The conflation of health and beauty in advertising: A critical multimodal discourse analysis of three television commercials

by

Andrea Noriega

A thesis submitted to the Faculty of Graduate and Postdoctoral Affairs in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

in

Applied Linguistics and Discourse Studies

Carleton University
Ottawa, Ontario

© 2012, Andrea Noriega
NOTICE:
The author has granted a non-exclusive license allowing Library and Archives Canada to reproduce, publish, archive, preserve, conserve, communicate to the public by telecommunication or on the Internet, loan, distribute and sell theses worldwide, for commercial or non-commercial purposes, in microform, paper, electronic and/or any other formats.

The author retains copyright ownership and moral rights in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author’s permission.

In compliance with the Canadian Privacy Act some supporting forms may have been removed from this thesis.

While these forms may be included in the document page count, their removal does not represent any loss of content from the thesis.
Abstract

This study applies a critical multimodal discourse analysis to three television commercials: 1) Neutrogena ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’, 2) Colgate ‘Advanced Total whitening toothpaste’ and 3) Danone ‘Activia probiotic yogurt’. In order to gain further insight into how advertising discourses can shape body image ideologies, this study sets out to investigate how television commercials construct a relationship between health and beauty. This research includes analysis of both the visual and the verbal modes, drawing on Systemic Functional Linguistics, Critical Discourse Analysis, Multimodal Discourse Analysis, and Inter-mode relations. The findings are discussed in terms of the theories of healthism discourse and aestheticization of everyday life. In addition, Pierre Bourdieu’s concepts of habitus, lifestyle, taste, capital, and field will be used to discuss how the health-beauty consolidation is recursively produced and reproduced by society and its members. The results of this study suggest that there is a colonization of the advertising non-health related products under healthism discourse, and this type of advertising is co-occurring with ideologies of the body beautiful resulting in an unprecedented consolidation between the concepts of health and beauty. These findings underscore the need for media literacy and hence the importance of practicing and also teaching discourse analysis approaches such as SFL, CDA, and MDA that are designed to expose ideological underpinnings.
Acknowledgements

It is with great enthusiasm that I would like to extend my sincerest thanks to all the wonderful people who have helped and supported me in this project. I am indebted to and extremely grateful for my relentlessly supportive thesis supervisor, Dr. Jaffer Sheyholislami, who has always encouraged me to persevere and who has served as an incredibly inspiring mentor and coach. I cannot express how profoundly appreciative I am of his dedication and devotion to my academic success for without his encouragement I would surely not have come this far. I am also very thankful to Dr. Lynne Young for her continuous support and advice. In addition, I would like to thank Dr. Ariel Fuenzalida from the Anthropology Department for kindly giving his time and valuable input.

I am fortunate to have been surrounded by the incredible staff and faculty in the School of Linguistics and Language Studies during all my years at Carleton. I would like to thank our wonderful administrator Joan Grant who has always made herself available and aided me through the entire graduate student experience. In addition I would like to thank my classmates and now friends for not only sharing this experience with me but always being there when I needed them.

This character building experience could not however have been possible without the undying love and support of my family and friends. A very warm and special thanks to my mother and father for having gotten me this far and who have always encouraged my education, and to my loving partner and all my patient friends who always have and continue to stand by me. And finally, I would like to thank my grandparents, you are always my inspiration.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .......................................................................................................................................... ii  
Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................... iii  
Table of Contents ........................................................................................................................ iv  
List of Figures ............................................................................................................................. vii  

1 Chapter: Introduction .......................................................................................................... 1  
   1.1 Statement of the problem .................................................................................................. 2  
   1.2 Analytical approach .......................................................................................................... 4  
   1.3 Research questions ........................................................................................................... 5  
   1.4 An interdisciplinary approach .......................................................................................... 6  
   1.5 Thesis map ........................................................................................................................ 7  

2 Chapter: Literature review and theoretical framework ............................................. 9  
   2.1 Introduction ..................................................................................................................... 9  
   2.2 Health as a social construct .............................................................................................. 9  
      2.2.1 Health and appearance in media and consumer culture ............................................. 14  
   2.3 Beauty and the body, a social construct ......................................................................... 15  
      2.3.1 Aestheticization of the body ....................................................................................... 17  
   2.4 The body and the social reproduction of health and beauty .......................................... 19  
      2.4.1 Capital ....................................................................................................................... 19  
      2.4.2 Field ........................................................................................................................... 21  
      2.4.3 Habitus ...................................................................................................................... 24  
      2.4.4 Lifestyle ..................................................................................................................... 26  
      2.4.5 Taste ........................................................................................................................... 27  
   2.5 Advertising, ideology, and discourse analysis ............................................................... 31
List of Figures

Figure 1 – Overlap between health and aesthetics in the field of body maintenance ...... 22
Figure 2 - Iedema’s Six Levels of Television/Film Analysis (Iedema, 2001, p.189) ...... 41
Figure 3 - Coding Orientations (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.165) ......................... 46
Figure 4 – Modality marker scale (from Kress & van Leeuwen (2006, p.160) ............ 47
Figure 5 – Image-Text Relations chart (van Leeuwen, 2005, p.230) .............................. 49
Figure 6 - Visual elements summary chart ...................................................................... 52
Figure 7 - Neutrogena commercial .................................................................................. 55
Figure 8 - Visual elements summary chart ...................................................................... 59
Figure 9 - Colgate commercial ......................................................................................... 60
Figure 10 - Colgate commercial ....................................................................................... 62
Figure 11 - Visual elements summary chart ..................................................................... 65
Figure 12 - Danone commercial ....................................................................................... 67
Figure 13 - Danone commercial ....................................................................................... 69
1 Chapter: Introduction

In order to better understand the social construction of body image, this thesis is dedicated to exploring how the concepts of health and beauty may be consolidated in the multimodal texts of advertising. The underlying hypothesis for this consolidation is that aestheticization (Welsch, 1996; Featherstone, 2007) and healthism (Crawford, 2006; Rose, 2001) are being reproduced in advertising (Featherstone, 1991; Lupton, 1995; Crawford, 2006) and are therefore creating a new understanding of what it means to be healthy and beautiful. Aestheticization refers to the process by which the previously non-aesthetic becomes aestheticized (Welsch, 1996, p.7). In the context of this study, aestheticization is understood as the phenomenon through which advertised products are framed as gateways to achieving beauty. Healthism refers to the health movement in contemporary Western culture which espouses ideologies of proactive and self-regulated health practice (Crawford, 2006; Rose 2001; Rysst 2010; Lupton, 2003). In addition, healthism is about a 'new health consciousness’ (Crawford, 2006), a contemporary social awakening which values behaviours and practices geared toward achieving and maintaining health and healthy living. Advertising is not exempted from this trend, lending itself to “an ever-expanding consumer culture of health products and services” (Crawford, 2006, p.415). Both Featherstone (1991) and Lupton (1995) have noted that the concepts of health and beauty have been adopted by advertising and consumer culture. Consequently, being healthy is understood as being beautiful, and vice versa (Featherstone, 1991, p.171). This study is designed to illustrate how this consolidation is achieved in advertising by applying a multimodal analytical approach (Kress & van
Leeuwen, 2006; Machin, 2007; Jewitt, 2009), and borrowing analytical strategies from both critical discourse analysis (Wodak, 2001a, 2006; Fairclough 1989, 1992) and systemic functional linguistics (Halliday 2003; Eggins, 2004).

In what follows I will first discuss the issue that motivated this study. Then, after presenting a brief overview of the research gap I will outline my research questions. Next I will briefly explain my data and method of analysis, and finally, I will provide a brief summary of the chapters contained in this thesis.

1.1 Statement of the problem

There is a fundamental issue with this association between health and beauty. If beauty is believed to be a marker of health, then an individual’s health can be greatly undersold. It is as if to judge a book by its cover. Conversely, if health is believed to manifest itself as beauty, then less aesthetic physical attributes may be seen as ‘unhealthy’ or diseased. This creates at least two social issues: 1) beauty ideologies that influence the conceptualization of health, and 2) health ideologies that influence the conceptualization of beauty. The implications of the first situation may be biased medical perspectives. One example of this is the vilification of obesity and how ideological thought on body image can infiltrate medical opinion (Monaghan et al., 2010). According to Monaghan et al. (2010), research on obesity is not entirely conclusive, and instead, medical opinions regarding the ills of obesity may be more influenced by social ideology than actual medical evidence (p.39). The implications for the second situation may be misguided attempts at achieving an appearance that is aligned with how a healthy body ought to look. An example of this would be body dysmorphia and disordered eating (Lemma, 2009). Interestingly, there has been a great deal of research on how the media endorses a
thin body ideal that ultimately encourages an unhealthy, ill, and anorexic appearance (Kilbourne, 1994; Groesz et al., 2002; Dittmar and Howard, 2004; Lemma, 2009; Gracia-Arnaiz, 2010; Halliwell & Dittmar, 2004, 2005). Attention has been focused on how the media constructs and perpetuates images of beauty that idealize ‘unhealthy’ looking bodies. This has been a battle with a clear, straightforward objective; to dismantle the discourses which represent beauty in an unhealthy way. This begs the question: what about discourses which represent beauty as ‘healthy’? Although there has been academic literature critiquing and commenting on ‘health’ as a marketing strategy to sell health related products such as pharmaceuticals, under the pretence of aiming to improve public health (e.g. Atherly & Rubin, 2009; Brennan et al., 2010; Fisher & Ronald, 2010), there seems to be little research being done on ‘health’ as a marketing strategy to sell non ‘health’ related products such as cosmetics. Additionally, in spite of the ‘healthy lifestyle’ being a pervasive part of current Western culture (Crawford, 2006) there is still an obvious need for critical investigation of the proliferation of the ‘new health consciousness’. The gap of research in the area of health advertising for non-health related products is worrying, and may also suggest the extent to which the use of ‘health’ as a marketing strategy has become a normalized part of daily life (Crawford, 2006). According to Fairclough (1989), when ways of seeing, behaving and believing become part of common sense assumptions they are ‘naturalized’ and become ideologies that are no longer questioned (p.92). Critically investigating ideologies helps make them more transparent and as a result bring about awareness about their socio-cultural significance. The ideology of ‘health’ as part of daily life (Crawford, 2006), thus requires critical
investigation in order to denaturalize not only its use in marketing, but also its association with ideologies of beauty and ideal body-image.

The goal of this thesis is therefore to show how ideologies of beauty and ideologies of health are consolidated through multimodal discourses of advertising. More specifically, I aim to investigate the relationship between health and beauty in advertising by analyzing three television commercials: 1) Neutrogena – ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’, 2) Colgate – ‘Advanced Total Whitening’ toothpaste, and 3) Danone – ‘Activia’ probiotic yogurt (see CD for all three video clips). These commercials were selected to help illustrate how a relationship between health and beauty can occur in different contexts, but also in varying degrees of explicitness. The Neutrogena ad directly pertains to beauty as it is a cosmetics product, and serves as an explicit example of the discursive juxtapositioning of health and beauty. The Colgate ad is more ambiguous as dental care can oscillate between both health (e.g. dental hygiene) and beauty (e.g. white teeth). Finally, the Danone ad is the least explicit as yogurt is not necessarily a beauty or health product.

With these commercials, I aim to show how a relationship between health and beauty could be visually and discursively constructed in advertising. This study does not however aim to find trends in a particular kind of commercial or a particular kind of product, it is instead to shed light on the potential for advertising to create a relationship between health and beauty.

1.2 Analytical approach

In order to investigate how the relationship between health and beauty is constructed, I will deploy multimodal analysis (Kress & van Leeuwen 2006; Machin, 2007; Jewitt,
According to Kress (2003), we live in a visual age: images are ubiquitous modes of communication permeating several facets of daily life (Fairclough, 1989). Understanding how these images convey meaning requires a literacy of visual grammar (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006). Furthering this, it may in fact be necessary to turn our attention to the visual mode as it has been suggested in research that images may be more affective in the imprinting of information into memory than the verbal mode alone (Kozma, 1991, p.191; Parkin, 2009). It is for this reason that I have chosen to focus primarily on the visual mode. This will entail a greater degree of detail in the visual analysis, as well as an image-based approach to the inter-mode analysis. Additionally, focusing on the visual mode will help provide evidence to support the value of visual literacy (Kress, 2003; Kress & van Leeuwen 2006; Kozma, 1991, p.191; Parkin, 2009).

1.3 Research questions

The overarching research questions that motivate this study are: Does advertising play a role in constructing a relationship between health and beauty, and if so, how does it do this? Do ideologies of health and ideologies of beauty co-occur in advertising and to what extent do these ideologies overlap to create new meanings for health and beauty? What are the social implications of associating health with beauty (and vice versa)? More specifically, my analysis will be guided by the following questions: How are health and beauty represented in both the verbal and visual modes of communication? What are the inter-mode relationships concerning health and beauty, and how do they work to
consolidate the two concepts? The discussion chapter however will address more of the social issues involved with discursive and semiotic association between health and beauty.

1.4 An interdisciplinary approach

My approach is interdisciplinary in that it is startled between at least two main areas of investigation: that of discourse analysis, and that of medical anthropology. While the literature review and theoretical framework outline theories pursued within the study of medical anthropology, the methodology and analytical approach is built entirely on the foundation of discourse analysis. As will be discussed further in later sections, the socially relevant theories that motivate this research include the concepts of healthism, molecularization, aestheticization, the body beautiful, and the place of health and beauty in advertising and consumer culture. It is within the discussion of these concepts that the core of the issue at hand, that is, the shaping of body image ideals within advertising, can be revealed. Furthering this however is the discussion of Pierre Bourdieu’s concepts of capital, field, lifestyle, habitus, and taste, which provide a cogent conceptualization of the social systems and social functions that serve to produce and reproduce ideologies. However in order to tangibly investigate the phenomena of the health-beauty association noted by such prominent scholars as Mike Featherstone and Deborah Lupton, it becomes necessary to deploy an analytical approach which is designed to tap in to the ideological nuances of discourses and texts such as television commercials. The discipline of discourse analysis provides access to analytical approaches that are engineered to unearth and reveal the ideological underpinnings of texts and discourses. Within this area of investigation influential scholars such as Norman Fairclough, Ruth Wodak, Gunther
Kress, and Theo van Leeuwen, have quite literally paved the way for this type of study: that is, critically analyzing the verbal and visual modes of communication, both separately and in relation to each other. Moreover, a significant amount of study in the area of discourse analysis has revolved around deconstructing advertising and media discourse. Bringing together the disciplines of medical anthropology and discourse analysis can therefore allow a rich and meaningful investigation of not only how ads construct and perpetuate body image ideals, but also how those ideals can be regenerated within society in what is ultimately an ongoing dialectic between discourse and society. Shedding light on this cycle creates awareness of the need for literacy in reading ads, as well as the urgent need to address the propagation of potentially threatening body image ideologies.

1.5 Thesis map

The organization of this thesis includes five more chapters. Chapter two is the literature review and theoretical framework. There, I will discuss how the concept of health in Western culture has changed over the past several decades, moving from an organ-based understanding of health to a more scientific and molecular-level understanding of health. I continue by discussing healthism and the move toward a ‘new health consciousness’ in advertising. This moves into a brief overview of aesthetics and the role of beauty in advertising. This chapter also covers the concepts of Pierre Bourdieu: capital, field, habitus, taste and lifestyle, which will be leveraged to gain insight into how ideologies are generated, reproduced, and ultimately imprinted on the body. Finally, the chapter will outline the analytical theories that will guide the analysis (i.e. Multimodal Discourse
Analysis, Inter-mode analysis, Critical Discourse Analysis, and Systemic Functional Linguistics).

Chapter 3 outlines the data and method of analysis. The three selected commercials will be introduced and the selection process will be explained. In addition, the analytical tools will each be defined and discussed under the headings of: systemic functional linguistics, multimodal discourse analysis, and finally, inter-mode relations.

Chapter 4 is the analysis and findings. The three commercials will be discussed separately as three different cases. The organization within each case will include a brief description of the data (as it is contained in the charts of the corresponding appendix), a verbal mode analysis, a visual mode analysis, and finally an inter-mode relations analysis. The chapter closes with a short overview of the findings mantled on Fairclough's framework for the ideological work of advertisements.

Chapter 5 is the discussion and conclusion. Here I will return to the theories outlined in Chapter 2 and consider the findings in relation to the concepts of healthism, aestheticization, and the concepts of Bourdieu. In addition to this, I will briefly outline the limitations of the study and suggest some possibilities for future research in this area. Finally, this chapter will conclude the thesis with a summary.
2 Chapter: Literature review and theoretical framework

2.1 Introduction

This chapter will discuss health as a concept, tracing a history of how it has come to be understood in contemporary Western culture, and how it has come to hold hands with beauty on the stage of media and advertising. Then I will discuss beauty as a concept, and outline how aesthetics of the body have to play a pervasive role in how beauty is understood and appreciated. Next I discuss the concepts of health and beauty, through Bourdieu's concepts of capital, field, habitus, lifestyle, and, taste. Finally, I will discuss discourse and advertising in terms of linguistic theories including critical discourse analysis (CDA), multimodal discourse analysis (MDA), and Fairclough’s framework for the ideological work of advertisements. These are theories which will furnish my theoretical framework.

2.2 Health as a social construct

Can health be defined, and if so, how has it been defined? It has been suggested in Boorse (1977) that health is the normative set of functions within a given organism. However the idea of health as a ‘normative’ function renders that which deviates from the norm as diseased. Boorse argues that health and illness are in effect, polarized opposites, lamenting that the definition of one (i.e. either health or illness) is thus dependent on the other (1977, p.542-3). He believes that the concepts of health and illness lie on opposite ends of a spectrum, and that the absence of disease has often been used to define ‘health’ (Boorse, 1977, p.542). Korp (2010) confirms this observation. He claims that in traditional medical discourse health was understood as the “absence of medical
conditions” (p.802); whereas the contemporary understanding of ‘health’ seems to be that health is an instrument for achieving goals put forth in social life (Korp, 2010, p.802). Boorse (1977) does however acknowledge that aspects of the concept of health are also value-laden. He argues that ‘health’, and being ‘healthy’, is a desirable state, and that physical conditions which interfere with ‘health’ are thus undesirable (Boorse, 1977, p.544). Not all conditions which interfere with ‘health’ are necessarily a disease however. Some conditions, Boorse implies, are value-laden and include physical characteristics such as strength, speed, and beauty (1977, p.544). Although Boorse’s overall argument advocates a value-free (bio-medical) definition of ‘health’, he acknowledges that values also play a role in defining it. This may shed light on how what is valued as ‘beautiful’ may become interwoven with what we understand as ‘healthy’. With a more social consideration for health, the World Health Organization (WHO) has defined health as “a state of complete physical, mental and social well-being and not merely the absence of disease or infirmity” (World Health Organization, 2006, p.1; Lupton, 1995, p.69). However this definition has been critiqued for being too circular, as it would require an established understanding of what is meant by ‘well-being’ (Law & Widdows, 2008, p.304; Hamilton, 2010). There is, therefore, still debate surrounding the definition of ‘health’ (Law & Widdows, 2008).

According to Crawford (2006), health, at least as an aspect of contemporary culture, is socially defined and constructed (p.405). As a concept, ‘health’ belongs to a constantly changing discourse that carves out the moralities of what is healthy, and who is healthy (Lupton, 1995, p.69). How we understand and value health and health promoting practices is therefore always subject to change, both across cultures and over
time. Rose (2001) outlines how health as a medical and also social concept has developed over the 19th and 20th century, going from a clinical understanding of the body at the level of organs and flesh, to a molecular understanding of the body (p.13). This, he explains, has been married with a much more scientific understanding of health and medicine. Science began to inform not only what could be classified as diseased, but also what is considered a valid medicine for treating these diseases (p.14). Rose refers to the shift toward a molecular understanding of health science as 'molecularization', arguing that the body has come to be understood at the level of the molecule. He argues that molecularization has spread into other areas of social practice including health maintenance and the engineering of products that aim to aid health at a molecular level (2006, p.16). Rose contends that in contemporary Western culture, molecularization has colonized everyday life. In other words, understanding health through the ‘sanctity’ of science and as a product of molecular processes has prevailed as a dominant conceptualization of health and daily life. The shift from the clinical to the molecular, and thus scientific (Lupton, 1995, p.16), view of health is only one of the changes that have worked to shape how society presently understands health. Crawford (2006) explains that after the 1960s, personal responsibility for health emerged as the dominant way of thinking about health and the prevention of illness (p.409). According to Crawford, the government sought to reduce health care costs to the state by increasing health promotion and health education. Lying at the center of this was a focus on individuals as the main agents in promoting their own health and preventing their own illness. This focus on personal health, brought into the daily lives of individuals formed what Crawford coined the ‘new health consciousness’.
By the 1970s, the new health consciousness became a health movement that inspired change in how products and services were marketed (Crawford, 2006, p.407). In addition to pharmaceutical companies, enterprises such as food and other retailers could now capitalize on the new health movement that emphasizes awareness of personal health. Public health can now essentially be governed “at a distance” (Rose, 2001, p.6), since what is understood as necessary self-directed health practices is now shaped by social structures lying outside the jurisdiction of the state (Rose 2001; Rysst, 2010, p.72). Marketing and advertising can now pick-up where the state left off, implicitly policing public health through the rhetoric of self-surveillance, personal discipline and self-control (Rose, 2001, p.6). The marketing of public health under healthism discourse has further encouraged personal responsibility for health (Crawford, 2006). Similarly to Crawford (2006) and Rose (2001), Lupton notes that by the 1960s and 1970s there was a major shift in medical perspective, placing pressure on the individual to take charge of their own health (Lupton, 2003, p.92). Taking responsibility for the health of the body through the engagement of body maintenance practices has become central to the new way of thinking about health in contemporary Western culture (p.40).

Moore (2010) suggests that preventative health practices, via healthy choices and healthy lifestyles, is in many ways sanctioned by the state because a preventative preemptive model to health care is ultimately more cost effective for the state’s health care system (p.101). Lupton (1995) also stresses the point that health has come to be viewed as a personal responsibility, and consequently illness is perceived as “draining public resources” (p.73). Being healthy can thus be seen as a ‘way of life’ (Moore, 2010, p.101), or as Korp (2010) describes it, a ‘life-style’. This is a lifestyle wherein asceticism is
equated with 'healthy' choices, and hedonism is equated with 'unhealthy' choices\(^1\). In addition to this dichotomy of healthism, we see the standardization of what constitutes a 'normal' and 'healthy' state of being. Lupton (2003) explains that the 19\(^{th}\) century brought about notions of health as a social standard to which individuals needed to conform in order to be deemed healthy (p.91). The idea of 'normality', and thus also abnormality, took siege of medical perspectives on both personal and public health. Health could now be standardized; a norm could be set and made available for individuals in society to compare themselves to and try to live up to (Lupton, 2003)\(^2\).

These historical changes in the discourse of 'health' have come to shape what is being referred to as 'healthism' (Lupton, 1995, p.69; Crawford, 2006, p.410). Healthism “insists that the maintenance of good health is the responsibility of the individual... [It] represents good health as a personal rational choice... [it is] a potential needful of release by virtue of engagement in certain behaviors or attitudes deemed promoting of good health” (Lupton, 1995, p.70). Crawford (2006) suggests that healthism is part of a new movement of health, which is facilitated through health promotion (Crawford, 2006, p.410).

To summarize, health in contemporary Western culture has come to be defined through at least two major governing concepts: 1) molecularization of the body and medicine, and 2) healthism. Molecularization represents the adoption of scientific opinion

\(^{1}\) I will return to the idea of lifestyle in the section dedicated to Bourdieu's theories.

\(^{2}\) "At the root of the development of the idea of normality is the rise in statistical methods as a process of collecting data from a population. This is the basis for the shift to biopolitics according to Foucault. Statistical methods move the understanding of health as being tied to an individual person to the idea that the population need be healthy...it is an imperative pronounced by the state and the responsible disciplined body responds to this imperative by consuming health products. To be patriotic is in a way the act of forming the healthy body.” (Personal communication with Dr. Fuenzalida, March 13, 2012).
in the conceptualization of the body, health, illness, and the engineering of medicine. Historically, molecularization marks the turn from the clinical body of the 19th century to the molecular, scientifically understood body leading into the 21st century. Healthism represents the historical shift from a state-controlled and mediated health care ideology to a social ideology that pressures individuals to take charge of and monitor their own health. Taking place in the latter half of the 20th century, this change in social attitudes towards health has transferred the onus of health maintenance from the hands of the state into the hands of individual members of society (Raman, 2010, p.719). People are now liable for their own health, and ensuring that they engage in health promoting practices to avoid illness. Failing to abide by self-control and health-focused due-diligence practices makes these members liabilities to society and to the state. Healthism discourses in health promotion and health education therefore work to encourage people to manage their own health and to seek out their own health care practices. This discourse has awoken a 'new health consciousness' in society.

2.2.1 Health and appearance in media and consumer culture

According to Crawford (2006), the 21st century has brought about new health practices and a greater health consciousness that has been greatly informed by advertising. He asserts that the media have been a primary vehicle for health promotion and health education (Crawford, 2006, p.415). Although this has included traditional ideas of health care products and services, Crawford acknowledges that the scope of this commercial culture is "ever-expanding" (ibid). An earlier discussion on health by Lupton (1995) informs us that health promotion have moved across different social spaces into areas of society that traditionally lay outside the traditional reach of the
medical industry (p.51). She states that “[m]ost social issues have become subsumed under the rubric of health” (Lupton, 1995, p.51). This idea of a ‘rubric of health’ may help to conceptualize the expansion of health perspectives into traditionally non-health related social platforms such as consumer culture. The rubric of health may furnish advertising of products and services that have not traditionally been marketed as ‘healthy’ or health related.

According to Featherstone (1991), “the popular media constantly emphasizes the cosmetic benefits of body maintenance” (p.170). Furthering this he argues that positioned as a reward, the results of body work are not about health, but are instead about generating a socially acceptable appearance (Featherstone, 1991, p.171). He explains that “Within consumer culture, the inner and the outer body become conjoined: the prime purpose of the maintenance of the inner body [health] becomes the enhancement of the appearance of the outer body [beauty]” (Featherstone, 1991, p.171). According to Featherstone, in consumer culture, the appearance of the body and the maintenance of the body have become one and the same. Hence, being healthy and looking good are almost synonymous concepts. But what does it mean to look good in our society? In the next section I will discuss the concept of beauty in the context of bodily-appearance.

2.3 Beauty and the body, a social construct

3 “The emphasis upon body maintenance and appearance within consumer culture suggests two basic categories: the inner and the outer body. The inner body refers to the concern with the health and optimum functioning of the body which demands maintenance and repair in the face of disease, abuse and the deterioration accompanying the ageing process. The outer can thus range from demographic and human ecological aspects (Park et al., 1925; Park 1952) down to face-to-face interactions in which appearance, preservation of self and management of impressions (Goffman 1972) become the focus of attention. It can also encompass the organization and surveillance of docile disciplined bodies within social spaces (Foucault 1977; Giddens 1981) as well as the aesthetic dimensions of the body...” (Featherstone, 1991, p.171).
While the previous section described the concept of ‘health’, the current section aims to describe the concept of ‘beauty’. It has been argued that the way we conceptualize beauty in society is biologically driven (Grammer et al., 2003). According to Grammer et al., beauty is part of sexual selection and hence our perception of beauty is a function of this process. They argue that the perception of beauty is universal across cultures and is based on particular characteristics. Interestingly, Grammer et al. argue, one of the biological objectives of beauty is to signal health (Grammer et al., 2003, p.387). But their position to understanding the concept of beauty almost entirely neglects the influence of society. Firstly, the authors themselves fail to be self-reflexive and acknowledge that their assumptions about beauty (i.e. that it is indeed an indicator of health) are socially influenced and mediated. Secondly, the article fails to acknowledge that concepts of beauty are value laden (Reischer & Koo, 2004). According to Reischer and Koo (2004), beauty is subjective and shaped by culture (p.298). Furthering this, they remark on the variances and sometimes diametrically opposing opinions of beauty between different cultures (p.299). They believe that beauty is a product of a hegemonic value-system of the body wherein “beauty becomes an embodied concept that is not simply an articulation of dominant cultural values but also a negotiation of them” (Reischer & Koo, 2004, p.299). The body is therefore a medium onto which values are imposed.

If the point of departure is that beauty is culturally defined, then what does it mean to be beautiful in Western society? Reischer and Koo (2004) explain that the value for self-control and self-discipline in Western culture underpins ideologies4 in favour of a slender body (p.301). In addition, the body must be re-shaped and prevented from

---

4 The relationship between ideology, discourse, and social practice will be further elaborated and discussed in section 2.5 of this literature review.
displaying the signs of aging (p.302). An even more interesting point that is discussed is that Western values on beauty are governed by “white culture” (Reischer & Koo, 2004, p.304). This suggests that beauty is measured up against a Caucasian ideal. These ideals spill over into other facets of social life to shape an overall image of beauty, and an aestheticization of the body.

2.3.1 Aestheticization of the body

I used the term ‘aestheticization’ in the introduction, explaining it as the process by which the previously non-aesthetic becomes aestheticized (Welsch, 1996, p.7). What does this mean in terms of health and beauty? While the aestheticized body suggests a life of glamour, indulgence, and overall hedonism, healthism discourse proposes self control, restraint, and overall asceticism (Featherstone, 1991, p.170). The body is therefore the site where our values can not only be displayed but also assessed by others. For example, the lean, toned physique displays control over what the body consumes, and self-discipline to sculpt the body (Reischer & Koo, 2004). Having excess weight is thus an abomination of the body, as it displays a vulgar and hedonistic lifestyle bereft of self-control (Reischer & Koo, 2004; Featherstone, 1991). Additionally, the aging body is seen as having to be “combated by energetic body maintenance on the part of the individual – with help from the cosmetic, beauty, fitness and leisure industries” (Featherstone, 1991, p.178). The pursuit of the aesthetization of the body would thus require a modified view of hedonism, wherein we are expected to indulge only in those things which facilitate body maintenance: ‘healthy’ food, skin care, dental care, hair care, exercise, etc. (Featherstone 1982; Lupton, 1995). Not participating in body practices that fashion our appearance in a way acceptable to the norm, threatens how others perceive us, and
subjects our so-called deviant physical characteristics to the stigma of what has been culturally deemed unattractive (Goffman, 1963). Members of society who do not fit aesthetic norms are effectively outcasts (Goffman, 1963), and hence, in order to embody the body beautiful, people must submit to physical transformations (Reischer & Koo, 2004).

These transformations include the application and ingestion of products and surgical alternation that could be detrimental to our health, damaging to our physical appearance, and also harmful to our self-esteem and body image identity (Glenn, 2008; Lamkin, 2011; Lemma, 2009; Dittmar & Howard, 2004; Groesz et al., 2002; Reischer & Koo, 2004; Holliday & Carnie, 2007; Featherstone, 2010; Whitehead & Kurz, 2008). Among these forms of body modification is, for example, the use of skin lightening creams which contain chemicals that can seriously damage skin (Glenn, 2008; Lamkin, 2011). Not only is the rhetoric surrounding skin lightening fraught with racist undertones, there are also serious health repercussions with the application of the product. Other examples of how media disseminated body-image ideas that could be threatening to the well-being of members of society are the potential psychological issues of body dysmorphia and disordered eating (Lemma, 2009; Whitehead & Kurz, 2008; Gracia-Arnaiz, 2010). According to a Canadian Government survey in 2002, 1.5% of Canadian women aged 15 – 24 years had an eating disorder; and 1.7% of Canadians aged 15 and over reported symptoms that met the 12-month criteria for an eating attitude problem (Government of Canada, 2006, p.97). These types of issues beg further investigation into the relationship between social discourses, such advertising, and society. The following sections are dedicated to a discussion of how body image ideals can be produced and
reproduced in society and will be guided by Bourdieu’s concepts of *capital*, *field*, *habitus*, *lifestyle*, and *taste*.

2.4 The body and the social reproduction of health and beauty

There have been several scholars who have applied Bourdieu’s theories and concepts to a discussion of the body and the social life by which it is influenced (Dumas et al. 2005, Edwards & Imrie, 2003; Lee & MacDonald, 2010; Warde, 2006; Wainwright & Turner, 2006). These discussions have included areas pertaining to the body and sports, dance, weight, age and so on. Featherstone (1991) also leverages several of Bourdieu’s theories and uses them to discuss both health and beauty and their place in society and in consumer culture. Mantling the health-beauty consolidation discussion on Bourdieu’s concepts of *capital*, *field*, *habitus*, *lifestyle* and *taste* could therefore allow for a richer analysis of how the consolidation is not only an influential force in shaping body-image ideals in society but also shapes advertising and consumer culture. I enter the discussion of Bourdieu’s concepts in relation to health, beauty, and advertising with an overview of ‘capital’ as it will open the stage for further discussion by first allowing me to outline the motivation behind the social adoption of the health=beauty ideal.

2.4.1 Capital

The concept of *capital* can be understood as a resource within an area of social life (Bourdieu, 1992, p.98). A social agent that has more capital than another social agent therefore has more power: it has more ‘resources’ that aid it in a given aspect of social life (p.98). According to Jenkins (1992), Bourdieu identifies four kinds of capital: economic (affluence), social (who you know), cultural (what you know), and symbolic (prestige/honor) (Jenkins, 1992, p. 85). Economic capital is understood as ‘financial
resources’, social capital is understood as relationship, organizational, and network resources, and cultural capital is the rare knowledge and rare skills resources (Holt, 1998, p.3). Holt (1998) outlines that the three forms of capital – economic, social, and cultural – compete for symbolic capital, which he defines as ‘status’ (p.3). The notion of status is further developed by Edwards and Imrie (2003), who believe that “the management of the body is core to the acquisition of status and distinction” (p.240). Thus, the body can also serve as form of capital. The body as capital has been identified as ‘physical capital’. ‘Physical capital’ makes the body a form of capital in itself (Shilling, 1991, p.654). That is, the body is a resource in social life much like money, social connections, knowledge, and status. Wainwright & Turner (2006) argue that physical capital is only secured so long as our bodies are able to embody it (p. 242). In other words, as we age our physical capital declines. Featherstone notes that “within consumer culture the body is proclaimed as a vehicle of pleasure: it is desirable and desiring, and the closer the actual body approximates the idealized images of youth health fitness and beauty the higher its exchange-value” (Featherstone, 1991, p.177). In other words, the more physically ‘attractive’ we are, the more capital we have in social life, and therefore the more power we have (Bourdieu, 1992, p.98).

As suggested in Featherstone (1991), the social construction of beauty with its requirement of a youthful appearance may threaten the physical capital of those who see themselves as aging. However, the threat of losing physical capital may only be a concern for those who do not consider themselves old. Dumas et al. (2005) conducted a qualitative study with women ages 65 to 75, and found that ‘older’ women tended to value norms of beauty “that they believed suited their age group” (p.895). Their focus of
beauty shifted (with age) to more internal characteristics of personality rather than external characteristics of physical attributes. Dumas et al. termed this age based value system “age-habitus” (2005, p.899) – a system of dispositions corresponding to a particular age group. Consequently, their findings suggest that individuals who are ‘old’ are less concerned with bodily appearance, but individuals who are not ‘old’ remain subject to these concerns. The age-habitus may therefore enable different groups in society based on age. If the findings in Dumas et al. (2005) are to be generalized, then there might be a large group of people who are not necessarily ‘old’ who do value a youthful, ‘beautiful’ and ‘healthy’ physical appearance. This may shed some light on the question; ‘why would the association between health and beauty be accepted by consumers of media discourses?’ Perhaps consumers of media discourses accept, and ultimately value, the association between health and beauty because their age-habitus predisposes them to. This may also be understood as physical capital being a valuable resource to a particular age group of society. Ultimately, the value of the capital to be attained is determined by the field.

2.4.2 Field

A field, according to Bourdieu, is a network of positions in social life, wherein social relations are mediated by capital, and thus capital mobilizes and empowers those who have favorable capital (1992, p.97). The field is a site of struggle, wherein the social agents that occupy particular social arenas, compete for positions within a hierarchy (Holt, 1998, p.4; Laughey, 2007, p.190). In other words, the field is a social space that houses a network of social relations. These relations are mediated by forms of capital: social agents who have the forms of capital valued within that field can compete for
higher positions along the hierarchy than social agents with less capital (Bourdieu, 1992, p.98). The boundaries of a field are always up for negotiation, they are not inherently established, and may be challenged or defended by the participants within and around the field (p.100). Bourdieu notes that “the limits of a field are situated at the point where the effects of the field cease” (p.100). In other words, the field can only reach as far as its social agents can have power within it. There are many different fields (Laughey, 2007, p.190), and each field may be comprised of several different subfields (Bourdieu, 1992, p.104). The boundaries of both fields and subfields may therefore be challenged, negotiated, and re-established. Their boundaries may blur or overlap as they compete for social space (p.104).

Figure 1 – Overlap between health and aesthetics in the field of body maintenance

According to Lupton (2003), body maintenance has come not only to mean health care, but also beauty care (p.40). Figure 1 above illustrates how the subfields of healthism (left circle) and beauty aesthetics (right circle) are overlapping to form a new domain in
which health and beauty are conjoined (middle space: H&B). This is occurring however within the field of body maintenance, which is residing as a subfield within the field of consumption. In other words, there is the field of consumption – the social space of consumerism, and within that there are subfields. The subfield shown in this diagram is the sub-field of body maintenance as a function of consumption – that is, the social space within consumerism that is concerned with body maintenance. Finally, within the subfield of body maintenance are several other possible subfields, however the diagram is focusing on healthism and aestheticization and how the two overlap.

Holt (1998) argues that “although cultural capital is articulated in all social fields as an important status resource, it operates in consumption fields through a particular conversion into tastes and consumption practices” (p.4). In terms of the field of body maintenance, cultural capital (i.e. particular knowledge or skills) may be understood as the ability to employ ‘self-discipline’ or ‘self-control’ in monitoring and regulating the practices pertaining to the body such as nutrition and exercise (Lupton, 2003, p.33). High cultural capital in this regard is converted into particular choices and ‘consumption practices’ (e.g. food and athletic choices: where, how, and how often). This could then translate into high physical capital, which may also be empowering in the field of body maintenance. In other words, as it concerns body maintenance, people who can appear to embody the values of the field (e.g. looking fit) have more cultural capital (i.e. more social power) than those who do not embody it. However people do not embody the values of the field indiscriminately; rather it is socially constructed through what they have observed. This can be further understood through what Bourdieu has termed the *habitus*. 
2.4.3 Habitus

The *habitus* is a complex idea that is a fundamental part of Bourdieu's work (Korp, 2010, p.802). It was developed by Bourdieu to try and explain that practices are socially constructed (1992, p.121). Bourdieu explains that social agents do not just internalize available social knowledge indiscriminately; instead their knowledge is constructed by the social practices they observe and engage in (p.121). The habitus is therefore a “system of durable, transposable dispositions” (p.72). It is “the product of history...a past which survives in the present” (p.82). In other words, it is the experiences of our past that shape our habitus, creating dispositions that mediate our present and future practices. In Jenkins (1992), the habitus is described as “an acquired system of generative schemes” (p.74). These schemes function abstractly, residing only in people’s minds, and being realized only through people’s actions (Jenkins, 1992, p.75). The habitus, Jenkins explains, is formed through experience more so than it is through any sort of explicit teaching of it (1992, p.76). That is, the habitus is a set of habits and routines “rather than consciously learned rules and principles” (Jenkins, 1992, p.76). According to Jenkins, the habitus forms dispositions that in turn work to ‘generate’ certain behaviours and/or practices (Jenkins, 1992, p.78). The habitus is therefore in a dialectical relationship with practices. That is, the habitus works to produce practices, and practices work to reproduce and reinforce the habitus (Jenkins, 1992, p.80). The habitus not only serves as a generative system of practices, it also functions as a means for perceiving and appreciating practices of other social agents (Bourdieu, 1984, p.170). That is, the habitus not only works to produce behaviors, it also allows us to recognize and
appreciate those behaviors in others. It shapes how we perceive the world and distinguish between the different types of social practices of others (Bourdieu, 1984, p170).

According to Featherstone (1991), the habitus is not only internalized as knowledge, it is also externalized as embodiment: it is “inscribed onto the body and made apparent in body size, volume, demeanor, way of eating, drinking, walking, sitting, speaking, making gestures, etc” (p.123). The body is therefore the vehicle through which the habitus is expressed. The way the body looks is a representation of our habitus. In other words, our physical appearance is telling of the types of ideologies we have internalized, and the types of practices we engage in. In terms of the association between health and beauty, our bodies, our physical appearances, and our practices demonstrate our habitus. In turn, those practices, as perceived by others, work to reinforce not only our own habitus, but also the habitus of those who witness the products of our habitus. Bourdieu refers to the recursivity between practices and habitus as a “structured and structuring structure” (Bourdieu, 1984, p.171). In other words, the structure of body image in a society structures the practices that it produces - consequently, those are also the practices which reinforce it. The habitus is shared by members of a group, a culture, or class (Hinde & Dixon, 2007, p.413). Thus, the practices of the members within that group shape and reinforce the habitus of the rest of the members of that group. This is almost to say that social practice is catching: it spreads across a group through the perceptions and practices of its members. Hence, the body-image ideologies of Western culture are subject to being reproduced by Western advertising, which in turn reinforces body-image ideologies of Western society. After all, advertising is not just about selling products, but also lifestyles (Lemke, 2009; Williamson, 1978; Featherstone, 1991).
2.4.4 Lifestyle

Lifestyles are constituted by the set of practices our habitus generates (Bourdieu, 1984). In Bourdieu's words, lifestyles are "the systematic products of the habitus" (1984, p.171). That is, lifestyles are the end result of the collective practices generated by the habitus. Lifestyles are translated into various spaces: these spaces include our bodies, our wardrobes, our food choices, and so on (Bourdieu, 1984, p.172). The practices we engage in within these spaces identify us as members of a group of people who share the same lifestyle (p.172). As discussed in the previous section, habitus is not only individual; it is also shared by a group of people. For Bourdieu (1984) these groups are determined by social class; however in Dumas et al. (2005) it is argued that different groups may be determined by age (p.899), and in Hinde and Dixon (2007) it is suggested that a group may also be culturally determined (p.413). Different groups entail different lifestyles. Likewise, members of the same group share similar values, and thus have similar lifestyles. Members of the same culture, as indicated in Hinde and Dixon (2007), share the same habitus, and therefore are predisposed to valuing and enacting similar lifestyles. Featherstone (1991) suggests that a 'consumer culture' is part of contemporary life, and thus also part of contemporary lifestyles. Consumer culture, he explains, involves "the aestheticization of reality" (p.58). This may also be understood as the perversion of the real world into a 'dream world' (Machin & Thornborrow, 2003). Products that were once positioned as valuable for their use are now positioned as valuable for their appearance (Featherstone, 1991). The value of aesthetic in consumer culture is translated to bodily appearance, among other facets of social life (p.59). In terms of the association between
health and beauty in the media, consumer culture may play a pivotal role in their association.

Bourdieu argues that lifestyles act as sign systems in social life, and as such are subject to being qualified as good or bad – as "distinguished" or "vulgar" (1984, p.171). This allows for discussion of ‘lifestyle’ as something that can have social value, as desirable or as undesirable. Returning to the issue of health and beauty, it could be understood that the lifestyles which support the health-beauty association (e.g. exercising to be thin) may be seen as desirable by members of consumer culture. Whereas lifestyles that do not reflect the values of the habitus that supports the health-beauty association may be seen as undesirable or even vulgar (e.g. obesity and sloth). Essentially, the distinction between lifestyles, practices, and social products, is in effect a matter of judgment, or as Bourdieu has termed it, ‘taste’.

2.4.5 Taste

According to Bourdieu (1984), lifestyles are constructed through taste: that is, the scheme of preferences that leads us to appreciate and engage in certain practices over others (p.174). Our lifestyles are therefore a product of the tastes that are fostered by our habitus. The habitus is comprised of two capacities: 1) the capacity to generate practices that can be ‘appreciated’ in the social world, and 2) the capacity to ‘appreciate’ practices which occur in the social world (Bourdieu, 1984, p.170). Here, the notion of appreciation directly refers to taste: both the taste as concerns which practices we value in others, and taste determining which practices we engage in ourselves. As part of the habitus, taste works to generate lifestyle (Bourdieu, 1984, p.173). It is the mechanism through which we classify practices and through which our practices can be classified by others.
Practices and lifestyles are therefore representations of the tastes which constitute our habitus.

Philips (2005) argues that television programs, namely home makeover reality shows, construct "taste-makers" by showcasing the taste of 'experts' (p.214). The term 'taste-maker', as borrowed from Bourdieu (1984), refers to the social actors who are in a position to influence and endorse tastes and lifestyles (Philips, 2005, p.214). The media thus acts as a platform through which alleged 'experts' can promote so called desirable lifestyles and tastes. The field of media advertising can thus be understood as an avenue through which taste-makers disseminate taste and convert it into a consumable product.

Bourdieu discusses taste in terms of supply and demand – or – production and consumption. He admits that the production of taste cannot function independently from already existing taste (1984, p.230). That is to say, in order for taste to be adopted by consumers, it needs to be, to some extent, pre-existing as part of the habitus of the consumer so that they may accept it. Bourdieu argues that products of taste are often designed by professionals who turn taste into a consumable product (ibid). The taste-maker takes taste out of the abstract (habitus) and into the concrete (lifestyle) (Bourdieu, 1984, p. 230), making way for the commodification of taste (Philips, 2005, p.224). The products that are created by taste in turn serve to perpetuate and reshape taste in the society in which they were fostered (Bourdieu, 1984, p.230). Hence, the tastes for (i.e. the preference for and appreciation of) health promoting products must grow out of a pre-existing value for health. As discussed in an earlier section, healthism in Western society pushes individuals to take charge of and value their own health. However simply being healthy is not enough. The taste for health promoting products is also intertwined with
tastes for outward bodily appearance (Featherstone, 1991). In the media, the experts (or spokespeople) who promote particular products, not only endorse particular products, they are effectively endorsing the health-beauty lifestyle.

A relatively contemporary yet very powerful means for packaging taste is through television (Bourdieu, 1996; Featherstone, 1991). Bourdieu (1996) discusses the power of television in terms of journalistic reporting. However some of the ideas presented in this book involve other facets of television as well. Bourdieu claims that images have the capacity to produce the "reality effect" (p.21). He argues that they present ideas, which can thus influence people and groups of people to adopt or be motivated by these ideas (Bourdieu, 1996, p.21). Also, like reporting which is "putting on record" (p.21) images and ideas, other television media such as commercials, movies, sitcoms, and so on, can put images and ideas 'on record' as well. Bourdieu argues that putting images, and thus ideas, on record creates a social construction of reality (p.21). This leads him to conclude that "television, which claims to record reality, creates it instead" (Bourdieu, 1996, p.22). In other words, television contributes to the construction of social products and values, ultimately shaping and influencing the habitus of the viewing public.

Featherstone argues that "images invite comparisons: they are constant reminders of what we are and what we might with effort yet become" (1991, p.178). He claims that images make people conscious of their appearance and of their "bodily presentation" (Featherstone, 1991, p.179). The question; 'why would the association between health and beauty be accepted by consumers of media discourses?' may be addressed here. If media images portray health as a product of taste, that is, as an area of life that is directly inscribed on the body (in other words, the association between health and beauty), then
consumers may become not only more aware of the way they look, but also more concerned about how their taste is reflected through their physical appearance.

As discussed in earlier sections, habitus, lifestyle, and taste, are all represented through and on the body, and as such are on display to be judged and classified by others. Others who share our habitus, share our sense of what is valuable and desirable, and what is ugly and profane through our shared sense of taste (Bourdieu, 1984). Looking ‘beautiful’ can therefore be understood as a reflection of the practices we choose in order to preserve our ‘health’. The importance of physical appearance, Featherstone argues, is a relatively new phenomenon. He attributes the social value of ‘looking good’ to post 1920’s Hollywood cinema. Featherstone explains that “Hollywood publicized the new consumer culture values and projected images of the glamorous celebrity lifestyle to a worldwide audience” (1991, p. 179). The portrayal of celebrity images and celebrity lifestyles is therefore, according to Featherstone, part and parcel of contemporary consumer culture. Furthering this, he notes that:

Within consumer culture, advertisements, the popular press, television and motion pictures, provide a proliferation of stylized images of the body. In addition, the popular media constantly emphasizes the benefits of body maintenance. The reward for aesthetic body work ceases to be spiritual salvation, or even improved health, but becomes an enhanced appearance and more marketable self (Featherstone, 1991, p. 170-1).

Here, Featherstone explains that the media markets body image. In terms of health and beauty, the media constructs an image for ‘body maintenance’ that may not even be necessarily grounded in health. Instead, as Featherstone suggests, body maintenance is commodified by the media (Miller & Rose, 1997). Talbot (2007) argues that we are affected by media discourses such as advertising, mostly because they are so prevalent in our society (p. 3). Similarly, Sender (2001) points out that the media educates people
through the texts it produces – and therefore informs consumers of the “appropriate 
cultivation of tastes and knowledge’s” (p.76). One of the main means of informing 
consumers in a capitalist society is advertising.

2.5 Advertising, ideology, and discourse analysis

Language and society exist in a dialectical relationship wherein one shapes, influences, 
and reinforces the other (Fairclough, 1989, p.23). In other words, society affects 
language, but language affects society. Social products, such as advertisements are sites 
where language and society intersect, with ideologies both being produced by and 
reproduced in the ad (Fairclough, 1989). According to Kress (1987), advertising is the 
“institution which is central to processes of cultural (re)production” (Kress, 1987, p.131). 
Ultimately, ads sell more than products, they sell lifestyles (Williamson, 1978) and 
identities (Lemke, 2009). Ideological versions of how a person’s life ought to be.

What is an ideology? According to Fairclough (1989) the word ‘ideology’ is in 
itself a challenge to define as it would hail an ideological position into its definition 
(p.94). What can be understood about ideology however is that it is like a rope in a 
perpetual game of tug-of-war between social groups; each side struggles and competes 
for their views to win and eventually dominate (Fairclough, 1989; Bourdieu, 1991). 
Fairclough argues that social issues over opposing ideologies are played out in language 
(1989, p.88). As ideologies become dominant, they are accepted as common sense – 
Fairclough refers to this as the process of ‘naturalization’ (p.91). As potentially 
naturalized, dominant ideologies must be questioned and exposed (Fairclough, 1989). 
If ideologies, such as the contemporary ideologies of health and beauty, go unnoticed 
they also go unchallenged. Fairclough argues that “consciousness is the first step towards
emancipation" (Fairclough, 1989, p.1). In other words, it is important to question seemingly common sense ideas and practices present in our society and to challenge their hegemony. By this I do not mean the explicit domination of one group over another, rather I mean the incidental dominance of powerful ideologies. In terms of health and beauty this may mean the power that comes about by virtue of 'expertise' – that is, alleged medical professionals endorsing an ideal of health and beauty. As van Leeuwen (2005) explains, ‘experts’ in social texts are afforded the authority to prescribe, recommend, and advise people (p.57).

2.5.1 Critical Linguistics and CDA

In order to investigate ideology and language, linguists have taken a critical approach to discourse analysis (Hodge & Kress, 1979; 1993; Fowler & Kress, 1979; Fairclough & Wodak, 1997; Chouliaraki & Fairclough, 1999; van Dijk, 1985). Pioneering the field, Hodge and Kress (1979; 1993) along with Fowler and Kress (1979) paved the way for a critical investigation of language through the analysis of ‘texts’ (i.e. social products, tangible manifestations of the otherwise abstract realm of discourse (Fairclough, 1989, p.24)). With the aim of critically analysing texts, Fowler and Kress (1979) contributed to the development of Critical Linguistics – a form of discourse analysis that builds on the theoretical foundations of Halliday’s metafunctional grammar and Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL)5 (see Eggins, 2004). This foundation rests on the theoretical premise that language and society are inextricably connected (Halliday, 2003; Eggins, 2004). According to Halliday, language reflects world views because language is a system of meaning-making choices (Halliday, 2003; Eggins, 2004). It is in these choices that our

5 Halliday’s metafunctional grammar will be outlined further in the methodology section.
values and judgments transgress out of latency and are revealed through the texts we produce (Halliday 2003; Eggins, 2004).

Critical Linguistics (CL), is more commonly referred to as Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) (Wodak 2001a; 2006), a term coined and popularized by Fairclough (1989; 1992) (Eggins, 2004, p.21) and widely used in several works (Fairclough, 1989; van Leeuwen, 2003; Fairclough & Wodak, 1997; Chouliaraki & Fairclough, 1999; Wodak, 2001a; 2001b; 2006; van Dijk 2001a; 2001b; Scollon, 2001). Although not confined to a particular methodology, CDA has guiding principles that allow its practitioners to share a similar mission (Wodak, 2006). Firstly, it must be noted that CDA is a program that follows critical theory. As Wodak explains, “such theories seek not only to describe and explain, but also to root out a particular kind of delusion” (2006, p.3). This is key for addressing the health-beauty association, as their consolidation is a social construction (a delusion) rather than an inherent biological connection. According to Wodak, “one of the aims of CDA is to ‘demystify’ discourses by deciphering ideologies” (Wodak, 2006, p.4). Adopting this objective in my analysis will allow me to identify and ultimately demystify the ideologies of health and the ideologies of beauty that are weaving together in advertising.

Wodak (2006) identifies some general principles and aims of CDA. These tenets include; employing an interdisciplinary approach, that is problem oriented, and wherein the theories and methodologies are eclectic, employing well defined tools for analysis that are respective to the theories and the objectives of the analysis, and employing an approach that takes context (i.e. history, culture, etc.) into account (Wodak, 2006, p. 6-7).
Although I will not be employing CDA per se, it is these tenets that I will leverage in making my multimodal analysis more critical.

### 2.5.2 Multimodal Discourse Analysis

Although a great deal of CDA practitioners have traditionally focused on the verbal mode (e.g. Wodak & Reisigl, 2001; Chouliaraki & Fairclough, 1999; Fowler & Kress, 1979), more attention is starting to be placed on other modes of communication such as the visual mode of images (e.g. van Leeuwen, 2004; Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006; Machin, 2007; Jewitt, 2009; Sheyholislami, 2008). Fairclough (1989) recognized the value of considering the visual elements of spoken language such as facial expression and gesture in the analysis of conversations (p.27). Van Leeuwen (2004) stressed the importance of analyzing visual elements of images such as colour, typography, and composition, arguing that these elements worked to convey and produce meaning, especially in relation to each other. The power of individual elements was described by Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) as 'meaning potential'. This refers to an element’s ability to convey meaning. However it is only as a collective whole with other elements that an element’s full (and yet relative) meaning can be realized (Machin, 2007; Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006).

Understanding the power and meaning of texts which employ several modes (such as visual, verbal, and aural) is therefore the mission of Multimodal Discourse Analysis (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006; Machin, 2007; Jewitt, 2009). This new trend in discourse analysis allows for the systematic deconstruction of texts through semiotic analysis. Applications of MDA include the analysis of magazine covers (Machin & Thornborrow, 2003), magazine advertisements (Bell & Millic, 2002), movies (Maiorani,
2007), children’s storybooks (Guijarro & Sanz, 2008), and online advertisements
(Harrison, 2008). I will contribute to this growing body of research in the area of beauty
product ads (Harrison, 2008), and to the moving image (Maiorani, 2007), by analysing
television commercials of health and beauty products.

According to Jewitt (2009) there are three different approaches or streams to
conducting multimodal analysis. The first approach, Jewitt explains, is referred to as
social semiotic multimodality (2009, p.29). This approach was developed by Kress and
van Leeuwen (2001), following Halliday’s and Systemic Functional Linguistics (SFL),
and focuses on meaning making through choices (Jewitt, 2009, p.30). The second
approach is referred to as multimodal discourse analysis (MDA) (p.31). According to
Jewitt, it was also developed by Kress and van Leeuwen (2001) and follows Halliday’s
work. The distinction between these two approaches however is their emphasis on the
sign-maker (p.36). While the social semiotic multimodality approach places higher
emphasis on the sign-maker, the MDA approach places low emphasis on the sign-maker
(Jewitt, 2009, p.36). Another key distinction is how they each approach has been
employed and extended by practitioners. Of particular interest is the MDA approach. It
has been deployed for the analysis of film, and other moving image texts (Jewitt, 2009,
p.32). It is for this reason that I have chosen to employ the MDA approach for my
analysis.

Finally, the third approach that Jewitt outlines is ‘multimodal interactional
analysis’. It addresses a dimension of the social semiotic that conventional multimodal
analysis does not seem to commonly address: that is, body language (Jewitt, 2009, p.33).

6 The analytical tools will be outlined in the methodology section.
This approach focuses on how multimodal texts are interfaced with and mediated by people. This type of analysis involves ethnographic study: thus, context becomes an important element of the analysis (i.e. taking into account where and when a text is occurring). Analysts examine the point of interaction – hence, “interactional” analysis. Interactional analysis does not claim to be able to make generalizations about modal resources; rather it aims to draw patterns of modes in action (Jewitt, 2009, p.34).

The approach that will be utilized in this study is Multimodal Discourse Analysis (MDA), following the program of Kress and van Leeuwen (2001; 2006), and Machin (2007). This approach involves the analysis of a mode’s elements. In the visual mode, such elements include colour, illumination, composition, etc. (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2001; 2006). The approach maintains that each of the elements has a meaning potential, and their full meaning is realized when analyzed as in relation to each other (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006; Machin, 2007). A great deal of the analysis described by Kress & van Leeuwen (2006), and Machin (2007) focuses on still images such as poster advertisements. Since this study seeks to investigate commercials, which are moving images, I will also be drawing on works that have analyzed advertisements (Bell and Millic, 2002; Harrison, 2008), commercials (Nina-Pazarzi & Tsangaris, 2008), and the moving image (Maier et al., 2007; Maier 2009). Additionally, in keeping with the tenets of CDA I will therefore employ a critical multimodal discourse analysis (CMDA).

2.6 Summary

In this chapter, I have discussed the concept of ‘health’, the concept of ‘beauty’, the concepts of Bourdieu in relation to health, beauty, and advertising, and discourse analysis. The discussion on health as a concept in Western society revealed that health is
shaped by culture, values, and scientific discoveries (Rose 2006; Crawford, 2006; Lupton, 1995; Korp, 2010). Health was understood through the discourse of healthism, which advocates a self-disciplined and self-controlled perspective on health and body maintenance. The concept of health was also discussed in relation to beauty, and we saw that the consolidation between health and beauty is occurring through advertising and media (Lupton, 1995; Featherstone, 1991). Similarly, the concept of beauty was discussed in terms of the body, and how social values are inscribed on the body, including the ideologies of fitness, thinness, etc. The process of transforming the body to be beautiful was conceptualized through the concept of aestheticization (Welsch, 1996). Health and beauty were then discussed against Bourdieu's concepts of capital, field, habitus, lifestyle, and taste. Through this discussion, health and beauty were seen as ideologies shaped by the products of society such as advertising. It was then identified that advertising works in dialectic with society to produce and reproduce ideologies. The discussion on discourse analysis followed through with the same premise, illustrating how language and discourse not only reflect ideologies, but work to in turn perpetuate and reinforce them (Fairclough, 1989). Finally, the theories of critical linguistics, CDA, and multimodal discourse analysis were outlined in order to present the analytical approach for this study.
3 Chapter: Method

3.1 Introduction

This chapter is devoted to presenting the data for analysis and the methodology that will be deployed. The data sub-section describes and contextualizes the three television commercials that have been chosen for analysis. Next, the rationale for these choices is presented and discussed. The methodology sub-section outlines the analytical framework, specifically the analytical tools, that will be used in the analysis.

3.2 Data

There are three television commercials that will be analyzed. The first is a makeup ad produced by Neutrogena for their product ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’ (see Appendix A). The second is a toothpaste ad produced by Colgate for their product ‘Colgate Total Advanced Whitening’ (see Appendix B). The third is a yogurt ad produced by Danone for their product ‘Activia’ (see Appendix C). Each of these commercials was retrieved from Youtube.com. Selection of these commercials was based on several criteria. First, since my research is focusing on advertising in Western culture, I was interested only in commercials that were in English and released in either the United States or Canada. Second, since my study is concerned with health and beauty, I only considered commercials that contained elements of either health or beauty (either verbally or visually)\(^7\). Health elements were therefore any product that was marketed as promoting health, such as oral care, skin care, etc. Health marketing was judged to be present if the

---

\(^7\) This did however exclude pharmaceuticals, as I am interested in advertising of products that are not traditionally medicinal.
commercial explicitly stated that the product or brand was involved in improving health. For example, if the commercial used the words ‘health’ or ‘healthy’ in their slogan, or as a brand descriptor or made reference to medical experts who allegedly endorsed the product, etc. Similarly, beauty elements that were considered were the use of a model (beauty icon) and the use of the word ‘beautiful’ in the slogan or as a way to describe the consumer, etc.

In conjunction with several Youtube.com searches (during a 9 month span between May 2011 to December 2011) these selection criteria yielded approximately 15 potential commercials (excluding commercials from the same company but for slightly different products). However, due to the scope of this project, and due to space limitations, this pool was narrowed down to 3 commercials. This would allow for a thorough analysis of each commercial as well as meaningful comparison between them.

In keeping with one of the objectives of critical discourse analysis (i.e. to reveal otherwise hidden meanings), I will examine three different degrees of overtness: 1) an explicit case, where the relationship between health and beauty is obvious (Neutrogena ad); 2) an ambiguous case (Colgate ad); and 3) a latent case, wherein the relationship between health and beauty is not obvious (Danone ad). It is expected that this will help illustrate not only the possible contexts in which the health and beauty association can occur, but also the possible levels of explicitness. These three commercials will allow me to approach my research questions: 1) how is a relationship between health and beauty constructed in television commercials; 2) how is a relationship between health and beauty represented visually; 3) what are the inter-mode relationships and how do they contribute.
to the association between health and beauty? In order to answer these questions I now turn to my method of analysis.

3.3 Methodology

Multimodal analysis has been frequently applied to still image texts such as magazine ads (Machin & Thornborrow, 2003), websites (Maier et al., 2007), political campaign posters (Teo, 2004), and so on. However the analytical approach for multimodal texts comprised of moving images is still being negotiated by MDA practitioners. Thibault (2000) deployed multimodal analysis to investigate television commercials, and Maier (2009) analyzed film trailers drawing mostly on inter-mode relations, a niche of multimodal analysis refined by van Leeuwen (2005). Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) comment on the moving image as an area of study that still requires further development. However, they suggest that the analytical tools they outline in their book can be extended to multimodal texts with moving images such as film and television (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.264-5). They advise that texts such as this should be considered as having ‘dynamisms’ – a fluidity not only between shots, but also between movements made by participants. As they move, participants themselves alter their own representation, and hence their closeness or distance to the camera, their gaze, etc., can be manipulated by them rather than by those recording the shot. Kress and van Leeuwen also express that film texts tend to have a narrative structure, and thus paying attention to how shots are connected to each other is also necessary for this type of multimodal analysis (2006, p.259). In other words, the cohesion (textual metafunction) between shots or frames should be considered as an element for analysis unto itself.
According to Iedema (2001), in film analysis, a "frame is a salient or representative still of a shot" (p.89). Breaking a television commercial down into frames allows for analysis of still images which are representative of the events occurring in the filmed advertisement. Once the commercial is in frames, then multimodal analysis can be applied to each frame individually, however as Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) discuss, the frames must be considered in relation to one another. Hence, an analysis of the entire commercial via the textual metafunction is needed in order to examine the commercial as a gestalt rather than as a series of frames.

Figure 2 - Iedema's Six Levels of Television/Film Analysis (Iedema, 2001, p.189)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Frame</td>
<td>A frame is a salient or representative still of a shot</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Shot</td>
<td>In a shot the camera movement is unedited (uncut); if the camera's position changes this may be due to panning, tracking, zooming, and so on, but not editing cuts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Scene</td>
<td>In a scene the camera remains in one time-space, but is at the same time made up of more than one shot (otherwise it would be a shot)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Sequence</td>
<td>In a sequence the camera moves with specific character(s) or sub-topic across time-spaces; when it is hard to decide whether you're dealing with a scene (1 time-space) or a sequence (multiple time-spaces), this is because editors may render time-space breaks as either more obvious (-&gt; sequence boundary) or less obvious (-&gt; scene boundary)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5 Generic stage</td>
<td>Roughly, stages are beginnings, middles and endings; each genre has a specific set of stages: narratives tend to have an orientation, a complication, a resolution and maybe a coda; factual or expository genres may have an introduction, a set of arguments or facts and a conclusion, or an introduction and a series of facts or procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6 Work as a whole</td>
<td>Depending on the lower levels, the work will be more or less classifiable as a particular genre; the primary distinction is between 'narrative' (fictional, dramatic genres) and 'factual' (expository, thematic, issue-oriented genres); genres are predictable relations between social-cultural, industrial-economic and symbolic-mythic orders</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The consideration of a text’s multi-dimensionality in the construction and communication of meaning is a main objective of MDA. In keeping with this objective, it is important to consider not only how each mode of communication conveys meaning,
but also how the interaction between modes works to create meaning. In Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) a single element in a multimodal text is referred to as having 'meaning potential'. It is only in combination with other elements that meaning is realized. It has been suggested in van Leeuwen (2005) and Maier et al. (2007) that the verbal mode and the visual mode should be considered as working in tandem, with mode either extending or elaborating on the meaning of the other mode. Independently, each mode can be seen as only having a 'meaning potential', however analyzed as a cooperative unit their meanings can be better understood.

My analysis will firstly investigate the commercials frame by frame, looking strictly at the multimodal elements of the visual mode, and then the inter-mode relationship with the verbal mode corresponding with that particular frame (this is illustrated in Appendices A, B, and C in form of a chart). Then I will discuss and consider how the frames and the inter-mode relationships work together throughout the commercial to bring about meaning in the text as whole. The following three sub-sections outline the analytical tools that will be employed in the analysis, starting with the metafunctions of SFL, and then moving to the visual analysis tools of MDA, and finally the inter-mode relations categories.

3.3.1 Systemic Functional Linguistics

*Ideational*

The ideational metafunction is the dimension of a text which involves the representation of the elements in the text (Lemke, 2009, p.284). Discussing the ideational metafunction involves the identification of a text’s transitivity – that is, answering 'who are the

---

8 The charts contained in the Appendices have been designed primarily drawing from the work of Sheyholislami (2010), as well as the work from van Leeuwen (2005) and Maier et al. (2007).
participants', ‘what are the processes’ and ‘what are the circumstances’ (Royce, 2007, p.67).

**Interpersonal**

The interpersonal metafunction is the dimension of a text which communicates, that is, ‘interacts’ with the viewer (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.43). It is the representation of the relationship between the participants of the text and the viewer (Royce, 2007, p.70). It can also include the interaction between two or more participants within a text. For the purpose of my analysis, I will be discussing how the commercials come to interact with the viewer through the use of gaze, distance, angle, and modality. One of the main mechanisms in this metafunction that I will be looking for is *synthetic personalization* – a discursive strategy that artificially creates a relationship between the participants of the text and the consumer (Fairclough, 1989). Other elements falling under this metafunction (such as gaze and distance) will be discussed and defined further in the MDA tools section below.

**Textual**

The textual metafunction is the cohesion and connectivity between the elements of a text (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.43). It is the relationship and continuity between the various parts of a text (Lemke, 2009, p.285). The main mechanism of this metafunction that I will be looking for is *lexical chains* – a discursive strategy that creates cohesion in a text by repeating the same word or words of a similar nature (Egginps, 2004).

### 3.3.2 Multimodal Discourse Analysis
Participants

According to Kress and van Leeuwen (2006), there are two participant types involved in a text: 1) represented participants, and 2) interactive participants (p.114). Represented participants are the people/objects/products/animals/characters that are depicted in a text (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.114). Interactive participants can be of two kinds; represented participants interacting with each other inside the text, or represented participant(s) interacting with the consumer of the text (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.114).

Distance

This refers to how close or far away a participant is from the viewer. According to Kress and van Leeuwen, a participant’s distance suggests a level of intimacy with the viewer. Their closeness to the camera simulates real-world closeness, and hence the closer a participant is the more intimate the relationship with the viewer.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Far</th>
<th>Neutral</th>
<th>Friendly</th>
<th>Intimate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>←-----------------------------O-------------------------------X--------------------------→</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Participants that are far away are less engaged with the viewer, and as they are closer, they enter a space wherein we typically find our friends. Growing closer still, participants enter our personal space, creating a more intimate relationship with the viewer. This could be the visual equivalent of Fairclough’s (1989) synthetic personalization – an artificial friendship with the consumer that is constructed through an advertisement.

Angle

Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) explain that the angle of interaction is the angle at which the viewer interacts with the participants in an image. There are two kinds of interaction:
those which occur on the horizontal plane – angle axis goes from left to right (p.135), and those which occur on the vertical plane – angle axis goes from above to below (p.140).

An oblique angle on the horizontal plane can indicate a sense of detachment of the participant from the viewer, while a straight on view involves the viewer into the image (p.135). A top-down angle on the vertical plane can indicate a sense of superiority on the part of the viewer, subordinating the participants of the image, while a bottom-up angle can indicate a sense of inferiority on the part of the viewer, empowering the participant of the image (p.140). There is also a neutral or level angle of interaction. This suggests that the participant and the viewer are equals, peers, etc. In combination with distance, angle has the meaning potential to suggest a certain level intimacy. A level angle of interaction, with a close distance creates an artificial friendship between the viewer and the participants.

**Gaze**

In terms of gaze Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) identify two kinds: demand - represented participants looking directly at the viewer demands something of the viewer (p.118), and offer - represented participants looking away from the viewer offer something to the viewer (p.119). The interpretation of gaze (specifically direct gaze) is also mediated by facial expression (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.118). Gaze engages the viewer in some way, and thus is part of the interpersonal metafunction.

**Modality**

Kress and van Leeuwen explain that modality serves as part of the interpersonal metafunction because it relies on a shared value of ‘truth’ between the producer and the viewer of the image (2006, p.155). Analyzing modality requires first, identifying the
'coding orientation' of the image, and second, identifying the 'modality markers' within that orientation. Modality markers are the elements of an image which indicate some aspect of the image's realism (p.160). Coding orientations are the ways in which images communicate their message (p.165). There are four coding orientations: technological, sensory, abstract, and naturalistic (p.165). I will be focusing my analysis within the naturalistic coding orientation (as will be discussed further below), however Figure 3 helps outline the differences between coding orientations.

Figure 3 - Coding Orientations (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, p.165)

(1) **Technological coding orientations**, which have, as their dominant principle, the 'effectiveness' of the visual representation as a 'blueprint'. Whenever colour, for example, is useless for the scientific or technological purpose of the image, it has, in this context, low modality.

(2) **Sensory coding orientations**, which are used in contexts in which the pleasure principle is allowed to be the dominant: certain kinds of art, advertising, fashion, food photography, interior decoration, and so on. Here colour is a source of pleasure and affective meanings, and consequently it conveys high modality: vibrant reds, soothing blues, and so on – a whole psychology of colour has evolved to support this.

(3) **Abstract coding orientations**, which are used by sociocultural elites – in 'high' art, in academic and scientific contexts, and so on. In such contexts modality is higher the more an image reduces the individual to the general, and the concrete to its essential qualities. The ability to produce and/or read texts grounded in this coding orientation is a mark of social distinction, of being an 'educated person' or a 'serious artist'.

(4) The common sense naturalistic coding orientation, which remains, for the time being, the dominant one in our society. It is the one coding orientation all members of the

Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) suggest that when the modality of an image in the naturalistic coding orientation seems to represent something as 'more than real', thus surpassing the 'natural' (highest modality), it is in fact low rather than high in modality – that is, it is low in truth value (p.163). Kress and van Leeuwen also refer to this type of modality as 'hyper-real' (low modality) (p.164). The modality markers that are being considered for this analysis are: contextualization, representation, and illumination
(Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006, pp.161-2). Each of these modality markers runs on a scale from low modality, to the highest modality (naturalistic), to low modality again (hyper-reality). Figure 4 below is an example of the scale of modality markers in the naturalistic coding orientation (although the figure has used ‘colour’, other modality markers run along the same scale).

Figure 4 – Modality marker scale (from Kress & van Leeuwen (2006, p.160)

Contextualization is a scale running from the absence of background to the most fully articulated and detailed background (p.161). Representation is a scale running from maximum abstraction to maximum representation of pictorial detail (p.161). Finally, illumination is a scale running from the fullest representation of the play of light and shade to its absence (p.162).

Composition

Composition involves the layout of items on a page, wherein their arrangement may be deemed significant (van Leeuwen, 2005). That is, whether they appear on the left/right, top/bottom/centre/margin, etc. may represent a particular meaning. The ‘left’ and ‘right’ are associated with ‘given’ and ‘new’ (respectively) and seem to have some associations to religious ideas of good (morally sound) and bad (morally wrong) (p.201). It is also aligned with Western notions of past and present – that is, past is on the left while new (either present or future) is on the right, and fits in with the construction of time as
moving from left to right (even clockwise motion support this). Also, writing in Western culture moves from left to right – the ‘given’ information comes before the ‘new’ information. The ‘centre’ and ‘margin’ involve the location of items at points spanning the center to the margin of a page. Van Leeuwen (2005) explains that there may be several culturally different understandings of the locus of significance in terms of centre and margin (p.205). Some cultures may place importance on the centre, whereas some may place importance on the margins. The ‘top’ and ‘bottom’ positions are associated with the ‘ideal and real’ (van Leeuwen, 2005). They are also associated with ‘up’ and ‘down’ (van Leeuwen, 2005, p.204). In other words, that which is ‘high’, ‘upper’ can be related a positive or advantageous position in socio-economic class or status. That which is ‘low’, ‘bottom’ can be related to a negative or disadvantaged position in socio-economic class or status. Again there are some religious connotations in terms of ‘up’ as ‘ethereal’ (the ideal), and ‘down’ and as ‘on earth’ (the real).

**Framing**

Van Leeuwen (2005) discusses *framing* as the division of areas of the text into compartments (p.7). He identifies six types of framing: *segregation, separation, integration, overlap, rhyme* and *contrast*. *Segregation* is the division of an image into different orders (p.12). That is, frames which keep two or more areas of an image apart through the use of borders or apparent boundaries. Van Leeuwen suggests that in advertising *segregation* often provides a split between fantasy and reality. *Separation* is the division of an image through the use of spacing (p.12). That is, frames do not exist explicitly, rather they are implied through the distance between one area to the next. Unlike *segregation* which constitutes several orders within one image, the items which
occur in separation are still considered to fall under one order. *Integration* is when text and picture occur within the same space (p.12). *Overlap* is when text and image occur in one another’s spaces (p.12). *Rhyme* is when elements of the image share similar qualities (e.g. have the same colour, pattern, shape, etc.), whereas *contrast* is when elements have opposing qualities (van Leeuwen, 2005, p.12-3).

### 3.3.3 Inter-mode relations

Van Leeuwen (2005) provides a framework through which the visual and the verbal modes can be cross analyzed (p.230). There are two main types of relationships between text and image: *elaboration* – the repetition or restatement “of information for purposes of clarification” (p.222), and *extension* – the addition of new information which links to “existing information in a particular way” (p.222). Each of these can then be further subdivided as is shown in Figure 5.

**Figure 5 – Image-Text Relations chart (van Leeuwen, 2005, p.230)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image-text relations</th>
<th>Elaboration</th>
<th>Specification</th>
<th>The image makes the text more specific (illustration)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The text makes the image more specific (anchorage)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Explanation</td>
<td>The text paraphrases the image (or vice versa)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Extension</td>
<td>Similarity</td>
<td></td>
<td>The content of the text is similar to that of the image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Contrast</td>
<td></td>
<td>The content of the text contrasts with that of the image</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Complement</td>
<td></td>
<td>The content of the image adds further information to that of the text, and vice versa ('relay')</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 3.4 Summary

The function of this chapter was twofold: to present and contextualize the data for analysis, and to identify and explain the analytical tools. In the data sub-section I explained the selection criteria for the three chosen television commercials: Neutrogena’s
‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’ (Appendix A); Colgate’s ‘Colgate Total Advanced Whitening’ (Appendix B); and, Danone’s ‘Activia’ (Appendix C). Within this subsection I also discussed the process by which the data was collected. Following this was the methodology sub-section wherein the analytical tools were defined under three sub-categories: Systemic Functional Linguistics, Multimodal Discourse Analysis, and Inter-mode Relations.
4 Chapter: Analysis and findings

4.1 Introduction

In this chapter I will discuss the observations and findings of my MDA and inter-mode analysis of the three television commercials: 1) Neutrogena ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’ (Appendix A), 2) Colgate ‘Advanced Total whitening toothpaste’ (Appendix B), and 3) Danone ‘Activia probiotic yogurt’ (Appendix C). Each of these commercials will be discussed respectively, and within each discussion I will present the findings for both the critical multimodal discourse analysis and also the inter-mode relations analysis.

This chapter is therefore organized into three main sections, each corresponding to one of the three commercials. Within the main sections, there will be three sub-sections; data description, visual analysis, and inter-mode analysis. The data description section will provide a brief overview of the commercial, and then a short summary of data noted in the chart of the Appendix. The visual analysis section will entail a critical multimodal analysis highlighting the salient visual elements as they work collectively to connote meanings. Analysing the elements as in relation to each other rather than individually allows for their ‘meaning potential’ (Kress & van Leeuwen, 2006) to be more fully appreciated. Finally, the third sub-section will discuss the visual-verbal inter-mode relations of the commercial in order to show how both the images and the captions/narrations come together to form new, or reinforce or extend already existing meanings.

4.2 Neutrogena ad

4.2.1 Data description
The Neutrogena commercial is promoting the product ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Make-up’, a cosmetic product also known as cover-up or foundation. The purpose of this type of makeup is to conceal the inconsistencies of the skin (i.e. blemishes, sun spots, scars, etc). The commercial is 30 seconds in duration and is divided into 8 main frames (Appendix A). The first four frames have the represented participant: blobs of makeup. Frames 5, 6, and 8, have the represented participant: bottle(s) of makeup. Finally, frame 8 has the represented and also interactive participant: spokes model, Jennifer Garner. Her voice serves as a non-diegetic narration for all the frames except for frame 8, wherein her voice becomes diegetic. It is in this frame that she visually becomes an interactive participant, engaging with the viewer both through direct gaze and through synthetic personalization when she asks “does your makeup do that?” (Appendix A).

Figure 6 - Visual elements summary chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendly</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intimate</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top-down</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bottom-up</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hyper-real</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The other elements also work to engage the viewer, as can be seen through the summary chart above (Figure 6). Out of eight frames, 6 have the participants at an intimate distance, allowing for a closer relationship between the viewer and the products. There are 5 frames which use a top-down angle, however this occurs 4/5 times with the blobs of
makeup and 1/5 times with the bottle of makeup (and this quickly becomes a level angle of interaction). The remainder of the frames are at a level angle of interaction. This allows the viewer to feel a sense of superiority over the makeup (at least at first as the top-down angles only occur in the first 5 frames, and shift to a level angle of interaction during frame 5). Once the main product is shown however, the angle remains level, creating a sense of equality with not only the products, but also with the spokes-model – she is our equal, our close and intimate friend whom we can take advice from. In terms of composition, 6/8 frames have participants centered and 2/8 have participants on the right. In both cases of right-justification it is the makeup bottles (frames 5 and 6), this suggests that this makeup is ‘new’, or in other words a solution to something. This is also reinforced by the narration: frame 5 verbally introduces the product, while frame 6 verbally associates it with notions of betterment through the lexical item ‘improvement’ (Appendix A). I will return to this in my discussion on inter-mode relations. As for modality, this will be discussed further in the visual analysis sub-section.

4.2.2 Verbal analysis

The Neutrogena ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’ ad makes reference to improving health in four ways: 1) overtly connecting the product to health by using the lexical item ‘healthy’ in the name of their product and showing the product several times (3/8 frames) throughout the commercial; 2) alluding to the product’s ability to improve how the skin appears to be healthier by juxtaposing the narration “there’s one makeup that’s so clever, it makes your skin look better even after you take it off” (Appendix A, frames 3-4) with the narration and visual caption “healthy skin...” (Appendix A, frame 5); 3) employing clinical-trial type language in the narration “98% of women saw improvement in their
skin’s natural texture, tone, and clarity” (Appendix A, frame 6); and finally 4) explicitly connecting their product to medical opinion through the narration “Neutrogena cosmetics, recommended most by dermatologists” (Appendix A, frame 8). Van Leeuwen (2005) explains that “experts” in social texts have the authority to prescribe, recommend, and advise people (p.57). As part of the medical profession, using dermatologists in a cosmetics commercial may give them the authority to prescribe an ideal for beauty through the guise of health. The authority of the so called medical ‘experts’ thus ‘naturalizes’ the ideologies they endorse. It is therefore clear to see how health was a key component to the Neutrogena ad.

4.2.3 Visual analysis

In the Neutrogena ad, the modality throughout most frames is high to hyper-real (Appendix A). This entails a more than naturalistic representation which is being achieved through bright lighting, decontextualization of the subjects (i.e. makeup bottles, makeup blobs, Jennifer Garner), and also the subjects are shown both highly focused and frequently at a close distance (see Appendix A). The closeness of the subjects to the viewer is not only hyper-real in that the subjects are closer to the viewer than they would normally be in the ‘real world’; the closeness also suggests a sense of intimacy with the subjects (see Figure 7, frame 7 below). The subjects are personal to us; Jennifer Garner is our friend, etc., they enter our personal space, becoming part of our world, and vice versa, we are invited into a world that is hyper-real. This world is seemingly made up of beautiful people, flawlessness is ubiquitous, and access into this world is only a purchase away. Armed with the product, not only can the consumer gain membership into a world of beauty, but they can also fortify the health of their skin, which in turn makes them
more beautiful. In other words, the makeup is a means of obtaining physical capital. The product gives symbolic power, especially in so far as it is linked with an already powerful figure, a celebrity. As Featherstone has noted, celebrities serve as beauty icons – they set the bar for what can be deemed beautiful, and as such can be valorized as having a high amount of physical capital. Juxtaposing the product with celebrity endorsement therefore suggests to the viewer that in order to gain the level of physical capital (ergo, power) that celebrities have, they must participate in the field of consumption that concerns itself with health and beauty. In other words, they must strive for beauty via health, and vice versa, through the consumption of not only the product itself, but also the ideologies which surround it.

Figure 7 - Neutrogena commercial

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frame 6</th>
<th>Frame 7</th>
<th>Frame 8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1" alt="Frame 6" /></td>
<td><img src="image2" alt="Frame 7" /></td>
<td><img src="image3" alt="Frame 8" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The colour palette of the images shows a pattern of white (the background around the subjects), and varying shades of tans, beiges, creams, and other pastel earth tones. The colours are always represented as pure, with no spots or blemishes (see Appendix A). When the colours are mixed, as is done in frames 1-4 of the ad, it is done rather artistically, like paint on canvas making a design rather than a blend with the different shades of makeup. This could suggest that makeup is art, it is beauty, and hence its use
can make your skin beautiful too. In spite of there being several shades represented, the
range of shades is relatively narrow considering the range of skin colours there actually
are (see Figure 7, frame 8). There are no dark brown shades, which suggests an exclusion
of darker skin tones in the representation of what is beautiful, and what skin tone is
eligible to be 'healthy' through the use of this product. The choices to either not
manufacture darker makeup, or simply not to display it in a commercial, also contributes
to defining what is beautiful and healthy. There is thus a marginalization of what healthy
and beautiful means in mainstream advertising, and by extension, in Western culture.
Reischer and Koo (2004) have suggested that beauty in Western culture is measured
against a Caucasian ideal. This ideal may be manifested in the marginalization of colour
in the Neutrogena ad. If there is no dark brown ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’ (at least in
the context of the ad), does that mean that it is neither healthy nor beautiful to be dark?
Or that dark skinned people are neither able nor eligible to be healthy and beautiful? This
raises some troubling questions concerning race in the construction of beauty, and by
extension, the construction of health. If being fair skinned is beautiful/healthy then is
being dark skinned ugly/diseased? As discussed in an earlier section on body
modification (see section 2.3.1), skin lightening practices around the world (e.g. India,
Africa, Jordan, South Asia) attest to the hegemonic ideal of lighter skin as more
attractive. Through the marginalization of colour in the Neutrogena ad, this ideal is
therefore reinforced and perpetuated.

4.2.4 Inter-mode relations analysis

The predominant inter-mode relation across the commercial is extension: complement
with about 88% (7/8 frames) of the ad having this inter-mode relation (see Appendix A).
In these instances, the content of the images is adding further information to the text or vice versa (van Leeuwen, 2005). The first four frames of the commercial are of blobs of makeup. In these frames, the images show makeup as clean, simple, and aesthetic. The verbal mode in these same frames is using lexical items such as ‘beautiful’, ‘look pretty’ and ‘look better’ (see Appendix A, frames 1-4). While the first four frames place emphasis on beauty, the next four frames place emphasis on health (see Appendix A, frames 5-8). When the product is shown, there is both extension: complement and extension: similarity. However in Frame 7, the only frame in which spokes model Jennifer Garner is shown, there is only complement (see Appendix A). Frames 5, 6, and 8, show the product in the visual mode, and have a health related verbal mode. For example, in frame 5, through the use of extension: similarity, the word ‘health’ appears both visually and verbally. In frame 6, through the use of extension: complement, the clinical-trial type nature of the words in the verbal mode are not only echoed visually through the superimposed text (extension: similarity), they are also qualified by the visual representation of the product. In other words, the makeup assumes the place of remedy (because it is on the right side of the frame, it is the ‘new’), resonating with the medical-solution type nature of the clinical realm. Through this frame, the otherwise beauty product can now be seen as a medication. In frame 8, through the use of extension: complement, the visual representation of the product is extended by the verbal mode with the text and simultaneous narration, “Neutrogena cosmetics, recommended most by dermatologists” (Appendix A). The image of the product, ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’, is further associated with the medical/clinical by the use of the word ‘dermatologists’.
What would otherwise be only a beauty product is now about making skin healthy, and as remedy to ugly skin that is promoted by alleged health care professionals.

The consolidation between health and beauty is ultimately occurring across both modes. However, while the concept of beauty is salient in both the visual and verbal modes, the concept of health occurs only in the verbal mode. Beauty is seen visually in all frames, either as an art form (frames 1-4), a beauty product (frames 5, 6, and 8), or a model (frame 7). It also occurs verbally through a lexical chain: “beautiful” (frame 1), “pretty” (frame 2), “look better” (frame 4), “makeup” (frames 5, 7), and “cosmetics” (frame 8). Health on the other hand is not visually represented per se. Instead, the verbal mode represents health lexically either through inscription (frames 5, 6, and 8), or narration (frames 5, 8). In this commercial beauty is the focus, however health is woven in through the verbal mode.

4.3 Colgate ad

4.3.1 Data description

The Colgate commercial is promoting the product ‘Colgate Total Advanced Whitening’ a toothpaste that contains teeth whitening agents. The commercial is 30 seconds in duration and is divided into 12 main frames (Appendix B). Frames 5 and 12 show the product, which is a represented participant. Frames 1-4 and 6-11 show actress and model, Brooke Shields, she is both a represented and interactive participant. There are two versions of her in this ad; as a model, and as a ‘regular’ person. The boundaries between these two roles are breached in frames 10 and 11 by what is presumably her daughter – also a represented participant. In addition to this there are four more participants; the photographer (who is both a represented participant and interactive
participant in so far as he interacts with Brooke Shields), the lighting assistant (represented participant), the nondescript studio lady (represented participant), and the voice-over narrator (represented participant). These participants however occur as auxiliaries to the main participants: Brooke Shields and the Colgate Total toothpaste. It is for this reason that the analysis is centered on the two main participants. Figure 8 below illustrates how elements occurred in relation to the main participants. Distance occurred equally across three categories, neutral 4/12 frames, friendly 4/12 frames, and intimate 4/12 frames. However there were no cases of 'far' distance. This allows there to be a certain degree of closeness between the viewer and participants. Angle of interaction however is consistently 'level' across all frames – this allows the viewer to be on an equal level with participants. It could suggest trust or friendship to the viewer as there is an absence of the sense of domination or subordination that is suggested through non-level angles.

Figure 8 - Visual elements summary chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Friendly</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Intimate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angle</td>
<td>Top-down</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bottom-up</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaze</td>
<td>Direct</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Indirect</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modality</td>
<td>Neutral</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>High</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Hyper-real</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition</td>
<td>Left</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Right</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Figure 8 (above) also shows the frequency for the elements of ‘gaze’, ‘modality’, and ‘composition’. There are 7 frames with indirect gaze – this suggests an offer rather than direct gaze that suggests a demand for something. This will be discussed more critically in the visual analysis section. There are 6/12 frames that are neutral modality, however the commercial collectively leans toward a higher modality with 5/12 frames that are high in modality, and 1/12 frames that are hyper-real. Finally, in terms of composition, the subjects in frames are predominantly centered (9/12), and the rest of the frames show the subjects to the right (3/12). Centering the subject matter makes it more salient, while having things on the right side of the frame (Appendix B, frames 1, 6, and 8) suggest a certain level of novelty – they are ‘new’ rather than a ‘given’. This is particularly interesting as it occurs in frame 6 (Figure 9, below). Both the product and Brook Shields appear on the right side of the frame, suggesting that this way of brushing your teeth is new, it is a novel solution to the ‘given’ brushing your teeth without whitening.

4.3.2 Verbal analysis

In the Colgate ad health is explicitly referenced through the use of the word ‘healthy’ which occurs twice (frames 4, 9) and the word ‘healthier’ which occurs once (Appendix B, frame 12). Health is also more implicitly referenced through the mention of
'germ' and 'germ fighting' (Appendix B, frames 6-7). The concept of the germ is analogous with the concept of molecularization in that health is understood at a microscopic level (Rose, 2001). Through the lexical use of 'germs' the idea of health can be triggered.

4.3.3 Visual analysis

In the Colgate ad, there seems to be an interchange between direct and indirect gaze, alternating between offer and demand. The viewer is offered an ideal, and then 'demanded' to listen and pay attention to the spokes-model, Brooke Shields. There are two sides to Shields in this ad; her as an actress/model (her 'job'), and her as a regular person (a mom). The offer to the viewer is to entertain a twofold reality; glamorous celebrity lifestyle wherein beauty is paramount, and the everyday-person who is concerned with health. To be beautiful like Shields the model, while also being healthy like Shields the mom, is offered up to the viewer as a possible reality through the use of this special formula toothpaste. Using the toothpaste is part of a lifestyle wherein the consumer can strike a balance between beauty (the smile of a model) and health (the dental care that would concern the everyday person, the mom, the dentist, etc.). Shields' direct gaze however demands that we listen, to pay attention not only to how she looks, but also to what she says (i.e. thinks, believes, advocates – the values of her habitus).

In terms of colour, there is a salient color pattern which is predominantly white, followed by red, and then pastels (see Figure 10 below). White is used when the main participant (Brooke Shields) is at 'work' (as an actress/model). White and red are present when the product is being shown (see Figure 10, below). And pastels are used when the main participant is at 'home' (as a regular person). There is a dullness and ordinariness to
the ‘at home’ life represented by colors that are not quite white (see Figure 10, below). However once the participant is in white, she is something to be filmed, photographed, and idolized – she is an icon of beauty. White is equated with beauty, but it is also equated with dental care. Having white teeth are portrayed as not only beautiful, but as healthy.

**Figure 10 - Colgate commercial**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Frame 2</th>
<th>Frame 4</th>
<th>Frame 12</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Image" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In almost all the frames the modality is neutral, showing a relatively natural setting (given the context). When the main participant (Brooke Shields) is on "the set", it is naturalistic for her to be highly illuminated. The lighting when she is ‘at home’ appears to be bright sunlight coming through the window. Overall, there is an acceptably natural, yet highly bright, lighting condition throughout the commercial. The product however tends to be displayed in less than natural conditions, decontextualized on a white shiny surface, devoid of background or other objects. It is therefore categorized as high modality, moving into the hyper-real (more than real). This may suggest an 'other-worldly' potency of the product, or some-what supernatural power to not only care for, but also whiten teeth. The toothpaste makes teeth healthy, but also beautiful through its seemingly special properties.

The distance between the main participant and the viewer rotates between far, friendly, and intimate (see Appendix B). When the participant is serving as an advice
giver (on her couch ‘at home’), she is at a friendly distance. Typically, the friendly
distance also occurs with direct gaze, further drawing the viewer in to what Shields has to
say about the product and how it suites both her professional and personal needs. She is a
star, but she can also be your friend. She is there to give the viewer advice on what she
used both to be beautiful, but also to be healthy.

4.3.4 Inter-mode relations analysis

There are four cases of elaboration: specification wherein the image (visual mode) makes
the narration (verbal mode) more specific (see Appendix B, frames 2, 4, 5, 9). In three of
these cases the image serves as a way to be specific about what white and/or healthy teeth
should look like. The inter-mode relations in these cases create a relationship between
what is said to be white (i.e. beautiful), healthy teeth, and what can be seen as white,
healthy teeth. In other words, the model (Shields) becomes a visual representation, and
thus setting the bar, for what it means not only have attractive teeth, but also what
‘healthy’ ought to look like. In frame 5 however, the specification is of the product itself
rather than the outcome. The image of the toothpaste makes the narration “So I upgraded
to Colgate Total Advanced Whitening” more specific, reminding the viewer of what it
takes in order to achieve the ‘healthy’, ‘white’ smile presented in previous frames.

Six out of twelve frames are extension: complement (Appendix B, frames 1, 6, 7,
8, 11, 12). Of particular interest here are frames 7, 8, and 12 as they directly contribute to
extending the meanings of health and beauty. In frame 7 the image of the day-to-day
Brooke Shields creates new meaning with the narration “now I get the germ fighting I
need” (Appendix B). This new meaning involves being ‘beautiful’ while also being
concerned with ‘health’. In this case, warding off microbes (i.e. ‘germ fighting’) is
consistent with the Western understanding of health at a microscopic, or ‘molecular’ level (Rose, 2001). It is not just any person who values being healthy however, it is a ‘beautiful’ person; she is a model and beauty icon. To be like her, and perhaps look like her, we must also think like her (i.e. share her tastes and adopt the values of her habitus). This is furthered in frame 8 wherein the image of Brooke Shields in a white dress extends the meaning of the narration “and the whitening I want” (Appendix B). There has been a shift from ‘need’ to ‘want’ and from regular to glamorous as there is also a shift from a health focused priority to an appearance driven priority. The image of her in a white dress extends the meaning of ‘whitening’ because it demonstrates whiteness (as beauty) beyond the mouth. Not only are her teeth white, but she is white, and her dress is white. As she models before the camera, as an icon of beauty, she is an embodiment of white. Whiteness can therefore be associated with being beautiful, and with looking like a model. To have white teeth therefore makes you beautiful. Finally, in frame 12 the image extends the text and narration “upgrade to the healthier side of white” (Appendix B) by showing the product as a solution. The toothpaste is the upgrade to not only being healthy, but also to being beautiful.

4.4 Activia ad

4.4.1 Data description

The Danone ad is promoting ‘Activia’ yogurt with ‘B.L. Regularis’, a probiotic formula that is supposed to aid the process of digestion. The commercial is 30 seconds in duration and has been divided into 12 frames (Appendix C). Unlike the previous two commercials, the Danone ad does not have one main spokes-model. Instead, there are several participants of which some are more salient than others. Frames 1-5 show three
different main represented participants who are interacting with other represented participants in the frame. Frames 6 and 10 have one main participant who only engages with the viewer in frame 10 (Appendix C). None of the represented participants verbally engage with the audience. There is however a voice-over narrator (female) who begins to talk between frames 5-6.

Figure 11 - Visual elements summary chart

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Frequency</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distance</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Far</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Friendly</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Angle</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Top-down</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Level</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bottom-up</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gaze</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Direct</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Indirect</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>none</td>
<td>-</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Modality</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Neutral</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Composition</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Left</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Right</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Figure 11 above summarizes the frequency of occurrences of visual elements in the Danone ad. There are 4 instances of neutral distance, two instances of far distance, and only one instance of a friendly distance. This may indicate that the commercial is not relying on the interpersonal metafunction to connect to the viewer. Other elements support this observation as well. For example in terms of gaze (Figure 11 above) there are 6 instances of indirect while only 1 instance of direct gaze. The remaining 5 frames do not even have people in them in which gaze can even be an element. There is however some closeness made with the viewer through 'angle', which, in 7 instances is level with
the viewer. Although the subject matter is predominantly centered, with 7/12 frames centering the subject, there is not a lot of emphasis on the product. Moreover, with 7 frames falling into low modality, and none of the frames occurring as a neutral modality, the subjects that are made salient are rendered that much more powerful. In the case of frames 1-5, the desaturated images provide a stark contrast to the colourful frame around the main participants’ mid-sections, calling attention to the belly. This will be discussed in more detail in the visual analysis section.

4.4.2 Verbal Analysis

The concept of molecularization manifests the idea of health in the Danone ad through the focus on the probiotic, B.L. Regularis (Appendix C). This is done in two ways both verbally and visually: 1) through the use of the word “probiotic culture” (Appendix C, frame 7) which alludes to a microscopic level of the yogurts’ health promoting properties; and 2) through the use of small moving spheres that look like parts of molecules (Appendix C, frames 7, 8, and 9). Health in the Danone ad is therefore more implicitly referenced, as overt mention of the word health is not present in the commercial per se. In frame 11 (Appendix C) there is however a direct reference to health through the narration and caption “proud sponsor of world digestive health day”.

4.4.3 Visual analysis

The two most salient elements in this commercial are color and framing. There is a consistent color pattern across 11/12 frames that includes green, yellow, and desaturated grey tones. Frames 1-5 are comprised predominantly of desaturated grey tones, and only a section of the image has more vibrant shades of green and yellow (Appendix C). This contrast in colour creates division between a belly-dancing bare
midriff and the rest of the given woman's body (see Figure 12, frames 3 and 10 below). The belly-dancing midsections are thus effectively 'framed' by contrast. That is, the colour differentiation between the belly and the rest of the image creates a frame around the belly. Furthering this, the frame is also made salient due to the difference in content. While the women are fully clothed in 'regular' attire in the desaturated portion of the image, their midsections are shown as bare, with a belly-dancing skirt around their hips. This combination of colour and framing places a high degree of emphasis on the belly and waistline of the represented participants, making their lean physique the focal point of the frame. In frame 10, the participant is shown in full colour, however there is still framing occurring around her midsection, making salient her bare and lean belly (see figure 12 below). In each of these types of frames, the participant is also shown eating the yogurt, forming an association between what the participants are eating and what their belly is doing. Not only are their bellies lean, and arguably shamelessly exposed, they also seem to be celebrating – dancing gaily to the music, but more importantly, to the consumption of the yogurt that keeps the belly trim and 'healthy' (i.e. regular due to the probiotic in the yogurt).

Figure 12 - Danone commercial

Another interesting element throughout the commercial is gaze. With the exception of frame 10 (Figure 12, above), all other frames show participants looking at
each other, but not looking at the viewer. They do not engage with us – there is therefore an indirect gaze. As Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) suggested, indirect gaze suggests that the participant has something to offer us. The offer in this case may be to observe the participants’ day to day lives, that is, their lifestyle as Activia yogurt consumers. They are everyday people, doing everyday things such as moving into a new home (frames 1-2), having company over (frames 3-4), and working at an office (frame 5). We as viewers, look on as the participants not only enjoy their yogurts, but enjoy their lives. They offer us the prospect of a happy day to day life through the regular consumption of yogurt.

The modality in this commercial shifts from a naturalistic coding orientation to a technological coding orientation. That is, it goes from depicting people (frames 1-6, and 10) to depicting abstract diagrams (frames 7-9) (Appendix C). Frames 7-9 have a green background with a waist-line like silhouette that has small spherical yellow figures floating through the centre. In Frame 7 and 9, these yellow balls form an arrow pointing downward, alluding to the outward process of digestion (see Figure 13 below). The caption ‘BL Regularis’ (Frame 7) appears in the top section of the frame, in what Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) identify as the ‘ideal’. The probiotic compound can therefore be idealized, while the yellow arrow points down toward the bottom of the frame, the ‘real’, to the bowels. In other words, digestion is the ‘real’ world problem and the probiotic compound is the ‘ideal’ solution. Similarly, in frame 9, the arrow points down toward the bowels, but it is also pointing down to the ‘real’ world product – Activia.
While the probiotic formula, B.L. Regularis, may be the ideal in so far as it is the ideal solution, Activia is symbolically rendered the 'real' world solution to ensuring balanced digestion. In all three frames (as seen in Figure 13 above), especially in frame 8, the little balls have a molecular-like appearance to them. Returning to the concept of molecularization (Rose, 2001), the suggestion of molecular level activity calls on notions of 'health' and being 'healthy'. Frame 8 shows a comparison between regular yogurt, with dull and sparse balls, and Activia with plenty of vibrantly coloured balls. This suggests that Activia has more potent molecular potential than other yogurts – it is therefore more able to contribute to achieving and sustaining 'healthy' digestion. The colours of the balls that are associated with Activia are a function of what Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) have described as *rhyme*. There is cohesion between the colours of the product, the colours of the 'health' promoting molecular-like properties of the yogurt (the yellow balls), and the colours of the midriffs of the belly dancing segments. The bright yellow and green used to make salient both the outward benefits of consuming the yogurt (i.e. midsection of people eating the yogurt) and inward benefits of consuming the yogurt (i.e. molecular-like properties of the probiotic, B.L. Regularis). As Featherstone (1991) has noted, the consolidation of health and beauty in consumer culture has come about due
to the association between the outer and inner body. Through colour rhyme between frames of the commercial, an association between the outer body (i.e. thin, lean belly – beautiful) and the inner body (i.e. regular, balanced digestion – healthy) is made.

Furthering this is that frames 7, 8, and 9, are all leveraging a silhouette of a seemingly thin waistline, echoing the emphasis on the belly as in previous frames. This may seem self evident, given that the product is for digestion and hence part and parcel with the stomach region, however what is more in question is how the belly is portrayed in the commercial. There is a marginalization of the waistline, and a repeated emphasis on it being lean, thin, and absent of fat – an abhorrent characteristic of the unhealthy and ultimately ugly body.

Finally, frame 8 is a case of what Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) describe as ‘given’ and ‘new’. The frame is split into two: regular yogurt is on the left, and Activia is on the right. This suggests that regular yogurt is the ‘given’ – it is the predictable day-to-day product, while Activia is the ‘new’ – it is the solution for promoting ‘healthy’ digestion.

4.4.4 Inter-mode analysis

There are 3 cases out of twelve that are extension: complement (Appendix C, frames 6, 8, 11). Frames 1-5 have no narration or text, they are also the frames which have desaturated images with saturated frames around the bellies of the main participants in the image (see Appendix C). By Frame 6, narration has started just as the quality of the video changes (i.e. full colour, close-up shot, use of diagrams, etc.). Frame 8 has the word ‘unique’ occur twice in the narration. This repetition not only places emphasis on the message that Activia has special properties (i.e. an exclusive probiotic formula), it
reminds the viewer that what is occurring in the image (the health promoting molecules of B.L. Regularis) is an experience – it is a practice that those who consume Activia are privy to. The Activia product is a means for achieving a certain kind of physical capital. It grants you access to a consumption community that not only sets you apart from (i.e. makes you more powerful than) ‘regular’ people by making you healthy, it also makes you more physically attractive as it will somehow positively influence your waistline. It is in this way that Activia is ‘unique’; it arms you with the ability to improve your physical capital.

In frame 11 the image is extended by the narration emphasizing that the company, Danone, values being associated with ‘health’ (Appendix C). The image leverages the same colour scheme as the rest of the commercial (i.e. green and yellow), and also leverages the same concept of the yellow dotted arrow pointing downward. The narration “Danone, proud sponsor of World Digestive Health Day” although echoing the text in the image, extends the meaning of image to be about the company. The producers of the yogurt are about ‘health’ and being ‘healthy’ and this is made overt and explicit in this frame. What is more subtle however is how the company depicts their consumers. The Activia consumer engages in a lifestyle that endorses a lean, trim physique. These people are young, and arguably attractive. If being an Activia consumer is about caring about your digestive health, than it is also about embodying an appearance that resonates with the tastes and habitus’ of the participants in the commercial. To be recognized as a healthy consumer, we must therefore look like the consumers portrayed by the Danone commercial. Having a ‘healthy’ lifestyle that adopts the practices consistent with the values of the ‘healthy’ Activia eater entails looking like the Activia eater. In other words,
how can we been seen as healthy, if we don’t look ‘healthy’ – that is, if we are not conforming to the body ideals projected in the commercial?

4.5 Overall observations

The analysis above has helped expose not only how commercials consolidate health and beauty, but also how the consolidation can occur in degrees of explicitness. While the Neutrogena ad coupled the words ‘healthy’ and ‘makeup’ within the product name (allowing the connection between health and beauty to be overt and transparent), the Danone ad makes subtle references to health and beauty through the juxtapositioning of the body beautiful with the molecularization of the ingredients of the yogurt. Leveraging healthism discourse, the Danone ad is able to portray allegedly attractive people consuming the yogurt as a form of due-diligence for digestive ‘health’. The analysis of these two ads has demonstrated the polarity in the explicitness/implicitness of the health-beauty relationship in advertising. The Colgate ad analysis however provides some insight into a middle ground wherein the relationship between health and beauty is neither explicit nor entirely implicit. The purpose of analyzing varying degrees of explicitness is to show how the health-beauty consolidation is indeed ideological to the point where it is so naturalized in discourse it occurs in a variety of contexts, even those which are neither really related to health nor to beauty. It is important to deconstruct the consolidation of health and beauty because, as the analysis has shown, it is ideologically constructed. That is, it is not simply an arbitrary relationship; it is instead a relationship that is fraught and imbedded with underpinning ideologies regarding what it means to be beautiful and what it means to be healthy. More troubling still is that this consolidation forces, to a certain degree, a conceptualization of health through beauty and vice versa.
According to Fairclough (1989), advertising is the stage through which ideologies can be played out and ultimately to be viewed by an audience. Advertising constructs consumption communities\(^9\), and understanding 'how' an ad does this provides insight into the ideologies which underpin it. I will therefore mantle this final 'overall analysis' on Fairclough's (1989) framework for the ideological work of advertisements: building relations, building images, and building the consumer.

4.5.1 Building Relations

According to Fairclough (1989), ads create artificial relationships with the viewer through various engagement mechanisms. Fairclough refers to this as *synthetic personalization*, a means of personalizing both the audience and the producer of a text. This dimension of a text is part of the *interpersonal metafunction*, as it is about how a text communicates on an interpersonal level. Kress and van Leeuwen (2006) also discuss this type of engagement, indicating that visual elements such as *gaze* and *distance* contribute to building a relationship between participants in an image and the viewer. While verbal features such as casual language, use of imperatives, and lexical items such as the pronouns 'you', 'us', and 'we', also draw the audience in. The combination of both the visual and the verbal modes employing such features allows for an even stronger relationship to be built between the consumer and the ad.

As mentioned earlier, each of the three ads represents a different degree of explicitness, from overt to implicit association between health and beauty. This also seems to correlate with the degree to which the ad builds relations with the viewer in that

---

\(^9\) According to Fairclough (1989), consumption communities are cultural groups formed through and perpetuated by advertising. These communities involve a shared value system for particular lifestyles (p.201).
the more explicit the ad (e.g. Neutrogena ad) the more overt the features of synthetic personalization, while the less explicit (e.g. Danone ad) the less overt the features of synthetic personalization. In the verbal mode, directly addressing the viewer through ‘you’ or the inclusive ‘we’ only occurs in the Neutrogena ad in the narration “does your makeup do that?” (see Appendix A, frame 7). This is also the only interrogative in the commercial and the only commercial out of the three to use an interrogative. The other two commercials, the Colgate ad and the Danone ad, use imperatives. In the Colgate ad the narration and caption say “upgrade to the healthier side of whitening” (see Appendix B, frame 12), and in the Danone ad the narration says “discover what makes Activia so unique” (see Appendix C, frame 8). In all three cases however, the interrogative/imperative occur with the last few frames of the commercial. This may be a common structure among various advertisements however, and not necessarily be exclusive to ads involving the health-beauty relationship.

In terms of the visual mode, there are both the elements of gaze and distance which contribute to creating a closer relationship with the viewer. To a lesser extent, the angle of interaction can also potential play a role in either alienating or inviting the viewer. However in all three commercials the angle was predominantly level with the viewer, especially when people (participants) were in the frame. Only in some frames in the Neutrogena ad when the product was shown (see Appendix A, frames 1-5) was there a top-down angle. It was thus relatively consistent across all three commercials that the viewer and the represented participants were on an equal plane. As described in the analysis, a level angle of interaction creates a sense of equality with the participants – they can be seen as our friends (Kress and van Leeuwen, 2006). It is interesting that in
the explicit commercial (Neutrogena ad) the one frame in which there is gaze, it is direct and the distance of the represented participant is very close – both of these suggest a more intimate relationship with the viewer. Whereas in the less explicit commercials (Colgate ad, and Danone ad), the gaze waivers and the distances tend to be further away from the viewer. The Colgate ad had more instances of indirect gaze (7/12 frames) than direct gaze (3/12 frames) and the distances varied from intimate, to friendly, to neutral. The Danone ad also had more instances of indirect gaze (6/12 frames) than direct gaze (1/12) and the distances varied from friendly, to neutral, to far. This makes the Danone ad the only one out of the three commercials to have far distance shots, and also the only one not to have intimate distance shots. It is interesting how the less explicit the commercial is in terms of the health-beauty association, the less it seems to focus on building relations with the viewer. Fairclough (1989) refers to this as implicit assumptions – wherein an advertisement overlooks ideology. The implicit assumption in all three ads, but in the Danone ad especially, is that health and beauty are one in the same – obviously one must be thin if they are healthy and vice versa.

4.5.2 Building Images

Advertisements have the ability invoke the habitus and create an image of the product – a reputation of sorts (Fairclough, 1989). This dimension of advertising pertains to lifestyle, and how the ad creates an image for how particular lifestyles ought to be played out in real life. Unlike the ‘building relations’ section which was able to summon concrete instruments for assessing the process of building relations, this discussion is more abstract, involving a discussion of ideology. These ideologies involve a) what it

\footnote{Fairclough (1989) refers to this as MR (member relations) however.}
means to beautiful, and b) what it means to be healthy. In terms of the former this involves a marginalization of the body beautiful, and in terms of the latter it involves an extension of the values of healthism into non-medically related social spaces.

4.5.3 Building the Consumer

In the context of this study, building the consumer refers to consumption communities, about who is the consumer and why are they interested in these products and this community. As outlined in the section on Bourdieu, consumers value certain lifestyles because of their habitus and they choose to engage in certain practices in order acquire greater capital – ultimately, this is to be regarded as successful. The consumption community being built in these ads is one that converts non-medical products of day-to-day life into health promoting products. Consumers within this community can allegedly gain capital by consuming products such as those promoted in the ads.

4.6 Summary

In summary, this chapter has presented the analysis and findings for: 1) Neutrogena ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’ (Appendix A), 2) Colgate ‘Advanced Total whitening toothpaste’ (Appendix B), and 3) Danone ‘Activia probiotic yogurt’ (Appendix C). The organization of the analysis for each commercial was threefold: first the data was described, and then the verbal analysis, followed by the visual analysis which was discussed in terms of a critical multimodal analysis, and finally the inter-mode relations between the visual and verbal modes were investigated. The final section of this chapter was devoted to a brief overview of the findings and discussion of how the commercials perform the ‘ideological work of advertisements’ (Fairclough, 1989).
5 Chapter: Discussion and conclusion

5.1 Introduction

In order to understand the above analysis in terms of its social significance, this chapter is dedicated to a discussion of the findings in terms of the theories presented in the literature review: healthism, aestheticization, and Bourdieu's concepts of capital, field, habitus, lifestyle, and taste. Here I will revisit the overarching research questions that motivated this study: Does advertising play a role in constructing a relationship between health and beauty, and if so, how does it do this? Do ideologies of health and ideologies of beauty co-occur in advertising and to what extent do these ideologies overlap to create new meanings for health and beauty? What are the social implications of associating health with beauty (and vice versa)? This chapter is therefore organized into four main sections: health, beauty, Bourdieu, and Fairclough. The discussion will consider the commonalities across all three commercials in an effort to try and understand how a relationship between health and beauty is semiotically constructed. It is important to note here however that the differences between commercials are also significant as they will provide insight into the different levels of implicitness or explicitness of the health-beauty relationship in advertising.

5.2 Summary of findings

The analysis chapter presented the findings for three television commercials: 1) Neutrogena ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’ (Appendix A), 2) Colgate ‘Advanced Total whitening toothpaste’ (Appendix B), and 3) Danone ‘Activia probiotic yogurt’ (Appendix
Each of these commercials featured a main participant (in these ads the main participants were all female\(^1\)) who were all relatively young looking, thin, and fair skinned. In all the commercials there was colour harmony between the colours used in various frames throughout the commercial, and the colours of the product. This created cohesion between the frames of the commercial. Cohesion was also created through lexical chains which tied together frames displaying bodily appearance (beauty) and frames referring or alluding to health.

5.3 A new health consciousness

According to Crawford (2006) the post 1960s Western world witnessed the advent of the new health consciousness – a movement that valorizes personal health. This movement grew out of healthism discourse which idealizes autonomous practices in achieving and maintaining health. Capitalizing on the new health consciousness, advertising changed the way it marketed products and services (Crawford, 2006). The analysis of the three commercials revealed that the values of healthism were at play. First, in all three ads the notion of health is a key component in the ad, and this is in spite of the products’ not being health items per se (e.g. pharmaceuticals, vitamins, etc.). The products that have been analyzed are instead a cosmetic product (Neutrogena), an oral hygiene product (Colgate), and a food product (Danone). None of these are medicines, drugs, or antibiotics, nevertheless all the ads revolve around achieving improved health through the use or consumption of the product (i.e. skin health, dental health, digestive health). The onus of improving health is placed on the consumer; they are not only responsible for

\(^{11}\) Each of these ads represented a different degree of explicitness: Neutrogena = explicit, Colgate = ambiguous, and Danone = implicit. As explained in the Methods section, the purpose of this was to show the extent to which the health-beauty association has been naturalized.

\(^{12}\) This will be discussed further in the limitations section as a feminist theory was not applied in this study.
ensuring the maintenance and improvement of their health and bodies, but are also accountable for subscribing to an overall ‘healthy’ lifestyle ideal. This lifestyle, fashioned by healthism discourse, creates a consumption community in which its members are expected to adhere to health promoting practices such as those idealized in these advertisements. The ads analyzed support a lifestyle that individualizes the consumer. This is done through semiotic elements that make one main participant more salient than other participants (e.g. representation, focus, foregrounding, framing, etc.). This reinforces healthism discourse that the individual is at the seat of control in his or her own health promotion.

The pro-health consumption community formed by these types of ads exceeds an extension of what is understood as health promoting practices – the previously ordinary behaviours of daily life such as applying makeup, brushing teeth, and eating yogurt, must now be seen as important practices if one is to belong to this consumption community (i.e. to this lifestyle). Here it becomes evident why the levels of explicitness are crucial to understand – the more pervasive and socially dogmatized the new-health consciousness becomes the more subject it is to being naturalized in social discourse. Commercials such as the Danone ad are good examples of how entrenched the values of healthism discourse have become in social discourses. It is almost to say: of course eating yogurt can help you be healthy. This brings us back to the earlier discussion on defining ‘health’ – it is a socially constructed concept, and hence the idea that particular food(s) make us necessarily healthier is a socially prescribed ideal. These ads therefore work to shape lifestyles that either include or exclude certain products and practices (e.g. eating yogurt daily).
5.4 Aestheticization of everyday life

There are many things in contemporary daily life which have come to be understood in terms of aesthetics (Welsch, 1996). The phenomenon of aestheticization has colonized facets of everyday life giving weight and value to the appearances of things, people, and places (Welsch, 1996; Reischer and Koo, 2004). The analysis revealed how aestheticization occurs in advertising to not only aestheticize and pronounce the body beautiful. In all three commercials there is not only verbal reference to some aspect of body maintenance (e.g. improving skin, teeth, digestion) there is also visual reference to the body. While the Neutrogena ad focuses on the participant’s face, amplifying the visibility of the facial skin as blemish free and arguably flawless, the Danone ad focuses on the participants’ midriffs, making salient the bare toned and lean physique that allegedly lies beneath the clothing. The body is sensationalized as something to be modified and beautified through certain consumption practices. The use of celebrity models in the Neutrogena ad and the Colgate furthers the reference to glamour and the power of beauty in society (Featherstone, 1991). All three commercials feature young, thin, fair skinned women. Images such as these work to marginalize beauty as they promote a narrow ideal.

As discussed in the previous section, there is a consumption community that is formed by these types of ads. Not only are these commercials informing the consumer of what it means to be healthy internally (as a function of the body), they are also prescribing an ideal for what healthy should look like externally (Featherstone, 1991). The body beautiful is now part and parcel with ‘being’ healthy. In this sense, body modification is not just about altering the body to look a particular way – it is about the
body looking a certain way as a reflection and measure of how healthy one is. This fallacy breeds a consumption community that values a lifestyle geared toward attaining the body beautiful under the pretense of health. It is as if to say, “in being healthy I will be more attractive”. In addition to the body, health is also being aestheticized through these ads as they are suggesting a link between being healthy and being beautiful. These representations are matter of choice at the point of production, and these choices are a reflection of values and ideologies (Halliday, 2003; Eggins, 2004). To have chosen to use a Caucasian spokes model (i.e. Jennifer Garner, or Brooke Shields) versus a non-Caucasian spokes model (e.g. Eva Mendes or Gabrielle Union) indicates a racial preference in the construction of beauty ideals. Similarly, the choice to have young people featured in the ad, the choice to have thin people, etc. is a reflection of the social ideologies of beauty. These ads produce and reproduce beauty ideologies that marginalize what it means to be beautiful in Western society.

5.5 Social implications

As has been illustrated in the previous two sections there are two important dimensions in these ads; a reproduction of healthism and the aestheticization of everyday life. Occurring in tandem, these dimensions work to weld together concepts of health and beauty creating a health-beauty consolidation. These ads are social texts which not only (re)produce ideologies, they reproduce them as well (Fairclough 1989). That is, they make available ideology to be consumed and reproduced by members of society. In addition to the power and influence of advertisements (Fairclough, 1989) the power and pervasiveness of television is eminent (Bourdieu, 1996), and hence, understanding television products such as commercials is valuable for gaining insight into how the habitus and lifestyles of
members of society can be influenced. This section will therefore discuss the social implications of the health-beauty consolidation in terms of an overall understanding of Bourdieu’s concepts of habitus, lifestyle, taste, capital, and field.

When consumed, advertisements, such as those analyzed in this study, work to inform the habitus. This is key since the habitus is the ultimate generator of our practices and by extension our lifestyles. All advertisements of course have this potential; however what sets these advertisements apart is what they inform the habitus about. These ads suggest that being healthy is equivalent to being beautiful and vice versa, and that our daily lives ought to be occupied by a series of health-beauty promoting practices such as having flawless skin, white teeth, thin bodies, etc. These external attributes are signals to the other members in society that we not only embody the habitus of the health-beauty lifestyle, we also share the same in taste. Violating the embodiment of health-beauty would suggest that we either do have the same taste or that we are impoverished in the form of capital necessary for being successful in the health-beauty field. The commercials provide us with tools for obtaining capital in this field – the products serve as means for aiding the consumer in becoming a more successful member of society. This success is marked by how we achieve and display the values of the habitus, which in this case is the embodiment of health and beauty. Purchasing the particular brand of makeup, toothpaste, and yogurt indicates to society that we are adhering to the values of the health-beauty consumption community. This in turn reinforces the ideals promoted in the ads. This interchange between perceived practices and the habitus is what Bourdieu (1984) refers to as a “structured and structuring structure” (p.171). It recursively builds on itself reinforcing and redistributing ideology between society and its members.
Ultimately this recursivity works to normalize ideology, naturalizing it (Fairclough, 1989). What does this mean in terms of health and beauty? It means that as advertising continues to leverage healthism and the body beautiful together to market its products the co-occurrence between health and beauty will not only seem normal it will seem inextricable. The issue with this is of course that health and beauty are indeed separate and conceptual rather than static and immutable. Moreover, it is problematic that these two concepts become one and the same because their consolidation lends itself to dangerous fallacies about body image and tolerable body modification practices.

5.6 Limitations and directions for future study

Although the analysis aimed to examine at least three cases of the health-beauty relationship in advertising (to represent at least three levels of explicitness) the data was limited to only three commercials. This could entail that some of the observations made may not necessarily be only true of health-beauty ads but may instead be patterns of ads in general. The intention was to provide a relatively rich analysis of how the health-beauty consolidation can be constructed in ads. However in order to be able to determine the larger patterns at play in these types of commercials more data would be investigated. Another limitation was the variety of the products of the commercials. Future research could not only investigate more data, but it could focus on a particular product type. For example, there could be a study on the health-beauty relationship in ads pertaining just to nutrition, or just cosmetics, or just dental care, etc. Similarly, future research could investigate particular companies to see if the health-beauty association occurs in all their ads or only some and to what extent. This may help us to understand in what circumstances the health-beauty association is leveraged in advertising. Additionally,
future research could include audience reception research to help shed light on some of the social implications questions that come about during this type of research.

5.7 Conclusion

This study has applied a critical multimodal discourse analysis to three television commercials: 1) Neutrogena ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’, 2) Colgate ‘Advanced Total whitening toothpaste’, and 3) Danone ‘Activia probiotic yogurt’. The purpose of this study was to illustrate how these advertisements constructed a relationship between health and beauty in order to gain insight into how ads can shape body image ideologies. The analytical framework for this research included Systemic Functional Linguistics, Critical Discourse Analysis, Multimodal Discourse Analysis, and Inter-mode Analysis, in order critical examine the verbal and the visual modes of communication both separately and in relation to one another. I have discussed the findings in terms of the theories of healthism discourse and the aestheticization of everyday life. In addition, the concepts of Bourdieu on habitus, lifestyle, taste, capital, and field have been used to discuss how the health-beauty consolidation is recursively produced and reproduced by society and its members. The results of this study suggest that there is a colonization of the advertising non-health related products under healthism discourse and this type of advertising is co-occurring with ideologies of the body beautiful resulting in an unprecedented consolidation between the concepts of health and beauty. In addition, these findings underscore the need for media literacy and hence the importance of practicing and also teaching discourse analysis approaches such as SFL, CDA, and MDA.
Appendices

Appendix A Neutrogena ad ‘Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup’
Appendix B Colgate ad ‘Colgate Total Advanced Whitening’
Appendix C Danone ad ‘Activia’

*All three appendices contain a chart13 organized into four main columns: Frame, Visual, Aural, Inter-mode Relations. This corresponds, respectively, to a thumbnail representing a frame in the ad, a visual break down of the MDA tools applied, a transcription of the narrations and captions of the ad, and the types of inter-mode relations between the verbal and the visual modes.

13 The charts contained in the Appendices have been designed primarily drawing from the work of Sheyholislami (2010), as well as the work from van Leeuwen (2005) and Maier et al. (2007).
### Appendix A

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Frame</th>
<th>Visual</th>
<th>Verbal</th>
<th>Inter-mode Relations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Elaboration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1   | ![Image](image1.png) | Distance: intimate  
Angle: top-down  
Modality: high  
Color: tan, cream, beige  
Composition: centered, focused, no background | “There’s a lot of beautiful makeup out there” | | Complement:  
The image adds to new meaning, showing what beautiful makeup may look like. |
| 2   | ![Image](image2.png) | Distance: intimate  
Angle: top-down  
Modality: high  
Color: tan, cream, beige  
Composition: centered, focused, no background | “To cover up flaws, and make skin look pretty” | | Complement:  
The image adds to new meaning, associating makeup with flawlessness and beauty |
| 3   | ![Image](image3.png) | Distance: intimate  
Angle: top-down  
Modality: high  
Color: tan, cream, beige  
Composition: centered, focused, no background | “But there’s one that’s so clever...” | | |
| 4   | ![Image](image4.png) | Distance: intimate  
Angle: top-down  
Modality: high  
Color: tan, cream, beige  
Composition: centered, focused, no background | “…it makes your skin look better even after you take it off” | | Complement:  
The narration adds new meaning to the blobs of makeup, suggesting that there is a capacity for them to be clever, different than other makeup. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Frame</th>
<th>Visual</th>
<th>Verbal</th>
<th>Inter-mode Relations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Distance: intimate&lt;br&gt;Angle: top-down&lt;br&gt;Modality: hyper-real&lt;br&gt;Color: white, beige&lt;br&gt;Composition: right, focused, no background</td>
<td>&quot;Neutrogena Healthy Skin Liquid Makeup&quot;</td>
<td>Elaboration: Specification: The image helps make the narration more specific by showing the product itself. Extension: Similarity: The text of the image is the same as what is being narrated.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td>Distance: Neutral&lt;br&gt;Angle: level&lt;br&gt;Modality: hyper-real&lt;br&gt;Color: white, tan, beige, cream&lt;br&gt;Composition: right, focused, no background</td>
<td>&quot;98% of women saw improvement in their skin’s natural texture, tone, and clarity&quot;</td>
<td>Similarity: The text of the image is the same as what is being narrated. Complement: The image of the makeup extends what is being said, it qualifies the narration.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td>Distance: intimate&lt;br&gt;Angle: level&lt;br&gt;Gaze: direct (demand)&lt;br&gt;Modality: high&lt;br&gt;Color: tan, white, brown&lt;br&gt;Composition: center, focused, no background</td>
<td>&quot;Does your makeup do that?&quot;</td>
<td>Complement: The image adds new meaning to who the narrator is – not just a voice, but the voice of actress Jennifer Garner, a celebrity, a young, and arguably attractive woman.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td>Distance: Friendly&lt;br&gt;Angle: level&lt;br&gt;Modality: hyper-real&lt;br&gt;Color: white, earth tone pastels&lt;br&gt;Composition: centered, focused, foregrounded</td>
<td>&quot;Neutrogena cosmetics, recommended most by dermatologists&quot;</td>
<td>Complement: The image adds meaning to the text – that makeup can be a doctor recommended health product. Similarity: The narration of text &amp; image are the same.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Image" /></td>
<td>Distance: Friendly&lt;br&gt;Angle: level&lt;br&gt;Modality: hyper-real&lt;br&gt;Color: white, earth tone pastels&lt;br&gt;Composition: centered, focused, foregrounded</td>
<td>&quot;Neutrogena cosmetics, recommended most by dermatologists&quot;</td>
<td>Complement: The image adds meaning to the text – that makeup can be a doctor recommended health product. Similarity: The narration of text &amp; image are the same.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Appendix B

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Frame</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><img src="image" alt="Frame Visual" /></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Visual
- Distance: Neutral
- Angle: level
- Gaze: indirect (offer)
- Modality: neutral
- Color: white
- Composition: right, backgrounded, focused

### Verbal
- "Well for me..."

### Inter-mode Relations
- **Elaboration**
- **Extension**
  - Complement: The image is not just a photo shoot, it is the intro to a personal anecdote.

### Distance: Intimate
- Angle: level
- Gaze: direct (demand)
- Modality: high
- Color: white
- Composition: centered, foregrounded, focused

### Verbal
- "white teeth are sort of a job requirement"

### Inter-mode Relations
- **Specification**
  - The image makes the dialogue more specific

### Distance: Neutral
- Angle: level
- Gaze: indirect (offer)
- Modality: high
- Color: white
- Composition: centered, foregrounded, focused

### Verbal
- "But I actually think that having healthy teeth is more important"

### Inter-mode Relations
- **Specification**
  - Image serves as an icon of whose value is communicated in the verbal.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Frame</th>
<th>Visual</th>
<th>Verbal</th>
<th>Inter-mode Relations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 5   | ![Image](0x0) | Distance: intimate  
Angle: level  
Modality: high  
Color: white, red, blue  
Composition: centered, foregrounded, focused | “So I upgraded to Colgate Total Advanced Whitening”  
“We upgraded...” | Specification:  
Image shows what the product is, making the verbal more specific |
| 6   | ![Image](0x0) | Distance: friendly  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: high  
Color: red, pastels  
Composition: right, backgrounded, focused and unfocused | “...adding advanced whitening technology to the 12 hour germ fighting of Colgate Total” | Similarity:  
The voice-over is saying the same as what is being shown on in the image.  
Extension:  
The image is giving new meaning to the verbal, showing how the product is used. |
| 7   | ![Image](0x0) | Distance: friendly  
Angle: level  
Gaze: direct (demand)  
Modality: neutral  
Color: pastels  
Composition: centered, foregrounded, focused | “Well, now I get the germ fighting I need...” | Complement:  
The image does not depict germs or germ fighting, it works with the verbal to make a new meaning. |
| 8   | ![Image](0x0) | Distance: friendly  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: neutral  
Color: white  
Composition: right, foregrounded, focused | “... and the whitening I want” | Complement:  
The image does not depict germs or germ fighting, it works with the verbal to make a new meaning.  
Image creates new meaning with the text, showing what is wanted: its whiteness, beauty, etc. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Frame</th>
<th>Visual</th>
<th>Verbal</th>
<th>Inter-mode Relations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|     |       | Distance: intimate  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: high  
Color: pastels  
Composition: centered, foregrounded, very focused | “Having healthy, white teeth...” | Specification:  
Image becomes an emblem of what it looks like to have ‘healthy’, ‘white’ teeth. |
| 9   | ![Image](https://via.placeholder.com/150) | Distance: neutral  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: neutral  
Color: white  
Composition: centered | “I am ready for my most important...” | |
| 10  | ![Image](https://via.placeholder.com/150) | Distance: intimate  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: neutral  
Color: white  
Composition: centered | “... role ever” | Complement:  
Images extend the meaning of role to mean more than acting, it means being a mother too — a care giver. |
| 11  | ![Image](https://via.placeholder.com/150) | Distance: neutral  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: neutral  
Color: white  
Composition: centered, foregrounded, focused | “Colgate Total Advanced Whitening upgrade to the healthier side of whitening” | Similarity:  
The voice-over is saying the same as what is being shown on in the image. |
| 12  | ![Image](https://via.placeholder.com/150) | Distance: neutral  
Angle: level  
Modality: high (hyper-real)  
Color: white, red  
Composition: centered, foregrounded, focused | Similarity:  
The voice-over is saying the same as what is being shown on in the image. | Complement:  
The image is giving new meaning to what tooth paste can do — it can make teeth healthy while making them beautiful. |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Frame</th>
<th>Visual</th>
<th>Verbal</th>
<th>Inter-mode Relations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Elaboration</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1   |       | Distance: far  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: low  
Color: yellow, green, desaturated grey  
Composition: right, focused, foregrounded  
Framing: contrast |        |        | |
| 2   |       | Distance: neutral  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: low  
Color: yellow, green, desaturated grey  
Composition: right, focused, foregrounded  
Framing: contrast |        |        | |
| 3   |       | Distance: neutral  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: low  
Color: yellow, green, desaturated grey  
Composition: left, focused, foregrounded  
Framing: contrast |        |        | |
| 4   |       | Distance: far  
Angle: level  
Gaze: indirect (offer)  
Modality: low  
Color: yellow, green, desaturated grey  
Composition: left, focused, backgrounded  
Framing: contrast |        |        | |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Frame</th>
<th>Visual</th>
<th>Verbal</th>
<th>Inter-mode Relations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Distance: neutral</td>
<td>“As well as tasting...”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Angle: level</td>
<td></td>
<td>Elaboration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gaze: indirect (offer)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modality: low</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Color: yellow, green, desaturated grey</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition: right, focused, foregrounded</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Framing: contrast</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td><img src="image1.png" alt="Frame" /></td>
<td>Distance: neutral</td>
<td>“As well as tasting...”</td>
<td>Complement: The image adds meaning to the text by showing what ‘tasting delicious’ can look like</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Angle: level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gaze: indirect (offer)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modality: low</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Color: green</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition: center</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td><img src="image2.png" alt="Frame" /></td>
<td>Distance: friendly</td>
<td>“… delicious, Activia’s the only yoghurt...”</td>
<td>Specification: The text makes the image more specific.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Angle: level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gaze: indirect (offer)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modality: low</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Color: green</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition: center</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td><img src="image3.png" alt="Frame" /></td>
<td>Distance: na</td>
<td>“... with B.L. Regularis. A probiotic culture...”</td>
<td>Similarity: The narration and the text say the same thing, “BL Regularis”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Angle: na</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gaze: na</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modality: na</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Color: yellow, green</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition: centered</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Framing: na</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td><img src="image4.png" alt="Frame" /></td>
<td>Distance: na</td>
<td>“... unique to Danone. Discover what makes Activia so unique at ...”</td>
<td>Complement: The image adds further meaning to the narration by showing Activia yogurt as separate and ‘unique’ compared to other yogurts.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Angle: na</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Gaze: na</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Modality: na</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Color: green, yellow</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Composition: centered, split in two</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Framing: segregation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
References


van Leeuwen, T. (2004). Ten reasons why linguists should pay attention to visual communication. In Philip LeVine and Ron Scollon (Eds.), *Discourse and technology: Multimodal discourse analysis* (pp.7-19). Georgetown University Press.


