Danger, Deviancy, and Desire in Apartheid South Africa:
Visualizing an Exchange of Transnational Homoerotic Commodities

by

Thomas Sloss

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs in partial
fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

History

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario

© 2019 Thomas Sloss

Abstract

This thesis demonstrates that legislation introduced by the National Party of South Africa between 1950 and 1988 was ineffective in subduing the exchange of homoerotic commodities for three reasons. First, despite increased regulation and enforcement, networks of exchange continued to operate in South Africa. Second, as legislation became increasingly oppressive, dissent and debate entered public discourse ultimately fomenting reform. Third, the attempt to redefine heteronormative South African sexuality paradoxically intensified a transnational exchange of commodities that prompted the circulation and integration of homosexual culture.

Methodologically, this thesis is a composite of macro- and micro-history. Its source base is a collection of homoerotic magazines, photographs, and other documents from the Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA) archive in Johannesburg, South Africa. Digitized and processed, the data from GALA is interpreted using mapping software to visualize two different commodity networks (<http://dangerdeviancyanddesire.com>). The first map illustrates a network between a vendor and consumers in South Africa in 1984. The second reveals an exchange of material connecting publishers to artistic contributors between 1954 and 1966 in South Africa, Europe, and the Americas, that defied legislation and a crackdown on morality. Associated correspondence, editorials, newspaper clippings, and oral histories are used to corroborate these visualizations. By doing so, this thesis navigates contentious issues with cultural history and simultaneously addresses some limitations of visualizing data in this manner.

Ultimately, the quantitative and qualitative methodology used in this thesis reveals that despite increased regulation, some same-sex desiring men in South Africa had the means to participate in a transnational network of exchange. This transient network of commodities and images created a community beyond borders and boundaries that resisted regulation and created a space for like-minded individuals to communicate. Emboldened by both legal precedent and discourse in South Africa and abroad, they defied the threat of harsh punishment and established reform organizations to combat the prohibition of homoerotic commodities and homosexual relationships.

Acknowledgements

First and foremost, I would like to thank Dr. Danielle Kinsey and Dr. Jennifer V. Evans for agreeing to co-supervise this project. My research trip to South Africa was life-changing, and for that opportunity, I will always be grateful. From the beginning of our academic relationship, your mentorship and feedback has continually shaped my work for the better. One day I hope to be able to pay forward the hard work you have both done for me.

I want to thank Dr. Aleksandra Bennett for her constant goodwill, positive energy, and encouragement. Mostly, thank you for persuading me to stay an extra week in South Africa “just-in-case” to complete my research: you were right.

Joan White merits the utmost gratitude for keeping me (and the Carleton History Department) on-track. Thank you for having answers and solutions when I need them most.

To all my family and friends, your support is inexhaustible, and my appreciation is unending. Thank you to my mother, Angela, and my brothers, Ryan and Brad, for being there at any hour of the day. My sister Jessica gets a special mention for taking care of the house, the dog, the cat, and my plants for nearly a month while I was away on my research trip. Rob Blades deserves a special thanks for introducing me to Leaflet, an application used in this project. Lastly, I am thankful to Sue Globensky, who was among the first, to encourage me to pursue a master’s degree.

Samantha Sabo deserves my greatest thanks. Without your love and support, I would not be here, especially since you got me in (and out) of the hospital in South Africa. Your compassion and kind-heartedness are continual sources of joy for me. As this chapter in our lives comes to a close, I am excited to see what is next for us.

To all of the acknowledged, thank you for your patience, despite my persistent stubbornness.

Table of Contents

Abstract	ii
Acknowledgements	iv
Table of Contents	v
List of Illustrations	vi
List of Appendices	viii
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: The Legal Status of Homosexuality in South Africa	16
Chapter 2: The GALA Collections	34
Chapter 3: Interpretation and Visualization	46
Klein Mailing-List, “Mail Distribution of Confiscated Erotic Material in South Africa”	51
Magazine Collections, “Transnational network of homoerotic magazine contributors and publishers”	57
Chapter 4: Limited Perspectives	60
Conclusion	66
Bibliography	69
Primary Sources	69
GALA	69
Government of South Africa	69
Secondary Sources	70
Technical Sources	74

List of Illustrations

Figure 1: Residence raided by police in Forest Town. “Special study. Personal. B.E.J. Garmeson”, “Joe Garmeson Papers,” 1966, AM 2580, GALA.	24
Figure 2: “Bennie,” TRIM, September 1960, “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s,” AM 2636, GALA.	35
Figure 3: “Niels,” TRIM, May 1960, “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s,” AM 2636, GALA.	36
Figure 4: Highlighted in yellow is MacFarlane’s business, Atelier Alpha. TRIM, 1960, “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s,” AM 2636, GALA.	37
Figure 5: Atelier Alpha mail-order catalogue cover page, featuring "Niels" and "Bennie" this time in full-frontal poses. “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s,” AM 2636, GALA.	40
Figure 6: Summons to Magister's Court for the collection and sale of prohibited material, “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997,” AM 3019, GALA.	42
Figure 7: A collaboration between Klein Enterprises and Optima Agencies. “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997,” AM 3019, GALA.	43
Figure 8: Iteration of mailing-list data visualization.	50
Figure 9: Iteration of magazine data visualization.	50
Figure 10: Finalized mailing-list map.	51
Figure 11: Localized market around Johannesburg	52
Figure 12: Mailing-list map, zoomed into point-of-origin, Joubert Park circled.	53
Figure 13: Postcard to Herb Klein, P.O. Box Redacted, “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997,” AM 3019, GALA.	54
Figure 14: Finalized magazine collections map.	57
Figure 15: No data from Australia or Asia, limited data in Africa (outside of South Africa) and South America.	63
Figure 16: Initial Leaflet test render.	76
Figure 17: Initial Leaflet test render, zoomed in.	76
Figure 18: Initializing and loading a tile layer in Leaflet.	78
Figure 19: Creating an information box in Leaflet.	78
Figure 20: Creating a point of reference in Leaflet.	79
Figure 21: Generating lines and polygons at specific geographic points.	79
Figure 22: Canvas-Flowmap-Layer demonstration file visualizing airport destinations.	83
Figure 23: Creating control panels in Leaflet.	85

Figure 24: Creating temporal map layers.	86
Figure 25: Using PapaParse to convert .CSV files.	86
Figure 26: Creating listener events for mouse-input.	87
Figure 27: Example .CSV Data	88

List of Appendices

Appendix A: The Mechanics of Leaflet Visualization	75
Technical Documentation for Klein Mailing-List, “Mail Distribution of Confiscated Erotic Material in South Africa”	75
Code Snippets from the Klein Mailing-List Map	78
Technical Documentation for Magazine Collections, “Transnational network of homoerotic magazine contributors and publishers”	81
Code Snippets from the Magazine Collections Map	85
Example .CSV Data from Magazine Collections Map	88
Cross-Origin Resource Sharing (CORS)	89

Introduction

From the outset of their election on May 26, 1948, the National Party attempted to redefine South African sexuality as heteronormative by prohibiting “deviant” or “immoral” behaviours and relationships, including the exchange of what many considered to be homoerotic images. The National Party achieved this primarily through amendments to the *Immorality Act*. This thesis argues that legislation introduced by the National Party between 1950 and 1988 was ineffective in subduing the exchange of homoerotic commodities for three reasons. First, despite increased regulation and enforcement, networks of exchange continued to operate within South Africa. Second, as legislation introduced by the National Party became increasingly oppressive towards marginalized groups, dissent and debate entered public discourse ultimately fomenting legislative reform. Third, the attempt to regulate heteronormative South African sexuality paradoxically encouraged a transnational exchange of homoerotic commodities. Five collections of homoerotic magazines, photographs, and other documents gathered from the Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA) archive in Johannesburg, South Africa form the source base for this thesis.

These primary sources point to an international trade in images and commodities that belies South African attempts to legislate and enforce heterosexual sexual practices and morality. The trade in magazines and photographs, many which originated outside of South Africa, from North America and Europe, attests to the continuation of an underground exchange in homosexual images and commodities. Drawing on the sources from GALA, I have created two databases that are visualized as maps to illustrate this network. These maps demonstrate that homoerotic commodities travelled across borders

and between and among actors in South Africa itself. This thesis contributes to ongoing historiography by using mapping as an alternative technique of *re-presenting* visual evidence.¹ Network visualizations effectively demonstrate complex social interactions, pathways of information, and the magnitude of exchange. More typical textual analyses prioritize the form of visual evidence, and less the function; comparatively the methodology used in this thesis excels at “investigating the patterned relationships among historical actors.”² However, this is not a lossless methodology. Transforming and restructuring information from primary archival sources into data useable by network visualization can eliminate “unusable” attributes. Accompanying information such as images, notes in the margins, or even textual information outside of the scope of the visualization can be discarded to streamline a narrative.³ Essentially, not only does data not speak for itself but also it can be misrepresentative and misleading: a form of archival violence.⁴ This thesis addresses these shortcomings by re-integrating other evidence found at GALA, such as photographs, correspondence, editorials, newspaper clippings, and oral histories, to historicize, contextualize, and reinforce the network visualizations.⁵

¹ Other recent quantitative analyses of South African homosexuality include Hattingh and Spencer, “Homosexual Not Homogeneous” that uses a Web-based electronic survey and a hierarchical cluster analysis to analyze the homogeneity of the “homosexual lifestyle” in South Africa; or McCormick, “Queering Discourses of Coming out in South Africa,” which analyzes three non-fiction gay and lesbian books and uses a content analysis to investigate how South Africans confess to the ‘truth’ of their homosexuality.

² Mustafa Emirbayer and Jeff Goodwin, “Network Analysis, Culture, and the Problem of Agency,” *American Journal of Sociology* 99, no. 6 (May 1994): 1447.

³ Shawn Graham, Ian Milligan, and Scott Weingart, *Exploring Big Historical Data: The Historian’s Macroscope* (London: Imperial College Press, 2016), 33.

⁴ Jacques Derrida, *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*, Religion and Postmodernism (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996), 91.

⁵ This is not the only shortcoming of using a network analysis, other limitations are examined in chapter three.

This thesis is proven across four chapters. The first chapter contextualizes this thesis by examining the legal status of homosexuality in South Africa before, during, and after the election of the National Party in 1948. Homosexuality, in this context, is the terminology found in the primary sources used for this thesis and how the men represented by the examined GALA collections chose to self-identify. However, this research does not encompass all available archival material at GALA. Therefore evidence in this thesis is particular to a subsection of homosexuality in South Africa: white men. Therefore, going forward, “homosexual” refers to same-sex relationships between these men exclusively. Defining this language navigates contemporary connotations and interpretations of homosexuality and grounds this thesis in a specific sociocultural context: the experience of white men who were among the first to agitate for “a right to sexual orientation” in South Africa.⁶ The first chapter demonstrates how the National Party procedurally prohibited the exchange of homoerotic commodities and homosexual relationships. Additionally, this chapter uses evidence found in the Joe Garmeson collection to show how homosexual men in South Africa resisted increasingly oppressive legislation. The second chapter introduces other primary evidence from the collections at GALA and specifically identifies the origin of the information used for the network visualizations. This chapter supplements the network visualizations with deep readings of primary evidence from the GALA collections. By doing so, this chapter ensures that the network visualizations are not isolated from context and the agency of individual actors, including publishers, contributors, consumers, and government agents. The third chapter analyzes methods of historical interpretation. Originally, this thesis was to be

⁶ Neville Hoad, “Queer Customs against the Law,” *Research in African Literatures* 47, no. 2 (2016): 5.

accompanied by a short historical documentary; instead, this chapter examines the viability of a documentary film and presents an alternative, more appropriate, method of interpretation to demonstrate complex networks of cultural exchange. This chapter visualizes the geospatial data collected from GALA as maps (found at <http://dangerdeviancyanddesire.com>). These maps demonstrate the exchange of homoerotic commodities within South Africa and abroad. Moreover, they confirm the failure of the National Party to effectively control the exchange of homoerotic commodities and prohibit the development of homosexual culture. The fourth chapter explicitly identifies the archival and methodological limitations of this thesis. As previously mentioned, the voices of many groups, including heterosexual couples, lesbians, and black homosexual men are underrepresented or altogether missing from the five collections examined at GALA. Furthermore, although this thesis takes steps to address some of the methodological shortcomings of network visualization, there are still unresolved drawbacks attributed to the methodology. This chapter engages with these shortcomings and analyzes how they impact this research. Ultimately, despite these significant limitations, the methodology used in this thesis is a valuable example of fusing micro- and macrohistory, qualitative and quantitative evidence, and the analysis of textual and visual evidence.

Select Historiography

Historiographically, this thesis relies on several key texts to inform its theoretical foundations. In particular, scholarly work on the history of sexuality, visual culture, and cultural exchange are formative to this thesis. These historiographic foundations answer, in part, the question of why a network visualization is an appropriate form of interpretation for this material. Fundamentally, these texts examine the relationships between individuals, states, bodies, commodities, and sexualities. Reflecting on the origins of my own interpretive bias was a critical exercise in understanding how to engage with the evidence from GALA.⁷ By engaging with these narratives via network visualization, this thesis seeks to intervene in historical conversations that relate to the governmentalization of sexuality, the diffusion of culture, and the interpretation of visual evidence.

The objective of legislation like the *Immorality Act* in South Africa was the prohibition of “deviant” sexual practices and behaviours, or conversely, the enforcement of heteronormative sexual practices and behaviours by the state. Michel Foucault analyzes the governmentalization of sexuality in *The History of Sexuality* translated to English in 1978. From a Foucauldian perspective, bodies are the “great instruments of the state,” and without bodies, a state has no power.⁸ Bodies are the cornerstone of gaining and maintaining power. Therefore, when a government determines that an increase in population is politically or militarily fortuitous, procreation and heteronormative sexual practices are encouraged. Transgression or deviation from this heterosexual norm is an

⁷ Or at least responded to the question of “what sources have I been exposed to that are shaping my interpretations”.

⁸ Michel Foucault, *The History of Sexuality*, 1st American ed (New York: Pantheon Books, 1978), 141.

incredible risk to the state, “dangerous for the whole society; strange pleasures, [. . .] would eventually result in nothing short of death: that of individuals, generations, the species itself.”⁹ For Foucault, “strange” pleasures are sexual activities outside of procreative sex, but in the South African context, the National Party expanded this definition to include sexual activities across boundaries of race, gender, and sexuality. Building on Foucault and grounding the conversation in South Africa, Desiree Lewis conflates the control of sexualized bodies, as a means of establishing “new coercive regimes.”¹⁰ To the detriment of National Party regulatory efforts, legislation causes sexuality to become public discourse. What may have been invisible, “trivial and base,” suddenly becomes arrested in momentum and fixated upon: more importantly it becomes debatable.¹¹ Furthermore, when governments legislate, regulate, or enforce heteronormative sexual relationships, marginalized “deviant” sexualities seek out other means of existence. Same-sex desiring men repurpose the pages of magazines or a collection of photographs as an imagined community.¹²

The National Party used a variety of mechanisms to control sexuality in South Africa, including the prohibition and censorship of “immoral” depictions in visual media: photographs, drawings, and other forms of art. John Tagg contemplates the camera as an apparatus of governance in *The Disciplinary Frame: Photographic Truths and the Capture of Meaning*.¹³ The camera, according to Tagg, is a complicit tool of governance,

⁹ Foucault, 53–54.

¹⁰ Desiree Lewis, “Rethinking Nationalism in Relation to Foucault’s History of Sexuality and Adrienne Rich’s ‘Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence,’” *Sexualities* 11, no. 1–2 (2008): 104.

¹¹ Foucault, *The History of Sexuality*, 7.

¹² Benedict R. O’G Anderson, *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*, Rev. ed (London ; New York: Verso, 2006).

¹³ See also Tagg, *The Burden of Representation* which unpacks photography as historical evidence and semiotically deconstructs the photograph into its constituent parts.

a “servile instrument” to “separate, isolate, and subjugate” its subjects.¹⁴ If the “subject can somehow interrupt or resist this power by a kind of refusal or evasion,” the camera can be co-opted into enabling the inverse: liberation and empowerment.¹⁵ Homosexual men in South Africa performed this resistance and refusal by producing and re-producing photographs for homoerotic magazines and by continuing to participate in a transnational economy of illicit commodities. In the South African case, homosexual desire transcends the male forms represented in the photographs and becomes a narrative of reclamation.¹⁶ *The Disciplinary Frame* is essential in providing language for this thesis to interpret the relationship between camera, subject, audience, and photographs. Viewing “erotic photography as an intellectual as well as subjective act of reclamation and discovery,” is the fundamental argument of Jennifer V. Evans’ “Seeing Subjectivity: Erotic Photography and the Optics of Desire.”¹⁷ Evans’ case-study, the work of photographer Herbert Tobias, and the primary sources used in this thesis follow similar trajectories: forms of visual evidence, once considered obscene, that migrate from personal collections to publication in magazines, and ultimately, at least in the case of Tobias, into the realm of “high art.”¹⁸ Both Evans’ work and this thesis share the goal of thinking “about ‘the social lives of images’ to historicize the sentiments that photos call into being in different moments of consumption and display.”¹⁹ Where Evans’ work investigates the

¹⁴ John Tagg, *The Disciplinary Frame: Photographic Truths and the Capture of Meaning* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009), 50.

¹⁵ Tagg, 208.

¹⁶ For more on using photographs and images as historical evidence, see: Burke, *Eyewitnessing*; Sontag, *On Photography*; Edwards and Hart, *Photographs Objects Histories on the Materiality of Images*; Sekula, *Photography against the Grain*; Solomon-Godeau, *Photography at the Dock*; Gower, Jast, and Topley, *The Camera as Historian*; White, *The Content of the Form*.

¹⁷ Jennifer V. Evans, “Seeing Subjectivity: Erotic Photography and the Optics of Desire,” *The American Historical Review* 118, no. 2 (2013): 462.

¹⁸ Evans, 432.

¹⁹ Evans, “Seeing Subjectivity: Erotic Photography and the Optics of Desire.”

affect of Tobias' photography, this thesis presents a different way to read similar sources by "[l]ooking outside the frame to consider the photograph's movement and migration as a physical thing."²⁰ Furthermore, by aggregating the data into a database, this thesis seeks to examine broad cultural trends, whereas Evans' analysis focuses on the influence of an individual photographer. This thesis visualizes the work of over fifty photographers published by dozens of companies across four continents and two decades and maps the circulation and exchange of their work.²¹ Considered alone, the network illustrated by this thesis demonstrates that there was a broad network of exchange; however, in the process of creating this visualization, the agency of individuals is diminished or lost entirely. Performing a deep reading of associated textual evidence found in the archival collections at GALA mitigates this shortcoming. By doing so, this network becomes more than just the exchange of photographs and magazines. It represents the communication of shared suffering, resistance, and something more than homoerotic fantasies: the aspiration of a sexually liberated future for homosexual men.

Photographs, curated and compiled in a magazine, can voice solidarity where the individual photograph cannot: a communicative form of power within the pages. Visualizing the self, even in the pages of an illicit homoerotic magazine, allows "a means of finding a place in the world."²² For homosexual men in South Africa, the circulation of homoerotic photographs and magazines was a way of communicating this space. In other words, these magazines are "hidden transcripts" that are only communicative if the

²⁰ In fact, the original title for this thesis "Outside the Frame" was borrowed from Evans, "Seeing Subjectivity: Erotic Photography and the Optics of Desire," 449.

²¹ For more on the intersection between visual culture, gender, and sexuality, see for example: Solomon-Godeau, *Photography after Photography*; Rose, *Sexuality in the Field of Vision*; Mitchell, *What Do Pictures Want?*

²² Susan Sontag, *On Photography* (New York: Picador USA, 2001), 92.

viewer/reader already knows the language of the message.²³ The primary evidence used in this thesis represents the development of this language: homosexual men in South Africa and other countries are discovering a visual and textual common language that circumvents prohibition and censorship.

Arjun Appadurai explores the question of how objects influence everyday sentiment in the edited volume of essays *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. For Appadurai, the exchange of commodities is in response to the “emanation of human needs,” and demand for these commodities becomes “social, relational, and active rather than private, atomic, or passive.”²⁴ Commodities change as different audiences consume them, meeting different needs from one consumer to the next. As we will see later in chapter two, the commodities analyzed by this thesis had flexible and fluid definitions, adapting to the concurrent pressures of prohibition and the needs of their audience. Commodities like the homoerotic magazines and photographs are “many different kinds of thing, at different points in their social lives,” as they flow between public and private realms and function between danger and desire.²⁵ More importantly, *The Social Life of Things* recognizes commodities as constituent elements of a whole: “relationships linking producers, distributors, and consumers of a particular commodity.”²⁶ One of the essays in the volume, Lee V. Cassanelli’s “Qat: changes in the production and consumption of a quasilegal commodity in northeast Africa,” sets a scholarly precedent for this thesis. By using maps and supporting quantitative and

²³ James C. Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts* (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990).

²⁴ Arjun Appadurai, ed., *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective* (Cambridge [Cambridgeshire] ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1986), 29–31.

²⁵ Appadurai, 13.

²⁶ Appadurai, 27.

qualitative evidence, Cassanelli analyzes the exchange and cultural diffusion of a prohibited commodity: qat, an herbal stimulant. Similar to the *Immorality Act* legislation enacted by the National Party in South Africa, “bans on qat have been imposed by area governments at least half a dozen times, with little permanent effect.”²⁷ Similarly, the homoerotic magazines and photographs examined in this thesis have undergone increasing intensities of prohibition. This legislative attention imbues prohibited commodities with symbolic value that fluctuates “in significance in response to social and political pressures.”²⁸ Using these commodities as a historical device is not necessarily about the history of the commodity itself but is instead an examination of cultural transformation, “from a commodity perspective.”²⁹ Cassanelli’s analysis is regionally specific to northeast Africa, whereas this thesis operates on a much broader scale. By evaluating cultural transformation on a transnational level, the integration and interaction between external and internal cultural forces becomes evident.

Qat and the primary evidence used in this thesis differ in another significant way. This thesis analyzes commodities that are erotically-charged and defined as obscene or sexually deviant. John Stratton’s *The Desirable Body: Cultural Fetishism and The Erotics of Consumption* is useful in providing even more specific theoretical framing for eroticized commodities. In particular, Stratton argues that the “male body was placed on display” in the mid-twentieth century was one of that visualized “phantasies of power, omnipotence, mastery and control.”³⁰ Stratton classifies the fetishistic male gaze as a

²⁷ Appadurai, 236.

²⁸ Appadurai, 255.

²⁹ Appadurai, 255.

³⁰ Stratton, *The Desirable Body*, 181 borrowing from Neale, “Masculinity as Spectacle,” 5.

desire for either “the ephebe” or “the blond god.”³¹ Although these binaries are problematic, the homoerotic magazines and photographs examined in this thesis exemplify those hard and fast definitions. The man most represented in the primary sources analyzed for this thesis “is the man men want to be, and because his body is so perfect [. . .] he needs nothing more.”³² The “Adonis” figure is, therefore, an “incarnation of phallic power.”³³ When the photographs do not depict these hypermasculine archetypes, there is usually an accompanying comment about the man’s journey in becoming the “Adonis” figure. Stratton’s monograph conclusively demonstrates a critical element of this thesis: the interaction between desire, commodities, and consumption, and how a particular vision of masculinity, viewed in the context of mid-twentieth-century South Africa, is itself political.

In South Africa, at a time of intense enforcement of moral and sexual norms, the mere existence of a network of same-sex consumption is an example of opposition. However, this assertion has not gone unquestioned. Martin Meeker’s *Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communication and Community, 1940s-1970s* identifies communication as a central obstacle for the homosexual community in mid-twentieth century America. Meeker argues that homoerotic magazines, many of which are identical to the primary sources used in this thesis, are a significant commodified medium of textual and visual communication.³⁴ Moreover, Meeker, drawing on the work of Robert Darnton, argues that combining “diffusion and discourse” allows the examination of a

³¹ Stratton, *The Desirable Body*, 119–20, borrowed from Dijkstra, *Idols of Perversity*, 199–200.

³² Stratton, *The Desirable Body: Cultural Fetishism and the Erotics of Consumption*, 192.

³³ Stratton, 192.

³⁴ Martin Meeker, *Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communications and Community, 1940s-1970s* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006), 9.

“communications circuit” where “authors respond to readers, reviews and other sources of information and information in the surrounding society.”³⁵ This more complex analytical approach allows for “meaning creation in a circular rather than top-down motion, therefore sidestepping the cause-effect tautology in favor of a more organic and systemic approach; and, it accounts for the influence of publishers, distributors, politicians, gossips, and censors alongside authors and readers, the usual focus of cultural history.”³⁶ Like *Contacts Desired*, the fundamental goal of this thesis is to analyze the interaction and influence of these agents on the status of homosexuality in South Africa. A critical weakness of Meeker’s analysis that this thesis seeks to remedy is the agency of contributors – specifically photographers who provided material to publishers. Chapter two details the role photographers played in maintaining a secondary network of more explicit material underlying the erotic content of the magazines.

Some scholars, such as Lillian Faderman, are critical of Meeker’s analysis and suggest that “Meeker produces few figures to demonstrate how widespread the readership of these magazines or the membership of these organizations actually was.”³⁷ This thesis refutes Faderman’s criticism by visually demonstrating the broad nature of this commodity network.³⁸ Referencing Thomas Waugh’s *Hard to Imagine: Gay Male Eroticism in Photography and Film from Their Beginnings to Stonewall*, Meeker estimates that *Tomorrow’s Man*, a magazine also used in this thesis, had over 100,000

³⁵ From Robert Darnton, *The Forbidden Best-Sellers of Pre-Revolutionary France* (New York: W.W. Norton, 1995), 182 in Meeker, *Contacts Desired*, 14.

³⁶ Meeker, *Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communications and Community, 1940s-1970s*, 14.

³⁷ L. Faderman, “Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communication and Community, 1940s-1970s,” *The American Historical Review* 112, no. 2 (April 1, 2007): 541–42.

³⁸ David K. Johnson provides further evidence of the market for “physique” magazines in “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” *Journal of Social History* 43, no. 4 (2010): 867–92.

copies in circulation in 1965.³⁹ Meeker does not pursue this further, likely due to a lack of corroborating or authenticating evidence (the print numbers are a point of conjecture, depending on who is doing the asking). The network visualizations utilized in this thesis cannot infer readership transnationally, but they do show the domestic exchange of one South African magazine in 1984. They also show that magazines like *Tomorrow's Man*, including the 1965 publications, were a means of connecting readers directly to photographers, and in the process, connecting desiring readers to thousands of photographs.

Consuming these types of images, especially in the sociocultural context of prohibition and punishment under the National Party of South Africa, carried significant risk. Marc Epprecht's *Hungochani: The History of a Dissident Sexuality in Southern Africa* grounds this thesis in the history of South African sexuality. Similar to Stratton's work, Epprecht identifies a "muscular, Christian, hard-drinking, heterosexually lusty, at-ease-in-the-bundu (wilderness), at-ease-with-Natives," masculine archetype.⁴⁰ Many of the explicitly South African magazines and photographs analyzed for this thesis engage with this archetype: well-built white men posing in natural settings. Chapter two briefly details how consumers of these magazines grappled with this hypermasculine archetype over time. The most valuable contribution of *Hungochani*, however, is that it makes the limitations of the primary sources used in this thesis distinctly evident by analyzing the historicity and wide variety of *homosexualities* in Southern Africa. This thesis supports

³⁹ From Thomas Waugh, *Hard to Imagine: Gay Male Eroticism in Photography and Film from Their Beginnings to Stonewall*, Between Men--between Women (New York: Columbia University Press, 1996), 217 in Meeker, *Contacts Desired*, 272.

⁴⁰ Marc Epprecht, *Hungochani: The History of a Dissident Sexuality in Southern Africa*, 2. ed (Montréal: McGill-Queen's Univ. Press, 2013), 148.

Epprecht's work by demonstrating how the integration and compilation of homoerotic visual culture as photographs in magazines influenced the development of homosexualities in South Africa and abroad: with the caveat that this interpretation only reflects the formation of homosexual white male identity.

"Sexuality, Africa, History," a journal article written by Epprecht, challenges the presentation of historical evidence as empirical "scientific" studies. By operating under the guise of scientific study, some research has definitively "promot[ed] stereotypes, simplifications, and calumnies against African cultures."⁴¹ This article is a critical resource in defining the stakes of this thesis and the potential harm it could cause including contributing to homophobic discourse, which "appears to be on the rise in many African countries, as vocal independent women and sexual minorities become scapegoats for a variety of social and political ills."⁴² This thesis seeks to enrich "global sexuality studies more broadly" by presenting "[t]ransnational historical research on sexuality" in a way that offers "insights into hidden struggles, tensions, and interconnections" between homosexual men within South Africa and beyond its borders.⁴³ This thesis mitigates the concerns that Epprecht articulates in "Sexuality, Africa, History," by performing a "[s]ensitive transnational excavation and analysis of the history of sexualities" that is grounded in a specific South African context and considers the contemporary livelihood of the represented communities as a paramount concern.⁴⁴ While this thesis has its limitations and does not fully address many of the

⁴¹ Marc Epprecht, "Sexuality, Africa, History," *The American Historical Review* 114, no. 5 (December 2009): 1258.

⁴² Epprecht, 1260.

⁴³ Epprecht, 1260–61.

⁴⁴ Epprecht, 1272.

“huge gaps” that exist in “African history in general” it does integrate Africa into “global structures and transnational movements or ideas.”⁴⁵ This thesis builds the foundation for further research that can “frame desire far beyond the physical borders of Africa” and disrupt “simplistic narratives about African sexualities” through the use of network visualization.⁴⁶

These historiographic texts form the structural foundations of this thesis.

However, this thesis departs from several of these texts by interpreting sexuality as a transnational phenomenon. By breaking away from national or regional boundaries, this thesis seeks to understand the changes homosexual culture went through during the mid-twentieth century. Contextually centred on South Africa, this thesis visualizes how the exchange of commodities, including homoerotic photographs and magazines, may have influenced the discourse on sexuality. The entanglement of prohibition and resistance is a critical aspect of this analysis; therefore, the following chapter details the legal status of homosexuality in South Africa and the history of prohibition by drawing on the archive of government legislation and the counter-archive of defiance found in the collections at GALA.

⁴⁵ Epprecht, 1272.

⁴⁶ Epprecht, 1272.

Chapter 1: The Legal Status of Homosexuality in South Africa

To avoid any sort of misunderstanding I may as well explain that I am definitely NOT a practising homosexual.

Yours sincerely,

S.

I will not even sign, the position looks so dangerous.

Is your Post Box really safe; might not other members of your staff open your letters?

Even if you keep receiving letters marked private etc. that could cause suspicion.

- Anonymous letter and postscript, “Joe Garmeson Papers”, 1967, AM 2580, GALA.

This letter and others like it are part of the Joe Garmeson Papers, a collection from the Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action archive (GALA). The prohibition and policing of homosexuality in South Africa come to a climax in 1967. Shortly thereafter, the addressee of this letter, Joe Garmeson, would become the “secretary of the Legal Reform Fund” which raised funds “to secure professional legal representation” to the Parliamentary Select Committee in order to advocate for significant revisions to the *Immorality Act*.⁴⁷ This organization gathered resources in order to challenge the ratification of the *Immorality Act Amendment, 1967*. Garmeson’s meticulous documentation reveals how the legislation interacted with public discourse through “correspondence, meeting minutes, notes, articles [...] audio tape and Garmeson’s scrapbook of newspaper clippings.”⁴⁸ In addition, the Garmeson collection suggests that the legal reform of the *Immorality Act* relied heavily on international cases as legal precedent: research originated from Belgium, Denmark, France, West Germany, Greece, Italy, the Netherlands, Norway, New Zealand, and the United Kingdom (among many other international newspaper clippings).⁴⁹ The *Immorality Act* was one of the primary mechanisms that the National Party used to prohibit and enforce heteronormative sexual

⁴⁷ Inventory notes, “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000.”

⁴⁸ Inventory notes, “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000.”

⁴⁹ “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000.”

practices and relationships in South Africa. In an interview with Graeme Reid recorded in 1997, Garmeson reflects that in the “attempt to drastically expand the *Immorality Act*, police actually didn't understand the law. They did not realize what an offence was. They didn't realize the powers that they had. And [...] the last thing we wanted to do is publish a handbook for how you go about arresting moffies.”⁵⁰ The Garmeson collection verifies that the *Immorality Act Amendment, 1967* effectively overstepped its bounds, a miscalculation which fomented organized legal challenges and reform.

The letter makes the stakes of the situation unequivocally clear: “S.” acknowledges the risk he takes in writing, the perceptible fear of surveillance, censorship, and punishment evident in his words. Each of his fears come in reaction to and thus reveal the modus operandi of the National Party, elected to form a minority coalition government on May 26, 1948. This chapter chronologically examines the legal status of homosexuality in South Africa before the election of the National Party in 1948, the amendment of the *Immorality Act* administered by the National Party, and the course it took after that, leading up to the successive *Immorality Act Amendments, 1950-1988* and beyond. Subsequently, the chapter introduces censorship legislation that defined many of the primary sources that inform this thesis as illicit, immoral, or obscene. Censorship legislation operated alongside the *Immorality Act* and its amendments and reinforced the ability of the National Party to interfere in the lives of South African citizens. Primary evidence, including personal correspondence, newspaper clippings, oral history interviews, the *Immorality Act* and its amendments, and Select Committee reports

⁵⁰ Interview in “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000,” 8. Garmeson self-identified as a homosexual, “moffies” in this context is a colloquial/pejorative South African term for homosexual men.

demonstrate the extent to which the National Party went to in their attempt to define national heteronormative sexuality.

Preceding the introduction of the original *Immorality Act, 1927*, homosexuality, and any other non-procreative sexual act for that matter, was criminalized by “Roman-Dutch common law” that forbade “a large number of sexual acts between adults [...] between men or between a man and a woman.”⁵¹ Dutch colonizers introduced this law in the seventeenth century. Furthermore, beyond the confines of gender, common law extended to other forms of identity and sexual relations, “a number of common-law authorities regarded even heterosexual intercourse between a Christian and a Jew, Turk or Saracen equally as a crime against nature and punishable by death.”⁵² After taking over the Cape Colony in 1806, the British who, as Epprecht argues, “shared the Dutch revulsion against sodomy,” adopted Roman-Dutch law “but interpreted it according to British precedents.”⁵³ Until nearly the turn of the twentieth century, courts tested the jurisdiction and severity of these laws. Moral perils bolstered enforcement of the law by authorities, for “where there exists no direct outlet for certain passions, hideous crimes and unnatural offences constantly crop up.”⁵⁴ These passions, crimes, and offences were sexual acts and relationships outside of heteronormative procreation.⁵⁵ Edwin Cameron provides an overview of the jurisdiction of Roman-Dutch common law in “Sexual Orientation and The Constitution: A Test Case For Human Rights,” male-female sodomy,

⁵¹ Edwin Cameron, “Sexual Orientation and the Constitution: A Test Case for Human Rights,” *South African Law Journal* 110 (1993): 453.

⁵² Cameron, 453.

⁵³ Epprecht, *Hungochani: The History of a Dissident Sexuality in Southern Africa*, 54.

⁵⁴ Epprecht, 57.

⁵⁵ Susanne Maria Klausen, *Abortion under Apartheid: Nationalism, Sexuality, and Women’s Reproductive Rights in South Africa* (New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2015), 16–17.

male-male intercourse, and masturbation were all “crimes against nature,” “misuse of the organs of creation,” and considered “punishable by death.”⁵⁶ These sentiments of “immoral” sexuality “fomented contempt and hatred against perceived homosexuals to advance specific political objectives” and provided the structure for the original *Immorality Act, 1927*.⁵⁷

The *Immorality Act, 1927* was “a bill in the House of Assembly prohibiting intercourse out of wedlock between white men and native women.”⁵⁸ The first bill, brought before South African parliament in 1927 by the National Party, was primarily concerned with miscegenation and interracial relations: “[a]ny European male who has, or attempts to have, illicit carnal intercourse with a native female ... shall be guilty of an offence.”⁵⁹ Although this Act was concerned with preserving racial purity, the *Immorality Act, 1927* also obliquely reinforced criminalization of homosexuality via the Roman-Dutch common law in section seven, “In this Act the expression “illicit carnal intercourse” means carnal intercourse other than between husband and wife.”⁶⁰ Until 1950, the *Immorality Act, 1927* would serve as the legislative precedent for crimes of an obscene or immoral nature.

The National Party amended the *Immorality Act, 1927* again in 1950, two years after reforming government. The National Party did not introduce immediate sweeping legislature after their election in 1948 but instead slowly incorporated ambiguous

⁵⁶ Cameron, “Sexual Orientation and the Constitution: A Test Case for Human Rights,” 453.

⁵⁷ Epprecht, *Hungochani: The History of a Dissident Sexuality in Southern Africa*, 189.

⁵⁸ Jeremy Martens, “Citizenship, ‘Civilisation’ and the Creation of South Africa’s Immorality Act, 1927,” *South African Historical Journal* 59, no. 1 (January 2007): 223.

⁵⁹ Martens, 223.

⁶⁰ Union of South Africa, “Immorality Act, 1927,” Pub. L. No. Act No. 5 of 1927 (1927).

language to the same effect. The *Immorality Act* and its amendments show a measured and methodical removal of rights. The National Party used the *Immorality Act Amendment, 1950* as a means to reinforce their platform of racial segregation, “apartness,” otherwise known as *apartheid*.⁶¹ This iteration of the National Party sought to bring “emergent gay subculture into the purview of criminal law.”⁶² The act, like many laws during apartheid, “merely elaborated on previous colonial policies and segregation legislation.”⁶³ The Nationalist Party was obsessed with the survival of “European” identity, and feared “cultural obliteration almost as much as physical annihilation.”⁶⁴ From a Foucauldian perspective, procreation was meant to bolster “European” bodies. Deviations from this act endangered the whole Union of South Africa and the National Party was “convinced to the point of obsession that South Africa was under attack by a malevolent external force [...] South Africa—by definition Christian and righteous, a moral bastion on the so-called Dark Continent—was the target of a conspiracy of ungodly political foes bent on destroying God’s outpost in Africa.”⁶⁵ Therefore, prohibiting transgressions, whether across racial, gendered, or sexual boundaries, was a priority for the National Party. After the election of the National Party in 1948, any deviant sexual act became increasingly scrutinized and regulated.⁶⁶

⁶¹ The historical timing of these policies is bewildering, considering the end of the Second World War years earlier. Connections between South African policies and those of Nazi Germany are demonstrated in Clark and Worger, *South Africa: The Rise and Fall of Apartheid*, 54.

⁶² Neville Wallace Hoad, Karen Martin, and Graeme Reid, eds., *Sex and Politics in South Africa* (Cape Town: Double Storey, 2005), 17.

⁶³ Clark and Worger, *South Africa: The Rise and Fall of Apartheid*, 58.

⁶⁴ Gwendolen Margaret Carter 1906-1991, *The Politics of Inequality: South Africa since 1948*, 2d, rev. ed., Book, Whole (New York: Praeger, 1959), 414.

⁶⁵ Klausen, *Abortion under Apartheid: Nationalism, Sexuality, and Women’s Reproductive Rights in South Africa*, 58.

⁶⁶ Foucault, *The History of Sexuality*, 43.

The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1950*, while still similar in content to the former *Act, 1927*, introduced language to underwrite the authority of the government. For example, the *Immorality Act, 1950*, qualified racial identification and segregation by “general acceptance and repute” or the “appearance” of being “obviously [...] a European or a non-European.”⁶⁷ Furthermore, “illicit carnal intercourse” was once again explicitly identified as any sexual relation “other than between husband and wife.” These vague supposedly “obvious” categories created ample room for interpretation and eliminated the possibility of non-binary options. The National Party applied these same standards of repute and appearance to identify homosexual men. Another anonymous letter from the Garmeson collection demonstrates the weakness of correlating appearance and identity:

Did I tell you, a priest said "He looks homo" to which I reply "Does he? How do homos look?"
(I'm sure there is no recognisable type, among the more masculine variety at least.)

I think the voice sometimes suggests it.⁶⁸

Nonetheless, using the *Immorality Act Amendment, 1950*, the National Party attempted to organize society into defined sections: European and non-European, man and woman, licit and illicit, moral and immoral.⁶⁹ Creating these binaries was a form of “administrative regulation” that controlled the “conception of the individual, whose health, moral conduct, criminal and sexual tendencies, and culture were constituted as the objects of new forms of governmental attention.”⁷⁰ Homosexuality threatened the mandate of the National Party and imperilled “‘natural’ binaries, identities and relationships central to fictions of nation” thereby endangering the “legitimate and

⁶⁷ Union of South Africa, “Immorality Amendment Act, 1950,” Pub. L. No. Act No. 21 of 1950 (1950).

⁶⁸ Anonymous letter, “Joe Garmeson Papers”, 1968, AM 2580, GALA.

⁶⁹ Notably, non-procreative intercourse, whether hetero- or homosexual, continued to fall within the jurisdiction of Roman-Dutch common law and was therefore a criminal act.

⁷⁰ Tagg, *The Disciplinary Frame: Photographic Truths and the Capture of Meaning*, 288.

‘natural’ sexual roles” South Africans were intended to play.⁷¹ This thesis lays bare the artificial quality of these dichotomous categories by demonstrating a thorough exchange of eroticized images of same-sex culture and identity through the circulation of homoerotic magazines and photographs.⁷²

The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1957*, was mainly concerned with regulating brothels and prostitution in South Africa. However, this amendment also gave government officials unprecedented power to “to demand, search for, and seize any account book, receipt, paper, document or thing likely to afford evidence of the commission by any person of an offence under this Act.”⁷³ By legislatively empowering authorities the National Party took a significant step into the private lives of South African citizens.

Furthermore, this Act also introduced punishment for falsified information, explaining the origin of the fears that “S.” had at the beginning of this chapter “[a]ny person who [...] refuses to furnish his name and address or furnishes a name or address which is false in any material particular [...] shall be guilty of an offence.”⁷⁴ Notwithstanding the immense power this amendment gave officials to enact the objectives of the National Party, this section continued to incorporate vague language into the *Immorality Act* including what defines a “thing likely to afford evidence”? In the

⁷¹ Lewis, “Rethinking Nationalism in Relation to Foucault’s History of Sexuality and Adrienne Rich’s ‘Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence’,” 107.

⁷² The “Western-ness” of the magazines can be called into question as the majority of publishers are producing from the United States and Europe. Contributions to the magazines are broader, but still largely from Western nations.

⁷³ Union of South Africa, “Immorality Amendment Act, 1957,” Pub. L. No. Act No. 23 of 1957 (1957).

⁷⁴ Union of South Africa.

case of the *Immorality Act Amendment, 1957*, it was anything that transgressed the policies of the National Party.

The regulatory intensification of the 1957 amendment signals an increased interest in the governance and control of “immoral” commodities and culture in South Africa by the National Party. The National Party believed that the failure of some white South Africans to “‘live white’ [...] undermine[d] the foundations of white supremacy.”⁷⁵ The *Act, 1957* represents an extension of legislation that made “claims to racial superiority dependent on middle-class respectability for the entire European population.”⁷⁶ This amendment also sanctions surveillance and a limitation of privacy.

As chapter two establishes, archival documents used as evidence for this thesis included erotic magazines, photographs, catalogues, and correspondence. Between-the-lines, the images and texts in prohibited media communicate the “constant struggle between dominant and subordinate [. . .] the most vital arena for ordinary conflict, for everyday forms of class struggle.”⁷⁷ The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1957* directly interacts with the evidence used for this thesis by threatening the freedom of both producers and consumers of these commodities. The broad and ambiguous language provided reasonable grounds to warrant investigation, arrest, and the confiscation of “immoral” materials.

⁷⁵ Martens, “Citizenship, ‘Civilisation’ and the Creation of South Africa’s Immorality Act, 1927,” 240.

⁷⁶ Ann Laura Stoler, *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault’s History of Sexuality and the Colonial Order of Things* (Durham: Duke University Press, 1995), 106.

⁷⁷ Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts*, 14.

Figure 1: Residence raided by police in Forest Town. "Special study. Personal. B.E.J. Garmeson", "Joe Garmeson Papers," 1966, AM 2580, GALA.

Although the 1957 amendment armed authorities with intrusive power and would remain unaltered for a decade, an event early in 1966 would prompt a renewed moral panic and trigger another review of the *Immorality Act*. Evidence of this, like the above photograph and associated newspaper clipping, can be found in the Joe Garmeson Papers. Known as the Forest Town raid, this event became a watershed moment in the history of homosexuality in South Africa. Early on the morning of January 22nd, 1966, "about 50" police "detectives from Pretoria and Johannesburg" raided and shut down a party that allegedly involved over "350 men."⁷⁸ Using the authority bestowed upon them by the *Immorality Act*:

The police, dressed in civilian clothes, infiltrated into the house at the height of the party, before giving the word for the raid to start.⁷⁹

⁷⁸ *The Star*, "Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000."

⁷⁹ *Sunday Times*, "Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000."

Police arrested nine of the estimated 350 men at the Forest Town party on charges of “masquerading, gross indecency, and the illegal sale of liquor.”⁸⁰ The Forest Town raid headlined several newspapers as a “sex orgy,” intensified a moral panic and was appropriated by the National Party to expand the scope of the *Immorality Act Amendments*.⁸¹ Most importantly, as a Sunday Times reporter recounted in an article the following day, this occurred in a “well-to-do suburb [in] Johannesburg.”⁸²

The Forest Town raid was emblematic of a greater threat to the moral mandate of the National Party that pervaded “all levels of society.”⁸³ As the “Report of the Select Committee on the Immorality Amendment Bill” describes shortly after the Forest Town raid, homosexuality was “rapidly gaining ground in the country, particularly in the big cities,” and homosexuals no longer feared their associations in public.⁸⁴ Following the Forest Town raid, government officials collaborated with policing authorities to plan a solution. The Select Committee report provides some insight into those conversations:

[Committee] What do you actually want to combat? You are an experienced police officer. To what extent do you want to go into private lives of these people, and to what extent do you want to protect public morals

[Officer] My personal view, after we in the police have had many discussions on the matter, is that unless we get a kind of *in toto* prohibition, I am afraid we shall be unable to act [...] unless we therefore have a total prohibition, I personally believe that there is no way in which we can be of assistance.⁸⁵

The “Report of the Select Committee on the Immorality Amendment Bill” shows the consultation and cooperation between police and agents of the National Party. It also foreshadows how the legislation will change following the Forest Town raid. The raid,

⁸⁰ *Express*, “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000.”

⁸¹ Unidentified News Article, “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000.”

⁸² *Sunday Times*, “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000.”

⁸³ “Report of the Select Committee on the Immorality Amendment Bill” (Republic of South Africa, 1968 1967), 30.

⁸⁴ “Report of the Select Committee on the Immorality Amendment Bill,” 34.

⁸⁵ “Report of the Select Committee on the Immorality Amendment Bill,” 31.

“filled even hardened members of the Criminal Investigation Department with disgust and revulsion,” which portrayed “same-sex activity as worse than any other social evil,” and “police officers, hardened by exposure to the darker elements of human behavior, as recoiling in horror from what they saw.”⁸⁶ The previous amendments “covered public offences only, and therefore could not be mobilized against the party-goers.”⁸⁷ The proposed amendments, while still using ambiguous language to ensure power for authorities, significantly increased punishments and further prohibited the exchange of material “immoral” goods.

The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1967*, amplified punishments (both length and intensity) for offences introduced in previous amendments. After deliberating with police and officials, the new legislation “sought to make male and female homosexuality an offence punishable by compulsory imprisonment of up to three years.”⁸⁸ Section 2 however, directed again towards brothels and prostitution, continues the expansion of ambiguous language found in previous amendments, “[a]ny person who [...] performs any act or does anything or furnishes any information which is calculated or likely to enable such male to communicate with or to establish the whereabouts of or to trace any such female, shall be guilty of an offence.”⁸⁹ While this amendment is specific to the regulation of prostitution and brothel-keeping, it is clear that the National Party was intent on casting a wide net for prosecution.⁹⁰

⁸⁶ From Botha and Cameron, “South Africa” in West and Green, *Sociolegal Control of Homosexuality*, 23.

⁸⁷ Hoad, Martin, and Reid, *Sex and Politics in South Africa*, 17.

⁸⁸ Mark Gevisser and Edwin Cameron, eds., *Defiant Desire* (New York: Routledge, 1995), 31.

⁸⁹ Republic of South Africa, “Immorality Amendment Act, 1967,” Pub. L. No. Act No. 68 of 1967 (1967).

⁹⁰ Conversations about “immoral” sexual acts and relations were not exclusive to South Africa in this time period and were occurring in other areas of the world. See for example, United States, “The Report of The Commission on Obscenity and Pornography.”

By 1967, publishers were incorporating discussions about the state of legislative affairs into their magazines and encouraging their readership to be informed and active in resisting the removal of their rights. In South Africa, the *Immorality Act Amendments* of the 1960s would ultimately provoke, in a “neat, almost Foucauldian reverse discourse fashion,” the creation of significant reform organizations like the Law Reform Fund.⁹¹

The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1969*, became law on May 9, 1969. The National Party introduced two critical sections:

18A. (1) Any person who manufactures, sells or supplies any article which is intended to be used to perform an unnatural sexual act, shall be guilty of an offence.

(2) For the purposes of subsection (1), ‘sell’ includes to offer for sale, to keep for sale or to keep in a place where goods are sold, offered or kept for sale.

20A. (1) A male person who commits with another male person at a party any act which is calculated to stimulate sexual passion or to give sexual gratification, shall be guilty of an offence.

(2) For the purposes of subsection (1) ‘a party’ means any occasion where more than two persons are present.

(3) The provisions of subsection (1) do not derogate from the common law, any other provision of this Act or a provision of any other law.⁹²

The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1957* allowed authorities to confiscate administrative materials or “any account book, receipt, paper, document or thing likely to afford evidence.”⁹³ Section 18A. of the *Immorality Act Amendment, 1969* criminalized the sale of these “unnatural” goods outright. For citizens found on the wrong side of the law, possession or sale of homoerotic magazines would be an admission of guilt; however, police confiscated other items like mailing-lists and customs receipts as evidence of participation in an illegal exchange.⁹⁴

⁹¹ Hoad, Martin, and Reid, *Sex and Politics in South Africa*, 16.

⁹² Republic of South Africa, “Immorality Amendment Act, 1969,” Pub. L. No. Act No. 57 of 1969 (1969).

⁹³ Union of South Africa, *Immorality Amendment Act*, 1957.

⁹⁴ “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997,” 2000, AM 3019, Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA).

This amendment demonstrates that the National Party had - or believed it had - the capacity to directly regulate and enforce the exchange of “unnatural” material. Compared to the other amendments introduced in this chapter, section 18A. is *less* ambiguous and more forthright; however, the terminology of “unnatural” sexual acts still leaves significant room for interpretation by authorities. Furthermore, section 18A. specifically defines the primary sources in chapter two as prohibited goods. Despite this legislative pressure, the market for homoerotic material persisted. These illicit commodities continued to be consumed both domestically and abroad despite the inherent risk in their exchange, creating a space “composed entirely of close confidants who share[d] similar experiences of domination.”⁹⁵ This thesis argues that purveyors and publishers of these transcripts fulfilled an important role in the act of resistance beyond mere distribution; they performed what Homi Bhabha has called “an insurgent act of cultural translation [. . .] interrupt[ing] the performance of the present.”⁹⁶ They were conduits in a system of exchange that found in the work of homoerotic art an opportunity for social solidarity, identity, and survival.⁹⁷ The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1969* made procuring these goods more challenging, but determined consumers fulfilled their desires with a variety of strategies to avoid detection. Arguably, the maintenance of a transnational network of homoerotic exchange was the maintenance of an imagined community that connected a “scattered people, their myths and fantasies and experiences.”⁹⁸ The magazines used in this thesis connect a wide variety of locales and provide a medium of communication to those who consume them. The National Party waged a “hidden war on sexual

⁹⁵ Scott, *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts*, 120.

⁹⁶ Homi K. Bhabha, *The Location of Culture* (London ; New York: Routledge, 1994), 7.

⁹⁷ Bhabha, 18.

⁹⁸ Bhabha, 139–40.

dissidence,” and those on the front-lines were “the visible rule-breakers: streetwalkers, gays who cruise for sex, sex-shop owners and pornography merchants.”⁹⁹

Primary evidence shows that contributors, publishers, and consumers resisted and evaded the *Immorality Act* through circuitous international exchanges, by using plain mailing envelopes, by making personally identifying details anonymous, or by smuggling magazines themselves through borderlands in Namibia, Botswana, or Zimbabwe.

Frequently, contributors, publishers, and consumers found themselves on the wrong side of arbitrarily enforced and ambiguously defined laws. Another anonymous letter to Joe Garmeson in 1968 describes the interpretive authority that government officials held:

Although this is a perfectly "correct" letter as anybody who reads it with care can see, despite its theme, yet some D.R.C. postal and law officials might think otherwise! One reason for giving no name or address.

But, suppose, e.g. it got in the wrong Post Box?¹⁰⁰

Authorities had the opportunity to act on suspicion and were enabled to do so by the language of the *Immorality Act*. Merely discussing the legality and status of homosexuality in a letter was grounds for punishment under the National Party.

Therefore, it was necessary for contributors, producers, and consumers alike to create strategies to evade government agents. For example, publishers purposefully adopted the styles of men's physique magazines, displaying men's bodies, but not displaying full-frontal nudity. The success of the *Immorality Act Amendment, 1969* required a passive subject, not one willing to adapt to a quickly changing sociocultural climate.

⁹⁹ Gevisser and Cameron, *Defiant Desire*, 99.

¹⁰⁰ Anonymous letter, “Joe Garmeson Papers”, 1968, AM 2580, GALA.

The latter section of the 1969 amendment, 20A., colloquially known as the “men-at-a-party” clause, allowed authorities to interfere in any occasion where two or more men were seen to be committing “indecent” acts together. This “unique criminal provision” prevented any act “calculated to stimulate sexual passion or to give sexual gratification” between men.¹⁰¹ Section 20A. was a legislative acknowledgement of the Forest Town raid and the increasing public prevalence of homosexual conduct. The policing of public space enabled by these amendments created significant opposition and would lead to the formation of law reform organizations. To this end, the *Immorality Act* became so ambiguous that it became futile to enforce and created a space in which homosexual men could intervene and begin to advocate for rights against sexual discrimination.

Despite legislative efforts to enforce heteronormative sexual practices publicly, homosexual culture endured privately in clubs, bars, train stations, bathroom stalls, and parks.¹⁰² Paradoxically, despite the *Immorality Act Amendments*, “from that time forward, gay clubs seemed to take on a huge lease of life. And one found them popping up everywhere. And needless to say dancing took place.”¹⁰³ Moreover, when relationships between homosexual men became increasingly scrutinized, and the exchange of material goods increasingly policed, networks of exchange between domestic and foreign markets persisted. These trade networks were a critical resource in a transnational economy that circumvented fluctuating political attitudes and permitted a homosexual identity to exist before, during, and after prohibition. By attempting to enforce a heteronormative South

¹⁰¹ From Botha and Cameron, “South Africa” in West and Green, *Sociolegal Control of Homosexuality*, 23.

¹⁰² Interview in “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000,” 7.

¹⁰³ Interview in “Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000,” 7.

African sexuality, prohibition of homosexual culture instead led men to employ other strategies to fulfill their “deviant” fantasies and in some cases made homosexual culture more prevalent. Chapter three examines the exchange of homoerotic commodities over geopolitical boundaries and over time.

It is important to note that other legislation operated together with the *Immorality Act* to censor and control homoerotic commodities. While reviewing all of the relevant legislation is outside of the scope of this thesis, the National Party sought to control undesirable media elements by introducing legislation such as: the *Post Office Act, 1958* (amended 1972 and 1974), the *Customs and Excise Act, 1964*, the *Indecent or Obscene Photographic Matter Act, 1967*, or the *Publications Act, 1974*.¹⁰⁴ The *Publications Act, 1974* was an omnibus overhaul of the censorship system and amended previous censorship legislation. The *Publications Act, 1974*, explicit in its moral position to “uphold a Christian view of life,” gave the government broader grounds for enforcement and prosecution, while simultaneously removing legal protection for those prosecuted.¹⁰⁵ The *Publications Act, 1974* encompassed traditional media formats, but also extended to “non-newspaper publications, films, records, stage shows, artwork and even amateur photography.”¹⁰⁶ “The censorship of gay material” was “disproportionately severe” in South Africa, compared to other areas of the world.¹⁰⁷ The *Publications Act, 1974* and the legislation before it operated in conjunction with the *Immorality Act* and its amendments to inhibit the exchange of homoerotic commodities, including most of the primary

¹⁰⁴ Frene Ginwala, “South Africa’s Censorship Laws,” 1975.

¹⁰⁵ Republic of South Africa, “Publications Act, 1974,” Pub. L. No. Act No. 42 of 1974 (1974).

¹⁰⁶ Ginwala, “South Africa’s Censorship Laws.”

¹⁰⁷ Gevisser and Cameron, *Defiant Desire*, 104.

evidence used in this thesis.¹⁰⁸ In response, an “informal distribution network” developed to circumvent legislation.¹⁰⁹

The final *Immorality Act Amendment, 1988* “rectif[ies] certain obsolete expressions,” increases fines, extends “provisions relating to sexual offences by a male with youths so that they shall also apply to a female,” and extends “the prohibition of sexual acts with female idiots or imbeciles so that it shall also apply in respect of male idiots or imbeciles.”¹¹⁰ These amendments, although not interacting directly with the primary sources used in this thesis, show the determination of the National Party to strengthen and protect white purity through sexual regulation.¹¹¹ The *Immorality Act Amendment, 1988* is a shift in the focus of the National Party towards other moral affairs: perhaps in response to the significant opposition their policies faced within South Africa and abroad. The failure of the National Party to prohibit homosexuality was in part due to the structure and language of the legislation; however, the ability for same-sex desiring men to circumvent that legislation made outlawing homosexuality untenable. These men found ways, despite the intentions of the National Party, to acquire and consume homoerotic material. Less than a decade after the last amendment, on April 27, 1994, the Interim Constitution of South Africa ended nearly a half-century of apartheid. Two years later, on May 8th, 1996, South Africa became the “world’s first nation whose constitution expressly proscribes anti-gay discrimination.”¹¹² This sociocultural inversion, at least

¹⁰⁸ Republic of South Africa, Publications Act, 1974.

¹⁰⁹ Gevisser and Cameron, *Defiant Desire*, 104.

¹¹⁰ Republic of South Africa, “Immorality Amendment Act, 1988,” Pub. L. No. Act No. 2 of 1988 (1988).

¹¹¹ From Susanne M. Klausen’s chapter “Eugenics and the Maintenance of White Supremacy in Modern South Africa” in Diane B. Paul, John Stenhouse, and Hamish G. Spencer, eds., *Eugenics at the Edges of Empire* (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2018), 290.

¹¹² From Botha and Cameron, “South Africa” in West and Green, *Sociolegal Control of Homosexuality*, 37.

legislatively, was a consequence of the *Immorality Act* and the work of Joe Garmeson, the Law Reform Fund, and other advocates of sexual liberation.¹¹³

In summary, legislation enacted by the National Party increased regulation and augmented the ability for authorities to interfere in the lives of citizens. Despite this, illicit “immoral” or “unnatural” homoerotic commodities continued to circulate in South Africa. Increasingly prohibitive legislation caused opposition groups like the Law Reform Fund to become more organized and outspoken. Finally, the risk of prosecution and punishment encouraged some homosexual men in South Africa to fulfill their desires beyond national borders. Commodities exchanged from other areas of the world counteracted the attempt of the National Party to define and impose a heteronormative South African sexuality. The next chapter introduces a collection of primary sources that are used to demonstrate how these commodities moved between and beyond contested and controlled spaces.

¹¹³ The constitution may include freedom from sexual discrimination, but that *does not* mean that homophobic discourse was simultaneously eliminated. It is still an ongoing sociocultural issue in South Africa and in many other countries that have enacted similar legislation.

Chapter 2: The GALA Collections

In total, five collections of archival material contribute to the arguments posited by this thesis: that increased regulation and enforcement were not effective in inhibiting networks of exchange, that gradually more oppressive legislation fomented dissent and debate and ultimately resulted in reform, and that attempts to redefine heteronormative South African sexuality conversely generated transnational exchanges of “deviant” sexuality. The five collections are the Hugh MacFarlane collection (AM2636), the Arthur Brown collection (AM2829), the Roger Loveday collection (AM2845), the Herb Klein collection (AM3019), and the Joe Garmeson Papers (AM2580). These collections date from the 1940s (MacFarlane) to 2000 (Garmeson), with a significant amount of the material registered between 1960 and 1980. Research for this thesis produced over 1400 digitized files (or 42.4 GB of raw data) created from the primary sources at GALA. In coordination with the contextual framing provided by chapter one, this chapter demonstrates the breadth of the analyzed collections and identifies critical primary sources that constitute the interpretations and visualizations found in chapter three. Crucially, the five collections analyzed at GALA are neither exhaustive nor universal; the five collections are not wholly representative of homosexuality in South Africa or in general but demonstrate the experiences of a sub-section of the homosexual community. Though limited these collections provide a critical mass of archival evidence to illustrate how illicit homoerotic material continued to be produced and consumed within South Africa despite the intentions of the National Party. Moreover, these collections show that domestic and foreign exchange occurred on a large scale, arguably influencing the development of same-sex desire in South Africa as international homoerotic magazines circulated through the country.

The Hugh MacFarlane collection (AM 2636) was the initial point of investigation for this thesis. The MacFarlane collection contains 772 loose photographs, four photograph albums, forty-seven slides, and six envelopes of negatives. Many of these documents are records of MacFarlane's photography business, *Atelier Alpha*, which operated as a mail-order catalogue and produced content for magazine publications in South Africa, Europe, and North America "for people who wished to order photosets of the models he photographed."¹¹⁴ For some, these photographs acted as virtual tour guides to homosexual subculture and spaces.¹¹⁵

Figure 2: "Bennie," *TRIM*, September 1960, "Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s," AM 2636, GALA.

Several items from the MacFarlane collection were missing from the GALA inventory: either lost or misfiled. Missing items included records of photos supplied by *Atelier Alpha* to international publications such as *Tomorrow's Man*, *Trim*, *Fizeek*, *MANual*, and others. Correspondence from MacFarlane/*Atelier Alpha* to his customers and publishers was also missing. This archival gap is incredibly significant because these

¹¹⁴ Inventory notes, "Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s."

¹¹⁵ Johnson, "Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture," 867.

Figure 3: “Niels,” *TRIM*, May 1960, “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s,” *AM* 2636, *GALA*.

documents would have provided rich, specific, contextual information about the operation of MacFarlane’s business in South Africa. Other associated collections at *GALA* were examined and analyzed to fill this archival gap.

The magazines and mail-order catalogues in the MacFarlane collection demonstrate “the importance of individuals’ relationships to consumer goods as a key to understanding their sense of self, community, and even national identity.”¹¹⁶ Some scholars have critically dismissed these magazines and

their “associated mail-order catalogs as peripheral to gay history because they were not explicitly gay.”¹¹⁷ It is true that until the late 1960s, very few of the magazines openly catered to homosexual men. However, many publishers used this to their advantage as a strategy to circumvent censorship. Editors published articles such as “These Foods Build Strength” and aligned themselves with men’s health by depicting healthy “hypermasculine” male physique and advertising exercise equipment and health products.¹¹⁸ This flawed criticism also begs the question of how explicit something has to be before it is considered erotic (or that eroticism is integral to “gay history”). Beyond these magazines, “health clubs” in South Africa provided services like “massage and

¹¹⁶ Johnson, 868.

¹¹⁷ Johnson, “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” 869.

¹¹⁸ *TRIM*, 19, September 1960, “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s.”

sauna” but were also fronts for “men looking for homosexual encounters.”¹¹⁹ Not all men had access or felt comfortable using these publicly-facing venues. Therefore, the magazines analyzed by this thesis operate as a substitute, private, point-of-access.

Moreover, these magazines contained erotically-charged content without being sexually explicit: photographs like Figure 2 and Figure 3 are “unusual perspectives, close-ups,” views that are inaccessible in day-to-day life.¹²⁰ They are intimate moments between photograph and audience, and their interpretation is dependant on the desire of the viewer. Furthermore, defining these commodities as not “explicitly gay” indicates that they are invariable and unchanging, unable to “undergo some sort of cultural transformation [to] acquire status and meaning” within new contexts.¹²¹ Over time, same-sex desiring men learned how to read and interpret the subtexts, the hidden transcripts, in these

Figure 4: Highlighted in yellow is MacFarlane's business, Atelier Alpha. TRIM, 1960, "Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s," AM 2636, GALA.

¹¹⁹ Gevisser and Cameron, *Defiant Desire*, 18.

¹²⁰ Solomon-Godeau, *Photography at the Dock: Essays on Photographic History, Institutions, and Practices*, 64.

¹²¹ Appadurai, *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*, 181.

magazines. The MacFarlane collection demonstrates that these magazines operated as a gateway to a back catalogue of photographs that were only accessible if that subtext was understood.

More progressive magazines, most notably *Grecian Guild Pictorial* and *Physique Pictorial*, included editorial articles such as “Do pictures speak for themselves?” and “What is obscene?” concerning the legality of the published photographs and engaged directly with their readership on the legitimacy of “obscene” material.¹²² These editorial conversations were a critical contribution to public discourse on homosexuality.¹²³ Simultaneously, these magazines contained disclaimers notifying the readership of the inability of the publisher to provide specific photographs. As mentioned, the magazines were legitimized, at least from the perspective of the publishers, by not including full-frontal nudity (although other editorial articles like “Where can an artist get full front view nudes?” dispel these disclaimers).¹²⁴ Publishers curated which photographs would be included in the magazines and frequently identified the contributing artist, both as a caption and in a directory at the end of the magazine (Figure 4). Publications like *TRIM* “urge[d] its readers to support,” these contributors.¹²⁵ Explicitly, the directories establish a connection between readers and contributors. Implicitly, the disclaimers and editorials direct readers to this space in the magazines and introduce them to an alternative, private, market for illicit photographs. A significant number of documents in the MacFarlane collection further support this alternative market. Most of the 772 loose photographs and

¹²² *Grecian Guild Pictorial*, Spring 1963 and *Physique Pictorial*, Spring 1965, “Arthur Brown Collection, ca. 1953-1976,” AM 2829, GALA.

¹²³ Meeker, *Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communications and Community, 1940s-1970s*.

¹²⁴ *Physique Pictorial*, 1962, “Arthur Brown Collection, ca. 1953-1976,” AM 2829, GALA.

¹²⁵ *TRIM*, 19, September 1960, “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s.”

the photographs in the four albums of the MacFarlane collection depict fully nude men in various states of arousal. Whether or not these were for personal or business use by MacFarlane is unknown, but the potential of their exchange remains. Additionally, as Figure 5 proves on the following page, MacFarlane had both “erotic” and “non-erotic” photographs of individual models. “Niels” and “Bennie” are the same men in Figure 2 and Figure 3 from *TRIM*, 1960. These thumbnails correlate to a larger *Atelier Alpha* mail-order catalogue which has the men in a variety of naked poses available for purchase.

I am all in person of your studio. Real STIMULATING. Regards. Frank.

ATELIER ALPHA
P.O. Box 6239, JOHANNESBURG, SOUTH AFRICA.

Model Series: **2**

presents the
MALE NUDE

Name: NIELS
Model: A Photo No. 58

Name: SIEBERT
Model: B Photo No. 12

Name: NEVILLE
Model: C Photo No. 2

Name: BENNIE
Model: F Photo No. 10

Thank you for your interest in our photographic studies of the male nude, and your remittance of \$1.00 for this selection sheet.

The contact prints on this page show several of our models, all of whom have been selected for their youthfulness, their good looks, well developed bodies, and sex appeal. We have studies of many other attractive young men, and selection sheets with different models are available.

If you are interested in a particular model and want a larger photograph of him, let us know the number of prints you require, and the size. Prints are priced as follows:---

6 1/2" x 9 1/2"	\$1.25
16 1/2" x 21 1/2" cm	
6 1/2" x 4 1/2"	\$1.00
16 1/2" x 12 1/2" cm	
3 1/2" x 4 1/2"	75¢
9 1/2" x 12 1/2" cm	

These prices are per print

Your choice of photo studies is not restricted to those shown on this sheet. You may want the models you like best in different poses. Tell us exactly what you require and we will do our best to meet your specification. You can be as frank as you like. All orders are a confidential and private matter between you and ourselves. We are sure your tastes, interests and inclinations are the same as our own.

AIRMAIL POSTAGE

If you decide to place an order with us and want to have the prints sent to you by airmail, we are obliged to make an extra charge to cover the airmail postage, which is rather expensive. Please add 50% to the value of the order for airmail charges

Name: NICK
Model: EZ Photo No. 9

Figure 5: Atelier Alpha mail-order catalogue cover page, featuring "Niels" and "Bennie" this time in full-frontal poses. "Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s," AM 2636, GALA.

MacFarlane notes that “all orders are a confidential and private matter between you and ourselves. We are sure your tastes, interests and inclinations are the same as our own,” conceding that privacy is necessary for these particular “tastes.”¹²⁶ This document corroborates the connection between the readers of *TRIM* and the exchange of homoerotic commodities. It also suggests that the “appropriation” of these commodities by homosexual men occurs between the lines in publications such as *TRIM*. Besides, it complicates narratives that suggest that these magazines were not “explicit enough” or narratives that assume these magazines were “byproduct[s] of the gay rights political movement, rather than a catalyst for its development.”¹²⁷ These magazines acted as a gateway to a broad and alternative market of illicit photographs and acted as a space for homosexual communication and community. There is fraternity in the pages of these magazines, a balance of power and subversion: a hidden transcript that uses circuitous networks of exchange to evade detection and eradication. This hidden transcript became increasingly important, especially after the Forest Town raid, as “the news that gay parties were alive and well in the Republic of South Africa sent shock waves through the white establishment.”¹²⁸ The subsequent legislation increased the risk for men who were “out” in South Africa.

¹²⁶ Catalogue cover page, *Atelier Alpha*, “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s.”

¹²⁷ Johnson, “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” 870.

¹²⁸ Gevisser and Cameron, *Defiant Desire*, 101.

The Herb Klein collection (AM3019) demonstrates the consequences a publisher would face for contravening the law. Klein's business *Flash* published homoerotic magazines from Johannesburg, South Africa. Police confiscated his business assets and prosecuted Klein on criminal charges for violating the statutes of the

Summons No./Dagvaarding No.	
Case No./Kasno. 8/1750/87	
SUMMONS IN CRIMINAL CASE / DAGVAARDING IN STRAFSAK	
Magistrate's Court / Landdroeshof	
District/Streek: JOHANNESBURG	Regional division/Streekafdeling: N/A
Issued at/Gegee te: MAGISTRATE'S COURT	Case No./Kasno. 8
Date of issue/Verkoedatum: 19/5/1987	
To the MESSENGER OF THE COURT:	
You are hereby required and directed to the same and on behalf of the State to serve a copy of the summons on the defendant named herein (hereinafter called the accused), that he appear personally before the Magistrate's Court on the date named above on the date of trial at 09:00 o'clock to answer and abide the judgment of the Court upon the charge(s) of the Public Prosecutor (prosecuting in the name and on behalf of the State) that the said accused is/are guilty of the offence(s) as set out hereunder.	
An die OORSGEDIGDE:	
Nemmers en toe bevelende van die Staat word u hiermee gegee om by ontvangs hiervan die persoon(s) benoem hierin die beskuldigde(s) persoon(s) te dirigeer om te verskyn voor die Landdroeshof op 19/5/87 om op te staan en te antwoorde op die aanklagte(s) van die Oorprokureur (wat in naam en op aan die staats/dagvaarding benoemde) staande is.	
Serve on the accused a copy of this summons and return to this Court what you have done thereon.	
Besken aan beskuldigde(s) 'n afskrif van hierdie dagvaarding en doen aan hierdie Hof verslag van wat u hiermee gedoen het.	
Name/Naam: [REDACTED]	
Address/Adres: [REDACTED]	
Sex/Geslag: MALE	Race/Ras: WHITE
Age/Ouders: 40 yrs	

Figure 6: Summons to Magister's Court for the collection and sale of prohibited material, "Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997," AM 3019, GALA.

Immorality Act, the *Publications Act*, and the *Customs and Excise Duty Act* in the early 1980s. By this time, the *Immorality Act* was publicly challenged in courts, and the censorship of "obscene" commodities by the National Party was comparatively relaxed. For example, the few copies of *Flash* in the Klein collection openly depicted full-frontal nudity. With that in mind, some material was still too transgressive in the eyes of the National Party, as the official explanation of one charge against Klein describes:

the [...] portrayal of male pubic hair in a publication with a wide likely viewership and which has homosexual overtones and will transgress the tolerance of the reasonable member of the South African Community who will regard it as offensive to public morals.¹²⁹

These charges demonstrate that there was still a specific moral and visual boundary between licit and illicit material, especially when it entered the public realm. Klein's prosecution demonstrates that authorities could still enforce the law on uncertain grounds: was the problem the pubic hair, the homosexual overtones, both, or neither? Ultimately, in the offence above, Klein pled guilty to his charges and was sentenced to pay a fine and spend time in prison.¹³⁰ Klein was not the only individual arrested in connection with the production or consumption of these magazines, "[a]most all of the

¹²⁹ Letter from Directorate of Publications, "Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997."

¹³⁰ Sentencing document, "Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997."

Figure 7: A collaboration between Klein Enterprises and Optima Agencies. “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997,” AM 3019, GALA.

publishers and photographers connected with physique magazines were arrested by the police and tried in court at some point in their careers.”¹³¹

Another strategy that Klein and others used to obfuscate their involvement in this illicit exchange was the adoption of false addresses or aliases.

Most frequently operating as Mr. William

Seabrook Jr., Klein arranged for photographs to be

sent to his publication headquarters. Correspondence shows that Klein used pseudonyms to establish contacts in the United States before ordering new material (or in rare cases, visiting California in-person). Klein built relationships with producers around the world and became the “sole agent” in South Africa for some international magazines, like *Pacific Man*, a publication based in Los Angeles, California or *Optima Agencies* based in Oakland, California as Figure 7 illustrates.¹³² In doing so, Klein became the focal point in the exchange of homoerotic magazines in South Africa, made further evident by a mailing-list found in the collection.

Over 470 unique names and South African addresses comprise the mailing-list with Klein’s business as the centre of the distribution.¹³³ The mailing-list creates a quantitative dataset that suggests the effect prohibition had on the South African

¹³¹ Many consumers were arrested for possession as well. Johnson, 876.

¹³² Letter forwarded to Klein from *Pacific Man*, “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997.”

¹³³ Personally-identifying information from the mailing-list was embargoed by GALA to protect the identities of individuals therefore names and street addresses were redacted. Only the general suburb locations in the mailing-list addresses, “Eikefontein,” “Noordbrug,” or “Mulbarton,” for example, were recorded for analysis. Further steps to anonymize the data from the mailing-list are detailed in the next chapter.

homoerotic commodity market. It also demonstrates, considering Klein's international connections mentioned previously, the inability of the National Party to define heteronormative sexuality. The next chapter analyzes the mailing-list in further detail.

The Arthur Brown collection (AM2829) and the Roger Loveday collection (AM2845) were used mainly to supplement the evidence missing from the MacFarlane collection. Together, the Brown and Loveday collections contained over 500 "international photo magazines of a homoerotic nature," published between 1953 and 1976.¹³⁴ The Brown collection also included 136 mail-order catalogues, similar to those distributed by *Atelier Alpha* in the MacFarlane collection. These collections are further evidence of a market that "shows not only that physique magazine publishers explicitly targeted a gay consumer market, but also that consumer items provided a means for gay men to understand themselves as belonging to a larger community."¹³⁵ The geographic scope of contributing photographers and publishers is complex, with changes in location per contributor per publication, all over time. The complexity of this data necessitated a network visualization. By extracting data from the magazine cover page, title page, and directory page it becomes possible to determine how these indicators changed over time.

The commodities found in the MacFarlane, Klein, Brown, and Loveday collections resist a market that is increasingly regulated, legislated, and policed. Despite these constraints, the market for homoerotic commodities endured. Each of the collections creates transnational connections through publication and directory information and the correspondence between suppliers and consumers. For homosexual

¹³⁴ Inventory notes, "Roger Loveday Collection, 1961-1968."

¹³⁵ Johnson, "Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture," 870.

men, these magazines and photographs “make a substitute world, keyed to exalting or consoling or tantalizing images.”¹³⁶ The magazines and photographs represent a hidden transcript that, once decoded, gave same-sex desiring men access to a transnational community. Most significantly, these collections depict a homoerotic commodity network that was producing, exchanging, and consuming commodities in South Africa and abroad.

The next chapter visualizes data from the magazines in the MacFarlane, Brown, and Loveday collections as well as the mailing-list from the Klein collection. By visually rendering these complex and intangible networks, the broad and interconnected nature of the homoerotic commodity market becomes apparent. These network visualizations show that thorough integration and exchange of different cultures and “deviant” sexual practices challenged the definition of heteronormative sexuality.

¹³⁶ Sontag, *On Photography*, 126.

Chapter 3: Interpretation and Visualization

Before engaging with the collections at GALA, a short documentary film was intended to accompany this thesis. The proposed documentary planned to detail the life of Hugh MacFarlane, his company, and the movement of his photographs around the world. The experience at GALA, the data found in the collections, and the process of digitization called into question whether or not a documentary film was the correct medium to convey this information. This chapter examines the viability of a documentary film and presents network visualization as a more practical alternative method of interpretation for this collection of material. It documents both the tools and processes that were used to visualize the data gathered from GALA as two maps. The first map illustrates a network of homoerotic commodities in South Africa using components of a mailing-list from the Herb Klein collection. The second map illustrates the exchange between publishers and photographic contributors using geospatial and temporal data found in the magazines from the Hugh MacFarlane, Arthur Brown, and Roger Loveday collections. In combination, these maps effectively illustrate a complex network of homoerotic commodities that travel throughout South Africa and circulating abroad. These maps are available to view and interact with online at <http://dangerdeviancyanddesire.com>.

As a disclaimer, privacy and anonymity were considered paramount while creating these maps. The data from GALA was specific and included names, street addresses, and postal boxes. This thesis is not intended to arm present or future governments, individual citizens, or any other group with identifying information that can be used to bring further harm to a marginalized community. Names, street addresses, and postal boxes were redacted to ensure privacy. The data was made *less* specific by using

partial address information. In the case of the mailing-list map, this was the associated suburb. In the case of the magazine map, this was the associated city. Using less specific information had little effect on the outcome of the visualization. Other privacy measures are discussed in Appendix A: The Mechanics of Leaflet Visualization.

Several obstacles prevented the creation of a documentary film to accompany this thesis. Despite receiving ethics approval to record interviews, no interview candidates were willing to participate while in South Africa.¹³⁷ Interviews are a critical component of historical documentaries and act similarly to secondary sources in a text. The absence of this essential component weakens a historical documentary significantly. As previously mentioned, another significant roadblock was the incomplete inventory of the MacFarlane collection: documents were misplaced or misfiled. Missing documents included evidence that likely connected MacFarlane's business *Atelier Alpha* to publishing studios in South Africa, records of photographs supplied by *Atelier Alpha* to international magazines, correspondence between MacFarlane and his customers, and catalogues from the United States imported by MacFarlane. If these documents were present, it would have been feasible to pursue a documentary narrative about MacFarlane and his business. Other collections were used to supplement the missing documents in the MacFarlane collection. In combination, these collections offered a completely different set of data: an abundance of geographic coordinates. Consequently, a different collection necessitated a different interpretation: an alternative interpretation to suit the information instead of forcing the information to suit a documentary interpretation.

¹³⁷ I am grateful to Marc Epprecht of Queen's University who agreed to record an interview on short notice and with little introduction. Shortly thereafter, upon reviewing the collected resources, it became evident that other avenues of interpretation had to be considered.

The complex nature of the data obtained from GALA would be challenging to convey in a documentary film. The least complex dataset, Klein's mailing-list, has over 450 unique geographic latitude and longitude coordinates. The second dataset is significantly more complex and uses the magazines from the MacFarlane, Brown, and Loveday collections. Respectively, the publisher and contributor addresses were compiled from the title and directory pages alongside the publication dates. Three levels of association, publisher, contributor, and date, resulted in over 2000 unique data points (see Appendix A, "Example .CSV Data" for a truncated example of this data). Expressing this complexity in a documentary film would not be possible without using maps. Therefore, maps were *necessary* to visualize the data, documentary or not.

Finally, the initial investigation of the MacFarlane collection was intended to examine the movement and exchange of individual photographs. Evidence from the other collections such as the mailing-list and magazines made individual photographs less consequential. Photographs are fundamental parts of both the mailing-list and magazine collections, but the information used in this thesis reflects the exchange of curated compilations of photographs. The mailing-list and magazine collections visualize the photograph as part of a cultural package. Packaged as a magazine and accompanied by editorials, advertisements, stories of resistance, and fantasies of liberation, these photographs become more than the sum of their parts. Establishing their trajectory and the reach of their influence empowers them even further. These visualizations are a demonstration of the "relationship between the individual and society, the relationship between "micro" and "macro," and the structuring of social action by objective, "supra-

individual" patterns of social relationships."¹³⁸ This methodology is a way of bringing another dimension of analysis to the in-depth readings of photographs and magazines that other scholars have accomplished. Many of the "problems of cultural history" are reconciled by implementing this progressive approach.¹³⁹ Despite the tendency of some historians to look down upon studies of production and diffusion, this methodology refreshes the value of cultural analysis.¹⁴⁰ While this thesis relies on the "laurels of a few almost randomly chosen early twentieth-century philosophers and late twentieth-century social theorists," it incorporates the theoretical refinements of contemporary scholars alongside a modern analytical framework.¹⁴¹ The remainder of this chapter illustrates and analyzes the exchange of homoerotic commodities in an increasingly regulated market and shows the breadth of actors that contributed to this exchange. Figure 9 and Figure 8 on the next page are finalized iterations of the data from the Klein collection and the MacFarlane, Brown and Loveday collections.

¹³⁸ Emirbayer and Goodwin, "Network Analysis, Culture, and the Problem of Agency," 1414.

¹³⁹ Peter Mandler, "The Problem with Cultural History," *Cultural and Social History* 1, no. 1 (January 1, 2004): 94–117.

¹⁴⁰ Mandler, 113.

¹⁴¹ Mandler, 113.

Figure 8: Iteration of mailing-list data visualization.

Figure 9: Iteration of magazine data visualization.

Klein Mailing-List, “Mail Distribution of Confiscated Erotic Material in South Africa”

Figure 10: Finalized mailing-list map.

Figure 10 shows the extent of Klein’s mail-order business in South Africa: a wide distribution of clients mostly concentrated in urban areas. Klein also had limited business in Namibia (then South West Africa) and Zimbabwe. There is significant traffic to major urban centres in South Africa (Cape Town, Port Elizabeth, East London, Durban, and Pretoria) and there is also a surprising amount of material travelling to rural areas. This map demonstrates, that for “isolated gay men [...] living beyond major cities,” these magazines were “a lifeline to a larger world.”¹⁴² While this map cannot speak for other locales, “these magazines and related consumer items created a sense of an imagined nationwide, even global, community of like-minded men with an interest in the male body.”¹⁴³ In rural areas, where access to private venues like bars and clubs was more limited, these magazines acted as a point-of-access to homosexual culture and discourse.

¹⁴² Johnson, “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” 870.

¹⁴³ Johnson, 888.

However, in the context of South Africa, rural areas were less likely to be scrutinized by authorities, who were more interested in policing “major urban centres [...] as the best way to protect the white minority.”¹⁴⁴

Figure 11: Localized market around Johannesburg

If policing urban centres was the concern of authorities, Figure 11 illustrates how effective that was. In the metropolitan area of Johannesburg alone, Klein has over fifty clients. Adding neighbouring Pretoria, that increases to over one hundred, or roughly one-quarter of Klein’s clients in 1984. Considering this concentration of “immoral” consumers in the heart of urban South Africa, this map calls the effectiveness of prohibitive legislation like the *Immorality Act* into question.

¹⁴⁴ Susanne M. Klausen in “Eugenics and the Maintenance of White Supremacy in Modern South Africa” from Diane B. Paul, John Stenhouse, and Hamish G. Spencer, eds., *Eugenics at the Edges of Empire* (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2018), 262.

Figure 12: Mailing-list map, zoomed into point-of-origin, Joubert Park circled.

If we consider distributors like Klein as gatekeepers to a broader community, Figure 12 illustrates a consensus of quantitative and qualitative evidence.¹⁴⁵ In an oral history video produced by GALA, *Josi: The Queer Tour*, Mark Gevisser suggests that a suburb called Hillbrow, and more specifically an area called Joubert Park was the “gay headquarters of South Africa.”¹⁴⁶ Contextually, this area saw “a proliferation of bars frequented by gay men” during the Second World War.¹⁴⁷ Fully zoomed in, Klein’s business address (although the point-of-origin is randomized within this suburb) sits nested within Hillbrow and with Joubert Park a block northwest. Joubert Park and other nearby venues like the Carlton Hotel, the Astor, and the Waldorf Hotel were spaces where same-sex desiring men could interact in a semi-public atmosphere.¹⁴⁸ Following the

¹⁴⁵ Appadurai in Fardon and Association of Social Anthropologists of the Commonwealth, *Counterworks*, 210.

¹⁴⁶ *Josi: The Queer Tour*, GALA.

¹⁴⁷ Graeme Reid and Teresa Dirsuweit, “Understanding Systemic Violence: Homophobic Attacks in Johannesburg and Its Surrounds,” *Urban Forum* 13, no. 3 (July 2002): 102.

¹⁴⁸ Gevisser and Cameron, *Defiant Desire*, 22.

Forest Town raid, on April 10, 1968, Joubert Park would also host the “the first gay public meeting ever held in South Africa.”¹⁴⁹

Organized by the Law Reform Fund, this was both a protest to legislation and fundraiser for the cause. Postcards, as seen in Figure 13,

Figure 13: Postcard to Herb Klein, P.O. Box Redacted, “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997,” AM 3019, GALA.

and other correspondence from the Klein collection validate the location of his business demonstrate the reach his products had in another way: he received post from the United Kingdom, Italy, the Netherlands, France, the United States, and Singapore. This nested point-of-origin, Klein was distributing hundreds of magazines, with domestic and foreign homoerotic content, all over the country. Although the link between “consumption and a sense of identity and community is exceedingly hard to document,” the Klein mailing-list map, alongside other qualitative supporting evidence from the archive, shows the significant role publishers like Klein had in operating and maintaining local commodity networks.¹⁵⁰ There are noteworthy gaps in the Klein mailing-list map. For example, high population areas such as Soweto are significantly underrepresented (to the west of Johannesburg in Figure 11).¹⁵¹ How did the areas missing from this map influence the development of homosexuality in South Africa? The answer, obviously, is that these areas had a significant influence on the development of homosexualities in South Africa.¹⁵² “The connections and sense of collective identity created by this consumer

¹⁴⁹ Gevisser and Cameron, 22.

¹⁵⁰ Johnson, “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” 887.

¹⁵¹ Soweto officially became part of Johannesburg in 1995 in an amalgamation of municipalities. Predating the 1995 amalgamation and to present, Soweto has a significant (or even disproportionate) population in correlation to Johannesburg as a whole. The fact that there are *no* mail-orders going to Soweto is significant.

¹⁵² Epprecht, *Hungochani: The History of a Dissident Sexuality in Southern Africa*, 23.

network of physique magazines and other mail-order items” are limited by gender, race, and affluence.¹⁵³ The network Klein provided was only accessible on specific terms and only by certain people. Moreover, the content of the magazines reflected those limitations, generally depicting “pages of whiteness.”¹⁵⁴ The second map created for this thesis bridges some of this gap by showing interconnectivity between communities.

The data from the mailing-list is dated 1984 (despite the inventory of the collection suggesting otherwise), *after* the most significant amendments to the *Immorality Act*. This map demonstrates that there is an extensive network of consumers exchanging prohibited material despite the National Party attempting to curb this behaviour. Other correspondence in the Klein collection substantiates that he has maintained this network for at least ten years.¹⁵⁵ The *content* of these magazines was not necessarily South African but instead derived through international exchange.¹⁵⁶ If the National Party sought to enforce heteronormative sexuality, they were failing on multiple fronts: prohibition caused Klein to incorporate foreign bodies into a South African publication. In other words, the *Immorality Act* indirectly filled Klein’s publication with photographs of men from North America and Europe. At least 450 of Klein’s clients were receiving this international content, several of them writing back in gratitude for the “refreshing” service he was providing.¹⁵⁷

¹⁵³ Johnson, “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” 885.

¹⁵⁴ Tracy D. Morgan in “Pages of Whiteness: Race, Physique Magazines, and the Emergence of Public Gay Culture” from Genny Beemyn and Michele J. Eliason, eds., *Queer Studies: A Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, & Transgender Anthology* (New York: New York University Press, 1996), 280.

¹⁵⁵ Letter, “Hugo,” “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997.”

¹⁵⁶ Letterhead, “Direct from America,” “Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s.”

¹⁵⁷ Letter, “Kelvin,” “Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997.”

The Klein mailing-list visualization is unidirectional and reminiscent of simplistic “hub and spoke” network modelling. Illustrating *flow*, showing the circulation and consumption of these commodities not “from the more powerful to the less powerful,” but instead in, around, and through mercurial structures of power and identity is a defining element of this thesis.¹⁵⁸ Showing flow and movement is especially important in the context of South Africa under the National Party, a government that was primarily concerned with controlling these cultural dimensions.¹⁵⁹ Indicating flow became a focus for the creation of a second map that uses the publication and directory information found in the MacFarlane, Brown, and Loveday collections to show the interaction between publishers and contributors. A cartographic technique called flow mapping was used to demonstrate, flow, directionality, and volume.¹⁶⁰

¹⁵⁸ Howell in Fardon and Association of Social Anthropologists of the Commonwealth, *Counterworks*, 173.

¹⁵⁹ Susanne M. Klausen in “Eugenics and the Maintenance of White Supremacy in Modern South Africa” from Diane B. Paul, John Stenhouse, and Hamish G. Spencer, eds., *Eugenics at the Edges of Empire* (Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2018), 302.

¹⁶⁰ Bernhard Jenny et al., “Design Principles for Origin-Destination Flow Maps,” *Cartography and Geographic Information Science* 45, no. 1 (January 2, 2018): 62–75.

Magazine Collections, “Transnational network of homoerotic magazine contributors and publishers”

Figure 14: Finalized magazine collections map.

The finalized map illustrated in Figure 14 projects a complex network of exchange between two flexible categories: distributors and contributors.¹⁶¹ By spatially enlarging the context and scope, previously intangible connections become visible and readable.¹⁶² Distributors (in red on the map) were publishers or purveyors of illicit material, whereas contributors (in green on the map) were artists, models, or photographers who sent erotic material to be published (pictures, illustrations, drawings). Occasionally, these categories were mutually exclusive, but more frequently, they were not; publishers were also contributors and vice versa.¹⁶³ As Figure 14 indicates, each distributor was receiving content contributions from several geographic areas. Distributors are exclusively located in metropolitan urban areas such as Johannesburg,

¹⁶¹ The online version of this map is animated and interactive and adds the ability to navigate through temporal layers to show changes over time.

¹⁶² Diego Adrián Olstein, *Thinking History Globally* (Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014), 79.

¹⁶³ Johnson, “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” 876.

Cape Town, London, New York, San Francisco, Los Angeles, and Hollywood whereas contributors are more variable, with some representation in rural areas. Depending on the temporal layer selected, distributors vary year-to-year. These gaps are a result of which magazines were in the MacFarlane, Brown, or Loveday collections. Conversely, there are many overlaps in these collections: magazines found in all three collections, for example. Broken down by contributor, publisher, year, and collection, there are over two thousand *unique* strings of data compiled in this map.

This map only represents the contributions that were curated and approved for publication. Although the total amount of unpublished content provided to publishers is unknowable, it would likely reinforce the trends that this map illustrates. Nodes in this visualization are fragmented and decentralized, illustrating what Bhabha calls an “act of social survival,” a strategy that is “both transnational and translational.”¹⁶⁴ A transnational network is strongest in the face of prohibition and regulation: the legislation of one state cannot restrict such a fluid market. If regulation intensifies in one region, the market adapts and corrects by incorporating contributions from elsewhere.¹⁶⁵ The foundation of this analysis is not an enclosed system, but rather cross-boundary networks that demonstrate “interactions and exchanges along these networks.”¹⁶⁶ Beyond the confines of nation-states, transnational communities, like those exchanging homoerotic magazines in the mid-twentieth century, “share certain interests and concerns” no matter where they are.¹⁶⁷

¹⁶⁴ Bhabha, *The Location of Culture*, 172.

¹⁶⁵ See also Akira Iriye, *Global and Transnational History: The Past, Present, and Future*, Palgrave Pivot (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013).

¹⁶⁶ Olstein, *Thinking History Globally*, 79.

¹⁶⁷ Olstein, 105.

Notably, there is a significant amount of material being imported and exported from South Africa in the 1960s, concurrent with amendments to the *Immorality Act*. From this perspective, foreign influence was *rightfully* a concern of the National Party. Distributors in South Africa included *Jock* magazine (although there is some evidence of other publishers, they did not appear in the magazine collections). Contributors from South Africa included *Jock Studios*, *Studio Seven*, *Jovan Studio*, and Hugh MacFarlane's *Atelier Alpha*.¹⁶⁸ Evidence in chapter two shows that MacFarlane is exporting photographs of South African men to international publishers.

In some cases, these photographs later return to South Africa, this time found in the pages of these international magazines. Using a map to illustrate the exchange of these commodities clearly illustrates that despite increased regulation and enforcement, networks of exchange continued to operate in South Africa. Flow mapping reveals the transnational exchange of magazines and photographs. However, as previously mentioned, these collections are *not* comprehensive. The collections represent a particular subsection of a subculture: white homosexual men. The next chapter analyzes the significance of these limitations and how it impacts the outcomes of this research.

¹⁶⁸ There was a connection between MacFarlane, *Atelier Alpha*, and *Jock*, but unfortunately it was part of the missing inventory at GALA. Trying to re-establish this connection was another reason for investigating the other magazine collections in the first place.

Chapter 4: Limited Perspectives

This thesis presents a unique way of interpreting archival evidence to reinforce the work of other scholars; however, it cannot make broad claims of representation because of several critical limitations which this chapter will analyze.¹⁶⁹ It is still possible to assert the main argument of this thesis that legislation introduced by the National Party between 1950 and 1988 was ineffective in subduing the exchange of homoerotic commodities. The significant contribution of this thesis is its methodology. This methodology suggests that the trajectory of these commodities as cultural packages are made more potent by a decentralized exchange structure.

The most detrimental shortcoming for this thesis, as previously mentioned, is that the collections analyzed as evidence at GALA only represent a limited homosexuality: same-sex desiring white men. This limitation was neither purposeful nor was the intent of this thesis to present this exclusive perspective. Notably, “a striking feature Select Committee report” discussed in the first chapter, “is its white male viewpoint: whenever homosexuality is talked about, it is white gay men who are used as examples, and lesbians and black gays enter the discussions as afterthoughts.”¹⁷⁰ Heterosexual couples, lesbians, and black or “coloured” (as per apartheid categorization) homosexual men are relatively unrepresented across the five examined collections.¹⁷¹ Black men from South Africa and the United States are occasionally included (in other words, tokenized) in some of the publications and determining the representation of “coloured” men in the publications is as futile and meaningless as its application was in apartheid South Africa.

¹⁶⁹ See for example, Evans, “Seeing Subjectivity: Erotic Photography and the Optics of Desire” or Meeker, *Contacts Desired*.

¹⁷⁰ Gevisser and Cameron, *Defiant Desire*, 103.

¹⁷¹ The Joe Garmeson collection is the predominant location of these other voices.

Across over five hundred magazines in the MacFarlane, Brown, and Loveday collections, no women were represented.¹⁷² If vendors of homoerotic commodities were gatekeepers that unlocked access to a broader marketplace, access to that market was additionally restricted by the politics of segregation in apartheid South Africa.

For further marginalized communities, like homosexual black or “coloured” men, the material found in the five collections analyzed at GALA could easily be rendered inaccessible by a “whites-only” sign on the front door. Keeping in mind that some information was embargoed for identity protection by GALA actual consumer participation in the market is unclear. There is limited data to suggest *who* is consuming the magazines and purchasing material from mail-order catalogues. Inferring identity or even gender from that limited data is reckless. Therefore, it is difficult to determine how these magazines and photographs *influenced* consumers. There is little evidence to corroborate that the consumers of these magazines and photographs identified as homosexual (or men for that matter, women could have been consuming these magazines as well). Finally, this analysis represents homosexual white men of particular affluence and education. Hugh MacFarlane and Herb Klein were able to operate businesses and ship prohibited material around South Africa and abroad. Joe Garmeson facilitated and organized the Law Reform Fund, networking within South Africa and abroad. This thesis is the narrative of these men. Men who were unable to participate in this market financially also remain voiceless.

¹⁷² For summaries of other collections at GALA, including those that mitigate this gap, see the “Guide to the Resources of the Gay and Lesbian Archives of South Africa” in Neville Wallace Hoad, Karen Martin, and Graeme Reid, eds., *Sex and Politics in South Africa* (Cape Town: Double Storey, 2005). Notable collections include the Gay and Lesbian Organisation of the Witwatersrand collection and the Lesbians and Gays Against Oppressions collection.

In addition, South Africa is a linguistically, diverse country. Under the National Party Afrikaans was the voice of power in government and many of the government sources, including the Report of the Select Committee on the Immorality Amendment Bill, were in Afrikaans. Interspersed English commentary throughout these documents allowed some interpretation, but what was lost in translation? What of the most spoken South African languages, Zulu or Xhosa? How would the inclusion of these omitted voices the shape of this research? How necessary is linguistic diversity to transnational history? Arguably, the inclusion of these perspectives would foster a decolonized narrative. Inevitably, including other languages, would have dramatically enlarged the scope of this thesis but would have created a more comprehensive analysis.

While the inclusion of these other voices would have unequivocally enriched the findings of this work, the scope of this thesis chronically expanded. It was vital to maintain some semblance of specificity in order to represent the demographic that *was* found in the collections analyzed at GALA. We can only surmise what is hidden from transcription in the absence of these other voices.¹⁷³ We can, at the very least, draw some conclusions about how transnational ties shaped the identity of a specific demographic, and how those transnational ties resisted the governance of the day. Consequently, to resolve this limitation, a more extensive study can use the methods demonstrated by this thesis to analyze sources that represent these missing voices.

¹⁷³ Epprecht, *Hungochani: The History of a Dissident Sexuality in Southern Africa*, 68.

Another significant shortcoming is that the evidence visualized by the maps is generally geographically specific to North America, Europe, and South Africa. Over fifteen years of contributions by artists, models, and

Figure 15: No data from Australia or Asia, limited data in Africa (outside of South Africa) and South America.

photographers, and there are no contributions or publications from Eastern Europe, anywhere else in Africa, Asia, or most surprisingly, Australia.¹⁷⁴ Outside of South Africa, the easternmost photographic contribution, apart from the numerous contributions of *Sven Swede* in Stockholm, comes from *Jock of Europe* in Rome. Westwards, Kaneohe, Hawaii has a 1964 photographic contributor; however, this is misleading. The contributor, Steve Jayson, is well represented across the data and is usually contributing from Albany, United States. Steve Jayson is a listed contributor for several magazines that year, all using the Albany address. Apart from this deviation, there are regular photographic contributions from the western coast of North America (San Francisco, Los Angeles, Seattle, Vancouver) with infrequent contributions from *Photo-Soto* in Santiago, Chile. Cold War politics could explain some of these absences, but what hindered contributions from other areas? The map illustrates a broad exchange over the Atlantic but not from anywhere else. This thesis is careful not to claim that this exchange is a global trend because the data does not reflect it. This is especially important when discussing cultural exchange, because an absence of evidence does not mean that cultural exchange is not occurring in other ways, “any weekend night in San Francisco in the

¹⁷⁴ Some contributions were expected from Australia, simply because many other former British territories were represented alongside its proximity to the global south.

1950s, more gay men —and probably more lesbians as well— were communicating face-to-face in bars than were on [any] mailing list.”¹⁷⁵ Other archives and collections could help to expand the range of this data in order to resolve this shortcoming.

Finally, there are limitations in the methodology used in this thesis. The “patterns of relations,” depicted by the visualizations do not appeal to attributes such as “class membership or class consciousness, political party affiliation, age, gender, social status, religious beliefs, ethnicity, sexual orientation, psychological predispositions, and so on, in order to explain why people behave the way they do.”¹⁷⁶ However, this methodological conflict is mitigated by incorporating a rich body of qualitative information, “thus facilitating analyses at both the individual and group level.”¹⁷⁷ The network visualizations performed in this thesis only function because the qualitative and quantitative evidence is mutually validating.

Visualizing the data via mapping is an additional, fallible, tool in the historian’s repertoire.¹⁷⁸ This research incorporated extensive privacy and security measures to protect individuals. However, since these technologies have been “made easily accessible to anyone who is curious, regardless of their training,” the impacts of this type of methodology are not always contemplated.¹⁷⁹ Also, while “it is easy to become

¹⁷⁵ John D’Emilio, “Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communications and Community, 1940s–1970s. Martin Meeker: Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006, 321 Pp,” *Journal of Homosexuality* 55, no. 2 (August 14, 2008): 318.

¹⁷⁶ Emirbayer and Goodwin, “Network Analysis, Culture, and the Problem of Agency,” 1413–14.

¹⁷⁷ Emirbayer and Goodwin, 1418.

¹⁷⁸ Patricia White and R. Saylor Breckenridge, “Trade-Offs, Limitations, and Promises of Big Data in Social Science Research: Promises of Big Data in Social Science,” *Review of Policy Research* 31, no. 4 (July 2014): 336.

¹⁷⁹ Danah Boyd and Kate Crawford, “Critical Questions for Big Data: Provocations for a Cultural, Technological, and Scholarly Phenomenon,” *Information, Communication & Society* 15, no. 5 (June 2012): 664.

hypnotized by the complexity of a network,” connectivity is specifically vital to how the data from GALA is interpreted.¹⁸⁰ The primary concern of researchers and scholars interested in this methodology should be the immediate and lasting potential impacts for the community in question. An excellent place to start is by contemplating how the research represents the community in the past, how it could impact the community in the present, and how it could be used for better, but especially for worse, in the future. The secondary concern in the application of this methodology should be its purpose in the first place. Apart from flashy maps and interactive interfaces, what work does a network do for the argument: how does it contribute.

Furthermore, network visualization does not function “without at least a second dataset of a different variety that is connected to the first.”¹⁸¹ A supplementary dataset is essential to draw any meaningful conclusions. Finally, although these types of visualizations can project thousands of data points, that “does not mean that methodological issues are no longer relevant.”¹⁸² Conversely, considering how easily these visualizations are accepted as “authentic,” being forthright about methodological gaps is even more significant.

¹⁸⁰ Graham, Milligan, and Weingart, *Exploring Big Historical Data: The Historian’s Macroscope*, 201, 251.

¹⁸¹ Graham, Milligan, and Weingart, 199–200.

¹⁸² Boyd and Crawford, “Critical Questions for Big Data: Provocations for a Cultural, Technological, and Scholarly Phenomenon,” 668.

Conclusion

The *Immorality Act*, first enacted in 1927 and last amended in 1988, was a tool used by the government of South Africa to regulate “immoral” or “deviant” sexual behaviour. After the election of the National Party in 1948, this *Act* became increasingly disparaging towards homosexual men. Not satisfied with merely prohibiting homosexuality, the National Party began to enforce the regulation of “obscene” commodities, including homoerotic magazines and photographs. Despite these regulations, both homosexuality and networks of homoerotic exchange persisted in South Africa. The Forest Town raid of 1966 sparked a renewed moral panic and allowed the National Party to implement more aggressive amendments to the *Immorality Act*. Ultimately, these amendments would be an overstep as they fomented the formation of law reform organizations. Over time, the *Immorality Act* would meet opposition in legislative committees, in courts, and newspapers and magazines. From their election in 1948, the National Party was obsessed with the maintenance of South African-ness but ignorant of the broad transnational cultural exchange that was occurring through homoerotic magazines and photographs.

These magazines and photographs fostered an imagined community that was not bound to national borders or politics but instead to “desire and longing.”¹⁸³ Johannesburg, Cape Town, London, New York, San Francisco, Los Angeles, and Hollywood were all important hubs in an extensive network of homoerotic exchange. While urban centres played an essential role in the distribution of homoerotic commodities, many other areas, including rural and suburban areas, participated in the network by making financial,

¹⁸³ Evans, “Seeing Subjectivity: Erotic Photography and the Optics of Desire,” 445.

textual, or visual contributions. Not only did these types of media allow desire to exist in cultures that sought to eradicate it, but they also allowed shared sentiments across vast distances. The editorials and commentaries in homoerotic magazines armed homosexual men with the language and precedent to organize further resistance.

This thesis engages with a large corpus of primary sources that include homoerotic magazines, photographs, and other documents from five collections examined at the Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA) archive in Johannesburg. These primary sources represent a specific and limited South African demographic: affluent white homosexual men. This thesis incorporates in-depth readings of evidence from GALA and quantitative data-driven visualizations that illustrate a different way of interpreting visual culture. This interpretation demonstrates that networks of exchange persisted through the prohibitive legislation like the National Party's *Immorality Act*. It also demonstrates that the commodities that constituted that network circulated within South Africa and abroad and that the variable geographic range of publishers and contributors was outside the jurisdiction of any individual government.

Historiographically, this thesis demonstrates an alternative way to interrogate the “multiple genealogies at work inside, outside, and beyond the frame,” of a photograph.¹⁸⁴ By visualizing the trajectories of homoerotic magazines, this thesis fortifies the position and value of cultural analysis as a methodology. Furthermore, this thesis reinforces a rich body of qualitative historical research with quantitative evidence and analysis.¹⁸⁵ This thesis refutes claims of heteronormative sexualities by illustrating a robust subculture of

¹⁸⁴ Evans, 438.

¹⁸⁵ Meeker, *Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communications and Community, 1940s-1970s*.

“deviant” sexuality was thriving in South Africa, despite the best regulatory efforts of the government. These communities created and maintained lines of communication to those more akin to them across borders and beyond boundaries. Finally, this thesis intervenes in narratives that depict “national gay commercial market[s]” by demonstrating an extensive transnational exchange of homoerotic material.¹⁸⁶

This thesis engages with histories that have been thoroughly researched, documented, and analyzed. However, flow mapping is a powerful new tool in the historian’s toolkit that can add value to typical cultural analysis. This thesis and notably Appendix A: The Mechanics of Leaflet Visualization can serve as a technical introduction to flow mapping and a case study for others to use in their research. While the application of flow mapping suits the study of commodities and exchange in particular, what other historical narratives can this methodology reinforce?

Finally, this research excavates relatively underused archival collections. Anecdotally, Linda Chernis, the archivist at GALA, mentioned that these documents, more “international” in scope than others at GALA, are rarely examined. These primary sources, therefore, have stories to *tell*, lest they sit unopened in musty archival fonds for decades longer.

¹⁸⁶ Johnson, “Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture,” 868.

Bibliography

Primary Sources

GALA

Brown, Arthur. "Arthur Brown Collection, ca. 1953-1976," n.d. AM 2829. Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA).

Garmeson, Joe. "Joe Garmeson Papers, 1967-2000," 1997. AM 2580. Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA).

Josi: The Queer Tour. Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA), 1999.

Klein, Herb. "Herb Klein Collection, 1986-1997," 2000. AM 3019. Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA).

Loveday, Roger. "Roger Loveday Collection, 1961-1968," 1999. AM 2845. Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA).

MacFarlane, Hugh. "Hugh MacFarlane Collection, ca. 1940s to 1960s," 1998. AM 2636. Gay and Lesbian Memory in Action (GALA).

Government of South Africa

"Report of the Select Committee on the Immorality Amendment Bill." Republic of South Africa, 1968 1967.

Republic of South Africa. Immorality Amendment Act, 1967, Pub. L. No. Act No. 68 of 1967 (1967).

———. Immorality Amendment Act, 1969, Pub. L. No. Act No. 57 of 1969 (1969).

———. Publications Act, 1974, Pub. L. No. Act No. 42 of 1974 (1974).

Union of South Africa. Immorality Act, 1927, Pub. L. No. Act No. 5 of 1927 (1927).

———. Immorality Amendment Act, 1950, Pub. L. No. Act No. 21 of 1950 (1950).

———. Immorality Amendment Act, 1957, Pub. L. No. Act No. 23 of 1957 (1957).

Secondary Sources

- Anderson, Benedict R. O'G. *Imagined Communities: Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism*. Rev. ed. London ; New York: Verso, 2006.
- Appadurai, Arjun, ed. *The Social Life of Things: Commodities in Cultural Perspective*. Cambridge [Cambridgeshire] ; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1986.
- Beemyn, Genny, and Michele J. Eliason, eds. *Queer Studies: A Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, & Transgender Anthology*. New York: New York University Press, 1996.
- Bhabha, Homi K. *The Location of Culture*. London ; New York: Routledge, 1994.
- Boyd, Danah, and Kate Crawford. "Critical Questions for Big Data: Provocations for a Cultural, Technological, and Scholarly Phenomenon." *Information, Communication & Society* 15, no. 5 (June 2012): 662–79.
- Burke, Peter. *Eyewitnessing: The Uses of Images as Historical Evidence*. Picturing History Series. Ithaca, N.Y: Cornell University Press, 2001.
- Cameron, Edwin. "Sexual Orientation and the Constitution: A Test Case for Human Rights." *South African Law Journal* 110 (1993): 450–72.
- Carter, Gwendolen Margaret, 1906-1991. *The Politics of Inequality: South Africa since 1948*. 2d, rev. ed. Book, Whole. New York: Praeger, 1959.
- Clark, Nancy L., and William H. Worger. *South Africa: The Rise and Fall of Apartheid*. Third edition. Seminar Studies. London ; New York: Routledge Taylor & Francis Group, 2016.
- Darnton, Robert. *The Forbidden Best-Sellers of Pre-Revolutionary France*. New York: W.W. Norton, 1995.
- D'Emilio, John. "Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communications and Community, 1940s–1970s. Martin Meeker: Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006, 321 Pp." *Journal of Homosexuality* 55, no. 2 (August 14, 2008): 316–19.
- Derrida, Jacques. *Archive Fever: A Freudian Impression*. Religion and Postmodernism. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996.
- Dijkstra, Bram. *Idols of Perversity: Fantasies of Feminine Evil in Fin-de-Siècle Culture*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 1988.
- Edwards, Elizabeth, and Janice Hart. *Photographs Objects Histories on the Materiality of Images*. London; New York: Routledge, 2005.
<http://www.myilibrary.com?id=4845>.
- Emirbayer, Mustafa, and Jeff Goodwin. "Network Analysis, Culture, and the Problem of Agency." *American Journal of Sociology* 99, no. 6 (May 1994): 1411–54.

- Epprecht, Marc. *Hungochani: The History of a Dissident Sexuality in Southern Africa*. 2. ed. Montréal: McGill-Queen's Univ. Press, 2013.
- . "Sexuality, Africa, History." *The American Historical Review* 114, no. 5 (December 2009): 1258–72.
- Evans, Jennifer V. "Seeing Subjectivity: Erotic Photography and the Optics of Desire." *The American Historical Review* 118, no. 2 (2013): 430–62.
- Faderman, L. "Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communication and Community, 1940s-1970s." *The American Historical Review* 112, no. 2 (April 1, 2007): 541–42.
- Fardon, Richard, and Association of Social Anthropologists of the Commonwealth, eds. *Counterworks: Managing the Diversity of Knowledge*. The Uses of Knowledge. London ; New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Foucault, Michel. *The History of Sexuality*. 1st American ed. New York: Pantheon Books, 1978.
- Gevisser, Mark, and Edwin Cameron, eds. *Defiant Desire*. New York: Routledge, 1995.
- Ginwala, Frene. "South Africa's Censorship Laws," 1975.
- Gower, H. D., L. Stanley Jast, and William Whiteman Topley. *The Camera as Historian*. The Literature of Photography. New York: Arno Press, 1973.
- Graham, Shawn, Ian Milligan, and Scott Weingart. *Exploring Big Historical Data: The Historian's Macroscope*. London: Imperial College Press, 2016.
- Hattingh, Chris, and John P. Spencer. "Homosexual Not Homogeneous: A Motivation-Based Typology of Gay Leisure Travelers Holidaying in Cape Town, South Africa." *Journal of Homosexuality*, December 24, 2018, 1–25.
- Hoad, Neville. "Queer Customs against the Law." *Research in African Literatures* 47, no. 2 (2016): 1–19.
- Hoad, Neville Wallace, Karen Martin, and Graeme Reid, eds. *Sex and Politics in South Africa*. Cape Town: Double Storey, 2005.
- Iriye, Akira. *Global and Transnational History: The Past, Present, and Future*. Palgrave Pivot. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013.
- Johnson, David K. "Physique Pioneers: The Politics of 1960s Gay Consumer Culture." *Journal of Social History* 43, no. 4 (2010): 867–92.

- Klausen, Susanne Maria. *Abortion under Apartheid: Nationalism, Sexuality, and Women's Reproductive Rights in South Africa*. New York, NY: Oxford University Press, 2015.
- Lewis, Desiree. "Rethinking Nationalism in Relation to Foucault's History of Sexuality and Adrienne Rich's 'Compulsory Heterosexuality and Lesbian Existence'." *Sexualities* 11, no. 1–2 (2008): 104–9.
- Mandler, Peter. "The Problem with Cultural History." *Cultural and Social History* 1, no. 1 (January 1, 2004): 94–117.
- Martens, Jeremy. "Citizenship, 'Civilisation' and the Creation of South Africa's Immorality Act, 1927." *South African Historical Journal* 59, no. 1 (January 2007): 223–41.
- McCormick, Tracey Lee. "Queering Discourses of Coming out in South Africa." *Stellenbosch Papers in Linguistics Plus* 42, no. 0 (January 13, 2014): 127.
- Meeker, Martin. *Contacts Desired: Gay and Lesbian Communications and Community, 1940s-1970s*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2006.
- Mitchell, W. J. T. *What Do Pictures Want? The Lives and Loves of Images*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 2005.
- Neale, Steve. "Masculinity as Spectacle." *Screen* 24, no. 6 (November 1, 1983): 2–17.
- Olstein, Diego Adrián. *Thinking History Globally*. Houndmills, Basingstoke, Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2014.
- Paul, Diane B., John Stenhouse, and Hamish G. Spencer, eds. *Eugenics at the Edges of Empire*. Cham: Springer International Publishing, 2018.
- Reid, Graeme, and Teresa Dirsuweit. "Understanding Systemic Violence: Homophobic Attacks in Johannesburg and Its Surrounds." *Urban Forum* 13, no. 3 (July 2002): 99–126.
- Rose, Jacqueline. *Sexuality in the Field of Vision*. Radical Thinkers 9. London ; New York: Verso, 2005.
- Scott, James C. *Domination and the Arts of Resistance: Hidden Transcripts*. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1990.
- Sekula, Allan. *Photography Against the Grain: Essays and Photo Works, 1973-1983*. The Nova Scotia Series : Source Materials of the Contemporary Arts, v. 16. Halifax, N.S., Canada: Press of the Nova Scotia College of Art and Design, 1984.
- Solomon-Godeau, Abigail. *Photography After Photography: Gender, Genre, History*. Edited by Sarah Parsons. Durham and London: Duke University Press, 2017.

- . *Photography at the Dock: Essays on Photographic History, Institutions, and Practices*. Media & Society 4. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1991.
- Sontag, Susan. *On Photography*. New York: Picador USA, 2001.
- Stoler, Ann Laura. *Race and the Education of Desire: Foucault's History of Sexuality and the Colonial Order of Things*. Durham: Duke University Press, 1995.
- Stratton, Jon. *The Desirable Body: Cultural Fetishism and the Erotics of Consumption*. Manchester, UK ; New York : New York: Manchester University Press ; Distributed exclusively in the USA and Canada by St. Martin's Press, 1996.
- Tagg, John. *The Burden of Representation: Essays on Photographies and Histories*. Minneapolis, Minn: University of Minnesota Press, 1993.
- . *The Disciplinary Frame: Photographic Truths and the Capture of Meaning*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2009.
- Waugh, Thomas. *Hard to Imagine: Gay Male Eroticism in Photography and Film from Their Beginnings to Stonewall*. Between Men--between Women. New York: Columbia University Press, 1996.
- West, D. J., and Richard Green, eds. *Sociolegal Control of Homosexuality: A Multi-Nation Comparison*. Perspectives in Sexuality. New York: Plenum Press, 1997.
- White, Hayden V. *The Content of the Form: Narrative Discourse and Historical Representation*. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1987.
- White, Patricia, and R. Saylor Breckenridge. "Trade-Offs, Limitations, and Promises of Big Data in Social Science Research: Promises of Big Data in Social Science." *Review of Policy Research* 31, no. 4 (July 2014): 331–38.

Technical Sources

Chromebeat. “Web Server for Chrome,” n.d. <https://www.chromebeat.com/app/web-server-for-chrome>.

“Cross-Origin Resource Sharing (CORS).” MDN Web Docs, n.d. <https://developer.mozilla.org/en-US/docs/Web/HTTP/CORS>.

“GeoJSON,” n.d. <http://geojson.org/>.

“Introducing JSON,” n.d. <https://www.json.org/>.

Jenny, Bernhard, Daniel M. Stephen, Ian Muehlenhaus, Brooke E. Marston, Ritesh Sharma, Eugene Zhang, and Helen Jenny. “Design Principles for Origin-Destination Flow Maps.” *Cartography and Geographic Information Science* 45, no. 1 (January 2, 2018): 62–75.

“Leaflet - a JavaScript Library for Interactive Maps,” n.d. <https://leafletjs.com/>.

“Papa Parse - Powerful CSV Parser for JavaScript,” n.d. <https://www.papaparse.com/>.

Stephen, Daniel M., and Bernhard Jenny. “Automated Layout of Origin–Destination Flow Maps: U.S. County-to-County Migration 2009–2013.” *Journal of Maps* 13, no. 1 (January 2017): 46–55.

Wasilkowski, Jacob. *A LeafletJS Custom Map Layer for Mapping the Flow of Objects, Ideas, People, Etc. with Bezier Curves Rendered on the HTML Canvas*. JavaScript, 2019. <https://github.com/jwasilgeo/Leaflet.Canvas-Flowmap-Layer>.

Wasilkowski, Jacob, and Sarah Bell. “Flow Mapping Bezier Curves onto the HTML Canvas,” n.d. <https://petrichor.studio/category/leafletjs/>.

Appendix A: The Mechanics of Leaflet Visualization

Technical Documentation for Klein Mailing-List, “Mail Distribution of Confiscated Erotic Material in South Africa”

The data from the Klein mailing-list was parsed, tallied, and organized into two categories, ‘Suburb’ and ‘Number of Clients’ by recording all of the suburbs found in the mailing-list and annotating each unique appearance. For example, “Newton Park” appeared three times in the mailing-list, indicating that there were three unique clients in this suburb.¹⁸⁷ Overall, this data indicated that Klein had over 450 clients in South Africa. The suburb of Klein’s business was considered the point-of-origin for this data. Creating this tallied list produced a basic network of exchange for Klein’s mail-order business in South Africa. After creating this database, each suburb was designated with latitude and longitude coordinates. These coordinates were randomized within the suburb as additional privacy protection. After assigning geographic coordinates to each suburb, determining the appropriate method to visualize the data was the next undertaking.

Interactivity was a secondary goal of this visualization; therefore, determining a system to produce this functionality became imperative. Ultimately, web-based systems readily provide this functionality, and an application called Leaflet was suitable to render this data.¹⁸⁸ Leaflet is a “leading open-source JavaScript library for mobile-friendly interactive maps," that uses HTML, JavaScript, and CSS to create a lightweight,

¹⁸⁷ There were several challenges to this approach including different spellings of suburbs, different suburb names (many areas were renamed after 1994), and non-suburb specific locations listed (‘Johannesburg’). Since this data was to be visualized with a map, it was important to choose an approach and remain consistent.

¹⁸⁸ ArcGIS, a popular application used to visualize geographic information, was the first trial for visualizing this data. Although Carleton University has student licences for this application, using ArcGIS to interpret this data was beyond the time constraints for this project, so finding an alternative was necessary.

functional, and customizable maps.¹⁸⁹ Leaflet includes a well-documented API (application programming interface) and a variety of plugins.

Figure 16 below shows an initial test render using Leaflet.

Figure 16: Initial Leaflet test render.

Figure 17: Initial Leaflet test render. zoomed in.

¹⁸⁹ “Leaflet - a JavaScript Library for Interactive Maps,” n.d., <https://leafletjs.com/>.

Figure 17 previous is the same map, zoomed in. This simple test processes a set of geographic coordinates from the database and creates a circle. This process was used to visualize all locations in the database. The red circle identifies the general area of Klein's business enterprise, within a one-kilometre radius. This radius is deliberate: a one-kilometre radius around the previously randomized latitude/longitude coordinates provides another degree of privacy.

Furthermore, this radius was multiplicatively increased for each client in the suburb. For example, the previously mentioned suburb, Newtown Park, had three clients; therefore, the circle for Newton Park is three-kilometres in radius. After inserting a circle for each location in the database, the circles were linked to Klein's business using lines. Overall, projecting the Klein mailing-list onto a map using Leaflet required over 3000 lines of code: a time-consuming process.

Code Snippets from the Klein Mailing-List Map

```
//INITIALIZE
var map = L.map('map').setView([-20, 24], 5);

//LOAD A TILE LAYER
L.tileLayer('https://{s}.basemaps.cartocdn.com/rastertiles/voyager/{z}/{x}/{y}{r}.png',
{
  attribution: '&copy; <a href="http://www.openstreetmap.org/copyright">OpenStreetMap</a> &copy; <a href="https://carto.com/attributions">CARTO</a>.',
  subdomains: 'abcd',
  minZoom: 5,
  maxZoom: 20
}).addTo(map);
```

Figure 18: Initializing and loading a tile layer in Leaflet.

Figure 18 depicts how the Leaflet JavaScript (JS) library is instructed to load a map into the webpage, centred on latitude/longitude -26.5, 24 (a non-specific point in South Africa) and zoomed to 6/20. It then directs the Leaflet JS library to load a tile layer from an online map tile provider: <https://carto.com/>. Map tiles are snapshots of geographic data that can increase and decrease in specificity. Zooming in causes more specific data to be visible (towns, roads, etc.) whereas zooming out makes less specific data visible (countries, large cities, borders). Carto was chosen because Leaflet documentation recommends it as an open-source, free, map tile provider. Among the other options, Carto has excellent visual contrast and a clean aesthetic.

```
//INFORMATION
var info = L.control({position: 'bottomleft'});

info.onAdd = function (map) {
  this._div = L.DomUtil.create('div', 'info');
  this.update();
  return this._div;
};

info.update = function (props) {
  this._div.innerHTML = '<h4>Mail Distribution of Seized Illicit Erotic Material in South Africa, by suburb, 1984.</h4>' + 'Click on circles to view number of addresses in each suburb.' + '</b><br />' + 'Opacity and thickness of lines represents mail frequency to an area.';
};

info.addTo(map);
```

Figure 19: Creating an information box in Leaflet.

Figure 19 depicts how Leaflet is instructed to create a text box on the bottom-left of the webpage. Within the text-box, a small description of the map and a legend are created.

```
// HOMEBASE
L.circle([-26.1991, 28.0491], {color: 'red', opacity: 0.5, fillopacity: 0.1, radius: 1000, interactive: false}).addTo(map);
```

Figure 20: Creating a point of reference in Leaflet.

Figure 20 depicts how Leaflet is instructed to add a circle to a specified latitude/longitude point on the map. This point is the general suburb of Herb Klein's business. It is not the specific address of his business (or whatever is there now). The options specify that the circle will be coloured red, have a line opacity of 50%, have a fill opacity of 10%, have a radius of 1000 metres, and be non-interactive. A critical component of this code is the radius option.

```
// DESTINATIONS
// Pretoria (24)
var latlngs = [
  [-26.1991, 28.0491],
  [-25.7479, 28.2293],
];
var polyline = L.polyline(latlngs, {color: '#7A991E', opacity: 0.1, interactive: false}).addTo(map);
L.circle([-25.7479, 28.2293], {color: '#7A991E', fillColor: '#7A991E', fillopacity: 0.1, opacity: 0.5, radius: 24000}).addTo(map).bindPopup("Pretoria; Mail Orders: 24");
```

Figure 21: Generating lines and polygons at specific geographic points.

Figure 21 depicts how Leaflet is instructed to add a line from one set of latitude/longitude coordinates to another set of latitude/longitude coordinates. Note that the first set of latitude/longitude coordinates is Herb Klein's business, whereas the second set of latitude/longitude coordinates is the general suburb where, according to the anonymized location information in Database #1, Klein is sending his products. The options specify for the line to have a colour, have an opacity of 10%, and be non-interactive. The opacity and non-interactive options were intentionally set due to the amount of data on the final map.

This also instructs the Leaflet JS library to add a circle to a specified latitude/longitude point on the map. Similar to the previous example of adding a circle; this point is the general destination suburb of the mail-order consumer, it is not the specific address of the consumer. The options specify that the circle will have a colour, have a line opacity of 50%, have a fill opacity of 10%, and have a radius of 24000 metres. Note that the title of each destination, in this case, 'Pretoria (24)', identifies the suburb and number of mail-orders sent to that suburb. For each unique mail-order to a location, the radius of the circle was increased by 1000 metres. In this example, there were 24 unique consumers in Pretoria receiving products from Klein. This helps to visualize the amount of material being sent to different locations on the final map: locations with larger circles had increased traffic. Finally, as a functionality extension, all of the destination circles are interactive. Clicking on a destination circle will prompt a pop-up that displays the location and number of mail orders to that location. In this case, clicking on the circle will display "Pretoria; Mail Orders: 24". The destinations were sorted by the number of mail-orders, in descending order. This was critical for functionality as it placed larger circles below smaller circles. If this were inverted, the smaller circles would be visible, but clicking on them would result in a pop-up for the larger circle (since it was 'on-top').

Technical Documentation for Magazine Collections, “Transnational network of homoerotic magazine contributors and publishers”

Since processing and visualizing the data from the Klein mailing-list with Leaflet was successful in revealing a network between consumers and producers, a similar approach was used for interpreting the magazine collections from the MacFarlane, Brown, and Loveday collections. These collections contained over 500 magazines and a significant portion of them had both publication data and directory information. The data from each magazine was broken down and categorized into: contributor city, contributor latitude/longitude, contributor company (contributor), contributor country, publisher city, publisher latitude/longitude, publisher company, publisher country, year, and collection. The data was organized into separate .CSV files (a Microsoft Excel format), organized by year (and undated). An example of the .CSV data can be found in Appendix A, “Example .CSV Data”.

This data represents over 2000 unique strings of data. The amount of data represented by the magazine collections was several orders of magnitude larger than the dataset for the Klein mailing-list. The Klein mailing-list has a single origin, all within one year, in one country. The magazine collection has data from a variety of origins, over several years, on a broad geographic scale. In order to increase the efficiency and accuracy of data entry, the JavaScript Object Notation (JSON) and GEOJSON functions of Leaflet became increasingly relevant. JSON “is a lightweight data-interchange format. It is easy for humans to read and write. It is easy for machines to parse and generate.”¹⁹⁰ Essentially, it is a method for organizing data into a structure that is uniform and readily

¹⁹⁰ “Introducing JSON,” n.d., <https://www.json.org/>.

parsed by other software. GEOJSON is a derivative format of JSON for “encoding a variety of geographic data structures.”¹⁹¹ In order to render the data usable by Leaflet, PapaParse, another JavaScript library, was used to interpret the .CSV data and render it into GEOJSON format.¹⁹²

As previously mentioned, it was important to represent the flow and exchange of material between contributors and publishers. A Leaflet plugin called Canvas-Flowmap-Layer enables the visualization of movement and the direction of flow.¹⁹³ Canvas-Flowmap-Layer “is a custom layer plugin for LeafletJS to map the flow of objects from an origin point to a destination point by using a Bezier curve. GeoJSON point feature coordinates are translated to pixel space so that rendering for the points and curves are mapped to an HTMLCanvasElement.”¹⁹⁴ In short, the Canvas-Flowmap-Layer plugin renders GEOJSON data into curved lines on a Leaflet map.

¹⁹¹ “GeoJSON,” n.d., <http://geojson.org/>.

¹⁹² “Papa Parse - Powerful CSV Parser for JavaScript,” n.d., <https://www.papaparse.com/>.

¹⁹³ Jacob Wasilkowski, *A LeafletJS Custom Map Layer for Mapping the Flow of Objects, Ideas, People, Etc. with Bezier Curves Rendered on the HTML Canvas.*, JavaScript, 2019, <https://github.com/jwasilgeo/Leaflet.Canvas-Flowmap-Layer>.

¹⁹⁴ Wasilkowski.

Figure 22: Canvas-Flowmap-Layer demonstration file visualizing airport destinations.

Canvas-Flowmap-Layer was built in 2017 by Sarah Bell and Jacob Wasilkowski originally as “an extension of the ArcGIS API for JavaScript (Esri JSAPI) to map the flow of objects from an origin point to a destination point by using a Bezier curve.”¹⁹⁵ Later, it was ported as a plugin for Leaflet.

The Canvas-Flowmap-Layer demonstration files were modified to interpret the data from the magazine collections. Some of the useful functionality of the demonstration code was preserved in the final version of the map, including the different methods of data visualization (new, add, subtract). For the finalized version, the navigation selection menu was modified, and a legend was added to the top-right. Since the dataset from the magazine collections is so significant, it must “be represented as a series of maps that show selected subsets of flows” in order to eliminate as much visual clutter as possible.¹⁹⁶

¹⁹⁵ Jacob Wasilkowski and Sarah Bell, “Flow Mapping Bezier Curves onto the HTML Canvas,” n.d., <https://petrichor.studio/category/leafletjs/>.

¹⁹⁶ Daniel M. Stephen and Bernhard Jenny, “Automated Layout of Origin–Destination Flow Maps: U.S. County-to-County Migration 2009–2013,” *Journal of Maps* 13, no. 1 (January 2017): 46–55.

To accomplish this, temporal navigation through the map was organized by publication year.

Code Snippets from the Magazine Collections Map

```
<div id="controlPanel" class="control-panel" style="overflow-y: scroll">

  <div class="container" style="width: 100%; padding: 5px 10px;">

    <h4>Years</h4>

    <div class="row">
      <div class="six columns">
        <select id="userInteractionSelect" class="u-full-width">
          <option value="click" selected>Click</option>
          <option value="mouseover">Mouseover</option>
        </select>
      </div>
      <div class="six columns">
        <select id="pathSelectionTypeSelect" class="u-full-width">
          <option value="SELECTION_NEW" selected>New</option>
          <option value="SELECTION_ADD">Add</option>
          <option value="SELECTION_SUBTRACT">Subtract</option>
        </select>
      </div>
    </div>
    <button id="undatedButton" class="u-full-width button-primary" value="0">Undated</button>
    <button id="fivefourButton" class="u-full-width" value="1">1954</button>
    <button id="fivefiveButton" class="u-full-width" value="2">1955</button>
    <button id="fivesixButton" class="u-full-width" value="3">1956</button>
    <button id="fivesevenButton" class="u-full-width" value="4">1957</button>
    <button id="fiveeightButton" class="u-full-width" value="5">1958</button>
```

Figure 23: Creating control panels in Leaflet.

Figure 23 depicts how Leaflet is instructed to create a control panel to create a scroll bar if there is too much data in the panel. The code specifies a header, “Years” (this was later modified to “Navigation”). The code creates an input box with options the user can select from for “path selection type.”¹⁹⁷ Finally, it creates a vertical list of buttons that display the year. At this point, with no other code, no functions have been assigned to any of the buttons, so the buttons would display, but would not return an interaction.

¹⁹⁷ This was borrowed and modified from the original Canvas-Flowmap-Layer code.

```
var layersArray = [];
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/undated.csv', 0, true);
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/1954.csv', 1);
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/1955.csv', 2);
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/1956.csv', 3);
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/1957.csv', 4);
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/1958.csv', 5);
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/1959.csv', 6);
createCanvasFlowmapLayer('http://127.0.0.1:8887/csv-data/1960.csv', 7);
```

Figure 24: Creating temporal map layers.

Figure 24 depicts how the Canvas-Flowmap-Layer plugin is instructed to create a layer using a .CSV file and assign it a numeric value. Note that the values listed here and the previous snippet for each year are identical. This begins linking the buttons to displaying the .CSV files.

```
function createCanvasFlowmapLayer(csvFilePath, customLayerId, doOneTimeDemoSetup) {
  Papa.parse(csvFilePath, {
    download: true,
    header: true,
    dynamicTyping: true,
    skipEmptyLines: true,
    complete: function(results) {
      var geoJsonFeatureCollection = {
        type: 'FeatureCollection',
        features: results.data.map(function(datum) {
          return {
            type: 'Feature',
            geometry: {
              type: 'Point',
              coordinates: [datum.s_lon, datum.s_lat]
            },
            properties: datum
          }
        })
      }
    }
  });
}
```

Figure 25: Using PapaParse to convert .CSV files.

Figure 25 depicts how the Canvas-Flowmap-Layer plugin is instructed to parse a .CSV file and create GEOJSON data using the PapaParse plugin. Furthermore, the GEOJSON data is specified as a ‘Feature Collection’ that will use latitude and longitude for coordinates.¹⁹⁸

¹⁹⁸ This was borrowed and modified from the original Canvas-Flowmap-Layer code.

```

userInteractionSelect.addEventListener('change', layerListenerChange);

function layerListenerChange(e) {
  if (e.target.value === 'click') {
    layersArray.forEach(function(layer) {
      layer.off('mouseover', handleLayerInteraction);
      layer.off('click', handleLayerInteraction);
      layer.on('click', handleLayerInteraction);
    });
  } else {
    layersArray.forEach(function(layer) {
      layer.off('click', handleLayerInteraction);
      layer.off('mouseover', handleLayerInteraction);
      layer.on('mouseover', handleLayerInteraction);
    });
  }
}

function handleLayerInteraction(e) {
  if (e.sharedOriginFeatures.length) {
    e.target.selectFeaturesForPathDisplay(e.sharedOriginFeatures, pathSelectionTypeSelect.value);
  }
  if (e.sharedDestinationFeatures.length) {
    e.target.selectFeaturesForPathDisplay(e.sharedDestinationFeatures, pathSelectionTypeSelect.value);
  }
}

```

Figure 26: Creating listener events for mouse-input.

Figure 26 depicts how Leaflet is instructed to listen for user interaction events.

Depending on what the user presses or selects, it changes how the data is displayed on the Leaflet map. This allows the user to either create new visualizations for each interaction or add/subtract nodes to an existing map. This is done by referring to values specified in the Canvas-Flowmap-Layer JavaScript library, “SELECTION_NEW,” “SELECTION_ADD,” and “SELECTION_SUBTRACT.”¹⁹⁹

¹⁹⁹ This was borrowed and modified from the original Canvas-Flowmap-Layer code.

Example .CSV Data from Magazine Collections Map

	A	B	C	D	E	F	G	H	I	J	K		M	N
1	s_city_id	s_city	s_lat	s_lon	s_comp	s_country	e_city_id	e_City	e_lat	e_lon	e_comp	e_country	year	collection
2	1	New York	40.7128	-74.006	AI Urban	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
3	2	Los Angeles	34.0522	-118.244	Art-Bob	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
4	3	Norfolk	36.8508	-76.2859	Artcraft	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
5	4	Los Angeles	34.0522	-118.244	Athletic M	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
6	5	New Haven	41.3083	-72.9279	BC/T Stud	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
7	6	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Bond	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
8	7	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Brett	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
9	8	Los Angeles	34.0522	-118.244	Bruce	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
10	9	San Francisco	37.7749	-122.419	CAL Mode	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
11	10	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Cas	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
12	11	New York	40.7128	-74.006	Champion	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
13	12	Toronto	43.6532	-79.3832	Cox	Canada	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
14	13	Bellmore	40.6687	-73.5271	Emerald	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
15	14	Erie	42.1292	-80.0851	F.L. Collie	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
16	15	Sundbyby	59.3829	17.9645	Foto-Graf	Sweden	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
17	16	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Fotolit	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
18	17	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Galaxy Stu	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
19	18	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Graham	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
20	19	New York	40.7128	-74.006	Hale Studi	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
21	20	Tampa	27.9506	-82.4572	Halv Studi	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
22	21	Edinburgh	55.9533	-3.1883	Hoffman	Scotland	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
23	22	Brooklyn	40.6782	-73.9442	Jack Sidne	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
24	23	Munich	48.1351	11.582	Jan Eyck	Germany	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
25	24	Nice	43.7102	7.262	Jean Ferré	France	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
26	25	Hollywood	34.0928	-118.329	Ken Photc	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
27	26	Chicago	41.8781	-87.6298	Kris Studi	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
28	27	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Lanza	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
29	28	Seattle	47.6062	-122.332	MacLane S	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
30	29	Hollywood	34.0928	-118.329	Mark Nixc	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
31	30	Lachine	45.4413	-73.6886	Mark-One	Canada	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
32	31	Henderso	37.8362	-87.59	Matt's	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
33	32	Connectic	41.6032	-73.0877	Michaud	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
34	33	Los Angeles	34.0522	-118.244	Milo	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
35	34	San Francisco	37.7749	-122.419	Modern C	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
36	35	Manchest	53.4808	-2.2426	Pagan	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
37	36	New York	40.7128	-74.006	Photograp	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
38	37	New York	40.7128	-74.006	Plato	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
39	38	Phoenix	33.4484	-112.074	Quaintanc	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
40	39	Los Angeles	34.0522	-118.244	Ralph Kell	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
41	40	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Royale	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
42	41	Bettendor	41.5263	-90.5073	Saxon	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
43	42	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Scott Phot	England	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
44	43	Hollywood	34.0928	-118.329	Spartan	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	
45	44	Cincinnati	39.1031	-84.512	Spectrum	USA	434	London	51.5074	-0.1278	Male Clas: England	undated	brown	

Figure 27: Example .CSV Data

Cross-Origin Resource Sharing (CORS)

During the development of the map for the magazine collections, none of the points or lines processed by PapaParse and rendered in Leaflet would load. Typical troubleshooting did not remedy the issue: there were no misplaced commas, brackets, or braces that would break the code. The code should have functioned, and the map should have appropriately displayed. After hours of painstaking review (and re-review) of the code, investigating the browser console error log proved fruitful with the following error message, “Origin `http://localhost` is not allowed by Access-Control-Allow-Origin.”

The original (functioning) CanvasFlowMapLayer demonstration file was directing Leaflet to load .CSV files that were hosted online. This loaded the map, points, and lines correctly. The modified version, although correctly coded, directed Leaflet to load local .CSV files. Technically, this should function as directed, but a browser-based security measure, Cross-Origin Resource Sharing (CORS) prohibits that. CORS, in short, “restrict[s] cross-origin HTTP requests initiated from within scripts.”²⁰⁰

The simplest but least secure method to remedy this error is to disable it from the internet browser security options. However, the security function is implemented for a reason. Disabling this security option opens a browser to script-based HTTP requests from any website. Furthermore, this method might work for testing a local iteration of the map, but would not for online versions of the map.²⁰¹

²⁰⁰ “Cross-Origin Resource Sharing (CORS),” MDN Web Docs, n.d., <https://developer.mozilla.org/en-US/docs/Web/HTTP/CORS>.

²⁰¹ The CORS error would be entirely negated if the maps were online, with Leaflet being directed to load .CSV data from an online directory. This stage of the project was ‘proof-of-concept’ and therefore not appropriate to be published online.

An alternative solution was to implement a locally-hosted web server. This allowed local files to be loaded from the same origin and negated the CORS error without compromising security. Surprisingly, a Google Chrome extension, “Web Server for Chrome” fulfills this function. Web Server for Chrome “is an open source (MIT) HTTP server for Chrome [that] serves web pages from a local folder over the network.”²⁰² Web Server for Chrome is lightweight, simple to install and use, and works offline. After installing Web Server for Chrome and revising the code to reflect a new directory infrastructure, the CORS issue was resolved.

²⁰² Chromebeat, “Web Server for Chrome,” n.d., <https://www.chromebeat.com/app/web-server-for-chrome>.