. pp. 84-87.
- Shiva, V. "Ecology Movements in India." Alternatives. XI. 1986. pp. 255-273.
- Sinha, Arun. Against the Few: Struggles of India's Rural Poor. London and New Jersey: Zed Books Ltd. 1991.
- Small, Dele. "Reflections of a Feminist Political Scientist on Attempting Research in Aotearoa." Convergence. Volume XXI, no. 2/3. 1988. pp. 85-94.
- Stamp, Patricia. Technology, Gender and Power in Africa, Technical Study no. 63E. Ottawa: IDRC. 1989.
- Society for Participatory Research in Asia. "Empowering Women: Organizational Models." Women in Action. Volume 2. 1989. pp. 3-7.
- Socio Economic Data Division, International Economics Division of the World Bank. Social Indicators of Development, 1989. Baltimore and London: The John Hopkins University Press. 1989.
- Stanley Foundation. Environment and Development: breaking the ideological deadlock. Report of the Twenty-first UN Issues conference. Feb. 23-25, 1990.
- Stanley, Liz and Sue Wise. "'Back into the Personal' or: our attempt to construct 'feminist research'." in Bowles, Gloria and Renate Duelli Klein, eds. op cit. pp. 192-209.
- Starke, Linda. Signs of Hope. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press. 1990.
- Stephens, Alexandra. "Yes Technology is Gender-neutral, but...women in Asia might not agree." Ceres. 108. Nov./Dec., 1985. pp. 32-35.
- Swaminathan, Padmini. "Science and Technology for Women: a Critique of Policy." Economic and Political Weekly. Volume XXVI, nos. 1 and 2. pp. 59-63.
- Tandon, Rajesh. "Social Transformation and Participatory Research." Convergence. Volume XXI, No. 2 and 3. 1988. pp. 5-18.

- Taylor, D.R.F. and Fiona Mackenzie. Development from Within: survival in rural Africa. New York: Routledge Press. 1992.
- Taylor, D.R.F. "Development from within and survival in rural Africa: a synthesis of theory and practice." in Taylor D.R.F. and Fiona Mackenzie. op cit. pp. 214-258.
- Tinker, Irene et al., eds. Women and World Development. New York: Praeger Publishers. 1975.
- Todaro, Micheal. Economic Development in the Third World, 3rd edition. New York: Longman Press. 1985.
- Tomm, Winnie. "Introduction." in The Effect of Feminist Approach on Research Methodologies. Waterloo: Wilfred Laurier University Press for the Humanities. 1989. pp. 1-12.
- Unnithan, T.K.N. Gandhi and Social Change. Jaipur: Rawat Publications. 1979.
- Umana, Alvaro. "Non-governmental organizations and Environmental Management: Lessons from the Costa Rican experience." in Erocal, Denizhan, ed. Environmental management in developing countries. Paris: Development Centre of the OECD. 1991. pp. 379-400.
- Wade, Robert. Village Republics: Economic Conditions for collective action in South India. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 1988.
- Weber, Thomas. "Is there still a Chipko Andolan?" Pacific Affairs. 60(4). Winter, 87-88. pp. 615-628.
- Wichterich, Christa. "'Another' Development with the 'Other' Sex." Development and Change. Volume 6. 1985. pp. 11-12.
- Wilber, Charles K. The Political Economy of Development and Under-development, 4th edition. New York: Random House Business Division. 1988.
- Wolcott, Harry F. Writing up Qualitative Research. Newbury Park, London, New Delhi: Sage Publications. 1990.
- World Commission on Environment and Development. Our Common Future. Oxford and New York: Oxford University Press. 1987.
- Yin, R.K. Case Study Research: Design and Methods. Newbury Park: Sage Publishers. 1984.

Zachariah, M. Revolution through Reform. New York: Praeger Publishers. 1986.

Zurbrigg, Sheila. Rakku's Story: the structures of Ill-health and how to change them.
Madras: George Joseph on behalf of the author at Sidma Offset Press. 1984.

END

24 05 93

FIN