PIONEERS IN METHYLENE BLUE TESTING SINCE 1974

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Your file - Votre référence

Our file - Notre référence

NOTICE

The quality of this microform is heavily dependent upon the quality of the original thesis submitted for microfilming. Every effort has been made to ensure the highest quality of reproduction possible.

If pages are missing, contact the university which granted the degree.

Some pages may have indistinct print especially if the original pages were typed with a poor typewriter ribbon or if the university sent us an inferior photocopy.

Reproduction in full or in part of this microform is governed by the Canadian Copyright Act, R.S.C. 1970, c. C-30, and subsequent amendments.

AVIS

La qualité de cette microforme dépend grandement de la qualité de la thèse soumise au microfilmage. Nous avons tout fait pour assurer une qualité supérieure de reproduction.

S'il manque des pages, veuillez communiquer avec l'université qui a conféré le grade.

La qualité d'impression de certaines pages peut laisser à désirer, surtout si les pages originales ont été dactylographiées à l'aide d'un ruban usé ou si l'université nous a fait parvenir une photocopie de qualité inférieure.

La reproduction, même partielle, de cette microforme est soumise à la Loi canadienne sur le droit d'auteur, SRC 1970, c. C-30, et ses amendements subséquents.

CONTRIBUTIONS OF THIRD WORLD WOMEN
TO A FEMINIST VISION OF DEVELOPMENT

by

CYNTHIA KING B.A., B.Ed.

A thesis submitted to
the Faculty of Graduate Studies and Research
in partial fulfilment of
the requirements for the degree of

Master of Arts

Department of Sociology and Anthropology

Carleton University

Ottawa, Ontario

April 13, 1992

c copyright

1992, Cynthia King

National Library
of Canada

Acquisitions and
Bibliographic Services Branch

395 Wellington Street
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0N4

Bibliothèque nationale
du Canada

Direction des acquisitions et
des services bibliographiques

395, rue Wellington
Ottawa (Ontario)
K1A 0N4

Votre titre - Votre référence

Our title - Notre référence

The author has granted an irrevocable non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of his/her thesis by any means and in any form or format, making this thesis available to interested persons.

L'auteur a accordé une licence irrévocable et non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de sa thèse de quelque manière et sous quelque forme que ce soit pour mettre des exemplaires de cette thèse à la disposition des personnes intéressées.

The author retains ownership of the copyright in his/her thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without his/her permission.

L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège sa thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.

ISBN 0-315-79832-7

Canada

The undersigned recommend to the Faculty of Graduate Studies
and Research acceptance of the thesis

"CONTRIBUTIONS OF THIRD WORLD WOMEN TO
A FEMINIST VISION OF DEVELOPMENT"

submitted by Cynthia King B.A., B.Ed.
in partial fulfillment of the requirements for
the degree of Master of Arts

Larad Kiel

Thesis Supervisor

J. R. Kelly

Chair, Department of Sociology and Anthropology

Carleton University

April 28, 1992

ABSTRACT

Current development practice has been lamentably unsuccessful largely because of a failure to problematise gender inequality and to base development programmes on the analyses and strategies identified by the people of the Third World themselves. The two related objectives of this thesis are to bring feminist theory and practice to bear on the theory and practice of development, and to do so by examining the standpoint of feminists from the Third World. A feminist framework, based on the experiences and analyses of Third World women should improve the effectiveness of development programmes. An examination of development theory and feminist theory as seen by Third World feminist researchers and activists is followed by a detailed examination of three development issues - structural adjustment, the new international division of labour and violence against women - to illustrate the contributions of Third World women to a feminist vision of development.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

My greatest debt is to the hundreds of women in the Third World who have shared their hopes, dreams and thoughts with me in the course of my work in international development. Their lives have inspired me, personally, professionally and academically. Their ideas have opened new perspectives for me.

The idea for this thesis came from my work with MATCH International Centre which kindly gave me a leave of absence to pursue my academic work. My colleagues at MATCH were a continuing source of encouragement.

A number of faculty at Carleton University were instrumental in guiding my academic work. Jared Keil, my thesis supervisor, created for me an ideally supportive learning environment. Lorna Weir provided helpful and copious suggestions to strengthen and improve my arguments. Together, they were a wonderful committee. I am indebted to them both. My thanks also to Fiona Mackenzie for opening new methodological perspectives to me and to Linda Freeman for helping me to hone my writing skills.

My data gathering was facilitated by the generous assistance of staff members of the libraries and resource centres which I visited. In particular, my thanks go to Niamh Reilly of the Centre for Global Issues and Women's Leadership, Alice Mastrangelo of the International Women's Tribune Centre and Cheryl King of WAND. I am grateful to Peggy Antrobus, Fatma Alloo, Joan French and Andaiye who allowed me to impose on their busy schedules for interviews. They were of great help in giving foundation and direction to my work.

Finally, my deep appreciation to my immediate family, Bob, Boyd and Pam who lovingly and patiently shared the ups, downs and deprivations associated with student life.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACCEPTANCE SHEET	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	iv
TABLE OF CONTENTS	v
LIST OF APPENDICES	vii
CHAPTER ONE: INTRODUCTION	1
Origins	1
Background	3
Rationale	5
The Process	7
CHAPTER TWO: METHODOLOGY	10
Introduction	10
The Philosophical Approach	12
The Technical Approach: Definitions and Data	22
Evaluation	33
CHAPTER THREE: DEVELOPMENT THEORY: TOWARDS A FEMINIST VISION	35
Introduction	35
Women's Place in Development Theory	38
A Feminist Critique	45
The Emergence of Feminist Development Theory	57
Conclusion	63
CHAPTER FOUR: FEMINISM IN THE SOUTH	65
Introduction	65
Roots of Feminism in the South	67
Influences on the Development of Feminism in the South	71
Contemporary Third World Feminism	86
A Third World Feminist Vision of Development	94
Conclusion	98
CHAPTER FIVE: STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT: WOMEN DEAL WITH THE DEBT	99
Introduction	99
The Roots of the Crisis	101
Structural Adjustment	108
Third World Women's Analyses	109
Women and Structural Adjustment	115
A Feminist Vision	126
Conclusion	131

CHAPTER SIX: THE NEW INTERNATIONAL DIVISION OF LABOUR: INEVITABLE INEQUALITY	
Introduction	133
The New International Division of Labour	135
The Export Processing Zone	140
A Feminist Analysis of the New International Division of Labour	150
Conclusion	166
CHAPTER SEVEN: VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN: A DEVELOPMENT ISSUE	168
Introduction	168
Violence: An Overview	170
Damage and Devastation	178
Resistance	180
Violence as a Means of Social and Political Control	190
International Sex Trade	196
Conclusion	215
CHAPTER EIGHT: CONCLUSION	217
REFERENCES	226
APPENDIX A: Women's Research and Resource Centres in the Third World	254
APPENDIX B: Interview Schedules	257
APPENDIX C: Magazines and Journals Published by Third World Women	260

LIST OF APPENDICES

Appendix A: Women's Research and Resource Centres in the Third World	Page 254
Appendix B: Interview Schedules	Page 257
Appendix C: Magazines and Journals Published by Third World Women	Page 260

CHAPTER ONE

INTRODUCTION

If you have come to help me you are wasting your time. But if you have come because your liberation is bound up with mine then let us work together.

Lilla Watson
quoted on a poster published by the World YWCA
(1987)

Origins

Over the past twenty years, there has been a proliferation of research in the area of women's role in Third World development, much of it done by Western¹ scholars. The African Association of Women for Research and Development (AAWORD) (1982:104) has identified three factors which have triggered recent interest in the field:

1. Primarily challenges from women to male-dominated social science, which visualizes female roles as necessary, natural and essentially not worthy of serious intellectual inquiry;
2. Recognition of the present universal subordination of women, which has led to a widespread query as to whether the position of women has been subordinate to that of men everywhere and at all times;
3. The growing women's movement: the resultant new knowledge about women in society coincided with

¹ In this thesis, the terms "West", "North", "industrialised" and "metropolitan" will be used to denote those countries commonly considered to be "developed". The terms "South", "Third World" and "peripheral" will be used to denote those countries commonly considered to be "underdeveloped". None of these terms is entirely accurate or politically "comfortable"; they are merely the best of a mediocre lot.

and was partly triggered by the failure of the First Development Decade as manifested by the 'world food crisis', 'population explosion' and widespread poverty. Women were 'discovered' to be central to both 'crises' of production and reproduction. Hence the need to include 'women and development' in the development agenda.

AAWORD (1982:104) further suggests that this research has had some positive effects:

...the creation of an awareness of women's important, yet neglected role in society, the creation of a forum where this issue continues to be debated and a growing solidarity among women in different parts of the world.

My own interest in gender and development² forms part of this current trend but at the same time attempts to explore an important, yet neglected area, that of the contributions being made by women from the Third World to a feminist vision of development. So much of the current academic debate in the North about women's role in development has been dominated by Western feminists that the voices of Third World women have gone unheard. Central to my research has been the conviction that these are precisely the voices to which we in the North must give ear. These are the women most directly concerned in the discussion and from whom Northern development scholars and practitioners

² I am using the terms "gender and development" or "women and development" in the lower case as alternatives for the more lengthy expression "women's role in the development process", and not in reference to a specific theoretical orientation. I am using the terms "Gender and Development (GAD)", "Women in Development (WID)", "Global Feminism" and "Feminist Development" in the upper case, to refer to theoretical frameworks which will be explained in Chapter Three.

have much to learn. In this thesis I shall attempt to come to a greater understanding of "a feminist vision of development" from the standpoint of women in the Third World.

Background

My decision to undertake this research is directly related to my experience in international development both in Canada and overseas. Since completing my undergraduate degree, I have had the opportunity to live in the Third World on two occasions, first in Peru and subsequently in Barbados. These experiences were crucial in shaping my perspective toward the Third World and my analysis of the relationship between the North and the South. My working life in Canada has been spent with non-governmental international development organisations and with women's organisations. Of particular relevance has been my work with MATCH International Centre, a Canadian non-governmental organization (NGO) which works with women's groups in the Third World and in Canada. I have travelled fairly extensively in Latin America and the Caribbean and to a lesser extent in Africa. A great deal of this time overseas has been spent meeting with individual women and women's groups. Much of what I have learned about both development and feminism I have learned from them.

This overview of my own experience must be

dovetailed with that of MATCH International Centre where I have been working for the past seven years, a period that has proved to be decisive both for me and for the organisation. MATCH was incorporated as a national non-profit, non-governmental organisation in 1977 in response to concern about the adverse effects of the development process on women. Originally, MATCH provided financial support to small projects undertaken by women's groups in the Third World, and carried out educational programmes in Canada about the situation of women in the South. Following an organisational evaluation in 1987, MATCH (1992:1) redefined itself as

...a Canadian-based women's organization, committed with its Third World sisters, to a feminist vision of development. Such a vision requires the eradication of all forms of injustice, particularly the exploitation and marginalization of women.

Current programming is focused on the themes of Violence Against Women, Gender and Development Analysis and Women's Cultural Expression, and includes such activities as small project support, organisational strengthening, research, publications, training, exchanges, educational tours, conferences and seminars (MATCH, 1992:2).

MATCH's early work was based on the concerns raised by Ester Boserup in her ground-breaking book, *Women's Role in Economic Development*, published in 1970. During the succeeding years, a number of theoretical and practical approaches to women's role in development have been put

forward, primarily by Western scholars and practitioners. Within this context of changing frameworks for development programmes with women, MATCH has been seeking to elaborate its own unique approach. In doing so, MATCH has drawn on two theoretical frameworks, Gender and Development (GAD), and Global Feminism, in an effort to construct what we have called "a feminist vision of development". My present need is to clarify for myself what such a vision is in order to contribute my understanding to the ongoing debate within the international development community in Canada. I cannot do this without coming to a greater knowledge of a feminist vision of development from the standpoint of feminist activists and researchers in the Third World. This thesis is a record of my journey toward that understanding.

Rationale

Before outlining the direction this journey will take, it is important to establish why such an understanding is necessary for me as a development worker. This is related to the concept of "standpoint". Nancy Hartsock (1983:285) describes "standpoint" as "not simply an interested position (interpreted as bias) but...interested in the sense of being engaged." As we shall see in Chapter Three, development theory and practice have been dominated by white, Northern, middle class men while those most affected by development have been Southern, working class

and peasant women and men of colour.

Hartsock's (1983:285) analysis of standpoint explains the distorted vision that these men have had of the women of the South.

(1) Material life (class position in Marxist theory) not only structures but sets limits on the understanding of social relations. (2) If material life is structured in fundamentally opposing ways for two different groups, one can expect that the vision of each will represent an inversion of the other, and in systems of domination the vision available to the rulers will be both partial and perverse. (3) The vision of the ruling class (or gender) structures the material relations in which all parties are forced to participate, and therefore cannot be dismissed as simply false. (4) In consequence, the vision available to the oppressed group must be struggled for and represents an achievement which requires both science to see beneath the surface of the social relations in which all are forced to participate, and the education which can grow only from struggle to change those relations. (5) As an engaged vision, the understanding of the oppressed, the adoption of a standpoint exposes the real relations among human beings as inhuman, points beyond the present, and carries a historically liberatory role.

Hartsock (1983:303) goes on to argue that

The articulation of a feminist standpoint based on women's relational self-definition and activity exposes the world men have constructed and the self-understanding which manifests these relations as partial and perverse. More importantly, by drawing out the potentiality available in the actuality and thereby exposing the inhumanity of human relations, it embodies a distress which requires a solution.

The results of the distorted vision which Hartsock describes can be seen in development programmes which have been ineffective because they have disregarded the power differentials between men and women, assumed that men and

women benefit equally, ignored women's productive roles and the contribution to production made by women's reproductive work, and failed to consult the women and men for whose alleged benefit the programmes were planned. Problems have similarly arisen when Northern feminists have neglected to try to understand the perspective of feminists from the South and have assumed a universal feminism based on a Northern view. The resulting misconceptions have had adverse effects on the building of a global feminist movement.

Narayan (1989:264) contrasts the potential to perceive of the oppressed and the oppressor and claims an "epistemic advantage" for oppressed groups in comprehending their own situation. In the development context, Hartsock's "inhumanity" is manifested in the gendered effects of development and women's subordinate status within and often because of the development process. The "solution" which I am proposing is a vision of development as seen from the standpoint of Third World feminists. As an "outsider" with sympathy but without an "epistemic advantage", one way to approach an understanding of women in the Third World is through their writing.

The Process

My journey toward understanding will begin in Chapter Two with a description of the philosophical and

technical approaches I used in carrying out my research. I will argue that a feminist methodology has proved especially effective in bringing me towards my goal. Chapter Three outlines the historical development of gender and development theory. We will see how early development theory and practice ignored the experience of women and worked to their greater disadvantage. Recent efforts to redress this imbalance have given rise to several approaches to women's role in development. The newest and most effective to date is Feminist Development, a body of theory just now emerging from the work of feminists in the South and the North. Chapter Four will trace the growth of feminism in the South, not as a replica of feminism in the North, but in response to the specific situations of women in those regions. We will see how Third World women have combined development theory and feminist theory, both rooted in their own experiences, to form a Southern feminist vision of development. That vision has been applied to a variety of development issues. In Chapters Five, Six and Seven, we will look at three such issues - structural adjustment, the new international division of labour, and violence against women - as examples of the contributions which Third World feminists have made to the international development dialogue. The end of the journey comes in Chapter Eight. We will look once more at the feminist vision of development presented by women from the South. We will see that such a

vision presents enormous challenges to development organisations in the North, challenges which must be met if development is to be a liberatory experience for the poor and oppressed in both North and South. This journey has been a personal one, but one that is intended to be shared.

CHAPTER TWO

METHODOLOGY

The only motive that makes sense to me for your joining us in this investigation is the motive of friendship, out of friendship. A non-imperialist feminism requires that you make a real space for our articulating, interpreting, theorising and reflecting about the connections among them - a real space must be a non-coerced space - and/or that you follow us into our world out of friendship.

María C. Lugones
in Lugones and Spelman (1983)

Introduction

The overall goal in carrying out my research was to seek a broader and deeper understanding of a feminist vision of development as seen by women in the Third World. It is my hope that such an understanding on my part and on the part of others working in international development will help us work more effectively toward the greater empowerment of women and other oppressed groups both in the Third World and in Canada. In approaching the question of methodology, I have found useful the distinction that Sandra Harding (1987:2) makes between *methodology*, the theory and analysis of how research should proceed, and *method*, the techniques of gathering evidence. I think of Harding's distinction as that between the *philosophical* and the *technical* approach to research. This chapter will concern itself with both aspects.

In addressing the philosophical questions, I will first explain how I came to select a feminist methodology and define what that means within the context of this research. A feminist approach takes into consideration, among other things, the identity of the researcher and the impact of that identity on the research process. I have felt very conscious of the differences in culture, race, language, though not, perhaps, class, between myself and the women whose work I have been studying, as well as our differing places in the global economic and political system. It is therefore relevant to explore some of the literature on this question and my own response to the critiques of Western feminist research that have been made by women from the Third World.

The philosophical base leads into a description of the methods and procedures I used in seeking research materials and the ways in which I have tried to bridge the gaps between the researcher and the researched. The data which I was seeking were basically the published and unpublished writing of feminists from the Third World concerning feminism and its application to women's role in the development process. This information was complemented by interviews conducted with four feminist researchers and activists from the South. With the data in hand, I was then able to decide how best to analyse it for the purposes of the thesis. Finally, I will evaluate the process overall,

pointing out which methods worked well, which were less successful and what might have been done more effectively.

The Philosophical Approach

I adopted a feminist methodology because that seemed most likely to enable me to gain the kind of understanding I was looking for, most consistent with the subject I was researching, and most comfortable for me as a researcher. My reading in feminist methodology brought to my attention a number of tenets which I found relevant for the particular type of research I was doing and which I endeavoured to apply.

Feminist research projects originate...in women's experiences in political struggles (Harding, 1987:8).

As I explained in Chapter One, this research project arose from my own experience in working in the field of international development over the past 20 years and the experience of MATCH International Centre and its involvement with women in the Third World since 1977. Part of the experience has been an "internal" struggle to develop my own understanding of the problematic of women in the development process. Part has been an "external" struggle, endeavouring to share that understanding with other individuals and organisations within the development community.

(F)eminist research...generates its problematics from the perspective of women's

experiences...Notice that it is "women's experiences" in the plural which provide the new resources for research...(W)omen's... experiences, desires, and interests differ according to class, race, and culture. (Harding, 1987:7).

It was for precisely this reason that I wanted to look at development from the perspective of the women who were living it on a daily basis, the women of the Third World. So much of what seemed to me wrong about the development process, so much of what had failed in development practice, stemmed from the fact that most development agencies, governmental, non-governmental and multilateral, were approaching development from a perspective that was white, male, Northern and middle class. We will look at a non-white, feminist, Southern critique of development in Chapter Three.

The postulate of value free research, of neutrality and indifference towards research objects, has to be replaced by conscious partiality, which is achieved through partial identification with the research objects (Mies, 1983:122).

My professional work with MATCH and my contacts and relationships with women from the Third World had already given me a *conscious partiality*, a sense of commitment to them and to the work in which they were engaged. It was because of this commitment that I was seeking to understand more fully their experiences and their visions and to try to bring those visions to the attention of others.

[There is] a necessary and integral connection

between feminist scholarship and feminist political practice and organizing (Mohanty, 1988:62).

For this reason I endeavoured to look particularly for writing by women who were feminist activists as well as researchers or scholars. I also wanted to make my research relevant to my own professional work and to other feminists and practitioners in the international development field.

A sociology for women preserves the presence of subjects as knowers and as actors. It does not transform subjects into the objects of study or make use of conceptual devices for eliminating the active presence of subjects (Smith, 1987:105).

In exploring a feminist vision of development, I wanted to see women as analysts, strategists and activists, not as objects. Chapters Three and Four will show us how women have analysed their own role as women and as actors in the development process. In Chapters Five, Six and Seven, we will see how women have resisted their subordination and become agents of change in three specific areas related to development.

(T)he class, race, culture and gender assumptions, beliefs, and behaviors of the researcher her/himself must be placed within the frame of the picture that she/he attempts to paint (Harding, 1987:9).

In Chapter One, I sketched my own identity and gave, in considerable detail, the background to this research and its origin in my experiences working in development and with women, both in the Third World and in Canada. There is a relationship of catalytic symbiosis between who I am and

what I do (as a researcher or as a development practitioner) in which each influences the other. Who I am has coloured the research and analysis reflected in this thesis. That work has also changed me as a person and will, I hope, influence my work in the future.

The knowledge formulated [as a result of research] must be of value to those whose experience is reflected therein. Such knowledge goes to facilitate the struggles waged by the disadvantaged. It may not be used by the status quo to continue subjugation, oppression and exploitation. In this sense, knowledge is itself 'liberated'... (Mangena, 1991:6).

For this reason, I wanted to investigate feminist development as conceived by women of the Third World rather than women of the North. This would, I felt, help me work around the obstacles of race and culture. I did, however, feel some concern that by reading and analysing written work by feminist researchers and activists, rather than, for example, interviewing women community activists from the popular sectors, I would be limiting myself to the ideas of women who were mostly middle class or even upper class. I tried therefore, to look for work that addressed the situations and priorities of rural and urban poor women. I hope too that my own research will, however indirectly, serve the interests of those same women by changing the attitudes and orientations of development practitioners from the North.

The reference earlier to differences in such factors as race, culture and language between the researcher

and the researched is related to a concern that has been expressed most forcefully by women from the Third World (Amadiume, 1987; Mohanty, 1988; Lazreg, 1988; AAWORD, 1982). This is the question of racism in research carried out by feminist scholars from the North on women in the South'.

This racism may be different in form but is directly related to the blatant racism of early anthropologists who assessed anything non-European as inferior, primitive, backward, unimportant and even immoral². In considering western feminist research on women in the Third World one must take into account the global economic and political context. AAWORD (1982:102) compares the global position of Africa economically and intellectually.

(C)oncomitant with Africa's role in the world economy as provider of raw materials and recipient of manufactured products, the international division of intellectual labour is such that Africa and Africans are the providers of 'raw data' and the recipients of finished products in the form of 'theories' and development programmes.

Thus research remains a tool for domination (AAWORD, 1982:103) rather than liberation. Colonialism in the past and neocolonialism in the present have created an imbalance of power inherent in the relationship between the Northern

¹ Racism has also been identified in the attitudes of some feminists toward black women and women of colour in their own cultures (Lugones and Spelman, 1983; Bhavnani and Coulson, 1986; González, 1988).

² In referring to examples of such racism, Amadiume (1987:1) cites the work of Radcliffe-Brown and Malinowski.

researcher and her Southern subject (Mbilinyi, 1984:119), including what Lazreg (1988:96) calls the "power of interpretation". Women in the Third World, like women in the North, want to tell their own stories, not to have their lives interpreted for them by others.

AAWORD (1982:103) notes that most of the social science research carried out on women in Africa in recent years has been that of Western women academics. Unfortunately, little of this research is available to African scholars (AAWORD, 1982:107). Women's studies has also gained a credibility in the West that it has not yet achieved in many Third World contexts (AAWORD, 1982:107). Given this imbalance, one might well ask why women academics in the North are not making greater efforts to ensure that their colleagues in the South have greater access to research funds and publishers. It is natural for Third World women to resent a Northern scholar's relative ease of access to grants for research on Southern women which could possibly have been better carried out by scholars from the South. Amadiume (1987:9) angrily notes,

After eavesdropping on Third World women's conversations, [Western researchers] turn self-appointed champions, defenders of our cultural institutions, and are quick to get to publishers before us!

Mbilinyi (1984:291) expresses concern that because of the hegemony of Northern research, Southern scholars often become "academic mercenaries", carrying out projects

conceptualised, co-ordinated, analysed and funded from the North in response to Northern rather than Southern priorities.

The racism of Western feminists is also expressed in their conceptualisation of women in the Third World. This occurs in two forms. First is "ethnocentric universalism" (Mohanty, 1988:64) by which a "sameness", based on the Western experience, is extended to women all over the globe. Oppression as experienced by (white) women in the West is assumed to be common to women throughout the world and to automatically create sisterhood among all women (AAWORD, 1982:105). Such an assumption does not take into account the influence of race, ethnicity, class and imperialism on women's lives (Mohanty, 1988:64). Nor does it recognise that these factors often place women in conflict with each other (Bhavnani and Coulson, 1986:84). Sisterhood is not automatic; it is "forged in historical and political praxis" (Mohanty, 1988:67) and can grow only after white women have acknowledged "the complex power relationships between white women and white men in relation to black women and black men" (Bhavnani and Coulson, 1986:90).

In contrast to this image of commonality among all women is the second Northern racist construction of women in the Third World, that of a homogeneous, powerless group, victimised by their cultural and socio-economic systems

(Mohanty, 1988:66), in contrast to women in the West who are liberated and in control of their lives. For example, Third World women deeply resent the attitudes of those Western feminists who express horror at the practice of female circumcision but can not recognise that "they themselves are victims of cultural and psychological clitoridectomy" (El Saadawi cited in Amadiume, 1987:8). More seriously, in their zeal, these Western crusaders are attempting to dominate a struggle which they have not troubled to fully understand and which is already being waged by those women directly involved (Amadiume, 1987:10).

Such attitudes on the part of Western feminist researchers have dangerous results. First of all, they make for bad scholarship in the form of false prescriptions and generalisations (AA'ORD, 1982:107). Further, Lazreg (1988:97) argues that

the misrepresentation of "different" women is a form of self-misrepresentation. It bespeaks a repression of one's femaleness and glosses over the fact that the represented is also engendered and remains far from having achieved the freedom and capacity to define herself.

Western feminist scholars criticise their male colleagues for universalising the male experience and silencing the voices of women, but these same feminist scholars deal in an identical way with their "sisters" in the South (Lazreg, 1988:87). The implications of this situation are far-reaching.

(W)hen the power of men over women is reproduced

in the power of women over women, feminism as an intellectual movement presents a caricature of the very institutions it was meant to question (Lazreg, 1988:97).

Secondly, the failure to recognise the very real conflicts among women, especially those based on class and race, means that such conflicts will never be addressed or resolved and that the women's movement globally will be weakened as a result (Bandarage, 1983:6; Bhavnani and Coulson, 1986:84).

Given the critiques that have come from the women of the South and the problems which racism poses for the feminist movement, what then is an appropriate role for a white, Northern feminist researcher? Amadiume (1987:10) contends that women from the West have no right to carry out research on women from other cultures and should stick to that which they know best, their own. As someone at whom this prescription is aimed, it is perhaps not surprising that I do not agree. While accepting many of Amadiume's examples of racism in Western research and recognising the dangers of distortion resulting from my own cultural bias, I believe that the appropriate question is not, "How can Northern women study women from the South?", but rather "How can we **not** do so?". Racism will not be eliminated by restricting ourselves to our own culture; such a strategy simply perpetuates parochialism. Nor will patriarchy be eliminated without a co-operative global effort involving women from many cultures and countries. Rather, we in the North must learn to see and hear and feel from *new*

perspectives. Indeed, Amadiume's view is not shared by other Third World feminists. Mohanty (1988:62) notes that the same attitudes found in Western feminist researchers can also be found in the work of some middle class, Third World women scholars, carrying out research on rural or working class women in their own countries. Narayan (1989:263-264) argues that while there are risks involved for Third World women in sharing their perspectives and insights with those who have not lived the same oppressions

it would be a mistake to move from the thesis that knowledge is constructed by human subjects who are socially constituted to the conclusion that those who are differently located socially can never attain *some* understanding of our experience or *some* sympathy with our cause. In that case, we would be committed to not just a perspectival view of knowledge but a relativistic one. Relativism, as I am using it, implies that a person could have knowledge of only the sorts of things she had experienced personally and that she would be totally unable to communicate any of the contents of her knowledge to someone who did not have the same sorts of experiences.

Instead, Narayan (1989:264) suggests that sensitivity among women with differing experiences be fostered by focusing on parallels rather than identities between different sorts of oppressions. Alloo (1991) points out the necessity of knowing one's own society and being committed to the struggles of oppressed peoples at home before setting out to investigate other struggles in other cultures. Both Antrobus (1991) and French (1991) emphasise the need for scholars from the North to recognise the demands their research makes on women in the South and to acknowledge and

compensate the contributions which those women make to the research results. Compensation need not be monetary, though that is always welcome; it can be in the form of a copy of the resulting thesis, article or film.

Western feminists are becoming increasingly aware of racism in their research and committed to addressing the problem. As Patricia Stamp (1989:19, 20 and 22) has defined it,

(Feminists) have rarely broken free of received Western truths about the nature of society (including gender relations) and truths grounded in assumptions held across the political spectrum of Western feminism from Marxism to developmentalism...Not only are we ignorant of the differences in concepts of family, politics, and economy in the Third World, we are also unaware that such differences exist. Our ignorance leads us to universalise our own Western categories and concepts...I am arguing for a materialism that on the one hand, sheds ethnocentrism and economism and, on the other, develops socialist feminism's commitment to historicize gender relations.

The complexities and pitfalls of cross-cultural research, outlined above, were fixed in my consciousness throughout my investigation.

The Technical Approach: Definitions and Data

The first step in data gathering is to decide what one is looking for. I was interested primarily in work of a theoretical rather than an empirical nature. It was not information about the situation of women in the Third World that I wanted but rather feminist frameworks, based on the experiences of Third World women, for analysing women's role

in the development process. I was looking for documentation that was overtly feminist in character. Although not all or even a majority of Third World women are feminists, I based my research on the premise that a feminist approach to development is essential to eliminating the subordination of women and other oppressed groups. As we will see in Chapters Two and Three, this view is shared by experienced women scholars and women's organisations in the Third World. What then is "feminist"?

Feminism is defined as variously in the Third World as in the North. A group of South Asian women (cited in Bhasin and Khan, 1986:2) sees feminism as

an awareness of women's oppression and exploitation in society, at work and within the family, and conscious action by women and men to change this situation.

A slightly more radical definition comes from Ifi Amadiume (1987:10):

a political consciousness by women, which leads to a strong sense of self-awareness, self-esteem, female solidarity, and, consequently, the questioning and challenging of gender inequalities in social systems and institutions.

Using these definitions, I found no difficulty in identifying those writers with a feminist perspective. Indeed, of all the journal articles, books, magazine and newspaper articles, speeches and interviews I read, only those of one writer struck me as lacking a feminist orientation.

While it was easy to define and identify

feminists, it was much more difficult to define and identify these feminists as being "Third World". The definition of "Third World" is not simply geographic; it is also political. The geographic definition of Third World is generally accepted as comprising the countries of Asia, Africa, Latin America, the Caribbean and Oceania. Many people from those countries who now live elsewhere, continue to define themselves as Third World people. In addition, many people born in the North, who form racial minorities in those societies, consider themselves Third World people (Mohanty, 1991:5) either because they have historic links with the geographic Third World, or because they feel a common bond of marginalisation and struggle with the people living in the geographic Third World. Could it not be considered presumptuous for me, who cannot claim to be a Third World woman on any of these counts, to place other women inside or outside this category? To further complicate the issue, it is not always possible to learn enough about an author to know whether she fits within any definition of "Third World".

I dealt with, but did not completely resolve this dilemma, by giving priority to women whom I knew were born and currently working in the geographic Third World. I did not, however, exclude women born in the Third World but now, for a variety of reasons, working temporarily or permanently in the North, nor did I exclude privileged racial minorities

born and raised in the South, such as white African women. I did exclude women from the North, now resident in the South. It seemed to me that their cultural background, privileged status within the global imperialist system, race (in most cases), and the option of returning to their country of origin, made it impossible for their standpoint to be exactly like that of someone born and raised in the Third World. Because the thesis was looking at women in the context of international development, I excluded women whom I knew to have only an historical connection to the Third World. In cases where I had little or no biographical information about an author, I considered whether an author's work had been published in the Third World, whether she was currently working in the Third World and whether her name indicated a Third World origin. This latter factor is not particularly reliable and was generally not used without other corroborating indicators. These decisions are, I realise, somewhat arbitrary, and were sometimes imposed simply because a limit had to be set somewhere. It is certainly possible to argue that the standpoint of a well-to-do African feminist of Asian origin is not significantly different from that of a middle class white American-born feminist long resident in an African country.

Having formulated definitions of "feminist" and "Third World", I then considered what subject matter I was looking for. Obviously, I wanted material related to

feminism in the Third World, development in the Third World and the connections between the two. But how was I going to explore the *contributions* of Third World women to a feminist vision of development? I needed to have some sense of this before I started to look for data. There were several possibilities:

- 1) compare feminist approaches to development in two or more regions of the Third World;
- 2) examine the way in which a particular "women in development" theme such as the sexual division of labour, economic independence, or access to land, was dealt with by several authors;
- 3) compare and contrast the work of selected scholars from one region or from several regions of the Third World;
- 4) examine the growth of and change within several women's research organisations such as DAWN, WAND, AAWORD or Isis International.

In considering these possibilities, I came to the conclusion that I wanted to take a fairly broad approach in terms of geography and in terms of the women whose work I would study. I wanted to be able to find a feminist vision of development which could be applied fairly broadly by development workers in different types of organisations and in different regions. I would, however, need to be specific in some

areas in order to have a manageable amount of data to analyse. The best option, then, seemed to be a thematic approach.

The next step was to select suitable themes; three themes seemed an appropriate number. These themes should:

- * be generally relevant to all or most regions of the Third World;
- * be priorities for women's organisations in the Third World;
- * have generated a specifically feminist analysis on the part of Third World researchers and activists;
- * be related to international development;
- * have generated enough literature for the purposes of analysis.

Initially, the three themes selected were structural adjustment, the environment, and liberation struggles. As data gathering proceeded, however, the latter two were abandoned and replaced by the new international division of labour, and violence against women³. The environment was not an issue of special importance in Latin America or the Caribbean although it was in Asia and Africa. Even in these two regions,

³ My thanks to Joan French for helping to steer me toward the situation of women in the export processing zones and to Andaiye and Peggy Antrobus for stressing the importance of woman-centred issues such as violence against women.

however, and especially in Africa, women's involvement in environmental issues seemed limited to tree planting, and building and using improved stoves, projects of a practical rather than a strategic nature⁴. In addition, I could find little specifically feminist analysis of the issue in the African context and only a limited amount from India.

There was considerable literature on women's role in liberation struggles. The nature and context of these struggles, however, differed greatly from one region to another. It was difficult to compare, for example, women's resistance to slavery in the Caribbean, women's role in the independence struggle in India, and women's involvement in armed resistance in Nicaragua or Zimbabwe. It also seemed to me that liberation struggles were not a development issue in the same way that structural adjustment or the new international division of labour were.

Specifying the subject matter of the data to be collected made the search easier, even though the final selection of themes was not made until part way

⁴ The concept of practical and strategic gender interests was put forward by Maxine Molyneux (1985:232-233). Practical gender interests arise from the conditions which women experience within a gendered division of labour. These interests relate to immediately perceived needs and do not challenge the subordinate relationship of women to men. Strategic gender interests are derived from an analysis of women's subordinate position and are the basis for formulating strategies to change that relationship.

through the data gathering process. Material for analysis was collected in three ways: 1) by personal visits to libraries and resource centres; 2) by requesting specific documents by mail from women's research and resource centres in the Third World; 3) by interviews with four feminist activists and researchers from the Third World.

Ideally, in searching out the written work of Third World feminists, especially those still resident overseas and possibly not well known in the North, the researcher would have to travel extensively. My original plan was to visit selected research and documentation centres in each region of the Third World. Since I was unsuccessful in securing sufficient funding for so ambitious an investigation, I restricted myself to visits to libraries and resource centres in Ottawa and two short trips outside Canada, one to the United States and the other to Barbados. In Ottawa, I used the facilities at Carleton University, the University of Ottawa, the International Development Research Centre, the Canadian International Development Agency, MATCH International Centre and World Inter-Action. Of these, the resource centre at MATCH had the largest collection of materials relevant to my research.

During a 12-day visit to the United States, I

visited the International Women's Tribune Centre (IWTC) in New York City, the Third World Women's Project at the Institute for Policy Studies in Washington, D.C., and the Centre for Global Issues and Women's Leadership at Rutgers University in New Brunswick, New Jersey. Both the IWTC and the Global Centre have large collections of relevant materials and excellent facilities for researchers. I was unsuccessful in getting in touch with the Women's International Resource Exchange in New York. I also discovered that the International Centre for Research on Women in Washington does not put its resources at the disposal of the general public at present. The Centre will, however, look for a specific document and, if they have it, send a copy by mail.

In Barbados, I spent a week at the Women and Development Unit (WAND) at the University of the West Indies which is also the new headquarters for Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era (DAWN). WAND has an extensive collection of materials on women and development which proved to be a gold mine for me. I was also in touch with the Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action in Trinidad but, based on my conversation with their co-ordinator, decided not to make a visit there. They kindly offered to copy and send any documents I wanted

which they had and which were not available at WAND. I found the staff members at the women's resource centres in particular both interested in my work and very helpful in assisting me.

As well as the personal visits outlined above, I wrote to 33 women's research and resource organisations in the Third World requesting lists of their publications⁵. Six of these replied. I ordered publications from three and two of my orders have arrived. Although the response rate was low, the replies I did receive were full of interest and encouragement.

To supplement the extensive reading of the work of Third World women, I conducted four interviews with women researchers and activists currently working in the Third World: Peggy Antrobus, Co-ordinator of the Women and Development Unit at the University of the West Indies and Co-ordinator of DAWN; Joan French, formerly with Sistren Theatre Collective in Jamaica and currently Co-ordinator of the Caribbean Policy Development Centre in Barbados; Andaiye, who works with WAND in Barbados and with Red Thread in Guyana; and Fatma Alloo of the Tanzania Media Women's Association

⁵ A list of women's research and resource centres in the Third World, including those with which I was in touch, is attached as Appendix A. This list is included for networking purposes.

(TAMWA). The interview schedules used are attached as Appendix B. These interviews gave me an opportunity to ask questions of a general nature related to my research and to test some of my own ideas and analyses.

Throughout the data-gathering period, I was conscious of the fact that women in the Third World have other priorities than assisting a Canadian M.A. student with her thesis. Women's research and resource centres in both the North and the South, have limited resources and heavy workloads. I felt particularly concerned about making excessive demands both on individuals and organisations and looked for ways of indicating, even if only symbolically, that I recognised their constraints and was grateful for their collaboration. On my visits to centres outside Canada, I took a selection of the latest MATCH publications to leave behind. In each letter to organisations overseas, I included a book mark commemorating the December 6, 1989 massacre. To those individuals and organisations who have helped with my research I will be offering a copy of my thesis, on disk, if appropriate, or by mail, if not. I also plan to write to the groups whose publications I have found especially helpful, to thank them for their

contribution'. If I have learned anything through my research, it is that the researcher is indebted to countless people, even people she may never meet, for the work they have done before her without which her own work would be impossible.

Evaluation

In evaluating my research experience, I find that the overall result was positive and successful. I discovered a large body of work on which to base my analyses, much of it not normally available in Canada. Indeed, I found so much material in the limited travel that I undertook, I concluded that it was just as well I did not make the more extensive visits I had originally planned. I would have ended up with a wonderful and unique collection of documents but a completely unmanageable amount of data!

For my purposes, it was the women's resource centres rather than the large institutional libraries, that had the largest selections of relevant materials and that took the greatest interest in my research. Obtaining documents by mail proved problematic. Many of the sources I wrote to did not reply, quite possibly because they are overworked and underfunded. It was

* A list of women's magazines and journals, including those which I have used in my research, is included as Appendix C, for networking purposes.

often difficult to tell from publications lists which documents would be most useful. The cost of materials was relatively expensive, mostly because of postage and the service charges on bank drafts. The interviews were very useful to me in orienting my research and receiving feedback on some of my own ideas. They were, however, time-consuming for the interviewees and difficult to fit into their busy schedules. I feel particular gratitude to these four women for their time and thoughtful responses. I had planned to conduct additional interviews but this proved not possible. In some cases, there were difficulties in fitting my work schedule to the availability of potential interviewees. In other cases, travel to Toronto and Montreal would have been involved and this was not feasible because of the time and money required.

I found the research process an intensely personal experience and tremendously rewarding. I have benefitted enormously from the information, ideas and insights of the women whose work I read and with whom I spoke. The chapters that follow could not have been written without them. A number of people have already requested a copy of my thesis. I hope that it will prove a useful, if small, contribution to the ongoing struggle for women's empowerment.

CHAPTER THREE

DEVELOPMENT THEORY: TOWARDS A FEMINIST VISION

The organization helped me to understand the conditions of our country: why we are poor, exploited and oppressed and who are the ones causing this problem. I study the history of exploitation and oppression in our country. I learn the solutions to the problem and the need to unite and fight and set up organizations on our own but the one education that speaks for me best is that one regarding the women's history of oppression and the forms of exploitation. It is true. It makes me strong to know that even as a woman, I could change my lot.

Women peasants have problems to tackle like the economic crisis which ties us down to the house and our fear of being arrested or killed as we become more involved. I think we could solve this if we, women, educate ourselves about our rights, organize ourselves and take action.

It is only now that I have done this, talking about myself as a person. In meetings in our previous organization, when I would be asked to say a comment or anything, my husband would answer. This time, I, a woman, will speak.

a peasant woman from Mindanao
cited in WSRC, 1988:28-29

Introduction

Despite three Development Decades, little progress has been made toward eradicating poverty and powerlessness in the Third World. In fact, millions of people in Asia, Africa, Latin America, the Caribbean and the Pacific have become victims rather than victors in the development process (Antrobus, 1987:1; El Saadawi, 1980:ii). The reasons for this have been posited in a vast critical literature argued from various standpoints. As explained in

Chapter One, the standpoint which I am exploring in this thesis is that of feminist researchers and activists from the Third World. I have selected this standpoint because I contend that two crucial flaws in development theory and practice have been the failure to problematise gender inequality and the failure to base development programmes on the analyses and strategies identified by the people of the Third World themselves.

The purpose of this and the following chapter is to place the standpoint of feminists from the Third World within the context of development theory and feminist theory, respectively. In this chapter, an examination of women's place in traditional development theory will show that until very recently this theory, whether devised in the North or the South, has either ignored women completely or has simply attempted to add them into a process which remains otherwise unchanged and therefore ineffective in addressing both women's subordination and broader issues of poverty and oppression. A feminist critique of dominant development models will lead us to an examination of a number of attempts which have been made over the past twenty years to elaborate a women-centred theory of development. A review of the Women in Development (WID) and Gender and Development (GAD) theories will show that, despite their positive contributions, these theories, too, failed to express a specifically feminist standpoint and to form the

basis for global action to eliminate the subordination of women and other oppressed peoples. It will be argued that in order to do this, a new theoretical approach to women in development, Feminist Development, must be adopted.

Feminist Development must, however, be rooted not in the experience of white, middle class, Western academics and development professionals but of poor, black women and women of colour in the Third World. Chapter Three concludes with a definition and outline of the origins of Feminist Development.

In Chapter Four, an examination of feminist theory, developed largely in the West, will show that, until recently, its race, class and imperialist biases have excluded black women and women of colour from both the North and the South. It will be argued that, although differences of class, race, nationality and culture distinguish women in the South as they do women in the North, there are certain common elements within feminism as it has been theorised and practised by women in the South. Based on these elements and on Southern feminist critiques of current development theory and practice, a Third World Feminist Vision of Development will be outlined. The theoretical framework laid down in Chapters Three and Four will form the basis for an examination of three specific areas within the current development debate to which feminists from the Third World have made unique and important contributions. Having

summarised the way in which the theoretical framework will be established, we can begin our more detailed examination by looking at how women have figured in development theory.

Women's Place in Development Theory

Initial contact between the peoples of the North and the South came through European imperialism beginning in the fifteenth century. This relationship was to have devastating effects upon both women and men in the Third World. In colonialism, as in other forms of conquest, however, women tended to suffer doubly - as conquered people and as women. The losses suffered by women in the course of the slave trade and in the military conquests that established colonial rule are incalculable. In places where the indigenous society was relatively egalitarian, the subordination of women may be said to have been a direct or indirect result of colonialism (Etienne and Leacock, 1980: 17-20). In other places, where women's subordination was well established (Sanday, 1981; Parpart, 1988: 116, Matsui, 1989:78-79; Silverblatt, 1978: 48-48), colonialism brought the added burden of European forms of gender domination (Hong, 1984:4) and wiped out those remaining traditional areas of women's autonomy and power (Steady 1987:7). There is even evidence of colonial and colonised men joining forces to maintain and increase women's subordination

(Parpart, 1988:115)¹.

It can be argued that some benefits accrued to women through colonialism, particularly in terms of access to education and the legal system, opportunities to create independent lives in the towns and attempts to eradicate practices such as forced marriage, polygamy and female circumcision (Parpart, 1988:115-138). The effects of these "advances" were sometimes transitory, however, and tended to benefit principally privileged women of the upper classes (Aquino, 1985:325; El Saadawi, 1980:x). The overwhelming consensus, certainly of Third World women scholars, is that colonialism was and continues to be a disaster for women. It established patterns of domination based on race, gender and colonial status that continue to shape the relations between the North and the South today.

Although the formal colonial structure is now largely dismantled, the nature of the relationship between the countries of the North and South has changed little (AAWORD, 1985). In most parts of the Third World, the formal shift from colonialism to development came following

¹ In colonial Zambia, both local men and colonial administrators became so concerned about the flight of rural women seeking independence in the towns, that a system of urban and later rural courts was set up under the control of African elders. Newly amended "customary" laws were established governing marriage, divorce, child custody and inheritance. Urban women engaged in beer brewing and prostitution (both illegal activities) or without a marriage certificate were repatriated to the villages and to the control of the elders (Parpart, 1988:115, 123).

World War II². As Phillips (1977:17) sees it, when the colonial framework could no longer control the forces it had brought into existence, there was a need for a new framework. What could be better than that provided by the ideologically neutral espousal of "development"?

Development was both a response to political crises in the colonised countries and a means of overcoming obstacles to the further accumulation of capital by the economic elites of the North and the South.

The framework which shaped the early development programmes and still pervades the thinking of officials of the major governmental and multilateral development agencies is known as modernisation theory. Its principal proponent was Walt Rostow³ but its roots go back to Weber, Spencer and Durkheim (Randall and Theobald, 1985:15). Modernisation theory views development as a linear progression followed by all societies from a "traditional" stage, through a "take-off" period to "the age of mass consumption", currently represented by the industrialised West. Underdevelopment is not something that is created, it is an original state of backwardness, which can be attributed to such factors as

² It should be noted that in most parts of Latin America, colonialism ended in the nineteenth century. In most parts of Asia, Africa, the Caribbean and the Pacific, the colonial era drew to a close between 1945 and 1980.

³ Rostow put forward his theory in *The Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-Communist Manifesto*, published in 1962.

scarcity of capital, prevalence of traditional institutions and dominance of rural oligarchies (Randall and Theobald, 1985:104). Development is seen exclusively in economic terms and is achieved by inputs of science, technology and finance, utilised by individuals with strong entrepreneurial capacities (Randall and Theobald, 1985:20-21). Gender differences are not considered in this analysis; nor are differences in class or culture. The unstated assumption is that modernisation will automatically improve the condition of the poor, women (Arizpe, 1982:76) and other disadvantaged groups. Although modernisation theory became outdated, at least in progressive academic and development circles, by the 1970s, it still constitutes the popular conception of development (Blomström and Hettne, 1984:24).

Critiques of modernisation theory and alternative proposals came from a number of quarters. Our discussion, however, will be limited to two of these: the critique by neo-Marxists and economists of the ECLA⁴ tradition who elaborated Dependency Theory in the 1960s, and the later critique by feminists, North and South, whose work in the 1970s and 1980s forms the basis for an emerging theory of Feminist Development.

Dependency theory can be seen as a Third World response to the ethnocentric, apolitical and mechanical

⁴ Economic Commission on Latin America, now ECLAC, Economic Commission on Latin America and the Caribbean.

"just add technology and stir" approach of the modernisationists. Although André Gunder Frank is one of the *dependentistas* best known in the North, dependency theory was in fact born in Latin America out of the work of economists and sociologists such as Raoul Prebisch, Osvaldo Sunkel, Fernando Henrique Cardoso and Rodolfo Stavenhagen. Their experience of development was that it did not follow the neat stages set down in modernisation theory. After a period of industrialisation in the 1940s and 1950s, Latin America in the 1960s should have been experiencing "take-off". What occurred instead was economic stagnation. In addition, the growth that had previously taken place had not brought with it social and political development (Blomström and Hettne, 1984:45). The *dependentistas* came to see underdevelopment not as the first stage in a natural process of enrichment but as the final stage in a deliberate process of impoverishment. Development and underdevelopment were complementary processes of an international system in which the few in the metropolitan centres extracted surplus value from the human and material resources of the many in the periphery.

Dependency theory was a vast improvement over modernisation theory. Most important, it was Third World people speaking (even if the First World wasn't listening) about a process which profoundly affected their lives. The *dependentistas* posited a multidimensional, not merely an

economic, approach to development. Refusing to "blame the victim", dependency theory began to shift the responsibility for underdevelopment from "primitive" and "backward" societies to the policies and practices of colonialism and international capitalism. Although the emphasis was still on the economic, political and social concerns also figured in this analysis. The humanistic element was introduced as well. Frank (1988:109) spoke of the need "to formulate adequate development theory and policy for the majority of the world's population who suffer from underdevelopment". Also, since underdevelopment was a deliberate not a natural or primordial state, dependency theory implied a pro-active response and held out the hope for constructive change.

Despite these positive features, the dependency framework still left some theoretical holes undarned. The following critiques are summarised by Randall and Theobald (1985:116-119). Dependency's sharp dichotomy between development and underdevelopment has been criticised as too stark to be able to describe variations in degrees and forms of underdevelopment. The emphasis on external factors tends to obscure influences within Third World countries themselves, especially political elements. Orthodox Marxists such as Bill Warren (1973:5 and 7) even maintain that considerable progress in industrialisation has been made in the Third World since the end of World War II. He points out that during the 1960s, Third World manufacturing

output grew by about seven per cent per annum while that of the industrialised countries grew at six per cent (United Nations cited in Warren, 1973:5). As Warren (1973:7) sees it, countries such as Mexico, Argentina, Chile and Iran are more industrialised than Canada, Australia or New Zealand because manufacturing in the former countries contributes more to the gross domestic product than it does in the latter.

In addition to these critiques, and particularly important within the context of this thesis, was dependency's failure to take gender into account. The dependency theorists cited in such reviews as those of Randall and Theobald (1985) and Blomström and Hettne (1984) are all men, many of whom were part of the highly patriarchal Latin American left. Nowhere is there mention of the gendered effects of dependency and underdevelopment. Nevertheless, the analysis of the *dependentistas* regarding the nature of dependence and the role of imperialism and international capital in the development/ underdevelopment process has been an important component of the analysis of feminists from both North and South (Antrobus, 1988:33) to which we will now turn.

The introduction of a gender analysis was the basis of Feminist Development, the second major theory currently emerging from a critique of modernisation. While the dependency critique has had considerable impact within

academic and progressive development circles, it has not been adopted by the major governmental and multilateral development agencies. Here, modernisation holds sway. In the Third World, those governments which have tried to base their development plans on a dependency analysis have suffered considerable external intervention and have seldom been able to see their work through to completion.

Nicaragua under the Sandinistas, Grenada under the People's Revolutionary Government, Mozambique under FRELIMO and Chile under *Unidad Popular*, are examples of governments which tried to implement development plans based on the attainment of greater autonomy from international capitalism and the political domination of the great powers. In each case, foreign intervention (American or South African) hampered or ended their efforts. Because dependency theory has had so little influence in practice, it is primarily toward the development programmes inspired by modernisation theory that feminists have directed their critiques. We will look at that analysis now.

A Feminist Critique

It has been said that it is from the standpoint of women that the most telling and most constructive critiques of development have come (Tadesse, 1991:46; Aklilu, 1991:190).

The Dependency School's recognition of the influence of external structures and power

relationships on the economic realities of periphery countries does not take us far enough in making the link between the macro and micro levels of experience. Feminism permits us to undertake a better analysis which extends the World Systems approach to take account of gender, class, race, and ethnicity: a feminist lens helps us to see clearly the link between the micro and the macro - whether at the (micro) level of the individual, the household, the community, the firm or the farm, or at the (macro) level of national, regional or international analysis or planning. (Antrobus, 1988:30)

Although women from both the South and the North have made important contributions to this discussion, we will pay particular attention here to the Southern perspective.

Ester Boserup (1970), a Danish economist, was the first to use gender as a variable in her analysis and to focus attention on the sexual division of labour and the differential impact of development strategies on men and women (Benería and Roldán, 1987:3). She and other researchers in the 1970s showed clearly that in both rural and urban settings, women benefitted less from development programmes than did men. Despite the shortcomings in Boserup's work, ably enumerated by Benería and Sen (1981), it formed the foundation for more detailed and more radical critiques of development which we will discuss below in terms of theoretical approach and ideology, analysis and planning, and execution.

The most general and basic critique of development has been of its excessive economism (French, 1991; Bhasin, 1980:126; Friedman, 1991:7) and its overt and covert efforts

to further entrench international capitalism (AAWORD/DHF, 1982:11). Peggy Antrobus (1990b:1-2), for example, rejects the market as the only engine of economic activity. This strategy may work, she says, when people have money to spend and when the partners in the economic relationship are equal. It is not likely to work where the majority is poor. Moreover, even if development is successful in bringing economic growth, measured in GNP, the social outcome has been increased inequality between rich and poor (Mazumdar, 1979:45; Bhasin, 1980:128). At the level of the family, increased economic status often results in "the oppression of prosperity" when women are withdrawn from public economic activity because their contribution to the family budget is no longer needed and the male breadwinner's status is enhanced by a "non-working" wife (Mazumdar, 1982:69). Likewise, it is often erroneously assumed that all members of a family have equal access to its economic resources (Heyzer, 1985:xv). In the case of both women and children, this is not true (Imam, 1988:2).

While overemphasising economics, development planners fail to consider issues of power. In the view of feminists from the South, imbalances in power, between countries, sexes, classes, racial or ethnic groups must be rectified if development is to take place (French, 1991; Alloo, 1991).

Feminists have been critical not only of the

ideology underlying development policies but also of the methodologies by which these programmes are planned and implemented. There is an assumption that development takes place in the form of "projects" in designated "sectors" such as education, health or agriculture, rather than being an ongoing, long term process (Alloo, 1991). While a project approach makes it easier for planners to prepare elegant flow charts and cost/benefit analyses, it masks the complexity of the process and the inter-related nature of the roles which women, especially, play. Too often, development programmes reflect the analyses and priorities of development agencies rather than the concerns of the people whose lives will be directly affected (French, 1991; Alloo, 1991).

This lack of fit between the sectoral thinking of planners and the "inter-sectoral" spread of women's activities is partly responsible for the failure of many projects which claim to address women's needs. Projects designed in one sector targeting women take little account of what other sectors might be doing. Primary health care projects, income-generating activities, environmental projects are all set up, implicitly or explicitly targeting one social category to participate in them. The result is conflicting demands on women's time, intensified work burdens and, in the long run, project failures. And when the project fails, the planner blames it not on his or her own myopic vision but on the hopelessness of planning for women (Kabeer, 1991:9).

Antrobus (1989c:3) among others, advocates a holistic, integrated approach to development which more closely replicates the realities of women's lives.

Kabeer (1991:9-10) has also been critical of development's concentration on women's practical needs and disregard of their strategic interests⁵. This enables development planners to avoid the risks involved in challenging men's power and privileges and also ensures that real change for women will not occur. Planners fail to understand that unless the strategic needs are met, even the practical gains are likely to be short-lived.

We will move now from the general theoretical and methodological level to examine the more specific analyses which have been typical of development. In particular, development has ignored, undervalued and undermined women's roles in production and reproduction (Arizpe, 1982:76; Kabeer 1991:6-7) and has failed to understand the inextricable link between the two (Antrobus, 1990a:3-5; 1989a:190). Despite all the talk of basic needs, for example, women's crucial role in providing for those needs is ignored (French, 1991). In addition, development programmes are often directed at "families" or "households", assuming a Northern, nuclear model and ignoring the many differing structures that pertain in the South (French, 1991). Development planners assume that families are headed and supported by males when in fact it is women who do so, often together with men but increasingly by themselves

⁵ Molyneux's (1985:232-233) distinction between women's practical needs and strategic interests is explained in Chapter Two, footnote 4.

(Heyzer, 1985:xiv). Moreover, studies indicate that women devote a greater proportion of their incomes to meeting basic family needs than do men (Heyzer, 1985:xv); so programmes designed to increase men's earnings are less likely to benefit the family as a whole than similar programmes designed for women.

The emphasis placed by development plans on the urban, industrial sector has led to the neglect of agriculture where women are important actors (Aklilu, 1991:186; Ellis, 1984:5). Those resources that are directed to the agricultural sector are devoted primarily to cash crops for export. This has led to a decline in production for domestic consumption, the sector in which women have been the major producers⁶. Women's control over land use has decreased along with their access to necessary inputs such as training and credit (AAWORD/DHF, 1982:12; Sen and Grown, 1987:34). Simultaneously their workload has increased as they are expected to help with the cash crops as well as grow food for domestic consumption (Hong, 1984:5) and probably supplement the family's cash income by engaging in handicraft production or petty trade (Arizpe, 1982:77). As a result, women have become more dependent on men and increasingly subject to their control (Hong, 1984:6; Aklilu, 1991:187).

⁶ In Jamaica, for example, women produce 60-75% of food for the local market and are responsible for 80% of its distribution (Deere et al., 1990:56).

Although, as noted above, a large proportion of Third World women are involved in agricultural production, an increasing number, especially in Asia and the Caribbean, are becoming industrial workers (Heyzer, 1985:xxiv).

Although industrial growth is an important priority in development programmes, women in this sector have succeeded no more than their rural sisters in achieving a greater degree of control over their lives (Heyzer, 1985:xxiv-xxvi; AAWORD/DHF, 1982:13; Arizpe, 1982:77-78).

Women have suffered not only when their role has been ignored, as in the agricultural sector or integrated as in the industrial sector, but also when they have become the specific "targets" of development programmes. This has been most clearly seen in population control⁷ programmes (Steady, 1982:55; Anand, 1983:9; Sen and Grown, 1987:46-49) but also in income generation (Anand, 1983:7; Hong, 1984:9) and home economics (Hong, 1984:8-9)⁸. Early population

⁷ I use this term rather than the more innocuous "family planning" which appears in much of development literature. I deliberately want to convey that the aim of these programmes is not to give women greater reproductive freedom but rather to limit or end their reproduction in order to respond to priorities which the women have not set and may not even be aware of. Population growth in the Third World is seen as threatening to Western affluence (Steady, 1982:55) and power. Thus any means is justified in achieving reduced fertility (Anand, 1983:9). The result is programmes promoting fertility control methods which may not only be unsuited to the bodies and lifestyles of the women involved (Anand, 1983:9) but hazardous to their health.

⁸ I do not wish to imply here that development programmes for women in these sectors can never result in their empowerment. This can happen, but only if empowerment

control programmes were narrowly focused on dissemination of contraceptive technology and knowledge. Lack of success in reducing the birth rate led to further research which demonstrated the direct relationship between fertility decline and factors relating to women's autonomy such as education, employment, income and legal status. Despite this new awareness, many governments, pharmaceutical companies and health professionals still treat women as guinea pigs and deny them adequate information and opportunity to make free and informed choices about their own fertility (Sen and Grown, 1987:47-48). Efforts to involve women in income generating projects seldom recognise women's already significant contributions to agricultural production and, by channelling women's energies away from agriculture, contribute to the ever declining production of food for local consumption (Anand, 1983:7). "Women's projects" of the child care, nutrition and sewing variety, all too often reinforce the western stereotype of the domesticated woman rather than offer women a greater variety of choices directly related to their needs (Rogers cited in Hong, 1984:8).

The feminist critiques of conventional development, summarised above, have led to several attempts

is a specific goal of the programme and if the women are approached not as mothers only but "as women playing a variety of social, economic and political roles in their communities, and in the country" (Antrobus, 1988:11). Unfortunately, few programmes are carried out in this way.

to change the traditional paradigm. The first, and the one which has gained the greatest degree of acceptance is Women in Development (WID). WID grew out of the work of Ester Boserup and other theorists primarily from the North, and was taken up enthusiastically by development planners. It has been suggested that developers were desperate to explain the failure of two Development Decades (Plewes and Stuart, 1991:118) in a way that would not simultaneously challenge the existing social, economic and political structure. WID was made to order for this purpose.

WID is connected to both modernisation theory and liberal feminist theory⁹. The rationale for WID is that development cannot occur if the resources of half the population (women) are wasted or underutilised. WID defines the problem not in terms of the existing systems or structures but merely as women's lack of participation in them. The solution, then, lies in the "integration" of women. This can be done in a number of ways such as providing legal equality, ensuring "equal opportunities" for education, employment, credit and access to land, and in particular, increasing women's productivity through income generating projects. Because WID does not challenge existing structures, including those of gender relations, it has been accepted by many governments in both the North and

⁹ I use the terms "liberal feminism" and "socialist feminism" in the sense elaborated by Alison Jaggar in *Feminist Politics and Human Nature*.

the South, and by multilateral organisations such as the World Bank, the United Nations and the International Monetary Fund.

Although popular in development circles, WID has come under considerable criticism, primarily from feminist researchers and practitioners in both the South and the North. These criticisms can be summarised as follows. First, by defining the "problem" in terms of women's lack of participation, WID overlooks causal factors in the system itself. No attempt is made to examine the roles of colonialism, imperialism, capitalism, racism and sexism in contributing to the subordination of the Third World in general and Third World women in particular (Maguire, 1984:24; Mair, 1986:591). In addition, defining women as non-participants ignores the tremendous contributions to development already made by women, both as producers, especially in agriculture, and as reproducers (Sen and Grown, 1987:23). Secondly, the development process into which the experts are attempting to integrate women is a male-controlled and culturally limited "Western patriarchal and capitalist notion of economic progress" (Bunch and Carillo, 1990:75) which many Third World women reject. Third, WID sees women either as entirely passive objects rather than subjects of development (Bunch and Carillo, 1990:77-78), or as becoming "integrated" in the process along lines defined by the planners rather than the women

themselves. Perhaps most important, development "experts" refuse to acknowledge that the inequities in the Third World are reflections of the unequal social structures in the so-called developed countries. The marginalisation of women in the South cannot be overcome without examining the root causes of women's oppression in both the South and the North (Anand, 1983:9).

These inadequacies in WID theory led to the elaboration of more holistic approaches which questioned not simply women's role in the system but the system itself. Best known among these is Gender and Development (GAD), the main proponent of which is Kate Young. GAD, as elaborated by Young (1988) focuses not on women only but on the socially constructed relations between women and men, recognises the inequalities in those relations and aims to change them. GAD considers women as both producers and reproducers and as active agents in the development process. Development is defined not only in economic but also in political, social and cultural terms. The GAD analysis distinguishes between "sex", the biologically given differences between women and men, and "gender", the socially constructed differences. Thus one can identify what aspects of male/female relationships are immutable and what can be transformed (Kabeer, 1991:11). In this way, GAD goes beyond the previous approaches and aims to give women control over their own lives. Emphasis is placed on

consciousness raising, popular education and organisational strengthening. For the first time, the need for radical transformation of existing structures is posited.

This relational and more strategically oriented approach put forward by Young and others such as Molyneux (1985) and Moser (1989), drew substantively on their experience of working with women in the Third World and was a major step forward in providing an analysis that would permit systemic and long term change for women. The analysis has also been popular among women academics and development practitioners in the Third World, many of whom have studied with Young at the University of Sussex. Nevertheless, some deficiencies were perceived. According to Cardinal et al. (1989:13-14), the GAD approach, while more far-reaching than WID, is not specifically feminist, relates only to the Third World and does not make links with women's global struggle against oppression. This critique is crucial in demonstrating the difference between GAD and Feminist Development and merits some further discussion.

The influences of feminist theory, specifically socialist feminist theory, can be seen in the work of the GAD theorists in their efforts to address women's subordination, to transform social structures that oppress on the basis of gender but also on the basis of class and race, and to empower women and other marginalised groups. There is not, however, a critique of development based on an

overtly feminist analysis nor an elaboration of feminist alternatives such as is found in the work of Maguire (1984), Anand (1983, 1984), Antrobus (1987, 1988, 1989, 1990), Sen and Grown (1987), CCIC (1987), Bunch and Carillo (1990) and others. It may be that the GAD theorists have come to feminism through development rather than the other way about and so express themselves in the language of economic or political theory rather than feminist theory. Possibly they feel the term "gender" is more acceptable within development circles than the term "feminist". They are probably right. Certainly development institutions such as CIDA and IDRC are now embracing GAD at least on paper and "gender training", using the GAD analysis is replacing the Harvard WID training at CIDA and within the Canadian NGO community. It is not yet clear whether GAD analysis has filtered through to actual programming in the majority of cases.

The Emergence of Feminist Development Theory

The shortcomings of GAD are addressed in large measure by the third model of development with women, Feminist Development. This is the term by which I distinguish an emerging body of literature and practice which attempts to bring feminist theory to bear on the theory and practice of development. The term "Feminist Development" was used by the CCIC Inter-Agency Working Group

on Women and Development in their 1987 paper "Feminist Perspectives on Development". Other authors refer to "a new theory of development which embraces feminism" (Anand, 1983:10), "feminism-and-development" (Cardinal et al.:1), "the feminist concept of development" (Antrobus, 1988:31), "a feminist development" (Friedman, 1991:1) or "a feminist approach to women in development" (Maguire, 1984:1). Though the terminology varies, the elements of the theory are in general the same. This theory and its accompanying practice have grown out of the ongoing dialogue among women, North and South, working in development. It is now time to recognise this approach as Feminist Development, distinct from WID and GAD.

Feminist Development is linked with dependency theory and with socialist feminism and global feminism. Antrobus (1988:33) notes the *dependentista* connection.

1. Women's dependence on men parallels that of Third World countries in their relationship with the countries of the North;
2. Women's well-being is profoundly influenced by 'global' factors beyond their control;
3. The sexual division of labour parallels that of the international division of labour in which women's labour in the household (surplus labour) is appropriated for the benefit on other household members; and
4. Women frequently lack control over the resources which they generate.

Maguire (1984) draws on socialist feminist theory in her efforts to relate feminism to development. Citing "women's experience with virulent sexism in the male

dominated left and revolutionary struggles in the West and the Third World" (1984:31), she stresses socialist feminism's important contribution in identifying women's oppression at home and in the workplace, across class and race lines, even in socialist countries. In addition, socialist feminism makes the crucial links between capitalism, racism, patriarchy and underdevelopment (Maguire, 1984:32).

While drawing upon socialist feminist theory, Feminist Development is also closely connected to global feminism, which might well be described as socialist feminism "thinking globally and acting locally". Charlotte Bunch (1987:276), a major proponent of global feminism, sees it as concerned with the elimination not only of women's subordination but the subordination of all oppressed groups. Racism, classism, imperialism and sexism are all seen as creations of a world controlled by white patriarchy. Within this struggle, all issues are women's issues whether they are specific to women or not. Global feminism is the perspective one brings to an issue, not the issue itself (Bunch, 1987:280-281). The struggle to eliminate women's subordination will be successful only if it is fought world-wide.

While dependency theory, socialist feminism and global feminism may represent the three "roots" of Feminist Development, the hot house in which they were permitted to

cross fertilise and grow was the International Women's Decade (IWD). The three themes of the decade, Equality, Development and Peace, were selected to please women from the West, the Third World and the Eastern Bloc, respectively. IWD began with International Women's Year in 1975 and ended with the End of Decade Conference in 1985. The key events during this period, in terms of Feminist Development, were not the official conferences, but the non-governmental fora in Mexico City (1975), Copenhagen (1980) and Nairobi (1985). This was where women's differences and commonalities were aired and shared, fought over and finally, in some measure, resolved. This process can be briefly summarised as follows.

Discussions at Mexico centred on the divergent priorities of the Third World and the industrialised countries (Anonymous, 1985a: 1). The attitude of the large United States delegation with its particular version of feminism which they assumed to be universal, was deeply resented by women from the Third World. It was Third World women who insisted that issues related to development and the global economy, national liberation and anti-imperialism, be incorporated in women's global struggle. On the other hand, attempts by delegates from the industrialised countries to place issues related to sexuality on the agenda were seen as attacks on the traditions of Third World cultures (Bulbeck, 1988: 122).

Perhaps because this was the first time that women from around the world had had an opportunity to present their ideas to each other, the differences seemed to overwhelm the commonalities (Anonymous, 1985a: 1-2). Nevertheless, the Mexico conference and the extensive media coverage of the proceedings "legitimized and acknowledged the feminist claim that there was indeed a 'women's problem' in every single society on the globe" (Carillo, 1990:201).

At Copenhagen, where some 8,000 women gathered in 1980, the differences became unmanageable and resulted in frequent clashes, generally on North/South lines. Many feminists from the North came with the attitude that they had the answers to all women's oppression and were going to save the women of the Third World (Ravindran, 1985: 20). Those to be "saved", not surprisingly, resented the efforts of others to define their oppression and tell them what they should do about it. This provoked conflicts especially around the question of female circumcision. Discussions about what Westerners defined as "political" rather than "women's" issues such as the New International Economic Order and the Palestinian/Israeli and anti-apartheid conflicts also permeated discussions at Copenhagen (Anonymous, 1985a: 2).

Finally, at Nairobi, the atmosphere changed. As one Third World delegate (Ravindran, 1985: 18) put it,

The Forum has established that the women's movement is truly 'global' and not 'white-western'

as some claim and would like to believe. All of us from the Third World felt that the agenda truly reflected our priorities and many of our discussions were very relevant to Third World problems... (T)here were no separate 'women's issues', non-threatening to the status quo and apolitical but all issues of oppression and exploitation concerned women and were therefore our issues.

For the first time in the history of the international women's movement, the white, middle class women from Europe and North America found themselves in the minority and, conversely, the women of colour were in the majority which, after all, is a reflection of global reality (Davis 1988: 21). Delegates from the industrialised countries were more ready to listen, more flexible in defining what were women's issues, and there were expressions everywhere of solidarity from women of one country or group with those of another. This time, the workshops on female circumcision were organised by African women (Ravindran, 1985: 20) while Western women showed their solidarity with this struggle. Nor was there any longer debate over the use of the word "feminist". Another distinguishing characteristic was the visibility of feminist leadership from the Third World (Bunch, 1987:347-8).

A feminist journalist (Hinojosa quoted in Anonymous, 1985b: 7) from Mexico summed up the progress over the Decade this way.

(T)here has been a shift away from what we labelled women's issues to a call for the legitimization of gender as a tool for analysis... (T)he voices of Third World women,

women of colour and working class women have been integrated into a feminist discourse.

Although the Decade did not result in significant changes to the status of women either globally or nationally, it brought to the world's attention the crucial importance of women's activities for economic and social development (Carillo, 1991:17). The Decade also resulted in a great change in the consciousness of feminists throughout the world. There was a greater understanding of commonalities in their situations, appreciation of differences and commitment to a global feminist struggle. In tangible terms, the Decade gave rise to a number of international feminist networks¹⁰. Interestingly all of these networks or groups are composed in whole or in part of women from the Third World. The potential for global women's action had been established.

Conclusion

The achievements of the Decade, coupled with the

¹⁰ These networks include Development Alternatives with Women for a New Era based in Barbados, the Global Network on Reproductive Rights (400 groups in 74 countries), the Women and Global Corporations Network coordinated by the Nationwide Women's Programme of the American Friends Service Committee, the Committee of Asian Women based in Hong Kong, the Pacific and Asian Women's Forum, the Women Under Muslim Law Network, the Comité International des Femmes Africaines pour le Développement based in Abidjan, the Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action based in Trinidad, and the Association of African Women for Research and Development based in Dakar.

theoretical foundations of dependency theory, socialist feminism and global feminism have led to the emergence of an identifiable Feminist Development theory. Our examination above of earlier theories of development has shown clearly a need for such a theory and how it grew out of women's experience and study of the development process. We have seen too how women's consciousness, in the North and South, changed in terms of their understanding of the global nature of women's oppression and their readiness to do something about it. Given the important role which Southern feminists have played in creating the theory of Feminist Development and the history of conflict between feminists from the North and the South mentioned above, it seems appropriate here to look more closely at feminism as it has been theorised and practised in the Third World. This will be our objective in Chapter Four.

CHAPTER FOUR
FEMINISM IN THE SOUTH

Feminism offers the only politics which can transform our world into a more humane place and deal with global issues like equality, development and peace, because it asks the right questions: about power, about the links between the personal and the political; and because it cuts through race and class. Feminism implies consciousness of all the sources of oppression: race, class, gender, homophobia, and it resists them all. Feminism is a call for action.

Peggy Antrobus
(cited in Bunch and Carillo, 1990:73)

Introduction

Much to the chagrin of millions of men, feminism is relevant to women in the South. In this chapter we will elaborate this statement by looking at the evolution of feminism in the Third World, defining those ideological elements common to feminist theory in the South and examining how feminism has influenced Third World women's approach to development.

An examination of the development of feminism in the South will show that it is by no means irrelevant or foreign to Third World societies. By analysing the origins of and influences upon feminism in the South we will see that it arose in response to both local conditions and international influences. Finally we will look at the way in which Southern feminists have combined development theory, feminist theory and their own lived experiences to

form a Southern feminist vision of development.

A logical starting point for our discussion is a working definition of feminism. The one which I find most useful comes from Rhoda Reddock (1990:12).

The critical consciousness and awareness of women's subordinated and/or exploited position in society and the commitment to do something to change it. In this vein, two aspects to feminist struggle can be identified:

The day-to-day acts of struggle of individuals or groups of women to attain and maintain a degree of autonomy and control over their lives and the resistance against attempts to undermine this autonomy; and

The movement of women at a local, national or international level for certain commonly defined goals, aimed specifically at the emancipation of women, i.e. the transformation of their subordinate position.

Putting forward this definition of feminism leads me to the issue of the dangers of generalisation. It is not my intention to argue that all feminists in the Third World subscribe to this or any other specific feminist creed. There are at least as many feminisms in the South as there are in the North. Nor do all Third World feminists share exactly the same vision of development. There are differences based on a variety of factors such as race, class, nationality, ideology and personal experience. I do maintain, however, that there are common elements, shared by large numbers of feminists in the South and it is these which I am attempting to elaborate here. Chandra Talpade Mohanty (1991:4) refers to an

...imagined community of third world oppositional struggles. "Imagined" not because it is not real

but because it suggests potential alliances and collaborations across divisive boundaries, and "community" because in spite of internal hierarchies within third world contexts, it nevertheless suggests a significant, deep commitment to what Benedict Anderson...calls horizontal comradeship.

The idea of imagined community is useful because it leads us away from essentialist notions of third world feminist struggles, suggesting political rather than biological or cultural bases for alliance.

Finding these common "political threads of opposition" (Mohanty, 1991:4) is an important task in creating international solidarity and active support for a movement toward a feminist vision which may be crucial not only to development but to global survival.

Roots of Feminism in the South

Having laid down these parameters for our discussion, we can now look briefly at the historical roots of feminism in the South. Third World feminist scholars have shown clearly that feminism is not a recent import from the West.

While the label "feminism" might be a new concept in the annals of struggle, the fundamental idea, that of resisting oppression has existed and evolved throughout historical times and forms part of other movements based on the principle of egalitarianism. As any social movement, it has its ebb and flow and because it questions the origins and perpetuation of power in all its forms, the forces against it have devised monumental obstacles to block its goals. (AAWORD, 1985:1)

(F)eminist struggles originated between 60 and 80 years ago in many countries of Asia. In a way, the fact that such movements for emancipation and

feminism flourished in several non-European countries during this period has been "hidden from history." (Jayawardena, 1986:2-3).

As in the North, feminists in the South have their early heroines, many of whom have been ignored in androcentric versions of history or anthropology. Such women include Queen Hatshepsut who ruled Egypt for more than twenty years in the fifteenth century B.C. (Qunta, 1987:46) and the Trung sisters who, in 43 B.C. led an army of 80,000 with women generals and successfully drove the Chinese out of Vietnam (Jayawardena, 1986:197). During the colonial period, women played active roles in resisting the European invaders. Nanny of the Maroons, "one of the most outstanding civic and military leaders in the history of black freedom movements" (Mathurin, 1975:34), was the last to accept peace terms from the British at the end of the Maroon Wars in Jamaica in 1739. Micaela Bastidas, with her husband, Tupac Amaru, led a revolt against the Spanish Empire and the Viceroy of Peru in 1780 (Latin American and Caribbean Women's Collective, 1980:23) and Mbuya (Grandmother) Nehanda was a leader of the armed resistance against the British at the end of the nineteenth century in Zimbabwe (Qunta, 1987:55-58). The varied resistance of women to colonial slavery is also well documented. Their methods included arson, poisoning, "pulling foot" (running away) and resistance to having children (Mathurin, 1975:19, 20 and 22-27; Reddock, 1986:28).

The long history of women's resistance is paralleled by an equally long history of debate about the "woman question". As early as the sixth century B.C. the Buddha and his followers were pondering the role of women in religious practice (Bhasin and Khan, 1986:4). In the eleventh century in China, scholars were discussing the right of widows to remarry (Jayawardena, 1986:171). In India in the early nineteenth century, male reformers were campaigning against practices oppressive to women. By mid-century officials of the Ottoman Empire, Egypt and Iran were debating the education of women (Jayawardena, 1986:12, 28, 61). These discussions were dominated by men but, by the end of the nineteenth century, many countries of the Third World were experiencing the "first wave" of feminism and women were forming their own organisations. Feminists were no longer acting as individuals; a movement had been born.

At this time, liberal, middle class urban women dominated the movement (Reddock, 1988:65). Groups such as the *Asociacion Feminista Filipino*, formed in 1905, promoted women's education, access to the professions, and suffrage (Jayawardena, 1986:22). Women also undertook social service activities. A benevolent society of well-to-do Argentinean women was founded as early as 1823 (Latin American and Caribbean Women's Collective, 1980:28). Many women's groups were affiliated with international women's organisations such as the YWCA, the Council of Women and the Women's

Institutes. Working class women were more likely to be involved in church groups and trade unions. Sadly, the history of their militancy is less recognised than that of their well-to-do sisters. The ferment of activity that went on at the end of the last century and in the early decades of this one seemed to decline following the First World War, although women continued to be very much involved, as we shall see, in labour and anti-colonial struggles.'

The "second wave" of the feminist movement was born out of the social turmoil of the 1960s, the end of the independence movements in many countries and the stimulus of the International Women's Decade. Again, middle class women were in the forefront, although more recently, conscious efforts have been made to overcome class barriers. Many small, autonomous groups sprang up to engage in consciousness raising, popular education, human rights advocacy, income generation, skills training and communications. These groups were often more militant than their foremothers of the first wave had been (Acharya, 1991:7) and they addressed more issues related to their personal and political lives (Reddock, 1990:19). Often, the influence of these groups radicalised the larger, more

More detailed information about women's organising activities during the "first wave" can be found in Latin American and Caribbean Women's Collective (1980), Reddock, (1990), Meer (1987), Mba (1982), Jayawardena, (1986), Portugal, (1986) and Reddock, (1989).

established organisations (Reddock, 1990:19)².

This brief historical summary provides a background to a more analytical discussion of the factors influencing the development of feminism in the Third World. Specifically, we shall look at how the feminist movement has been shaped by political and economic crises, by patriarchal repression and by international influences.

Influences on the Development of Feminism in the South

Reddock (1988:54) points out the close connection between women's liberation and other social movements. Such movements often develop in response to crises, both economic and political. In the Third World, the feminist movement has been influenced to the greatest extent by three types of crisis: revolutionary or national liberation struggles, political repression and economic crisis. It must be acknowledged that two or more of these conditions may be linked in a particular case. We will turn first to revolutionary or national liberation struggles.

Women have been an integral part of liberation struggles throughout the Third World (El Saadawi, 1980:xi; Jayawardena, 1986) and the early feminist movements have been closely associated with such struggles (Reddock,

² More information about women's organising activities during the second wave can be found in Reddock, (1990), Acharya, (1991), Patel, (1985), Kumar (1989), CESIP (1986) and Association of Salvadoran Women, (1982).

1988:54; APCWD, 1979:28). Women's involvement has been enthusiastically encouraged by revolutionary male leaders such as Gandhi³ (Chitnis, 1988:87) and Ho Chi Minh (Aquino, 1985:330), who have also been canny enough to realise that such struggles would likely not be successful otherwise (Kazi, 1987:31). Women, for their part, have believed that political change is necessary to their own liberation (Arizpe, 1982:80).

Liberation struggles, like other crises, have presented both opportunities and dangers to women. On the positive side, women have often gained legal concessions they would not otherwise have achieved (Reddock, 1982:11). It is also true, however, that the end of the struggle has frequently marked the end of women's advancement, regardless of the ideology of the newly created state (El Saadawi, 1980:xi). In India, for example, women linked freedom for women with freedom for India and allied themselves with the nationalist movement. Through this involvement, women became more articulate in voicing their own grievances and gained credibility for their struggle as women (Liddle and Joshi, 1986:33). As a result, the Indian Constitution guaranteed sexual equality, and a succession of Five Year Plans made special provision for women's health care,

³ Liddle and Joshi (1986:34-35) note that although Gandhi was instrumental in bringing women into the nationalist movement, he liked to be in control of their actions. He effectively mediated women's discontents so that they remained targeted exclusively at imperialism.

employment, education and welfare. Yet the status of Indian women since Independence has changed very little (Chitnis 1988:88-89). In Cuba, the only country to legislate the sharing of domestic work between women and men⁴, the Women's Federation still wonders why men have time to participate in party and union activities while women hurry home from work to make dinner (Santa Cruz, 1985:3).

This result can be linked to a number of factors. Rowbotham (cited in Reddock, 1982:14) suggests that for men, national liberation is linked psychologically with the re-establishment of control over women. Reddock (1982:12) also notes that excessive nationalism may lead men to reject everything associated with the coloniser, including liberal European ideas about reforms for women, as was the case in India at the end of the nineteenth century (Chitnis, 1988:86). Casal (1980:1), commenting on the Cuban revolution, argues that there is a time lapse between changes in structure and the changes in consciousness which are essential to transforming the relations between women and men. Specific strategies are essential for transforming consciousness and these strategies must involve all the sites where consciousness is formed, such as the family, the educational system and the mass media. In Casal's (1980:2)

⁴ The Family Code which, among other things, gave women the power to take their husbands to court for not doing their share of the housework, was enacted in 1975 (Reddock, 1979:148).

view, "cultural transformations must begin at the earliest stages of the Revolution, lest they become permanently postponed." Unfortunately, it is characteristic of most revolutionary movements to subordinate the gender struggle to the class struggle. Women's concerns are dismissed as divisive or diversionary (Reddock, 1979:149).

The failure to analyse this very important aspect of life has led to the ignorance on the part of revolutionary intellectuals of some of the more complex workings of capitalism and a lack of understanding that domestic labour is the basis on which the capitalist system is built. This could be explained by the fact that the majority of male revolutionaries benefit from this particular aspect of capitalist exploitation and so are loathe to admit it to the fire of revolutionary analysis...A better analysis of the role of domestic labour could have contributed to a greater understanding of the nature of accumulation and the necessity to replace or completely transform it under socialism (Reddock, 1979:149-150).

Reddock (1979:150) argues that it is not consciousness that needs to be changed but "the material structures which are related to the economic functions of the household and the resulting sexual division of labour."

Movements for national independence/liberation have probably been the most influential in bringing women into the sphere of public action. Another form of political crisis, authoritarian repression, has also been a key factor, especially in Latin America. For example, following the Chilean coup of 1973, women were the first to mobilise around the issue of human rights (Fuentes, 1988:103).

Throughout Latin America, from the 1970s onward, women have

organised committees of relatives of political prisoners and the disappeared. Best known, perhaps are the Mothers of May Square in Argentina. In El Salvador, the Association of Salvadoran Women was formed to bring women from a variety of class backgrounds into the human rights struggle (Association of Salvadoran Women, 1982:21-22). In Guatemala, the levels of repression have been so high for so long that women have had no choice but to be involved (LAWG, 1983:57).

Although Latin America has provided almost limitless opportunities for repression to shape the development of feminism, this phenomenon has occurred elsewhere as well. The imposition of the State of Emergency in India in 1975 gave many middle class women their first taste of state authoritarianism. It is significant that when the Emergency was lifted, clandestine women's groups formed during that period came above ground and new ones formed (Kumar, 1989:148).

For some women, armed conflict and political repression have made it impossible for them to remain within their own countries and they have gone into exile, often far from home. The effect of exile, despite its difficulties, was liberating for many women. Their experiences overseas gave them skills and perspectives which they were eager to share with other women when they returned home. The women's movement in Chile has benefitted particularly from the

contributions of the *retornadas*⁵.

The connection between repression and the growth of feminism has been posited by the Latin American feminist Julieta Kirkwood (n.d.:44). She argues that there is a connection between the questioning of authoritarianism in society and in the family. Certainly Chilean women did this when they devised the slogan, "Democracia en el país...y en la casa", (Democracy in the country...and in the home) or "Si el feminismo no está, la democracia no va", (Without feminism, democracy won't work).

We have seen that political struggles have brought women out of their homes and into the streets. Economic crises have had the same effect. Because of the centrality of their reproductive roles, women have been forced to confront directly hunger, homelessness and ill health. Women have had to organise for family survival and this has given them important experiences (CESIP, 1986:99-100). Their response has taken two main forms - trade union action and community action.

Involvement in the labour movement has been particularly important for working class women, both as workers and as wives of workers (Fuentes, 1988:91; Association of Salvadoran Women, 1982:17). As early as the

⁵ While conducting research in Chile in 1988, I met with a large number of women's groups. In almost all of them, *retornadas* were active members, sharing what they had learned during their years in Europe, North America and other parts of Latin America.

late eighteenth century women tobacco workers went on strike in Mexico City and Vera Cruz (Latin American and Caribbean Women's Collective, 1980:26). The first major textile strike took place in 1857 in Guadalajara. Eighty percent of the weavers were women (Latin American and Caribbean Women's Collective, 1980:27). The role of Salvadoran women in labour struggles over a number of decades has been key to forging their revolutionary spirit (Association of Salvadoran Women, 1982:20-21). More recently, within the *Asociación de Trabajadores del Campo* (Rural Workers Union) in Nicaragua, women and men have been able to address together issues of gender inequality (Criquillón and Espinosa, 1988:82). The result has been a union that is stronger overall and is also more responsive to the needs of its women members.

Women's trade union involvement is of long standing. More recent is their involvement in community-based economic survival strategies. An early form of women's community organisation comes from South Africa in the early years of this century. The Manyano, which has been called "the most prolific African women's organisation" (Meer, 1987:22), was a grassroots organisation which brought together women from the depressed townships and provided material and social assistance. It also campaigned on issues affecting women such as the move to extend the pass laws (1913 and 1950s), the prohibition on beer brewing

(1940s) which provided a livelihood for many women, and the forced removals of the 1950s (Meer, 1987:22).

More recently, worldwide economic crises of the 1970s and 1980s, exacerbated by the policies imposed by the International Monetary Fund, have had a devastating effect on Third World economies and especially on Third World women. Struggles of Indian tribal people against exploitation by rich peasants, money lenders and government officials involved women from the beginning. Through this struggle, the women identified the need to address more women-specific issues such as alcoholism, wife beating and sexual harassment of tribal poor by the rural rich (Patel, 1985:66).

In Latin America, women have organised *ollas comunes* or *comedores populares* (soup kitchens) (Vega, 1990:8), *vaso de leche* (glass of milk) campaigns (CESIP, 1986:99), neighbourhood libraries, community stores and environmental defence committees (Ramírez, 1985:4). Women's organising in this way has led to increased community profile for the women and to confrontations with patriarchal municipal administrators over organisational autonomy (CESIP, 1986:102). In Chile, the *ollas comunes* became centres of opposition to the Pinochet dictatorship (Fuentes, 1988:103).

A final example of women's response to economic crisis is the "Women's War" in Nigeria in 1929-1930. The

war was certainly the most notable, but not the only event in a history of women's mass protest against the colonial regime. The "war" was in fact a series of mass meetings, demonstrations and acts of violence undertaken by women responding to threats to their economic and political interests brought on by taxation policies, an economic crisis in the palm products trade and the actions of the warrant chiefs and native courts (Mba, 1982:68-97).

The foregoing discussion of women's organising in response to political and economic crises allows us to draw some conclusions about their influence on the development of feminism. A crisis provides women, individually and collectively, with the opportunity to take action which might not otherwise be permitted (Reddock, 1982:11). In organising collectively, women will often first address a situation affecting the community as a whole. As noted above, women may recognise that their own situation will not change without changes in society at large (El Saadawi, 1980:xi), or that they cannot reach their goals alone, without the support of men (LAWG, 1983:59). The converse is also true - men may not be able to achieve their goals without the support of women (Kazi, 1987:31). Finally, women may feel that the immediate survival of themselves and their children is in jeopardy.

Through involvement in a general struggle, two things happen to women. First, they gain skills, confidence

and experience which can be used in other situations and struggles. Secondly, a change in consciousness occurs and they begin to see their situation as women differently. Involvement in political and economic struggles creates a crack in the patriarchal order and brings closer the private and public realms. It also means changes in the domestic routine and in the roles of women and other family members in the home (CESIP, 1986:100). Through this form of involvement, women have learned to see collective action as an effective strategy in addressing common problems (Fuentes, 1988:104). They have also gone on to challenge other forms of women's oppression (Carillo, 1990:202). As one Zimbabwean woman put it

I do not think the war would have been won without the women. Women played a very important role in the struggle...Now women have to liberate themselves. We should not accept our husbands as our superiors. We are equal and we should be seen to be equal because we did a great job during the struggle (Maudy Muzenda quoted in Staunton, 1990:66).

A Guatemalan women phrased it this way.

I know that if I had never had experience in the popular struggle, I would never have developed an awareness of women's oppression (quoted in LAWG, 1983:60).

We have now seen that crises, political and economic, have propelled women from the kitchen into the community and a changed consciousness. Such a consciousness makes it more and more difficult to accept the overt and covert exercise of patriarchal power. We shall look now at

what effect patriarchal power has had on the development of feminism. Women's resistance has been particularly strong when governments have endeavoured to reimpose or increase patriarchal controls. Two such cases are those of Chile in 1973 and Iran in 1979.

In Chile, from the mid-nineteenth century until the coup of 1973, women benefitted from governments influenced by European liberalism and, after 1970, from the socialist regime of Salvador Allende (Fuentes, 1988:92-93) which encouraged women's participation in community life. Following the coup, Pinochet re-constituted the *Secretaría Nacional de la Mujer* (National Women's Secretariat), originally established by Allende, but on completely different lines. Its new purpose was to promote women's roles as wives and mothers and the values of the "traditional" family. Women were organised in volunteer corps in a fashion reminiscent of Mussolini's *fascio feminilis*, presided over by an administrative hierarchy of wives of junta members (Fuentes, 1988:96-97). A variety of edicts were issued concerning how women were to dress and comport themselves. Women wearing slacks in public were attacked and their clothes torn (Letelier, 1986:166)⁶.

⁶ There seems to be a connection between authoritarian military regimes and state efforts to enforce women's "traditional" roles as wives and mothers. The military-backed government in Fiji included in its stated policies "a return to traditional ways and customs". The political climate deliberately created by the government made women's efforts towards reform extremely difficult. Instead, the

This attempt at patriarchal repression, coupled with the heavy political repression and followed by an economic recession, were the main factors in mobilising women against the dictatorship and for women's rights (Fuentes, 1988:100).

A similar scenario was played out in Iran after the 1979 revolution. During the revolution, unprecedented numbers of women had filled the streets demanding an end to the repressive regime of the Shah. Less than a month later, many of those women were in the streets again protesting Khomeini's attempts to impose restrictions on women's freedoms. Specifically, the Ayatollah decreed that women should be veiled while working outside the home. More significant still was the government's suspension of the Family Protection Law which had restricted polygamy and given women the right to initiate divorce. Iranian women were determined not to hand back to the Shi'ite clergy the rights they had won under the Shah (Tabari, 1980:19-20). This particular struggle continues and has been repeated in other countries subjected to religious fundamentalism such as Pakistan (Rahman, 1987).

More covert, but just as frustrating and disillusioning, have been the patriarchal attitudes found in male-dominated political movements or parties of the "progressive" left. The Association of Salvadoran Women

government provided support to more traditional women's organisations which were not attempting to change the status quo (Jalal, 1989:15).

(1982:19) speaks eloquently of women's experience in this regard.

The parties of the democratic left have, in general, not dealt with the problems of women with the same consistency with which they confront other social problems...It is not easy for men, even with good intentions, to raise their consciousness concerning the privileges conveyed by masculinity and to relinquish their role as the star members of the cast, becoming instead comrades who share daily life and struggle...In other words, the failure to integrate the female problematic into the broad political project has, until now, left a large vacuum: a change in the relations of production is advocated, but not in the relations of reproduction; society is to be overturned economically and ideologically, but nothing is said of changes in the family, which is the sphere not only of consumption but also of reproduction of labour power, as well as the strategic locale for the transmission of ideology.

Similar concerns have been expressed by African women as well (Baffoun quoted in AAWORD, 1985:5).

During the social upheavals in Latin America in the 1970s, the one unchanging factor was the sexual division of labour within the parties most active in promoting social change.

(T)he compañeras still made the coffee, did the typing and carried out other services on top of shouldering most of the economic burdens at home in a period of sharp recession" (Portugal, 1986:6).

Ten years later, it was the women from those political groups who founded the "second wave" of the feminist movement in Latin America despite the active opposition of the male-dominated left (Pineda quoted in Cordero, 1986:37; Carillo, 1990:200-201; Portugal, 1986:4). The covert

exercise of patriarchal power has led to the formation of many single-issue women's organisations such as those concerned with women's reproductive freedom, women's access to non-traditional employment and the exploitation of women in free trade zones.

The foregoing discussions of crises and patriarchal repression give examples of local conditions leading to the development of feminism. There have been external factors as well to which we will now turn our attention. As early as the eighteenth century, Muslim travellers to Europe noted the degree of relative freedom enjoyed by European women and the deference shown to them by European men (Jayawardena, 1986:10-11). European liberal thought (Jayawardena, 1986:5; Chitnis, 1988:84; Reddock, 1988:60) and later Marxism (Fuentes, 1988:92-93) had considerable influence in the Third World. Espousal of liberal views on women's rights was seen as a step toward the modern development of colonised countries. In fact, reform of especially oppressive customs such as foot binding, seclusion and sati were thought necessary to improve the image of the colonised country in the eyes of the coloniser (Reddock, 1988:60 and 65). In India, for example, it was European-influenced men who first opposed many oppressive traditional practices; only toward the end of the nineteenth century did women become involved (Chitnis, 1988:84).

Colonial administrators and European missionaries were concerned about oppressive traditions as well, and, in both Asia and Africa, played a role in suppressing them (Parpart, 1988:117; Jayawardena, 1986:20). Europeans also promoted education for girls, another reform that found favour with local elites. With the spread of European education came European literature and the literary debates of the late nineteenth and early twentieth century. Ibsen's play, *The Doll's House*, whose heroine leaves her husband and children to make a life for herself, became a topic of heated controversy throughout Asia (Jayawardena, 1986:14). There was also a "flowering" of feminist literature in countries such as Egypt, Turkey, Iran, China and Vietnam (Jayawardena, 1986:17-18).

Personal contacts were also important in the growth of feminism. Early European feminists such as Flora Tristan⁷ travelled in the Third World (Mies and Jayawardena cited in Jayawardena, 1986:21). Annie Besant, a feminist and Fabian socialist from England, came to India in 1893 and became a leader in the nationalist struggle (Jayawardena, 1986:94). Margaret Sanger, the American campaigner for birth control, had a great influence on Asian women (Jayawardena, 1986:20). Third World women also took every opportunity of travelling abroad to meet with women's

One of the principal feminist organisations in Peru is named for Flora Tristan.

organisations and political groups (Jayawardena, 1986:21). During the "second wave", American radical and socialist feminism influenced feminism in other parts of the world such as Latin America (Fuentes, 1988:94; Pineda, quoted in Cordero, 1986:37).

Specific events in the international sphere such as the French Revolution (Henriquez cited in CIPAF, 1988a:8), the Spanish Civil War (Kirkwood, n.d.:43), the Cuban Revolution (Portugal, 1986:5), the American Civil Rights movement (Reddock, 1988:67), Black Power (Wiltshire-Brodber, 1988:148), the anti-war and student movements (Patel, 1985:66) and the International Women's Decade (Wiltshire-Brodber, 1988:149) influenced the consciousness of women in the Third World.

Contemporary Third World Feminism

The foregoing analysis clearly shows the long and fruitful history of feminism in the Third World. It will now be useful to examine the elements of feminist theory and practice as developed by women in the South. Although, as stated earlier, it may be somewhat problematic to speak of "feminism" rather than "feminisms" in the Third World, what I am attempting to do is to see how the specific historical and current experiences of women in the Third World have shaped their theory and practice of feminism. Many feminists in the South, as well as feminists of colour in

the North⁸, have objected to the assumption that the white, middle class, Northern woman's experience of womanhood is universal. Third World women have insisted that their feminism has been moulded by their specific historical and current experiences, experiences that are different in many ways from those of women in the North. Moreover, Southern feminists are asserting their right to speak in their own voices and not to be considered merely the younger siblings of feminists in the North (Mair, 1988:9). Instead, Third World women are demanding that feminism be transformed to reflect their perspective (Bandarage, 1983:6). Under this influence and that of immigrant women and women of colour in the North, Northern feminists are beginning to alter their approach to feminism. There is nothing unusual in this; no ideology is static.

Given this context, we can now look at some of those elements of feminism which Third World women have contributed to the ongoing theoretical discussion. The most significant issue is the nature of women's oppression. In the Third World, gender oppression is one strand in a

⁸ There are many parallels between the experiences of Third World women and women of colour in North America and Europe. Some theorists see the experiences as identical (Mohanty, 1991). I would argue, however that there are some differences, particularly in terms of the two groups' experience of imperialism, of their positions within their respective class structures and of their experiences as part of racial minorities or majorities. For the purposes of this thesis, we are dealing with women in the geographic Third World.

inextricable web of oppressions in which women are caught (AAWORD, 1985:2; Steady, 1987:4; Mohanty, 1991:11; Chitnis, 1988:92; Fuentes, 1988:92; Wiltshire-Brodber, 1988:153, Aquino, 1985:34?). The other strands may include class, race, imperialism⁹, ethnicity and age. Under these circumstances it makes no sense to privilege gender oppression above others. All are linked; all are oppressive; all must be addressed.

From this key factor, a number of others follow. Most important among these is that for Third World women, feminism does not deal only with narrowly defined "women's issues". Feminism is

... a basic approach to life. Feminism is an ideology that offers a holistic concept of how a society should be shaped in order to help all people realize their full potential. As such, it does not separate the political, social and economic elements of a society...or put any one of these elements first (Anand, n.d.:2).

The multi-dimensional nature of women's oppression in the Third world leads to five corollaries as well. First, for Third World women, feminism is a transformatory politics (Antrobus, 1988:30). Minor tinkering with the system will not suffice, the entire structure must be rebuilt.

⁹ I am using the same definitions for "imperialism" and "colonialism" that Liddle and Joshi (1986:41) do. "Imperialism" signifies "any relationship of dominance and subordination between nations, including the modern form of using economic control". "Colonialism" refers to "the specific historical form of imperialism which uses direct military and political control".

2

PM-1 3 1/2" x 4" PHOTOGRAPHIC MICROCOPY TARGET
NBS 1010a ANS J1/ISO #2 EQUIVALENT

PRECISIONSM RESOLUTION TARGETS

PIONEERS IN METHYLENE BLUE TESTING SINCE 1974

1080 COUNTY ROAD 8, BURNING WOOD, OH 44021, USA
TEL: 814/485-1987 FAX: 814/485-1987 TLR: 814/485-1987

Second, many Third World women find it difficult to identify man as the undifferentiated oppressor (Chitnis, 1988:92; Nakpel cited in Aquino, 1985:343; Steady, 1987:8; Jain, 1978:10; Okeyo, 1981:8). Although there are certain situations where women recognise and resist male oppression, there are other situations in which men are their allies, for example, within the context of revolutionary or nationalist struggles, or efforts to resist racism. In addition, religious philosophies, especially in Asia, are based on the complementarity of women and men. This complementarity finds expression particularly in the rural areas where men's and women's work are mutually supportive (Jain, 1978:10). In addition, women frequently find that other women are their principal oppressors. This can happen in relations between middle and upper class women, and their domestic servants, (Barrett et al., 1985:31-37) and between young Indian brides and their mothers- or sisters-in-law (Chitnis, 1988:92).

A third corollary to women's multiple oppressions is that the concept of equality with men may be inappropriate. In societies where the vast majority lives in poverty, few women aspire to be equal to men. "In many senses, for women it would mean equal repression and we already have that" (Guatemalan woman quoted in LAWG, 1983:60). On the contrary, women may feel they have much more in common with men of their own class than with women

elsewhere on the economic ladder (Fernández-Kelly, 1980:18). This may be why Third World women seem more ready than feminists in the North to accept the support of sympathetic men¹⁰.

Fourth, the family is not always identified as the major site of women's oppression. Despite the oppression which women may feel from their husbands or fathers, home is also "a source of strength, respect and financial support" to which there is no viable alternative (Fernández-Kelly, 1980:18). Home can also be a haven within a racist society (Bhavnani and Coulson, 1986:88; Bandarage, 1983:8).

Finally, Third World women argue that the experience of womanhood is not universal (Bhavnani and Coulson, 1986:83). There are conflicts of interest among women based on a large number of factors, particularly class, race and experience of imperialism. These differences must be acknowledged and addressed (Bhavnani and Coulson: 1986:84).

It is perhaps the inclusive approach to women's issues that leads Third World women to be more "political" in their practice. There is a strong and specifically anti-imperialist, anti-capitalist orientation to much of feminist writing from the Third World (Antrobus, 1989b:40; CIPAF,

¹⁰ The definition of feminism quoted in Bhasin and Khan (1986:2) speaks of "conscious action by women and men to change (women's oppression)." Ayesha Imam (1986:68) speaks of creating "a society where women and men can live in peace with each other."

1988c:7; Bandarage, 1983:9; AAWORD/DHF, 1982:11). This is not surprising given the devastating effects of colonialism and international capitalism on women and on Third World societies in general. It has been noted in Chapter Three that colonialism superimposed European forms of male domination on local ones and wiped out women's traditional sources of power and prestige (Bandarage, 1983:9). Today, most Third World women are members of the working class or the rural poor. Their labour is exploited in the factory, field and home with little material reward. But despite a sympathetic view of neo-Marxist socialism (APCWD, 1979:27; Reddock, 1988:73; Fuentes, 1988:92-95), many Third World feminists are highly critical of existing socialist regimes as well (Anand, n.d.:3-4; Ernst, 1986:67; AAWORD, 1985:2). While acknowledging that socialist states may offer an environment more conducive to women's liberation, women know that "a change in regime is not a necessary and sufficient condition for solving the problem of women's status" (Savané quoted in *Le Soleil*, 1986:12). Socialist governments tend to treat sexism as a problem for capitalist societies only and therefore of no concern to them. Oppression is seen only in terms of class (Anand, n.d.:3). Following Marxist theory, women are encouraged to emancipate themselves through participation in the paid labour force. Whether such encouragement stems more from a desire to increase production than liberate women, the result is often to

burden women with an even longer work day (Fuentes, 1988:93).

In fact, there is considerable scepticism of political parties and governments of any stripe amongst women of the Third World. Over fifteen hundred women at the Fourth Feminist Meeting for Latin America and the Caribbean in Taxco in 1987 concluded that, "Women must find a different kind of politics because men's politics do not take our needs into account" (Portugal, 1987:1). Peggy Antrobus (1989a:197) explains her concept of feminist politics this way.

(W)hen women act politically they often do so in ways that are different from those of men - and it is precisely this difference that offers hope for an alternative to...a model of society based on male domination. Women's political activism offers an alternative because movements in which women predominate tend to be less hierarchical, to be more likely to use non-violence as a strategy, and are more likely to be both progressive (i.e. seeking a better life) and offensive (i.e. challenging the status quo) than movements in which men predominate (Frank and Fuentes 1987). Further, the energy which invigorates women's movements is a special energy: it is an energy that comes from women who are (or feel themselves to be) "outside" the power structure - women who are not constrained by convention or privilege.

Emphasis is placed on the building of a broadly-based, independent women's movement, grounded in grass-roots organising, and the efficacy of coalition politics (Vargas, 1988:107; Santa Cruz, 1985:3; Reddock, 1988:75; Carillo,

1990:200-201)".

Within Third World feminist politics there is also a strong call for internationalism (Arizpe, 1982:81; Carillo, 1990:201-205; Diskin, 1984:620; Bandarage, 1983:11; El Saadawi, 1987:269). Perhaps because of the difficulties which Third World feminists have had in making their voices heard in the North, they are conscious of the need for exchanges of ideas and experiences in order to overcome the barriers which separate women. The subordination of women is recognised as an international phenomenon which can be effectively challenged only through concerted action. Third World women have no illusions about the difficulty of this task. Roxanna Carillo (1990:205) addresses this issue.

How can we build strong alliances that take into account our differences but do not necessarily erase them? How can we women from the Third World and from industrialized countries move beyond feelings of anger or guilt that tend to have a paralysing effect and that do not help us to act politically?

Perhaps the first step is to have respect for others' insights and perceptions of reality...No one is to blame for the country, class or race she was born into: those are givens that we do not have any control over. But one has to take responsibility for that, working consciously to change the aspects of our lives and our countries that are oppressive to others...

But in order for us...to create alliances with you, we must first see that you acknowledge and take responsibility for the oppressive consequences of your nation's power in our lives.

" This is not to suggest that women should withdraw from other struggles, merely not to expect those struggles to address adequately the situation of women.

A Third World Feminist Vision of Development

The elements of Third World feminism outlined above have had considerable impact on the international feminist debate. They have challenged many Northern women's concepts of feminism and contributed to their transformation. Third World feminism has also had a powerful impact on women's approach to development issues. With these concepts in mind, we can now see how they are reflected in a Third World feminist vision of development. We will look at this vision in terms of its overall goals, its scope and context, and proposed strategies.

The goals of a feminist vision of development have been best expressed by Sen and Grown (1987:80), writing on behalf of DAWN.

We want a world where inequality based on class, gender, and race is absent from every country, and from the relationships among countries. We want a world where basic needs become basic rights and where poverty and all forms of violence are eliminated. Each person will have the opportunity to develop her or his full potential and creativity, and women's values of nurturance and solidarity will characterize human relationships.

The scope of a Third World feminist approach to development is both broad and deep. Development¹² is seen in holistic terms, encompassing every aspect of human advancement (Antrobus, 1989b:156; Benería and Roldán, 1987:170). It is based on justice (Jain, 1983:20; Bhasin,

¹² In the following section the term "development" is understood within the context of a Third World feminist vision.

1980:126) and requires equal distribution of wealth and power at the household, societal and international levels. Development responds to those most in need and is rooted in local history (Antrobus, 1989b:157) and indigenous institutions rather than imported paradigms (Ellis, 1984:2-3). Development demands transformation - of traditional development theory (as we saw in Chapter Three), of society's structures and institutions and of attitudes and human relationships in order to eradicate all forms of discrimination, domination and exploitation (AAWORD, 1982:13). In particular, patriarchal practices and relations, and those aspects of "tradition" and culture that denigrate women must be eliminated (AAWORD, 1982:14 and 15). As well as protecting and nurturing people, development must do the same for the environment (Benería and Roldán, 1987:170; AAWORD, 1982:14).

The process through which development takes place reflects its goals. Thus, governments and people work together (Ellis, 1984:2), in a participatory and democratic fashion (Benería and Roldán, 1987:170-171). The process and the policies developed through it will take women's experience into account (Antrobus, 1990b:2) and will themselves be gender-aware, taking into consideration the relations between women and men and valuing their different roles (Imam, 1988:13).

Development can occur only within a context

compatible with its goals. Economies will have to be restructured (Benería and Roldán, 1987:171) to give people and the satisfaction of their basic needs priority over the interests of international capital (Antrobus, 1989b:157). This will mean gearing production to the local rather than the export market (Steady, 1982:60) and working toward self-reliance in such key sectors as food, water, energy, health and education (Sen and Grown, 1987:83; AAWORD, 1982:14). The political process will be based on mobilisation at the grass roots level to ensure that decision-making is participatory and democratic (Sen and Grown, 1987:86). Work for the poor will be guaranteed (Jain, 1990:16) and the division of labour within society will be restructured so that women and children will no longer be exploited (AAWORD, 1982:14). In particular, reproductive work will be considered a fundamental component of human activity (Benería and Roldán, 1987:170).

Within this context, what concrete actions will take place? Economic resources will be diverted from military expenditures (Sen and Grown, 1987:83; Benería and Roldán, 1987:170) to production of basic needs and provision of social services. Production in agriculture and industry will be geared to the local rather than the international market (Steady, 1982:60). In the rural areas, agrarian reform will give women control over the land they till (AAWORD, 1982:12; Mazumdar, 1982:70; Sen and Grown,

1987:83). In the industrial sector, multinationals will be controlled to stop capital drain (Sen and Grown, 1987:84) and industrial development will be linked with raw materials extraction (Steady, 1982:60). International trade will be based on mutually beneficial and negotiated interdependence with an emphasis on South-South connections (Steady, 1982:61; AAWORD, 1982:13). The informal economy in rural and urban areas will be supported since it is this sector that caters to the consumption requirements of the poor (Sen and Grown, 1987:86).

In order to carry out such a programme, the involvement of issue-based, grass roots organisations is vital (Jain, 1990:15). Resources will have to be provided to strengthen such groups (in which women predominate) (Ellis, 1984:9) and to facilitate their mobilisation (Sen and Grown, 1987:86) and their role in the decision-making process (Antrobus, 1990b:3). It is important to build on the characteristics which women bring to the development process. These characteristics are a desire for peace, a sense of responsibility and care for each other, a rejection of hierarchy, their involvement in both productive and reproductive work and their roots in the local culture and religion (Jain, 1990:21).

Is there a role for Northern women in a Southern feminist vision of development? Devaki Jain (1990:1) argues that "international solidarity must move from the realm of

moral and financial support to joint action in the field of growth and development strategies". She goes on (1990:2-4) to urge the North to modify its production and consumption choices by emulating the waste-avoiding cultural practices of the South and calls on women of the North to critique their own governments' policies and relationships that have a negative impact on the South.

The Southern feminist vision of development may seem naive and idealistic. Nevertheless, in the words of Benería and Roldán (1987:171), "more than any other vision, it is likely to represent the needs and aspirations of a great majority of the world's population." As such it behooves us in the North, especially those of us who are international development workers, to listen and learn.

Conclusion

This chapter has examined the development of feminism in the South and the ways in which feminism has been theorised and practised by the women of the Third World. We have seen how their concept of feminism and their experiences have led them to a feminist vision of development. In the next three chapters we will look at specific areas within the current development debate, to which Third World feminists have made significant contributions - the debt crisis, the new international division of labour, and violence against women.

CHAPTER FIVE

STRUCTURAL ADJUSTMENT: WOMEN DEAL WITH THE DEBT

I don't serve myself anything but just fool my stomach by drinking tea - although sometimes I feel that I'm splitting with hunger. Someone has to make more sacrifices than the rest of the family, especially when there's nowhere to get food from.

Duberlida Navarro,
wife of an unemployed locksmith in Santiago, Chile
(quoted in Alcalde cited in de Barbieri and de
Oliveira, 1991:27)

Introduction

In selecting three development issues to which Third World women have made significant contributions, I had no difficulty in deciding that structural adjustment would be one of them. Structural adjustment or stabilisation is the strategy developed, promoted and imposed by the International Monetary Fund (IMF) to deal with the economic crisis resulting from the balance of payments deficits accumulated by Third World countries. This problem and the IMF's solution are not new. The increasing severity of the economic crisis, however, and the growing number of countries which have come under the IMF's strict discipline, have now brought structural adjustment into the communities, workplaces and homes of millions of people in the Third World'. Moreover, structural adjustment has become the

¹ Since 1980, approximately 60 countries in the Third World have adopted structural adjustment programmes (Gentry, 1990:3).

keystone around which the development programmes of international agencies and major donors, including Canada, have been built (Jolly cited in Tadesse, 1991:46).

Structural adjustment is highly controversial and has generated considerable debate within the development community in the North and the South. Many researchers, academics, development workers and even international bodies such as the Commonwealth Expert Group on Women and Structural Adjustment (1989) have condemned structural adjustment as a "cure" that is worse than the disease. Because the effects of structural adjustment programmes (SAPs) have been so devastating for millions of Third World women, this question has been addressed at length by women's organisations and women scholars and researchers throughout the South. This chapter will examine their analyses of the issue and the alternatives which they are proposing.

The women whose research we will review argue that, far from easing the debt crisis, structural adjustment programmes have exacerbated the situation (Antrobus, 1989b:146). Furthermore the ill effects of SAPs have been borne disproportionately by women, especially poor women. In coping with the crisis, however, women's consciousness has changed. They have gained in knowledge and experience, and through collective action are surviving and working to transform the structures which have brought this particularly catastrophic crisis upon them.

In tracing the roots of the current crisis, we will see that they go back beyond the period of rapidly increasing indebtedness in the 1970s to the colonial era and to the global economic order established after World War II. Tracing the growth of Third World debt will demonstrate how indebtedness benefitted elites in the North and South to the detriment of the vast majority of Third World people, especially women. An analysis of the debt crisis and the SAPs established to deal with it, will show how they contributed to the worsening economic situation in the Third World and the further deterioration in the quality of life of Third World women at home, at work and in the community. This analysis will also be shown to differ considerably from that of international agencies and donor countries such as Canada. Examples of women's efforts to cope with the crisis will demonstrate their resourcefulness and tenacity, and the ways in which they have used the crisis as an opportunity to break with traditional roles and stereotypes. By examining the alternatives to structural adjustment proposed by Third World women, we will see how their feminist vision has been applied to a particular development issue.

The Roots of the Crisis

A number of factors contributed to the debt crisis: the colonial heritage of unequal economic

relationships between the North and the South, the nature and role of the International Monetary Fund, the availability of a large pool of dollars administered by profit-blinded, irresponsible lenders, and misuse by governments in the South of the funds they borrowed. We will look at each of these in turn.

The traditional economic relationship between the North and the South involved the South as the source of raw materials and the North as manufacturer and provider of finished products. Prices for primary products have been dictated by the world market, out of the control of the producer countries, and are always less than those of the finished products. Moreover, this has been a steadily worsening situation from the point of view of the South (Vega, 1990:8). The resulting trade imbalances have forced developing countries to seek balance of payments support loans.

The relative weakness of the Southern economies and their economic dependence on the countries of the North has also made them vulnerable to downturns in the economies of the Northern countries. While economic prosperity reigned in the North during the 1950s and 1960s, many countries in the South enjoyed periods of economic growth and increases in living standards (Arriagada, 1988:53). It was at this period that those countries which had adopted the strategy of import-substitution industrialisation reaped

the benefits of expanded local industry and growth of local markets. Beginning at the end of the 1960s, however, a period of economic stagnation set in and by the mid 1970s a global recession had begun (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:14-16). By the early 1980s many developing countries had large trade deficits as a result of deteriorating terms of trade, increased protectionism of Northern countries and a slow-down in global trade generally (Commonwealth Expert Group on Women and Structural Adjustment, 1989:5). The situation was aggravated by increases in global interest rates and the "oil shocks" of the early and late 1970s which gravely affected those developing countries dependent on imported petroleum (George, 1988:28). In addition, many countries were afflicted with "capital flight" as rich elites sought to increase and protect their wealth by sending it abroad (Arriagada, 1988:54).

Trade was simply one aspect of a global economy dominated by Northern countries to the detriment of the South. Even after political independence, economic dependence continued and one of the important institutions responsible for maintaining this relationship has been the International Monetary Fund. The IMF and its "twin", the World Bank, were created by the European and North American governments at the Bretton Woods Conference in New Hampshire in 1944. The purpose of the IMF was to "uphold financial

discipline, coordinate national monetary policies and prevent economic warfare" (Anand,1984:1) in order to prevent the economic chaos and crisis that had existed during the 1920s and 1930s. In addition the IMF is mandated to promote international trade. In this role, the IMF provides balance of payments support to those countries in deficit situations in order to ensure their continued participation in the global economy (George, 1988:50). Moreover, the Fund has become a watchdog on national economies around the world whose approval is sought before other lenders will extend loans to borrowing nations. The Fund is thus in a position to dictate conditionalities to borrowers. The nature of these conditionalities is shaped by the Fund's ideology of economic liberalism (Payer, 1974:25), based on the doctrines of free trade and comparative advantage (George, 1988:50). Market forces are to be allowed free play with a minimum of government interference (Payer, 1974:25).

The IMF is clearly the key, though not the only actor in the debt drama and its demands on borrowing nations have had disastrous effects on the lives of millions of Third World women and men. The Fund has not, however, provided the bulk of the money from which the debt was made. The initial source of loans was Europe. In the late 1940s, the Soviet Union and China deposited their dollar earnings

in France to keep them out of reach of the Americans². As western European governments (except Britain) permitted the conversion of their currencies into dollars, a huge pool of Eurodollars was created, providing credit on an unprecedented scale. At the same time as Eurodollars became more readily available, American dollars became less accessible. The United States had moved into a deficit, interest rates were controlled and American corporations and financial institutions were putting their funds into the more profitable Eurodollars as well. The United States placed restrictions on foreign borrowing in an effort to keep their dollars at home. America's involvement in the Vietnam War created an even greater credit squeeze. The supply of Eurodollars increased and bankers actively canvassed for borrowers, especially among developing countries. Half of the Eurodollar loans to the Third World went to Brazil and Mexico. A second pool of money looking for borrowers was created in the early 1970s when the sharp and rapid rise in the price of oil created large surpluses.

The lenders were so busy disposing of money and counting their profits that they gave no thought to the risk factors involved. How much money could developing countries usefully absorb? What guarantees could they offer? What

² The following discussion on the rise of the Eurodollar and the petrodollar is based on Anita Anand's account in her 1984 article, "Financing Debts with Your Dollars and Mine: The IMF and the International Economic Crisis".

would happen in the event of a default? No one, in either the North or the South, cared to ask. If repayment was a problem, bankers obligingly arranged new loans or rescheduled payments, thus keeping the developing countries in thrall. By 1982 Brazil owed US\$60 billion, mostly to commercial banks. Mexico's debt was \$80 billion (George, 1988:41). It is important to note too that a significant proportion of the debt was private rather than public. The advantage to private borrowers was that if they were unable to repay, the government would kindly take responsibility for the debt. Also, much of the debt, both public and private was owed to commercial banks rather than to foreign governments (Briones, n.d.:1-2).

A final factor in creating the debt crisis was the way in which the loans were used by many Third World governments. Loans were generally spent without consideration of the needs or interests of the majority of Third World peoples (Sen and Grown, 1987:60). In some cases, loans financed grandiose mega-projects which were impractical from the beginning and were seldom successful or even completed (Mair, 1988:8; Anand, 1984:2; Sen and Grown, 1987:60). In other cases, loans purchased armaments (Mair, 1988:8; Sen and Grown 1987:60) or luxury goods for the elite (Anand, 1984:2; Ramírez, 1985:4). At worst, the money went straight into the pockets of corrupt officials or contractors (Ramírez, 1985:4; Sen and Grown,

1987:60; Tocón, 1989:3). When loans were put to productive purposes, they financed export-oriented agriculture or industry, rather than the development of the domestic market (Anand, 1984:2). As time went on, loans were negotiated simply to pay off the interest on previous debts (Iguíñiz cited in Tocón, 1989:3).

The "crisis" came abruptly in August, 1982, when Mexico came perilously close to defaulting and an international rescue had to be engineered by the Americans to save everyone's skin (George, 1988:40-44). Thereafter, the fountain of dollars dried up and many developing countries have since become net exporters of capital (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:17). During the last three years of the 1980s, the net capital outflow from the South to the North was US\$120 billion (French, 1990:7). The Mexican crisis convinced the North to make even more concerted efforts to put the Third World's financial house in order, but without considering any renovations to its own shaky structure (Sen and Grown, 1987:61). Structural adjustment was the plan to which everyone (in the South) would have to conform.

Structural Adjustment

Structural adjustment has been defined by the World Bank (quoted in Landry, 1990:3) as

programs, policies and institutional change
necessary to modify the structures of an economy

so that it can restore or maintain its growth, and viability in its balance of payments, over the medium term.

In keeping with the IMF's ideology, structural adjustment is based on the assumption that market forces, liberalised trade and "freedom" in economic matters are more efficient and will promote greater prosperity than controls and restrictions (Anand, 1984:1). SAPs are applied universally (French, 1990:6) without regard to culture, history or current social or political contexts and include the following measures.

- * Public spending is curbed by reducing allocations to "unproductive" sectors of the budget such as social services and education, laying off public sector employees, eliminating subsidies on basic goods, freezing public sector wages and cancelling public works programmes such as construction of roads, schools and hospitals.
- * Inflation is reduced by reducing demand, primarily by freezing or reducing current wages and the legal minimum wage.
- * Foreign exchange earnings are increased by emphasising industrial and agricultural production for export, establishing export processing zones, abolishing export taxes, devaluing the local currency, encouraging

foreign investment and expanding tourism³.

- * Government revenue is increased by selling state enterprises and increasing public utility rates and public transportation fares.
- * Taxation and other economic and trade policies are "reformed" by reducing income taxes, increasing personal tax exemptions, introducing regressive taxes such as a value added tax, increasing interest rates and eliminating import restrictions.

How are these "packages" affecting the lives of ordinary people in the Third World?

Third World Women's Analyses⁴

It can be difficult to differentiate between the effects of the debt crisis and the effects of measures intended to alleviate that crisis. Defenders of structural adjustment will say that the situation would be even worse without SAPs (Landry, 1990:6). The consensus of the women whose work we are examining here, however, is that the debt

³ We will see in Chapter Seven how some countries have increased tourism revenues by tolerating or even encouraging sex tourism.

⁴ By the phrase "Third World women" I do not intend to include every single woman in the Third World but rather those women whose work is reviewed here. Although they do not necessarily form a "representative sample", my research indicates that their views are generally held by women activists, analysts and researchers in the Third World.

crisis has created an intolerable burden on the women and men of the Third World and that structural adjustment is making the situation even worse. Let us look at some statistics.

- * In 1950 the rich countries had incomes 15 times greater than those of the poor countries; in 1990 the incomes were 25 times greater and by 2000 the figure will be more than 30 times greater (Vega, 1990:8).
- * In Africa between 1980 and 1986, agricultural production declined by 25%, industrial production by 27% and services by 18% (Tadesse, 1991:49).
- * Between 1980 and 1983 the growth rate in Brazil's GNP fell from 7.2% to -3.2% (Spindel, 1988:1).
- * Production of basic food items in Brazil declined by 25% between 1978 and 1988 (Spindel, 1988:9).
- * Inflation in Peru reached 1,722% in 1988 (Portugal, 1989:12).
- * The amount budgeted for debt repayment by the Philippines government for 1988 could have been used to construct over one million classrooms or 600,000 communal faucet systems or to increase the budget of the Department of Health

13 times (Santos and Lee, 1989:27).

- * Debt servicing cost Bolivia 40%-50% of the value of exports in 1990 (Vega, 1990:8); the Philippines allocated 40.8% of their budget to debt service in 1988 (Corpuz, 1988:6); Jamaica spent 41% of its budget on debt payments in 1985-86 (Antrobus, 1989b:150).
- * Per capita expenditure on health in Ghana in 1982 was one fifth that of 1975-76 (Commonwealth Expert Group, 1989:7).
- * Ninety-three per cent of all categories of Peruvian workers in 1989 were earning less than the average wage for 1972 (Huáman, 1989:8).
- * During the first part of 1982 in Brazil, the amount needed for basic food for a family of four was 55.6% of the minimum salary; by 1984 it was 83.2% (Spindel, 1988:9).
- * Malnutrition among Brazilian children under five increased from 11% to 16% between 1980 and 1984 (Kucinsky and Bradford cited in Spindel, 1988:9).

These statistics indicate the severity of the economic crisis with which women and men in the Third World are coping. Let us look now at how women in the Third World are analysing that situation. We will look first at their overall analysis and then more closely at the ways in which

women have been affected by structural adjustment in their personal lives, at home, in the workplace, in the countryside and in the community.

Unlike the international financial institutions, many women in the Third World do not see the present crisis as transient (Tadesse, 1991:49) or purely economic in nature. The crisis is also political, social and cultural, embodying conflicts of gender, race, ethnicity, class and age (Ramírez, 1988:7). Its roots go far back to colonial history and to the subsequent development models imposed on the Third World (Sen and Grown, 1987:51). Although the question of debt is merely a symptom of a global systemic crisis, the adverse effects are felt disproportionately in the Third World (Sen and Grown, 1987:59).

Many authors stress the importance of looking at the crisis from the point of view of poor, Third World women. These are the people, first of all, who are bearing the brunt of the crisis in both their productive and reproductive roles (Tadesse, 1991:53; Spindel, 1988:2; Antrobus, 1989b:151; Tocón, 1989:7; Commonwealth Expert Group, 1989:5; Fuentes, n.d.:1). They are also key actors in keeping the economic and social life of their communities going. Because poor women play a vital role in the production and distribution of food and in the provision of goods and services, especially through the informal sector, they are responsible for the survival of their

families and for meeting the basic needs of the society as a whole. Therefore, the impact of adjustment on them has implications for everyone (Antrobus, 1989b:145). The perspective of poor women is also important because it shows us "the links between household activities, the workplace and the internationally-influenced policies of capitalist development" (Bolles cited in Antrobus, 1989b:145), and "the connections between women's inequality and the structures and relationships which reinforce and perpetuate poverty and other forms of deprivation in our societies" (Sen and Grown cited in Antrobus, 1989b:145).

From this perspective, structural adjustment programmes have not only been implemented without thought for or consultation with those who would be adversely affected (Huamán, 1989:8; French, 1990:9), but are misconceived from the beginning in a number of ways. First of all, the short term stabilisation measures of the SAPs are often in conflict with long term development goals and the resulting hardships have undermined the entire process (Commonwealth Expert Group, 1989:4). For example, an emphasis on export-oriented agriculture conflicts with achieving self-sufficiency in food.

Secondly, the strategy of increasing foreign exchange earnings through exports is unlikely to succeed until northern countries are willing to remove protectionist barriers to Third World manufactures and to pay fair prices

for commodities. There is no indication that this is about to happen (Tadesse, 1991:53; Sen and Grown, 1987:61). Moreover, the emphasis on exports has meant a neglect of both agricultural and industrial production for the local market (AAWORD, et al., 1985:34; Sen and Grown, 1987:61). On the agricultural side, basic food items are expensive and in short supply. In addition, the decline in local food production has been worsened by the free entry of cheap food imports (Spindel, 1988:9)

Industry has also been affected by the emphasis on export production. Small and medium sized companies have closed, forced out of business by cheap, duty-free foreign products and high interest rates. The result is massive unemployment (See and Corpuz, 1990:10). Neither the unemployed nor new entrants can be absorbed by the labour market. In the mid 1980s it was estimated that 1.7 million new jobs had to be created in Brazil each year just to keep up with the demographic increase, but only 750,000 were added in the three years between 1980 and 1983 (Spindel, 1988:9).

Demands of adjustment policies on national budgets make it impossible for governments to fulfil their obligations to their own people (Briones, n.d.:3; Huamán, 1989:7). The decline in public services combined with lower incomes places a tremendous burden on women who fulfil both productive and reproductive roles. The failure to take into

account women's crucial position in both these areas has led to a crisis in reproduction felt throughout the Third World (Sen and Grown, 1987:66). Finally, as the standard of living declines, discontent erupts in social unrest followed by government repression, (French, 1990:8; Fuentes, n.d.:2-3) thus further disrupting the economy.

Women and Structural Adjustment

While women in the Third World have rejected structural adjustment on the basis of its effects on their societies in general, they have also recognised that the effects on women have been particularly destructive (Santos and Lee, 1989:54). It is the multifaceted nature of their lives that makes women so vulnerable to the adverse impact of structural adjustment. And it is the gendered division of labour, inside and outside the home, that places greater additional burdens on women than on men.

At a personal level, the crisis places greater and greater demands on women's time and energy. Ultimately, the strain takes its toll on their health (Tocón, 1989:15). In Latin America and the Caribbean, female morbidity is rising (Rajapakse, 1990a:6). In the Philippines, the health budget is now approximately half of what it was in the 1950s (Corpuz, 1988:6), nutritional anaemia affects 49.7% of pregnant women (Food and Nutrition Institute cited in Santos and Lee, 1989:30) and the maternal mortality rate is one per

1000 live births (*IBON Facts and Figures* cited in Santos and Lee: 1989:30).

The psychological impact of the crisis is also substantial. Mothers who must leave their children unsupervised while they work outside the home feel tremendous guilt and worry (Tocón, 1989:8). The pain and stress of seeing the effects of the crisis on those they care for leads many women to depression and mental illness (Antrobus, 1989b:150). Yet women must generally put the needs of others before their own. The demands of family are perhaps the greatest.

Within the family, it is women who have traditionally been responsible for reproductive work. As noted above, reductions in income and social services have significantly increased the demands of this role. In an effort to save money, women substitute domestic work such as baking, laundering and sewing, for purchased goods and services (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:24). They purchase cheaper foods which require longer preparation time, shop more carefully for the best bargains and wait in line for goods in short supply (Tocón, 1989:8). Women often do without necessities, especially food, in order to provide for their children and husbands, even though it is the women who work the longest hours (Santos and Lee, 1989:26). The

According to figures given in Seager and Olson (1986:10) this figure is approximately 4 times higher than the rate in Canada.

closing of day care centres and clinics means additional work for women who are the usual caregivers to children, the elderly and the ill (Ramírez, 1985:4; Antrobus, 1989b:149-150).

When the costs of education become insupportable, it is the boys who are favoured to remain in school because of their greater future earning potential (Fuentes, n.d.:2). Normally it is the girls who must stay at home to assist their mothers or find other work (Rajapakse:1990a:5; Tadesse, 1991:56).

The pressures of increasing poverty often lead to family disintegration manifested in increasing rates of physical abuse of women and children⁶, delinquency, suicide, alcoholism and divorce (Rajapakse, 1990a:7; de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:27; Tocón 1989:10-11). More and more women find themselves the involuntary heads of household (Portugal, 1989:12). In Latin America and the Caribbean, women represent between one quarter and one third of heads of household (Arriagada, 1988:56).

Despite women's efforts to cope on the domestic front and the increases in workload at home, they may often be forced to find paid work either inside or outside the

⁶ It is important to note that violence against women and children has structural roots and exists throughout society in times of prosperity as well as in times of poverty. However, the economic crisis has resulted in increases in violence by men toward their wives and children (Rajapakse, 1990a:7).

home (Tocón, 1989:11). This places even greater demands on women because they are still expected to do the domestic work as well (Rajapakse, 1990a:4). Although women on the whole earn less than men, even when their levels of education are the same (Arriagada, 1988:58-59), women's incomes in times of crisis are vital to the survival of their families (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:14). While the effects of the crisis on women workers are difficult to measure and vary with social class, type of work and level of skill (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:20-21), it seems generally agreed that the overall impact has been negative (Arriagada, 1988:59). During the crisis, the participation rate of women in the labour market has increased (Arriagada, 1988:59) and, moreover, has increased more quickly than that of men (Rajapakse, 1990a:2). At the same time, however, the unemployment and underemployment rates for women are also increasing (Corpuz, 1988:4)⁷. Because of the segmented nature of the job market, it is often easier for women to find work in times of crisis than for men. Many women, because of the additional demands on their time, their subordinate status in the workforce and the gendered division of labour, seek and find work in informal sector activities such as laundry,

This is not to suggest that men are not also suffering from high rates of unemployment. It is in part because of male unemployment that women are forced to seek work outside the home.

domestic work, sewing and embroidery (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:24).

With the crisis, the informal sector has grown tremendously in size (Tadesse, 1991:52; Santos and Lee, 1989:35) and has become increasingly dominated by women (Cordero, 1990:7). Women, especially those with young children, tend to be concentrated in this sector because the nature of the work allows them to combine it with domestic responsibilities and because their skills and the gendered nature of the labour market do not permit them entry to the formal sector. By the end of the 1980s, almost 60% of the Philippines workforce was in the informal sector (Corpuz, 1988:6). Because of rising unemployment and declining incomes, however, demand for the goods and services provided by the informal sector is dropping and earnings are decreasing (Rajapakse, 1990a:1; Commonwealth Expert Group, 1989:6). In addition, working conditions in the informal sector are onerous and the hours long, especially when combined with women's other responsibilities. It is not uncommon for a Latin American woman to work at a soup kitchen in the morning, sell lunches at the factory gate at noon and peddle candy and cigarettes on the street at night (Tocón, 1989:15). Some informal activities, such as beer-brewing, are illegal and leave women vulnerable to police prosecution (Feldman, 1989:12). Street workers are also subject to harassment by the police and may even have to pay

protection money (Corpuz, 1988:6; French, 1990:8).

One segment of the informal sector that is increasing is prostitution, particularly with the expansion of tourism (Corpuz, 1988:7; Ramírez, 1985:4). Many prostitutes are students whose parents can no longer afford to keep them in school (See and Corpuz, 1990:11). In the Philippines, prostitution involves between 300,000-500,000 people, mostly women and girls (Santos and Lee, 1989:36). In addition, many women migrate as mail-order brides, domestics or "entertainers", a euphemism for prostitutes (Corpuz, 1988:7-8)⁷. Feldman (1989:112) notes that the spread of the HIV virus makes prostitution even more hazardous for women than in the past. Nine out of ten Zambian prostitutes carry the virus (Feldman, 1989:12). Their degree of economic desperation makes it impossible for them to insist that their clients use condoms which are, in any case, both expensive and in scarce supply (Moseley and Smith cited in Feldman, 1989:12).

While millions of women work in the informal sector, others have increasingly found work in the formal economy. The effects of the crisis on these women workers has been mixed. Because the majority of public sector and social service workers are women (teachers, office workers, nurses, social workers) cutbacks in employment in these

⁷ We will look at this situation in greater detail in Chapter Seven.

areas have adversely affected women more than men (Rajapakse, 1990a:3; Antrobus, 1989b:149). In times of job scarcity, women's subordinate position in the labour market and the large pool of unemployed women, make it difficult for women to change jobs. Fear of losing employment makes women vulnerable to sexual harassment (Rajapakse, 1990a:4).

On the other hand, the increasing emphasis on export-oriented industries has favoured women. Young, unmarried women are in fact, the preferred employees in the garment and electronics industries because they will perform monotonous assembly work for lower wages and under less favourable conditions than will men (Rajapakse, 1990a:2; Antrobus, 1989b:148). While this type of employment may be considered better than none at all, the rewards are meagre, especially in comparison with the hazards involved⁹. The private service sector, in which women also predominate, has been relatively resistant to the current crisis (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:21; Rajapakse, 1990a:2). Men, who tend to be employed in capital and intermediate goods production, have felt the effects of plant closures in these sectors which have been hard hit by the crisis (Spindel, 1988:11). There are indications that men are also more affected by lay-offs than women (Aguilar, 1988:12). Nevertheless, the wage gap between women and men has

⁹ In Chapter Six, we will examine the situation of women workers in export processing zones who are part of the new international division of labour.

increased (Spindel, 1988:14).

In some countries such as Peru, governments have established make-work programmes in which women are the main participants. They generally do heavy manual work such as stone breaking or street cleaning and are paid in cash and in food. In the case of Peru, such programmes were abused by the ruling party (APRA) in order to gain political support (Tocón, 1989:13).

While women in the cities have been forced into the labour market, rural women have also had to redouble their efforts to survive. Throughout the Third World, it is women who are primarily responsible for growing and distributing food for domestic consumption (Sen and Grown, 1987:57). Their livelihoods are being threatened by the effects of structural adjustment. As mentioned earlier, the emphasis on export agriculture has meant neglect of production for domestic consumption (Fuentes, n.d.:2). The deregulation of agricultural prices means that the internal market favours richer farmers who control access to land and to credit (Rajapakse, 1990a:1). At the same time, the escalating cost of agricultural inputs (Rajapakse, 1990a:1) and consumer goods (See and Corpuz, 1990:10) coupled with increased competition from cheap imported food (Santos and Lee, 1989:39; Corpuz, 1988:5) is leaving many farm women with few options. They can force the land to greater

production or switch to cash crops, both of which involve greater use of dangerous and environmentally damaging agro-chemicals, more deforestation and increased tapping of underground water. A third possibility is to leave the land altogether and migrate to the city or abroad. Those who go to the city often end up as prostitutes (See and Corpuz, 1990:11). Clearly, none of these possibilities is particularly palatable.

Faced with such choices, many women are organising to survive and fight back. At an individual level, women have fallen back on the inherent strengths of traditional coping mechanisms such as networks of reciprocal exchange of goods and services among family and friends (Antrobus, 1989b:151-152). In rural areas of Zambia, women and men farmers are refusing to plant maize for urban consumption and instead are growing groundnuts and beans for their own survival. Expensive fertiliser is used on their own millet fields rather than on cash crops (Feldman, 1989:18). In an effort to avoid police harassment, women traders in Caracas lay out their goods on oil cloths which can be quickly bundled up and hidden when the need arises (French, 1990:8). When vendors were removed from the streets by the police in Accra, they took to sitting by the roadside with brooms, since sweeping is a legitimate activity. On the broom handles were tied strips of cloth or other indicators of the goods they had to sell which were hidden nearby (French,

1990:8).

Women have also devised and implemented countless survival strategies at the group or community level (Hiriart, 1988:7). We discussed in Chapter Three the establishment of income generating activities, community stores, soup kitchens, thrift shops and *vaso de leche* committees. At a more sophisticated level, women have organised into pressure groups like the Freedom from Debt Coalition in the Philippines. The Coalition carries out policy analyses, publishes positions on debt-related issues, and organises seminars and public education campaigns (Briones, n.d.:5-6).

Women are also prepared to adopt more extreme measures. In Nicaragua, some 300 women, including former Sandinista fighters, have taken up arms to force the government to stop discrimination and ease the economic hardships which affect women most directly. They call themselves the Nora Astorga Northern Front, named for a hero of the Sandinista Revolution, and are demanding funding for elder care, child care and maternal health ('Women Waging War', 1992).

If there is a silver lining in the grey cloud of increasing poverty, the mobilisation of women is it. Even though some activities are relief measures and do not address the causes of the problem (Tocón, 1989:14), they give women important experiences in working together and

carrying out community activities on their own (Vega, 1990:8). When women come together to discuss the crisis, other issues affecting their lives emerge (Hiriart, 1988:7). Their consciousness and level of awareness change. Most important, women refuse to become victims (Vega, 1990:8). They also tend to lose any illusions about the benevolent nature of the state (Tadesse:1991:55) and recognise the need for both national and international solidarity among women in addressing their problems (See and Corpuz, 1990:11 and 13; Tocón, 1989:21; Sen and Grown, 1987:66).

Unfortunately, the increasing mobilisation of women and other popular sectors has often made them targets for repression. Women's groups and individual women have experienced violence at the hands of union-busting goon squads, the military and right-wing vigilantes. In extreme situations such as the Philippines, counter-insurgency activities result in mass evacuations or hamletting of whole communities with accompanying torture and rape of women (Corpuz, 1988:8). Despite the horrific backlash, women's experiences at the community level have enabled them to see their own situation in a national and international context and to devise and promote alternative strategies for dealing with the debt.

A Feminist Vision

Both individual women and women's organisations

have given considerable study and thought to alternative solutions to the debt crisis. Few have been attended to, either in the South or the North. As we shall see, these strategies reflect a different perspective from that of the proponents of structural adjustment or even from some of its critics.

Any viable solution to the debt crisis must go beyond the purely economic (Antrobus, 1989b:152) and recognise the need for broadly based structural transformation in both the North and the South (Sen and Grown, 1987:66; de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:49).

Systems of domination based on gender, race, age, sexual preference, nationality and geography must give way to new ways of organising society, based on the sanctity of human rights. The current division of labour must be explicitly recognised and redefined with new values for both productive and reproductive activities (de Barbieri and de Oliveira, 1991:50).

In the words of Anita Anand (1984:4),

Only when models of development are re-examined and the contradictions of free trade, export-oriented growth and development based on finance and monetary modes are evaluated, then a sound system of international economics may emerge.

The goals of structural transformation must be defined by those people whose efforts will be required for its achievement (Antrobus, 1989b:158). In this process women must be seen as key actors, not as a vulnerable group (Antrobus, 1990b:2). Strategies for economic growth should not be based on debt dependency (GABRIELA, cited in Corpuz,

1988:10), should ensure the use of foreign capital in the national interest (GABRIELA, cited in Corpuz, 1988:11) and should promote the development of the domestic market.

In terms of specifics, the following have been suggested.

- * Debt repayments should be limited to a maximum of 20% of the value of annual exports (GABRIELA cited in Corpuz, 1988:9).
- * A full disclosure should be made of all debts so that the people can decide which loans have benefitted them and which are unjust burdens (GABRIELA cited in Corpuz, 1988:9).
- * A multi-sectoral body should be established at the national level to study all debts and decide which should be repaid and which should be repudiated (GABRIELA cited in Corpuz, 1988:9).
- * Debts which have only benefitted corrupt leaders and their cronies should not be repaid (GABRIELA, cited in Corpuz, 1988:9).
- * Some debts, especially to the less developed countries, should be written off (Anand, 1984:3).
- * Consideration should be given to bartering debts i.e. debtor nations would repay their loans in raw materials or manufactured products (Anand, 1984:3).

- * Adjustment policies must protect the most vulnerable sectors of society and strengthen the productive activities of the informal sector (Antrobus, 1989b:156-7).
- * An international climate, favourable to the economic development of Third World countries must be created. This would include more favourable terms of trade and increased international aid (Commonwealth Expert Group, 1989:14).

Sadly, these strategies have been granted little attention from the IMF or major donor countries, including Canada. Monique Landry (1990:7), as Minister for External Relations and International Development, gave a spirited defense of structural adjustment at Carleton University two years ago in which she claimed that the new and improved "poverty-oriented adjustment" increased economic efficiency and reduced poverty simultaneously. This has been refuted by the Commonwealth Expert Group (1989:5 and 8) which states that, even though more lip-service is now paid to cushioning the adverse effects of adjustment on the poor, little concrete action has been taken and what changes have been made are too little, too late.

Although the report of the Commonwealth Experts and similar documents from UNICEF and the United Nations Branch for the Advancement of Women have much in common with

those of independent researchers and women's organisations in the Third World, there are some interesting differences which possibly arise from the differences in perspective of the governmental or quasi-governmental agencies, and that of women's organisations such as DAWN, WAND or GABRIELA. Peggy Antrobus (1990:7-8), while acknowledging the importance of many of the Commonwealth Experts' recommendations, maintains that their ideas were originally proposed during the Decade for Women and that to recommend increasing expenditures in the social sector when SAPs are specifically aimed at cutting them is pointless. She also criticises the Experts' report for "its failure to challenge the paradigm which uses traditional, quantitative indicators as performance criteria, as well as...overlooking the political and ideological biases in terms of gender".

It is also interesting that the Experts make some recommendations which do not appear elsewhere in the literature. They (1989:9) call for the strengthening of government and other official machinery such as women's bureaux, women's units in key ministries and parliamentary committees. Increased government action of this type is not recommended by other authors, possibly because most Third World women no longer see the State as either willing or able to represent their interests. On the contrary, Third World women are calling for a redistribution of power (Rajapakse, 1990b:3) and the strengthening of their own

organisations and the empowerment of women collectively and individually (Antrobus, 1989b:157). Given the quasi-governmental nature of the Commonwealth Secretariat and the fact that many of the Experts were or are still civil servants, their expressed faith in governments is perhaps understandable.

Another report that has been criticised from the perspective of Third World women is UNICEF's *Adjustment with a Human Face: Protecting the Vulnerable and Promoting Growth*. Although there is no quarrel with the document's concern for the adverse effects of adjustment on the poor, there is criticism of the general acceptance of the IMF's monetarist strategy and the assumption that, with minor changes, adjustment can work for everyone (Rajapakse, 1990b:3). Rajapakse (1990b:3) also notes that UNICEF takes no account of the effect on Third World women of colonialism and patriarchy. Antrobus (1990:15) also critiques the UNICEF report for its lack of gender analysis and its failure to take account of the implications of women's multiple roles.

Documents from the UN Branch for the Advancement of Women also reveal some curious analyses. The Branch (cited in Rajapakse, 1990a:3) argues that the migration of Third World women to the Middle East and to the industrialised countries indicates a break with the tradition of women as dependent on male breadwinners. While

this may be so to a certain extent, it seems a gross oversight not to mention the extreme exploitation and violence to which these women are subjected in their work as domestics or prostitutes. There is also a suggestion (cited in Rajapakse, 1990a:4) that women's increased participation in the informal sector may result from self-employment schemes designed to provide a safety net for women during these hard times. Again, there is no mention that such "income generation projects" seldom generate much income and have been discredited by many researchers¹⁰.

Conclusion

What Third World women want are not income generating projects or forced migration. They are demanding the replacement of structural adjustment by a model of development "which is holistic - building on the cultural values of the mass of people (especially those of poor women for the well-being of their children), on the prioritising of basic needs, and on a commitment to an equitable

¹⁰ It is interesting to compare the economic concerns of Third World feminists with those of feminists in the North. Until recently our economic concerns have been focused primarily on pay equity, exploitation of non-unionised women workers and problems around combining employment and home responsibilities (availability of part time work, job-sharing, flex-time, tax deductions for child care). As the economic situation of the North begins more closely to resemble that of the South, however, Canadian feminists are examining women's relationship to the macro-economy as seen in cutbacks in social services and the gendered effects of Free Trade, high unemployment and the GST.

distribution of the costs and benefits of economic growth"

(Antrobus, 1990b:6-7): in short, a feminist vision of development.

CHAPTER SIX

THE NEW INTERNATIONAL DIVISION OF LABOUR:

INEVITABLE INEQUITY

Today I didn't make my quota because I was feeling sick, so I'll have to work all day instead of half of Saturday to make it up. I'm supposed to do seven big bundles of bras an hour. My job is to sew on one strap.

woman worker in Jamaican EPZ
quoted in McAfee (1991:82)

Introduction

In the previous chapter, we examined the approach which feminists from the Third World have taken toward structural adjustment. One of the major components in the universal SAP prescription is to increase foreign exchange earnings by means of manufactured exports. These products are, for the most part, produced in Export Processing Zones (EPZs), also known as Free Trade Zones (FTZs) which have been established throughout the Third World over the past 25 years¹. The emphasis on export-oriented manufacturing in

¹ The phenomenon of the FTZ is also found in countries in the North such as Ireland and Italy. In fact, the world's first EPZ was established in Ireland in the late 1940s (Stanton cited in Pyle, 1990:87). Similar patterns in terms of effects on the host country's development and on the status of women can be seen in both the North and the South. Our discussion, however, will limit itself to the situation in the South. Most of the source material for this chapter concerns EPZs in Asia, Latin America and the Caribbean. Although I found references made to FTZs in Africa, I was able to find only minimal information written by Third World women on the situation there.

the developing countries has led to a change in the traditional trading relationship between the North and the South, a change which has been called the New International Division of Labour. The key elements within this new phenomenon are the transnational corporation (TNC) and the labour of Third World women.

Chandra Mohanty (1991:28) argues convincingly that

(N)o discussion of the contemporary contexts of third world women's engagement with feminism could omit a sketch of the massive incorporation and proletarianization of these women in multinational factories. While this location is not just a "social indicator" of third world women's economic and social status (Momsen and Townsend 1987), it is a significant determinant of the micropolitics of daily life and self-constructions of massive numbers of third world women employed in these factories.

What is significant about this particular situation is that it is young third world women who overwhelmingly constitute the labour force. And it is these women who embody and personify the intersection of sexual, class, and racial ideologies.

In this chapter, we will be examining the situation of Third World women in EPZs from a Southern feminist perspective. A glance backward will show us how the New International Division of Labour grew out of the colonial and neo-colonial past as a response to the needs of international capital. A look at the present will reveal the extent of EPZs and the vital role which women have played and continue to play as producers in this sector. A more detailed examination of the way in which EPZs function will show the way in which they serve the needs of

international capital, and local governments and elites at the expense of women workers. With this basic information in mind, we will explore the analyses of the New International Division of Labour put forward by feminists in the South, with particular attention to the impact on women and on the development process. From this perspective, the New International Division of Labour is seen as a focal point for the forces of capitalism, imperialism, racism and patriarchy which have combined to change drastically the situation of hundreds of thousands of women throughout the Third World while maintaining their subordination and oppression. At the same time, it will be shown that women have not only resisted their exploitation but are demanding specific changes and proposing alternatives.

The New International Division of Labour

During the colonial era a global economic system was established under which the Third World provided the raw materials which were shipped to the factories of the North, turned into manufactured goods, and sold on the domestic market or exported back to the South². Although this

² It is worth noting that at the time of the Industrial Revolution, as the Third World provided the raw materials which fed the expanding industries of Europe, the accumulation of capital was made possible by exploiting the most vulnerable sectors of the population, women and children, who made up 60% of the workforce at that time (Arregui and Baez, 1991:30). This pattern was to be repeated under the New International Division of Labour.

pattern remains in place, a new one has emerged over the past 30 years. Under the New International Division of Labour, the Third World has become the site of labour-intensive manufacturing for worldwide markets, a supplier of low-priced consumer goods and a source of cheap, largely female, labour (Magallona cited in Pineda-Ofreneo, 1983:281). The industries which have been most affected by these changes are both the traditional ones in which women have predominated in the North, such as garments, textiles and food processing, and new high tech electronics (Elson and Pearson, 1981:88). What distinguishes the nature of the work going on under the New International Division of Labour, however, is that it is generally at what Lipietz (1987:71) refers to as the third level - labour-intensive, unskilled assembly and execution. The ideal workforce for such industry must possess manual dexterity, tolerate monotonous industrial processes and accept a high degree of control over their work by management. As happened in the North, capitalists operating in the South have found the ideal worker to be female.

What led to this change in production patterns? We must look first at the colonial legacy of economic dependence which made Third World countries ideal locations for export-oriented industrialisation. During previous decades, many developing countries attempted to industrialise through a strategy of import substitution

(Fernández-Kelly, 1983:20; Green, 1990:2). These efforts were largely unsuccessful. The results were exacerbated migration, widened internal income differentials and accentuated urban poverty (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:20). In the Caribbean, trade rivalries developed and led to increased protectionism (Green, 1990:2). Export-led strategies seemed to offer a better alternative.

In other countries, especially in Asia, programmes for rural "development", such as those inspired by the "Green Revolution" had the effect of concentrating resources of land, technology and training in the hands of middle and large-scale land-owners to the detriment of small holders and landless labourers (Heyzer, 1986:94). As the interests of the urban economy spread into the rural areas, traditional craftspersons and traders were almost completely displaced by competition from mass produced goods (Heyzer, 1986:94 and 96). The result has been increased poverty, landlessness and economic decline in the rural areas, creating a pool of workers which can be pulled into the manufacturing sector when needed and sent back to the countryside when markets fall (Heyzer, 1982:185). Often, when economic opportunities present themselves in the cities or in a nearby EPZ, rural families can send their daughters out to work without seriously jeopardising the family's

agricultural activities (Heyzer, 1982:182)³. Thus, the failure of import substitution industrialisation and of programmes for rural development, created internal conditions which made the Third World "ready" for the New International Division of Labour.

What factors, then, have led international capitalists to transfer production from the North to the South? First, the Third World offered an inexhaustible supply of cheap, unskilled labour at a time when workers in the North had become increasingly militant (Landsberg, cited in Pineda-Ofreneo, 1982:282). Second, there was a rise in new labour-intensive manufacturing industries, notably electronics, requiring a large supply of cheap workers (Landsberg cited in Pineda-Ofreneo, 1982:282). Third, manufacturing processes had been fragmented, separating more complex from simpler operations of production (Frobel et al. cited in Pineda-Ofreneo, 1983:281). Fourth, transportation and communications had become faster and cheaper as a result of developments in air freight and ship containerisation, telecommunications and data processing (Heyzer, 1986:94; Frobel et al. cited in Pineda-Ofreneo, 1983:281). Fifth, many former colonies or neo-colonies, such as the Philippines and South Korea, enjoyed the "protection" of

³ It is not always true that agricultural activities are unaffected. As will be seen below, rural labour has in some cases, for example, the ricelands of Malaysia, declined with a resulting decline in production (Lim, 1985:83).

military forces of the imperialist powers which ensured political stability and investment security (Goster, McDevitt and Chhachhi, 1983:17). Sixth, governments in both the industrialised and developing countries offered incentives to promote Northern investment in the South (Green, 1990:9-10). Finally, periods of economic recession in the North and increasing competition on the international market made it imperative to decrease production costs as much as possible (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:19). In labour-intensive industries, this was most easily done by reducing labour costs.

Not only was there a variety of good reasons for manufacturers to move to the South, but Third World governments were highly motivated to welcome them. The structural adjustment programmes (discussed in Chapter Five) imposed on many Third World countries, placed great emphasis on export-oriented production. The alleged benefits of this strategy have been enthusiastically promoted by major international donors (Pineda-Ofreneo, 1982:282-283) which wield considerable influence over Third World governments. Local governments have either accepted this strategy willingly (if the leaders could see some personal benefit) or unwillingly (if the alternative was national bankruptcy). Increasing poverty, rural-urban migration, unemployment and discontent have made Third World governments anxious to provide jobs, even if only unskilled, poorly paid and short-

term (Ong, 1987:143)⁴. In addition, the demands of creditors have created a need for immediate generation of foreign exchange (Green, 1990:4). Given such "favourable" conditions, it is not surprising that EPZs have mushroomed throughout the Third World. Let us try to gain some sense of the extent of this phenomenon.

The Export Processing Zone

The establishment of Export Processing Zones in the Third World began as early as the 1950s in Puerto Rico (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:20). Fairchild opened the first offshore semiconductor assembly plant in Hong Kong in 1962; similar factories were subsequently established in Korea, Indonesia, the Philippines, India and Mauritius (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:21). The Border Industrialization Program began in Mexico in the mid-1960s (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:22). In the Caribbean, EPZs came first to the Dominican Republic in the 1970s (Pineda, 1988:2), to Jamaica in the early 1980s and subsequently to the smaller islands of the Eastern

⁴ When the United States unilaterally ended the Bracero Programme, under which Mexican male agricultural workers had been permitted to work in the United States, the Mexican government initiated the Border Industrialization Program as a means of neutralising the political risks posed by large numbers of unemployed workers (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:22). What the BIP ended up doing, however, was creating a new labour force of women rather than providing employment to the unemployed men. In Malaysia, the government brought in their New Economic Policy in 1971 following violent communal uprisings resulting from rural economic decline. The programme was based on export-oriented industrialisation (Ong, 1987:143).

Caribbean (Green, 1990:2). By 1980 there were approximately 120 EPZs in all regions of the Third World (UNIDO cited in Fernández-Kelly, 1983:19).

EPZs have had a marked effect on the national industrial scene⁵. In less than 20 years, the *maquiladoras* in Mexico became the fastest-growing sector of the economy, employing 156,000 people. Production accounted for 25% of manufactured exports and 10.5% of all exports (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:23). From an initial strip of 12.5 miles along the northern border, the EPZ was extended to include all but three areas of the country (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:22). The export-oriented textile and garment industry was established in Sri Lanka in 1977 and by 1985 employed some 27,000 workers (Rosa, 1987:161). In the Philippines, earnings from garment exports increased 560% from 1971-1977 (Pineda-Ofreneo, 1982:283). Exports from the Kingston Free Zone in Jamaica went up by 45% from US\$72 million in 1986 to US\$104 million in 1987 (Jones, 1988:17). In terms of world trade, in 1963, 15.2% of total world exports of garments and textiles originated in developing countries; by 1975 their share rose to 23.2% (Frobel et al. cited in Gloster, McDevitt and Chhachhi, 1983:17). The share of developing

⁵ It is important to keep in mind, as will be pointed out in greater detail later, that despite the impact EPZs have had on women's lives, employment patterns, value of exports, and international production and trade, the promises of export-led industrialisation have not been fulfilled, either for the economies or the women of the Third World.

countries in cotton yarn production increased from 19% in 1950 to almost 40% in 1978 (Gloster, McDevitt and Chhachhi, 1983:17). In the Dominican Republic, the EPZs are the main employers of women in the cities, after domestic service (Duarte et al. cited in Arregui and Baez, 1991:33). Some 2,000,000 women in Asia and Latin America were working in FTZs in the early 1980s⁶ (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:21). Approximately 300,000 women, half the workforce in Asian manufacturing, are employed in electronics assembly (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:21).

These figures indicate that the EPZ is having a significant impact on the lives of hundreds of thousands of women in the Third World and their families. Before analysing this impact further, let us clarify just what an EPZ is, how it operates, who works there and under what conditions. An EPZ is an area of land designated by the local government and provided with services such as factory shells, transportation and communications facilities for the use of companies, normally TNCs, engaged in the manufacture of goods destined for the export market. In order to attract investors, governments offer a package of concessions including waiver of export and import duties, suspension of normal labour, safety and environmental regulations, moratorium on trade union activity, full

⁶ I have not been able to find a more current figure but it would very likely be higher.

repatriation of profits, tax holidays, workforce training incentives and security services (Green, 1990:10-11). In addition to the features mentioned above governments will also exploit the sexuality of local young women in order to lure investors (Mohanty, 1991:30). A brochure produced in Jamaica used the slogan, "Your bottom line is beautiful when you make it Jamaica", illustrated with an attractive female behind. The pamphlet was later withdrawn following protest by women's groups (Women's Action Committee, 1988:13). Often, national or regional development corporations play an important role in attracting foreign investors and provide additional financial incentives. Although these corporations are Third World institutions, they receive most of their funding from international donors who tie their assistance to the implementation of export-oriented industrial strategies (Green, 1990:10-11). Normally, no sale of the goods produced is permitted in the host country. In some cases only foreign firms (TNCs) are allowed to invest (Green, 1990:11); in other cases joint ventures with local capital are permitted so long as controlling interest rests with the foreign company (Pineda-Ofreneo, 1982:281-282)⁷.

⁷ Subsequent to the establishment of branch plants in the Third World, TNCs found it even more profitable to subcontract their work to local entrepreneurs who in turn employ homeworkers. This procedure serves to reduce the visibility of the TNC and avoids the risk of nationalisation. It also lowers the cost of production by eliminating the need for a factory and for provision of any

The industries which locate in EPZs are light and labour-intensive, requiring semi-skilled or unskilled workers. Such industries include textiles and garments, electronics or electrical assembly, food processing, shoemaking, pharmaceuticals and data processing. Production is based on the processing of imported raw materials, components or semi-manufactured goods which are completely or partially processed and re-exported. Operations requiring a high level of skill or technology, intensive capital investment and complex or creative skills such as research and design take place in the metropolitan countries while the more routine work is exported to the South (Baksh-Soodeen, 1988:10).

The workforce in such factories is organised in a hierarchy. Top management is normally foreign, white and male. Middle management may be male or female and is more likely to be local (Baksh-Soodeen, 1988:12), though possibly of a different ethnic group or nationality than the workers (Ong, 1987:156). Throughout the world, 85%-90% of FTZ workers are women (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:21). These workers

kind of worker benefits. Workers under this regime are subjected to even greater exploitation than those in the EPZs (Pineda-Ofreneo, 1982; Ramírez, 1988:28). The homeworkers are generally located in rural areas, far from the scrutiny of any government inspectors. They are also isolated from each other. Under these conditions they are most unlikely to organise in their own interests (Zapanta, n.d.:3). Although these workers are most definitely part of the New International Division of Labour, we will, for the purposes of this chapter, restrict discussion to the situation of women in the EPZs.

are usually young, single women without children, from rural areas, working outside the home for the first time (Arregui and Baez, 1991:33)⁸. EPZs may be purposely located close to the labour supply (Phongpaichit, 1989:155); in other cases agents are sent into the rural areas to recruit young women workers. Although there is some variation from place to place, recruitment often occurs in such a way as to put the worker and even her family under an obligation to a local authority figure (Heyzer, 1986:100) and to establish control over the worker before she ever enters the factory (Rosa, 1987:162). In Sri Lanka women are recruited through Members of Parliament via parents or other family members who belong to the ruling party (Rosa, 1987:162); in Malaysia, representatives of factories in Singapore usually approach clan organisations and local political party branches for help; in Indonesia male agents recruit village girls through local male dignitaries such as religious leaders or teachers (Heyzer, 1986:100).

The conditions under which these women work vary considerably by country, by industry, by size and ownership of plant and by position in the workforce hierarchy (Heyzer,

⁸ There are some exceptions to this profile as a result of local customs and conditions. In the Caribbean, for example, where most women become mothers in their mid-teens, most workers, though unmarried, have at least one child for whom they are likely to be the sole or principal support (Baksh-Soodeen, 1988:10 and 12). In the Dominican Republic, where the average age at marriage is 17, workers are more likely to be married and have children; a significant proportion are family heads (Arregui and Baez, 1991:34).

1986:106). Work is organised on the principle that increased production and profits can be created by intensifying the work process and by strictly controlling the workforce (Heyzer, 1986:106 and 108). This is done in a variety of ways: by installing faster machines to speed up the pace of work, by setting quotas and offering incentives for additional production, by paying on a piece-work basis, by limiting breaks for lunch, rest and even visits to the bathroom, by refusing time off for medical visits, and by extending the normal working day and enforcing compulsory overtime (Heyzer, 1986:108; Arregui and Baez, 1991:36; Green, 1990:12). If machinery breaks down, workers are expected to repair it without pay on their own time (Green, 1990:12).

In EPZs, national regulations regarding occupational health and safety are normally suspended. In any event, such regulations in many Third World countries are non-existent or at least much less strict than in the North (Reyes, 1988a:3). In general there is a high level of industrial accidents and workers suffer from hearing or visual impairment, eyestrain, skin diseases, burns, fatigue, spontaneous abortions, loss of fertility, cancer and even death (Heyser, 1982:185; Reyes, 1988a:3; Zapanta, n.d.:2). High standards of hygiene prevailing in some factories (electronics, for example) are instituted for the protection of the machinery and components, not for the workers (Reyes,

1988a:3).

In addition to these hazards, women workers are systematically subjected to the sexism and sexual harassment of their supervisors. In some factories, women are offered the option of "lay down or lay off" (AWRAN Report cited in Carillo, 1991:24). Some supervisors insist on having only the prettiest women under their direction, a "factory harem". One supervisor in a *maquiladora* boasted that, at his request, each of the women on his crew had a different colour of hair and eyes; another claimed that each of the women on his line had borne him a child (Fernández-Kelly:1983:25).

For enduring the strict discipline, hazardous environment, harassment and the stressful nature of the work itself, the women workers are paid pitifully little. It is often necessary to work overtime simply to earn a living wage (Anderson cited in McAfee, 1991:86). These women make less than male workers in the South⁹ and than male or female workers in the North, although their productivity is higher (Lim, 1983:80). Wages in the Third World are 10%-20% of those in developed countries (Frobel et al. cited in Pineda-Ofreneo, 1983:281) and those of FTZ workers may be even less than what prevails in locally based industry

⁹ For example, the wages of women workers in Korean industry are two thirds or less those of men (Phongpaichit, 1988:159).

(Reyes, 1988b:6). At a time when the minimum wage in the United States was US\$3.30 an hour, workers in the Dominican Republic were making 47 cents (CIPAF, 1988b:2). Although the nature of the work is very simple, training periods are often extended beyond what is necessary so that the worker's wages can be kept lower (Arregui and Baez, 1991:35). Facilities for the workers' use such as lunchrooms, clinics and child care are inadequate or non-existent.

In these conditions of extreme exploitation, the workers have little recourse to ensure fair treatment. Some countries such as Hong Kong and South Korea have enacted repressive labour legislation (Heyzer, 1986:108) and in most places, unions are banned from EPZs (Green, 1990:10). Even in those cases where unions are allowed to operate, the women seldom receive adequate support (Heyzer, 1986:108). Many unions are really "company" unions, promoting the interests of the employers rather than the workers. Even if the membership is primarily female, almost all unions are male-dominated and fail to address the special needs of women workers (Rosa, 1987:161-2). In some places, such as Sri Lanka and the Caribbean, unions are affiliated to political parties and thus have a partisan agenda which comes ahead of workers' needs (Green, 1990:14; Rosa, 1987:160). In other cases, the union may be well-intentioned but lack the resources to serve this new membership (Green, 1990:15). Workers attempting to organise

are subject to disciplinary action and even harassment and violence (Pineda cited in Leung, 1988:14). If worker protest gets out of hand, the companies call in the police and the military to restore "order" (Heyzer, 1986:106 and 108).

It is not surprising that, under these conditions, there is high turnover in the workforce¹⁰. The average *maquiladora* worker remains on the job less than three years (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:23). The demands of the work make it very difficult for women with domestic responsibilities to be able to combine productive and reproductive roles (Arregui and Baez, 1991:35). The workers' health deteriorates rapidly until they are simply not able to keep up with the pace of production. Nor is employment all that secure. When the market declines, women workers are the first to be laid off. During the 1974-75 recession, three quarters of the workers in Singapore who lost their jobs were women from the textile and electronics plants. If eventually re-hired, the women must start again at the lowest rate of pay (Heyzer, 1986:108). If higher profits can be made elsewhere, companies will simply move, leaving the workforce without compensation (Pineda cited in Leung, 1988:14). Should a company wish to phase out production or should certain employees become less productive, the company

¹⁰ It is only fair to note that some women resign because of cultural values relating to the role of married women and mothers (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:23).

will encourage "voluntary" resignations by making greater demands on the worker or paying her on a piece work rather than a daily basis (Karl and Cheung, 1983:94; Committee for Asian Women, 1990:2). From the employers' point of view, it is easier to hire a new worker than to incur the responsibilities that a long-standing workforce might demand (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:25). It is small wonder that work in the EPZs has been compared to slavery or indentureship (Baksh-Soodeen, 1988:10).

A Feminist Analysis of the New International Division of Labour

The foregoing description of EPZs and the conditions which women workers face there prepares us for an examination of the analyses of this phenomenon which Third World feminists have developed. The conventional view is that export-oriented industrialisation is the best way for indebted countries to balance their budgets and develop their economies. EPZs are described as ideal working situations which will relieve unemployment, promote the transfer of new technologies and help build up a skilled industrial workforce. A Third World feminist perspective reveals a far different picture.

In our examination of that perspective, we will look particularly at the main issues addressed in the literature: what effect the New International Division of

Labour has had on development in general; what makes women the "ideal" workers under the New International Division of Labour; whether work in EPZs has increased women's autonomy and status.

From the standpoint of Third World feminists, the New International Division of Labour is "part and parcel of a long tradition of exploitation of [Third World] peoples, long regarded as workforces to service the needs of metropolitan capitalist country industry and markets" (Green, 1990:4). Export-oriented industrialisation allows capitalist states to keep their former colonies within the orbit of the world market economy (Constantino cited in Pineda-Ofreneo, 1982:281). It is not a development strategy but the logical response of metropolitan capitalist interests to increased international competition, especially in the manufacturing sector. The objective is to reduce production costs and increase profits (CIPAF, 1988b:2). Fragmenting production and locating it overseas enables corporations to play off one developing country against another for concessions, offers the possibility of resorting to blackmail by threatening to move elsewhere and permits the diversification of economic and political risks (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:27).

This strategy has failed to fulfil its promises on several counts. Although some jobs have certainly been created, the number has been nowhere near enough to cope

with the flood of workers entering the labour market. After 20 years of operation in the Dominican Republic, the EPZs have generated less than 70,000 jobs at a time when between 75,000 and 80,000 people per year are beginning their working lives (Pineda, 1988:2). It has been estimated that with an equal investment in, for example, agriculture and small business, infinitely more jobs could have been created with the equivalent level of investment (Antrobus, 1989b:149). Moreover, national resources dedicated to the export sector have left domestic industry starved and many businesses have closed, reducing jobs (Jones, 1988:17; Antrobus, 1989b:155). Because the EPZs use imported raw materials, there is no opportunity for backward and forward linkages which could help develop the local economy (Green, 1990:3). The much-heralded transfer of technology has simply not happened (Pineda, 1988:2; Jones, 1988:15), because the most innovative and complex processes continue to be performed in the North while only the most routine work is exported to the EPZs (Heyzer, 1982:183). Because of the nature of the work and the foreign control of senior management, little human resource development takes place either. On the contrary, the hazardous conditions under which many people work has reduced the capacity and productivity of the workforce. Lack of attention to environmental impact has resulted in severe pollution problems, especially related to toxic waste (Baksh-Soodeen,

1988:11). There are also concerns that women's employment in factories removes their labour from the agricultural sector and reduces agricultural productivity (Lim, 1985:83). The ultimate insult, perhaps, is that while poor Third World people are suffering as a result of removal of subsidies on food staples and local businesses are having to borrow money at 30% interest, foreign corporations are enjoying tax holidays and other concessions paid for with the sacrifices of the poor (Baksh-Soodeen, 1988:9; Jones, 1988:17).

It has been recognised too that the New International Division of Labour has had a negative impact on the development of the North as well. During the 1970s over one million jobs in the textile industry disappeared in Western Europe while employment in the Hong Kong textile industry increased four times (Heyzer, 1986:94)¹¹. By the late 1970s, 30% of the trousers and 60% of the shirts sold in Europe were made by Asian women (Heyzer, 1986:94).

Looking at the overall picture, export-oriented industrialisation has served, not to develop Third World economies, but to increase their dependency on the industrialised North (CIPAF, 1988b:2; Arregui and Baez, 1991:31). Moreover, a hierarchy has developed within the

¹¹ Gloster, McDevitt and Chhachhi (1983:21) note that not all job losses in European industry can be blamed on cheap competition from the Third World. Most job losses resulted from technological change, some from Third World imports and some from imports from other developed countries.

Third World under which a few countries (or regions within countries) have undergone rapid industrialisation and the majority has been relegated to the sidelines, more vulnerable than they were before (Gloster, McDevitt and Chhachhi, 1983:17-18).

Within this broader picture, Third World feminists have looked particularly at the impact of the New International Division of Labour on women. Women workers in the FTZs have been described as at the intersection of systems of national, class and gender oppression (Green, 1990:16). Their behaviour, attitudes and expectations, all a result of socialisation in which gender plays an important role, have combined with their youth and their subordinate position in their own households to make them a highly vulnerable, docile and manipulable workforce (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:22). Employers make two major assumptions about women workers, based on their gender, which create the myth of the "ideal" woman worker. The first assumption is that the women are unskilled and can therefore be paid a low wage. It is admitted that women, especially Asian women, have a high degree of manual dexterity¹², but this is "natural" and therefore not worthy of compensation. In fact, the "nimble fingers" of women workers are the result of years of training in sewing and other domestic skills in

¹² This view would appear to be racist as well as sexist.

the home, considered to be "women's work". Because this training has been informal and hidden in the domestic sphere, it is unacknowledged (Heyzer, 1986:103).

Discrimination on the basis of class, race and sex combine to keep women in poorly paid, "unskilled" jobs. Skills are defined and rated by the employer, not the employee and depend not on the nature of the work itself but on who does it and how much is paid for it. Work done by women, the young and racial minorities is considered unskilled and is poorly paid. The converse is also true; work that is poorly paid is considered unskilled. It is the size of the wage and the race, age and gender of the worker that determines the level of skill assigned to the job (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:26).

The second assumption made about women workers is that their wages are merely supplementing those of a male member of the household and that women's earnings are spent on non-essentials. In fact, women's wages are vital to the economic survival of their families; often women are the principal or sole wage-earners and under all circumstances they are expected to make a contribution to the family income¹³ (Heyzer, 1982:197). Most urban working class and rural peasant families require the wages of older daughters

¹³ By contrast, sons are not required to make such contributions, even though their earnings are usually greater than those of their sisters. Sons also have the option of remaining unemployed for longer periods waiting for "the right job" to come along (Ong, 1987:103 and 105).

to maintain an acceptable standard of living (Heyzer, 1986:105; Ong, 1987:99). In fact, families may become so dependent on a daughter's wage that they will discourage her from marrying (Phongpaichit, 1989:153-154). Working daughters in Hong Kong increase their families' incomes by 30%-70% (Salaff cited in Lim, 1985:81). In Morocco, 32% of factory workers were the highest income earners in their families (Joeke cited in Lim, 1985:81). *Maquiladora* women contribute on average, 50% of their earnings to family expenditures and spend most of the rest on employment-related costs such as transportation and lunches. In most cases, their husbands or fathers are unemployed and the women have become the family's economic mainstay (Fernández-Kelly, 1983:24). In the Caribbean, where 30%-50% of women head their households, a significant proportion of women workers are the sole providers for their children (Baksh-Soodeen, 1988:10; Arregui and Baez, 1991:34). Women in Hong Kong, Sri Lanka, Tunisia and Malaysia use their earnings to provide their own dowries and other wedding-related expenses (Lim, 1985:82) which in the past were paid for by parents. What is clear, is that factors of gender, class and race have combined to create a potentially highly exploitable workforce. What we need to examine now is whether involvement in the paid workforce has helped women overcome

their subordinate status¹⁴.

Perhaps the only thing on which Frederick Engels and the World Bank would agree is that paid employment is the key to women's liberation. Certainly the women workers themselves say that they seek employment in order to gain an income, improve the prospects for themselves and their families and to achieve a greater degree of independence (Heyzer, 1986:104). Third World feminists, addressing the issue, have identified an extremely complex field of conflicting forces working upon the women of the EPZs. We will look first at the positive forces.

Although the concept of women working outside the home is contrary to the prevailing values of most cultures in the Third World, in varying degrees, families have been induced to accept it because of the material benefits thus derived (Phongpaichit, 1989:153). In terms of women's status and autonomy, both are enhanced by working outside the home (Phongpaichit, 1989:154; Fernández-Kelly, 1983:28; Lim, 1983:82). Work away from home gives women the opportunity to escape the authority of family and village elders, to increase income and consumption levels and to exercise greater decision-making power over such matters as marriage and childbearing (Lim, 1983:83; Heyzer, 1986:110).

¹⁴ It must be kept in mind that it is impossible in practice to isolate the effects on women of paid employment from the effects of the rapid social change which most Third World societies are experiencing (Phongpaichit, 1986:155).

The absence of women from the household imposes at least some changes in the division of domestic labour involving a greater contribution on the part of older women and men, and younger, unemployed men (Phongpaichit, 1989:151-152). The authority of older men declines as a greater and greater proportion of the family budget derives from the work of women (Ong, 1987:107-108).

These factors may move women toward liberation; others push in the opposite direction. In the EPZs, the power of patriarchy and capitalism combine to reinforce women's subordinate status and their socially constructed acceptance of male authority (CIPAF, 1988b:2). Managers deliberately create a "family" atmosphere which replicates not only the co-operative aspects but also the strict authoritarianism the women have known at home (Ong, 1987:188-189; Fernández-Kelly, 1983:26). Such a management style discourages workers from taking any initiative or responsibility and instead fosters dependence (Heyzer, 1982:198). Moreover, this structure imposes a degree of supervision and control much greater than that to which young rural women may be accustomed in their daily round of activities in home and fields (Ong, 1987:111). Factory work is reduced to meaningless manipulations with no sense of connection to the process as a whole (Ong, 1987:7, 111 and 112).

The sexual division of labour in the workplace

parallels the division of labour at home. The nature of the jobs themselves - monotonous, repetitive and in many cases unskilled, gives the women no opportunity to gain skills or experience that can be transferred to other, more lucrative or more challenging work (Phongpaichit, 1989:154). Compared with men's work, women's jobs have less status, less compensation and less recognition. Few women ascend the factory hierarchy. When they do move into jobs previously held by men it is usually because men have vacated these positions to take up more remunerative roles (Phongpaichit, 1989:160)¹⁵.

Although women are earning an income, much of it must be devoted to family survival, as we have seen, and little is left for discretionary spending. Married women may be forced through violence to turn over their earnings to their husbands (Vásquez and Tamayo cited in Carillo, 1991:24). Families of single women may retain access to their earnings by preventing them from marrying, thus prolonging their subordinate status as daughters. The longer a woman remains unmarried, the greater the need for strict surveillance to protect her "virtue" (Ong, 1987:191-

¹⁵ Women in Singapore appear to have overcome the gender division of labour to some extent as a result of the high demand for labour and the relatively small pool from which employers can draw. Women are given opportunities for skills upgrading and are hired to perform traditionally male jobs because the economy requires their labour to keep going (Phongpaichit, 1988:155-158). Lower level jobs can be filled by migrants from Malaysia.

192).

Nor does earning an income absolve women from the responsibility of reproductive work, although these demands vary depending on local custom, marital status of the worker and number, age and sex of other household members. Male family members may resent the reduction in services when a daughter, sister or wife goes out to work and mothers may still insist that daughters do their share of work in the home (Phongpaichit, 1989:151-152).

Women factory workers, especially in societies where women are normally secluded or semi-secluded, may find that society has fashioned negative images of them as morally degenerate pleasure-seekers and spendthrifts who have abandoned their own culture in preference to Western materialism (Ong, 1987:181; Heyzer, 1986:110). As a result they are subjected to increased levels of supervision and regulation by government officials, religious authorities, work supervisors and families (Ong, 1987:181-186)¹⁶. These stereotypes, combined with the real changes that occur in women's values, life-styles and self-images as a result of working outside the home, can make it very difficult for them to re-integrate into village life (Heyzer, 1986:109).

¹⁶ Ong (1987:181 and 183) notes that similar criticisms were not made of middle class university students and young professionals, whose "transgressions" were probably greater than those of the factory women. In addition, the controversy over the factory women's behaviour served to obscure the more serious issue of their working conditions.

Capital exploits women not only as workers but also as consumers. Even within the factories, beauty contests and make-up classes objectify women and create a materialist "feminine" ideal (Ong, 1987:185). Women are the market for many of the products produced by the multinationals for whom they work. Western style advertising encourages a consumerist lifestyle. The state takes its cut too by levying a tax on every item women buy (Zapanta, n.d.:4).

Women workers thus find themselves at the centre of a paradox. Paid employment which they see as a means of escape from male authority at home uses that very pattern of male dominance to keep them under control at work (Ong, 1987:113). They find themselves in a losing struggle to remain true to their families and cultural values and at the same time take advantage of their new rights as workers (Ong, 1987:187).

Although this picture seems depressing, there is one factor, not yet considered, which offers hope for long term positive change for women. In the words of Maria Patricia Fernández-Kelly (1983:28),

(T)he internationalization of production and the extension of complex communications systems are enabling, for the first time in history, the creation of a world-wide workforce. Women all over the globe share now a common experience, the result of their similar position in the world of production. And this may yet provide the basis for new forms of organization and strengthened solidarity in the future.

Third World feminists stress the importance of focusing on women as "subjects - agents who make choices, have a critical perspective on their own situations, and think and organize collectively against their oppressors", rather than as "victims of multinational capital as well as their own 'traditional' sexist cultures" (Mohanty, 1991:29). Increasing numbers of women have taken advantage of their international connections to resist repression and reconstruct the economic order. They are involved in a three-pronged struggle - as women, as workers and as inhabitants of the Third World (Rosa, 1987:159).

Women workers have always fought around demands pertaining to their working conditions or general working-class issues. Given their particularly oppressive conditions, women are found to be stronger in the face of state repression, join their strength and move fast to achieve their demands. There have been examples of women who were beaten up by the police, tear-gassed, arrested but stood firm together on their demands, not moving until they were met (Rosa, 1987:161).

It is truly not easy for women workers to resist either individually or in groups. For one thing, they and their families are economically dependent on the jobs in the EPZs. This work may be oppressive but it is better than no job at all and for many women represents the fulfilment of a dream to move to the big city and become independent. Most EPZ workers are young, have little work experience and do not fully understand the nature of their exploitation. They have been raised to accept authority, particularly of males and elders. Many do not think of themselves primarily as

workers; they are only in the factory for a short time before marriage and motherhood (Committee for Asian Women, 1987: 1-2; Rosa, 1987:162). Workers are often too tired to take part in union activities in their off hours and shift work makes it difficult to schedule meetings (Committee for Asian Women, 1987:4). Nevertheless, there is resistance.

Most common, perhaps, are small individual acts of rebellion through which women show that they are still in charge of themselves even in an atmosphere of compulsion (Heyzer, 1982:195): minor infractions of the rules, slow downs, careless work, damage to equipment. Efforts to evade authority or disciplinary action can include trips to the locker room or prayer room, and crying (Ong, 1987:203). More dramatic are incidents of spirit possession or mass hysteria reported from Asia. It is suggested that this phenomenon is an "unconscious mode of retaliation against male authority" and an expression of "a sense of dislocation in human relations" (Ong, 1987:207). Women who have been victimised by their supervisors may also persuade their male relatives to retaliate by attacking their tormentors (Ong, 1987:211-212).

Of greater impact than these individual protests have been collective actions by unions and women's groups. Despite the drawbacks of unions as a vehicle for promoting women workers' interests, effective action has been taken in some instances. In June, 1982, textile workers in the

Bataan Free Zone in the Philippines instigated the first general strike ever in an EPZ. The issues were inhumane working conditions and work overload. At the height of the action, over 10,000 workers from 23 factories were involved. Police were called in and a number of strikers were arrested. In the end, however, the employers were forced to reinstate striking workers without penalty and to reduce the workloads of the original group of strikers. The Philippine government subsequently enacted anti-labour legislation and arrested the leadership of the national workers organisation KMU (First of May Movement) (Karl and Cheung, 1983:92-93).

Because unions are so severely restricted in EPZs, women's organisations have been more effective vehicles for protest and change. Women's centres, workers' centres and religious centres provide a place where workers can meet, discuss and relax (Rosa, 1987:161). Through these organisations, women have been able to organise petition campaigns, lobbying efforts and actions of international solidarity (CIPAF, 1988b:2; Zapanta, n.d.:5).

Through joint action, women focus not only on struggles at individual factories, but also on changes needed in every workplace. It is not expected that FTZs will be dismantled (Jones, 1988:18), but the ways they are structured and function will have to change. Women workers are making the following demands:

- * the right to parity in wages and working conditions for similar jobs performed in

- different world locations (Rivera, 1985);
- * national guidelines on foreign investment (Green, 1990:16);
- * unimpeded access for trade unions to EPZ workers (Jones, 1988:18);
- * elimination of sex-specific hiring practices (Rivera, 1985);
- * laws to protect workers in the event of plant closures (Committee for Asian Women, 1990:4);
- * unemployment insurance (Committee for Asian Workers, 1990:4);
- * special programmes for displaced workers (Green, 1990:16);
- * a role for unions in the running and management of factories (Committee for Asian Women, 1990:4);
- * safe and humane working conditions (Green, 1990:16);
- * the right to demand continued research on the risks of factory work (Rivera, 1985);
- * the right to demand information about the organisation of the production which workers assist with their labour (Rivera, 1985);
- * indepth opportunities for women to learn about their rights as workers (Jones, 1988:18);
- * the right to promotion, merit increases and rotation of operations for assembly workers (Rivera, 1985);
- * skill training and upgrading at the workplace so that women can make the transition to higher technology industries (Heyzer, 1986:110);
- * leadership training (Green, 1990:16);
- * the right to maternity leave and child care facilities (Rivera, 1985);
- * better health schemes (Jones, 1988:18);
- * modification of work schedules to permit time off for medical appointments, school visits, etc. (Jones, 1988:18);
- * workers' networks to promote communication among workers or trade unions which belong to different plants of the same company (Karl and Cheung, 1983:97).

The demands are clear and specific; women's capacity for struggle is proven; solidarity among women workers internationally is growing. Teresa Dagdag (cited in Rosa, 1987:159) of the Committee for Asian Women has issued a challenge to women throughout the world who wish to give

attention to the struggles of the factory women of Asia.

There is need not only to be *concerned* but also to be *connected*. This means that women responding to the plight of these Asian women workers need to link up in solidarity in order to address this issue which is closely related to the flight of transnational capital. The third challenge is to be *committed* to their cause. To the women who are aware and able to respond to these needs of the Asian women workers, we put out this challenge: to be *concerned*, to be *connected* and to be *committed*.

The women workers' issues have their roots in the international flight of capital; hence this problem needs international solutions and approaches.

The opposition, however, is formidable.

Conclusion

In this chapter, we have seen how the New International Division of Labour has established itself in response to the needs of international capital. We have seen, too, how women's labour has been vital in this process, as it was in the early stages of industrialisation in Europe. From the perspective of Third World feminists, the effects on development and on women have been mixed. There have certainly been benefits, though these have accrued primarily to the already rich and powerful. Although women's situation has been drastically affected by their employment in EPZs, they still remain exploited and subordinate, both at home and at work. What is evident, however, is that the bringing together of large numbers of women in factories has helped to develop a new sense of consciousness on which more and more women are beginning to

act. Their experience of factory work has also given women throughout the world a common experience and common ground for mutually supportive action. Their goals are clear and form part of a feminist vision of development. To what extent this will have long term impact on the TNCs remains to be seen. Noeleen Heyzer (1986:135) summarises the current situation well.

The task ahead is certainly to spread the ethics of care and concern. This concern entails an alternative conception or vision of what is possible in human society. It is a vision in which women and men will be treated as of equal worth; a vision in which everyone will be responded to and no one will be left to struggle at subsistence level. The implementation of this vision requires certain reordering of human activities in terms of different priorities which will often conflict with major vested interests which will act to prevent fundamental changes from taking place. The struggle is how to ensure that sensitivity and care are values that will make for the functioning of alternative organisations. Only when the economic, social and political arrangements of society are no longer taken for granted and are formed according to the ethics of care, concern and sharing will there be the erosion, even if slowly, of discriminatory social formations and gender inequity.

CHAPTER SEVEN

VIOLENCE AGAINST WOMEN: A DEVELOPMENT ISSUE

I felt scared, I wanted to run away from him. Where can I go? I saw myself standing by the road at 11 p.m. in Lahore, waiting for a taxi. Deserted roadside, loose men, passing cars, dirty remarks. I felt even more vulnerable. But I have children. The thought brought some hope to me. I can stand by the roadside with four children and no one will take me for a prostitute. They might think it weird but few will jeer at me. I can find a taxi. Where can I go? And no money?...I am trapped as always. Helpless as always. At least [here at home] no one knows that I am so unhappy. Children are not dependent on others. Here I take abuse from one man which is better than taking abuse from three or four people. Whatever it is, I have my own little space, I better not let it go for no space at all.

battered wife (quoted in Rafiq, 1991:11-12)

Introduction

Male violence against women is a ubiquitous phenomenon'. It knows no barriers of class, race or culture. Likewise, women's resistance to violence, though often unknown or unacknowledged in historical or current records, has been continuous through time and place. In this chapter we will examine the Third World feminist response to violence against women and its links with

In hunter-gatherer cultures such as that of the !Kung San any form of aggressive or authoritarian behaviour is unacceptable (Draper, 1975:91). Rape, for example, is rare, although it is common in many other societies (Lee, 1981:89 and Brownmiller and Webster cited in Lee, 1981:89). Even in such a non-violent setting, however, women are usually the victims when domestic disputes do occur (Lee, 1981:89).

women's role in the development process.

Because violence against women is so pervasive and because it takes so many forms, our discussion here will not be able to explore all aspects of the subject. A brief review of the forms of violence against women in the Third World will show that many forms common in the North are seen in the South as well; other forms are peculiar to specific cultures. Likewise, we will see that the Third World feminist analysis of violence has many features in common with that of feminists in the North. More important within the context of this thesis, however, are additional aspects of violence as experienced and analysed by women in the South. Key factors of gender, race, class and imperialism will be considered as we look in some detail at two forms of violence against women prevalent in the South: violence as a means of social and political control, and the international sex trade.

It will be argued by feminists from the South that violence against women forms one more point of intersection between the forces of patriarchy, capitalism and imperialism, together reinforcing and benefitting from the subordination of women. Violence against women is intimately linked to the development process and to the relationships between countries of the North and the South. Violence against women is seen as a major strategy in social and political control both during the conquest of colonies

in the past and in the maintenance of neocolonialism and of undemocratic, authoritarian regimes in the present. The international sex trade has become at once a continuation of the violent racist exploitation of women from the South by men from the North as well as a means of earning badly needed foreign exchange by governments of the South. We will see, however, that women's resistance is as international in character as the violent forces ranged against them and that a feminist vision is leading to new and effective links of sisterhood.

Violence: An Overview

Violence against women has been defined by feminists in both the North and the South in varying degrees of breadth. Within the context of this chapter I have opted for a relatively narrow definition which includes specific acts or practices that are the direct and deliberate cause of pain, injury or suffering, either physical or psychological, on an interpersonal basis, and which arise out of women's subordinate position to men. Examples of such forms of violence would include battering, sexual assault and harassment, gynaeicide², genital mutilation,

² This is a term used by Yasmin Tambiah (1986:149) to denote "killing of women because they have acted contrary to the roles defined for them by patriarchal society or because they were unable to comply with such expectations". Although she makes reference particularly to crimes of honour in the Arab World and dowry deaths in India, the term is equally applicable to deaths in the North resulting from

torture and the international sex trade³. We will look first at practices of violence against women common to the North and the South.

Violence against women is systematic and pervasive throughout the world. It knows no boundaries of race, class, ethnicity or geography (Fernandez, 1990:84; Carlessi, n.d.:10; Mutukwa cited in YWCA Council of Zambia, 1991:22; Sinha, 1991:83; Kurukulasuriya, 1991:27; Pallais, 1988:1). Issues such as gynaeicide, battering, and sexual assault and harassment, around which women in the North are organising, also affect women in the South. Although statistics relating to violence against women are incomplete, a few may help to establish the context in which our discussion in this chapter will take place.

- * Six out of ten Tanzanian women have experienced violence at the hands of their partners (TAMWA cited in MATCH, 1990:9).
- * In Mexico City, a woman is raped every nine minutes (Carlessi, n.d.:10).

rape, domestic violence and massacres such as that in Montreal in 1989.

³ I in no way wish to discount the suffering of women through structural violence such as that which results from poverty, differential wages paid to women or neglect of female children. Such violence is real and terrible in its effects and is being actively resisted by women North and South. Limitations of space, however, do not permit an adequate discussion of all forms of violence against women. Nor would a broader discussion result in different analyses or conclusions from those to be discussed here.

- * In Pakistan, 99% of housewives and 77% of women working outside the home are beaten by their husbands (Asian Women's Research and Action Network cited in IWTC, 1991:23).
- * Ninety-five per cent of Mexican women workers are subjected to sexual harassment (Mexican Federation of Women Trade Unions cited in Carillo, 1991:24).
- * In Papua New Guinea, 61% of persons murdered in 1981 were women, the majority by their spouses (Papua New Guinea Law Reform Commission cited in Carillo, 1991:20).
- * In the only general hospital in Pune, India, 90 women a month are admitted for treatment of burns, 80% of which are said to result from "stove bursts" a euphemism for dowry burnings (All India Democratic Women's Association cited in MATCH. 1990:42).
- * Between 1975 and 1983, 300 women were killed in the Dominican Republic in "crimes of passion" (CIPAF cited in Carlessi, n.d.:11).
- * A study at one clinic in Bombay revealed that of 8,000 aborted fetuses, all but one were female (All India Democratic Women's Association cited in MATCH 90:42).

While gynaecide, sexual assault, battering and

sexual harassment are found throughout the world, their practice may vary from one cultural context to another⁴. Other forms of violence against women are culturally specific. Within the context of this chapter, however, we will briefly review three forms of violence - sati, crimes of honour and genital mutilation - more frequently seen in the South and around which Southern women have been organising⁵.

Sati, the burning of a widow on the funeral pyre of her husband, has long been practised by Hindus in India⁶. Although outlawed by the British colonial authorities in 1829 (Liddle and Joshi, 1986:27), sati continues to be practised today and appears to be on the increase in recent years. Indian feminists view sati in the context of rising levels of violence against women. They point out that Hindu scripture does not require sati and

⁴ This is particularly true of gynaeicide which can include witch hunting (Manimala, 1988; Gabba, 1989), dowry deaths (Jahan, 1989; Manushi, 1983), abortion of female foetuses (Shukla, Kulkarni, Lata and Harpal (1987), and female infanticide (Davín, 1987:117-118).

⁵ The forms of violence against women are seemingly endless. Others, which we will not deal with here include the Devadasi system in which young girls from Harijan families are dedicated to prostitution in a religious ceremony and are then "patronised" by more wealthy men (Ramesh and H.P., 1984), and virgin worship in which girls between two and eight years of age are chosen to be living goddesses, confined to a throne room, until they reach puberty (Rai, 1988a).

⁶ This discussion of sati is based on Jethmalani, (1990) unless otherwise indicated.

that many non-Hindu cultures in Europe, Central-West Asia, the Far East and the Pacific practised sati in ancient times. Further, it appears that sati is related to anxiety of the dead man's family that his property not fall into the hands of his widow and her relations. In addition, sites of sati burnings have become lucrative tourist attractions and wealthy industrialists provide large donations to sati shrines. While sati may be performed for material benefits, other acts of violence against women are performed for less tangible but equally important gain.

Crimes of passion or crimes of honour are recognised either officially or unofficially in a number of countries in the South including Brazil, the Dominican Republic, Egypt, Iraq, Tunisia and Syria (Cavalcanti and Heilborn, 1987:197; CIPAF cited in Carlessi, n.d.:11; Moghaizel, 1986:174)⁷. Official recognition means that there is legislative provision for lighter sentences or even complete exoneration for persons who have caused death or bodily harm under certain conditions relating to adultery or "illegitimate" sex (Moghaizel, 1986:174-175). For example, in Brazil, a man was sentenced to two years' imprisonment

⁷ I have not been able to discover whether crimes of passion are recognised in Brazilian or Dominican statutes. Certainly in practice sentences for such crimes in those countries are very light. Crimes of honour are recognised in law in the other Third World countries mentioned (Moghaizel, 1986:174). It is important to note that some Northern countries such as Spain and Portugal also legally recognise crimes of passion and that Italy and France did so until the 1970s (Moghaizel, 1986:174, 177).

for killing his wife whom he had seen talking to a former lover in a shopping centre (Cavalcanti and Heilborn, 1987:197). An Iranian woman who had left her husband and moved to another city was stabbed to death by her brother because she had brought shame to her family by living independently without male protection (Ahmady, 1987:193-194). Feminists see "honour" as simply a disguise for men's desire to control women (Simorgh Collective and Hussein, 1990:26).

No one quite remembers when this concept of honour took flight from the male species and housed itself in women's bodies, but ever since it did, the benefits that accrue to men are undeniable. They get to pose as custodians of this honour, they get to define what honour comprises of and what kind of behaviour on women's part endangers it. Most importantly, they have the blanket right to enforce their definition of honour and punish those who transgress against it. Most conveniently, men's mobility and behaviour is not constrained by this notion of honour (Simorgh Collective and Hussein, 1990:27).

The final form of violence against women seen more frequently in the South is genital mutilation or female circumcision. Currently, various forms of mutilation are being performed in over 25 African countries (Inter-African Committee cited in MATCH, 1990: 24); incidence in some places is as high as 95% (Badri, Badri and Badri, 1990:218). This practice has given rise to considerable controversy in both the North and the South. Some writers emphasise the positive value of circumcision within the female culture. The ritual itself may take place as part of a celebration of

initiation into womanhood, including feasting, dancing and story telling in an atmosphere of intense social support. Completion of the rites indicate that the young woman is "a mature woman in knowledgeable control of [her] own sexuality, eligible for marriage and child bearing" (MacGormack, 1977:98-99). On a somewhat more banal plane, the ceremony is said to provide "a happy social occasion" for women who have few sources of entertainment (Mustafa quoted in Bilal, 1988:22). African feminists, however, take an unequivocal stand against genital mutilation as a practice which oppresses women and exposes them to serious health hazards (AAWORD, 1983:218; Inter-African Committee cited in MATCH, 1990:24; Eket Women's Centre cited in MATCH, 1990:25). The origins of genital mutilation are obscure but it was practised in Egypt among Arabs and Copts in the eighteenth century (Baasher cited in Badri, Badri and El-Jii, 1990:217) and is found in some African mythologies (Barry, 1990:8). Contrary to widely held belief, this practice is not prescribed by religion (Badri, Badri and Badri, 1990:220). Feminists see the origin of genital mutilation in men's desire to control the sexuality of women and force them to conform to a patriarchal ideal of virtuous womanhood (Eket Women's Centre cited in MATCH, 1990:25; Tambiah, 1986:145). The effects on women of this type of "virtue" are, however, disastrous. Apart from the psychological effects, which are common to women who have experienced

extreme violence and which we will discuss below, are the pain and terror of the procedure itself and serious damage to health. Complications, which occur in 30%-50% of cases, can include infection, tetanus, shock, haemorrhage, urinary problems, infertility and difficulty in childbirth (Badri, Badri and Badri, 1990:220). Fifteen percent of Sudan's maternal deaths result from complications linked to circumcision (Bilal, 1988:22).

The foregoing discussion is not intended to sensationalise or "exotify" violence against women in the Third World but rather to indicate how pervasive such violence is, how devastating are the effects on women and how immense is the problem which women are confronting. Because of the lack of adequate and accurate statistics, it is not possible to say whether violence against women is greater in the North or in the South. The phenomenon is of such magnitude throughout the world, however, that ranking one region in relation to the other is irrelevant. It does seem, however, that the rate of incidence is increasing (Kelkar, 1987:181-182; Fernandez, 1985:6; Joint Action Group, 1985:17; Luciano, 1989:8; Kamugisha, 1986:74; Jathmalani, 1990:72; Guerrero, 1990:2; Truong, 1990:201; Gabba, 1989:27; Figueiras, 1990:6). How is this affecting women?

³ A truly chilling first hand account of female circumcision is found in El Saadawi (1980:7-8).

Damage and Devastation

Violence hurts, physically and psychologically, not only the women who suffer it directly but also their children and others who are witnesses to their pain. The physical effects of violence cover a wide range from cuts and bruises to death'. Psychological reactions are equally severe. These include loss of self-esteem (TAMWA, 1989:1), anxiety, depression (Domínguez and Salamovich, 1990:16), guilt (Kurukulasuriya, 1991:26), fear (Rape Crisis, 1989:8) and shame (Women's Information Centre, 1987:208). In addition, women's reputations are brought under public scrutiny and their marriages suffer (TAMWA, 1989:1). Many women may therefore become unable to take action to address their situation. This is in sharp contrast to the initiative women show when seeking solutions to other types of problems they face such as property disputes (Kurukulasuriya, 1991:31) or to the problems of others (Domínguez and Salamovich, 1990:16).

In the Third World, even more than in the metropolitan countries, women's options are extremely

* Thirty-three percent of women in hospital emergency rooms in Peru have been battered (Viva cited in Carillo, 1991:26). Homicide is the sixth most common cause of death among Dominican women between 15 and 40 years of age (IEPD cited in Luciano, 1989:8). The battered women who come to the *Movimiento Manuela Ramos* in Lima are not the only ones who need professional psychological support. Staff members working with them also need help to cope with the effects of the horrible stories they hear (Carlessi, n.d.:10).

limited or non-existent (TAMWA cited in MATCH, 1990:29; Rafiq, 1991:10; Women's Information Centre, 1987:206). Battered women may remain with their partners because of extreme economic and social dependency (TAMWA cited in MATCH, 1990:29-30), expectations of their families and society in general (Women's Information Centre, 1987:208), lack of support services in the community (Women's Information Centre, 1987:206), the sake of the children (Rape Crisis, 1989:8), fear of reprisals, and a belief that violence in marriage is normal (TAMWA cited in MATCH, 1990:30) or that they are destined to be beaten (Rafiq, 1991:6). Many women do not turn to the police for help because they are unaware of their legal rights (Kurukulasuriya, 1991:31), have no confidence in the police (Women's Information Centre, 1987:208) or cannot face the humiliation and expense of legal action (Kamugisha, 1986:76). Those women who do choose to leave their partners often end up as prostitutes (Asian Women's Research and Action Network cited in IWTC, 1991:27). In extreme cases, women who find their situation intolerable may turn with violence on themselves (Jalal 1989:7) or, less often, on their tormentors (Women's Information Centre, 1987:206). Such horrendous effects of violence on women make concerted action all the more imperative.

Resistance

In the words of Govind Kelkar (1987:184), "it would be wrong to assume that women...are passively groaning under an ever increasing oppression within and outside the family." What is both encouraging and inspiring about the literature on violence against women in the Third World, is the breadth and depth of resistance. Because violence is found throughout societies, both North and South, it has proved to be a key mobilising issue for women, one which has been able to overcome the barriers of class and ethnicity. In addressing the question of violence, women have come to an understanding of body politics and how such politics operate in the context of the wider social and economic system (Fernandez, 1990:84; Reddock, 1990:23; MATCH, 1990:6; Rad et al., 1991:99).

Many of the strategies adopted by women in the South are similar to those used by women in the North - public demonstrations (Kelkar, 1987:184), political pressure on legislators (Fernandez, 1990:90), Take Back the Night marches (Shefer, 1991:13), women's support groups at workplaces (TAMWA, 1989:1), court action (All India Democratic Women's Association cited in MATCH, 1990:42), public awareness campaigns (Eket Women's Centre cited in MATCH, 1990:25), training programmes for police and other workers in the judicial system (WAG, 1990:7; Fernandez, 1990:89; CAFRA, n.d.:10), establishment of women's studies

programmes (Kelkar, 1987:185), legal literacy training for women (Jalal, 1989:12) and establishment of support services for women who have experienced violence (Fernandez, 1990:89).

Other strategies which have worked well in the North must be adapted or abandoned and replaced by others more relevant to a Southern context. Although support services are important, some services such as shelters or telephone crisis lines may be too expensive or impractical to maintain for any but a small percentage of the women who need them (Musasa Project cited in MATCH, 1990:35). Some women's groups in Argentina have taken a political decision not to establish a shelter because they feel this would give the government the opportunity to absolve itself of the responsibility of caring for abused women (*Lugar de Mujer* quoted in MATCH, 1990:52). Although legislative reform is an important strategy in many cases, in others, such as that of genital mutilation, it can be counterproductive and simply drive the practice underground (Eket Women's Centre, cited in MATCH, 1990:25). Neither is imprisonment of violent husbands and fathers the answer in societies where few women are economically or socially independent. It is poor justice that provides food and shelter to a violent man and leaves his family to starve at home (WAG cited in MATCH, 1990:21).

Instead, emphasis is placed on public awareness

and the conscientisation and mobilisation of women (Sinha, 1991:88; Kamugisha, 1986:78; Simorgh Collective and Hussein, 1990:83; Eket Women's Centre cited in MATCH, 1990:25) using methodologies relevant to the Third World reality.

Because many people lack reading skills, radio and popular theatre are used extensively in educational and awareness building work. Women often find it easier to speak of their own situations through songs or skits than in a formal meeting (Patel cited in MATCH, 1990: 44). In some cases, women have been successful in including violence against women within the context of larger struggles being waged by women and men together. For example, women in parts of rural India were successful in incorporating wife battering and alcoholism into the fight for land rights being waged by landless labourers and tribal peoples (Tambiah, 1986:146). Alerting midwives to the health hazards of genital mutilation is a good way to change community attitudes to this practice. Not only are midwives influential people at the village level, they are also the ones who often perform female circumcisions (Inter-African Committee cited in MATCH, 1990:24).

A number of important initiatives have been taken by women in the Third World in their struggles against violence. International Women's Day has frequently been used as a focal point for demonstrations and other actions against violence (Rad et al., 1991:99). In Latin America,

women attending the First Latin American Feminist Meeting in 1981 declared November 25 an International Day Against Violence Against Women (Carlessi, n.d.:13). This was the date in 1960 when three sisters, Patria, Minerva and Maria Teresa Mirabal were forced from their jeep, tortured and killed on a deserted road near Puerto Plata in the Dominican Republic. All three had been active in the struggle for democracy in their country (MATCH, 1990:67). Since 1981, November 25 has been marked every year throughout Latin America and more recently in other parts of the world as well.

The establishment of special police stations to deal with charges relating to violence against women also began in Latin America, in Brazil, in 1985. There are now 74 such stations in Brazil and others have been established in Peru, Pakistan¹⁰ and Jamaica (Pitanguy, 1991:3; Sala, 1988:24; Simorgh Collective and Hussein, 1990:85; CAFRA, n.d.:10). This service was the outcome of long and hard work by women's groups (Sala, 1988:24). The result has been increased rates in the reporting of violent crimes against women (CAFRA, n.d.:10; Sala, 1988:24; Station cited in MATCH, 1990:56), increased public condemnation of violence against women (Pitanguy, 1991:5), increased public awareness

¹⁰ This special police station, set up in Punjab, was considered largely a token. Although it was commanded by a woman officer it did not even have a telephone (Simorgh Collective and Hussein 1990:85).

and discussion (Station, cited in MATCH, 1990:56) and a decrease in repeat offenses (Sala, 1988:25)".

Small scale actions are equally important. In this regard, public ridicule has proved extremely effective, especially in villages and other closely knit communities. In one such action, a group of villagers, mostly women, in rural India protested the kidnapping of a woman and the murder of her husband by the local landlord by catching the man responsible, mounting him on a donkey and leading him around the village, abused and humiliated (Stree Shakti Sanghatana, 1983:199). Villagers in a Mexican town punished a man who had raped his granddaughter by stripping him naked and writing on his chest "I am a rapist" before parading him through town to the police station (Carlessi, n.d.:14-15). Women in some Lima shantytowns use whistles to call their neighbours to help them when their partners become violent (Carlessi, n.d.:14).

Clearly, resistance against violence is mounting. As women take action against violence, they also develop their own analyses of its causes and its effects. Many aspects of these analyses are shared by feminists in the

" On the down side, in Brazil, at least, the special police stations do not have the same status as other specialised stations dealing, for example, with drug offenses or homicide, and women officers feel that working in the special stations has an adverse effect on their careers (Pitanguy, 1991:6).

North¹². Violence is seen as rooted in the socially structured inequality of women and men (Cordero, 1989:3; Sinha, 1991:86; Ahmady, 1987:194) which is a key feature of almost all societies. However that inequality was first established, men today and for centuries in the past, have been raised to assume positions of dominance over women and women have been trained to submit (Rape Crisis, 1989:2). Violence against women is an important means by which men maintain that arrangement (Pitanguy, 1991:1). The power which men exercise over women relates to women's sexuality, fertility and labour (Sinha, 1991:86; Kelkar, 1987:179). Violent acts against women are not committed by deranged or psychopathic individuals but by perfectly ordinary and sane men who are not necessarily violent in other situations (SPEAK Collective, 1988:4; Cavalcanti and Heilborn, 1987:201). Psychological explanations related to experiences of violence in childhood or an unstable family life are only partial and do not in themselves explain why

¹² I will not attempt in this discussion to represent all the nuances of arguments about violence against women advanced by feminists from the South. Some writers place greater emphasis on psychoanalytic theory relating to men's envy of women's ability to create life (Perea, 1988). Those with a psychological orientation look at the feelings of men and women (Domínguez and Salamovich, 1990). Others have a more political-economic orientation and analyse factors of property, power and relations of production (Rafiq, 1991). Sociologists examine the structure and role of the family or the workplace, and anthropologists explore cultural influences (Simorgh Collective and Hussein, 1990; Ahmady, 1987). Most are holistic and consider a variety of factors. I have tried to distil all of these arguments into a summary which emphasises the important common elements.

12000 COUNTY ROAD 3, BURNVILLE, MN 55007 USA
TEL 612 636 7027 FAX 612 636 7027 TLL BURNVILLE

the target of men's violence is women (Rape Crisis 1989:1). Socioeconomic factors involving alcoholism, unemployment, poverty and overcrowded housing may exacerbate the problem but do not explain it either (SPEAK Collective, 1988:5; Jalal, 1989:7). Violence against women is a social and political, not an individual problem (Sala, 1988:24; Rape Crisis, 1989:1) and must be addressed by the community at large.

In addition to these arguments, focused on patriarchy, which are familiar to feminists from the North, Third World feminists have tied in factors relating to imperialism, struggles for democracy and national liberation, and development. Taking "possession" of another man's woman has for long been a strategy of conquest. Rape also is symbolic of the relationship between the colonised and the coloniser. Speaking of Asia, Edward Said (cited in Stoler 1989: 635) sees the sexual submission and possession of colonised women by European men as a measure of the "relative strength of East and West...In this male power fantasy the Orient is penetrated, silenced and possessed". Colonialism, which used violence, including violence specifically directed at women, to maintain power, established a climate in which women could continue to be "legitimate" targets of male violence.

The legacy of colonisation and current anti-imperialist sentiment in many countries makes it difficult

for women to question "traditional" practices that do violence to women (Musasa Project cited in MATCH, 1990:31) or to speak out about male oppression of women in any form. Upholding tradition has been an important strategy in preserving the cultural identities of colonised peoples. For Third World women to suggest that certain aspects of their cultures, or men themselves, are oppressive to women leaves those critics vulnerable to the charge that they are diverting and weakening the revolutionary or democratic struggle (Musasa Project cited in MATCH, 1990:31), that they have "fallen for" Western values (Nala, 1986:12) or that they are betraying a comrade (Dutch Refugee Council, 1988:20). Although such arguments can be refuted¹³, Third World women, who have been at the forefront of liberation struggles, do not want to be seen as jeopardising those causes (Musasa Project cited in MATCH, 1990:31).

This colonial legacy of violence toward women is also seen in authoritarian regimes which depend on violence to maintain their power. Third World feminists make a connection between the organisation of the state and the organisation of the family (Kelkar, 1987:183). There is an especially strong link between authoritarianism, militarism and violence against women (Rape Crisis, 1989:4; Rajapakse, 1990a:8). "Like the state, the family is ruled by a

¹³ For a spirited refutation of such charges, see Bhasin and Khan (1986) and Jayawardena (1989).

dictator kept in power through violence" (Momburg cited in Coetzer, 1988:12). Ironically, violence against women in the home jeopardises the struggle for democracy in the society.

(A)s long as women live in fear of men, solidarity against state violence will not be achieved. Any threat and fear of violence that divides people against one another works in the interest of maintaining the existing...state (Rape Crisis cited in MATCH, 1990:28).

Although feminists in the Third World recognise the importance of support to national democratic movements, they also believe that action against violence against women cannot be entirely put off in favour of the wider struggle. "There are likely to be serious consequences when this work is postponed or put off altogether in favour of other social or political goals" (Musasa Project cited in MATCH, 1990:31).

Violence against women in the Third World is connected not only to imperialism and authoritarianism but also to development. Women, North and South, working in development have come to see violence against women as a fundamental development problem (Carillo, 1991; MATCH 1990).

Violence against women is in direct contradiction to securing human-centred development goals...Where domestic violence keeps a woman from participating in a development project, or fear of sexual assault prevents her from taking a job, or force is used to deprive her of earnings, development does not occur (Carillo, 1991:23).

(U)ntil women are free to participate fully in the social, political and economic aspects of community life, free from threat and fear of

violence, real development will not happen. Supporting women's efforts worldwide to end violence against women is essential, then, to creating conditions for development and social justice for all humanity (MATCH, 1990:6).

It is important to note as well that the issue has arisen directly out of the experiences of Third World women at the grassroots level without the intervention of outside authorities or international agencies (Carillo, 1991:18).

Carillo (1991, 25-27) emphasises the costs of violence against women to a Third World country, not only in terms of physical and psychological damage to women, children and men, but also in monetary terms - lost productivity at work, provision of medical and counselling services, and the time of the police and courts. She argues that violence can even contribute to the brain drain to the North as educated Third World women seek a safer environment.

If development programmes are to be successful, they must address the issue of violence against women which, as we discussed earlier, is directly connected to women's subordination. Such programming is, however, rare. We looked in some detail in Chapter Three at the adverse effects on women's status of many development programmes. Carillo (1991:23) points out that:

Nowhere do females enjoy the same standards as males, and in some areas gaps have widened so considerably that one must question whether development attempts are intrinsically gendered to the disadvantage of females.

Consideration of violence against women as a development issue leads us to closer examination of two forms of violence against women: violence as a means of social and political control, and violence in the international sex trade. In both of these discussions, we will see a complex configuration of factors - patriarchy, imperialism, race and class woven into the web of violence in which women are entangled.

Violence as a Means of Social and Political Control

Historically, violence against women has been used frequently as a means of social and political control, not only of women but of men as well. Rape has been a weapon by which armies have intimidated the enemy's women and through them, the men (Tambiah, 1986:147). In the Third World, this was clearly seen during the years of European conquest and slavery. Although both women and men suffered during this process, women experienced additional forms of violation and oppression (Mama cited in CAFRA, n.d.:9)

In a patriarchal society, which demands that certain men control and manipulate others in order to consolidate their professed supremacy, violence is probably the most sanctioned means to maintain social control over women. It is through bonding with or subjugating their own and others' women that men determine their worth in each other's eyes. Women are extremely vulnerable, placed as they are on the rim of the coin whose two faces read *male = protector* and *male = predator* (Tambiah, 1986:145).

Sadly, the most recent examples of this form of systematic

social and political control come from the Third World. As illustrated by the following examples, we shall see that violence against women in the Third World is not simply gender based (Tambiah, 1986:148). Factors of class, race, ethnicity and imperialism all come into play in various combinations and strengths.

Gender appeared to be the principal determinant in the sexual torture used against women political prisoners in Latin America in the 1970s and 1980s¹⁴. Both Bunster and Pitanguy (1991:2) note that political torture affected women of all classes. During this time, women were arrested both as a result of their own political activities and those of their male relatives. In the latter case, the women became surrogates in the punishment of their men.

Although some forms of torture were common to both women and men, others were directed specifically toward women's sexual identity and sexual anatomy: harassment, mutilation of their breasts, introduction of foreign objects or small animals into their vaginas, gang rape and family torture in which women were raped in front of other family members. Even torture that is not directed toward women's sexual organs can still be considered sexual because the woman is being punished for not conforming to the traditional role she is expected to perform (Dutch Refugee

¹⁴ Unless otherwise noted, the discussion of sexual torture of women political prisoners in Latin America is based on Bunster (1984).

Council, 1988:13). A woman refugee from the Philippines (cited in Dutch Refugee Council, 1988:10-11) has noted that in her country, although male political prisoners are subjected to some forms of sexual torture, such as electric shocks to their genitals, this is only one aspect of their torture. In the case of women, almost all tortures involve women's sexual anatomy.

Bunster points out the interplay of *Machismo* and *Marianismo*¹⁵ in the torture of women. The entire procedure is designed to change each woman from Madonna to Whore, to punish her from straying from her traditional role but, by repeatedly violating her, to prevent her from ever regaining it. Women's emotional conflicts between their politics and their families were also played upon as their captors threatened them with the rape of their daughters if they did not inform on their husbands or comrades. Given the value placed on women's sexual purity in many cultures, rape is often the most devastating form of torture for women (Turkish and Sri Lankan refugee women cited in Dutch Refugee Council, 1988:11).

Even though gender may be the main factor in the

¹⁵ *Machismo*, is the cult of virility which gives Latin American men special privileges in home and society, including the "right" to dominate women. *Marianismo* is the cult of the Virgin Mary, embodying women's spiritual superiority and the female ideals of nurturance, motherhood and chastity. The same concepts, under different names are found in other major cultures around the world including the Confucian, Hindu and Moslem.

treatment of women political prisoners, class also plays a role. It has been noted that women political activists often have more education than the soldiers who guard them. This may give the soldiers even more reason to wish to degrade and humiliate their prisoners (women refugees cited in Dutch Refugee Council, 1988:12).

It is not only political prisoners who suffer sexual violence at the hands of their jailers. Custodial rape of women prisoners and women awaiting trial has been identified as a major problem in India and Sri Lanka, affecting in particular women who come from economically deprived sectors. Charges are seldom laid (Tambiah, 1986:148; Rad et al., 1991:94). In some cases, women prisoners are raped by male prisoners on the orders of the police (Rad et al., 1990:96).

A specific case involving sexual violence by police occurred in Mexico City in 1989 when more than 21 women were raped by members of the drug enforcement police squad. Although the rapists were identified by the women involved, the officers were protected by their superiors. The *Red Contra la Violencia hacia las Mujeres* (Women's Anti-Violence Network), which organised an international campaign in support of the raped women, linked this violence to bombings of neighbourhoods in Panama, both of which were seen as consequences of the American-promoted "War on Drugs", yet another "justification for the global abuse of

power" (*Red Contra la Violencia hacia las Mujeres* cited in CAFRA, 1990:21).

The police and military are also called out to quell organised social protest, and rape is one of their principal weapons. Rad et al. (1991:95-96) record such incidents in India involving workers, tribal people and political dissidents. The state responds by setting up boards of enquiry which never report, by denying the facts presented by the survivors, by intimidating witnesses or by simply saying nothing. In other cases, the police are not directly involved, but turn a blind eye to violence committed by landlords and factory or mine managers because the financial and political support of the wealthy is needed to maintain the political status quo (Rad et al., 1991:96).

As the economic crisis worsens throughout the Third World and social protest increases, women leaders and activists are more and more frequently targets of sexual violence on the part of the police, right-wing vigilantes and goon squads (Guerrero, 1990:2). In the Philippines, American military bases also play a role in the suppression of women's groups and other social movements (Diokno cited in Towey, 1990:21). Women's organisations, especially those of poor urban and rural women, are special targets of the counter-insurgency forces. They are accused of being Communists and are subjected to all forms of human rights violations (Sancho, 1990:6).

Women workers are also subjected to police violence in their struggle for decent wages, working conditions and benefits (Heyzer, 1986:106-8; Rosa, 1987:161; Karl and Cheung, 1983:92-93), as we saw in Chapter Six. In these cases, class, gender and sometimes race, combine to make women targets for sexual violence. These factors are also at play in the case of feudal societies, such as that of rural India where sexual violence is an integral part of the social system. The landlord owns the land and everything on it, including the people. He has the "right" to demand sexual access to any woman at any time and she, at the lowest position in the hierarchy, has no power to object (Stree Shakti Sanghatana, 1983:1980199). The landlord's "right", whether exercised at whim or in response to militancy on the part of peasants, is a means of maintaining the unequal power relationships in a highly stratified society.

The foregoing examples also illustrate the ways in which violence against women relates to development. Development issues such as human rights and democracy, industrialisation, land tenure, poverty and foreign economic and political influence cannot be analysed adequately without taking into consideration the way in which violence against women becomes a tool in the hands of the powerful to maintain current social, political and economic inequalities at the community, national and international level. These

connections are seen most clearly of all in the final example of violence against women which we will examine.

The International Sex Trade

The international sex trade is a vast and complex industry based on the patriarchal principle of men's insatiable need for sexual gratification and women's obligation to provide it. If a suitable "supply" cannot be found at home, then the resources of economic or political colonies can be exploited. The breadth and depth of the market offer almost unlimited opportunities for commercial returns. In this case, women's bodies provide both the labour and the product in a process in which increasing violence against women matches the growing profit margins. In the context of this chapter, we will examine in particular, one aspect of the international sex trade: sex tourism. We will first describe the industry and then analyse it from a Third World feminist perspective.

Sex tourism is found primarily in South-east Asia, although business is also brisk in parts of Latin America such as Brazil, Costa Rica, and the Dominican Republic (*Contours* cited in Isis International, 1988a:13; Carlessi, n.d.:12). Our discussion will focus particularly on Thailand which has earned a regrettable reputation as the

"Brothel of Asia" (Mingmongkol, n.d.:24) ⁶.

A particular configuration of political, economic and social factors has produced the phenomenon of sex tourism in South-east Asia. In this part of the world, as in others, there is a long history of concubinage and brothels, though in past times, these institutions did not carry the stigma that they do today (Truong, 1983:535-536). Since colonial times, the relationship between Asian women and European men has been characterised by sexual exploitation. Daño and Francisco (1990:6) note that when the Spaniards arrived in the Philippines, they found that the sexual mores of the local people were very different from those prevailing in Europe. Assuming the universality of their own values, the Spaniards branded the local women as licentious and immoral. Although condemning the women's behaviour, they also engaged in sexual relations with them.

The foundation of sex tourism as it now exists, however, was laid by military prostitution which began with Japanese expansion in the early 1900s. After Japan colonised Korea, 200,000 Korean women were forcibly drafted into prostitution for Japanese troops throughout Asia (Nim

⁶ As the following discussion will show, sex tourism is closely related to military prostitution and to the international traffic in women. Although each has its own peculiarities, all have many features in common, including inequalities connected with gender, race, class and imperialism. Because all are common to Southeast Asia, it is sometimes difficult to separate one from the other. For reasons of space, however, we will deal primarily with sex tourism.

cited in Towey 1990:20). The Second World War, the Korean War and the Vietnam War ensured the continuation of military prostitution through the 1970s. The market towards the end of this period was largely American. Even after the Vietnam War was over, American military personnel continued to be stationed in the region, especially in the Philippines and South Korea. Currently, some 20,000 prostitutes meet the needs of U.S. soldiers in the Philippines (Raquisa, 1987:221)¹⁷. Five thousand prostitutes serve the 7,000 U.S. soldiers stationed with the Second Infantry Division in Tongduchun in South Korea, only one of 120 American military installations in the country (Lee, 1990:9).

The American military presence is directly related, not to the needs of the Asian people, but to the geopolitical importance of South-east Asia to American interests (Lee, 1990:10)¹⁸. In addition, the American bases have played a role in suppressing popular movements of peasants, workers, women and the urban poor (Diokno cited in Towey, 1990:21) thus creating the "stability" needed for investment and tourism, and serving the interests of the local and foreign elites.

¹⁷ These figures reflect the situation prior to the withdrawal of American troops from Clark Air Base following the volcanic eruptions in 1991.

¹⁸ The end of the Cold War, the closing of American military bases in the Philippines and the new economic strength of the Asian trading axis will doubtless have a significant and widespread impact on the entire region.

The economic impact of military prostitution is illustrated by the example of Thailand. In the three years after Thailand became a Rest and Recreation centre for Vietnam-based American soldiers in 1967, the amount spent by U.S. servicemen on leave in Thailand increased from US\$5 million to US\$20, an amount equivalent to one quarter of Thailand's total rice exports (Truong, 1990:161). The demand created by military prostitution led to the construction of hotels and other entertainment facilities, largely financed by international capital (Permtanjit cited in Truong, 1990:161-162). The result was an over-supply of accommodation and entertainment facilities, particularly after the Vietnam War ended. To take up the slack and protect the interests of local and international investors, the Thai government began to promote tourism in which sexual entertainment was a significant feature (Truong, 1990:166-167).

Other factors have also facilitated an increase in sex tourism throughout the Third World. On the supply side, many Third World countries have adopted economic strategies emphasising increased foreign exchange earnings, foreign investment, and diversification of and concentration on manufactured goods and services, including tourism as an important component (Phongpaichit cited in Truong, 1990:160). Governments with high levels of foreign debt, unemployment and poverty have seen in tourism a relatively

easy means of easing these problems, especially in countries "whose only comparative advantage appears to lie in the unqualified beauty of their land/beaches, their climate, and the sea that surrounds them" (Antrobus, 1990:3). There is no hesitation in advertising the advantages of the local women either, promoting their exotic beauty, sensuality, devotion and docility with varying degrees of subtlety. Sex tourism was actively promoted by the Philippine government during the Marcos years (Raquisa, 1987:218) and the former Prime Minister of Thailand, Kukrit Pramoj, advised publicly, "If you want to make money, sell sex. Don't be ashamed. They do it everywhere" (Srisang, 1986:13). Depressed economic conditions, especially in rural areas, have ensured an almost endless supply of young women who have no other economic alternatives (*Balai Asian Journal* cited in Truong, 1983:543) and are prepared to accept the risks of working in the sex trade.

On the demand side, increasing affluence and leisure in the North, combined with changes in international tourism, particularly low cost, all-inclusive package tours, permit much greater opportunities for foreign travel (Truong, 1983:544). In addition, a cheaper and wider range of sexual adventures can be offered to foreign tourists in the Third World than is available to them at home (Truong, 1983:547). Business travel, involving mostly men, is also on the increase. The spread of international capitalism has

turned Bangkok, Hong Kong and Manila into cosmopolitan centres, visited by large numbers of businessmen, who form another market for "entertainment" facilities (Truong, 1983:537). The result has been a boom in sex tourism. In 1969, tourist arrivals in the Philippines were approximately 125,000 but by 1979, the figure was 950,000, the majority being Japanese males (*Neda and Impact* cited in Truong, 1983:543). Tourist arrivals in Bangkok almost doubled between 1970 and 1977, from 628,700 to 1,220,700, two thirds of whom were men (*International Travel Statistics and Economic Review of World Tourism* cited in Truong, 1983:543).

This growing industry involves hundreds of thousands of women. At present there are 50,000 child prostitutes and at least 1,000,000 women prostitutes in Thailand (Prapote cited in Srisang, 1986:12-13). They work in brothels, massage parlours, bars and restaurants and on the street. About 450,000 men, local and foreign, visit Thailand's brothels every night, spending some US\$4 billion a year (Ehrlich, 1992)¹⁹. Since tourism reached the north of Thailand, it is said that there is no village in the

¹⁹ Although it is not possible to separate the statistics for sex tourism from those for local prostitution, a positive correlation has been established between the rise of tourism and the rise of prostitution throughout the Third World (Truong, 1983:533; Krikiat cited in Srisang, 1986:11) and both are on the rise (Joint Action Group, 1985:7). In Thailand, tourist arrivals increased from 8,000 in 1961 to 2,300,000 in 1984 (Opas cited in Srisang, 1986:11). An estimated 60% of tourists to Thailand come specifically for sex-related entertainment (Truong, 1983:533).

region untouched by the industry and many in which almost all of the young women are involved (Prapote cited in Srisang, 1986:13). Tourism's contribution to the Thai economy increased 185 times between 1960 and 1986 and, compared to other major commodities, has been the principal foreign exchange earner since the mid-1970s (Truong, 1990:163). In the Philippines, prostitution involves between 300,000-500,000 people, mostly women and girls (Santos and Lee, 1989:36). South Korean prostitutes number between 500,000 and 1,000,000 (Lee, 1990:9). In Brazil, a country of 150 million people, there are some 10 million prostitutes and 35 million abandoned children who are often both the result and the future labour power of prostitution (Isis International, 1988a:13).

If the "buyers" are unable to travel South, then the "commodity" can be moved North. There are an estimated 50,000 Thai prostitutes in Japan (Srisang, 1986:13); others go to other industrialised countries (Thajeen and Supapung, 1990:19). Women from Ghana are sent to Europe (Schoorlemmer, 1989:13). In Switzerland alone, there are between 4,000 and 5,000 women from the Dominican Republic legally established and probably an equal number there illegally. From one Dominican town of 14,679 inhabitants, 4,000 women have gone to Europe in recent years (Minaya, 1991:6).

For men seeking a more permanent arrangement, mail

order brides are available. Asian women, in particular, are advertised as equally talented in bedroom or kitchen and more docile than their Western sisters (Raquisa, 1987:218). Mail order brides go from the Philippines to Western Europe, the United States, Japan, Australia and New Zealand (Kababayan cited in Isis International, 1988b:11). From 1978 to 1983, the number of Filipino women granted fiancé and spouse visas by the Australian Embassy alone grew by 400% (Raquisa, 1987:221). Mail order brides, like prostitutes, seek a viable means to assure their economic future which, in their own countries, appears grim; those who run the business, profit from someone else's poverty (Raquisa, 1987:222). Kababayan (cited in Isis International, 1988b:11) points out the glaring inequalities in the mail order bride market beyond those that are immediately obvious. For example, although the prospective groom is given detailed information about the woman he is considering, she must rely on his personal correspondence only. The category of husband she is offered depends on how much she can pay for the matchmaking service.

Clearly, the scale of the international sex trade is monumental. Let us look more closely at the women who form, quite literally, its life blood. It has been said that no woman enters prostitution willingly (Isis International, 1988a:13; Truong, 1983:540). Most are driven to it by economic necessity and a lack of viable

alternatives (Raquisa, 1987:220); others are kidnapped or entrapped and forced to remain. It is estimated that about 10% fall into this latter category (Thajeen and Supapung, 1990:20). Those who are physically forced to become prostitutes are usually innocent, young girls from the countryside. Legal measures exist to stop this practice but they are not enforced (Skrobanek, 1987:214). In countries such as Thailand, where women have traditionally made economic contributions to the family, young women migrate from rural areas to the cities in search of work (Thitsa, 1980:5). While many find jobs in export processing zones, others turn to prostitution which offers higher pay (Thajeen and Supapung, 1990:19). Thousands of young women leave their own countries to find work elsewhere in Asia. In Hong Kong, women in the sex trade come from Thailand, Malaysia, the Philippines and Taiwan, often lured by promises of jobs as domestics (Cheung, 1990:33). Women and children from Burma, Cambodia, Laos and China, most of whom have been kidnapped, tricked or threatened into becoming prostitutes, have been found in the brothels of Thailand (Ehrlich, 1992). Filipina and Thai prostitutes work in Malaysia, Taiwan and Singapore (Joint Action Group, 1985:31; Thajeen and Supapung, 1990:19). Close to 100,000 Nepali women work in the brothels of India (Rai, 1988b:11). Many prostitutes come from broken homes; most are older siblings with little education; many have already been sexually or physically

abused (Joint Action Group, 1985:31-32). For these women, prostitution is a survival strategy which offers them greater returns than other jobs available to them. Some may even be able to save enough money to set up a small business, educate younger siblings or support families in the countryside (Truong, 1983:534, 539, 540) though many wind up in debt to their pimps (Lee, 1990:9).

While prostitution may provide some economic rewards to some of the women involved, it also brings serious hazards to all of them. Most prostitutes suffer physical violence from their pimps or their customers. Among the most horrifying stories is that of a fire in a brothel in Phuket, Thailand in which five prostitutes died in 1984. They had been locked in their brothel and some had been chained (Srisang, 1986:10). Prostitutes suffer the same psychological effects, discussed earlier in this chapter, as other women who encounter violence. This often leads them to drug abuse and suicide (Lee, 1990:10; Thajeen and Supapung, 1990:10).

Of growing concern to local authorities, perhaps because of the potential harm not only to prostitutes but also to "respectable" members of the community, is the transmission of AIDS. Approximately 570,000 Thais, about 1% of the population are infected with HIV²⁰, although some

²⁰ As was noted in Chapter Five, prostitutes in the Third World are in such economic need of clients that they are not in a position to be able to insist on the use of

private organisations estimate the actual figure is much higher (Ehrlich, 1992). The source of the infection is believed to be the sex industry²¹. Some 250,000 Thai prostitutes, or 25%, are suspected of carrying the virus. This could spread to between two and four million people by the year 2000 (Ehrlich, 1992).

Another corollary of prostitution is unwanted children. This problem is not unique to sex tourism and appears to be still more acute in military prostitution. The Philippines has experienced an increasing number of unwed mothers and abandoned children. An estimated 90% of babies adopted between 1980 and 1983 were "souvenir" babies. Selling children has also become common in the Philippines; mothers prefer this to raising their children in poverty. In the city of Olongapo, adjacent to Subic Naval Base, there are an estimated 3,000 street children, many of whom are abandoned Amerasians (Liao, 1990:68).

While the sex trade brings untold suffering to hundreds of thousands of women, other people, primarily men, are reaping substantial profits. In this, as in other forms

condoms, even if they are aware of the hazards posed by AIDS (Moseley and Smith cited in Feldman, 1989:12).

²¹ In South Korea and the Philippines, AIDS has been linked more with military prostitution than with sex tourism. The highest incidence of HIV infection is found among prostitutes serving U.S. troops. Although medical testing is required of prostitutes catering to American servicemen, no testing of soldiers, who are the source of the disease, is mandatory (Lee, 1990:10; Liao, 1990:68; Sancho, 1990:7).

of capital accumulation, the contribution of women "remains invisible, in spite of the blatant exposure of their flesh" (Truong, 1990:6). Prostitution has now become a significant item of international trade (Truong, 1983:544) and sex tourism is a growth industry throughout South-east Asia and in some other Third World countries (Raquisa, 1987:218).

It is the inequalities pervasive in sex tourism illustrated above, which are the focus for a Third World feminist analysis of the industry. Feminists in the Third World see the international sex trade as linked to the internal class structure of their own societies, the structure of the international economy, the inadequacy of development strategies, and global patriarchy (Perpiñan, 1986:156; Yupha cited in Srisang, 1986:12; Truong, 1983:544 and 549; Lee, 1990:9).

Thailand's strategy depends internationally on accepting a dependent and vulnerable role in the world economy, and depends internally on keeping the primary sector in a dependent and tractable state. A business which sets girls out of the poorer parts of the countryside and sells their services to the urban earner and to the foreign visitor is merely the mirror image of this hierarchy of dependence (Phongpaichit, 1982:75).

It is the failure of rural development policies to ensure equal distribution of land and of the wealth from the land that has forced both women and men to abandon the countryside in search of wage employment in the cities

(Perpiñan, 1986:156)²². Here, the sexual division of labour, and lack of recognised skills limit women's options. Those options available perpetuate the colonial images of women's docility and servitude (Perpiñan, 1986:156). Many women end up in the service sector and enter the sex trade as the only viable economic choice (Skrobanek, 1987:213). Possibilities are equally limited even if they choose to leave the country. While men may find lucrative jobs in the oil fields of the Middle East, women find that the greatest demand for their labour comes from the international sex trade (Skrobanek, 1987:213). Prostitution also becomes the last resort of women in a patriarchal society, abandoned by their men, be they fathers or husbands (Truong, 1983:540). These women's bodies have been used and discarded by the men closest to them and are now fit only to be used and discarded by strangers. So strong is this ideology that it has been internalised by the women themselves. Although these women are reviled, the men who use their services are considered to be responding to "natural" sexual needs (Skrobanek, 1987:213).

The emphasis on tourism as a development strategy has also brought the forces of capitalism, imperialism, racism and patriarchy to bear on Third World women.

(Tourism) seeks consciously and specifically to

²² In Chapter Five, we spoke of rural decline as a result of the emphasis on export oriented economic policies included in structural adjustment programmes.

capitalise on differences between cultures and societies, and when these differences include differences in economic circumstances, the relationships are infused with all the elements of domination, exploitation and manipulation characteristic of colonialism. Indeed, in many ways, tourism is a powerful mechanism for the incorporation of the poor countries into an essentially exploitative global economic system (Antrobus, 1990c:1).

The tourist industry offers women as "the quintessence of the exotic, to be experienced by 'civilised' man, the adventurer" (Antrobus, 1990c:1) exactly as they were regarded by the early colonialists²³. Advertising for sex tours uses inducements steeped in racism, sexism and imperialism, implying that men from the North can have their pick of women from the South who possess the traditional virtues of passivity, subservience and blind loyalty and have an ethnic history of "free love" (Raquisa, 1987:222, 224).

For feminists in the Philippines and South Korea, major centres of military prostitution, the sex trade is even more closely linked with American imperialism (Lee, 1990:10). The liberation of women is dependent upon the liberation of the whole country from foreign domination (Raquisa, 1987:222). Truong (1990:158) also sees an

²³ Antrobus (1990c:8) also notes that in the case of male prostitution, the male drive for sexual power is matched by the female's desire for sexual adventure. In female prostitution, the woman's motivation is often her need to provide for herself and her family. Thus her vulnerability makes her easy prey to both her pimp and her client.

alliance between the military and business in the growth of sex tourism as part of the international expansion of travel and entertainment.

Whatever women's role within the sex trade, one factor is common to their experience: violence. The trade itself is a form of institutionalised violence against women²⁴ (Joint Action Group, 1985:7), let alone the individual acts of violence committed against them by pimps, clients or even themselves. Truong (1990:201) argues that the organisation of the industrial production of sexual services means that a continuous supply must be ensured by increased levels of violence to locate and control sexual labour.

Once into prostitution, it is almost impossible for women to get out not only because other economic options aren't available but also because society considers prostitutes of less value than other human beings (Carlessi, n.d.:12). Society's treatment of prostitutes and prostitution reflects a patriarchal double standard. To begin with, referring to prostitution as women's oldest profession ignores women's contributions to other forms of economic endeavour from the beginning of recorded history (Skrobanek, 1987:211). Laws regulating prostitution are formulated to "protect" men from "bad" women (Skrobanek,

²⁴ Sex trade activists in the North might well take issue with this statement. In the South, however, that is the prevailing view.

1987:212) when it is obviously the prostitutes who need protection. For example, South Korea has an AIDS prevention law requiring a medical examination for prostitutes but not for the American soldiers who are bringing the disease into the country and infecting the women (Lee, 1990:10).

American military authorities in the Philippines have refused to provide medical care to infected Filipino women even though it is clear that they got the disease from U.S. servicemen (Liao, 1990:68). What is needed, is legal protection for prostitutes and punishment for those who exploit them (Skrobanek, 1987:214). Instead, prostitutes are offered "rehabilitation" programmes, although such programmes are not thought necessary for their clients. What these programmes really do, however, is further penalise prostitutes by their paternalistic approach and by failing to provide them with viable economic alternatives. In fact, pimps use the threat of rehabilitation programmes as a means of controlling prostitutes (Skrobanek, 1987:214).

Feminist sex trade activists prefer to approach prostitutes, not as social outcasts, but as oppressed workers (Marr, and *Asia Week* cited in Truong, 1983:537). Prostitution is seen as "no different from other social ills afflicting women in semi-feudal, neocolonial societies" (Raguiza, 1987:221). In the long term prostitution should be eliminated because it is based on inequalities of sex and class, but in the short term, this is not feasible and other

strategies are required (Skrobanek, 1987:214-215). The immediate goal of organisations such as GABRIELA, that work with prostitutes, is not to remove them from the trade but to empower them to make their own decisions about their lives, whatever those decisions might be, (MATCH, 1990:38). Women have been organising and mobilising to end violence and exploitation in the sex trade. Two factors have been significant in this work: the involvement of sex trade workers and international solidarity.

In the Philippines, bar women have initiated petitions to demand VD and AIDS clearances as a prerequisite for American servicemen's entrance to the country, and compensation for Filipina AIDS victims (Sancho, 1990:7). Prostitutes are demanding the right to organise and the decriminalisation of their trade (MATCH, 1990:38). GABRIELA has worked with prostitutes to establish four centres where the women can gain analytical and organisational skills and receive information about health and other support services (MATCH, 1990:38).

Wherever the international sex trade operates, groups are organising to protect and empower women in a variety of ways:

- * providing services such as counselling, health care, legal aid, child care and emergency shelters (Skrobanek, 1987:216; Liao, 1990:69; Towey, 1990:20);

- * assisting women who have decided to leave the sex trade and want to return home (Perpiñan, 1986:162; Skrobanek, 1987:216);
- * counselling women who want to work abroad or marry foreigners (Skrobanek, 1987:216);
- * protesting the traffic in mail order brides (Perpiñan, 1986:162);
- * demanding the closure of establishments, including marriage bureaux²⁵, involved in sex peddling (Raquiza, 1987:222);
- * lobbying for laws that would punish pimps, brothel keepers and traffickers in women and children (Skrobanek, 1987:215; Raquiza, 1987:222);
- * demanding viable alternative employment for sex trade workers (Raquiza, 1987:222);
- * organising public information campaigns designed to create awareness of the international traffic in women and girls (Perpiñan, 1986:159; Skrobanek, 1987:215).

²⁵ The major concerns related to mail order marriage bureaux are first of all that the parties to the economic arrangement are not dealing as equals. The women are driven to these services by the bleak economic future that awaits them in their homelands. Second, women often have unrealistic expectations of what their lives will be like in Europe or North America. Many end up as "unpaid household helps and bed partners to virtual strangers" (Raquiza, 1987:221). Finally, the mail order bride business is seen as one more form of imperialism practised on the women of the South by the men of the North.

At the international level, the Third World Movement Against the Exploitation of Women is one of many groups involved in building international solidarity, providing information, undertaking research and organising sex trade workers for their own empowerment (Perpiñan, 1986:157). One of their most successful campaigns involved women in Japan, Thailand, South Korea, Taiwan and the Philippines who worked together to oppose Japanese sex tours in South-east Asia. Protests were organised in conjunction with the visit of the then Japanese Prime Minister Suzuki to the region and demonstrations were held outside Japanese embassies. As a result there was a sharp decline in male Japanese visitors to the Philippines and a 25% decrease in Thailand. Japan Air Lines had to reduce the number of flights to Manila and advertisements for Asian tours from Japan were changed to emphasise scenery rather than women. (Perpiñan, 1986:158, 164)²⁶. The need for international solidarity such as this is stressed by sex trade activists (Sancho, 1990:8; Perpiñan, 1986:160; Skrobanek, 1987:217). Nor are Southern women the only ones to suffer from the international sex trade. Takazato (cited in Towey, 1990:21), for example, points out the vested interest of American women in ending military prostitution.

A soldier who has learned that women are
disposable sexual objects eventually has to be

²⁶ No information was given as to whether these results were permanent or transitory.

reintegrated into [American] society...What kind of lover, husband, or father will he be?

Conclusion

The comment made by Takazato points up the most frightening aspect of violence against women. It damages the recipient, the oppressor, and all of those close to them. Violence is a social, not a personal problem. It harms women, children and men in the North and in the South. As such, it must be addressed by the local, national and international communities.

Our particular perspective, that of feminists from the South, brings out a number of important aspects to this question which, in the Northern context, may be ignored. While patriarchy plays a vital role in identifying women as a target for men's violence, other factors are also involved, especially for women from the South. Violence against women is an important strategy in maintaining control of the powerful minority over the marginalised majority. This pattern repeats itself in colonial conquest, authoritarian dictatorship, feudal land tenure, capitalism and imperialism. The example of the international sex trade in particular has shown how violence against women forms an integral part of global economic, political and social relationships. The threads of patriarchy, class, race and imperialism have been woven into a particularly menacing and deadly pall which has enveloped, stifled and annihilated

countless women in the South.

Nevertheless, women in the South are fighting back. Violence against women has become a decisive factor in conscientising and mobilising women and in building international solidarity. Violence against women has been linked to all of the struggles in which Third World women are involved as women, workers and citizens. It has become a development issue which, as a result of the efforts of Third World women, is now beginning to be addressed by even the large international donor agencies and must be addressed if the goals of development are to be realised. For Third World women, with a feminist vision of development, the elimination of violence against women is perhaps their most difficult but most crucial challenge.

CHAPTER EIGHT

CONCLUSION

Look like you put a blaze a fire in me and it blaze, it burnin me to know that we trying to get betterment and these man them breaking and they rebelling...Women have belly and they would stand up, and all you man only study to go inside the rum shop. All you who want to go, go, cause all you dis is worms feedin on de union. We suffer so long here, and we must sacrifice, and if we have to eat dirt we must eat it, and if we have to eat brick we must eat it, before we go back to that condition we was in, and if we have to eat grass we will eat grass.

Saheedan Ramroop, cane cutter from Trinidad and Tobago, during the sugar workers' strike of 1975
quoted in Haniff (1988:41)

We have come to the end of this journey, this quest for understanding, and it is time to assess how far we have come and what the next stage will be. Our goal was to reach a clearer conception of a feminist vision of development through the writing of feminist researchers and activists from the South. In this way, we have examined development through what Peggy Antrobus calls a "feminist lens" in an attempt to see the flaws in current strategies and identify effective alternatives. While recognising that we in the North, and I as a white, middle class woman, cannot come to a full understanding of the lived experience of poor women of colour in the South, we can at least increase our knowledge and sensitivity to their situations. What have we seen?

It is clear that past and present strategies, as practised by the majority of development agencies have not succeeded in improving the quality of life of the poor majority in the Third World and have in particular pushed women further onto the margins of their societies. I argued in Chapter Three that two major flaws in current development practice were the failure to problematise gender inequality and the failure to base development programmes on the analyses and strategies of the poor majority in the Third World. This view was borne out in our examination of development theory and the critique that has been made of it by feminists from the South. Even efforts to bring women into the development process, as seen in *Women in Development* and *Gender and Development* theory, have not been totally satisfactory although they have made important contributions to the debate. The solution which I put forward, based on a growing body of literature and practice from both the South and the North, I called *Feminist Development*. Based on the evolution of feminism in the Third World and the experiences of Third World women with the development process, we constructed in Chapter Four a *Feminist Vision of Development*. Such a vision

- * is a holistic vision which encompasses all aspects of human advancement, not just the economic (Antrobus, 1989b:156; Benería and Roldán, 1987:170);

- * requires the transformation of structures and institutions and of attitudes and human relationships in order to eradicate all forms of discrimination, domination and exploitation between individuals, groups and countries (AAWORD, 1982:13; Sen and Grown (1987:80);
- * is rooted in local history rather than imported paradigms (Antrobus, 1989b:157; (Ellis, 1984:2-3);
- * is nurturing of both people and the environment (Benería and Roldán, 1987:170; AAWORD, 1982:14);
- * is based on processes which begin at the grass roots and are participatory, democratic and gender-aware (Sen and Grown, 1987:86; Benería and Roldán, 1987:170-171; Imam, 1988:13);
- * responds first to the basic needs of the poor majority, not the greed of international capital (Antrobus, 1989b:157);
- * promotes self-reliance in such key sectors as food, water, energy, health and education (Sen and Grown, 1987:83; AAWORD, 1982:14);
- * considers reproductive work a fundamental component of human activity (Benería and Roldán, 1987:170).

This feminist vision of development, gleaned from the experiences and analyses of women in the Third World, is

shared by an increasing number of feminist theorists and development practitioners in the North as well. It was Ester Boserup, a European, whose work first called attention to the negative impact of development programmes on women. Carrying this work forward, many Northern researchers and development workers gained further insights as a result of their experiences in the women's movement in the North and their involvement with women from the South¹. The International Women's Decade in particular, provided many opportunities for women from the North and South to meet and exchange ideas, analyses and strategies. The contacts made during that period, the international networks formed then and since, and the continuing dialogue between feminists South and North has enabled women all over the world to share this vision and work toward its realisation.

In Chapters Five, Six and Seven, we examined three issues within the current development debate through the work of feminist researchers and activists from the Third World. Our discussions of structural adjustment, the new international division of labour and violence against women illustrated the concerns which feminists from the Third

¹ Examples of such women would include Georgina Ashworth, Charlotte Bunch, Diane Elson, Cynthia Enloe, Saralee Hamilton, Marilee Karl, Patricia Maguire, Maria Mies, Maxine Molyneux, Patricia Stamp and Kate Young. A feminist vision is also shared by some Northern development NGOs such as MATCH International Centre, Inter Pares, the American Friends Service Committee, Cinquième Monde and the Comité québécois femmes et développement.

World have been raising about the development process. In all three areas, we saw how structural imbalances - between sexes, between classes, between races, between countries - have permeated the entire development process, rendering it not just ineffective, but counter-productive. The imbalances and disparities have simply increased.

A feminist vision of development shares many of the goals which are espoused, at least at a rhetorical level, by the large international and governmental aid agencies - goals such as providing for basic needs, helping "the poorest of the poor" and promoting sustainable development. The strategies of a feminist vision, however, are diametrically opposed to those of current mainstream development practice. Feminist strategies relate to three global systems. First, a feminist vision demands a transformation in the global capitalist system which has exacerbated the disparities between rich and poor within and among nations. It also requires an end to imperialism which allows a minority, mostly in the North, to live well off the wealth produced by a poor majority in the South and which imposes economic, political and cultural systems and values which have impoverished, both materially and spiritually, the lives of the majority of the world's peoples. Finally, a feminist vision insists on an end to global patriarchy which devalues women's bodies and maintains women in positions of subordination and powerlessness, in a variety

of ways and to varying degrees.

The realisation of a feminist vision of development is obviously a challenge requiring tremendous effort over a long period of time. Those fighting for a feminist vision will have to overcome the formidable forces of capitalism, racism, imperialism and patriarchy. On what strengths can a feminist vision rely? First is the tremendous capacity of women for resistance. Within the context of our current discussion, we have seen evidence of this strength in the efforts of poor women confronting increasing poverty as a result of structural adjustment, of women workers in export processing zones, and of women facing the violence of partners, employers and governments. We must also consider the worsening political, economic and ecological crises which face our planet and the failure of conventional solutions to deal with them. Moreover, evidence is mounting that it is the internal contradictions of capitalism, imperialism and patriarchy themselves that are at the root of the current crises. In human, material and spiritual terms, these systems are too expensive to be maintained. A feminist vision of development offers a viable, sustainable alternative.

The vast dimensions of this struggle preclude a complete discussion here of the forms which it might take. Based on what has been learned from the work of feminists from the South, I will focus on those strategies which the

community I am most familiar with, that is, the Canadian non-governmental development organisations (NGOs), might adopt to further a feminist vision of development.

1. If the sort of transformation contemplated in the feminist vision is to take place, it will have to come from the bottom up rather than the top down. So support to community based groups of women and other marginalised groups is vital to the process. Such support must be responsive to the groups' own priorities and contexts and focus on empowering them to take control over their own lives.

2. Recognition of the international nature of the forces mounted against a feminist vision, implies an international struggle in which solidarity across national, class and racial boundaries is vital.

3. Such solidarity cannot emerge at the international level, however, without recognition of and action in support of the struggles of marginalised communities at home. Roxanna Carillo's remarks (1990:205), quoted earlier, bear repeating.

No one is to blame for the country, class or race she was born into: those are givens that we do not have any control over. But one has to take responsibility for that, working consciously to change the aspects of our lives and our countries that are oppressive to others.

4. Assuming this responsibility, will mean taking a close look at our own personal lives and at our

attitudes and actions towards people of other races, cultures, classes or genders.

5. We must also examine our organisations. Is the work which we support in the Third World promoting or retarding the achievement of a feminist vision of development?

6. Do our organisations operate internally in a participatory and democratic manner? Do they perpetuate or confront the racial, class and sexual inequalities present in Canadian society?

7. Finally, we must analyse the policies and practices of our government in its relationship with other countries, especially those of the Third World, and press for changes that will help eliminate global economic and political imbalances.

Our time is one of rapid change but this change is not bringing us closer to the goals of Equality, Development and Peace which the International Women's Decade adopted. We are, in fact, even further away. The strategies of the past and the ideologies on which they were based have fallen short. We need a clear vision for the future, one which gives us worthwhile goals and a framework within which we can question, analyse, innovate and create. Through this thesis we have come to a greater knowledge and understanding of the experiences and analyses of

feminists in the Third World and their vision of a future we could all share. This is the end of the journey. But what we have learned here is worthwhile only insofar as it prepares us for a greater quest.

REFERENCES

- AAWORD (Association of African Women for Research and Development)
1982 "The Experience of the Association of African Women for Research and Development (AAWORD)." Development Dialogue 1982: 101-113
- AAWORD
1983 "A Statement on Genital Mutilation." Pp. 217-220 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 1. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- AAWORD
1985 "Feminism in Africa." Newsletter II and III: 1-11
- AAWORD/DHF (Dag Hammarskjold Foundation)
1982 "Dakar Declaration on Another Development with Women." Development Dialogue 1982: 11-16
- AAWORD, WIN (Women in Nigeria) and ZARD (Zambia Association for Research and Development)
1985 "The Nairobi '85 Manifesto on Women and the Crisis in Africa." IFDA Dossier (50): 31-35
- APCWD (Asian and Pacific Centre for Women and Development)
1979 "Feminist Ideology and Structures in the First Half of the Decade for Women." Report of a workshop held in Bangkok, Thailand, 24-30 June, 1979. Republished in International Women's Tribune Centre, 1980, Developing Strategies for the Future: Feminist Perspectives.
- Acharya, Meena
1991 "Women's Organization and Women's Movement in Nepal." CWD Networker (May): 4-13
- Aguiar, Neuma
1988 "The Crisis in Latin America and Its Impact on Women." Pp. 11-22 in Barbara Stob and Nena Tyrrell (eds.), Confronting the Crisis in Latin America: Women Organising for Change, translated by Barbara Stob and Nena Tyrrell. Santiago: Isis International/DAWN
- Ahmady, Simin
1987 "Crimes Against Women in Iran." Pp. 190-195 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 2. London and New Jersey: Zed Books

- Aklilu, Delawit
1991 "Women and the Food Crisis in Africa." Pp. 183-191 in Neuma Aguiar and Thais Corral (eds.), Alternatives, Vol. 1. Rio de Janeiro: Editora Rosa dos Tempos
- Alloo, Fatma
1991 Interview with the author, October 4, 1991
- Amadiume, Ifi
1987 Male Daughters, Female Husbands. London: Zed Books.
- Anand, Anita
n.d. "Copenhagen 1980: Taking Women Seriously." Mimeo
- Anand, Anita
1983 "Rethinking Women and Development." Pp. 5-11 in Isis International Women's Information and Communication Service (ed.), Women in Development: A Resource Guide for Organisation and Action. Geneva: Isis
- Anand, Anita
1984 "Financing Debts with Your Dollars and Mine: The IMF and the International Economic Crisis." Mimeo.
- Anonymous
1985a "The Women's Decade." Connexions (17-18): 1-6
- Anonymous
1985b "Things Have Changed." Connexions (17-18): 7-9
- Antrobus, Peggy
1987 "Rural Development in the Third World: Feminist Critiques, Visions and Priorities." Paper presented at a seminar of the University School of Rural Planning and Development, University of Guelph. Guelph, 31 March, 1987
- Antrobus, Peggy
1988 "Development Theories: Perspective of a Caribbean Feminist." Unpublished paper. Amherst: Centre for International Education, University of Massachusetts

- Antrobus, Peggy
1989a "The Empowerment of Women." Pp. 189-207 in Rita S. Gallin, Marilyn Aronoff and Anne Ferguson (eds.), *The Women and International Development Annual*. Boulder, San Francisco and London: Westview Press
- 1989b Peggy
"Gender Implications of the Development Crisis." Pp. 145-160 in Norman Girvan and George Beckford (eds.), *Development in Suspense: Selected Papers and Proceedings of the First Conference of Caribbean Economists*. Kingston, Jamaica: Friedrich Ebert Stiftung/Association of Caribbean Economists
- Antrobus, Peggy
1989c "Lome's Contribution to the Macro-Economic Development Debate: An analysis of Women's Roles." LOME Briefing No. 10, September, 1989
- Antrobus, Peggy
1990a "The Woman Factor in Economic Planning." Georgetown: Red Thread
- Antrobus, Peggy
1990b "Strategies for Change: Design of Programmes/Plans." Paper presented at the Commonwealth Regional Meeting on Structural Adjustment, Economic Change and Women. Barbados, 21-23 May, 1990
- Antrobus, Peggy
1990c "Gender Issues in Tourism." Paper presented at the Caribbean Tourism Research Centre Conference "Tourism and Socio-cultural Change in the Caribbean". 25-28 June, 1990
- Aquino, Belinda A.
1985 "Feminism Across Cultures." Pp. 317-351 in Madeleine J. Goodman (ed.), *Women in Asia and the Pacific: Towards an East-West Dialogue*. Honolulu: University of Hawaii Press
- Arizpe, Lourdes
1982 "Women and Development in Latin America and the Caribbean: Lessons from the Seventies and Hopes for the Future." *Development Dialogue* 1982: 74-84

- Arregui, Marivi and Clara Baez
1991 "Free Trade Zones and Women Workers." Pp. 30-38
in Tina Wallace with Candida March (eds.),
Changing Perceptions: Writings on Gender and
Development. Oxford: OXFAM
- Arriagada, Irma
1988 "Latin American Women and the Crisis." Pp. 53-59
in Barbara Stob and Nena Tyrrell (eds.),
Confronting the Crisis in Latin America: Women
Organising for Change, translated by Barbara Stob
and Nena Tyrrell. Santiago: Isis International/
DAWN
- Association of Salvadoran Women
1982 "Participation of Latin American Women in Social
and Political Organizations: Reflections of
Salvadoran Women." Monthly Review 34(2): 11-23
- Badri, Boran, Amna el Sadik Badri and Balghis Badri
1990 "Female Circumcision: Attitudes and Practices."
Pp. 217-223 in Margaret A. Schuler (ed.), Women,
Law and Development in Africa. Washington, D.C.:
Overseas Education Fund International
- Baksh-Soodeen, Rawwida
1988 "Export Processing Zones: An Overview." CAFRA
News 2(3): 8-11
- Bandarage, Asoka
1983 "Towards International Feminism." Brandeis Review
3(3): 6-11
- Barrett, Jane, Aneene Dawber, Barbara Klugman, Ingrid Obery,
Jennifer Shindler and Joanne Yawitch
1985 South African Women on the Move. Toronto: Between
the Lines
- Barry, Josette
1990 "Excision: L'atteinte à l'intégrité physique de la
femme." CIFAD-INTER (5): 8
- Benería, Lourdes and Martna Roldán
1987 The Crossroads of Class and Gender. Chicago and
London: University of Chicago Press
- Benería, Lourdes and Gita Sen
1981 "Accumulation, Reproduction and Women's Role in
Economic Development: Boserup Revisited." Signs 7
(2): 279-298

- Bhasin, Kamla
1980 "Participation of Women in Development." Pp. 126-134 in Kamla Bhasin and Vimala R. (eds.), Readings on Poverty, Politics and Development. Rome, Bangkok and New Delhi: Freedom from Hunger Campaign/Action for Development, Food and Agriculture Organisation of the United Nations
- Bhasin, Kamla and Nighat Said Khan
1986 Some Questions on Feminism and its Relevance in South Asia. New Delhi: Kali for Women
- Bhavnani, Kum-Kum and Margaret Coulson
1986 "Transforming Socialist-Feminism: The Challenge of Racism." Feminist Review (23): 81-92
- Bilal, Neimat M.
1988 "Sudan: Changing the Course of Circumcision." Women's Feature Service (July-August): 22-23
- Blomström, Magnus and Björn Hettne
1984 Development Theory in Transition: The Dependency Debate and Beyond: Third World Responses. London: Zed Books
- Boserup, Ester
1970 Women's Role in Economic Development. New York: St. Martin's Press
- Briones, Leonor M.
n.d. "An Overview of the External Debt Problem." Mimeo.
- Bulbeck, Chilla
1988 One World Women's Movement. London: Pluto Press
- Bunch, Charlotte
1987 Passionate Politics: Feminist Theory in Action. New York: St. Martin's Press
- Bunch, Charlotte and Roxanna Carillo
1990 "Feminist Perspectives on Women in Development." Pp. 70-82 in Irene Tinker (ed.), Persistent Inequalities: Women and World Development. New York: Oxford University Press

- Bunster, Ximena
1984 "The Torture of Women Political Prisoners: A Case Study in Female Sexual Slavery." Pp. 94-102 in Kathleen Barry, Charlotte Bunch and Shirley Castley (eds.), *International Feminism: Networking Against Female Sexual Slavery*. New York: International Women's Tribune Centre
- CAFRA (Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action)
n.d. Provisional Report of the Regional Meeting on Women, Violence and the Law
- CCIC Inter-Agency Working Group on Women and Development
1987 "Feminist Perspectives on Development." Mimeo. Ottawa: Canadian Council for International Co-operation
- CESIP (Centro de Estudios Sociales y Publicaciones)
1986 "Feminism and the Grassroots Movement of Poor Women." *Isis Women's Journal* (6): 99-103
- CIPAF (Centro de Investigación para la Acción Femenina)
1988a "Camila Dice del Feminismo y Otras Cosas..." *Quehaceres* 8(4): 8
- CIPAF
1988b "Imperialismo, Capitalismo y Patriarcado." *Quehaceres* 8(5): 2
- CIPAF
1988c "Capitalismo y Feminismo." *Quehaceres* 8(4): 7
- Cardinal, Linda, Annette Costigan and Tracy Heffernan
1989 "From Women and Development to Feminism and Development: MATCH's New Directions". Mimeo. Ottawa: MATCH International Centre
- Carillo, Roxanna
1990 "Feminist Analyses: A View from Peru." Pp. 199-205 in Lisa Albrecht and Rose M. Brewer (eds.), *Bridges of Power: Women's Multicultural Alliances*. Philadelphia: New Society.
- Carillo, Roxanna
1991 "Violence Against Women: An Obstacle to Development." Pp. 17-36 in *Gender Violence: A Development and Human Rights Issue*. New Brunswick: Centre for Women's Global Leadership, Rutgers University

- Carlessi, Carolina
n.d. Mujeres, Violencia y Alternativas. Lima: Mujer y Sociedad
- Casal, Lourdes
1980 "Revolution and Consciencia: Women in Cuba." Pp. 1-12 in Carol Berkin and Clara M. Lovett (eds.), Women, War and Revolution. New York: Holmes and Meier
- Cavalcanti, Maria Laura and Maria Luiza Heilborn
1987 "SOS - Mulher of Rio de Janeiro: An Interview." Pp. 196-204 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 2. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Cheung, Choi-wan
1990 "Sex Industry in Hong Kong." In God's Image (June): 33-34
- Chitnis, Suma
1988 "Feminism: Indian Ethos and Indian Convictions." Pp. 81-95 in Rehana Ghadially (ed.), Women in Indian Society: A Reader. New Delhi, Newbury Park, London: Sage Publications
- Coetzer, Diane
1988 "South Africa: Violence in the White Home." Women's Feature Service (September-October): 11-13
- Committee for Asian Women
1987 "Women and Trade Unions." Asian Women Workers Newsletter 6(3): 1-4
- Committee for Asian Women
1990 "Plant Closure: Its Effect on Women Workers." Asian Women Workers Newsletter 9(1): 1-5
- Commonwealth Expert Group on Women and Structural Adjustment
1989 Engendering Adjustment for the 1990s. London: Commonwealth Secretariat
- Cordero, Margarita
1986 "Latin American and Caribbean Feminism: A Multiple Challenge: Interview with Magaly Pineda." Isis Women's Journal (5): 36-39
- Cordero, Margarita
1989 "La Violencia Es un Acto de Poder." Quehaceres 9 (11): 3

- Cordero, Margarita
1990 "El Inútil Empeño de la Microempresaria."
mujer/fempress (106): 7
- Corpuz, Victoria Lucia
1988 "Women, Debt, and Development: Filipino Women's Perspectives." Paper presented at a conference on "Women and the Debt Crisis", Netherlands, 8 March, 1988.
- Criquillón, Ana and Olga María Espinosa
1988 "Women in Transition: From the Separate to the Whole." Pp. 81-84 in Barbara Stob and Nena Tyrrell (eds.), *Confronting the Crisis in Latin America: Women Organising for Change*, translated by Barbara Stob and Nena Tyrrell. Santiago: Isis International/DAWN
- Daño, Neth and Josefa S. Francisco
1990 "A Historical Look at Filipino Sexuality and the Rise of Prostitution." *Flights* 4(2): 6-7
- Davin, Delia
1987 "Gender and Population in the People's Republic of China." Pp. 111-129 in Haleh Afshar (ed.), *Women, State and Ideology*. Albany: SUNY Press
- Davis, Angela
1988 "Feminism, Womanism and the Third World." *CAFRA News* 2(3): 20-21
- de Barbeiri, Teresita and Orlandina de Oliveira
1991 "The Presence of Women in Latin America in a Decade of Crisis." Pp. 9-65 in Neuma Aguiar and Thais Corral (organisers), *Alternatives*, Vol. II. Rio de Janeiro, Editora Rosa dos Campos
- Deere, Carmen Diana, Peggy Antrobus, Lynn Bolles, Edwin Melendez, Peter Phillips, Marcia Rivera and Helen Safa
1990 *In the Shadows of the Sun: Caribbean Development Alternatives and U.S. Policy*. Boulder, San Francisco and Oxford: Westview Press
- Diskin, Vilunya
1984 "Developing an International Awareness." Pp. 611-625 in *The New Our Bodies, Ourselves*. New York: Simon and Schuster
- Domínguez, Rosario and Sofía Salamovich
1990 "The Psychology of Violence." *Women's Health Journal* (17): 15-17

- Draper, Patricia
1975 "Kung Women: Contrasts in Sexual Egalitarianism in Foraging and Sedentary Contexts." Pp. 77-109 in Rayna Reiter (ed.), *Toward an Anthropology of Women*. New York: Monthly Review
- Dutch Refugee Council
1988 *Sexual Violence: 'You Have Hardly Any Future Left,'* translated by Herman te Loo and Paul Pearce. Amsterdam: Dutch Refugee Council
- Ehrlich, Richard
1992 "Thailand: AIDS Campaign Targets Sex." *Inter Press Service* (February 7, 1992)
- El Saadawi, Nawal
1980 *The Hidden Face of Eve*. London, Zed Press
- El Saadawi, Nawal
1987 "Toward Women's Power, Nationally and Internationally." Pp. 266-274 in Diana L. Eck and Devaki Jain (eds.), *Speaking of Faith: Global Perspectives on Women, Religion and Social Change*. Philadelphia: New Society Publishers
- Ellis, Patricia
1984 "Women's Wisdom: The Missing Factor in Development Plans and Policies in the English-Speaking Caribbean." *Mimeo. Environment and Development in the Third World*
- Elson, Diane and Ruth Pearson
1981 "'Nimble Fingers Make Cheap Workers': An Analysis of Women's Employment in Third World Export Manufacturing." *Feminist Review* 7(Spring): 87-107.
- Ernst, Miriam
1986 "Feminismo: Un Camino Hacia la Utopia." Pp. 64-68 in Lily Rodríguez et al. (eds.), *Guía de la Mujer Ecuatoriana*. Quito: Instituto Latinoamericano de Investigaciones Sociales/Centro Ecuatoriano para la Promoción y Acción de la Mujer
- Etienne, Mona and Eleanor Leacock
1980 "Introduction." Pp. 1-24 in Mona Etienne and Eleanor Leacock (eds.), *Women and Colonization*. New York: Praeger

- Feldman, Rayah
1989 Women for a Change! The Impact of Structural Adjustment on Women in Zambia, Tanzania and Mozambique. London: War on Want
- Fernandez, Irene
1985 "Opening Address." Pp. 6-9 in Joint Action Group on Violence Against Women, "Proceedings of a Workshop-cum-Exhibition on Violence Against Women". Malaysia: Joint Action Group on Violence Against Women
- Fernandez, Irene
1990 "In Malaysia: Mobilizing to Combat Violence Against Women." Pp. 81-92 in Margaret Schuler (ed.), Women, Law and Development - Action for Change. Washington, D.C.: Overseas Education Fund International
- Fernández-Kelly, María Patricia
1980 "The 'Maquila' Women." NACLA Report on the Americas 14(5): 14-19
- Fernández-Kelly, María Patricia
1983 "Gender and Industry on Mexico's New Frontier." Pp. 18-29 in Jan Zimmerman (ed.), The Technological Woman: Interfacing with Tomorrow. New York: Praeger
- Figueiras, Carmen Luisa
1990 "La Espiral de la Violencia No Se Detiene." Quehaceres 10(November): 6
- Frank, André Gunder
1988 "The Development of Underdevelopment." Pp. 109-120 in Charles K. Wilber (ed.), The Political Economy of Development and Underdevelopment. New York: McGraw-Hill Publishing Company
- French, Joan
1990 "Who Really Owes Whom?" CAFRA News 4(1): 6-11
- French, Joan
1991 Interview with the author, September 4, 1991
- Friedman, Michelle
1991 "Is a Feminist Development Appropriate and/or Possible in South Africa?" Paper presented at the First Women and Gender in Southern Africa Conference. University of Natal, Durban, January 1991

- Fuentes, Marta
n.d. "Mujeres Contra la Deuda en el Tercer Mundo."
Mimeo.
- Fuentes, Marta
1988 "The Recent Chilean Women's Movement." Pp. 90-110
in Saskia Wieringa (ed.), Women's Struggles and
Strategies. Aldershot and Brookfield: Gower
- Gabba, Anna
1989 "Tanzania: Old Women - Victims of Witch Hunt."
Women's Feature Service (January-February): 27
- George, Susan
1988 A Fate Worse than Debt. London: Penguin Books
- Gloster, Margherita, Martha McDevitt and Amrita Chhachhi
1983 "Restructuring: The Cutting Edge." Pp. 15-23 in
Wendy Chapkis and Cynthia Enloe (eds.), Of Common
Cloth: Women in the Global Textile Industry.
Amsterdam and Washington: The Transnational
Institute
- González, Lélia
1988 "For an Afro-Latin American Feminism." Pp. 95-101
in Barbara Stob and Nena Tyrrell (eds.),
Confronting the Crisis in Latin America: Women
Organizing for Change, translated by Barbara Stob
and Nena Tyrrell. Santiago: Isis International/
DAWN
- Green, Cecilia
1990 The World Market Factory: A Study of Enclave
Industrialization in the Eastern Caribbean and Its
Impact on Women Workers. Summary Report.
Kingstown, St. Vincent and the Grenadines:
Caribbean People's Development Agency
- Guerrero, Verónica
1990 "Mujer, Crisis y Violencia." Quehaceres
10(November): 2
- Haniff, Nesha Z.
1988 Blaze a Fire: Significant Contributions of
Caribbean Women. Toronto: Sister Vision
- Harding, Sandra
1987 "Introduction: Is There a Feminist Method?" Pp.
1-14 in Sandra Harding (ed.), Feminism and
Methodology. Bloomington, Indiana University
Press

- Hartsock, Nancy
1983 "The Feminist Standpoint: Developing the Ground for a Specifically Feminist Historical Materialism." Pp. 283-310 in Sandra Harding and Merrill B. Hintikka (eds.), *Discovering Reality*. London: Reidel
- Heyzer, Noeleen
1982 "From Rural Subsistence to an Industrial Peripheral Work Force: An Examination of Female Malaysian Migrants and Capital Accumulation in Singapore." Pp. 179-202 in Lourdes Beneria (ed.), *Women and Development - The Sexual Division of Labour in Rural Societies*. New York: Praeger
- Heyzer, Noeleen
1985 "Introduction: Missing Women in Development Planning." Pp. xi-xxxii in Noeleen Heyzer (ed.), *Missing Women: Development Planning in Asia and the Pacific*. Kuala Lumpur: Asian and Pacific Development Centre
- Heyzer, Noeleen
1986 *Working Women in South-East Asia: Development, Subordination and Emancipation*. Milton Keynes and Philadelphia: Open University Press
- Hiriart, Berta
1988 "Las Mujeres en el Año de la Crisis." *mujer/fempress* (77): 7
- Hong, Evelyn
1984 "Rural Women in Development." *Ideas and Action* (158): 4-10
- Huamán, María Josefina
1989 "La Crisis Económica Actual y su Impacto en Mujeres de Sectores Populares." Mimeo. Lima: Alternativa
- IWTC (International Women's Tribune Centre)
1991 "Violence Against Women is Global." *The Tribune* (46): 23-27
- Imam, Ayesha
1988 "Households and the Crisis in Africa." Paper presented at the Third General Assembly and Seminar on "The African Crisis and Women's Vision of the Way Out". Dakar, 8-14 August, 1988
- Isis International
1988a "Under the Mask." *Women in Action* (1): 13-14

- Isis International
1988b "Stop Marketing Filipina Women!" Women in Action
(1): 11-12
- Jaggar, Alison
1983 Feminist Politics and Human Nature. Totowa,
N.J.: Rowman and Allanhead; Brighton: Harvester
Press
- Jahan, Roushan
1989 "Hidden Wounds, Visible Scars: Violence Against
Women in Bangladesh." Pp. 199-227 in Bina Agarwal
(ed.), Structures of Patriarchy. London and New
Jersey: Zed Books
- Jain, Devaki
1978 "Can Feminism Be a Global Ideology?." Quest 4(2):
9-15
- Jain, Devaki
1983 "Development as if Women Mattered or Can Women
Build a New Paradigm?" Paper presented to the
OECD/DAC Meeting. Paris, 26 January, 1983. New
Delhi: Institute of Social Studies Trust
- Jain, Devaki
1990 "Can We Have a Women's Agenda for Global
Development?" Paper presented to the Sixth WIDE
General Assembly. The Netherlands, 3 November,
1990. New Delhi: Institute of Social Studies
Trust
- Jalal, Patricia I.
1989 "Country Paper: Fiji." Paper presented at the
conference "Training on Legal Literacy Strategies
that Empower Women." Manila, Philippines, 24-29
November, 1989
- Jayawardena, Kumari
1986 Feminism and Nationalism in the Third World.
London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Jayawardena, Kumari
1989 "Thoughts on Feminism and the Left in South Asia."
Echo (12): 11-13
- Jethmalani, Rani
1990 "In India: Reasserting Constitutional Guarantees
in the Struggle Against Sati." Pp. 69-79 in
Margaret A. Schuler (ed.), Women, Law and
Development. Washington, D.C.: Overseas Education
Fund International

- Joint Action Group (on Violence Against Women)
1985 "Proceedings of a Workshop-cum-Exhibition on Violence Against Women". Malaysia, 23-24 March, 1985
- Jones, Jennifer
1988 "Jamaica: The Struggle Continues." CAFRA News 2(3): 16-18
- Kabeer, Naila
1991 "Rethinking Development from a Gender Perspective: Some Insights from the Decade." Paper presented at the First Women and Gender in Southern Africa Conference. University of Natal, Durban, January 1991
- Kamugisha, Stephanie
1986 "Violence Against Women." Pp. 74-79 in Pat Ellis (ed.), Women of the Caribbean. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Karl, Marilee and Choi Wan Cheung
1983 "Resistance, Strikes and Strategies." Pp. 91-97 in Wendy Chapkis and Cynthia Enloe (eds.), Of Common Cloth: Women in the Global Textile Industry. Amsterdam and Washington: The Transnational Institute
- Kazi, Hamida
1987 "Palestinian Women and the National Liberation Movement: A Social Perspective." Pp. 26-39 in Khamsin Collective (ed.), Women in the Middle East. London: Zed Books
- Kelkar, Govind
1987 "Violence Against Women: An Understanding of Responsibility for Their Lives." Pp. 179-189 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 2. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Kirkwood, Julieta
n.d. "Chile: La Mujer en la Formulación Política." Especial-Mujer: Mujer y Democracia: 42-44
- Kumar, Radha
1989 "The Feminist Movement in India." New Politics 2 (2): 148-155
- Kurukulasuriya, Lasanda
1991 "Wife Assault in Sri Lanka." Diva Special Edition. "Wife Assault: South Asian Perspectives": 26-34

- LAWG (Latin American Working Group)
 1983 "Gratemalan Women Have Always Participated." Pp. 57-60 in LAWG (ed.), Central American Women Speak for Themselves. Toronto: LAWG
- Landry, Monique
 1990 "Structural Adjustment and the Growth of Nations." Paper presented at Carleton University. Ottawa, 12 February, 1990
- Latin American and Caribbean Women's Collective
 1980 Slaves of Slaves: The Challenge of Latin American Women, translated by Michael Pallis. London: Zed Press
- Lazreg, Marnia
 1988 "Feminism and Difference: The Perils of Writing as a Woman on Women in Algeria." Feminist Studies 14(1): 81-107
- Lee, Mi Kung
 1990 "U.S. Troops in South Korea and Prostitution." In God's Image (March): 9-11
- Lee, Richard B.
 1981 "Politics, Sexual and Nonsexual, in an Egalitarian Society: The !Kung San." Pp. 83-99 in Gerald D. Berreman (ed.), Social Inequality: Comparative and Developmental Approaches. New York: Academic Press
- Letelier, Fabiola
 1986 "Chile: Response of Political Women to the Dictatorship". Pp. 166-173 in Margaret Schuler (ed.), Empowerment and the Law: Strategies of Third World Women. Washington, D.C.: Overseas Education Fund International
- Leung, Diana
 1988 "Dominican Republic: A Tale of Exploitation." CAFRA News 2(3): 14
- Liao, Nelia Sancho
 1990 "The Social Cost of the U.S. Bases." Women and Children's Alternative Forum 1(1): 67-69
- Liddle, Joanna and Rama Joshi
 1986 Daughters of Independence: Gender, Caste and Class in India. New Delhi: Kali for Women; London: Zed Books

- Lim, Linda
1983 "Capitalism, Imperialism, and Patriarchy: The Dilemma of Third-World Women Workers in Multinational Factories." Pp. 70-91 in June Nash and Maria Patricia Fernandez-Kelly (eds.), *Women, Men and the International Division of Labour*. Albany: State University of New York Press
- Lim, Linda
1985 *Women Workers in Multinational Enterprises in Developing Countries*. Geneva: International Labour Office
- Lipietz, Alain
1987 *Mirages and Miracles: The Crises of Global Fordism*. London: Verso
- Luciano, Dinny
1989 "Crisis y Violencia: ¿Pérdida de Poder Masculino?" *Quehaceres* 9(11); 8
- Lugones, María C. and Elizabeth V. Spelman
1983 "Have We Got a Theory for You! Feminist Theory, Cultural Imperialism, and the Demand for 'The Woman's Voice'." *Women's Studies International Forum* 6(6): 573-581
- MacCormack, Carol P.
1977 "Biological Events and Cultural Control." *Signs* 3 (1): 93-100
- Maguire, Patricia
1984 *Women in Development: An Alternative Analysis*. Amherst: Centre for International Education
- Mair, Lucille Mathurin
1986 "Women: A Decade is Time Enough." *Third World Quarterly* 8(2): 583-93
- Mair, Lucille Mathurin
1988 "The Debt Crisis and Militarism: A Challenge to International Feminism." Excerpts from a paper "Women in the World - The Challenge of the Nineties" presented in April 1986 at the University of South Dakota Centre for Continuing Education. *Women's World* (17): 8-10
- Mangena, Oshadi
1991 "Against Fragmentation: The Need for Holism." *Journal of Gender Studies* 1(1): 3-12

- Manimala
1988 "India: Killing Witches for Money." Women's
Feature Service (November-December): 13-15
- Manushi
1983 "Indian Women Speak Out Against Dowry." Pp. 201-
209 in Miranda Davies (ed.), Third World - Second
Sex, Vol. 1. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- MATCH
1990 Linking Women's Global Struggles to End
Violence. Ottawa: MATCH International Centre
- MATCH
1992 "Overseas Program Funding Proposal". Presented to
the Non-Governmental Division, Canadian
Partnership Branch, Canadian International
Development Agency. Ottawa: MATCH International
Centre
- Mathurin, Lucille
1975 The Rebel Woman in the British West Indies During
Slavery. Kingston: Institute of Jamaica
- Matsui, Yayori
1989 Women's Asia. London: Zed Press
- Mazumdar, Vina
1979 "Women, Development and Public Policy." Pp. 39-54
in Rounaq Jahan and Hanna Papanek (eds.), Women
and Development: Perspectives from South and
Southeast Asia. Dacca: The Bangladesh Institute
of Law and International Affairs
- Mazumdar, Vina
1982 "Another Development with Women: A View from
Asia." Development Dialogue 1982: 65-73
- Mba, Nina Fama
1982 Nigerian Women Mobilised: Women's Political
Activity in Southern Nigeria, 1900-1965.
Berkeley: Institute of International Studies,
University of California
- Mbilinyi, Marjorie
1984 "Research Priorities in Women's Studies in Eastern
Africa." Women's Studies International Forum
7(4): 289-300

- McAfee, Kathy
1991 Storm Signals: Structural Adjustment and Development Alternatives in the Caribbean.
London: Zed Books
- Meer, Fatima
1987 "Organising Under Apartheid", Pp. 20-30 in Miranda Davies (ed.), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 2.
London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Mies, Maria
1983 "Towards a Methodology for Feminist Research."
Pp. 117-139 in Gloria Bowles and Renate Duelli-Klein (eds.), Theories of Women's Studies.
London: Routledge
- Mies, Maria
1986 Patriarchy and Accumulation on a World Scale.
London: Zed Books
- Minaya, Mildred
1991 "El Fiz y el Tráfico de Mujeres Hacia F oopa."
Quehaceres 11(July): 6
- Mingmongkol, Santi
n.d. "Official Blessings for the 'Brothel of Asia'."
Southeast Asia Chronicle (78): 24-25
- Moghaizel, Laure
1986 "The Arab and Mediterranean World: Legislation Towards Crimes of Honor." Pp. 174-180 in Margaret Schuler (ed.), Empowerment and the Law: Strategies of Third World Women. Washington, D.C.: Overseas Education Fund International
- Mohanty, Chandra
1988 "Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial Discourses." Feminist Review (30): 61-88
- Mohanty, Chandra Talpade
1991 "Introduction: Cartographies of Struggle: Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism." Pp. 1-47 in Chandra Talpade Mohanty, Ann Russo and Lourdes Torres (eds.), Third World Women and the Politics of Feminism. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press
- Molyneux, Maxine
1981 "Socialist Societies Old and New: Progress Towards Women's Emancipation?" Feminist Review 8(Summer): 1-34

- Molyneux, Maxine
1985 "Mobilization Without Emancipation? Women's Interests, the State and Revolution in Nicaragua". *Feminist Studies* 11(2): 227-254
- Moser, Caroline O.N.
1989 "Gender Planning in the Third World: Meeting Practical and Strategic Gender Needs." *World Development* 17(11): 1799-1825
- Nala, June
1986 "Active, Loyal - But Banned From Leadership." *Third World Women's News* 1(1): 10-11
- Narayan, Uma
1989 "The Project of Feminist Epistemology: Perspectives from a Nonwestern Feminist." Pp. 256-269 in Alison Jaggar and Susan R. Bordo (eds.), *Gender/Body/Knowledge: Feminist Reconstructions of Being and Knowing*. New Brunswick and London: Rutgers University Press
- Okeyo, Achola Pala
1981 "Reflections on Development Myths." *Africa Report* 26 (March April): 7-10
- Ong, Aihwa
1987 *Spirits of Resistance and Capitalist Discipline: Factory Women in Malaysia*. Albany: State University of New York Press
- Pallais, Desirée
1988 "Nicaragua: Battered Women Ending Their Silence." *Women's Feature Service* (May-June): 1-2
- Parpart, Jane L.
1988 "Sexuality and Power on the Zambian Copperbelt: 1926-1964." Pp. 115-138 in Sharon B. Stichter and Jane L. Parpart (eds.), *Patriarchy and Class: African Women in the Home and the Workforce*. Boulder: Westview Press
- Patel, Vibhuti
1985 "Indian Women on the Warpath: A Profile of Women's Struggles in the Recent Past." *Isis Women's Journal* (5): 66-70
- Payer, Cheryl
1974 *The Debt Trap: The IMF and the Third World*. Harmondsworth: Penguin Books

- Perea, Mabel Loaiza
1988 "Genealogía de la Violencia." Viva 4(15): 11-13
- Perpiñan, Soledad
1986 "The Philippines: Prostitution and Sexual Exploitation." Pp. 155-165 in Margaret Schuler (ed.), Empowerment and the Law: Strategies of Third World Women. Washington, D.C.: Overseas Education Fund International
- Phillips, Anne
1977 "The Concept of 'Development'." Review of African Political Economy (8): 7-20
- Phongpaichit, Pasuk
1982 From Peasant Girls to Bangkok Masseuses. Geneva: International Labour Organisation
- Phongpaichit, Pasuk
1989 "Two Roads to the Factory: Industrialisation Strategies and Women's Employment in South-east Asia." Pp. 151-163 in Bina Agarwal (ed.), Structures of Patriarchy: The State, the Community and the Household. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Pineda, Magaly
1988 "Edulcorar la Píldora." Quehaceres (May): 2
- Pineda-Ofreneo, Rosalinda
1982 "Philippine Domestic Outwork: Subcontracting for Export-Oriented Industries". Journal of Contemporary Asia 12(3): 281-293
- Pitanguy, Jacqueline
1991 Paper presented on a panel "Reforms in the Criminal Justice System" at the conference "Violence Against Women: Addressing a Global Problem". New York, 14 February, 1991
- Plewes, Betty and Rieky Stuart
1991 "Women and Development Revisited: The Case for a Gender and Development Approach." Pp. 107-132 in Jamie Swift and Brian Tomlinson (eds.), Conflicts of Interest. Toronto: Between the Lines
- Portugal, Ana María
1986 "Introduction: On Being a Feminist in Latin America." Isis Women's Journal (5): 5-8

- Portugal, Ana María
1987 "La Búsqueda de una Política Feminista."
mujer/fempres (76): 1
- Portugal, Ana María
1989 "La Crisis Golpea...Sobre Todo a las Mujeres."
mujer/fempres (89): 12
- Pyle, Jean L.
1990 "Export-led Development and the Underemployment of
Women: The Impact of Discriminatory Development
Policy in the Republic of Ireland." Pp. 85-112 in
Kathryn Ward (ed.), Women Workers and Global
Restructuring. Ithaca: ILR Press
- Qunta, Christine N.
1987 "Outstanding African Women, 1500 BC - 1900 AD",
Pp. 23-64 in Christine N. Qunta (ed.), Women in
Southern Africa. London and New York: Allison and
Busby
- Rad, Amiya, Sudesh Vaid and Monica Juneja
1991 "Rape, Society and State." Pp. 91-100 in Veena
Poonacha (ed.), Understanding Violence. Bombay:
Research Centre for Women's Studies
- Rafiq, Fauzia
1991 "Wife Assault: Pakistan, An Overview." Diva
Special Edition. "Wife Assault: South Asian
Perspectives": 5-15
- Rahman, F.
1987 "No Return to the Veil." pp. 16-19 in Miranda
Davies (ed.), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 2.
London and Atlantic Highlands: Zed Books
- Rai, Sumeeta
1988a "Nepal: Life is Short for a Goddess." Women's
Feature Service (September-October): 1-3
- Rai, Sumeeta
1988b "Nepal: Traders Thrive on Women." Women's Feature
Service (November-December): 11-12
- Rajapakse, Darshini Anna
1990a "Impact of Adjustment on Women." Paper
distributed at the seminar "Beyond the Debt
Crisis", New York, N.Y., 23-25 April, 1990

- Rajapakse, Darshini Anna
1990b "Summary and Critical Comment on: Adjustment with a Human Face: Protecting the Vulnerable and Promoting Growth." Paper distributed at the seminar "Beyond the Debt Crisis", New York, N.Y., 23-25 April, 1990
- Ramesh, Asha and Philomena H.P.
1984 "The Devadasi Problem." Pp. 82-87 in Kathleen Barry, Charlotte Bunch and Shirley Castley (eds.), *International Feminism: Networking Against Female Sexual Slavery*. New York: International Women's Tribune Centre
- Ramírez, Socorro
1985 "Las Mujeres de Sectores Populares Ante la Crisis Económica." *mujer/fempress* (53): 4
- Ramírez, Socorro
1988 "¿Necesitamos la Crisis para Formar un Movimiento de Mujeres?" *mujer/fempress* (78): 7
- Randall, Vicky and Robin Theobald
1985 *Political Change and Underdevelopment: A Critical Introduction to Third World Politics*. Basingstoke and London: Macmillan
- Rape Crisis
1989 "Battering". Mimeo. South Africa: Rape Crisis
- Raquis, Tonette
1987 "Prostitution: A Philippine Experience." Pp. 218-224 in Miranda Davies (compiler), *Third World - Second Sex*, Vol. 2. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Ravindran, Sundari
1985 "Looking Forward from Nairobi." *Women in Action* (4): 18-22
- Reddock, Rhoda
1979 "Women and the Transition to Socialism: The Case of Cuba." *Transition* 2(2): 144-151
- Reddock, Rhoda
1982 "Women's Liberation and National Liberation: A Discussion Paper." Pp. 11-22 in Rhoda Reddock (ed.), *National Liberation and Women's Liberation*. The Hague: Institute of Social Studies

- Reddock, Rhoda
1986 "Some Factors Affecting Women in the Caribbean Past and Present." Pp. 28-30 in Pat Ellis (ed.), Women of the Caribbean. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Reddock, Rhoda
1988 "Feminism and Feminist Thought: An Historical Overview." Pp. 53-75 in Patricia Mohammed and Catherine Shepherd (eds.), Gender in Caribbean Development. St. Augustine, Mona and Cave Hill: University of the West Indies Women and Development Studies Project
- Reddock, Rhoda
1990 "Women's Organisations in the Caribbean Community from the 19th Century to Today." Woman Speak (26 and 27): 17-24
- Reyes, Quintina
1988a "Una Forma de Violencia contra la Mujer: Inseguridad en el Trabajo." Quehaceres (May): 3
- Reyes, Quintina
1988b "Diferencias Salariales entre las Industrias Domésticas y las Empresas de las Zonas Francas." Quehaceres (May): 6
- Rivera, Luisa María
1985 "Bill of Rights". In Switching Circuits: Women Organising in a Microtech World. Kit distributed at a conference organised by World Inter-Action Ottawa, 4-5 October, 1985
- Roberts, Pepe
1984 "Feminism in Africa: Feminism and Africa." Review of African Political Economy (27-28): 175-184
- Rosa, Kumudhini
1987 "Organising Women in the Free Trade Zone, Sri Lanka." Pp. 159-164 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 2. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Rostow, Walt
1962 The Stages of Economic Growth: A Non-Communist Manifesto. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press
- Sala, Mariella
1988 "Comisaría de Mujeres: 40 Días Después." Viva 4 (15): 24-26

- Sancho, Nelia
1990 "Women, Foreign Intervention and Military Prostitution." Paper presented at the International Women and Health Meeting. Manila, 6 November, 1990.
- Sanday, Peggy Reeves
1981 "The Socio-Cultural Context of Rape: A Cross-Cultural Study." *Journal of Social Issues* 37(4): 5-27
- Santa Cruz, Adriana
1985 "Los Movimientos de Mujeres." *mujer/fempress* (48): 3-5
- Santos, Aida Fulleros and Lynn F. Lee
1989 "The Debt Crisis: A Treadmill of Poverty for Filipino Women. Philippines: Kalayaan
- Schoorlemmer, Lucré
1989 "Impressions About Prostitution and Traffic in Women in Ghana." *Vena Newsletter* 1(2): 13-15
- Seager, Joni and Ann Olson
1986 *Women in the World.* London: Pluto Press
- See, Bernice and Maria Victoria Corpuz
1990 "The Economic Crisis and the Cordillera Women." *Chanég* 1(2): 8-13
- Sen, Gita
1984 "Subordination and Sexual Control: A Comparative View of the Control of Women." *Review of Radical Political Economics* 16(1): 133-142
- Sen, Gita and Caren Grown
1987 *Development Crisis and Alternative Visions.* New York: Monthly Review Press.
- Shefer, Tammy
1991 "Take Back the Night." *SPEAK* (33): 13
- Shukla, Sonal, Sanjeev Kulkarni, Lata and Harpal
1987 "Campaign Against Sex-Determination Tests in India." Pp. 238-243 in Miranda Davies (compiler), *Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 2.* London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- Silverblatt, Irene
1978 "Andean Women in the Inca Empire." *Feminist Studies* (3): 37-61

- Simorgh Collective and Shazreh Hussein
1990 Rape in Pakistan. Lahore: Simorgh Collective
- Sinha, Niroj
1991 "Profile of Marital Violence: Wife Battering."
Pp. 81-90 in Veena Poonacha (ed.), Understanding
Violence. Bombay: Research Centre for Women's
Studies
- Skrobanek, Siriporn
1987 "Strategies Against Prostitution in Thailand."
Pp. 211-217 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third
World - Second Sex, Vol. 2. London and New
Jersey: Zed Books
- Smith, Dorothy
1987 The Everyday World as Problematic; a Feminist
Sociology. Boston: Northeastern University Press
- Le Soleil*
1986 "Interview: Marie Angélique Savané: 'For Me,
Feminism is a Political Struggle'." Reprinted in
Echo 1(2-3):11-13
- SPEAK Collective
1988 "Breaking the Silence: Women Say Our Men Must Stop
Beating Us." SPEAK (19): 4-7
- Spindel, Cheywa
1988 "Poverty and the Debt Crisis: A Struggle for
Employment." Paper presented at the conference
"Women and the Debt Crisis". Netherlands, 8
March, 1988
- Srisang, Koson
1986 "Tourism Promotion and Its Effects on Thai Women."
Thai Development Newsletter 4(1): 10-14
- Stamp, Patricia
1989 Technology, Gender, and Power in Africa. Ottawa:
International Development Research Centre
- Staunton, Irene
1990 Mothers of the Revolution. Harare: Baobab Books
- Steady, Filomena Chioma
1982 "African Women, Industrialization and Another
Development: A Global Perspective." Development
Dialogue 1982: 51-64

- Steady, Filomena Chioma
1987 "African Feminism: A Worldwide Perspective." Pp. 3-24 in Rosalyn Terborg-Penn, Sharon Harley and Andrea Benton Rushing (eds.), Women in Africa and the African Diaspora. Washington, D.C.: Howard University Press
- Stoler, Ann
1989 "Making Empire Respectable." American Ethnologist (16)4: 634-660
- Stree Shakti Sanghatana
1983 "The War Against Rape: A Report from Karimnagar." Pp. 197-201 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third World - Second Sex, Vol. 1. London and New Jersey: Zed Books
- TAMWA (Tanzania Media Women's Association)
1989 "On Sexual Harassment." Sauti Ya Siti (5): 1
- Tabari, Azar
1980 "The Enigma of the Veiled Iranian Women." Feminist Review (5): 19-31
- Tadesse, Zenebeworke
1991 "Coping with Change: An Overview of Women and the African Economy." Pp. 44-62 in Nancy O'Rourke (ed.), The Future for Women in Development: Voices from the South. Ottawa: North-South Institute
- Tambiah, Yasmin
1986 "Sri Lanka: Violence and Exploitation". Pp. 145-154 in Margaret Schuler (ed.), Empowerment and the Law: Strategies of Third World Women. Washington, D.C.: Overseas Education Fund International
- Thajeen, Thanawadee and Naiyana Supapung
1990 "Japan's Economic Power and Sex Exploitation of Thai Women." In God's Image (June): 19-20
- Thitsa, Khin
1980 Providence and Prostitution: Image and Reality for Women in Buddhist Thailand. London: CHANGE International Reports
- Tocón, Carmen
1989 "Crisis Management and Subsistence Work of Women in the Informal Sector." Paper presented at the conference on "Women in the Development Process". Berlin, 8-16 July, 1989

- Towey, Shawn
1990 "Asian Women Confront Military Prostitution."
Listen Real Loud 10(1-2): 3 and 20-21
- Truong, Thanh-Dam
1983 "The Dynamics of Sex Tourism: The Case of
Southeast Asia." Development and Change 14: 533-
553
- Truong, Thanh-Dam
1990 Sex, Money and Morality: Prostitution and Tourism
in South-east Asia. London and New Jersey: Zed
Books
- Vargas, Virginia
1988 "Nudos del Movimiento Feminista." Pp. 105-112 in
Centro Acción de la Mujer/Centro de Información
y Apoyo a la Mujer (eds.), Tomando Fuerzas para
Volar con Fibra: Memorias de los Encuentros
Feministas del Ecuador. Ecuador: CAM/CIAM
- Vega, Magali
1990 "Deuda Externa y Mujer." mujer/fempres (105): 8
- WAG (Women's Action Group)
1990 "Women Take Action on Rape." Speak Out (13): 7-8
- WSRC (Women's Studies and Resource Centre)
1988 Women's Stories from the Land of Promise. Davao
City: WSRC
- Warren, Bill
1973 "Imperialism and Capitalist Industrialization."
New Left Review (81): 3-44
- Wiltshire-Brodber, Rosina
1988 "Gender, Race and Class in the Caribbean." Pp.
142-155 in Patricia Mohammed and Catherine
Shepherd (eds.), Gender in Caribbean Development.
St. Augustine, Cave Hill and Mona: University of
the West Indies Women and Development Studies
Project
- 'Women Waging War'
1992 The Citizen, Ottawa (4 April): A2
- Women's Information Centre
1987 "Shelter for Battered Women in Thailand." Pp.
205-210 in Miranda Davies (compiler), Third
World - Second Sex, Vol. 2. London and New
Jersey: Zed Books

World YWCA
1987 Poster

YWCA Council of Zambia
1991 Report on Public Forum on Violence Against Women,
 Lusaka, Zambia, 23 February, 1991

Young, Kate
1988 "Gender and Development: A Relational Approach".
 Mimeo. Brighton: Institute for Development
 Studies

Zapanta, Cleofe
n.d. "Women in the Workplace: The Role of Multi-
 National Corporations in Women's
 Underdevelopment". Mimeo

APPENDIX A

WOMEN'S RESEARCH AND RESOURCE CENTRES IN THE THIRD WORLD

African Training and Research Centre for Women, UN/ECA, P.O. Box 3001, Addis Ababa, Ethiopia

Asia Women's Research and Action Network, c/o Pilipina, P.O. Box 208, Davao City 9501, Philippines

Asian and Pacific Centre for Women and Development, Asian and Pacific Development Centre, Persiaran Duta, P.O. Box 12224, 50770 Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Association of African Women for Research and Development, B.P. 3304, Dakar, Senegal

Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action, P.O. Bag 442, Tunapuna, Trinidad and Tobago

Centre for Women and Development, P.O. Box 3637, Kamaladi, Kathmandu, Nepal

Centre for Women's Development and Studies, B6/F2, Sanjeeva Reddy Nagar, Hyderabad 500 038, India

Centre for Women's Development Studies, B-43, Panchsheel Enclave, New Delhi 110017, India

Centre for Women's Development Studies - Bihar, 5 Serpentine Road, Patna, Bihar, India

Centre for Women's Research, 12 1/1 Ascot Avenue, Colombo 5 Sri Lanka

Centre for Women's Resources, Second Floor, Mar Santos Building, 43 Roces Avenue, Quezon City, Philippines.

Centre of Excellence for Women's Studies, University of Karachi, Karachi 75270, Pakistan

Centro de Documentación sobre la Mujer, Avenida La Mar 170, Lima 18, Perú

Centro de Estudios de la Mujer, Purísima 353, Bellavista, Santiago, Chile

Centro de Investigación para la Acción Femenina, Apartado Postal 1744, Santo Domingo, República Dominicana

Centro de la Mujer Peruana Flora Tristan, Parque Hernán Velarde 42, Lima 1, Perú

Centro Ecuatoriano para la Promoción y Acción de la Mujer, Apartado Postal 182-C, Sucursal 15, Quito, Ecuador

Centro Feminista de Información y Acción, Apartado 5355, San José 1000, Costa Rica

Gender Research Group, Department of Sociology, Faculty of Social Science, University of Natal, King George V Avenue, Durban 4001, South Africa

Grupo de Estudios de la Mujer, Centro de Planificación y Estudios Sociales, Casilla 6127 CCI, Quito, Ecuador

Grupo de Estudios sobre la Condición de la Mujer, Miguel del Corro 1474, Montevideo, Uruguay

Indian Council of Social Science Research, Women's Studies Programme, IIPA Hostel, Indraprastha Estate Ring Road, New Delhi 110002, India

Institute of Social Studies Trust, Women's Studies Programme, 5 Deen Dayal Upadhyay Marg, SMM Theatre Crafts Building, New Delhi 110002, India

Instituto de Estudios Jurídico-Sociales de la Mujer, Montevideo 2303, 2000 Rosario, Argentina

Instituto Nicaraguense de la Mujer, Apartado 5714, Managua, Nicaragua

Isis International, Casilla 2067, Correo Central, Santiago, Chile

Isis International, 85-A East Maya Street, Philamlife Homes, Quezon City 1104, Philippines

Kalyanamitra, Women's Communication and Information Centre, Julian Raya Bogor 30/km 20, Jakarta 13510, Indonesia

Novimimiento de Mujeres Nicaraguenses Luisa Amanda Espinoza, Casilla A-238, Managua, Nicaragua

Muslim Women's Research and Action Front, 125 Kirula Road, Colombo, Sri Lanka

Pacific and Asia Women's Forum, 4 Bhagwandas Road, New Delhi 110 001, India

Palestinian Federation of Women's Action Committees/Women's Resource Centre and Research Unit, P.O. Box 20576, East Jerusalem, via Israel

Red de Programas Universitarios de Estudios de la Mujer en América y el Caribe, Escuela de Psicología, Hipólito Yrigoyen 3238, Buenos Aires 1207, Argentina

Research Unit in Women's Studies, S.N.D.T. University, Vithaldas Vidya Vichan, Santa Cruz West, Bombay 400049, India

Sistren Research, 20 Kensington Crescent, Kingston 5, Jamaica

University Centre for Women's Studies, University of the Philippines, Diliman, Quezon City, Philippines

Women and Development Unit, School of Continuing Studies, University of the West Indies, Pinelands, St. Michael, Barbados

Women and Law in Southern Africa Research Project, P.O. Box UA 171, Harare, Zimbabwe

Women, Environment and Development Network, Environment Liaison Centre International, P.O. Box 72461, Nairobi, Kenya

Women's Association for National Development (WAND), P.O. Box 1152, Freetown, Sierra Leone

Women's Studies and Resource Centre, Rm. 207, Santos Building, Malvar Ext., Davao City, Philippines 9501

Women's Research and Documentation Project, Box 35108, Dar Es Salaam, Tanzania.

Women's Research Centre, c/o Dr. Swarna Jayaweera, 16 Elliott Place, Colombo 8, Sri Lanka

Zambia Association for Research and Development, P.O. Box 37836, Lusaka 10101, Zambia

Zimbabwe Women's Resource Centre and Network, P.O. Box 2192, Harare, Zimbabwe

APPENDIX B

INTERVIEW SCHEDULES

The purpose of the interviews was to give me the opportunity to hear directly the views of several feminists from the Third World on some of the broader issues with which my thesis would deal. I also wanted to get input from them on the selection of the three thematic areas I was planning to explore. The questions were open-ended and designed to enable us to dialogue on the issues raised. Since all of the women I was interviewing had extremely full schedules, I tried to limit the interviews to one hour.

Schedule #1 was used for the interview with Peggy Antrobus. Since I had read much of her written work, I already knew the answers to some of the questions I planned to ask the other interviewees and I wanted to investigate a little further some issues raised in her writing.

Each interview began with a request for permission to tape record the session and an assurance that I would not use any material which the interviewee indicated was to be "off the record". I also agreed to give the interviewees, prior to publication, those sections of the thesis in which I cited portions of the interview so that they could ensure that I had not misunderstood or misrepresented their statements to me. Before turning to the questions, I explained the purpose of my research and how the interview fit into the overall investigation. The interviews ended with my thanking the interviewee and presenting her with the most recent MATCH publications.

Schedule #1

1. In one of your papers, you stated that in 1975, most women in the Caribbean accepted the conventional concepts of Equality, Development and Peace and felt that these could be achieved within existing structures. My impression from reading what you wrote in the late 1970s, compared with what you have written since 1985 is that although you may have shared that view once, your current approach is much more transformational, with a de-emphasis on government and an emphasis on mobilisation of autonomous women's groups. Is that accurate? If so, what happened to bring about that change?

2. From your writing, I get the impression that you support the concept of global feminism, even the necessity of global feminism, if we are going to humanise our world and save it from destruction. What barriers would you identify to

global feminism and how do we overcome them?

3. In one of your articles from 1987, you said that although women's "invisibility" in the development process had been recognised by Boserup and others, no one had explored the issue from a feminist perspective. Do you feel that is still the case? If not, who are the major researchers, particularly from the South, who have done this?

4. In what areas do you feel women from the Third World have made particular contributions to the development debate?

5. One of the concerns which I have been particularly conscious of in approaching this research has been the whole question of the exploitation and racism involved in much of the research about women in the Third World done by white, middle class women from the North. Ifi Amadiume has suggested that Northern researchers should stick to their own cultures. What are your views on this issue?

Schedule #2

1. The failure of conventional or mainstream development programmes to achieve their own economic goals let alone broader social and political goals, has been widely acknowledged. What, from your perspective, are the major critiques you would offer of the conventional development paradigm?

2. What elements do you think should form part of an alternative model of development? Does feminism have anything to offer in formulating such a model?

3. In what areas do you feel women from the Third World have made particular contributions to the development debate?

4. A number of feminist theorists and activists such as Charlotte Bunch and Anita Anand have stressed the importance of looking at feminism from a global perspective and recognising connections between women's oppression all over the world. Would you agree that is important? Many women from the Third World have identified obstacles to creating a global sisterhood. Would you agree there are such obstacles? If so, how can we overcome them?

5. One of the concerns which I have been particularly conscious of in approaching this research has been the whole question of the exploitation and racism involved in much of the research about women in the Third World done by white,

middle class women from the North. Ifi Amadiume has suggested that Northern researchers should stick to their own cultures. What are your views on this issue?

APPENDIX C

MAGAZINES AND JOURNALS PUBLISHED BY THIRD WORLD WOMEN

The following publications, some of which were used in research for this thesis, are produced primarily by women in the Third World. A few are published by immigrant and visible minority women living in the North. These publications are listed here for purposes of information and networking. The list is by no means exhaustive.

African Woman, published by Akina Mama wa Africa, London Women's Centre, 4 Wild Court, London, WC2B 5AU, U.K.

Agenda: A Journal about Women and Gender, P.O. Box 37432, Overport, 4067 Durban, South Africa

Aquelarre: Latin American Women's Magazine, published by Aquelarre, Latin American Women's Cultural Society, P.O. Box 65535, Station F, Vancouver, B.C., V5N 5K6, Canada

Arise, published by Action for Development, P.O. Box 16729, Kampala, Uganda

Asian Woman, published by the Asian Women's Institute for Information, 90 Kinnaird College, Gulberg Road, Lahore, Pakistan

Asian Women Workers Newsletter, published by the Committee for Asian Women, 57 Peking Road, 4/F Kowloon, Hong Kong

Awareness, published by the Association of Women for Action and Research, 64A Race Course Road, Singapore 0821

BATIS, published by BATIS Centre for Women, Room 711, Don Santiago Building, 1344 Taft Avenue, Ermita, Manila, Philippines

Bolitin Diálogo Mujer, published by the Fundación Diálogo, Apartado Aereo No. 43061, Bogotá, Colombia

La Bolitina: Un Aporte a la Comunicación entre Mujeres, Apartado Postal RP-39, Managua, Nicaragua

BUKAS, published by the Mga Babaye Karon ug Ugma sa Agusan ug Surigao (BUKAS), Room 209, Ong Hoc Building, Montilla Boulevard, Butan City, Philippines

CAFRA News, published by the Caribbean Association for Feminist Research and Action, P.O. Bag 442, Tunapuna, Trinidad and Tobago

CWD Networker, published by the Centre for Women and Development, P.O. Box 3637, Kamaladi, Kathmandu, Nepal

Chanég, published by the Cordillera Women's Education and Resource Centre, 462 Dahlia Street, Q.M. Subdivision, Baguio City, Philippines

CIFAD-INTER, published by the Comité International des Femmes Africaines pour le Développement, 01 B.P. 5147, Abidjan 01, Côte d'Ivoire

Correspondencia, published by Mujer a Mujer/Woman to Woman, P.O. Box 12322, San Antonio, Texas 78212, U.S.A.

Diva: A Quarterly Journal of South Asian Women, 60 Richmond Park Boulevard, Scarborough, Canada, M1V 3B6

Doble Jornada, supplement to *La Jornada*, Balderas 68, CP 06050, México D.F., México

Echo, published by the Association of African Women for Research and Development, B.P. 3304, Dakar, Sénégal

Flights, published by the Women's Resource and Research Centre, U.P. P.O. Box 110, Diliman, Quezon City, Philippines

GABRIELA Women's Update, published by GABRIELA National Women's Coalition, GABRIELA, Public Information Department, P.O. Box 4386, Manila 1800, Philippines

In God's Image, published by the Asian Women's Resource Centre for Culture and Theology, 566 Nathan Road, Kiu Kir Mansion, Kowloon, Hong Kong

Informativo, published by the Centro de Documentación sobre la Mujer, Avenida La Mar 170, Lima 18, Perú

mujer/fempres: red de comunicación alternativa de la mujer, Casilla 16-637, Santiago 9, Chile

Mujer y Sociedad, supplement to *La República*, Avenida Nicolás de Pierola 677, Oficina 503, Lima 1, Perú

Pagsibol, published by AMIHAN National Federation of Peasant Women, 113-E 13th Avenue, Cubao, Quezon City, Philippines

Quehaceres, published by the Centro de Investigación para la Acción Feminina, Apartado Postal 1744, Santo Domingo, República Dominicana

Revista FEM, Avenida Universidad 1855, 4 Piso, Oxtoculpo, México D.F. 04310, México

Sauti ya Siti, published by the Tanzania Media Women's Association (TAMWA), P.O. Box 6143, Dar es Salaam, Tanzania

Sistren, published by Sistren Theatre Collective, 20 Kensington Crescent, Kingston 5, Jamaica

Speak, published by the SPEAK Collective, P.O. Box 45213, Mayfair 2108, South Africa

Speak Out, published by the Women's Action Movement, P.O. Box 135, Harare, Zimbabwe

Tok Blong Ol Meri published by the World YWCA Pacific Area Office, Box 3940, Samabula, Suva, Fiji

Viva: Revista Feminista, published by the Centro de la Mujer Peruana Flora Tristan, Parque Hernan Velarde No. 42, Lima 1, Perú

Voice of Eritrean Women, published by the National Union of Eritrean Women, P.O. Box 631, New York, N.Y. 10025, U.S.A.
Voice of Women, 125 Kirula Road, Colombo 5, Sri Lanka

Voz de Mujer: Boletín Feminista de CIDHAL (Centro para Mujeres), Calle de las Flores No. 12, Colonia Acapantzingo 1-579, Cuernavaca, Morelos, México

Women in Action, published by Isis International, 85-A East Maya Street, Philamlife Homes, Quezon City 1104, Philippines

Women's Health Journal, published by the Latin American and Caribbean Women's Health Network of Isis International, Casilla 2067, Correo Central, Santiago, Chile

Women's Feature Service published by Inter Press Service, Via Panisperna 207, Rome 00184, Italy

Women's News Digest, published by the Association for the Advancement of Feminism, 444-446 Nathan Road, Kowloon, Hong Kong

Womenews, published by the Women's Studies and Resource Centre, Door 12, Santos Compound, Malvar Extension, Davao City, Philippines 8000

END

2|5| 0|5| 93|

FIN