Middle-Earth Soundscapes: 
An exploration of the sonic adaptation of Peter Jackson’s ‘The Lord of the Rings’ through the lens of Dialogue, Music, Sound, and Silence

by

Emma Shehan

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs 
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Music and Culture

Carleton University, 
Ottawa, Ontario

© 2017
Emma Shehan
Abstract

This thesis examines the complete soundtrack within Peter Jackson’s film trilogy *The Lord of the Rings* and discusses the sonic adaptation between the films and the original source material, J.R.R. Tolkien’s written trilogy by the same name. Adapted films are a popular avenue for filmmakers, and consequently theoretical film scholarship has been undertaken to study the components unique to cinematic adaptations. However, one component of adaptations has been neglected within film studies: the sonic adaptation. This thesis will focus specifically on the sonic adaptation in the popular fantasy film franchise *The Lord of the Rings* by discussing the dialogue, music, sound effects and silence. Through an examination of these components, the importance of each towards creating authenticity will become clear. This thesis will argue that the study of the sonic adaptation is a necessary future direction for film studies, and particularly studies that examine dialogue and sound.
Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to thank my supervisor Dr. Paul Théberge for his guidance and support throughout the course of writing this thesis. His patience and expertise have been an incredible aid in helping me craft and hone my ideas and writing. I am extremely grateful for his assistance throughout the duration of this process.

I would also like to thank the many wonderful professors within the Music and Culture program: Dr. James Deaville, Dr. William Echard, Dr. Anna Hoefnagels, and Dr. Jesse Stewart. Thank you for your excellent teaching which has helped guide me not only within this thesis, but also within my own worldview and life. Additional thank you to Dr. Charles O’Brien who assisted in helping develop my work from a film studies perspective, and an extra special thank you to Dr. Alexis Luko who encouraged me as an undergraduate student and lead me to this wonderful program.

Finally, I would like to thank my friends and family, without whom I would not have been able to accomplish this monumental task. Thank you to Thomas, John, Laura, Dena, Chloe, Taylor, Stef, Alicia, Helen, Robert, Matthew, and Nicola - your support of my thesis and assistance throughout this process have been of the utmost value to me. A large thank you to my parents for the unending love and support they have always provided, and especially to my father for introducing me to a lifelong passion for The Lord of the Rings.

I would like to dedicate this thesis to my grandfathers Leslie Shehan and Robert Schultz for instilling their love of literature and film within me and whose spirits I carry.
# Table of Contents

Abstract ii  
Acknowledgements iii  

Chapter One: Introduction 1  
  Chapter Outline 5  
  Adaptation 5  
  Dialogue 6  
  Music 7  
  Sound and Silence 8  
  Conclusion 10  

Chapter Two: Adaptation 11  
  Traditional Translation 12  
  Issues with Fidelity 14  
  Authorship 17  
  Fans 19  
  Adaptation in LotR 23  
  Elision 24  
  Exclusion 25  
  Expansion 27  
  Discussion 30  

Chapter Three: Dialogue 33  
  Dialogue in ‘The Lord of the Rings’ 35  
  Acousmêtre 42  
  Invented Languages 47  
  Discussion 53  

Chapter Four: Music 57  
  Leitmotives and Diegetic Music 60  
  The Shire 60  
  Rivendell and Lothlórien 63  
  Rohan 68  
  Gondor 71  
  Isengard and Mordor 75  
  Gollum 77  
  The Ring 79  
  Non-Diegetic Songs 81  
  Within the Film 82  
  Following the Film 85  
  Discussion 88
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter Five: Sound and Silence</th>
<th>92</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Supernatural/Natural Sounds</td>
<td>94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Ring’s Sonic Influence</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Silence</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discussion</td>
<td>109</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter Six: Conclusion</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Works Cited: Print Sources</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Film Sources</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Cinematic adaptations are a staple of film production that offer viewers the chance to experience a new interpretation of their favourite book on screen. Both the popular and academic discussion of these films often focuses on the authenticity or level of faithfulness with which filmmakers have adhered to the literary source material. Adapted films certainly offer film scholars a plethora of intermedial information to analyze and interpret, however, one aspect of adaptations often neglected by theorists and audiences alike is the sonic adaptation. The areas of dialogue, music, sound and silence have become popular topics for film and music theorists, yet the way in which these sonic components contribute to the process of adaptation has remained relatively unexplored.

In this thesis, I will examine the sonic adaptation of J.R.R. Tolkien’s *The Lord of the Rings* by director Peter Jackson and composer Howard Shore in order to understand the role in which dialogue, music, and sound play within the adaptation. This is an important avenue of research that will contribute to a better understanding of the significance of music and sound and the unique challenges and features of cinematic adaptations. I have chosen Jackson’s films for several reasons: their length and complexity (that offers myriad opportunities for for analysis); the popularity of the novels and the films; and the genre (as fantasy films, they have unique sonic qualities that can be explored in depth).

*The Lord of the Rings* was published by J.R.R. Tolkien in 1954 as a sequel to his popular children’s novel *The Hobbit* (1937). Set in the same fictional world of Middle-Earth,
The Lord of the Rings developed into an incredibly detailed and vast fantasy epic told over the span of three books. The novels are a part of a broader fantastic mythology developed by Tolkien, which is extrapolated in his later novel The Silmarillion (1977). Tolkien’s works that focus on Middle-Earth, especially The Lord of the Rings, have become immensely popular: The Lord of the Rings was named Britain’s best-loved novel of all time by BBC’s The Big Read in 2003. The novels have become incredibly influential for fantasy literature and indeed the fantasy genre. One need only look to the amount of words that have become a part of the English vernacular as a result of the books to confirm their impact: fantastical beings such as hobbits, ents, and orcs have all become creatures commonly known within the fantasy genre. The author himself has even become an adjective since the induction of the word ‘tolkienesque’ into the Oxford English Dictionary (Gilliver, 202).

The Lord of the Rings at its simplest is a story of good vs. evil: the peoples of Middle-Earth are threatened by the Dark Lord Sauron, who wishes to enslave all beings under his rule. To do this, he begins by crafting magical rings that he distributes to the leaders of the various races disguised as gifts. Instead of granting their wearers power, the rings instead convert the deceived into servants of Sauron, who has forged a master ring for himself. In an effort to overthrow Sauron by the free peoples of Middle-Earth, the ring is cut off of his hand in battle. Once he has lost his ring, which is imbued with his own life force, Sauron is temporarily defeated, but yearns to regain his ring and former might.

The ring passes through several bearers before it reaches the hobbit Frodo Baggins. He is tasked with destroying the ring in the fires of Mount Doom, where it was crafted. A
fellowship of eight companions is organized in order to assist Frodo on his journey. *The Lord of the Rings* follows the fellowship as it navigates through many lands and obstacles to reach Mount Doom.

*The Lord of the Rings* is embedded with many complex themes. The novels ultimately present a tale of an alternative hero - not the epic hero bravely facing his foes, but the unlikely one, who against all odds finds the courage to continue on. It is about the capacity for good and evil in every single person, that no one is wholly good nor bad, and the role in which fate and chance can play. Mortality, nature, and industrialization play a significant role in Tolkien’s tale, which ultimately presents a broad and complex sense of morality.

One of the most unique qualities of *The Lord of the Rings* is the multitude of languages and grammars that Tolkien created. Tolkien crafted the world of Middle-Earth in order to contextualize his languages and provide them with an accompanying mythology. This level of detail is unparalleled in fantasy literature. The invented languages give a sense of legitimacy to the tales and also provide something tangible for fans to interact with.

Tolkien’s novels have held a special place within popular culture since their publication. Creative interpretations of *The Lord of the Rings* include music, art, film, video games, and literature. Notable musical examples include Johan de Meji’s *Symphony #1: The Lord of the Rings*, Led Zeppelin’s *Misty Mountain Hop*, and Rush’s *Rivendell*. It is evident that the tale of *The Lord of the Rings* has created a significant and profound im-
pact on the arts. Peter Jackson’s epic cinematic adaptation is simply one of many works inspired by the novels.

Jackson’s *The Lord of the Rings* (henceforth referred to as LotR) serves as the first time that the entire trilogy has been brought to the big-screen, and one of the most culturally mainstream translations of Tolkien’s work. The three films bear the same title as Tolkien’s three novels, and in order are: *The Fellowship of the Ring* (2001), *The Two Towers* (2002), and *The Return of the King* (2003). The films will henceforth be referred to as FotR, TT, and RotK respectively. The films were extremely well-received by critics and audiences alike, netting a total of 17 Oscars.

Jackson’s trilogy presents an important case study for the intersectionality between film and literature that is the adapted film. The study of adaptations is a unique subsection of film studies, that has sometimes been neglected by theorists, yet offers a rich point of analysis. Adaptation studies create the opportunity to identify the ways in which literature and film intersect and the manner in which it is done. The sonic adaptation is a particularly interesting avenue of research: for example, how does a composer decide how to musically portray a previously silent world? Unfortunately, sonic adaptation studies are even more sparsely represented in literature.

This thesis will offer a new perspective on adaptation studies as it applies to the fantasy genre. Fantasy film has its own distinct cinematic conventions, just as fantasy literature does. Through a detailed analysis of adaptation, dialogue, music, and sound this thesis will offer a more thorough discussion on how fantasy literature becomes fantasy film and the role dialogue, music, and sound play in order to do so.
Central to my examination of LotR will be Robynn Stilwell’s term, ‘fantastical gap’. The fantastical gap is meant to define music or sound that is both within and without the diegesis. Stilwell initially coined the term in an attempt to fill in the perceived gap in the definition of diegetic music, provided by Claudia Gorbman. Gorbman’s definition for diegetic music contained the word ‘apparently’, meaning that in order to consider music as diegetic, the source of the sound must be apparent on screen (21, 1987). This presents a problematic definition for music that exists within the diegesis but is not necessarily shown, or exists within a fantastical gap. The fantastical gap will be discussed as it relates to the dialogue, music, and sound within Jackson’s films as a means to understand the complex relationship which the soundtrack has with the fantastical nature of the tales.

It is my hope that this thesis provides a valuable addition to the bodies of literature of film, sound and music studies by offering an original angle on a popular tale that continues to be culturally relevant and inspire contemporary compositions.

Chapter Outline
Adaptation

The second chapter will provide an examination of adaptation, which will be discussed in multiple facets. Adaptation studies is currently a field which is faced with several issues: mainly, there is a profound lack of a basic theoretical framework with which to discuss adaptation as it relates to cinema. In spite of this, several theorists have offered possible ideas for terminology, such as Cahir, whose adaptation theory will be discussed in conjunction with Jackson’s films.
An additional issue within adaptation studies is the pervasive fallacy of fidelity to the original story. The concept of fidelity and why it is a problematic form of critical analysis will be further explored. Alongside the concept of fidelity is that of authorship. The notion of authorship is particularly confounded when considering adaptation. In the case of an adapted film, is authorship accredited to the original author, to the director, or both? This question will be discussed as it applies to LotR.

The role of the fan will be discussed as it pertains to adapted films and the unique relationship Tolkien’s fans had with Jackson’s films. The fans of the source material act as a built-in audience for adapted works, who wish to see the literary source material honoured on screen. Creating a cohesive film that attracts a new audience without alienating the existing fan base can be a difficult task for filmmakers. Jackson’s team took a novel approach to endear the book’s fans by involving them in the process. This section will discuss what this approach was and its effect on the films.

Subsequently, Jackson’s adaptation of Tolkien’s novels will be reviewed in detail. Rateliff’s concept of elision and exclusion will be used to examine what changes occurred in order to make the films. Additionally, I will add the category of expansion to create a more extensive review of the adaptation.

**Dialogue**

An integral aspect of any film is its dialogue and this is no less true for fantasy films. The role of dialogue in LotR plays an important part in bridging the gap between book and film. Sarah Kozloff’s functions of dialogue will be examined in order to analyze spe-
cific instances of dialogue and discern their narrative use (34). Kozloff’s ‘speech acts’ will also be considered in conjunction with examples from the films to ultimately discover the impact dialogue has upon narrative and action in Jackson’s films (41).

Tolkien was predominantly a linguist and he delighted in creating grammar and lexicons for the numerous cultures that exist within his fictional realm of Middle-Earth. The Lord of the Rings is a unique work within the fantasy genre for its prolific lore and use of invented languages. Though many of Tolkien’s languages are present within the films, it is the Elvish languages, Quenya and Sindarin, which hold a place of prominence within the dialogue. The use of Tolkien’s languages is one way in which Jackson sought to retain the fantastical qualities of the books. Chapter Three will conclude with a depiction of Tolkien’s created languages and their function within the films.

Music

Jackson felt that the role of music in film was integral, and indeed the amount of music included in the films certainly reflects this belief. The fourth chapter will be dedicated to a broad outline of the music that accompanies Jackson’s trilogy. Beginning with a brief introduction to Shore’s work on the score, the structure of the score will be broken down in order to examine its many facets, which include: leitmotivs, diegetic music, non-diegetic songs, and end credit songs.

Shore’s leitmotivs represent the bulk of the film’s scores, and therefore the leitmotivs will be discussed in some detail. These leitmotivs, which are mainly (but not exclusively) written for geographical areas, provide the audience with important cultural information.
The leitmotivs also provide a link to the novels through instrumentation and the accompanying choral parts, which are sung in one of Tolkien’s invented languages.

There are several examples of diegetic songs, which are arguably the most reflective of Tolkien’s texts, and thus are particularly informative examples when considering the adaptation from book to film. Though not nearly as prolific as the non-diegetic score, the diegetic music also offers cultural cues for the audience about the various peoples of Middle-Earth.

Shore includes only a few non-diegetic songs (which are part of the score yet distinct from the leitmotivs) and end credit songs which function in a unique way in the films. These songs are closer to pop songs and act as a bridge between the fantastical nature of the films and our own contemporary society. The intriguing role of these songs will be elaborated upon in this chapter.

**Sound and Silence**

To round out the discussion of the soundtrack, Chapter Five will examine sound effects and silence as they are used within LotR. The study of sound differs from music and dialogue: the field of sound studies has interdisciplinary origins that did not stem from a pre-existing artistic tradition. Furthermore, the study of sound in film may have been hindered due to the assumption that sound design is more technical whereas dialogue and music are more artistic (Sergi, 2006). Increasingly, however, the importance of sound design within film is being recognized academically.
Just as with dialogue and music, sound and silence have a complex relationship with the cinematic image and with narrative. Sound can be used to communicate important narrative information in a unique way. In a fantasy film, successfully creating the fantastical in a coherent and believable way is paramount, and sound plays a large role in facilitating this. In LotR, sound has been used to differentiate good and evil and helps to bridge the gap between the real and the supernatural.

The sounds associated with good and evil will be examined, and the link between good and the natural as well as evil and the supernatural will be discussed. Sound is used effectively to reinforce the ideals of good and evil throughout the films. Examples of ‘good’ sounds are those associated with the hobbits and elves, and evil is represented through orcs, trolls, and the balrog.

One way in which sound helps to facilitate the supernatural is through what I will refer to as ‘the sonic fantastical gap’ created within the Ring space. There are several key scenes in which the Ring has an effect sonically on several characters; each of these will be analyzed to identify how sound is used to create this fantastical space.

Kozloff’s theory of ‘speech acts’ will also be adapted to discuss ‘sound acts’ within the films and how they are used to advance the narrative. Several examples from FotR will be considered. This discussion will serve to demonstrate how sound may be used actively within film.

The final segment of the Chapter Five will focus on the role of silence within the films. Silence is capable of manipulating audience’s emotions; silence within LotR is used to both create a sense of tranquility and abnormality (Théberge, 52).
Conclusion

To conclude this thesis, I will briefly summarize the focal points of each chapter in order to highlight areas of discussion. Through an examination of adaptation through the lens of dialogue, music, sound and silence, a more thorough understanding of the sonic adaptation can be realized. This will include an analysis of what exactly the sonic adaptation incorporates as well as how it works within film to contribute to the overall narrative. Most importantly, I will highlight the importance of sound within cinematic adaptations, as it is an area that currently lacks scholarly attention and that requires greater scrutiny. Much work on adaptation does not consider dialogue, music, or sound in detail, much less the interplay of these components; yet in order to reach a more complete understanding it is crucial to consider each of these sonic aspects in their own respect and also how they function together.
Chapter Two

Adaptation

_Tolkien felt that rewriting narrative fantasy for a performing medium was nearly impossible._

(Croft, 7)

Though we now have a film adaptation that has accomplished what J.R.R. Tolkien thought unattainable, it is interesting to note that these were the genuine feelings of the author. Tolkien felt that film was unable to capture all of the nuances of the novel, and though he was speaking in more general terms, one can only assume he must have felt the same way about his own work. Tolkien’s sentiment stands in direct opposition to Thomas Leitch, the scholar who pointed out twelve perceived fallacies that exist surrounding the discussion of adaptation (2003). Most pertinently, he identified three fallacies that would seek to discredit Tolkien’s thoughts: 1) that novels are better than films, 2) that novels deal in concepts and films in percepts, and 3) that novels create more complex characters than films (Leitch, 2003). Tolkien did not outright state that he felt that novels are superior to films, but it is within his rhetoric that novels do a better job of creating nuance. This is not an uncommon issue within the field of adaptation studies. Though it is not this thesis’ intention to offer an ultimate opinion on whether cinematic adaptations are comparable to novels, it will attempt to illuminate adaptation studies, and utilizing various theories, discuss Peter Jackson’s cinematic adaptation of Tolkien’s cult-classic _The Lord of the Rings._
The concept of cinematic adaptation is one that film and literature scholars alike have grappled with since George Bluestone’s seminal work, *Novels Into Film*, was published in 1957. Despite the half-century that has passed since its publication, adaptation studies has still struggled to establish a theoretical framework; instead, “studies are shaped by case studies they are designed to illuminate” (Westbrook, 25). The lack of theory may also be an inhibiting factor in allowing the field to grow (Jellenik, 222). The interdisciplinary nature of the field no doubt lends to the sense of confusion amongst scholars working on adaptation, especially in light of the fact that adaptation studies stood separately from film studies until recently, yet has connections to both film and literature studies (Leitch, 3, 2007).

Several issues beleaguer the field: in addition to the lack of an established theory, fidelity, authorship, and intermediality are concepts that require consideration when examining adaptation studies. This chapter will examine these concepts while also delving into the details of Jackson’s adaptation. Specifically, what Jackson chose to include and exclude will be considered, as well as the role of the fan.

**Traditional Translation**

In an effort to establish a theoretical foundation in adaptation studies, several theorists, such as Andre Bazin, Geoffrey Wagner, John Dryden, Dudley Andrew, and Louis Gianetti, have attempted to create categorical models to classify and discuss cinematic adaptations (Cahir, 16). Many of these categories find their roots in literary theory; the issue here is that these categorizations may fail to take into account film standards and
language. For the purposes of this discussion, I will refer to Linda Cahir’s *Literature Into Film*, one of the few works that is dedicated solely to the study of film adaptations and theory. She proposes three categorizations: literal, traditional, and radical (Cahir, 16).

It is important to note that Cahir uses the word ‘translation’ in place of ‘adaptation’, as she asserts that films are translations that interpret the original source text, rather than adapt it. This is a point of contention amongst adaptation scholars, who do not appear to agree on the language used to describe adaptation. Jellenik states that adaptation does not equal translation and feels that traditional views of adaptation such as this create a one-dimensionality (222). For the purposes of this work, translation and adaptation will be used interchangeably.

Cahir’s three modes of translation are as follows:

1. Literal: which reproduces the plot and all its attending details as closely as possible to the letter of the book.

2. Traditional: which maintains the overall traits of the book (its plot, settings, and stylistic conventions) but revamps particular details in those particular ways that the filmmakers see as necessary and fitting.

3. Radical: which reshapes the book in extreme and revolutionary ways both as a means of interpreting the literature and making the film a more full independent work. (Cahir, 17).

The mode that best fits Jackson’s LotR is the ‘traditional’ translation. Jackson stated that his goal was to “be as accurate as possible” and include Tolkien’s thematic material in the film (Boyens et al., 2011 Disc 3A), but also felt that many of the film’s adjustments to the story were improvements. Thomas Leitch writes that Jackson sought to be faithful to the novels as a whole and not necessarily to each one individually (136, 2007). Jackson felt that the novels were ‘unfilmable’ if shot scene by scene according to the book
Tolkien himself felt that in order to film the novels, scenes that could not be done aptly should be cut rather than compressed (Thompson, 28), a sentiment which likely contributed to Jackson’s choice to cut out Tom Bombadil from the films: this choice was reinforced by Jackson’s opinion that LotR was in essence about Frodo’s journey to destroy the ring, and that any characters or plot points which did not directly contribute to this story were unnecessary, such as Tom Bombadil (Rateliff, 60).

Cahir’s categories are useful in identifying to what degree a director chose to incorporate the original source text into the film; Cahir also notes that films may possess a combination of these modes (15). For example, while Jackson’s LotR is on the whole a traditional translation, several aspects of it might be considered instances of radical translation. Predominantly, the addition of Arwen’s role in the films: such as the choice to tie Arwen’s life to the fate of the ring, creating further incentive for Aragorn to succeed in his quest. This development does not exist within the novels.

Assessing the intention of the director in how they chose to approach an adapted film is an important aspect to consider. It would be unsuitable to judge a radical translation by its literary source. The failure to assess intention may be one reason why the concept of fidelity as a judgement has endured and proliferated.

**Issues with Fidelity**

‘The book was better than the film’, the age-old adage which has given rise to discussions of fidelity, seems to persist despite a lack of any real logic or reasoning. This statement, which is nearly synonymous with cinematic adaptations in academic and
casual discussion alike, has created a perceived need in the academic community to address it (Leitch, 2003). Indeed, nearly every work dedicated to discussing the various facets of adaptation seem compelled to respond to the issue of fidelity, and most importantly, to dispel the myth that this is a worthwhile point of analysis.

The roots of this contentious subject lay amongst the frictions between literature and film studies. Adaptation studies lies at a halfway point between the two fields, yet belongs to neither. As I have previously mentioned as well, adaptation studies is a field that does not lay claim to any foundational theory. Instead, scholars from either literature or film studies discussing adapted cinema do so from a point of view which may not be applicable to the work at hand (Morgan, 21). Originally, adapted films were examined through a literary lens, a technique that is not well suited to analyzing cinema (Leitch, 2007). This betrays the inherent intermediality of adaptation.

Jean-Luc Godard is quoted as stating that “originality is inevitable” (quoted in Cahir, 15). Even George Bluestone, author of the seminal text on adaptation expressed that changes are unavoidable and therefore it is pointless to bother comparing a film with a novel (Leitch, 3, 2007). The concept of fidelity is based in the privileging of literature over film.

The issue of fidelity stems from presumptions about what should and should not be brought into a film (Cahir, 14). This can be a tricky way to appraise a film: McFarlane notes that each reading of a text is an individual act, and creates a response not unlike one’s own personal adaptation; the same could be said of viewing a film, an idea that overcomes the misconception that film requires less imagination on the part of the

15
audience than literature (17). In this fashion, adaptation is not about replicating a text’s voice, but rather about creating its own (McFarlane, 17). I.Q. Hunter asserts that one must view adaptation “not as fidelity to a controlling original, but a dissemination” (154).

Additionally, one must question why fidelity is not a valid judgement in other media forms. “The idea of a single, definitive, faithful adaptation does not hold sway in other medias” (Westbrook, 38). An excellent example of this is the oratorio, a Baroque-era genre which adapted biblical stories and interpreted them musically for performance in the church. While the oratorio dealt strictly in sacred material, its structure was not unlike that of an opera, including such operatic devices as arias and recitatives. While the oratorio retained its original source material (the biblical tale it was based upon) it did so in a way that allowed for creative freedom to create a new work, something independent from its source. Comparing an oratorio to its biblical source material is no different than attempting to compare a novel with a film, they are simply different media forms. While they may share some commonalities, they are inherently different in the way in which they disseminate information to their audience.

Leitch stated that fidelity is only useful when we can be sure that the original model is more valuable (2003). Literary scholarship’s tendency to privilege literature over film would assure us that it is. It is the classic old versus new, high art versus low art debate that has followed artistic creations for centuries. Director Alfred Hitchcock’s films are a pertinent example. Hitchcock did not concern himself with fidelity, only taking base elements of a story and creating something unique in his own vision (Leitch, 2003). Had he felt the need to remain as faithful as possible to a text, we would be without such
classic films as *Psycho* (1960) and *The Birds* (1963), films which have established and defined the horror genre.

Indeed, in these ways, it is evident that fidelity cannot be a trusted means by which to critique a cinematic adaptation. The extent to which a film contains elements of its source text is certainly one element that results in the end product, but there are many more measures by which we can assess a film’s values (Morgan, 21). The ensuing discussion of what Jackson’s adaptation has chosen to include is not a value judgement, but a means of examining how a narrative must evolve in order to translate into a new medium. Whether Jackson remains faithful to Tolkien’s novels is thus a matter beside the point.

### Authorship

It is perhaps the concept of authorship that makes the idea of fidelity so difficult to grapple with. Audiences seem unable to give recognition of authorship to a film director over the original source author, despite the differences between the two media forms. The former example of Dracula is an interesting case study of authorship. Most people are aware that it was Bram Stoker who originally penned the novel (which itself is based upon earlier vampiric literature and folklore), however, after countless remakes and the adaptation of the Dracula character through popular culture, it would seem as though the character is available for the taking. This gives the impression that while there is one author directly responsible for the original story, the titular character has transcended the particular and attained an almost canonical status within popular culture.
Yet in the case of The Lord of the Rings, Jackson seems unable to claim authorship of his films, he is simply borrowing the ideas. However, this line of thinking robs Jackson of the credit for taking a written idea and bringing it to life in a way Tolkien was incapable of. Jackson has been recognized as an auteur director for the depth in which he infuses his own creative practice and ideas into his films. LotR is no different: it is a film that showcased Jackson’s keen interest in computer-generated imagery and allowed him to push boundaries (with the assistance of big studio financing) and to create magnificent battle scenes and fantasy creatures in a way that had not yet been accomplished. In considering this, it would seem evident that Jackson holds some degree of authorship over his films.

Interestingly enough, while Jackson has noted that he and his team were dedicated to preserving Tolkien’s vision of the novels, it was also treated as a tale that had been mythologized in a sense. Jackson stated in the commentary on FotR that “this should ultimately be Tolkien’s film, it shouldn’t be ours” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3A), thus surrendering personal claims to authorship in favour of recognizing Tolkien. Alternatively, Richard Taylor, creative supervisor of WETA Workshop (the company responsible for the digital effects of the film) stated that working on the film was an “opportunity to bring a piece of modern English folklore to the screen” (quoted in Fimi, 85). To add to this, Buhler writes that the music is actually used to create a mythical sense in the films, beginning with the opening credits (232). Specifically, Buhler points to the moment when the New Line Cinema logo appears on screen: the audience has not yet seen Middle-Earth but the score begins to play, inviting the audience into a mythical
world of legend (232). Buhler argues that it is this moment that casts the tale as more myth than fiction, which further confounds the matter of authorship.

It is evident that the issue of authorship is not clear cut in regards to *The Lord of the Rings*. Both Tolkien’s and Jackson’s iterations are distinct, yet the tale retains a legendary quality that confounds authorship on both parts, in a fashion that very well may echo the opening lines of FotR: “History became legend, legend became myth” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 1A).

**Fans**

When Peter Jackson decided to embark on the marathon journey of adapting *The Lord of the Rings* to film, he understood that creating a cinematic version of a beloved novel required a special attention to detail unlike a regular film. Orlando Bloom, who plays Legolas in the films, remarked that many fans regard the novels as an almost sacred text (Leitch, 133), and stated that those working on the film treated the novels as their bible. For the fans of the book, LotR is indeed a canonical work.

One potential issue that faces all cinematic adaptations of popular novels is in fact fandom, which can make or break a film. Fans become the driving force that creates a perceived ready-made audience for a film, and come prepared to the film with a pre-determined view of the story. The issue of fidelity is perhaps significant to this audience alone, as viewers who have not read the book will not have the same expectations, and are freshly experiencing the story. Certainly, adaptations that take too many liberties are deemed to have been unfaithful to the novel to their detriment. Fans of *The Lord of the*
Rings had already faced disappointment with the 1978 animated films by Robert Bakshi: though ambitious in his attempt to bring the novels to the screen in two films, he was ultimately unable to produce the sequel due to financial concerns, stemming from a negative reception (Rateliff, 57).

Jackson thus faced a unique challenge in creating the films: he needed to walk a fine line between appeasing the fans of the novel and engaging with new viewers. Faithful fans would not only desire to see the story remain largely intact, but would likely expect the finer details of the story (including appendices) respected, such as the created languages, history, and geography. New viewers would require the films be approachable to those not familiar with the novels, creating the need for the films to have a linear plot and sufficient intrigue to retain their attention across three films and three years. Though the novels had a cult following, the fan base was not large enough to ensure the film’s financial success, and therefore required that the films attract a broader audience. Therein lay Jackson’s greatest challenge: how to take a 1000+ page novel, whose readership lay mainly in adolescents and fans of the medieval/fantasy genre, and adapt it across three films that would appeal broadly enough to mainstream audiences to ensure financial success.

Early on in the filming process, Jackson’s recognition of the role of the fans extended through to the creation of an online fan club (Fimi, 86). This fan club enabled members to receive monthly updates, discounts on merchandise, and the opportunity to have their names included in the credits of the film (which can be found in the credits on the extended versions of the films). Jackson thus initiated an intermedial relationship with
fans – a relationship that integrated the novels, the films, and the clubs into a system where the potential for reciprocal exchange could be encouraged, recognized and, to a certain extent, controlled. This symbiotic, intermedial relationship even extended to fans having an influence over the production of the films: Jackson originally intended for Arwen to appear at Helm’s Deep to aid in the battle for Rohan, a plot change that would represent a radical translation according to Cahir. When the fan club learned of this, there was a decidedly negative reaction on their website, which led to the filmmaker’s decision to abandon their Helm’s Deep plot change, despite the fact that they had already filmed the scenes with Arwen (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3B).

This unusual immersion of the fans into the process of adaptation was an ingenious way in which to ensure that Jackson had the fans on board even before the first film came to theatres. Validating their identity and creating an ‘in-group’ effect results in positive feelings and an increase in self-esteem, according to Groene and Hettinger (2016). Therefore, fans would feel more positively about themselves, other fans, and the films.

Though Jackson was aware that the fans of the book would be expecting a film that respected the novels, he recognized that in some ways, it would be impossible to remain totally faithful:

We felt we would become completely derailed very quickly if we attempted to write these scripts to please every fan in the world. You realize that the only way to really do this is to say, “Well, we’re fans and we’re just going to write for ourselves and not for anybody else”. So we took a fairly selfish attitude toward it right from the beginning. It’s an interpretation…these movies have the same title, but they’re not The Lord of the Rings. It’s not like on the day The Fellowship of the Ring opened there was a meeting where everybody in the world had to burn their copy of the book. Eventually these films will become dated and the book will live on.

(Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3A).
In this quote, Jackson expresses the role of the fan in two different ways: the first of which is the role of the novel’s fans, namely that though they are important, catering specifically to them is not an option. The second role is that of Jackson’s own personal fan-hood. Despite being unable to please fans in general, it was crucial for him to self-identify as a fan in order to appease fans who perhaps were less appeased by the films. Declaring his identity as a fan and expressing his desire to make the movies based on his own interpretation authenticates himself and the films in a fashion. Further examples of his effort to authenticate the films’ commitment to fandom was to comment that all executives of the film were fans and also the choice to cast Christopher Lee, the only member of the cast to have met Tolkien (Hunter, 157).

Jackson also grapples with the concept of authorship: in the previous quote he is clearly outlining that the films are an interpretation yet stand alone and independent of the novels. Neither should negate the other, both may co-exist (despite Jackson’s sentiment that the novel will outlive his films).

In spite of Jackson’s defensive attitude towards the fans, Kristin Thompson notes that overall, the film was able to appeal widely to both fans of the novels and create new fans: she dubs “book-firsters” and “film-firsters” as a means to differentiate fans based on which medium introduced them to the tale (43). Thompson analyzed online message boards, and observed that it did not seem to matter which camp fans fell into, but that they were able to peacefully co-mingle and share their different views on the films. This is a marked departure from typical fandoms: one study found that fandoms routinely
exhibit hierarchies (McCudden, 2012), mirroring the issue of fidelity and the “book is better” rhetoric. To LotR fans, however, both Tolkien’s Middle-Earth and Jackson’s Middle-Earth are valid and valued.

**Adaptation in LotR**

Jackson was fortunate that two other big-budget, fantasy trilogies had come before or were contemporaneous with LotR: George Lucas’ *Star Wars* (1977, 1980, 1983) and Lana and Lilly Wachowski’s *The Matrix* (1999, 2003a, 2003b). Not only did these trilogies furnish examples that sci-fi films can appeal to mainstream audiences, they provided Jackson with an outline for approaching his films (Hunter, 156). One aspect that he may have observed was the importance of unification, as demonstrated in *Star Wars.* Jackson was keen for the films to be seen not as three separate films, but as a single, overarching story told in three parts (Leitch, 131, 2007), which also paralleled the structure of the novels. An additional benefit to this structure was ensuring viewership for all three films as audiences would need to return for the next film to see how the plot unfolds. Jackson’s approach to the issue of the large amount of source content was thus to be faithful to the books as a whole, and not necessarily follow the books individually (Leitch, 136, 2007).

In discussing the content that did not make it into the film, Rateliff established two categories: elision and exclusion (55). ‘Elision’ refers to that which was not included but theoretically could have occurred within the film universe (Rateliff, 55). ‘Exclusion’ refers to events that were not included in the film but could not theoretically have taken place off-screen as they would contradict something which has already occurred in the
film (Rateliff, 55). In the interest of discussing more broadly what was changed for the films, I would like to add one more category to Rateliff’s: ‘Expansion’, that which Jackson has expanded upon in order to create intrigue or in the interest of linearity.

**Elision**

The most contentious example of elision is the fantastical character Tom Bombadil. In the novels, the hobbits meet Bombadil as they are travelling through the Old Forest on their way to Bree. They quickly become lost and unable to find their way out, but are rescued by Bombadil. Bombadil is an interesting character as he is the only person in Middle-Earth to be completely unaffected by the Ring’s power. This is because Bombadil recognizes neither good nor evil, he is the first earthly creature and exists without any cultural context. Morgan notes that Bombadil’s elision is one large criticism from literary scholars who argue that “Bombadil is essential to Tolkien’s complex vision of good and evil” (23). Jackson asserts that this was done as audiences would not have understood why Bombadil could not have carried the Ring to Mount Doom himself, in essence they would not have been able to adequately portray the subtleties of the character in which the novel is able to in a few brief passages. From a music scholar’s point of view, Bombadil’s elision is a disappointment in that he is the most musical being that exists in the novels, opting to sing more often than speak and often bursting out into nonsensical song. This is one instance in which a good deal of potential diegetic music has been discarded.
An additional example of an elided element is that of the Old Forest. As mentioned, the hobbits travel through the Old Forest takes place before they reach Bree. In addition to meeting Tom Bombadil, the hobbits also become trapped by Old Man Willow, a sentient tree from whom Bombadil rescues them. This early exposure to the idea that trees can be sentient and even dangerous is dropped in favour of a line from Merry recounting an old wives tale about trees that could walk and talk. Boyens addressed both of these elisions in the supplementary material for FotR: “We don’t know that they didn’t go into the Old Forest. We don’t know that they didn’t meet Tom…We just don’t mention it. It’s just left untold” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3A).

The overwhelming majority of Tolkien’s songs were also elided from the films. Several examples are included in the films, however of the many that are not, it can reasonably be assumed that they also fall into the category of events that may have taken place within the film’s universe, but are simply not shown on screen. A more detailed discussion of the music will ensue in Chapter 3.

**Exclusion**

Tolkien himself felt that if filmmakers could not delegate enough time for some of the film’s elements (in his example Helm’s Deep and the Ents), then it would be better to cut them completely rather than compress them (Thompson, 29). Jackson has taken this approach in several instances, though he retained both Helm’s Deep and the Ents.

The first notable example of exclusion is the hobbits encounter with the Barrow-Wight. This occurs in the same portion of the book cut from the film in which we meet
Tom Bombadil, however this scene could not have taken place off-screen in the film. The main reason for this is that the encounter with the Barrow-Wight serves to provide the hobbits with weapons, which have been gathered in a cave left behind from wight victims. This contradicts the later scene in which Aragorn provides the hobbits with swords briefly before the fight at Weathertop. As Rateliff notes, this would have been an excellent opportunity for Jackson to apply his practiced hand at creating a horror-type scene (65). The Barrow-Wight could have been used as an exciting extra scene for the extended versions, but without the weapons gained from the encounter, the scene provides little narrative progression.

The second, and much more significant exclusion in terms of differences between the novels and films is the exclusion of the Scourge of the Shire. In the novels, this takes place after the final climax of the destruction of the ring in Mount Doom. The hobbits return to the Shire only to find that someone named Sharkey has essentially enslaved the civilians and turned the idyllic, pastoral Shire into an industrial, depressing workplace. The hobbits uncover that Sharkey is in fact Saruman, and work to overthrow him and take back the Shire. Interestingly, though this does not exist in the film’s universe, it is alluded to in FotR when Frodo peers into Galadriel’s magic mirror: he sees a vision of the Shire wrought in flame, and a group of chained hobbits being lead and whipped by orcs. As we are made to understand, what the mirror shows are things that are, things that were, and things that have not yet come to pass - we are able to assume that Frodo’s vision is prevented through his actions.
The Scourge of the Shire could not occur in Jackson’s films as it involves a character who is not alive at this point - Saruman. In order to have a cleaner, more organized ending for the film and to save time, Jackson opted not to include this scene. Thus, in order to for there to be closure in Saruman’s role, Jackson created the scene in which Wormtongue, Saruman’s servant, grows angry with Saruman and stabs him in the back during negotiations.

Expansion

Jackson’s changes to the narrative did not only encompass cuts to the plot: in many instances he opted to expand certain scenes in order to fit in with the overarching story line. Though supernatural characters such as Tom Bombadil and the Barrow-Wight were not included, many of Jackson’s expansions were fantastical in nature, perhaps in an effort to inject more magic into the narrative.

The first example of an expansion is Jackson’s choice to have Arwen rescue Frodo from the Black Riders in the forest. In the novels, it is the elf Glorfindel who rescues Frodo on horseback. Thompson notes that adding a character to fill this purpose would be ‘weak dramatically’ (39). Arwen’s substitution for Glorfindel also allows for the expansion of her screen time and places her as a more central character rather than her largely absent role in the novels.

A fantastical expansion to Arwen’s roles are the dream scenes. There are two dream scenes, both of which occur in TT, a part of the narrative in which Arwen would otherwise be relatively absent, thus allowing her to play a greater role. The dream scenes
are useful in cementing her relationship with Aragorn, and reminding him (and the audience) of Arwen.

The first dream scene occurs as Aragorn is accompanying the Rohirrim to their keep in Helm’s Deep. It is nightfall, and Aragorn is contemplating his and Arwen’s future. Her voice is heard repeating what she had told him in Rivendell, seemingly from Aragorn’s memory. The scene transcends into the fantastic as Arwen’s voice is then heard encouraging Aragorn to go to sleep. The image fades to show Aragorn lying on a divan in a stone gazebo overlooking a forest. He is dressed in the clothing he wore in Rivendell, as he replies to Arwen that he is asleep. As he opens his eyes to see her standing nearby, he states that he must be in a dream. Their conversation is held in Elvish as well, creating an additional indication of the fantastical. This dream sequence is ambiguous as to whether it is in fact a dream, or perhaps Aragorn’s recollection of a past encounter, but it serves to bolster Aragorn’s resolve through Arwen’s encouragement of his journey.

The second dream scene occurs after Aragorn has fallen over a cliff into a river, seemingly to his death. His companions have been forced to keep moving, believing him to have died. Aragorn is seen washing ashore as an image of Arwen laying in Rivendell, looking outward, as if seeking him, fades into view. Arwen’s image does not completely materialize on screen, as the shimmering water can faintly still be seen. As Aragorn lies unconscious, an image of Arwen appears in the shot and leans down to kiss him. Momentarily, the kiss is revealed to actually be Aragorn’s horse nudging him as it attempts to revive him. However, despite the comical nature of Aragorn seemingly imagining Arwen in the horse’s place is actually an example of the fantastical in the
narrative. As Arwen’s image first appears over Aragorn, her voice is overlaid saying “May the grace of the Valar protect you” in an Elvish blessing and appeal to the gods of Middle-Earth, similar to what she said as she held a dying Frodo following the Ring-Wraith attack (Boyens et al., 2011 Disc 1B). Once Aragorn has remounted his horse, the image of Arwen laying in Rivendell fades back in, and she stirs, as if feeling assured that Aragorn has arisen. This suggests that she seems to have a telepathic connection with Aragorn, and sensed that Aragorn was in danger.

An additional flashback-type scene features telepathic communication by Galadriel and Elrond as the former urges Elrond to assist Rohan in their time of need. This is unparalleled in the book, and results in Elrond sending a company of Elvish warriors to Helm’s Deep (Thompson, 38). Though this does not occur in the novels, Jackson’s expansion to Helm’s Deep and the relationship between Elrond and Galadriel serves to solidify the sense of an ancient alliance between men and elves, supporting the theme of unity in the face of adversity. The addition of the Elvish warriors is just one way in which Helm’s Deep is expanded upon, in fact the entirety of the scene takes a larger narrative role in the film as opposed to the book, which covers the battle over just a few short pages. This expansion was likely created not only in order to include a large battle scene for the climax of TT, but also as an opportunity for Jackson’s company, WETA Workshop, to flex their creative muscle in digitally creating the orc armies. The fantastical nature of this telepathic exchange will be explored further in Chapter Four.

These adjustments were made in order to create films with a more logical flow (and greater opportunities for fantastical and action scenes). Abiding exactly to the structure of
the novels would likely have created a more confusing timeline. Though Jackson did choose to alter the narrative structure of the novels, he paid close attention to other smaller details in order to present a more scrupulous adaptation. Examples of this are his devotion to the mise-en-scène, which involves the set design, makeup, and costume design. Jackson employed Tolkien illustrators John Howe, Alan Lee, and Ted Nasmith to assist with designing many of the visual aesthetics of the film in hopes that this would lend a sense of familiarity to Tolkien fans (Leitch, 138, 2007). In these ways, Jackson combined the role of fan and auteur in order to craft his cinematic adaptation of the cult classic.

Discussion

Though the field of adaptation studies has existed for nearly fifty years, a definitive theory has yet to be established. The field is defined through anthologies dedicated to book-to-film analyses: a worthwhile endeavour that adds value through a critical analysis of a case study, but lacks broad applicability. In 2008, Leitch published ‘Adaptation Studies at a Crossroads’, a review article that sketched out the state of then-current literature with a critical eye towards the authors proposed ideas regarding adaptation. In his work, Leitch skillfully deconstructed these theories, such as Cahir’s proposed three categories of adaptation, while also illuminating the underlying issue within adaptation studies - specifically the fact that the large majority of work being published deals with specific case studies (2008). A cursory glance at Adaptation, a journal dedicated to its eponymous study, reveals piece after piece reviewing feminism, gender, patriotism, and
many other themes in relation to a specific film. Articles such as these limit their own application of these themes, constraining them from bearing relevancy to any other film. This is one of the fundamental issues within adaptation studies. Leitch proposes that adaptation studies must instead move away from these kinds of works (and fidelity at large as well) and towards texts that deal with “specific problems in the production and reception of adaptations” (Leitch, 2008).

A significant and necessary future contribution would thus be to take Leitch’s recommendation, and focus all efforts on creating a text that addresses issues within adaptation. An examination of past efforts at categorization should be considered, and perhaps a new model be proposed that does not privilege any one type of adaptation over another, and that recognizes the role of adaptation within film theory. Additionally, as previously mentioned, even the matter of the definition of adaptation is nebulous: a future study might endeavour to craft a more clear-cut, easily understood definition, which recognizes adaptations’ intermediality.

Furthermore, future adaptation studies should seek to include more work that addresses the role of music and sound within an adaptation. As countless film music scholars have noted, most notably Gorbman in *Unheard Melodies* (1987), film is theorized as primarily a visual medium, as opposed to an audio-visual medium. This fallacy relegates dialogue, music, and sound as simply additions to film, rather than as central and crucial elements. Likewise, this same bias may be seen in adaptation studies, which seems to largely neglect sound studies. Within the sizeable amount of research undertaken for this chapter, only one scholar discussed music’s role in any substantial
way, arguing that the soundtrack is the richest adaptive text (Jellenik, 223). This may be
due to the field’s own lack of organization, but nonetheless this is an important avenue
for future research. Music and sounds’ role in creating a specific intermedial aesthetic
cannot and should not be ignored. The role of Shore’s score in enhancing the created
world of *The Lord of the Rings* will be discussed in more depth in Chapter Three, but it is
worth noting it here as well that Jackson’s attention to Tolkien’s musical, linguistic and
sonic descriptions give a legitimacy to the films and are also an important tool in
characterization.
Chapter Three

Dialogue

The function of dialogue within film may at first appear superficial. As *Film Encyclopedia* describes it: “Since the cinema is essentially a visual medium, dialogue is, or should be, used more sparingly than in the theatre, supplementing action rather than replacing it” (Katz & Nolen, 57). It is indeed true that cinema can achieve more visually than theatre, as it is not restrained to a single stage and has the use of technology such as computer-generated imagery; but does this mean that film dialogue should also be used more sparingly than in theatre?

Film theorists seem to disagree on this matter. At the initial conception of sound/dialogue in film, Russian filmmakers S.M. Eisenstein, V.I. Pudovkin, and G.V. Alexandrov published an open letter titled ‘A Statement on Sound’ criticizing the introduction of speech and sound in film (1928). The filmmakers felt that using synchronous sound would ultimately “destroy the culture of montage” and that only by the use of contrapuntal sound could this disparagement be remedied.

While synchronous sound has stood the test of time, it seems that the idea that film is a visual medium primarily, and sound and dialogue are additions, has endured. Fortunately, the importance and significance of film music and sound have been recognized by scholars, and the study of film soundtracks continues to flourish. The same cannot be said of dialogue studies. As Kozloff writes, “Dialogue has been perceived as too transparent, too simple to study” (6). Yet, dialogue occupies a central role in film: “dialogue occupies...”
the sonic foreground and music and effects the background” (Buhler, Neumeyer, & Deemer, 9).

Interestingly, dialogue has been historically privileged in film over sound in what Michel Chion has coined ‘vococentrism’ (7, 1999). Chion notes that intelligibility of the voice has remained a primary goal for filmmakers, and that the voice sonically commands centre stage: ‘The presence of a human voice structures the sonic space that contains it’ (5, 1999). Thus, as Chion argues, audiences are attracted to the sound of the voice over any other sounds. Despite the fact that dialogue studies remain sparse, it is clear that dialogue plays an important role in film. Memorable lines of dialogue can be just as iconic as a theme song. However, dialogue’s significance in film lies beyond creating memorable one-liners and witty retorts. This chapter will discuss several ways in which dialogue structures the fantastical sonic space of Middle-Earth.

To begin, Sarah Kozloff’s research on the functions of dialogue as well as her concept of ‘speech acts’ will be examined in relation to LotR. This analysis will illuminate the various manners in which dialogue acts in conjunction with the visual, or in the case of speech acts, replaces it entirely as speech becomes action. Following this, the particular vocal role of the Ring will be considered through the lens of Chion’s acousmêtre. The Ring is a fantastical character unlike any seen on screen before: the addition of vocal capabilities is a large part of its unique qualities. Thus, the meaningful use of the voice will be discussed along with its effect on the narrative. The final section of the chapter will focus on Tolkien’s linguistic legacy - his myriad of invented languages. The functions of the invented languages will be considered as they appear within the novels
and the films. The chapter will conclude with a brief discussion reviewing the functions of dialogue and offering recommendations for future research.

**Dialogue in LotR**

As discussed in Chapter 1, Peter Jackson faced a challenge that all directors of adaptations face - how to make the film approachable to new audiences yet retain the quality and nuances of the original in order to please existing fans. One way in which Jackson chose to facilitate this was through his use of dialogue. As actors Viggo Mortensen and Ian McKellen confirmed, the director and producers were ‘mindful of the novel’ and this included a mindfulness towards dialogue (Boyens, Jackson, & Walsh, 2011, Disc 3A). As mentioned earlier, Jackson noted that the novels were unfilmable if they were to be shot scene by scene (Hunter, 157), and therefore some scenes required re-arranging. Original lines of dialogue were also rearranged: Jackson used a line of dialogue from Elrond in the novel and gave it to Aragorn in the film, but the director was still utilizing Tolkien’s language (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3A). Alternately, Thomas Leitch writes that with some exceptions, Jackson did not actually use a great deal of Tolkien’s dialogue verbatim (138), and that the dialogue in the film is less arcane than that of the novels, with the exception of references to people and places (142).

In their desire to retain as much of the thematic material of the novels, the script was constantly being re-written, to the point where a script might be changed the night before a shoot: Philippa Boyens compared the ever-changing dialogue to laying the tracks as the train approached (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3A). The producers and Jackson also allowed
actors to have input into what and how their character might speak (an example is included in the section on invented languages). It is clear that dialogue was of great importance to Jackson: for him it played a large role in bridging the gap between the novels and the film.

In order to frame the discussion of dialogue and underscore its importance in the narrative, Sarah Kozloff’s functions of dialogue should be considered. Kozloff’s functions of dialogue are as follows: 1) anchorage of diegesis and characters, 2) communication of narrative causality, 3) enactment of narrative events, 4) character revelation, 5) adherence to the code of realism, 6) control of viewer evaluation (34). While each of these functions is present in LoTR, select examples will be discussed in greater detail.

In the opening scene of FotR, the audience is introduced to Middle-Earth, but before anything is seen on screen, Galadriel’s voice is heard, whispering first in Elvish, and then opening with “The world is changing” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 1A). The decision to initially present the film sonically focuses the audience’s attention on Galadriel’s voice and underlines the importance that sound and dialogue will play in the film, and also serves as an introduction to the use of Elvish in the films.

According to Film Art, exposition is concentrated during the beginning of the film (Bordwell & Thompson, 36). The prologue serves to introduce the audience to the backstory of Middle-Earth and the Ring in as short a time as possible. Briefly, it describes how the Ring was made, the war with Sauron, and how the Ring was lost and found its way to Bilbo Baggins. These actions are all visually represented on screen, but it is
arguably Galadriel’s narration that effectively provides the most information. Indeed, without the narration, the on-screen action may not make complete sense, and important details, such as the unique features of the Ring, would not be communicated. The opening scene thus fulfills two functions as outlined by Kozloff: 1) The anchorage of diegesis and characters, and 3) enactment of narrative events (34).

While the prologue demonstrates that dialogue is used to provide the audience with narrative information, the following example suggests that dialogue can also be used to confuse both the audience and the characters. At the onset of TT, the fellowship has lost Gandalf and been broken. Aragorn, Legolas, and Gimli enter Fangorn Forest in pursuit of Merry and Pippin, who have fled into the forest to escape the Uruk-hai. As they are searching the forest, Legolas (who, as an elf, possesses superior sight and hearing) warns his companions that ‘the White Wizard’ is approaching (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 2B). Before this moment, Saruman, who has been revealed to be in league with Sauron, was referred to as the White Wizard. Their initial presumption of Saruman’s approach raises alarm. They prepare to attack, but their weapons are rendered useless, and they are unable to see their foe as a bright ray of light emanates from the wizard. As the wizard begins speaking, he sounds like Saruman, but there is an ethereal quality to the speech. The voice begins to sound more like Gandalf, which leaves both the characters and audience unsure of the speakers identity, until the light dims and they are able to see that it is Gandalf, who has returned to life as Gandalf the White. The sound mixing team cleverly did this by having both Christopher Lee and Sir Ian McKellen record the lines of dialogue, and then fading Saruman out while fading Gandalf in as the line progresses.
(Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3B). This effective use of dialogue keeps the suspense and also vocally symbolizes the title passing from Saruman to Gandalf. This example exhibits Kozloff’s sixth function, control of viewer evaluation, by confounding the audience as to the speaker’s identity and ensuring that they initially believe it to be Saruman as well; it also suggests how dialogue can be used to replace action.

The actions of TT focuses on the struggle of the kingdom of Rohan in resisting the increasing threat faced by Saruman. As Saruman prepares to launch an attack, he uses magic in order to weaken the king, Theoden; Saruman places his henchman Grima Wormtongue as Theoden’s advisor and it is through Wormtongue that the spell is facilitated. We are introduced to Theoden as a diminished and failing old man who does not seem to possess the mental capacity to rule anymore. It is clear that Wormtongue is taking advantage of Theoden’s situation and influencing him to do things he likely would not otherwise do, such as banishing his nephew Eomer. Once Theoden’s son dies during the night, it seems clear that Wormtongue is corrupting Rohan from the inside.

As Theoden’s niece Eowyn so succinctly says to Wormtongue “Your words are poison” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 1B). Wormtongue’s control over Theoden has been enacted in an entirely verbal way. We do not need to witness Wormtongue slowly poisoning Theoden’s mind to be able to understand it. This succinct line of dialogue is an example of Kozloff’s second function: communicating narrative causality (34). As Kozloff explains, dialogue “explains what cannot be communicated visually” (39). Attempting to capture Wormtongue’s vocal spell on film would be time-consuming, thus dialogue is used in order to disclose this event.
A second significant example of dialogue’s ability to communicate narrative causality is through the telepathic communication of Elrond and Galadriel, which occurs in TT. The audience is already familiar with Galadriel’s telepathic abilities, as she employed them to communicate privately and to see the minds of the fellowship upon their arrival in Lothlórien. As Rohan prepares for war in Helm’s Deep, Galadriel reaches out to Elrond to urge him to aid the remaining people of Middle-Earth as the elves prepare to leave.

Images of Elrond and Galadriel are used in a shot-reverse-shot technique to create the semblance of a conversation, as Galadriel speaks and Elrond listens. Initially, only Galadriel’s eyes and not her mouth are shown, leaving doubt as to whether she is physically speaking or not. Towards the end of the scene, it is revealed that she has been speaking aloud, yet can be understood by Elrond.

The telepathic conversation may also be seen as an example of Stilwell’s ‘fantastical gap’, as the conversation exists within an ambiguous space due to the vast geographical distance between the two (193). Despite the fact that Galadriel is physically speaking, and thus the vocal source is visible, the source is imaginary for Elrond. This example showcases the fantastical abilities of dialogue when used to illustrate the telepathic qualities of the elves in an easily identifiable way.

An additional function of dialogue that Kozloff discusses is that of the speech act, which is founded in the belief that conversations can be thought of as actions; these acts are “pivotal links of the narrative chain”, or major events in the narrative (Kozloff, 41). There are two main speech acts in LotR that serve this purpose. The first occurs in FotR as the fellowship attempts to pass through the mountains at Caradhras. The fellowship
must contend with the snowy weather of the mountain, and are seen trudging along slowly. This already dangerous situation is complicated as Saruman attempts to impede their journey by casting spells that cause great boulders to fall from the mountain. His motivation is to force the group to turn back and proceed through the Mines of Moria, an even more dangerous route. In this scene, the audience is alerted to the fact that this is occurring through Gandalf’s exclamation “It’s Saruman!” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 2A). Following this, we are shown Saruman standing atop the tower of Orthanc casting spells in the direction of the mountain. This is an important speech act within the narrative as it provides a reason why the fellowship must abandon their route through the mountains, despite Gandalf’s initial hesitation. Gandalf’s reservations about entering Moria combined with Saruman’s concerted effort forewarn the audience that there is something to be feared within Moria.

The second significant speech act is the scene in which Gollum reveals his plot to kill Frodo and Sam. This speech act involves a revelation of a secret, which Kozloff states is the most common type of speech act, and which generally reveals information that is vital to the plot and poses a threat (41). This information is typically revealed near the end of a film, as is the exact case with this speech act. In the scenes preceding this revelation, Frodo and Sam have been convinced by Gollum to pursue an alternate route into Mordor after they witness just how well-guarded the Black Gate is. The audience is unsure of Gollum’s motivations, as he is presented as villainous but also has helped Frodo on several occasions, such as rescuing him from drowning in the Dead Marshes. His apprehension towards letting the hobbits try to sneak in through the gate is interpreted as
protective by the hobbits, though it is mainly directed by his fear of Sauron regaining the Ring. By speaking with himself, the audience has also been shown Gollum’s dual personality: Gollum (that of the Ring, which seems to dominate him) and Smeagol (his own true identity before the Ring took hold of him). Gollum’s contrasting personalities make it difficult to tell what his intentions are. As he is leading the hobbits towards the secret tunnel, he once again enters into a private conversation between his two personalities, thereby explaining to the audience what his real plan is. Smeagol does not want to kill the hobbits, so Gollum equivocates with Smeagol by stating that he can lead them to the tunnel and “let her do it” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 2B). Though the audience does not yet know who ‘she’ is, they are alerted to the impending danger that the hobbits will be led to, and revealing an important aspect of the plot - the spider Shelob and the capture of Frodo. In addition to fitting the criteria of a speech act, this example also represents the fourth function of dialogue, that of character revelation (Kozloff, 34).

Though dialogue’s essential function is considered to be to communicate information, whether that be to the audience or between the characters, it is evident that dialogue is much more refined than that. Dialogue can fill many roles and can replace action when needed. Compared to dialogue in literature, dialogue in film holds the advantage of being able to express emotion sonically: the audience is able to hear emotion and understand it immediately (Gianetti & Leach, 230). According to Hearing the Movies, speech organizes and interprets the frame (Bulher, Neumeyer, & Deemer, 10). The examples of the importance of dialogue from LotR have shown that dialogue can be used in many ways, and even possess its own plot functions.
Acousmêtre

One of the most significant examples of dialogue in LotR is one that the casual viewer may not consider dialogue at all - that which comes from the supernaturally empowered Ring in the form of whispers in the Black Speech - the language of Mordor. Before examining the ring in depth, its role and narrative function will be briefly sketched out. LotR is focused around the quest to destroy the Ring, an object that has been infused with Sauron’s evil and soul. This act has allowed Sauron to survive in a way, despite the fact that his physical body was destroyed. If Sauron regains the Ring, he would be able to regain his full power and enslave Middle-Earth. He is represented by a tower topped with an eye made of flames referred to as the Great Eye. The Great Eye is always watching Middle-Earth and seeking the Ring. To further aid him in his search, Sauron also has many servants and spies. The greatest of these are the Ringwraiths: once kings, these wraiths were enslaved by Sauron through magical rings he had given to them. They are neither dead nor living, and are cursed with relentlessly hunting for the Ring.

Thus, the Ring represents a personification of evil and Sauron himself. The Ring, the Great Eye, and the Ringwraiths are all connected through a supernatural force. The Ring is able to exert its supernatural power over those around it as well: for example it often tempts Frodo into putting the Ring on, an act that seems to amplify the supernatural connection with the Ringwraiths. The Ring is also able to manipulate situations, such as when it slips onto Frodo’s finger as he falls down; this is also the first time that Frodo wears the Ring. Wearing the Ring renders Frodo invisible, and it also places him in a fantastical space. He can see and interact with his surroundings, but images are greyed
and blurred, and the environmental sound is gone. In this sort of limbo, the Great Eye is able to see and communicate with Frodo: we are able to hear whispers in a foreign language and hear the Great Eye threaten Frodo that it can see him. In this way, the audience is able to hear directly the connection between the Ring and the Great Eye. While Frodo becomes invisible to the physical world, he is suddenly visible in the metaphysical world of which Sauron is master. Additionally, while the Ring is capable of some speech, the Great Eye may only speak (or rather, communicate telepathically) within the metaphysical realm to which the Ring transports Frodo. Despite his lack of a physical body, Sauron is able to see, speak, and exert power over others.

In discussing the Ring, Boyens remarked that through its on-screen presence, the Ring becomes a character, and even develops relationships with various characters (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 1A). The supplementary materials on FotR reveal how the sound effects crew dealt with the Ring, echoing Boyens’ sentiment that the Ring is a character unto itself. The sound technicians initially tried to give the ring a “physical ring” sound that “turned into it having its own voice” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3A). This voice could appeal differently to different characters, seeking ways in which to tempt and corrupt them. Alan Howard, an experienced theatrical actor, supplied the voice of the Ring, which is heard through hushed whispers.

The efforts of the filmmakers to personify the Ring are reflected in the language in which the characters describe it. During Galadriel’s narrated prologue, she describes how the Ring left Gollum and was found by Bilbo, “The Ring perceived its time had now come. It abandoned Gollum. But something happened then the Ring did not
intend” (emphasis is my own) (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 1A). Thus, from the beginning of the films, the audience is aware that the Ring is sentient and can make strategic moves.

It is clear that the Ring’s role in the film extends beyond that of a physical object, it can be considered to have some semblance of sentience, and more significantly, have a voice. Michel Chion’s seminal work The Voice in Cinema explored the role of the voice in film in great depth. Of particular importance is his concept of the acousmêtre. The acousmêtre is a being who is heard, yet the source of its voice cannot be seen (Chion, 19, 1999).

Acousmêtre is derived from ‘acousmatic sound’, a term that was originally created to describe a Pythagorean sect in which the pupils were taught by a master from behind a curtain, so that their image would not distract from the teachings (Chion, 19, 1999). It was ‘re-discovered’ and brought into the literature of musique contrète by composer Pierre Schaeffer (Chion, 18, 1999). Acousmatic sound refers to a sound whose source is unseen. The differentiation between the two lies within the root words of acousmêtre: ‘être’, is the French word for a ‘being’.

The term acousmêtre is fitting for the Ring in describing its broader qualities and function within the narrative. Indeed, even Chion’s wording regarding the acousmêtre’s role in film seems to describe the plot of The Lord of the Rings to a tee: “Everything can boil down to a quest to bring the acousmêtre into the light” (23, 1999). The acousmêtre is typically a malevolent being, and having a vocal source that is hidden is used to create tension and apprehension in the audience. The Ring’s ability to speak coupled with its supernatural abilities acts in a similar way.
Chion outlined four powers that an acousmêtre should possess: ubiquity, panopticism, omniscience, and omnipotence (24, 1999). The Ring displays examples of each of these abilities, with some caveats. It seems clear that the Ring is able to wield power over those it comes into contact with, a power that grows stronger over time. Throughout the duration of the films, we witness Frodo slowly succumbing to the power of the Ring until the moment when he reaches Mount Doom. In this scene, the Ring has taken complete control over Frodo and he is unable to bring himself to destroy it, instead declaring to Sam that it is his possession. The Ring also displays limited abilities of ubiquity, panopticism, and omniscience. Its ability to be everywhere is increased through its connection to the Great Eye and the Ringwraiths. It is evident that the Ring is able to ‘know’ through Galadriel’s description of its perceptive powers, but we cannot judge how far-reaching these powers are. Thus, it seems more apt to define the Ring as a ‘partially-seeing acousmêtre’ (Chion, 26, 1999). Additional powers that Chion’s acousmêtre possesses are invulnerability, control over destructive forces, and hypnotic power. The Ring possesses each of these qualities until its ultimate destruction.

There is one way in which the term acousmêtre is not suitable for application to the Ring, which is that the language used to describe an acousmêtre seems to only apply to a physical figure, and seems less suited to a more abstract entity, such as the Ring. This becomes more apparent when the term ‘de-acousmatization’ is considered: Chion described the de-acousmatization as the unveiling of the sound source (Chion, 27, 1999). The most well-known example of this is the discovery of the true Oz in *The Wizard of Oz* (1939): the man behind the curtain and not the great and powerful wizard he appeared to
be. This is an issue in LotR as there is no ultimate unveiling of Sauron. To de-acousmatize Sauron would be for the fellowship to fail in their journey. Instead, we see a reversal of the de-acousmatization process. During the prologue, we witness Sauron physically (albeit silently) during the battle. It is only when he is defeated that he becomes acousmatized.

Additionally, the acousmître that is the Ring is not in fact one single entity, but rather a piece of an identity that is shared with the Great Eye. Both fit the description of an acousmître given that they possess an acousmêtre’s abilities and create sound without a visual source. Given that there are several caveats regarding their suitability to be termed an acousmêtre, I would like to propose a new category - the ‘fantastic acousmêtre.’ The fantastic acousmêtre possesses the same qualities as the acousmêtre but these powers are achieved through a supernatural means. The fantastic acousmêtre can also apply to acousmêtre’s who do not necessarily possess a physical body or are represented through a fantastical being. The process of de-acousmatization would be different in this respect in that the unveiling of the acousmêtre need not be a physical unveiling, but could be a destruction of the acousmêtre. An example of another fantastic acousmêtre is the character of Voldemort from the *Harry Potter* series, who, like Sauron, infuses his life-force into various objects to sustain his life.

The speech capabilities of the Ring, though nuanced, are of central importance to the film: indeed, the great struggle of the story is arguably that of Frodo, the temptation of the Ring, and his resistance of evil. The abstract quality of this internal struggle would evidently be difficult to capture on film, and thus the quiet whispers of the Ring are used
effectively to portray this on screen. The supernatural qualities are well reflected in the fantastical vocal portrayal of the Ring and of the Great Eye.

**Invented Languages**

*If I had considered my own pleasure more than the stomachs of a possible audience, there would have been a great deal more Elvish in the book.*

(Tolkien, J.R.R., Carpenter, & Tolkien, C., 216)

That Tolkien was primarily a linguist before he was a writer is a well-documented fact (Shippey, 2003). His interest in linguistics began early in his life: as a schoolboy, Tolkien was fluent in Latin, Greek, Anglo-Saxon, and Gothic (Weiner & Marshall, 95). A linguistic proficiency and enthusiasm came naturally to Tolkien: “It has always been with me: the sensibility to linguistic pattern which affects me emotionally like colour or music” (Tolkien et al., 163). His ability to understand and engage with languages provided the foundation necessary upon which to construct his own languages, which would later become a highlight of LotR and one of his most enduring legacies.

The earliest documented lexicons of Tolkien’s creation are from 1915 (Weiner & Marshall, 92). These early experiments produced the languages Quenya and Gnomish. Tolkien’s intention was to create a language that was “specially pleasant” and represented “beauty in word form” (Tolkien et al., 144). The final product was the creation of the two Elvish dialects: Quenya and Sindarin (which evolved out of Gnomish). Quenya possesses elements of Latin, Finnish, and Greek, while Sindarin draws inspiration from Welsh (Weiner & Marshall, 77). Similarly to Latin, Quenya is a more formal language and is
“presented mainly in poetic passages displaying its musicality” (Weiner & Marshall, 77). Sindarin acts as the common-tongue of Elves (Adams, 18). Both of these languages are meant to construe a sense of the ancient, in keeping with Tolkien’s desire of implying that the narrative is more history than fiction (Weiner and Marshall, 80). David Salo, the Tolkien language expert who worked on the films, used both languages in different ways: “I used [Quenya] for some of the lyrics, for benedictions, and in the spells of Gandalf and Saruman. Sindarin, the language most often heard in the film, is the common language of the Elves” (quoted in Adams, 19).

Quenya and Sindarin have evolved outside of their role in LotR, and have inspired fans both amongst academics and in popular culture. In academia, two journals exist for the study of Tolkien’s linguistic notes on Elvish: Vinyar Tenguar and Parma Eldalamberon. In the online world, the content-aggregation website Reddit hosts several forums dedicated to the study and discussion of Quenya and Sindarin with users of all skill levels and even provides material to assist users to learn the languages.

“A name comes first and the story follows” (Tolkien et al., 165). In order to give his “archaic language of lore” more meaning, Tolkien felt that the effectiveness of his invented languages required a “hypothetical background” (Weiner & Marshall, 77); The Lord of the Rings was the product of this thought. As Weiner and Marshall note, “Tolkien invested at least as much of his expertise, ingenuity, imagination, and time in constructing his languages as he did in devising his narrative” (249).

Examples of both Elvish languages are scattered throughout the novels and films. In the books, the reader does not always receive a full translation (Shippey, 2003). In these
situations, the reader is left in much the same state as the hobbit protagonists - to pick it up as they go. This is different from the films as the audience is given subtitles to allow for a full understanding. Though the film’s dialogue is not a word-for-word duplication of the novel’s dialogue, some pieces of Elvish from the film remain intact. One example is the phrase “Mae govannen” – a Sindarin greeting – which the audience hears in the film when Haldir arrives to Helm’s Deep with an elvish army to aid Rohan (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 2B).

Though Elvish is predominantly spoken by elves in the film, Aragorn also regularly communicates in Elvish. This is a useful technique that helps connect Aragorn to the elves and Rivendell, where he was raised. To strengthen this connection, and to add to characterization, one extended scene in FotR features Aragorn singing ‘The Lay of Beren and Luthien’ in Elvish as the Hobbits sleep. Frodo overhears Aragorn, and, able to understand the language, asks Aragorn of whom he is singing. This scene is significant in several ways: it is one of the few examples of diegetic music in the film and one of even fewer examples of Tolkien’s songs diegetically included in the film. The idea for this scene came from actor Viggo Mortensen himself (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A). ‘The Lay of Beren and Luthien’ tells of a love story between an immortal elf and mortal man, a story that reflects that of Aragorn and Arwen. Mortensen may have gained inspiration for this scene from reading the appendixes of The Lord of the Rings, where Arwen and Aragorn’s meeting was detailed (though it plays a large role in the films, their relationship is not directly mentioned in the novels, only in the appendix). The appendix describes Aragorn walking through the forests of Rivendell, singing ‘The Lay of Beren
and Luthien’, and then laying eyes upon Arwen (the music of this scene will be discussed further in Chapter Three).

In addition to Quenya and Sindarin, Tolkien added several other invented languages into LotR, though these are not as fully-fledged as the Elvish dialects, nor do these feature as prominently in the films. The dwarvish language, Khuzdul, is semi-developed, with some apparent roots, and contains elements of Hebrew and Arabic (Weiner & Marshall, 83). Dwarvish is more consonant-heavy, and uses the letters ‘k’ and ‘z’ frequently, giving it a harsher sound than Elvish. Salo described Khuzdul as a “hard-edged, rough language, constructed long ago by the makers of the dwarves and [has] changed very little since that time” (quoted in Adams, 36). Tolkien’s Khuzdul language is not as fully-fledged as the Elvish dialects, and contained only a small amount of vocabulary, thus for Salo to write choral lyrics, he had to get creative: “I used existing roots to build up a vocabulary, but there was practically no grammar. The language that appears in the movies is about one-quarter by Tolkien, three-quarters by me.” (quoted in Velten, 220).

Adunaic is Tolkien’s version of Latin for the race of men (Weiner & Marshall, 80). It is no longer spoken, but was created by the same race of men that Aragorn belongs to, the dunedain (Velten, 211). There are only a few surviving dunedain remaining during the events of LotR, but they do differ from men in several ways, such as a higher life expectancy. Salo did not have to create much of the dunedain language, as Tolkien had invented a detailed explanation of the grammar (Adams, 37). Adunaic is heard in the films through the choral music of the Ringwraiths, fantastical beings under the power of
Sauron (Velten, 216). Salo suggested providing them with an antiquated speech to reflect this unique history (Adams, 34).

The land of Mordor also contains two languages, Black Speech and Orkish. Black Speech is the native language of Mordor, and that which Sauron created for his subordinates (Adams, 34): “Tolkien wanted that particular language to be grating and unpleasant to the ear. It has a lot of consonant clusters, a lot of back vowels” (Salo, quoted in Adams, 34). It is the language used in the inscription on the Ring and is alluded to in the film. Once Gandalf realizes that Bilbo’s ring may in fact be The One Ring, he identifies it through the inscription, which is only displayed when exposed to fire. The audience does not hear the Black Speech, but it is clear that the language has evil connotations, as Gandalf declares “The language is that of Mordor, which I will not utter here” (Boyens et al., 2011 Disc 1A). It can also be faintly heard in any interaction with Sauron. These interactions occur through fantastical circumstances, such as when the Ring is worn or through the Palantir, or seeing-stone. Saruman uses a Palantir to communicate with Sauron who is heard speaking in the Black Speech before his instructions are heard in English. Similarly to Khuzdul, Salo created much of the Black Speech heard in the film. Salo stated that there were only a few words of the Black Speech written by Tolkien, the longest example being the ring inscription (Adams, 35).

Orkish is not heard in the films, nor alluded to, but exists in the novels. The exclusion of Orkish may be due to the fact that the orcs have relatively minimal dialogue as it is, and Jackson may not have wished to complicate the dialogue with the addition of another language. Orkish is derived from the Black Speech, and both feature heavy consonants,
guttural sounds, and lack the clear ‘e’ vowel. These languages are meant to sound cacophonous and harsh; they stand in stark opposition of the fairer Elvish tongues. In addition to clearly showcasing the contrast between good and evil through the harmonious and disharmonious sounds, the linguistic differences between Elvish and Orkish may be an allusion to the connection between the two races. Orcs were not a natural occurring species, but rather were a creation brought to life through the torture and mutilation of elves. Thus, they are meant to represent the opposite of the elves in every fashion, including their language. Moreover, their language echoes their derivative origins, the orcs “took what they could of other tongues and perverted it to their own liking, yet they made only brutal jargons” (Weiner & Marshall, 106).

The invented languages are largely incorporated into the films through the score. “I had the idea of using Tolkien’s languages to express another layer of his thinking. It’s a way to get the mythology back into the film” (Shore, quoted in Adams, 11). As a result, the films feature a diverse array of choral singing in Tolkien’s invented languages. Though the audience will not understand the meaning of the words themselves, the inclusion of these languages lends a sense of the ancient, as if they are singing in a dead language. Salo assisted Shore in creating lyrics in Tolkien’s languages for the choral pieces in the score. The source for Salo’s lyrics differs: some are original Tolkien lyrics, some are adapted, and some are completely original, drawing inspiration from Tolkien (Velten, 210).

Though Tolkien’s invented languages have acted as a foundation upon which LotR was built, they play a crucial role in the tales. The fleshed out languages mark the novels
as something beyond a mere tale, but truly help in creating the air of ‘folklore’ that Tolkien sought to create. For the avid fan, they provide a new layer upon which to explore the lore of Middle-Earth. For the films, they lend a sense of authenticity and create a tangible connection to the novels. The many scenes featuring spoken Elvish help to lend a sense of the fantastic to the films – a subtle sense that shapes and defines the series.

**Discussion**

Throughout this chapter, the influence of dialogue in LotR has been demonstrated. Dialogue can fulfill technical requirements, such as informing the audience or characters of narrative events, but as Kozloff has determined, these functions are complex and varied. Dialogue in LotR functioned to bridge the gap in different circumstances: between the book and the film through infusing Tolkien’s original dialogue and thus lending a sense of authenticity, between characters or between the audience and characters by providing necessary information, and even bridging the gap in a fantastical sense through telepathic conversations and wizard’s spells. This function is of particular significance as the films need to strike a fine balance between realism and fantasy. They must communicate the magical elements of the tale in a believable way. The significant contributions of dialogue in support of creating coherence in an imagined world are often minimized. As the examples in this chapter have shown, dialogue has played a large role in reaching that goal.

A particularly unique function of dialogue in bridging the gap in a fantastical sense
was through the acousmêtre, the Ring. The Ring exhibits all of Chion’s qualifications as an acousmêtre, yet those powers may be difficult to identify without its vocal qualities. The objective for the filmmakers was to give the audience the impression that the Ring was its own being, rather than an inanimate object. This is a difficult task to accomplish, as the Ring’s life-force is abstract. Equipping the Ring with a voice provided a necessary sense of sentience and serves to amplify the threat it poses.

Chion’s term is limited in its applicability to the Ring due to the fact that it does not possess a physical body that may result in its de-acousmatization, thus I proposed an alternate term of the ‘fantastic acousmêtre.’ The term ‘fantastic acousmêtre’ is used to account for the lack of a physical body and is meant to entail the acousmêtre, which may exist within a fantasy realm. One avenue for future research may be to further investigate the applicability of ‘fantastic acousmêtre’ and identify other examples beyond the two that I have provided, the Ring and Voldemort of the *Harry Potter* series. If more examples were to be found, it would be interesting to compare the omniscient powers of the fantastic acousmêtre and determine whether differences may exist and if the difference are dependent upon genre.

Finally, the unique legacy of Tolkien’s tales was examined - the invented languages. Similar to the original lines of dialogue taken from the books, the invented languages served as a means to bridge the gap between novel and film: a prime example is through the Elvish songs sung by Aragorn. However, the role that Tolkien’s created languages play is much more substantial. The invented languages are used as a means to assist in the characterization of the various cultures in Middle-Earth, particularly that of Elvish
and Adunaic. The Elvish language creates a sense of the unfamiliar and antiquated, as it is not a language that exists outside of Tolkien’s realms yet has its roots within ancient languages on Earth. Adunaic also provides a sense of antiquity and the ancient, as it is a dead language within Middle-Earth and is associated with the Ringwraiths, who are archaic in their own right.

The invented languages are mainly used in tandem with music, and thus do not largely feature in the narrative. Yet they are useful in disseminating information about the many cultures within Middle-Earth to the audience. In spite of the incredible length of the films, it would be difficult to adequately express the intricately detailed races and cultures that Tolkien elaborated. Hence, language and music have been brought together to assist in this fashion. As Tolkien’s initial conception of Middle-Earth was formulated purely out of a desire to provide context to his languages, Jackson was surely mindful of the fact that they must be included in the films.

Over the long span of the films and books, there are countless ways in which dialogue is used to fulfill a variety of roles, and surely far more than could be adequately discussed within the scope of this chapter. However, it should now be clear that dialogue offers far more narrative support than has been credited. The dialogue within LotR is far more complex and integral than it may first appear: and for the purposes of this thesis, an especially crucial function that dialogue fulfills within LotR is to communicate the fantastical, which it is able to do through the acousmêtre and the inclusion of invented languages. Future research could look to examine additional roles of dialogue in the fantasy genre, and create a comparative examination of dialogue across a wide scope of
genres. More work certainly must be done to understand and value the role of dialogue in film. As dialogue within Jackson’s films has demonstrated, verbal communication truly is key.
Chapter Four

Music

I wanted there to be three beautiful works: the book, the films, and the music. That's what I wanted to create.

Howard Shore (quoted in Adams, 4)

For Peter Jackson to realize his vision of LotR, he required a composer who would be able to bring the music of Middle-Earth to life and create music with cultural significance to the fictional world. Jackson and producers Fran Walsh and Philippa Boyens’ first and only choice was Canadian composer Howard Shore (Adams, 5). Boyens explained that, while the filmmakers were choosing temp tracks and deciding on a style, they routinely came back to Shore’s previous work and realized that his compositional style was best suited for the film (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4C). Boyens was particularly inspired by Shore’s score for David Cronenbzer’s The Fly (1986) and hoped to find a similar sound for the scene in which Frodo and Sam encounter Shelob, a giant spider (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4C).

Shore prefers slightly unconventional work habits: he immerses himself within the film’s production as much as possible (Brown, 335). On the DVD’s making-of documentary, Jackson explains that composers typically begin work once the film has been finished, as music constitutes one of the last components (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A). In this case, however, Shore’s work began even before principle filming commenced: he was invited to New Zealand to visit the set of FotR to get a sense of the
design and feel of the movie to decide whether or not to compose for Jackson. His work on the films ultimately would take four years.

Shore began writing the score in 2000, and composed in both his home studio in New York and in New Zealand, and he met weekly with Jackson and producers Walsh and Boyens. The collaborative spirit of the project positively benefitted Shore: “Most composers want to get some notes and to go off and create…I realized early on that if I worked with them I would create a much better score.” (quoted in Adams, 7).

As Shore began his work on the films, he began researching ring-based mythology in addition to re-familiarizing himself with Tolkien’s works (Adams, 2). His interest in historic mythology influenced the direction of the sound: “I’m writing the music based on a story that predates our culture. I want it to feel old. I want to create a very specific sound for this story…to feel like somebody discovered the score…in a vault somewhere” (quoted in Adams, 3). Shore’s interest in Tolkien’s mythology sparked him to research historic Western, Celtic, Middle-Eastern, and African musical traditions in his attempt to create a musical history for Middle-Earth (Adams, 3). The diverse array of instruments and styles examined helped to create sonically distinct cultures within the fantasy realm in the style of leitmotivs. At any point when Shore could not find a sound that would fit, he would “experiment with the percussive capacity of piano wires, new variations on fiddles’ sympathetic strings, and bowed lutes” (Adams, 2). These experiments in instrumentation thus led to an uncommon score.

Jackson’s recognition of the importance of the score led to a collaborative effort on the part of the filmmaker and the composer, which resulted in an increased role in the
musical process for Jackson, as well. He emphasized that music and emotion are related closely and play crucial parts in the success of a film, likening it to “directing the performance of an actor” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4B). Shore echoed the importance of emotion in music: “Most themes began based on an emotional emphasis. I wanted the audience to feel.” (quoted in Adams, 7). The director admits his lack of musical knowledge but strove to engage with the process regardless. Jackson worked closely with Shore, describing the sentiment of each scene and character to Shore to ensure the music corresponded appropriately. Jackson’s immersion into the musical process extended to playing an instrument on the score (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A): Shore instructed Jackson to bang a gong for the introductory piece to Rohan, which can be heard as Aragorn, Legolas, Gimli, and Gandalf are entering the capital city of Edoras.

Shore constructed the score by building around a number of themes: using a leitmotif style of composition (Adams, 4). The leitmotif is a Wagnerian operatic technique that associates a particular musical melody, rhythm or sonority with a specific person, place, or thing. It has become a familiar compositional tool in film music – suggesting a somewhat generalized, intermedial role for music in film – but also one where memorable themes are useful for marketing and for creating emotional effects. Shore’s approach was to compose leitmotivs primarily for geographical locations (however, some characters or objects also have distinct themes). The various leitmotivs for different locations aid the audience to identify – and provide information about – the numerous cultures within Tolkien’s fictional world.
The following sections will examine some of the most significant leitmotivs and diegetic music present in LotR and provide details regarding instrumentation and meaning, followed by an analysis of non-leitmotif music, such as the promotional songs for each film, which are heard in the credits. The chapter will conclude with a discussion on the score and its relationship to the novels.

**Leitmotivs and Diegetic Music:**
**The Shire**

As previously noted, Shore generally composed leitmotivs for places. Thus, instead of creating four separate themes for the four hobbits, they are collectively represented by the Shire theme. The theme aids in designing an association between each of them and associating them with home and their desire to return home. Adams writes that “the Shire theme reminds the audience that for all its spectacle and flourish, Tolkien’s story is primarily about simple themes: friendship, loyalty, and the sanctity of home” (22).

The hobbits are described as peaceful, easy-going, and rustic folk. They are protected by Gandalf to such a degree that they remain relatively ignorant of world events, and care little for what lies beyond their own borders. Hobbits embrace a simple and traditional lifestyle. The Shire theme expresses these ideals through its playful and hopeful sound expressed in a major key. Unlike the more serious themes for Elves or men, the hobbit theme sounds less sober and thoughtful, rejoicing in its simplicities.

The principle instruments used by the orchestra in this theme are strings and woodwinds, such as fiddles and flutes. Tolkien provided a description of hobbit instruments being played at Bilbo’s birthday party: “Noises of trumpets and horns, pipes
and flutes, and other musical instruments” (Tolkien, 38, 1999). The only example of diegetic instrumental hobbit music shown in the films is of this scene. The audience is able to see the hobbits playing simple woodwinds and strings. The diegetic music provides the soundtrack for the party in a style similar to that of the Shire theme. Shore sought to recreate the rustic setting sonically by choosing folk instruments. Consequently, the Shire theme bears distinct Celtic influences (Young, 17). Shore stated, “We wanted to feel that the hobbits were playing the music, so it has that quality” (quoted in Adams, 26).

Shore uses multiple variations of the Shire theme to fit a multitude of moments: Adams detailed the distinctive settings as pensive, rural, hymn, lullaby, heroic, and playful (22). Each of these settings reflects the hobbits thoughts and feelings, and the instrumentation changes accordingly. For the heroic setting, the lead wood flute is replaced by a French horn, providing a bolder sound (Young, 47). The pensive setting is heard played by a solo clarinet, which creates a more sombre tone (Adams, 23). The many thematic variations of the Shire theme allow the audience to hear the changes and maturations the hobbits experience, as well as witness them onscreen.

The Shire theme appears in each film, and undergoes variations as the hobbits themselves change and grow. The end of their journey is heard with sounds of ‘The Shire Reborn’, the final variation on the theme, which retains the buoyancy and simplicity of the theme, but mingled with strains of melancholy, signaling acceptance of the end of an Age and the beginning of a new one.

The novels present the hobbits, especially Bilbo Baggins, as exceedingly musical. This musical legacy, though not represented in its entirety, is portrayed through several
instances of song. There are two primary examples of diegetic hobbit songs, both of which occur in RotK. The first takes place in Edoras, following the victory at Helm’s Deep, where a celebration is underway. Pippin and Merry are found standing atop a table (which leaves them at about eye-level for the much taller men), and are performing a folk song ode to their local pub, The Green Dragon. The eponymous song is sung slightly off rhythm, perhaps owing to the influence of the pints of beer that they hold throughout their performance. A lone fiddle is heard accompanying them softly in the background, rounding out the folk song.

The second example of diegetic hobbit music is Pippin singing ‘The Edge of Night’ to Lord Denethor, steward of Gondor. The song follows after Lord Denethor has ordered his son Faramir, Captain of Gondor, to reclaim the over-run city of Osgiliath, an errand that amounts to a suicide mission. Lord Denethor seems ignorant of this fact and requests that Pippin sing him a song to accompany his dinner. Pippin thus begins an acapella rendition of ‘The Edge of Night’, a melancholy and introspective song. The footage of Pippin singing cross-cuts with Faramir and his small band of men charging towards Osgiliath as the orcs draw their bows. The use of the music in this scene helps to underscore the futile military maneuver: instead of a triumphant, full brass section, the music sounds more akin to a requiem.

The idea to include this song came merely days before shooting the scene. Boyens suggested including a piece of music, and chose a poem that was originally one of Bilbo’s walking songs (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4C). Boyens whittled it down to the song heard in the film. Interestingly, actor Billy Boyd wrote the melody for the song: Boyd had been
given about a day’s notice to put music to the words for the scene and the vocals were later recorded at Abbey Road Studios (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4C). The song is accompanied lightly by strings, which Shore had written around the vocals. The song ends with the lines ‘all shall fade’ with the sounds of arrows being fired, a powerful use of musical counterpoint.

The musical counterpoint heard in this scene provides an example of what film theorist Michel Chion calls ‘the acousmatization of the unshowable’ (209, 1999). Essentially, this concept refers to the use of sound to ‘show’ the audience something occurring off-screen, typically something gruesome. Chion provides examples such as a murder scene, in which a gun is pointed towards a victim. While the camera flashes to a shot of somewhere outside, the gunshot is heard, indicating to the audience the murder has taken place. The example of Pippin’s song overlaying the charge on Osgiliath does not provide sounds as concrete as the gunshot: the audience does not hear the impact of the arrows upon the small battalion. However, Pippin’s final line of the song, “all shall fade,” acts as the acousmatization of the unshowable in this instance. His words describe what has occurred in a literal sense, sparing the audience a more chilling visual.

Rivendell and Lothlórien

When Tolkien was writing his mythology, he conceived the Elves as a lithe, wise, and musical people. The Elves were the first-born peoples and possessed many physical gifts, chiefly immortality. The Elves are in the process of leaving Middle-Earth, and passing over the sea to the Grey Havens, the Elvish homeland. Sam describes the Elves as ‘old
and young, and so gay and sad, as it were’ (Tolkien, 114, 1999). The merriment of the
Elves has become bittersweet as they face the diminishment of their Middle-Earth
civilizations. This is reflected musically by Shore.

There are two principle Elvish kingdoms in The Lord of the Rings that the fellowship
visits: Rivendell and Lothlórien. Musically, they are distinctive but share some qualities:
the music, according to Adams, ‘is awash in chromatic harmonies, Eastern influences,
and distinctive instruments. Shore favours female voices and the most transparent
tones…clean figures devoid of plush harmonizations, tidy, artful worlds of music’ (42).
The music is presented mainly non-diegetically; Lothlórien, however, contains an
example of diegetic music that will be explored further in this section.

Rivendell is the first Elvish kingdom the hobbits (and the audience) encounter, and
also bears the distinction of being the birth place of the fellowship. Rivendell is a cultural
and academic epicentre, where outsiders seeking advice from Lord Elrond are welcome.
Rivendell is presented initially in more familiar orchestral tones, which depict a realm of
“opulence and respite”, but which gradually become “darker and more tenebrous as
Middle-Earth is abandoned by the Elves” (Adams, 42). This is reflected visually as
Rivendell darkens on screen as well.

The fellowship encounters Lothlórien towards the end of FotR, and it is initially a
more uncertain place than Rivendell. Aragorn and Legolas are familiar with Lothlórien,
but Gimli is uneasy in the wooded realm. He has heard rumours of a witch who lives
within the forest. “Rivendell is more about learning and knowledge but this is different.
This is a more mysterious world of Elves. They could be bad; they could be good - you’re
not really sure” (Shore, quoted in Adams, 51). This uncertainty is reflected musically in a theme which is “alien and intimidating” (Adams, 42) at first, but becomes more welcoming as the fellowship meet Galadriel, the “witch” and leader of Lothlórien, and find her to be an ally.

The theme for Lothlórien is the most Eastern and exotic Elvish music, which Adams describes as “emotionally unreadable” (51). It is sung by a female chorus, with little vibrato and clear tones. Shore sought to make this music in particular sound ancient, a reflection of the fact that these Elves are the oldest civilization in Middle-Earth. In order to craft this sound, Shore drew inspiration from Gregorian chant to create the ethereal and archaic sound of Lothlórien (Adams, 51). The theme for Lothlórien changes throughout the films as well. Initially, Shore uses an augmented second interval in the opening to stress the sense of the ancient, but as Lothlórien becomes more involved with Middle-Earth through the course of the action, this augmented second is heard less often until it is eliminated completely in its statement in RotK (Adams, 54).

Two instances of diegetic Elvish music occur within a specific category of their own. These are examples in which the music heard is diegetic but has a fantastic aspect. The ethereal quality of the Elves is communicated through this music to the viewer. As James Buhler writes, the music “hovers nebulously between the diegetic and the non-diegetic, disembodied but of this world” (232). Stilwell’s ‘fantastical gap’ serves as a term for what I believe Buhler was trying to describe. Given that LotR is in itself a fantasy of epic proportions, its music fittingly displays similarly fantastic elements.
The first example of the fantastical gap in Elvish music occurs in the woods before Frodo and Sam reach Rivendell. In true Elvish fashion, they are heard before they are seen, alerting Frodo and Sam to their presence by their singing. The voices lead the two hobbits to the Elves, who are on their journey to the Grey Havens, the first indication to the audience that Middle-Earth is changing. The music in this scene presents an example of a fantastical gap, in that there is no apparent source of the music, but it is clear to both the audience and the characters that the source of the sound is the Elves. The Elves exude an ethereal glow during the night-time journey, a visual indication of the fantastical. Similar to their glow, the Elves seem to exude song, as the audience cannot see them physically singing. The accompanying music is thus used to create a sonic sense of the fantastic amongst the Elves.

A second example of a fantastical gap in the film also occurs in FotR. Following the loss of Gandalf, the fellowship makes its way to Lothlórien, where news of his passing quickly reaches the inhabitants. As the fellowship settles for the evening, a solo voice sings in Elvish with a choir softly providing harmony. The voice is that of Elizabeth Fraser, who was chosen by Shore for Lothlórien because of her voice’s ethereal quality (Buhler, 232). The song, titled ‘Lament for Gandalf’ contains both Sindarin and Quenya text, written by Boyens and translated by Salo.

This scene exemplifies the fantastical gap similar to that of the first, as the music has no apparent source to confirm its location in the diegesis. As the fellowship is settling down, the audience can hear the lament through the distinct solo voice and choir. The music initially appears to be non-diegetic and is revealed to be diegetic once Merry asks
Legolas what the words of the song mean; Legolas replies that it is a lament for Gandalf.

This moment reveals to the audience that it is indeed the Elves of Lothlórien who are the source of the music, but they are never revealed on screen. The realization that the music is diegetic in this scene adds to the sense of the otherworldly, as the disembodied voices do not sound near or far but retain the same quality and volume, preventing audience detection of the sound’s source.

Although Tolkien described this musicality of the Elves throughout his novels, Jackson may have had more difficulty in expressing this innate musicality on-screen. The two preceding uses of the fantastic gap portray this musicality by featuring the sonic world of the Elves, suggesting that the music emanates from them without being physically produced by them.

Similarly to hobbit folk songs, Tolkien’s books are littered with Elvish songs, disclosing historical events and legends. Jackson and Shore could not fit the scope of these songs, but two examples are nevertheless found within the films. One of the most prominent takes place in FotR, shortly after the hobbits have met Aragorn, whom they know as Strider for the time being. As Aragorn keeps watch while the hobbits sleep he sings to himself in Elvish. In a rare instance, the lyrics are not translated to English in subtitles, possibly as a reflection of Aragorn’s shroud of mystery before his identity is revealed. Frodo awakens and asks Aragorn about the woman he sings of, indicating that, at the least, Frodo can understand some Elvish. Aragorn explains that the song is ‘The Lay of Luthien’, a song telling the story of the elf-maiden Luthien who falls in love with the mortal man Beren. The tale ultimately ends in death, as Luthien forsakes her
immortality to be with Beren. Readers of Tolkien, particularly those who have read *The Silmarillion* (1977), will instantly recognize this story.

The idea to include the song in the film came from actor Viggo Mortensen (Aragorn), who felt it would add depth to his character, by foreshadowing his mirrored relationship with Arwen, as well as underlining his connection to the Elves with whom he was raised (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A). Jackson supported the decision to include more of Tolkien’s songs, stating: “We don’t have the ability in the movies to use the songs and poems to the extent that Professor Tolkien did in his books, but we are obviously trying to make it part of the texture and fabric of the movies” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A).

The addition of the song also provides a nod to fans, who will understand the full breadth of the reference, versus those who have not read the novels. Though we only hear a couple of lines from the acapella singing, Mortensen composed the melody himself. Mortensen was aided by the film’s on-set linguist Roisin Carty, who helped with Elvish pronunciation (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A).

**Rohan**

The second instalment of the films marks the audience’s introduction to Rohan, a kingdom of Men who are well known for their skill in both breeding and training Middle-Earth’s finest horses. Their civilization is somewhat less developed than Gondor, but of no less proud heritage. Tolkien’s inspiration in creating Rohan stemmed from Norse civilization, and this inspiration is reflected both visually and aurally.
Rohan’s culture is connected historically to the Shire: Tolkien hinted at a shared ancestry when he wrote that the people of Rohan and the Shire emigrated from the same territory of the Misty Mountain (Young, 32). Both cultures are more rustic and peasant-like than the more advanced civilizations of the Elves and of Gondor: “As with the Shire theme, this melody is as much attached to the people of Rohan as it is to the land” (Adams, 61). Shore associates Rohan with the hardanger fiddle (an instrument used in 18th and 19th century Norwegian folk music) to “represent a fragile and rural side of this struggling culture.” (Adams, 61). Shore’s decision to use fiddles in both Rohan and the Shire’s themes creates a musical link between the two cultures, a sonic hint at a deeper connection. The fiddle is heard as a diegetic musical instrument of Rohan in the aforementioned ‘Green Dragon’ song scene, though the fiddle is not visible.

The Rohan theme is not heard in FotR but Peter Jackson considers it to be the primary theme of TT (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4B). It is first heard before the fellowship has even reached Rohan, yet not in full: the theme accompanies the film’s title displayed in the initial minutes of TT. This seems to echo the practice of the cinematic overture, where a film’s principle themes are heard line-by-line as the opening credits play.

The Rohan theme is heard in more detail as Gandalf, Aragorn, Legolas and Gimli ride to Edoras, and the capital city is shown for the first time. A solo hardanger fiddle plays the theme: the unaccompanied instrument seems fragile, reflecting the weakened state of affairs in Rohan. Once Gandalf arrives in the Golden Hall of Edoras, the location of the seat of the king, he immediately sets to work on freeing King Theoden from Saruman’s spell, which had caused him to age rapidly and lose his faculties. Upon freeing Theoden,
the Rohan theme can be heard more triumphantly, using a brass orchestra to support the reinvigorated realm and king.

The use of brass instruments, and particularly the French horn, connects Rohan to Gondor musically. The choice of instrument also harkens to Tolkien’s description of ‘the horns of Rohan’ (Young, 30). Horns were an important instrument for men as they were instruments of war, something that the residents of the Shire were entirely unfamiliar with.

There is only one example of diegetic vocal music in Rohan, which takes place in TT in an extended scene. Theoden’s son Theodred has been killed by Wormtongue, who has poisoned the prince but framed it to appear as a complication due to a battle wound. The funeral takes place just outside of the city’s walls, where Theodred is being interred into his family’s mausoleum. Eowyn begins singing a dirge in Old English titled ‘Lament for Theodred’ (Adams, 227). This song is the only instance where a language that is neither English nor a creation of Tolkien is used. The text was written in English by Boyens and translated by Tolkien expert David Salo. Salo chose to use Old English as he felt that Tolkien had rooted this culture in medieval European traditions (Adams, 226). The text was an adaptation of the Anglo-Saxon epic poem Beowulf, one of the most important works in Old English literature and a literary inspiration for Tolkien, thus fusing once again factual and fictional history (Velten, 225). It is clear as well that Old English grammar influenced Tolkien, who borrowed the Anglo-Saxon term ‘Middle-Earth’ to use for his fictional world (Hickman, 469).
‘Lament for Theodred’ is initially sung accapella: the orchestrated score accompanying the march to the mausoleum fades out just before Eowyn begins to sing, creating a rare moment of non-diegetic silence in the film. The lack of a score creates a more focused sound, and adds to the sombre sentiment expressed in the opening measures of the lament. About halfway through the song, some strings are very lightly added to create an ambient, drone-like tone beneath Eowyn’s singing, but they do so without disrupting the overall acapella feel of the lament.

Rohan’s music was carefully crafted by Shore to create cultural links between Rohan, Gondor, and the Shire, alluding to the history of Middle-Earth itself. The choice of instrumentation in both non-diegetic and diegetic music recall Tolkien’s description of Rohan’s heritage. Furthermore, Jackson’s inclusion of Old English text adapted from *Beowulf* adds a real-world connection between Middle-Earth and Earth. This is yet another example of Jackson and Tolkien’s attempts to root LotR into our own world’s history, giving it more of a sense of myth or lore than fiction.

**Gondor**

Gondor is the kingdom in which the penultimate battle occurs in *The Return of the King* and where Aragorn will reclaim his rightful throne. Allies of Rohan, Gondor displays more sophistication in terms of architecture, academia, and the military. Its theme is more mature than Rohan’s yet linked in some ways. Rohan’s theme contains a more folk-style sound, harkening to its Viking connection, whereas Gondor’s theme
sounds more like Western European music. Both themes use a French horn as their primary instrument, thus connecting them instrumentally.

The Gondor theme (as played on a solo French horn) is first heard prominently in FotR at Elrond’s council as Boromir begins to speak of his homeland (Hickman, 472). The theme here is heard in two variations, one supported and one unsupported (Young, 57): the supported variation contains a B note supported by an A minor triad played by a brass section, whereas the unsupported variation does not have this triad. The unsupported half is first heard as Boromir begins to speak of Gondor and the threats the country faces from Mordor. In his monologue, Boromir seeks to convince the council to wield the Ring as a weapon against Sauron, an idea that would end in tragedy and defeat. The supported variation enters as Aragorn begins to speak, explaining to Boromir that no one is capable of using the Ring but Sauron. The supported theme extends as Legolas rebukes Boromir and explains that Aragorn is heir to the throne of Gondor. This slight thematic variation is significant as it provides information to the audience in several ways. The first is in a parallel, almost literal way: just as the music supports Aragorn and not Boromir, so too does the council, since the Ring cannot be used as a weapon for their gain. The music also may hint at the fate of Boromir, who becomes a threat to the fellowship as he becomes seduced by the Ring and is ultimately killed, whereas Aragorn is able to resist (Young, 60). A third layer of meaning may be interpreted as a musical representation of the right to leadership: Boromir is the eldest son of Denethor, the current steward of Gondor, acting as the leader in the absence of a king; upon Denethor’s passing, this role would fall to Boromir. Aragorn is the rightful heir to the throne and
could reclaim it, thus taking back power from Denethor, and ultimately Boromir. The supported theme heard on behalf of Aragorn can be considered as a foreshadowing of Aragorn’s successful ascension to the throne at the end of the narrative.

The use of the solo French horn playing the unsupported theme for Boromir may also hold significance for the fate of his character: Boromir carries the horn of Gondor, an heirloom of his family and, at the time of his death, he blows the horn in a call for aid from Aragorn, Legolas and Gimli in vain. His body is sent down a waterfall, clutching his cloven horn in a water burial, and it is this cloven horn which eventually makes its way to Denethor, who immediately recognizes that it represents the death of his son. The solo, unsupported French horn may thus be a musical act foreshadowing Boromir’s cry for help. On a larger scale, it represents Gondor’s present state under Denethor’s leadership. The French horn is the primary instrument of Gondor, and is used to signify nobility, but the unsupported French horn heard in Rivendell acts as a symbol for the diminished state of Gondor in the absence of its king.

Beyond this example in FotR, the Gondor theme does not figure prominently until RotK. The majority of the events of the final film take place in Gondor, making its theme the dominant one, similarly to the use of Rohan’s theme in TT (Young, 57). Moreover, in the same fashion that Rohan’s theme is announced over the opening title, Gondor’s theme is heard playing over the third film’s title, acting as an overture. It is heard fully as Gandalf and Pippin first enter the realm of Gondor.

There are no direct examples of diegetic Gondorian music aside from that which Aragorn sings. His first diegetic song, ‘The Lay of Luthien’ (mentioned earlier), is
essentially an Elvish folksong, something he would have picked up during his childhood in Rivendell. His second diegetic song, ‘Elessar’s Oath’, is sung at his coronation as King of Gondor towards the end of RotK and thus has great significance in representing his rightful place in Gondor. But the song also includes a nod to Aragorn’s upbringing in Rivendell, as it uses his Elvish name of Elessar.

The coronation song features words that were written by Tolkien. In the novels, they are spoken by Aragorn’s ancestor, Elendil, upon his first sight of Middle-Earth, as Elendil was an elf who had come across the sea from the Grey Havens (Donnelly, 311). The words tell of the promise of Middle-Earth and of his heirs who will remain there until the end of days. As was the case with ‘The Lay of Luthien’, Mortensen composed the melody himself. This song is more fully developed than the snippets of ‘The Lay of Luthien’, as we hear the song in its entirety while lightly supported by strings. The choice of song is yet another example of the filmmaking teams’ ability to adapt bits of mythology from the novels, fitting them in where they can. The coronation song, as such, does not exist in the books, but Mortensen’s selection of words which recall Aragorn’s ancestor is an apt choice: the song’s repetitions of Elendil’s words act as a musical indication that Aragorn has finally accepted his birthright as King of Gondor.

The song is sung in a monophonic, Gregorian chant-like style that recalls Medieval music. The inspiration for the chant-style came directly from Tolkien in two ways: the first is how Tolkien described Aragorn’s singing in The Fellowship of the Ring, “he began to chant softly…Strider [Aragorn] sighed and paused before he spoke again. That is a song’, he said, ‘in the mode that is called ann-thennath by the Elves”’ (Tolkien, 252,
Additionally, in 1952 Tolkien was recorded singing ‘Namarie’, a Quenya song, the only recording directly from the author indicating what his folk songs should sound like. His style is reminiscent of Gregorian chant, an example in rooting Middle-Earth’s ancient music in our own world’s history. Mortensen’s singing is more melodic than Tolkien’s, yet both are similar in style.

‘Elessar’s Oath’ is also treated in leitmotif fashion when it is sonically referenced, briefly, in FotR. The thematic material of the song played by the full orchestra and supported by a choral section is heard as the fellowship passes the twin statues of the Argonath, a relic of the ancient world of men (Adams, 191). The statues are of two by-gone kings, who have passed into legend. They are also Aragorn’s ancestors, and represent a reminder of his heritage and ultimate destiny. The musical reference to ‘Elessar’s Oath’ acts as sonic foreshadowing to Aragorn’s eventual ascension to the throne, an act that will finally allow him to join the ranks of his fore-fathers as king.

**Isengard and Mordor**

The realms of Isengard and Mordor are the homes of Saruman and Sauron, respectively, two lords who are vying for power over Middle-Earth. Neither is truly of the world, as both hold power beyond that of any of the beings in Tolkien’s fictional land. The second novel and film draws its name from their alliance, or in Saruman’s words, “the union of the two towers” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 1B).

Saruman is originally a member of the Istari, the wizarding order to which Gandalf also belongs. The Istari were created by the Valar (the gods of Middle-Earth) and are sent
to Middle-Earth to act as watchers and protectors, thus they are akin to demigods themselves. They are differentiated by colour: Saruman the White and Gandalf the Grey. Saruman is the head of the order, and thus initially more powerful than Gandalf. As a result of his corruption, he eventually loses his designation as an Istari, and is replaced in his role by Gandalf, ‘Gandalf the White’. Sauron, often called the Dark Lord, was originally a Maia, which are “spirits whose being also began before the world, of the same order as the Valar but of less degree” (Tolkien, 21, 1977). Sauron has many servants under his influence, such as orcs, goblins, balrogs, and animals.

Both Isengard and Mordor have their own distinct themes. The Isengard theme “expresses power, bloodlust, and an industrial dread that seeks to overtake all of Nature” (Adams, 92) and is “probably the most reflective of Tolkien’s text” due to its use of percussion and its low brassy melody that are reflective of Tolkien’s description of orc music (Young, 33). The film features an example of this music in the Mines of Moria, where the fellowship is alerted to the incoming orcs through the sounds of their drums.

Isengard’s theme uses several instruments that are not heard in any other music for the films which are used to increase the sense of harshness: Shore used an assortment of anvils, metal bell plates, bass drums, and taikos to create the sound of Isengard (Adams, 93). The use of the anvil as part of the Isengard theme reflects the growing industrial nature of Isengard - a complete reversal of Saruman’s previous environmental consciousness. Industrialism is associated with evil in the tale, as Tolkien seemed to equally distrust modern industrialism (Young, 33). Shore wrote the Isengard theme in a 5/4 time signature with irregular three-bar phrases, which also create an off-kilter sense
(Young, 33). Thus, musically, Isengard stands in opposition with the other cultures in Middle-Earth, whose music is written in a more regular meter, with less dissonance, and less harshness in the sonic palette.

Similar to the Isengard theme, Mordor’s theme contains short, repetitive phrases played by low brass instruments and strings (Hickman, 470). Adams describes the music as a “hostile, suffocating fume of tone colours” (93). The Mordor theme remains relatively unchanged throughout the films until the moment when the Ring is destroyed in Mount Doom. At this point, the theme becomes triumphant, signaled by a change from the minor mode to the major as the evil of Mordor is conquered (Hickman, 472).

**Gollum**

Gollum is a unique being in Middle-Earth - he was once a river hobbit named Smeagol, but has become a twisted life form as a result of the Ring’s corruption, barely resembling his former self. He represents what could become of Frodo if he fails to let go of the Ring. He is now known as Gollum due to his signature coughing vocal inflection, which sounds like ‘gollum’. Frodo chooses to take Gollum on as his guide, and attempts to appeal to him by reminding him of his identity of Smeagol, igniting a mental battle between Gollum’s two personas.

Gollum is uniquely represented in music: he is the only character who has his own theme – multiple themes, in fact, which acknowledge the duality of his character; he has the most thematic material besides the Ring (Adams, 36). “He needed two pieces of music to work against each other. He is two characters. Smeagol’s more sympathetic and
pitiful, so that theme is more emotional. Gollum is more sneaky and creepy” (Shore, quoted in Adams, 36). Shore represented this duality by writing the two themes, ‘Gollum’s Menace’ and ‘The Pity of Gollum’ (Adams, 37).

‘The Pity of Gollum’ is the first thematic introduction to the character in the films, heard in the opening scenes of the prologue, whereas ‘Gollum’s Menace’ is not heard until the final scene of TT (Adams, 37). In fact, until the introduction of Gollum’s second theme, the audience may not have been aware of the conflicting personalities of Gollum, who becomes increasingly schizophrenic as he fights with his own urge and temptation with the Ring.

Shore chose to use the cimbalom as the representative instrument in ‘Gollum’s Menace’. He had previously used a hammered dulcimer in the Shire theme, so Shore chose the cimbalom for its instrumental relation to the dulcimer (Adams, 38); in this way, a musical connection is created between the hobbits and Gollum. An additional indicator of Gollum’s true heritage comes through in a little song that he sings that sounds akin to a nursery rhyme. As he is catching a fish, Gollum begins singing in a narrative style about what he is doing. It is evident that he is making the song up on the spot, but it seems reminiscent of the many songs that hobbits are well known for. Bilbo’s numerous songs are often referenced throughout Tolkien’s novels. It seems that Gollum’s musical heritage has remained with him.

A secondary musical connection between Gollum and the Ring lies in ‘Gollum’s Menace’, which contains a melodic thematic connection to the ‘History of the Ring’ theme (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4C). As a result, Gollum’s theme music contains
associations with the two fundamental aspects of his personality, his hobbit heritage and his obsession with the Ring, which are also the sources of his internal conflict.

Kevin Fisher theorizes that the music and sound for LotR operates on both a natural and supernatural level (169). While there are many examples of the supernatural in the music, Gollum’s two themes present a fitting example of this phenomenon. As a character, Gollum embodies both the natural and supernatural, a natural being who has been warped by supernatural forces. ‘The Pity of Gollum’ uses more traditional orchestral instruments (strings, woodwinds, brass), whereas ‘Gollum’s Menace’ uses the cimbalom, as previously noted. The sonic qualities of a cimbalom are more foreign in a film score, creating a strange sound, which helps to differentiate the natural from the supernatural in Gollum’s themes.

Shore’s decision to sonically represent Gollum with two musical themes illustrates not only Gollum’s duality but also his unique place within Middle-Earth. There are truly no other beings like him – he has been transformed both physically and mentally by the Ring – and this is amplified through the choice to represent him musically with two themes.

The Ring

Despite being an inanimate object, the Ring, which lies at the centre of the narrative, is considered by Jackson to be a character in its own right (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3C). It also represents the most complex element in the tale owing to its fantastical nature. As discussed in Chapter Three, the Ring’s voice is an example of an acousmêtre, a voice that lies within a fantastical gap in Middle-Earth. The music that represents this fantastical
being is equally complex. It is one of the most enduring themes, which is prominent throughout each of the three films.

The Ring is represented by four thematic settings: the history/evil/seduction/fate of the Ring (Adams, 44). Each setting is representative of the multi-dimensional nature of the Ring and reflects its changing status throughout the progression of the story. ‘The History of the Ring’ is one of the most prominent themes in the entire score, first heard during the prologue, but undergoing thematic changes, notably fusing together with ‘The Pity of Gollum’, signalling the intertwined histories and fates of both characters (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4B). ‘History’ “rises and falls in a slow breath-like pattern that serves to anthropomorphize the Ring’s power” (Adams, 45). This compositional technique further adds to the sense of the Ring’s sentience and characterization.

‘The Evil of the Ring’ becomes the most pronounced Ring theme during RotK, as the Ring draws nearer to Mordor and the threat of Sauron grows greater (Adams, 45). The theme contains Arabic musical tones. The association of Arabic music in the Ring theme, which ultimately represents evil, is a problematic musical association during a time in which political tensions between the Western world and the Middle-East were running high (Donnelly, 310).

‘The Seduction of the Ring’ has a more distinct sound, or ‘voice,’ than the other three themes: “the Ring has many different voices in the music, so I used the sound of the boy’s choir for the seduction of the Ring…the seduction was the re-gaining of a lost life” (Shore, in Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4C). The re-gaining of a lost life that Shore refers to could signify the Ring’s ability to tempt its bearers with promises of power and
immortality. Interestingly, this theme also has a thematic connection to the snake charmer’s song: both tunes have nearly identical opening melodies, save for a differing note in the Ring theme (Young, 63). The choice to draw inspiration from the snake charmer’s song may have been cultivated through a desire to create a sense of a hypnotic, seductive, charming melody. Indeed, the Ring itself acts much like a snake charmer towards its bearers.

‘The Fate of the Ring’ is first introduced during TT, but the opening lines lack a concluding phrase, insinuating that at this point in the narrative, the fate of the Ring, and of Middle-Earth, is still uncertain (Adams, 45). This is the only example of the Ring theme that is written in the major mode, signaling optimism and hope for the future.

The various iterations of the Ring theme are heard throughout the three films, creating a coherence and musical story arc for the Ring. It grows from uncertainty to feverish as the Ring approaches Mordor. That Shore chose to represent the Ring with four different versions of its central theme demonstrates the Ring’s adaptability and capacity to tempt different people. The Ring is as dynamic a character as any within LotR, and Shore’s music captures this dynamism.

In addition to music, sound effects are another medium used to portray the Ring’s sentience and cunning. The sounds associated with the Ring will be discussed in greater detail in Chapter Five.

Non-Diegetic Songs
A small part of Shore’s score to the trilogy is dedicated to non-diegetic songs. In using the term ‘non-diegetic song’, I am referring to specific songs that differ from the main parts of the orchestrated score as they are self-contained pieces of music that are heard once and in their entire duration. There are only two such songs – ‘Aniron’ and ‘Arwen’s Song’ – within the films. The other non-diegetic songs are the songs that are heard over the end credits of the films, and thus are not considered to be a part of the film score proper (Velten, 209). The two non-diegetic songs within the film’s narrative will be discussed first, followed by an examination of the end credit music.

**Within the Film**

‘Aniron’, sung by recording artist Enya, is the first non-diegetic song and is heard in FotR during the scene that introduces Arwen and Aragorn’s relationship in Rivendell. In this scene, Arwen also reaffirms her pledge to forego her immortality to stay in Middle-Earth with Aragorn rather than depart to the Grey Havens with the Elves. Both Shore and Jackson strongly wished to include Enya on the soundtrack: “I wanted her voice for this scene. She wrote the music and I orchestrated.” (Shore, quoted in Adams, 166). Jackson concurred, “Enya’s music has always been associated with Tolkien” (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A). Instead of Salo translating the lyrics, Enya brought in her own lyricist, Roma Ryan, to translate the lyrics to Sindarin (Velten, 220). ‘Aniron’ was deliberately given an Eastern sound to associate it with the Elvish culture (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 4A). The choice to include Enya on the soundtrack may have also been influenced by a desire to feature recognized mainstream artists to encourage music sales.
The lyrics of ‘Aniron’ describe the desire for the Evenstar, a name by which Arwen is also known. The song alludes to a star shining through the darkness, perhaps a metaphor for Arwen’s love leading Aragorn through his journey. The lyrics, which are written in first person, thus describe Aragorn’s feelings towards Arwen. The choice to write the song in Sindarin is a further reflection of Aragorn’s upbringing and a nod to Arwen’s heritage and status as immortal elf.

The second non-diegetic song is heard in RotK during the extended scene at the houses of healing. The battle for Gondor has ended in victory, but the war has not yet been won. Among the many wounded are Eowyn and Faramir, who are being cared for by Aragorn in the house of healing. This scene shows Eowyn and Faramir meeting and foreshadows their eventual relationship. The accompanying song is titled ‘Arwen’s Song’ as it is sung by Liv Tyler, who plays Arwen. The lyrics for ‘Arwen’s Song’ were written by producer Fran Walsh (Adams, 329).

This song is unique for several reasons: in addition to being one of the two non-diegetic songs heard in isolated scenes, it is the only song on which a cast member sings non-diegetically (there are several examples of actors singing throughout the trilogy, but each does so within the diegesis); the third reason is that it is the only piece in the non-diegetic score which is sung in English rather than in Tolkien’s invented languages.

The choice to write ‘Arwen’s Song’ in English is significant in several ways. The lyrics are as follows:

With a sigh you turn away
With a deepening heart no more words to say
You will find that the world has changed forever
And the trees are turning from green to gold
And the sun is now fading
I wish I could hold you closer

Adams writes that ‘Arwen’s Song’ “acts as an Elvish blessing - an ethereal prayer for the suffering. Arwen, too, is somewhere in Middle-Earth, just as lovelorn” (328). At face value, the lyrics sound as if they are depicting the love story of Faramir and Eowyn, whose world ‘has changed forever’ now that they have met. But the fact that it is Arwen who is singing the song also reveals deeper meanings. ‘Arwen’s Song’ is more accurately describing Arwen’s relationship with Aragorn and, at another level, describes changes in the world of Middle-Earth as a whole.

The two lovers know that even if the battle for Middle-Earth is won and they are reunited again, they will inevitably be parted in death. The first stanza chronicles Aragorn’s reaction to Arwen’s decision to forsake her immortality for him: he initially discourages her, instead repeating her father, Elrond’s, counsel to take the ship to the Grey Havens. The final line, however, ‘You will find that the world has changed forever,’ may refer more broadly to the changing of Middle-Earth in the wake of the Elves departure, and on a personal level, Arwen’s changing world now that she is mortal.

The second stanza also contains meaning on two levels: on the first level, it again refers to Arwen and Aragorn, and on the second level it refers to Middle-Earth. Arwen’s choice has in essence created the end to an otherwise forever youthful existence, hence the lines referring to the changing of the leaves and the fading of the sun. The second layer of meaning in the song, however, refers to Middle-Earth passing from the Third into the Fourth Age: even if Frodo is successful and Sauron is defeated, the war and the
passing of the Elves will irreparably change the face of Middle-Earth. It is a bittersweet victory, as Middle-Earth is departing one age into an unforeseen future: the industrial age has been set in motion by Saruman. Thus, the song describes the leaves turning from green to gold and the sun fading as a metaphor for the change into the new Age. The sun is setting on the Third Age, the Age of the Elves, into the dawning of the Age of men. It is a beginning but also an ending, especially for Arwen, who will lose her family and culture. It hints at the regret and loss felt by the peoples of Middle-Earth as well as that of Arwen.

Finally, the choice to write the lyrics in English further illustrates Arwen’s newfound connection to men. Singing the song in English as opposed to Quenya or Sindarin reflects the change in her status from immortal to mortal, the change that parallels the change in the dominant race. ‘Arwen’s Song’ is only heard in an extended scene, yet the thematic material distills a greater thread of meaning within LotR.

**Following the Film**

Each cinematic chapter of LotR ends with a signature pop-style song meant to illustrate the greater themes present in each film. In order of each film, these songs are ‘May It Be’ (sung and written by Enya), ‘Gollum’s Song (sung by Emiliana Torrini), and ‘Into the West’ (sung by Annie Lennox). Each of these three songs can be considered to be the theme song for each film. They act as promotional singles and are packaged as pop songs (as opposed to the majority of the score, which is better suited for a concert hall or packaged as a soundtrack album).
In his article titled *Mood Music* (1984), Simon Frith explored the use of theme music in film, which can be either heard during the film or accompanying the end credits. Frith noted that there are three main functions of theme songs: 1) to reprise a melody or act as a musical summary, 2) to capture the mood of the film, and 3) as a built-in sense of sadness and nostalgia (78). These functions are present to various degrees in the theme music of LotR.

Of the three end-credit songs, both ‘Gollum’s Song’ and ‘Into the West’ are quoted in the films, though they are not considered the ‘theme song’ within the films. Instead, the addition of the end-credit song quotation in the film acts as a musical anchor, planting the theme within the narrative only to reprise it at the end. In this way, Shore’s credit themes are working quite differently than the typical film theme song. They do not act as a final overture, reprising musical themes, but instead pick up a thread that began in the films. In this way, the three end-credit songs stand more independently from the score.

The end-credit songs embody the mood of each film. Enya’s ‘May It Be’ is written to sound like a prayer, a blessing upon Frodo and his journey. It contains the spirit of the fragile hope that Middle-Earth bears for Frodo. The line ‘A promise lives within you now’ is the perfect summary, or end note of FotR and the new resolve which the broken fellowship holds. ‘Gollum’s Song’ is the end-credit music for TT, and while the film contained many important narrative events, Gollum begins to play a larger role and reveals the extent to which he embodies dual personalities. Frith also notes that the theme song does not necessarily need to relate to the film’s events, but rather become a commentary on them (79). The theme of pity emerges as Frodo attempts to create a
relationship with Gollum in the hopes that he can be redeemed. However, as the lyrics in ‘Gollum’s Song’ so poignantly state ‘We are lost, we can never go home’. Gollum is truly forever changed, and cannot return to the person he once was. ‘Gollum’s Song’ communicates the ‘emotional reality’ of the character (Frith, 84).

The trilogies final end-credit song, ‘Into the West’, is perhaps more complex. First, it contains references to the film, as implied by the title, which allude to Frodo’s journey into the west, across the sea and into the Grey Havens. But the Grey Havens is often read as a metaphor for death, a metaphor that Jackson has injected into the film during the scene where Pippin asks Gandalf what death is like. The description Gandalf gives him was in fact taken from a passage in the novel, The Fellowship of the Ring, in which Frodo dreams of the Grey Havens: “Frodo heard a sweet singing running in his mind: a song that seemed to come like a pale light behind a grey rain-curtain, and growing stronger to turn the veil all to glass and silver, until at last it was rolled back, and a far green country opened before him under a swift sunrise.” (Tolkien). ‘Into the West’ alludes to this passage in several instances but most notably in the final stanza: And all will turn/To silver glass/ A light on the water/ Grey ships pass / Into the West. A main theme of RotK is death and the temporary status of life on Earth, thus ‘Into the West’ contains allusions to the Grey Haven, Tolkien’s metaphorical heaven.

The final function of end-credit music laid out by Frith is as a built-in sense of nostalgia. The sense of nostalgia embedded within end-credit music may have been created as a way for film-makers to influence audience perceptions by making them feel nostalgic for a place or time that only exists within the film’s universe and as a transition
to the world of their everyday lives. The three end-credit songs for LotR do this to various degrees. ‘May It Be’ is nostalgic but hopeful in tone, reflecting the particular moment in the narrative but also creating a desire in viewers to see the next two instalments. ‘Gollum’s Song’ and ‘Into the West’ portray the nostalgic element more clearly, however the former is comprised more of sadness and regret, and the latter with a sense of the impending voyage across the sea and a nostalgia for what has been left behind.

Thus, by using Frith’s theory of theme music, the functions of Shore’s end-credit music become clear. Frith states that theme music is used to mirror the audience’s response, but also to teach the film’s main message if it is not already clear, which is what Shore’s songs do. A final function of the end-credit songs may be to act as a bridge between fiction and reality: each of the three songs is clearly more pop-influenced than the main body of the score, and indeed would seem out of context if heard during the film; however, all are linked to the main narrative. Choosing to use songs that are closer to what audiences are accustomed to hearing in other films or on the radio is a way that Shore reintroduces audiences to their own world in a gentle fashion; in contrast, the opening, mystical prologue music invites audiences into a forgotten time.

**Discussion**

It is clear that Shore’s score for LotR is a complex work, which had the task of not only accompanying the on-screen action, but also of creating a cohesive and convincing musical interpretation of Middle-Earth. Shore composed the score as one over-arching
work spanning three acts, as he believes some film music should be more akin to an opera than a film score (Brown, 337), thus revealing an essentially intermedial aesthetic. He achieved cohesion through the implementation of leitmotivs, most prominently given to geographical locations, but also to key characters such as the Ring and Gollum. In this way, Shore was able to create distinctions between the various cultures of Middle-Earth and to portray deep forces within the narrative.

Taking Tolkien’s lead, Shore used different instruments to represent the various cultures according to what types of instruments were typically used in the novels. Despite attempts to include some of Tolkien’s songs in the films, very few examples were actually used; this is one instance in which Shore’s score strayed from the novels. The result is a very different soundscape in Jackson’s films: “In many cases, the precise references that the books make to music are ejected in favour of an attempt to evoke an impression of Middle-Earth” (Donnelly, 316). As mentioned in Chapter Two, the exceedingly musical character of Tom Bombadil is elided in order to cut the narrative to a more palatable size, a decision that removes many of the books musical instances.

The numerous songs scattered throughout the novels are all folk songs that range from nonsensical nursery rhymes to lyrical depictions of historical events and myths. Jackson’s LotR steps away from the folklore style of the novels and moves towards a fantasy/epic/myth/action film interpretation, a move that may necessitate a shifting view of the music. I believe it is this interpretive move – a part of the overall process of adaptation – that required a departure from Tolkien’s folk songs and a shift into Shore’s orchestral, grandiose work.
In *Narrative Film Music*, Gorbman outlined the way in which music creates different levels of meaning in the form of codes: pure musical codes, cultural musical codes, and cinematic musical codes (185). Most relevant to the discussion of film music is the second and third codes: cultural and cinematic. The cultural musical code refers to the way in which music can elicit encultured reactions. Cinematic musical codes “bear specific formal relationships to coexistent elements in the film” (188). In choosing to forego the majority of Tolkien’s archaic songs and opting instead to represent Middle-Earth through large-scale orchestral and choral works, Shore appears to have been adhering to the conventions of contemporary cultural and cinematic musical codes.

As previously stated, Jackson’s version of *The Lord of the Rings* focused more closely on the action elements of the story, creating stunning battle scenes with the use of CGI. In order to abide by the cinematic musical codes, Shore composed music that supported this element of action and thrill: triumphant and heroic sounding brass sections accompanied battle scenes, particularly when a member of the fellowship pulled off a daring maneuver. Tolkien’s folk songs, or even music which was composed in a similar style as Tolkien’s songs, would have seemed ill fitted to the types of scenes that Jackson created.

This sense of synchronicity that is created between Jackson and Shore’s approach is linked with Gorbman’s theory of cultural musical codes, in which different musical styles becomes culturally associated with different emotive responses (such as the association between the french horn and heroism; Young, 47), it is a culturally ingrained response. Cultural musical codes have the potential to be problematic as well, for example Shore associates Arabic music with the evil cultures in Middle-Earth, while associating
traditional Western-style orchestral music with good (Donnelly, 309); cultural codes are built on stereotypes and they can perpetuate them.

Cultural and cinematic musical codes can be useful as they help to organize musical meanings, similar to how Shore organized the score around different cultures and characters. Despite some problematic associations and the exclusion of much of the musical details found in Tolkien’s books, Shore’s score provides an interesting and expansive case study of film music and its relationship to the process of adaptation. Gorbman notes that music helps to define the image (189): it is thus a necessary component of cinema and, as such, Shore’s work contributed greatly to the re-interpretation of Middle-Earth as a cinematic fantasy world.
Alongside music and dialogue, sound effects is the third sonic element of the soundtrack. The field of film sound studies has seen a good deal of growth due in part to the development of newer technology and an increased scholarly interest in the narrative functions of sonic elements. In 1999, Rick Altman wrote that sound studies’ time had come (4). In “A Statement on Sound Studies”, Mark Kerins declared that sound studies had become a fully fledged field (2008).

Unlike the fields of music and dialogue, sound effects does not have a single origin or tradition from which it naturally emerged (Sergi, 2006). As a result, sound designers have often drawn on a much more diverse and varied background of traditions for inspiration, such as theatre, radio drama, and animation. Similarly, the field of film sound has relied on a variety of analytical models that draw equally within cinema studies and from without. The study of film sound is thus multi-disciplinary, enriched by an assortment of perspectives. This may not be entirely beneficial, as Kerins points out that an over-reliance on analytical models outside of film may in fact hinder development (2008).

An additional hindrance to the study of sound lies within the fallacy that sound design is more technical and music/dialogue are more artistic (Sergi, 2006). This fallacy takes root in the assumption that dialogue and music tend to be individualistic productions that require more creativity, whereas sound design is the result of a collective effort realized through technology and a subdivided form of labor. This assumption neglects the fact that
music and dialogue can both be collective efforts as well as necessitating the use of technology.

In spite of a relatively smaller base of research, sound is an integral aspect of the sonic tapestry. As Michel Chion points out in *Audio-Vision: Sound on Screen*, sound is capable of sonically extending the film world, or the ‘audio-visual superfield’ (151, 1994). Chion’s ‘audio-visual superfield’ describes the space created by all of the sounds issuing from a multichannel loudspeaker system that exists outside of the boundaries of the screen (Chion, 151, 1994). Theorist Alison Walker states, “Sound oscillates a relationship between various, juxtaposed spaces and places, facilitating a form of cinematic articulation beyond the visual” (2004). Sound is an effective way to extend perceived geographical boundaries in film in a way in which the camera is simply unable to do.

In the case of LotR, the most significant function of the audio-visual superfield is in bridging realism and the fantastical. Tolkien’s tale includes many supernatural beings who are brought to life through enhanced CGI and Dolby sound. The sound design of these supernatural creatures is an important means of both communicating the fantastic as well as making the creatures sound as ‘real’ as possible to support the illusion of film. In addition to the sound design of the supernatural, the natural sounds within the film worked to create a sense of realism. The sound design in the film worked to balance the natural and supernatural to create a unified world that makes sense sonically.

This chapter will examine the role of sound in fusing together fantasy and reality within Jackson’s epic trilogy. A discussion of supernatural and natural sound effects will serve to identify sound’s narrative function within LotR. The Ring’s effects on various
characters will also be discussed in order to identify how a supernatural, inanimate object is able to create an impact on a living being, and how this is communicated sonically. An examination of the narrative functions of silence will follow which will include an analysis of “sound acts”, an adaptation of Kozloff’s theory of speech acts in order to analyze what role sound acts play in the films. The chapter will conclude with a brief discussion that will consider the importance of sound within film, and particularly the importance of sound within fantasy, which must work to blend fantastic elements with verisimilitude.

**Supernatural/Natural Sounds**

In his article, ‘Sonic Resonances’, theorist Kevin Fisher describes the sound in Jackson’s LotR as operating on two levels: natural and supernatural (169). This description fits perfectly with the overarching thematic material of Tolkien’s tale, which itself is divided by the natural and the supernatural. Accordingly, the sound associated with the natural and supernatural differs both in terms of quality and function.

Extrapolating from Fisher’s ideas of natural and supernatural sounds, Neil Bather writes on the sounds of good and evil in Middle-Earth (2004). In the following section, I will explore the sounds of LotR and examine their function using the good/evil and natural/supernatural parameters as a point of reference.

In LotR, those who are associated with the good and natural sounds are also those who are ‘natural’ beings in Middle-Earth. These beings are men, hobbits, elves, and dwarves. Although hobbits, elves, and dwarves are not natural within our own reality, they represent the beings that had natural origins within Middle-Earth (Tolkien, 7): each race
was created by the Valar, the deities of Middle-Earth. Unnatural creatures, like Gollum, the Ringwraiths, and orcs are manipulations of Sauron or the Ring.

Bather notes that those sounds associated with good or nature are also those sounds that would be deemed familiar to audiences (2004). Examples of such familiar sounds are the sound effects used to furnish the locations of Hobbiton and Rivendell, the towns that are home to hobbits and elves respectively. Both Hobbiton and Rivendell are habitations that embrace and incorporate nature into their lifestyles and architecture. ‘Hobbit holes’, the term for the hobbits residential locations, are holes dug into the sides of hills, thus, the earth acts as their insulation and roofing. Rivendell is built into a valley, architecturally designed around the various waterfalls that surround it.

The proximity and incorporation of nature greatly influence the sound design of these locations. Hobbiton is populated with the sounds of birds, wind through trees, and farm animals, which draw associations with a country lifestyle. Rivendell is crafted with similar natural sounds of the wild, with the addition of the sounds of the great crashing waterfalls. Another distinct difference is that the sounds of Rivendell were given slight reverberation to reflect the fantastical status of elves as immortal beings. Rivendell thus is washed in a golden glow, giving it a dream-like quality: the reverberating natural sounds intensify this quality.

There are fewer sounds associated with men and dwarves. Audiences encounter two capitals of men and one ancestral dwarvish dwelling, however these locations offer less in terms of ‘natural’ sound. In the case of men, this may be because both capitals are relatively isolated. The first, Edoras is atop a hill in a sparse country. Minas Tirith is a
great fortress built into the side of a mountain. The physical attributes of both limit the number of natural sounds present. Moreover, both locations are not just physically isolated, but are also in states of political disarray, unlike the more harmonious states of Hobbiton and Rivendell.

The ancestral dwelling place of the dwarves, the Mines of Moria, does not exhibit many natural sounds for two reasons: it has been abandoned and is a cavernous city within a mountain. Thus, its physical qualities do not invoke sound, but rather silence. The soundscape of Moria is a significant sonic element, and will be discussed further in the following section on silence.

Contrary to the nature/good sounds are those associated with supernatural/evil. As previously noted, the elves do have some supernatural characteristics that are communicated through the use of reverberation. The sounds of the supernatural/evil employ additional audio processing to create a distinct sense of the unnatural and foreboding. The beings for which evil is sonically characterized are the Ring/Sauron, the Ringwraiths, and Sauron’s creatures (orcs, trolls, balrog). Each of these beings will be discussed in order to examine how sound was used to convey a sense of evil and the supernatural.

**The Ring’s Sonic Influence**

In Chapter Two, the vocal qualities of the Ring and Sauron were analyzed and their status as an acousmêtre examined. While the Ring itself is given a voice with which to tempt would-be ring bearers, it is interesting to note that initially producers sought a
‘physical ring’ sound for the ring before opting to connect the Ring to a voice (Boyens, et al. 2011, Disc3B). Therefore, the Ring does not have many sound effects associated with it - it does, however, create exaggerated thuds whenever it falls to the ground, potentially to make its physical presence (and inadvertently, its menace) more powerful and threatening. However, it is the Ring’s effect on others that is sonically intriguing.

Bather notes that typically, cinematic musical codes reveal that minor-key, and dissonant bass music and sounds are used to convey evil (2004). The infamous ‘Imperial March’ from John Williams’ score for Star Wars is an excellent example of this. As discussed in Chapter Four, the Isengard theme also adheres to this convention. Audiences are thus able to quickly recognize malicious forces through lower tones. The same association seems to be present vocally. The voice of Christopher Lee, who plays Saruman, was pitched down for his performance (Bather, 2004).

Throughout Jackson’s trilogy, several characters besides Bilbo and Frodo (the two main ring-bearers) come into contact with the Ring. The Ring is shown to be able to tempt and influence those around it, but it seems to have a special effect when the topic of the Ring changing hands is brought up. There are three main occurrences of this phenomenon, all of which coincidentally occur in FotR, perhaps because it is the only point in which the fate of the Ring has not been concretely determined.

The first occurrence follows Bilbo’s ill-fated birthday party, at which he uses the Ring to disappear mid-speech and head home to depart from Hobbiton. Gandalf confronts him in his home in order to make sure Bilbo leaves the Ring for Frodo. Bilbo becomes angry with Gandalf and accuses him of wanting the Ring for himself. At this point, the room
darkens considerably and Gandalf grows in stature until he reaches the ceiling. These effects are compounded by his voice deepening noticeably. The sonic and visual effects used in this scene are convincing in casting an intimidating shroud over the wizard.

The second instance of the Ring’s sonic influence also involves Bilbo. Once Frodo reaches the safety of Rivendell, he is delighted to find his uncle Bilbo staying in the elvish haven as well. While they are conversing, Bilbo catches sight of the Ring on a chain around Frodo’s neck and asks if he could hold it once more. Frodo hesitates and as he begins to conceal the Ring from view, Bilbo lunges at the Ring. As with Gandalf, there are both visual and audio changes that indicate that the Ring has a hold over the hobbit. His eyes momentarily become blackened and look unnatural, while his voice becomes animalistic as he lets out a cry. Bilbo’s cry sounds like a cross between a human yelling and hissing. The manipulation of his voice in this instant is effective as it portrays how Bilbo is beginning to change as a result of his prolonged exposure to the Ring, reminiscent of Gollum and creating parallels between the two characters.

The third example takes place in Lothlórien, where the fellowship is seeking refuge. Frodo encounters Galadriel late in the night while his companions are asleep. Following the loss of Gandalf, Frodo seeks guidance from Galadriel, and ultimately offers her the Ring if she would take it. While she considers what would happen if she were to take the Ring, her image and voice also undergo audio and visual manipulation. As she begins to speak and recount how she would become a ‘dark queen’ and would rule over Middle-Earth, her colour changes to a deepened blue and her voice is very noticeably pitched down. The change of colour and in vocal register to reflect a more dark version of herself
is effective in creating a frightening glimpse at what horrors might befall Middle-Earth should Frodo fail in his quest. Galadriel regains control of herself and ultimately refuses the Ring in order to resist such a mutation.

In each of these instances, it is remarkable to note how the audio and visual aspects are working in tandem, creating parallel effects. The changes in tone and colour both darken and work to enhance the effect of the other. The darkening colour and deepening tone are reflective of cinematic codes wherein darker colours and bass tones are representative of evil. Film music theorist Phillip Hayward recounts how the addition of music in John Carpenters *Halloween* (1978) was dramatic enough to completely change the emotional tone (and fear factor) of the film (109). Examples such as the three I have examined in LotR surely reinforce the idea that music and sound are instrumental in contributing emotional cues and in creating meaning. The examples illustrate that the power and ability of sonic cinematic codes to create an identification of evil and the unnatural is profound.

The orcs, trolls, and balrog in LotR are three types of evil creatures that the fellowship faces throughout their journey. Each of these creatures are supernatural in that they were not created through natural means by the Valar, but rather by Sauron or Morgoth (Sauron’s mentor), who sought to rule Middle-Earth through dark magic and force. Orcs have a particularly interesting history, as they were initially created through the torture and mutilation of elves, in an attempt to sully and mock the children of the Valar (Tolkien, 47). Balrogs were created through corruption of the Maiar, angelic beings in Tolkien’s invented religious sect. Similarly, the trolls were made in mockery of the ents, a
sentient tree-like being. Thus, orcs, trolls, and balrogs represent attempts to take something natural and good and warp it into the supernatural and evil.

The sounds associated with these creatures were mostly made possible through the art of sound editing, mixing, and audio processing. It seems fitting that the sounds are created through the manipulation of natural sound objects to fashion something new. Reflective of Bather’s observation that pitching down sounds and vocals are used to establish ‘evil’, the sounds for each of these creatures were also processed to sound larger, deeper, and more powerful. A segment in the DVD extras included in Jackson’s films is dedicated to the discussion of sound, wherein sound technicians discuss the different methods and sounds they used to create the various tonalities of evil. The sound of orcs squealing was developed through fusing the sounds of pitched down pigs and dogs (Boyens, et al. 2011, Disc 3A). Trolls were manufactured through combining a tiger, walrus and lynx to create the heavy, deep, and menacing grunts of the powerful monster. The sounds of the balrog, a creature who is perhaps the most removed from natural life, was constructed by scraping cinder blocks across cement. An additional layer of depth was added by re-recording the finished sound mixes in tunnels to gain reverberation to reflect the cavernous Mines of Moria (Boyens, et al. 2011, Disc 3A). In this manner, the created sounds for each of these evil beings were constructed by taking a natural sound (or several sounds) and manipulating and deepening it to create something more fearsome; this is reflective of the means by which these creatures were brought to life, as manipulations of nature to create the supernatural. Sound techniques have been employed to aptly represent these beings by turning the familiar into the unfamiliar.
Similarly, the terrifying Ringwraiths are also the result of nature exploited. Once mortal kings, the Ringwraiths were given rings of power by Sauron, which corrupted their souls. They are unique in Middle-Earth as they are neither living nor dead. Unlike the majority of the evil creatures, the sound of the Ringwraiths is pitched up and is higher than the human vocal range (Bather, 2004). Despite the tendency for sound technicians to use deeper, bass sounds to represent malevolent characters, the Ringwraiths were created by taking audio clips of producer Fran Walsh screaming and manipulating them (Boyens, et al. 2011, Disc 3A). The manipulations were intended to remove any semblance of the human voice and give the Ringwraiths a dissonant edge (Bather, 2004). The sound of the Ringwraiths is thus symbolic of their status within Middle-Earth: a result of the natural moulded into the unnatural. Additionally, the high-pitched shriek of the Ringwraiths seems reminiscent of the infamous violin shrieks that Bernard Herrmann composed for Alfred Hitchcock’s *Psycho*. An association such as this may have been a means for the sound technicians to infuse horror into the Ringwraiths sound to create a more terrifying, ghostly foe.

Through an examination of the sound effects used to portray good and evil in Middle-Earth, an additional layer of meaning can be uncovered: the association between good and nature, and evil and the supernatural is in accordance with Tolkien’s views on nature. In addition, the theme of anti-industrialization and pro-ecological messages are strong within Tolkien’s rhetoric: one need only look to the literal way in which nature overthrows industry in the battle between the ents and Isengard as the music becomes increasingly triumphant.
The sound techniques used to create the cries of the evil creatures within the films demonstrate how the natural and familiar can create the supernatural and unfamiliar. The sounds of these creatures are intended as distinct from anything one may have previously heard, adding to the fantastical element of the films. Pitching the sounds up or down effectively adds a layer of terror to the films, inspired by horror film music and sound convention. In this manner, sound has effectively created a discernible contrast between nature and the supernatural.

Silence

*The presentation of silence is one of the most specific dramatic effects of the sound film. No other art can reproduce silence.*

(Bela Balázs, 205)

When Bela Balazs’ *Theory of the Film* was originally published in 1949, the significance of silence in film was already clearly recognized by theorists. Balazs included a brief segment on silence in his sound chapter, in which he discussed its important potential within film: “In film, silence can be extremely vivid and varied, for although it has no voice, it has very many expressions and gestures” (Balazs, 207). Balazs' words hold true for modern uses of silence in film. Though the study of sound and silence is not as prominent within film studies as music, a number of works have been devoted to the topic within the last two decades as public interest in sound increased. As home theatre-quality speaker systems began to be marketed in the late 1990s, sound quality began to become an area of interest for casual movie-enthusiasts.
Undoubtedly, the increased availability of high-quality sound systems led to a difference in filmmakers’ approach to sound (Kerins, 2008). If audiences were able to hear sound in as much detail at home as they could in the theatres, sound designers would be able to increase the functionality of sound, and consequently of silence.

Coincidentally, Jackson was making his epic trilogy during the early 2000’s which were marked by an increase in DVD sales and growth in home theatre sound systems (Kerins, 2008). Perhaps in an effort to take advantage of this, sound and silence often play a unique role in the films.

The following section will explore silence as it occurs in several instances: specifically, in the Mines of Moria, in relation to the Ring, and in “sound acts”, a concept that is derived from Kozloff’s theory of speech acts as discussed in Chapter Three. A speech act is a significant narrative event that is caused by or through the act of speaking (Kozloff, 41). One significant speech act, Saruman’s weather spells, ultimately forces the fellowship to the doors of Moria. A sound act thus operates in a similar way: it is a narrative event that is caused by or through an act of sound.

As Paul Théberge writes in “Almost Silent”, silence is typically relative and total silence is only found rarely in the sound track: “complete silence can place the audience in a form of direct confrontation with both the film and the other members of the theatre audience” (52). Thus, filmmakers typically abstain from utilizing complete silence to avoid creating a sense of discomfort in the audience. Instead of complete silences, filmmakers sometimes employ ‘relative silences’ (where only a very small number of select sounds are heard), or ‘relational silences’, silences that occur in one part of the
sound track, while other sounds may still be present (for example the sounds of the
diegetic world are noticeably muted and music comes to the fore). Relative and relational
silences can effectively be used to create a sense of the abnormal, or tension and fear in
audiences in a more controlled manner than the use of total silence, as can be seen in the
Mines of Moria.

The journey through the Mines of Moria takes place during the first film in the trilogy,
and is essentially the only period that the fellowship will be together in its entirety. The
audience is forewarned of the impending danger through Gandalf’s hesitation to enter the
Mines, and through Saruman’s voice-over alluding to an ancient evil that was awoken by
the dwarves. The fellowship enters the Mines only to realize that its inhabitants have been
killed, but are then unable to escape as the entrance collapses. As the last rock falls and
darkness washes over the screen, the film is almost silent: only the sound of the
fellowship’s breathing is heard, the relative silence thus drawing the attention of the
audience to the plight of the fellowship and their feeling of apprehension.

Gandalf magically creates a light and they begin journeying into the mountain. There
is no music, just the echoing footsteps and voices of the fellowship. One sound effect
used to intensify this relative silence is a prominent reverberation to signify the echo of
the vast, empty space. This combination of relative (and relational) silence and
reverberation act together to create a sense of claustrophobia and tension: silence and
darkness surround the characters.

Until this point in the film, the soundtrack has been relatively full with dialogue,
music, and sound, thus there have been no moments as silent as Moria, which produces a
disconcerting feeling. The silence, as well as foreshadowing of a monster within, creates a sense of foreboding. Where the fellowship had hoped to be welcomed in the kingdom of dwarves, they are met with a dead silence, signaling something is wrong within Moria.

Théberge notes that silence can indicate either tranquility or abnormality (52). In the Mines of Moria, however, silence embodies both of those qualities. Initially, the absence of the sounds of civilization indicates abnormality. But as the fellowship journeys on, silence becomes their ally as they seek to move quietly and undetected through the mountain. Silence becomes extremely important as noise threatens to disclose their presence in the mountain to enemies. In this sense, silence becomes a sign of tranquility, an assurance that their presence has gone unnoticed.

Silence’s association with tranquility is no more evident than when its disruption creates danger. The fellowship has stumbled upon the tomb of Gimli’s cousin and discovered a journal detailing the attack on the dwarvish civilization. The journal’s author describes the sounds of drums emanating from the depths of the mountain as the orcs ascend. The journal thus reinforces the association of silence and tranquility. The scene is lightly accompanied by strings, which adds to the sense of tension, even before the orc drums have begun to be heard.

Shortly following the discovery, Pippin is absentmindedly prodding at a skeleton, which causes it to accidentally fall into a well. The strings, which have been accompanying this scene, suddenly drop out just as the skeleton begins to fall apart. In a stark contrast to the relative silence as the music halts, the skeleton makes a chilling crashing as it descends hundreds of feet, the sounds slowly softening until it thuds to the
bottom. The reverberation of the skeleton bashing the walls of the well is used to heighten and highlight the relative silence, as well as increase the sense of tension. Within only a few seconds, the aforementioned drums begin to beat, breaking the silence and confirming that their presence is no longer unnoticed. In this moment, the re-introduction of the music alongside the diegetic drum sounds is an example of Rick Altman’s term ‘audio dissolve’ (63). An audio dissolve occurs as a means to bridge together two distinct music tracks (Altman, 63): in this case, the diegetic drum beats are heard within a relative silence initially to allow them to be the sonic focal point, but they also act as a bridge as the non-diegetic music is reinstated into the sound track.

The scene in Moria is not only an example of the power of silence to indicate both tranquility and abnormality, but the final part of the scene with the skeleton may also be interpreted as a ‘sound act’ (the silence serving to prepare the audience for the significant moment of the sound act). Pippin’s mishap with the skeleton is an excellent example of this concept: the accident causes a significant turn in the narrative as the orcs are provoked and attack. The result of this attack is a confrontation with the balrog, the most fearsome opponent the fellowship must face, and subsequently Gandalf is lost fending it off. We cannot visually see the skeleton falling through the well, however the visual accompaniment is not needed - sound alone acts to narrate the cacophonous fall, which results in a cringe-inducing sense of dread. The effectiveness of sound in creating terror has been well documented (Donnelly, 145). But it is the contrast between silence (evoked partly through reverberation and the absence of music) and sound that emphasizes the
emotional tone of this scene: truly, this is an event that could not have occurred without the use of silence in conjunction with a ‘sound act.’

The second example of a sound act occurs just as the fellowship is awaiting entry into Moria. Gandalf is attempting to open the magic door through spells and passwords. The other members of the fellowship grow bored, and Merry and Pippin begin tossing rocks into a nearby pond. The quiet of the night is broken as the rocks hit the water’s surface with a sharp ‘plunk’. Aragorn catches Pippin’s arm and warns him not to ‘disturb’ the water. Shortly after, Frodo and Gandalf crack the code and the fellowship enters Moria, only to discover that it seems to be abandoned. A tentacled arm reaches in and grabs Frodo by the leg. It seems that Merry and Pippin’s rocks have drawn the attention of ‘The Watcher’, a giant octopus-like monster, who breaks the entrance to Moria and causes the fellowship to be trapped.

Similar to the previous example, this sound act is the result of an object coming into contact with another, causing a disruptive sound, and breaking the tranquil silence. Silence is one of the most important protective elements, thus disturbing the silence is cause for danger. Both examples demonstrate the important narrative function that silence can play in the diegesis, and how a sound act can fundamentally alter the course of the narrative.

There is an additional use of silence within LotR that plays a unique role in propagating the fantastical elements of the story. In Chapter Three, the acousmêtre properties of the Ring were discussed as they pertain to its vocal capabilities. The Ring’s power to transport its wearer into a metaphysical fantastical gap was discussed, and the
fact that within this fantastical gap, sound is altered. The fantastical gap of the Ring is an additional zone of silence that holds narrative meaning.

The audience is able to glimpse this metaphysical world when the Ring slips onto Frodo’s finger in the scene at the pub, The Prancing Pony. As he becomes invisible to the diegetic world, he becomes visible to Sauron, who takes the form of an acousmêtre as the flaming Great Eye. Frodo is still present within the Prancing Pony and has not been transported somewhere else, but perhaps to an alternate dimension. The shapes of those around him are somewhat visible, but blurred in the grey haze that surrounds him.

Bather notes that there are four sonic elements associated with this fantastical gap: a deep rumbling bass reminiscent of fire, wind howling, a faint scream, and the sounds of a voice whispering in the Black Speech (2004). The diegetic sounds of the pub become silenced as the sounds of the fantastical gap overtake the soundtrack. The silencing of the outside diegetic world (the pub) is also indicative of a shift from the real to the surreal (Théberge, 59). There is no music that is heard, emphasizing the fact that Frodo is within a metaphysical realm. The elimination of the pub sounds and replacement with ambiguous sounds accentuates the fact that the sonic space is extended (Walker, 2004).

As Frodo is both within and outside of his diegetic world, he seems to be in a sonic fantastical gap. Stilwell’s term fantastical gap was originally applied to describe sound that is diegetically within the film universe, but its origin was ambiguous and unseen. The sounds of the Ring space operate similarly: Frodo is still within the universe, as he can see the shapes of those around him, but his exact location is ambiguous. Correspondingly, the sounds of the Ring space are diegetic, but their source invisible. As Sauron speaks to
Frodo, an image of the Great Eye is shown to Frodo, indicating the association between Sauron and the voice. This scene is a particularly interesting example of when an acousmêtre and the fantastical gap coincide sonically to create multiple levels of diegesis that exist simultaneously in the cinematic universe.

**Discussion**

This chapter has focused on the final piece of the triumvirate of the soundtrack: sound effects and silence. Sound and silence have not received as much critical attention as music, possibly owing to the perception that sound is less artistic than music (Sergi, 2006). Nonetheless, sound is a powerful component in creating the “immersive aural environment” that movies are able to create (Kerins, 2008).

On the technical level, sound design is important to create realism, or verisimilitude within film. Bather points out that sounds such as the swishing of swords in battle are added to support this imagined reality, showcasing the importance of sound in reinforcing the illusion of cinema (2004). Support such as this is crucial, especially in relation to the genre of fantasy: Tolkien himself felt that coherence and believability are the two essential qualities of the ‘adult fairy story’ (Ferré, 123).

“Sound design, when enmeshed with the visual image, is a powerful cinematic tool in its own right, adding nuances of meaning, character, space and setting” (Bather, 2004). This chapter has discussed the ways in which sound adds ‘nuances of meaning, character, space and setting,’ in the ways that it is able to create a fantastical gap, characterize good and evil, depict sonic spaces such as Moria, and portray natural settings such as Hobbiton.
and Rivendell. Similar to music, sound and silence play a unique role within the process of adaptation by creating a sonic world (cinema) based on a silent one (the book).

Gary Rydstrom is quoted as stating that “the areas that can most improve in making a soundtrack is for the sound effects department and the music department to work better together” (quoted in Sergi, 2006). Sound design is not perceived to be as important to a film as a critically-acclaimed score, an issue that persists within film. In the realm of academia, there is also much work to be done to understand the complex roles of sound, silence, music and dialogue, and how they may vary between different genres. As this chapter has argued, sound and silence can be as important to the narrative as music and dialogue and, indeed, work together with them.

In creating the 1981 BBC radio adaptation of *The Lord of the Rings*, the producers insisted that the adaptation ‘sound real’ (Barker, 2006). This emphasis on the sonic adaptation is significant - the need for sound to create authenticity and realism was recognized as being crucial to the success of the adaptation. Jackson has been influenced by the BBC adaptation in several documented ways, but the desire for Middle-Earth to ‘sound real’ is certainly one as well. The creative ways in which sound design, sound processing, and silence were used to fabricate the universe of Middle-Earth further illustrate the importance of sonic adaptation.
Chapter Six

Conclusion

It should now be evident that there is no simple formula to convert a novel into a film. The art of adaptation is complex and there is no right or wrong way to approach it. *The Lord of the Rings* is likely the largest adaptation mounted to date in consideration of the countless amount of time and money spent by thousands of dedicated people. The films introduced a new generation of readers to Tolkien’s best-selling novels and exemplified that fantasy film can have mainstream appeal, and even critical acclaim. RotK is the only fantasy film to have won an Oscar for Best Film (Buhler, Neumeyer, & Deemer, 312), which demonstrates the lack of recognition that the fantasy genre receives within the film industry, yet it is a genre that routinely extends the boundaries of our imagination through both image and sound. The adaptation of *The Lord of the Rings* is no different: whether by WETA Workshop’s advancement of the capabilities of digital technology for film or Shore’s score cast the fantastical into musical sound, Jackson’s trilogy expanded the cinematic frontier, particularly in regards to adapted films. The films are certainly a fitting response to a novel that pushed boundaries of its own for what fantasy literature can be and reinvigorated interest in the genre.

The fantasy genre truly is a diverse and open playing field in which audiences are prepared to embrace new cultures, societal conventions, languages, races, landscapes, and beings. The dialogue, music, and sound in LotR are workhorses in the sense that they function to corroborate the fantastic that is displayed on screen, and even communicate it.
in ways in which the visual action cannot. One concept discussed throughout this thesis is Stilwell’s fantastical gap. The fantastical gap was used to advantage by Shore in several instances: it was typically associated with the elvish culture, a supernatural race endowed with immortality. Tolkien was able to dedicate larger portions of his work to elvish lore than Jackson was able to in his films, therefore the director relied upon music to create a fantastic atmosphere. Music within the fantastical gap helps to position the audience within the ethereal world of Middle-Earth in a way that is unique to the fantasy genre.

The process by which Jackson brought Middle-Earth to life was, in short, complicated. Adapting any work into a new medium is a challenge even without the added factors of length and a loyal fan base. In crafting his adaptation, many of the novel’s elements evolved out of necessity. As discussed in Chapter Three, dialogue is a crucial element of film that is often overlooked by scholars and audiences alike. The dialogue of *The Lord of the Rings* tended to be sparse: Tolkien took a similar approach to filmmakers and embraced a ‘show them, don’t tell them’ mentality. Tolkien’s dialogue was archaic in structure, which conveyed the antiquated quality of Middle-Earth, imagined by Tolkien to be our Earth from a bygone era.

Jackson chose to forego the use of Tolkien’s more formal language in order to create an accessible, more modern dialogue for viewers (Thompson, 36). However, some original lines of dialogue were kept, though often shuffled around to different characters or points in the plot (Leitch, 142). The addition of the original dialogue is one method of creating a sense of authenticity and faithfulness to fans of the novels who would recog-
nize these lines. Yet, Leitch notes that there are very few examples of original dialogue included, with the exception of the names of various locations and items (142, 2007).

Though few original lines of dialogue were included, Tolkien’s invented languages were incorporated more heavily into the films in the interest of authenticity. These invented languages were used not only for dialogue, but also lyrically in all of the choral music that Shore wrote. Both Jackson and Shore felt that it was important to include the invented languages to retain Tolkien’s ‘voice’ within the films (Adams, 11).

In terms of the dialogue, only the Elvish language is included. Quenya and Sindarin were the most fleshed-out languages and Tolkien’s inspiration for writing *The Lord of the Rings* (Weiner and Marshall, 78). Elvish is heard in each of the films spoken by various characters: as per general cinematic practice, subtitles are always included to assist audience members who are unfamiliar with fantastical languages. This is one way in which the novels and films differ substantially. Tolkien added many examples of both Elvish languages throughout the novels, but rarely supplied the readers with any kind of translation, beyond what the character within the narrative (typically the hobbits) could discern from the speech (Shippey, 2003). This placed the reader in a position of alienation within an unfamiliar culture. Had Jackson chosen a similar approach, this alienation would have been more problematic for an audience who does not have an appendix entry with Elvish translations at their disposal. Thus, Tolkien was able to estrange readers in a way that Jackson could not have.

A further change to the original dialogue occurred through the scriptwriters attempts to distribute the dialogue more evenly. Shippey noted that in Tolkien’s novels, and especial-
ly in *The Fellowship of the Ring*, Gimli, Legolas, and Boromir had very few lines (2003). In order to enrich their characterization and enable them to be more equal members of the fellowship, Jackson’s adaptation saw these characters take on a larger speaking role, resulting in a greater presence.

Musically, Jackson’s films differ quite substantially from Tolkien’s works. Chapter Four explored the score and detailed its use of leitmotifs, diegetic music, and non-diegetic songs, the majority of which were written for the films; very few of Tolkien’s musical examples were included in the films. In fact, it is arguably the score that is least faithful to the novels. The music is one instance that was very clearly directed by cinematic conventions, yet also took on a fantastic flair.

The extensive use of the leitmotifs is the most obvious adherence to general film score practice. The use of leitmotifs has been popular since the Golden Age of film, and has been used within large-scale fantasy films such as *Star Wars* with great success. Shore chose to employ leitmotifs within his writing as a useful technique to provide cohesion within the score and ultimately the films: it is an integral factor in providing the unity between films that Jackson sought (Donnelly, 308). The score, in general, was one instance in which Shore had little direction from the novels.

In comparison to the novels, Tolkien’s numerous folksongs provided the predominant musical substance as opposed to Shore’s leitmotifs. Donnelly feels that by largely abstaining from including the folk songs in favour of the leitmotif style, Shore changed the musical spirit of the stories greatly (316). Shore took inspiration from the novels in terms of using instrumentation that Tolkien ascribed culturally, but aside from this and the in-
clusion of only a few folk songs from the novels, the musical landscape between the books and films bears little similarity. As described in Chapter Four, this was likely owing to the film convention of having a score which matches the on-screen action. Jackson’s translation of Middle-Earth put more stock into the grand-scale battle scenes and evolved *The Lord of the Rings* into an action/fantasy fusion. Tolkien’s rustic folk songs would have been out of place within this epic realization of Middle-Earth.

Conversely, Shore’s score helps to provide integral characterization and development that the dialogue and action are unable to do. An advantage that literature has over film is a greater amount of space to dedicate to slowly building character development. Tolkien had ample space to do just that, over a thousand pages that carefully detail landscapes, characters, and events. Jackson was required to work within cinematic conventions for acceptable screen-times. The theatrical releases of the films average three hours each, already a lengthy amount of time to hold an audience’s attention. With the addition of the extended editions later released, Jackson was able to add more detailed scenes, but was still operating within time limits. The music was able to provide some characterization through development of the leitmotifs, which reflected the changing emotions and maturation of the characters.

Though the leitmotifs changed the musical style from rustic to epic film score, Shore rooted them within Tolkien’s narrative by selecting instruments and sounds that best reflected the culture or character represented. In choosing to forego an extensive use of Tolkien’s folk songs, Shore likely sought a way to link the score to the novels in a concrete way, in the interest of fidelity. Fidelity, as discussed in Chapter Two, is a problemat-
ic point of comparison within adaptation, but nonetheless holds sway over audiences and critics alike. Thus, it was integral for both Shore and Jackson to provide evidence of fidelity in their interpretation of Middle-Earth if they hoped for a positive reception from fans.

Fidelity within the cinematic remake *The Lord of the Rings* was an example of give and take between the filmmakers and fans. Fans of the novel latched onto any news from the film early on and even created a website dedicated to tracking the progress and changes that Jackson was making to the novel. Jackson stated that his films would not be able to take the place of the novels, and thus should not be compared to them, but was also careful to note his own personal fandom as a qualifier for his directorial role (Boyens et al., 2011, Disc 3A). His insistence that the movies be considered merely one interpretation of the novels reiterates what some adaptation scholars feel is the correct way to consider adaptations: not as literal re-creations, but re-imaginations (Westbrook, 38). Even so, fans were expecting to see a film that honoured the literature. Consequently, Jackson and the producers took into consideration fan feedback from the dedicated website, theonering.net: negative feedback from the site regarding a major plot change at the battle of Helm’s Deep resulted in the producers completely scrapping this story line, despite the fact that a good deal of this development had already been filmed (Fimi, 85). In this way, any adaptation must acknowledge the source text’s fans to achieve success.

In addition to dialogue and music, sound effects and silence were examined as the final piece of the soundscape for LotR. The study of film sound has not yet become as fully developed as film music studies, yet scholarly attention has been steadily increasing as
technology widens the scope of what sound is capable of and as film enthusiasts themselves become more aware of sound as an integral part of cinema experience.

Within LotR, sound played an important role for personifying the supernatural creatures within Middle-Earth. Tolkien’s supernatural creatures, such as orcs, do not exist within reality and thus to portray them sonically, the film’s sound designers had to blend together the sounds of existing animals to craft the supernatural creatures.

Fisher’s (169) theory of the natural and supernatural sounds within LotR seems to be related to Bather’s (2004) theory of good and evil sounds, specifically that natural sounds tend to be associated with good, and supernatural sounds tend to be associated with evil. This may be a reflection of Tolkien’s work, wherein supernatural creatures were brought into creation through the manipulation of the natural and good. It may also be considered as a sonic play on the theme of industrialization vs. environmentalism that is a large part of Tolkien’s writing.

The association of supernatural sounds with evil continues with the discussion of the Ring’s sonic influences over other characters. The producers felt that the Ring was an actual character, rather than an inanimate object, which led to a unique sound design. In addition to the Ring’s speech capabilities, it was able to exercise influence over others that manifested both visually and aurally. Notably, characters that came under its spell would experience deeper vocal tonalities. Bather described deeper tonalities as indicative of malevolence according to cinematic musical codes, which may confirm why the Ring’s influence was realized sonically through deepened voices (2004).
The role of silence in films is perhaps the least acknowledged or discussed when considering the soundtracks of films. Directors do not often include absolute silences in film, as they may make audiences feel uncomfortable, and therefore relative and relational silences are more commonly used to draw attention to a particular aspect of the film narrative (Théberge, 52). LotR displays several instances of relative silence, most notably in the Mines of Moria, in which relative silence serves an important narrative function. Communicating both tranquility and abnormality, silence is used to create comfort and tension in the audience. The relative silence of the Mines thus functions on two different levels and exemplifies the importance of silence within the soundtrack.

Working from Kozloff’s theory of speech acts, the ‘sound act’ was discussed in relation to silence (34). The silence in the Mines is used to amplify the impact of the sound act of the skeleton falling down the well. This example serves to illustrate the importance which sound has within film: the emotional affect of this scene would not have been as effective without the use of both silence and sound, nor could it have been communicated in the same fashion. More work on the role of sound and silence, and particularly their function in different genres, is needed to advance the understanding of film sound.

Adaptation studies is at a crossroads: it is a field that sorely needs a theoretical framework to expand but is currently lacking such work. This is a crucial area for research because cinematic adaptations are an ever-popular avenue for filmmakers. Additionally, the field of fantastic adaptations is growing at an accelerated rate due to the recent popularity of films adapted from comic books and graphic novels. Many, like Guardians of the Galaxy (2014), blend the elements of superhero and fantastic. Future studies should endeav-
our to establish a theoretical base upon which to discuss adaptations, and to break down discussions of adaptation by genre. Each cinematic genre holds its own conventions, or cinematic codes, and adaptations differ accordingly, an important aspect to consider theoretically.

Additionally, expanded research is required to examine the role that music plays within adaptations. Music is an ambiguous portion of adaptations as there is rarely a literary precedent on which a composer might base their score. Despite this, music plays a significant role in adaptation, not solely in terms of fidelity, but also more largely in creating authenticity within the fictional world. Shore’s score was certainly an important part in crafting Middle-Earth. As discussed in Chapter Four, using Stilwell’s term ‘fantastic gap’, music was critical in constructing the sense of the ethereal in the films. Indeed, a third avenue for future research would be the role of music within fantasy films in general.

Though this thesis is merely an interlude in a larger conversation on the intermediality of adaptation, of fantastic music, and of dialogue and sound’s role within adaptation, it is my hope that it is not the end. These are all topics that are rich with potential, and as deserving of thought as the literary and cinematic worlds that they analyze.
Works Cited

Print Sources


Film Sources


